

# **Historical-Analytical Studies on Nature, Mind and Action**

Volume 15

## **Editor-in-Chief**

Gyula Klima, Fordham University, New York, USA

## **Series Editors**

Russell Wilcox, University of Navarra, Pamplona, Spain

Henrik Lagerlund, Stockholm University, Stockholm, Sweden

Jonathan Jacobs, CUNY, John Jay College of Criminal Justice, New York, USA

## **Advisory Editors**

Dan Bonevac, University of Texas, Austin, USA

Sarah Borden, Wheaton College, Wheaton, USA

Edward Feser, Pasadena College, Pasadena, USA

Jorge Garcia, University of Buffalo, New York, USA

William Jaworski, Fordham University, New York, USA

Joseph E. Davis, University of Virginia, Charlottesville, USA

Stephan Meier-Oeser, Academy of Sciences of Göttingen, Göttingen, Germany

Jose Ignacio Murillo, University of Navarra, Pamplona, Spain

Calvin Normore, UCLA, Los Angeles, USA

Penelope Rush, University of Tasmania, Hobart, Australia

Jack Zupko, University of Alberta, Edmonton, Canada

Historical-Analytical Studies on Nature, Mind and Action provides a forum for integrative, multidisciplinary, analytic studies in the areas of philosophy of nature, philosophical anthropology, and the philosophy of mind and action in their social setting. Tackling these subject areas from both a historical and contemporary systematic perspective, this approach allows for various “paradigm-straddlers” to come together under a common umbrella. Digging down to the conceptual-historical roots of contemporary problems, one will inevitably find common strands which have since branched out into isolated disciplines. This series seeks to fill the void for studies that reach beyond their own strictly defined boundaries not only synchronically (reaching out to contemporary disciplines), but also diachronically, by investigating the unquestioned contemporary presumptions of their own discipline by taking a look at the historical development of those presumptions and the key concepts they involve. This series, providing a common forum for this sort of research in a wide range of disciplines, is designed to work against the well-known phenomenon of disciplinary isolation by seeking answers to our fundamental questions of the human condition: What is there? – What can we know about it? – What should we do about it? – indicated by the three key-words in the series title: Nature, Mind and Action. This series will publish monographs, edited volumes, and commented translations.

Timothy Paul Fortin

On the Nature of Human  
Sexual Difference:  
A Symposium

 Springer

Timothy Paul Fortin  
Seton Hall University  
South Orange, NJ, USA

ISSN 2509-4793 ISSN 2509-4807 (electronic)  
Historical-Analytical Studies on Nature, Mind and Action  
ISBN 978-3-031-74530-0 ISBN 978-3-031-74531-7 (eBook)  
<https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-031-74531-7>

© The Editor(s) (if applicable) and The Author(s), under exclusive license to Springer Nature Switzerland AG 2024

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are solely and exclusively licensed by the Publisher, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilms or in any other physical way, and transmission or information storage and retrieval, electronic adaptation, computer software, or by similar or dissimilar methodology now known or hereafter developed.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

The publisher, the authors and the editors are safe to assume that the advice and information in this book are believed to be true and accurate at the date of publication. Neither the publisher nor the authors or the editors give a warranty, expressed or implied, with respect to the material contained herein or for any errors or omissions that may have been made. The publisher remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.

This Springer imprint is published by the registered company Springer Nature Switzerland AG  
The registered company address is: Gewerbestrasse 11, 6330 Cham, Switzerland

If disposing of this product, please recycle the paper.

# Acknowledgments

This work began many years ago with my doctoral dissertation. There are many more who deserve thanks than there is, alas, space here to mention them. I am truly grateful for the support of so many people whose unique modes of assistance made this project possible. In particular, I must express my gratitude to my dissertation director, Fr Robert Gahl for all his work on the original project from which this work arose, and to Fr Stephen Brock who has patiently responded to far too many queries seeking clarity on the thought of St Thomas. I further owe a debt of gratitude to my sister and brother-in-law, Karen and Sam Ntiros, for always providing me with a quiet escape for writing. Special thanks must be offered to those who helped reviewing and editing the text: Mark and Francis Fusco; Angela Franks, who was of great help in reviewing work on the thought of Beauvoir and Butler; and finally, my nephew and burgeoning philosopher, Matthew Ntiros, who did the yeoman's work of editing the text and providing many helpful insights. I must thank Fr Larry Young for his encouragement and insight and Christopher West for sharing his vision of the thought of John Paul II.

I must also thank my colleagues at Immaculate Conception School of Theology at Seton Hall University for all their support. Special thanks must be given to the Seton Hall University Research Council for awarding me a Summer Stipend for research on this project. I also received a visiting research fellowship with the Program in Constitutional Studies (now the Center for Citizenship & Constitutional Government) at the University of Notre Dame that was of great help in completing this project.

I must mention a recent book that is similar in theme and content to this work: *Metaphysics and Gender: The Normative Art of Nature and Its Human Imitations* (Emmaus Academic, 2023) by Michele M. Schumacher (2023). I only learned of this work after submitting my own manuscript. The matter treated—in particular, emphases upon the thought of Beauvoir, Butler, and St Thomas, and Dr Schumacher's Thomistic analysis are similar to my own indicating that we often were moved by the same intellectual inspirations. I have updated my manuscript to include some references to Schumacher's text that might prove helpful to the reader.

Finally, as noted above, this work began with my doctoral dissertation, parts of which survive in the current text. I am grateful to Edizioni Università Santa Croce (EDUSC) for their permission to use material contained in my doctoral work. Similarly, I am grateful to *Nova et Vetera* for their permission to draw from work done in my essay “Finding Form” and *Logos* for arguments contained in my essay “Reciprocal Generativity.”

## References

- Fortin, T. (2008). *Fatherhood and the perfection of masculine identity: A thomistic account in light of contemporary science*. EDUSC.
- Fortin, T. (2017). Finding form: Defining human sexual difference. *Nova et Vetera*, 15(2), 397–431.
- Fortin, T. (2021). Reciprocal generativity: Reason, intimacy, and sexual difference. *logos. A Journal of Catholic Thought and Culture*, 24(1), 88–123.
- Schumacher, M. (2023). *Metaphysics and gender: The normative art of nature and its human imitations*. Emmaus Academic.

# Contents

<b>1</b>	<b>Introduction</b> . . . . .	1
1.1	The Question . . . . .	1
1.2	Goals . . . . .	2
1.3	History & Context . . . . .	2
1.4	Form & Method . . . . .	3
1.5	Order of the Work . . . . .	4
1.6	Limits and Limitations . . . . .	7
1.7	Sex and Gender, Gender and Sex . . . . .	7
	References . . . . .	8
<b>2</b>	<b>The Explanandum</b> . . . . .	9
2.1	Foundations . . . . .	9
2.1.1	Foundations and Modulations . . . . .	13
2.1.2	A More Complex Picture . . . . .	14
2.2	Twists in the Plot . . . . .	16
2.3	Minipuberty & Puberty . . . . .	18
2.4	Fertility . . . . .	20
2.5	Hormones . . . . .	21
2.6	Sex and the Brain . . . . .	24
2.6.1	Of Mice and Monkeys . . . . .	25
2.6.2	Sex and the Human Brain . . . . .	26
2.7	Behaviors, Desires, & Abilities . . . . .	29
2.7.1	Early Behavior and Play Themes and Styles . . . . .	29
2.7.2	Group Dynamics, Communication Style, and Friendship . . . . .	32
2.7.3	Adult and Adolescent Behavior . . . . .	33
2.7.4	Mate Selection, Sexual Behavior, and Parenting . . . . .	35
2.7.5	Cognitive Ability . . . . .	38
2.8	Battles of Brain & Behavior . . . . .	38
2.8.1	False Positives & Exaggerations . . . . .	39
2.8.2	The Significance of Significance . . . . .	40

2.8.3	Static & Dynamic Difference. . . . .	41
2.8.4	Whence Cometh Difference?. . . . .	43
2.8.5	Mosaics . . . . .	47
2.9	Conclusion . . . . .	51
	References. . . . .	52
<b>3</b>	<b>The Evolutionary Account . . . . .</b>	<b>55</b>
3.1	Introduction . . . . .	55
3.2	The Anthropological Context. . . . .	56
3.3	Foundations of Evolution. . . . .	61
3.4	Summary of the Foundational Principles. . . . .	64
3.5	The Evolution of Sexual Difference . . . . .	65
3.5.1	Why Divide the Power of Generation? . . . . .	65
3.5.2	Why Is the Power of Generation Divided Asymmetrically? . . . . .	67
3.5.3	Sex and Mating Strategies . . . . .	68
3.6	The Unfolding of Sexual Difference . . . . .	70
3.6.1	The Economy of Sexual Difference. . . . .	70
3.6.2	Male Competition . . . . .	74
3.6.3	Female Choice and Competition . . . . .	76
3.6.4	Proximate Causes. . . . .	79
3.7	Human Sexual Difference . . . . .	82
3.7.1	Female Investment . . . . .	84
3.7.2	Male Investment. . . . .	89
3.7.3	Costs of Paternal Investment . . . . .	89
3.7.4	Benefits of Paternal Investment . . . . .	91
3.7.5	Mating Strategies . . . . .	95
3.7.6	Female Choice . . . . .	96
3.7.7	Male Competition . . . . .	99
3.7.8	Role Reversals . . . . .	105
3.8	Summary and Conclusion . . . . .	107
	References. . . . .	113
<b>4</b>	<b>Simone de Beauvoir . . . . .</b>	<b>115</b>
4.1	Introduction . . . . .	115
4.2	Fundamental Anthropology . . . . .	117
4.2.1	A Useless Passion . . . . .	117
4.2.2	Passion and Negation. . . . .	119
4.2.3	Being, Existence, and World . . . . .	120
4.2.4	Projects and Future . . . . .	121
4.2.5	Freedom and Facticity . . . . .	123
4.2.6	The Other . . . . .	125
4.2.7	Oppression: A Negation of Negation of a Negation . . . . .	129
4.2.8	Ambiguity, Absurdity, and Antimonies . . . . .	131
4.2.9	World, the Body, and the Cartesian Subject. . . . .	134
4.2.10	Summary: Ethics, Anthropology, & Ontology. . . . .	136

4.3	The Second Sex . . . . .	138
4.3.1	Introduction . . . . .	138
4.3.2	The Argument in Summary . . . . .	139
4.3.3	A Genealogy of Otherness . . . . .	142
4.3.4	A Genealogy of Woman: How the Human Female Becomes Woman . . . . .	150
4.3.5	Why? . . . . .	166
4.3.6	No Exit? . . . . .	168
4.3.7	An Aristotelian Analysis . . . . .	170
4.4	Conclusion . . . . .	174
	References . . . . .	176
<b>5</b>	<b>Judith Butler</b> . . . . .	177
5.1	Introduction . . . . .	177
5.1.1	Summary of Butler's Account . . . . .	179
5.2	Foundations: Text and Power . . . . .	182
5.2.1	Inversions: From Substance to Act and Back Again . . . . .	182
5.2.2	The <i>Hors-Texte</i> . . . . .	183
5.2.3	Power and Inversion . . . . .	185
5.3	A Theory of Sexual Difference . . . . .	187
5.3.1	What Comes First? Sex or Sexuality? . . . . .	187
5.3.2	Gender Trouble, Sex Trouble, Substance Trouble . . . . .	190
5.3.3	The Destabilization of Sex . . . . .	192
5.3.4	Doing or Being? . . . . .	196
5.3.5	A Genealogy of Difference . . . . .	196
5.3.6	Making the Body: The Incorporation of Melancholy . . . . .	201
5.3.7	Soul and Surface . . . . .	203
5.3.8	Performativity and the Production of Power . . . . .	205
5.3.9	Seeds of Undoing . . . . .	207
5.3.10	Disruption, Parody, and Subversion . . . . .	208
5.3.11	To What End? . . . . .	211
5.3.12	Philosophy in Drag . . . . .	212
5.4	Conclusion . . . . .	213
	References . . . . .	215
<b>6</b>	<b>The Thomistic Account—A Causal Analysis</b> . . . . .	217
6.1	Introduction . . . . .	217
6.1.1	Foundations: Substance . . . . .	218
6.1.2	Form . . . . .	219
6.1.3	Nature and Ends . . . . .	219
6.1.4	Anthropology . . . . .	221
6.1.5	Realism . . . . .	221
6.2	A Very Brief History . . . . .	222
6.3	Causal Analysis: Formal Cause . . . . .	224
6.3.1	Acts & Powers . . . . .	226
6.3.2	Sex & Power . . . . .	228

6.3.3	Finding the Formal Cause . . . . .	231
6.3.4	Organs or Organization? . . . . .	235
6.3.5	Psyche, Self, & Sexual Difference. . . . .	237
6.3.6	The Social Self. . . . .	247
6.3.7	Dissonances . . . . .	250
6.4	Material Causality . . . . .	255
6.4.1	Wholes and Parts . . . . .	256
6.4.2	Matter of Unfolding Difference . . . . .	257
6.4.3	Psyche as Matter . . . . .	259
6.4.4	Matter of the Social Self . . . . .	260
6.5	Essence. . . . .	263
6.6	The Agent Cause . . . . .	263
6.6.1	Essences and Accidents . . . . .	263
6.6.2	Nature, Genes, & Hormones . . . . .	266
6.6.3	Discourse & Culture . . . . .	267
6.6.4	The Psychological Self & the Social Self . . . . .	269
6.6.5	A Final Point: Manifesting Form. . . . .	276
6.7	The Final Cause . . . . .	277
6.7.1	Necessity & Power. . . . .	278
6.7.2	Parts and Wholes, Wholes and Parts . . . . .	279
6.7.3	Two Questions . . . . .	281
6.7.4	Foundations of Human Society . . . . .	283
6.7.5	Sexual Difference & Logos . . . . .	285
6.7.6	Human Sexual Difference and the Intellect. . . . .	287
6.7.7	Sex and the Divine: First Take . . . . .	289
6.7.8	The Imperative of Alterity . . . . .	291
6.7.9	The One, the Many, & the One Again . . . . .	292
6.7.10	A Hermeneutic of Gift . . . . .	295
6.7.11	Deus sive Natura . . . . .	296
6.7.12	Person, Intellect, & Intimacy . . . . .	297
6.7.13	The Outside Text . . . . .	299
6.8	Summary of the Causal Account . . . . .	300
	References. . . . .	302
<b>7</b>	<b>The Thomistic Account—Ontological Analysis . . . . .</b>	<b>305</b>
7.1	Modes of Being . . . . .	305
7.1.1	The One and the Many: Revisited . . . . .	305
7.1.2	The Being of Sexual Difference: First Take. . . . .	307
7.1.3	Specific Difference and Substantial Form . . . . .	308
7.1.4	Essential Accidents . . . . .	311
7.1.5	Essence and Sexual Difference . . . . .	314
7.1.6	Powers and Dispositions—Revisited. . . . .	315
7.1.7	Power, Essence, and Sex . . . . .	315
7.1.8	Thomas’s Solution . . . . .	317
7.1.9	Nature as Acting for an End—Or Possibly Two . . . . .	318

- 7.1.10 A Point on Univocity & Analogy..... 322
- 7.1.11 Accident in Summary ..... 323
- 7.2 Sexual Difference as a Quality..... 324
  - 7.2.1 The Qualities of Qualities ..... 325
  - 7.2.2 The Quantity of Qualities..... 328
  - 7.2.3 Sexual Difference and the First Species of Quality..... 332
- 7.3 Summary of the Ontological Account ..... 333
  - 7.3.1 An Icon of Existence ..... 336
- References..... 337
- 8 Resolutions..... 339**
  - 8.1 Introduction ..... 339
  - 8.2 Nature, Substance, and Being ..... 340
    - 8.2.1 The Thomistic Position ..... 340
    - 8.2.2 The Evolutionists..... 342
    - 8.2.3 Beauvoir..... 344
    - 8.2.4 Butler..... 345
  - 8.3 Measures ..... 347
  - 8.4 Stories of Sexual Difference ..... 353
  - 8.5 Measure and Meaning ..... 360
    - 8.5.1 Essence..... 361
    - 8.5.2 Expanding Meaning’s Meaning ..... 361
    - 8.5.3 Agents and Ends ..... 362
    - 8.5.4 Significance ..... 363
  - 8.6 The Meaning of Human Sexual Difference..... 364
    - 8.6.1 The Evolutionists..... 364
    - 8.6.2 Simone de Beauvoir..... 365
    - 8.6.3 Judith Butler..... 366
    - 8.6.4 Thomas Aquinas..... 367
  - 8.7 Corollaries ..... 369
    - 8.7.1 Giving & Receiving..... 369
    - 8.7.2 The Fulcrum of the Feminine ..... 369
    - 8.7.3 The Fulcrum of Fertility..... 370
  - References..... 373
- Index..... 375**

# Abbreviations

<i>De ente</i>	<i>De ente et essentia (On Being and Essence)</i>
<i>De princ. nat.</i>	<i>De principiis naturae (On the Principles of Nature)</i>
<i>De ver.</i>	<i>Quaestiones disputate de veritate (Disputed Questions on Truth)</i>
<i>In De an.</i>	<i>Sentencia Libri De anima (Commentary on Aristotle's De anima)</i>
<i>In Meta.</i>	<i>Sentencia super Metaphysicam (Commentary on Aristotle's Metaphysics)</i>
<i>In Phys.</i>	<i>Sentencia super Physicam (Commentary on Aristotle's Physics)</i>
<i>QD De an</i>	<i>Quaestio disputata de anima (Disputed Questions on the Soul)</i>
<i>ScG</i>	<i>Summa contra Gentiles</i>
<i>ST</i>	<i>Summa Theologia</i>