The Catholic Historical Review

VOL. LXXXIII JULY, 1997 No. 3

# REACTION AND REFORM: RECEPTION OF HERESY IN ARRAS AND AQUITAINE IN THE EARLY ELEVENTH CENTURY

BY

Michael Frassetto*

In the first decades of the eleventh century, chroniclers throughout Western Christendom took note of the sudden and dramatic resurgence of religious dissent around them.1 Although certain of the diabolic inspiration of the heretics, chroniclers have left modern scholars with an uncertain record of the precise nature of the heretics' teachings. Much of this confusion in the documents stems from the hostility

*Mr. Frassetto is an assistant professor of history in LaGrange College, Georgia. He read a version of this article at the twentieth annual meeting of the Southeastern Medieval Association, held on September 29 and 30 and October 1, 1994. He wishes to thank Professor Daniel F. Callahan of the University of Delaware for his long-standing support.

'Numerous ecclesiastical writers in this period report the appearance of heresy in the early eleventh century. These writers, including Rodolphus Glaber, Paul of St. Père de Chartres, and Landulf of Milan, identify heretics in Orléans, southern France, Milan, Sicily, and other parts of Italy and the West. Useful introductions to and discussions of the sources may be found in D. Barthélémy and J. Chiffoleau, "Les sources cléricales et la notion de la clandestinité du Moyen-Age (France, XP-XTV' s.)," Hütoire et clandestinité du Moyen-Age à la première guerre mondiale (Colloque de Privas, May, 1977), Revue de Vivarais (1979), 19-39, esp. 21-23 and 26-27; Robert Henri Bautier, "L'hérésie d'Orléans et le mouvement intellectuel au début du XIl siècle," Actes du 95' Congrès national des sociétés savantes, Section philologique et historique, tome 1 (Paris, 1975), pp. 63-88; Monica Blöcker, "Zur Häresie im 11. Jahrhundert," Zeitschrift für Schweizerische Kirchengeschichte, 73 (1979), 193-234; Renate Gone, Die Ketzer im 11. Jahrhundert: Religiöse Eiferer—Soziale Rebellen? Zum Wandel der Bedeutung religiösen Weltbilder (Constance, 1981); and Brian Stock, The Implications of Literacy, Written Language, and Models of Interpretation in the Eleventh and Twelfth Centuries (Princeton, New Jersey, 1983), pp. 101-151.

of the orthodox to the heretics and the tendency of some chroniclers to identify heresy in terms established by St. Paul and St. Augustine. This difficulty can be overcome by reference to Arras and Aquitaine, regions where heresy received the most elaborate and lengthy documentary reaction. The documents from these areas, the Acta Synodi Atrebatensis in Manicheos of 1025 of Gerard of Arras-Cambrai and the history and unedited sermons of Ademar of Chabannes, contain the most important information concerning the nature of religious dissent in the early eleventh century.2 Moreover, in response to the arrival of the heretics, these authors provide in-depth commentary on the nature of orthodox belief and thus place themselves in the broader context of eleventh-century religious controversies. A comparison of the works of Ademar and Gerard, thus, would reveal unique insights into the development of religious belief, orthodox and heterodox, in the eleventh century.

The works of Ademar and Gerard are of particular value because of the backgrounds of these two ecclesiastics. The disgraced impressario of the failed apostolic cult of St. Martial, Ademar was a prominent monk in the communities of St. Cybard of Angoulême and St. Martial of Limoges.3 As a master of the arts of the scriptorium, he naturally became

The Acta of Gerard are edited in the PL, Vol. 142, cols. 1269-1312. Ademar's history is edited by Jules Chavanon, Chronique (Paris, 1897). The sermons are at Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale, MS. Lat. 2469, fols. G-112», and Berlin, Deutsche Staatsbibliothek (hereafter D.S.), MS. Lat. Phillipps 1664, fols. 58'-170r. I am assisting Daniel Callahan in the preparation of an edition of the sermons in two volumes to appear in Corpus Christianorum. It should be noted that there is another newly-discovered source concerning the appearance of heresy in Aquitaine. This is the long-known twelfth-century letter of the monk Heribert recently found by Guy Lobrichon in an eleventh-century manuscript. Although relevant to the discussion of this essay, I have chosen not to consider the letter for two reasons. First, it lacks the extended meditations on orthodoxy and heresy that are found in the sermons of Ademar and Gerard. Second, the issues involved with study of the letter are too complex for consideration at this time and require a separate treatment which I will provide in an article I am preparing on Ademar and Heribert. I can state, however, that I am unpersuaded by Lobrichon's arguments against the reliability of the letter as a witness to the appearance of heresy in the early eleventh century. See, Guy Lobrichon,"Le clair-obscure de l'hérésie au début du XIe siècle en Aquitaine. Une lettre d'Auxerre," Historical Reflections/Reflexions Historiques, 14 (1987), 423-444, and "The Chiaroscuro of Heresy: Early Eleventh-Century Aquitaine as Seen from Auxerre," in The Peace of God. Social Violence and Religious Response in France around the Year 1000, edd. Thomas Head and Richard Landes (Ithaca, New York, 1992), pp. 80- 103, and my,"The Sermons of Ademar of Chabannes and the Origins of Medieval Heresy" (Ph.D. dissertation, University of Delaware, 1993), pp. 26-30 and 78-80.

'For Ademar see Daniel Callahan, "The Sermons of Ademar of Chabannes and the Cult of St. Martial of Limoges," Revue Bénédictine, 86 (1976), 251-295: Leopold Delisle,"Notice sur les manuscrits originaux d'Adémar de Chabannes," Notice et extraits des manuscrits de la Bibliothèque Nationale, 35 (1896), 241-358; Frassetto, op. cit.; Richard Landes,

involved with the great artistic, liturgical, and musical reforms associated with the community at St. Martial. As a result of these activities, Ademar has left us an extensive literary corpus including works of forgery, hagiography, liturgy which provide important insights into the monastic mentality of this period.4 Slightly different insights are offered by the writings of Gerard. A conservative bishop of the north, Gerard was not involved in the liturgical or hagiographical reforms of his southern contemporary but rather was involved in the administrative duties his office required.5 Gerard, like Adalbero of Laon, supported the traditional tripartite division of society and asserted the prerogatives of the episcopal order. Ademar and Gerard, thus, offer valuable evidence because they provide us with the reaction of members of the two main orders of the institutional Church to the appearance of heresy.

As several scholars have noted, Gerard's Acta Synodi Atrebatensis is a complex document written in response to the appearance of heretics in Arras in 1025.6 As one of a series of documents in which Gerard condemned the enemies of the traditional social order, including the Peace of God and Cluniac reform movements, the Acta concentrate on the issue of the threat posed by religious dissent. Composed to respond to the heretics of 1025, the Acta reflect Gerard's long-standing concerns about conformity to and preservation of the established faith. The longest and most interesting section of the Acta is the defense of the sacramental and sacerdotal system of the Church which was composed

Relics, Apocalypse, and the Deceits of History: Ademar of Chabannes, 989-1034 (Cambridge, Massachusetts, 1995); Louis Saltet, "Un cas de mythomanie historique bien documenté: Adémar de Chabannes (988-1034)" Bulletin de littérature ecclésiastique, 32 (1931), 149-165, and Robert Lee Wolff, "How the News was brought from Byzantium to Angoulème; or, The Pursuit of a Hare in an Ox Cart," Byzantine and Modern Greek Studies, 4 (1978), 139-189.

4Michael Frassetto, "The Art of Forgery: The Sermons of Ademar of Chabannes and the Cult of St. Martial of Limoges," Comitatus, 26 (1995), 1-15; Landes, op. cit., pp. 77-178, 251-281, and Herbert Schneider, "Ademar von Chabannes und Pseudoisidor—der Mythomane' und der Erfalscher," in Gefälschte Rechtstexte der bestraften Fälscher, vol. 2 of Fälschungen im Mittelalter (Schriften der Monumenta Germaniae Histórica, Vol. 33 [Hanover, 1988]), pp. 129-150.

5Georges Duby, The Three Orders: Feudal Society Imagined, trans. Arthur Goldhammer (Chicago, 1980), pp. 13-43 and 129-146.

6IMd., pp. 29-36 and 130-134; Gorre, op. dt., pp. 132-169; Erik van Mingroot, "Acta synodi Attrebatensis (1025): problèmes de critique de provenance," Studia Gratiana, 20 (1976), 201-229; R.I. Moore, 7ibe Origins of European öfeeref, rev. ed. (Oxford, 1985), pp. 9-18; J.-M. Noiroux, "Les deux premiers documents concernant l'hérésie aux Pays-Bas," Revue d'histoire ecclésiastique, 49 (1954), 842-854; J. B. Russell, ? propos du synode d'Arras en 1025" Revue d'histoire ecclésiastique, 57 (1962), 66-87, and Brian Stock, op. cit., pp. 120-139.

between 1025 and 1042.7 Indeed, the sermon of Gerard was rewritten in the years after the synod, allowing the bishop or his secretary a period of reflection in which to develop a thorough defense of orthodoxy.

The other sections of the Acta provide evidence of the character of the heresy appearing in Arras. The opening section contains a letter written by Gerard to a certain bishop "R," most likely Roger I of Châlons-sur-Marne, in whose diocese the heretics had formerly appeared.8 In the letter, Gerard chastises this bishop for failing to correct the heretics who were now infecting Gerard's diocese and also describes the heretics' beliefs and missionary activity. The letter is followed by the procès-verbal of the synod, which includes Gerard's sermon or libellus. In this section the heretics are given opportunity to describe their own beliefs and assert that, in accordance with scripture, they reject baptism, the Eucharist, penance, marriage, the Church, and the cult of the saints.9 The hesetlcs' confession is followed by Gerard's long sermon, in which he demolishes the heretics' purported errors.10 The synod closes with Gerard victorious over the converted heretics and with a final summary of the defeated sectaries' beliefs." Thus the Acta provide at least three separate statements concerning the teachings of the heretics and an extended meditation on the nature of orthodoxy.12

Ademar's corpus provides commentary on the matters of orthodoxy and heresy in a manner similar to that of the Acta. In two of his numerous works, Ademar describes the arrival of heretics in his native Aquitaine. In his history, he reports that "Manichaeans," who abstain from food and seem as chaste as monks, appeared in Aquitaine, Périgord, Orléans, and Toulouse in 1018 and the 1020's.13 These brief reports of religious dissent are supplemented by his extended reflections on orthodoxy and heresy in the unedited sermons he wrote in the early 1030's.14 Concerned with the revival of dissent, Ademar examines a

'Mingroot, op. cit., p. 223.

'Acta Synodi, cols. 1269-1270. I follow Noiroux, op. cit., pp. 842-855, and Mingroot, op. cit.,pp. 215-218, rather than Russell, op. cit., pp. 66-87.

"Acta Synodi, cols. 1271-1272.

mIbid., cols. 1272-1311.

11TZhV/., cols. 1311-1312.

12Moore, op. cit.,pp. 10-16, identifies five separate statements.

aChronique,3:49 and 59, pp. 173 and 184-185.An important discussion of this can be found in Daniel Callahan, "The Manichaeans and the Antichrist in the Writings of Ademar of Chabannes:'The Terrors of the Year 1000' and the Origins of Popular Heresy in the Medieval West," Studies in Medieval and Renaissance History, 15 (1995), 163-223.

"Further discussion of the sermons can be found in Callahan, "The Sermons of Ademar," pp. 251-295, and Frassetto, "Sermons of Ademar."

wide variety of heresies in his sermons, including the Arian, Manichaean, and Sabellian. His denunciations of the historic heresies are matched by references to contemporary heresy and refutations of its flawed doctrines. Moreover, Ademar, concerned with questions of his own orthodoxy as well as that of the heretics, included in the sermons a vigorous defense of established Catholic doctrine. As a result of these concerns, the sermons are some of the most valuable but least-known sources for the nature of religious heresy and orthodoxy of this period. And, when compared with the material from Arras, the sermons provide new light on the nature of religious belief in the eleventh century.

The heretics emerging from the documents of Arras and Aquitaine are characterized by a combination of missionary zeal and ethical and doctrinal concerns. As Gerard notes in the prefatory letter to the Acta, the heretics had recently arrived in Arras after seducing the simple folk in the neighboring diocese of Chalons with their depraved dogmas.[15] The missionary character of the sect is confirmed by the heretics themselves, who reveal a corridor of heresy from Arras through Chalons to Italy by admitting that they were taught the lessons of the Gospels by a certain Italian named Gundolfo.[16] Ademar too recognizes the missionary activity of certain heretics in his homeland.[17] In the year 1018, he notes, Manichaeans appeared in Aquitaine, preaching their doctrine to the people. Evangelical or missionary activity, according to Ademar, is also a trait of the heretics who spread their error in Toulouse and several other places in the early 1020's. In fact, heresy broke out in Orléans in 1022 because of "a certain rustic from Périgord" who carried a magic powder made from the remains of children which converted to Manichaeism those who ate it.[18] Once having participated in this cannibalistic communion, the Manichaeans, like the witches in their sabbaths, would worship the devil, indulge in shameful crimes, and spread their evil to unsuspecting men and women.[19] Ademar repeats this tale in his

[15] "Acta Synodi, col. 1269.

[16] Ibid., col. 1271.

[17] "Chronique, 3: 49 and 59, pp. 171 and 184-185.

[18] "Ibid., 3: 59, p. 184. "Nam ipsi decepti a quodam rustico Petragoricensi, qui se dicebat faceré virtutes, et pulverem ex mortuis pueris secum ferebat, de quo si quem posset communicate, mox manicheum faciebat." For heresy in Périgord, see the works by Lobrichon and Frassetto cited above.

[19] Ibid., p. 185. See also Norman Conn, Europe's Inner Demons: An Enquiry Inspired by the Great Witch-Hunt (New York, 1975), pp. 16-59, for the demonization of medieval heretics. Cohn, p. 261, also notes that accusations of cannibalism and child murder were made by medieval ecclesiastics against the Jews. It should not be surprising, therefore, to find a process of demonization of the Jews in Ademar's sermons. For a consideration of

sermon De Eucharistia and reinforces the idea that the powder was used as a missionary tool which would permanently convert simple folk to heresy by diabolical means.20

Although Ademar felt compelled to identify the practice of the black arts as the secret of the success of the peasant from Périgord, the evidence from the sermons suggests a different reality. Indeed, as Brian Stock has demonstrated for dissidents at Arras, it is likely that the heretics of Aquitaine formed a textual community united behind the shadowy, charismatic figure from Périgord.21 Just as Gundolfo taught the Gospels to the heretics of Arras, the peasant of Périgord taught heterodox doctrines, most likely based on his own idiosyncratic reading of the Gospels, to the sectaries of Aquitaine and Orléans.22 For Ademar, the communion of the powder of the heretics, a perversion of the orthodox Eucharistie rite, created a heterodox community which could not be turned from its error by force or persuasion.23 But rather than some concrete object, it was, as Ademar reveals in his sermon De Eucharistia and his chronicle, the moral integrity of the heretics who frequently fasted and practiced chastity that converted the peasants of Aquitaine to heresy24 The simplicity of the lifestyle of the Manichaeans and rustic from Périgord provided a striking contrast to the worldly orthodox clergy with their increasingly elaborate liturgical practices. The peas-

this process, Daniel Callahan, "Ademar of Chabannes, Millennial Fears and the Development of Western Anti-Judaism," Journal of Ecclesiastical History, 46 (January, 1995), 19-35. See also Barthélémy and Chiffoleau, op. cit., pp. 29-33.

20D.S., MS. Lat. Phillipps 1664, fol. 75'. "Solent enim quidam ex eis portare secum pulverem de ossibus mortuorum hominum et quasi propter medicinam aliquibus rusticis in cibo aut potu de ipso pulvere ministrant. De quo pulvere si quis aliquid sumpserit, statim obliviscitur veritatem Dei, et in amentiam versus fit eorum similis. Et ita seductus in desperationem cadit ut nee praedicatione neque terrore neque amore nullatenus ad sanctam Catholicam ecclesiam redeat ultra. Et a iudicibus saecularibus Christianae dignitatis non nulli aliquando questioni subditi potius eligunt supplicium mortis quam salutem conversionis. Tanta vis diaboli est permissu divino ut sicut mártires pro defensione veritatis animas posuerunt sic haeretici pro amore falsitatis intereant et de morte corporum perveniant ad aeternam mortem animarum." References to the missionary activities of the heretics can be found also on fols. 71', 72v, 73', 74", and 1 14'.

21Brian Stock, op. cit., pp. 88-92 and 120-139. See also Richard Landes, "La vie apostolique en Aquitaine en l'an mil: paix de Dieu, culte des reliques et communautés hérétiques," Annales: ESC, 36 (1991), 579-584.

22Moore, op. cit. ,p. 29.

25D.S., MS. Lat. Phillipps 1664, fol. 75'. See also André Vauchez,"Diables et hérétiques: les réactions de l'église et de la société en Occident face aux mouvements religieux dissidents, de la fin du Xe au début du XIP siècle," Santi e Demoni nell'Alto Medioevo Occidentale (Secoli V-XI), Vol. 2 (Spoleto, 1989), pp. 588-590.

^Chronique, 3: 49, p. 172, and D.S., MS. Lat. Phillipps 1664, fol. 75'.

ants of Aquitaine, dissatisfied with the established Church, readily accepted the teaching of these foreign missionaries and organized themselves into textual communities around these missionaries.25 Ademar's sermons help to confirm the evidence of Gerard's Acta and provide a model by which heterodox doctrines could be introduced to the peasantry of Aquitaine and Arras.

Forming such evangelical communities, the heretics of Arras and Aquitaine spread a message rejecting both the fundamental teachings of the Church and the intermediary role of the priesthood. In the prefatory letter and concluding refutation, Gerard describes the sectaries' teachings. He notes in the letter to "R" that although they claim to follow the Gospels, the heretics reject baptism, the Eucharist, penance, and marriage.26 In the conclusion, Gerard repeats this list and adds that they also reject "the holy church of God and the sacred altar."27 The heretics, when offered the chance to speak at the synod, confirm Gerard's description of their teachings. They declare that baptism, the sacrament of the body and blood, and penance are useless, and reject the Church, marriage, and the cult of the saints.28 Responding to the bishop's further questioning, they say that nothing they teach is contrary to scripture and includes rejection of the world, restraint from the pleasures of the flesh, manual labor, and charity.29 Finally, they declare that those who follow this righteous path will not need baptism. Indeed, baptism itself, they explain, is worthless for three reasons: because of the moral corruption of the ministrant, because sins disavowed at baptism are repeated later in life, and because the infant cannot make the necessary profession of faith.30

The heretics of Aquitaine profess similar heterodox opinions, according to Ademar. In his history the monk of Aquitaine describes Manichaeans who "denied baptism and the cross, the Church and the Redeemer of the world, the honor of the saints of God, legitimate mar-

2,Landes, "La vie apostolique," pp. 577-584, and idem, "Between Aristocracy and Heresy: Popular Participation in the Limousin Peace of God, 994-1033," in The Peace of God, pp. 184-218.

2'Acta Synodi, col. 1270.

"Ibid., col. 1311:"sanctam Dei ecclesiam, et sacrosanctum altare." Giorgio Cracco,"Le Eresie del Mille: un fenómeno di rigetto délie strutture feudali?" in Structures féodales et féodalisme dans l'Occident méditerranéen (X*-XÏÏT siècles) ("Collection de l'École française de Rome," Vol. 44 [Rome, 1980]), pp. 346-347.

™Acta Synodi, col. 1271.

29Ibid., col. 1272.

xIbid.

riage and all sane doctrine."31 These same heretics abstained from food and lived simple and chaste lives.32 Moreover, Ademar notes that the Manichaeans of Orléans seemed more religious than all others in that city.33 Thus, like Gerard, Ademar identifies sectaries who practice a rigid moral lifestyle and teach unorthodox doctrines.

In the sermons, Ademar repeats many of his statements from the history concerning the doctrinal character of the heretics' beliefs. In the sermon De Eucharistia, he describes these beliefs in several separate passages. In this sermon, he denounces Manichaeans who refuse to honor the sign of the cross and refutes the errors of these religious dissidents on the sacrament of baptism.34 He also advises all Christians to avoid those heretics who say that "nothing is gained from communion at the holy altar."35 These heretics, Ademar continues, also deny baptism, the cross, the Church, marriage, and all worldly wealth and honors.36 Ademar repeats these descriptions in other sermons of the collection. In one sermon he compares the heretics of his day with the Jews described by John the Evangelist who refuse the mystery of the sacrament of the bread and wine.37 And in yet another passage, he confirms the missionary and doctrinal nature of the sectaries when he warns of "certain heretics who secretly rise among us denying baptism, the mass, the cross, and the Church and who are messengers of Antichrist."38

Heresy appeared to Ademar and Gerard as an actively evangelical movement with a developed intellectual challenge to the Catholic institutional and doctrinal establishment. Although it has become commonplace to question the veracity of these first accounts of heresy or discern levels of meaning unrelated to heresy itself, it can be argued

^Chronique, 3.49, pp. 173 and 210."Paulo post exorti sunt per Aquitaniam Manichaei, seducentes promiscuum plebem. Negabant baptismum et crucem, Ecclesiam et ipsum Redemptorem seculi, honorent sanctorum Dei, conjugia legitima et quidquid sanae doctrinae est." The italicized sections are from the H version of the history, written ca. 1025-1028, and are printed on p. 210 by Chavanon.

}2Ibid.

33TWd., 3: 59, p. 184.

54D.S., MS. Lat. Phillipps 1664, fols. 72\ 73', and 75' for rejection of the cross, and fols. 74'-74v for baptism.

nIbid., fol. 75'. "Ideo cávete ab haereticis qui dicunt nihil prodesse communionem sancti altaris."

*Lbid. "Et … se ieiunare a cibis quos Deus creavit abstinere, nulli maledicere, pecuniam saeculi relinquere, honores pro nihilo ducere, nuptias damnare. . . ."

37TZMd., fols. 107'-108'.

xIbid., fol. 114v."Dicere habemus vobis de aliis rebus quae pertinent ad sinodum et de haereticis qui modo latenter inter nos surgunt qui negant baptismum, missam, crucem, Ecclesiam, qui praecursores Antichristi sunt."

that the accounts from Arras and Aquitaine represent a fair approximation of the heretics' beliefs. Moreover, it is likely that Ademar and Gerard witnessed the emergence of heretical textual communities in a line from Arras through Aquitaine to Italy39 At the very least, the similarity of the unorthodox teachings reported by Ademar and Gerard reflect a general dissatisfaction with the nature of Church and society in the early eleventh century that could undermine the established order. Thus, the material from Arras and Aquitaine provides strong evidence for recognizing a geographically broad movement emerging at the millennium which raised both an ethical and doctrinal challenge to the institutional Church.

Although comparison of thereto and sermons of Gerard and Ademar offers new perspectives on the nature of heresy itself, of greater interest is the response of these orthodox churchmen to heresy. Their reaction to religious dissent and perception of it, whether accurately reflecting the heretics' teachings or not, is of significance in understanding the evolution of the Church's teachings in the eleventh century.40 Indeed, reports of heresy virtually disappear from our sources after about mid-century, but the issues raised by the heretics, or at least perceived to have been raised by them, continued to be addressed by orthodox churchmen, particularly the Gregorian reformers, even after the disappearance of the sectaries.41 The important question concerning the

"That heresy was a broad movement in this period has been suggested by a number of scholars including Antoine Dondaine, "L'origine de l'hérésie médiévale," Rivista di storia délia chiesa in Italia, 6 (1952), 47-78; Raffaello Morghen, "Problèmes sur l'origine de l'hérésie au moyen âge," Revue Historique, 236 (1966), 1-16, and, more recently, Jean-Pierre Poly and Eric Bournazel, The Feudal Transformation 900-1200, trans. Caroline Higgitt (New York, 1991), pp. 272-308. Moore, op. cit., pp. 1-43; Malcolm Lambert, Medieval Heresy: Popular Movements from the Gregorian Reform to the Reformation, 2nd ed. (Oxford, 1992), pp. 9-32, among others, have argued against this view.

"Lambert, op, cit., pp. 4-5, notes, "It takes two to create a heresy: the heretic, with his dissident beliefs and practices; and the Church, to condemn his views and define what orthodox doctrine is. . . . [HJeresies are an integral part of the medieval scene in a number of countries, and their growth is a phenomenon which runs side by side with, often directly influencing, such well-known developments as the rise of papal power, the growth of canon law, the emergence of religious orders and the development of the crusading ideal." It should be noted also that the sermons of Ademar and Gerard form part of the broader redefinition of society described by R. I. Moore, The Formation of a Persecuting Society (Oxford, 1987), esp. pp. l 1-26 and 100-123.

41H. EJ. Cowdrey'The Papacy, the Patarenes and the Church of Milan," Transactions of the Royal Historical Society 5th ser, 18 (1968), 25-48; Heinrich Fichtenau, "Zur Erforschung der Häresien des 11. and 12. Jahrhunderts," Römische historische Mitteilungen, 31 (1989), 78; Ilarino da Milano, "Le Eresie Popolari del Secólo XI nell'Europa Occidentale," Studi Gregoriani, 2 (1947), 79-89; R. L Moore, "Family, Community and Cult

early eleventh-century appearance of religious dissidents may not be whence they came or what they believed but what impact they had on the orthodox Church. The extended commentaries of Ademar and Gerard suggest that the heretics had profound influence on the development of orthodox teaching in the eleventh century by forcing ecclesiastics to define and defend their positions against these new foes. Clearly, the reactions of Ademar and Gerard to heresy in their day place them in the broader context of the institutional and theological debates of the decades to come.

In their respective works, Ademar and Gerard took the opportunity presented by the appearance of the heretics to respond to the various critics or enemies of the Church. Ostensibly responding to the criticisms of the heretics, these two orthodox churchmen compiled an elaborate apology for the established sacramental and sacerdotal system of the institutional Church.42 Indeed, they argued that salvation could be obtained only by performing specific works including, especially, the acceptance of the sacraments from the hands of the clergy. Moreover, their commentary, often in strikingly similar language, addressed a number of the fundamental issues that would concern ecclesiastics throughout the eleventh century. And thus, although the precise teachings of the heretics may remain unclear, the appearance of religious dissidents forced Ademar and Gerard to define more clearly the fundamental beliefs of Catholic orthodoxy.

In response to the heretics' apparent indictments of clerical morality and the Church's intermediary role in the plan of salvation, Ademar and Gerard, in the sermons and the Acta, discuss the nature of the clerical order and emphasize its responsibility for administering the sacraments. Moreover, like the Gregorian reformers later in the century, they recognized the necessity of a celibate clergy. Indeed, Ademar included canons concerning clerical celibacy in his version of the proceedings of the Council of Bourges, and Gerard argued that marriage was supported in the Gospels for the laity but not for the clergy.43 Clearly, ques-

on the Eve of the Gregorian Reform," Transactions of the Royal Historical Society, 5th ser, 30 (1980), 49-69, and Jeffrey B. Russell, Oi'sserci and Reform in the Early Middle Ages (Los Angeles, 1965), pp. 18-100.

"Although the discussions of both Ademar and Gerard extend beyond these issues to include such things as church buildings, the use of incense and bells, the Cross, etc., it is the defense of the sacramental system, as Stock, op. cit., p. 134, notes, that is the cornerstone for "the description of the utility of the church's other practices."

"'For Ademar, see "Concilium Bituricense," Mansi, Vol. 19, cols. 503 and 505-506, and D.S., MS. Lat. Phillipps 1664, fols. 63' and 88'. For Gerard, see^cfa, cols. 1299-1301.

tions concerning the sexual purity and sacramental function of the clergy would remain uppermost in the coming decades and for Ademar and Gerard were inspired, in part, by the criticisms of the heretics.44

Ademar and Gerard's attention to the clergy was not limited to matters of morality but, in reaction to the heretics' rejection of the priesthood as a whole, included a spirited defense of the sacerdotal order. In his libellus, Gerard responds to the heretics' repudiation of clerical authority by asserting the necessity of the various religious orders in the sacramental life of the Church and by identifying biblical references justifying the clergy's existence.45 Ademar too emphasizes the necessary role of the clergy in the life of the Church. And, like Gerard, Ademar recognizes the apostolic origins of and scriptural support for the priesthood. In one insertion into his copy of the Pseudo-Isidore he notes that the apostolic community at Jerusalem established the precedent for both the monastic and sacerdotal orders.46 Moreover, in a sermon simply entitled In Sínodo Sermo, he explains that like the Apostles themselves the priests stand in the place of Christ.47 Indeed, Ademar and Gerard, by locating the source of the authority of the priesthood in the precedent of the Apostles and scripture, suggest that to oppose the clergy is to oppose the Apostles themselves. It may be suggested, therefore, that their purpose was to disprove the heretics' claim to follow the teachings of the Apostles.48

Ademar's defense of the apostolic origins of the priesthood led him to consider also the important didactic and sacramental functions the clergy inherited from the Apostles. Throughout his sermons, Ademar refers to the responsibility of the clergy to preach. It is the duty of the priests to teach the Gospel so that the faithful will know the way to salvation and know what is clean and unclean. The priests must teach

44On eleventh-century concerns with sexual purity see Moore,"Family, Community and Cult," pp. 64-69, and Amy G. Remensnyder, "Pollution, Purity, and Peace: An Aspect of Social Reform between the Late Tenth Century and 1076," in The Peace of God, pp. 280-307.

454cto,cols. 1273-1284 and 1291-1294.

46D.S., MS. Lat. Phillipps 1664, fol. 147".

i7Ibid.,M. 108v. See also fols. 82v and 104'.

45We are reminded again about Ademar's activities as impressario of the apostolic cult of St. Martial. It is likely that his promotion of the saint's cult was intended, in part, to curtail the heterodox activities of followers of the apostolic life by establishing the apostolic cult of Martial. The cult, thus, can be seen as the official church reaction to popular spiritual demands. On this see Landes, Relics, Apocalypse and the Deceits, pp. 50-74, and Berhnard Töpfer, "The Cult of Relics and Pilgrimage in Burgundy and Aquitaine at the Time of the Monastic Reform," in The Peace of God, pp. 21-40.

their flocks the truths of the faith, especially the Lord's Prayer and the Apostolic Creed, so that their sheep can pray properly and confess their faith in God.49 Furthermore, it is clear that Ademar saw preaching as essential in protecting the orthodox from the errors of the heretics. In the sermon De Eucharistia, Ademar calls on the priests to preach to their flocks to protect them from heretics who wish to seduce them to error.50 In one of his shorter sermons defending the Catholic faith, Item in Concilio, Ademar repeats his exhortation to the clergy to fulfill their responsibility to preach so that the faithful will be able "to resist the sayings of future heretics contradicting the truth and the harbingers of Antichrist."51 Indeed, so important is the obligation for the clergy to preach for Ademar that he repeats his appeal to the clergy to preach the true faith as a defense against the errors of the messengers of Antichrist a second time in this short sermon.52

More important than the pedagogical responsibilities of the priesthood for Ademar, however, was the sacramental function. Indeed, for Ademar and Gerard, administration of the sacraments was the primary duty of the priesthood and its rejection by the heretics most seriously threatened ecclesiastical authority.53 Consequently, Ademar devotes much attention in his sermons to the sacramental authority of the clergy. In the sermon In Sínodo Sermo, he reminds the priests that they stand in the place of Christ who commands them, as he commanded the Apostles, to perform the rite of communion.54 Emphasizing the evangelical origin of the clerical order against the heretics' claims to follow the Gospels, Ademar repeats the argument throughout this sermon that the priests are following Christ's command when they administer communion. Moreover, Ademar declares that Jesus and the clergy perform the sacrament only for those who accept Christ and not for heretics or pagans.55 Responding to heretics who deny the truth of the sacrament, Ademar and Gerard demonstrate the apostolic origin of the

*>Ibid., fols. 83v,96v, and 122".

"Ibid., fol. 75'.". . . et nuntii sunt Antichristi et seducere volunt oves Domini. . . . Vos autem praedicate assidue plebibus vestris."

nIbid., fol. 96t." 'vos, o sacerdotes Christi sicut a patribus scriptum est, debetis fidem Catholicam discere ut possitis veritati contradicentibus futuris haereticis et Antichristi praenuntiis resistere. . . .'"

'2Ibid.

53MM Rubin, Corpus Christi: The Eucharist in Late Medieval Culture (Cambridge, 1991), pp. 319-324. For Gerard's sentiments on the Eucharist and the clergy, see Acta, cols. 1278-1279 and 1291-1293.

54D.S., MS. Lat. Phillips l664,fols. 107'-108\

KIbid.,iolA06\

sacramental function of the priesthood and the awesome authority the order possesses as a result of administering the sacraments.

Ademar and Gerard's concern with defense of the sacramental authority of the priesthood was the result of the heretics' renunciation of the Eucharist itself and the other sacraments. In their sermons, Ademar and Gerard refute the real or perceived errors of the heretics concerning baptism, penance, and unction and provide the orthodox definition of these rites. These issues would continue to attract the interest of theologians in the coming decades, but the most important issue raised by the heretics and their orthodox opponents in the early eleventh century is the definition of the Eucharist. A matter of little concern since the mid-ninth-century debate of Ratramnus of Corbie and Paschasius Radbertus, definition of the Eucharist would become one of the most hotly contested issues in Christendom from the mid-eleventh century until the early thirteenth.56 This debate would not need to wait until the great controversy of Berengar and Lanfranc in the 1050's but first reemerged in the response of orthodox churchmen like Gerard and Ademar to rejection of the Eucharist by the heretics of their day.

For Gerard, defense of the Eucharist was one of the most important issues he faced in refuting the heretics. Gerard, and Ademar as well, believed that the Eucharist was the rite binding all believers just as it bound heaven and earth to the despoliation of hell.57 Moreover, Gerard demonstrates the importance of this sacrament for salvation by reference to the precedent of Gregory the Great and to Scripture itself.58 Clearly responding to the heretics' claims that their faith was based on the Gospels, Gerard demonstrates the scriptural foundation for the Eucharistie rite by citing Jesus' command to celebrate communion in his memory. The Lord's invitation to this sacred meal, Gerard continues, provides us the only way to salvation.59

Gerard grants the Eucharist a central role in the plan of salvation because it contains the presence of Christ himself. It is this mystery that attracts Gerard's attention and offers this orthodox ecclesiastic a powerful weapon against the charisma of heretical preachers.60 Moreover, it is Gerard's demonstration of the reality of the physical presence of Christ in the Eucharist against the errors of the heretics that associates

560n the eucharistie debates see Stock, op. cit., pp. 252-315.
^Acta Synodi, col. 1278. Rubin, op. cit.,p. 13.
'"Acta Synodi,cols. 1279-1282.
'9LbId.
aRubin, op. cit., p. 13.

Gerard with later eleventh-century commentators on this matter. In the Acta, Gerard confirms the reality of the flesh and blood of Christ in the bread and wine by citing the passage from John in which the Jews denied that Jesus was the living bread they must eat for salvation. And, as further evidence of the real presence, Gerard describes the miraculous transformation of the wafer into an infant and visions of choirs of angels above the altar at communion.[61] Thus, inspired by the purported rejection of the Eucharist by the heretics of Arras, Gerard took part in a debate on the sacrament that would last throughout the century and into the next.

Ademar too lavishes a great deal of attention in his sermons on the Eucharist, including discussion of its role in the plan of salvation, and justification of it by reference to the Gospels, especially John.[62] Moreover, like Gerard, Ademar asserts the salvific nature of the Eucharist. In his sermon De Eucharistia Ademar explains that the performance of the sacrament contributes to "the salvation and redemption of the human race."[63] In another piece entitled In Sínodo Sermo, Ademar observes that the sacrament of the body and blood brings eternal life and perpetual salvation to those who accept it.[64] He also declares that the host at communion brings us absolution, the grace and blessing of heaven, eternal peace and blessedness.[65] And, as he reveals in his Sermo de Oratione Dominica, it was the heretics' rejection of Catholic doctrine on the Eucharist that inspired Ademar to emphasize the importance of this sacrament for salvation.[66]

In his sermons, Ademar, like Gerard, responds to the purported questions of the heretics concerning the Eucharist by indulging in sophisticated doctrinal considerations related to the fundamental mystery of the sacrament. Of primary importance for Ademar was the demonstration of the orthodox teaching of the real presence. Like Gerard, Ademar

aActa Synodi, col. 1283. On miracles and the Eucharist see Rubin, op. cit., pp. 112-113 and 116-120, and Benedicta Ward, Miracles and the Medieval Mind, rev. ed. (Philadelphia, 1987), pp. 13-18.

«D.S., MS. Lat. Phillipps 1664, fols. 74v-75' and 123' for salvation and fols. 67", 75", 103', and 107"-108' for references to John.

aIbid., fols. 74"-75'."Ista communio sanctorum hoc est sacramentorum a vobis sacerdotibus cotidie celebratur in salvatione et redemptione generis humani quando panem et vinum per invocationem Patris et Filii et Spiritus Sancti consecratis in corpus et sanguinem Domini."

"Ibid., fol. 103'.

<"Ibid.,M. 109'.

66IbId., fol. 114T.

confirms the physical presence of Christ in the Eucharist by citing the occurrence of a variety of miracles and prodigies.67 He describes the vision of a wounded infant in the hands of the priest at the altar. He cites another vision in which a seated boy appeared in place of the bread of communion. Ademar says also that others have seen angels circling a seated boy above the altar or the wounded Lamb shedding blood into the chalice held in the hands of the priest. Reference to these miracles was part of Ademar's attempt to prove the reality of Christ's presence in the Eucharist against errors of the heretics.

Ademar asserts the reality of the presence in several other ways throughout the sermons. Participating in the kind of debate that would predominate in the coming decades, he declares that "the bread and cup of the altar is nothing other than the immaculate and true body of Christ."68 In De Eucharistia, he repeats this understanding of Christ's presence in the sacrament and includes explanation of how the miracle occurs.69 He preaches that the invisible consecration of the Holy Spirit transforms the visible offering of the bread and wine into the actual body and blood of the Lord.70

In one final sermon, In Sínodo Sermo, Ademar clearly demonstrates the connection between the appearance of heresy and his concerns with the defense of orthodoxy. In this sermon he makes numerous references to heretics who, like the Jews mentioned in the Gospel of John, deny that the bread and wine is the body and blood of Christ.71 In response to what he believed were the claims of the heretics, Ademar explains the orthodox doctrine concerning the mystery of the Eucharist. He preaches in this sermon that before it is consecrated, the substance of the Eucharist is purely that of the bread and wine; but after it is consecrated, the offering is the true flesh and blood of Christ.72 Once the priest repeats the words first uttered by Christ at the Last Supper, the bread and the wine are transformed into the same flesh and blood born of the Virgin Mary.73 This miracle, Ademar asserts, occurs by the opera-

67UWd., fols. 103'-103T.

68B.N.,MS.Lat.2469,fol.90r.". . . panem et calicem altaris non aliud quam inmaculatum et verum Christi corpus et sanguinem. . . ."

"D.S., MS. Lat. Phillipps 1664, fol. 74'.

70Ibid., fol. 70VItaque per visibilem vestram oblationem et invisibilem Sancti Spiritus consecrationem, panis et vinum transeunt in tantam dignitatem ut corpus et sanguis Domini efficiantur."

71Ibid.,fols. 104', 106', and 107-108'.

72TMt, fol. 103'.

7iIbid.,íol 106\

tion of the Holy Spirit who performs the invisible transformation of the substance while the priest officiates over the visible ceremony at the altar.74 Thus, like Gerard, Ademar sought to demonstrate the importance of the Eucharist and the existence of the real presence in the bread and wine in response to the heretics in Aquitaine.

The rebirth of heresy at the time of the millennium engendered a passionate response from many churchmen who desired to preserve the unity of the faith. In the face of religious dissent chroniclers and bishops like Ademar and Gerard recorded the heretics' beliefs to warn contemporaries of this new danger. Although it is possible that the characterization of the heretics came from the pages of Paul and Augustine, the similarities in the accounts of Ademar and Gerard demonstrate at least a limited sense of the beliefs of the heretics. Indeed, the accounts from Aquitaine and Arras reveal a growing sense of dissatisfaction among many lay Christians with the institutional Church and its teachings. More importantly, these documents reveal the influence heresy had on the development of Catholic teaching in the eleventh century. The heretics themselves raised issues concerning the purity of the priesthood and the value of the sacraments that would continue to concern the Church in the coming decades. Moreover, the heretics forced clerics like Ademar and Gerard to examine a number of doctrinal issues including the role of the clergy and the nature of the Eucharist. Indeed, the discussions of Ademar and Gerard on these doctrinal questions foreshadow the great debates of Berengar and the Gregorians later in the century. Thus, heresy in the early eleventh century contributed to the evolution of Catholic orthodoxy because it forced Ademar, Gerard, and others to address the very doctrinal issues that would interest clerics in the decades to come.

74Ibid., fols. 70' and 104'.

# RECONCILIATION OF CULTURES IN THE THIRD REPUBLIC: EMILE MALE (1862-1954)

Joseph F. Byrnes*

## The Lost Catholic Patrimony1

When Emile Mâle deciphered the art programs of the French medieval cathedrals, and, in fact, religious art from the twelfth to the eighteenth centuries, he rediscovered a culture2—clerical, artistic, and popular—that had been expressed in the art.3

"Mr. Byrnes is professor of modern European history in Oklahoma State University, Stillwater. He wishes to acknowledge gratefully the help of Gilberte Emile-Mâle, daughter of the historian; Annick Adam, librarian and archivist at the Bibliothèque de l'Institut; and Daniel Moulinet, Francis-Noël Thomas, and Elizabeth Williams. A brief version of this article was presented at the annual meeting of the Western Society for French History in October of 1994.

¦André Chastel glosses the term "patrimony" as "an artistic and architectural (monumental) heritage in which one can recognize oneself." See "Le Patrimoine," in Pierre Nora (ed.), Les Lieux de mémoire: II La Nation ** (Paris, 1984-1992), p. 420. This volume is one of a series of seven. The first is entitled La République; the second, third, and fourth volumes are bear the title // La Nation, each successive volume indicated by one, two, three asterisks; the fifth, sixth, and seventh volumes all bear the title III Les France, each successive volume indicated by arabic numerals and subtitles. Readers of these volumes should consult Steven Englund's masterly criticism of their analytical framework. See "The Ghost of Nation Past," Journal of Modern History, 64 (1992), 299-320, and "History in a Late Age: A Review Essay of Pierra Nora, ed., Les France" French Politics and Society, 14 (1996), 68-79- Englund argues forcefully that "nation" and "France" are ideological constructs subject to historical and critical analysis. Taking my cue from Englund, I hold that Male's achievement must be understood as part of a continuum: a major step in the scholarly clarification of medieval culture and a major step in the development of one principal definition of French national consciousness. Philip Schlesinger says that "national cultures are not simple repositories of shared symbols to which the entire population stands in identical fashion." Rather they are to be approached as sites of contestation in which competition over definitions takes place. See "On National Identity: Some Conceptions and Misconceptions Criticized," Social Science Information, 26 (1987), 260-261; I am grateful to Steven Englund for pointing out this reference.

2"Culture" has been defined by the anthropologist Clifford Geertz as an "historically transmitted pattern of meanings embodied in symbols, a system of inherited conceptions

Over a period of thirty-four years Mâle published four great syntheses of religious art history. Each synthesis was effected in a different manner, depending upon the sources used to explain the subject matter and the media employed by the artists. In LArt religieux du XIIIe siècle en France (1898), then, it was the Speculum Majus, the encyclopedia of religious thought by Vincent of Beauvais. In LArt religieux de la fin du moyen âge en France (1908), it was the Franciscan theologians of deep religious sentiment; in LArt religieux du XIIF siècle en France (1922),

expressed in symbolic forms by means of which men communicate, perpetuate, and develop their knowledge about and attitudes toward life." See Clifford Geertz,"Religion as a Cultural System," The Interpretation of Cultures: Selected Essays (New York, 1973),p.89. In the decades since the appearance of this essay, the concept of culture has become highly politicized. Stefan Collini says that contemporary cultural studies are less concerned with the "plurality of symbolic systems and practices that enable different groups to make various kinds of sense of their lives"; more concerned with the attempt to give voice to minority cultures—"social therapy." See his "Escape from DWEMsville: Is Culture Too Important to be left to Cultural Studies?" Times Literary Supplement, May 27, 1994, pp. 3-4. In my essay I retain the use of the term "culture" in the older, standard anthropological sense established by Geertz. Male's work was, in effect, a study of "culture" as defined by cultural anthropologists from Clyde Kluckholn to Clifford Geertz. Among modern medievalists, those who have cultural concerns complementary to those of Mâle are Georges Duby and Aaron Gurevich. If Mâle represents the proximate cultural cause of the production of religious art, Duby presents the more remote, secular causes. For example, in L'Europe des cathédrales, 1140-1280 (Geneva, 1984), he starts from the Paris of Philip Augustus, the influence of the Arab philosophers, the importance of Italian money, and the power of Frederick II. Gurevich, in Historical Anthropology of the Middle Ages, trans. Jana Howlett (Oxford, 1992), privileges "culture" as a fundamental experience that finds expression in religious and political behavior; he insists, however, on a fundamental distinction between popular and elite culture. See below, note 5.

3Male transformed a recently developed historical discipline, iconography, to study the artistic representation of ideas, the iconography of the Middle Ages. In creating his syntheses, he studied the ideas of individuals (participating in groups, to be sure), the conventions of institutions, the images, beliefs, and symbols that are found across populations. "Iconography" literally means to describe ("graphein") an image ("eikon"); for a brief explanation of this discipline, see Louis Réau, Iconographie de l'art Chrétien, Vol. I (Paris, 1955), pp. 1-11. The value of Male's work, specifically as synthesis, is explained in Léon Pressouyre, "Emile Mâle,le moyen âge et nous," interview in Préfaces, no. 2 (1987), p. 130. The validity of Male's basic theses is indirectly confirmed by the synthesis article of Herbert L. Kessler,"On the State of Medieval Art History," The Art Bulletin, 72 (1988), 166-189- Examining a decade's worth of monographs, Kessler draws together broad conclusions on periodization, the medieval art object and production from scholarly writing that "has focused on single works or on small groups of related monuments" (p. 186). In fact, the broad conclusions do not notably diverge from Male's synthesis.

I analyze other aspects of Male's achievement in two projected, partially completed studies: (1) his transformation of nineteenth-century medievalism, and (2) his contributions to the development of historical theology (ecclesiology).

it was St. Bernard, Suger, and the great abbots of Cluny; and in L'Art religieux après le concile de Trente (1932), it was the theologians of the Counter-Reformation.4 To put it another way, the unity, the synthesizing principle of the epoch and of Male's own work, was thought for the thirteenth century, sentiment at the end of the Middle Ages, the monastic impulse (powerful monastic foundations produced and patronized both religious activity and artistic expression) for the twelfth century, and church authority, organized for defensive—and offensive—action, in the period after the Council of Trent. But thought, sentiment, movement, and institution exist in cultures: elite clerics, artists, and religiously active people from various levels of the social hierarchy—from princes to poor intellectuals and, yes, even some of the farmers and small merchants—transmuted their experiences into a common religious culture.5

In Male's hands, iconography, generally understood to be the classification and interpretation of images, became a study of the ideas and methods that produced the images and of the culture that produced the ideas and methods. The subtitle of his first book, "A Study of Medieval Iconography and its Sources of Inspiration," makes it clear that iconography is, in its primary sense, the actual artistic expression of ideas; secondarily, it is the study of this artistic expression. His achievement was uniquely different from the cataloguing, conservation, and restoration of medieval monuments effected by Arcisse de Caumont, Alexandre Lenoir, Antoine Quatremère de Quincy, Alexandre du Sommerard, and Eugène Viollet-le-Duc; uniquely different, also, from the deciphering efforts of Adolphe-Napoléon Didron, the clerical team of Cahier and Martin—and Roger Gaignières long before them.6 The religious art of the Middle Ages was not a monument to be preserved and

4An these volumes were published in Paris by Armand Colin.

'John Van Engen argues that a choice does not have to be made between a Catholic golden age and an Indo-European religious folk culture: there is an interaction, in that the mentalities of the lower classes influenced the theological ideas of the elite, and the preaching of the theologians and clergy was absorbed by the common people. See "The Christian Middle Ages as a Historiographical Problem," American Historical Review, 91 (1986), 537-538. Michel Lauwers prefers to speak of "milieux" within "culture" in " 'Religion populaire,' culture folklorique, mentalités: note pour une anthropologie culturelle du moyen âge," Revue d'histoire ecclésiastique, 82 (1987), 221-258. I prefer these distinctions to the dichotomy posited by Gurevich; see note 2.

6See in particular the articles on Lenoir, de Caumont, and Viollet-le-Duc (as well as on Guizot and Mérimée) in Nora, Lieux de mémoire: Il Nation**. Otherwise consult Le "Gothique" retrouvé avant Viollet-le-Duc: Exposition à l'Hôtel de Sully, 31 octobre 1979-17 février 1980 (Paris: Caisse nationale des monuments historiques et des sites, 1979).

reverenced, a. lieu de mémoire where one could meditate on France as Nation and^fifepublic.7 Mâle confronted his colleagues and readers with a French way of life of another age. It was that culture, as signified in the art and reconstituted in his prose, that became the lieu de mémoire. My goal is to demonstrate how Male's achievement derives from his powers to place his own culture, the intellectuals and educated readers of the Third Republic, in contact with medieval Catholic culture. He thereby gained broad acceptance of this culture as an element of the French national patrimony.

## Formation: Republican and Catholic

The Third Republic was born in turmoil, political and religious. In 1871, the Paris Commune, inspired by an exaggerated revolutionary Republicanism, was accompanied by an anticlerical violence that culminated in the execution of the Archbishop of Paris, Georges Darboy In reaction, the new National Assembly, led by monarchists, voted for public prayers of reparation, a vote reinforced by the activities of mayors, magistrates, and army officers. Early rivalry of the leading Republicans, the Moderate Adolphe Thiers and the Opportunist Léon Gambetta, gave way before the electoral success of the monarchist general Patrice MacMahon and his government of "Moral Order." For six years MacMahon presided over attempts to restore conservative (even aristocratic) political and religious control of France. When finally he was forced to resign, the Republican government sought to control religious orders: teaching congregations were required to ask for state authorization; monasteries were closed; many priests and religious were expelled. Control of the schools was the fundamental goal. Jules Ferry, alternately minister of public instruction and prime minister, established the fully secularized public education system by law. Laws voted into place between 1882 and 1886 in particular concretized Ferry's program.8 When

The expression lieux de mémoire has the range of meanings proposed by Pierre Nora in the series described above: from the most material and concrete, such as the Archives Nationales and monuments to the dead, to the most abstract intellectual constructions, such as the notions of lineage, generation, or even region and homme mémoire. See Nora, Lieux de mémoire: La République, p. 7.

"Jean-Marie Mayeur and Madeleine Rebérioux, The Third Republic from its Origins to the Great War, 1871-1914, trans. J. R. Foster (New York, 1984). Ideological intensity could not have characterized the country as a whole. Mayeur and Rebérioux say, "The real cement which kept the republican party together was . . . the common desire to secularize the state and social life" (p. 84). By 1881, peasants and members of the middle class found their own interests best represented by the Republicans. That year the Republican gov-

Emile Mâle entered the École Normale in 1883, the Ferry ministry had just appointed as its head Georges Perrot, a sincere Republican. And Mâle was loyal to this intellectual tradition at the same time as he searched for the religious and cultural meaning of a tradition of living and thinking that the Revolution, the republican tradition, had renounced.9 In fact, knowing the varieties of national sentiment embodied in the political language and culture of the predominant intellectuals and politicians of the Third Republic, he fashioned the history of medieval religious art in the form of a communication to his own times. In other words, by representing the alien medieval religious culture in the intellectual "native language" of his day, he served as the bridge across the divide that separated secular intellectual life in the Third Republic from the Catholic religious experiences and expressions of medieval France.

Recalling that he had never worked more ardently than he did for admission to the École Normale, he said, "If I succeeded, it was because I had the lively desire to succeed that without doubt came to me from my father."10 He was admitted on August 19, 1883, along with Lucien

ernment received more than 50% of the vote in all but six departments. See the maps charting "the conquest of the Republic by the Republicans," ibid., pp. 32-35. Maurice Agulhon's broad and balanced interpretation of the secular and religious antagonisms in government should also be consulted; see The French Republic, 1879-1992, trans. Antonia Nevill (Cambridge, Massachusetts, 1992), chap. 1: "Ten Founding Years, 1879-1889."

There were, still and all, some first moves toward dialogue. Robert J. Smith cites the texts of Ernest Lavisse ("little marvels of reconciliation"), who taught at the Ecole Normale from 1876 to 1880, but whose influence on the École and the Sorbonne continued for over thirty years. Lavisse, in fact, never declared himself during the Boulanger or Dreyfus affairs, remaining "more of a nationalist than a partisan politician." Joseph Bédier, a good friend of Male's, emphasized the close textual analysis that he and his mentor, Gaston Paris, had learned in Germany. But he was also a free spirit: "A free-thinker, a Dreyfusard, and a friend of Lucien Herr and Jean Jaurès, Bédier was nevertheless not a socialist." See Robert J. Smith, The Ecole normale supérieure and the Third Republic (Albany, New York, 1982), pp. 61, 62, 65.

""Souvenirs inédits." Cited in Emile Mâle, le symbolisme chrétien, catalogue of the Exposition Emile Mâle, edited and arranged by Monique Kuntz, Head Librarian of the Bibliothèque Municipale de Vichy, for the exhibition of May 28-June 20, 1983, at Vichy (Allier), France: #46 (hereafter Exposition). A published edition of the "Souvenirs inédits" is projected—to be accompanied by an introduction and, perhaps, a selection of Male's letters. At the moment, the "Souvenirs" exist only in the notebooks that Mâle filled in over the years while on vacation, and they are still in the possession of the family. A few typewritten copies of these notebooks are in circulation, but they have no archival significance and will be destroyed when a printed edition is finally published. My own citations from the "Souvenirs" are limited to those passages previously cited in various printed sources; here I thank Gilberte Emile-Mâle for making available to me a copy of the "Souvenirs," as

Herr, later librarian of the École Normale, and a significant intellectual influence there for many years, Stéphane Gsell, the historian of North Africa, and Joseph Bédier, specialist in French medieval literature. Though not ranked among the highest after the entrance examinations because he had missed a question in history, his exceptional abilities were quickly recognized. After his first major presentation—on the Egyptian gods—Ernest Desjardins, his history and geography professor, stood up and said, "In the twenty-five years that I have been a professor at the Ecole Normale I have never seen a debut as remarkable as this one."[11]

To Mâle the École Normale offered an advanced education and a personal experience of national community: "This common life, this daily companionship will certainly develop all sorts of qualities that one would look for in vain in the faculties. Fraternity, that is the great strength of the École Normale. I understood that from the first day."[12] His notebooks preserved from the period, written in tiny, tight script, are the evidence for his intense work habits—though his work did not blind him to his old family values.[13] He wrote to his parents:

> I have not seen much, but I have read much, and books often supply for experience.—Well, do believe that nothing, nothing in the world inspires as much respect in me as the simplicity and honesty of your life. Ancient wisdom said that parents find in their children their punishment and their reward: be happy—you have all my love and all my respect."

Without disparaging education, Mâle stated that plain and simple people had a spirit and a wisdom that could not be inculcated by anything as superficial as a teaching method. His grandfather Mâle was for

well as a wide range of materials now collected and catalogued in the Papiers Emile Mâle of the Bibliothèque de l'Institut de France. In this article I provide the "manuscript" (carton) number from the Papiers Emile Mâle (hereafter PEM). For a full bibliography of Male's publications, established by Elie Lambert with the assistance of Mme Emile Mâle and Gilberte Emile-Mâle, see "Bibliographie de Emile Mâle," Cahiers de Civilisation Médiévale, 2 (1959), 69-84; re-editions and new editions published since 1958 are, of course, not included.

"To his parents, November 5, 1883, PEM, ms. 7657. In the PEM one finds only photocopies of Male's letters to his parents. The originals, still in possession of the family, will probably be donated to a library or museum in the town of Commentry (Allier), Male's birthplace.

12Ibld.

"The coursework notes, along with some sketch notebooks that formed part of Male's iconographical research, are in the possession of the family, pending donation to a library or museum.

1To his parents, July 21, 1884, PEM, ms. 7657.

him, as he said in his later years, "the peasant of pure race, . . . the peasant of a thousand years ago and of two thousand years ago."[15] In one of his earliest publications, a speech delivered to the lycéens of Toulouse in 1891, he extolled the merits of the ordinary people who knew enough to appreciate the beauty and monuments of France. Savants from the days of Fénelon and Voltaire down to his École Normale teachers and classmates, who were taken with Roman history and Italy, did not have such an appreciation. Rather, said Mâle, "The people alone, at a time when the savants no longer understood, knew how to love beautiful things with a profound instinct."[16] He praised the stonecutters and the carpenters, and ordinary French visitors who alone knew how to love the arenas of Aries, the portal at Chartres, and the great nave at Amiens. In modern times, he said, Michelet and the other great historians have learned to feel and think like the people. Because their solidarity with popular sentiment was lost, these intellectuals now had to know much in order to love much.

Encounter with the work of Ernest Renan helped Mâle to define his own Catholic sentiments. He had attended some of Renan's lectures at the Collège de France and had read L'Histoire des origines du christianisme in 1885 when he brought the book home with him during a grip epidemic—all the normaliens were sent home during this period. He said that those few weeks passed at Monthieux counted for much in his intellectual formation. He knew then that Renan could never be for him "a master of thought, but only a master of style."[17] Mâle could not understand how one could explain away the miracles of Christ and the spread of Christianity as purely natural history. He realized the strength of his "Catholic" sentiments: across the years his father had attended Mass each week, and his mother was quite devout. Although Male's mother's family, of Bourbonnais origins, had been living in Charolles, the next city over from Paray-le-Monial (site of the Sacred Heart apparitions), we have no record of them entering into these religious controversies of the epoch. In fact, Mâle could recall that his father would read aloud to the family from Victor Hugo's Notre-Dame de Paris (Hugo's works had been placed on the Catholic Index of Forbidden Books). The religious turbulence of Paris did not reach their home, with the excep-

[15] "Souvenirs inédits," in Exposition, p. 7.

[16] Discours de distribution des prix du lycée de Toulouse [31 juillet 1891] (Toulouse, 1891), p. 10.

[17] "Souvenirs inédits," in Exposition, p. 2.

tion of the Commune uprising, when there was such danger to the management class everywhere that Gilbert Mâle decided to keep a revolver close to his bed at night.18

After having lapsed from active religious practice in the secular atmosphere of the Ecole Normale, Emile returned to active church life when he became deeply involved in his study of the Middle Ages.19 He finished first in the agrégation des lettres from the École Normale. As such he was entitled to go to the École Française at Athens, where he would have a chance to pursue his passion for Greek art and thought. But a profound intellectual and emotional experience at Florence focused his attention on the rationality and beauty of medieval art. Traveling in Provence and Northern Italy with his cousin Gustave Debrière during the month of September, 1886, he came to Florence and the Church of Santa Maria Novella. Already he had been taken by the frescoes of Giotto and monuments contemporary to Dante. Standing in the Spanish chapel of the Florence church, he studied the fourteenth-century frescoes of Andrea da Firenze, "The Triumph of St. Thomas Aquinas," and "The Church Militant and Triumphant."

"I was struck by the grandeur of the ordering thought," he said.20 Like a thunderclap, a revelation, he knew what he wanted to be, a historian of art and the Middle Ages. Each fresco was a representation of order, sheer order. On one side, the medieval hierarchy was arrayed against a background that resembled the cathedral of Florence: Pope, Emperor, cardinals, kings, rich and poor, St. Dominic guiding from on high; on the other side, Thomas Aquinas on a level above the human sciences personified by beautiful female figures, and at their feet the great thinkers of antiquity—Aristotle, Cicero, Euclid, Ptolemy, and others.

Returning to France, Mâle immediately gave himself over to a serious reading of Dante, and for a time thought he might do a study of the influence of Dante on Italian art."I followed the sublime poet across three worlds: a magisterial work, a summa of human intelligence, and the im-

18The revolver incident was first recounted to me by Gilberte Émile-Mâle and is found in the "Souvenirs inédits," PEM. The Hugo incident comes from the same source. See Exposition^. 1.

"I am grateful to Gilberte Émile-Mâle for providing me with this information. There was, in fact, a varied and active group of Catholics at the Ecole Normale in the first decades of the twentieth century. See Paul Cohen, "Les Elèves Catholiques de l'Ecole Normale Supérieure, 1906-1914," Cahiers d'Histoire, 29 (1984), 33-46. Formal religious practice was not widespread, although some of the normaliens were practicing Catholics, even members of the St. Vincent de Paul Society.

""Vocation italienne," L'Amour de l'art, 46-48 (1950), 3.

perishable glory of Italy"[21] While teaching—he had taken a position at his old lycée at St.-Etienne—he plunged into careful readings of Eugène Viollet-le-Duc and Adolphe-Napoléon Didron. He was studying, writing, formulating the ideas that he published in article form several years later, and in book form over ten years later.'Tt was at Monthieux that the plan for my first book came to me, and it was there that my destiny was fixed."[22]

Still and all, Mâle remained independent of the formally Catholic movements of the era. Such movements came into being to revive the most powerful and successful elements of medieval church life, such as scholastic philosophy, monasticism, and pilgrimage. Individual churchmen, like all others who turned to the Middle Ages, had their own fads and fancies, some of them not far removed from the nationalism of the politicians and the esotericism of some novelists. The renewal of scholastic philosophy brought new attention to Thomas Aquinas, other scholastics, and the Church Fathers too; several monastic foundations produced historians and manuscript specialists, and the pilgrimage revival brought people to centers of prayer and devotion, some of which—one thinks of Chartres, first of all—were showcases of medieval art.[23]

A revival of medieval scholastic philosophy was in progress[24] at the same time as Mâle was developing his own history of medieval religious

21 Ibid.

22 "Hommage à M. Emile Mâle de l'Académie française," Mémorial de la Loire et de la Haute Loirejxùy 28, 1928.

23 On nineteenth-century French enthusiasm for shrines and apparitions see Thomas A. Kselman, Miracles & Prophecies in Nineteenth-Century France (New Brunswick, New Jersey, 1983).

24 For a classical and brief general history of the Thomist revival, see Etienne Gilson,"In the Spirit of Scholasticism," chapter 12 of Etienne Gilson, Thomas Langon, and Armand Maurer, Recent Philosophy: Hegel to the Present (New York, 1962). The writings of Vincenzo Buzzetti, professor at the seminary of Piacenza, represented the transition from the technique of overlaying, dear to the previous centuries, to the ways of the modern Neo-Thomists:"On the one hand, they had to rediscover the true doctrine of Thomas Aquinas hidden beneath the layers of alluvia deposited on it by the past five centuries" (p. 331). Equally important in the Thomist revival was Joseph Pecci, professor at the seminary of Perugia, and Giovanni Cornoldi, professor at the seminary of Padua. Pecci was the brother of Pope Leo XIII, who brought Neo-Thomism into the center of Catholic intellectual life. In 1897, Pecci (by then a cardinal), Cornoldi, and Pope Leo XIII founded the Roman Academy of St. Thomas Aquinas. This effort was paired with the publication of Leo's encyclical letter promoting a return to scholastic philosophy in general and Thomas's philosophy in particular, Aeterni Patris of August 4, 1879. Ultimately the best studies of Neo-Thomism produced in France—and Belgium—came after Male's work on the thirteenth century had been published. The most fully developed branch of the scholastic revival grew up in

thought. But this revival had no observable influence on him. His own goal was to show how the "thought" of the Middle Ages was a systematization and synthesis of the thought of the Church Fathers by way of the ancient Greek and Roman philosophers. Dante was the model here, and Mâle considered him as a possible subject for his École Normale dissertation. At the École Normale, Plato and St. Augustine were the principal philosophical ghosts. Father Alphonse Gratry a chaplain who had left the Ecole by mid-century and was eventually admitted to the Académie Française as a philosopher, was more in the tradition of the philosophies of inner experience synthesized in the teaching of St. Augustine, rather than in the Aristotelian Thomistic tradition. Gratry's ideas were preserved in the philosophical teaching of Léon Ollé-Laprune, and we do know that Mâle worked with Ollé-Laprune's recasting of Aristotle.25

When Mâle began to read the writings of medieval theologians, a massive collection of medieval and patristic authors was at his disposal. It was his good fortune that an ecclesiastical entrepreneur of a generation earlier, the Abbé Jacques-Paul Migne, had published hundreds of volumes of the principal extant writings of Christian thinkers across the centuries. As entrepreneur, Migne was primarily a publisher, and not a scholar or leader of any kind of movement. He was not a medievalist or interested in a revival or re-establishment of anything medieval, but he made possible Male's own work on the Middle Ages. Migne's passion for commerce bordered on blatant commercialism. He projected 2000 volumes, set up an enormous printery at one time employed as many as 500 printers, typographers, editors, and other practical and intellectual functionaries in his Ateliers Catholiques in the Petit-Montrouge district of Paris. Though the prices of his volumes were always kept very low, he initiated several credit-union-type schemes, trafficked in Mass stipends, and advertized his enterprise in phrases as grandiose in self-

Belgium at the University of Louvain, where a school for the study of Thomism was established. French Dominicans began the publication of the Revue Thomiste in 1893, and their leading intellectuals, A. D. Sertillanges and Pierre Mandonnet, did their major work in the twentieth century. For a concise recent summary, see Gerald A. McCool, The Neo-Thomists (Milwaukee, 1994).

2The archives of the École Normale contain the library loan records of the Mâle years. Bibliothèque (Registre des emprunts)/Élèves/1885-1886, lists the books Mâle checked out (thirty-three titles on the philosophy of Greece and Rome, literature, mythology, and religion) including Ollé-Laprune's Essai sur la morale d'Aristote. See also Smith, op. cit., chap. 4. Ollé-Laprune was an influence on Maurice Blondel, Like Ollé-Laprune a committed Catholic. On Gratry, see Le Père Gratry, 1805-1872:L'homme et l'oeuvre d'après des documents inédits (Paris, 1901).

glorification as in ambition. Neither ignorant nor poorly educated, Migne was still and all really not equipped for serious editorship of historical documents. But just as he was able to keep a huge business on its feet, he was able to secure the help of the right people.26 Dom Jean-Baptiste Pitra, the man responsible for the editing of the patrologies, was a monk of the Benedictine-revival monastery at Solesmes, and necessarily a disciple and associate of Dom Prosper Guéranger, founder of the restored monastic community.27 Indirectly, then, Mâle benefited from the revival of Benedictine monasticism at Solesmes that sustained Dom Pitra: Pitra's motivation as editor of historical editions came from reliving the monasticism of an earlier historical epoch.

Not only theologians, but historians and archaeologists, conservers and restorers took on primary importance for Mâle after that emotional and intellectual encounter with the Florence frescoes.28 Returning to teach in the lycée, his course work finished at the École Normale, he still had not decided on a thesis topic. Back at St.-Etienne, with the experience at Florence still fresh in his memory, he gave free rein to his suddenly and fully established master-passion for the Middle Ages, and he used every minute not taken up by professional teaching duties on his medieval studies. In the library of the Palais des Arts he discovered two treasures: Eugène Viollet-le-Duc's magisterial Dictionnaire raisonné de l'architecture française du XIe au XVF siècle and the journal founded by Adolphe-Napoléon Didron, Annales archéologiques. His understanding of the rational beauty and proportions of the Gothic de-

26For a summary of earlier studies of Migne, see the entertaining R. Howard Bloch, God's Plagiarist: Being an Account of the Fabulous Industry and Irregular Commerce of Abbé Migne (Chicago, 1994).

27See Fernand Cabrol, Histoire du Cardinal Pitra (Paris, 1893). At first Pitra wanted to do substantial editorial work, but soon time constraints forced him to reproduce existing editions. He contented himself with brief indications of editions chosen and the addition of minimal commentaries, notes, and charts. Working day and night, he moved with great speed, and was ultimately responsible for both patrologies—though other scholars did collaborate in minor ways. By the time the two patrologies were issued Pitra was a cardinal and encouraging Migne to do an edition of the General Councils in time to benefit scholars at the First Vatican Council. See pp. 107-108.

2The two most important studies of nineteenth-century archaeologists, conservers, and restorers are Paul Léon, ?a Vie de monuments français; destruction, restauration (Paris, 1951), and Jean Mallion, Victor Hugo et l'art architectural (Paris, 1962). For a recent, concise history, see Jean-Michel Léiûaud, Jean-Baptiste Lassus (1807-1857) ou le temps retrouvé des cathédrales (Paris, 1980), chap. 2: "A la recherche d'une nouvelle culture, l'art médiévale." On the cathedral and the Gothic revival, see Alain Erlande-Brandenburg, The Cathedral: The Social and Architectural Dynamics of Construction, trans. Martin Thom (New York, 1994), Introduction.

rived from Viollet-le-Duc; later Mâle attributed the modern discovery of the Gothic to Viollet-le-Duc, comparing him to Champollion, who first deciphered Egyptian hieroglyphics; each discovered a "world."[29] As soon as Mâle found his seat on the trolley that used to take him from the St.-Etienne lycée to his home at Monthieux, he opened whichever volume of the Dictionnaire he was working on and began to read. The Annales archéologiques made an even stronger impression on him. Struck by the enthusiasm for the Middle Ages that he found on every page, he said, "Reading them, I saw what I had to do."[30] Didron, by his own writings and by his editorship of the Annales archéologiques, most developed the embryonic discipline of iconography: the identification of themes, persons, objects, and motifs that are represented by artistic forms. Didron was a journalist, dealer in devotional objects, a stained-glass window designer, and utterly devoted to the revival of Gothic architecture, art, and the understanding of its subject matter.[31] Mâle acknowledged his debt to Didron and all his predecessors in the preface to his first book, L'Art religieux du XIIF siècle en France—pages that still serve as a concise history of the development of iconography.

## Teaching Medieval Catholic Culture

As a young professor, Mâle ardently promoted the teaching of art history on the lycée and university levels. He observed that we look for a history of the Middle Ages in the university curricula in vain, in spite of the work of Didron and others. While there were courses in medieval French literature, the important thinkers, all of whom wrote in Latin, were thereby neglected—Thomas Aquinas, Gulielmus Durandus, Vincent of Beauvais—"And it is in their works only that we will find the secret of these times."[32] Only the art vested the religious life and ideas with a perceptible form that was worthy of them: "the cathedral, with its mystical geometry, its thousands of painted or sculpted personages, is, to be precise, theology, liturgy, sacred science clothed in perceptible

2,See "Hommage à M. Emile Mâle de l'Académie française."

»Cited ibid.

31In the introduction to his Iconographie chrétienne, Didron argued that the medieval sculpture and stained glass were designed for the faithful in general and that the organization of ideas embodied in the art followed the division of Vincent of Beauvais's Speculum majus. These two notions were placed in high relief in Male's study of thirteenth-century religious art. See Adolphe-Napoléon Didron, Iconographie chrétienne: Histoire de Dieu (Paris, 1843).

""L'Enseignement de l'histoire de l'art," Revue universitaire, 1 (January 15, 1894), 14.

forms."33 The written vesture of the ideas was far less beautiful: "When the thought is beautiful, the form is very often mediocre. . . . what the thirteenth century did not know how to say it carved."34 Naturally, the advantages gained by the study of the Middle Ages are also gained by the study of Renaissance and modern art. Mâle highlighted the specific importance of the study of medieval art for understanding the France of the past, recognizing that students can also learn much about other countries. He did not want his students to "pass with indifference before the works into which their Fathers had put so much genius and love"; they should not be strangers in their own country. But he eschewed the quasi-religious qualities of nationalism: "Michelet wanted France to be a religion; let it at least be a subject to be taught."35 Male's use of his own love of France as a means of communication of the value of the medieval religious art patrimony was appropriately in evidence years later when he was appointed to teach at the Sorbonne after the years as a lycée professor.36

Mâles LArt religieux du XLIF siècle en France had achieved such renown, that he was appointed to teach the course, "Histoire de l'art chrétienne du moyen âge," at the Sorbonne. In his Opening Lesson, December 8, 1906, he again explained the crucial importance of the study of the Middle Ages for an adequate understanding of the culture of modern France."The art of the Middle Ages is perhaps the most original creation of France," he said. In other areas there are rivals and masters of the French: the Italian Dante gave the epic poem its perfect form and the English Shakespeare realized the potentialities of poetry and beauty in drama, but "on the other hand, there is nothing in Europe that can be compared to the cathedral of Chartres or the cathedral of Rheims."37 The Romanesque churches of Germany are half-Germanic, half-Italian,

»Ibid., pp. 14-15.

i4lbid.,p. 15.

"Ibid., p. 17. On nationalism in modern France, see Robert Tombs (ed.), Nations and Nationalism in France: From Boulangism to the Great War (New York, 1991), and Steven Englund,"The Ghost of Nation Past."

i6No one before Mâle had placed the cultural, historical, and civic importance of art education into such high relief. Six years later, Georges Perrot published an entire book on the topic of art in secondary education, wherein he lamented that Male's admonitions had not been heard. Perrot developed the case for art history, saying that it added to a student's knowledge and understanding of the past. Sometimes art fills in lacunae in the written tradition; for example, statues can tell of attitudes toward the role of an emperor or of changes in an emperor's personality. See Georges Perrot, L'Histoire de l'art dans l'enseignement secondaire (Paris, 1900), pp. 34 (n. 1), l6ff.

ä7" 'L'Art chrétien au moyen âge': Leçon d'ouverture faite à la Sorbonne le 8 décembre 1906: Revue bleue,! (1907), 138.

and really stem from the Holy Roman Empire of Charlemagne; furthermore, Germany has no variety and no novelty compared to the architectural originality of the different regions of France. Reviewing the origins of Gothic art, Mâle wrote,'! do not know if there is a spectacle more beautiful than to see, at the beginning of the thirteenth century, France become the educator of Europe."38

This opening lecture contains a refutation of the then popular view that Gothic architecture began in Germany, engendered by the German's love of nature with all its exuberance and its intricacy. Although Mâle is pleased to see that few German scholars continue to support this view, the error is of such long standing—Mâle singles out Sulpiz Boisserée,39 the friend of Goethe, for dishonorable mention—that he must continue to preach the priority and superiority of French Gothic.

He notes the influence of French art on Hungary, Scandinavia, and England. Looking southward, he describes possible influences of Cluny and Citeaux on the great Spanish cathedrals, pointing out the features that the cathedral of St. James at Compostela had in common with St-Sernin of Toulouse. In Italy, in spite of the work of Italian artists, many of the great churches show French influence.

> We are permitted to conclude, then, that France awakened the genius of Italy, asleep for centuries. The artists of Italy owe as much to our great Gothic masters as Dante and Petrarch to our troubadors."

Reviewing the sources of French iconography, he underlines the influence of the Mystery Plays upon post-thirteenth-century art. This, of course, was the principal theme of his then forthcoming study of art at the end of the Middle Ages:"One must conclude that it is France, by the intermediary of the theater, that created the new Christian iconography."41 Here, he would have to change his mind because, whatever the influence of France upon Italy before and during the thirteenth cen-

"???.,?. 139.

"Boisserée was among those instrumental in the Neo-Gothic continuation of the building of Cologne cathedral, begun in the Middle Ages but left incomplete until the nineteenth century. In 1833, he published his principal study of medieval architecture. See W D. Robson-Scott, The Literary Background of the Gothic Revival in Germany (Oxford, 1965), pp. 282ff.

*""L'Art chrétien au moyen âge," p. 173.

41Ibid.

tury, Italian artists of the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries very much influenced the French religious art that came after them.42

In 1912-13 Mâle gave two lectures under the auspices of La Revue française politique et littéraire. These lectures, part of a series called Conférences Chateaubriand, were centered on the forces behind the building of the cathedrals, and on the great medieval patron of the arts, the Duc de Berry. Of the cathedrals, he says,

> To build the cathedrals that so astound us today, much enthusiasm, much genius, and also much money were necessary. I would like to show you in this lecture, that all the lively forces of France collaborated in this great work, and that there are on our soil no monuments that belong more to the nation.43

Mâle emphasizes the Frenchness of the cathedrals in order to render them personally meaningful to his listeners. His brief history includes the usual citations about the people's participation in the building of the cathedrals, where the money came from, and the achievements and methods of workers and artists. The key role of clergy and theologians in determining the art programs is underscored. He gives his usual elegant description of the monuments, reminding his listeners, virtually all of them French, that the cathedrals represented their heritage. The Due de Berry, who was "something other than a hero," is also commended for his support of the beauties of art and architecture on French soil: "It is thanks to him above all, that great French art did not become a victim of the Hundred Years' War. … If, then, we judge that French art is one of the most noble creations of France, we have the right to demand for the Duc de Berry, not only indulgence, but gratitude."44

## The Political Context

As a little boy who felt the humiliation of the 1870 French defeat in the Franco-Prussian war, Emile Mâle had decided that one day he would make up for it in his own way:

42TMs change is reflected in the second edition (1922) of L'Art religieux de la fin du moyen âge en France.

43lL'Art gothique: les collaborateurs de la cathédrale," ?a Revue française politique et littéraire, January 28, 1912, p. 487.

44lLe Moyen âge; le duc de Berry—protecteur des arts," ibid., July 6, 1913, p. 381.

> That war that I could not yet understand, but the disasters of which I learned as if half drearning, marked the child that I was with a profound imprint. I felt later that our defeat was connected with my very substance, and I had from then on the secret desire to do something one day that would bring honor, however little it be, to a humiliated France.45

Mâle as an adult was very private about his politics, having had friends on the French Left and the French Right across the years. His great friend was the socialist, Lucien Herr. Librarian at the École Normale for many years, Herr was extremely active in political discussion, writing under an assumed name. His hidden proselytizing was rewarded with success, because he numbered among his converts Jean Jaurès and Léon Blum. Mâle himself was fascinated by Herr, and very much under the influence of his extraordinary powers of philosophical discourse. Only in the domain for which he is best known, political thought, did Herr have no real influence on Mâle, for the latter was never active in politics and appreciated political ideas more for their shape and subtlety. In other areas of life, Herr's influence was apparent: Mâle later requested Herr to read his thesis and comment on its values, and Herr introduced the young Mâle to the music of Wagner. Years later, when Lucien Herr became engaged to marry a young woman who had originally come to Paris to study with Mâle, it was to Mâle first of all that he announced the engagement.46

On the other hand, Mâle was a kindly mentor to the art historian Louis Gillet, who was himself sympathetic to the right-wing nationalism of Maurice Barres. In fact, the calm political stance of Mâle contrasted so much with Gillet's feelings that he interpreted Male's calm, reasoned ways as indifference:

> This great intellectual led the existence of a calm visionary, knowing nothing here below except those things that are worthy of love, indifferent to the general hubbub, without intrigue, without ambition, skirting the edges of the crowd, taken up only with a few of the great ideas and some of the most precious dreams of the human race—the best efforts of the human imagination—one can say of such a Life that it is made of the stuff of dreams.47

¦""Souvenirs inédits," in Exposition, p. 28.

"Lucien Herr to Emile Mâle, October 13, 1911, PEM, ms. 7655. On the life and work of Herr, see Charles Andler, Vie de Lucien Herr, 1864-1926 (Paris, 1932); Daniel Lindenberg and Pierre-André Meyer, Lucien Herr, le socialisme et son destin (Paris, 1977), and the Correspondance entre Charles Andler et Lucien Herr, 1891-1926, édition établie, présentée et annotée par Antoinette Blum (Paris, 1992).

"Louis Giüet,Amitiés littéraires (Paris, 1928), p. 126.

Gillet said that Mâle came out of his political isolation in World War I. In fact, he caricatured Mâle, who voted in all national elections. "For the first time the author became aware that he was dreaming; the clash of arms awakened him."[48] Otherwise, "he always remained on the sidelines, keeping his grievances to himself, and preferring the society of the dead to that of the living. … He lived only with the shades."[49] In spite of this strange exaggeration, Gillet on the whole is reverential—"I do not believe that I have ever seen him [Mâle] without going away enriched, refreshed, and having renewed my store of enthusiasm, for such was his empathy and his capacity for admiration."[50] At least his remarks indicate that Mâle was not a standard-bearer for any political party, and they contain one correct notion, that World War I did activate Mâle to impassioned expression.

The opening and early development of the war brought the artistic passion of Mâle to the surface. German cannonading of Rheims cathedral profoundly affronted Male's love of beauty and of France. Since nothing was more valuable, more representative of the highest efforts of the human person than Rheims cathedral, nothing could be more representative of human malice than its destruction. It was 1914, and Rheims had been hopelessly scarred, blackened by soot and flames, partially destroyed:"When France learned that the cathedral of Rheims was in flames, her heart shrank; those who wept for a son, still found tears for the holy church."[51] France is the great unity summed up in the cathedral of Rheims; so the cathedral can be compared to a son, a member of the family, to oneself.

Mâle had always considered it virtually proven that German medieval architecture was totally derived from outside sources, above all from France. What had before been a negative judgment about originality of German Gothic, now turned to anger.[52]

[48] Ibid., p. 127.

[49] Ibid.

[50] Ibid., p. 125.

[51] "La Cathédrale de Reims," Revue de Paris, December 15, 1914, p. 294.

[52] To appreciate the profound anti-German antagonism of Mâle and other French scholars during this war, we should review the larger context: in the nineteenth century, many French intellectuals expected Germany to liberate France from some of its ordinariness in literature and philosophy, because they idealized German intellectual life. See Claude Digeon, La Crise allemande de la pensée française, 1870-1914 (Paris, 1959). In the face of German invasion, academics indebted to German thought—to wit, Charles Seignobos and Lucien Herr following a line of thought earlier developed by Fustel de Coulanges and Emile Durkheim—were perfectly ready to denounce the Germans as barbarians and hypocrites.

> [They] have turned their cannons on the beautiful statues that have spread peace about them, that speak only of charity, of gentleness, of forgetfulness of self. They have taken aim at the apostles who presented themselves as disarmed as Christianity itself, and who today are as mutilated as soldiers. The entire world has been moved by this crime: everyone feels that a star had paled, and that beauty had been diminished on the earth.53

He points to his beloved Divine Comedy to illustrate the perversity of this destruction. What if some tyrant had destroyed the Divine Comedy of Dante, with its beauty of order, richness of thought, and perfection of form, he asks. Mâle recalls the value of Rheims for the French, who enter the cathedral to seek, first of all, the place where Joan of Arc, "that angel from heaven," stood during the crowning of her king. Then, for the only time in his life, Mâle uses his intellectual power militantly Those portal statues with their elegance and fine smiles were the flower of a civilization that couldjpe likened to the Greek civilization. The Germans came to learn from this civilization, and have now turned against their old masters: "What a wonderful occasion for Caliban to destroy the work of his master, and to say then to the world that it was he who invented Gothic art."54 Mâle evokes the image of the smoking, crumbling cathedral, and dreads the winter when the stones begin to detach themselves and fall, one by one. His only resort is to proclaim the cathedral's virtues, beauty, and perfection. His articles, appearing first in the Revue de Paris, were then collected toward the end of the war into L'Art allemand et l'art français du moyen âge (Paris: Armand Colin, 1917), along with other materials.55 This was a politics of the defense and promotion of beauty. What Louis Gillet called Male's "capacity for admiration" of beauty took precedence over political platforms and party loyalties.56

»Ibid.

54"La Cathédrale de Reims," p. 295.

"L'Art allemand et Tartfrançais du moyen âge (Paris, 1917).

56The German occupation of northern France in 1940 and the creation of the collaborationist Vichy regime found Mâle in his native Bourbonnais. Seventy-six years old and retired, he did not attempt major essays on this new German invasion. But in Rome et ses vieilles églises, published in 1942, he pointedly reflects on the barbarian attacks on Rome. For French readers, the allusion to the Nazi presence would have been clear. See Rome et ses vieilles églises (Paris, 1942). I am indebted to Francis-Noël Thomas for pointing out the reference to the barbarian invasions.

## Administrator and Académicien of the Third Republic

In 1918, with his first two major works behind him, Mâle was elected to the Académie des Inscriptions et Belles-Lettres within the Institut de France.57 He wrote to Louis Gillet:

> The Institut heaps praise upon me right now. The Académie Française gives me an award; the Académie des Inscriptions, a chair. I think of the precursors, the founders of the history of French art, who themselves received nothing but abuse. Ideas do finally make their way. The French themselves will end by admiring France.58

He was designated to succeed Msgr. Louis Duchesne as director of the École Française at Rome in 1923. At the insistence of members of the Académie des Inscriptions, and of Raymond Poincaré, president of the Council of Ministers charged with the confirmation of these appointments, he accepted, reluctant as he was to leave his students at the Sorbonne. As he ended his teaching years there, he appeared this way to Germain Bazin:

> Having attained the age of sixty, he offered the paradoxical silhouette of a retired cavalry officer, whose elegant moustache, aquiline nose, and proud bearing he had; his voice a little weak but musical, he communicated to his students the warmth of a teaching that was also a discrete profession of faith; you might believe that a legend was being recounted, but you were still ruled by strict historical disciplines.59

Friends and colleagues in France pressed for his election to the Académie française while he continued his work in Italy. In 1924, Joseph Bédier wrote to him, "When you present yourself, whatever be the circumstances, I shall vote for you: you know it, and that is why I have not hurried to answer you; you scarcely need to know what I shall do, but what the others will do."60 At the urging of friends, then, he presented himself for membership in the Académie, and in June, 1927, he was elected to the chair held just recently by the poet, Jean Richepin, and earlier by Montesquieu and Alexandre Dumas, the younger. In his Discours de réception of June 28, 1928, Mâle praised his immediate predecessor, Jean Richepin, as was proper to the occasion, adding some thoughts about the value of words and their mystery, and about the cre-

*The Académie brought together scholars in the archaeology, philology, and history of Greco-Roman, Egyptian, Near Eastern, Islamic, and Oriental cultures.

5To Louis Gillet, December 15, l91S,Exposition,#184.

"Germain Bazin,"Le Souvenir d'Emile Mâle," Xe Figaro littéraire, October 16, 1954.

«Joseph Bédier to EmUe Mâle, September 12, 1924, PEM, ms. 7580.

ative power of a people. But he began with a word of praise for those who had elected him to the Académie:

> You wished to say that the cathedrals are worth as much as our most beautiful poems, that France put as much genius in them as in her most profound books, and that those who have spent their lives studying them have not worked in vain. I thank you for believing that when I set myself to the task of deciphering the thought that these old stones express, I was able to do something useful for my country.6'

Mâle himself felt that he had made a contribution to France's self-understanding, and believed that the Académie had understood the value of his work in the same way as he understood it.

Just the year before, in 1927, a collection of the major journal articles—those not previously integrated into his books—was published: Art et artistes du moyen âge, with studies of the influence of Arab art on the churches of central and southern France, Gothic architecture in the south of France, the history of Mont-Saint-Michel, and the importance of the miniaturist Jean Bourdichon. In his preface to Art et artistes he told of his joy as a young researcher when he was so much alone in his interest in the art and architecture of medieval France:

> I asked myself if there was anyone in France who would be moved by these marvels. . . . My joy was great at Chartres one day when a peasant of the Beauce, a descendant of those who harnessed themselves to the carts to transport the stone of Notre-Dame, came to my side to contemplate the statues of the south porch."I never come to Chartres,"he told me,"without admiring the cathedral." I had at last met a Frenchman who loved the art of France.62

Mâle then said that he had exaggerated as a young man. There were people in those early days who studied and loved the French art of the Middle Ages, even though the situation since that time has much improved. He certainly knew, that same year in which he was elected to the Académie Française, how his work had served to bring about the change among the well-educated.

In a study of the religious art of Gaul,63 written in his old age, he praised the "genius" of France, the genius of peoples, rather than their formal politics. He recalls the major invasions of French soil, the de-

""Discours de réception de Emile Mâle à l'Académie française," Institut de France, n° 98 (Paris, 1928), p. 6.

62Arts et artistes du moyen âge (Paris, 1927), pp. v-vi.

63La Fin du paganisme en Gaule et les plus anciennes basiliques chrétiennes (Paris, 1950).

struction, and the magnificent rebuilding that went on. These examples console him because they prove that "French genius is indestructible." Then Mâle, the old man, the leading scholar of the past, who has just finished a major study of France's earliest days, calls for a new, lively, and enlightened approach by the architects and urbanists responsible for city planning and rebuilding. Let them create modern houses that are inspired by the "divine proportion" of the Italian Renaissance, known also to the Middle Ages. Let the urban planners open vast perspectives replacing ruins with parks. "Let them bring the country into the city, with air, light, and sun."[64] At the end of his history of the Christian art of Gaul, he says, "It is to the honor of the great bishops of Gaul that they believed it necessary to maintain, in the world, real beauty."[65]

## Influence: The Varieties of Reconciliation

Male's influence on his famous students, though genuine, was more on the level of inspiration (the eminent value of medieval iconography and its importance for modern France) and example (respect for data and care in analyzing them) than on the level of data selection and methodology. For his students, his works constituted a historiographical and literary monument that could not be redone. They said that he was "the first to teach that the history of forms is the history of thought" (Henri Focillon), that he made them "understand the soul of the Middle Ages" (Marcel Aubert), that his method was "the only valuable one as far as the Christian art of the Middle Ages is concerned" (Louis Réau), and that the lessons he taught were "so alive that the memory of them always enchants" (Germain Bazin).[66] Mâle had no real disciples, but some scholars followed more directly in his footsteps than others. The work of Marcel Aubert, for example, grew more directly out of Male's projects than did the work of Focillon.

L'Art religieux du XIIF siècle en France, in its first simple edition, was respectfully received. Georges Perrot, a mentor of Male's and Director of the Ecole Normale, had said, "From the time of Fustel de

64IbUl., pp. 6-7.

6'Ibid.,p.327'.

The citation from Henri Focillon is found in the copy of Vie deformes (Paris, 1934) that the author inscribed "A mon maître, Monsieur Mâle, qui nous enseigna le premier qu'histoire des formes est histoire de l'esprit. Hommage et respectueuse amitié." Marcel Aubert to Emile Mâle, September 21, 1948, PEM, ms. 7653. Louis Réau, "A Emile Mâle: In Maxiomm" Académie d'architecture: Bulletin (4e trimestre, 1954), p. 7.

Coulanges, nothing has made us better relive the genius of an epoch."67 Louis Réau says that when Mâle was appointed to teach the history of Christian art at the Sorbonne in 1906 there were no genuine art courses in the universities and lycées. Ernest Lavisse, a little earlier, had engineered at the Sorbonne a type of adjunct chair ["une chaire annexe"] of art history that covered everything from the catacombs through Impressionism. But because Mâle had presented and defended his dissertation with such brilliance that scholars in connected disciplines in the Paris institutions of higher education learned of his achievement, he was invited to teach special courses at the Sorbonne. Réau wrote that Male's talents as a writer enabled him to appeal to the general public. Yet he managed to avoid the banal generalizations that the "Chartists" (professors and graduates of the École des Chartes) somewhat contemptuously believed to be characteristic of all popular authors.68 His great syntheses were in all libraries and in the houses of tens of thousands of educated French.69 They gained for him the post he occupied in the French university system as well as election to the Académie française.

Of Male's acknowledged admirers, the one who eventually achieved greatest fame was Marcel Proust.70 He came to know Male's work when Robert de Billy lent him a copy of the original edition of the 1898 thesis. In 1900, Proust had sent Émile Mâle a copy of his article "Ruskin à

67Rapport sur la thèse d'Emile Mâle. F17 24519, Archives Nationales; cited in Exposition,#\05.

"Louis Réau, "A Emile Mâle: In Memorium," p. 6.

69According to the office of his publisher, Armand Colin, each edition of Male's four major works, represented about 5,000 copies. This would mean that between 1900 and, let us say, 1980 only 50,000 copies of L'Art religieux du XHF siècle en France, 30,000 copies of L'Art religieux de la fin du moyen âge en France, 35,000 copies of L'Art religieux du XlF siècle en France, and 15,000 copies oí L'Art religieux après le concile de Trente had been sold. But during this period we must count also reprinted editions, paperback editions, the several editions of some of his shorter works, and the translation of his major works into English, German, Spanish, and Italian (obviously, the diffusion of the translations tells us little about Male's influence in France). The first paperback edition of L'Art religieux du XIIf siècle en France numbered about 40,000 copies, and the editions of his study of the churches of early Christian Gaul, Chartres cathedral, Albi cathedral, the essay collection Arts et artistes du moyen âge, and a postwar presentation of selections from his major works have gone into thousands of copies for each edition (publishers are by and large unable to unearth this information for us). I am grateful to Anne Nesteroff of the publishing house of Armand Colin for information on the editions of Male's work and general difficulties of estimating the number of copies published. In the past fifteen years entirely new editions of Male's major works have been published.

70Mâle's letters are classified in relationship to his publications and the events in his life. They are found, then, throughout the cartons of the PEM.

Notre-Dame d'Amiens," which had appeared in the Mercure de France. In a letter of Mme Catusse in 1905, Proust referred to L'art religieux du XIIF siècle en France as the "beautiful book of Mâle," calling it a "pure masterpiece and the last word in French iconography."[71]

Even textbooks and tour guides gave increased attention to the beauty and national importance of medieval religious art and architecture.[72] Though the Catholic-school texts placed more emphasis on the civilizing role of the Church than did the public-school texts, both types placed equal emphasis on the beauty of the art and architecture. In one major textbook, Gauthier and Deschamps (Hachette), a change occurred between the 1904 and 1928 editions that I would attribute to Emile Mâle. In the 1904 edition there is no mention whatsoever of cathedrals or religious art. In the 1928 edition, however, there is a cathedral discussion running several pages with subheading on "The Construction of Cathedrals," "Notre Dame of Paris," and "The House of the People." The authors say, "There are no structures more beautiful than the great churches called cathedrals, built from the thirteenth century on. Each city in France wanted to have a beautiful cathedral. The poor worked for nothing; the rich donated money; great lords were seen digging up the soil, and harnessing themselves to carts loaded with construction material."[73] To be sure, the notion that cathedrals were the

[71] Quoted in Richard Bales, Proust and the Middle Ages (Geneva, 1975), p. 28. Periodically throughout the years, Proust used Mâle as a source for things medieval. In his August 16, 1904, article in Le Figaro, "La Mort des cathédrales," Proust quoted him. Though he footnotes Mâle in sketches for A la recherche du temps perdu, there were no footnotes in the printed editions. Jean Autret says, "It was Emile Mâle who furnished or suggested to Marcel Proust almost all the details on religious art that he introduced in Swann" (Jean Autret, "La Dette de Marcel Proust envers Emile Mâle," Gazette des Beaux-Arts [1958], p. 59). Proust scholar Luc Fraisse says that Mâle the scholar and teacher was mirrored in the personality of Elstir, the painter in A la recherche du temps perdu. Fraisse points out that "a note in Cahier 54 indicates that [Elstir] owes much to Emile Mâle. Proust evokes there 'the opinion of Elstir (Mâle) on good and bad restorations.' " And when Marcel, the protagonist of the novel argues with his love Albertine—again evoking Elstir—"it is as if in the fictional painter a Claude Monet and an Emile Mâle were coexisting and not coming to any mutual understanding." Elstir evaluating Gothic art and architecture plays a role in the novel corresponding to the role played by Emile Mâle in the life of Proust. See Luc Fraisse, L'Oeuvre cathédrale: Proust et l'architecture médiévale (Paris, 1990), pp. 103, 256.

There is a large collection of correspondence from persons of all walks of life in the PEM.

[72] In spite of his renown among the educated public, Male's influence on the general public came gradually. Mercure de France reported at the time of his election to the Académie française: "Emile Mâle is not known by the general public. He is not seen at major Parisian events and social gatherings. He does not write for newspapers and he is

work of the people had been placed in relief since the days of Victor Hugo and Viollet-le-Duc, but the privileged place of the cathedrals in the French national patrimony was given most powerful expression in Male's first book. Beginning around 1950, the textbooks for the upper primary grades, and for the secondary schools gave attention to chronology, techniques of construction, the stages of religious art history, and the relationship of the art to the religious teachings of the medieval period. Other textbooks offered selected paragraphs from Male's studies of the twelfth and thirteenth centuries: the 1959 Réunion des professeurs (Ligel) and the "accompanying texts" volume of the 1959 Labal (Hachette). By the 1960's, some of the texts for upper grades and lycées were produced by authors competent in religious art history. For example, the 1964 Isaac (Hachette) has a balance of discussions, architecture, sculpture, and glass; there are discussions of the subject matter of the art, and there are references to Italian art. One might also ask whether the 1964 Durif and Labal (Hachette), quoting from "a great French poet" the words, "In the Middle Ages, the human race thought nothing of importance that it did not write in stone,"[74] found the sentence in Victor Hugo's Notre-Dame de Paris or found it dramatically

not sought out for interviews on contemporary issues. But his works are read and admired by the well educated in Europe and outside of Europe." Male's life is easy to sum up, says the author of the article: he had traveled, studied, taught, and written. See Lucien de Sainte-Croix, "Emile Mâle: Un grand historien de l'art au Moyen Age," Mercure de France, September 15, 1927, p. 7.

Relative to textbooks, Mâle himself believed that an examination of texts would aid historians:"! shall share with you an idea that has preoccupied me for a long time. Nothing would be more useful to us, in my opinion, than to gather together the textbooks of national history that, in every country, we place in the hands of grammar school children. These books have received the approval of the authorities and make known the aspirations of a people. There you can learn what to expect of the future generations that you are forming. These little books would certainly bring us more truth than the official pronouncements we hear." See Les Nouvelles littéraires, October 17, 1949,p. 6. A textbook, as Alain Choppin has pointed out, is really a digest of the society that produces it. One should study the content, diffusion, and official promotion of the text to understand more clearly its relationship to the producing society. See Alain Choppin, "L'Histoire des manuels scolaires: une approche globale," L'Histoire de l'éducation, 9 (December, 1980), 1-25. For a study of the influence of Lavisse, see Pierre Nora,"Ernest Lavisse: son rôle dans la formation du sentiment national," Revue historique, 228 (1962), 73-106. See also the surveys of Jacqueline Freyssinet-Dominjon, Les Manuels d'histoire de l'école libre, 1882-1959, de la loi Ferry à la loi Debré (Paris, 1969), and Dominique Maingueneau,ies Livres d'école de la République (discours et idéologie) (Paris, 1979).

73See p. 50.

74Seep.211.

presented in the Conclusion of Male's L'Art religieux du XIIF siècle en France.

The most popular French tourist guides, after 1950, included, where appropriate, quotations from and bibliographical references to the works of Mâle and his great students. In the 1950-1951 Guide vert, Chartres, Male's study of Chartres is suggested as a study that is "well documented and illustrated," and the 1952-1953 Guide vert, Environs de Paris, refers to the writings of Male's student, Marcel Aubert. From then on there are references to works of Mâle and his students.75 Mâle is directly quoted in the contemporary Guide bleu, île de France, and his contribution to the general fund of iconographical information is still seen in Michelin's Guide vert, Environs de Paris. Of Chartres cathedral the Guide bleu says, "From this exceptionally homogeneous building, built essentially in less than thirty years, emerges the classical type of cathedral, which will be repeated in the course of the following years at Rheims and Amiens, and which in the celebrated formula of Emile Mâle is called 'the very thought of the Middle Ages made visible'." The Guide discusses the extraordinary blue color of the most famous window of the Blessed Virgin, "de la Belle Verrière," "of which Emile Mâle said that it puts us in contact with the beyond."76

Of course, Male's work had always been appreciated in church circles. After his death, there were several articles about him in the church-affiliated journals, L'Enseignement chrétien and Ecclesia.77 The authors emphasized the Christian faith and sentiments expressed in Male's writings, one of them erroneously suggesting that he was a "pious" (dévot) Christian—family and friends remember him as a sincere and moral Christian, yes, but never "pious." Churchmen and church organizations adopted Male's ideas in somewhat haphazard fashion—and here we are

75But there are no references to his four major studies because the team of editors would only provide references to readily available, single-subject works (pertaining to an individual monument or region). For help in the study and interpretation of tourist guides, I wish to thank Yves Petot and Alain Arnaud of editorial staff of the Guides Michelin.

76Guide bleu, île de France (Paris: Hachette, 1976), pp. 239, 246; Guide vert, Environs de Paris (Paris: Editions Michelin, 1962). Until very recently each volume of the Guides bleus was the work of an individual author or editor, who would decide himself or herself what references to base a presentation on and where quotes from important authors would be appropriate. For this information, I wish to thank Georges Anthoinette, archivist for the publisher Hachette.

77Joseph Tranchant, "Emile Mâle (1862-1954): historien de l'art religieux," L'Enseignement chrétien (January, 1958), 196-21 l;Madeleine Ochsé,"Un grand humaniste chrétien: Emile Mâle," Ecclesia (August, 1962), 75-84.

halfway between the cultivated reader and the general public. His first book received favorable notice in the Jesuit fortnightly journal La Civiltà Cattolica (October 17, 1903). And in the Parisian Catholic daily, La Croix (December 21, 1910) another clerical writer said of his second book that it "ought to be found in all the rectory libraries of France. It would train our pastors to respect our artistic tradition; it would teach them the meaning and value of their churches and the profound significance of the venerable vestiges of medieval art." In the years following World War I, L'Ami du clergé (January 18, 1923), the most widely received journal for French priests, reported on his work in some detail, and brief selections from his books were published in La Voix de Notre-Dame de Chartres, the official publication of the cathedral staff—these are a few examples from among many. His years in Rome, of course, brought him into friendly contact with important members of the Catholic hierarchy, including the future Pius XII. Catholic intellectuals had a more rounded and balanced appreciation of Male's goals and gifts. Right after Male's death, the Jesuit Paul Doncoeur wrote that the works would be esteemed as long as scholars and readers understood exactly what the historian had set himself to accomplish: not a history of aesthetics or techniques, but rather the history of the relationship of the images—the subject matter—to the theological sources. Such an appreciation of Male's accomplishments is fundamentally correct.[78]

In sum, as André Grabar wrote in 1962, "The literary and scientific work of Mâle holds a very sure place in the awareness of all of us; he is part of the intellectual and, in part, sentimental baggage of every cultivated man in France, and as such he is both of our own times and ageless."[79] Mâle showed the way to generations of scholars, who, along with

[78] Paul Doncoeur, "L'Oeuvre religieuse d'Emile Mile," Etudes, 283 (1954), 257-258.

[79] "Notice sur la vie et les travaux de M. Emile Mâle," Institut de France, Académie des inscriptions et belles-lettres (Paris, 1962), p. 4. Similar appreciations were offered at the time of Male's death in 1954. André Chastel, writing in Le Monde, October 8, 1954, said that Male's oeuvre was a great "structure": the master interpretation of stained glass, miniature, and sculpture that is "nuanced" today—"Everyone remains indebted to him." Pierre Gaxotte, writing the same day in Le Figaro, said that Male's ideas "belong today to the public domain of teaching and criticism." Elie Lambert, in a journal article written shortly after Male's death, made clear that "in its straight simplicity, the life made a single unity with the considerable work of the great professor, master of all our historians of art, who was at the same time a great scholar and a great writer." Henri Daniel-Rops, shortly after Male's death, conceived the idea of erecting some kind of memorial to Mâle on the grounds of Chartres cathedral. When a bust of Mâle was unveiled in the garden park behind the cathedral in 1963, Daniel-Rops evoked the moment when, lost in reflection

him, taught the reading public to understand and appreciate the beauty and value of a medieval French Catholic culture that had been ignored or disdained for centuries.

within the cathedral, "The image of the old master imposed itself so much then on the evening pilgrim, that he seemed to appear before him to guide him to La Belle Verrière, or to make him admire the marvelous tracework of the vaults of the transept. And the visitor said to himself that it would be a great day when he would see the poet of the cathedral honored in a fitting way." For similar appreciations, see Elie Lambert, "La Vie et l'oeuvre d'Emile Male" Revue universitaire, 64 (January-February, 1955), and Henri Daniel-Rops, "Discours [pour l'inauguration de buste d'Emile Mâle] , (Edité par la Ville de Chartres et le Syndicat d'Initiative), p. 19; see PEM, ms. 7661.

# ARCHBISHOPJOSEPH SCHREMBSS battle TO OBTAIN PUBLIC ASSISTANCE FORTHE PAROCHIAL SCHOOLS OF CLEVELAND DURING THE GREAT DEPRESSION

BY

Martin Poluse*

Archbishop Joseph Schrembs (1866-1945) was an American churchman who championed the spiritual, physical, and educational needs of his diocese. He was the fifth bishop of Cleveland; his administration (1921-1945) encompassed twenty-four years of dedicated ministry to his diocese and to the American Catholic Church. Even though Schrembs never was the head of an archdiocese, he was presented with the title of archbishop by Pope Pius XII on March 25, 1939, for his eminent leadership and assiduous service.1 During his tenure the Diocese of Cleveland and the American Catholic Church became involved in various social and political issues, issues which profoundly affected him and his fellow prelates of the American Catholic hierarchy. One of these issues was the campaign to obtain public assistance for Ohio's parochial schools during the Depression era. Although this campaign to save Catholic education was a co-operative effort on the part of Ohio's bishops, the tenacious leadership of Schrembs was the driving force behind it.

Joseph Schrembs was born on March 12, 1866, at Wurzelhofen in Bavaria, the second youngest of sixteen children. He was brought to the United States at age eleven and was ordained to the priesthood by Bishop Henry Richter for the Diocese of Grand Rapids on June 29, 18892 On January 8, 1911, Schrembs was named Titular Bishop of

"Dr. Poluse is a religion teacher at Villa Angela-St. Joseph High School in the Diocese of Cleveland. He is also an adjunct instructor in the Department of Theology in Notre Dame College of Ohio.

'Michael J. Hynes, History of the Diocese of Cleveland: Origin and Growth (1847-1952) (Cleveland, 1953), p. 375.

2Lawrence A. Mossing, A History of the Diocese of Toledo: General History Prior to and after its Establishment in 1910 (Fremont, 1983), p. 100.

Sophene, as well as Auxiliary Bishop of Grand Rapids.5 A few months later Schrembs was appointed the first bishop of Toledo, Ohio, on August 11, 1911. From 1911 to 1921 Schrembs emerged as the "builder" of the Diocese of Toledo, establishing thirteen new parishes and thirty-three schools.4 His firm belief in Catholic education became the focal point of his administration. However, Schrembs did not limit his ministry to the local issues of his diocese. As the United States entered World War I, Schrembs became involved with the National Catholic War Council, serving on its Administrative Committee. During the tumultuous war years the National Catholic War Council acted as a liaison for the American Catholic community for the purpose of "unifying the church behind the war effort."5 After the war, Schrembs and the majority of the American hierarchy desired to continue the National War Council or at least a similar national Catholic organization, though its purposes would now be concerned with Catholic welfare, especially in the areas of Catholic education and social justice (hence the change in name from war to welfare).6 From 1919 to 1922, the National Catholic Welfare Council (NCWC) struggled with internal structural problems and external acceptance among Roman officials and certain members of the American Catholic hierarchy.7 It was during these years that Schrembs emerged as one of the most vocal supporters of the NCWC. Eventually it was Schrembs who played a prominent role in saving the NCWC, and in so doing, propelled himself into the forefront of the American Catholic hierarchy.

The final and most important leg of Schrembs's episcopal career commenced on September 8, 1921, with his installation by Archbishop Henry Moeller of Cincinnati as Bishop of Cleveland.8 Schrembs along with other members of the American Catholic hierarchy strongly believed that religious education was vital for the present survival and

3Hynes, op. cit., p. 302.

"Impact of Schrembs' Arrival Hard to Appreciate Today," Catholic Chronicle, September 20, 1985.

'Douglas J. Slawson, The Foundation and First Decade of the National Catholic Welfare Council (Washington, D.C., 1992), p. 30.

'Gerald P. Fogarty The Vatican and the American Hierarchy from 1879 to 1965 (Stuttgart, 1982), p. 215.

7Slawson, op. cit., pp. 96-122; 123-144; 145-178. Idem, "The National Bishops' Conference: An Analysis of Its Origins," Catholic Historical Review, LXVI (October, 1980), 576. Elizabeth McKeown, "Apologia for an American Catholicism: The Petition and Report of the National Catholic Welfare Council to Pius XI, April 25, 1922" Church History, 43 (December, 1974), 514-528.

"Hynes, op. cit., p. 304.

the abiding future of the American Catholic Church. Consequently, Schrembs patterned his new administration on the successes that he had achieved in the Diocese of Toledo, by providing the Catholic community of Cleveland with schools and colleges to educate its youth. However, with this emphasis on education and building, the Schrembs administration found itself hard pressed for money, especially for the elementary and high schools. Although Schrembs initiated attempts to obtain public monies for his parochial schools as early as 1922, his efforts became more desperate during the Great Depression. Intertwined with this issue of public assistance was the fact that Schrembs sought public assistance without sacrificing church control. Schrembs and his episcopal colleagues insisted that the Church maintain complete jurisdiction over its educational institutions. Public assistance would be of no use to the Church if it was controlled by the public. Thus from 1929 well into the late 1930's the major focus of the Schrembs administration was to save the Catholic schools of the Cleveland Diocese from financial disaster. But this act of salvation had to be completed under the auspices of the Church.

The question of public financial assistance was not a new issue for the Catholic Church. Since the mid-nineteenth century the American Catholic hierarchy had battled for public assistance for their parochial schools all over the country. Bishop John Hughes of New York had challenged that city's Common Council for financial assistance to maintain parochial schools in 1840.9 Although Hughes was unsuccessful in securing any public monies, his efforts set the stage for continued battles over this issue. This question agitated Ohio between the Civil War and 1930. In 1873 Ohio's bishops became very concerned about protecting the future of Catholic education and financing parochial schools following an unsuccessful attempt by the city of Cincinnati to levy a tax on Catholic schools.10 Efforts were made by Ohio's Catholic leaders in the 1900's to obtain public assistance for parochial schools ranging from textbooks to public transportation in 1915,1919,and 1927,butAt-

9Ray Allen Billington, The Protestant Crusade 1800-1860: A Study of the Origins of American Nativism (New York, 1938), pp. 146-152. Vincent P. Liumie, Public Money and Parochial Education: Bishop Hughes, Governor Seward, and the New York School Controversy (Cleveland, 1968), pp. 54-56. John R. G. Hassard, Life of John Hughes: First Archbishop of New York (New York, 1866), pp. 223-251. Henry A. Brann. Mosi Reverend John Hughes (New York, 1892), pp. 67-79. See also Michael Feldberg, The Philadelphia Riots of 1844: A Study of Ethnic Conflict (Westport, Connecticut, 1975).

'"Richard J. Gabel, Public Funds for Church and Private Schools (Washington D.C., 1937), p. 666.

torneys General of Ohio ruled against these requests.11 With the advent of the Great Depression, the financial status of the parochial schools became critical, prompting Ohio's hierarchy to resume their heated battle with the State. In the industrial center of Cleveland, where the Depression had hit the hardest, the Schrembs administration emerged as the leading force in attempting to secure public money for the parochial school.

Needless to say, Schrembs and his fellow bishops were immediately confronted with a determined opposition based on nativism and political ideologies antagonistic to providing public funds for parochial schools. Nativist organizations such as the Junior Order of American Mechanics and the resurgent Ku Klux Klan, whose anti-Catholic sentiments had confronted Schrembs and other Catholic leaders in the past, contributed to some of the opposition to secure monies for parochial schools.12 However, a much broader opposition came from those who firmly believed in the philosophy of the nineteenth-century public school movement. This movement embraced universal education for all children regardless of their religious denomination. Schrembs and the American Catholic bishops were not opposed to the concept of universal education, but they firmly believed that education in the public or common school was incomplete because it did not include the teachings of the Catholic Church.13 Apart from this external opposition, Schrembs and other members of the hierarchy were political amateurs when dealing with issues of this nature, and as a result, the bishops found themselves embroiled with their own internal disagreements or divisions as well. Consequently, the campaign to obtain public assistance for the parochial schools became a long and arduous undertaking, an undertaking that severely challenged the Schrembs administration and the leadership of the American Catholic Church.

""Public Funds for Parochial Schools; the Constitution of Ohio Prohibits Such Appropriations." Statement of the Citizens League of Cleveland (September, 1933). Schrembs MSS., Diocese of Cleveland, hereafter cited as Schrembs MSS.

"John Higham, Strangers in the Land: Patterns of American Nativism (New Brunswick, 1955), pp. 57, 288. Slawson, The Foundation and First Decade, p. 84. Paul E. Czuchlewski, "Liberal Catholicism and American Racism, 1924-1960," Records of the American Catholic Historical Society of Philadelphia, 85 (September-December, 1974), 163-173. Philip Jenkins, "The Ku Klux Klan in Pennsylvania, 1920-1940," Western Pennsylvania Historical Magazine, 68 (April, 1986), 121-137. See also William D. Jenkins, Steel Valley Klan. The Ku Klux Klan in Ohio's Mahoning Valley (Kent, 1990).

13R. Freeman Butts and Lawrence A. Cremin, A History of Education in American Culture (New York, 1953), p. 363.

Bolstered by the influx of European immigrants, the Catholic community had reached nearly twenty million by 1920.14 Although this growth in Catholic population slowed considerably with the passage of the Johnson-Reed Immigration Act in 1924, the American Catholic Church continued to incarnate its theology and ministry through massive building projects, erecting parishes, schools, colleges, universities, hospitals, and orphanages, and thus demonstrating to the American Catholic people that this institution was a vital part of the culture. The American Catholic Church of the 1920's and 1930s was on the verge of estabhshing its own identity, no longer a helpless infant awaiting baptism, but a precocious adolescent striving for its autonomy. However, this young institution needed direction, leadership, education, and most importantly, money.

The Diocese of Cleveland, with over 454,000 Catholics in seventeen counties, was an active participant in, and contributor to, this maturation of the American Catholic Church.15 Cleveland's Catholics were primarily working-class immigrants, and with their children, were intimately bound to their ethnic parishes, organizations, neighborhoods, and schools. They were traditional Catholics taking pride in their ancestry, their families, and their own pious convictions. However, they also needed the American Church to foster their religious education.

The Catholic school system in the diocese of Cleveland in 1923 had nearly 55,000 students enrolled in 132 elementary schools. There were also 1,900 students enrolled in "other Catholic schools," in Cleveland, but the Official Catholic Directory for 1923 did not specify if this number included high school students.16 However, by 1940 nearly 7,000 students were attending Catholic high schools in the Diocese of Cleveland.17 In the decade preceding World War II it became evident that more schools were needed, especially on the high school and university levels.18 The Schrembs administration initiated several building projects that added parish schools, high schools, and four colleges to the diocese. Elementary schools such as St. Ann's (1925), St. Philomena's (1924), Holy Cross (1926), Holy Redeemer (1928), St. Elizabeth's (1930), Our Lady of the Blessed Sacrament (1923), Our Lady of Peace (1923), St.

"James Hermesey, American Catholics: A History of the Roman Catholic Community in the United States (New York, 1981), p. 207. John Tracy Ellis, American Catholicism (Chicago, 1956), pp. 124-125.

"Official Catholic Directory (New York, 1922), p. 283.

,6Hynes,o/>.«i.,p.333.

"Ató., p. 335.

1OHd.

Andrew's (1926), and St. Cecilia's (1925) were just a few of the parish schools that were dedicated during the Schrembs administration.19 As for high schools, Cathedral Latin, Benedictine, and St. Ignatius were expanded between 1928 and 1942, and outside the city, Ursuline High School in Youngstown opened in 1925, and in Akron, Our Lady of the Elms in 192920 Beyond the basic twelve years of education, Schrembs was successful in providing higher education for his diocese by establishing two colleges for Women—Ursuline College (1922) and Notre Dame College (1928). Furthermore, the Jesuit College expanded in 1923, eventually emerging as John Carroll University in 1937.21 But perhaps Schrembs's most memorable contribution to higher education was the construction of a new facility for the seminary of Our Lady of the Lake in 1925 for the future training of the clergy.22

Besides the construction of these educational facilities, the Schrembs administration sought to staff them with religious men and women. Communities such as the Fathers of the Order of Mercy (1922), the Fathers of the Blessed Sacrament (1931), Maryknoll Fathers (1937), the Franciscan Fathers of the Order of Friars Minor Conventual (1923), Sisters of the Third Order of Franciscan Conventual (1925), the Dominican Fathers (1923), the Fathers of the Most Precious Blood (1931), the Sisters of St. Joseph (1926), and the Vincentian Sisters of Charity (1928) were invited by Schrembs to serve and educate the Catholics of the Cleveland Diocese.23

The Depression severely damaged the educational structure established by Schrembs. This distressing time caused over 41,000 workers to lose their jobs by April, 1930. Within a year, an additional 60,000 were unemployed.24 Coupled with the collapse of Cleveland's industry, the closing of two of Cleveland's prestigious banks (March, 1933) released economic shock waves throughout the greater Cleveland area. As with the city and county, the Schrembs administration had witnessed the acute effects of unemployment, since the majority of Cleveland's Catholics owed their livelihood to the city's industries. Now with the failure of Union Trust and the Guardian Savings Trust companies, the parochial schools of the diocese were in jeopardy. The diocese alone

"/Wrf.,p.310,315-321.
"Ibid., pp. 333-334.
2li&tó., pp. 336-337.
22lbid., pp. 337-338.
2ilbid., pp. 341-343.
"David D. Van Tassel and John J. Grabowski (eds.), The Encyclopedia of Cleveland History (Bloomington and Indianapolis, 1987), p. xiv.

had nearly $5 million deposited in these institutions along with the majority of the parish mortgages.25

In the summary of the 1928 and 1933 Diocesan Parish Financial reports, Schrembs was informed that in the 233 parishes, an outstanding debt of over ten million dollars was owed to the Union and Guardian Trust companies.26 Sixty-five parishes (twenty-seven percent) owed fifty-five percent of the ten million dollar debt; seventy-eight parishes (thirty-three percent) owed eighty-one percent of the debt, and thirteen parishes (eight percent) owed twenty-seven percent of the debt.27 Five schools were also delinquent on their interest payments. Schools such as Cathedral Latin and Ursuline Academy owed anywhere from $50 to $2,000.28

Even though Schrembs and his fellow bishops of Ohio did not establish a state-wide campaign to secure public assistance for their parochial schools until 1932, Schrembs and his auxiliary, Bishop James McFadden, had requested a legal opinion on the issue from the Cleveland firm of Mooney Hahn, Loiser, and Keough in November, 192929 The lawyers stated that, for the most part, the students in the public school districts were eligible to receive free transportation, textbooks, and medical care. Furthermore, a particular school district might also provide tuition for students in another school district, if those students had to attend a school outside their own district. This situation had occurred in areas of the state where there were no schools. However, there was nothing to imply that these "benefits" were available to parochial or private schools. The districts had to maintain a close accounting of what was needed for that district.

The lawyers did point out to Schrembs a possible issue or "case for argument" in the public schools' accounting of students in their respective districts. According to the lawyers, the school districts included in their tabulation of pupils those who were attending parochial or private schools, and in this way, they submitted an inflated number of "pupils" and received more funds than were actually needed. The parochial and private schools received none of these funds. This information was beneficial to Schrembs and the other bishops as they developed a justification for public money

"Schrembs to Governor George White, March 2, 1934, Schrembs MSS. Hynes, op. cit., pp. 356-357.

261928 Diocesan Parish Financial Report, p. 3, Schrembs MSS.

27Ibid.

28I. F. Fulton to Schrembs, February 9, 1933, Schrembs MSS.

29Mooney, Hahn, Loiser, Keough to Schrembs, November 7, 1929, Schrembs MSS.

Another important piece of information examined by Schrembs and the bishops of Ohio was the United States Supreme Court's unanimous decision in Pierce v. Society of Sisters in the Oregon law case on June 1, 1925.30 This ruling justified the existence of parochial schools and established their legitimate role in the education of the state's children. According to an Oregon law of November, 1922, the state was able to "force" all children between the ages of eight and sixteen to attend public schools, thus eliminating any need for parochial or private schools. The Sisters of the Holy Names of Jesus and Mary challenged this law, as did another private school, Hill Military Academy. The Sisters of the Holy Names had been firmly established in Oregon since October, 1859, and during their tenure had constructed and staffed schools and academies. Now they were being told that their students could not attend their schools. The Sisters based their case not only on the civil rights of the parents to choose where they would send their children, but also on the fact that without students in their schools, the Sisters would not be able to meet the financial responsibilities of their contracts with their teachers. No students meant no tuition and thus no income for the schools. This law would eventually destroy all the work of the Sisters and make their school buildings worthless, at least for the purpose for which they were built.

In the decision of Justice James C. McReynolds, the issue here was not a challenge to the state's right to compulsory education. The issue was the state's attempt to eradicate parochial and private schools. Thus, the Supreme Court found that the State of Oregon had abused its powers; it clearly sided with the Sisters and forbade the state from attempting to force its children to attend only public schools.31 The decision of

"John Tracy Ellis (ed.), Documents of American Catholic History, Vol. 2: 1866-1966 (Wilmington, 1987), pp. 613-616. David Tyack, "The Perils of Pluralism: The Background of the Pierce Case," American Historical Review, LXXTV (October, 1968), 74-98 at 78. Lloyd R Jorgenson, "The Oregon School Law of 1922: Passage and Sequel," Catholic Historical Review, LIV (October, 1968), 455-466. M. Paul Holsinger, "The Oregon School Bill Controversy, 1922-1923, "Pacific Historical Review, XXXVII (August, 1968), 327-342. Thomas J. Shelley, "The Oregon School Case and the National Catholic Welfare Conference," Catholic Historical Review, LXXV (July, 1989), 439-457. Edward Cuddy, "The Irish Question and the Revival of Anti-Catholicism in the 1920's," Catholic Historical Review, LXVII (April, 1981), 236-255 at 251. Timothy Mark Pies. 'The Parochial School Campaigns in Michigan, 1920- 1924 .The Lutheran and Catholic Involvement" Catholic Historical Review, LXXII (April, 1986), 220-238. John Whitney Evans, "John LaFarge, America, and the Newman Movement," Catholic Historical Review, LXTV (October, 1978), 614-643 at 624-626. See also William M. Halsey. The Survival of American Innocence: Catholicism in the Era of Disillusionment, 1920-1940 (Notre Dame, Indiana, 1980).

"Oregon School Case, June 1, 1925, p. 3, Schrembs MSS. Ellis, Documents (Pierce v. Society of Sisters 268 U.S. 510), pp. 529-536.

McReynolds also emphasized that the parochial schools had historically contributed to the educational needs of the students and their work had been "long regarded as useful and meritorious."[32]

In the spring of 1932, Schrembs and Archbishop John T. McNicholas of Cincinnati began to exchange letters regarding a plan of action to obtain public money for the parochial schools. Schrembs believed that the entire issue was a matter of social justice for American Roman Catholics. Moreover, if the parochial schools were forced to close, it would mean the ruination of the public school system, in that the State of Ohio would not be able financially to incorporate the education of the Catholic community. Schrembs and McNicholas agreed that the Ohio bishops must have their superintendents submit comprehensive documents explaining the financial status of the parochial schools in their dioceses. Once this information was obtained, it would be up to the courts to determine the constitutionality of their request.

One year later, the diocesan superintendents informed the Ohio bishops that the parochial schools were saving the state approximately $14,763,000 per year. In the Diocese of Cleveland, Father John R. Hagan, the diocesan superintendent, told Schrembs that the 76,441 students in the parochial elementary schools were saving the state anywhere from $103.18 to $149.25 per student.[33] Moreover, the superintendents also emphasized that the state would not be able to afford the construction and maintenance of new schools if the parochial schools closed, especially in light of the Depression. Besides the report by the superintendents, Schrembs and the other bishops were strengthened in their decision to pursue this issue when the Bishop of Toledo, Karl J. Alter, published an open letter to Ohio's legislators entitled, "Twenty-five Questions and Twenty-five Answers on State Support for Religious Free Schools." This letter strongly affirmed the views of Schrembs and his fellow prelates as they continued to organize their plan of attack.

Alter intended to raise the consciousness of the Catholic citizens of the state so that they would understand why their religious leaders wished to pursue public money for their parochial schools. The initial seven questions presented by Alter discussed the history and importance of education in the United States by both public and parochial schools. Alter emphasized that for years the Catholic community had

[32]Pierce v. Society of Sisters 268 U.S. 510, pp. 534-535, cited in R. Freeman Butts and Lawrence Arthur Cremin, A History of Education in American Culture (New York, 1953), p. 527.

[33]Hynes, op. cit., p. 329-

supplied funding for both types of schools. First, they paid to support their own parochial schools, and second, they were taxed to finance the public schools. Alter believed that this system of "double taxation" was blatantly discriminatory in that the Catholic schools had never received any money from public taxation. Catholic parents were called upon to pay for another citizen's education.34

Furthermore, the state legislators had failed to realize that in the past, certain Protestant private schools had benefited from public funds. As early as 1881, schools such as Miami and Ohio Universities that were deeply associated with the Presbyterian Church had received money in accordance with Section 7, Article 1 of the Constitution which emphasized that it was the obligation of the state, "to pass suitable laws to protect every religious denomination in the peaceable enjoyment of its own mode of public worship, and to encourage schools and means of instruction."35 Section 7, Article 1 of the Constitution also upheld special funding for Wilberforce University and Payne Theological Seminary, with many of these appropriations continuing up to 1930, but when it came to the parochial schools, public money was never available. Catholics had never sought any special dispensation from state taxes; they only sought equal treatment and justice.

Alter's letter then suggested that legislators examine how other countries dealt with the system of education, noting that in Germany, France, England, Holland, Belgium, and Canada, the governments furnished religious denominations with financial assistance.36 The parochial schools of the United States and Ohio were faced with a grave situation, warned Alter, and if they were unable to secure public money, then the future of education would be in jeopardy. Alter concluded his letter with an appendix that contained excerpts from Pope Pius XI's encyclical Rappresentanti in terra (on Christian education):

> Let it be loudly proclaimed and well understood, recognized by all, that Catholics, no matter what their nationality, in agitating for Catholic schools for their children, are not mixing in party politics, but are engaged in a religious enterprise demanded by conscience. They do not intend to separate

"Karl Alter, "Twenty-Five Questions and Twenty-Five Answers on State Support for Religious Free Schools," Our Sunday Visitor (Indiana, 1932), pp. 18-21. Archives of the Diocese of Toledo.

"Gabel, op. cit., p. 662, Article I, Section 7, Ohio Constitution.

*Alter, "Twenty-Five Questions," pp. 27-28.

> their children from the body of the nation or its spirit, but to educate them in a perfect manner, most conducive to the prosperity of the nation.37

Although Alter's letter gave Schrembs and the bishops of Ohio more incentive to pursue their plan for seeking financial assistance for their schools, they also realized that whatever course they decided to follow, the opposition would be strong. Nevertheless, Schrembs had encountered anti-Catholic and anti-Church opposition many times before, and consequently, he was even more determined to do everything possible to preserve the parochial schools of his diocese and in Ohio. Schrembs realized that this issue risked a serious confrontation between Church and State, but he believed that religious officials had proper responsibilities in secular affairs. However, he also cautioned his fellow bishops that their ultimate goal was to save the parochial schools by obtaining public assistance.38 This must be accomplished without stirring up a "political" hornets' nest that would be detrimental to the American Catholic Church.

In the meantime, as the bishops continued to explore the possibilities of obtaining public assistance, the pastors of several parishes throughout Ohio's dioceses voiced their support of the bishops' endeavors. This important segment of the Catholic community was led by Father Arthur J. Sawkins of Immaculate Conception Church of Toledo. He and other pastors of the Diocese of Toledo drafted a letter assuring state legislators and Ohio's citizens that if the parochial schools were to receive public money, the money would not be used to pay the salaries of the teachers but would be used for purchasing books and for providing transportation for the children. Furthermore, the Catholic community did not expect the same amount of money as would be allocated for public schools. Sawkins and his fellow pastors, however, made it clear that they did not expect the state to exercise any control over the parochial schools (a point equally emphasized by Schrembs and his colleagues).39 The state would handle the distribution of money and the dioceses would maintain their jurisdiction over their schools.

,7lbid., pp. 50-51; Rappresentanti in ferre, December 31, 1929, par. 85, in The Papal Encyclicals, 1903-1939, ed. Claudia Carlen, I.H.M. ([Wilmington, North Carolina] 1981), p. 366.

"Schrembs to McNicholas, May 3, 1932, Schrembs MSS. Statement by Schrembs, September 26, 1933, Schrembs MSS.

"Letter by Sawkins acknowledged by Bishop James McFadden, auxiliary to Schrembs, May 27, 1933, Schrembs MSS. See Sawkins, "State Aid for AU Free Schools," February 8, 1934, Schrembs MSS.

Sawkins continued by stating that Catholics comprised one-sixth of the state population, and that the public schools failed to recognize the profound impact that Catholics had on public education. If Catholics were suddenly to stop voting for public school bond issues, the public school system would cease to exist.40 The letter by Sawkins demonstrated to Schrembs and the Ohio bishops that several members of the clergy were willing to accept the challenges raised by this issue and to campaign to secure the future of Catholic education.

In May, 1933, McNicholas wrote to Schrembs, calling for a united front by Ohio's hierarchy to achieve their goal of securing public money for the parochial schools. McNicholas was concerned that certain state legislators might attempt to divide the bishops, as well as the Catholic community, on this issue. During the first week of June some of the bishops and their superintendents met, including Schrembs and the superintendent of the Diocese of Cleveland, Father Hagan. Their first objective was to establish a state-wide program for obtaining additional information on the school issue. Secondly, they agreed that the bishops should be represented on the State Board of Education. Finally, certain legislators who had been opposed to giving state aid to parochial schools should be contacted and informed that the bishops and the Catholic community disagreed with their stand on this issue. These legislators should also be educated on the current plight of the parochial schools.

Schrembs and the bishops then proceeded to consult lawyers again on the legality of their request. The Cleveland firm of Mooney, Hahn, Loiser, and Keough, which had been retained for previous diocesan problems, submitted a four-page document to Schrembs beginning with a brief description of the current economic situation in the United States and how this directly affected one of this country's most precious institutions, education. The lawyers emphasized that the national constitution supported freedom of religion and that Section 3 of Article VIII of Ohio's Constitution of 1802 stated that "religion, morality, and knowledge,"were important to every citizen.At the same time, the State Constitution also stated in Section 2 of Article VI that "no religious or other sect, or sects shall ever have any exclusive right to, or control of, any part of the school funds of this state." The lawyers informed Schrembs that this part of the Constitution was the major stumbling block for the bishops' securing public money for their parochial schools. However, the lawyers believed that the phrase, "any exclusive

49Ibid.

right to," might be further explored by Schrembs and the bishops, since that part of the Constitution did not necessarily mean that religious sects should be debarred from public money. Finally, the lawyers echoed previous statements by Schrembs, the other bishops, and the pastors that the State of Ohio did not have the financial resources to absorb an additional 175,000 students of the parochial schools if these schools were forced to close.41

With this information Schrembs and the bishops began to discuss methods whereby they could communicate their intentions to the general populace of the state. At a meeting in July, 1933, Schrembs and his colleagues proposed a four-level approach that would first reach the Catholic community, with a special effort to convince the laity that public money was absolutely necessary to keep the parochial schools open and safeguard the Catholic tradition. The bishops also believed that the governor and state legislators had to be made aware not only of the financial crisis facing the parochial schools, but also of the injustices that Catholics had experienced in the state's educational structure.42 In addition, Schrembs proposed that Protestant denominations whose schools faced similar financial difficulties should be notified of the bishops' intentions. Finally, the bishops planned to inform important segments of the broader community such as bankers, insurance companies, and the farming community of their intentions.

As the bishops began to unveil their ideas for obtaining public money, they received their first major setback when, in August, 1933, Attorney General John W Bricker submitted his legal opinion regarding parochial school aid. His statement focused on the definition of the term "public school." Bricker emphatically stated that the public schools were owned and operated by the public, and although there had been some confusion in the past over the term "public" versus the term "common," the courts had ruled that "common schools" as used in the Constitution was synonymous with public schools. Moreover, common schools or public schools operated within a broader context in serving the needs of the community. They were totally different from those schools associated with a particular religious group or sect. Bricker continued his opinion citing other past cases that had declared that common schools or public schools were generically different from religiously affiliated schools. The terms "private" and "parochial" had the same meaning and were operated and maintained in a similar manner.

"Mooney to Schrembs, November 4, 1932, Schrembs MSS.
"Executive Meeting of the Ohio Bishopsjuly 27, 1933, Schrembs MSS.

Bricker concluded that under the Constitution of Ohio, there was nothing that permitted revenue raised through public taxation to be distributed to any school owned by a religious group. The separation between Church and State had to be maintained.43

Even though this statement placed a pall over the bishops' campaign, they continued to pursue the issue. Governor George White appeared to be sympathetic to their cause, but other interest groups such as the Cleveland Citizens League and the Junior Order of American Mechanics campaigned heavily against any type of aid to the parochial schools. General relief bills for the schools and an equalization of educational opportunity bill proposed by House Democrats W M. Goodwin of Butler County, Hugh McNamee of Cuyahoga County, and Democratic Senator D. J. Gunsett of Van Wert County were defeated.44 Schrembs also found himself directly challenged by the Cleveland Citizens League, which had drafted a strong statement of opposition to parochial school aid.

The Cleveland Citizens League was an organization of prominent members of Cleveland's civic and business community that promoted an effective and economical government both in the city of Cleveland and throughout Cuyahoga County. The League, in a nine-page document published in September, 1933, declared its opinion that aid to parochial schools was unconstitutional. Although the Ohio Constitution stated that religion was important to the general well-being of the state's citizens, it clearly stated that the state could not display a special preference toward any particular religious group. Furthermore, the League pointed out that the State Constitution declared that religious groups could not have any jurisdiction over money raised by the state. What could be more clear, argued the League? It also cited several rulings by previous Attorneys General in defense of their position. In 1915, Attorney General Timothy L. Hogan ruled that parochial school students were not entitled to free textbooks from a local school district.

eBricker to B. O. Skinner, State Director, Department of Education in Ohio, August 6, 1933, Schrembs MSS.

^Hynes, op. cit., p. 330. Ohio House Journal, Vol. 115, 90th General Assembly, August 16-September 22, 1933 (Columbus, \955yjournal of Senate, Vol. 115, 90th General Assembly (Columbus, 1935). Alter to Schrembs August 3, 1933; McNicholas to Schrembs, August 17, 1933; Schrembs to McNicholas, August 20, 1933; Albers to Schrembs, January 10, 1934; Schrembs to McFadden, January 26, 1934; McFadden to priests of the Diocese of Cleveland, February 1, 1934; McFadden to McNicholas, February 3, 1934; McNicholas to McFadden, February 6, 1934; Schrembs to the Diocese of Cleveland, Diocesan Letter, Vol. XIII, February 8, 1934, Schrembs MSS.

Attorney General E. C.Turner handed down another ruling in 1927 stating that public transportation could not be provided for students who attended private schools, and in 1933, Attorney General John W Bricker had emphasized that there was a definite difference between parochial and public schools. Adamantly rejecting any type of financial assistance to the parochial schools, the League argued that state taxes could only be used for "public purposes."45 Because parochial schools were in fact private, they were not entitled to any public tax revenues.

Another factor was the issue of "public control." If financial assistance were rendered to the parochial schools, then the public sector would be forced to relinquish its control over some public funds, an action which in the League's opinion, was not only unconstitutional, but constituted a "handout" to the Church. The League's statement did not mention anything about giving money to the parochial schools even if the public was able to maintain some control over this assistance. The League concluded its document by citing Article VI, Section 2 of the Ohio Constitution which "specifically prohibits the control of any part of the school funds of the state by a religious group or sect."46

The League sympathized with the financial woes of the parochial schools, exacerbated by the Great Depression. It also acknowledged the great contributions that these schools had made to the welfare of the state. However, in the League's opinion, the principle of separation of Church and State was of such importance to religious freedom as to preclude any kind of state assistance to parochial schools.

Schrembs was not impressed with the League's opinion nor its platitudinous remarks about the contributions of the parochial schools. He accused the organization of fostering anti-Catholic sentiments not only in its statement against the use of public money for the parochial schools, but also in its endorsement of candidates for the Cleveland Public Board of Education.47 Schrembs wondered why there were no Catholics on the Board of Education. Had the public schools overlooked the fact that Cleveland's bishops and its Catholic community had traditionally supported bond issues to finance the public schools? The League's director, Mayo Fesler, denied that Catholics had ever been excluded from the Board of Education, and defended the League's posi-

«Statement by the Cleveland Citizens League, September, 1933, Schrembs MSS.

*7Wd.,p.8.

""Bishop Scores League Choice, Charges Discrimination by Group Against Catholics in Recommendations," The Cleveland Press, November 3,1933.

tion on the parochial school assistance issue.48 As tensions mounted between Cleveland's bishop and the League, Schrembs declared that he never desired to engage in a political battle with the League, but only wished to protect the constitutional rights of Catholics and to preserve their parochial schools system. These issues were crucial to the administration and to the future of Catholic education in the diocese and in the state.

Later that same month, additional articles appeared in the Catholic Universe Bulletin, the diocesan newspaper, in which Schrembs discussed the question of public money for parochial schools and expressed his opinion that the League's opposition to public assistance had partially influenced state legislators, making it more difficult for Schrembs and the other bishops of Ohio to present their case.49 Even though the level of disagreement between Schrembs and the League had risen, the Universe Bulletin article did not condemn the League for the role it was playing as a representative of a segment of Cleveland's citizens, but it did declare that the League had been guided by a small group of biased leaders, harboring anti-Catholic sentiments. Schrembs believed that this religious bigotry would eventually undermine the efforts of the Ohio bishops to save their parochial schools, and in turn destroy the public school system.

The Citizens League of Cleveland was not the only influential organization to challenge Schrembs and the Ohio hierarchy. The Junior Order of American Mechanics also campaigned against public assistance for parochial schools. This American nativist organization had broken off from its parent group, the Order of United American Mechanics (O.U.A.M.) in 1885.50 The O.U.A.M. had been formed in the 1840's by workers as a response to immigrant competition in the job market, but like other fraternal organizations of the period, it demonstrated strong anti-European and anti-Catholic sentiments. This xenophobia, especially anti-Catholicism, carried over to the Junior Order of American Mechanics, and by 1914 this organization's religious bigotry had attracted a membership of over 200,000.51 Although the Junior Order of American Mechanics was especially prominent in the South and West, it had made significant inroads in Pennsylvania and Ohio as well. Once again, Schrembs was confronted by anti-Catholicism, something that he had

*"Fesler Denies Attack Made on Catholics," The Cleveland News, November 5, 1933.

|""Prints Secret Paper Which Doesn't Exist," Catholic Universe Bulletin, November 10, 1933.

"Higham, op. cit., p. 57.

nlbid., pA74.

experienced many times as a religious leader. With regard to the parochial school issue, the Junior Order of American Mechanics had strongly supported an amendment that prohibited public money for private and church-related schools in the State of Virginia in 1902.52 Consequently, it also voiced its opposition to Schrembs and the Ohio bishops in their campaign to obtain public money for the parochial schools, basing its position on strong anti-Catholic rhetoric, which confirmed Schrembs's belief that the Order failed to comprehend the significance of the issue and the justice of the Catholics' position.

Despite these challenges and others, Schrembs and his fellow bishops were determined to implement their campaign for obtaining public money. The prelates from the four dioceses of Cleveland, Cincinnati, Columbus, and Toledo believed that one of the best tactics was to convince the state legislators that the public school system could not survive if the parochial schools ceased to exist, a possibility many feared was close at hand. The Depression had taken its toll on the parochial schools. In Cleveland alone, statistics obtained from Father Hagan, the diocesan superintendent of schools, revealed that 170 Catholic educational institutions would have a difficult time operating in the 1933-1934 academic year. Moreover, 92% of the teachers employed by the diocese had not collected a recent paycheck, and at least 66% of the teachers were owed back pay. Finally, 79 of the 170 parishes had defaulted on interest payments.53 Schrembs and his colleagues believed that if the state legislators were presented with these statistics, as well as those from the other three dioceses, they might realize that if the parochial schools were to close, the public schools would have an obligation to educate an 171,000 children.54

Aside from the state campaign to obtain public assistance, Schrembs and his fellow bishops maintained close contact with Father George Johnson, director of the Education Department of the National Catholic Welfare Conference (NCWC), in Washington, D.C., hoping that the efforts of the Ohio bishops would be noticed on the national level as well. Schrembs was chairman of the NCWC Department of Lay Organizations and a member of the Administrative Committee; he believed that the NCWC might be able to assist the parochial school campaign of Ohio's bishops. As early as November, 1933, Johnson had informed the Federal Advisory Committee on Emergency Aid in Education that the

"Gabel, op. cit., p. 625.
"John R. Hagan to George Johnson, November 24, 1933, Schrembs MSS.
"State Aid for Parochial Schools, 1932, p. 5, Schrembs MSS.

parochial school situation in the State of Ohio was critical, especially in the industrial cities where the Depression had a severe impact. Johnson reiterated the standard Catholic position of Ohio's hierarchy that, even though the parochial schools needed financial assistance, the Church did not want its schools to come under state jurisdiction. Nor did the bishops desire to establish a federal department that would centralize all forms of education. The parochial schools needed money, but they also needed their autonomy. Johnson also emphasized the fact that over 2,500,000 students were enrolled in over 9,000 Catholic schools in the United States, and if these schools were in the same desperate situation as in Ohio, then the federal government would have to finance the ongoing upkeep of new schools costing between 200 and 300 million dollars.55 Johnson's final remarks echoed those of Schrembs, stating that the parochial school had taught the solid Christian values necessary for the shaping of our country's future leaders. These values would be lost if the parochial schools had to end their rich teaching tradition. Ultimately, the bishops of Ohio were hoping that the federal government and its newly created emergency agencies, such as the Public Works Administration, would be open to another emergency situation and recognize the importance of assisting the parochial schools with public money.

Two months after Johnson made his comments, Archbishop McNicholas of Cincinnati, Episcopal Chairman of the NCWCs Department of Education, authorized Johnson to attend a meeting of the United States Commission on Education. At that meeting, Harry L. Hopkins, Administrator of the Federal Emergency Relief Administration, issued a statement to all state emergency relief administrations and chief school officers, recommending that more financial aid be given to the schools to pay teachers' salaries. However, there was no mention of public money being used for the parochial schools. The Federal Emergency Relief Administration insisted that the distribution of these funds be handled as in previous emergency relief services.56 The parochial schools were overlooked again.

Nevertheless, Schrembs and his fellow bishops continued to work with the NCWC, and in March, 1934, the Reverend Michael J. Ready, Assistant General Secretary of the NCWC, informed Schrembs that the House Educational Committee had recently established a subcommit-

"Memorandum from Johnson to Federal Advisory Committee, November 27, 1933, Schrembs MSS.

56Harry L. Hopkins to State Administrators, February 2, 1934, Schrembs MSS.

tee to further examine the school crisis. Apparently, this subcommittee had urged the House to appropriate 75 million dollars for the schools. Johnson hoped that when this bill was drafted, the NCWC might be able to exert enough pressure on the House Educational Committee to ensure that the parochial schools would be included in the appropriation. However, two months later, in May, 1934, Father John J. Burke, General Secretary of the NCWC, informed Schrembs that he had met with President Roosevelt regarding the 75 million dollar school relief bill but Roosevelt was unwilling to support it.[57]

In the meantime, John J. Douglas, chairman of the House Committee on Education, had made another proposal for assisting the schools. This bill contained the same amount as the previous appropriation, the money to be distributed to the schools that had suffered the most from the Depression. Section 5 of the bill declared that the federal government would not interfere with the administration of the schools. Even more important to the bishops was Section 6 because it did not exempt parochial schools and private schools from the appropriation.[58] Initially, Schrembs was cautious regarding the Douglas proposal, but eventually he agreed with Burke in May, 1934, that the NCWC should remain a "silent" advocate of the bill. Unfortunately, since the President did not demonstrate any enthusiasm for this measure, the bill was doomed to wallow in subcommittee. Schrembs also believed that their opponents, especially the NEA, would somehow manage to have Section 6 of the bill altered.

Frustrated by these setbacks on the national level, Schrembs and the Ohio bishops proceeded to advance their campaign with the state as the 1934 gubernatorial election approached. In the spring of 1934, the Schrembs administration initiated its own proposal, asking Governor White to grant the Cleveland diocesan parochial schools a ten-year loan at 2% interest, the loan to be used for the schools' non-religious purposes. By now Schrembs had grown impatient with the situation, and with over five million dollars in closed banks, his diocese and its schools were desperate.[59] Although White remained supportive of the parochial school situation in Cleveland, as well as throughout the state, his past efforts in seeking relief measures for the parochial schools during the summer of 1933 had been met with stiff opposition. Conse-

57Jolm J. Burke to Schrembs, May 1, 1934, Schrembs MSS.
"Douglas Bill, Schrembs MSS.
"Chancellor of Cleveland Diocese to Governor White, March 8, 1934, Schrembs MSS.

quently, further efforts to obtain similar legislation in 1934 were also doomed.60

Adding to the demise of the bishops' campaign, two events occurred in late July, 1934, that made their task even more challenging. First, the auxiliary Bishop of Cincinnati, Joseph H. Albers, communicated to Schrembs's auxiliary, Bishop James McFadden, that the Ohio Teachers' Federation published a two-page inquiry regarding aid to the parochial schools. This inquiry was circulated among certain candidates for the General Assembly and called upon the legislators to keep public money from reaching the parochial schools.61 The Ohio Teachers' Federation reiterated their opposition to giving money to the parochial schools, emphasizing that it was unconstitutional. Second, Walter O'Donnell, associate professor of economics and political science at John Carroll University, informed Schrembs that "nasty" rumors had emerged surrounding gubernatorial candidate Martin L. Davey. Davey had publicly expressed concern over the parochial schools.62 O'Donnell told Schrembs that these rumors suggested that Davey was "associated" with James A. Colescott, a prominent Ku Klux Klan leader in Ohio.63 Davey released a statement in August, 1934, denying these accusations, but for Schrembs this information only reaffirmed that anti-Catholic sentiments continued to radiate from the opposition to the parochial school campaign.

Needless to say, Schrembs and the other members of Ohio's hierarchy remained optimistic that their campaign would eventually bear fruit. Martin L. Davey was elected governor in 1934, and even though his "background" had been suspicious, it appeared that he understood some of the parochial schools' problems. In December, 1934, Schrembs, as he had stated earlier, directed his fellow bishops to submit a comprehensive budget to the State's Department of Education so that the governor and the General Assembly might understand the financial situation of the parochial schools.64 Schrembs pointed out that if public money was granted to the parochial schools, each diocese would have to keep an accurate accounting of how it was used. Thereupon, with the Department of Education displaying the budgets for each diocese, the public could see how its money was being spent. Schrembs further

MHynes, op. cit. ,pp. 329-330.

"Albers to McFadden, July 25, 1934, Schrembs MSS.

62Universe Bulletin,November 1, 1934.

«Walter O'Donnell to Schrembs, July 31, 1934, Schrembs MSS.; "Links Davey to Catholics," Youngstown Vindicator, September 20, 1934.

"Schrembs to Albers, December 14, 1934, Schrembs MSS.

reiterated that, even though religious leaders had to walk a fine line in dealing with political issues, they must be willing to use their influence to promote legislators who supported parochial school assistance. The primary goal of saving the parochial schools was the ultimate objective of this campaign.

Although it seemed that the bishops were united in this continued effort and were willing to follow Schrembs's advice, a disagreement between Schrembs and Bishop James J. Hartley of Columbus disrupted the campaign.65 Schrembs had become impatient with Hartley and some of the more conservative members of the hierarchy, and accused them of not working hard enough. In a letter to Bishop Joseph H. Albers, auxiliary of Cincinnati, Schrembs wanted the bishops to "state a specific amount needed for parochial school relief."66 In an even more radical gesture, Schrembs urged the bishops to "serve notice on Governor Davey that we will use all our influence to defeat any general appropriation measure that does not include the parochial school relief."67 Schrembs declared that as religious leaders, it was their obligation to address the importance of this issue whenever possible. As bishops, they could not wait for assistance to come to their schools; they had to go out and fight for it.

Hartley informed Schrembs that he could not understand his impatience with the efforts of the bishops, stating that "your [Schrembs's] letter has had a very discouraging effect on the committee after all their hard work. We bishops gave them [the superintendents] the work to do and they have not failed to do their best."68 Hartley also reminded Schrembs that any request by the bishops for public assistance outside the state's emergency funds would be considered unconstitutional.69 An anxious and frustrated Schrembs said to Hartley that the bishops "need an honest presentation of the facts to obtain proper votes," so the legislators "who will give you their votes must be able to prove to the public that their votes were justified by the facts in the case."70 Schrembs did not think that the committee had provided the necessary information for the bishops to promote the parochial school issue in their dioceses.

60Ibld.; Hartley to Schrembs, December 17, 1934, Schrembs MSS.
66Ibld.; Schrembs to Albers, December 14, 1934, Schrembs MSS.
67Ibld.
«"Hartley to Schrembs, December 17, 1934, Schrembs MSS.
69Lbld.
70Schrembs to Hartley, December 18, 1934, Schrembs MSS.

Upon hearing of this disagreement, Archbishop McNicholas of Cincinnati exerted his metropolitical authority by first chastising Schrembs for his impatience and then by emphatically reminding him that unity and not division was the key to a successful effort. He warned Schrembs that if he continued to question the findings of the bishops' committee, the campaign would be called off.[71] Schrembs reconciled his feelings with Hartley and pledged his co-operation with the other bishops. The hierarchy then held two important meetings in January, 1935, that established a list of Senate and House members who might be partial to the parochial school aid issue.[72] According to the bishops' findings, fifty-eight members of the General Assembly were supportive of the issue, sixty-two were against, and fourteen were undecided.[73] The Democrats heavily favored the issue, but the Republicans seemed determined to prevent any state assistance from reaching the parochial schools. There was also evidence that legislators from urban centers with large Catholic populations hard hit by the Depression favored public money for the parochial schools, whereas those who represented rural communities, which were largely Protestant, were opposed.[74] Schrembs and his fellow bishops believed that this information would be helpful to their campaign, but they were not prepared to publicly support candidates or to lobby actively. However, they were gradually becoming politically aware of the realities with which they had to deal.

During the 91st General Assembly (1935-1936), Senate Bill No. 260, or the Davis Bill, was proposed by Senator John R. Davis of the 25th District of Cuyahoga County, a Democrat and strong advocate of parochial school aid.[75] Davis believed that there should be an "equalization" of education in Ohio,"an appropriation for the purpose of equalization of ed-

[71] McNicholas to Schrembs, December 27, 1934, Schrembs MSS. Hartley had never been a strong supporter of the NCWC (see Slawson, The Origin and First Decade, pp. 231, 264). Whether this had any effect on his relationship with Schrembs and exacerbated this disagreement is not clear. Although McNicholas settled this disagreement in an authoritative manner, his role throughout this campaign seemed co-operative and conciliatory. There was some evidence in the Schrembs MSS. of other disagreements among the bishops during this campaign. However, I would not consider these disagreements tantamount to a major in-fighting among the Ohio prelates.

"Minutes from Meeting of Central Committee, January 8, 1935,Schrembs MSS.

7a/&tó.,January9,1935.

14LbId.

75Davis Bill, S.B. 260, 1935-1936.Äosfer of Senate and House of Representatives, 91st General Assembly (Columbus, date unknown), Schrembs MSS. There was no information available on Senator Davis' religious affiliation.

ucational opportunity to the many thousands of pupils of the state whose parents elect to fulfill the duty of preparing their children for citizenship in schools not supported by state funds. . . ."[76] Davis saw a vital need for assistance to all schools in the state, recommending that an appropriation of five million dollars be granted to them, whether they were public or private. Schrembs and his fellow bishops were supportive of the Davis Bill, but they were concerned with the language of the proposal. They wondered if they should recommend that the Davis proposal insert the words, "parochial schools," or accept the proposal's current language, "free tuition schools."[77] Again the question of control and distribution of public money was raised. Schrembs and the other bishops had consistently declared that any assistance given to the parochial schools must not abrogate the Church's control over its institutions. In the end their concerns were in vain as the Davis Bill passed in the Senate 17 to 15, but failed in the House of Representatives 86 to 42.[78]

Although the defeat of the Davis Bill sealed the fate of the bishops' campaign for public money, Schrembs and his colleagues pursued the struggle for the next two years, but the results were the same. Other watered-down bills were introduced, such as Senate Bill 163, the Waldvogel Bill, which proposed a tax deduction for parents who sent their children to parochial schools. There were also proposals that would allow school districts to provide free textbooks to all elementary and high school pupils in their respective districts, regardless of what school they attended. These were also defeated. On the national level, Schrembs received information from William F. Montavon, director of the Legal Department of the NCWC, in July, 1936, that in the states of New York, Indiana, New Mexico, Iowa, and Louisiana the parochial schools had received partial assistance in the form of textbooks and transportation.[79] The bishops of these states had accused the public education system of being discriminatory against students that attended parochial schools. Amendments had been introduced in these states that continued the separation between Church and State, but ended any form of discrimination against the students.

76Lbld.

77Meeting of Central Committee, January 9, 1935, Schrembs MSS.

7eVoting on S.B. 260, Schrembs MSS. Journal of the Senate, 91st General Assembly, commencing Monday, January 7, 1935, Vol. 116 (Columbus, 1935), p. 688; Journal of the House of Representatives of 91st General Assembly, Monday, January 7, 1935, Vol. 116 (Columbus, 1935), pp. 1187-1188.

79Montavon to Schrembs, July 15, 1936; Montavon to Schrembs, August 3, 1938; Montavon to Schrembs, June 30, 1939, Schrembs MSS.

The progress that had been attained in other states regarding the use of public money for parochial schools did not change the situation in Ohio. Defenders of Church-State separation, nativist sentiments, and differing educational philosophies prevented Schrembs and his fellow bishops from obtaining financial assistance for their parochial schools. However, even though their campaign did not achieve the desired results, Schrembs and members of the American hierarchy were becoming more competent in exercising their political influence. On the theological level, the preservation of the Catholic faith and the quest for distributive justice for the students of the parochial schools had been the motivating factors for Schrembs and his fellow bishops to seek public assistance. On the practical level, the Great Depression was the real impetus. In the future there would be more vociferous campaigns for the parochial schools. But for now, regardless of the reasons or the situation, it was clear to Schrembs and other members of the hierarchy that the Catholic schools, and everything that they represented, were on their own.

Archbishop Joseph Schrembs
(Courtesy of Ms. Chris Krosel,
director of the Archives of the Diocese of Cleveland.)

# THE ROLE OF ANTICLERICALISM IN THE REFORMATION

Review Article

Nelson H. Minnich*

Anticlericalism in Late Medieval and Early Modern Europe. Edited by Peter A. Dykema and Heiko A. Oberman. Second, revised edition. [Studies in Medieval and Reformation Thought, Volume Ii.] (Leiden: E.J. Brill. 1994. Pp. xii, 706. $197.25.)

The forty articles contained in this volume were originally presented as papers at an International Colloquium on "Late Medieval and Early Modern Anticlericalism" organized by Heiko A. Oberman and held at the University of Arizona at Tucson, September 20-22, 1990, under the formal direction of Peter A. Dykema, who helped to edit this collection, to supply it with a "thematic" and a supplemental bibliography (pp. 671-680 and 705-706), and to translate into English Hans-Christoph Rublack's contribution. The first edition was published in 1993. That the papers were subsequently revised is evident in the cross-references: e.g. ,William Monter agreeing with Silvana Seidel Menchi, Ronnie Po-Chia Hsia raising questions about Rublack's methodology, and Thomas Brady faulting Hans-Jürgen Goertz's thesis. The contributors are among the leading scholars in the field, coming mostly from Germany and America, the host institution in Tucson providing four. A quarter of the volume is in German, the rest in English, and of the English-language articles four are translations from German and Italian. Only one author, John Van Engen, has contributed two independent studies. Although Goertz is the author of but one article in this collection, his name reappears as various scholars take issue with his positions. While all the articles are focused on anticlericalism, some provide sweeping surveys and historiographical reviews; others concentrate on a particular figure or region or incident. Two enrich their presentations by including transcriptions of archival materials as appendices. Although most of the articles are original pieces, they are frequently closely related to earlier work done by the

"The author is grateful to Professor Elisabeth G. Gleason for having offered valuable suggestions for improving an earlier draft of this review.

authors, so that they provide something of an overview of the various methodologies and themes pursued by contemporary scholars. The volume treats the period 1300-1700 and is concerned primarily with Germany and the Protestant Reformation, although some consideration is also given to the Netherlands, Italy, Switzerland, England, Bohemia, Spain, and France and to the Catholic clergy apart from their being the targets of evangelical criticism.

The Tucson conference papers provide a good glimpse at the state of contemporary scholarship on the issue of how anticlericalism contributed to the Reformation. Pioneering and controversial work on this topic was done in the previous decade by Goertz, who argued that the primary animator of what became the Protestant Reformation was anticlericalism. Luther's contribution to the movement was to supply theological formulations and justifications, such as his teachings on faith, grace, and the Bible that eliminated the need for mediators and his expansive reinterpretation of the traditional doctrine of the priesthood of all believers. Leading historians have joined in exploring the topic of anticlericalism from a variety of perspectives and many of these scholars have presented their most recent findings at the Tucson conference in an effort to clarify what role anticlericalism played in the major transformation of Western European society during the Reformation era.

The obvious problem that confronts any scholar working on this theme is how to define the fragile, central operative term "anticlericalism." Does any criticism of the clergy constitute anticlericalism? What other factors must go into the definition? Has the term evolved over time so that criticism of the clergy in the medieval period primarily urged the conformity of clerics to an apostolic, sacerdotal, celibate ideal, while among early Protestant Reformers central elements of that ideal and its flawed practitioners were attacked and a new model proposed, and in the nineteenth century emphasis was on eliminating from the public sphere the influence of clerics and of religion itself? Although the conference papers give evidence of a diversity of working conceptions, the participants in the end hammered out a consensus definition in the following formulation, as reported by Heiko A. Oberman in his introductory essay:

> Anticlericalism is a collective term, gaining currency in the nineteenth century as a one-sided negative designation. Properly understood, it describes attitudes and forms of behavior which in late medieval and early modern Europe engendered literary, political or physical action against what were perceived as unjust privileges constituting the legal, political, economic, sexual, sacred or social power of the clergy. Significantly different according to place, time and social background, anticlericalism could focus on papal, episcopal, sacerdotal, monastic, ministerial or intellectual power-structures.
>
> These grievances and actions emerged from a long tradition of medieval critique directed against the first ordo. Around the time of the reformation, anticlericalism's programmatic goal was to reform and discipline the clergy. In the post-reformation era we note the reversal of this tendency:

> now the clergy, as state-officials, turned their efforts more assertively than before to the problem of disciplining the laity; church and state cooperated to (re)form the laity into subjects. This gave rise to a new type of anticlericalism.

The conference's definition is problematic. It focuses heavily on the social and political aspects of the term, giving little attention to the theological assumptions implied in the words "perceived as unjust." The definition seems to assume as normative the conceptions of late medieval heretics and Reformation-era Protestants. Within the Catholic community as evidenced for Italy by Seidel Menchi and Elisabeth Gleason, for Spain by Monter, and for Germany by Manfred Schulze, criticisms of the clergy were based not so much on hostility to perceived-as-unjust privileges, but on a concern over the clergy's failure to carry out their duties properly. Missing from the collection is any paper dedicated to a study of how priests were viewed or defended in contemporary Catholic theology—e.g., as set aside by an indelible character placed on the soul at ordination, as having special sacramental powers, as called to a holy life of liturgical and pastoral service, and as entitled to material support from the laity according to the teachings of both the Old and New Testaments. The helpful article by Scott Hendrix does try to remedy this lacuna by investigating the impact of anticlericalism upon the Catholic clergy, but his study either passes over quickly the Catholic doctrine of the priesthood, or suggests, after claiming that Eberlin's polemical depiction of Catholic priests was basically accurate, that the pious priest upon hearing Luther's message woke "with an enlightened but stabbing conscience" and "felt just as angry and cheated as the laity" (p. 459).

Also problematic is the reference in the definition to the sexual power of the clergy. In what did this consist? In the priest's sacramental power to absolve the sexual sins of a penitent in confession? In the claim to a higher form of holiness because the priest did not exercise his sexual powers due to the obligation of celibacy? Was such an assertion of sanctity viewed as unjust because it implicitly devalued the lay vocation to the married life? Was the real issue not the sexual power of the clergy but the burden of celibacy which some resented as a non-scriptural obstacle to their exercising pastoral ministry in the Church? Was the sexual power of a priest seen as unrestrainable so that, not having a wife of his own, he became a sexual predator, having affairs with others' daughters and wives? Of course, no reputable Catholic writer ever claimed a power or right to or condoned, but only excoriated, such conduct. Reference to the perceived-as-unjust sexual power of the clergy is at best confusing and does not help to clarify the term.

The definition's assertion that the goal of anticlericalism "was to reform and discipline the clergy" tries to embrace in one formulation very differing aims. While these words would apply to anticlericalism among Catholics, Protestant proponents most often urged not the reform and discipline of Catholic clerics, but their abolition and replacement with married ministers who had no special

sacramental powers and differed from the laity in their level of theological learning, commissioning, and status as clerical servants of the state.

Having noted some of the problems inherent in the conference's summary definition of the term, we are in a better position to examine the forty articles on which this definition is based.

What image of anticlericalism emerges from the eight contributions in the section on the late medieval period? Kaspar Elm reports that criticisms of the clergy during that era were but a continuation of earlier complaints. These proceeded from a love of the Church and a desire to reform it, not from the nineteenth century's hostility toward the clergy and determination to exclude their influence from civil society. Only in the nineteenth century does the term anticlericalism first appear. Albrecht Classen's analysis of late medieval poems finds that criticism of the clergy's misuse of power, claims to ethical superiority, neglect of spiritual duties, and failure to carry out properly the military responsibilities of a prince-bishop was widespread among German writers of the period. According to Van Engen, the English Lollards tried to eliminate some of the principal bases of priestly power in the control of sacraments and ecclesiastical lands and to appropriate to themselves the offices of preacher and teacher, creating in the process a new clerical caste among Wyclif's followers. Frantisek Smahel's study of the Bohemian Hussites shows that attacks on the clergy were due in part to their relatively high numbers (five percent of the population) and great wealth (one-third of the land). Following the Hussite revolt, the clergy's numbers dropped signincantíy and they lost eighty percent of their lands. Frantisek Graus proposes that the Taborites' attacks on orthodox priests and ordinary Christians' complaints about their immorality and neglect of their spiritual duties were part of a wider scapegoating process that blamed the deterioration of society also on women, witches, and homosexuals. The anecdote related by Gordon Griffith of the Florentine government's complaint to Eugenius IV in 1431 about a Knight of St. John who hawked without authorization indulgences that remitted supposedly both the pena and culpa attached to sins seems more like an isolated denunciation of abuse than a generalized hostility toward the clergy. Van Engen finds in the founding of the Brethren of the Common Life an increasingly conscious effort to create a group half-way between religious and laity that avoided those areas where there were most complaints against the clergy; thus the Brethren had few priests as members, submitted to episcopal and civil jurisdiction, supported themselves by manual labor instead of from begging and benefices, and limited themselves to practical learning helpful to spiritual advancement. Peter Blickle holds that the four Swiss Forest Cantons remained Catholic in good part because they had earlier resolved in the laity's favor such issues of ecclesiastical power as local choice of pastors, a reduction of the competence of church law, and secular control over monastic lands.

The second section, "The Transition to Early Modern Society," consists of eleven articles, four each on Germany and Italy and only one each on Spain,

France, and Holland. Karlheinz Blaschke's study of Saxony demonstrates that in addition to state efforts to gain control over the Church, there was a tradition of complaints directed at individual clerics' misuse or inappropriate use of power and failure to be worthy spiritual ministers. Robert Scribner finds that the evangelical party in the cities, notably Erfurt, consciously stirred up traditional anticlericalism, denouncing the clergy as greedy hypocrites and staging dramatic confrontations and riots. The evangelicals' allies on town councils, frequenüy relatives of Protestant preachers, used these displays of popular discontent to subdue the Catholic clergy, confiscate their wealth and power, expel them, and install in their place evangelical preachers. Thomas and Katherine Brady, in an article and collection of relevant documents, use the Heido/Drenss legal suit over a clerical marriage in 1524 to murninate the changing situation of clergy in Strassburg. The city's ruling lay elite used the common people's resentment against the clergy who were often foreign-born and economic competitors to desacralize their office and integrate them into society by encouraging priests and nuns to abandon their more austere and intimidating spiritual life style, to marry and thus adopt as the only acceptable social ideal the patriarchal household.

Four articles address the Italian scene. Donald Weinstein briefly outlines the conventional topics he would treat in a book on Italian anticlericalism for the period 1200 to 1530. While Seidel Menchi can identify numerous anticlerical statements in the major Italian writers of the period, she notes that half of them were economically dependent on the Church, as were the others' lay patrons whose relatives often held ecclesiastical offices. Italian anticlericalism was a healthy blowing off of steam built up from an overfamiliarity with clerics and the Roman Curia. Rather than hostility, a spirit of great co-operation existed between clerics and laity. Convents remained the convenient holding tanks for the leftovers from the marriage market. City officials accepted the need to repress heresy, whether by their own civil or local episcopal authority or by the external Roman Inquisition. Gleason argues that the spirituali, who were frequently openly anticlerical in the 1530's, failed to be more effective in promoting church reforms because they generally limited reform to the personal, and their famous Consilium de emendanda ecclesia on institutional reform was viewed as too radical, even though they supported a pastoral and administrative papacy and the traditional sacramental system. Thomas Mayer, who analyzes the epic poem Orlando Furioso of Ludovico Ariosto, a client of the d'Esté duke and friend of the spirituali, finds in this poem the religious attitudes of the poet's patron and friends: clergy, who are often depicted as evil men, play minor roles and the laity manage their own religious affairs.

Anticlericalism elsewhere in Europe is also studied. William Monter notes that while Spanish folk proverbs give evidence of criticism of clerics, assaults upon them were rare. The records of the Spanish Inquisition provide paltry evidence of any anticlericalism, and what there was seldom led to Protestantism. Only fifteen Spaniards were ever executed by the Inquisition as unrepentant Protestants. Given Lucien Febvre's assertion that the relationship between anti-

clericalism and the origins of the Reformation in France is a poorly-put question, little study has been done. Jane Dempsey Douglass tries to fill in this and other historiographical lacunae by studying the anticlericalism of three women in the period 1404-1539. The writer Christine de Pizan defended women against clerical misogyny. Marguerite d'Angoulême, sister of François I and Queen of Navarre, criticized in her Heptameron corrupt Catholic clergy and posed as a model of Christian living an elderly woman who prayed privately and read daily from the Bible. Marie Dentiere, an apostatized abbess who married a Protestant pastor, wrote works attacking both Catholic clerics as immoral idlers and Genevan pastors as too tolerant of continuing idolatry and of lenient magistrates. Anticlericalism in Holland during the reign of Charles V was fueled, according to James Tracy, by resentments over clerical exemptions from taxes, extensive land holdings, competitive business practices, frivolous impositions of ecclesiastical penalties upon the laity, and harsh repressions of heretics in contravention of local privileges.

Section III, "Reform and Reformation: The Call for Change," contains fourteen articles that treat Luther's evolving anticlericalism, the reception of his message, the Peasants' War, and anticlericalism and the clergy. At issue in some of these studies are the theories of Franz Lau and Goertz. Lau's "wild growth" thesis holds that prior to the Peasants' War (1524/25) the Protestant movement witnessed a proliferation of ideas and behaviors, but following the war authorities imposed Lutheran uniformity. Goertz sees anticlericalism as the primary driving force behind the Reformation with only the Anabaptists following through to liquidate the clerical estate, while Lutherans and others retained a modified clergy.

Luther's evolving views on the Catholic clergy are traced by three authors. Martin Brecht finds that the young Luther was not anticlerical. Criticism of the clergy grew from 1516 onwards as Luther came to a new understanding of justification. He initially urged the reform of clerics, not their destruction. Contrary to Goertz's thesis, first came new theological insights, then came anticlericalism. In his study of Luther's Address to the Nobility of the German Nation (1520), Bernd Moeller notes that the reformer limited his attacks to the pope and Roman Curia as instruments of Satan and called for the elimination of the distinction between clergy and laity by advocating the priesthood of all believers. After 1521 Luther expanded his anticlericalism to the other ranks of the clergy. According to Robert Bast, Luther in the years 1521/22 began calling openly for the elimination of the clerical state as a diabolical and human invention whose members blindly urge the faithful to perform works that are doctrinally and socially useless.

The reception of Luther's ideas in German society are studied by four authors. Having outlined Lau's thesis of a "wild growth," Berndt Hamm summarizes the counter-view of Moeller which holds that prior to the Peasants' War the various Reformers adopted Luther's central theological positions, but thereafter his disciples developed in differing and polarizing ways the inner logic of

his positions. Based on an examination of pre-1525 pamphlets, Hamm holds that multiple expressions of Luther's ideas were already present. Rublack rejects Goertz's thesis and claims that anticlericalism gave only added impetus to and was not the primary agent of the Reformation. Luther actively promoted pamphlets attacking the Catholic clergy. The criticisms found in these pamphlets went beyond those of the later Middle Ages by adding an apocalyptic tone and emphasis. Hsia cautions that in studying these pamphlets one needs to distinguish such things as their various authors, audiences, themes, literary styles, targets (e.g., they were aimed not just at clerics, but also at elderly women and Jews), and dates of publication (e.g., there was a sharp decline in their number after the Peasants' War). Goertz holds that the people were so stirred up by Luther's vehement attacks on the clergy as agents of Antichrist that they engaged in acts of violence: openly insulting and manhandling the clergy, closing monasteries, banning Mass, destroying images, etc.

Four scholars try to determine what role anticlericalism played in the Peasants' War. Hans Hillerbrand traces Thomas Mtintzer's evolving identifications and denunciations of the perverters of the Gospel: immoral and worldly Catholic clergy (1521), Luther (1523), and unjust princes (1524/25). Siegfried Hoyer argues that important driving forces behind the peasants' actions were their anticlerical demands for the free preaching of the Gospel according to the Protestant interpretation, local lay election of pastors, and the right to refuse payment of tithes to particular pastors and tribute to ecclesiastical landlords. Henry Conn warns that anticlerical and Protestant factors are not always clear. Part of the peasants' motivation came from anger and envy, from a desire to escape servitude, to wreak revenge and humiliation on their overlords, only some of whom were clerics. According to James Stayer's study, the radical Protestants of northeastern Switzerland who generally did not engage in large-scale military actions held views similar to those of their more bellicose neighboring German peasants in calling for the abolition of the corrupting benefice system which led eighty percent of the region's Catholic clergy to switch faiths to retain their income. Zwingli actively opposed the Anabaptists' call for the elimination of tithes and benefices.

Clergy as agents or targets of anticlericalism is examined by four studies. Goertz notes that former Catholic clerics were particularly sharp in denouncing their earlier associates: Luther verbally, Müntzer militarily, and Sattler in calling for a total separation from corruption. Their denunciations of individual clerics led in places to the elimination of the clerical state and its replacement with a new elite to provide leadership and discipline. Similar observations are made by Susan Karant-Nunn, who points out that while these former clerics urged the abolition of such institutions as monasteries, they retained pastorates which they came to occupy and were transformed into servants of the state. The unusual case of a Catholic bishop, Berthold Pirstinger, attacking in his Onus Ecclesiae (written ca. 1519) the sins of various members of the hierarchy is studied by Schulze, who finds in the bishop's angry denunciations themes borrowed from the Bible and medieval apocalyptic writers such as St. Birgitta of

Sweden. Skeptical of the helpfulness of either a Luther or an Eck, Pirstinger called upon all Christians to reform the Church. Scott Hendrix explores the reactions of Catholic clergy to the anticlerical attacks. He relates that as a profession the clergy were already in economic and social decline and did not enjoy a supposed comfortable lifestyle. Even pious priests became the targets of the hatred and envy of the laity. They felt victimized and cheated by the Reformation's stripping away of any respect and prestige and by its vilification of their motives and ministry.

The final section, entitled "Toward the Confessional Age," contains several articles that deal with the historiography of English anticlericalism, Calvin's attitudes toward Catholic clerics, and anticlericalism directed against Protestant and Tridentine clerics.

Richard Cosgrove traces the pedigree of the claim that anticlericalism was a major factor in promoting the English Reformation. In the sixteenth century, the Hunne Affair (1511/14) and writings of propagandists such as Simon Fish and John Foxe vilified the Catholic clergy as corrupt and tyrannical servants of a foreign pope, themes that became central explanations for the success of the Reformation in England in the highly influential history of James Anthony Froude (1818-1894), who personally feared the influence and despised what he considered the status-seeking and domineering ways of the Catholic clergy of his day. Recent scholarship has shown that anticlerical Lollardy barely survived underground (G. Elton), there was no widespread hostility toward the clergy (J. Scarisbrick), Elizabeth's imposition of strict religious controls provoked an anticlerical response (C. Haigh), and thus anticlericalism was more a consequence than a cause of the Reformation (J. Guy). Peter Marshall's study of the English Catholic priesthood, The Catholic Priesthood and the English Reformation (1994), would seem to date the rise of disrespect for the clergy to the 1540's and 1550's, to the period when the roles a priest should carry out were much debated and the clergy were most subjected to Protestant attacks.

Calvin's criticisms of the Catholic clergy and his vision of a Reformed pastorate are studied by two scholars. Carlos Eire provides a close analysis of Calvin's 1536 letter to Gerard Roussel warning him not to accept the post of bishop of Oleron because the Catholic priesthood was corrupted by serious doctrinal, pastoral, and financial problems. In place of Catholic sacerdotalism, Calvin urged an aggressive, pedagogical, and disciplinary leadership of Christendom by Reformed clergy. David Steinmetz finds that Calvin criticized not only the failings of monks, but the institution of monasticism itself for lacking a foundation in Scripture, and for being self-centered, schismatic, and based on such false doctrines as a second baptism, obligations contrary to the divine plan, and claims that only an elite are called to observe the counsels. Calvin's views are set against the background of the earlier teachings of Augustine, Aquinas, Gerson, and Goch.

The continuance and transformation of anticlericalism in the later period of the Reformation is also investigated. Robert Kingdon studies the failed opposi-

tion of the Favres and their allies to the political and juridical authority exercised by the non-citizen clerical members of the Genevan Consistory until the crushing defeat of these "Libertines" in 1555. Heinz Schilling examines the struggle (1649-1672) between two Calvinist factions in the Netherlands. The middle- and lower-class conservative Orange party was heavily influenced by its extremist clerical allies who wanted the state Calvinist church to control tightly the government and society, arguing that such a monopoly would guarantee the unity and independence of the state under a king. The intellectual and upper-class pragmatic Regency party wanted the worldly, power-seeking clergy out of politics, the Calvinist church subject to a republican government, and toleration for religious minorities. The Orange party triumphed over the anticlerical Regents. From an examination of the visitation reports of 1569/70 for the Weimar region of Saxony, Gerald Strauss finds that the laity viewed their Lutheran clergy negatively as a burdensome, privileged class that arbitrarily exercised unreasonable powers, needlessly meddled into people's private lives, and harshly demanded the laity's money, goods, and services under threat of civil penalties. Anticlericalism was probably also aroused by the fact that Lutheran pastors were often outsiders who did not mingle socially with the people but functioned as part of the state's disciplinary apparatus. Philip Soergel's study shows that Lutheran pastors in Germany responded to claims of proofs of Catholicism's divine approbation and greater effectiveness, found in the exorcisms of its priests and in the miracles worked at its shrines, by engaging in bizarre, scatological denunciations of Catholic priests for performing their prodigies by sorcery or trickery.

These forty studies, here briefly summarized, constitute a significant contribution to our understanding of how anticlericalism functioned in the Reformation era, whether to urge conformity to a traditional ideal, to attack that ideal and replace it with another, or to criticize those who failed to live up to the new model. If the anticlericalism of the later Middle Ages was spontaneous and widespread in various regions, urging the reform of the clergy, that of the early Reformation is portrayed in a number of these studies as a movement inspired and directed by calculating evangelical preachers who intentionally stirred up the people to take violent action against even pious priests whom they had demonized as tools of Satan and enemies of the Gospel. These preachers profited economically when they replaced the Catholic clerics who were thus driven from their posts. Although protected by the state from similar harsh treatment, the new Protestant clergy became themselves targets of lay resentment, especially when these pastors attempted to discipline the laity in ways not attempted by medieval clerics.

Hopefully this collection will inspire further studies. The methodologies of social and political history here predominantly employed need to be complemented by investigations into intellectual and cultural history, using such disciplines as theology and anthropology. A topic in obvious need of further work is how the Catholic community responded to anticlerical attacks. David V. N. Bagchi in his Luther's Earliest Opponents: Catholic Controversialists, 1518-

1525 (1991) included sections briefly surveying efforts to defend the priest's special status as mediator, consecrator, and sacrificer, a status consistent with the ordering of divine and natural realities testified to by Christ, Paul, and Dionysius the Pseudo-Areopagite, a status that is conferred by the sacrament of ordination. New research should study these and other arguments advanced in defense of the clergy's special status. What measures were taken by Catholics to blunt specific criticisms of clerics? To what extent were the Catholic indices of books prohibited or to be expurgated driven by a concern to eliminate anticlerical sentiments? The topic of anticlericalism lends itself to study from multiple perspectives employing a variety of methodologies. This collection of papers from the Tucson conference has pointed the way. We are deeply indebted to Heiko A. Oberman and Peter A. Dykema for having organized so interesting a conference and for sharing with us its valuable findings.

The Catholic University ofAmerica

# BOOK REVIEWS

## Early Modern European

The Loyal Opposition; Tudor Traditionalist Polemics, 1535-1558. By Ellen A. Macek. [Studies in Church History, Vol. 7.] (New York: Peter Lang. 1996. Pp. xv, 299. $53.95.)

It has long been recognized that the term 'Catholic' is unsatisfactory when applied to those within the English church who resisted the advance of Protestantism in the mid-sixteenth century. Either 'conservative' or 'traditionalist' is better, but it is very hard to devise a satisfactory category in which to place them. In this study, Ellen Macek's subtitle is unexceptionable, but the use of the word 'opposition' raises serious problems. In what sense were Gardiner and Tunstal opponents of Henry VDTs changes? Moreover, these same men were in power under Mary. The terminology is more difficult than the substance, because what these men were endeavoring to do for most of the time was to keep an English church controlled by the Crown in line with traditional doctrine on such important issues as justification and the sacraments. There can be little doubt that they spoke for the majority of English people, but there was no bottom line to their argument, because they had no alternative theory of ecclesiastical authority. As long as Henry VIII was alive they could sustain a viable position, because their opponents were the "reforming faction" rather than the king himself. The short reign of Edward VI disillusioned them, when the Royal Supremacy which they had hitherto supported was used to destroy what they regarded as the fundamentals of the Christian faith. They embraced Mary's conservative reaction with enormous relief, but many of them were less than enthusiastic about the papacy, merely accepting that the Royal Supremacy had proved to be a broken reed for the protection of what they considered to be essential religious truth.

Dr. Macek is correct in claiming that these writers have been unduly neglected. A generation ago their existence was barely acknowledged, and although they now enjoy a relatively high profile in revisionist studies of the English Reformation, what they actually wrote has been little studied. Here the emphasis is upon two main areas of doctrine, justification and the sacraments, and one of methodology, the extent of humanist influence. Within these

parameters it is a thorough and lucid study, showing both the continuities and discontinuities with late medieval theology, and the extent to which positive thinking was obstructed by polemical priorities. It does not, however, make clear the extent to which these writers evaded controversial issues where their conservative instincts were at odds with their humanist training. 'Purgatory,* for instance, does not even appear in the index, and vernacular scriptures are "but slenderly handled," as they themselves might have said. What is done is well done, and a useful contribution to understanding, but there is scope for more than one work of this kind.

One of the most interesting points arises almost incidentally toward the end, when Dr. Macek points out that the true heirs of these mid-Tudor traditionalists were less the Catholic recusants of the next, and subsequent, generations, than the High Anglicans of the Laudian church and the Tractarian movement. Gardiner, Bonner, Tunstal, Smith, and their fellows were only ultramontane to a limited extent and when forced by circumstances. The intense papalism of Reginald Pole was alien to them, and they paid little attention to such progress as the Council of Trent had made by 1558. In most respects they were less an opposition than the purveyors of an alternative Anglican vision.

David Loades

Oxford

Dangerous Talk and Strange Behavior. Women and Popular Resistance to the Reforms of Henry VJII. By Sharon L. Jansen. (New York: St. Martin's Press. 1996. Pp. viü, 232. $39.95.)

This is a series of case studies of women involved in opposition to Henry VHFs proceedings in the 1530's. The particularly thorough investigations ordered by the government in these years makes such an investigation unusually possible. Margaret Cheyne, alias Lady Bulmer, was the only woman to be executed for direct involvement in the Pilgrimage of Grace. Elizabeth Barton, the "Nun of Kent," already well known as a visionary, was hanged in 1534 for prophetic warnings against Henry's marriage to Anne Boleyn. A Norfolk woman, Elizabeth Wood, was executed for lamenting the failure of the 1537 "Walsingham Conspiracy," and for wishing for a popular rising "with clubs and clouted shone." Mabel Brigge undertook a three-day fast, allegedly to bring about the death of the king. Professor Jansen also mentions in passing several other cases. Particularly poignant is the story of nine Cumberland women who cut down and buried the bodies of their husbands, left hanging on the gallows for several weeks; Thomas Cromwell was particularly insistent that the men he assumed to be behind this should be punished.

Jansen concludes that women of all social groups were ready to express views on religion, politics, and social issues. Nevertheless, they were less likely

to be reported, and, when reported, to pay the ultimate penalty. Jansen speculates on why these four were selected for execution. The women's circumstances were very various, and it is difficult to come to a conclusion, except in the case of Elizabeth Barton, whose fame and high contacts made her an obvious victim. Margaret Cheyne may have been an illegitimate daughter of the duke of Buckingham, executed in 1521, and her marriage to Sir John Buhner, whom she was accused of urging into rebellion, was commonly impugned. Elizabeth Wood was the wife of a husbandman; curiously, there seems to have been no investigation of her husband's opinions. Mabel Brigge, a widow, was executed; her married associate Isabel Bucke escaped the death penalty.It is clearly impossible to recover the particular circumstances which made for condemnation in each case. Professor Jansen has worked carefully through the evidence. She does not press it beyond what it will bear, nor does she make exaggerated claims. It is good to have these cases of awkward, careless, or high-principled women brought to the fore. Women did not take up arms. But their attitudes, if not their actions, seem as various as those of the men, and not very noticeably "gendered."

C. S. L. Davies

Wadham College, Oxford

Luther's Heirs Define His Legacy: Studies on Lutheran Confessionalization. By Robert Kolb. [Variorum Collected Studies Series, CS539] (Brookfield, Vermont: Variorum, Ashgate Publishing Company. 1996.Pp.xii, 322. $89.95.)

There is no more convincing demonstration that the fundamental layer of every culture is religion than considering the process called "confessionalization." The Variorum series has happily brought together a number of specialized studies on the confessionalization which did so much to form modern German culture and character by Dr. Robert Kolb of Concordia Theological Seminary in St. Louis. Thanks are due to the Variorum series for retaining the original pagination of the journal articles, which avoids the confusion which could arrive when Kolb's investigations are cited—as they surely will be—in other publications. Collected, the essays raise the hope for a comprehensive history of the Late Reformation. Reprinted in the fresh form of their original printing, they convey Kolb's enthusiasm for his period and his curiosity about individual themes.

Together, the essays in the first section, "Theology in the Context of Controversy," tend to disprove the common opinion that the early controversies about Luther's legacy were mere squabbling. There are careful essays on predestination, the necessity of good works, as well as the Lutheran reaction to the Council of Trent. Impressive is the evidence of his rare gusto for reading and interpreting long-neglected—dusty—Latin tomes of biblical interpretation. In

the second section,"The Wittenberg Tradition in Biblical Exegesis,"he looks into Luther's influence on the history of commentaries on Genesis and on the Epistle to the Galatians. He is interested not only in the academically acceptable theme of the influence of humanism in the Reformation, but also in the less acceptable themes of the uncompromisingly biblical emphasis of Cyriakus Spangenburg. His investigation of the fate of St. Anselm's interpretation of the atonement as "satisfaction" is a contribution to the unfinished discussion among systematic theologians. I hope that he finds an effective way to insert the insights from his study on the Saints' days into discussions on contemporary liturgical practice.

The varied essays have been grouped together in an amiably loose fashion. Since they are both useful contributions to the millennium-long scholarly discussion de methodo, for example, the discussion on the commonplace method could just as well have been grouped with the study of Johannes Wigand's use of dialectic in the section, "Theological Freedom and Method." Description of the feisty defense by Matthaeus Judex of freedom of the press could just as well have been included in the section, "Theology in the Context of Controversy."

Against Paul Tillich's classification of the partisans, Kolb argues that the Gnesio-Lutherans, who followed Matthias Flacius, were "radicals"; the Philippists, followers of Philipp Melanchthon, were "conservatives" (I, 21). Rather sharing the dismay of Spangenberg, however, that the Formula of Concord originated "in the collusion of princes" (VI, 206), he is sanguine. "As an intellectual movement develops from origin to orthodoxy," he explains, "adjustments need to be made between the style of the charismatic prophet, who is necessary to launch such a movement, and the style of the institutional servant of the establishment, which supports the continuing life of the movement" (Vl, 216). Should Kolb undertake a comprehensive history of the Late Reformation—and, as this collection demonstrates, no one is better qualified—he would do well to adopt a wider world-historical perspective, and wrestle with the judgment, e.g., of Hans Iwand (Nachgelassene Werke, ?, 199) about the part played by the 286 editions of the Loci Communes of Philipp Melanchthon, certainly an "institutional servant of the establishment," in the fearful rise of German absolutism. Had they been heeded, "the calls and cries of a diminishing band of obstinate radicals [the Gnesio-Lutherans, (VI, 215)]," against state absolutism might have led to a happier German history.

Oliver K. Olson

Marquette University

"Poor Sinning Folk": Confession and Conscience in Counter-Reformation Germany. By W. David Myers. (Ithaca, New York: Cornell University Press. 1996. Pp. xiii, 230. $35.00.)

David Myers' new book fills an important gap in our understanding of the processes of Reformation and Counter-Reformation and the role that penance played in those transformations. Myers focuses primarily, although not exclusively, on the Duchy of Bavaria, that firm bastion of Catholic piety long cited as the epitome of the central European, counter-reforming state. Before Myers' book, English-speaking historians often relied on the research of historians such as John Bossy and Jean Delumeau to reconstruct the social history of confession in places like this. These works primarily examined early-modern France, a state whose counter-reforming trajectory was hardly typical by European standards. Now historians of Germany and Central Europe have Myers' exemplary study, a work that will hopefully inspire other forays into the local history of the sacraments and their function in early-modern Catholicism.

Too often, Myers concludes, scholars of late-medieval and early-modern religion have judged confession from the standpoint of its presumed effects instead of examining it within its social milieu. Before 1970, the school of religious sociology inaugurated by Gabriel Le Bras quantified confession and communion like any other social behavior. The startlingly low rates of participation that Abbé Toussaert discovered in late-medieval Flanders, for instance, became proof for an enduring lay disregard of clerical orthodoxy. By the 1970's, English-speaking scholars had entered into the debate and had shifted the nature of its discussion. Thomas N. Tender's judicious Sin and Confession on the Eve of the Reformation (1977) explored the prescriptive literature of confessors' manuals, showing how late-medieval penance could give rise both to moral rigor and effective consolation. In his famous The Reformation in the Cities (1976), Steven Ozment had already attacked those conclusions, instead insisting that penance was the source for a widespread spiritual anxiety among the laity.

Rather than concentrating on those questions, Myers hopes to shift the nature of the discussion once again: he wishes to reconstruct the ways in which penance functioned in the late-medieval Church and the precise changes that the Reformation and Counter-Reformation produced in its practice. Myers consequently grants the penitential system primacy, exploring its permutations over two centuries. The resulting text is concise and well written. And although this book does not exhaust all questions concerning penance in the early-modern period, it is an excellent starting point on which other scholars will be able to build. The first of Myers' two sections, "Late-Medieval and Reformation Confession," explores the environment in which late-medieval penance functioned and deftly treats late-medieval and Reformation-era theology and praxis. Instead of characterizing confession's role as an amorphous "communal sacrament" in the manner of John Bossy, Myers relies on thick description to reconstruct the public world in which penance was practiced. At the end of the

Middle Ages, Myers observes, confession in Germany was primarily a seasonal rite limited to Lent. Any anxiety confession produced was thus an ephemeral phenomenon and "not a continuous source of guilt, fear, worry or joy" (p. 59). At this time confession may have been a secret rite conducted between priest and lay people, yet since the rite was conducted in public, complete secrecy was never really achieved.

While Myers agrees with John Bossy's characterization of the substance of early-modern innovations—privacy and internalization—he avoids setting up a too dramatic dichotomy between the later Middle Ages and the seventeenth century. Early-modern changes grew out of late-medieval theological discourse, and that discourse was in turn transformed by the Protestant upheavals of the half-century after 1520. Three important changes revolutionized penance in seventeenth-century Bavaria: the confessional booth, state control, and the Jesuit missions. The first of these, the confessional booth, helped to secure the priesthood from scandal, even as it also set penance physically apart within churches and increased the rite's prominence. Eventually, the confessional booth would create the modern experience of confession, an experience which in the words of Dorothy Day occurs in "thick darkness."

Within the Bavarian state, however, other transformations served to heighten the prominence of penance. Bavaria's dukes were not only serious Catholics, given to public penitential exploits themselves; they labored to instill this discipline in their subjects too. Even before the conclusion of the Council of Trent, Myers shows, absence from confession was interpreted by church visitors as evidence of Protestant sympathies. The first post-Reformation visitations from the 1550's and 1560's carefully catalogued clerical and lay attitudes concerning confession. And in the half-century that followed, the state's newly formed Clerical Council at Munich labored to ensure the population's minimal compliance. Attendance at annual Easter duties thus emerged as an element of state policy.

While Myers carefully catalogues these uses of coercion, he also includes a thoughtful analysis of the positive role that penance played in early-modern devotional life. In Bavaria, as elsewhere, the "hard sell" of church and state officials proved inadequate to create Catholic identity and allegiance. The third prong of the Counter-Reformation offensive Myers sees as decisive: Jesuit efforts in support of frequent confession and communion. Perhaps the most satisfying part of Myers' study is Chapter 4, "The Precious Jewel," which explores Jesuit teachings concerning penance. It reconstructs the complexity of the Society's attitudes toward confession, demonstrating how Jesuit writers viewed penance, not just as good discipline and theology, but as an effective force for harnessing the mind. Frequent confession, they counseled, allowed the faithful to maintain a pious disposition while involved in worldly affairs. Here the texts that Myers examines, and from which he freely quotes, make for fascinating reading. They demonstrate the religious motives behind the Jesuits' support of frequent penance, even as they reveal that program to be fully consonant with much late-medieval theology concerning the sacrament. The ideology of the Jesuits con-

cerning penance advocated active lay participation. Instead of counseling passive reception of the sacrament, numerous manuals and devotional books advised their readers to take control over the act of penance, to track their sins and harness their minds, and not to wait content for priestly interrogation. An active conscience thus became a necessary prerequisite for full participation in the sacrament. Similarly, rigor was not merely to be imposed from the clergy downward, since these writers expended enormous energy to ensure that the clergy made complete and satisfactory confessions themselves.

In his Epilogue, "Careful not Fearful," Myers returns to consider the qualitative question, "What kind of piety did Counter-Reformation penance create?" In contrast to the tortured world that Jean Delumeau's many works evoke, Myers is more prudent. The combined efforts of the state, Church, and the Jesuits helped to create a new kind of religious experience. Confession's practice, once tied to the rhythms of the ecclesiastical year; was now more frequent. For most Catholics, penance was a monthly or even weekly exercise. "The disciplines of Lent—prayer, fasting, and meditation on death—stretched throughout the year, their austerity pervading all of Catholic piety" (p. 193). Myers thus finds himself in agreement with Andrew Barnes, who has argued that the Counter-Reformation helped to "iron out" the liturgical year. It dispersed, in other words, the disciplines of Lent into regular Catholic practice. The result was a new Catholic lay person, one who may have been more effectively subjected to a clerical and state hierarchy, but who was also expected to exercise greater self-restraint and discipline.

Philip M. Soergel

Arizona State University

The Reckoned Expense: Edmund Campion and the Early English Jesuits. Essays in Celebration of the First Century of Campion Hall, Oxford (1896-1996). Edited by Thomas McCoog, SJ. (Rochester, New York: The Boydell Press. 1996. Pp. xxvi, 337. $71.00.)

Handsomely produced with a good index and bibliography, this book contains fifteen essays by well-known writers including the editor. The notes indicate the latest as well as older standard works. Part I deals with the "context" in which, after a brief life of Campion, David Loades studies the spirituality of the "restored Catholic Church" from 1553 to 1558, underlining the tensions between the Marian restoration and new currents from abroad. The tension theme is taken up in Thomas F. Mayer's "A Test of Wills: Cardinal Pole, Ignatius Loyola and the Jesuits in England." Pole shunned Jesuit help for England, his own sympathies lying with Paul FV and his Theatines (p. 31). J. M. McConica pursues the tension theme at Oxford University, where the Chancellor, Robert Dudley, forced the issue against the papists to the limit.

CoIm Lennon begins Part II, "Campion and His Contemporaries," with an essay on Campion's Histories of Ireland. Tension existed in individuals as well as systems. Campion strongly supported the viceroy, Sir Henry Sidney, including his defeat of Shane O'Neill, paramount chief of Ulster. He believed in Anglicization and education, although an Irish university had to wait (p. 78). Katherine Duncan-Jones pursues Campion's influence on Sir Philip Sidney, Sir Henry's son, especially during his stay in Prague. Alison Shell considers Campion as a dramatist. Thomas McCoog's essay on "The Role of Disputation in the Jesuit Mission" makes it clear why Jesuits were so much hated by adversaries. They trained students in the seminaries to argue with needle sharpness (p. 122).

Unsatisfactory, alas, is John Bossy's assessment of "The Heart of Robert Persons." After a sneer at Campion's "angelism" and his way of "turning a mission into a melodrama" (p. 141), Bossy gets down to Persons. He claims a "discovery that, during his major period of political activity, Persons advocated, or . . . did rather more than condone the assassination of Queen Elizabeth as a preliminary to the enterprise of England." For evidence Bossy offers an obscure Latin passage from a reply of General Claudio Aquaviva of June 5, 1583, to a letter from Persons no longer extant (pp. 148-149, and n. 26). Bossy admits one cannot define exactly something hinted at obscurely in the Latin but presumably connected with the invasion of England. He takes a cardinal unnamed to be the Cardinal of Como, who accepted, like Gregory XIII, the idea of assassination. "If Gallio was the cardinal in question, we can surmise what Persons' dubious proposal was" (p. 149)—Elizabeth's murder. He follows this up, "I am sorry to say I think there can be no reasonable doubt that . . . what Persons was putting to Aquaviva, and Aquaviva stiffly turn[ed] down was [George] Gifford's offer to assassinate Elizabeth" (p. 150). There were several possibilities, but Bossy unashamedly refers later to "the discovery that during the major period of political activity, Persons advocated or, shall we say, did rather more than condone the assassination of Queen Elizabeth" (p. 155). He sees Persons possessed by the spirit of revenge. By the end, a possibility has become "the distasteful fact" (p. 158). Bossy admits, "These may be untoward suggestions; but suggestions seem to be needed" (p. 157). Untoward suggestions are never needed. The assassination issue was controverted on all sides. Persons spoke authentically for himself in A Temperate Ward-word to . . . Sir Francis Hastinges . . . ; "He was never consenting, witting, inducing, yielding, nor privy to any such personal attempt against her Majesty in his life." He knew also that "English Catholics themselves desired not to be delivered from their miseries by any such attempt" (Scolar reprint, 1970, pp. 66-72). Victor Houliston reveals the more authentic heart of Persons in "Edmund Bunny's Theft of The Book of Resolution." Petsons resented not so much the theft as the emasculation of the text by the removal of all Catholic connotations (p. 161).

Dennis Flynn's "Six Supplementary Notes on Jasper Heywood" portray a man who was more than a singer outside the choir conducted by Persons and com-

pany. Heywood was twelve years Persons's senior, an aristocrat, flamboyant but effective, who for a time seemed to improve on Persons' cautious adaptation to a persecution environment (p. 184). His arrest and torture in the summer of 1584, alas, gave Persons the right of it (p. 188). Unfortunately, Heywood resented Persons' influence so much that he was prepared to accuse him without evidence of complicity in George Gifford's alleged scheme to assassinate Elizabeth (p. 191)- Nancy Pollard Brown enlarges on Robert Southwell and "The Mission of the Written Word."The main drive of the mission was spiritual and not political. Southwell's only polemical work was "An Humble Supplication to her Majesty" of 1591 (p. 198). Francisco de Borja Medina switches back to politics in the "Intrigues of a Scottish Jesuit at the Spanish Court" with eight previously unpublished letters of William Crichton, colleague and sometime critic of Robert Persons, to Aquaviva between 1590 and 1592. New ground is broken.

Part ?? assesses "Campion's Legacy." John LaRocca's "The Effect of the Jesuit Mission on Penal Legislation" describes the reaction of a determined government to this new challenge. Catholicism might not after all atrophy and die after severance from its continental sources. Interesting facts come to light such as the legal position of Justices of Peace who could avoid taking the oath of allegiance (pp. 251, 255). LaRocca is undoubtedly correct in asserting the propaganda value of the "papal invasion" of Ireland in 1580. But it was farce. In 1578 Gregory XIII commissioned Thomas Stucley—incidentally not an Irishman—"to raise an army and invade Ireland" (p. 259)-Typically he stopped in Lisbon and joined a Portuguese crusade to Africa where nemesis met him in 1579- He was probably one more agent of the English government: so he was hardly working for the Pope (See Francis Edwards, The Marvellous Chance, chap. 5: "Stucley confuses"). Michael Questier's "Like Locusts over All the World" handles "indoctrination and the Society of Jesus in late Elizabethan and Jacobean England." Jesuits were bogeymen not only for Protestants but also for many Catholics especially after the repeated failure of the empresa. This was certainly supported by continental Jesuits. They were more forward than the secular clergy in proselytizing (p. 270) through good use of the spiritual exercises and Persons's "Book of Resolution." Books of controversies were necessary, but Questier sees in them "a spirit of contradiction and contention" (p. 280). But when books had to be reduced to very economical dimensions, there was no space for the verbal cushioning which might have made for better literature. The Jesuits fished for men as anglers, not as trawlers. So it may well be true that "revisionism" makes too much of Jesuits as setting out to reconvert the whole country (p. 283). Michael Williams' "Campion and the Continental Seminaries" summarizes the writer's wide researches and important publications.The Irish expedition of 1580 sticks up, yet again, like a nail in a shoe, which cannot cripple but causes discomfort (p. 285). Allen probably knew nothing of it. It was all set in motion before there was serious intent of sending Campion to England. In the days before rapid communications a process could be initiated which no one could stop because no one knew if it was still active or what stage it had reached. Whatever the attempts at invasion implied, Allen defended the semi-

naries against the charge of treason and disloyalty to Elizabeth. No missionary to England set out to undo queen or government (p. 292).

Francis Edwards, SJ.

London

Erudition et religion aux XVIF et XVHF siècles. By Bruno Neveu. (Paris: Albin Michel. 1994. Pp. xvi, 516. FF. 180,00.)

Already in 1935, Paul Hazard in his authoritative La Crise de la conscience européenne coined the term "Pre-enlightenment" to characterize Gallican scholarship at the turn of the seventeenth century, impressive both in quantity and quality, and influential in the many questions it raised. It is sad to admit that fifty years later very few studies have been devoted to the many aspects of this scholarship; we know more about the Maurists' finances or eating habits than their patristic publication. In his masterly preface to this collection of articles, Marc Fumaroli appropriately stresses how Bruno Neveu, one of the few to pursue Hazard's intuition, has contributed a first-class analysis of this intellectual movement. Eight of these eleven studies deal directly with this question; the last three were preparatory to the great study L'Erreur et son juge (reviewed ante, LXXXII [January, 1996], 114-116) concerning the magisterium of the Church during the Jansenist crisis.

Of these articles, the most valuable and certainly the most impressive is the first one, "La Vie erudite à Paris à la fin du XVIIe siècle," based upon the documents collected by Father Léonard de Sainte-Catherine de Sienne. This Augustinian friar was the librarian of his community and spent his life collecting and filing every possible bit of information he could find. Professor Neveu, who has learned to decipher the very difficult handwriting of the religious, has used his notes to present a general survey of French intellectual life. In sixty-seven pages we have here the only existing exposition of this extraordinary interest manifested by the French in a reconstruction of the past, an abstract and idealized past conceived as absolute and normative for the present. The other studies examine some of the major issues related to this scholarship, its various aspects (S. Le Nain de Tillemont et l'érudition ecclésiastique de son temps, Mabillon et l'érudition gallicane, Mabillon et l'historiographie gallicane), its influence (Muratori et l'historiographie gallicane), the questions it raised (Érudition ecclésiastique et la nostalgie de l'Antiquité chrétienne, Archéolatrie et modernité dans le savoir ecclésiastique au XVIIe siècle), as well as its ideological content (Port-Royal à l'âge des Lumières, Le statut théologique de St. Augustin au XVIIe siècle). Neveu shows clearly how despite some reforming aspirations, in Rome itself (Culture religieuse et aspirations réformistes à la cour d'Innocent XI), the Papacy was able to resist such perspectives and even oppose them on the issue of Jansenism (Augustinisme janséniste et magistère romain). In their ambition to establish irrevocable truth through a purely scientific and independent

process, Gallican scholars and their allies were countering the Papacy's perception of its role and its claim to infallibility; a confrontation was inevitable (Juge suprême et docteur infaillible: le pontificat romain de la bulle In eminenti à la bulle Auctorem fidei).

Each one of these well-written essays not only offers precious information but also thoughtful analysis and stimulating observations. In order presumably not to frighten the reader, the original footnotes have been changed to endnotes, but they are complete and offer many precious references. There is also a very useful index. Happily this republication marks a renewed interest in the field as a new generation of scholars has been following Neveu's lead in this demanding but important path. We may hope to see in the future more works that will contribute to a better knowledge of Gallican scholarship and an assessment of its influence upon the European Republic of Letters.

Jacques M. Gres-Gayer

The Catholic University of America

Galileo and the Church: Political Inquisition or Critical Dialogue? By Rivka Feldhay. (New York: Cambridge University Press. 1995. Pp. viii, 303. $54.95.)

In 1983 Pietro Redondi published his controversial account of Galileo's condemnation, an account considered by one reviewer to be "un véritable désastre, une sorte de Tchernobyl de l'érudition." Rivka Feldhay mentions Redondi's work in passing, as if to demonstrate that it does not deserve serious consideration, but her account of the condemnation is likely to be just as controversial. Feldhay condemns all previous work on Galileo's condemnation for constructing a "binary opposition" or conflict between faith and reason, between authoritative obscurantism and scientific enlightenment, between ignorance and knowledge. Instead of conflict Feldhay adopts what she calls "the framework of a dialogic model." The Jesuits were major protagonists for both Redondi and Feldhay. In a review for Parergon (VHI [1990], 167-168) I criticized Redondi's portrayal of the Jesuits for its hackneyed stereotyping. Feldhay's Jesuits, on the other hand, are not the obscurantist opponents of new knowledge but the proponents of dialogue with Galileo; hence her "dialogic model."

Feldhay begins with a close examination of Galileo's two trials in 1616 and 1633. According to the simplistic version enshrined in traditional myth, the Church condemned Galileo for his Copernican views. However, the Church's position was more complicated than that; it permitted the use of the Copernican theory as "an astronomical hypothesis" but forbade the consideration of it as an absolute truth. A reading of the documents associated with the trial of 1616 reveals that the Jesuits, and Cardinal Robert Bellarmine in particular, and the Dominicans differed on what was meant by "an astronomical hypothesis." These differences derived from the two religious orders' position on Thomism, the Dominicans supporting a pure Thomism while Jesuit educators sought to

modify it. The dispute reached its denouement in the trial of 1633, when the Jesuits found themselves caught between Dominican claims that their position was unorthodox and Galileo's Dialogue Concerning the Two Chief World Systems, which demonstrated an affinity with the ideas of Jesuit educators and mathematicians.

Redondi tried to establish an "evidential paradigm" to support his account by searching for "clues and signs" in the milieu of seventeenth-century Rome. Feldhay seeks support for her account by returning to the sixteenth century, to the Council of Trent and its decrees on education, to the traditional role of Dominicans as an educating elite, to the development of the Jesuits as an alternative educating elite, and to the resulting rivalry between the two religious orders that culminated in the dispute on free will and predestination. This is the longest part of the book, and it attempts to explain the denouement of 1633. The final part of the book focuses on the dialogue between Galileo and Jesuit mathematicians, focusing on the debate on sunspots with Christopher Scheiner.

Feldhay's approach is anachronistic. She interprets sixteenth-century developments and documents on the basis of later developments and documents, incorrectly reading interpretations into the earlier material that support her views on the Church's condemnation of Galileo. For example, instead of considering the vigorous debate within the Society on the shape of its educational program as a natural outcome of the Jesuit development as educators, she considers it as a manifestation of a cultural crisis, an intellectual crisis, a moral crisis, and a crisis over authority within the Society. Similarly, to prove her points about Jesuit theater in the early seventeenth century she uses material from the late seventeenth century. Ultimately, Feldhay's Jesuits are only slightly less hackneyed than those of Redondi. According to Feldhay, Jesuits were militant subversives who did not hesitate to undermine the traditional authority in the Church; the Society "used all possible means not only to capture power bases to build up its position, but also to gain recognition and legitimation for that position" (p. 195). Feldhay's account of Galileo's condemnation is far from being a "Tchernobyl de l'érudition," but neither is it an unqualified success.

A. Lynn Martin

The University of Adelaide

The Conduct of the Christian Schools. By John Baptist de La Salle. Translated by F. de La Fontainerie and Richard Arnandez. Edited with notes by William Mann. [Lasallian Sources, Volume 6.] (Landover, Maryland: Lasallian Publications. 1996. Pp. 287.)

This is a richly detailed handbook for the day-by-day and rninute-by-rninute running of an elementary school in the neglected parts of Reims, Rouen, Paris, and a growing succession of other cities in the early eighteenth century. From the beginnings of the Christian Brothers' order in the 1680's, De LaSalle and the

first teachers began to accumulate operational tactics in manuscript form. On parallel tracks, rules of the order and spiritual reading treatises were also being produced. But this manual stays with the operational, and it leaves nothing to chance.

To contemporary teachers accustomed to almost-presiding over chaos, the Conduct can seem oppressive. But the evidence is that it worked, and in an environment of almost unimaginable deprivation.

Long known in English as Management of Christian Schools, the Conduct has been brought out in a scholarly edition of the 1720 first printing from the 1706 manuscript. For many years, loyal Christian Brothers treated this and other works as if they had sprung from the brain of St. John Baptist de LaSalle, our founder, in publishable form. A surge of modern research has revealed a far more human and appealing process of collaboration between De LaSalle and the first Brothers, on all the central documents of their then-new-model congregation: rules, readers for students, and the historically most significant Conduct. (Certain other writings for the Brothers, notably meditations, are more clearly De LaSalle's own.)

What is not attempted here is a survey of the work's permutations as it has followed the Brothers into higher levels of education and other cultures. The monumental French-language series, Cahiers LaSalliens, will certainly get around to doing so. But this lack, if it is one, in the current volume allows the enduring pedagogical good sense of the 1720 edition to show luminously through the details which would otherwise risk seeming quaint. Again, this manual worked in school as nothing previously had. And its principles still do.

I think it is important to realize that students love to be in classes that are run this way. They feel obliged to test the system as a duty of their state in life and, in half the cases, of their gender. But they don't want to win, because then the bullies take over and nothing is accomplished. If there is one dominant thread in the Conduct, it is that everything is purposeful. Thinking of the rest of the children's lives, then and now, one is in awe at this insight. Rarely, a student in such a system will come out and say all this; but the nearly 100 percent attendance really conveys the message.

All this is work for the teachers. It is much easier in the short run to go in and talk than to prepare probing lines of questions, interesting quizzes, sharing of students' writing, links to other subjects for them to discover, applications from the news of the day for them to come upon. Indeed, the teacher must work to know the students well enough to make these methods fit the group.

Twentieth-century educators are often upset by the emphasis on silence in the Conduct, including that of the teacher. Most routine procedures are by hand signals or "the signal" (illustrated on page 124), a clicking device of great simplicity. Young people love to gain mastery of all the resultant codes, and to imitate them of course. When one teaches, say, five high school classes back to back, headed for the last lunch, he or she can't physically talk the whole time.

And even if it were possible, it's not good teaching. The students need to grow through all those public appearances: reading, discussing, responding, writing at the board, even fulfilling classroom chores—so long as each has his moment and none is preferred. Again, work ahead of time for the teacher, overwhelming the first few times around but almost second nature after a while.

A selective, hostile reading could see such a school as a religious tyranny. But a closer look, buttressed by experience, reveals a productive structure in otherwise chaotic lives. All that gravity and all that silence need to be seen in a humming context of respect for the person of each student as a child of God. The early Brothers could not imagine any other way of looking at it, and teachers are still trying to bring such an environment into lives that are complicated by distractions undreamed of in 1720, but no less damaging to the fundamental purpose of life.

The faith foundation of the Conduct doesn't go without saying, nor is it present in every line, because this is a manual. In the Brother's life, it was a companion to other resources of a more explicitly religious kind, as noted earlier. They didn't make any distinction between the religious life ("chapel") and the apostolate ("class"). Again, an insight at the outset which has withstood many assaults in the three centuries of the enterprise.

Brother Patrick Elus, F.S.C.

The Catholic University of America

Ireland in the Stuart Papers. Correspondence and Documents of Irish Interest from the Stuart Papers in the Royal Archives, Windsor Castle. Volume I: 1719-1742, and Volume II: 1743-1765. Edited by Patrick Fagan. (Dublin: Four Courts Press. 1995. Pp. vii, 341;v, 303.)

Ireland in the Stuart Papers consists of Patrick Fagan's edition of the Irish items of the 80,000-item collection of the correspondence of the court-in-exile of James Frances Edward Stuart, which the British government acquired after the death of the last of the Stuarts, the Cardinal of York, in 1807. The whole collection is now available on microfilm in the British Library Document Center. In his introduction Dr. Fagan notes that as a source of Irish history the Stuart Papers "have been largely neglected by historians" (I, 5), with the exception of those specializing in Catholic Church history. A superficial examination of the correspondence may seem to justify its limited use since much of it deals with the nomination and appointment of the Irish Catholic hierarchy, an area in which James Stuart had major responsibility. However, a closer reading of the correspondence provides valuable insights into several areas of early modern Irish history which have been neglected by historians. One finds, for example, specific information about the Catholic middle class and gentry who remained active during the Age of the Penal Laws. The correspondence reveals the intense rivalry between the regular and the diocesan clergy and the degree to

which the latter protested the number of Dominicans and Franciscans appointed to the hierarchy. We get a firsthand knowledge of the Irish Colleges on the continent, especially as they debate the issue of whether to accept ordained Irish priests or to restrict membership to young men in the early stages of preparation for the priesthood.

The papers reveal, as Fagan puts it, "a hierarchy, in a predominant degree, intensely loyal to James and virulently opposed to any accommodation with the Hanoverian Succession and ready to nip in the bud any movement in that direction" (J, 3). The papers also reveal a Catholic hierarchy who greatly exaggerate the prospects for a Jacobite restoration. A number of the letters from Ireland throw light on the workings of the Protestant-dominated Irish Parliament, especially when that body was considering anti-Catholic legislation. One of the many letters of Sylvester Lloyd, Bishop of Killaloe, contains a sophisticated analysis of the fall, 1729, session of the Irish Parliament. Referring to that body as "our Parliament" and "that great assembly," he intelligently discusses the Lord Lieutenant's revenue requests.

The correspondence reveals that many of the Irish hierarchy found it impossible to survive financially on the revenues of their diocese. Thus those aspirants who had independent incomes from their families or expectations of pensions provided by continental Catholic sources were in a stronger position to assert their claims. Moreover, as Patrick Fagan notes, in many cases the correspondent's "quest for a mitre was pursued with a single-mindedness and a lack of Christian charity more in keeping with a secular rat-race" (J, 3).

It is disappointing, but perhaps not surprising, that the correspondence reveals little of the largely Irish-speaking Catholic masses whom these reigning or aspiring Irish bishops would presumably be serving. If we are to believe a 1739 letter of Kerry-born Abbé Robert Fitzmaurice to his brother Henry Fitzmaurice, the Irish bishops often knew little of their flocks' needs. Fitzmaurice specifically questions the qualifications of the person whom the Archbishop of Cashel, Christopher Butler, was supporting as Bishop of Kerry. He scathingly adds that Butler himself "had never done the mission when he was made archbishop" (I, 283). Moreover, the same was true for six other members of the Irish hierarchy whom "nevertheless his majesty nominated . . . without scruple." Finally, Fitzmaurice laments that the archbishop still does not know a word of Irish. One of the other rare references to the Catholic masses comes in a 1745 report of a Reverend Myles MacDonnell to James which argued that the misfortunes of his fellow Catholics were caused in part by their being "inundated by a crowd of priests and religious having neither inherited wealth, nor benefice nor other ecclesiastical revenues, who consume and drain them to the entrails. . . ." Half their number, McDonnell asserts, "would be more than sufficient to provide the needs of the ministry" (II, 32). Such a view is certainly at odds with the conventional view of Ireland in the Age of the Penal Laws!

Ireland in the Stuart Papers contains much valuable primary source material which historians will find useful as they focus more attention on eighteenth-

century Ireland. We are fortunate in having Patrick Fagan's edition. His footnotes provide valuable biographical information on the correspondents as well as cross references to related documents in the collection. Moreover, he includes a very comprehensive index at the end of Volume II.

Thomas F. Moriarty

Elms College
Chicopee, Massachusetts

The Diocese of Killaloe. Volume I: In the Eighteenth Century; Volume II: 1800-1850; Volume III: 1850-1904. By Ignatius Murphy. (Dublin: Four Courts Press. 1991, 1992, 1995. Pp. 373, 488, 527.)

These three volumes by Ignatius Murphy on the history of the Diocese of Killaloe in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries are not only a very significant contribution to knowledge, but they will long remain a rich resource for all who will venture to research and write about the modern Irish Church. The Diocese of Killaloe (pronounced like Waterloo) extends in a broad band across the middle of Ireland from the Atlantic coast eastwards to include virtually all of County Clare, the northern third of Tipperary and a large part of King's County. In the eighteenth century, Killaloe was one of the twenty-six dioceses that constituted the Irish Church, and while it was one of the largest in terms of area and population, it was among the poorest in regard to wealth and resources. The diocese was mainly rural, containing a considerable amount of mountain and bog and only a half-dozen towns of any importance. If Killaloe was representative of anything, therefore, in the Irish Church in the eighteenth century, it was its poverty. This continued to be the case for the greater part of the nineteenth century, and especially in the western reaches of the dioceses. These three volumes, then, are a true witness not only to the courage but to the endurance of the Catholics of Killaloe between 1700 and 1900.

The recent and untimely death of the author of these volumes at the age of fifty-five in 1993 was both a sad and a serious loss for Irish historical scholarship. When Monsignor Murphy initially conceived his history of the Diocese of Killaloe, he structured it in terms of two volumes—one on the eighteenth century and the other on the nineteenth century, and he published his first volume in late 1991. The enormous amount of material available for the volume on the nineteenth century, however, had resulted in a manuscript of twenty-five chapters, compared to the ten that had comprised his very substantial first volume. Monsignor Murphy then decided to divide his manuscript into two volumes, breaking his narrative at 1850, and in late 1992 he published his second volume, 1800-1850, which consisted of the first eleven of these twenty-five chapters. By that time, however, he had learned that he was seriously ill, and set to work to prepare his third volume, 1850-1904, for publication. He proposed to revise the remaining fourteen chapters, and then write a concluding chapter

that would serve to sum the significance of his work on the nineteenth century. He was only able, unfortunately, to revise the first two chapters before his death, and never wrote the concluding chapter. The diocesan publication committee, which had been formed to see the third volume through the press, wisely decided, in consultation with Monsignor Murphy before his death, to publish the fourteen chapters as they then stood, and the third volume was finally published in 1995.

The first of these volumes, on the eighteenth century, is undoubtedly Monsignor Murphy's masterpiece. It is in terms of its conceptual framework and the great learning that informs it, a model of what an artful and thoughtful historical presentation ought to be. After a graceful prologue, which sets the scene, Monsignor Murphy opens his eighteenth century in 1697 with the passing of the first of the penal laws affecting the Church in the banishing of all those secular clergy, bishops, deans, and vicars general, exercising ecclesiastical jurisdiction in Ireland and all the regular clergy without exception, and closes it in 1815 with the end of the Napoleonic wars. During that extended eighteenth century, the Irish Church, and its microcosm in the Diocese of Killaloe, emerged from the darkness of a severe persecution into the light of a limited toleration. The pilgrimage was not only a long and painful one, requiring considerable patience and endurance, but it was also a very rewarding one because the journey was in itself an incremental and extended promise of ultimate freedom. The ten chapters that account for this journey are also nicely structured in terms of a thematic rolling chronology, which includes the political, biographical, ecclesiastical, pastoral, and artifactual, and which allows for a multidimensional historical presentation that cumulatively results in a very satisfying social history of the Diocese of Killaloe. These ten chapters are, moreover, supported by fourteen valuable appendices and forty apposite illustrations, all of which greatly expand and enrich the text.

The second volume, 1800-1850, which in its structure is modeled on the first, actually begins in 1815 rather than 1800, and ends in 1850 in the aftermath of the Great Famine. The wealth of material available, however, not only results in a much longer book, but the thirty-five-year period is treated in very great detail. If the chief virtue of the first volume, therefore, was to be found in the wholeness of its conception as a presentation, that of the second is certainly rooted in the richness of its texture, the fabric of which is further enhanced by sixty-eight handsome illustrations, and six very pertinent appendices. Virtually every aspect of the social and religious life of the people and clergy of Killaloe, including their new-found popular politics, is examined and discussed. If the mood and tone of the people and clergy in the first volume, moreover, was one of resignation and quiet endurance, that in the second is one of assertiveness and gênerai turbulence. Indeed, the most remarkable thing about the people and clergy of Killaloe in pre-Famine Ireland, and perhaps by extrapolation, the Irish people as well, was their enormous zest for life, whether expressed in its positive or negative aspects. From their temperance processions, monster meetings, and chapel building to their drinking, faction fighting, and clerical schisms,

they displayed a prodigious vitality and energy. The Great Famine dealt a mortal blow to this way of life by sweeping away the largest part of the bottom of the social pyramid. "Every day," the Limerick and Clare Examiner explained on January 5, 1850, more than three years after the awful catastrophe, "brings a fresh bundle to the faggot heap by which the funeral pyre of the old Celtic race is burned to cinders. Landlords crippled—farmers crushed—shopkeepers ruined—and the poor rotting in heaps—aye, in heaps, among the bogs and ditch-pits of the country" (III, 13). And Monsignor Murphy's account of this severe trial is as poignant as it is touching.

In his third volume, Monsignor Murphy tells the story of how the Phoenix rose from the ashes. The narrative opens with the convening of the national Synod of Thurles in 1850, at which a canonical Tridentine frame was finally established for the Irish Church, and closes with the end of the episcopate of Thomas McRedmond in 1904. In that half-century there was an extraordinary change in the religious life of the people and clergy of Killaloe. Monsignor Murphy's views on the timing and duration of that change, therefore, are of more than ordinary concern to those interested in the "Devotional Revolution" in Ireland in the nineteenth century. As he explains in the conclusion to his first chapter on "The Synod of Thurles":

> The middle of the 19th century was a period of great change for the Catholic Church in Ireland. Before the Great Famine it retained many of the characteristics of the penal period, although the new churches being built in the 1830s and 1840s together with some devotional innovations were indicative of change. By I860 the Church had taken on a new shape more closely, though never fully, in line with the general canon law. In essence it was the format which was to survive in Killaloe diocese and throughout Ireland until after the Second Vatican Council in the 1960s. Overall, there was far less change in parish structures, layout of churches, ceremonial and devotions in the century from 1865 than in the fifteen years after the Synod of Thurles (III, 32-33).

The great pity, of course, is that we do not have Monsignor Murphy's considered views on the quality of that great change, as distinguished from its timing, in the conclusion he planned for this volume. If the thrust of the evidence assembled in his unrevised chapters, however, is any indication, given the impressive increase in the number of priests, nuns, brothers, new churches, schools, missions, retreats, confraternities, and devotional practices, he might have had to extend his turning point of 1865 down to 1875 or 1880. In any case, the enormous amount of new and stimulating information provided in this volume and its six appendices, graced by another handsome twenty-one illustrations, will, like its two companion volumes, long remain a worthy memorial to a very worthy priest and historian.

Emmet Larkin

The University of Chicago

The History of the Congregation of the Most Holy Redeemer. Volume I: The Origins (1 732-1 793)- Edited by Francesco Chiovaro, C.Ss.R. English Translation Edited by J. Robert Fenelli, C.Ss.R. [Studia et Monumenta Congregationis SS. Redemptoris, First Series: History of the Congregation, Volume One.] (Liguori, Missouri: Liguori Publications. 1996. Pp. xv, 576. $19-95 paperback.)

This first volume in the history of the Congregation of the Most Holy Redeemer (Redemptorists) invites the reader to enter into a religious drama set against the backdrop of eighteenth-century Southern Italy. The back cover design sets the tone of the volume: "A king who did not want a new religious order! A pope at odds with the king! Powerful families out to confiscate property! A saint forced to die shut out of the very congregation he founded!" Dramatic as this may sound to the twentieth-century historian, these are the facts, and one who wishes to understand the history of this congregation and its earliest members must suspend judgment of the events and their principal actors in order to discover heroic efforts and the men and women who fostered them and who along the way became saints.

Volume I is divided into two sections. The first section presents the historical context for the foundation and its early history. Comprised of five chapters written by two authors (Giuseppe Orlandi and Theodule Rey-Mermet), the strongest portions of the work depict the life and times of Alphonsus Liguori. The reader is invited to share the vision of the founder and experience the day-to-day struggle of the age. Particularly striking is the detail given to political, religious, and familial structures which provide the impetus for the events of this early phase of development. One cannot help but be struck by Liguori's tortured relationship with his spiritual director (father) Bishop Falcoia. This first section ends with an insightful discussion of both the internal and external political machinations which divided the congregation and its subsequent reunification.

The second section provides a descriptive narrative of the apostolic activities, Rule and Constitutions, and Formation of the members of the Congregation. The thematic style of chapters written by several authors (Giuseppe Orlandi, Fabricano Ferrerò, and Sabatino Majorano) is maintained. However, this section appeals to Redemptorists themselves. It reads much more as an internal document meant for the members of the Congregation. Although accurate in its presentation through the use of historical texts, the section lacks the depth of the first section. Whereas the reader is given the sense of participating in the full panoply of the events of the eighteenth century leading to the founding of the Congregation in section one, in section two the reader is relegated to the sidelines and becomes an observer. By the conclusion of the text, the reader is convinced of the value of the enterprise. Founded by Alphonsus Liguori as a missionary society devoted to preaching and evangelizing the poor, the Congregation of the Most Holy Redeemer succeeded not because of the secular val-

ues of the eighteenth century, but because of the Gospel values which permeated the Congregation's mission, Constitution, and very way of life.

Given the scope of this first volume, the authors are successful for the most part in their attempt to make the history of this religious community come alive. This is not to say that it is a complete success. The text is at its best when incorporating original materials into its narrative. The letters of St. Alphonsus and his first companions infuse the history with meaning and life. It is least successful when recounting details of daily orders, attire, and aspects of formation. These details leave the reader wondering how they are to affect his or her life. For future volumes to be of interest, this chasm must be bridged. What is clear is the purpose of this volume: to bring the passion of the Redemptorist community to the public. And what is this passion? It is best summed up in the final phrase of the text taken from the Redemptorist constitution: "Saintly and learned for the sake of apostolic ministry"

Joseph R. Gibino

Seminary of the Immaculate Conception
Huntington, New York

Notables and Clergy in Mount Lebanon: The Khäzin Sheiks and the Maronite Church (1736-1840). By Richard van Leeuwen. [The Ottoman Empire and Its Heritage, Volume 2.] (Leiden: E. J. BrUl. 1994. Pp. xi, 290. $89-50.)

The Maronite Church has many distinctions that make it unique within the family of Christian communities. It is the only church that had a monastic origin; it lived for centuries as a self-contained Christian island in a Muslim sea on the slopes of Mount Lebanon; and it is the only Eastern church that came into communion with Rome in the Middle Ages.

Richard van Leeuwen, a Dutch scholar, picks up the story of the Maronites in the eighteenth century, carrying it forward for a century. His interest is in placing the church in its political and economic roles as a small, but important, player in one of the Arab eyalets of the Ottoman Empire. The reader should not look here for information on the sacramental or devotional aspects of Maronite life, for unless it touches the public life of the community, it does not find a place in this volume.

The story is told in terms that an economic historian will find on the mark. When it begins Mt. Lebanon's traditional authorities, the sheikhs of the Khäzin clan, are in uncontested control. They are the church's protectors and patrons and have a major voice in appointments to clerical and monastic offices. Even the patriarchs defer to their judgment, especially after the Khäzin emirs begin to hold the title "consuls of France."

Then matters change. Mt. Lebanon is increasingly drawn into a capitalist economic system that produces silk for export. Silver flows into the hands of merchants and moneylenders, creating a Maronite middle class. NaturaUy the Khäzins sought ways to participate in the creation of this new wealth, but capitalism proved too diffused and the members of their own clan too dispersed for them to keep on top of affairs.

Enter the French missionaries and representatives of the Papacy, who have their own agenda for the Maronites. Rome wants the Maronites to get in line with the legislation of the CouncU of Trent. Its messengers to Mt. Lebanon bring two major demands: to set up bishoprics with the incumbents making their residence within their dioceses, and to break up the double monasteries that housed both men and women. One further development was the foundation of a Western-style religious order of monks.

The book traces the economic and political struggles between traditionalists and modernists until the Khäzins find themselves outdistanced. The combination of economic development, active Roman intervention, and the growing independence of patriarchs and bishops causes their hold on the Maronites to crumble.

The Khäzins did not go down quietly. Constant litigation over wakfs, properties that provided income, clashes with Ottoman governors, papal legates, patriarchs, bishops, monasteries, and the sheikhs of other clans fill the pages of the book.

Some wording is awkward, for example, "to perform the sacraments" and to call Pope Innocent III "Innocence." Speaking of Rome as the Maronite "mother church" is certainly strange, since it had nothing to do with that church's origins.

An excellent appendix contains maps, genealogical charts, a glossary of Arabic terms, and lists of patriarchs and bishops. A fuU bibliography will content the most avid student of this century of Maronite history.

Charles A. Frazee

California State University, Fullerton

## Late Modern European

Becoming a Revolutionary: The Deputies of the French National Assembly and the Emergence of a Revolutionary Culture (1 789-1 790). By Timothy Tackett. (Princeton, New Jersey: Princeton University Press. 1996. Pp. xvi, 355. $39.95.)

For two hundred years, historians have vigorously debated a basic enigma of the French Revolution: how a group of men without a preconceived goal, divided in their intentions as weU as their backgrounds, managed to come to-

gether in an undertaking that ultimately led to the overthrow of the Old Regime. In this meticulously documented and convincingly argued study, Timothy Tackett has made a major contribution to this historical debate. Focusing on the first year of the Revolution, Tackett has conducted extensive research on the revolutionary experiences of the specific individuals who participated in the Revolution, examining their contemporary diaries, letters, and memoirs, as weU as newspaper accounts and reports produced by the National Assembly. Information gleaned from these sources provides insight into the transformation in the deputies' values and modes of thinking which enabled them to adapt to the process of democracy and representative government.

The value of this approach is vividly apparent in Tackett's analysis of the transformation within the Third Estate which culminated in the crucial decision to proceed with a joint verification of credentials. (The significance of this pivotal moment in the Revolution's history has been mistakenly overshadowed by the more dramatic Tennis Court Oath and the storming of the Bastille.) Tackett cites four major factors contributing to this psychological transformation: the growing group consciousness and self-confidence of the deputies, the persuasive arguments of radical orators, the enthusiastic support of the crowds, and the Nobility's unwUingness to compromise.

Tackett provides particular insight into the mindset of the parish priests, depicting the internal conflict a number of them experienced initially between ardent sympathy for the viewpoints of the Third Estate deputies and long-engrained habits of deference to the higher clergy. This deference rapidly frayed for some as the revolutionary dynamic progressed, and the assemblies of the clergy became the most contentious and acrimonious of the three Estates. Tackett traces yet another psychological transformation among the clerical deputies as many became disillusioned in the wake of decrees on church property and the faUure of the Dom Gerle motion, which called for Catholicism to be declared the state religion.

In this study Tackett challenges a number of widely held theories concerning the revolutionary period. He refutes the idea that the monarch had become desacralized, demonstrating that the pamphlets and cahiers of the Third Estate were replete with strong sentiments of respect and devotion to the king. Even Robespierre joined in praising "the solemn and touching voice of our king who is offering us happiness and liberty" (p. 102). Tackett also shows that, contrary to the traditional view that the deputies were political neophytes innocent of the realities of exercising power, many had been involved in Old Regime politics before they arrived in VersaUes, serving in guilds, provincial and clerical assemblies, and systematically campaigning to become deputies to the Estates General. And whUe other historians see the left as having seized control early in the Revolution—by October, 1789—Tackett sees the evolution of this development as more complex. He demonstrates that the king and his supporters retained real measures of power and engaged in an ongoing competition with more radical elements into the spring of 1790.

Tackett is less convincing when he downplays the extent to which Enlightenment values had been integrated into the deputies' assumptions about their world. WhUe Tackett's analysis of the deputies' writings demonstrates that abstract theories were generaUy not of interest to most of them (although, as he points out, a number were disciples of Voltaire and Rousseau), he also shows that they had absorbed the overarching attitude of Enlightenment thought, which included a strong interest in the broadening of knowledge and awareness. It can be argued that this wülingness to move beyond the confines of narrow, parochial thinking made the deputies' participation in revolutionary change possible. In addition, the anticlericalism which was frequently a key component of Enlightenment writings was a significant factor in the subsequent radicalization of the Revolution.

A thesis of this study is that the ideological mixture which the deputies of 1789 represented could have yielded any number of revolutions or counterrevolutions. By his richly detailed charting of the transformations which occurred in the attitudes of these deputies, Tackett has provided valuable insight into how their reactions to the political contingencies and social interactions which they experienced ultimately turned them into revolutionaries.

Jo Ann Browning Seeley

Alexandria, Virginia

The Nineteenth-Century Church and English Society. By Frances Knight. (New York: Cambridge University Press. 1995. Pp. xiii, 230. $54.95.)

This is a study of the Church of England in a period of far-reaching transition. Its scope is significantly more limited that the title might imply: in chronological terms the coverage effectively ends in 1870, and the evidence is drawn predominantly from the author's doctoral dissertation on the largely rural diocese of Lincoln, in eastern England. Nevertheless, an extensive range of primary evidence is deployed: Lincoln at that period was an enormous diocese extending as far south as Buckinghamshire, and material is also drawn from the adjoining diocese of Ely and from the diaries of three clergymen, Francis Massingberd, John RashdaU, and W K. Hamilton, which include reference to other parts of the country. Knight also effectively surveys the secondary literature and integrates its conclusions with her own.

Knight begins with an examination of lay religion, paying particular attention to ambiguities of loyalty between Anglicanism and Methodism, discussing the role of the Bible and the Book of Common Prayer, and examining popular attitudes to salvation. She then turns to the role of the church in the community, tracing an increasing differentiation of spheres. Zealous clergy were liable to discountenance secular uses of the church building, to make unpopular changes in the routine of services, and to make increasingly exacting requirements for baptism, the churching of women, and confirmation. For the clergy

themselves, the benefits of church reform were also uncertain. WhUe non-residence and pluralism were gradually reduced, they could StUl face significant financial difficulties. Increasing residence by incumbents limited opportunities for curates. The general trend was for Anglicanism to become more of a denomination and less of a national church, better organized but more limited in its popular appeal. The change, however, was a relative one, and traditional loyalties only slackened slowly.

The argument is a stimulating one especiaUy insofar as it serves to question the importance of church party identifications in grass-roots Anglicanism, and to Uluminate the tensions between lay and clerical religiosity. An authoritative coverage of the ground suggested by the title would, however, have required more extensive engagement with material relating to other parts of the country, and above all, to urban and industrial areas. Readers of this journal will also be struck by the lack of any discussion of the relationship of the Church of England to Catholicism. Nevertheless, within its limitations, this is an important and suggestive book.

John Wolffe

The Open University, United Kingdom

Wunderbare Erscheinungen. Frauen und katholische Frömmigkeit im 19. und 20. Jahrhundert. Edited by Irmtraud Götz v. Olenhusen. (Munich: Ferdinand Schöningh. 1995. Pp. 252.)

The seven essays in this book deal with various forms of female religiosity during the nineteenth and twentieth centuries and with the reactions of church and state officials to the women involved. David Blackbourn's essay introduces German readers to "Marpingen," his weU-known 1993 study of Marian apparitions during the Bismarck era. Many readers will be surprised that so many pious German women experienced visions and stigmatisms, something we have grown accustomed to associating with Mediterranean Catholicism. But, as Blackbourn points out, there is another side to the "modern,""organized," church of Germany—the everyday, religious mentality of its people.

The essays of Wunderbare Erscheinungen unearth new discoveries and pose some interesting questions. It becomes apparent that during the nineteenth century visionaries and stigmatics found ready acceptance within the Church. They were visited by major personalities of the day: Josef Görres, Clemens Brentano, Cardinal von Reisach, to mention a few. But by the twentieth century they could expect the opposite. Third-Reich bishops like Michael Buchberger (Regensburg) and Wilhelm Berning (Osnabrück) discouraged public interest in persons like Thérèse Neumann.

Likewise, visionaries and stigmatics found that civU authorities' attitudes toward them varied from time to time and place to place: cold in Protestant Prus-

sia and equaUy cool in Catholic but liberal Freiburg. It was better to be a Bavarian visionary or, in the Hitler era, to be a stigmatic in a parish whose pastor was not berating the Nazis.

A number of the essays pose the question of the feminization of religion. Did Germany experience the same process as France during the nineteenth century? The authors would probably not agree on an answer except that some feminization did take place. The fact that over ninety percent of the stigmatics were women suggests this. Essayist Rudolf Schlögl offered additional convincing evidence of feminization in his essay, which reminded this reader of the work of Maurice Agulhon decades ago on Mediterranean religious culture.

Did feminization take the form predominantly of a cult of Mary? This seems unlikely, although a few essayists developed this line of thought. The prevalence of the stigmata itself signals us that many pious women did not concentrate on Mary Norbert Busch's essay on the Heart of Jesus cult, which developed in the last quarter of the nineteenth century, furnishes further evidence.

The Church's reaction to the Heart of Jesus cult—and therefore to the feminization of religion—is fascinatingly developed by Busch in "Die Feminisierung der Frömmigkeit." Depictions of the Savior in this cult point to a coquettish, "kissable" Jesus who would attract women emotionally, even eroticaUy (page 209). So strong was this movement that German clergy themselves underwent an adrogynous transformation during the second half of the nineteenth century: shaven face and soutane. Only when the church saw the danger in women's privatization of religion, did it react by taking charge of the Heart of Jesus cult.

Readers of Wunderbare Erscheinungen wUl come away from this book with plenty of food for thought and an excellent survey of the religious mentality of German Catholics.

Michael Phayer

Marquette University

La scienza del cuore. Spiritualità e cultura religiosa in Antonio Rosmini. By Fulvio De Giorgi. [Annali deU'Istituto storico italo-germanico, Monografia 25.] (Bologna: Società editrice U Mulino. 1995. Pp. 628. Lire 60,000 paperback.)

Although not as weU known in the EngUsh-speaking world as in Europe, and especiaUy Italy, the reputation of the priest, phüosopher, theologian, and statesman Antonio Rosmini-Serbati has long been established. Unfortunately, his vision of a universal order under the moral leadership of the pope and his attempt to fuse the Christian tradition with the contemporary world often provoked reprobation from the groups he sought to reconcüe. likewise known, though less contentious, is his foundation of the Institute of Charity (Rosmini-

ans) in 1828, which was formaUy approved by Pope Gregory XVI in 1839- However, his critique of the Church and call for reform in his Delle cinque piaghe della santa chiesa (Of the Five Wounds of the Holy Church) written in the 1830's but not published until 1846, was condemned by the Congregation of the Index in 1849, along with his La costituzione secondo la giustizia sociale (A Constitution based on Social Justice). Rosmini was vindicated only in 1854—a year before his death. Perhaps Rosmini is best known for the mission he undertook at the request of the Piedmontese government to Pius IX at Gaeta (1848-1849) to persuade him to preserve his prerevolutionary liberal institutions, which ended in failure to the detriment of the temporal power.

Rosmini's relations with Pius LX are examined in Gianfranco's Radice's volume Pio IX e Antonio Rosmini (Vatican City, 1974); his moral phUosophy explored in Enrico Verondini's La Filosofia morale di Antonio Rosmini (Bologna, 1967), his ethics and metaphysics in Michele Schiavone's L'etica del Rosmini e la sua fondazione metafisica (MUan, 1962); his apologetics and anthropological approach in Maria Manganelli's Persona e personalità nell'antropologia di Antonio Rosmini (Milan, 1967); his dialectical approach in Maria Raschini's // principio dialettico nella filosofia di A. Rosmini (MÜan, I96I) and his overall view of the Church Ln Giovanni Velocci's La Chiesa in Rosmini (Rome, 1974). Of these only the last is cited in the extensive bibliography of the De Giorgi book (pp. 567-61 1), which includes most of the more recent publications but ignores many of the older, estabUshed works. The author, who teaches cultural and reUgious history as well as the history of historiography at the CathoUc University of Brescia, has made extensive use of the printed works of Rosmini—some sixty volumes—as weU as archival and diocesan sources.

The present volume, which utUizes a thematic rather than a chronological approach, focuses on the evolution of Rosmini's spirituality, stressing the special role therein of his devotion to the Sacred Heart. Although Rosmini is generally not associated with evolution of this devotion, the author contends that it was central to the cultural evolution and development of Rosmini's thought (p. 21). The title of the volume, La scienza del cuore, indicates as much. In tracing the roots of Rosmini's spirituality, De Giorgi explains that this theologian and phüosopher linked a dualistic ascetic struggle between body and soul with a tripartite spiritual anthropology of mind, heart, and spirit guided respectively by phUosophy friendship, and religion (p. 71). De Giorgi makes a convincing case, shedding considerable Ught on the religious inspiration of this extraordinary man and encyclopedic writer.

Frank J. Coppa

St. John's University, New York

Catholic Devotion in Victorian England. By Mary Heimann. [Oxford Historical Monographs.] (New York: Clarendon Press, Oxford University Press. 1995. Pp. x, 253. $49.95.)

The author of this ambitious study notes that her purpose has been "to incorporate devotion, that voluntary and explicitly religious aspect of the Faith, into a social and inteUectual understanding of CathoUcism in England in the second half of the nineteenth century and the early years of the twentieth" (p. vi). Her intention, she adds, has been "to put many of the assumptions of English CafhoUc historiography to the test, whUe at the same time uncovering the field of devotion as an independent area of Interest" (p. 5). She is aware of the complexities of the issues involved in her effort. The extensive bibUography and the use made of it are evidence of the care that she has taken to support her conclusions.

Dr. Heimann, at the outset, discusses and convincingly refutes the basic supposition of the so-called "Second Spring" approach to devotion, that is, one based upon the exaggerated view that prior to the CathoUc reUef acts in the late eighteenth century and Catholic Emancipation in 1829, EngUsh Catholics were unable to reflect their devotion publicly "without fear of actual imprisonment" (p. 11). Heimann also discounts the later influence upon devotion of the socaUed "Uberal-ultramontane struggle."

The complexities of the issues may be found in the career of Cardinal Nicholas Wiseman, one of the truly significant figures in Victorian England who warmly embraced Latin devotions. As Heimann points out, his formative years had been spent rn Rome. In a puzzling note, however, she states that "he grew up in Spain and Ireland" (p. 19, n. 64). He left Spain for Ireland at the age of two, and he was not yet eight when he moved to Ushaw CoUege, Durham, where he came under the influence of men like John Lingard, Robert Tate, and George Brown, the future bishop of Liverpool. None of the three was identified with Latin tastes. Lingard, who later objected to the enthusiasm of Wiseman as weU as that of Newman, was nevertheless the author of the popular hymn "Queen of Heaven the Ocean Star."

It has often been noted that Irish immigration had a major impact upon the growth of Catholic devotional practice in England. Here again, Heimann offers a revisionist approach, pointing out that many of those who fled to England in the 1840's were far from earnest in their reUgious practices in Ireland. Most were in no position to develop them in England. The CathoUc Revival in nineteenth-century England was nevertheless real, as Dr. Heimann acknowledges and describes as "a distinctive reUgious outlook among CathoUcs, both nominal and practicing, Uving in England" (p. 137). She argues, however, that "it was an Invigorated EngUsh recusant tradition, not a Roman one, which was most successful in capturing the Imagination of CathoUcs living in England from the middle of the nineteenth century to the early years of the twentieth" (p. 137). Until the twentieth century, the author points out, "it was The Garden of the Soul rather than the Roman Raccolta which continued to be used by

CathoUcs living in England, whether for private prayer or in assisting at Mass or Benediction." She notes that "those extra-liturgical forms which came to be practised with increasing regularity were devotions which had also been favourites in the recusant tradition" (p. 138). Heimann insists that CathoUcs in England "remained as English as the Scots remained Scottish," but adds that "in their holy aspiration to accept one another as CathoUcs first, despite class, ethnic, and political differences, they had also become more cathoUc in the other sense," and finaUy that "this CathoUc world within England was not an outpost of Rome but remained both an English and a Catholic community" (p. 173).

The book is a fine one. The very complexity of its subject matter should incite other scholars to further research and dialogue.

R.J. Schiefen

University of St. Thomas, Houston

Catholic Church Music in Ireland, 1878-1903: The Cecilian Reform Movement. By Kieran Anthony Daly. (DubUn: Four Courts Press. Distributed by International Specialized Book Services, Inc., Portland, Oregon. 1995. Pp. vU, 189. $30.00.)

WhUe this concise book is primarily a study of the Irish Cecilian movement over the twenty-five-year period that preceded the promulgation of Pius X's famous sacred music motuproprio of 1903, it also provides a European and a tantaUzingly brief American perspective on an interesting cultural phenomenon in the history of late nineteenth-century CathoUcism. Founded on the liturgical imperative of ridding the sacred rites of a musical style which its proponents considered had enfeebled the liturgy by its incorporation of eighteenth- and nineteenth-century secular elements, the CecUians vigorously sought a return to what they considered to be the ideal church music, namely, Gregorian chant, classical polyphony, and their modern imitators. Yet contemporary compositions had to comply strictly with the modal/diatonic harmonic language requirements of CecUian ideology if they were to be accepted as kosher. NaturaUy true creative talent could not and would not submit to such curbs on artistic freedom, and so part of the tragedy of this movement is that nonentities were elevated as paragons of compositional virtue whUe real compositional giants such as Bruckner (who as a devout Catholic leant over backwards in his efforts to comply with Cecilian requirements) were treated with some disdain. Indeed, as an indication of the zeal of the Cecilian mind, Daly recounts how in 1877, the archbishop of Dublin, whUe presiding at a festive Mass in a city church, on hearing the Kyrie of Beethoven's Mass in C

> . . . sent up word to the choir to have the performance of Beethoven's Mass discontinued, and some other listed work which was free from conditions and independent of instruments substituted.

This account (as is much of the source material In this book) is taken from the Lyra Ecclesiastica, the journal of the CecUian movement Ui Ireland, which flourished for fifteen years between 1878 and 1893 This periodical published Usts of approved music called the white list (which clearly impUed the existence of a black list), and kept strong tabs on the music programs (and their manner of execution) of liturgical celebrations throughout the country.

Central to Daly's work are studies of the three clerical leaders of the international movement's Irish section: the German, Heinrich Bewerunge, a priest of the Diocese of Paderborn, who came to Ireland in 1888 as Maynooth's first professor of sacred music, a position he was to hold until his death m 1923:WUUam Walsh, the musicianly president of Maynooth who became archbishop of Dublin Ln 1885 and reigned until 1921, lending the considerable weight of his office to the implementation of CeciUan ideals in the Uturgy; and then there was Walsh's auxLUary Nicholas DonneUy cold, aloof, but imbued with a deep love and knowledge of CeciUan music which was developed and sustained through his annual visits to the fons et origo of the movement, Regensburg, and to other continental centers of CeciUan endeavor, and through his friendship and association with such CecUian stalwarts as F. X. Haberl, Franz Witt, and Michael Haller.

As this was primarily a southern German movement in origin and organization, it is not surprising that the CeciUan society took root Ln the United States Ui the Midwest where German CathoUcs were numerically strong. Milwaukee's first archbishop, John Martin Henni, was a strong supporter, as was the first rector of St. Francis Seminary, Joseph Salzmann. And it was Witt in Regensburg who recommended J. B. Singenberger to Henni and Salzmann as an exceUent church musician fuUy in sympathy with Cecilian ideals. Thus it was that in 1873 Singenberger came to the United States, where he founded and edited the periodical Caecilia (the American equivalent of the Irish Lyra). The language of the publication was mainly German and was so to remain until 1925, thus unashamedly declaring its aesthetic aUegiance.

Daly recounts the story weU, despite occasional syntactical awkwardnesses. The division of the text on the contents page into three main sections corresponding to the phases of the society's rise and faU, are inexplicably not evident in the body of the book itself. This is a pity as these divisions assist the reader in following the progress of the CecUian movement. It is also rather a pity that there are no music examples whatsoever, so that it is difficult for the interested reader to assess the quality of the (mainly obscure) music under discussion.

However, Ui general this is an excellently documented and weU presented study which illuminates the vital role music played in the advancement of ecclesiastical thought in Ireland at the turn of the century. Daly has told the story as far as Ireland is concerned. His references to America indicate that the story of CeciUanism Ln the United states remains to be told and should be weU worth telling.

Gerard Gillen

St. Patrick's College
Maynooth, Ireland

Thomas Hardy and the Church. By Jan Jedrzejewski. (New York: St. Martin's Press. 1996. Pp. Lx, 243, $49.95.)

G. K. Chesterton once spoke for many when he dubbed Hardy "a sort of vU-lage atheist brooding and blaspheming over the village idiot." Few readers would deny that Hardy was "anthropomorphic out of sheer atheism," that his Victorian agnosticism pervades virtuaUy aU that he wrote. Today unlike those of so many of his contemporaries, his novels are stUl being read, not only because they are set texts on university reading-Usts and examination syllabi, but his characters, plots, settings, dramatic and picturesque scenes are clearly the stuff of good literature.

This latest addition to an endless stream of books and articles on Hardy's life and works begins by noting that his attitude toward the Christian faith has received scant attention from critics and scholars. What is requisite for a proper understanding of Hardy's religious opinions, Professor Jedrzejewski posits, is a recognition that the complex nature of his responses is not only a function of the multiplicity of influences that shaped his vision, but also a consequence of the varying Intensity of those influences throughout the nearly eighty-eight years of his life. In short, Hardy could not fuUy accept Christianity nor Uve his life without it.

To discuss Hardy's religious views in terms of a static system of negatives—nonconformist, nihUist, infidel, immoralist, heretic, pessimist, and so on—is about as helpful as labeling him a Christian agnostic or agnostic Christian. Is there any value in reducing him to an epigone of Victorian disbelief? Jedrzejewski thinks not, and he recommends an inquiry into the evolution, or devolution, of Hardy's religious thinking. Accordingly Jedrzejewski first considers Hardy's early acceptance of Christianity; then his rather timid refusal to accept the supernatural; and lastly, in his middle period, an expression of bitter criticism of Christian churches, especially the Roman CathoUc, for the emphasis they placed on the letter of the faith rather than on its spirit. Toward the end of his Ufe, however, Hardy came to a recognition of the ethical values of Christianity despite what he continued to consider a questionable ontological basis.

Since Hardy Uved through a period pulsating with change, it is hardly surprising that his views fluctuated from year to year, from decade to decade. His fiction and his poetry are both reflective of external circumstances and psychological traumas. At the end of the century, for example, he avowed that he was a practicing communicant of the Church of England. Several years later he is reported to have said: "As a young man I was deeply interested in reUgion. Indeed I stiU am." Twenty years later he looked upon worship as a kind of ethical imperative and an exercise of the wLU. "I beUeve in going to church," he wrote; "it is a moral drUl, and people must have something. If there is no church in a country viUage, there is nothing." At the same time, he hoped for the disestablishment of the AngUcan Church. He preferred a faith "modulated by degrees into an undogmatic, non-theological organization for the promotion of virtuous living on which all honest men agreed. . . ."

Throughout his long life, Hardy was victim of a dialectic between two impulses. There was his emotional attachment to the Christian tradition on the one hand, and on the other his inclination to favor the thinking of such Victorians as MLU and Arnold, Darwin and Huxley. As for Newman, Hardy read the Apologia pro Vita Sua and made copious notes on all he found inspirational, but he lamented that he found too many "gaps" in Newman's reasoning. Yet to realize how the two impulses operated against each other is to begin to understand how the process affected his attitude toward Christianity and influenced the creation of his best novels, short stories, and poems.

In the context of aU the modifications that took place in Hardy's religious reasoning over a lifetime, it is interesting to note that he was granted burial in Westminster Abbey, an honor denied in previous years to such agnostic luminaries as George Eliot, George Meredith, and Algernon Charles Swinburn. Posthumously Thomas Hardy was united with his Church even though most of his life he had moved phUosophically in the opposite direction.

G. A. Cevasco

St. John's University, New York

Priestly Fictions: Popular Irish Novelists of the Early 20th Century: Patrick A. Sheehan, Joseph Guiñan, Gerald O'Donovan. By Catherine Candy. (Dublin: Wolfhound Press. 1996. Pp. 216. IRÄ12.99 paperback.)

This is a study long overdue and very much to be welcomed. The Irish Literary Revival of the early twentieth century seems so abundant in writers of commanding reputation (e.g., W. B. Yeats, J. M. Synge, Lady Gregory, Sean O'Casey even—though he held himself aloof—James Joyce) that it is easy to forget that neither they nor the revival movement itself was very popular in their time. Contemporary readers more often preferred the novels of Canon Patrick Augustine Sheehan, positive in outlook though also thoughtful, or Canon Joseph Guinan's more resolutely sunny The Soggarth 4roo«. This was CathoUc, indeed clerical, Uterature, meant forthrightly to appeal to the conventions not only of political nationalism but also of religious morality then widespread in Ireland, in which respect certaLnly it contrasts with the modernist literature of the Revival. But clerical Uterature, even more than other forms of popular Uterature, suffers the neglect of literary scholars. These tend to cast its value as "mainly historical," however weU disposed they might otherwise be to invoking social history. At the same time, despite the steady blurring of distinctions among academic disciplines, it is stUl unusual for an historian to treat works of fiction more than incidentally.

AU the more reason, then, to respect Catherine Candy's discussion of popular clerical fiction in the final decades of the British Imperium in Ireland at large. Sheehan (1852-1931), Guiñan (1863-1932), and the less popular, anticlerical

(and indeed, by the time he began publishing novels, former priest) Gerald O'Donovan (1871-1942) are of decided, Lf "mainly historical," significance. Nearly contemporary with each other (although O'Donovan's first novel appeared the year that Sheehan died), they nonetheless offer quite distinct perspectives on the lives of ordinary Catholics, and especiaUy on those of priests, in their time.

Sheehan's sacerdotal characters reflect the mid-nineteenth century in Ireland, much aware though they are (as was Sheehan) that an exposition of Catholic faith more comfortable with complexity would become necessary. The old certainties of thought and behavior puUed strongly aU the same, presenting in Sheehan a steadfast integrity that, combined with considerable narrative talent, drew an audience weU beyond Ireland. He was much pubUshed in America, where his autocratic priests struck a nostalgic chord among many Catholic readers but also attracted OUver WendeU Holmes, a Boston brahmin if ever there was one. Guiñan, on the other hand, was a priest at once simpler and more up-to-date. Kindly, and sentimentaUy content with stock images of peasant and priest, he was less deUcate than Sheehan, and less artistic, sufficiently fortified by faith to confront the ugliness and complexity of the modern age, and reduce them to his satisfaction. Both authors seem to late-twentieth-century sensibilities embarrassingly sectarian: Sheehan typicaUy treats Protestants as curiosities, enduringly mysterious, while to Guiñan they are just the enemy. By contrast, O'Donovan is self-consciously modernist and righteous In his exposures of clerical misbehavior, especially hypocrisy (somewhat slyly, Candy notes that he left the priesthood, in which his ambition was very much evident, shortly after his hopes for a see were frustrated). With the passage of time, this sort of anticlericalism has become standard in Irish Uterature.

As an historian, Candy takes an informative more than an analytical approach, perhaps betraying some diffidence at venturing into such literary territory. Of Sheehan, who acquired a strong following in mainstream literary opinion, Candy notes that he is now most commonly remembered for having been so popular in his day. We have, however, no probing of reasons for the critical neglect of a novelist whose talents, if conventional, were by any measure very substantial; the question of critical bias against Catholic Uterature as such, indeed, hangs unasked over the book. Moreover, Candy appears in her introduction to be preparing a contrast between Sheehan and O'Donovan, implying some exploration of pro- and anticlerical writing, but this never materiaUzes. Even the issue of how the three writers constrict Irish identity a question Candy regards as very important, is explored only tentatively.

In these respects the book reveals its origins as a thesis. And it must be said of Wolfhound Press that the copy editing is very poor. Naming O'Donovan as "Gerald Donovan" on the back cover is the most glaring of such errors, but the lack of an index is the most gaUing. Nevertheless, this is an often searching, often

spirited study, one that could herald a new examination of CathoUc Uterature in an Ireland that is steadily, these days, sUpping its CathoUc moorings.

Robert Mahony

The Catholic University of America

The Path to Christian Democracy: German Catholics and the Party System from Windthorst to Adenauer. By Noel D. Cary (Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press. 1996. Pp. xl, 355. $49.95.)

Soon after the victorious alUes permitted Germans in 1945 to exercise a limited amount of political freedom, prominent CathoUcs began discussions and debates about the type of poUtical party they should try to establish. Some wished to restore the old Center Party of historic and emotional memory in its confessional character and with its emphasis on cultural issues. Others also favored the revival of the old CathoUc party but insisted that its focus should be on political and social issues and that it should aUy itself with the Social Democrats who had shared power with the Prussian Center in the governance of Prussia from 1919 to 1932. A third group, eventuaUy led by the redoubtable Konrad Adenauer from 1919 to 1933 the Lord Mayor of Cologne, the Catholic capital of West Germany, insisted that only a broadly based interdenominational party could be an adequate counterbalance to the strong Social Democratic Party and cope with Germany's serious governmental and economic problems. Some years later the new Christian Democratic Union would replace the Center Party Ln the hearts and minds of most Catholic Germans in West Germany.

The book under review is a work of highly competent scholarship and is written in a style which is usuaUy graceful and sometimes sharply incisive. The author shows unusual skiU in describing the debates between the leading spokesmen of the CDU and Center parties and in tracking the maneuvers which they used in their efforts to win CathoUc support for their sides. However, the knowledgeable reader wUl be surprised that he does not deal more substantiaUy with the relations between the CDU and the higher CathoUc clergy whose active backing was necessary for the new party's triumph over the Center. There is no reference in his work to Cardinal Josef Frings, the Archbishop of Cologne and the leader of the West German episcopate, who had, like Konrad Adenauer, a strong personaUty. Whüe the Cardinal and the party leader were probably in basic agreement with each other on most church and state issues, they sometimes tUted with each other as well, presumably over school affairs.

In his early chapters on the pre-1933 Center the author also devoted minimal attention to the relations between the party's leadership and the heads of the Prussian Church's hierarchy, and he only took up the school issue when it loomed up before him in the Weimar Republic years. He claimed that Ludwig Windthorst, the Center's brUliant leader from 1874 to 1891, used the school

issue as a device to raUy Catholics behind his party. In the early Weimar years Peter Spahn, a onetime aide to Windthorst and sometime successor to him in their party's leadership, would say to a Reichstag Investigative committee that he and his coUeagues had never made an important poUtical decision untU they had first considered how it might affect the weUbeing of their church. Down to the last year ofWorld War I they had steadUy opposed the introduction of workingclass suffrage in Prussian elections because they feared that it would lead to a Social Democratic majority in the Prussian Landtag and the secularization of that state's school system. In doing so, they deeply offended the leaders of the interconfessional trade union movement whose cause they had promoted before the war with the sanction of most bishops.

The Weimar constitution would deprive the confessional school system of the privüeged position which it had previously enjoyed in most of Germany's states since it stipulated that the interdenominational school form would be the constitutional norm. However, the author correctly implies that the denominational schools reaUy did not suffer in practice from the change in their legal position. Most state governments left them intact after 1919 with the result that over eighty percent of German youth was in their system when Hitler came mto power in January, 1933.

In the period of new party formation after World War II the founders and leaders of the revived Center would be handicapped in some degree by the fact that many adult Catholics recalled that the old party of that name had sacrificed its constitutional principles by voting for Hitler's Enabling Act in late March, 1933. The author suggests that the Center did so because the party chairman, Monsignor Ludwig Kaas, found that his party was in a difficult political position but also because he believed that he could strike a deal with the new chancellor, presumably on the school issue. However, the author does not refer to any of the substantial evidence which could lead to the conclusion that Kaas had secretly reached an agreement with the regime in which he promised to seek his Reichstag coUeagues' support for the EnabUng Act in return for a Hitler promise that his government would enter into binding concordat negotiations with the Vatican.The author is right, of course, in asserting that Kaas had underestimated Hitler's capacity for duplicity.

The Cary book is a serious work which often reaches high levels in its scholarship and writing. His study would be even better U he had been broader in his focus, selection of materials, and interpretation of them.

John Zeender

The Catholic University of America

Katholische Verbände und moderne Gesellschaft: Organisationsgeschichte und Vereinskultur im Bistum Münster 1918 bis 1945. By Christoph Kösters. [VeröffentUchungen der Kommission für Zeitgeschichte, Reihe B: Forschungen, Band 68.] (Paderborn: Ferdinand Schöningh. 1995. Pp. 684. 98 DM.)

Christoph Kösters's work, a revised version of his University of Münster dissertation, is a study of the Intersection of the Church, society, and poUtics between 1918 and 1945, "the crisis years of classical modernism" (p. 18). Based on intensive research into primary sources, the book focuses on CathoUc, male youth groups In the Diocese of Münster, the "CathoUc bulwark of Northern Germany" (p. 23). The author's ambitious inteUectual program includes a discussion of CathoUc responses to the social and poUtical crises of the first half of the twentieth century, and also a new evaluation of CathoUc resistance to the Nazi regime in the Ught of his research into the social history of reUgion.

Kösters begins with an account of the construction of a network of CathoUc associations in the decades before World War I. Such groups, he notes, were part of a CathoUc subculture, separate from the rest of German society, but internaUy divided by social class. GeneraUy led by the clergy, the associations were nonetheless separate from parish life and diocesan structures. After the war, a growing number of Catholics felt that the old network of associations was no longer appropriate to new social and poUtical circumstances. They sought to break out of their confessional ghetto and create new kinds of organizations, with distinct simUarities to contemporary non-CathoUc youth groups, that would tear down the barriers between social classes. Adherents of this course were often supporters of the eucharistie and Uturgical movements, that sought a renewal of reUgious Ufe by encouraging a greater and more intensive participation of laypeople In church services (the author detaUs the scandalous occurrences of priests saying Mass whUe facing the congregation), a current of reUgious renewal ultimately culminating in the Second Vatican CouncU.

Although the author does not particularly emphasize this point, his own evidence shows that such Initiatives were the work of a distinct minority and met with relatively Uttle success. The new Catholic youth groups formed during the Weimar Republic had a much smaller membership than the older Kolping (journeymen's) associations or the Marian SodaUties, and this apparently continued to be the case weU into the Nazi era. For aU their claims to overcoming class barriers, the new organizations tended to be as segregated by class as the older ones were. The bulk of the diocesan clergy showed no great enthusiasm for new Uturgical practices.

These caveats are important, because Kösters argues against the notion, advanced by other social historians, that the CathoUc confrontation with Nazism was a clash between a traditionaUst religion and a modernizing totaUtarian regime. Instead, he asserts that it was the modernizing, dynamic, initiatives of reUgious renewal, which provided the faithful in the Diocese of Münster with the impetus needed to resist the Nazis. The author's detaüed discussion of the dio-

cese under Nazi rule does not focus on the usual historical showpiece, Bishop von Galen's celebrated 1941 sermons denouncing the regime's euthanasia program, but on the relationship between the church and the state and party during the 1930's, as initial efforts at cautious co-operation quickly gave way to open hostiUty. WhUe Kösters emphasizes the role of members of the new Catholic associations and adherents of new forms of piety in CathoUc resistance to the Nazis, he downplays the way in which a number of members of the new groups went over to the Nazis or the role that the more numerous members of older associations or supporters of older ideas had In opposing the regime. (Women, frequent among these, are not discussed in his book.) Bishop von Galen himself, as the author notes, was no particular friend of the new forms of piety.

More convincing is the author's observation that the Nazi regime, by persecuting and ultimately prohibiting most Catholic associations, left the field open to the adherents of a parish-based, intensive lay participation in reUgious services. This transition from the old network of associations to the new forms of piety went relatively smoothly in the rural areas of the diocese. In its industrial districts, though, just a smaU group of young men became intensively involved Ln parish life, whUe a much larger number were increasingly indifferent to religion, thus setting the stage for further developments after World War II.

Appearing in the "Veröffentlichungen der Kommission für Zeitgeschichte," a major monograph series of "official" CathoUc historiography in Germany, the book emphasizes a number of themes previously discussed by authors of sharply differing viewpoints, such as Günter Plum, Ui his 1972 study of religion, politics, and society in the Aachen region, or Doris Kaufmann's 1985 account of the CathoUc mUieu in the city of Münster. This convergence of "official" and "dissenting" Catholic historiography is itself suggestive of the growing inteUectual maturity of the study of the social history of reUgion in central Europe, of which this work provides a fine example. Although I am not sure that I always agree with the author's conclusions (in part, because he often formulates them in an indirect and guarded fashion), I nonetheless found his deeply researched and unusuaUy well written study a consistent source of information and thought-provoking insights.

Jonathan Sperber

University of Missouri, Columbia

The Sorcerer's Apprentice. The Life of Franz von Papen. By Richard W Rolfs, SJ. (Lanham, Maryland: University Press of America. 1996. Pp. xiii, 470. $58.00 clothbound; $42.00 paperback.)

Professor Rolfs has written the first complete biography of an individual who faciUtated the triumph of Nazism in 1933. Franz von Papen was dapper, charming, and clever. If he was rooted in anything, it was his Catholic heritage, which

did little to enUghten his poUtical judgment. Born into the Westphalian nobUity, Papen began his adult Ufe as a cavalry officer. When World War I began, he was the German military attaché in Washington, D.C., where he was expeUed for espionage. During the 1920's Papen was elected to the Prussian Landtag, in which he served as an ultra-conservative member of the CathoUc Center Party. Toward the end of this period Papen began an association with Kurt von Schleicher, a poUtical general and wire-puller, who Papen thought was "a man of great clarity and vision. . . ." When someone suggested to Schleicher that Papen lacked a strong inteUect, the former replied that he did not need one: "He's a hat" (pp. 80-81).

Papen soon demonstrated that he was as clever as the general. Both wanted to revise the German constitution in an authoritarian direction. From 1930 to May, 1932, these two remained in the background hatching new plots and schemes. The most overused word in Rolfs's book is "crafty." When President von Hindenburg lost confidence in ChanceUor Heinrich Bruening, Papen became the Weimar RepubUc's penultimate chanceUor because of the speU he exercised over the aging and confused president. Papen's most notable achievements during his six months in office were lifting the ban on Hitler's private army (the S.A.) and then removing Prussia's Socialist leaders from power because they could not maintain order. This was the end of Prussia as an independent poUtical entity; it was a fateful event because Prussia and its Social Democratic party had been the backbone of democracy in Germany. Concerning the last weeks of the Weimar RepubUc—Schleicher was now the chancellor—Rolfs says that they "were so fiUed with plots and manipulations that it is almost impossible to unravel the tangled web" (p. 237). Papen was back in the shadows looking for a deal with Hitler.

Rolfs has done a prodigious amount of research. The footnotes alone wiU be useful to serious students of German history. His description of Papen's year and a half as Hitler's Vice ChanceUor and four years as his representative in Vienna, which ended with Anschluss, are very interesting. The somber irony in this case is that Papen accepted the invitation to move to Vienna only days after the Nazis murdered two of his assistants and Schleicher as weU on the "night of the long knives." Papen, on his own testimony, beUeved that his presence in high office was necessary to avert more disasters. His last assignment was in Ankara, where he spent most of the war years, working with some success to keep the Turks out of World War II, at least until the final months. What foUows is a poignant description of Papen's arrest and his acquittal at the Nuremberg Trials.

How did Papen reconcüe his private and pubUc morality? Rolfs does not reaUy answer the question. Perhaps it is unanswerable. Another author (a psychiatrist), using the results of tests given at Nuremberg, has estabUshed that Papen's LQ. was something like "134." In other words, Papen was brighter than most of the people around Hitler. Moreover, he had enough education to know that he was dealing with people of extraordinary criminality. Rolfs notes that Papen al-

ways denied that he had any influence over Hitler; on the other hand, he always claimed that his presence in the government was intended to moderate Hitler. Did he reaUy think that he was serving the Fatherland and not the Nazis? If so, it is a good indication of how far German conservatism had degenerated. Rolfs makes this very clear. On at least two occasions Papen thought that he was reinterpreting the work of Bismarck, which is ludicrous. Rolfs obviously beUeves that Papen's anxieties about his church were authentic and that he negotiated the 1933 Concordat with the Vatican with the best of Intentions.

Papen's Life had a few redeeming features. His most courageous act, it should be noted, was pubUcly to protest against Nazi abuses of power in June, 1934. WhUe in Ankara he and the papal nuncio, Angelo RoncalU, faciUtated the passage to Palestine of thirteen hundred Jewish chUdren who otherwise would have been sent to concentration camps. However, the most important thing to remember about Papen was summarized by the Chief Counsel for the United States at Nuremberg, Robert H. Jackson: "Franz von Papen, pious agent of an infidel regime, held the stirrup whüe Hitler vaulted into the saddle, lubricating the Austrian annexation, and devoting his diplomatic cunning to the service of the Nazi objectives abroad" (p. 437).

It is unfortunate that such a thorough piece of scholarship contains so many minor errors. Most are probably typographical. The first sentence of the book says that WiUam //was proclaimed Kaiser in 1781. A few pages later Papen is concerned with German "nationaUsts" in Mexico, when the author certainly means nationals. Rolfs quotes someone who described Papen as "being a Catholic in wolf's clothing. . . ." Surely, it was the other way around. Most troubling is that the pages cited in the Index do not always correspond with the pages in the text. The University Press of America should encourage a more careful proof reading of its books.

David Owen Kieft

University of Minnesota

Twisted Cross: The German Christian Movement in the Third Reich. By Doris L. Bergen. (Chapel HUl. The University of North Carolina Press. 1996. Pp. xy 341. $39.95 hardcover; $16.95 paperback.)

In post-World War I Germany there were a good number of groups within the Protestant Land Churches "preaching religious renewal along nationaUst, völkisch lines" (p. 5). Among the strongest of these movements was one in the Land Church of Thuringia led by two young pastors, Siegfried Leffler and JuUus Leutheuser. Other groups joined, and their movement came to be caUed German Christians, a name often held to have been suggested by Hitler. The church elections which took place in 1933, shortly after Hitler came to power, gave the German Christians a golden opportunity to gain control of many congregations and other church offices. People who had never bothered to vote in church

elections went to the polls, and the German Christians won two-thirds of the votes. The German Christians did not withdraw from the established churches, and which church party would control the churches became an important aspect of the Kirchenkampf.

The German Christians sought to promote a synthesis of the church and the National Socialist movement. To this end they tried to "dejudaize" the church. It was maintained that Jesus was not of Jewish heritage. Jewish phrases were deleted from the Old Testament, which was often set aside. New hymnals were brought out, and the author has quite a bit to say about German Christians and church music.

The volume is organized on a topical basis with eleven chapters. The titles of some of the chapters will give an idea of the way the material is presented. There are chapters on "The Anti-Jewish Church"; "The Antidoctrinal Church"; "Non-Aryans in the People's Church"; and "Catholics, Protestants and Dreams of Confessional Union." The German Christians wanted one National Church, which obviously would have to include Catholics. The Catholics, however, were not ready for such a recruitment, and the author has little to report on attempts to achieve a German Christian/Catholic rapprochement.

While the German Christians were a vital part of the church conflict during the Hitler years, there is little said about the Confessing Church and the Catholic Church conflicts. The election of Ludwig Müller of the National Church is dealt with without mentioning Friedrich Bodelschwingh. The important Pastors' Emergency League is mentioned but never explained and evaluated. Discussion of the German churches and church finances would have strengthened the volume. Important problems such as the control of seminaries and the question of crucifixes and crosses in the schools are neglected. The position of the German Christians on these matters was important.

The author holds that the membership of the German Christians hovered around 600,000. A pastor-led movement comprising one-third of the approximately 1,800 Protestant pastors was affiliated with it (pp. 7, 178, 232). There were some denazification proceedings after World War II, but mostly the pastors associated with the German Christian movement found employment within the reconstituted Land Churches. This account is well documented; there are an extensive bibliography and an exceptionally large number of appropriate photographs.

Ernst C. Helmreich

Bowdoin College

Visionaries: The Spanish Republic and the Reign of Christ. By WUliam A. Christian, Jr. (Berkeley: University of California Press. 1995. Pp. xxii, 544. $39.95.)

WLUiam Christian continues his examination of Spanish religious anthropology with this exhaustive study of apparitions in the Basque country during the first months of the Second Spanish Republic in 1931. Hundreds of seers reported visions of Mary and of Christ, starting in the smaU Basque town of Ezkioga and spreading to other towns in the region, and then to places as far away as Toledo.

Christian has unearthed every possible source for his report of events—interviews with survivors, diaries, newspapers, archival holdings of aU sorts, including a large number of photographs which are reproduced throughout the text. It is an extraordinary job of reconstruction. In addition, he has read most of the relevant material on apparitions in general, and he draws conclusions and comparisons with other nineteenth- and twentieth-century apparitions in Europe. He is not a believer, but he treats the visionaries with respect to show how religion, and particularly Catholicism, lends itself to visions.

The visionaries—mainly rural folk, but including other classes as weU—were responding to a secular event, the pronounced anticlericalism of the new Spanish Republic. Crucifixes were being banned from the schools, processions were proscribed, and worst of all, church buUdings Ln Madrid and southern Spain were attacked and burned by anticlerical mobs. The visionaries were unable to stop this anticlerical onslaught through normal means; so they resorted to supernatural ones. They reported that Mary told them that through prayer and sacrifice the anticlericals would be defeated. Before long, the visionaries moved from the political to the apocalyptic, offering visions of the end of the world and describing calamities to come; in a larger sense, the apparitions were a challenge to materialism, secularism, and rationalism. The visions also gave beUevers a new source of power, that of knowing the future and the supernatural.

Quite naturaUy, the visionaries attracted hundreds of thousands of persons, including promoters who sought to take advantage of the events; their main effect was to "connect the rural seers to the wider literate society." Most of these persons were not interested in monetary advantage, but rather in the promotion of their own special religious views. These included such worthies as Raymond de Rigné, a French professional Catholic, and Padre Amado Burguera, a Valencian Franciscan who had already written both a seven-volume encyclopedia of the Eucharist and a four-volume moral evaluation of over 11,000 plays and books.

Despite Cardinal Pedro Segura's and other bishops' beUef in the visions, the local bishop denounced the visionaries and got the Holy See to declare that the visions were "devoid of aU supernatural character." The civil government joined with the bishop to suppress the visionaries; it arrested some and interrogated them in the provincial asylum before they were released. The visionaries stubbornly resisted both authorities, but fewer visions were reported after 1932.

In most cases the visionaries, consciously or not, were seeking fame, and they drew rural folk together against both the anticlerical state and their skeptical bishop. Christian concludes that the visions had a marvelous leveling effect: "paradoxicaUy whUe having visions of dire events . . . the beUevers were having a wonderful time. . . . The mixing of unrelated men and women, of wealthy and poor, of merchants and farmers, ... of adults and chUdren, led to a kind of exhüaration that comes with the breaking of taboo and convention." Cultural underdogs became the most popular persons in society.

Christian's comparisons and analyses of the events provide exceptional insight into the nature of visions and visionaries, along with a fascinating glimpse into people's inner spiritual Uves. He also captures the mood of CathoUc Spain in one of its most troubled years.This is a powerful work and a worthy addition to the Uterature on modern Spain and on visionaries in general.

José M. Sánchez

Saint Louis University

Para ganar la guerra, para ganar la paz: Iglesia y guerra civil: 1936-1939- By Alfonso Alvarez Bolado. (Madrid: PubUcaciones de la Universidad Pontificia ComUlas. 1995. Pp. 716.)

This is a useful analysis of the role of the clergy in the Spanish Civü War. The author states that it is the first phase of a study of the mentaUty of the clergy to show how it influenced the poUtical relationship of the Church with the NationaUst state in the wartime years and then carried over into the Franco dictatorship until the CaudUlo died in 1975. Alvarez Bolado, a Jesuit historian and theologian, uses as his main source for this study the diocesan buUetins of the bishops of Spain during the wartime years. He states that he realizes the limitations of such sources: half of Spain was occupied by the RepubUcans for much of the time and the clergy in those areas were either in hiding or exüe, and therefore no diocesan buUetins were pubUshed.

In fact, these limitations were not aU that restrictive for the author's purpose, as his concern is chiefly with the NationaUsts, and he uses other sources as weU, including some of the diplomatic documents from the Spanish embassy to the Holy See, along with aU of the secondary works pubUshed on the subject, especiaUy the studies by Marquina Barrio on Vatican-Spanish relations and by Rodriguez Aisa on Cardinal Goma.

The book is divided into chapters corresponding to the chronological course of the war and continuing on into the remainder of 1939 (the war ended in April ofthat year).The postwar chapter deals with the Franco government's attempts to secure a concordat and the Vatican's fears of German influence in Spain. In addition, there is a chapter on the detafls of the writing of Pius XII's April, 1939, message to Spaniards congratulating the NationaUsts on their vie-

tory. In composing the message, the Pope reUed upon the assistance of Joaquin Salaverri, a Jesuit aide to the Assistant for Spain in Rome. The author uses Salaverri's unpublished diary to provide some interesting detaU.

AU of these chapters were pubUshed as articles in Miscelánea Comillas from 1986 through 1995, and it is convenient to have them bound in one volume. As a most helpful addition, the book includes a complete annotated bibUography of aU the bishops' statements, letters, and other pastoral concerns from aU of the diocesan buUetins of the period. This alone takes up nearly 200 pages of text and in itself makes this a valuable resource.

The author succeeds in his task of showing the mentaUty of the clergy. He proves beyond a doubt that the bishops' primary concern was the protection of the Church, not the support of a government that was more ideologicaUy suited to their class needs. The Nationalists were in fact supported by the clergy because of the anticlerical fury of the first few months of the war that resulted in the death of nearly 8,000 clerics. The bishops would have supported any government that protected them. The diocesan buUetins reveal over and over again the detaüs of the persecution.

This book does not change any of the standard interpretations of the Church's role in the war, but it does include a great deal of interesting detail. A slight drawback is some detail on the mUitary struggle that detracts from the author's main purpose, but aU in aU, this is a most useful work.

José M. Sánchez

Saint Louis University

Kirche und Staat im kommunistischen Polen, 1945-1989. By Jan Siedlarz. (Paderborn: Ferdinand Schöningh. 1996. Pp. 416. DM 52,- paperback.)

This book capably summarizes most of what we already knew about the relations of church and state in Poland during its phase of Communist dictatorship. Although the author, a PoUsh priest and theologian, has little to say that is original, what he does teU the reader is informative, well documented, and unexceptionable, including his assertion of the importance of his topic as a crucial element in the coUapse of Communism in his homeland, and perhaps, by extension, in much of the rest of Central Europe as weU.

After noting the depth of Poland's Christian heritage and the venerable association of Catholicism with Polish identity and patriotism, Father Siedlarz recites a detailed account of his subject according to the formula that has become standard among those observers incUned to celebrate the ultimate success of the PoUsh Church in its dramatic forty-five-year struggle against totaUtarianism. After seizing the reins of government at the end of World War II, the Polish Communist regime strove to extirpate reUgion and break the Church, driven by ideology and thirst for unchecked power. The Church weathered this assault,

largely owing to the astute and courageous leadership of Cardinal Wyszynski, leaving the ruling cUque no choice but to coexist grudgingly with its ecclesiastical rival and even to seek common ground In certain limited respects. Through it aU, the Church consistently upheld Christian truths and values, especiaUy an insistence on the subjectivity of man. The author stresses, with justice, that this was a reUgious message, not overtly poUtical, but under the circumstances it amounted to much the same thing, as everyone understood. The unimpeachable integrity of the Church lent it unmatched prestige and authority among the great majority of Poles and contributed to a noteworthy surge of reUgiosity in the country that culminated Ln the astonishing election of a PoUsh pope in 1978. Now Ln effect operating from the Vatican, the PoUsh Church picked its way cautiously through the last decade of the Cold War, encouraging and instructing the Poles, supporting SoUdarity in its infancy, and succoring a stricken nation through the rigors of martial law, but never severing Unes of communication with the increasingly frustrated and isolated Party. By the time "People's Poland" reached the end of its rope in 1989, the Church was uniquely positioned to mediate the peaceful and orderly Communist abdication of power to the democratic opposition, the first of the Soviet bloc dominoes to topple in that momentous year.

In conclusion, Father Siedlarz appends some thoughtful words on the place of the Church in post-Communist Poland, an issue that has generated no little controversy. Convinced that PoUsh society needs the moral guidance that only the Church can provide, he rejects as alarmist the oft-heard charge that this constitutes a clericaUst threat to democracy and pluraUsm. In his view, the church in Poland faces two challenges: the aUures of materiaUsm and secularization, and the danger that an ostensibly friendly poUtical faction might seek to use it for partisan gain. The author recommends that now, as before, the Church should remain true to itself and hold fast to the gospel of Christ.

Originally presented as a doctoral dissertation at the University of Augsburg, this study is based almost whoUy on pubUshed sources, accounting for its derivative character. Readers in search of fresh revelations wUl prefer to consult the emerging generation of monographs that utilize the recently opened archives of the defunct ministries of Communist Poland, but those content with an able synthesis wUl find Father Siedlarz a trustworthy guide. His unsurprising sympathy for the PoUsh Church Ln its remarkable effort to outlast an unsympathetic adversary is open but not obtrusive, and at any rate is not likely to offend many readers of this journal.

Neal Pease

University of Wisconsin-Milwaukee

American

Catholics in Colonial Delmarva. By Thomas Joseph Peternian. (Devon, Pennsylvania: Cooke Publishing Company. 1996. Pp.xi, 372.)

The story of the growth and development of the Catholic faith in Anglo-colonial America is an exciting one, although works delving into this history are far from common. Certainly Maryland, where the majority of Catholics lived in the eighteenth century, has been the subject of numerous studies. These have tended, however, to focus primarily on the population which resided west of the Chesapeake Bay, to the exclusion of those who lived on the Eastern Shore (the work of Edward Carley is an exception). Catholics in Colonial Delmarva, therefore, is a most welcome addition to the literature on the colonial Catholic community. Its author does not limit himself to an examination of the counties of Maryland alone; rather, he considers the history of the entire peninsula. Drawing on a wide array of documentary sources and secondary literature, Peterman surveys the growth of the Church through a treatment of the first Catholic families to inhabit the area, as well as the subsequent development of the community through a variety of political and social transformations (the border disputes between the Calvert and Penn administrations being just one of these). The author's encyclopedic account of the growth and mter-mingling of the pioneer families is truly impressive, as is his firsthand knowledge of the geography of the Delmarva peninsula. These enable him to produce an in-depth account of the progress of the faith literally county by county, town by town, family by family—including a number of fascinating asides, such as the legend of the Trappist monastery at Chancellor's Point in Talbot county.

Herein, though, lie the work's strengths and weaknesses. Anyone searching for a comprehensive account of Delmarva Catholicism in the colonial era could ask for no better guide than the present volume. It complements existing accounts of the colonial Catholic community in Maryland and Pennsylvania, providing valuable background to what is generally known concerning the labors of such figures as the indefatigable Father Joseph Mosely. Those researching family genealogies will especially appreciate the detailed treatment of the descendants of the earliest settlers and the comprehensive index. For those who are either urifamiliar with or uninterested in the intricacies of geography or kinship, however, the work can be somewhat daunting, as, for example, in the twelfth and last chapter, in which Catholic patriots from Delaware and five Maryland counties are enumerated, along with their wives, children, and relations. The sheer volume of information can occasionally overwhelm, even as the detailed nature of the treatment impresses.

Nevertheless, students of colonial Catholic history are indebted to the author for producing such an ordered and complete account. High marks must also be given to the thoughtful inclusion of numerous maps, photographs, and drawings. This work will be a valuable addition to the libraries of all who are interested in the story of the Church in Anglo-colonial America, and a useful guide to

those of us who relish visiting those places where the seeds of faith were first planted by our intrepid predecessors.

Joseph C. Llnck, CO.

The Oratory
Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania

The New York Irish. Edited by Ronald H. Bayor and Timothy J. Meagher. (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press. 1996. Pp. xxiii, 743. $45.00.)

The New York Irish is a welcome and valuable collection of essays organized chronologically rather than topically that discusses aspects of the Irish experience in America's largest city from before Independence to the present. The book is divided into five sections, each containing between three and five essays introduced by an "Overview" written by a distinguished scholar in the field of Irish American history. It is a big book, not only in heft but in import.

Since the book is not organized topically, readers with an interest in religion will have to sift through the essays in order to piece together a coherent picture of the role of the Catholic Church in the lives of New York's Irish citizens over time. Nevertheless, in their "Introduction," the editors acknowledge the importance of the Church in the history of the New York Irish. Significantly, they see Irish-America shaping the Church, and not vice versa. This theme is continued in several other essays found in the book.

Religion here is viewed from a sociological rather than a theological vantage point, and mostly from a "bottom-up" rather than a "top-down" perspective. Colleen McDannell's "Going to the Ladies' Fair: Irish Catholics in New York City, 1870-1900," for example, focuses on the often overlooked role of lay women in parish activities. Alan Kraut's "Illness and Medical Care among Irish Immigrants in Antebellum New York" also stresses the importance of Catholic women in Irish New York, in this case, the work of nuns in creating health care institutions.

The church hierarchy is not overlooked in these pages, however. The interaction between New York's Irish-dominated political machine and its Irish-dominated clergy is discussed in several essays, as is the Church's stance on Irish-American labor activism, education, and social welfare. In addition, Irish-American spirituality is elegantly examined in Charles Fanning's essay, "The Heart's Speech No Longer Stifled: New York Irish Writing Since the 1960s."

Other standouts among the many fine essays in this book include Hasia Diner's overview of the New York Irish in the mid-nineteenth century, and, especially, Lawrence McCaffrey's moving essay-memoir in which he reflects on a lifetime of scholarship using his Cavan-born father's experiences in New York as his leitmotif.

The New York Irish is an outstanding work and is sure to inspire studies of other American cities whose history was shaped by their Irish populations. It is a pioneering work, and it is a model for further scholarship.

Janet Nolan

Loyola University Chicago

Religion and Politics in the Early Republic: Jasper Adams and the Church-State Debate. Edited by Daniel L. Dreisbach. (Lexington: The University Press of Kentucky. 1996. Pp. xix, 220. $42.95 clothbound; $16.95 paperback.)

Daniel Dreisbach teaches Ln the Department of Justice, Law, and Society at the American University, Washington, D.C. He offers here a weU-edited, interesting, and useful coUection of documents from the early part of the nineteenth century discussing the relation of reUgion and poUtics. For his purpose, Dreisbach focuses on a sermon by the Reverend Jasper Adams, The Relation of Christianity to Civil Government in the United States (1833), with its extensive notes, responses from Chief Justice John MarshaU, Justice Joseph Story, and President James Madison, and a long, critical review, of uncertain authorship, entitled "Immunity of ReUgion." He offers some historical comments and perspective of his own on a debate which is with us stiU.

Adams, related to the Adamses of Massachusetts and a Congregationalist turned an Episcopal priest, was a professor, moral phüosopher, and president of Charleston CoUege. He preached his sermon during a period of "freedom's ferment" with the emergence of Jacksonian democracy, the disestabUshment of reUgion in Massachusetts in 1833, an attempt to establish a Christian party in poUtics, and a controversy over the deUvery of maU on Sunday. Living in South Carolina, Adams had to deal with the controversy over Thomas Cooper, president of South Carolina CoUege, regarding the latter's vocal criticisms of orthodox Christians. According to Adams, these were uncertain times for reUgion and the RepubUc. In his sermon he acknowledged that the writers of the Constitution of the United States intended to reject the Constantinian estabUshments of the Old World. But the issue was larger than the relationship between the churches and the various states of the union and the federal government. Adams claimed that Americans did not intend to disestabUsh Christianity as the reUgion of the nation. He found evidence of this in the practices of the people, in the common law, and Ln the Constitution itself. Although largely sUent on reUgion, the Constitution did acknowledge that it had been written in the "year of our Lord, 1787" and contained an expUcit recognition of the sanctity of Sunday. Christian faith and life was essential for the nation's good health. He argued that American civU, legal, and poUtical institutions should provide for a nonpreferential support of the various forms of Christianity and toleration for aU other reUgions. He buttressed his arguments with lengthy footnotes. Unfortunately,

Adams is short on suggestions on what should be done with popular, noisy denominations and cults unlike, for example, the EpiscopaUans, Congregationalists, and Presbyterians, the difficulty of administrating (as in Massachusetts) nonpreferential support of multiplying religious communities (together with more and more Catholic immigrants), a coalition of Christians who claimed that it knew what was the Christian thing to do for the nation's good, and radicals like Cooper who were sowing seeds of doubt about Christianity itself. Moreover, Adams does not give much attention to the case of a Jewish merchant who went to the synagogue on Saturday, but wanted to do business on Sunday.

Adams circulated his sermon widely and received many repUes, some from notable Americans. Story expressed appreciation for Adams' agreeable references to his Commentaries on the Constitution. He also seems to support Adams' argument by writing that it was not the purpose of the founders to "abolish" Christianity as a part of the "antecedent Law of the Land." Rather, Story held, they intended to do away with aU preferences between reUgious persuasions, "whether Christian or otherwise." MarshaU appreciated Adams' effort. He knew no person who questioned the importance of reUgion in this Ufe as weU as for the next. But he also warned that the subject required "great deUcacy" because "freedom of conscience" and respect for "our religion" both claim serious regard. Madison did not like the use of the word toleration m connection with this matter. He took issue with Adams. Directly involved with the passage ofVirginia's Act for Religious Liberty and First Amendment to the Constitution, he was a "separationist." He beUeved that the current vitality of Christianity in the Republic proved that religion could survive without official recognition or monetary support of governments. He saw the issues in terms of power and admitted that it may be difficult at any particular time to determine where the "line of separation" between the "rights of Religion & the CivU authority" should be drawn. He wanted to curb usurpation on one side or the other, or a "corrupting coalition or aUiance between them." He claimed that the only thing the government should do is to preserve pubUc order and protect "each sect" against "trespasses on its legal rights by others."

In recent years, persons who work in this field have come to appreciate Madison's metaphor of the "line of separation" over Jefferson's metaphor of the "waU." Dreisbach has made a contribution by providing the larger context for Madison's reflections in his retirement. This includes the extensive quotations, in some cases from contemporary court cases, which Adams attached to his sermon. Dreisbach makes this reviewer appreciate the founders who left us the First Amendment with its no establishment and "free exercise" clauses, both related to civü rights. This case study Ulustrates how our founders started a constitutional debate in which each generation of Americans has had to participate, not only to preserve freedom of reUgion, but to keep some combination of poUtical and reUgious power from becoming corrupt, arbitrary, and absolute. Dreisbach reinforces this reader's suspicion of attempts to amend the Constitution to clarify once and for all where the "line" between reUgion and poUtical faith and Ufe should be drawn. Dreisbach also reminds us that the Uberty we

have, despite all the controversy, allows Americans to participate in public and religious affairs as free citizens. With access to the public square, it is up to Christians and the adherents of other religious communities to talk sense and convincingly about the American condition on behalf of liberty, justice, domestic tranquUity, and the general welfare for a "more perfect union," to use words of the Preamble of the Constitution.

James H. Smylie

Union Theological Seminary
Richmond, Virginia

Hispanic California Revisited: Essays by Francis F. Guest, O.F.M. Edited and with an introduction by Doyce B. Nunis, Jr. (Santa Barbara, California: Santa Barbara Mission Archive Library. 1996. Pp. xix, 20-389)

This volume, published by the major research center for California mission history, presents eight essays by the former director of the center. Four of the articles are concerned largely with secular Ufe in California, and these occupy about a third of the space in the book.The others are focused on the missions, more specificaUy on a defense of the Franciscans and their efforts to convert the native people.

The briefest of the secular history essays describes the service of the Leather Jacket Soldiers during the first twenty years of Spanish occupation, and attempts to use conflicting payroUs to establish an accurate roster of those who served. Of more general interest is a longer essay on municipal government in Spanish California. With a third essay about the establishment of the Villa of Branciforte and another on local poUtics, the author creates a picture of the tensions that arose between the towns, the missionaries, and the mUitary commanders. Written more than twenty years ago, these three articles reflect the state of scholarly research in California history before the advent of the postmodern, deconstructionist view of mission history.

In about 1980 the emphasis Ln California history shifted. It became popular to accuse the missionaries of all sorts of crimes and delinquencies, ranging from bad table manners to genocide. Most such charges came from people who had little or no familiarity with the manuscript sources and, as it later turned out, not much concern for the truth. Much of these deconstructionist histories is based on the seriously-flawed statistical studies of Sherburne Friend Cooke, who wrote and taught at the University of California. In time, the criticisms became part of a general attack on Junípero Serra in particular and the Catholic Church in general.

In the four concluding articles Father Guest has taken up the various accusations of the deconstructionists and has searched the records to see whether they are true or false. In his study of"Cultural Perspectives on California Mission

Life" Father Guest examines health and sanitation, discipline, and cultural change at the missions. A second article, "Junípero Serra and the Indians," defends the religious ideaUsm of the great missionary and his companions. A third article on "Discipline in California Mission life" concludes that discipline at the California missions was mUd, about what might be expected in simUar institutions anywhere in the world at the time. "The missions," writes Father Guest, "need to be viewed as expressions of Spanish reUgious culture" (p. 295). The final article, "The California Missions Were Far from Faultless," deals with such topics as the ethnocentrism of the missionaries and the persistence of superstition among the converts. As in the other essays, Father Guest concludes that many of the criticisms of the missions are based on isolated incidents, taken out of context. Answering the accusation that the Indian converts did not reaUy accept Christianity, Father Guest describes the obvious fervor of the Indian Christians. In one particularly long quotation from the death register for Mission Santa Cruz, the missionary priest recaUed the saintly Ufe of a young woman name Antonina in terms that bear repeating: "She busied herself with common and ordinary chores to which her lot in life had assigned her, doing them with aU the perfection possible for her, doing them for God, which is what perfection consists in" (p. 371).

AU of the articles are based on thorough research Ln the original sources, most of which are avaUable at the Santa Barbara Mission Archive library. The prose style is clear and concise. The page layout is pleasing.The index is thorough. If there is a fault in Father Guest's work it is that he assumes the critics of the missions are people of good wUl who really want to be engaged Ln scholarly discourse.

Harry Kelsey

Huntington Library
San Marino, California

American Catholics and Slavery: 1789-1866. An Anthology of Primary Documents. CompUed and edited by Kenneth J. Zanca. (Lanham, Maryland: University Press of America. 1994. Pp.xxxi, 290. $4950.)

Kenneth Zanca, professor in the department of reUgious studies at Marymount CoUege, has compüed a series of documents dealing with CathoUcism and slavery Ln the United States. This work, 'which began as a coUection to aid his own teaching, includes more than one hundred documents ranging from Scripture texts and excerpts from Early Church Uterature to quotations from the antebeUum Catholic press and the bishops' pastoral letters of the mid-nineteenth century. An introduction begins each section with an explanation before each document. The coUection has been divided into three categories: the CathoUc tradition regarding slavery; sources that trace the context of eighteenth- and nineteenth-century America (the author Includes such docu-

ments as Jefferson's Notes on Virginia and the Supreme Court's Dred Scott decision); and the observations of Catholics on slavery between 1789 and 1866.

Professor Zanca has produced an anthology that should be of use to aU students of American church history. Interest in Black CathoUc history in the United States is growing rapidly. HopefuUy in a subsequent volume Professor Zanca wUl consider placing the documents in chronological order. The present arrangement causes too much repetition. A case in point is the treatment of Pope Gregory XVTs condemnation of the slave trade (1839) on page 27, reaction to the condemnation of the slave trade on page 128, reference to Gregory XVTs apostoUc brief on the slave trade on page 221, and finaUy the treatment of it by Bishop England on page 191.

Professor Zanca makes a very good effort to explain the proslavery mentality of the Catholic clergy and people, placing this mentaUty within the context of the time. It is interesting to note that Félix Dupanloup, Bishop of Orléans, had no difficulty in denouncing slavery with passion and feeling as moraUy reprehensible (p. 121) whUe American bishops could only bring themselves to avoid it as a political issue. Surprisingly Zanca includes none of the anti-slavery speeches of Daniel 0'ConneU,who fiercely condemned the pro-slavery stance of the Irish in this country.

Zanca seems less famUiar with the documents that reveal the thoughts and feelings of Black Americans. He overlooked "The Journal of the Society of the Holy FamUy," a document that detaüs the weekly meeting of two hundred or more Black Catholics in Baltimore who met in the parish haU attached to the cathedral from 1843 to 1845. This handwritten journal found in the Sulpician archives in Baltimore reveals the piety and religious sentiment of a Black Catholic community Ui the midst of a slave-holding city.

Certain errors in the text should be noted. The editor consistently misspeUs the name of the religious congregation of the UrsuUnes (pp. 38, 39,43, 100, etc). The editor gives a phonetic spelling of the Louisiana city of Natchitoches (page 159) that gives a pronunciation unfamUiar to any geographical dictionary or to the inhabitants of this old French Louisiana city. Augustine Verot, Bishop of Savannah and vicar apostolic of St. Augustine, deUvered his famous sermon on slavery on January 4, 1861, a day set aside for prayer and fasting by President James Buchanan, not by Jefferson Davis (p. 201) as Zanca notes in the introduction. Davis assumed the office of president of the Confederacy a month later. On page 248, a letter found in the New York Archdiocesan Archives is presented as a letter written Ln 1862, from Bishop Patrick N. Lynch of Charleston to Archbishop John Hughes of New York. The author of the letter reminisces about himself as a young clergyman thirty-eight years before. Lynch who was born in 1817 was forty-five in 1862 and thirty-eight years before would have made him seven years old. Hughes, on the other hand, was born in 1797 and was sixty-five in 1862 and would have been twenty-seven some thirty-eight years before. It might seem that the names of writer and addressee had been reversed. Hughes wrote the letter. It might be added that the artificial line drawn from Cairo to

Cape May by the author of the letter had to be from Cairo in Illinois, not in Mississippi (p. 248).

Unfortunately, the editor does not give a bibUography. His footnotes lack a reference to some rather important works. For example, any treatment of the New York draft riots should include the reference to Iver Bernstein, The New York City Draft Riots: Their Significance for American Society and Politics in the Age of the Civil War (New York, 1990). Zanca quotes a diary by John Morgan, SJ., which refers to a French mulatto who sang the Mass on November 26, 1863 (p. 183)-The French mulatto is identified as a priest by Professor Zanca. An effort should have been made to identify this mulatto priest. Was it James Augustine Healy who was ordained in France in 1854, or was it his brother, Sherwood A. Healy, ordained in Rome in 1858? FinaUy, the work closes with an excerpt from the pastoral letter of the Second Plenary CouncU of Baltimore in 1866. The short comments about the emancipated slaves in the closing pastoral letter gave no hint of the bitter division regarding the freed slaves that characterized a secret session of the second plenary council, the records of which are to be found Ln the Baltimore Archdiocesan Archives, never translated and never pubUshed. It would be good to publish them, for they would remind us that many of the American bishops faUed in compassion and understanding for the African American population during the darkest days of United States history.

As the study of Black CathoUc sources advances, any future anthology of this sort wiU need to devote more space to the Black Catholic reality; for CathoUcism is greater than the narrow perspectives of a pro-slavery episcopate and laity. American CathoUcism is also revealed in the faith, holiness, and humanity of Black CathoUcs Uving in an age of chains. Professor Zanca is to be commended for making a good beginning.

Cyprian Davis, O.S.B.

St. Meinrad School of Theology

Hoosier Faiths: A History of Indiana's Churches and Religious Groups. By L. C. Rudolph. (Bloomington: Indiana University Press. 1995. Pp. xv, 710. $39.95.)

This massive volume results from the author's audacious effort, probably unprecedented, to survey the major religious traditions found in a single state. Through 700 double-columned pages, Rudolph provides fifty-three essays, most of which describe individual traditions with a summary of their history before treating Indiana developments. "Narratives end," the author notes, "as a conversation or lecture might, when the basic identity of the group seems to be estabUshed and when some of its characteristic stories have been told." An essay's length is not always adjusted to a group's size. Denominations with limited membership but a complex history may have essays as substantial as those dealing with the influential Methodist and CathoUc churches, whose combined

membership claimed 40% of the state's religious adherents by 1990. With emphasis on each tradition's story, the author does not aim at a general interpretation of religion's role in shaping culture.

Though not known as a home to diverse groups, Indiana, as the volume reveals, has accommodated a wide range of reUgious expressions. The author starts with an essay on Indians, then moves to Methodists and CathoUcs. The stories of mainline Protestant denominations loom large in the state's nineteenth-century reUgious development. The essay on "Christians," the book's longest, portrays Alexander CampbeU, his movement, and its importance for Indiana, home to denominational headquarters of the Christian Church (Disciples of Christ). Articles also appear on such antebeUum movements as Rappites, Owenites, Shakers, Swedenborgians, and RationaUsts.

For the twentieth century, the religious scene becomes more complex. Rudolph introduces movements that depart from mainline Protestantism with an overview essay on "Holiness and Pentecostal Development." Separate essays then foUow on denominations within the latter traditions, of which several have importance to Indiana, location of denominational headquarters of the Wesleyan Church, Free Methodist Church, Church of God (Anderson), Missionary Church, United Brethren, and Pentecostal AssembUes of the World. The state's developing ethnic complexity is addressed in an overview essay on "Major Minorities" before presenting separate essays on four black Methodist denominations, black Baptists, ethnic Catholics, and Eastern Orthodox.

Informative essays portray Jews and Mormons, but articles on Christian Scientists and Jehovah's Witnesses reflect the difficulty of exploring groups that keep outsiders at a distance. The essay on Muslims focuses on activities of the international organization, the Islamic Society of North America, with imposing headquarters near the IndianapoUs airport. SpirituaUsts, as the reader learns, have probably the world's largest center for their ministerial training near Anderson. However, for groups recently planted in the state, the author admits to not having "enough time or room" to do justice to Baha'ism, Buddhism, Hare Krishna, Scientology, Transcendental Meditation, Unification Movement, Unity, and The Way as weU as communes and non-denominational ministries. The "Science and Religion" article treats controversies played out in the state. The concluding essay addresses reUgion at the community level as found Ui Robert and Helen Lynd's famous Middletown sociological studies of Muncie during the 1920's and updated in the 1970's.

A volume of such magnitude is normaUy the product of a coUaborative effort of many scholars, each addressing an area of specialty. Instead, Rudolph, coauthor of Religion in Indiana: A Guide to Historical Resources OSloomington, 1985), worked alone for years at the Herculean task of exploring a vast Uterature to create this extraordinary volume that is valuable for its informative introductions to major faiths and how each develops within a state's boundaries. It demonstrates, too, the author's skiU Ui writing fascinating profiles of founders, significant leaders, and representative figures as well as 'famUy' stories

of reUgious faiths. More than a reference volume on Indiana and midwestern religion, Hoosier Faiths is in a class by itself as a work intended for the general reader but also useful to scholars.

Joseph M.White

Indianapolis, Indiana

The History of Alta California: A Memoir of Mexican California. By Antonio Maria Osio. Translated, edited, and annotated by Rose Marie Beebe and Robert M. Senkewicz. (Madison: The University of Wisconsin Press. 1996. Pp.xU, 388. $45.00 hardcover, $19.95 paperback.)

This work is a soUd contribution to the continuing effort to understand Mexican California and the experience of the Hispanic californio population as it struggled through the transition from Spanish to Mexican to U.S. rule in less than three decades. While this period in California history often has been treated from the governmental and ecclesiastical perspectives, the memoirs used to narrate the experiences of the general californio population previously have dated from a full quarter of a century after the U.S. conquest, and even longer after many of the events related.

Antonio Maria Osio came from Baja California and was a resident of Alta California from 1825 until 1852. In 1851, he composed this history which covers the years from 1815 through the U.S. conquest. The story begins with a letter from Osio to Father José María Suárez del Real, a Franciscan then serving at Mission Santa Clara, agreeing to the friar's suggestion that he compose a history of Alta California. It ends with Osio's narrative of the events leading to the end of hostilities between the U.S. and Mexico and the beginning of U.S. sovereignty, as weU as brief, poignant references to the discovery of gold and the incipient expropriation of californio landowners, himself included, as the speculators and lawyers descended on the new American state. Osio held land grants at Point Reyes, in present day Marin County, and on Angel Island in San Francisco Bay. Although he made every effort to retain adequate legal representation and secured substantial testimony regarding the validity of his title to these lands, he lost them in the flurry of legal manipulation which erupted with the arrival of U.S. rule. No doubt the pain of this perceived injustice attended his resettlement Ui Mexico and augmented his sense that the californios, ever aware of their Hispanic heritage, would always be viewed as aUens in their own land.

Antonio Maria Osio's story of Mexican California is a treat in itself. It has been rendered even more valuable by the meticulous scholarship and Unguistic sküls of Professors Rose Marie Beebe and Robert M. Senkewicz, both of Santa Clara University. The translation is rendered in an enjoyable style which evokes the oral tradition behind much of Osio's information, as weU as his own epistolary format. It also integrates Spanish words and phrases in a natural flow which highlights the personal and cultural tone of the story. Professors Beebe and

Senkewicz have included many other helpful dimensions to this volume. There is an introduction which provides the reader with a brief biography of Antonio Maria Osio and the context in which he came to write his memoir. The introduction also includes a history of the Osio manuscript itself, which is a wonderful exercise in historiography and would serve as a useful case study for beginning historians. Sixty-three pages of notes, placed after Osio's history, add depth and specificity to the primary source account and provide the reader with background for Osio's narration. There are abundant illustrations, photographs, maps, a diagram of the Osio family tree, a fine bibliography, and a helpful index. Two other especially thoughtful inclusions are twenty-seven pages of biographical sketches which identify and introduce the various persons noted in Osio's story, and a glossary of Spanish words which remain in Spanish in the translated English text. Professors Beebe and Senkewicz have provided a great service in bringing Antonio Maria Osio's memoir to life with such rich supporting scholarship and literary style.

Michael Charles Neri

St. Patrick's Seminary
Menlo Park, California

Reviving the Ancient Faith: The Story of Churches of Christ in America. By Richard T. Hughes. (Grand Rapids, Michigan: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company. 1996. Pp. xiii, 448. $30.00 paperback.)

Richard Hughes, Distinguished Professor of Religion in Pepperdine University, spent fourteen years laboring on this book; he has spent even more time living with its subject matter. All of which gives the reader high expectations, and those expectations are not disappointed. With the sympathy and sensitivity of the insider, coupled with the perspective and objectivity of the historian, Hughes sets out to "explain the character of Churches of Christ" (p. Lx). And explanation, not mere narration, is the signal contribution of this important work.

To those who may think of Churches of Christ as somewhat at the edge of America's religious history, Hughes's language may surprise when he notes that he will deal principally with the "mainstream tradition of the movement" (p. 1). Some may have questioned whether the heritage of Alexander Campbell, Barton Stone, and Walter Scott had a "mainstream" within the legalistic, exclusivist, and often apocalyptic Churches of Christ, but the author carefully follows the center that somehow held.

Professor Hughes is self-consciously revisionist as he helpfully distinguishes between the emphasis of Campbell (rationalist, postmillennialist, and ecumenical) versus that of Stone (pietist, premillennialist, and sectarian). Tensions were built in from the beginning. The 1906 separation of Churches of Christ from Disciples is not a case, Hughes convincingly demonstrates, of a modern splinter group going its own way, but a continuation from the 1840's on of a primitivist

sectarian tradition that is closer to Stone than to CampbeU. AU of this is not easy to sort out, and the church members in both traditions have had their own difficulties with a history that never seemed as relevant as the effort to reproduce the primitive New Testament church.

Most historians recognize that the Disciples of Christ have long since acquired the status (or obloquy) of a denomination, but Hughes shows that Churches of Christ have also moved from sect to denomination—aU the while rejecting both terms. Fighting for their own uniqueness, these restorationists acquired a reputation for argumentation, if not beUigerence. Their arguments, however, were as often within the family as outside it. One cannot help noting that many of the leaders highlighted in this book are acclaimed as "author, preacher, and debater" (p. 347, but also see pp. 77, 151, 199 et passim). Many clergymen publish their sermons; these sectarians pubUsh their debates.

In his final chapter, Hughes confronts the troubling problems of gender and race, issues not yet fuUy resolved. In these and several other respects, Hughes concludes, "the monolithic nondenominational temple that Churches of Christ had undertaken to buUd almost two hundred years before was in serious disrepair" (p. 385). If aUowed, this book, rich in notes, in Ulustrations, and in scholarship, can greatly assist in the necessary rebuUding.

Edwin S. Gaustad

University of California, Riverside (Emeritus)

Religion and the Public Schools in 19th Century America: The Contribution of Orestes A. Brownson. By Edward J. Power. (New York: Paulist Press. 1996. Pp. v, 182. $13.95 paperback.)

Edward Power's monograph arrived at my office on the 120th anniversary of the death of Orestes A. Brownson (1803-1876). I opened the package with great anticipation, and I was not disappointed.

Power is an excellent writer who combines great analytical abUity and sound interpretations with smoothly flowing prose sprinkled with occasional colorful imagery. The cover needs special mention. The dominant image—the American flag attached to a pole capped with a crucifix—reflects Brownson's four-decade attempt to demonstrate that Catholicism was compatible with America. The image also shows that Brownson elevated the spiritual over the temporal. Professor Power very ably depicts Brownson's overriding theme throughout this work.

The movement for pubUc education—the common school movement—spread during the first half of the nineteenth century. But whUe reUgious homogeneity vanished as CathoUc immigration increased, the question of reUgious instruction in the public schools took center stage. A brand of non-sectarian Protestantism usually became the legislative and pedagogic solution. Brownson, a

journalist and a highly reUgious person who had firsthand experience in practically every reUgious denomination that existed in nineteenth-century New England, entered the fray and became Horace Mann's antagonist—even before Brownson converted to Catholicism in 1844.

One of the ironies of the Brownson educational legacy is that years later he was often accused by the CathoUc hierarchy of being supportive of pubUc schools. Power, however, clearly demonstrates that Brownson fought Horace Mann's attempts to centraUze curriculum decision making at the state level, to ban religion from the school house, and to strip poUtical education from the classroom. Power comes down on the side of Mann in this debate.

Power is at his best when he analyzes Brownson's views on authority and responsibiUty in educational matters. He does not go easy on Brownson and considers his theory of authority and responsibUity to be fragmented. Acknowledging the importance which Brownson placed on the role of the famUy as primary in the educational process, Power maintains that Brownson puts us "in a bed of phUosophical quicksand" in determining who has precedence in secular educational matters—church, family, or state.

In the final chapter on CathoUc schools, Power brings into perspective Brownson's views on education from elementary to higher education and seminary education. Power criticizes Brownson for his lack of common sense and tact in several articles written between 1854 and 1862. While one can see Brownson often writing "good news—bad news" articles, Power argues that Brownson's negative tirades and barbs outweighed his cajoling and supportive remarks and often left his reading audience and the hierarchy seething in anger and dismay.

Brownson's more conservative writings foUowmg the CivU War do not receive much attention from Power. These final articles may have seemed too Utile, too late to restore his name in Catholic circles.

Power tells us that he is not to be counted among the revisionist educational historians. He does allude to the "Cubberley" thesis, but I find him more influenced by Lawrence J. Cremin. Power devotes an entire chapter to Brownson's role as a journalist, and certainly acknowledges the significant role of the famUy, the church, adult societies, and the press.

Readers wUl find Power's work highly readable and remarkably contemporary in its discussion of the role of the famUy and the teaching of values in public schools today.

James M. McDonnell

Canisius College
Buffalo, New York

Catholic Parish Life on Florida's West Coast, 1860-1968. By Michael J. McNaUy. (St. Petersburg: CathoUc Media Ministries, Inc., The CathoUc Diocese of St. Petersburg. 1996. Pp. xix, 503. Paperback.)

Born of Spanish colonial struggle, pockmarked by virulent anticlerical strife, and punctuated by explosive growth, the Catholic Church along Florida's southwest coast has long awaited its historian. In Catholic Parish Life on Florida's West Coast, 1860-1968, Michael J. McNaIly offers the region's first comprehensive history of CathoUcism.

The task of writing a history of parish life along the gulf region stretching from Naples to Tampa Bay is daunting. McNaUy possesses impeccable credentials for the task. A professor of history at St. Charles Borromeo Seminary, he enjoyed fuU access to diocesan materials and church archives. Moreover, McNaUy has consulted a wide variety of secondary sources, notably new studies which attempt to place the Church in broader perspective.

In his conclusion, McNaUy notes, "What characterizes parish life on the West Coast from I860 to 1968 is change, from a rural Southern backwater frontier community to a sprawling metropoUtan mecca, in just over 100 years" (p. 399)· Examined through four separate time periods and organized around five themes (clergy, piety, organization, education, and ethnicity), Catholic Parish Life presents an extraordinary amount of material, detaU, and analysis. Readers and researchers wiU find names and deeds of pioneering priests, founding dates for parish churches and schools, and tables listing baptisms, marriages, and school enrollment. Significantly McNaUy does a splendid job in providing background, borrowing UberaUy from the proliferation of studies examining Florida, especiaUy Tampa Bay. His fascinating discussion of African-American and Afro-Cuban CathoUc schools and reUgious practices invites future inquiry.

WhUe Catholic Parish Life on Florida's West Coast breaks new ground, the work is marred by several troubling areas. The copious endnotes make no sense; the endnotes do not match the chapters. The documentation will confuse and exasperate readers attempting to determine any sense of order. This reviewer takes sharp issue with McNaUy's interpretation of CathoUcism among Tampa's Ybor City immigrants. The author ignores the weighty evidence of anticlericaUsm engendered by Spanish and ItaUan language newspapers and labor-mutual aid society sources, while arguing that the Catholic Church in Ybor City triumphed in spite of the opposition. This reviewer contends that Italian, Cuban, and Spanish immigrants ("Latin" in the vernacular) manifested an anticlericalism seldom matched in the United States. When viewed against the competing institutions of labor unions and mutual aid societies, the CathoUc church in Ybor City faUed miserably Future historians wUl find fruitful inquiry into these issues.

OveraU, McNally's Catholic Parish Life on Florida's West Coast, 1860-1968, is an impressively researched book that wUl become the standard work on the subject for many generations.

Gary R. Mormino

University of South Florida

The Search for Thomas E Ward, Teacher of Frederick Delias. By Don C. GUlespie. (GainesvUle: University Press of Florida. 1996. Pp. xvi, 180. $29.95.)

Thomas Ward (1856-1912) was buried in a pauper's unmarked grave in Houston's Holy Cross Cemetery. Ward was a professional musician, a music teacher, and a Catholic. But none of his musical compositions were preserved; only one verifiable photograph of him exists; only four of his letters are extant; his extensive library has vanished; aU correspondence between him and his famous student, Frederick DeUus, was destroyed. Why write and publish a biography about a man in historical oblivion? Moreover, GUlespie, a New York musicologist, an editor of the scores of modern composers, a writer for scholarly musical journals, is an unlikely biographer of Ward since his is neither an historian nor a Catholic, but his interest in the renowned Delius led him to the obscure Ward.

GiUespie teUs two stories: the first, as his title implies, is about his dogged and patient pursuit for documentation about Ward; the second, is about Ward himself, a man unremembered, but whose life of quiet dignity touched others. GUlespie makes his search for Ward an integral part of the narrative. Some may find this self-referential detective tale distracting; the author's research difficulties become as important as Ward himself. Others may find some of GiUespie's conjectures about Ward, when evidence is lacking, disconcerting; yet one cannot but admire the author's love for his subject and his creative persistent research techniques over a ten-year period.

Nevertheless, Gillespie's work is valuable for several reasons. His thesis is that Ward had an important formative influence upon Delius by imparting to him both disciplined work habits and counterpoint techniques during their association in 1884 at Solano Grove (on the St. John's River near St. Augustine, Florida). Moreover, the Southern black music which Delius heard at Solano Grove influenced DeUus' Appalachia. Although a portrait of the life of a struggling peripatetic musician, the work is not just for musicologists. Ward's Ufe is a window for viewing Catholic life in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries in New York City, Florida, Louisiana, and Texas. Ward's itinerancy reveals for us CathoUc orphanage Ufe, the importance of parish liturgical music at the turn of the century, the place of CathoUcism in several emerging Southern urban centers, Benedictinism on the frontier (Ward was a monk for six years at St. Leo's Monastery in Florida), and the impact of disease (especially yeUow fever and tu-

berculosis) on individuals and communities of the period. Numerous Ulustrations and photographs enhance the reader's comprehension of the subject.

In his epüogue GUlespie muses on the comparison between the successful, famous, yet blasphemous, Delius and the obscure, devout Ward. Who is successful, who is great, who is worth writing about? The author's reflections led me to a further one. This work, whose research and pubUcation was supported by the DeUus Trust (London), would have never seen the Ught of day without such patronage, a fact which caused me to ponder the role of foundations in scholarly research and publication, but that is another book and another review.

Michael J. McNally

St. Charles Borromeo Seminary
Overbrook, Philadelphia

Churches, Communities and Children: Italian Immigrants in the Archdiocese of New York, 1880-1945. By Mary EUzabeth Brown. (Staten Island, New York: Center for Migration Studies. 1995. Pp. vi, 219. Paperback.)

ItaUan mass migration to the United States began in earnest during the decade foUowing the Risorgimento and the poUtical unification of the ItaUan Peninsula. General poUtical confusion, plummeting economy, increased taxation, a burgeoning mUitary estabUshment and extended mandatory service, as weU as a government that encouraged and, in some instances, forced emigration, aU contributed to the massive movement of the poor from the various provinces, cities, and towns of Italy to the Americas from the 1880's to the first decades of the present century.

New York City, even then the symbol of American economic and poUtical prosperity, became the goal and dreamed-for haven for mUUons of the dispossessed, especiaUy after the opening of EUis Island. The largest single religious group represented during these years among the arriving immigrants was Roman CathoUc, at least in name; the largest single national group among these was the ItaUan. They were also the neediest, "the most pitiable," as Archbishop Corrigan once described them, with no single language, only various dialects, no national identity, only loyalty to the local town or province of birth, and a strong mutual disdain between those haUing from Northern and Southern Italy. Many were mere slave labor, indentured to "padroni" who had paid their passage to America in return for years of servitude.

The Archdiocese of New York found itself host to hundreds of thousands of newly arrived Roman Catholics, among whom were the Italians, most in need of every imaginable form of assistance, not least of which was the spiritual guidance and comfort of their Church. Mary EUzabeth Brown's book describes the Church's response and pastoral plan for the Italians living within the Archdiocese of New York from 1880 until the eve of Vatican CouncU II.

Beginning with the administration of John Cardinal McCloskey during which time the number of Italian immigrants arriving in New York began to rise, Brown continues in detail her study through 1945, during the rule of Francis Cardinal Spellman. She then paints a general view of the Italians up until the council. She traces the life of Italian Catholics in New York and the Church's response to them and their needs throughout these years.

Brown studies aspects of the archdiocesan pastoral efforts in New York, beginning with Corrigan's initiative in bringing religious congregations to the City to work with the Italians, and the establishment of national parishes for Italians, as for other Catholic immigrant groups in response to the needs of these people. Schools, both industrial and parish elementary, were likewise founded, as well as orphanages, especially with the co-operation of Mother Cabrini and her Missionary Sisters of Charity. Here, and during the administration of John Cardinal Farley in 1903, the Church in New York attempted to meet the spiritual needs of the Italians and assist them in becoming part of America, all the while maintaining their Catholic faith. By the Spellman years, not only had the sons and daughters of the Italian immigrants become stronger in their Catholic faith and support of the Church, but they and their children had also developed an identity as Americans and were called upon to defend their adopted country during the years of the First and Second World Wars and the Cold War. Her final chapter treats of the third generation and their life and relationship with the Church up until Vatican Council II, as full members of American society and Church.

As Brown shows, both Italian immigrant and Church took some time to adapt to each other in America. Nevertheless, without the efforts of the Church, the life and history of the Italian immigrants and their families in New York City would have been radically different.

Churches, Communities and Children is a valuable work, based primarily on research employing the archival collections of the Archdiocese of New York and the Center for Migration Studies, the holdings of the New York Province of the Society of Jesus and those of the Province of the Immaculate Conception of the Order of Friars Minor, as well as the sacramental records of various parishes and a host of secondary sources. While Dr. Brown's book occasionally touches on the "trendy," sometimes forcing the 1990's views or interpretation into the period of her study, the work is interesting and provides a detailed study of aspects of the socio-religious world of the Italian immigrants and their subsequent generations in the changing American world and Church of New York.

Stephen M. DiGiovanni

St. John Fisher Seminary Residence
Stamford, Connecticut

Diary of a Frontier Bishop: The Journals of Théophile Meerschaert. Edited and annotated by James D. White. (Tulsa, Oklahoma: The Sarto Press. 1994; third printing, 1996. Pp. xx, 638. $32.50 paperback.)

When Belgian-born TheophUe Meerschaert was named a titular bishop and Vicar Apostolic of Indian Territory in 1891, he began a personal diary. He did so primarily because the bishop under whom he had trained had also kept a journal. For the next thirty-four years, he continued to jot notes Ln his ordo for transcription at a later time. In the diary, Meerschaert recorded his daily life as the first resident bishop in Indian Territory and then after 1905 as the first bishop of Oklahoma. When this reviewer first read the original manuscript diary over two decades ago, the personaUty of its author leapt from the pages. This was in spite of the sometimes impossible task of deciphering the hastUy written journal with its idiosyncratic abbreviations, punctuation, and syntax. The thought came to mind that a scholarly and professionally edited diary would remove this impediment and reveal even more of Meerschaert's missionary temperament. When James D. White edited and annotated the full text of the diary, he succeeded admirably in doing just this.

The picture of Meerschaert that emerges is that of a down-to-earth, matter-of-fact man. WhUe he was devoted to buUding his church despite few resources and vast distances, he was also intensely loyal to his friends and family. He was something of a "bean counter" as he numbered each confirmation by date and place and dutifuUy recorded the mUes between towns. And his fascination with rituals and ceremonies surfaces as does his constant efforts to recruit priests for his far-flung congregations. The diary is almost totaUy devoid of any mention outside of his trips and ceremonial duties within and outside of Oklahoma. This leads White to conclude, "In spite of his wide travels, Meerschaert was at heart an insular man."

This clear image of Meerschaert would not have appeared had it not been for White's work. He has provided a brief essay on the Ufe of Meerschaert which gives the context for the dairy. Further, in the finest tradition of historical editing, his copious footnotes explain the people and places mentioned in the journal. When White goes beyond identification and provides background information and comments on Meerschaert's activities, the footnotes also serve as a history of the Catholic Church in Oklahoma during Meerschaert's episcopacy. But maybe White's greatest contribution is his successful editing. He has unraveled the penmanship, corrected spellings, standardized punctuation, and provided full names. In this effort, White has not only preserved the original flavor of Meerschaert's manuscript but has in many ways enhanced it. Thus he has presented the reader with a text that reveals the facets of the man who laid the foundation for the Catholic Church in the Sooner State.

Thomas Elton Brown

National Archives and Records Administration
College Park, Maryland

The Jesuit Mission to the Lakota Sioux: Pastoral Theology and Ministry, 1886-1945. By Ross Alexander Enochs. (Kansas City, Missouri: Sheed and Ward. 1996. Pp. x, 178. $12.95 paperback.)

Jesuit priests, building on the work of earUer missionaries, began missions to the Lakotas (Holy Rosary at Pine Ridge Reservation and St. Francis at Rosebud) in 1886.They had a remarkably successful pastoral ministry among these Indians during the six decades covered by this smaU but valuable book.

The book has a clear purpose: to refute the judgments made by other authors that the Jesuits viewed the native Lakota reUgion as heathenism dominated by the devU and that Lakotas could not participate in Indian ceremonies and stül be Catholic. On the contrary, Ross Enochs says, "The Jesuits accepted many aspects of Lakota culture and participated in several Lakota rituals and customs throughout this time among the Lakotas. Furthermore . . . [they] sought to preserve those aspects of Lakota culture and religion that they beüeved were good, and attempted to aboUsh only those practices and beliefs that they thought were in conflict with either the Catholic faith or the Lakotas' well-being" (p. viU).

To make his point, Enochs discusses at some length the educational program of the Jesuits, the popular Catholic Sioux Congresses that flourished in this period, the extensive use of Lakota catechists (including the famous Black Elk), and the promotion of Lakota language and legends. He provides briefer notices of other missionary adaptations—in funeral rituals, art, processions, dances and games, use of the calumet or sacred pipe, and adoption and naming ceremonies.These early Jesuits were able to build Catholic faith and ceremonies on Indian foundations because they learned the Indians' language and to a large extent shared their life.

Enochs does not fail to note, however, the missionaries' strong condemnation of the medicine men and of polygamy and easy divorce and their fight against the aboriginal sun dance and peyote and ghost dance religions.This opposition to significant Indian ways weakens somewhat the book's major theme, but the author is convincing in his assertions that those Indians who converted to Christianity did so willingly and that conversion was not forced upon them.

Basing his study on exhaustive research in missionary records and on interviews with Indians and with missionaries, Enochs has produced not so much a critical evaluation of the missionary endeavor as a sympathetic descriptive account of how the Jesuits related to the Lakotas and of the Lakotas' positive response.

Enochs ends his story in 1945, a point at which he sees major changes on the reservations resulting from World War II, the strong secularization in the dominant American culture surrounding them, and changes in Catholic mission theory.

The book is simply an unrevised doctoral dissertation Ln pubUshed form. That is unfortunate, for careful revision and editing would have greatly strengthened the presentation and eliminated irritating elements of dissertation style.

Francis Paul Prucha, SJ.

Marquette University

The Ecumenical Orthodoxy of Charles Augustus Briggs, 1841-1913- By Richard L. Christensen. (Lewiston, New York: MeUen University Press. 1995. Pp. vU, 236. $89.95.)

At a party given in 1907 to honor the publication of Charles Briggs's Church Unity, WUliam Reed Huntington—the moving spirit behind the ecumenical efforts of turn-of-the-century Episcopalians—toasted his friend Briggs for the "softeness of his heart and the hardness of his head." (No, as Anna Russell would say, I'm not making this up.) A pretty shrewd judge of character, Huntington "got it" just about right in summing up the personaUty of the man more distrusted by evangeUcal conservatives and more lionized by theological Uberals than almost any other in GUded-Age America. Indeed, one might argue that the various "heresy trials" that Briggs underwent between 1891 and 1893 over his biblical theories—trials that represented a defining moment in the history of American religion in a way analogous to the Salem Witch Trials of the seventeenth century and the "Monkey Trial" of 1925—were due in no smaU measure to Brigg's warm-hearted but bellicose personaUty.

Richard Christensen has published a finely crafted and engaging study of this complex and crucial figure who helped define the battle lines between the Fundamentalists and modernists of our own century. It is based on the dissertation he wrote at the Union Theological Seminary in Virginia. Christensen argues that previous studies of Briggs—studies that portrayed Briggs variously as being primarily a bibUcal scholar, an ecclesiastical politician, and an advocate of historical criticism—have all helped to uncover important strands of the life of this conflicted scholar, but have paid insufficient attention to what Briggs himself conceived to be the defining work of his life: the cause of Christian unity. Indeed, Christensen notes that whUe the beginnings of the modern ecumenical movement are well documented, the place of scholars like Briggs who contributed in significant ways to its emergence has been largely ignored. Thus, the author convincingly presents Briggs as a scholar who "spent his life in pursuit of the dream of church union, laboring tirelessly for his vision of a cathoUc unity," and attempts to show "how his work foreshadowed the greater ecumenical accord of the middle and later twentieth century."

Christensen argues that Briggs's famous biblical works like the International Critical Commentary (edited with S. R. Driver and A. Plummer), his historical studies, and his efforts at creedal reform that eventuated in his famous heresy trial and suspension from the Presbyterian ministry, can aU be most fruitfully

understood as various manifestations of his ecumenical dream. Christensen states that Briggs beUeved "that free inquiry, comparative historical research, and honest debate would bring about a synthesis of beUef and practice out of the variety of expressions of the faith. Historical critical study . . . would bring consensus, and differences between church bodies would eventuaUy be reconcUed in a comprehensiveness (one of Briggs's favorite words) which aUowed for a variety of temperaments." Of particular interest to CathoUc biblical scholars and historians of Modernism, Christensen documents Briggs's central role (Ln league with Baron von Hügel) in attempting to deflect the fuU brunt of the papal condemnation of critical biblical and historical scholarship in Pascendi and Lamentabili.

Christensen offers students of the modern ecumenical movement, as weU as students of GUded Age reUgion, a smart new "read" on one of the most famous figures of the era. Christensen deftly makes comprehensible one of the most complex scholars in the history of American reUgion.

Mark S. Massa, SJ.

Fordham University

John LaFarge and the Limits of Catholic Interracialism, 1911-1963- By David W Southern. (Baton Rouge: Louisiana State University Press. 1996. Pp. xxüi, 385. $45.00.)

As Professor David Southern mentions in his preface, Father John LaFarge, SJ., came to his attention while Southern was doing research on the influence of Gunnar Myrdal's An American Dilemma. Additional research on LaFarge left Southern wondering why no scholarly book had been written on this pioneer Catholic interracialist. Given Southern's interest in race issues, he hopes this work wiU help in the larger effort to move CathoUc history from the margins of American history and integrate it with American history. This thoroughly researched book succeeds both in analyzing LaFarge's successes and faUures and in comparing LaFarge's interracial work to the larger civU rights movement.

The first three chapters estabUsh the context for understanding this son of the famous nineteenth-century artist. Professor Southern argues that from the aristocratic famUy background, the Jesuit formation and education, and the prevaUing racial attitudes of church and society what emerged was a priest who could be described as paternalistic, conservative, defensive, overly prudent, cautious, and ambivalent about African-American culture. From this combination of experiences, John LaFarge developed a gradual, long-term approach to racial issues.

The next five chapters cover the period from LaFarge's joining the staff of America in 1926 until 1941. The important issues discussed are: interraciaUsm versus black protest, LaFarge's relationship with Victor and Constance Daniel,

the estabUshment of the CathoUc Interracial Council of New York and the interracial movement, and LaFarge's opposition to communism, fascism, and racism. Two cases which receive great attention are LaFarge's relationship with the Federated Colored Catholics (FCC) and the closing of the Cardinal Gibbons Institute in southern Maryland. Professor Southern argues that John LaFarge steered the FCC away from the mission of its founder, Dr. Thomas Wyatt Turner, as a CathoUc African-American protest organization toward the less confrontational interracial approach. The closing of the Cardinal Gibbons Institute involved a protracted battle with the principal and assistant principal of the school, Victor and Constance Daniel. From these two cases, LaFarge's reputation emerges battered and stained.

In the remaining biographical chapters, Professor Southern examines LaFarge's and the Catholic interracial movement's responses to the race question through the "hot" and "cold" wars, the civü rights movement in the pre- and post-Brown decision era, and the final years of John LaFarge's Ufe. The final two chapters of the book provide a summary about John LaFarge's interracial work within American CathoUcism and a postscript on black CathoUcism.

Professor Southern has written a very interesting and intriguing book which examines not only the life of a pioneer Catholic interraciaUst but also examines in a thorough manner the CathoUc efforts to address the American dUemnia. He poses some very provocative questions and offers historical interpretations which deserve further discussion and study. His concluding Unes Ui the summation of LaFarge jump off the page: "StUl, for roughly three decades LaFarge was the primary spokesman for the American CathoUc church on black-white relations. This fact alone speaks volumes about the church's past record in facing up to the American dUemma" (p. 375).

Martin Zielinski

Mundelein Seminary

Thank You, St. Jude: Women's Devotion to the Patron Saint of Hopeless Causes. By Robert A. Orsi. (New Haven: Yale University Press. 1996. Pp. xxiU, 303. $30.00.)

St. Jude was for me, as a Protestant chUd in a heavily CathoUc neighborhood, the single most powerful symbol of CathoUcism's fundamental otherness. It was the eroticism of the standard Jude image that bothered me most, I think—and perhaps the effeminate overtones that were there as weU. A largely unconscious class snobbery was probably also at work: the image of Jude is somehow mixed up in my mind with memories of the long-defunct Detroit Times, a Hearst paper which "educated" people simply didn't read. "Thank you, St. Jude" notices in the paper's classified section are a likely source of the association. More basic to the link, however, was the aUenness of the world to which both

the Times and the notices belonged—a world, to my suburban eyes, of unimaginable ignorance and impossibly narrow horizons.

St. Jude is not so great a problem for my adult self, or at least for my adult scholarly self. I've come to appreciate the rich possibLUties attendant on the study of Catholic devotionaUsm. StUl, doubts and residual prejudice linger, especiaUy with regard to the implications of devotionaUsm for a mostly female clientele. So I was more than ripe for Robert Orsi's masterful analysis of the American cult of St. Jude. Orsi explores the ambiguous meaning of the Jude devotion for the women who were his principal petitioners, uncovering both its regressive and empowering aspects. Jude was at once a figure intended to discipline women by reconciling them to lives of submission and pain, and a means by which they found voices of their own and space in which to act on their desires.

The Jude devotion in America is of recent origin: the first (and, as it happens, the pre-eminent) shrine was estabUshed at a South Chicago church in 1929The Depression seems to have been instrumental in the cult's swift rise to popularity, and not only because of Jude's role as the patron of hopeless causes. Jude, as Orsi notes, was peculiarly without national or ethnic associations. As such he was an evocative figure for CathoUcs just emerging from their various "ethnic enclaves" to confront a disaster that was national in scope—something that was even truer of the war that was soon to foUow. Women, Orsi argues, were especially vulnerable to the dislocations of this turbulent time. Better educated on average than their brothers, they were more likely to find jobs outside the ethnic neighborhood and consequently more likely to marry outside the group. At the same time, they remained responsible as daughters for the care of aging parents and for maintaining affectional ties across generations whose expectations and experiences often differed widely. Moving constantly between two worlds and burdened by guilt and anxiety these "immigrant daughters" were natural clients for a saint who also seemed to straddle boundaries.

So it was mostly women who came to Jude, though they frequently did this on behalf of men. Orsi plumbs their concerns in part by analyzing the letters published since 1935 in periodicals issued by the Chicago shrine. He has interviewed various of Jude's clients as well, and solicited letters from others. Orsi makes no pretense to a scientific sample, which is hardly surprising. But the richness of his material and the sensitivity of his analysis more than compensate for the inevitable lack of what a sociologist would call methodological rigor. Few of us social historians escape the problem; there is more imagination than system in most of what we do.

Women petitioned Jude in times of iUness—their own and others'—and in times of famUy crisis. Males were often a cause of the hopelessness that animated prayer to Jude: husbands and fathers drank to excess, were out of work for months at a time, were prone to emotional withdrawal.The erotic but mUdly effeminate image of the saint that so troubled me in childhood doubtless re-

fleets the tensions thus generated: women, Orsi teUs us, imagined Jude as a male figure uniquely worthy of trust and capable of an almost maternal tenderness. "With Jude's eyes on them," as Orsi writes,"women have felt truly seen and recognized—and loved and held in recognition" (p. 98). There was certainly a regressive side to this imagining: engaging Jude as an idealized male could be an evasion of reality and the action needed to transform it. Some of Orsi's sources speak squarely Ln this mode. But Jude's cUents were capable of using this relationship to achieve an enhanced sense of agency. They learned to speak about hopelessness, despite a culture which enjoined women to süent suffering, and through their speaking were enabled to probe their experience and ultimately act Ui new ways.

Jude, then, was a mediating figure in more than one sense. He bridged the often conflicting worlds in which his clients moved, and supported his cUents against those mostly male authorities—clergy and physicians pre-eminent among them—who chaUenged the legitimacy of their hopes and desires. He does this for fewer women today, and especiaUy fewer young women, than was the case forty years ago. But Jude is stiU an important figure for a portion of present-day CathoUcs, and surely an essential one for understanding the recent CathoUc past. Robert Orsi's splendid book, which is far more complex and subtle in its argument than a brief review can suggest, helps to open that recent past to our understanding and, ultimately, our appreciation.

Leslie Woodcock Tentler

University ofMichigan-Dearborn

Sin and Censorship: The Catholic Church and the Motion Picture Industry. By Frank Walsh. (New Haven: Yale University Press. 1996. Pp.xi, 394. $35.00.)

If the Academy of Motion Picture Arts and Sciences had a category for the "best book" of the year, one of the chief contenders for the 1996 award would surely be this treatise by a professor of history in the University of Massachusetts. It accurately and yet candidly teUs the story of how the Catholic Church became "the most successful pressure group in the history of the movies and why it was eventuaUy forced to relinquish its power."

The saga of the Church's role Ln motion pictures began with a decision to launch a campaign during World War I against government-sponsored movies aimed at preventing the spread of venereal diseases among the mUitary. Then, beginning in 1934, with the establishment of the Legion of Decency, the Church became a major and effective influence in determining both what Americans saw and did not see on the screen during HoUywood's "golden age."

In fourteen carefully documented chapters, the author outlines the work of the Legion as it evolved over the years. He explains how pressures were exerted to force Gypsy Rose Lee to change her screen name, to alter a dance sequence

in Oklahoma, to eliminate infidelity in Two-Faced Woman, to block distribution of Birth of a Baby, and to compel Howard Hughes to make 147 cuts in The Outlaw. Between 1934 and 1980, the Legion and/or the National Catholic Office for Motion Pictures classified no fewer than 16,521 films. No group then or since exerted a greater presence on the Hollywood scene.

The Walsh study traces not only the origins of the Church's involvement and success with motion pictures, but also its decline. Recognizing that the Legion was starting to lose touch with a new generation of better-educated Catholics in the post-Vatican Council II days, ecclesial leaders first liberalized the Legion's classification system and, in 1965, changed its name to the National Office for Motion Pictures. But it was too late. Times had changed and the Church eventually terminated its efforts to control the type of films that Hollywood produced by closing down the NCOMP, much to the dismay of many inside and outside the Catholic fold. Whether it was a wise decision remains a moot question.

There were and are those who want to restore the Legion of Decency as it had existed in its earlier years. Certain fundamentalist Protestants have adopted many of the time-proven policies of the Legion of Decency, such as letter writing campaigns, decency oaths, film morality ratings, boycotts, and picketing.

Walsh points out that the head of the Christian Film and Television Commission, together with other contemporary church leaders, attribute Hollywood's "moral collapse" to the Legion's demise. Some even feel that the dramatic increase in "objectionable films" in the past two decades stems not so much from Hollywood turning its back on religion as from religious groups like the Legion of Decency turning their backs on Hollywood. Walsh does not place much credence in that claim because he feels that "sometime the cure can be worse than the disease."

The author concludes his fascinating study by commenting on Cardinal Roger Mahony's pastoral letter of 1994 in which the Archbishop of Los Angeles declares that moviegoers must decide what to see "in the solitude of (their) own well-formed consciences." In the final analysis, "the viewing public gets the kind of motion pictures it will support."

Two minor errors should be corrected in future editions: Father "Paul" Sullivan is really "Patrick" Sullivan (p. x) and Msgr. John J. Devlin, a founder of the Legion of Decency, was pastor of Saint Victor's Church in West Hollywood, not Saint Vincent's (p. 217).

Francis J. Weber

Archival Center of the Archdiocese of Los Angeles

Modern American Religion Nolxxme 3: Under God, Indivisible, 1941-1960. By Martin E. Marty. (Chicago: University of Chicago Press. 1996. Pp. xii, 548. $34.95.)

At five-year intervals Martin Marty has presented us with his nuanced understanding of reUgion in America in the twentieth century. Taking roughly two decades at a time, he has now Ui three volumes moved to the opening of the 1960's. We can confidently expect to see Volume 4 appear on schedule in 2001, at which point the prolific University of Chicago professor wUl have retired and the twentieth century itself wUl be history.

Each volume in this series has turned out to be longer than its predecessor, a witness chiefly to the growing complexity of the age. Indeed, one wonders at Marty's abUity to find a handle for what must often seem like a bathtub of warm jeUo. But organize and synthesize he does, to the boundless benefit of the reader. One organizing principle that helps in the 1940's and 1950's is the centripetal tendencies manifest: coming together in the large-scale effort of World War II, coming together in the heady optimism of the ecumenical movement, and coming together in cold-war opposition to communism and Protestant opposition to (or at least wariness regarding) Roman Catholicism. Of course, not aU is sweetness and light, especiaUy in matters of ethnicity, race, and gender, but these issues wUl be explored in greater depth in Volume 4 as centrifugal forces take over.

Marty here writes neither social nor inteUectual history, but "cultural history" (p. 8). This raises the question of whether it is high culture or popular culture that one finds; Marty clearly intends that it be both. He recognizes, however, that by the nature of this kind of history he will necessarily concentrate on the "articulated element of the populace" (p. 10). This wiU bring him repeatedly to the Niebuhr brothers but also to BUly Graham, to Paul Tillich and Walter Ong, but also to Martin Luther King and Paul Blanshard. This is not a history of private devotional reUgion, nor is it history from "the bottom up." It is a history of what aroused the pubUc, made the news, and left a clear imprint on the times, at the time.

Professor Marty approaches the past with respect and on its own terms. He deUberately rejects the unfair advantage that hindsight brings, even as he disdains the current pattern of proving how much brighter we are than were the benighted folks who preceded us. He recognizes limits and distortions and reckless rhetoric, but he knows that these can be found in every time, including our own. The 1940's and 1950's deserve to be evaluated in terms of the presuppositions and "received wisdom" of their own day.

WlU Herberg's widely popular Protestant-Catholic-Jew, pubUshed Ui 1955, provides a kind of frame for this volume. Marty discusses most issues and events in terms of the three reUgious perspectives, adding to that trinity, however, much attention to ethnicity and race. He does not have a great deal to say about gender here, because in this period the public debate was carried on almost ex-

clusively by men. Women had few outlets for the expression of their views and fewer leadership roles. "While some women had voices in reUgious journalism, only one or two were tenured in theological schools, and not many taught in religious studies departments, even Ui women's colleges" (p. 232).

With the election of John F. Kennedy in 1960, the era of Protestant hegemony may be said to have ended. Culture became plural and one nation "indivisible" turned into a coUection of interests and factions, infinitely divisible.

Edwin S. Gaustad

University of California, Riverside (Emeritus)

Being Right: Conservative Catholics in America. Edited by Mary Jo Weaver and R. Scott Appleby. (Bloomington: Indiana University Press. 1995. Pp. xiv, 352. $18.95.)

After years of relative neglect, conservative American CathoUcs are starting to attract attention from scholars. First, Patrick AUtt's American Catholics and Conservative Politics, 1950-1985, appeared In 1993· Now Weaver and Appleby have produced this volume. Whüe AUitt focused on the political ideas of a smaU number of influential CathoUcs—most of whom had ties to the National Review—Weaver and Appleby examine a variety of theologicaUy conservative organizations that have emerged in the aftermath of Vatican CouncU II. Since the groups profiled are conservative reUgiously their members are generaUy less interested in secular politics than AUitt's subjects. They are much more concerned with liturgical rubrics, dissent in Catholic institutions, orthodox catechesis, and related issues.

Weaver and Appleby's volume is an eclectic coUection of essays from both scholars and conservative activists. This structure makes the work uneven at times, but does not weaken its overaU appeal. The editors offer their rationale in the preface. After noting their own Uberai sympathies, Weaver and Appleby explain that they have tried to fashion a book that combines "insider" and "outsider" perspectives. WhUe some conservatives were suspicious of the project, four agreed to contribute insider essays: James Sullivan of Catholics United for the Faith (CUF); George Weigel, a neoconservative scholar; James Hitchcock, a history professor in St. Louis University; and Helen Hitchcock, foundress of Women for Faith and FamUy (WFF). The outsider accounts are provided by Weaver and three other academics: Sandra Zimdar-Swartz, a reUgious studies professor in the University of Kansas; WiUiam Dinges, a reUgion professor in the Catholic University of America; and Michael Cuneo, a sociology professor in Fordham University.

To provide some context for the reader, four background essays precede the insider and outsider accounts. Father Joseph Komonchak, a theologian in the Catholic University of America, discusses Vatican Council II and notes that many

conservatives quickly became convinced that progressives were foisting unauthorized Uturgical and catechetical changes on the laity. WhUe conservatives wanted Church leaders to abide strictly by the conciUar texts, Uberals claimed the "spirit ofVatican ?" as their guide. Appleby foUows with a provocative essay on Americanism. WhUe the Americanist movement was formaUy condemned Ui 1899 by Pope Leo XIII, Appleby argues that most CathoUcs—Uberals and conservatives alike—have adopted a form of Americanism. Most now accept Father John Courtney Murray's contention that the American proposition is compatible with CathoUcism. The other key background question discussed is Neo-Scholasticism, which is deftly handled by Father Benedict Ashley, O.P , a leading Thomist. WhUe conceding that Thomism was regnant in CathoUc institutions before Vatican CouncU II, Ashley points out that its proponents were divided into three camps: AristoteUans, existentiaUsts, and transcendentaUsts. As the 1960's progressed, Thomism lost favor in many places. Some phUosophers and theologians abandoned it altogether, whUe others like Fathers Richard McCormick, S.J., and Charles Curran took it in new and controversial directions. McCormick and Curran claimed that transcendental Thomism was the springboard for their "proportionaUst" moral theology, which many conservatives felt offered equivocal teaching on a host of issues including abortion, euthanasia, and homosexual activity.

The introductory section ends with an essay on Hispanic CathoUcs by Father AUan Deck, SJ. Although interesting in places, Deck's is the one contribution which has little relevance to the main themes of the book. Why the editors chose to Include it is unclear.

James SuUivan's insider essay offers a balanced overview of CUF, which he has served as vice-president. CUF was founded in I968 amidst the controversy over Humanae Vitae. SuUivan admits that CUF's leadership has repeatedly found it necessary to try to distance the group from ultraconservatives.

James Hitchcock and his wife each provide informative pieces on fledgling conservative groups that they have helped to estabUsh. James Hitchcock describes the FeUowship of CathoUc Scholars (FCS), which was created in 1977 to provide a forum for orthodox Catholic academics. The FCS founders beUeved that the CathoUc Theological Society of America had become so overwhelmingly Uberai that an alternative organization was urgently needed. In the intervening years, the group has grown Ln size and influence and now regularly attracts bishops and archbishops to its annual meetings.

Helen Hitchcock founded her group in 1984 because she wanted the bishops—who were working on a pastoral on women—to know that not aU CathoUc women were feminists. Hitchcock and the WFF closely studied the various drafts of the pastoral and repeatedly urged the bishops to take a critical view of feminism.The pastoral was finaUy tabled in 1992 when it became clear that the bishops were so deeply divided on the subject that they would not be able to agree upon any substantive document. Since the pastoral's demise, the WFF has continued to battle feminism. Of late, it has been concerned with

thwarting feminists' efforts to modify the language of the Scriptures and the Uturgy.

George Weigel's essay is the only insider account that does not concentrate on an organization. Instead, he offers an apologia for CathoUc neoconservatism, a movement that he, Michael Novak, and Father Richard Neuhaus have been championing since the early 1980's. Weigel is the sort of conservative whose views support Appleby's claims about Americanism. He beUeves neoconservatives are carrying on John Courtney Murray's work. Like Murray, Weigel sees much to admire in America and—unlike some conservatives—refuses to view the United States "as an Ul-founded experiment" (p. 140). At the same time, he is concerned about the direction America seems to be taking and hopes that CathoUcs will work with other beUevers in battling against secularism.

The four outsider essays offer an interesting complement to the activists' pieces. Each is carefuUy researched and generaUy fair to its subjects. Every once in a whUe, however, the authors adopt mUdly derisive tones, which remind the reader that some distance separates these authors from their subjects. Sandra Zimdar-Swartz chronicles the faU and subsequent rise of Marian piety in the contemporary Church. WhUe traditional Marian practices like the rosary dedined in popularity in the wake of Vatican CouncU II, by the 1980's numerous apparitions of the Virgin Mary were being reported, most notably in Medjugorje. These apparitions, which have appealed especiaUy to charismatics, have led to a renewed interest in Marian devotions and Mariology. Cuneo first discusses the National Right to Life Committee, which was founded Ui 1967 by the bishops but subsequently split from them and has tried ever since to offer a reasoned, secular case against abortion. He notes that by the early 1980's, two groups with more confrontational attitudes had emerged: the American Life Lobby and Human Life International. By the mid-1980's a number of proUfers had radicaUzed further and turned to civil disobedience.

The other two outsider essays were not as valuable to this reader. William Dinges' piece on Lefebvrists is intriguing but it is not clear that they have much in common with the other Catholics profiled in this volume who pride themselves on their fidelity to the Pope. Mary Jo Weaver surveyed four "alternative" Catholic coUeges: Christendom, Thomas More, Thomas Aquinas, and Magdalen. These institutions are young, quite smaU and quite outspoken in their commitment to Catholic orthodoxy. She finds these schools' traditional curricula and strict disciplinary codes interesting if anachronistic; however, she concludes that these coUeges are ultimately "tilting at windmills" (p. 317). She, however, left out the leading conservative Catholic coUege, Franciscan University of SteubenviUe, because of its connections to the charismatic movement. Had she included SteubenvUle and the University of Dallas in her chapter, she would probably not have been so quick to write off the conservative coUeges as quixotic enterprises.

There are other omissions as weU. What about Mother AngeUca and her Eternal Word Television Network, whose programs reach milUons of CathoUc

homes? And what about the traditional religious communities which have been experiencing steady growth in recent years? The Legionaries of Christ and the Daughters of St. Paul would be logical choices.These drawbacks notwithstanding,Weaver and Appleby have made a very good start.This is a detaUed and fair-minded overview of conservative CathoUcism which should be of interest to anyone concerned with post-concUar American CathoUcism.

John E Qulnn

Salve Regina University
Newport, Rhode Island

## Canadian

A Concise History of Christianity in Canada. Edited byTerrence Murphy and Roberto Perin. (New York: Oxford University Press. 1996. Pp. xU, 456. $27.95 paperback.)

Since the trilogy of A History of the Christian Church in Canada by Walsh, Moir, and Grant was pubUshed in the early 1970's, the speciaUzation of Canadian history has produced new and more accurate methods of gathering information and deepening our understanding of the more sensitive issues of history. Fields such as gender, Native, reUgious devotion, and popular history have opened up whole new horizons which had been hidden or forgotten. Under the editorial leadership of Terrence Murphy and Roberto Perin, Oxford University Press has pubUshed a new history of Canadian Christianity. Its emphasis is centered on the people's beUefs and practices in an effort to move away from institutional history.The five historians mobilized to write the lengthy sections of this substantial volume are skiUed methodologists in researching and -writing contemporary history. For instance, the American CathoUc Historical Association m 1995 bestowed its John Gilmary Shea Award on one of the authors, Brian Clarke, for his Piety and Nationalism: Lay Voluntary Associations and the Creation of an Irish-Catholic Community in Toronto, 1850-1895. And so the other authors are equaUy weU respected and weU pubUshed in their fields.

Five essays averaging seventy pages each are carefully researched and sklUfuUy written.The authors demonstrate that five researchers writing an historical synthesis are more powerful in skills and thoroughness than individual researchers. Each of these speciaUsts has unique insights to share into the "fundamental turning-points" of Canadian church history. Although a bibUography is not compüed at the end of the volume, the endnotes of each section provide a record of the latest research on each topic. If this is the upside of the volume, the downside is that there is a wrench as one finishes one essay and goes on to the next. By means of the preface and epUogue, Murphy works to draw the volume into structural unity and raise questions about the future of Christianity in Canada. In the first essay, Terry Crowley treats the French colonization tul its

cessation at the British Conquest in Canada in 1763. He documents the rise of seventeenth-century baroque spirituaUty with a cast of colorful characters, such as John de Brébeuf, Marguerite Bourgeoys, Marie de l'Incarnation, and Kateri Tekakwitha. He misses, however, some outstanding Native Christians such as Joseph ChUiwatenha and Louis Taondechoren. Proceeding to the eighteenth century, Crowley reveals the creeping Influence of secularism and the superficiality to which religious practices had degenerated. With a dearth of vocations and lack of funding, one of the few bright spots on the Canadian horizon was the founding of the Grey Nuns in Montreal by Marguerite d'Youvüle.

Analyzing the period after the Conquest, Gules Chaussé focuses on the alienation which developed between the Church and the Québécois between 1791 and 1840. He refers to this period as the "hibernation" of the Canadian church, a period when it sidled up to the British government aUowüig the "new lay élite" in the Legislative Assembly to lead the Canadian community. Church officials at the time faUed to show sympathy for the pUght of an oppressed people. The breach between the upper clergy and faithful was later restored by the ultramontane renewal beginning in 1840. Murphy reviews the period from the founding of Scottish and Irish communities in the Atlantic region and Upper Canada to the disestabUshment of the AngUcan Church in 1854. The assertion of the rights of the Protestant evangeUcals, the Church of Scotland, and the Catholics brought an end to the privUeges of the AngUcan Church. These changes and the emergence of voluntarism, however, did not fracture the traditional harmony of the cross and crown.

DeaUng with the period of ultramontane spirituality from 1840 to I960, Perin reminds the reader that during the Manitoba school crisis in the 1890's the ApostoUc Delegate Ui his report and the Holy See in its letter espoused the argument of the EngUsh-speaking bishops favoring acceptance of the Prime Minister Laurier compromise. Perin personaUy views the acceptance by the Holy See of Laurier's "sunny ways" as a tragic weakening of the Quebec church and consequently that of the Canadian church. He concludes his essay discussing how the prelude to the Quiet Revolution Ui Quebec during the 1950's began the secularization of the CathoUc culture and social network. Brian Clarke provides a perceptive analysis in the post-Confederation period of denominational similarities and dissimilarities, the CathoUc rationale for religious schools, the battles after Darwin between science and reUgion, and the relationship of Christianity to Canadian society. He recounts the process of Canadianization for the Irish, Polish, Ukrainians, and how the Vatican came to share the anglophone view that EngUsh-speaking clergy were essential across Canada if CathoUcism was to have a future in the west.

The volume ends with the postwar unraveling of ultramontane spirituaUty during the time of the Quiet Revolution Ui English- and French-speaking Canada, and the high expectations offered by the coming of the Second Vatican CouncU.^4 Concise History of Christianity in Canada is directed at university students, interested readers, and reUgious people who wish to know their her-

itage.The research is intense, the writing is pithy, and the impact on the reader is beyond what one author could fabricate. I recommend this volume to interested readers as it wiU be a standard book on the shelves of universities, schools, and privates Ubraries for a considerable time to come.

Terence J. Fay, SJ.

St. Augustine's Seminary, Toronto School of Theology,
University of Toronto

## Latin American

Holy Wednesday: A Nahua Drama from Early Colonial Mexico. By Louise M. Burkhart. (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press. 1996. Pp. xU, 3 14. $42.95 clofhbound; $18.95 paperback.)

Of aU the techniques used by the missionary friars for evangelizing the native populations of Mexico after the Spanish conquest, one of the most intriguing is that of "edifying play." Preconquest rituals among the Mexica had strong elements of drama. Sacred drama also had a long and important history in Spain, where, as in other countries, stage plays originated m Uturgical functions. Whether by means of the auto sacramental or seasonal presentations dramatizing specific feasts, drama was a natural tool for instructing the faithful. Hence it is not at all surprising that the missionaries in sixteenth-century New Spain, especiaUy the Franciscans, would turn to stagecraft as a way of conveying the Christian message. FoUowing the official poUcy of reaching out to the indigenous peoples in their own languages, the friars wrote, or had written, dramas in Náhuatl (Aztec), the most widespread of the native languages and a veritable lingua franca in the early years of the missionary enterprise. GeneraUy these dramas tended to foUow Spanish dramatugical conventions, even to the point of having the stage directions in Spanish. As with so many other compositions in the native languages, it is often difficult to say what role was played by the missionaries and what role by native assistants.The resulting body of work offers a fascinating glimpse not only Ulto mission methods but also into the outlook and attitudes of the natives in the years foUowing the conquest.

Náhuatl drama has been studied by Fernando Horcasitas, Angel Maria Garibay Barbel Brinkman, and others. Louise Burkhart, whose book The Slippery Earth: Nahua-Christian Moral Dialogue in Sixteenth-Century Mexico (Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1989; reviewed ante, LXXVI [October, 1990], 906-908) was a groundbreaking study of the interacting attitudes of missionaries and Nahuas, has now pubUshed a translation and commentary on one such play, composed about seventy years after the Spanish conquest of Mexico. This new work contains valuable introductory material on Spanish drama and Uterary genre, the impact of the conquest, Náhuatl theater, Franciscan educational methods, Nahua scholars, Nahua devotional practices, and approaches to interpreting the play. These sections are clear and cogent and are highly recom-

mended to anyone teaching or studying New Spain in the colonial period. The translations of the Spanish and Náhuatl are on facing pages and are linked to Burkhart's commentaries by a simple code system. The original Spanish and Náhuatl are not reproduced in the book but are available on disk.

What is unique about this play is that it was a translation of a Spanish original, Lucero de Nuestra Salvación (beacon or star of our salvation), by a Valencian bookseller named Ausías Izquierdo Zebrero, which was probably published some time in the 1580's. The Spanish play belonged to a genre called despedimiento (farewell), in which Christ takes leave of the Virgin Mary prior to undergoing his passion and death. In these dramas the Virgin often remonstrated with her son about his upcoming sufferings and sought to have him avoid them. Eventually she became reconciled to the idea because of their necessity for redemption. Izquierdo's play was translated into Náhuatl by a native scholar some time around 1591 and is, as Burkhart points out,"the earliest known extant script of a play in Náhuatl—or any other Native American language" (p. 3).

What makes this Náhuatl translation invaluable is that it allows us to see the changes, deliberate and otherwise, that were introduced by the native translator. Contrary to the Italian adage traduttore, traditore, this translator was not a traitor but rather an adapter who consciously or unconsciously mingled his own culture and theological ideas with those of the Spanish original. Thus, the translation highlights different attitudes toward questions of family and gender. "The Náhuatl Mary is invested with more authority and more knowledge than her Spanish counterpart . . . sixteenth-century Nahua women had more authority within the family than their Spanish counterparts" (p. 89). Christ is represented as a dutiful and obedient Nahua son whose behavior is determined by his parents and the demands of ancestors and prophecy, with the result that the Nahua playwright "contradicts Christian doctrine in a manner that may be seen as an assertion of Nahua moral values" (p. 90). The Nahua Christ has no choice since his actions are determined by a pre-established pattern. The playwright also approached his task with the native view that "time proceeds not as an unbroken sequence but in a periodic fashion, intermittently interrupted by nonchronological intervals" (p. 92). Burkhart sees the Náhuatl text not just as a translation but as a critique of the original and a means of asserting Nahua ideas and values.

I found myself wondering if the Nahua playwright's departure from the original into the world of native concepts was as deliberate as Burkhart believes it to be. It may perhaps have been more instinctive and unconscious, but this is a matter of personal interpretation. Izquierdo's Spanish original, as Burkhart points out, was not of a high literary value. Certainly, in her translations, the Spanish seems leaden and pedestrian in comparison with the more lyrical, poetic, and rhetorical Nahuaü.

Burkhart has published an important and fascinating work, one of interest not just to Náhuatl specialists alone. All who are interested in the history of ideas, missionary methods, European and native ideas, and the latest interpreta-

tions of the impact of the Spanish conquest will find this work to be of great value. It is also a handsome volume, virtually error-free with copious illustrations, many of them photographs taken by the author. It is highly recommended to a wide class of readers.

Stafford Poole, CM.

Los Angeles

The Cross and the Serpent: Religious Repression and Resurgence in Colonial Peru. By Nicholas Griffiths. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press. 1996. Pp. xi, 355. $37.50.)

This important revisionist study complements such recent works concerned with issues in the Christianization of Andean Indigenous populations as Sabine MacCormack's 1991 Religion in the Andes: Vision and Imagination in Early Colonial Peru and Pierre Duvoils' 1986 Cultura andina y represión. Procesos y visitas de idolatrías y hechicerías. Drawing his careful and thorough analysis from archival records in Peru, Spain, and Rome, Nicholas Griffiths argues convincingly against the standard interpretation in mission histories that repression effectively eradicated native religious practices by 1660 and firmly established Catholicism in colonial Peru. His close examination of archival sources indicates that extirpation activities persisted intermittently well into the eighteenth century. Delineating the cases of many accused hechiceros, he also challenges the theorizing of Michael Taussig's 1980 The Devil and Commodity Fetishism in South America and Irene Silverblatt's 1987 Moon, Sun and Witches that seventeenth-century idolatry trials in Peru represented a New World counterpart of the European witch craze.

Griffiths focuses most of his study on the ideological and institutional shortcomings of what he terms the Extirpation Campaign. He emphasizes that Eurocentric perspectives among the clergy hearing idolatry charges against shamans during most of the seventeenth century invalidated the process from its beginnings. Refusing to recognize native religious practitioners as respected and powerful leaders, the extirpators identified them as frauds who deceived their clients while enriching themselves. This mind-set proved ????efG?a????e, for the punished shamans retained and even enhanced their prestige among the Indians as preservers of traditional beliefs. Nor did the destruction of mallquis and huacas obliterate their perceived numinous significance in Indian communities. Contrasting the idolatry trials with those of the Inquisition, Griffiths contends further that they lacked the institutional support necessary to succeed. He maintains that only the occasional interest of zealous prelates, such as Archbishop Pedro de Villagómez, who revived the Indian idolatry trials after 1660, provided limited continuity for repressive activities.

Griffiths demonstrates that the manipulation of idolatry trials by native religious and political leaders to further their own ambitions, as well as to protect

their communities from Spanish domination and repression, also contributed to the demise of the Extirpation Campaign. Indian resistance strategies and the politicization of idolatry trials became increasingly evident during the 1690's and the early eighteenth century. As Griffiths documents, these cases often were power struggles between the shaman, the Christian priest, and the indigenous poUtical authority, the kuraka, for community control. Unlike Inquisition procedures, defendants were permitted to know the identity of witnesses. They frequently used this information to gain dismissal of the charges against them with convincing arguments that the accusations arose solely from the enmity of jealous rivals and community exploiters.

In a lengthy conclusion, Griffiths considers the survival of certain native rituals either in a syncretic form or as practices that have been unchanged since before the Spanish conquest as a legacy of the faUed Extirpation Campaign. WhUe some scholars may question the extent of such linkages, Peruvanists wUl especiaUy welcome his insightful contribution to Andean cultural encounters.

Joseph A. Gagliano

Loyola University of Chicago

## Asian

Educating the Women of Hainan: The Career of Margaret Moninger in China, 1915-1942. By Kathleen L. Lodwick. (Lexington: The University Press of Kentucky. 1995. Pp. xvi, 255.)

Crusaders against Opium: Protestant Missionaries in China, 1847-1917. By Kathleen L. Lodwick. (Lexington: The University Press of Kentucky. 1996. Pp. xiii, 232. $29.95.)

Known for her pubUcation of The Chinese Recorder Index (1986), Kathleen L. Lodwick exhibits versatUe scholarship in a biography of Margaret Moninger, a missionary to Hainan, and in a study of missionary, institutional, and governmental events surrounding suppression of opium Ui China at the turn of the century.

Moninger (1881-1950) was an Iowa-born, Presbyterian-sponsored missioner to Hainan (1915-1942). Graduating from GrinneU CoUege in 1913, she was led by the fervor of the Student Volunteer Movement for Foreign Missions to volunteer for China. Lodwick judiciously uses Moninger's correspondence to show her range of Hainan mission activity. Notable is her education of Miao women, occasional evangeUsm, and service as a mission secretary and treasurer, compUer of a two-volume Hainanese-EngUsh dictionary, editor of a book on Hainan culture, Isle of the Psalms (1919; reprinted by Garland, 1980), and contributor to a number of scholarly journals.

Moninger observed Hainan's response to post-1911 Republican China and the 1920 warlord power struggles. By late 1930 she witnessed the heightened tension caused by the Japanese mUitary, who eventuaUy put her under house arrest in 1941. Erroneously declared dead in 1942, she finaUy did return to the United States as a repatriated passenger on the SS. Gripsholm. Lodwick sees Moninger as a "casual cultural imperialist of their time" (p. 6) and, Uiterestingly concludes that she had less of "religious call . . . but rather a caU to service and to live a Ufe of fun and excitement" (p. 217) beyond her home. This professional and adventurous attitude led Moninger's correspondence to be more a social commentary on Hainan and less about her own religious sentiment and piety.

Educating the Women of Hainan examines other themes. Historians of China should welcome Lodwick's descriptive narrative of Moninger's educational efforts with the Miao. It compliments studies of the Hunan Miao: Theophane Maguire, Hunan Harvest (1946), and Jeffrey C. Kinkley, The Odyssey of Shen Congwen (1987). Consulting Ralph R. Covell's The Liberating Gospel in China (1995) places the Hainan effort among the Miao in context of mission work among other Chinese minorities.

Shock of Moninger and the Hainan mission over the death of Reverend George D. Byers in June, 1924, reminds scholars they have yet to fuUy appreciate the poUtical and cultural impact of missionary indemnity cases in China. TypicaUy after Byers' murder, some local Chinese were executed, leading Moninger to state that "none of the missionaries thought those were guUty of the crime" (p. 110). Re-analysis of such events is necessary so as to aUow scholars to better ascertain the dynamics of the Chinese government's punishment and the overaU bandit relationships in China.

However, one may wonder if it wasn't Moninger who was truly educated in Hainan. She, like many missionaries, was given lasting impressions of Chinese culture by their local language tutors. Moninger often wrote about how local Hainanese social and political opinion and custom differed in various degrees from her own western viewpoints. Furlough and evacuation during poUtical turmoü was another source of missionary education. They combined in 1925 to aUow Moninger to travel to Haiphong, French Indochina. In 1940 the Japanese aUowed her to travel to Hong Kong for vacation and return to occupied Hainan. In July, 1941, she was put under house arrest, and in August, 1942, she returned to the United States.

Given the richness of historical detail, characters for Chinese and Japanese terms would have been helpful. OveraU, Lodwick's study paints a fine picture of mission life Ui Hainan from 1915 to 1940 and is a welcome contribution to the study of women missionaries to China.

Crusaders against Opium describes the addictive and financial dimensions of opium upon China, arguing that the ultimate question was a moral issue: the ending of trade or maintaining the British India-based financial venture. Chapter One shows the consequences of a person and nation addicted to opium. Chap-

ter Two concentrates on Protestant missionaries' efforts to organize, in China and England, against the opium market. "WhUe anti-opium advocates were largely clergymen, missionaries, and missionary doctors, the pro-opium forces included opium merchants, employees of the British colonial governments, and military men particularly doctors" (p. 75). Their battle—between good and evil—holds the narrative together throughout the book.

Lodwick's strength is the detailed summary describing the structured semi-paralysis of various government investigative commissions on opium: The Royal Commission of 1894 (London), the United States PhUippine Commission on Opium (1905), the International Drug Conferences (1909 in Shanghai and 1913 in The Hague). Summary of Sir Alexander Hosie's On the Trail of the Opium Poppy (1914; pp. 150-163) shows the extent of the opium problem in China. Only after 1917 was it iUegal for British subjects to have any interests in opium.

Exploration of larger issues such as the importance of international commissions, the competition between religious, government, and business interests of this era, and the interaction with Chinese leaders such as Li Hung-chang, Chang Chih-tung, andT'ang Kuo-an, would have been welcome.

In conclusion, Lodwick argues convincingly that "missionaries were most successful not in convincing the Chinese to give up the drug" but as "publicist[s]: constantly keeping the issue before the British government until it was forced to take action" (p. 182). Both books are recommended for public, academic, and missiology libraries. Moninger's biography is important for women's history.

Robert E. Carbonneau, CP.

Passionist Community
at the Catholic Theological Union, Chicago

# NOTES AND COMMENTS

## Association News

The president of the American CathoUc Historical Association, Uta-Renate Blumenthal of the Catholic University of America, has appointed John C. Moore of Hofstra University to the Committee on the John Gilmary Shea Prize for a three-year term. The committee for 1997, therefore, consists of Sister Mary J. Oates, CSJ., of Regis College (chairman), a specialist Ui American history, Frederic J. Baumgartner of the Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University, Blacksburg, an expert in modern European history, and Professor Moore, a medievalist.

The chairman of the Committee on Program for the Association's seventy-eighth annual meeting, Arthur L. Fisher of Seattle University, has announced that eight sessions have been planned besides the business meeting, social hour, presidential luncheon, and Sunday Mass. There wiU be one session on ancient history, two on medieval, one on modern European, three on American, and one on general modern history. The president, Professor Blumenthal, wUl devote her address to the topic, "The Papacy and Canon Law in the Eleventh-Century Reform." The meeting wUl be held in Seattle on January 9-11,1 998. Copies of the printed program and practical information wiU be sent to aU members of the Association Ui the autumn. The members of the Committee on Program, besides Dean Fisher, are David Alvarez of St. Mary's CoUege of California (Moraga), Alberto Ferreiro of Seattle Pacific University, Patricia KUlen of Pacific Lutheran University, and John Scott, O.S.B., of St. Martin's CoUege (Lacey).

## Meetings, Conferences, Symposia, Lectures

On February 28-29, 1997, the University of New Mexico hosted a conference on "The Virgin and the DevU Ui the New World: ReUgious Encounters in Latin America." The conference was sponsored by the Latin American Institute, the Latin American Studies Program, the Student Organization for Latin American Studies, and the Department of History of the University of New Mexico. Funding was also received from the New Mexico Endowment for the Humanities. The conference opened on the evening of February 28 with a keynote address "The Inquisition in Colonial Mexico: Heresy, Dissent, and Social Control" by

Richard Greenleaf of Tulane University. The foUowing day was devoted to the body of the presentations. Linda B. HaU, professor of history in the University of New Mexico, "The Virgin Mary and the Growth of Spanish NationaUsm in the Reconquest"; Stafford Poole, C.M.,"Our Lady of Guadalupe: Missionary Tool or Pious Fiction?"; Fernando Cervantes, Director of the Centre for the Classical Tradition, University of Bristol, "Diabolism in New Spain, 1521-1767"; Robert D. Martinez, M.A. candidate in the Department of History, University of New Mexico, "The Devil in Spanish New Mexico:A Story of Witchcraft and Cultural Conflict in 18th Century Abiquiu"; Charlene Villaseñor Black, assistant professor of art and art history in the University of New Mexico, "The Marianization of the Image of San José in Colonial Spanish America"; Alfred Brichta-López, of the Department of History, University of New Mexico,"The Virgin Mary in the Spiritual life of Santa Rosa of Lima"; Elizabeth Kiddy, Ph.D. candidate, University of New Mexico, "Congados: Devotion to Our Lady of the Rosary in BrazU"; and Adrian Bantjes, of the Department of History, University of Wyoming, "Saints and State Formation in Revolutionary Mexico."

In a series of lectures entitled "Before and After the Book" Astrik L. Gabriel, professor emeritus of history in the University of Notre Dame, spoke on "Early Academic Printing at the University of Paris: Ulricus Gering and Bertholdus Remboldt." Gering, a graduate of the University of Basel, printed the first book in France; he died in 1510, leaving half of his fortune to the College of the Sorbonne and the other half to Montague College. Remboldt, who was treasurer of the EngUsh-German Nation in 1506-07, formed a partnership with Gering in 1494 and collaborated with him until 1509· The most important book they published together was the Liber Sextus Decretalium of Boniface VIII. The lecture was delivered on AprU 10, 1997, in the Department of Special CoUections.

During the spring conference of the New England Historical Association, which was held at Northeastern University, Boston, on AprU 26, Maureen McCarthy of Samt Anselm College read a paper entitled "The Case of the Missing Servant Girls: Family, Religion, and Conversion in Nineteenth-Century America."

During the thirty-second International Congress on Medieval Studies held at Western Michigan University, Kalamazoo, on May 7-11, 1997, the American Cusanus Society presented several sessions. In the first,"Nicholas of Cusa: Lawyers and Jurisprudence in the Fifteenth Century," Thomas E. Morrissey of the State University of New York College at Fredonia read a paper, "Unquiet life: Franciscus ZabareUa at the University of Padua," and James Muldoon of Rutgers University at Camden read one, "Walter UUmann, Nicholas of Cusa, and the Empire." In the second,"Nicholas of Cusa: Thereto Cusana, 1, 3: Its Recent Publication and Its Significance for Cusanus Research," Morimichi Watanabe of Long Island University read a paper, "Nicholas of Cusa and the Bleeding-Host Shrine of WUsnack," and Brian A. Pavlac of King's College read one, "From Theory into Practice: The FaUure of Nicholas of Cusa as Bishop of Brixen."

In an international conference on "Genocide, Religion, and Modernity," which was held at the United States Holocaust Memorial Museum in Washington, D.C,

on May 11 and 12, Beth PoUeIe of Rutgers University read a paper entitled "A Pure Soul Is Good Enough: Bishop von Galen, Resistance to Nazism, and the CathoUc Community of Münster," and Doris Bergen of the University of Notre Dame read one entitled "Between God and Hitler: German MUitary Chaplains and the Crimes of the Third Reich."

"Santa Maria del Fiore: The Cathedral and Its Sculpture" was the theme of an international symposium held on the occasion of the seventh centenary of the foundation of the cathedral of Florence, June 5-6, 1997, and organized by VUla I Tatti and VUla La Pietra.

The bicentenary of the founding of Mission San Fernando Rey de España in Mission HUls, California, wUl be observed with a Mass that wUl be celebrated by the Archbishop of Los Angeles, Cardinal Roger Mahony, on a still undetermined day Ui September. The mission, the seventeenth in chronological order, was founded by the president of the Missions of Upper California, Fray Fermín de Lasuén, O.F.M..

The twenty-second International Conference on Patristic, Medieval, and Renaissance Studies wUl be held on September 12-14, 1997, at VUlanova University. Those who wish to participate should write to the director of the conference, Thomas A. Losoncy at VUlanova University, VUlanova, Pennsylvania 19085-1699·

In co-operation with the Institut für Cusanus-Forschung in Trier, the Cusanus-GeseUschaft of Germany wUl hold its annual conference (Tagung) in Padua on October 13-18, 1997. The general theme of the conference is "Nikolaus von Kues als Kanonist und Rechtshistoriker."

A Conference on "The Friars and Jews in the Middle Ages and Renaissance" will be held on October 26-28, 1997, at Saint Louis University. Further information is avaUable from Philip Gavitt in care of the Center for Medieval and Renaissance Studies, Saint Louis University, 3663 LIndeU Boulevard, St. Louis, Missouri 63103-3342.

The Department of PhUology and History Ui the University of Cassino is organizing a convegno internazionale di studi on "Guitmondo di Aversa, la cultura europea e la riforma gregoriana nel Mezzogiorno." It wUl take place at Cassino and Aversa on November 13-15, 1997. The Norman monk, caUed egregius doctor and sapientissimus monachus, was a student of Lanfranc of Pavia along with Anselm of Aosta and an intrepid Gregorian reformer. In 1088 Urban II consecrated him bishop of Aversa, the Norman diocese founded by the first reforming pope, Leo LX. Further information may be obtained from the organizing committee at Via Zamosch snc, 03043 Cassino, Italy; telephone: 0776-31. 10.66;fax: 31.14.27.

The twenty-fifth annual Sewanee Mediaeval CoUoquium wiU be held on AprU 3-4, 1998, and wUl be devoted to the theme "Reading and the Book Ln the Middle Ages." The lecturers will be Brian Stock of the University of Toronto and Rosamond McKitterick of Newnham CoUege, Cambridge. The program wiU in-

elude twenty-minute papers from any discipline. Anyone who wishes to present a paper should submit two copies of an abstract (approximately 250 words long) and two copies of a brief curriculum vitae by November 1, 1997. AU inquiries should be addressed to the Sewanee Mediaeval CoUoquium, The University of the South, 735 University Avenue, Sewanee, Tennessee 37383-1000; telephone: 61 5-598- 1531.

"Discovery, New Frontiers, and Expansion in the Iberian World" is the theme of a conference that wiU be held In the BibUoteca Nacional at Lisbon on May 27-30, 1998. Proposals for papers and sessions may be sent until October 1, 1997; a proposal should Include a 200-word abstract and a one-page curriculum vitae of the speaker. Submissions should be addressed to the Mediterranean Studies Association in care of the Office of the Provost, University of Massachusetts, North Dartmouth, Massachusetts 02747-2300.

A conference to be caUed "Through Multiple Lenses: Interdisciplinary Perspectives on the History of Women Religious" wUl be held at Loyola University Chicago on June 21-24, 1998. It is being sponsored by the Conference on the History of Women Religious. Interdisciplinary panels may be made up of papers that incorporate the theories or methods of more than one discipline; for example, artists and historians may coUaborate in studying how the ideaUzed woman depicted in the Renaissance Madonnas and female saints influenced or shaped the way in which women Uved the reUgious life. Those who wish to organize a panel or to present an individual paper should submit five copies of their proposal by November 15, 1997, to Florence Deacon, O.S.E, History of Women ReUgious Program Committee Chair, Cardinal Stritch CoUege, 6801 North Yates Road, MUwaukee, Wisconsin 53217; telephone: 414-352-5400, extension 287. Persons desiring copies of the program and information on registration should address their requests to Nancy Hirsch, The Gannon Center for Women and Leadership, Loyola University Chicago, 6525 North Sheridan Road, Chicago, Illinois 60626; telephone: 773-508-8430.

The ninth centenary of the birth of HUdegard of Bingen wUl be celebrated Ui various places in Germany in 1998. In the city of Bingen on September 13-19 an international symposium entitled "HUdegard von Bingen in ihrem historischen Umfeld" wül be held under the chairmanship of Alfred Haverkamp of Trier. Other events wiU be a music festival in which twelfth-century music Ln general and HUdegard's in particular wUl be performed under the chairmanship OfWuU7ArIt of Basel and a special reUgious service at St. HUdegard's Monastery of Rudesheim (near Bingen). Inquiries should be directed to "900 Jahre HUdegard von Bingen e. V," attention: Chairman of the Steering Committee, RochusaUee 40,55411 Bingen, Germany; fax: 011-49-6721-12006.

The eighth International CoUoquium on Gregory of Nyssa wUl take place in Paderborn on September 14-18, 1998. The theme wUl be "HomUies on the Beatitudes." Proposals of papers should be submitted to Hubertus R. Drobner in care of the Theologische Fakultät, Paderborn, Kamp 6, 33098 Paderborn, Germany.

## Awards

During its annual meeting for 1997, held on June 4 and 5 in St. John's, Newfoundland, the Canadian CathoUc Historical Association presented the George Edward Clerk Award to Terrence Murphy of Memorial University of Newfoundland.

The Book Award Committee of the New England Historical Association announced last October that Thomas H. O'Connor of Boston CoUege was given an award for his book The Boston Irish:A Political History:

## Appointments

The Most Reverend Anthony M. PiUa, Bishop of Cleveland, as president of the National Conference of Catholic Bishops and the United States Catholic Conference, announced on January 31 that Cardinal Roger Mahony, Archbishop of Los Angeles, has been appointed episcopal moderator of the Association of Catholic Diocesan Archivists after consultation with the Association's board. Cardinal Mahony succeeds the late Cardinal Joseph Bernardin in that office.

The Board of Directors of the Center for Reformation Research has announced the appointment of Robert Rosin as its executive director. Dr. Rosin is an associate professor of historical theology at Concordia Seminary in St. Louis. He succeeds WUliam S. Maltby who is retiring from the office after twenty years of service to the Center.

## Archives

The Pontifical Commission for the Cultural Heritage of the Church has issued to the bishops of the world a circular entitled "The Pastoral Function of Church Archives." PubUshed as a forty-five-page booklet, it brings together provisions in canon law with practical advice on the care of archives. Stating that "archives are places of memory of the Christian community and storehouses of culture for the new evangeUzation," it warns that the valuable church patrimony may be lost page by page if archivists are not informed of basic techniques of preservation. And even weU-tended collections may be of diminished use if they are not catalogued in a uniform system and if their inventory is not known beyond diocesan boundaries. "As places of memory," the circular adds, "archives must systematicaUy gather aU the data making up the articulated history of the church community so that what has been done, the results obtained, including omissions and errors, may be properly evaluated." Many of the recommendations are taken from documents addressed to ItaUan ecclesiastical archivists by various Vatican offices over the years. This circular is part of a series produced by the Pontifical Commission, which Pope John Paul II established in 1988. Some of its previous directives have concerned the importance of church li-

braries and the cataloguing of artistic and historical material in Europe as the cold war came to an end. The document was written for and sent to bishops because, according to canon law, it is their duty to ensure that archival records of their dioceses be "adequately preserved." But one of the first suggestions in the set of guidelines, which comprise roughly one-half of the booklet, is that bishops delegate this work to commissions on archival coUections and to experts in the field. Dioceses should maintain archives on current affairs, the directive states, because they wiU be the historical records of the future. Lacunae in past records can be fiUed with the use of modern technology. Internet searches of records and microfilm reproductions can help to "recover archives which have been confiscated in the past, often as a result of complex historical circumstances, and dispersed in other locations."Items of a personal or otherwise confidential nature should be marked as such in the inventories and catalogues of the archives. However, the Pontifical Commission also advises that in general archives should be accessible to the pubUc. Noting that the preservation and thorough cataloguing of church archives takes time and individual attention, the commission gives one final argument for devoting a diocese's resources to these projects. The historical and artistic appreciation of archives, it says,"could constitute a valid meeting ground with today's culture and offer occasions to participate in the progress of humanity as a whole."

The Chapel Car CoUection of the CathoUc Church Extension Society has recently been processed in the archives of Loyola University Chicago. This rich coUection of correspondence, chaplains' reports, and photographs provides insights into both the Society's missionary work and the cultural geography of early twentieth-century America. Beginning with the first chapel car in 1907, the "St. Anthony," and continuing with two more cars, the "St. Peter" and the "St. Paul," these railroad cars stopped in towns and hamlets, engaging the rural people UvUig along then· routes. Most of this work was carried on in the Great Plains, the Northwest, and the Southeast. The photographs of these ornate chapel cars document their history from inception to neglect and demise; many of them were taken in the countless towns the cars visited. The chapel car photographs form a part of the transportation subseries that also includes photographs of the Society's motor car chapels, chapel wagons, chapel boats, and a missionary yacht used Ui the Philippine Islands. Correspondence between the Superintendent of Chapel Cars, George C. Hennessey, and the officers of the Society chronicles the complex operation and unique culture of railroad missionary work. Chaplains' reports give firsthand accounts of rural towns and provide Usts of baptisms, marriages, and confirmations. More information may be obtained from the University Archivist, Brother Michael Grace, SJ., at the Loyola University Archives, 6525 North Sheridan Road, Chicago, Illinois 60626; telephone: 773-508-2661.

## Historic Site

Officials of St. Mary's County, Maryland, have announced that they will proceed with plans to rebuüd the seventeenth-century Jesuit chapel at St. Mary's City. A campaign wUl soon begin to raise by private funds the five miUion dollars needed for the construction. The original buüding is considered by scholars to have been the first brick church erected for English-speaking Catholics Ui North America. About fifty-seven feet long and fifty-four feet wide and between twenty-five and thirty feet high from the ground to the roof, it was built in 1667, replacing an earlier chapel that was destroyed during the poUtical turmoU in the colony. In spite of the lack of drawings, it can be accurately described on the basis of historical evidence and educated deductions. After Maryland was made a royal colony and public Catholic worship was banned, the sheriff in 1704 padlocked the building; the Jesuits later dismantled it and sold the land to farmers. The foundations were discovered in a field in the early 1980's, and archaeologists have spent years sifting dirt where the cruciform structure once stood. Thomas M. Lucas, SJ., axJrofessor of fine arts in the University of San Francisco, who directed the restoration of the rooms in which St. Ignatius Loyola lived and died Ui Rome, has been engaged as a consultant; he went to Belgium, northeastern France, and Holland to study the kinds of churches the Jesuits buüt during the baroque period. The plans have been drawn by a New York architect, John Mesick, who said that the chapel "is a reinvention of what might have been here."The interior will include plaster walls and scissor trusses similar to those at nearby St. Inigoes; the ceUing will be of wood; the original tabernacle, pulpit, and painting over the altar probably were brought from Europe, and the European style wiU be reproduced here. Although the church has completely vanished, it is widely regarded to be the most important symbol of religious freedom from an era when Maryland led the English colonies in tolerance. A controversy, however, has arisen over the nature of the future church. Since it wUl stand on land owned by the State of Maryland, it is to be a nondenominational museum. The Historic St. Mary's City Commission, the state-funded body that manages the 835-acre open-air museum and archaeology park that St. Mary's City has become over three decades of research and restoration, contends that returning the site, which is historic trust property, to the Catholic Church or recreating the chapel as a place of Catholic worship would violate the separation of church and state. The Commission's director of research, Henry M. MiUer, said that the intention is to produce "an exhibit about religion and toleration in early Maryland . . . , a buUding that speaks to many audiences." On the other hand, the Democratic State Senator from St. Mary's County, Roy P. Dyson, a CathoUc, thinks that it would be more appropriate if the chapel were again a CathoUc place of worship. Otherwise, it would hardly be "different from Disneyland." He and others maintain that although the replica wUl be authentic in design and materials—locally fired brick and hand-hewed oak—it wiU faU the test of authenticity if it is merely an exhibition run by the state. Mr. Dyson prefers to have a private entity, or perhaps the Catholic Church itself, take ownership of the land. Cardinal James Hickey, Archbishop of Washington, supports

the reconstruction project, but the Archdiocese of Washington, which includes southern Maryland, does not wish to own the chapel, according to one of its auxUiary bishops, WUliam E. Lori, because there are plenty of churches in the area and the archdiocese must reserve its funds for parishes, schools, and social services. Last year Cardinal Hickey wrote, "In the first settlement at St. Mary's City, it is traditionaUy beUeved that Catholic Masses were followed by Anglican services." He added that he would like to see the church function like a military chapel with both Catholic and Episcopal services conducted "for a few days each year. … In this respect, restoration of the brick chapel would truly be an ecumenical project."

## Exhibition

The Concordia Historical Institute Museum has opened a new exhibition commemorating the quincentenary of the birth of Philip Melanchthon. It wUl remain open until the end of November. Rare books and documents from the Reformation era, including an original edition of Melanchthon's Loci communes, other works, and the Augsburg Confession, as well as a medal struck in commemoration of the quincentenary, are displayed.

## Publications

Commemorating the ninth centenary of the departure of the First Crusaders from Europe, History Today (Volume 47) has published a series of expertly Ulustrated articles edited by Nigel Saul and entitled "Confronting the Crusades." In the March, 1997, issue appear "The Pilgrim Origins of the First Crusade" by Marcus Bull (pp. 10-15) and "Who Were the First Crusaders?" by Jonathan Phillips (pp. 16-22). In the AprU issue are "The Capture of Jerusalem" by John France (pp. 37-42) and "Muslim Responses to the Crusades" by Robert Irwin (pp. 43-49).

Volume 10 (1996) of Studia Borromaica contains papers presented at the dies académicas, November 10-11, 1995, of the Accademia di San Carlo in Milan. On the one hand the symposium commemorated the fourth centenary of the entrance of Cardinal Federico Borromeo into his diocese as Archbishop of Milan, and on the other it Ulustrated the methods and ecclesial significance of the pastoral visits undertaken by Saint Charles Borromeo. FoUowing a preface by the director of the academy, Franco Buzzi, are twelve essays: Pamela M. Jones, "Federico Borromeo scrittore religioso e mecenate d'arte: il frutto maturo di un umanesimo cristiano" (pp. ll-38); John Bossy, "Carlo Borromeo e la tradizione morale" (pp. 39-51); Bruno Maria Bosatra, "La normativa borromaica suUe visite pastorali" (pp. 53-70); Angelo Turchini, "I 'questionari' di visita pastorale di Carlo Borromeo per il governo deUa Diocesi mUanese" (pp. 71-120); DanUa Ghezzi, "L'istituzione dei visitatori regionari: una nuova figura di officialis vescovUe nel

dialogo fra centro e periferia" (pp. 121-130); Claudio di FUippo, "Carlo Borromeo e le leghe grigie" (pp. 131-159); Lucia Sebastiani, "Chiesa, società e istituzioni: vecchi usi e nuove potenziaUtà espUcative deUa documentazione suUe visite pastoraU" (pp. 161-177); Lucia Pelagatti, "Le pievi della bassa pianura: visite, clero parrocchiale e congregazioni foranee a San Donato"(pp. 179-197);Angelo Borghi, "Alta Brianza e valU lariane: U controUo deUe periferie al tempo di Carlo Borromeo" (pp. 199-217); Giuseppe De Luca, "Il controUo dei corpi ecclesiastici deUa città: i capitoli canonicaU e la collegiata di giuspatronato regio di S. Maria deUa Scala" (pp. 219-241); Luisa BrambUla di Civesio,"Un aspetto deUa riforma borromaica a MUano: la collegiata di S. Tommaso in terra amara (1574-1630)" (pp. 243-280); and Alphonse Dupront, "Autour de Saint FUippo Neri: de l'optimisme chrétien" (pp. 281-312).

The issue of the Journal of Religious History for February, 1997 (Volume 21, Number 1), is caUed the "Richard Hooker Issue." Edited by Bruce Kaye, it contains the foUowing articles: "Authority and the Shaping of Tradition: New Essays on Richard Hooker," by Bruce Kaye (pp. 3-9); "Natural Law in Hooker's Of the Laws of Ecclesiastical Polity',' by Damián Grace (pp. 10-22);"Church and State Unified: Hooker's Rationale for the EngUsh Post-Reformation Order," by John Gascoigne (pp. 23-34); "The Creation of Richard Hooker's Public Authority: Rhetoric, Reputation and Reassessment," by Conal Condren (pp. 35-59); "The Unity of Church and State Challenged: Responses to Hooker from the Restoration to the Nineteenth-Century Age of Reform," by John Gascoigne (pp. 60-79); and "Authority and the Interpretation of Scripture in Hooker's Of the Laws of Ecclesiastical Polity" by Bruce Kaye (pp. 80-109)·

"La Bible au XVIIe siècle" is the theme of the issue of XVII' Siècle for January-March, 1997 (Volume 49, Number 1). The foUowing articles are contained in it: Bernard Chédozeau,"La lecture de la Bible chez et parles cathoUques"(pp. 9-17);Jacques Le Brun,"Exégèse herméneutique et logique au XVIIe siècle"(pp. 19-30); François Laplanche, "Le sens mystique des Ecritures" (pp. 31-41); Hélène Ostrowiecki, "La Bible des libertins" (pp. 43-55); Peter N. MUler, "Aux origines de la Polyglotte parisienne: philologia sacra, Contre-Réforme et Raison d'Etat" (pp. 57-66); Vanessa Selbach, "La Bible iUustrée" (pp. 67-92 with eight plates); and Jean-Robert Armogathe, "Commenter l'Apocalypse" (pp. 93-103).

Volume I of The History of the Archdiocese of New York by Thomas J. SheUey has been published by the Editions du Signe in Strasbourg. It is large in format (30 ? 21 cm.), beautifuUy designed, and lavishly illustrated with photographs and maps in full color throughout its forty-four pages. The first volume treats "CathoUcism in New York from the Colonial Period to the Mid-Nineteenth Century," that is, to the advent of Bishop John Hughes. The price is nine doUars.

"Lutheranism in the Delaware VaUey" is portrayed by six contributors to the issue of Lutheran Quarterly for winter, 1996 (Volume X, Number 4), as foUows: George E. Handley "The Ministerium of Pennsylvania, from 1748" (pp. 363-383); Faith E. Rohrbough, "The PoUtical Maturation of Henry Melchior

Muhlenberg" (pp. 384-405); Richard Hulan, "Swedish Provost Carl Magnus Wrangel Visits Manatawny in 1762" (pp. 406-424); Karl E. Johnson, Jr., and Joseph A. Romeo, "Jehu Jones (1786-1852), the First African American Lutheran Minister" (pp. 425-443); L. DeAne Lagerquist, "Revisiting the Founding of PhUadelphia Seminary" (pp. 444-466); and John E. Peterson, "Historic Lutheran Sites in the Philadelphia Area" (pp. 467-477).

The theme of the issue of U.S. Catholic Historian for winter, 1997 (Volume 15, Number 1) is "Sacred Places—Liturgical Spaces explorations of Religious Architecture." The contributors and their articles are Paula Kane, "Is That a Beer Vat under the Baldochino [sic]? From Antiniodernism to Postmodernism in Catholic Church Architecture" (pp. 1-32); Timothy M. Matovina, "Sacred Place and CoUective Memory: San Fernando Cathedral, San Antonio, Texas" (pp. 33-50); Roy A. Hampton III, "German Gothic in the Midwest: The Parish Churches of Franz Georg Himpler and Adolphus Druiding" (pp. 51-74); Peter W. Williams, "'The Heart of It AU': The Varieties of Ohio's ReUgious Architecture" (pp. 75-90); John C Murphy, "Frederick V Murphy: The Catholic Architect as Eclectic Designer and University Professor" (pp. 91-104); and R. Kevin Seasoltz, O.S.B., "From the Bauhaus to the House of God's People: Frank Kacmarcik's Contribution to Church Art and Architecture" (pp. 105-122).

Pascal Baumstein, O.S.B., archivist of Belmont Abbey, has produced a sixteen-page pamphlet on "The Art of Michael Mclnerney." It is abundantly Ulustrated with black and white photographs and drawings. Mclnerney (1877-1963) was a monk and priest of Belmont Abbey and an architect and designer. "Drawn primarily to ecclesial projects, he designed more than 500 buUdings, including 220 churches, missions, and chapels, seventy-eight schools and orphan asylums, twenty-seven hospitals and infirmaries, eighteen convents and monasteries, and ten autonomous gymnasia—in a career that exceeded sixty years."

Last December the Josephites celebrated the 125th anniversary of their foundation in the Archdiocese of Baltimore. In commemoration they have published a thirty-two-page booklet in which the arrival of the MiU HiU Fathers is briefly recounted and each of their parishes in Maryland, Virginia, and Washington, D.C., is given one page. Pages are also devoted to Josephite ministries, parish-school partnerships, and community outreach. Copies of the booklet may be obtained from the provincial house of the Society of St. Joseph of the Sacred Heart, 1130 North Calvert Street, Baltimore, Maryland 21202; telephone: 410-727-3386; fax: 410-385-2331.

## Personal Notice

Paul V Murphy has been appointed an assistant professor of history in the University of San Francisco.

## Obituary

Thomas H. D. Mahoney, who was president of the American CathoUc Historical Association In 1957, died on AprU 22 in a hospital Ui Palo Alto, California, after suffering a stroke. He was stricken whUe returning to Massachusetts from South Korea, where he had deUvered a speech. He was born on November 4, 1914, in Cambridge, Massachusetts. He received the A.B. and A.M. degrees from Boston CoUege in 1936 and 1937, the Ph.D. degree from George Washington University in 1944, and the M.RA. degree from Harvard University in 1967. He was an assistant professor of history in Boston CoUege (1939-1943), an associate professor in the Army Special Training Program (1943-1944), an assistant professor of history in the CoUege of the Holy Cross (1944-1946), and an assistant and then associate professor of history (1945-1961) m the Massachusetts Institute of Technology, in which he was promoted to the rank of professor in 1961. At various times he was a Carnegie feUow (1954), a Guggenheim feUow (I96I-I962), a feUow of law and history in the Law School of Harvard University (1965-1960), chief consultant of the Special Committee on Elections of the U.S. House of Representatives (1966), and administrative feUow of the John F. Kennedy School of Government of Harvard University (1966-1967). An expert on Edmund Burke, he wrote Edmund Burke and Ireland (I960) and edited Burke's Reflections on the Revolution in France and Selected Writings and Speeches by Edmund Burke. He was also coauthor of Edmund Burke: The Enlightenment and the Western World and Edmund Burke and the Repeal of the Stamp Act in 1776 as weU as of a coUege textbook entitled The United States in World History and oí China, Japan, and the Powers. Besides being a scholar, Professor Mahoney was also a Democratic poUtician. He was a Massachusetts state legislator from 1971 to 1979 and the Secretary for Elderly Affairs in Massachusetts from 1979 to 1983. He married in 1951 and had five cMdren.

# PERIODICAL LITERATURE

## GENERAL AND MISCELLANEOUS

Vom Nutzen und Nachteil der Kirchengeschichte. Begriff und Funktion einer theologischen Kerndisziplin. Albrecht Beutel. Zeitschrift für Theologie und Kirche, 94 (Mar., 1997), 84- 110.

The Missionary Impulse in the Early Asian Christian Traditions. T. V Philip. International Review ofMission, LXXXV (Oct., 1996), 505-521.

El Tesorero de la catedral altoaragonesa de Roda de Isábena. Francisco Castillon Cortada. Revista de Historia ferónimo Zurita, No. 69-70 (1994), 7-37.

Il procuratore generale nell'ordine carmelitano: origine e sviluppo della figura e del ruólo. Emanuele Boaga, O.Carm. Carmelas, 43 (1, 1996), 42-98.

L'Archivio storico della Provincia napoletana del SS. Cuore di Gesu, OFM. Gioacchino F. D'Andrea, O.F.M. Archivum Franciscanum Historicum, 89 (July-Dec, 1996), 537-560.

Le temple réformé de Sainte-Marie-aux-Mines du XVIP au XXe siècle. Michelle Magdelaine. Bulletin de la Société de l'Histoire du Protestantisme Français, 143 (Jan.-Mar., 1997), 39-61.

The "Catechetical" School of Early Christian Alexandria and Its Philonic Heritage. Annewies van den Hoek. Harvard Theological Review, 90 (Jan., 1997), 59-87.

Théophile d'Antioche est-il millénariste? Nicole Zeegers. Revue d'histoire ecclésiastique, XCI (July-Dec, 1996), 743-783.

Maximinus und Paulinus. Zwei Trierer Bischöfe im vierten Jahrhundert. Hans A. Pohlsander. Trierer Zeitschrift, 59 (1996), 119-180.

Arians and Jews in the Histories of Gregory of Tours. Avril Keely.fournal ofMedieval History, 23 (June, 1997), 103-115.

L'évêque Martin et la ville de Tours. Nancy Gauthier. Revue d'Histoire de l'Eglise de France, LXXXII (July-Dec, 1996), 249-262.

Villas and Monasteries in Late Roman Gaul. John Percivai. Journal of Ecclesiastical History, 48 Qan., 1997), 1-21.

Martyre et ritualité dans l'Antiquité tardive. Horizons de l'écriture médiévale des rituels. Philippe Bue. Annales, 52 (Jan.-Feb., 1997), 63-92.

Le livre dans les trésors du Moyen Age. Contribution à l'histoire de la Memoria médiévale. Éric Palazzo. Annales, 52 (Jan.-Feb., 1997), 93-118.

From Northern Europe to Southern Europe and from the General to the Particular: Recent Research on Jewish-Christian Coexistence in Medieval Europe. Anna Sapir Abulafia. Journal of Medieval History, 23 Qune, 1997), 179-190.

Engendering Religious Desire: Sex, Knowledge, and Christian Identity in Anglo-Saxon England. Clare A. Lees. Journal of Medieval and Early Modern Studies, 27 (Winter, 1997), 17-45.

Simbolismi ascensionali in una meta di pellegrinaggio: S. Michèle della Chiusa e la porta dello Zodiaco. Adriana Solaro Fissore. Bollettino Storico-Bibliografico Subalpino, XCIV (2 , 1996), 511-540.

Eighth-Century Byzantine Anti-Islamic Literature. Context and Forces. Daniel J. Sahas. Byzantino-slavica, LVII (2, 1996), 229-238.

D'Auxerre à Cluny: technique de la peinture murale entre IeVIIP et le XIIe siècle en Bourgogne. Juliette Rollier-Hanselmann. Cahiers de civilisation médiévale, 40 (Jan.-Mar., 1997), 57-90.

The Commentary on Genesis of Claudius of Turin and Biblical Studies under Louis the Pious. Michael Gorman. Speculum, 72 (Apr., 1997), 279-329·

The Earliest Queen-Making Rites. Julie Ann Smith. Church History, 66 (Mar., 1997), 18-35.

La paix de Dieu dans son contexte (989-1041). Dominique Barthélémy. Cahiers de civilisation médiévale, 40 (Jan.-Mar., 1997), 3-35.

La chiesa abbaziale di S. Giustina di Sezzadio e l'architettura ottoniana. Lelia Rozzo. Bollettino Storico-Bibliografico Subalpino, XCIV (2, 1996), 663-680.

Hosios Christodoulos: An Eleventh-Century Byzantine Saint and His Monasteries. Anthony Kirby. Byzantino-slavica, LVII (2, 1996), 293-309.

Die Synode von Piacenza und die Konsekration Tedaids zum Erzbischof von Mailand im Februar 1076. Claudia Zey. Quellen und Forschungen, 76 (1996), 496-509.

Eadmer's Vita Anselmi: A Reinterpretation. Michael Staunton. Journal of Medieval History, 23 (Mar., 1997), 1-14.

Man, Flora and Fauna in the Bronze Door of the Gniezno Cathedral in Poland. Jadwiga I. Daniec. Polish Review, XLII (1, 1997), 3-27.

Henry of Wincester and the Expansion of Legatine Political Authority in England. Ilicia J. Sprey. Revue d'histoire ecclésiastique, XCI (July-Dec, 1996), 785-803.

The Making of a Crusade: The Genoese Anti-Muslim Attacks in Spain, 1146-1148. John Bryan Williams, fournal of Medieval History, 23 (Mar., 1997), 29-53.

Voraussetzungen und Perspektiven mittelalterlicher I^ienfrömmigkeit seit Innozenz III. Eine Auseinandersetzung mit Herbert Grundmanns "Religiösen Bewegungen." Martina Wehrli-Johns. Mitteilungen des Instituts für Österreichische Geschichtsforschung, 104 (3-4, 1996), 286-309.

The Fourth Lateran Council's Definition of Trinitarian Orthodoxy. Fiona Robb. Journal of Ecclesiastical History, 48 (Jan·. 1997), 22-43.

Censure, liberté et progrès intellectuel à l'Université de Paris au XIIIe siècle. Luca Bianchi. Archives d'Histoire Doctrinale et Littéraire du Moyen Age, 63 (1996), 45-93.

An Anchor in the Storm: Medieval English Anchoresses and the Vocation of Solitude. Elise A. Feyerherm. American Baptist Quarterly, XVI (Mar., 1997), 81-97.

Husband, Father, Bishop? Grosseteste in Paris. N. M. Schulman. Speculum, 72 (Apr., 1997), 330-346.

Manducator von Lucca. Ein unbekannter Kanonist des frühen 13. Jahrhunderts. Andreas Meyer. Quellen und Forschungen, 76 (1996), 94-124.

The Carmelites in England 1242-1540: Surviving Writings. Richard Copsey, O.Carm. Carmelas, 43 (1, 1996), 175-224.

Matthew Paris's Attitudes toward Anglo-Jewry. Sophia Menache.. Journal of Medieval History, 23 (June, 1997), 139-162.

Berthold von Regensburg, OFM, and the Mongols—Medieval Sermon as a Historical Source. Jussi Hanska-Antti Ruotsala. Archivum Franciscanum Historicum, 89 Guly-Dec, 1996), 425-445.

Provinciales Carmelitas de la Provincia de España (1281-1416). Pablo Maria Garrido, O.Carm. Carmelas, 43 (1, 1996), 153-164.

Francesco Brun da Apt, un francescano alia corte angioina fra XIII e XTV secólo. Clemente Ciammaruconi. Archivum Franciscanum Historicum, 89 (July-Dec, 1996), 585-614.

Dalle "peregrinationes maiores" all'istituzione dell'anno santo. Vincenzo Paglia. Ricerche di Storia sociale e Religiosa, XXVI (June-Dec, 1996), 217-230.

The Chapter on Rome from the Crónica of Benzo d'Alessandria. Joseph Berrigan. Manuscripta, 38 (Mar., 1994), 51-67.

New Evidence for the Condemnation of Meister Eckhart. Robert E. Lerner. Speculum, 72 (Apr., 1997), 347-366

Reg. Vat. 62: Ein päpstliches Dossier zur Politik gegenüber Ungläubigen und Schismatikern aus dem Jahre 1369. Karl Borchardt. Quellen und Forschungen, 76 (1996), 147-218.

Le vicende del complesso conventuale di San Salvatore al Monte a Firenze. Francesca Capecchi. Archivum Franciscanum Historicum, 89 (July-Dec, 1996), 469-536.

I Miracula Beati Angelí (ms. Magliabecchi XXXLX, 75) e gli Ultimi anni del Clareno in Basilicata. Feiice Accrocca. Archivum Franciscanum Historicum, 89 Guly-Dec, 1996), 615-627.

Due fonti del "De curialium miseriis" di Enea Silvio Piccolomini: Bracciolini e Lucrezio. Davide Canfora. Archivio Storico Italiano, CLIV (3, 1996), 479-494.

Insultes, blasphèmes ou hérésie? Un procès à l'officialite de Troyes en 1445. Christelle Walravens. Bibliothèque de l'École des Chartes, 154 (July-Dec, 1996), 485-507.

SIXTEENTH CENTURY

Il monastero florentino délie Carmelitane in San Barnaba. Stefano Possanzini, O.Carm. Carmelas, 43 (1, 1996), 123-145.

Erasmus as Hero, or Heretic? Spanish Humanism and the Valladolid Assembly of 1527. Lu Ann Homza. Renaissance Quarterly, L (Spring, 1997), 78-118.

Discourses of Vulnerability : Pietro Alcionio's Orations on the Sack of Rome. Kenneth Gouwens. Renaissance Quarterly, L (Spring, 1997), 38-77.

Political and Religious Propaganda at the Court of Charles V: A Newly-Identified Tract by Alfonso Valdés. Erika Rummel. Historical Research, LXX (Feb., 1997), 23-33.

The Influence of Humanism on Post-Reformation Catholic Preachers in France. Larissa J. Taylor. Renaissance Quarterly, L (Spring, 1997), 119-135.

João de Deus, o santo de Montemor e Granada, no 5o. centenario do nascimento, visto através da obra do seu biógrafo, Frei Antonio de Gouveia (Madrid, 1624). Manuel Cadafaz de Matos. Archivo Teológico Granadino, 59 (1996), 123-143.

Religion, Discipline, and the Economy in Calvin's Geneva. Mark Valeri. Sixteenth Century Journal, XXVlll (Spring, 1997), 123-142.

Les premiers réformés et leurs cimetières en pays foyen. Jean Vircoulon. Bulletin de la Société de l'Histoire du Protestantisme Français, 143 (Jan.-Mar., 1997), 21-38.

John Cheke's Preface to De Superstitione. John F. McDiarmid./owra«/ ofEcclesiastical History, 48 (Jan., 1997), 100-120.

Der rastlos bewährte Pontifex. Eine ikonologische Deutung der Fresken Vasaris im "Saal der Hundert Tage" der Cancellería. Volker Reinhardt. Quellen und Forschungen, 76 (1996), 274-307.

Pierre Du Chastel et la Faculté de théologie de Paris: règlement de compte autour de la mort du roi François. Pascale Chiron. Bibliothèque d'Humanisme et Renaissance, LLX (1, 1997), 29-39.

For the Good of the City: The Bishop and the Ruling Elite in Tridentine Modena. Michelle M. Fontaine. Sixteenth Century Journal, XXVIII (Spring, 1997), 29-43.

I vescovi campani ed il Concilio di Trento. Michèle Cassese. Ricerche di Storia Sociale e Religiosa, XXVI Qune-Dec, 1996), 189-215.

Generaläbte der Zisterzienser auf dem Konzil von Trient. Zur Vorgeschichte der Fürstenfelder Äbteversammlung von 1595. Polykarp Zakar. Analecta Gsterciensia, LII (Jan.-Dec, 1996), 49-75.

Jesuit Colleges and Chapels: Motet Functions in the Late Sixteenth and Early Seventeenth Centuries. T. Frank Kennedy, SJ. Archivum Historicum Societatislesu, LXV (July-Dec, 1996), 197-213.

Jacob Andreae im Streit mit Cyriakus Spangenberg. Quellen zur Disputation von Sangerhausen 1577. Helmut Neumaier. Blätter für württembergische Kirchengeschichte, 95 (1995), 49-88.

The Moral Agency and Moral Autonomy of Church Folk in the Dutch Reformed Church of Delft, 1580-1620. Charles Parker. Journal ofEcclesiastical History, 48 (Jan., 1997), 44-70.

Robert Vaux and Martin Chemnitz: An Anglican-Lutheran Encounter. J. Francis Watson. Anglican Theological Review, LXXLX (Winter, 1997), 38-44.

The Age of Caravaggio: Early Modern Catholicism. Pamela Jones. Studies, 86 (Spring, 1997), 33-42.

L'attività sinodale della chiesa méridionale in età post-tridentina: il sínodo diocesano leccese del 1587. Piero Doria. Ricerche di Storia Sociale e Religiosa, XXVI (June-Dec, 1996), 153-188.

Engendering the Wars of Religion: Female Agency during the Catholic League in Dijon. S. Annette Finley-Croswhite. French Historical Studies, 20 (Spring, 1997), 127-154.

Zur Redigierung der Fürstenfelder Reformstatuten von 1595. Hans Bruno Schneider. Anälecta Cisterciensia, LII (Jan.-Dec, 1996), 76-96.

Patterns of Godly Life: The Ideal Parish Minister in Sixteenth- and Seventeenth-Century English Thought. Neal Enssle. Sixteenth Century Journal, XXVIII (Spring, 1997), 3-28.

SEVENTEENTH AND EIGHTEENTH CENTURIES

Amici e Creature. Politische Mikrogeschichte der römischen Kurie im 17. Jahrhundert. Wolfgang Reinhard. Quellen und Forschungen, 76 (1996), 308-334.

Das Generalkapitel von 1601 und das Projekt einer Kongregation im oberdeutschen Raum. Leonhard Scherg.^4ra«fecto Cisterciensia, LII (Jan.-Dec, 1996),97-135.

Christian Influences in Sierra Leone before 1787. P E. H. Hait. Journal of Religion in Africa, XXVII (Feb., 1997), 3-14.

De Instituto societatis iesu. Monarquía y cuerpo universal de compañía en el proceso de confesionalización católica. José María Iñurritegui Rodríguez. Estudios Eclesiásticos, 72 (Jan.-Mar., 1997), 101-119.

Los Hospitalicos de niños y niñas de Zaragoza en 1605 según la visita del arzobispo Tomás de Borja. Juan Ramón Royo García. Revista de Historia Jerónimo Zurita, No. 69-70 (1994), 115-127.

Puritan Church Architecture and Worship in a Dutch Context. Keith L. Sprunger. Church History, 66 (Mar., 1997), 36-53·

Der Kirchenvater der lutherischen Orthodoxie Johann Gerhard (1582-1637) und ein Forschungsprojekt. Johann Anselm Steiger. Kerygma und Dogma, 43 (Jan.-Mar., 1997), 58-76.

L' Europe des évêques au temps de la réforme catholique. Joseph Bergin. Bibliothèque de l'École des Chartes, 154 (July-Dec, 1996), 509-531.

Le repli du religieux. Les missionnaires jésuites du 17e siècle entre la théologie chrétienne et une éthique païenne. Ines G. Zupanov. Annales, 51 (Nov.-Dec, 1996), 1201-1223.

"Lor colpa fu d'essere sedotti": un processo dell'inquisizione modenese ad ebrei e neofiti. Andrea Zanardo. Nuova Rivista Storica, LXXX (Sept.-Dec, 1996), 525-592.

Un aspect de la conquête française de l'Artois: les nominations aux bénéfices majeurs de 1640 à 1668. Olivier Poncet. Revue d'Histoire de l'Église de France, LXXXII (July-Dec, 1996), 263-299.

Un lecteur catholique de l'Histoire universelle d'Agrippa d'Aubigné: Gabriel Boule. Gilles Banderier. Bulletin de la Société de l'Histoire du Protestantisme Français, 143 Oan.-Mar., 1997), 9 -19·

To the Attentive, Nonpartisan Reader: The Appeal to History and National Identity in the Religious Disputes of the Seventeenth-Century Netherlands. Charles H. Parker. Sixteenth Century Journal, XXVIII (Spring, 1997), 57-78.

The Revival of the Birgittine Order in the 17th Century: What Happened after the Reformation? Ulla Sander Olsen. Revue d'histoire ecclésiastique, XCI (July-Dec, 1996), 805-833.

"Let Truth Be Free": John Bunyan and the Restoration Crisis of 1667-1673. Richard L. Greaves. Albion, 28 (Winter, 1996), 587-605.

Between Political Loyalty and Religious Liberty: Political Theory and Toleration in Huguenot Thought in the Epoch of Bayle. Luisa Simonutti. History of Political Thought, XVII (Winter, 1996), 523-554.

Echi in Toscana della controversia tra Bossuet e Fenelon. Enrico Bint. Divinitas, XL (Feb., 1997), 24-61.

Tra '700 e '800. Assistenza e beneficenza a Roma. La questione della mendicità. Luciano Nasto. Rassegna Storica del Risorgimento, LXXXIII (Oct.-Dec, 1996), 441-462.

Guardie e mendicanti: i collettori dell'Ospizio di Carita di Torino (1716-1743). Evelina Christillin. Bollettino Storico-Bibliografico Subalpino, XCIV (2, 1996), 541-588.

L'Ospizio Apostólico de' poveri invalidi detto il San Michèle (sec. XVHT). Tra ortopedia sociale e rieducazione al lavoro. Luciano Nasto. Studi Romani, XLIV (July-Dec., 1996), 272-294.

Los franciscanos descalzos españoles por la Inmaculada Concepción en 1732. Víctor Sánchez, O.F.M. Archivum Franciscanum Historicum, 89 (July-Dec, 1996), 561-584.

Dr. Johann Kaysers "Evangelisches Bedencken" (1738). Ein Beitrag zur Jud-Süß-Forschung und zur Geschichte des separatistischen Pietismus in Württemberg. Martin Jung. Blätter für württembergische Kirchengeschichte, 95 (1995), 89-113.

"Naïve Monarchism" and Marian Veneration in Early Modern Germany. David M. Luebke. Past & Present, No. 154 (Feb., 1997), 71-106.

Methodism, the Clergy, and the Popular Belief in Witchcraft and Magic. Owen Davies. History, 82 (Apr., 1997), 252-265.

La bibliothèque d'un érudit toulousain du XVIIIe siècle, l'abbé Magi. Koichi Yamazaki. Annales du Midi, CLX (Jan.-Mar., 1997), 33-51.

Il ferrarese Giovanni Rondinelli, Vescovo di Comacchio e suo esilio (1758-1795), nella vita sociale ed económica della città lagunare. Giuseppe Turri. Palestra del Clero, 75 (Oct.-Nov., 1996), 735-756.

Johann Georg Rapp (1757-1847) und die Separatisten in Iptingen. Mit einer Edition der relevanten Iptinger Kirchenkonventsprotokolle. Eberhard Fritz. Blätter für württembergische Kirchengeschichte, 95 (1995), 133-207.

Scipione De' Ricci e la Santa Sede dopo il Sínodo di Pistoia (1786). Il carteggio Garampi. Vincenzo Calabrese, O.F.M. Antonianum, LXXII (Jan.-Mar., 1997), 79-93.

Des communautés paroissiales aux communes en Bretagne et en Normandie. Un conflit pour l'identité communautaire. Antoine Follain. Annales de Bretagne et des Pays de l'Ouest, 104 (1, 1997), 33-66.

Mons. Karl Theodor Anton M. Von Dalberg nella corrispondenza con Pio VII dall'ASV [Ep. ad Principes] (Segretaria di Stato). Rosario E Esposito. Palestra del Clero, 75 (Oct.-Nov, 1996), 757-772.

Un insigne prelato della Curia Romana elevato alia Porpora dal Ven. Pio LX nel 1848. Il Cardinale Carlo Vizzardelli. Stefano Gizzi. Pio IX, XXVI (Jan.-Apr., 1997), 62-98.

French Nuns in Nineteenth-Century England. Susan O'Brien. Past & Present, No. 154 (Feb., 1997), 142-180.

Le procès super non cultu, source de l'histoire des pèlerinages: Germaine Cousin et le sanctuaire de Pibrac au lendemain de la Révolution française. Philippe Boutry. Bibliothèque de l'École des Chartes, 154 (July-Dec, 1996X565-590.

Il Conclave del 1846 e l'elezione di Papa Pio LX. Stefano Gizzi. Pio IX, XXVI (Jan.-Apr., 1997), 12-43.

John Foxe's Victorian Reception. D. Andrew Penny. Historical Journal, 40 (Mar., 1997), 111-142.

Thomas More's Reputation in Nineteenth-Century England. Russell M. Wyland. Moreana, 33 (Dec, 1996), 37-56.

La Société de l'Histoire du Protestantisme Français et son Bulletin. Anne Reichert. Bulletin de la Société de l'Histoire du Protestantisme Français, 143 (Jan.-Mar., 1997), 63-97.

Neues zur Frühgeschichte der Österreichisch-Ungarischen Zisterzienserkongregation (1859-1880). Die Wahl von Leopold Wackarz zum Generalvikar und ihre Folgen. Hans Bruno Schneider. Analecta Cisterciensia, LII (Jan.-Dec., 1996), 136-203.

Chapels and the Ecclesial World of Prerevolutionary Russian Peasants. Vera Shevzov. Slavic Review, 55 (Fall, 1996), 585-613.

La Guardia Palatina sotto il regime delle Guarentigie. Niccolö Del Re. Pio IX, XXVI (Jan.-Apr., 1997), 44-61.

Pio LX e il saggista Thureau Dagin. Voce laica a glorificazione d'un pontificato. Arnaldo Pedrini. Pio IX, XXVI Qan.-Apr., 1997), 3-11.

Of Catechisms and Sermons: Church-State Relations in France, 1890-1905. Joan L. Coffey. Church History, 66 (Mar., 1997), 54-66.

Apologetik zwischen Konfrontation und Dialog. Von der Apologetischen Centrale zur Evangelischen Zentralstelle für Weltanschauungsfragen. Rainer Lächele. Blätter für württembergische Kirchengeschichte, 95 (1995), 232-262.

Max Weber, Italien und der Katholizismus. Peter Hersche. Quellen und Forschungen, 16 (1996), 362-382.

Frederick Temple, Randall Davidson and the Coronation of Edward VII. Peter Hinchliff. Journal of Ecclesiastical History, 48 (Jan., 1997), 71-99.

Charles de Foucauld. Missionarische Präsenz in der Karawane. Josef Amstutz. Neue Zeitschrift für Missionswissenschaft, 53 (1, 1997), 1-59.

Giuseppe Dalla Torre a Padova. Angelo Gambasin. Ricerche di Storia Sociale e Religiosa, XXVI (June-Dec, 1996), 231-247.

Zacarías García Villada, S.I. historiador, paleógrafo y diplomatista (1879-1936). Fernando de Lasala, S.I. Archivum Historicum Societatis Iesu, LXV (July-Dec, 1996), 215-232.

The Heresy of "Bolshevik" Christianity: Orthodox Rejection of Religious Reform during NEP Edward E. Roslof. Slavic Review, 55 (Fall , 1996), 614-635.

La Bonne Presse dans le diocèse de Poitiers d'après une enquête de 1922. Jacques Bouquet. Revue d'Histoire de l'Église de France, LXXXII (July-Dec, 1996), 311-322.

Le Père Montuclard, l'action catholique et la mission (1936-1940). Thierry Keck. Revue d'Histoire de l'Eglise de France, LXXXII (July-Dec, 1996), 301-310.

NeI 50° della liberazione di Assisi dai pericoli della guerra, 1944-1994. Lorenzo Di Fonzo, O.EM.Conv. Miscellanea Francescana, 96 (July-Dec, 1996), 633-642.

The Case of the "Cultivated Man": Class, Gender and the Church of the Establishment in Interwar Australia. Anne O'Brien. Australian Historical Studies, 27 (Oct., 1996), 242-256.

Das Archiv des Zisterzienserstiftes Hohenfurt in der Pflege des staatlichen Gebietsarchivs in Treboň 1950-1994. Marie Répásová. Analecta Cisterciensia, UI (Jan.-Dec., 1996), 204-223.

The Armenian Church under the Soviet Regime, Part 2: The Leadership of Vazgen. Felix Corley. Religion, State & Society, 24 (Dec, 1996), 289-343.

L'esperienza dei preti opérai italiani riletta dall'esterno. L'osservatorio della stampa. Fulvia Raffaelli. Humanitas, LII (Feb., 1997), 53-76.

Christmas in Early New England, 1620-1820: Puritanism, Popular Culture, and the Printed Word. Stephen W Nissenbaum. Proceedings of the American Antiquarian Society, 106 (1, 1996), 79-164.

A Communion of Saints: The Move to Restrict Admissions to the Lord's Supper in the Congregational Churches of Connecticut, 1740-1818. James P. Walsh. Mid-America, 78 (Fall, 1996), 259-278.

"Know How Thou Oughtest to Behave Thyself in the House of God": The Creation of Ritual Orthodoxy by Eighteenth-Century Baptists. Janet Moore Lindman. Mid-America, 78 (Fall, 1996), 237-257.

The Staff of Leadership: Indian Authority in the Missions of Alta California. Steven W Hackel. William and Mary Quarterly, UV (Apr., 1997), 347-376.

Congregational Autonomy and Presbyterian Discipline: The Immoral Ministry of Luther Gleason in Early Republic New York, 1789-1808. Robert E. Cray, Jr. Mid-America, 78 (Fall, 1996), 303-324.

The Origins of the Second Great Awakening in New England: Goshen, Connecticut, 1798-1799. Richard D. Shiels. Mid-America, 78 (Fall, 1996), 279-301.

David Baker and Old School Revivalism in Mississippi. Robert Milton Winter. American Presbyterians, 74 (Winter, 1996), 227-240.

E. K. Reagin and the Cumberland Presbyterian Tradition. Hubert W Morrow. American Presbyterians, 74 (Winter, 1996), 265-274.

Ontologism in American Catholic Thought, 1840-1900. Patrick W Carey. Revue d'histoire ecclésiastique, XCI (July-Dec, 1996), 834-861.

The Impact of Early New England Missionaries on Women's Roles in Zulu Culture. Amanda Porterfield. Church History, 66 (Mar., 1997), 67-80.

Native American Resistance and Presbyterian Missions in Post-Civil War New Mexico, 1867-1912. Michelle Butts. American Presbyterians, 74 (Winter, 1996), 241-252.

The Benedictine Sisters of Saint Scholastica: The Formative Years, 1878-1926. Scott Jones. Arkansas Historical Quarterly, LVI (Spring, 1997), 80-94.

"Mainline Women Ministers: One Beginning Point": Women Missionary and Temperance Organizers Become 'Disciples of Christ' Ministers, 1888-1908. Glenn Michael Zuber. Mid-America, 78 (Summer, 1996), 109-137.

Spin Doctors at Santee: Missionaries and the Dakota-language Reporting of the Ghost Dance and Wounded Knee. Todd Kerstetter. Western Historical Quarterly, XXVIII (Spring, 1997), 45-67.

Swelling the Ranks: Walter Elliott and the Extension of Paulist Evangelization. Lawrence McDonnell, CS.P. Journal of Paulist Studies, 4 (1995-1996), 33-45.

"The Holy Spirit Come to Us and Forbid the Negro Taking a Second Place": Richard H. Boyd and Black Religious Activism in Nashville, Tennessee. Paul Harvey. Tennessee Historical Quarterly, LV (Fall, 1996), 190-201.

Thomas Verner Moore's Paulist Roots. Benedict Neenan, O.S.B. fournal of Paulist Studies, 4 (1995-1996), 15-31.

The Trials of A. A. Morrison, Rector of Trinity Church. John C. Beattyjr. Oregon Historical Quarterly, 97 (Winter, 1996-97), 428-469.

John J. Burke C.S.P.: The Vision and Character of a Public Churchman. Douglas Slawson. Journal of Paulist Studies, 4 (1995-1996), 47-93.

From Widow's Mite to Widow's Might: The Philanthropy of Margaret Olivia Sage. Ruth Crocker. American Presbyterians, 74 (Winter, 1996), 253-264.

A Conflict of Values, a Confusion of Laws: The Case of John Elliott Ross. John E. Lynch, CS.?. Journal of Paulist Studies, 4 (1995-1996), 1-14.

The Great White Migration, Alcohol, and the Transplantation of Southern Protestant Churches. Chad Berry. Register of the Kentucky Historical Society, 94 (Summer, 1996), 265-296.

Trends in the Missouri Synod as Reflected in the Lutheran Witness, 1960-Early 1993. Leland Stevens. Concordia Historical Institute Quarterly, 69 (Winter, 1996), 165-182.

### LATIN AMERICAN

Les pouvoirs de la parole. La prédication au Pérou: de révangélisation à l'utopie. Juan Carlos Estenssoro-Fuchs. Annales, 51 (Nov.-Dec, 1996), 1225-1257.

La iglesia y la Medicina en la colonia. Alfredo Naranjo Villegas. Revista de la Academia Colombiana de Historia Eclesiástica, No. 46 (1996), 89-97.

Mini-monografía de la Diócesis de Pasto. Primera Parte—Antecedentes. José Vicente Agreda A. Revista de la Academia Colombiana de Historia Eclesiástica, No. 46 (1996), 133-154.

Idolatry and Iconoclasm in Revolutionary Mexico: The Dechristianization Campaigns, 1929-1940. Adrian Bantjes. Mexican Studies, 13 (Winter, 1997), 87-120.

Monseñor Alfonso Uribe Jaramillo: su vida. Luis Alfonso Londoño B. Revista de la Academia Colombiana de Historia Eclesiástica, No. 46 (1996), 55-80.

Escritos de Monseñor Alfonso Uribe. Revista de la Academia Colombiana de Historia Eclesiástica, No. 46 (1996), 81-87.

Developing an Indigenous Church in Guatemala: Robert Gussick, a Pioneer Strategic Planner. Douglas L. Rutt. Concordia Historical Institute Quarterly, 69 (Winter, 1996), 183-199.

Protestantism and Indigenous Mobilisation: The Moravian Church among the Miskitu Indians of Nicaragua. Susan Hawley. Journal of Latin American Studies, 29 (Feb., 1997), 111-129.

# OTHER BOOKS RECEIVED

Aers, David, and Lynn Staley. The Powers of the Holy: Religion, Politics, and Gender in Late Medieval English Culture. (University Park: The Pennsylvania State University Press. 1996. Pp. vU, 310. $45.00 cloth; $19.95 paperback.)

Baum, Gregory. The Church for Others: Protestant Theology in Commmunist East Germany. (Grand Rapids, Mich.: William B. Eerdmans PubUshUig Company. 1996. Pp. xvii, 156. $15.00 paperback.)

Bradshaw, Paul E, and Lawrence A. Hoffman (Eds.). Life Cycles in Jewish and Christian Worship. [Two Liturgical Traditions, Volume 4.] (Notre Dame, Ind.: University of Notre Dame Press. 1996. Pp. ix, 303. $32.95.)

Brett, Annabel S. Liberty, Right and Nature: Individual Rights in Later Scholastic Thought. [Ideas in Context, 44.] (New York: Cambridge University Press. 1997. Pp. xU, 254. $59-95.)

Casey, Maurice. Is John's Gospel True? (New York: Routledge. 1996. Pp. xii, 268. $74.95.)

Cavadini john C. (Ed.). Gregory the Great. A Symposium. [Notre Dame Studies in Theology, Volume 2.] (Notre Dame, Ind.: University of Notre Dame Press. 1995. Pp. xiv, 226. $34.95.) Contents: 1. Robert A. Markus, "The Jew as a Hermeneutic Device: The Inner Life of Gregorian Topos" (pp. 1-15); 2. Carole Straw, "Purity and Death" (pp. 16-37); 3. Conrad Leyser, "Expertise and Authority Ln Gregory the Great: The Social Function of Peritia" (pp. 38-6l); 4. James J. 0'DonneU, "The Holiness of Gregory" (pp. 62-81); 5. Rodrigue Bélanger, "La dialectique Parole-Chair dans la christologie de Grégoire le Grand" (pp. 82-93); 6. Paul Meyvaert, "A Letter of Pelagius II Composed by Gregory the Great" (pp. 94-116); 7. G. J. M. Bartelink, "Pope Gregory the Great's Knowledge of Greek" (pp. 117-136); Paul Meyvaert, "Translator's Appendix: Gregory the Great and Astronomy" (pp. 137-145); 8. Bernard McGinn, "Contemplation Ln Gregory the Great" (pp. 146-167); 9. Grover A. Zinn, Jr., "Exegesis and SpirituaUty in the Writings of Gregory the Great" (pp. 168-180); 10. Celia Chazelle, "Memory, Instruction, Worship: 'Gregory's' Influence on Early Medieval Doctrines of the Artistic Image" (pp. 181-215); U.E. Ann Matter, "Gregory the Great in the Twelfth Century: The Glossa Ordinaria" (pp. 216-226).

ChaUha, Yaya, and Edward Le JoIy (Comp.). The Joy in Loving: A Guide to Daily Living with Mother Teresa. (New York: Viking. 1997. Pp. 438. $1995.)

Clancy, Thomas H., SJ. English Catholic Books, 1641-1700: A Bibliography. Revised Edition. (Brookfield, Vt.: Scolar Press, Ashgate PubUshing Company. 1996. Pp. xvUi, 215. $67.95.) The first edition, pubUshed by Loyola University Press of Chicago Ln 1974, was reviewed by J. Anthony Williams ante, LXIII Guly, 1977), 464-465. The numbers in that edition have been preserved; new discoveries have been added under decimals. Use is faciUtated by thorough indexes of printers and bookseUers, translators and editors, persons and groups to whom books were dedicated, and proper names mentioned Ui the text as well as a chronological index.

Conn, Samuel K. Jr. Women in the Streets: Essays on Sex and Power in Renaissance Italy. (Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press. 1996. Pp. xi, 250. Paperback.) The fifth chapter deals with "Nuns and Dowry Funds: Women's Choices in the Renaissance" (pp. 76-97).

Cummins, John. Francis Drake: The Lives of a Hero. (New York: St. Martin's Press. 1997. Pp. xv, 348. $16.95 paperback.)

Curran, Charles E. The Origins of Moral Theology in the United States: Three Different Approaches. [Moral Traditions and Moral Arguments.] (Washington, D.C: Georgetown University Press. 1997. Pp. xiii, 311. $55.00 cloth; $24.95 paperback.) The three moral theologians studied here are Aloysius Sabetti, SJ., Thomas J. Bouquillon, and John B. Hogan, S.S.

de Grazia, Sebastian. A Country with No Name: Tales from the Constitution. (New York: Pantheon Books. 1997. Pp. Lx, 419. $27.50.)

Doyle, WUliam. Venality: The Sale of Offices in Eighteenth-Century France. (New York: Clarendon Press, Oxford University Press. 1996. Pp. xvU, 343· $85.00.)

Emery, Kent, Jr. Monastic, Scholastic and Mystical Theologies from the Later Middle Ages. [Collected Studies Series.] (Brookfield, Vt.: Variorum, Ashgate Publishing Company. 1996. Pp. xii, 362. $98.95.)

Finocchiaro, Maurice A. (Trans, and Ed.). Galileo on the World Systems. A New Abridged Translation and Guide. (Berkeley: University of California Press. 1997. Pp. xi, 425. $55.00 cloth; $19-95 paper.)

Henderson John. Piety and Charity in Late Medieval Florence. (Chicago: University of Chicago Press. 1997. Pp. xviii, 533. $29.95 paperback.) OriginaUy published in 1994 and reviewed by James R. Banker ante, LXXXII (July 1996), 546-548.

Hollister, C Warren (Ed.). Anglo-Norman Political Culture and the Twelfth-Century Renaissance: Proceedings of the Borchard Conference on Anglo-Norman History, 1995. (Rochester, N.Y.: The BoydeU Press. 1997. Pp. xi, 180. $63.00.) Among the essays are "When the Saints Go Marching: Religious Connections and the Political Culture of Early Normandy," by Cassandra Potts (pp. 17-31), and "Christ Church Canterbury's Anglo-Norman Cartulary," by Robin Fleming (pp. 83-155).

Hosking, Geoffrey. Russia: People and Empire, 1552-1917. (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press. 1997. Pp. xxviü, 548. $29.95.)

Isard, Walter. Commonalities in Art, Science and Religion: An Evolutionary Perspective. (Brookfield,Vt.: Avebury Ashgate PubUshing Company. 1996. Pp. xix, 407. $49.95.)

Kümin, Beat A. (Ed.). Reformations Old and New: Essays on the Socio-Economic Impact ofReligious Change, c. 1470-1630. [St. Andrews Studies in Reformation History] (Brookfield, Vt.: Scolar Press, Ashgate PubUshing Company. 1996. Pp. xiv, 272. $76.95.) Contents: 1. Beat Kümin, "Reformations old and new: an introduction" (pp. 1-17); Part One: "State and purpose of the clergy": 2. Arnoud-Jan A. Bijsterveld,"Reform in the parishes of fifteenth- and sixteenth-century North Brabant" (pp. 21-38); 3. Peter Dykema, "The reforms of Count Eberhard of Württemberg: 'confessionalization' in the fifteenth century" (pp. 39-56); 4. D. G. Newcombe, "John Hooper's visitation and examination of the clergy in the diocese of Gloucester, 1551" (pp. 57-70); Part Two: "Church resources": 5. Richard CahiU, "The sequestration of the Hessian monasteries" (pp. 73-91); 6. Patrick R. N. Carter, The fiscal Reformation: clerical taxation and opposition in Henrician England" (pp. 92-105); Part Three: "Ecclesiastical patronage": 7. Per Ingesman, "Episcopal patronage and social mobiUty in late medieval and Reformation Demark" (pp. 109-123); 8. Peter MarshaU,"The dispersal of monastic patronage in East Yorkshire, 1520-90" (pp. 124-146); 9. Trevor Johnson, "Patronage, Herrschaft, and confession: the Upper-Palatinate nobility and the Counter Reformation" (pp. 147-168); Part Four: "Education": 10. Markus Wriedt, "Continuity and competition: Luther's caU for educational reform in the light of medieval precedents" (pp. 171-184); 11. WUliam G. Naphy "The Reformation and the evolution of Geneva's schools" (pp. 185-202); 12. Karin Maag, "Financing education: the Zurich approach, 1550-1620" (pp. 203-216); Part Five: "Poor reUef": 13- Timothy Fehler, "The burden of benevolence: poor reUef and parish finance in early modern Emden" (pp. 219-236); 14. Andrew Spicer, "Poor relief and the exUe communities" (pp. 237-255).

Makower, Frances, R.S.C.J. (Ed.). Call and Response: Jesuit Journeys in Faith. (Chicago jesuit Way, an imprint of Loyola Press. 1996. Pp. vu, 168. $12.95 paperback.)

Marty, Martin E. The One and the Many: America's Struggle for the Common Good. (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press. 1997. Pp. ix, 244. $24.95.)

Mcintosh, Mark A. Christology from Within: Spirituality and the Incarnation in Hans Urs von Balthasar. [Studies in SpirituaUty and Theology, 3] (Notre Dame, Ind.: University of Notre Dame Press. 1996. Pp. xi, 200. $29.00.)

Oakes, Edward T. Pattern of Redemption: The Theology of Hans Urs von Balthasar. (New York: Continuum. 1997. Pp. xU, 314. $24.95 paperback.)

O'MaUey William J., SJ. The Fifth Week. Second Edition. (Chicago Jesuit Way, an imprint of Loyola Press. 1996. Pp. xv, 218. $5.95 paperback.) OriginaUy pubUshed in 1976.

Partington, Geoffrey. The Australian Nation: Its British and Irish Roots. [Social Policy and Social Theory Series.] (New Brunswick, N.J.: Transaction Publishers. 1997. Pp. xxiv, 347. $44.95.) Originally published Ui 1994 by AustraUan Scholarly Publishing.

PhUips, Paul T A Kingdom on Earth: Anglo-American Social Christianity, 1880-1940. (University Park: The Pennsylvania State University Press. 1996. Pp. xxvii, 303. $55.00 cloth; $16.95 paperback.)

Poorman, Mark L., C.S.C. (Ed.). Labors from the Heart Mission and Ministry in a Catholic University. (Notre Dame, Ind.: University of Notre Dame Press. 1996. Pp. xiU, 278. Paperback.)

QueUer, Donald E., and Thomas F. Madden. The Fourth Crusade: The Conquest of Constantinople. Second Edition. [Middle Ages Series.] (PhUadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press. 1997. Pp. xU, 357. $47.50.) The first edition, by QueUer alone, was published in 1977 and was reviewed by John W. Barker ante, LXVI (October, 1980), 628-630. In this second edition many portions have been substantiaUy revised and expanded. The bibUography and endnotes have also been brought up to date.

Rees, EUzabeth. Christian Symbols, Ancient Roots. (Bristol, Pa. Jessica Kingsley Publishers. 1997. Pp. 165. Paperback.) First published in hardback in 1992.

RoteUe John, O.S.A. (Ed.). Saint Augustine: Teaching Christianity. De Doctrina Christiana, 1/11. Introduction, translation, and notes by Edmund HUl, O.P. [The Works of Saint Augustine.] (Hyde Park, N.Y.: New City Press. 1996. Pp. 259. $29.95 cloth; $19.95 paperback.)

Somerville, Robert. Papacy, Councils and Canon Law in the llth-12th Centuries. [Collected Studies Series] (Brookfield, Vt.: Variorum, Gower PubUshing Company. 1990. Pp. x, 316. $64.95.) Contents: I. "The Case against Berengar of Tours: A New Text"; II. "Cardinal Stephan of St Grisogono: Some Remarks on Legates and Legatine CouncUs in the Eleventh Century"; III. "Anselm of Lucca and Wibert of Ravenna"; FV "Mercy and Justice in the Early Months of Urban IFs Pontificate"; V. "The French CouncUs of Pope Urban II: Some Basic Considerations"; VI. "Prolegomena [to the Edition of the Decreta Claromontensia]"; VII. "The CouncU of Clermont (1095), and Latin Christian Society"; VIII. "The CouncU of Clermont and the First Crusade"; IX. "The So-caUed Canons of Nîmes (1096)"; X. "The CouncU of Beauvais, 1114"; XI. "The Councils of Pope Calixtus II and the CoUection in Ten Parts"; XII. "The CouncUs of Pope Calixtus II: Reims 1119"; XIII. "Pope Honorais II, Conrad of Hohenstaufen, and Lothar III"; XTV "Pope Innocent II and the Study of Roman Law"; XV "The Canons of Reims (1131)"; XVI. "The CouncU of Pisa, 1135: A Re-examination of the Evidence for the Canons"; XVII. "On the Trail of a Lost Morningside Heights Manuscript"; XVIII. "The

Beginning of Alexander Hi's Pontificate: Aeterna et incommutabilis and Scotland"; XLX. "Baluziana." Additions and corrections occupy nine pages.

Stadler, Peter. Der Kulturkampf in der Schweiz: Eidgenossenschaft und katholische Kirche im europäischen Umkreis, 1848-1888. Erweiterte und durchgesehene Neuauflage. (Zurich: Chronos. 1996. Pp. 828.) OriginaUy published in 1984 by the Verlag Huber and reviewed by Victor Conzemius ante, LXXI (April, 1986), 315-316. An afterword has been added in which the current state of research on the subject is reported.

Steinmetz, David C. The Bible in the Sixteenth Century. [Duke Monographs Ln Medieval and Renaissance Studies, 11.] (Durham, N.C.: Duke University Press. 1996. Pp. vii, 263. $16.95 paperback.) OriginaUy pubUshed in 1990 and reviewed by James Michael Weiss ante, LXXX QuIy 1994), 587-588.

Stone, Elaine Murray. Maximilian Kolbe: Saint of Auschwitz. IUustrated by Patrick KeUey (Mahwah, N.J.: PauUst Press. 1997. Pp. xiv, 106. $6.95 paperback.)

WeaverJ. Denny. Keeping Salvation Ethical: Mennonite and Amish Atonement Theology in the Late Nineteenth Century. [Studies in Anabaptist and Mennonite History, No. 35.] (Scottdale, Pa.: Herald Press. 1997. Pp. 316. $1999 paperback.)

Young, Michael B. Charles I. [British History in Perspective.] (New York: St. Martin's Press. 1997. Pp. vUi, 223. $49.95 cloth; $17.95 paperback.)