

The Catholic Historical Review

ROBERT TRISCO

Editor

JACQUES GRES-GAYER

NELSON H. **MINNICH** GLENN OLSEN

Advisory Editors

VOLUME LXXXIII

1997

Published Quarterly by

The Catholic University of America Press

Washington, D.C. 20064

1997

Table of Contents

ARTICLES:

Penitential Sermons in Renaissance Italy: Girolamo Seripando and the Pater Noster	Francesco C. Cesáreo 1
Catholic-Marxist Competition in the Working-Class Parishes of Cologne during the Weimar Republic	Raymond C. Sun 20
A Parish for the Black Catholics of Boston	William C. Leonard 44
Regalism, Liberalism, and General Franco	William J. Callahan 201
The Early Development of Pierre d'Ailly's Conciliarism	Christopher M. Bellitto 217
After Vatican Council II: The American Catholic Bishops and the "Syllabus" from Rome, 1966-1968	Samuel J. Thomas 233
Reaction and Reform: Reception of Heresy in Arras and Aquitaine in the Early Eleventh Century	Michael Frassetto 385
Reconciliation of Cultures in the Third Republic: Emile Mâle (1862-1954)	Joseph E. Byrnes 401
Archbishop Joseph Schrembs's Battle to Obtain Public Assistance for the Parochial Schools of Cleveland during the Great Depression	Martin Poluse 428
Christianity in China	
Introduction	569
New Trends in the Historiography of Christianity in China	Nicolas Standaert, SJ 573
Confucian and Christian Religiosity in Late Ming China . . .	Erik Zürcher 614
Bringing Christ to the Nations: Shifting Models of Mission among Jesuits in China	Jean-Paul Wiest 654
Chinese Glossary	682
San Diego de Alcalá and the Politics of Saint-Making in Counter-Reformation Europe	L.J. Andrew Villalon 691
Father Demetrius A. Gallitzin: Son of the Russian Enlightenment	Daniel L. Schlafly, Jr. 716

MISCELLANY:

The Execution of John Fisher Viewed through Italian Eyes: A Letter of Cardinal Ercole Gonzaga	Paul V. Murphy 69
The Seventy-seventh Annual Meeting of the American Catholic Historical Association	258

REVIEW ARTICLES:

The Popes and the Jews: From Gelasius I to Julius III (492-1555)	Charles Burns 75
Rewiring the Circuit: Campi's Reformation	Dermot Fenlon 275
The Role of Anticlericalism in the Reformation	Nelson Minnich 452

BOOKREVIEWS

86,281,462,726

BRIEF NOTICES

159

NOTES AND COMMENTS

173,350,542,819

PERIODICAL LITERATURE

185,365,553,831

OTHER BOOKS RECEIVED

194,379,564,843

GENE · - L INDEX

Volume LXXXIII (1997)

Abbreviations:

ACHA—American Catholic Historical Association
 rev.—**review**b.n.—brief note

Académie des Inscriptions et Belles-Lettres

E. Mâle elected to, 419

Académie Française

E. Mâle elected to, 419-420

Accademia di S. Carlo

theme of the dies académicas of the, 173

American Catholic Historical Association

Committee on Program, 542, 819

Committee on the John Gilmary Shea Prize,
 542

deceased members of the, 264-265

Financial Statement, 269-272

new members, 272-274

Report of the Committee on Nominations,
 261-262

Report of the Committee on Program,
 258-261

Report of the Committee on the Howard R.
 Marraro Prize, 263-264

Report of the Secretary and Treasurer,
 264-270

spring meeting in 1998 to be held in Indi-
 anapolis, 350-351

Adamsjasper

The Relation of Christianity to Civil Govern-
 ment in the United States, 507-508

Ademar of Chabarnes, 386-387

De Eucharistia, 390

Adoptionism

CaroUngian contributions to debates on,
 764

debates on, 305

Agostino, Marc

Le Pape Pie XI et l'opinion (1922-1939),
 rev., 122-126

AguayoJose

rev. of J. E. Chorprenning, O.S.F.S., editor, 160

Ahlgren, Gillian T. W.

Teresa of Avila and the Politics of Sanctity,
 rev., 338-339

Albany diocese celebrating 150th anniversary of
 its establishment, 177

Albigensian Crusade history, 312-313

Alcalá de Henares University, 92

Alcalá-Zamora, Niceto

approach toward church-state relations, 207

Aleni, Giulio

debate on opening phrase of the Doctrine of
 the Mean, 626-627

Alexander, Thomas G.

on later nineteenth-century Mormons, 132

Alfonso the Battler (A.D. 1104-1134)

Aragon's Expansion into Islam's Ebro Frontier
 under, 776-777

Allen, David F.

rev. of P. Bander van Duren, 738-739

Allen, Leonard

Roger Williams's fascination with the New
 Testament church, 132

Almaráz, Félix D., Jr.

rev. of J. P. Dolan and G. M. Hinojosa, editors,
 141-143

Alumbrados

backlash against, 339

Alvarez, David

member of the Committee on Program, 542

Alvarez Bolado, Alfonso

Para ganar la guerra, para ganar la paz:
 Iglesia y guerra civil: 1936-1939, rev.,
 502-503

Ambrose, Saint, 295-296

in orchestrating the cults of SS. Gervasio and
 Protasio, 279

American Baptists, essays on, 132

"The American Catholic Experience: New His-
 torical Perspectives" lecture series, 351

American Catholicism history, 161-162

American Catholics and Slavery: 1789-1866. An-
 thology of Primary Documents, 510-512

American Cusanus Society sessions presented at
 International Congress on Medieval Studies
 by, 543

American Life Lobby, 533

American Mennonites, essays on, 132

American Methodism

Domestication of, 134-135
 essays on, 132

GENERAL INDEX

- Amish, essays on, 132
- Andrew and the apostolic origin of the Ukrainian Church, Saint, 734
- AngUbert, the symbolic vision of, 305-306
- Anglicanism in nineteenth-century England, 115
- Angold, Michael
 Church and Society in Byzantium under the Comneni, 1081-1261, rev. 771-772
- Angoulême, Marguerite d'
 criticized corrupt Catholic clergy in Hoptameron, 456
- Anthony, rise and fall of the late medieval cult of Saint, 787
- antiercericalism
 directed against Protestant and Tridentine clerics, 459-460
 role in the Reformation of, 452-461
- Antifraternalism and Antiercericalism in the German Reformation
 Johann Eberlin von Ginzburg and the Campaign against the Friars, 801-802
- Anti-Judaism associated with cannibalism and child murder, 389-390
- anti-Semitism of Christian Socialism, 122
- Antoniazzi, Margarita
 Life by P.M. Campi of, 278
- Antoninus of Florence, Archbishop. See Pierozzi, Antonino
- Apologia del Beneficio di Christo e altri scritti inediti, 806-807
- Apostolic Tradition, 294-295
- Appleby, Scott, on contemporary fundamentalism, 131
- Aquitaine and Arras in the Early Eleventh Century, Heresy in, 385-400
- Aragon's Expansion into Islam's Ebro Frontier under Alfonso the Battler (A.D. 1104-1134), 776-777
- Archaeology of Early Christianity: A History, 729-731
- Arcilla, José S., S.J.
 Jesuit Missionary Letters from Mindanao. Volume Two: The Zamboanga-Basilanjolo Mission, rev., 816-818
- Arian-Nicene Conflicts end and Ambrose of Milan 295-296
- Arianism
 and Other Heresies by St. Augustine, 159
 western manifestation of, 295-296
- Armenia and Byzantium, Art and Architecture, 756-757
- Armstrong, Brother Philip, C.S.C.
 A More Perfect Legacy: A Portrait of Brother Ephrem O'Dwyer, C.S.C., 1888-1978, rev. 147-148
- Arnstein, Walter L.
 rev. of D. G. Paz, editor, 114-115
- Arras and Aquitaine, Heresy in the Early Eleventh Century, 385-400
- Art and Architecture in Byzantium and Armenia-Liturgical and Exegetical Approaches, 756-757
- art in secondary education, 413
- art programs, key role of clergy and theologians in determining, 415
- Asceticism, 282-283
- Assembly of the French Clergy, 106-107
- "associational Catholicism" in Germany (1848-1914), 117-118
- athletae Christi, Saints as, 279
- Augustine, Saint, 161
 Arianism and Other Heresies, b.n., 159
 and the Catechumenate, 166
 on relationship between the Jewish Synagogue and the Gentile Church, 81
 thought in context, 749-750
 on Women, 750-751
- Augustine of Canterbury, Saint
 fourteenth century of the arrival in Kent to be commemorated at Medieval Congress, 352
- Augustinians in Mecklenburg, 317
- Aune, David E.
 rev. of W. H. Wagner, 741-742
- Aurore University. See also Zhendan
 idea of a Chinese system of Shuyuan with a western curriculum rejected by French, 670-671
- Austin Friars in Mecklenburg, 316-317
- Austin, Gerard, OP
 rev. of P. Cramer, 731-732
- Aversa, Guitmondo di
 conference to be held on, 544
- Avignon papacy
 France's withdrawal of spiritual and financial obedience from, 217
- Backman, Clifford R.
 The Decline and Fall of Medieval Sicily: Politics, Religion, and Economy in the Reign of Frederick III, 1296-1337, rev. 86-87
- Badillo, David A.
 on emerging Mexican-American communities in the Midwest, 143
- Ballester, Carmelo
 Vincentian priest named bishop of León, 210
- Bander van Duren, Peter
 Orders of Knighthood and of Merit: The Pontifical, Religious and Secularized Catholic-founded Orders, and their relationship to the Apostolic See, rev., 738-739
- baptism
 reasons given for being worthless by heretics of Aquitaine, 391
 and change in the Early Middle Ages, c. 200-c. 1150, 731-732
 first conferred in the New World commemoration by Pope John Paul ? of the quinquagesimal year, 177
- Baptists in nineteenth-century England, 114-115
- Barber, Malcolm, 777-778
 The New Knighthood: A History of the Order of the Temple, rev. 779-780

- Baumgartner, Frederic J. John Howe, and Mary J. Oates, C.S.J.
 Report of the ACHA Committee on the John Gilmary Shea Prize, 262-263
- Baumstein, Pascal
 pamphlet on "The Art of Michael McInerney," 551
- Bayor, Ronald H., and Timothy J. Meagher, editors
 The New York Irish, rev., 506-507
- Bays, Daniel H.
 Christianity in China from the Eighteenth Century to the Present, rev, 814-816
- Beaton, Cardinal David
 assassination of, 352
- Becket, Archbishop Thomas
 shrine of, 285-286
- Bédier, Joseph, 406
- Bellitto, Christopher M.
 "The Early Development of Pierre d'Ailly's Conciliarism," 217-232
 Nicholas de Clamange: Reformatio Personalis as the Foundation of Church Reform during the Great Schism, paper given at ACHA 77th annual meeting, 259
- Benedictine-revival monastery at Solesmes, 411
- Benedict XIII, Pope of Avignon
 as Argonese Pedro de Luna, 225
 made R d'Ailly bishop of Cambrai, 218
 refusal to abdicate of, 226
- Benedict XIV, Pope
 institution of a Chair of Liturgy and a Chair of History by, 280
- Benedict XV, Pope
 had no significant influence on his times, 123
- Benko, Stephen
 rev. of R. Stark, 739-741
- Bergen, Doris L.
 Twisted Cross: The German Christian Movement in the Third Reich, rev., 499-500
- Berlinghieri, Francesco
 exhorted the faithful to practice penitential mortification, 3
- Bernard, Saint
 sermons 39 to 86 on the Song of Songs, 777-778
- Bérulle, Pierre de, 104
- Bessarion, Cardinal, 95-97
- biannian tradition of historical studies, 583
- Bilaniuk, Petro B. T.
 rev. of S. Senyk, 733-735
- Bilinkoff, Jodi
 rev. of G. T. W Ahlgren, 338-339
- Biller, Peter
 rev. of A. Friedlander, 791-792
- Binski, Paul
 Westminster Abbey and the Plantagenets: Kingship and the Representation of Power, 1200-1400, rev, 311-312
- Bireley, Robert, SJ.
 rev. of H. Záh and S. Strodel, editors, 345-346
 rev. of J. Wijnhoven, 107-108
- Bitel, Lisa M.
 rev. of D. Edel, editor, 754-755
- rev. Off. Cahill, 299-300
- Black Baptists
 essay on history in Indiana of, 513
- Black Catholics
 Boston parish for the, 44-68
- Black Death and Pastoral Leadership: The Diocese of Hereford in the Fourteenth Century, 90-91
- Black Elk's Religion: The Sun Dance and Lakota Catholicism, 140-141
- Blanchard, Jean
 university opposition against, 222
- Blet, Pierre, SJ.
 Le clergé du Grand Siècle en ses assemblées (1615-1717), rev, 106-107
- Block, David
 Mission Culture on the Upper Amazon: Native Tradition, Jesuit Enterprise, Secular Policy in Moxos, 1660-1880, b.n., 159-160
- Bogomilism
 investigations into, 772
- Book of Documents, 628
- Book of Songs, 628
- "Book of the Warning Bell," 647-648
- Boston
 Black Churches in, 68
 A Parish for the Black Catholics of, 44-68
- Bouchard, Constance B.
 rev. of A. G. Remensnyder, 768-769
 rev. of M. G. Newman, 772-773
- Boyea, Earl
 rev. of M. Warner, 146-147
- Boyer, John W.
 Culture and Political Crisis in Vienna: Christian Socialism in Power, 1897-1918, rev., 121-122
- Bozeman, T. Dwight
 on Puritanism, 132
- Bozsóky, Paul G., and László Lukács
 De l'oppression à la liberté, L'Eglise en Hon-
 grie, 1945-1992, rev., 130-131
- Brading, D. A.
 Church and State in Bourbon Mexico: The Diocese of Michoacán 1749-1810, rev., 810-811
- Brady, Thomas A. Jr.
 rev. of Joel E Harrington, 99-100
- Breen, John, and Mark Williams, editors
 Japan and Christianity: Impacts and Responses, rev., 813-814
- Brent, Alien
 Hippolytus and the Roman Church in the Third Century: Communities in Tension before the Emergence of a Monarch-Bishop, rev, 294-295
- Brethren of the Common Life
 as attempt to create a group half-way between religious and laity, 455
- Bricker, John W., Attorney General
 legal opinion against parochial school aid, 440-441
- Briggs, Charles Augustus
 The Ecumenical Orthodox of, 524-525

- Brodman James W.
rev. of J. Edwards, 324-325
- Bronescombe, Walter
The Register of, 317-318
- Brown, Mary Elizabeth
Churches, Communities and Children: Italian Immigrants in the Archdiocese of New York, 1880-1945, rev., 520-521
- Brown, Peter
The Rise of Western Christendom. Triumph and Diversity, AD 200-1000, rev., 745-746
- Brown, Thomas Elton
rev. of J. D. White, 522
- Brownson, Orestes A.
Religion and the Public Schools in 19th Century America: The Contribution of, 516-517
- Brox, Norbert
A Concise History of the Early Church, rev., 293-294
- Brundage, James A.
Medieval Canon Law, rev., 755-756
- Buffalo diocese celebrating 150th anniversary of its establishment, 177
- Bundy, David
rev. of H. J. W. Drijvers, 746-748
- Burkhart, Louise M.
Holy Wednesday: A Nahuatl Drama from Early Colonial Mexico, rev., 536-538
- Burns, Charles
"The Popes and the Jews: From Gelasius I to Julius III (492-1555)" review article, 75-85
rev. of J. Kirk, editor, 78 1-782
- Burns, Jeffrey
examination of plight of Mexican immigrants in southern California by, 143
- Burns, Robert L, SJ.
elected Corresponding Member of Institut d'Estudis Catalans, 828
- Burr, David
rev. of N. Minorita, 793-794
- Burrus, Virginia
The Making of a Heretic: Gender, Authority, and the Priscillianist Controversy, rev., 752-753
- Bushnell, Amy Turner
rev. of J. E. Worth, 133-134
- Byrnes Joseph F.
"Reconciliation of Cultures in the Third Republic: Emile Mâle (1862-1954)," 401-427
- Byrnes, Robert E
obituary of, 829-830
- Byzantium and Armenia
Art and Architecture in, 756-757
- Byzantium under the Comneni, 1081-1261
Church and Society in, 771 -772
- Cahill, Thomas
How the Irish Saved Civilization: The Untold Story of Ireland's Heroic role from the Fall of Rome to the Rise of Medieval Europe, rev., 299-300
- Calced Carmelites. See Spanish Carmelites of the Ancient Observance
- California
history memoir of Mexican era, 514-515
Spanish Naval Visit in 1792, 162-163
- Callahan, William J.
"Regalism, Liberalism, and General Franco," 201-216, 260
rev. of S. Haliczzer, 340-341
- Calvinism of the Mediterranean, 330-331
- Calvin's attitudes toward Catholic clerics, 459
- Cambridge Medieval History, The New, Volume II: c. 700-C.900, rev., 302-305
- Campi, Pietro Maria, 276-277
Reformation of, 275-280
- Campion, Edmund
Early English Jesuits and, 468-471
- Canada
A Concise History of Christianity in, 534-536
- Canada Dry: Temperance Crusades before Confederation, 151-153
- Canadian Catholic Historical Association
annual conference, 352
Religion and Secularism theme of articles in issue of Historical Studies, 826-827
- Candy, Catherine
Priestly Fictions: Popular Irish Novelists of the Early 20th Century: Patrick A. Sheehan, Joseph Guiñan, Gerald O'Donovan, rev., 492-494
- cannibalism and child murder, 389
- canonization costs, 712-713
- Cánovas del Castillo, Antonio, Spanish Prime Minister, 205
allowed the virtually unlimited reintroduction of the religious orders into Spain, 206
- Canterbury Cathedral history, 285-286
- Caponetto, Salvatore
La Riforma Protestante nell'Italia del Cinquecento, rev., 330-331
- Capuchin nuns of the Divine Shepherdess, 178
- Carafa, Gian Pietro. See Paul IV, Pope
- Carafa, Pier Luigi
nunciature in Cologne of, 107-108
- Carafa's "Rule," 328-329
- Caraman, Philip, SJ.
rev. of D. Block, 159-160
- Caravale, Mario
how Apostolic Camera increased its ability to collect revenues from the Papal States in the Renaissance, 95
- Cárcel Ortí, M. Milagros, and José Vicente Boscá Codina
Visitas pastorales de Valencia (Siglos XIV-XV), rev., 796-797
- Cardinal Gibbons Institute in southern Maryland closing, 526
- Carey, Patrick W.
rev. of C. F. Crews, 161-162
- caritas as a concept at the heart of Augustine's spiritual teaching, 7
- Carlisle
Register of Bishop of, 89-90

- Carlist movement, 205
 Carmelite Province of Castile history, 735-736
 Carolingians
 achievement much of which is in fact myth, 765-766
 aspects of learning in the Age, 762-766
 school survey in the empire, 764
 sponsoring of reform by, 763
 Carpenterjoel
 impulses toward uncritically seeing the past as edenic among early fundamentalists, 132
 Carrafiello, Michael L.
 rev. of T. M. McCoog, SJ, 805-806
 Cartiella, Fernando Maria
 Spanish ambassador to the Holy See who took a tough line on patronage, 215
 Cary, Noel D.
 The Path to Christian Democracy: German Catholics and the Party System from Windthorst to Adenauer, rev., 494-495
 catacombs rediscovery, 279
 Catalonia
 Primo de Rivera efforts to exclude Catalans from appointment to the dioceses of, 206
 Catechism
 evolution of the genre, 287-288
 of the Council of Trent, 288
 cathedrals
 E. Male promoted privileged place in the French national patrimony of, 423-425
 Catholic colleges
 essay on four "alternative," 533
 Catholic Devotion in Victorian England, 488-489
 Catholic Health Care in the United States, religious history of, 135-137
 Catholic Higher Education in the Twentieth Century, 144-145
 Catholic Historical Review contributors to budget, 267
 Catholic-Marxist Competition in the Working-Class Parishes of Cologne During the Weimar Republic, 20-43
 Catholic orthodoxy
 early eleventh-century heresy as contribution to evolution of, 400
 Catholic Parish Life on Florida's West Coast, 1860-1968, 518-519
 Catholic Peacemakers documentary history, 737-738
 Catholic school system in the Diocese of Cleveland in 1923, 432
 Catholics, essay on history in Indiana of, 512-513
 "Catholics in a Non-Catholic World"
 theme of articles in issue of U.S. Catholic Historian, 826
 Catholic Theological Society of America
 request for copy of bishops' letter by, 252
 Catholic theories of conversion
 required outward acquiescence and practice not persuasion, 325
 CDE See Sacred Congregation for the Doctrine of the Faith
 Cecil, Robert
 Gunpowder Plot contrived by, 347
 Cecilian Reform Movement 1878-1903, 489-490
 Celestine II, Pope
 response to the appeal of the monks' of Norwich, 302
 Celestine V, Pope
 first to require performance of miracles to prove sainthood, 319
 celibate clergy, Ademar and Gerard recognized necessity of a, 394
 Centre for the Study of Religion in Canada conference
 on "Christianizing the Social Order: A Founding Vision of the United Church of Canada," 360
 Centro Italiano di Studi su l'Alto Medioevo
 forty-fifth international study week in Spoleto, 351
 Cesáreo, Francesco C.
 "Penitential Sermons in Renaissance Italy: Girolamo Seripando and the Pater Noster," 1-19
 Cevasco, G. A.
 rev. of J. Jedrzejewski, 491-492
 Chadwick, Owen
 A History of Christianity, rev. 281-282
 Chapel Car Collection of the Catholic Church Extension Society
 processing in the archives of Loyola University Chicago of, 547
 Charles V, Emperor
 visit to the shrine of Archbishop Thomas Becket, 286
 Charles V, King of France
 advice with regard to support of a general council to resolve Great Schism, 218
 Charles VI, King of France
 banning of university discussion of the Great Schism, 218
 university community courses of action to resolve the Great Schism suggested in letter to, 219
 "Cheng-Zhu School," 616
 Chiapas colonial missions, 169-170
 Chicago Irish Community and Race Relations, 145-146
 China, images of
 presented to European society by nineteenth-century French Jesuits, 665
 Chine et christianisme
 aim of book to study Chinese reactions to Christianity, 580
 Chinese Cultural Heritage, respect for, 658-659
 Chinese culture needs to be primary focus of research, 579
 Chinese Rites Controversy, 662-663
 symposium on, 570
 Chinese Society in the Eighteenth Century, 591

- Chiovaro, Francesco, editor
 The History of the Congregation of the Most Holy Redeemer. Volume 1: The Origins (1732-1793), rev., 480-481
- Chorpenning Joseph E., O.S.E.S.
 rev. of C. Slade, 102-103
- Chorpenning Joseph E., O.S.E.S., editor
 Mexican Devotional Retablos from the Peters CoUection, b.n., 160
- Chrisman, Miriam Usher
 Conflicting Visions of Reform: German Lay Propaganda Pamphlets, 1519-1530, rev., 327-328
- Christendom and Its Discontents: Exclusion, Persecution, and Rebellion, 1000-1500, 769-771
- Christensen, Richard L.
 The Ecumenical Orthodoxy of Charles August Briggs, 1841-1913, rev., 524-525
- Christian Archaeology, 119-121
- Christian art of Gaul, E. Mâle study of, 420-421
- Christian Brothers schools, 473-475
- Christian Democratic Union
 relationship of Cardinal Josef Frings and, 494
- Christian Film and Television Commission attribute
 Hollywood's "moral collapse" to the demise of the Legion, 529
- Christianity
 a history of, 281-282
 and China as Other, 61 1-613
 and zheng, 620-622
 as a Civilizing Project, 610-611
 as a factor in the Modernization of China, 604-607
 as a Marginal Religion, 607-609
 as a Type of Cultural Contact, 602-604
 five challenges in the second century to, 741-742
- Christianity in China
 from the Eighteenth Century to the Present, 814-816
 importance after the cultural revolution, 569
 New Trends in the Historiography of, 573-613
- Christianity in the Second Century, 741-742
- "Christianizing the Social Order: A Founding Vision of the United Church of Canada" conference at the Centre for the Study of Religion, 360
- Christianizing the Urban Empire: A Quantitative approach, 740
- Christian Schools conduct, 473-475
- Christian Scientists, essay on history in Indiana of, 513
- Christian Socialism in Power in Vienna, 1897-1918, 121-122
- Christian social thought history, 292-293
- Christian, William A. Jr.
 Visionaries: The Spanish Republic and the Reign of Christ, rev., 501-502
- Chrysostom, John, Saint, 296-298
- Church and State in the Modern Age. A Documentary History, 290-291
- Churches of Christ in America history, 515-516
- Church Missionary Society microfilm publication of archives, 179
- Church of God, essays on, 132
- Church of God (Anderson), essay on history in Indiana of, 513
- "Church of the East: Life and Thought" articles in Bulletin of the John Rylands University Library of Manchester on theme, 825-826
- churchwarden, development of the office of, 321
- Cilicia and Isauria early Byzantine churches, 748-749
- Cistercian Culture and Ecclesiastical Reform (1098-1180), 772-773
- Clairvaux, Bernhard von
 Sämtliche Werke: lateinisch/deutsch, VI, rev., 777-778
- Clancy, Thomas H., SJ.
 A Literary History of the English Jesuits: A Century of Books, 1615-1714, rev., 348-349
 rev. of L. E Parmelee, 341-343
- Clares in Mecklenburg, 316-317
- Clark, Mary T., RSCJ.
 Augustine, b.n., 161
- class basis of early Christianity, 740
- class mentality
 G. Seripando denunciation of a, 15-16
- Clayton Jefford N., with Kenneth J. Harder and Louis D. Amezaga Jr.
 Reading the Apostolic Fathers, An Introduction, b.n., 166-167
- Clement V, Pope
 canonization was first requiring miracles to prove sainthood, 319
- Clement VII, Pope of Avignon
 as the Frenchman Robert de Geneva, 225
 nomination of P. d'Ailly as Paris chancellor, 218
- Clement VIII, Pope
 problems that encountered concerning the overseas Church, 289
- clergy as agents or targets of anticlericalism, 458-459
- Cleveland
 accusation of excluding Catholics from Board of Education of, 442
 Citizens League campaigned against parochial schools aid, 441-442
 diocesan parochial schools request for ten-year loan, 446
 diocese celebrating the 150th anniversary of its establishment, 177
 parochial schools battle to obtain public assistance, 428-451
 Schrems installation as Bishop of, 429
- Clovis
 articles inspired by the fifteenth centenary of the conversion and baptism of, 357-358

GENERAL INDEX

- historiography of the conversion theme of issue, 179
- Cluny, St. Bernard, and Suger
as basis for syntheses of religious art history, 402-403
- Codex Theodosianus
Jewish sect is not forbidden by law, 81
- Cohn, Norman
Noah's Flood: The Genesis Story in Western Thought, rev., 726-728
- Cole, Penny J.
rev. of M. Goodich, editor, 774-775
- Colegio de Jalisco, Zapopan
donation of research library on the history of colonial Mexico by W Michael Mathes to El, 823
- collegiality "effective" and "affective" distinction, 291-292
- Collinson, Patrick, Nigel Ramsay, and Margaret Sparks, editors
A History of Canterbury Cathedral, rev., 285-286
- Cologne nunciature, 107-108
- Cologne during the Weimar Republic
Catholic-Marxist Competition in the Working-Class Parishes of, 20-43
- commemorative postage stamp on Padre Félix Várela, 822-823
- Committee on Doctrine of National Conference of Catholic Bishops, 241
reply endorsed by the "entire" Conference, 251
request for guidelines from Holy See, 250
- Conciliarism, The Early Development of Pierre d'Ailly's, 217-232
- Concordat between the Vatican and Israel, 78
- concordat of 1851 between Spain and the Vatican, 204-205
- concordat of 1953 between Spain and the Vatican, 215
refraining from exercising patronage rights under, 201
- Concordia Historical Institute Museum
special exhibition on the life of Philipp Melancthon, 824
- concubines, prohibition among Christians of, 646
- The Conduct of the Christian Schools, 473-475
- Conference on Latin American History, papers read at, 174
- Confession and Conscience in Counter-Reformation Germany, 466-468
confession and self-accusation had a long tradition in China, 637-638
- "Confronting the Crusades" articles of History Today, 549
- Confucian
and Christian Religiosity in Late Ming China," 614-653
Concept of "Orthodoxy," 615-620
monotheism, 622
- orthodoxy built on interpersonal relationships, 617
relationship with Christianity, 603-604
selfcultivation, 618
- Confucius, Buddha, and Christ: A History of the Gospel in Chinese, 589
- Congregationalists in nineteenth-century England, 114-115
- Congregation
for the Propagation of the Faith establishment, 289
of Rites function, 275
of the Most Holy Redeemer history, 480-481
of the Sisters of the Immaculate Conception of the Blessed Virgin Mary, 178
- Conservative Catholics in America, 531-534
- Constantine, Emperor
as head of state practicing the cult of Sol Invictus, 293-294
- Contosta, David R.
Villanova University, 1842-1992, rev., 138-140
- convents as convenient holding tanks for the leftovers from the marriage market, 456
- conversion and Christian growth, 740
- Conversos, Inquisition, and the Expulsion of the Jews from Spain, 97-99
- Conway, John S.
rev. of M. Huttner, 128-130
- Conzemius, Victor
rev. of A. Holzem, 116-117
- Coope, Jessica A.
The Martyrs of Córdoba: Community and Family Conflict in an Age of Mass Conversion, rev., 306-307
- Copenhagen, University of, 92
- Coppa, Frank J.
rev. of F. De Giorgi, 486-487
- "Cordobán Martyrs' Movement" of the 850's, 306-307
- Corrado, Saint
"The Aristocratic Hermit," 278
- Council of Constance, 217
history and analysis of past century research on, 322-323
- Council of Trent
Catechism of the, 288
preaching of the gospel as chief task of the bishop according to, 3
- Counter-Reformation
Confession and Conscience in Germany of the, 466-468
theologians as basis for syntheses of religious art history, 403
- Courtenay, William J.
rev. of R. W Southern, 307-308
- Cousin de Méricourt, Hubert
last European Jesuit in China for almost seventy years, 662
- Cox, Jeffrey
surveys literature on Victorian Protestant missionaries, 115

- Cramer, Peter
 Baptism and Change in the Early Middle Ages, C.200-C. 1150, rev., 731-732
- Crews, Clyde E
 American and Catholic: A Popular History of Catholicism in the United States, b.n., 161-162
 rev. of M. Tardiff, O.P (ed.), 171-172
 criticisms of the clergy
 based upon concern over failure to carry out duties properly, 454
- The Cross and the Serpent: Religious Repression and Resurgence in Colonial Peru, 538-539
- Cross Cultural Convergence in the Crusader Period, 774-775
 crusaders
 model for Catholic Church, 655-656
 cultural convergence in the period of the, 774-775
 crusading and the Military Orders papers, 774
 C TSA. See Catholic Theological Society of America
 "Cubberley" thesis, 517
 culture as defined by Clifford Geertz, 401-402
 Culture and Religion in Merovingian Gaul (A.D. 481-751), 758-759
- Curran, Robert Emmett, SJ
 "Michael Corrigan and New York Catholicism in the Gilded Age," paper given at ACHA 77th annual meeting, 259
- Cusanus-Gesellschaft of Germany to hold annual conference in Padua, 544
- Cushing, Richard Cardinal
 supported idea of Black Catholic parish, 44
- Cushwa Center for the Study of American Catholicism
 sponsoring of three initiatives regarding gender, 357
- Cutter, Donald C.
 California in 1792: A Spanish Naval Visit, b.n., 162-163
- Cyprian, Saint
 petition of "forgive us our trespasses?" as constant reminder that we are sinners, 14
- Cyprus, history of the Church of, 283-285
- d'Ailly, Pierre
 The Early Development of Conciliarism of, 217-232
- Daly, Kieran Anthony
 Catholic Church Music in Ireland, 1878-1903: The Cecilian Reform Movement, rev., 489-490
- Dante influence on Italian art
 E. Mâle thought he might do a study of, 408-409
- Darboy, Georges, Archbishop of Paris
 execution of, 404
- "Dark Learning" Buddho-Taoist speculations, 623
- Darowska, Marcelina née Kotowicz
 beatification of, 178
 database developed containing Latin manuscripts on philosophy and theology from the Middle Ages, 823
- Davies, C. S. L.
 rev. of S. L.Jansen, 463-464
- Davis, Cyprian, O.S.B.
 "Portrait of a Foundress: Henriette Delille," paper given at ACHA 77th annual meeting, 259
 rev. of K. J. Zanca, editor, 510-512
- Davis John R., Senator
 strong advocate of parochial school aid, 449-450
- Deacon, Florence
 "School Choice is Nothing New: Church-State Educational Partnerships in the Nineteenth-Century Midwest," paper given at ACHA 77th annual meeting, 261
- Dearden John, Archbishop of Detroit, 241
- Debating Technique and Interpretation of Chinese Classics, 661-662
- Decretals of Gregory K.
 Canon law in the thirteenth century Midi used as the main text, 791
- De Eucharistia
 Ademar, 390
 calls on priests to preach to their flocks, 396
 performance of the sacrament contributes to the "salvation and redemption of the human race," 398
- Délicieux, Bernard
 the trial of, 791-792
- Delle cinque piaghe della santa chiesa, 487
- Delph, Ronald K.
 rev. of S. Gensini, 93-95
- Delumeau Jean
 History of Paradise: The Garden of Eden in Myth and Tradition, rev, 728-729
- DeMolen, Richard L.
 rev of W.V Hudon, 328-329
- Dennis, George T, SJ
 rev. of H. Nicholson, 780-781
- Dentiere, Marie
 wrote works attacking both Catholic clerics as immoral idlers and Genevan pastors as too tolerant, 457
- Deputies of the French National Assembly and the Emergence of a Revolutionary Culture, 482-484
- Desjardins, Ernest, 406
- Deutschkatholiken movement, 116-117
- Devotio Moderna influence on lay piety, 787
 "Devotional Revolution" in Ireland in the nineteenth century, 479
- "dialogic model" of Rivka Feldhay, 472
- Dialogue with Trypho, 81
- "Diary of Daily Admonitions" 623
- Didacus. See Diego de Alcalá, San
- Didron, Adolphe-Napoléon
 E. Mâle acknowledged his debt to, 412

GENERAL INDEX

- "diffuse religion" model
of C. K. Yang, 630
- Di Giovanni, Stephen M.
rev. of M. E. Brown, 520-521
- Di Lella, Alexander ?, O.F.M.
rev. of N. Cohn, 726-728
- Dilworth, Mark, O.S.B.
rev. of J. Kirk, 100-101
- Dipple, Geoffrey
Antifraternalism and Anticlericalism in the
German Reformation: Johann Eberlin von
Giinzburg and the Campaign against the
Friars, rev., 801-802
- Discaiced Carmelite nuns introduction into
France, 103-104
- Disciples of Christ
essay on history in Indiana, of, 513
- Disciples of Christ, Churches of Christ
essays on, 132
- "Discovery, New Frontiers, and Expansion in the
Iberian World"
theme of a conference to be held in Lisbon,
545
- Ditchfield's Liturgy as a major contribution and
a transforming experience, 280
- Divini Redemptoris encyclical against Commu-
nism, 124-125
- Doctrina Addai, 747
- "Doctrine of the Lord of Heaven," 623
- Doctrine of the Mean, 626-627, 639
- Documentos del Japón, 1558-1562, 156-157
- Dohar, William J., C.S.C.
The Black Death and Pastoral Leadership:
The Diocese of Hereford in the Fourteenth
Century, rev., 90-91
rev. of O. F. Robinson, 317-318
rev. of R. L. Storey, 89-90
- Dolan, Jay R.
rev. of T. W. Spalding and K. M. Kuranda,
137-138
- Dolan, Jay R. and Guberto M. Hinojosa, editors
Mexican Americans and the Catholic
Church, 1900-1965, rev., 141-143
- Dominican Fathers in Cleveland (1923), 433
- Dominicans in Mecklenburg, 316-317
- Donaghy, Thomas J.
rev. of D. R. Contosta, 138-140
- Donalson, Malcolm Drew
A Translation of Jerome's Chronicon with
Historical Commentary, b.n., 163
- Don Carlos (eldest son of Philip ? of Spain)
contact with San Diego de Alcalá, of, 695-
704
- Donlin Party, 635
- Donne, John
and the Ancient Catholic Nobility, 343-344
- Donovan, Sister Grace E., S.U.S.C.
"Holy Union Sisters: Exile from France or Ex-
pansion of Ministry?," paper given at ACHA
77th annual meeting, 261
international archivist of the Holy Union Sis-
ters in Rome, 829
- Doran, Robert
The Lives of Simeon Stylites, rev, 753
- Dorn, Georgette
appointed co-chairman of ACHA Committee
on Program for the 1999 annual meeting,
819
- Dorsey, J. H.
black priest who said Mass in 1902 Boston, 46
- "double taxation" of Catholic parents for public
schools, 437
- Dreisbach, Daniel L., editor
Religion and Politics in the Early Republic:
Jasper Adams and the Church-State De-
bate, rev., 507-509
- Drijvers, Han J. W.
History and Religion in Late Antique Syria,
rev., 746-748
- Duc de Berry
commended for support of the beauties of art
and architecture on French soil, 415
- Duchesne, Louis, 119-121
- Dykema, A., and H. A. Oberman, editors
Anticlericalism in Late Medieval and Early
Modern Europe, rev., 452-461
- Early Byzantine Churches of Cilicia and
Isauria, 748-749
- Eastern Christian Worlds, IVL-IVS
- Eastern Orthodox, essay on history in Indiana
of, 513
- Eberlin von Gunzburg, Johann
Antifraternalism and Anticlericalism in the
German Reformation and the Campaign
against the Friars, 801-802
- Eckenstein, Lina
Women under Monasticism, 500-1500,
298-299
- Economic History, the History of Material Cul-
ture, and the historiography of Christianity
in China, 598-599
- Edel, Doris, editor
Cultural identity and Cultural Integration:
Ireland and Europe in the Early Middle
Ages, rev., 754-755
- Eden-Webster Library of St. Louis, Missouri, on-
line catalog, 354
- Edgerton, Ronald K.
rev. of J. S. ArcUla, S.J., 816-818
- educational matters
Brownson's views on authority and responsi-
bility, 517
educational revolution in the first half of the
twelfth century created new unity of cul-
ture, 308
- Edwards, John
Religion and Society in Spain, c. 1492, rev.,
324-325
- Edwards, Francis, S.J.
rev. of A. Fraser, 347-348
rev. of T. McCoog, S.J., editor, 468-471
- Edward the Confessor cult, 311-312

- Egan, Keith J.
 appointed to newly created Joyce McMahon
 Hank Aquinas Chair of Catholic Theology,
 829
 rev. of P. M. Garrido, O.Carm., 735-736
- Eire, Carlos M. N.
 appointed professor of religious studies and
 history in Yale University, 181
- Elgar, Edward WiUiam
 composer who set Newman's poem to
 music, 119
- Elizabeth I, Queen of England
 Robert Persons on condoning an assassina-
 tion of, 469
- Elkins, Sharon K.
 rev. of B. Golding, 782-784
- Ellis, Patrick, F.S.C.
 rev. of J. B. de La Salle, 473-475
- Englezakis, Benedict
 Studies on the History of the Church of
 Cyprus: 4th-20th Centuries, rev., 283-285
- English Protestant Thought, Roman and Protes-
 tant Churches in, 104-106
- Enochs, Ross Alexander
 The Jesuit Mission to the Lakota Sioux: Pas-
 toral Theology and Ministry, 1886-1945,
 rev, 523-524
- Eno, Robert B., S.S.
 rev. of E. Fouilloux, 163-164
 rev. of J. N. Clayton, K. J. Harder, and L. D.
 Amezagajr., 166-167
 rev. of M. D. Donalson, 163
 rev. of M. T. Clark, 161
 rev. of P. I. Kaufman, 167
 rev. of R. A. Markus, 168
 rev. of T. K. Scott, 179-180
 rev. of R. Teske, S.J., 159
 rev. of W. Harmless, S.J., 166
- epidemics, networks and conversion, 740
- Epiphanius of Salamis, 284
- Episcopal and Evangelical essays on, 132
- Epistola Diaboli Leviathan, 217, 220-222
- Erasmus work on sacred oratory, 1
- Erfurt
 evangelical party consciously stirred up tradi-
 tional anticlericalism in, 456
- Esch, Arnold
 Romans profited economically from presence
 of papal prince, 94-95
- Espartero, Baldomero, General
 attempted extreme administrative reorganiza-
 tion of the Church while being a practicing
 Catholic, 203-204
- Espejo-Ponce Hunt, Marta
 rev. of R. D. Perry, 169-170
 "Essence of the Doctrine of the Lord of Heaven,"
 636
- Essman, Charles
 complained errors could be used to condemn
 both heresy and imprudent remarks, 246
- Estrella, Diego de
 turned the teaching of the sermon to a moral
 purpose, 2
- ethical questions
 advocacy of a utilitarian or consensus ap-
 proach to, 248
- ethnic Catholics, essay on history in Indiana of,
 513
- Ettlinger, Gerard H., S.J.
 rev. of J. N. D. KeUy, 296-298
- Eucharist
 as one of the most hotly contested issues in
 Christendom, 397
 demonstration of physical presence of Christ
 in, 397-398
- Eugenius IV, Pope
 appeal on problems of converso to, 82-83
 complaint of Florentine government to, 455
- Eutychius, remains of the martyr Saint, 120
- "evidential model" of Redondi, 473
- "Exertion" and "Merit" of Lay Christianity,
 633-635
- "Explanation of the Practice of Mercy," 648
- Extirpation Campaign in colonial Peru, 538-539
- Fagan, Patrick, editor
 Ireland in the Stuart Papers. Correspon-
 dence and Documents of Irish interest
 from the Stuart Papers in the Royal
 Archives, Windsor Castle, rev., 475-477
- Falange
 Cardinal Goma viewed emergence with a
 mixture of acceptance and suspicion, 211
- Farenga, Paola
 Papal government neither efficient nor well
 loved by the Romans, 94
- fasting, 639-640
- Fathers of the Blessed Sacrament in Cleveland
 (1931), 433
- Fathers of the Most Precious Blood in Cleveland
 (1931), 433
- Fathers of the Order of Mercy in Cleveland
 (1922), 433
- Fay, Terence J., S.J.
 rev. of T. Murphy and R. Perin, 534-536
- FCS. See Fellowship of Catholic Scholars
- Federal Advisory Committee on Emergency Aid
 to Education informed that parochial
 school situation in Ohio was critical,
 444-445
- Federated Colored Catholics
 John LaFarge's relationship with, 526
- Feldhay, Rivka
 Galileo and the Church: Political Inquisition
 or Critical Dialogue?, rev., 472-473
- Feldman, Lawrence H., Dr.
 compilation of general index by, 269
- Fellowship of Catholic Scholars, 532
- female religiosity during the 19th and 20th cen-
 turies, 485-487
- Fenlon, Dermot
 "Rewiring The Circuit: Campi's Reformation,"
 review article, 275-280
- Ferreiro, Alberto
 member of the Committee on Program, 542

- Ferry, Jules
 anticlerical reorganization of education further reinforced missionary impetus of the French Jesuits, 664
- Fifth Lateran Council (1512-1517)
 failure to accommodate reformist pressures of, 786
- Fuippo Neri, Saint
 as instigator of a new epoch of historical studies, 279
- Finke, Heinrich
 father of modern research on Council of Constance, 322
- Finney, Paul Corby
 rev. of W. H. C. Frend, 729-731
- Firey, Abigail Anne
 "Sin and Crime: Distinguishing in the Dark," paper given at ACHA 77th annual meeting, 260
- First Spanish Republic planned to separate church and state on basis of a "free church in a free state," 207
- Fisher, Arthur L.
 as chairman of the Committee on Program for the Association's annual meeting announced eight sessions, 542
- Fisher, John, Saint
 the Execution of, 69-74
- Fitzgerald, Edward, Bishop of Winona
 hoped that never again publish synodal errors, 246
- "Five Constant Virtues," 616
- "Five Human Relations," 616
- Flacius, Matthias
 Gnesio-Lutherans as followers of, 465
- flagellation
 Christian use in China of, 640
- Flaminio, Marcantonio
 Apologia del Beneficio di Christo e altri scritti inediti, rev., 806-807
- Florida's West Coast (1860-1968)
 Catholic Parish Life on, 518-519
- Flynn, Dennis
 John Donne and the Ancient Catholic Nobility, rev., 343-344
- Flynn, James T.
 obituary of Robert E. Byrnes, 829-830
 rev. of J. J. Santich, O.S.B., 344-345
- Fogarty, Gerald P., S.J.
 The Vatican and the American Hierarchy from 1870 to 1965, 234-235
 "Francis Cardinal Spellman as a World Figure: His Wartime Trip to Rome," 1943, paper given at ACHA 77th annual meeting, 259
- Fontaine, Michele M.
 rev. of M. Flaminio, 806-807
- Fontcuberta, Maria Ana Mogas
 beatification of, 178
- Fouilloux, Etienne
 La collection "Sources chrétiennes": Editeur les Pères de l'Eglise au XX^e siècle, b.n., 163-164
- Fouracre, Paul, and Richard A. Gerberding
 Late Merovingian France: History and Hagiography, 640-720, rev., 759-761
- France
 early nineteenth-century religious revival in, 663-664
 public penance in thirteenth century, 309-311
- Franca, S.
 "The Well Born Nun," 278
- Franciscan
 among mendicant orders, largest number of seduction cases investigated by the Inquisition concerned, 340
 Fathers of the Order of Friars Minor Conventual in Cleveland (1923), 433
 in the New World, publication of the Fifth International Congress on, 827-828
 Observants in Mecklenburg, 316-317
 theologians as basis for syntheses of religious art history, 402
- Franco, Francisco
 apparent commitment to an aconfessional regime, 209
- Frank, Isnard Wilhelm
 A Conche History of the Medieval Church, b.n., 164-165
- Franklin, M. J., and Christopher Harper-Bull, editors
 Medieval Ecclesiastical Studies in Honour of Dorothy M. Owen, rev., 301-302
- Fraser, Antonia
 The Gunpowder Plot: Terror and Faith in 1605, rev., 347-348
- Frassetto, Michael
 "Reaction and Reform: Reception of Heresy in Arras and Aquitaine in the Early Eleventh Century," 385-400
- Frazer, Charles A.
 rev. of R. van Leeuwen, 481-482
- "free church in a free state" as motto of First Spanish Republic, 207
- Freed, John B.
 rev. of Ulpts, 315-317
 rev. of S. Logemann, 315-317
- Free Methodist Church, essay on history in Indiana of, 513
- Free thought: the Religion of Irreligion, 114-115
- French, Katherine L.
 "Where, oh Where, Have the Lay Women Gone,' Gendering Parochial Involvement in Late Medieval England," paper given at ACHA 77th annual meeting, 258
- French, Roger, and Andrew Cunningham
 Before Science: The Invention of the Friars' Natural Philosophy, rev., 313-315
- French Anti-League Propaganda in Late Elizabethan England, 341-343
- French Government support to Zhendan, 674-678
- French Jesuits
 images of China presented to European society in the nineteenth century, 665
 their understanding of mission and their missionary style at Zhendan, 665-678

- French National Assembly and the Emergence of a Revolutionary Culture, 482-484
- Frend, William H. C.
The Archaeology of Early Christianity: A History, rev, 729-731
- Frenken, Ansgar
Die Erforschung des Konstanzer Konzils (1414-1418) in den letzten 100 Jahren, rev, 322-323
- Friars and Jews in the Middle Ages and Renaissance conference, 544
- Friedlander, Alan
Processus Bernardi Delitiosr. The Trial of Fr Bernard Délicieux, 3 September-8 December 1319, rev, 791-792
- Frings, Josef Cardinal
relationship of Christian Democratic Union and, 494-495
- fuero. See special legal code
- Gabriel, Astrik L.
rev. of E. Van Mingroot, 91-93
- Gagliano, Joseph A.
rev. of N. Griffiths, 538-539
- Gajda, Patricia A.
rev. of R. G. Musto, 737-738
- Galileo and the Church: Political Inquisition or Critical Dialogue?, 472-473
- GaUitzin, Demetrius A.
son of the Russian Enlightenment, 716-725
- Galveston
diocese celebrating the 150 anniversary of its establishment, 177
- Ganz, David
rev. of S. A. Rabe, 305-306
- Gapp, Jakob, Blessed
beatification of, 355-356
- Garden of Eden in Myth and Tradition
History of Paradise, 728-729
- Garrido, Pablo Maria, O.Carm.
El Solar Carmelitano de San Juan de la Cruz: la antigua provincia de Castilla (14161836), rev., 735-736
- Gaustad, Edwin S.
rev. of M. E. Marty, 530-531
rev. of R. T. Hughes, 515-516
- Gauvreau, Michael
rev. of J. Noel, 151-153
- Gender
and Heresy: Women and Men in Loyal Communities, 1420-1530, 797-798
Authority, and the Priscillianist Controversy, 752-753
- Geneva, Robert de
as Clement VII, 225
- Geneva, University of, 92
- Genevan Academy and Reformed Higher Education, 1560-1620, 333-334
- Genevan Consistory, 332-333
- "Genocide, Religion and Modernity" conference held at the United States Holocaust Memorial Museum, 543-544
- Gensini, Sergio, editor
Roma Capitale (1447-1527), rev., 93-95
"The Gentle Voices of Teachers"-Aspects of Learning in the Carolingian Age, 762-766
- George Edward Clerk Award presented to Terence Murphy, 546
- Georgia coast, eighteenth-century Spanish Retrospective
on Guale and Mocama on the, 133-134
- Gerard of Arras-Cambrai
Acta Synodi Atrebatensis of, 387-388
German Catholicism 1930-1939
glossing over the moral failings of, 129-130
German Catholics and Party System from Windthorst to Adenauer, 494-495
German Catholic Movement in the Third Reich, 499-500
- Germans in Rome, shrinking employment opportunities available to, 94
- Gerson, Jean
discussion of abdication of papal spiritual authority, 223
- Giannico, Thomas
"Cola di Rienzo and the Renewal of the City of Rome: Art, Politics, and the Revolution of 1347," paper given at ACHA 77th annual meeting, 259
- Gibino, Joseph R.
rev. of E. Chiovaro, editor, 480-481
- Gubertine Order, c. 1130-C.1300
Gilbert of Sempringham and the, 782-784
- Güchert, Roberta
Contemplation and Action: The Other Monasticism, b.n., 165
- Gulen, Gerard
rev. of K. A. Daly, 489-490
- Giuseppe, Don C.
The Search for Thomas E Ward, Teacher of Frederic Delius, rev., 519-520
- Gillet, Louis
E. Mâle as mentor to, 416-417
- Guley, Sheridan
essay on "Roman Catholicism" by, 115
- Giorgi, Fulvio De
La scienza del cuore. Spiritualità e cultura religiosa in Antonio Rosmini, rev., 486-487
- Gleason, Philip
Contending with Modernity: Catholic Higher Education in the Twentieth Century, rev, 144-145
conference in honor of, 174
- Gnesio-Lutherans, 465
- Gnosticism, history of, 742-743
- Goering, Joseph
"What Happened at the Fourth Lateran Council?" paper given at ACHA 77th annual meeting, 260
- Golding, Brian
Gilbert of Sempringham and the Gubertine Order, c. 1130-C.1300, rev., 782-784
- Goma y Tomás, Isidro Cardinal
appointment judged unacceptable, 207

- viewed emergence of Falange with a mixture of acceptance and suspicion, 211
 worried about the Church's place in the Nationalist regime, 209
- gongfu as "work, labor, exertion," 633-634
- Gonzaga, Ercole Cardinal
 letter of, 69-74
- Goodich, Michael E. (author and editor)
 Cross Cultural Convergence in the Crusader Period: Essays Presented to Aryeh Grabois on his Sixty-Fifth Birthday, rev., 774-775
 Violence and Miracle in the Fourteenth Century-.Private Grief and Public Suffering, rev, 319-320
- Gothic, E. Mâle preached the priority and superiority of French, 414
- Götz v. Olenhusen, Irmtraud, editor
 Wunderbare Erscheinungen. Frauen und katholische Frömmigkeit im 19. und 20. Jahrhundert, rev, 485-486
- GoukVirginia Meacham
 "The Southern Women's Studies Perspective," paper given at ACHA 77th annual meeting, 259
- Grab, Alexander, Paul E. Grendler, and Alice Kellian
 Report of the Committee on the Howard R. Marraro Prize, 263-264
- Graham, Robert A., SJ.
 obituary of, 361-363
- Granada, Luis de
 viewed the sermon as persuading individuals to live a life of justice and piety, 2
- Grant, Robert M.
 rev. of A. H. B. Logan, 742-743
 "Great Prayer of the [Swiss] Confederates," 788
- Great Schism, 218
- Greene, Anne
 The Catholic Church in Haiti: Political and Social Change, rev., 811-812
- Green, Thomas R., Maureen C. Miller, and J. Dean O'Donnell
 Report of the Committee on Nominations, 261-262
- Gregory I, the Great, Pope
 many of the early papal documents on Jews emanated from, 79
- Gregory IX, Pope
 Decretals of, 791
- Gregory X, Pope
 attempt to canonize, 277
- Gregory xm, Pope
 commissioned Thomas Stucley"to raise an army and invade Ireland," 470
 dispensed Jesuits from regulations prohibiting priests from being involved in medical and surgical procedures, 157
 establishment of permanent nunciature in Cologne by, 108
- Gregory XV, Pope
 problems that encountered concerning the overseas Church, 289
- Gregory XVI, Pope, 91
 condemnation of the slave trade (1839) by, 511
 Institute of Charity approved by, 487
 refusal to recognize Queen Isabel II as legitimate sovereign, 204
- Gregory of Nyssa
 Eighth International Colloquium on, 545
- Gres-Gayerjacques M.
 rev. of B. Neveu, 471-472
 rev. of R. Blet, SJ., 106-107
- Grey Nuns in Montreal, founding of, 535
- Griffinjohn R.
 "Cardinal Newman and the 'PhUosophy of Byron,'" paper given at ACHA 77th annual meeting, 260
- Griffiths, Nicholas
 The Cross and the Serpent: Religious Repression and Resurgence in Colonial Peru, rev, 538-539
- Gritsch, EricW
 rev. of B. Hodler, 326-327
- Groh, Dennis E.
 rev. of D. Rankin, 170
- Gsell, Stéphane
 historian of North Africa and classmate of E. Mâle, 406
- Guérin, Theodore, Venerable Mother
 beatification of, 356
- Guest, Francis E. OEM.
 Hispanic California Revisited, rev., 509-510
- Guiñan, Joseph
 popular Irish novelist, 492-494
- Gunpowder Plot: Terror and Faith in 1605, 547
- Hagen, Kenneth
 rev. of S. H. Hendrix, 798-800
- hagiography, new Tridentine genre of 278
- Hainan, educating the women of, 539-541
- Haiti
 CathoUc Church in, 811-812
 political and social change in, 811-812
- Haider, Winfrid
 Katholische Vereine in Baden und Wiirttemberg, 1848-1914, rev, 117-118
- Haliczer, Stephen
 Sexuality in the Confessional: A Sacrament Profaned, rev., 340-341
 "Hall of the Lord of Heaven," 631
- Handy, Robert
 role of New Testament Christianity among different sorts of American Baptists, 132
- Hangzhou, The Forgotten Christians of, 587
- Hankins, James
 rev. of J. Monfasani, 95-97
- Hardy, Thomas
 and the Church, 491-492
- Harmless, WUUam, SJ.
 Augustine and the Catechumenate, b.n., 166
- Harrell, David E.
 on cluster of movements emerging from Stone-CampbeU matrix, 132

- Harringtonjoel F.
Reordering Marriage and Society in Reformation Germany, rev., 99-100
- Hartley, James J., Bishop
disagreement with Schrembs, 448
- Haskett, Timothy S.
rev. of M. J. Franklin and C. Harper-BUI, 301-302
- Havran, Martin J.
rev. of A. M. Uton, 104-106
- Hayden, Michael
rev. of S.-M. Morgain, 103-104
- Head, Thomas
rev. of P. Fouracre and R. A. Gerberding, 759-761
- Heart of Jesus cult, 486
- Heath, Peter
rev. of W. J. Dohar, 90-91
- Heimann, Mary
Catholic Devotion in Victorian England, rev., 488-489
- Heldman, Marilyn E.
rev. of M. Zibawi, 732-733
- Helmreich, Ernst C.
rev. of D. L. Bergen, 499-500
- Helmstadter, Richard J.
assesses Baptists and Congregationalists who had been awakened by Evangelical Revival, 114-115
- Hempton, David
discussion of Victorian Methodism, 115
- Hen, Yitzhak
Culture and Religion in Merovingian Gaul, AD. 481-751, rev., 758-759
- Hendrix, Scott H.
Tradition and Authority in the Reformation, rev., 798-800
- Hennessee, James, SJ.
essays in honor of, 359
rev. of J. Maclear, editor, 290-291
- Henry Luce Foundation grant to catalogue rare books, 354
- Henry VIII, King of England
Women and Popular Resistance to the Reforms of, 463-464
- Hereford Diocese of, in the fourteenth century, 90-91
- heresy
associated with cannibalism and child murder, 389
in Arras and Aquitaine in the early eleventh century, 385-400
- Herman of Tournai
The Restoration of the Monastery of Saint Martin of Tournai, rev., 784-785
- Herr, Lucien, 405
as great friend of E. Mâle, 416
- Heywood, Jasper, 469-470
- HUdegard of Bingen
celebration of the ninth centenary of the birth of, 545
- HUI, Bennett, OSB.
rev. of R. Colunson, N. Ramsay, and M. Sparks, editors, 285-286
- HiU, Stephen
The Early Byzantine Churches of Cilicia and Sauria, rev., 748-749
- HiUgarth, J. N.
rev. of M. D. Johnston, 318-319
rev. of N. Roth, 97-99
- Hinojosa, Guberto
"Mexican-American Faith Communities in Texas and the Southwest," 142-143
- Hippolytus and the Roman Church in the Third Century, 294-295
- Hispanic California Revisited: Essays by Francis F. Guest, O.F.M., rev., 509-510
- Histoire de l'imaginaire and the historiography of Christianity in China, 596
- Histoire des Mentalités et des Moeurs and the historiography of Christianity in China, 595
- historical anthropology and the historiography of Christianity in China, 593-595
- History of Christianity in China symposium papers, 571-572
- History of Sciences and the historiography of Christianity in China, 596-598
- Hitchcock, James
rev. of E. M. Jones, 149-151
- Hodler, Beat
Das "Ärgernis" der Reformation: Begriffsgeschichtlicher Zugang zu einer biblisch legitimierten politischen Ethik, rev., 326-327
- HoUer, Clyde
Black Elk's Religion: The Sun Dance and Lakota Catholicism, rev., 140-141
- Holmes, David
on Episcopal Anglican evangelism, 132
- "The Holocaust and the Waning of the Modern Narrative"
International Society for the Study of European Ideas workshop, 821
- Holy Office. See Sacred Congregation for the Doctrine of the Faith
- Holy Wednesday
A Nahuatl drama from Early Colonial Mexico, 536-538
- Holzem, Andreas
Kirchenreform und Sektenstiftung. Deutlichkatholiken, Reformkatholiken und Ultramontane am Oberrhein (1844-1866), rev., 116-117
- Homoianism as western manifestation of Arianism, 295-296
- Hopkins, Harry L.
Administrator of the Federal Emergency Relief Administration, 445
- Housley, Norman
rev. of C. R. Backman, 86-87
- Howard, Peter Francis
Beyond the Written Word: Preaching and Theology in the Florence of Archbishop Antoninus, 1427-1459, rev., 323-324
- How the Irish Saved Civilization, rev., 299-300

- Hsia, R. Po-chia
 rev. of M. U. Chrisman, 327-328
- Hudon, William V
 Theatine Spirituality: Selected Writings, rev., 328-329
 "The Voice of CamUla Battista da Varano in Early-Modern ItaUan Devotional Literature," given at ACHA 77th annual meeting, 259
- Hughes John, Bishop
 attempt to obtain pubUc assistance for parochial schools in New York by, 430
- Hughes, Richard T.
 The American Quest for the Primitive Church, edited, rev., 131-133
 The Primitive Church in the Modern World, edited, rev., 131-133
 Reviving the Ancient Faith: The Story of Churches of Christ in America, rev., 515-516
- "Humanitarian Society" of Wang Zheng in Xi'an, 648-649
- Human LUe International, 533
- human nature, soul and body, 625-630
- Humble, BUJ.
 uses of presumed apostolic ways among the Churches of Christ, 132
- humiliation, medieval need for, 309-311
- Humiliation of Sinners: Public Penance in Thirteenth-Century France, 309-311
- Hungary
 overview of the history of the Church after 1945 in, 130-131
- Hurtubise, Pierre
 analysis of efforts of transplanted Salviati Florentine merchant famUy to work way into elite or Roman nobUity, 93
- Hussites, antidericaUsm of, 455
- Huttner, Markus
 Britische Presse und Nationalsozialistischer Kirchenkampf. Eine Untersuchung der "Times" und des "Manchester Guardian" von 1930 bis 1939, rev., 128-130
- Iconoclasm, CaroUngian contributions to debates on, 764
- iconography as transformed by E. Mâle, 402
- Ignatius Loyola
 casa dei catecumeni estabUshed in Rome by, 81
- Incarnation as a source of Chinese perplexity, 623
- inculturation of Christianity process, 680
- Index of Forbidden Books, discontinuing of publication of, 237
- Indiana's Churches and Religious groups, A History of, 512-514
- Innes, Robert
 rev. of K. Power, 750-751
- Innocent III, Pope
 international conference on world of, 352
 increase in papal documents on Jews after election of, 79
- Inquisition, suppression of, 203
- In Sinodo Sermo, 396, 398
 demonstration of connection between appearance of heresy and concerns with defense of orthodoxy, 399
- Institute of Charity, 486-487
- Integrae Servandae, Motu proprio, 236
- intercultural contacts in the Crusader Period, papers on, 774-775
- International Conference on Patristic, Medieval, and Renaissance Studies, 544
- International Congress of Historical Sciences, nineteenth to be held in Oslo, Norway, 822
- International Society for the Comparative Study of CivUizations
 caU for papers, 821
- International Thomas More Conference solicits papers, 175-176
- Ireland and Europe in the Early Middle Ages
 Cultural Identity and Cultural Integration, 754-755
- Ireland and the Vatican: The Politics and Diplomacy of Church-State Relations (1922-1960), 126-127
- Ireland in the Stuart Papers. Correspondence and Documents of Irish Interest from the Stuart Papers in the Royal Archives, Windsor Castle, 475-477
- Irish Christian Brothers, 178
- Isabel II, Queen of Spain, 204
- Islam, medieval Christian perceptions of, 766-768
- Israel, diplomatic relations with the Vatican, 77
- Italian-German Historical Institute symposium, 174
- ItaUan Immigrants in the Archdiocese of New York (1880-1945)
 Churches, Communities and Children, 520-521
- Italia Sacra, 277
- Item in Concilio, 396
- Jamaica, History of the CathoUc Church U, 812-813
- James Henry Breasted Prize
 awarded to WUUam Klingshirn, 353-354
- James I. Good Collection, 354
- Jansen, Sharon L.
 Dangerous Talk and Strange Behavior: Women and Popular Resistance to the Reforms of Henry VIII, rev., 463-464
- Japan and Christianity: Impacts and Responses, 813-814
- Jarrige, Catherine, Blessed
 beatification of, 356
- Jedrzejewskijan
 Thomas Hardy and the Church, rev., 491-492
- Jehovah's Witnesses, essay on history U Indiana of, 513
- Jenal, Georg
 Italia ascética atque monástica: Das Asketen- und Mönchtum in Italien von den

- Anfängen bis zur Zeit der Langobarden (ca. 150/250-604), rev, 744-745
- Jerome's Chronicon, a translation of, 163
- Jesuit
- Accounts of Epidemic Disease in the Sixteenth Century, 335-337
 - emphasis on teaching in French in China, 671-672
 - Mission Presses in the Pacific Northwest (1876-1899), 170-171
 - Missionary Letters from Mindanao, 816-818
 - Missions in Paraguay, 154-155
 - plans to rebuild 17th century chapel at St. Mary's City, 548-549
- Jesuits. See also Society of Jesus
- "Culture, Learning, and the Arts, 1540- 1773" international conference entitled, 175
 - Edmund Campion and the Early English, 468-471
 - in Confucian milieu conformed to role of the teacher, 632
 - in Westernization of Russia, role of the, 344-345
 - of England, 1615-1714, a literary history of the, 348-349
 - suppression by Spanish Republic of, 208
- Jews
- and Christians in the Crusader Period, 775
 - essay on history in Indiana of, 513
 - essays on problems in medieval times of, 770-771
 - mission to, 740
 - Rhegius' strong plea for toleration of, 800
 - who resided in territories under direct papal temporal rule, 83
- John II, King of France
- visit to the shrine of Archbishop Thomas Becket, 286
- John Paul II, Pope
- beatifications by, 177-178, 354-357, 822
 - commemoration of the 350th anniversary of the Union of Uzhorod, 177
 - commemoration of the quincenary of the first baptisms conferred in the New World, 176-177
 - commemoration of the sexcentenary of the Pavia charterhouse by, 176
 - official delegation representing the government of Israel at inauguration of the pontificate of, 77
 - visit to the Jewish Community of Rome by, 77
- Johnson, George, Father
- efforts on behalf of parochial education funding, 444-445
- Johnson, David, SJ.
- rev. of R. Doran, 753
- Johnson-Reed Immigration Act slowed growth in Catholic population, 432
- Johnston, Mark D.
- The Evangelical Rhetoric of Ramon Hull. Lay Learning and Piety in the Christian West around 1300, rev, 318-319
- John Tracy Ellis Dissertation Award, 350
- John XXII, Pope
- Documentation on, 793-794
- John XXIII, Pope
- official delegation representing the government of Israel at the funeral of, 77
 - Second Vatican Council generated documents strongly affirming call for church renewal of, 233
- Jones, E. Michael
- John Cardinal Krol and the Cultural Revolution, rev., 149-151
- Jones, Peter D'A.
- rev. of E. M. McMahon, 145-146
- Josephites
- booklet published on history and ministries of, 551
 - only Catholic religious order devoted exclusively to ministry in the Afro-American community, 52
 - priests staffed Black Catholic parish of Boston, 44
- Journal of Religious History "Richard Hooker Issue," 550
- Joyce, Kathleen
- "Staff Appointments: Catholic Hospitals and the Politics of Catholic Privilege," paper given at ACHA 77th annual meeting, 260
- Juan Carlos, King
- refrains from exercising patronage rights, 201
- Jude, Saint
- as a bridge between different cultural worlds, 527-528
 - shrine, first and pre-eminent established in South Chicago, 527
- Junior Order of American Mechanics
- against public money for parochial schools, 443-444
 - as nativist organization, 431
 - campaign against any aid to parochial schools, 441
- Jurichjames P., SJ.
- "Victor de Buck's Espousal of Ecumenism at the First Vatican Council," paper given at ACHA 77th annual meeting, 260
- K'ang-hsu, Emperor of China, Self-portrait of, 587
- Kangxi emperor
- bestowed official patronage on Catholic Church in 1692, 661-662
- karmic retribution concept, 634
- Kauffman, Christopher J.
- appointed co-chairman of ACHA Committee on Program for the 1999 annual meeting, 819
 - Ministry and Meaning: A Religious History of Catholic Health Care in the United States, rev, 135-137
- Kaufman, Peter Iver
- Church, Book, and Bishop: Conflict and Authority in Early Latin Christianity, b.n., 167

- Kelly, N. D.
Golden Mouth: The Story of John Chrysostom—Ascetic, Preacher, Bishop, rev., 296-298
- Kelsey, Harry
rev. of D. B. Nunis, 509-510
- Kent, Peter C.
rev. of M. Agostino, 122-126
- Keogh, Dermot
Ireland and the Vatican: The Politics and Diplomacy of Church-State Relations, 1922-1960, rev., 126-127
- Kieft, David Owen
rev. of R. RoUs, S.J., 497-499
- Kievan Rus
distinctive characteristics of the religious culture of, 735
- Killaloe, the diocese of, 477-479
- Killen, Patricia
member of the Committee on Program, 542
- Kingdon, Robert M.
rev. of K. Maag, 333-334
- Kirk, James, editor
The Books of Assumption of the Thirds of Benefices: Scottish Ecclesiastical Rentals at the Reformation, rev., 100-101
The Medieval Church in Scotland, rev., 781-782
- Kirkby John, Bishop of Carlisle
Register of 1332-1352, 89-90
- Kitchen John
rev. of Y Hen, 758-759
- Knight, Frances
The Nineteenth-Century Church and English Society, rev., 484-485
- Knox, John
international conference to mark the 450th anniversary of the beginning of the Protestant preaching career of, 352
- Kolb, Robert
Luther's Heirs Define His Legacy: Studies on Lutheran Confessionalization, rev., 464-465
- Komonchak, Joseph A.
rev. of Paolo Vilella collegialità episcopate, 291-292
- Kösters, Christoph
Katholische Verbände und moderne Gesellschaft: Organisationsgeschichte und Vereinskultur im Bistum Münster 1918 bis 1945, rev., 496-497
- Krol John Cardinal, 149-151
- Krueger, Derek
rev. of B. Englezakis, 283-285
Symeon the Holy Foot: Leontius's Life and the Late Antique City, rev., 761-762
- Kümin, Beat A.
The Shaping of a Community—The Rise and Reformation of the English Parish, c. 1400-1560, rev., 320-322
- Kuttner, Stephan George
obituary of, 181-184
- LaFarge John
and the Limits of Catholic Interracialism, 1911-1963, 525-526
- Lakota Sioux Jesuit Mission to the, 523-524
- Lambert, Thomas A., and Isabella M. Watt, editors
Registres du Consistoire de Genève au temps de Calvin, rev., 332-333
- Lamentabili Sane Exitu, 240
- Larkin, Emmet
rev. of I. Murphy, 477-479
- LaSalle John Baptist de
The Conduct of the Christian Schools, rev., 473-475
- Lateran Agreements of 1929, 124
- Latin manuscripts on philosophy and theology from the Middle Ages
development of a database containing, 823
- Law on Religious Confessions and Congregations of 1933, 208
- Lay Christianity
Baptism and Confession, 635-638
"Exertion" and "Merit," 633-635
- Lee, Egmont
on Rome as a home to the papacy and great pilgrimage site, 94
- Leeuwen, Richard van
Notables and Clergy in Mount Lebanon: The Khazin Sheiks and the Maronite Church (1736/1840), rev., 481-482
- Lefebvrist, essay on, 533
- Legion of Decency, history of, 528-529
- L'Eglise et le droit dans le Midi (XII-XLV siècles), rev., 790-791
- Lehfelt, Elizabeth A.
"A Place in the Temporal World: The Response of Convents to Lay and Ecclesiastical Changes in Sixteenth-Century Spain," paper given at ACHA 77th annual meeting, 258
- Leighton, C. D. A., O.Praem.
rev. of V. McNulty, 111-112
- Leonard, William C.
"A Parish for the Black Catholics of Boston," 44-68
- Leo X, Pope, Lucrezia de Medici sister of, 93
- Leo XIII, Pope
Americanist movement formally condemned in 1899 by, 532
- Lerchund José, Padre
issue of Archivo Ibero-Americano homenaje to, 827
- "Let There Be Light: WUUam Tyndale and the Making of the English Bible" exhibit, 819
- Libentissimo Sane Animo, 237
- Liberal Conservative party, 205
- Liberalism, final triumph over absolute monarchy in Spain in 1834, 203
- Liberation theology as basis for work on Mexican Americans, 142
- Liberpraedicationis contra Iudaeos, 319

- Lienhard, Joseph T.
rev. of D. H. Williams, 295-296
- Linck, Joseph C., CO.
rev. of T. J. Peterman, 505-506
- Lindberg, David C.
rev. of R. French and A. Cunningham, 313-315
- Lippy, Charles H.
rev. of R. T. Hughes, editor, 131-133
- Little, Franklin
does an appropriation of an ideal past deny the value of history, 131-132
- Liturgical and Exegetical Approaches
Art and Architecture in Byzantium and Armenia, 756-757
- Liturgy performance as a basis for a reformed priesthood, 279
- Llu, Ramon
Evangelical Rhetoric of, 318-319
- Loades, David
rev. of E. A. Macek, 462-463
- Lodwick, Kathleen L.
Crusaders against Opium: Protestant Missionaries in China, 1847-1917, rev, 539-541
Educating the Women of Hainan: The Career of Margaret Moninger in China, 1915-1942, rev, 539-541
- Logan, Alastair H. B.
Gnostic Truth and Christian Heresy, rev, 742-743
- Logemann, Silke
Die Franziskaner im mittelalterlichen Lüneburg, rev, 315-317
- LoUards
anticlericalism, 455
gender and heresy in communities of, 797-798
not insignificant members of isolated communities, 802
preaching was a prime tool for dissemination of ideas, 770
- The Lord of Heaven: "Confucian Monotheism," 623-625
- Louis VII, King of France
visit to the shrine of Archbishop Thomas Becket, 285-286
- Louvain, University of
Diplomatic and Comparative Study of Bull of Foundation of, 91-93
- Lowe, Elizabeth
"Hervaeus Natalis: Evangelical Models and the Reform of the Dominican Order," paper given at ACHA 77th annual meeting, 259
- Lucero de Nuestra Salvación of Ausias Izquierdo Zabrero, 537
- Lucius III, Pope
inception of Inquisition under, 82
- Lucker, Raymond A.
rev. of B. L. Marthaler, O.E.M. Conv, 287-288
- Luna, Pedro de
as Benedict XIII, Pope of Avignon, 225
- Luongo, E Thomas
"Family Conflicts and Political Networks: Catherine of Siena and Her Disciples in the War of the Eight Saints," paper given at ACHA 77th annual meeting, 258
- Luther, Martin
evolving anticlericalism of, 457
essays on, 798-800
Heirs Define His Legacy: Studies on Lutheran Confessionalization, 464-465
"Lutheranism in the Delaware Valley"
as theme of issue of Lutheran Quarterly, 550-551
- Lynch, John E.
rev. of L'Eglise et le droit dans le Midi (XIII-XTV siècles), 790-791
rev. of J. A. Brundage, 755-756
- Lynch, Joseph H.
rev. of Herman of Tournai, 784-785
- Maag, Karin
Seminary or University? The Genevan Academy and Reformed Higher Education, 1560-1620, rev, 333-334
- McAuley, Catherine, 112-113
- McCauley, Bernadette
"Conflicting Legacies? The Gendered Origins of Roman Catholic Involvement in Health Care in Nineteenth-Century New York City," paper given at ACHA 77th annual meeting, 260
- McClendon, James WU
does an appropriation of an ideal past deny the value of history, 131-132
- McCoog, Thomas M., S.J.
The Reckoned Expense: Edmund Campion and the Early English Jesuits, rev, 468-471
The Society of Jesus in Ireland, Scotland, and England, 1541-1588: "Our Way of Proceeding?," rev, 805-806
rev. of D. Flynn, 343-344
rev. of T. H. Clancy, 348-349
- McCoy, Floyd
rev. of A. Greene, 811-812
rev. of F. Osborne, S.J., 812-813
- McDonnell, James M.
rev. of E. J. Power, 516-517
- Macek, E. Uen A.
The Loyal Opposition: Tudor Traditionalist Polemics, 1535-1558, rev, 462-463
- McGinness, Frederick J.
award of Howard R. Marraro Prize to, 263-264
- McGivney, Michael, Father
National Conference of Catholic Bishops agreed to initiating of the cause of, 822
- McGlynn, Sean
rev. of J. Shirley, 312-313
rev. of W. of Tudela, 312-313
- McGrath, Stamatina
rev. of D. Krueger, 761-762

- McGreevy John T.
award of the John Gilmary Shea Prize for
1996, 262
- McInerney, Michael
pamphlet on the art of, 551
- McIntyre James Cardinal, 244
response to Ottaviani query of, 244
- McKevitt, Gerald, SJ.
rev. of P. Gleason, 144-145
- McKitterick, Rosamond, editor
The New Cambridge Medieval History,
Volume II: C. 700-c. 900, rev., 302-305
- Maclear J. J., editor
Church and State in the Modern Age. A Doc-
umentary History, rev, 290-291
- McMahon, Eileen M.
What Parish Are You From? A Chicago Irish
Community and Race Relations, rev.,
145-146
- McManamon John M., SJ.
rev. of E. F. Howard, 323-324
- McMannus, E. Leo
rev. of E. M. Young, 118-119
- McNaUy, Michael J.
Catholic Parish Life on Florida's West Coast,
1860-1968, rev., 518-519
rev. of D. C. GiUespie, 519-520
- McNaUy, Vincent J.
Reform, Revolution and Reaction: Arch-
bishop John Thomas Troy and the
Catholic Church in Ireland, 1787-1817,
rev., 111-112
rev. of M. C. SuUivan, 112-113
- McNamara Jo Ann Kay
Report of the Committee on Program,
258-261
rev. of R. Ranft, 298-299
- McNicholas John T., Archbishop of Cincinnati
and parochial schools in Ohio, 443, 449
- McSheffrey, Shannon
Gender and Heresy - Women and Men in Lol-
lard Communities, 1420-1530, rev.,
797-798
- Maddicott J. R.
rev. of R. Binski, 311-312
- Madigan, Kevin
rev. of I. W. Frank, 164-165
- Madison James
as a "separationist" with regard to religion and
the state, 508
- Maggi, Armando
"Stories and Histories in the Visions of Maria
Maddalena de' Pazzi," paper given at ACHA
77th annual meeting, 259
- Magic and Miracles, 641-644
- Maier, Sister Mary Denis, C.S.A.
rev. of C. J. Kauffman, 135-137
- Mahoney, Thomas H. D.
Obituary of, 552
- Mahony, Robert
rev. of C. Candy, 492-494
- Mahony, Roger Cardinal
appointed episcopal moderator of the Asso-
ciation of Catholic Diocesan Archivists,
546
declares moviegoers must decide what to see
based upon their consciences, 529
- Making of a Heretic: Gender, Authority, and the
Priscillianist Controversy, 752-753
- Måle, EmUe (1862-1954), 401-427
- Maloney, Thomas P.
rev. of D. Keogh, 126-127
- Mango, Cyril
rev. of S. HUI, 748-749
- Manichaeans
as heretics of Aquitaine, 388-389
rejection of doctrines of orthodox, 391-392
- Manichaeism in Syria, 747
- Mansfield, Mary C.
The Humiliation of Sinners: Public Penance
in Thirteenth-Century France, rev.,
309-311
- Mantua, 69-70
- Marcion and the Marcionites in Syria, 747
- Marian
apparitions during the Bismarck era, 485
piety in the contemporary Church, in and
subsequent rise of, 533
- Markus, R. A.
rev. of P. Brown, 745-746
Sacred and Secular Studies on Augustine
and Latin Christianity, b.n., 168
- Maronite Church in 1736-1840, 481-482
- Marriage and Society in Reformation Germany,
99-100
- Marsden, George
contemporary fundamentalism as efforts to
restore an idealized past, 131
- Marshall John, Chief Justice
on religion and the state, 508
- Marthaler, Berard L., O.F.M. Conv.
The Catechism Yesterday and Today: The
Evolution of a Genre, rev, 287-288
- Martial, Saint
cult as official church reaction to popular
spiritual demands, 395
in apostolic cult of, 386
- Martin, A. Lynn
Plague? Jesuit Accounts of Epidemic Disease
in the Sixteenth Century, rev, 335-337
rev. of J. W. Padberg, 168-169
rev. of R. Feldhay, 472-473
- Martini, Raymond
Pugio Fidei adversus Mauros et fadaeos,
82
- Martin Pope, 91
Improved the efficiency of the papal fiscal
system, 95
- Marty, Martin E.
Modern American Religion, Volume 3:
Under God, Indivisible, 1941-1960,
rev, 530-531
- Martyrs of Córdoba: Community and Family
Conflict in an Age of Mass Conversion,
306-307
- martyrs: sacrifice as a rational choice, 741

- Maryknoll Fathers in Cleveland (1937), 433
- Massa, Mark S., S.J.
rev. of R. L. Christensen, 524-525
- Material History of American Religion Project, 353
- Mathes, W. Michael
donation of research library on the history of colonial Mexico to El Colegio de Jalisco, Zapolopan, by, 823
- Mathews, Thomas F.
Art and Architecture in Byzantium and Armenia: Liturgical and Exegetical Approaches, rev, 756-757
- Matrix: A Collection of Resources for the Study of Women's Religious Communities, 500-1500, now online, 824
- Ma Xiangpo, founder of first Aurore, forced to resign, 670
- Maximum Illud, first of series of attempts by the Holy See to denounce frontier model for Catholic Church, 656
- Mecklenburg, mendicant orders in, 316-317
- Medieval Canon Law, 755-756
- Medieval
Christian Perceptions of Islam: A Book of Essays, 766-768
Church, A Brief History, 164-165
Congress holding of the Fourth International, 352
Ecclesiastical Studies in Honour of Dorothy M. Owen, 301-302
scholastic philosophy revival had no influence on E. Mäle, 409-410
Sicily decline and fall of, 86-87
- meditation, self-examination and asceticism, 638-641
- Meeks, Wayne A.
rev. of V. L. Wimbush and R. Valantasis, editors, 282-283
- Meerschaeft, Théophile
Diary of a Frontier Bishop: The Journals of, 522
- Meissner, W. W., S.J., MD.
rev. of A. L. Martin, 335-337
- Melanchthon, Philipp
Concordia Historical Institute Museum special exhibition on the life of, 824
new exhibition commemorating the quincentenary of the birth of, 549
Philippists as followers of, 465
quincentenary of birth commemorated by a lecture, 820
- Mentzer, Raymond A.
rev. of P. Roberts, 334-335
- Merovingian
France: History and Hagiography of late, 640-720, 759-761
Gaul, A.D. 481-751, culture and religion in, 758-759
- Merton, Thomas
letters of, 171-172
- Methodism in nineteenth-century England, 115
- Methodists, essay on history in Indiana of, 512-513
- Metzler, Josef, editor
America Pontificia, III. Documenti pontifici nelVArchivio Segreto Vaticano riguardanti l'evangelizzazione dell'America: 1592-1644, rev, 288-290
- Mexican Americans and the Catholic Church, 1900-1965, 141-143
- Mexican Devotional Retablos from the Peters Collection, 160
- Michael of Cesena, documentation on, 793-794
- Michoacán Diocese 1749-1810, 810-811
- Migne Jacques-Paul, Abbé
publication enterprise of, 410-411
- Miller, Maureen C.
rev. of A. R. Bagliani and V. Pasche, editors, 794-795
- Miller, Samuel J.
rev. of P. Stella, 110-111
- Milliken, Elizabeth
"Depending upon Divine Providence: The Establishment of St. Joseph's Hospital and the Sisters of St. Joseph, Elmira, New York, 1908-1932." paper given at ACHA 77th annual meeting, 260
- Milton, Anthony
Catholic and Reformed: The Roman and Protestant Churches in English Protestant Thought, 1600-1640, rev., 104-106
- Mindanao, Jesuit Missionary Letters from, 816-818
- Minnich, Nelson H.
rev. of A. Dykema and H. A. Oberman, editors, 452-461
"The Role of Anticlericalism in the Reformation," review article, 452-461
- Minorcan Jews, essay on conversion of, 770
- Minorita, Nicolaus
Chronica, Documentation on Pope John XXII, Michael of Cesena and the Poverty of Christ with Summaries in English. A Source Book, rev, 793-794
- Misner, Paul
rev. of A. Tergel, 292-293
- Missionary Church, essay on history in Indiana of, 513
- Missionary Sisters of Charity founding of schools in New York, 521
- Mission San Fernando, Rey de España bicentenary to be observed with a Mass, 544
symposium commemorating the bicentenary of the founding of, 820
- Mit brennender Sorge encyclical against Nazism, 125
- Mola, Emilio, General
believed that church ought to be separated from the state in Spain, 209
- Monastic Foundation Legends in Medieval Southern France, 768-769
- monasticism
data on the history in Italy of early, 744-745

GENERAL INDEX

- Monfasanijohn E.
 appointed ACHA representative on joint committee on the Marraro Prizes, 173
 Byzantine Scholars in Renaissance Italy: Cardinal Bessarion and Other Emigrés, rev., 95-97
- Moninger, Margaret
 The Career in China 1915-1942 of, 539-541
- Monophysites in the Near East, 732-733
- Monter, William
 rev. of T. A. Lambert and LM. Watt, editors, 332-333
- Moore John C.
 appointed to the Committee on the John Gilmary Shea Prize, 542
- Moran, Jo Ann Hoepfner
 rev. of S. McSheffrey, 797-798
- Morgain, Stéphane-Marie
 Pierre de Bérulle et les Carmélites de France: La querelle du gouvernement, 1583-1629, rev., 103-104
- Moriarty, Thomas F.
 rev. of P. Fagan, editor, 475-477
- Mormino, Gary R.
 rev. of M. J. McNally, 518-519
- Mormons
 essay on history of Indiana of, 513
 essays on nineteenth-century, 132
- Morrissey, Thomas E.
 rev. of A. Frenken, 322-323
- Motion Picture Industry on Sin and Censorship, 528-529
- Mountain Retreat Association
 commemoration of the centenary of, 181
- Moxos
 Native Tradition of Jesuit Enterprise, Secular Policy in, 1660-1880, 159-160
- Mungeo, D. E., and Edward J. Malatesta, SJ.
 "Christianity in China, Introduction," 569-572
- Munitiz, Joseph A.
 rev. of M. Angold, 771-772
- Münster Diocese
 Catholic, male youth groups between 1918 and 1945 in, 496-497
- Murphy, Ignatius
 The Diocese of Killaloe, rev, 477-479
- Murphy, Paul V.
 appointed as assistant professor of history of the University of San Francisco, 551
 "The Execution of John Fisher Viewed through Italian Eyes: A Letter of Cardinal Ercole Gonzaga," 69-74
- Murphy, Terrence
 George Edward Clerk Award presented to, 546
- Murphy, Terrence, and Roberto Perm
 A Concise History of Christianity in Canada, rev., 534-536
- Music in Ireland, The Cecilian Reform Movement 1878-1903, 489-490
- Muslims, essay on history in Indiana of, 513
- Musto, Ronald G.
 Catholic Peacemakers: A Documentary History. Volume Two: From the Renaissance to the Twentieth Century, rev, 737-738
- Myers, W David
 "Poor Sinning Folk," Confession and Conscience in Counter-Reformation Germany, rev, 466-468
- Mystery Plays, influence upon post-thirteenth-century art of, 414
- A Nahua drama from Early Colonial Mexico, Holy Wednesday, 536-538
- National Catholic War Council, 429
- National Catholic Welfare Conference, 241
- National Conference of Catholic Bishops, 241
- National Right to Life Committee, 533
- "Native American Women's Responses to Christianity" in special issue of Ethnohistory, 359-360
- Nazism, publication of encyclical condemning the principles of, 211
- NCCB. See National Conference of Catholic Bishops
- NCWC. See National Catholic Welfare Conference
- Nelson Janet L.
 rev. of R. E. SuUivan, editor, 762-766
- Nemer, Lawrence
 rev. of R-Y. TouUelan, 157-158
- Neophytes the Recluse, St., 284
- Neoscholasticism
 positive role played during "Catholic Renaissance" of twentieth century, 145
- Neri, Michael Charles
 rev. of A. M. Osio, 514-515
- Netherlands, struggle between Calvinist factions in, 460
- Neururer, Otto, Blessed
 beatification of, 354-355
- Neveu, Bruno
 Erudition et religion aux XVII^e et XVIII^e siècles, rev, 471-472
- New England Historical Association, papers read at meeting of, 173
- New Jersey Catholic Historical Records Commission received grant for publication of "New Jersey Catholicism: An Annotated Bibliography," 824
- Newman John Henry, 119
- Newman, Martha G.
 The Boundaries of Charity: Cistercian Culture and Ecclesiastical Reform, 1098-1180, rev, 772-773
- New York
 Catholicism of the Gilded Age, 259
 founding of schools by Missionary Sisters of Charity of, 521
 Health Care of nineteenth-century New York City, 260

- history of the Archdiocese of, 550
 Irish of, 506-507
 Italian Immigrants (1880-1945) in the Archdiocese of, 520-521
- Nicholas of Cusa
 American Cusanus Society will sponsor three sessions on, 820-821
- Nicholson, Helen
 Templars, Hospitallers and Teutonic Knights: Images of the Military Orders, 1128-1291, rev., 780-781
 "Nicodemism," 331
- Noah's Flood: The Genesis Story in Western Thought, 726-728
- Noel, Jan
 Canada Dry: Temperance Crusades before Confederation, rev., 151-153
- Ato es muy
 encyclical against Mexican persecution of the Church, 125
- Nolan, Charles E.
 "Introduction to the Deggs Journal and the Louisiana Catholic History Perspective," paper given at ACHA 77th annual meeting, 259
- Nolan, Janet
 rev. of R. H. Bayor and T.J. Meagher, 506-507
- NoU, Mark
 how origins are authoritative for biblical interpretation, 132
- NoU, Ray R.
 rev. of N. Brox, 293-294
- Nostra Aetate, 75-76
- Nunis, Doyce B., editor
 Hispanic California Revisited: Essays by Francis E Guest, O.E.M., rev, 509-510
- Nyhus, Paul L.
 rev. of G. Dipple, 801 -802
- Oates, Sister Mary J, CSJ.
 on Committee on the John Gilmary Shea Prize, 542
- O'Boyle, Patrick A, Archbishop of Washington, 240
- O'Brien, David J.
 "John Hughes and the Formation of the Antebellum American Catholic Church," paper given at ACHA 77th annual meeting, 259
- Occidentals as Chinese construction of the West, 577
- Oceania, Picpusian missionaries in, 157-158
- Ockham, WiUiam of
 A Letter to the Friars Minor and Other Writings, rev, 87-89
 A Short Discourse on the Tyrannical Government: Over Things Divine and Human but Especially over the Empire, rev., 87-89
- O'ConneU, Marvin R.
 rev. of P. Saint-Roch, 119-121
- O'ConneU, WiUiam Cardinal
 refused to consider idea of Black Catholic parish, 44
- O'Connor, Thomas E, ES.C.
 received research travel grant, 824
- O'Connor, Thomas H.
 given an award for The Boston Irish: A Political History, 546
- O'DonneU, Anne M., SND.
 rev. of D. Parker, editor, 803-804
- O'DonneU, James J.
 rev. of G. Jenal, 744-745
- O'Donoghue, Fergus, SJ.
 rev. of M. K. Walsh, 172
- O'Donovan, Gerald
 popular Irish novelist, 492-494
- O'Dwyer, Brother Ephrem, C.S.C., 147-148
- Ohio Teachers' Federation inquiry regarding aid to the parochial schools, 447
- Oklahoma, history of the Catholic Church in, 522
- Ulbricht, Thomas
 how origins are authoritative for biblical interpretation, 132
- O'Uvi, Petrus Johannis
 as major hero of spiritual Franciscan movement, 794
- Olsen, Glenn W
 rev of S. L. Waugh and P. D. Diehl, 769-771
- Olson, O'Uver K.
 rev. of R. Kolb, 464-465
- O'NeU, Hugh
 Prince of Ulster in exUe, 172
- Opium traffic in China
 history of Protestant Missionaries' attacks on, 540-541
- Oratorians
 role in connection with the work of the Congregation of Rites, 276
- Orders of Knighthood and of Merit:
 Pontifical Religious and Secularised Catholic-founded Orders, and their relationship to the Apostolic See, 738-739
- Orientalism
 notion of, 575-576
- Orlando Furioso, analysis, 456
- Orsi, Robert A.
 Thank You, St. Jude. Women's Devotion to the Patron Saint of Hopeless Causes, rev, 526-528
- Osborne, Francis J., SJ.
 History of the Catholic Church in America, rev, 812-813
- Osio, Antonio Maria
 The History of Alta California: A Memoir of Mexican California, rev, 514-515
- Ottaviani, Alfredo Cardinal
 request for eight replies to his letter, 246-247
 secret circular letter of, 233-234
- Ottawa
 Archdiocese to sponsor historical conference commemorating sesquicentennial of episcopal see, 352-353
- Our Lady of Guadalupe: The Origins and Sources of a Mexican National Symbol, 1531-1797, 153-154

- Outler, Albert
sense that American Methodists reflect biblical norms, 132
- Owen, Dorothy M.
Medieval Ecclesiastical Studies in Honour of, 301-302
- Owenites, essay on history in Indiana of, 513
- Ozanam, Frédéric
beatification of, 357
Pope John Paul II declared blessed, 822
- Padberg, John W., S.J.
Together as a Companionship: A History of the Thirty-First, Thirty-Second, and Thirty-Third General Congregations of the Society of Jesus, b.n., 168-169
- Paolo VI e la collegialità episcopale: Colloquio Internazionale di Studio, Brescia 25-26-27 settembre 1992, rev, 291-292
- Papen, Franz von, life, 497-499
- Paradise, History of
Garden of Eden in Myth and Tradition, 728-729
- Paraguay Jesuit Missions, 154-155
- Paravicini Bagliani, Agostino and Véronique Pasche, editors
La Parrocchia nel Medio Evo: Economia, Scambi, Solidarietà, rev, 794-795
- Parish Boundaries: The Catholic Encounter with Race in the Twentieth Century Urban North, 262-263
- Parker, Douglas, editor
A Proper Dialogue between a Gentilman and an Husbandman, rev., 803-804
- Parmelee, Lisa Ferrano
Good News from France, French Anti-League Propaganda in Late Elizabethan England, rev, 341-343
- parochial schools
in several states received partial assistance in the form of textbooks and transportation, 450
save money for state, 436
- Partner, Peter
explains process by which the Roman Curia became "Italianized," 94
- Pater Noster and Girolamo Seripando, 1-19
- Path to Christian Democracy: German Catholics and the Party System from Windthorst to Adenauer, 494-495
- Paul IV, Pope
"Rule of Carafa," 328
- Paul V, Pope
problems that encountered concerning the overseas Church, 289
- Paul VI, Pope, 215
Libentissimo Sane Animo, 237
lack of clear and definitive statements from, 245
Motu proprio, Integrae Servandae, 236
meeting with the President of Israel during the Pope's pilgrimage to the Holy Land, 77
papers on activity after the close of the Second Vatican Council on, 291-292
Second Vatican Ecumenical Council, 75
- Paz, D. G., editor
Nineteenth-Century English Religious Traditions: Retrospect and Prospect, rev., 114-115
- Peasant War, role that anticlericalism played in, 458
- Pease, Neal
rev. of J. Siedlarz, 503-504
- Pentecostals, essays on, 132, 513
- Perrot, Georges
appointed head of Ecole Normale in 1883, 405
book on topic of art in secondary education, 413
- Perry, Richard D.
More Maya Missions: Exploring Colonial Chiapas, b.n., 169-170
- Persons, Robert
and condoning an assassination of Queen Elizabeth, 469
- Peterman, Thomas Joseph
Catholics in Colonial Delmarva, rev, 505-506
- Peterson, David S.
rev. of D. Webb, 788-790
- Phayer, Michael
rev. of L. Götz v. Olenhusen, editor, 485-486
- Philippists, 465
- Piacenza
breviary of 1598, 276
Lives of the Saints of, 277
- Picpusian missionaries in Oceania, 157-158
- Pierce v. Society of Sisters, 435-436
- Pierozzi, Antonino
study of, 323-324
- piety (lay) in social and political context of late Middle Ages, 786-788
- Pius II, Pope
effect on imports into Rome during an extended absence of, 94-95
- Pius IX, Pope
and canonization of San Diego de Alcalá, 705
- Pius V, Pope
Regnans in Excelsis inaugurates hard line against Catholics in England, 342
- Pius VII, Pope
examination of Pistoia's decrees ordered by, 110
re-establishment of Society of Jesus in 1814 by, 664
- Pius LX, Pope
150th anniversary of establishment of dioceses by, 177
mission of Rosmini to, 487
Neo-Ultramontanism that developed under, 111

- refusal to recognize Queen Isabel II as legitimate sovereign, 204
- Pius X, Pope
decree against Modernism of, 240
- Pius XI, Pope
denounced racism, 125
encyclical letter *Rerum Ecclesiae* of, 656
naming of priest as bishop of León without consulting the regime, 210-211
publication of encyclical condemning the principles of Nazism, 211
reign of, 122-126
- Pius XII, Pope
convenio with Spain agreed to by, 213
Joseph Schrembs presented with title of archbishop by, 428
message congratulating the Nationalists on their victory in the Spanish Civil War, 502-503
official delegation representing the government of Israel at the funeral of, 77
- Pizan, Christine de
defended women against clerical misogyny, 457
- Pizzorusso, Giovanni
Roma net Caraibi: L'organizzazione dette missioni cattoliche nette Antille e in Guyana (1635-1675), rev, 807-808
- plague
Jesuit accounts of epidemic disease in sixteenth century, 335-337
religious controversy over the morality of fleeing, 788
- Pletho
paganism of, 96-97
- Pohlsander, Hans A.
rev. of O. Chadwick, 281-282
- Poland
relations of church and state during the Communist dictatorship, 503-504
- Poluse, Martin
"Archbishop Joseph Schrembs's Battle to Obtain Public Assistance for the Parochial Schools of Cleveland During the Great Depression," 428-451
- Pontifical, Religious and Secularised Catholic-founded Orders, and their relationship to the Apostolic See, Orders of Knighthood and of Merit, 738-739
- Poole, Stafford, C. M.
Our Lady of Guadalupe, The Origins and Sources of a Mexican National Symbol, 1531-1797, rev, 153-154
rev. of L. M. Burkhart, 536-538
- Poos, L. R.
rev. of B. A. Kumin, 320-322
rev. of M. Spufford, editor, 802-803
"The Popes and the Jews: From Gelasius I to Julius III (492-1555)," review article, 75-85
"Port-Royal et le Protestantisme," colloquium held at Montpellier on, 820
- Poverty of Christ Documentation, 793-794
- Powell James M.
rev. of J. V. Tolan, 766-768
- Power, Edward J.
Religion and the Public Schools in 19th Century America: The Contribution of Orestes A. Brownson, rev., 516-517
- Power, Kim
Veiled Desire: Augustine on Women, rev., 750-751
- preaching
as essential in protecting the orthodox from the errors of the heretics, 396
"Pre-enlightenment" as Gallican scholarship at the turn of the seventeenth century, 471
- Presbyterian Church school had received public funding, 437
- Primeau, Ernest J., Bishop of Manchester
response to inquiry of Ottaviani of, 244-245
- Primo de Rivera dictatorship effort to exclude Catalans from appointment to the dioceses of Catalonia, 206
- Priscillianist Controversy, 752-753
- Progressive party in mid-nineteenth-century Spain, 204
- A proper Dialogue between a Gentilman and an Husbandman
rev. of D. Parker, editor, 803-804
- Protestant Missionaries in China (1847-1917) as Crusaders against Opium, 539-541
- Protestant Nonconformists in England between 1840's and 1890's, 114-115
"Le Protestantisme dans les pays de l'Adour (1787-1905)" colloquium, 358
- Proust, Marcel
admirer of E. Mâle, 422-423
- Prucha, Francis Paul, S.J.
rev. of R. A. Enochs, 523-524
- public schools counted students in private schools in request for funds, 434
- Puritanism, essays on, 132
- Quakers
in nineteenth-century England, 115
soliciting of papers on any aspect of history, 821
- Quiet Revolution in Quebec, prelude to, 535
- Quinn John F.
rev. of J. Weaver and R. S. Appleby, editors, 531-534
- Quiñones breviary, 275
- Rabe, Susan A.
Faith, Art, and Politics at Saint Riquier. The Symbolic Vision of Ang Ubert, rev, 305-306
racism, Pius XI denounced, 125
Rader J. Matthäus, S.J., 345-346
Raimondo, S.
"The Lady Helper of the Urban Poor," 278

- Ranft, Patricia
 Women and the Religious Life in Premodern Europe, rev, 298-299
- Rankin, David
 Tertullian and the Church, b.n., 170
- Rappites, essay on history in Indiana of, 513
- Rationalists, essay on history in Indiana of, 513
- Ready, Michael J., Reverend
 informed Schrems on House Education subcommittee, 445-446
- Reformation Germany, Marriage and Society in, 99-100
- "RegaUsm, LiberaUsm, and General Franco," 201-216
- Regimini Ecclesiae Universae, 238
- Reig, Enrique Cardinal, 206
- Reilly, Bernard F.
 rev of C. Stalls, 776-777
- Reinburg, Virginia
 will represent ACHA as delegate at UistaUation of sixth president of Northeastern University, 173
- Reiter, Frederick J.
 They Built Utopia (The Jesuit Missions in Paraguay) 1610-1768, rev, 154-155
- relics and reUquaries in the Middle Ages
 theme of articles published in issue of Gesta, 826
- Religion and
 Devotion in Europe, c. 1215-c. 1515, 785-786
- Politics in the Early Republic: Jasper Adams and the Church-State Debate, 507-509
- Secularism in Canada, theme of articles published in issue of Historical Studies, 826-827
- Public Schools in nineteenth-Century America, the contribution of Brownson, Orestes A., 516-517
- Religion in Indiana: A Guide to Historical Resources, 513
- Jemensnyder, Amy G.
 Remembering Kings Past: Monastic Foundation Legends in Medieval Southern France, rev, 768-769
- Renaissance Italy Penitential Sermons, 1-19
- Renan, Ernest
 influence on E. Mâle of work of, 407
- Restoration in Spain
 concessions to the Church with regalists restraints during, 205
- ecclesiastical settlement, 206
- Rhegius, Urbanus
 essays on, 798-800
- strong plea for toleration of Jews, 800
- Rheims cathedral
 German cannonading of, 4 17
- Rhine Palatinate regulation of marriage, 99
- Rho, Jacobus
 "Explanation of the Practice of Mercy" of, 648
- Ricci, Matteo
 elements in missionary style of, 658-662
- Memory Palace of, 587
- Rice, Edmund Ignatius
 beatification of, 178
- "Richard Hooker Issue" of the Journal of Religious History, 550
- Richardson, James, C.M., the Very Reverend
 as subject of issue of Vincentian Heritage, 360
- The Rise of Christianity. A Sociologist Reconsiders History, 739-741
- The Rise of Western Christendom. Triumph and Diversity, AD 200-1000, 745-746
- Robert E. Carbonneau, C.P.
 rev. of K. L. Lodwick, 539-541
- Roberts, Penny
 A City in Conflict: Troyes during the French Wars of Religion, rev, 334-335
- Robinson, O. E, editor and translator
 The Register of Walter Bronescombe, Bishop of Exeter, 1258-1280, rev., 317-318
- Rolf, Richard W, SJ.
 The Sorcerer's Apprentice: The Life of Franz von Papen, rev., 497-499
- Roma Capitale (1447-1527), 93-95
- Roma nei Caraibi, L'organizzazione delle missioni cattoliche nelle Antille e in Guyana (1635-1675), 807-808
- Roma Sottoterrena, 279
- Rome et ses vieilles églises, anti-German content of, 418
- Roñan, Charles E., SJ.
 rev. of S. Poole, C.M., 153-154
- Roñan, Charles E., S.J., and John D. Baggarly, SJ.
 rev. of J. Metzler, editor, 288-290
- Roosevelt, Franklin D., President
 unwilling to support school reUef bill, 446
- Rosin, Robert
 appointed director of Center for Reformation Research, 546
- Rosminians, 486-487
- Rosmini-Serbati, Antonio, 486-487
- Ross, John, Bishop of CarUle
 Register of, 1325-1332, 89-90
- Rossi, Giovanni Battista de, 119-121
- Rostock, University of, 92
- Roth, Norman
 Conversos, Inquisition, and the Expulsion of the Jews from Spain, rev., 97-99
- Royle, Edward
 surveys "Freethought: The Religion of IreUgion," 115
- Ruether, Rosemary Radford
 letters of, 171-172
- Ruiz-de-Medina, Juan, SJ.
 Documentos del Japón, 1558-1562, rev, 156-157
- Rural Dissenters, the world of, 1520-1725, 802-803
- Rus pagan religion, 734-735
- Rush, Robert T, SJ.
 rev. of J. Brean and M. Williams, editors, 813-814
- Ryan, James D.
 rev. of J. Delumeau, 728-729

- Sacred Congregation for the Doctrine of the Faith, 233, 234
 majority of bishops not enthusiastic over approach to postconciliar problems, 246
 letter on "strange and audacious opinions," 254-257
- Sacred Congregation of the Holy Office, 236-237
- Sacred Congregation of the Roman and Universal Inquisition. See Sacred Congregation of the Holy Office
- "Sacred Places—Liturgical Spaces: Explorations of Religious Architecture" as theme of an issue of *U.S. Catholic Historian*, 551
- Saeger James Schofield
 rev. of E.J. Reiter, 154-155
- Safran, Linda
 rev. of T. F. Mathews, 756-757
- Sagasta, Práxedes
 Liberal party of, 205
- Saidi, Reza
 appointed to ACHA Committee on Investments, 173
- Saint-Barthélemy, Anne de
 influence of the christology of, 104
- Saint Joseph's Society of the Sacred Heart. See Josephites
- Saint Louis Conference on Manuscript Studies
 twenty-fourth meeting, 353
- Samt Martin of Tournai, restoration of the monastery of, 784-785
- Samt Mary's City Jesuit chapel
 plans to rebuild seventeenth-century, 548-549
- Saint Richard's Parish, Boston
 closing of, 61-67
 establishment of, 52-60
- Saint Vincent de Paul of Baltimore: The Story of a People and Their Home, 137-138
- Saint-Riquier, Abbey of, 305-306
- Saint-Roch, Patrick
 Correspondance de Giovanni Battista de Rossi et de Louis Duchesne (1873-1894), rev, 119-121
- Saints
 as *athletae Christi*, 279
 in the Italian City-states, 788-790
- Salerno, spread of heretical teachings in, 5-6
- Salviati, Florentine merchant family, 93
- Salvio da Bagnoli, Ambrogio
 testimony of, 5
- Sánchez José M.
 rev. of A. Alvarez Bolado, 502-503
 rev. of W. A. Christian Jr., 501-502
- San Diego de Alcalá
 arguments in favor of canonization, 704-705
 and the Politics of Saint-making in Counter-Reformation Europe, 691-715
- "Santa Maria del Fiore: the Cathedral and Its Sculpture"
 as theme of international symposium, 544
- Santich Jan Joseph, O.S.B.
Missio Moscovitica: The Role of the Jesuits in the Westernization of Russia, rev, 344-345
- Sapientie Immarcessibilis, 91-93
- Sargent, Steven D.
 rev. of K. Schreiner, editor, 786-788
 rev. of R. N. Swanson, 785-786
- Saxony, tradition of complaints of clerics' misuse of power in, 456
- Scala, Bartolomeo
 exhorted the faithful to practice penitential mortification, 3
- Schäfer, Christoph
 Das Simultaneum: Ein Staatskirchenrechtliches, politisches und theologisches Problem des alten Reiches, rev, 109-110
- Schiefen, R. J.
 rev. of M. Heimann, 488-489
- Schlabach, Theron
 on American Mennonites and Amish, 132
- Schlaflly, Daniel L. Jr.
 "Father Demetrius A. GaUitzin: Son of the Russian Enlightenment," 716-725
- Schneider, A. Gregory
 The Way of the Cross Leads Home: The Domestication of American Methodism, rev, 134-135
- Schoenberg, Wilfred E, S.J.
 Jesuit Mission Presses in the Pacific Northwest: A History and Bibliography of Imprints, 1876-1899, b.n., 170-171
- Scholastic Humanism and the Unification of Europe, Vol. I: Foundations, 307-308
- Schools of Christian Doctrine, 16
- Schrader, William C.
 rev. of C. Schäfer, 109-110
- Schreiner, Klaus, editor
 Laienfrömmigkeit im späten Mittelalter: Formen, Funktionen, politisch-soziale Zusammenhänge, rev, 786-788
- Schrems, Joseph, Archbishop
 Battle to Obtain Public Assistance for the Parochial Schools of Cleveland During the Great Depression, 428-451
- Schuchard, Christine
 shrinking employment opportunities available to Germans in Rome, 94
- Schwab, John F.
 rev. of W. B. Taylor, 808-810
- Science and Civilization in China, 596-597
- Scotland, the medieval Church in, 781-782
- Scott, Karen
 "Imagery of Conversion and Political Action: Catherine of Siena in Early Modern Italian Religious Writing," paper given at ACHA 77th annual meeting, 259
- Scott, John, O.S.B.
 member of the Committee on Program, 542
- Scott, T. Kermit
 Augustine. His Thought in Context, rev, 749-750
- Scottish Ecclesiastical Rentals at the Reformation, 100-101
- Seeley Jo Ann Browning
 rev. of T. Tackett, 482-484

- Segura, Pedro, archbishop of Seville, Cardinal considered episcopal oath as flagrant Gallicanism and a disgraceful humiliation for the Church, 214
 suppression of pastoral letter of, 213
 who first publicly challenged the apparent drift of the regime toward a fascist model, 212
- Senyk, Sophia
 A History of the Church in Ukraine, Volume I: To the End of the Thirteenth Century, rev., 733-735
- Seper, Franjo Cardinal
 "Instruction" to the heads of all episcopal conferences, 238
- Seripando, Girolamo, 1-19
 concerned with moral reformation and inner renewal, 3
- Serra, Junipero
 defense of role in California of, 509-510
- Seville, suppression of Catholic associations in, 212
- Sexuality in the Confessional: A Sacrament Profaned, 340-341
- Shaffern, Robert W
 rev. of M. E. Goodich, 319-320
- Shakers, essay on history in Indiana of, 513
- Shaw, Christine
 how Italian political exiles fared in Renaissance Rome, 94
- Shedel James
 rev. of J. W. Boyer, 121-122
- Sheehan, Patrick A.
 popular Irish novel, 492-494
- Sheetz, Jessica
 "Catholic Progress in London: A Public-Private Partnership, the Poor Law Guardians, and Catholic Religious Congregations," paper given at ACHA 77th annual meeting, 261
- Shehan, Lawrence Cardinal
 response to inquiry of Ottaviani of, 244
- Shiels, Richard D.
 rev. of A. G. Schneider, 134-135
- Shippisjan
 Mormon conviction that they are the restoration of the New Testament church, 132
- Shirleyjanet, translator and editor
 The Song of the Cathar Wars: A History of the Albigensian Crusade, rev., 312-313
- Sicut Iudaeis
 cornerstone laid by the papacy for the protection of the Jews, 80
- Siedlarzjan
 Kirche und Staat im kommunistischen Polen, 1945-1989, rev., 503-504
- Siena College twelfth multidisciplinary conference on World War II, 175
- Silvius, Aeneas (later Pope Pius II)
 visit to the shrine of Archbishop Thomas Becket, 286
- Simons, Francis, Bishop of Indore, India
 advocacy of a utilitarian or consensus approach, 248
- Simonsohn, Shlomo
 The Apostolic See and the Jews, 75-80
- Sin and Censorship: The Catholic Church and the Motion Picture Industry, 528-529
- Sisters of Charity in Cleveland (1928), 433
- Sisters of St. Joseph in Cleveland (1926), 433
- Sisters of the Blessed Sacrament, 45
- Sisters of the Third Order of Franciscan Conventual in Cleveland (1925), 433
- Sixtus V Pope
 canonization of San Diego de Alcalá and sailing of the Spanish Armada, 713-715
- Slade, Carole
 St. Teresa of Avila: Author of a Heroic Life, rev., 102-103
- Smith, W. Barry
 "American Catholic Philosophy Confronts the Age of Modernism: William Turner, Bishop of Buffalo, as Philosophical Historian," paper given at ACHA 77th annual meeting, 260
- Smyth, James H.
 rev. of D. L. Dreisbach, editor, 507-509
 "Societies of Doing Good," 648
- Society of Jesus. See «Jesuits among religious orders, fewest number of seduction cases investigated by the Inquisition concerned, 340
 as a kind of scholarly and humanitarian association, 632
 history of recent congregations of, 168-169
 in Ireland, Scotland, and England 1541-1588, 805-806
- Society of Saint Vincent de Paul
 commemoration of the founding of the, 180
- Society of the Holy Child Jesus
 commemoration of the founding of the, 180-181
- Socinianism, 331
- Soergel, Philip
 rev. of W. D. Myers, 466-468
- Solberg, Winton
 uses of an idealized past time among Enlightenment thinkers, 132
- Sommerfeldt, John R.
 rev. of Bernhard von Clairvaux, 777-778
- Somorjai, Adam, O.S.B.
 rev. of P. G. Bozsóky and L. Lukács, 130-131
- The Sorcerer's Apprentice: the Life of Franz von Papen, 497-499
- Southern, David W.
 John LaFarge and the Limits of Catholic Interracialism, 1911-1963, rev., 525-526
- Southern, R. W.
 Scholastic Humanism and the Unification of Europe, vol. I: Foundations, rev., 307-308
- Spain
 constitution of 1931 separated church and state for first time, 207
 proposals for a new concordat in 1968, 215
 religion and society in ca. 1492, 324-325

GENERAL INDEX

- role of clergy in CivU War, 502-503
- Spalding, Thomas W. and Kathryn M. Kuranda
St. Vincent de Paul of Baltimore: The Story of a People and Their Home, rev, 137-138
- Spalding, Thomas, CEX.
rev. of R Armstrong, C.S.C., 147-148
- Spanish CarneUtes of the Ancient Observance, 735-736
- Spanish RepubUc, Second
politicians committed to regalism, 207
visions and visionaries in, 501-502
- Speculum Majus as basis for syntheses of reU-
gious art history, 402
- SpeUman, Francis Cardmal, 240
- Sperber/Jonathan
rev. of C Kösters, 496-497
- Speyer, regulation of marriage in, 99
- spirituali
why failed to be more effective in promoting
church reforms, 456
- SpirituaUsts, essay on history m Indiana of,
513
- Spitz, Lewis W, and Barbara Sher Tinsley, transla-
tors
Johann Sturm on Education: The Reforma-
tion and Humanist Learning, rev, 337-338
- Spufford, Margaret, editor
The World of Rural Dissenters, 1520-1725,
rev, 802-803
- Stafford, WUam S.
rev. of L. W. Spitz and B. S. Tinsley, translators,
337-338
- Stalls, Clay
Possessing the Land: Aragon's Expansion
into Islam's Ebro Frontier under Alfonso
the Battler, 1104-1134, rev, 776-777
- Standaert, Nicolas, SJ
description of major paradigm shift in histori-
ography of Christianity in China, 570
"New Trends in the Historiography of Chris-
tianity in China," 573-613
- Stanley, Susie
on the Church of God, 132
- Stark, Rodney
The Rise of Christianity. A Sociologist Recon-
siders History, rev., 739-741
- Steinhauser, Kenneth B.
rev. of V Burrus, 752-753
- Stella, Pietro
Il giansenismo in Italia, Vol. II/I: Roma: La
bolla "Auctorem fidei" (1794) nella storia
dell'ultramontanismo. Saggio introduttivo
e documenti, rev, 110-111
- Steltenkamp, Michael, SJ.
rev. of C HoUer, 140-141
- Stevens Arroyo, Anthony M.
rev. of G. Pizzorusso, 807-808
- Stinger, Charles
how humanists created an image of Rome, 93
- Storey, R. L., editor
The Register of John Kirkby, Bishop of
Carlisle, 1332-1352, and the Register of
John Ross, Bishop of CarUsle, 1325-1332,
rev, 89-90
- Strassburg, use of Heido/Drenss legal suit to illu-
minate changing situation in, 456
- Studia Borromaica papers presented at the Ac-
cademia di San Carlo in MUan, 549-550
- Sturm/Johann
on education: the Reformation and Humanist
Learning, 337-338
- StyUtes, Simeon
The Lives of, 753
- SuUivan, Mary C
Catherine McAuley and the Tradition of
Mercy, rev, 112-113
- SuUivan, Richard E.
rev of R. McKitterick, 302-305
- SuUivan, Richard E., editor
"The Gentle Voices of Teachers:" Aspects of
Learning in the CaroUngian Age, rev.,
762-766
- Sun, Raymond C.
"Catholic-Marxist Competition in the Working-
Class Parishes of Cologne During the
Weimar Republic," 20-43
- Swanson, R. N.
Religion and Devotion in Europe, c. 1215-
c. 1515, rev, 785-786
- Swedenborgians, essay on history in Indiana of,
513
- Swiss Forest Cantons, why they remained
CathoUc, 455
- 'SyUabus' from Rome, 1966-1968, and the Amer-
ican CathoUc Bishops, 233-257
- Symeon the Holy Fool: Leontius's Life and the
Late Antique City, 761-762
- Synod of Bishops, plenary assembly of the first
worldwide, 238
- Synod of Thurles, 479
- Syria
history and reUgion in late antique, 746-748
- Syriac Christianity and Islam
relationship between during the seventh and
eighth Christian centuries, 747
- Taborites' anticlericalism, 455
- Tackett, Timothy
Becoming a Revolutionary: The Deputies of
the French National Assembly and the
Emergence of a Revolutionary Culture,
rev, 482-484
- Talmud, attack on, 82
- Tampa's Ybor City immigrants manifested an an-
ticlericalism seldom matched in the United
States, 518
- Tanzone, Daniel F.
awarded medal Pro Ecclesia et Pontifice,
181
- Tardiff, Mary, O.P., editor
At Home in the World: The Letters of Thomas
Merton & Rosemary Radford Ruether,
b.n., 171-172

GENERAL INDEX

- Taylor, WUUm B.
Magistrates of the Sacred: Priests and Parishioners in Eighteenth Century Mexico, rev., 808-810
- Tedeschijohn
rev. of S. Caponetto, 330-331
- Teja, Frank de la
given the Carlos Castañeda Award, 829
- Templars, Hospitallers and Teutonic Knights: Images of the Military Orders, 1128-1291, 780-781
- Temple, A History of the Order of the, 779-780
- Tender, Leslie Woodcock
rev. of R. A. Orsi, 526-528
- Tender, Thomas
rev. of M. C. Mansfield, 309-311
- Teresa of AvUa, Samt, 102-103
and the PoUtics of Sanctity, 338-339
- Tergel, Alf
Church and Society in the Modern Age, rev, 292-293
- Teske, Roland, SJ.
St. Augustine. Arianism and Other Heresies, b.n., 159
- Texas CathoUc Historical Society annual meeting, 351
- Theatine Spirituality: Selected Writings, 328-329
- "Theodore Roosevelt and the Dawn of the 'American Century'"
multidisciplinary conference on, 175
- Thibodaux, Sylvia
"The Holy FamUy Sisters' Perspective," paper given at ACHA 77th annual meeting, 259
- Third Republic [of France], Republican and Catholic, 404
- Thomas, Samuel J.
"After Vatican Council II The American Catholic Bishops and the 'SyUabus' from Rome, 1966-1968," 233-257
- Thomas Hardy and the Church, 491-492
- Thomism, three divisions before Vatican Council II of, 532
- Thomist revival, brief general history of, 409-410
- "Through Multiple Lenses: Interdisciplinary Perspectives on the History of Women Religious" conference to be held at Loyola University Chicago, 545
- Tierney, Brian
rev. of W. Ockham, 87-89
- "Time and Space U Women's Lives in Early Modern Europe"
conference to be held on, 820
- Tiraboschi, Girolamo
on very learned contribution of Campi to Ecclesiastical History of Piacenza, 277
- Tolanjohn Victor, editor
Medieval Christian Perceptions of Islam: A Book of Essays, rev, 766-768
- Toledo, Ohio Joseph Schrems first bishop of, 429
- Tolton, August, Father
celebration of centenary of the death of, 819-820
- TouUelan, Pierre-Yves
Missionnaires au quotidien à Tahiti. Les Picpusiens en Polynésie au XIX' siècle, rev., 157-158
- Toulouse, University of, 92
Using of fourteenth century professors at, 790-791
- Toussaint, Pierre
beatification of, 356-357
- Tradition and Authority U the Reformation, 798-800
- Trappist monastery at ChanceUor's Point U Talbot county legend, 505
- "Tridentine Reformation," 329
- Trinitarians
congress being held U observance of the eighth centenary of the approval of the rule of the, 821-822
- Trisco, Robert
ex officio chairman of the ACHA Committee on Investments, 173
Report of the Secretary and Treasurer, 264-270
- Troy, John Thomas, Archbishop of Dublin, 111-112
- Troyes during the French Wars of ReUgion, 334-335
- Tudela, WUUm of
The Song of the Cathar Wars: A History of the Albigensian Crusade, rev, 312-313
- Tudor Traditionalist Polemics, 1535-1558, 462-463
- Twisted Cross: The German Christian Movement in the Third Reich, 499-500
- Tyndale, WUUm
"Let There Be Ught" exhibit, 819
thesis that edited A compendious olde treatyse, 803-804
- Übelhör, Monika
external element is accepted only U it joins an internal movement of a specific culture, 607
- Ubi Arcano Dei, 123
- UgheU, Ferdinando
Italia Sacra, 277, 279
- Ukraine, a history of the Church in, 733-735
- Ulpts, Ingo
Die Bettelorden in Mecklenburg: Ein Beitrag zur Geschichte der Franziskaner, Klarissen, Dominikaner und Augustiner-Eremiten im Mittelalter, rev, 315-317
- Unfinished Encounter: China and Christianity, 588
- Unitarians U nineteenth-century England, 114-115
- United Brethren, essay on history in Indiana of, 513

- UppalJamshedY.
appointed to ACHA Committee on Invest-
ments, 173
- Urbanski, Maryann, 269
- Urban VI, Pope
election of, 226
- Urban VII, Pope
brief Britannia (1631) of, 349
problems that encountered concerning the
overseas Church, 289-290
- U.S. CathoUc Historian, 181,359,551
- Uzhorod Union, commemoration of the 350th
anniversary of the, 177
- Vagnozzi, Egidio, 240
- ValdésJuan de
writings of a disciple of, 806-807
- Valencia, pastoral visits in, 796-797
- Valignano, Alessandro
as Visitor to the East, 658-660
- Van Mingroot, Erik
Sapientie Immarcessibilis.A Diplomatic and
Comparative Study of the Bull of Founda-
tion of the University of Louvain, rev.,
91-93
- Várela, Félix, Padre
commemorative postage stamp of, 822-823
- Vatican Council II
consequences for conservatives of, 531 -
532
international conference on "Decrees, Experi-
ence, and Event," 174
official delegation representing the govern-
ment of Israel at opening and closing of,
77
- Veiled Desire, Augustine on Women, 750-751
- Vibiana, Saint
removal of the remains of, 179
- Vidal i Barraquer, Francesc
pressured to accept a transfer to either
Zaragoza or Burgos, 207
- Vienna, 1897-1918
Christian Socialism in Power in, 121-122
- VUlalon, L. J. Andrew
"San Diego de Alcalá and the PoUtics of Saint-
making in Counter-Reformation Europe,"
691-715
- Vulanova University, 1842-1992, 138-140
- Vincentian Heritage, 360
- VioUet-le-Duc as discoverer of the Gothic
"world," 412
- "Virgin and the Devil in the New World: ReU-
gious Encounters in Latin America," Uni-
versity of New Mexico conference,
542-543
- visions and visionaries in the Second Spanish
Republic, 501-502
- Wacker, Grant
on the Pentecostals, 132
- Wagner, Karen T.
"Cum aliquis venerit ad sacerdotem: Liturgy
and the Development of Penance in the
Eleventh and Twelfth Centuries," paper
given at ACHA 77th annual meeting, 260
- Walsh, Micheline Kerney
An Exile of Ireland: Hugh O'Neill, Prince of
Ulster, b.n., 172
- Wang Zheng, "Standing in Awe of Heaven and
Loving Other People," 621
- Ward, Thomas E
The Search for, 519-520
- Warner, Michael
Changing Witness: Catholic Bishops and
Public Policy, 1917-1994, rev, 146-147
- Warren, Ann K.
rev. of R. GUchrist, 165
- Waugh, Scott L, and Peter D. Diehl
Christendom and Its Discontents: Exclusion,
Persecution, and Rebellion, 1000-1500,
rev., 769-771
- Weaver, Mary Jo, and R. Scott Appleby, editors
Being Right: Conservative Catholics in
America, rev, 531-534
- Webb, Diana
Patrons and Defenders: The Saints in the
Italian City-states, rev, 788-790
- Webb, Robert K.
appraises the Quakers and Unitarians,
115
- Weber, Francis J.
rev. of D. C. Cutter, 162-163
rev. of F. Walsh, 528-529
- WebsterJiU R.
rev. of M. M. Cárcel Ortí and J.V Boscá
Codina, 796-797
- Weimar region of Saxony
laity viewed their Lutheran clergy negatively,
460
- Wesleyan Church, essay on history Uí Indiana of,
513
- Westminster Abbey and the Plantagenets: King-
ship and the Representation of Power,
1200-1400, 311-312
- Wheeler, Arthur, C.S.C
rev. of W. P. Schoenberg, S J, 170-171
- WhiteJames D.
Diary of a Frontier Bishop: The Journals of
Théophile Meerschaert, rev, 522
- WhiteJoseph M.
rev. of L. C. Rudolph, 512-514
- White Lotus Teachings association with Chris-
tianity, 581
- Wiestjean-Paul
"Bringing Christ to the Nations: Shifting Mod-
els of Mission Among Jesuits Uí China,"
654-690
rev. of D. H. Bays, 814-816
- WijnhovenJoseph, editor
NuntiatuBerichte aus Deutschland. Volume
VOjy.Nuntlus Pier Luigi Carafa (1631
fanuar-1 632 Dezember), rev, 107-108

GENERAL INDEX

- Wilken, Robert L.
 rev. of A. Brent, 294-295
- Williams, Caroline A.
 rev. of D. A. Brading, 810-811
- Wiliams, Daniel H.
 Ambrose of Milan and the End of the Arian-Nicene Conflicts, rev. 295-296
- Wimbush, Vincent L., and Richard Valantasis, editors
 Asceticism, rev.
- Wiseman, Nicholas Cardinal, 488
- Witek John W. S. J.
 rev. of J. Ruiz-de-Medina, S. J., 156-157
- Wolfe, Kenneth Baxter
 rev. of J. A. Coope, 306-307
- Wolfe, John
 essay on "Anglicanism" by, 115
 rev. of F. Knight, 484-485
- Wolkovich-Valkavicius, WiUiam
 inducted into the Order of Gediminas, 829
- Women and Popular Resistance to the Reforms of Henry VIII, 463-464
- Women and the Religious Life in Premodern Europe, 298-299
- Women's
 Devotion to the Patron Saint of Hopeless Causes, 526-528
 Lives in early Modern Europe, 820
 religious aspirations in medieval Europe, 770
- women under monasticism, 500-1500, 298-299
- "The World of Innocent III" international conference, 352
- Worth John E., translator and editor
 The Struggle for the Georgia Coast: An Eighteenth-Century Spanish Retrospective on Guale and Mocama, rev. 133-134
- Wyclif's followers' anticlericalism, 455
- Xavier, Francis, Saint
 rejection of collusion between European colonial expansion and conversion to Christianity, 660
- Yang, C. K.
 "diffuse religion" model of, 630
- Yoder, Howard
 can appropriation of an ideal past deny the value of history?, 131-132
- Yonke, Eric John
 rev. of W. Haider, 117-118
- Young, Percy M.
 Elgar, Newman and "The Dream of Gerontius": In the Tradition of English Catholicism, rev. 118-119
- Zäh, Helmut, and Silvia Strodel, editors
 P. Matthäus Rader S. J., Volume I: 1595-1612, rev. 345-346
- Zajac, WUam G.
 rev. of M. Barber, 779-780
- Zaleski, Alexander, Bishop of Lansing, 235-254
- Zanca, Kenneth J., editor
 American Catholics and Slavery: 1789-1866. An Anthology of Primary Documents, rev. 510-512
- Zaragoza
 Muslim taifa conquest of, 776
- Zebrero, Ausias Izquierdo
 play of Lucero de Nuestra Salvación, 537
- Zeenderjohn
 rev. of N. D. Cary, 494-495
- Zeitschrift für Schweizerische Kirchengeschichte
 articles in ninetieth volume of, 358-359
- Zhendan University in Shanghai, 654-655, 665-681. See also Aurore
- Zibawi, Mahmoud
 Eastern Christian Worlds, rev., 732-733
- Zielinski, Martin
 rev. of D. W. Southern, 525-526
- ZorUla, Alfonso
 published first treatise on preaching in Italy that broke with the medieval style, 2
- Zürcher, Erik
 comments on nature of conflict of Christianity with seventeenth-century Chinese culture, 57
 "Confucian and Christian Religion in Late Ming China," 614-653

The Catholic Historical Review

VOL. LXXXIII OCTOBER, 1997 NoA

CHRISTIANITY IN CHINA

Introduction

Thirty years ago, the study of the history of Christianity in China was still a peripheral field of mission history which was viewed from an overwhelmingly European perspective. The field was very marginal to the major concerns of China historians and Sinologists, and research was done mainly by religious scholars and lay mission historians. Chinese scholars contributed few works to the field, and these were little read outside of China. Mainstream China scholars tended to regard the history of Christianity in China as a fairly insignificant field, and this view was reinforced by the belief that Christianity had been largely destroyed by the antireligious movement of the Chinese Cultural Revolution (1966-1976). The experience of Christianity was viewed as a byproduct of European expansion and as a passing event in the great span of Chinese history.

The above views have now been revised. The Christian churches in mainland China were not exterminated in the Cultural Revolution. They suffered persecution and were driven underground in a manner that made them imperceptible to observers outside of China. After the Cultural Revolution ended, these churches began to re-emerge, although both Catholic and Protestant churches remain divided today into official and underground bodies. The re-emergence of these Christian churches as a vital and growing force in China has been important to the study of the history of Christianity there. It forces us to view that history within an ongoing chronological framework whose projected growth increases its significance in Chinese history. Numerous works published since 1968 have recast the history of Christianity in China into an increasingly mainstream concern of China historians.

In 1992 the Ricci Institute of the University of San Francisco sponsored a symposium on the Chinese Rites Controversy. Prominent mainstream China scholars, such as Professors Wm. Theodore de Bary of Columbia, Jonathan Spence of Yale, and Erik Zürcher of Leiden, participated in a program aimed at viewing this heretofore narrow topic of the Chinese rites in a broader light. These papers were eventually published as *The Chinese Rites Controversy: Its History and Meaning* ("Monumenta Sérica Monograph Series," Vol. 30 [Nettetal, Germany, 1994]).

One notable deficiency of the Rites Controversy Symposium was the small number of Chinese scholars who were able to take part. This deficiency was rectified by choosing Hong Kong as the site of another symposium devoted to the theme of the history of Christianity in China. This symposium was cosponsored by Baylor University, Hong Kong Baptist University, the Ricci Institute of the University of San Francisco, and the Henry Luce Foundation. It took place in Hong Kong on October 2-4, 1996, and its participants were evenly balanced between Chinese and non-Chinese scholars, between Catholics and Protestants, and between clerical and lay scholars. Papers were presented in either Chinese or English with simultaneous translation into the other language.

Because of the broad range of the topics and the editorial problems that would have been engendered by publishing the papers in Chinese and English, it was decided by the organizers that a symposium volume was not feasible. Nevertheless, the quality of the papers was so exceptional, that we endeavored to locate an eminent academic journal willing to publish a selection of the papers in English. We have been delighted that the editor of *The Catholic Historical Review* has been willing to publish three of the twenty papers presented. We hope that this sampling of papers will give the readers some understanding of the state and quality of current research and of the growing importance of this field in history.

The first paper is "New Trends in the Historiography of Christianity in China," by Reverend Professor Nicolas Standaert, S.J., a young Jesuit scholar at the Katholieke Universiteit Leuven (Belgium). He describes the major paradigm shift in recent years from a mainly missiological and Eurocentric to a Sinological and Sinocentric approach. In addition, Father Standaert contrasts the methodological approach of positivist history found in China and Europe with the interpretive, narrative history found in the United States. The second paper is "Confucian and

Christian Religiosity in Late Ming China" by Professor Zürcher of Leiden University (Netherlands), one of Europe's leading Sinologists. He argues that Christianity was in cultural conflict with seventeenth-century Chinese culture, because it was at odds with the role of personal religion in the life of the Confucian literati. He argues that the Jesuits introduced into Chinese literati culture a special type of "Mediterranean" religion whose ecclesiastical authority was completely alien to China.

The third paper, "Bringing Christ to the Nations: Shifting Models of Mission among Jesuits in China," is by Dr. Jean-Paul Wiest of the Center for Mission Research and Study at Maryknoll (New York). The famous pioneering Jesuit in China, Matteo Ricci, had forged a missionary model of accommodation which enabled indigenous peoples to express their faith within their own culture. Whereas Ricci found God in the Confucian classics, the early twentieth-century French Jesuits refused to adapt the Gospel to China. At Zhendan (Aurora) University of Shanghai they conducted classes in French rather than Chinese, because they believed that the civilizing power of French culture would draw the Chinese to Christ and rebuild China.

The Symposium papers and participants not included in this selection are as follows (with Chinese surnames given in capital letters): Daniel H. Bays (Lawrence, Kansas), "Chen Chonggui and the Evolution of Twentieth-Century Chinese Protestantism"; Timothy Brook (Toronto), "Religion for Confucians: The Buddhism of Dong Qichang, the Christianity of Xu Guangqi"; Claudia von Collani (Würzburg), "Kuan Stumpf and the Chinese Rites Controversy after 1710"; Ralph Covey (Denver), "The Chinese Message in China: Were Catholics and Protestants on the Same Page?"; LI Tiangang (Shanghai), "Buddhist or Confucian, the Cultural Difference in Lingnan and Jiangnan" (in Chinese); Edward J. Malatesta, SJ. (San Francisco), "An Historical-Theological Essay on China and the Jesuits"; Eugenio Menegon (Berkeley), "Surinam Tragedy. Religious and Political Martyrdom in the Yongzheng Period"; D. E. Mungello (Waco, Texas), "Christianity in the Capital of Shandong Province, ca. 1650-1725"; Peter NG Tze-ming (Hong Kong) and Philip LEUNG Yuen-sang (Hong Kong), "Perspectives on Paradoxes: Some Thoughts on Christian Higher Education in Modern China" (in Chinese); Lauren F. Pfister (Hong Kong), "The Way Is One, but its Expressions Are Many: Nineteenth-Century Protestant Influences on Ruist (Confucian) Spirituality in Guangzhou"; Paul A. Rule (Melbourne, Australia), "The History of Christianity in China in the Light of Theology of ReUgians"; R. G. Tiedemann (London), "The Changing Role of Christian

Missions in Shandong, China, 1860-1945"; Peter WANG Chen-main (Taiwan), "Keeping Balance between the Church and the State—the Efforts of David Yui in the Turbulent 1920s" (in Chinese); WANG Mei-xiu (Beijing), "John L. Nevius' System and the Churches in China" (in Chinese); XU Rulei (Nanjing), "The Contextualization of Chinese Christianity" (in Chinese); ZHANG Kai-yuan (Wuhan), "The Historical Fate of Chinese Church-Related Universities—Using the Papers of M. S. Bates as Documentary Evidence" (in Chinese); and ZHUO Xinping (Beijing), "The Figurists and the Acknowledgment of Similarities in Chinese and Western Cultures" (in Chinese). Commentary was provided by G. Bertuccioli (Rome), A. Camps, O.F.M. (Nijmegen, Netherlands), Jean Charbonnier, M.E.R (Paris), Wayne Flynt (Auburn, Alabama), Jane Kate Leonard (Akron, Ohio), K. C. Liu (Davis, California), Philip L. Wickeri (Nanjing and Hong Kong), John D. Youngt (Hong Kong), and Carver YU Tatsan (Hong Kong).

D. E. Mungeixo, Symposium Director
Baylor University

Edward J. Malatesta, SJ., Symposium Editorial Coordinator
Ricci Institute, University of San Francisco

NEW TRENDS IN THE HISTORIOGRAPHY OF CHRISTIANITY IN CHINA

Nicolas Standaert, S.J.*

In this article I will attempt to discern new trends in the historiography of Christianity in China. I will take the major paradigm shift achieved in recent years as a starting point. This shift was from a mainly missiological and Eurocentric to a Sinological and Sinocentric approach. By connecting this shift with the discussion around Orientalism, I will underscore the advantages of this shift, but also the possible limits. In a second part I will discuss some major methodological questions: positivist and textual history (China, Europe) versus interpretative and narrative history (United States). In addition, in a third programmatic section, new topics of research will be indicated. These topics are inspired by developments in the study of history in general. Finally, different interpretative schemes will be discussed: Was Christianity a type of cultural contact, a factor in the modernization, a marginal religion, a civilizing project, or an encounter with the other?

The purpose of this presentation is neither to give a synthesis of that has been achieved, nor to present an overall conclusion, but rather to stimulate a discussion about the way in which we study Christianity in China. In this article I will limit my examples mainly to the pre-eighteenth century. Most of the remarks, however, can be extended to post-eighteenth century as well.

1. Major Paradigm Shift

In the last twenty-five years an important paradigm shift took place in the study of Christianity in China. In general, this shift can be described

*Father Standaert is professor of Chinese Studies in the Catholic University of Leuven. He wishes to express his gratitude to Dr.A.Dudink,Dr.N.Golves,Dr.C.Jami,and Professor J. Tollebeek for their comments on an earlier version of this text.

as a change from a mainly missiological and Eurocentric to a Sinological and Sinocentric approach.

This shift was expressed by a change in methodology, in the nature of research subjects, and the background of the historians themselves. Until the beginning of the 1960s, the main question that occupied the attention of historians was the question of presentation: "What did the missionaries do to introduce and proclaim Christianity in China? How effective were the missionaries and what means did they use?" The historians were interested in the overall success of the missionaries, the ways by which they led the Chinese to Christianity, and the extent of the influence of Western science and art. Through the introduction of missiology as a theological discipline in the 1920s and 1930s, researchers wanted to know whether the Chinese experience was representative of a certain missiological approach (especially after World War II with the discussion around the terms "accommodation" and "adaptation"). Research focused on the activities of the missionaries. As a result, many studies of the famous missionaries Matteo Ricci, Adam Schall von Bell, and Ferdinand Verbiest were published. It is not surprising that each of these missionaries was studied primarily, but not exclusively, by fellow countrymen (e.g., respectively by P. M. d'Elia, A. Våth, H. Bosmans). Texts in Western languages (letters, travel-stories) formed the most important source of information. Chinese sources were not always neglected, but were rarely objects of a distinct study, unless they were texts written by missionaries. Interest in the reaction of the Chinese was mostly limited to their support of the missionaries. Chinese historians, such as Fang Hao, paid more attention to Chinese authors, and consequently to Chinese sources, but on the whole shared the same missiological approach.

Gradually some changes took place and a new perspective was added to this study. The new question that attracted the attention of historians was that of reception: "How did the Chinese accept Christianity or Western sciences? How did they react toward the missionaries?" Their attention was not limited to positive reception, but included the study of anti-Christian movements. Now the Chinese texts became the primary source of research. Some research continued to be missiological in nature, but followed the new perspective by shifting the focus of its interest to the local (indigenous) churches. Another major development was the background of the historians. Until the early seventies, a considerable number of them were members of a religious congregation and they were gradually replaced by lay people who were most often well trained in Chinese studies. The definitive breakthrough of

the Sinological approach to Christianity in China was the stimulating work of Jacques Gernet, *Chine et christianisme* (1982). The renaming of the China-Mission Studies (1550-1800) Bulletin (founded in 1979) as the Sino-Western Cultural Relations Journal in 1990 summarizes this paradigm shift well.

Since several scholars, such as Paul Rule and Erik Zürcher, have pointed out the characteristics of this shift in detail,¹ I will not describe it further. It should be stressed, however, that this shift is not unique to the field of Christianity in China. As Paul Cohen has shown with his concept of "China-centered history of China,"² the paradigm shift took place in Sinology at large and was preceded by similar shifts in the history of contact between cultures.³ Yet, I am of the opinion that the paradigm-shift also raises two new questions. The first question is one of hermeneutics (from which perspective do we study Christianity in China?); the second pertains to the research object itself (what are we finally studying?).

1.1. Hermeneutic Question

The question related to hermeneutics can be best approached from the discussion concerning the notion of "Orientalism." Although Edward Said focused on the Middle East to show how Orientalism was a "Western style for dominating, restructuring, and having authority over the Orient,"⁴ one could easily transpose his analysis to Chinese studies.

¹Cf. Paul Rule, "Chinese-Centered Mission History," in J. Heyndrickx (ed.), *Historiography of the Chinese Catholic Church* (Leuven, 1994), pp. 52-59; Erik Zürcher, "From Jesuit Studies to Western Learning," in *Europe Studies China: Papers from an International Conference on the History of European Sinology* (London, 1995), pp. 264-279; Nicolas Standaert, "Acculturation and Chinese-Christian Contacts in the Late Ming and Early Qing," *Ching Feng*, 34 (1991), 209-227; see also Daniel Bays "Preface" to D. H. Bays (ed.), *Christianity in China: From the Eighteenth Century to the Present* (Stanford, 1996).

²Paul A. Cohen, *Discovering History in China: American Historical Writing on the Recent Chinese Past* (New York, 1984).

³Well-known books on overseas history from the viewpoint of its victims are: Dee Alexander Brown, *Bury My Heart at Wounded Knee: An Indian History of the American West* (New York, 1970); Nathan Wachtel, *La vision des vaincus: Les indiens du Pérou devant la conquête espagnole (1530-1570)* (Paris, 1971); *The Vision of the Vanquished* (New York, 1977); Amin Maalouf, *Zes croisades vues par les arabes* (Paris, 1983); *The Crusades through Arab Eyes* (London, 1984); Serge Gruzinski, *La colonisation de l'imaginaire: Sociétés indigènes et occidentalisation dans la Mexique espagnol XVI-XVIII- siècle* (Paris, 1988).

⁴Edward W Said, *Orientalism: Western Conceptions of the Orient* (London, 1995 reprint with new Afterword), p. 3-

The early missionaries writing about China, the later missiologists analyzing these sources, and also the Sinologists had "a specific complicity with imperial power."⁵ The reason was that "The scientist, the scholar, the missionary, the trader, or the soldier was in, or thought about, the Orient because he could be there, or could think about it, with very little resistance on the Orient's part."⁶

One can find very concrete examples of Orientalism for the study of Christianity in China. M. Hue's work *Le christianisme en Chine, en Tartarie et au Thibet*, for instance, stands out as a work with such an explicit Orientalist approach. Christianity in China is seen as a primary concern for "la France catholique" which is linked directly to "la France politique."⁷ Moreover, the paradigm shift in the study of Christianity in China (or resistance against it) confirms also that scholars in the field became conscious of their Orientalist approach. It is no surprise that the paradigm shift occurred precisely at the moment of decolonization.

While agreeing with most of this analysis,⁸ I would also like to take into account some criticism of Said's possible one-sidedness.

Simon Leys, for instance, does not agree that the notion of an 'other' culture is of questionable use, as it seems to end inevitably in self-congratulation, or hostility and aggression. Leys says, "From the great Jesuit scholars of the sixteenth century down to the best sinologists of today, we can see that there was never a more powerful antidote to the

⁵ </p>
</div>
<div>
<p>⁶Ibid., p. 7.</p>
</div>
<div>
<p>⁷Evariste Regis Hue, <i>Le christianisme en Chine, en Tartarie et au Thibet</i> (4 vols.; Paris, 1857-1858). The preface (pp. vii-ix) links the expansion of Christianity to Western expansion as a result of inventions of steam and electricity. It also calls for France's role in the competition for the nations: "Il n'est peut-être pas inopportun d'appeler l'attention de la France sur la haute Asie. Il n'est pas trop tôt pour se préparer aux grands événements qui peuvent déjà se prévoir. Si la France veut conserver le rang qu'elle occupe dans le monde, elle doit examiner attentivement les symptômes de la crise asiatique, étudier ces populations lointaines, et rechercher la position qu'il lui conviendra de prendre, lorsque le moment d'agir sera venu. Il faut le dire, car nous sommes profondément convaincu qu'il y a pas de temps à perdre, d'autres nations [such as Great Britain] sont déjà préparées dès longtemps à exercer une influence considérable sur les affaires de l'extrême Orient." English translation: <i>Christianity in China, Tartary and Thibet</i> (New York, 1887).</p>
</div>
<div>
<p>⁸Besides the political and social framework in which Sinology developed, the biographical element in the history of European Sinology cannot be neglected. The preference of a scholar for one or another facet of Chinese culture is sometimes linked with the personal biography of the author. Cf. Herbert Franke, "In Search of China: Some General Remarks on the History of European Sinology," in <i>Europe Studies China</i>, pp. 17-18.</p>
</div>

temptation of Western ethnocentrism than the study of Chinese civilization."⁹

In her thought-provoking work *Occidentalism*, Chen Xiaomei continues in the same line of thought: "To simply dismiss the works of Pound, Kingston, Polo, Ricci, Waley and Snyder as expressions of Orientalism is to erase a better part of cross-cultural literary history and communication."¹⁰ In her view, it is more important to discover how these works, as well as their Chinese counterparts, have their roots in both Occidentalism and Orientalism.

Applying Chen's analysis to the seventeenth century, one could state that Ricci's *Diary*, for instance, is not only the result of a distant observer who merely reconstructs China entirely in terms of his own Christian Expedition. It is also the result of nearly thirty years of the interaction with Chinese who presented Chinese society and thought as they themselves wanted to present it. Similarly, Xu Guangqi's construction of the West is the result of both his own strategies for rebuilding the state and the information he got from the missionaries. Therefore, Xu Guangqi's texts can be labeled with Chen Xiaomei's term "Occidentalism," which is "the (Chinese) construction of the West." Chen points out that this discursive practice shares with Orientalism many ideological techniques and strategies." Therefore, the shift from Western sources to Chinese sources in the study of Christianity in China should be evaluated with an equally critical approach, since both types of discourses are subjected to power. One can agree with Chen Xiaomei's opinion that the binary oppositions Orient/Occident and Self/Other can therefore best be viewed as in a constant and continuing dialogue.

Such a critical approach of Chinese sources may well lead to a rediscovery of the importance of Western sources, for instance, so as to treat them in mutual complementarity. Western sources are ideal sources for the study of self-understanding and the understanding of the other.¹²

⁹Simon Leys, "Orientalism and Sinology," in *The Burning Forest* (London, 1988), p. 98 (originally in *Asia Studies Association of Australia Review*, April, 1994).

¹⁰Chen Xiaomei, *Occidentalism: A Theory of Counter-Discourse in Post-Mao China* (Oxford and New York, 1995), p. 100; for a discussion of "occidentalism" see also "Bianyuan—zhongxin—dongfang—xiang" [Periphery—Center—East—West], *Dushu*, 1 (1994), 146-152.

¹¹Chen Xiaomei, *op. cit.*, pp. 4-5.

¹²A good example of self-understanding is Ferdinand Verbiest's *Astronomia Europea*: Noel Golvers, *The Astronomia Europaea of Ferdinand Verbiest, SJ.*, (Dillingen, 1687): Text, Translation, Notes and Commentaries ("Monumenta Sérica Monograph Series," XXVIII [Nettetal, 1993]).

They had an important impact on the development of modern Western society as Asia in the Making of Europe" convincingly shows. Moreover, they contain information about Chinese political and social life that are not available in Chinese sources." For instance, in her fascinating book presenting eyewitness accounts of the turbulent period of the fall of the Ming and the conquest by the Manchus, Lynn Struve used both Chinese and Western sources. About the Western sources she writes: "His [=M. Martini 1614-1661] records, and those of other Europeans who visited China in the Ming-Qing era, provide us with alternatives to Chinese points of view and detailed, straightforward descriptions of many things that seldom, if ever, are mentioned in contemporary Chinese writings—such as what ordinary Manchu soldiers were like."¹⁵

In addition, what is true for the original sources is also true for the texts written by present-day historians. Paul Cohen had already pointed out that "the China-centered approach adopted by increasing numbers of American historians has the potential to degenerate into a new form of parochialism that, by underestimating the part taken by the West in nineteenth- and twentieth-century China, simply turns the old parochialism, with its overestimation of the West's role, inside out and takes us no closer to the truth about the Chinese past."¹⁶ Chen Xiaomei definitely takes an equally critical view toward the radical Sinocentric approach. She warns us that Sinocentrism can be "simply Eurocentrism turned upside-down." It can function merely as a reaction to Eurocentrism, not as a real alternative to it.¹⁷ In the end, the Sinocentric reconstruction of Christianity in China by a Western scholar can still be very Orientalist as well.¹⁸ This can also be applied to voices that plead that

¹⁵Donald F. Lach and Edwin J. Van Kley, *Asia in the Making of Europe*; Volume III: 14th Century of Advance, Book Four: East Asia (Chicago, 1993).

¹⁶A good example is the *Litterae Annuae 1625* which recounts the political troubles at Court and the persecutions by eunuch Wei Zhongxian. Because Chinese sources are extremely censored on these events, Western sources contain some unique information.

¹⁷Lynn A. Struve (ed. and trans.), *Voices from the Ming-Qing Cataclysm: China in Tigers' Paws* (New Haven, 1993), p. 49 (comment on the use of M. Martini's *De bello Tartarico* (English translation 1654); Struve's book is an excellent example of integration of both Western and Chinese sources.

¹⁸Cohen, *op. cit.*, p. 195.

¹⁷Chen Xiaomei, *op. cit.*, p. 11.

¹⁸Chen writes in this context: "One must candidly admit, though such admissions are seldom found in First World academic discourse, that there is always the danger of theoretically recolonizing the Third World with Western-invented and theoretically motivated languages of 'anti-colonialism' . . . Western theoreticians—especially those "Third-World-

Chinese history can be written only by native Chinese (excluding even overseas-Chinese).¹⁹ This approach can be very Occidentalist as well. Therefore, one should avoid an overly dualistic or essentialist approach to East and West.²⁰

1.2. Object of Research

The second point of discussion relates to the object of research: What do we want to study? The paradigm-shift is not univocal in this regard. For some, the shift consists in a move toward "reception" history while their main interest remains church history and missiology. For them the focus on the missionary strategy was replaced by an interest in the establishment of the local community. For others, such as Erik Zürcher, the shift consists in a radical move toward Sinology: "Sinology is concerned with (pre-modern) China. Whatever we are doing, Chinese culture (including the way Chinese traditional culture reacted to the intrusion of complex systems from abroad) should always be the primary focus of research."²¹ As a result, the arrival of Christianity in China is a means to know China better: "I believe that Chinese culture shows its features most clearly when it is confronted with something from outside. It is like people in conflict—when you are quarreling with your neighbor, you may say things and show things about your character that you otherwise never would. In the same way, the Chinese

born' critics residing in the West—who speak for the need of liberating the "Third World" from the West's economic and political power—need to be much more cautious in their claims, lest they unwittingly and unintentionally themselves become neocolonizers who exploit the cultural capital of the colonized in a process in which those voices are appropriated for reinvestment in those 'banks of the West' that currently offer the highest rate of return to speculators in trendy academic markets" (p. 17). These remarks also underline the place from which the authors conduct their research. In the past, some scholars writing about Christianity in China lived in China. Henri Bernard, S.J., is a typical example. Though his writings were influenced by a missiological questioning, they were also written against the background of the intellectual discussions in China in the 1930's. E.g., *Sagesse chinoise et philosophie chrétienne: Essai sur leurs relations historiques* (Tientsin, 1935); *Le Père Matthieu Ricci et la société de son temps* (Tientsin, 1937). The last work was translated into Chinese in 1942 and republished in 1993: Pei Huaxing, *Li Madou pingzhuan* (2 vols.; Beijing, 1993).

¹⁹See on this topic the discussion in *Ershiyi shiji* (Twenty-First Century), 32 (December, 1995): esp. Liu Dong, "Jingti renwei de 'Yangjingbin xuefeng'" (Watch out for Purposeful 'Pidgin Scholarship'), pp. 4-13; Gan Yang, "Shei shi zhongguo yanjiuzhong de 'women'?" (Who Are the 'We' in Chinese Studies?), pp. 21-25; see "Intellectuals: The Self and the Others," *China News Analysis*, No. 1556 (March 15, 1996).

²⁰Chen Xiaomei, *op. cit.*, p. 12.

²¹Zürcher, *op. cit.*, p. 275.

have shown certain characteristic features in their reactions to Buddhism and Christianity."²²

The shift toward Sinology, however, has in itself not solved all problems. The different versions of the title of Jacques Gernet's *Chine et christianisme*, the first truly Sinological approach to the subject, may well serve as an illustration. The aim of the book was not to study the history of Christianity in China, which has been the subject of many writings, but to study Chinese reactions to it. Therefore, Gernet had chosen the subtitle *Action et réaction*. The Italian version *Cina e cristianesimo: Azione e reazione* (1984) is identical to the French, while the Spanish version clearly underlines the reactive side: *Primeras reacciones chinas al cristianismo* (1989). The English title, however, puts stress on the "impact": *China and the Christian Impact: A Conflict of Cultures* and as such puts the work in a significantly different context from the original aim. As Cohen has pointed out, the impact-response approach had its heyday in American Sinology of the 1950s and 1960's. The German title *Christus kam bis nach China: Eine erste Begegnung und ihr Scheitern*, reinforces to a certain extent the impact model. By choosing the term "collision" (*chongzhuang*), one of the two Chinese versions sharpens the conflictual aspect of the encounter, while the other version stresses the comparative side: *Zhongguo wenhua yu jidujiao de chongzhuang* (Shenyang: Liaoning renmin chubanshe, 1989) and *Zhongguo yu jidujiao: Zhongguo he ouzhou wenhua zhi bijiao* (Shanghai: Guji chubanshe, 1991). For the second French printing (1991), Gernet has chosen a new subtitle: *La première confrontation* (The First Confrontation). This subtitle treats both sides as equal parties but also stresses the confrontational aspect.²³

This evolution is in itself significant in order to discover possible difficulties related to the Sinological approach. The concepts of action and reaction imply an assumption that it was the Western Christianity that played the truly active role, a much more passive or reactive part being taken by China. The concept of a "Chinese response" links Christianity too closely to an initial Western impact.²⁴

²²Wang Jiafeng and Li Guangzhen, *Dang xifang yujian dongfang: Guojia hanxue yu hanxuejia* (When West Meets East: International Sinology and Sinologists) (Taipei, 1991), pp. 135-137.

"Unfortunately, Gernet does not explain the change in the new preface.

²³Cohen, op. cit., pp. 9, 53. As a corrective to these distortions, Cohen proposed to think of Chinese history in the nineteenth century as being comprised of several distinct zones. (Cohen, op. cit., pp. 53-55). Similar zones could be found for the seventeenth century.

Following the logic of this reasoning, one could state that the real attempt would no longer be to write a history of Christianity, but a history of China in which Christianity figures. The point of departure, then, is not the foreign challenge but the native cultural setting. The historian portrays persons and movements as responding not just to Western Christianity but also to a vast and complex intellectual and social world with its own inner variety and competing currents of thought.²⁵ In fact, we have a successful example of such an approach in B. J. ter Haar's *The White Lotus Teachings in Chinese Religious History* (Leiden: EJ. Brill, 1992). In this study on the White Lotus, ter Haar shows that a clear distinction has to be drawn between positive autonyms and disparaging labels and stereotypes called "White Lotus." The term became a label after 1525, employed by outside observers and investigators, most of whom belonged to a network of eunuchs and officials, to castigate religiously suspect groups. As an illustration, ter Haar includes several sections on Christian persecutions. By sketching the whole socioreligious context of Late Ming religious persecutions, he convincingly shows that from the viewpoint of Chinese officials and literati, to associate Christianity with heresy such as the Non-Action Movement and the White Lotus Teachings was entirely justifiable.²⁶ At the same time, they used White Lotus clearly as a label, since Christianity had no connection with this Chinese religious movement. Ter Haar's case proves how the study of Christianity can be employed for a better understanding not only of Chinese society but also of the religious context in which it appeared and was interpreted. Moreover, by identifying Christianity with an indigenous movement like the White Lotus, the study shows that the Chinese response to Christianity was not always primarily a response to the West but rather a response to indigenous forces.

However, one could also go beyond a study of Christianity in China that is strictly limited to either missiology or Sinology. Since the history of Christianity in China remains an intercultural history of actions and reactions, it is imperative to discover the elaborate web of impacts and response—Chinese and Western in each instance.²⁷ Seen from a broader perspective, the detour by these approaches could reflect back on European studies or studies of global history. At European universities, for instance, research subjects like church history, Sinology, and Eu-

²⁵TWd., p. 156.

²⁶Ter Haar, *op. cit.*, p. 241.

²⁷Cf. Cohen, *op. cit.*, p. 55.

European history are distinctive fields that are academically speaking scarcely interrelated. It is my opinion that the methodological, cognitive, and other results of the study of Christianity in China should find their echo in these research fields. Pursuing Zürcher's argument about the quarrel with neighbors, one could easily argue that through their contact with Chinese, also Europeans (and other foreigners) showed characteristic features that they otherwise never had. Their encounter with China which had a highly developed and specialized intellectual life in the seventeenth century forced them to put themselves into question in a way different from the encounter with America or Africa. China made an "impact" on them, and they "responded" in a variety of ways. Therefore, the study of their reaction is significant for a better understanding of Europe as well.

Language exchange can well be taken as a wider metaphor for this exchange. The introduction of Western sciences and philosophy into China, accompanied by an effort to adapt to the Chinese language, produced quite a number of neologisms in Chinese, some of which are still used today.²⁸ It is often ignored that the reverse influence also happened. The encounter with China produced Latin neologisms or added a new meaning to common Latin words that were later adopted by other languages. The word "character" to indicate Chinese characters is but one example.³⁹ Taking this example as an analogy, one can state that the study of Christianity should lead to a better understanding of both Chinese and Western culture and of the interaction between them.

2. Methodology: Different Types of History

In this section I would like to discuss some methodological questions. When reading reviews of books related to Christianity in China, one can notice that the reviewer not only expresses an opinion emanating from his personal appreciation, but also from the academic tradition in which he completed his education. It seems to me that at

²⁸Cf. Federico Masini, "Aleni's Contribution to the Chinese Language," in Tiziana Lippello and Roman Malek, *Scholar from the West* ("Monumenta Sérica Monograph Series," XLII [Nettetal, 1997]), pp. 539-554; see also F. Masini, *The Formation of Modern Chinese Lexicon and its Evolution toward a National Language: The Period from 1840 to 1898* (Journal of Chinese Linguistics Monograph 6 [Berkeley California, 1993]).

²⁹Cf. Noel Golvers, "The Latin Treatises of F. Verbiest S.J. on European Astronomy in China: Some Linguistic Considerations," *Humanística Lovaniensia* (Journal of Neo-Latin Studies), XLTV (1995), 305-369.

present one can distinguish the following four main streams of research: history of events, textual (commentarial) tradition, problem-oriented and interpretative history, and narrative history. The former two are more practiced by Chinese and European scholars, the latter two by Northern American and Australian scholars. It is obvious that one cannot oppose these traditions too much and that they should not be treated in an essentialist way either.

2. 1. Chinese and European History of Events

In this century, Chinese and European historians communicated best at the level of history of events. This approach to history consists in a detailed description of historical events, the identification of dates, or the description of sources. On the Chinese side, this approach corresponds well to the many historical sources of the *biannian* tradition which arranges the historical events in a strictly chronological order. It is characteristic of the dynastic histories or the *nianpu* type of biographies. An equally important influence is the bibliographical enumeration of sources, as can be found in the *Yiwenzhi* section of the dynastic histories or the *difangzhi*. The works of Chen Yuan, Wang Zhongmin, Feng Chengjun, Yang Zhen'e, and Fang Hao are a representative of this approach.

On the European side, this approach to history resulted in a very important collection of historiographical aids (repertories, bibliographies, biographies, geographical sources) which strictly speaking are not historical writings but are still irreplaceable for research today: C. Sommervogel,³⁰ L. Pfister, H. Verhaeren, J. Dehergne,³¹ and the *Bibliotheca Missionum* are the clearest examples of this approach.

Thus, in its more radical form this approach consists only in writings of encyclopedic nature. More important is that these works produced a greater sense of the historical critical method which tries to relate a person or a text to the exact historical circumstances. It namely produced a "history of events" that consists in the exact description of historical events with only a minimal attempt at interpretation.

³⁰Carlos Sommervogel, *Bibliothèque des écrivains de la Compagnie de Jésus* (Paris, 1900-1932); it is a continuation of a work by the brothers Augustin and Aloys de Backer (7 vols.; Liège, 1853-1871); the second revised edition was published by Sommervogel, 1869-1876; the third, 1890-1900.

³¹Joseph Dehergne's *Répertoire des jésuites de Chine de 1522 à 1800* (Rome and Paris, 1973) was recently published in Chinese: Rong Zhenhua (J. Dehergne), Geng Sheng (trans.), *Zaihua yesuishi liezhuanji shumu bubian* [Supplement to the Biographies and Bibliographies of Jesuits in China] (2 vols.; Beijing, 1992), 101 | pp.

2.2. European Textual (Commentarial) Tradition

Another strength of Chinese and European scholarship in general is certainly the textual tradition. This consists in the edition and annotation of primary sources. This approach is close to the former tradition but concentrates on the text itself. Since many publications in the field of the history of Christianity in China of the beginning of the twentieth century are characterized by this approach, we arrange it under a separate section. It was typical of the historical materials published by the Jesuits since 1894 (*Monumenta Histórica Societatis Iesu*). il Pietro Tacchi Venturi, SJ's publication of the *Opere Storiche del P. Matteo Ricci SJ.* (Macerata, 1911-1913) 'was completely in the same line. The first *Sínica Franciscana* on the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries marked by a similar textual approach was published in Quaracchi in 1933- Pasquale d'EUa's *Fonti Ricciane* continued the same line of research to its summit. On the Chinese side one has the work by Xu Zongze and also the re-edition (though not critical edition) of ancient texts in different congshu. It would be easy to estabUsh the link between the edition of these texts and the studies that have been written after their pubUcation.

This textual approach was not limited to the study of Christianity in China. It was also present in European Sinology of the pre- and post-World War II period. It was distinguished by the so-caUed "commentarial tradition," the approach to Chinese civilization through critically annotated translations. At this level Sinologists had no problem in communicating with historians of Christianity. The book reviews by J. J. L. Duyvendak or P. PeUiot in scholarly periodicals like *T'oung Pao* are an exceUent Ulustration of this scholarly dialogue.

This commentarial tradition came under criticism from the 1960's untU recently. WhUe this methodology of learning has its merits, it may also result in a "'stamp coUectors' mentaUty, i.e., the tendency for scholars to preoccupy themselves with marginal or curious aspects of Chinese tradition." Another problem with the preference for commentarial tradition was that it "inhibited the study of China within a broader context utilizing social science methodology or making comparisons with other humanistic traditions."³³

'The modern historiographic activities of the Society started in Madrid, at the instigation of the newly elected General Luis Martin. Later on they moved to Rome, where the Historical Institute was established in its present form in 1931.

³³Cf. Harriet Zurndorfer, *China Bibliography: A Research Guide to Reference Works about China Past & Present* (Leiden, 1995), pp. 15, 40 n. 110.



2.3- Problem-oriented and Interpretative History

Another genre of historical writing is the problem-oriented analytical history. Characteristic of this history is also the collaboration with other disciplines: with geography, sociology, psychology, economics, anthropology, and so on. Moreover, it is not limited to analysis, but it tries to interpret. The purpose of this historical writing is not primarily a positive description of historical facts and events, nor a simple explication of their causal connection, but an interpretation of these events so that they can help us to understand the particular person, time, or text within a larger context. Interpretation tries to give sense and value to the events.

This type of history is to a large extent the result of what the French *École des Annales** has tried to realize and is now widely practiced by historians in other countries and continents. Within Sinology in general, however, interpretative history is much more practiced by scholars from North America than from Europe, where the "textual" approach is more dominant.

The reason for this difference might be found in the difference of organization of academic life. In Europe, Sinology has often been an isolated branch, most often merely integrated in a department of "Oriental Studies." In the United States, on the contrary, departments of Chinese studies can be relatively small, but Sinologists are present within departments of history, religion, philosophy, or anthropology. The European scholar was (is) in a day-to-day relationship with other scholars of Chinese studies who investigate an entirely different subject but who all apply the same textual method. The American scholar, on the contrary, was (is) in day-to-day relationship with other scholars of social sciences who have no text in common but who can question each other on the interpretation by establishing a comparison with other human sciences.

The difference of approach, which also continues to dominate classrooms in many European, Chinese, or American universities,³⁵ is also reflected in publications. An article from the event-bound or commentarial tradition will first present in abundance (dry) facts and (translated) texts and at the end draw a few conclusions from them. An article from the interpretative tradition will first present a (hypo)thesis or in-

³⁴Paul Ricoeur, *Temps et récit: 1. L'Intrigue et le récit historique* (Paris, 1983), esp. pp. 195-197; Reginald De Schryver, *Historiographie* (Leuven, 1994), pp. 373-374; Peter Burke, *The French Historical Revolution: The Annales School, 1929-1989* (Cambridge, 1990).

³⁵Cf. Zurndorfer, *op. cit.*, p. 43.

terpretative scheme and then present facts and texts that sustain or nuance the interpretation.

While these differences are very clear in Chinese studies at large, they are less obvious in the study of Christianity in China which, as far as the pre-eighteenth century is concerned, has been largely dominated by European and Chinese scholars. While I will make some suggestions for new interpretations in the next two sections, I here plead for an equilibrium between the two different streams of historical writing. The event-bound and textual tradition and interpretative tradition should complement each other.

The commentarial and textual approach may seem outdated to some, but it is -worthy of being reconsidered. "After all, why have the Chinese themselves written so many commentaries and exegetical notes on their classics if they were supposed to be easy to understand?"³⁶

A good example of this approach is Ad Dudink's recent Ph.D. dissertation. Dr. Dudink used the historical-critical method for his study of the Nanjing persecution (1616-1617).³⁷ It is an example of the results that a combined use of Chinese and Western sources may yield. It consists, among others, in a detailed comparison between the *Nangong shudu* [FUed Documents from the Ministry of Rites] (1620) and the *Poxie ji* [Collected Documents Refuting Heterodoxy] (1639) which shows that the editor of the latter had omitted some documents of the former. Dudink convincingly refutes the idea that was held until now that Buddhist opposition to Christianity was the main factor leading to the Nanjing persecution. He concludes that this persecution should be viewed as an attempt not to expel Christianity from China, but to bring it under control of the government and the official state orthodoxy, just as Buddhism and Taoism were. It is clear that one could probably not have arrived at these conclusions without the detailed comparisons of texts.

2.4. Narrative History (American)

Another evolution in historical writing, which originated mainly from the third and fourth generation of the *École des Annales* and those who worked in the same line, was the revival of interest in the narrative of events in the 1970's. This revival was accompanied by a re-discovery of the history of mentalities (*histoire des mentalités*) and the

Tranke, op. cit., p. 19-

³⁷Ad Dudink, "Christianity in China: Five Studies" (Ph.D. dissertation, Rijksuniversiteit Leiden, 1995), pp. 1-176; see also the excellent writings of Huang Yi-long of Tsing Hua University, Taiwan.

practice of historical anthropology. Another feature of narrative history is that history, which was often a confined academic genre, became accessible to a large public. The writings by scholars such as Georges Duby, Emmanuel Le Roy Ladurie, and Barbara Tuchman became very popular at that time.³⁸

In the Sinological world it was successfully practiced by Jonathan Spence under various forms. In *The Emperor of China: Self-portrait of K'ang-hsi* (New York: Vintage Books, 1975), Spence presents the varied historical material by constructing an autobiographical memoir out of K'ang-hsi's own words. In *The Memory Palace of Matteo Ricci* (New York, 1984) the narrative method seems to have reached a seemingly unsurpassable climax. In fact, compared with the earlier biographies of Ricci, Spence hardly provides any new information, but he presents it in a very original arrangement. Spence does not narrate Ricci's story in a conventional chronological sequence, but divides the chapters around four memory images taken from Ricci's mnemotechnical treatise *Xiguo jifa* and four religious pictures from a collection of Chinese calligraphy and graphics under the title of "The Ink Garden." He builds a "memory palace" of Ricci's life and makes "a composition of the place" (*compositio loci* from the Ignatian Spiritual Exercises) of the different places he lived. As such he applies the mnemotechnical theme of his book to his own writing. This method also has its limits, for instance because of the blurring chronological order.³⁹ As appears from *The Question of Hu*, it might also result in a historical writing that leaves little space for analysis.⁴⁰ But in itself it is certainly very innovative.

A nice combination of descriptive-analytical writing and narrativity can be found in D. E. Mungello's *The Forgotten Christians of Hangzhou* (Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 1994). The core of each chapter is composed of standard historical writing in which statements are traced to footnoted sources or the tentative nature of the material is indicated by cautionary phrasing. The preludes and postludes of each chapter, however, are imaginative reconstructions of the thoughts of three central figures in the work. Some of the reconstructions follow the historical documentation quite closely; others diverge in varying degrees.⁴¹

³⁸Cf. Ricoeur, *op. cit.*, pp. 195-197; De Schryver, *op. cit.*, pp. 373-374; Burke, *op. cit.*, pp. 66ff, 89ff.

³⁹Cf. De Schryver, *op. cit.*, p. 373-

⁴⁰See also criticism by Rule, *op. cit.*, pp. 54-55; Simon Leys, "Madness of the Wise: Ricci in China," in *The Burning Forest*, pp. 42-52.

⁴¹"Introduction," p. 9.

3. Topics

In this section I would like to make a programmatic sketch of possible research topics. These topics are mainly but not exclusively inspired by historical research emanating from so-called "new historians" of the French academic schools.⁴² This section will be less descriptive than the former sections. References will merely serve as illustrations. I am aware that the headings could be arranged in a different way since the subjects involved are not always as distinct as may appear from this categorization.

3-1. General Histories: *La longue durée*

One of the developments of the "new" history is the attempt to write "total" or "integral" histories instead of strictly event-bound histories (*l'histoire événementielle*). There are relatively few general histories of Christianity in China. Kenneth Scott Latourette's ⁴*History of Christian Missions in China* (London, 1929) is probably still the best attempt at an in-depth and coherent study of the Christian missions. The author stresses the fact that he endeavors to tell this story in the light of various factors "political, economic, intellectual, and religious." He is also very conscious of his own limits. "It is impossible for any writer of history entirely to free his account from the influence of his own interests and convictions." These limits shaped his partial approach to the subject. "For that reason the book has been purposely named *History of Christian Missions in China*, so stressing the part of the foreigner, rather than *History of the Christian Church in China*." It is to be hoped that a Chinese will sometime prepare a narrative from this larger angle.⁴³ One characteristic of the book is that it consistently integrates the different aspects of Christianity: Nestorian, Roman Catholic, Russian Orthodox, and Protestant Churches. The summary makes a comparison between the Roman Catholic and Protestant approach that still holds today.⁴⁴

⁴²For good descriptions of the historiographical developments in the last thirty years, see: Paul Ricoeur, *op. cit.*, pp. 171ff.; Reginal De Schryver, *op. cit.*, pp. 363ff.; the short descriptions that follow are based on these works.

«"Preface," pp. vii-viii; "Introduction," pp. 3-4.

⁴⁴At several places the author draws attention to the fact that Protestants were often more in accord with the established social structure of China than the Catholics (Protestants attempted to reach the group rather than the isolated individual; it was also less clerical and more adapted to the scholar class); cf. pp. 827-828.

In the last decade several new general histories have seen the light. The most innovative is probably Ralph R. CoveU, *Confucius, the Buddha, and Christ: A History of the Gospel in Chinese* (Maryknoll: Orbis, 1986). Strictly speaking it is not a book on Christian missions or on the Chinese church. "The focus is on the shape and nature of the message that has been preached in China—the gospel in Chinese." The purpose of the book is to analyze the more notable attempts through Chinese history to bring the Christian faith and Chinese culture together. Therefore, "it is an intellectual history, a history of Christian ideas in Chinese garb."⁴⁵ Bob Whyte's *Unfinished Encounter: China and Christianity* (Glasgow: Collins, 1988) shares with CoveU the fact that it is not a history of Christian missions in China, "but rather an attempt to trace the encounter of Christianity with the world's oldest living civilization." It looks at the history in the light of the contemporary situation of the Church in China. The book is designed to pass on the insights and interpretations of others and its primary concern is the story of Chinese Christianity after 1949.⁴⁶ Jean Charbonnier, *Histoire des chrétiens de Chine* (Paris: Desclée, 1992), from his side, attempts to refocus the attention not on Christianity as such, but on Christians, and not on the missionaries, but on the Chinese Christians to whom a "walk-on" role has often been attributed. Through many historical examples he puts them at the center of this history. Finally worth mentioning is the promising work of Samuel Hugh Moffett, *A History of Christianity in Asia: Volume I: Beginnings to 1500* (San Francisco: Harper, 1992). The hope of the author is "to restore global balance to the study of church history," namely, "to serve as a reminder that the church began in Asia." China appears here within the broader Asian context of Persia, India, or the Pax Mongolica.⁴⁷

Looking at these works from a historiographical perspective, one could conclude that they fall within the longue durée type of history of Christianity in China. Yet, they apparently fail to approach the history of Christianity in China in the same line of what Fernand Braudel meant by the term *longue durée*, which, contrary to the event, is not a temporal leap but the "social time" of which the major categories (conjuncture [short-term cycle], structure, tendency, cycle, growth, etc.) are borrowed from economics, demography, and sociology. Braudel pointed out that "after all, my problem is not a history, or a description of European expansion, but rather it is the outline of a general model which, transcending Europe, would possibly encompass the expansion

⁴⁵Cf. "Preface," pp. xiv-xv.

⁴⁶"Introduction," pp. 21-24.

⁴⁷Cf. "Introduction," pp. xiii-xv.

model as a whole.⁴⁸ In the same line, one could state that the real problem is not a descriptive and event-bound history of Christianity in China, but rather an outline of a general model encompassing the Christian expansion, but also the (Chinese) reaction to this type of expansion. Is it possible "to construct such a model, a sort of cage in which to lock up the word expansion [or reaction]"? In the history of Christianity in China were there conjunctures which, by correlation of different factors at a given moment, caused fundamental changes in the expansion? More importantly, are there also some structures, which like a relational architecture with a durable stability can explain how this expansion was realized in China?⁴⁹

A serious attempt in that direction was Zürcher's well-known article describing how the institutional and organizational differences between Buddhism and Christianity led to two entirely different ways of expansion (spontaneous versus guided).⁵⁰ Other themes need to be investigated: How to explain that Christianity seems to have been relatively successful in China in periods of political and economic disunity and weak in periods of political and economic unity? What is the relationship between China's characteristic of "ultra-stability" and its reaction to Christianity?⁵¹

Finally, these long-term questions cannot be separated from similar research on Europe. Recent studies have underscored the importance of studying the religious, cultural, socio-economic as well as the political realities to which the missionary belonged in his homeland.⁵² This background reality affected the way the missionary designed his missionary activities in China.

3-2. Regional Histories: Macroregions

The "general histories" are not the only works of the *longue durée* type. Two other types can be found: regional and congregational histories. The latter will be treated under the prosopographies.

⁴⁸Fernand Braudel, "The Expansion of Europe and the 'Longue durée,'" in H. L. Wesseling (ed.), *Expansion and Reaction* (Leiden, 1978), p. 20.

⁴⁹Cf. Ricoeur, *op. cit.*, pp. 184, 191.

⁵⁰E. Zürcher, "Bouddhisme et christianisme," in E. Zürcher, *Bouddhisme, christianisme et société chinoise* (Paris, 1990), pp. 11-42.

⁵¹The term "ultra-stability" (*cbaoowending xitong*) was mainly developed by Jin Guantao and Liu Qingfeng in their famous article "Lishi de chensi" (*Meditation on History*), in *Wenti yufangfaji* (*Questions and Methods*) (Shanghai, 1986), pp. 2-46.

⁵²E.g., Carine Dujardin, "Historiography and Christian Missions in China," in *Historiography of the Chinese Catholic Church*, ed. J. Heyndrickx (Leuven, 1994), pp. 92-93.

The regional approach to history is relatively new in Sinology and is, to a certain extent, atypical for Sinology because China lacked the "natural" subdivision of the space into countries which was the case of Europe. For China, it has been mainly developed since the study on "macroregions" by G. W. Skinner, who discerned eight units of economic integration and regional urbanization. Each macroregion, including parts of several provinces, had a "core" defined by heightened economic activity in major cities, high population density, and comparatively sophisticated transportation networks for the conveyance of food and merchandise. Each core was surrounded by a "periphery" of less populated and developed areas, which isolated the core of a given macroregion from the cores of its neighbors.⁵³

In fact, since the beginning of this century there has been a considerable interest in the history of Christianity "from the beginnings" in a certain province or region (not yet macroregion), which is illustrated by the impressive collection of books using this approach: Jiangnan (Colombel),⁵⁴ Huguang (Gubbels),⁵⁵ Guangxi, Guangdong, Guizhou, and Sichuan (Launay),⁵⁶ Beijing (A. Thomas and J. M. Planchet),⁵⁷ and Shanxi (Margiotti).⁵⁸ There are, of course, also the numerous articles on "géographie missionnaire" by J. Dehergne. An integrated history of these works has still to be written. S. Naquin and E. Rawski's *Chinese Society in the Eighteenth Century* (Yale: Yale University Press, 1987) could well serve as an example for such regional historical writing about Christianity. The book studies the eighteenth century from a thematic point of view (government policies, social relations, cultural life) but includes a lengthy chapter on the diversity of the Chinese according to ten regional societies.

33- Social Prosopography

Another thesis put forward by the new historians is that the object of history is not the "individual" but the "total social fact" in all its dimen-

"George William Skinner, "Regional Urbanisation in Nineteenth Century China," in *The City in Late Imperial China*, ed. G. W. Skinner (Stanford, 1977); idem, "Presidential Address: The Structure of Chinese History," *Journal of Asian Studies*, 44 (1985), 288.

⁵⁴A. M. Colombel, *Histoire de la Mission du Kiang-nan* (2 vols.; Shanghai, 1895-1905).

"Noël Gubbels, *Trois Siècles d'Apostolat: Histoire du Catholicisme du Hu-kwang depuis les origines 1587 jusqu'à 1870* (Wu-chang and Paris, 1934).

"Adrien Launay, *Histoire des Missions de Chine: Mission du Kouang-si* (Paris, 1903); *Kouy-Tcheou* (3 vols.; 1907-1908); *Kouang-tong* (1917); *Se-tch'ouan* (2 vols.; 1920).

⁵⁷A. Thomas (=J.M. Planchet), *Histoire de la Mission de Pékin: Depuis les origines jusqu'à l'arrivée des Lazaristes* (Paris, 1923).

⁵⁸E. Margiotti, *Il cattolicesimo nello Shansi dalle origini al 1738* (Rome, 1958).

sions: economic, political, social, cultural, and spiritual. Looking at the pre-eighteenth-century history of Christianity, one cannot but have the impression that it is largely a history of individuals. Many studies appeared on individual missionaries, and in recent years, many studies have appeared on individual Chinese. But the group approach is almost totally absent. This question can be treated from a synchronic and diachronic perspective.

On the synchronic level, Goodman and Crafton have pointed out that "prosopographies of the Jesuits' contacts, both with the Chinese and with the other Europeans working in similar intellectual areas, are needed."⁵⁹ Similarly, the different networks (guanxi-relationships) of the Chinese in relationship with Christianity could be reconstructed. These networks are composed of different axes (relationship on the basis of the same place of origin, success in jinshi examination, participation in same academy, opposition to Christianity, etc.). There are at least two reasons for this need of study of networks: firstly, if anthropological research points out the importance of the group and the guanxi in Chinese society, the network analysis would be a way to go further into the Chinese-centered approach of history. Secondly, it might well be that this research will lead to the conclusion that the transmission of ideas is not only an action by one individual or another individual, but that it is largely influenced by the network in which these individuals operate.⁶⁰

The diachronic approach to the question mainly pertains to the general histories of one religious congregation or order. While a number of missionary societies who went to China in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries have written their history in recent years, it is quite striking that we have hardly any in-depth studies of those who were in China from the seventeenth century. The only serious study is the five-volume work devoted to the Dominicans by José María González, *Historia de las misiones dominicanas de China (1600-1954)* (5

⁵⁹Howard L. Goodman and Anthony Grafton, "Ricci, the Chinese, and the Toolkits of Textualists," *Isis*, 82 (1991), 143.

⁶⁰Examples of networks are: Lin Jinshui, "Li Madou jiaoyou renwubiao," *Zhongwai guanxishi luncong* (Beijing, 1985), pp. 117-143; Lin Jinshui, "Airulüe yu Mingmo Fuzhou shehui'Haijiaoshi yanjiu (1992), pp. 56-66, 99; Huang Yi-long, "Kangxi chaoshi hanren shidafu dui liyu' de taidu jiqi suo yansheng de chuanshuo," *Hanxue yanjiu*, 11 (1993), 137-161.

vols., 1955-1967).⁶¹ Studies on the Franciscans, Missions Etrangères de Paris, Lazarists, or Jesuits are mostly limited to one period or do not present the same completeness as González' work.⁶² The lack of such a *longue durée* history, especially for the Franciscans, Missions Etrangères de Paris, and Jesuits, means that we tend to believe that their way of operating in the seventeenth or eighteenth century was basically the same as in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. Such a study could perhaps serve as a bridge. It will probably bring many differences into light, not only with regard to the strategies employed by these groups, but also to the relationships between them.

The diachronic approach concerns the evolution in the number of Chinese Christians as well. It is clear that in all these studies the statistical approach adopted from demographical sciences is necessary.⁶³ These quantitative approaches are another way to transcend the purely event-bound or narrative character of history.

3-4. Historical Anthropology or the History of the Common Person (Gender Studies, Histoire des Mentalités et des Moeurs, Histoire de l'Imaginaire)

One of the major developments initiated by the new historians is what is called "historical anthropology." Its central attention is directed to "popular culture" or "the history of the common person."

"Since the Dominicans operated mainly in Fujian province, this work is also a regional history of Fujian; see also: Fidel Villarroel, "Historiography of the Dominican Missions in China," in *Historiography of the Chinese Catholic Church*, ed. J. Heyndrickx, pp. 431-449.

This is true for the George Soulié de Morant, *L'épopée des jésuites français en Chine (1534-1928)* (Paris, 1928), which is nearly an apologia for Jesuit heroic actions, *real Gesta Dei per Francos* ("Liminaire," p. 5); it is also true for modern studies like Andrew Ross, *A Vision Betrayed: The Jesuits in Japan and China 1542-1742* (Edinburgh, 1994), or Jean-Pierre Duteil, *Le Mandat du Ciel: Le rôle des jésuites en Chine, de la mort de François-Xavier à la dissolution de la Compagnie de Jésus (1552-1774)* (Paris, 1994). Duteil uses several methods of French modern historical writing (his book contains a preface by Jean Delumeau): statistics, regional approach, women, ideas, etc. Unfortunately, it is nearly entirely based on sources of Romance languages and is not always very precise. A remarkable study, however, in which China figures only as one component is Dauril Alden, *The Making of an Enterprise: The Society of Jesus in Portugal, Its Empire, and Beyond, 1540-1750* (Stanford, 1996).

"E.g., Nicolas Standaert, "The Jesuit Presence in China (1580-1773): A Statistical Approach," *Sino-Western Cultural Relations Journal*, XIII (1991), 4-17.

History in general, and Chinese history in particular, has focused on the elite for a long time. The fact that most historical documents were written by the literate elite has contributed largely to this focus on gentry culture. We can find a similar stress in the study of Christianity in seventeenth- and eighteenth-century China. The fact that the general missionary policy of the Jesuits was one that aimed at a conversion "from the top down" has meant that on the one hand they tried to prove the results of their policy in their writings, and on the other hand that historians tried to check these results. Until now, nearly all attention has gone to the successes of the missionaries working at the court in Beijing, hardly any to the missionaries in the fields. Similarly, we are quite well informed about the famous converts like Xu Guangqi, Yang Tingyun, and Li Zhizao, but we know hardly anything about the women converts, poor converts, ordinary parish life, etc. A simple statistical analysis of the missionaries and their converts would easily show that many, if not the large majority of the missionaries were active among the middle and lower classes of Chinese society and that most converts originated from these layers.

Therefore, the study of Christianity might benefit from the studies of historical anthropology with its attention to the common person and to popular culture. Recently, research on the Fujian community,⁶⁴ with important sources like the *Kouduo richao* and *Lixiu yijian* has already contributed to a much better knowledge of these societies. The *Litterae annuae* are probably the best sources to be studied from that perspective. Similar studies should be continued. They will certainly throw a different light on Christianity in China. On the one hand, the different conversion methods applied to the elite and the masses will be viewed as less contradictory than one usually assumes. On the other hand, because the prejudice of a sharp distinction in reaction between the literate elite and an illiterate populace is given up, the whole configuration of the spread of a religious belief in Chinese society will be considered as being more complex.

Historical anthropology developed in different subsections which are thematically oriented and do not have "time" as their major category. I will indicate some of these fields which, in my view, could be fruitfully developed for the study of Christianity in China. I present only a brief description which may serve as a suggestion for research.

⁶⁴E.g., Erik Zürcher, "The Jesuit Mission in Fujian in Late Ming Times: Levels of Response," in E. B. Vermeer (ed), *Development and Decline in Fukien Province in the 17th and 18th Centuries* ("Sinica Leidensia," Vol. XXII [Leiden, 1990]), pp. 417-457.



Gender Studies:

Gender studies assume that gender is a constitutive element of social relationships based on perceived differences between sexes. This can be delineated into four elements: symbolic representations, normative concepts, social institutions, and subjective identity. Gender is also a primary way of signifying relationships of power. Here attention can be called to the integral links between gender and other formulations of equality and hierarchy⁶⁵

Because of the differences between the Western-Christian and the Chinese Confucian views on gender, this axis of intercultural analysis could well illuminate better the characteristics of both traditions. Such a study could investigate questions like: What vision on man-woman relationships did Christianity bring to China? How did the Chinese react to this vision? How did the missionaries interpret the Chinese practices? What was the place of Christianity in the history of sexuality (history of the body) in China?⁶⁶ A study on the portrait of Chinese women in the books and letters from missionaries from the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries would be a good attempt in this direction.⁶⁷

Histoire des Mentalités et des Moeurs:

The reference sciences for the history of mentalities are the sociology of knowledge, psychoanalysis, structural semantics, and rhetoric. Here attention is drawn to customs, social mores, local traditions, and manners. Moreover, the historian tries to draw the attitudes toward life, death, generation, and love from the written documents left by regions and ideologies. For instance, an in-depth study on the different attitudes toward concubines by missionaries and converts could well fit into this category.

⁶⁵This description is adapted from Dorothy Ko, *Teachers of the Inner Chambers: Women and Culture in Seventeenth-Century China* (Stanford, 1994), p. 5; this work may serve as a good reference for an intercultural study of the subject.

⁶⁶Cf. Frank Dikötter, *Sex, Culture and Modernity in China: Medical Science and the Construction of Sexual Identities in the Early Republican Period* (Honolulu, Hawaii, 1995).

⁶⁷A first attempt in that direction was the licentiate's thesis by Inge De Baerdemaeker, "De Chinese vrouw vanuit westers oogpunt in de 18e eeuw," (Catholic University of Leuven, 1992), see also Gail King, "Couplet's Biography of Madame Candida Xu (1607- 1680)" *Sino-Western Cultural Relations Journal*, XVIII (1996), 41-56; and Robert E. Entenmann, "Christian Virgins in Eighteenth-Century Sichuan," in D. Bays, op. cit., pp. 180-193.

Histoire de l'imaginaire:

The history of the imaginary is close to the former category. It concerns representations that surpass the limits of (scientific) experience. The classical example is Jean Delumeau's work on *La Peur en Occident*. The same question could be raised for Christianity in China: what were the causes for fear and dread and to what extent did Christianity cause or give relief to these dreads? What were the concepts of heaven, hell, descent to hell, good and evil spirits, exorcism, etc. How did Christian rituals bring order or provoke chaos?

3-5. History of Sciences

The history of Christianity has long been linked to the history of sciences. The study of sciences in China has been much influenced by the impressive work of Joseph Needham. *Science and Civilisation in China* aimed at according China the role it deserves in the history of science and technology. It also wanted, however, to respond to the question why modern science arose in Europe in the seventeenth century, while until 1600 China appeared to have had a considerable advantage over Europe.⁶⁸ His treatment of the introduction of Western science by the Jesuits was much influenced by this questioning. As a result, in line with a certain interpretation of Needham, attention has been focused by some (Chinese) historians of science on the "obsolete and antiquated" character of the sciences introduced by the Jesuits because they failed to introduce Copernicanism.⁶⁹

For several years now, this research has undergone some evolution. It has left the strictly comparative (and competitive) framework and focused on the transmission itself. The recent dissertation "Euclid in China" by Peter EngelfrietTM may serve as an illustration of this approach. It is concerned with the transfer of knowledge and thought from one culture to another and the reception of that knowledge within an existing framework. In this study of the first Chinese translation of Euclid's

⁶⁸Joseph Needham, "Astronomy: The Time of the Jesuits," in *Science and Civilisation in China*, Vol. 3 (Cambridge, 1959), pp. 437-461.

⁶⁹An important correction of this opinion is Hashimoto Keizo, Hsu Kuang-ch'i and *Astronomical Reform—The Process of the Chinese Acceptance of Western Astronomy 1629-1635* (Kansai, 1988).

⁷⁰Peter M. Engelfriet, "Euclid in China: A Survey of the Historical Background of the First Chinese Translation of Euclid's Elements (Jihe yuanben; Beijing, 1607), an Analysis of the Translation, and a Study of its Influence up to 1723" (Ph.D. dissertation, Rijksuniversiteit Leiden, 1996); for a discussion of Engelfriet's work by Jonathan D. Spence, *Chinese-Western Cultural Relations 1595-1995* (The Hague, 1995), pp. 15ff.



Elements (Jibe yuanben [Beijing, 1607]), Engelfriet shows that Chinese reactions to Euclid were far more complex than Needham seemed to believe. He comes to this conclusion by putting the background of the work in its broad historical context. For instance, he considers the place of mathematics in the Jesuit curriculum, availing himself of material that was not yet at Needham's disposition (such as the *Ratio Studiorum* [1599]). Moreover, in their complexity, the Chinese reactions offer Engelfriet the opportunity to bring to light several linguistic difficulties resulting from the translation.

Such detailed studies also contribute to attempts at a kind of overall evaluation and characterization of the impact of Western science. By equating detailed comparisons of texts, J. C. Martzloff, for instance, concludes that the Chinese distinguished between the purely scientific and practical aspects (such as calculations, trigonometry, logarithms) which were accepted, and the theological, logical, or demonstrative aspects (geometry) which were rejected by most Chinese authors.⁷¹

An excellent complement to Martzloff's study is the analysis of the relationship between neo-Confucianism and science in the Late Ming—Early Qing period by Zhang Yongtang. It is an analysis of the Chinese context viewed not from the perspective of history of science, but from the history of thought, especially studies on textual criticism. A number of case studies led Zhang to the conclusion that scientific investigations in the Late Ming and Early Qing period basically developed from the Cheng-Zhu theories on the investigation of things and had the correction of the Wang Yangming theories as their purpose.⁷²

These various studies lead to the main question of delineating a relationship between religion and science that was quite different in seventeenth century China from the post-Enlightenment twentieth century. This relationship needs to be further investigated so as to understand the particular nature of Christianity as a religion and the Chinese reaction to religion. The best way to treat this question is through

⁷¹Jean-Claude Martzloff, "Espace et temps dans les textes chinois d'astronomie et de technique mathématique astronomique aux XVII^e et XVIII^e siècles," in Catherine Jami and Hubert Delahaye (eds.), *L'Europe en Chine: Interactions scientifiques, religieuses et culturelles aux XVII^e et XVIII^e siècles* ("Mémoires de l'Institut des Hautes Études Chinoises," XXXIV [Paris, 1993]), pp. 217-230; also quoted by Engelfriet, p. 19; see also the comments by Jacques Gernet, "Espace-temps, science et religion dans la rencontre de la Chine avec l'Europe," in Jami and Delahaye, pp. 231-240.

⁷²Zhang Yongtang, *Mingmo Qingchu lixue yu kexue guanxi zailun* [New Discussion on the Relationship between Neo-Confucianism and Science in the Late Ming—Early Qing Period] (Taibei, 1994).

a multidisciplinary approach. A successful attempt in that direction was the Xu Guangqi conference organized by Catherine Jami in Paris in March, 1995. It brought together scholars from various disciplines (history of mathematics, astronomy, military defense, religion, philosophy agriculture, etc.) so as to approach Xu Guangqi as an integrated person. This meeting also confirmed the need to situate "sciences" within the broader context of social history.

3-6. Economic History and History of Material Culture

One of the innovations of historical writing in this century is the link established between historical writing and economics. As for the entire economic situation of Christianity in China, however, it is at present almost a completely undiscovered field. Questions that need to be investigated are: How were the missionaries financed? What kind of economic activities did they engage in? Who were the chief patrons of Christianity? How much support did it get from the gentry society? What contributions did Chinese Christians make to charitable associations? How were the property problems solved?⁷³

A recent study by Noel Golvers is promising. He discovered the account book of F. de Rougement, SJ. (Changzhou, 1674-1676). It includes the detailed list of expenses and income of Rougement when he was in Changzhou in 1674-1676. Not only does this text enable us to reconstruct the daily life of a missionary in the mission; it also contributes to a better understanding of the Early Qing economy.⁷⁴

A research theme closely related to economic history is the history of material culture. *La civilisation matérielle* (term used by Fernand Braudel) pays attention to material aspects of culture (way of living, food, means of travel, etc.). It has scarcely been studied in the case of the missionaries and converts. The material culture of Ming China in general is itself a relatively new field. We are helped by a recent study by Ad Dudink who analyzed the inventories of the Jesuit house at Nanjing,

⁷³Similar questions for Buddhism were treated by Timothy Brook in *Praying for Power: Buddhism and the Formation of Gentry Society in Late Ming* (Cambridge, Massachusetts, 1993). The first global study to my knowledge which addresses the complex question of money and missionary activities of the Society of Jesus is chapter 24, "Striking a Balance: For God or Mammon?" in Alden, *op. cit.*, pp. 614-650.

⁷⁴Noel Golvers, "The Account Book of F. de Rougement, SJ. (Ch'ang-chou, 1674-1676): A First Presentation." Paper presented at the International Conference on Christianity in China, Leuven, September, 1995.



made up during the persecution of 1616-1617 as included in Shen Que's *Nangong shudu* [Filed Documents from the Ministry of Rites] (1620). The inventories include a list of objects that the authorities returned to the missionaries and a list of objects that were confiscated, such as religious books and images. It is a rather unique document, because such detailed information about a house of the missionaries seems to be lacking in contemporary Western sources. Moreover, hardly any comparable sources about Late Ming material culture are available. This document gives a fairly good idea of the living standard of the missionaries, their capacity for receiving guests, and their library.⁷⁵

3-7. Other Types of Intellectual History: Textual History and History of Boundaries

There are different types of intellectual history that are still unexplored. A field that is still in its infancy in terms of research is that of the history of interpretation of texts. Research on *jingxue* studies for Late Ming and Early Qing have expanded in recent years. Howard Goodman and Anthony Grafton draw attention to the relationship between textual study and Christianity in their thought-provoking article "Ricci, the Chinese, and the Toolkits of Textualists."⁷⁶ It concentrates on the texture and detail of Western and Chinese textual scholarship as practiced by both Ricci and his hosts. The authors believe that such a two-pronged analysis should allow us to understand the intricate negotiations that preoccupied Jesuits on the one hand, and the Chinese literati on the other. This is important because the two cultures' humanist textual trends and methods headed toward one another at various moments, with occasional friction and occasional congruence.⁷⁷ They show convincingly that textual appropriation, tinkering, and accommodation constitute a fairly universal mode of cultural transfer.⁷⁸

The in-depth study of textual tools and methods in the Christian encounter with China is essential. But it is a step that has to be followed by the study of other materials for converting and convincing, such as images, etc.⁷⁹

⁷⁵Ad Dudink, op. cit., pp. 177-226.

⁷⁶Goodman and Grafton, "Ricci, the Chinese, and the Toolkits of Textualists", pp. 95-184.

⁷⁷Ibid., p. 96.

⁷⁸Ibid., p. 15.

⁷⁹Ibid., p. 143.

Another unexplored field of intellectual history is the history of boundaries. It draws its inspiration from Michel Foucault's *The Order of Things: An Archaeology of Knowledge*. Foucault's book starts with a quotation taken "from a certain Chinese encyclopedia" which he came across in a book by Jorge Luis Borges:

Animals are divided into: a) belonging to the Emperor, b) embalmed, c) tame, d) sucking pigs, e) sirens, f) fabulous, g) stray dogs, h) included in the present classification, i) frenzied, j) innumerable, k) drawn with a very fine camelhair brush, l) et cetera, m) having just broken the water pitcher, n) that from a long way off look like flies.⁸⁰

The taxonomy of this (mythic) encyclopedia appeared wondrous to these two authors precisely because its categories seemed meaningless. The puzzlement did not lie in the categories themselves, which are remarkably precise. Instead, it lies in our inability to perceive any purpose in the way the lists' inner boundaries are drawn. Indeed, categories collect similarities, but always a similarity defined by a difference. The difference is a boundary. 'Same as' and 'different from' are not symmetrical, and the topography is extremely complicated. The history of boundaries attempts to understand this complexity and to discuss the dynamics of culture in terms of physical structures like "boundaries."⁸¹

One way of conducting the history of boundaries is to investigate the classifications used by Chinese for Western categories. The lists of Christian books in *congshu* or in the *yiwenzhi* lists of libraries are an appropriate source for such investigation. The classical example is Li Zhizao's division of books in the categories of *li* and *qi* in his *Tianxue chuhan*. The same books were arranged under different sections in the *Siku quanshu zongmu* (such as *jingbu xiaoxuelei*; *zibu zajiale*).⁸² They still appear under other categories in private libraries (such as *zibu xiaoshuo*; *shibu waiyi*).^m A systematic study of these categorizations could indicate how Chinese catalogued the Western books.

⁸⁰Michel Foucault, *The Order of Things: An Archaeology of Knowledge* (London, 1970), p. xix; quoted in John Hay, "Introduction," in J. Hay (ed.), *Boundaries in China* (London, 1984), p.1.

^mHay, "Introduction," in J. Hay, op. cit., pp. 2-7.

⁸²Zhong Mingdan, "Siku quanshu zongmu duiyu 'Xixue' de pingjia," *Zhongwai guanxi shi xuehui tongxun*, 4 (1983), 4-11.

^WNicolas Standaert, "Note on the Spread of Jesuit Writings in Late Ming and Early Qing China," *China Mission Studies (1500-1800) Bulletin*, 1 (1985), 22-32. About the Chinese categorical system for books see Li Ruiliang, *Zhongguo mulu xueshi* (Taipei, 1993).

It would be particularly interesting to analyze the binary structure in different types of discourses. Recently, for instance, several studies have appeared on the notion of "time" and "space."⁸⁴ Similarly one would have to determine the applicability of the secular/sacred categories to China.⁸⁵ It will be equally important to establish the paradigms by which the parties involved defined themselves and described the other, or more precisely, how by defining the other they often defined themselves. Why did Chinese Christians, for instance, use terms like *wuru*, *tongzhi*, *jiao*, *xue*, etc., for *feUow*-Christians or Christianity? Why did the missionaries use terms such as *aspietà*, *secto*, *doutrina civil*, *Confucian*, *Buddhist*, etc., to describe the Chinese religious environment? Such an investigation would be especially important for the history of knowledge, because, as was recently clearly indicated by Joël Thoraval, the interpretation of religion in China is largely determined by the Western concepts that are used for it (and vice versa).⁸⁶ For instance, how did the missionaries describe and interpret the Chinese notion of *sanjiao heyi* (and its variations)? When was it first called "syncretism"?⁸⁷ Beyond the historic and strategic aspects involved in the Terms Controversy, the documents related to it have much material to offer in this field.

This investigation involves a re-examination of the operative hermeneutics. As Paul Rule has pointed out in this regard: "In historical perspective the deficiencies of the Jesuit interpretation of Confucianism are evident, but their bias was overt and their assumptions usually quite explicit. The assumptions of more recent scholars are often far less obvious, but they are not necessarily less biased."⁸⁸

⁸⁴See the papers in Jami and Delahaye (eds.), *op. cit.*; see also Erik Zürcher, "In the Beginning": 17th-Century Chinese Reactions to Christian Creationism," in Chun-chieh Huang and Erik Zürcher (eds.), *Time and Space in Chinese Culture* (Leiden, 1995), pp. 132-166.

⁸⁵Proposal made by Paul Rule in *K'ung-tzu or Confucius: The Jesuit Interpretation of Confucianism* (Sydney, 1986), p. 196.

⁸⁶Joël Thoraval, "Pourquoi les 'religions chinoises' ne peuvent-elles apparaître dans les statistiques?" *Perspectives chinoises*, 1 (March, 1992), 37-44.

⁸⁷Timothy Brook points out that Ricci did not use the term "syncretism," but the idea of Chinese religions as syncretic may be traced to his observations: "Rethinking Syncretism: The Unity of the Three Teachings and their Joint Worship in Late-Imperial China." *Journal of Chinese Religions*, 21 (Fall, 1993), 13-44.

⁸⁸Rule, *K'ung-tzu or Confucius*, p. 196.

4. Interpretative Schemes

In this final section I want to bring together some interpretative schemes for the history of Christianity in China. As mentioned earlier, these schemes do not try so much to explain history in terms of cause and effect, but rather try to give sense and value to the events. The different schemes often function as a frame through which these events are viewed. This frame might well condition the interpretation, but is in itself reframed through confrontation with the historical facts. The schemes are, of course, very much influenced by the methodological paradigm in which they function (including the positivist-textual or narrative-interpretative approach).

4.1. Christianity as a Type of Cultural Contact

Christianity in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries has often been interpreted as a unique type of cultural contact. There are several reasons for this uniqueness. The Jesuit experience in seventeenth-century China is considered "as a success in the sense that it stands out as a memorable episode in the 'world efforts at cultural accommodation; it has been one of the few serious alternatives to the otherwise brutal ethno-centrism of the European expansion over the earth."⁸⁹ Though the missionaries themselves remained exponents of European culture and ultimately dependent on material support from ecclesiastical institutions and from the colonial administration, due to the Ming and Qing administration they were largely separated from the trader and colonist and as such were able to establish a unique relationship with different layers of Chinese society. One other important reason for uniqueness is that it was to a large extent an encounter between equals. China and Europe were both societies that were culturally, economically, institutionally, intellectually, and materially highly developed. They were able to communicate at a level that, at least from the European perspective, was very different from encounter in other countries at that time. Finally, the contact was also unique because it had lasting influences on both societies.

This cultural contact has been studied from different perspectives. In the West most attention has been given to the transmission of ideas. Different terms are used for the strategies involved: accommodation, adaptation, acculturation, inculturation, assimilation, syncretism, encounter,

⁸⁹Charles E. Ronan and Bonnie B.C. Oh (eds.), *East Meets West: The Jesuits in China, 1582-1773* (Chicago, 1988), p. xxxiii.

etc.⁹⁰ These terms function on the borderline between cultural anthropology, missiology and religious studies, and have been widely used in the missiological interpretation of Ricci's experience." In addition, the case has been put in wider perspective by historians of European expansion or history of intercultural contacts. In his history of European expansion, for instance, the German historian Wolfgang Reinhard devotes an entire chapter to the "processes of acculturation" (Akkulturationsprozesse) that were involved in the Christian missions in China, Japan, and India.⁹² He considers them as alternatives to blind Eurocentrism and therefore they still deserve our special attention. Another German scholar, Urs Bitterli, also studied the different types of European contacts with non-Western peoples.⁹³ He distinguishes between "cultural contact" (an initial, short-lived, or intermittent encounter between a group of Europeans and members of a non-European culture), "colonization" (in which the weaker partner, in military and political terms, was threatened with the loss of cultural identity, while even its physical existence was jeopardized and sometimes annihilated altogether), and "cultural relationship" (a prolonged series of reciprocal contacts on the basis of political equilibrium or stalemate). Under the last category seventeenth-century China is described.

Chinese scholars have given their own accent to the interpretation of the cultural contact. The relationship between Confucianism and Christianity has received particular attention. The relationship was organized in different types: *heru* (harmonizing with Confucianism), *buru* (complementing Confucianism), *chaoru* (surpassing Confucianism).⁹⁴ From

⁹⁰ See, e.g., Rule, *K'ung-tzu or Confucius*, pp. 56-57.

⁹¹ For a good overview of nine different interpretations see C. Spalatin, *Matteo Ricci's Use of Epictetus* (Waegwan, 1975), p. 85 n. 106.

⁹² Wolfgang Reinhard, "Akkulturationsprozesse und Missionsstrategien in Asien," in *Geschichte der europäischen Expansion: Band 1: Die Alte Welt bis 1818* (Stuttgart, 1983), pp. 184-195.

⁹³ Urs Bitterli, *Cultures in Conflict: Encounters between European and Non-European Cultures, 1492-1800* (Oxford, 1989), pp. 20-51.

⁹⁴ See, e.g., the chapter "Mingmo tianzhujiao shuru shenmo 'xixue'? Juyou shenmolishi yiyi?" [What Kind of 'Western Learning' Did Catholicism Introduce at the End of the Ming? What is its Historical Significance?] (written by He Zhaowu), in Hou Wailu (ed.), *Zhongguo sixiang tongshi* [Comprehensive History of Chinese Thought], LVb (Beijing, 1980 repr.), pp. 1189-1290; see also for a modern interpretation in the same line: Chen Weiping, *Diyiye yu peitai: MingQing zhiji de zhongxi wenhua jiaoliu* [The First Page and Embryo: A Comparison Between Eastern and Western Culture in the Transition Period of Ming and Qing] (Shanghai, 1992).

a broader perspective, comparisons between Chinese reception of Buddhism and Christianity are relatively rare. Most focus is put on a comparison between the seventeenth-eighteenth and the nineteenth-twentieth centuries, especially concerning the various opinions of Chinese intellectuals ranging from ti-yong traditionalism to complete assimilation. The question whether the missionaries in the seventeenth century were the "vanguard of colonialism" or not has become less important since the 1980's.⁹⁵

It should be underlined that these interpretative schemes are not limited to the impact-response approach. Christianity in China functions more like a case to be understood in a broader theory of cultural interaction.

4.2. Christianity as a Factor in the Modernization of China

The interpretation of Christianity as a possible factor in the modernization of China finds its origin in a broader scholarly world (already in the 1920's with a scholar such as Liang Qichao; strong revival of this debate in the 1950's and 1960's) which assumed that Chinese society was immune to fundamental change from within and could therefore be transformed only as a result of an intrusion by a foreign body. The traditional unchanging China is here confronted with the modern dynamic West. Since science was introduced by missionaries in the seventeenth century, Christianity also enters this discussion of modernity.

A typical example of this approach is Joseph Levenson's work on Confucian China's modern fate. In a section on "Confucianism, Christianity, and Chinese selectivity," Levenson asks two questions: Why did Christianity fail to infiltrate a living Confucianism? And once Chinese intellectuals had begun to reject their own heritage and advocate westernization, why did not Christianity succeed a dying Confucianism? Unlike many authors, Levenson does not seek the explanation in the inadequacies of missionary methods. He finds his answer in what he con-

⁹⁵Lin Jinshui was one of the first to state that Matteo Ricci and the other Jesuits cannot be regarded in the same light as the missionaries in China after the Opium War. Not all missionaries who came to China were "elements of cultural invasion" or the "vanguard of colonialism": Lin Jinshui, "Li Madou zai zhongguo de huodong yu yingxiang" [Matteo Ricci's Activities and Influence in China], *Lishi yanjiu* (1983), pp. 25-36; in the English translation of this article (*Social Sciences in China* [1983], pp. 169-185) the negation of the second sentence (Not all missionaries) was left out; this was corrected in a reprint of the article in F. Verbiest Foundation (ed.), *China & Europe Yearbook 86* (Leuven, 1986), pp. 140-156.



siders the inherent paradox of exporting a foreign religion and in the psychological needs of the Chinese themselves. For Levenson, "the whole story of the growth of iconoclasm in modern China, of how it came to be possible for Chinese minds to drift away from historical Chinese values, is implied in the modern history of the Christian Church in China."

The role Christianity played, however, in the modernization of China underwent an important evolution: "In the seventeenth century, Chinese opposed Christianity as un-traditional. In the twentieth-century China, especially after World War I, the principal anti-Christian cry was that Christianity was unmodern. In the early instance, then, Christianity was criticized for not being Confucian; this was a criticism proper to Chinese civilization. In the later instance, Christianity was criticized for not being scientific; and this was a criticism from Western civilization."

In the eyes of Levenson, the changing character of Chinese opposition to Christianity reflected the progressive disintegration of traditional Chinese civilization. "But it did more than indicate the fact of disintegration; it exemplified the process. After an unimpressive beginning in the early modern period, Christianity assumed a great and important role in Chinese history—important, but vicarious. Chinese came to require it, not as something to be believed in, but as something to be rejected. Modern Christian missionaries have made outstanding contributions to the westernization of China, but in this, their secular, secondary success, their religious cause was lost, at least for a time, at least as long as waning traditions survive enough to be regretted. For men do not change their intellectual commitments easily. When Chinese traditionalism crumbles into iconoclasm, it costs the Chinese dear; and he prefers, as far as possible, to pay in a foreign coin."

In the same context Levenson writes that "for the Chinese to live, without too bitter an emotional chill, in a gathering coolness to their own Confucian heritage, they had to meet with unaltered coolness the Christian invitation." In summary, Christianity, in Levenson's opinion, made it possible for science and then industrialism, as "modern" civilization, not as "western," to supersede Confucian China.⁹⁶

"Joseph R. Levenson, *Confucian China and Its Modern Fate: The Problem of Intellectual Continuity* (Berkeley, California, 1958), pp. 117-125; also reprinted in Jessie G. Lutz, *Christian Missions in China: Evangelists of What?* (Boston, 1965), pp. 90-95; the main part of the text appeared earlier under the title "Western Religion and the Decay of Traditional China; The Intrusion of History on Judgments of Value," *Sinologica*, TV (1956), 14-20.

Though Needham's interpretation is the result of a different approach, he also focuses on the "modern" aspect of Western sciences: "It is vital today that the world should recognise that 17th-century Europe did not give rise to essentially 'European' or 'western' science, but to universal world science, that is to say, 'modern' science as opposed to the ancient and medieval sciences." It was the mathematization of hypotheses that led to a universal language, a universal medium of exchange. Needham further establishes the post-Enlightenment distinction between religion and sciences. For the Jesuits to seek to accomplish their religious mission by bringing to China the best of Renaissance science was a highly enlightened way of proceeding; yet this science was for them only a means to an end. What mattered for them just as much was that it had originated in Christendom. The implicit logic was that only Christendom could have produced it. Needham concludes: "The Chinese were acute enough to see through this from the very beginning. The Jesuits might insist that Renaissance natural science was primarily 'Western,' but the Chinese understood clearly that it was primarily 'new.'"⁹⁷ As can be observed, Needham in the end makes science ultimately independent from civilization, so as to make the modern aspect acceptable.

As pointed out earlier, Chinese scholars have also joined the debate to prove whether or not Christianity contributed to the modernization of China. One of the key-points was the identification of Catholicism and especially of the Jesuits in the historical materialistic time-frame. The schematical division between Catholicism = Old Learning (fujiao) = Feudal Middle Ages, and Protestantism = New Learning (xinjiao) = Renaissance has been commonly adopted.⁹⁸ Since the translation of Weber into Chinese in the 1980s, the theme of identification of Catholicism with feudalism and other-worldliness and Protestantism with capitalism and this-worldliness has been reinforced.⁹⁹ These frames impose some limits on the modern aspect of the Christian enterprise in China, and often make a clear distinction between on the one hand the "scientific" and on the other hand "religious" interest or the contribution of a certain individual or movement.

⁹⁷Needham, *op. cit.*, pp. 448-449.

⁹⁸Chen Weiping, *op. cit.*, p. 47.

⁹⁹See also Sun Shangyang, *Mingmo tianzhujiao yu ruxue dejiaoliu he chongtu* [Exchange and Conflict Between Catholicism and Confucianism in the Late Ming Period] (Taipei, 1992), pp. 128-129 (mainland version: *fujiao yu mingmo ruxue* [Beijing, 1994]).

A major problem with this type of interpretation is that, more than the others, it is dependent on a retrospective reading of this history. One could consider the missionaries as "forerunners of modernity" but the seventeenth-century actors certainly did not view the Jesuits as vanguards of something greater to come.

Moreover, all these interpretations have as a basic assumption a stable and only slowly changing China that only experienced some change within tradition but that had to wait for the West (including Christianity) to undergo transformation. A quite different approach that moves beyond tradition and modernity tries to discover the internal dynamism of Chinese society. It is based on a theory of cultural exchange that states that an external element is accepted only if it joins an internal movement of a specific culture. As a result, researchers should not primarily focus on the means employed by the foreign element to impose its ideas, but rather on the prior internal dynamism of a culture that made the reception possible. An example of this approach is the writings by Monika Übelhör, which, unfortunately, have not received the attention they deserve.¹⁰⁰ They have the advantage of linking the scientific and religious sides of a person. New studies on the process of conversion confirm the attention that has to be paid to the internal dynamism, the context, the personal or cultural crisis, and the quest prior to the encounter that prompts change.¹⁰¹

4.3. Christianity as a Marginal Religion

A different type of interpretation is to look at the place of Christianity as a religion in Chinese society. A fundamental contribution in this field has been made by C. K. Yang with his notions of diffused and institutional religion. Though he does not treat Christianity extensively, he certainly points out the many limitations of its organized position as an institutional religion in the structural framework of traditional Chinese society (such as limitations on the social functions of the priesthood, lack of participation in community charity, lack of participation in secular education, lack of organized authority over morality). In addition, Yang related the long tradition of persecution of heterodoxy to the power structure and the ethical order of the State. The entire system of adminis-

¹⁰⁰M. Übelhör, "Hsü Kuang-ch'i und seine Einstellung zum Christentum," *Oriens Extremus*, 15 (1968), 191-257 (I); 16 (1969), 41-74 (II); "Geistesströmungen der späten Ming-Zeit die das Werken der Jesuiten in China begünstigten," *Saeculum*, 23 (1972), 172-185.

¹⁰¹Lewis R. Rambo, *Understanding Religious Conversion* (New Haven, 1993).

trative control over religion in traditional China was based on the general purpose of guarding the interest of the ruling power and the State against possible subversive influence of heterodoxy.¹⁰² Christianity in seventeenth-century China was subjected to this system.

Recently Erik Zürcher, who is influenced by C. K. Yang's interpretation, has classified Christianity as a "marginal religion." The notion of marginality appeared in an article on Aleni's relationship with the literati. Zürcher observes that from a Chinese perspective, seventeenth-century Christianity contained two orientations that were mutually incompatible. On the one hand, Christianity attempted to associate itself with Confucianism, -which -was a rather rational doctrine, -without a concept of a personal God, without precise ideas of afterlife, retribution, without priests or miracles. On the other hand, it was forced, by its own nature, to proclaim a doctrine full of "mysteries of faith," fundamentally irrational, focused around a personal Master of Heaven, who was a supreme Judge, punishing and rewarding, and intervening directly in history. It was composed of very precise and detailed ideas on the nature of the soul, afterlife. It was a doctrine full of miracles and events of supernatural order and was propagated by persons who, despite their efforts to identify themselves with the class of literati, could never dissociate themselves from their religious profession. In fact, Zürcher is of the opinion that it is this internal contradiction, rather than the external circumstances such as the hostility of certain officials or the rites controversy, which prevented Christianity from becoming more than a "marginal" phenomenon in pre-modern China.¹⁰³

In a more recent article, Zürcher has treated the question from another perspective. Again he attempts to approach the main issues of Christianity as a constitutive part of a special phenomenon in late imperial Chinese culture. He examines the way in which sinicized marginal religions of foreign origin adapted themselves to the central ideology of Confucianism. The two central concepts proposed by Zürcher are "marginal religion" and "cultural imperative."¹⁰⁴ Marginal re-

¹⁰²C. K. Yang, *Religion in Chinese Society* (Berkeley, California, 1967), pp. 167ff.; pp. 329ff.

¹⁰³E. Zürcher, "Giulio Aleni et ses relations dans le milieu des lettrés chinois au XVII^e siècle," in L. Lanciotti (ed.), *Venezia e l'Oriente* (Florence, 1987), p. 135; Chinese translation: "Wenhua chuanbozhong de xingbian," *Ershiyi shiji*, 9 (1992), 114.

¹⁰⁴These ideas are developed in E. Zürcher, "Jesuit Accommodation and the Chinese Cultural Imperative," in David E. Mungello (ed.), *The Chinese Rites Controversy: Its History and Meaning* ("Monumenta Sérica Monograph Series," XXXIII [Nettetal, 1994]), pp. 31-64.

ligions, such as Judaism, Christianity, Islam, and in an earlier period Buddhism shared the patterns of adaptation intrinsic to the same "deep structure in Chinese religious life" in late imperial China: congruity, complementarity, historical precedent, reductionism. In the same way as other foreign religions, Jesuits were faced with a "cultural imperative": "no marginal religion penetrating from the outside could expect to take root in China (at least at that social level) unless it conformed to the pattern that in late imperial times was more clearly defined than ever. Confucianism represented what is zheng, "orthodox," in a religious, ritual, social, and political sense; in order not to be branded as xie, "heterodox," and to be treated as a subversive sect, a marginal religion had to prove that it was on the side of zheng. On the basis of writings of Chinese converts, Zürcher shows how they interpreted the message in their own way and how they appear occasionally to have gone farther than their Jesuit teachers would ever go.

From a different perspective and using different words, Chinese scholars also point to the role reserved for Christianity as a minority. After a short overview of the development of Christian theology, Tang Yi from the Institute of World Religions at the Chinese Academy of Social Sciences, comes to the conclusion that "The comparison of Christianity in its mainstream version and Chinese culture in terms of contrasting outlooks on history would make it easier to account for the fact that, starting with Matteo Ricci, after so many generations of competent and creative endeavours, no real Chinese theology on the same level as Chinese Buddhism has ever resulted." In addition he sees three different ways for Christianity to develop in China. Referring to the past, it seems unlikely to him that the Christian faith may eventually conquer China and Christianize Chinese culture (first possibility) or that Christianity may eventually be absorbed by Chinese culture, following the example of Buddhism (second possibility). "The third way is for Christianity to retain its basic Western characteristics and settle down to be a sub-cultural minority religion in China. In the end the public will get more used to it and accept its religious ideals, including its prophetic message, as a complement to and ornament of the Chinese civilization without any fear of jeopardising the mainstream culture. This is, for all practical purposes, the most likely solution to be reached."¹⁰⁶

¹⁰⁶Zürcher, "Jesuit Accommodation ..." pp. 40-41; this analysis is completely in line with C. K. Yang.

¹⁰⁷Tang Yi, "Chinese Christianity in Development," *China Study Journal*, 1 (1991), 7-8.

4.4. Christianity as a Civilizing Project¹¹

A quite different angle from which to interpret the encounter between China and Christianity is to consider it as an encounter of at least two civilizing projects. In his work on the "Chineseness of China," Wang Gungwu has already pointed out the "Chinese Urge to Civilize."¹⁰⁸ The term "civilizing project" is to be found in a collection of articles on China's relations with the surrounding neighbors.

Stevan Harrell defines the concept as follows:

A civilizing project is a kind of interaction between peoples, in which one group, the civilizing center, interacts with other groups (the peripheral peoples) in terms of a particular kind of inequality. In this interaction, the inequality between the civilizing center and the peripheral peoples has its ideological basis in the center's claim to a superior degree of civilization, along with a commitment to raise the peripheral peoples' civilization to the level of the center, or at least closer to that level. The civilizing center draws its ideological rationale from the belief that the process of domination is one of helping the dominated to attain or at least approach the superior cultural, religious, and moral qualities characteristic of the center itself.

Focusing on the modern period, Harrell distinguishes three different civilizing projects in China: Confucian, Christian, and Communist. Each of these projects has its own characteristics in terms of location of the civilizing center (China; West; China and Moscow), the defining features of civilization (Humanist/moral; Divine/moral; Humanist/scientific), the differentiation of groups (Culture; Race; Political economy), etc.

Though Harrell uses this frame for the study of the peripheral peoples in the modern period, it could also be applied to the encounter between Christianity and China in the Late Ming and Early Qing period. Christianity certainly started out as a "civilizing project," and it was directed at transforming the Han. In parallel, one can also discern a civilizing

¹⁰⁷Stevan Harrell, "Introduction: Civilizing Projects and the Reaction to Them," in Stevan Harrell (ed.), *Cultural Encounters on China's Ethnic Frontiers* (Seattle, Washington, 1995), pp. 3-36. I would like to express gratitude to P. Taveirne for pointing out this article.

¹¹Wang Gungwu, "The Chinese Urge to Civilize: Reflections on Change," in Wang Gungwu, *The Chineseness of China: Selected Essays* (Hong Kong, 1991), pp. 145-164.

Using project on the Confucian side at that time. Besides larger movements, such as the Donglin in the Late Ming or the kaozheng in the Early Qing, there was a general "urge to civilize" (hud) the other, especially the foreigner. As a result, there existed competition between the Confucian and Christian civilizing projects. On the one hand, both sides met with a "barbarian" who was different from the barbarians they were used to meeting. Both sides presented themselves as having a highly developed culture (Literary, scientific, or bureaucratic). On the other hand, they kept also their feeling of superiority to the other. They were each other's mutual civilizers and civilizees.

One can observe that their encounter developed the same characteristic reactions as peripheral peoples to civilizing projects. Indeed, when persons are confronted with a center that attempts to define and educate them, they are forced to come to terms with who they are and with how they are different from those who are attempting to civilize them. So quite naturally they rethink their own position and their own nature, and in most cases, they seem to come up with a self-definition that is ethnic (in the terms outlined above). If developing an ethnic consciousness is an almost inevitable result of becoming the object of a civilizing project, then this development has two aspects: the development of consciousness of belonging to a group, and the development of consciousness of being different from other groups.

4.5. Conclusion: Christianity and China as Other

These four interpretative schemes try to give sense to the encounter between Christianity and China. Despite their value, they should not conceal the fact that this encounter and its influence are but a minor thread in the whole tapestry of Chinese history. As a conclusion I would like to suggest that the paradigm of the "other" (and therefore also of the "self") can be taken as a basis for an additional interpretative scheme for the history of Christianity in China.

In the last two decades, French philosophy has been involved in a particular way with the question of "the other" (l'altérité). This involvement had also its impact on historical writing. Tzvetan Todorov's history of the conquest of America is a nice example of examining intercultural contact from the angle of the other.

Todorov establishes a "typology of the relations to the other." In his eyes there are three axes from which the question of otherness can be

treated.¹⁰⁹ Firstly, there is the value judgment (an axiological level): the other is good or bad, I like him or I do not like him, he is my equal or my inferior. Secondly, there is the rapprochement and removal from the other (the praxeological level): I adopt his values, I identify myself with him, or I assimilate the other to myself, I impose my own image on him; between submission to the other and submission of the other there is also the option of neutrality or indifference. Thirdly, I know or ignore the identity of the other (the epistemológica! level): here is no absolute but an infinite gradation between lesser and greater states of knowledge. There are relations between these three levels but no strict implication: one cannot reduce one to another, nor deduce one from the other. One can, for instance, know a culture less but like it more. These are also the three dimensions around which Todorov constructed his book: conquering, loving, and knowing (*conquérir, aimer et connaître*).

The axes used by Todorov could be taken as an interpretative frame for an analysis of the question of the other in the Christian-Chinese encounter. What was, for instance, the value judgment of the different groups involved? Were there significant differences between these groups? How were the differences expressed? How did this value judgment interfere and interrelate with personal liking and disliking of the other and different levels of knowledge or ignorance of the other and vice versa.

As a result, the history of Christianity in China is also, but not exclusively, a history of defining the "other" and the "self." The two entities involved, "Christianity" and "China," have been associated with terms such as Western, scientific, modern, traditional, stable, unchanging, etc. The danger of this approach is the essentialist labeling which does not accept any evolution, change, or transformation. It can make communication impossible. The alternative is to consider the two entities as open, dynamic, and mobile. Self and other are dynamic concepts since they allow for different identifications. For instance, Christianity in seventeenth-century China can be studied by Western (other) Christian (self) or non-Christian (other) scholars, or by Chinese (self) Christian (self) or non-Christian (other) scholars. When they study anti-Christian movements, however, the identification is different. Moreover, if the two mo-

¹⁰⁹Tzvetan Todorov, *La conquête de l'Amérique: La question de l'autre* (Paris, 1982), esp. p. 191. English translation: *The Conquest of America: The Question of the Other*, trans. Richard Howard (New York, 1984).

These identities are studied in depth by a wide range of methodological means (positive-textual and interpretative-narrative) using both Chinese and Western sources, and if the wide variety of themes they embrace is interpreted from different perspectives, then one can discover how they shape, transform, and define each other. As such the "other" and the "self" come into the light for both sides. This might be a new challenge for the study of Christianity in China.

CONFUCIAN AND CHRISTIAN RELIGIOSITY IN LATE MING CHINA

BY

Erik Zürcher*

Introductory Remarks

Much has been written about the relation and interaction between Confucianism and the Christian doctrine as preached by Jesuit missionaries in late Ming and early Qing times, and not without reason, for since the Jesuits consciously concentrated their proselytizing effort upon the Confucian elite, they had constantly to define their own position vis-à-vis that absolutely dominant ideology. It is true that their acceptance in these circles did not depend only upon their religious message; many members of the educated elite admired the xiru, the "literati from the West," for their intellectual qualities and their useful new knowledge, without being attracted by their exotic religion. But even so, the first prerequisite was that this doctrine of the Lord of Heaven was essentially compatible with the Confucian world-view—that was a "cultural imperative" from which no minority religion could escape.

The Jesuits accepted that imperative and made it the cornerstone of their missionary approach, not only for strategic reasons, but also because most of them sincerely admired what they regarded as the "original teachings" of Confucius and of the oldest Chinese classics transmitted by him. In their view, those teachings were excellent guidelines for social and political life, and they even were held to contain clear evidence of a Chinese monotheism of the most distant past. Christianity could therefore both "complement Confucianism" (bu ru) by enriching it with a divine revelation, and restore it to its original monotheistic purity. The conclusion was clear and was drawn by all Chinese converts of the educated upper class: one could very well be-

*Mr. Zürcher is professor emeritus of East Asian history in the Rijksuniversiteit Leiden. [N.B. A list of the abbreviations used in the footnotes follows the article, beginning on page 650.]

come a Christian and yet remain a convinced Confucian. Other literati disagreed; their reactions varied from mild criticism to utter rejection.

Thus, ever since Ricci published his celebrated "Substantial Meaning of the Lord of Heaven" (Tianzhu shiyi) in 1604, a critical dialogue developed between Christianity and Confucianism. On the Christian side, both missionaries and converts have produced a large corpus of apologetic and polemical treatises; the opponents—Confucian scholars and officials (and also Buddhist monks and lay believers, in response to the Jesuits' extreme hostility toward all non-Confucian religious beliefs)—have done the same. It is a fascinating kind of literature, but it has one serious limitation: it largely deals with doctrinal and theoretical issues, and it teaches us little about the way in which Chinese converts actually experienced and practiced their religion, and how that Christian, personal religiosity related to the religious dimension of Confucianism. This paper is a first attempt to fill the gap.

In our story the Jesuit missionaries will not play the main role, for the subject implies that we shall have to focus upon the dispersed and fragmentary data found in the testimonies of native Chinese Christians. Statements made in Chinese works written by the foreign missionaries will be used only as supportive information if those texts are known to have had a wide circulation, or if those statements are quoted or paraphrased by Chinese authors. Such a self-imposed limitation is necessary, for quite a number of texts produced by missionaries are normative and prescriptive; in many cases they are free translations of European scholastic textbooks, and we therefore cannot assume that they reflect the reality of the religious life of Chinese Christians.

The Confucian Concept of "Orthodoxy" (zheng)

There is hardly any area in which the Confucian and the Christian discourses differ so fundamentally from each other as they do in their definition of orthodoxy—the complex of beliefs and practices that are officially established as being true, right, and binding.

In the Confucian tradition that nucleus of right thought and action is called zheng, "correct, legitimate"; it is contrasted with the "heterodox principles" (yiduari) of non-Confucian religious systems, notably Buddhism and Taoism, and with sectarian cults and rituals that are regarded as potentially subverting the moral order, and therefore are considered "heretical" (xie) or "uncontentious" (yin).

At first sight one would be tempted to limit the sphere of zheng to the officially recognized interpretation of the Confucian canon as it had been formulated by Cheng Yi, Cheng Hao, and other Neo-Confucian masters of the eleventh century and systematized by Zhu Xi (1130-1200), for this particular variety of Neo-Confucianism had enjoyed official status since the early fourteenth century. However, this official recognition only meant that the commentaries of the so-called "Cheng-Zhu School" or "School of Principles" formed part of the uniform curriculum for the state examinations. Of course, the fact that all male members of the educated gentry who aspired to even the lowest grade in the examination system had memorized these standard commentaries is of great importance. However, the Cheng-Zhu formulation of Confucianism had by no means the status of an unassailable, dogmatic orthodoxy. There were several strongly divergent trends and schools within Neo-Confucianism, and particularly in late Ming times there were influential masters who expounded ideas that differed from the official exegesis on fundamental points, without being branded as heterodox or heretical. It is interesting to note that such points of controversy and diverging opinions precisely concerned metaphysical, ontological, and other theoretical subjects (such as the relation between the eternal metaphysical principles and physical endowment, or the qualities of human nature and the mind) that in a Western context would be essential elements of orthodoxy.

The Confucian concept of zheng is of another order than the monopolistic, all-inclusive, Mediterranean type of orthodoxy, of which Christianity (in its seventeenth-century, Roman Catholic, post-Tridentine form) was an outstanding example. As has been argued by C. K. Yang, zheng is, first and foremost, a moral and political orthodoxy.¹ The ideal moral order is formally categorized as the "Three Bonds," san gang, i.e., the relations between ruler and subject, father and son, and husband and wife; the "Five Human Relations," wu lun: the same, plus elder and younger brother and "friends," i.e., close non-familial relations; and the observance of the "Five Constant Virtues," wu chang: benevolence or human-heartedness (ren); righteousness or sense of duty (yi); sense of propriety and ritual (li); wisdom or insight (zhi), and good faith (xin). These quintessential relations and virtues, together with their correct and hierarchical ritual expression, form the very basis of the orthodox, zheng way of life and of the social and political order; it was even considered to be the hallmark of Chinese civilization. As K. C. Liu rightly re-

¹C. K. Yang, *Religion in Chinese Society. A Study of Contemporary Social Functions of Religion and Some of Their Historical Factors* (Berkeley, California, 1961), p. 196.

marks: "The Confucian orthodoxy was built on interpersonal relationships, and not necessarily on a transcendent faith."²

However, the scope of zheng reaches far beyond social ethics; it also has an important religious dimension. The Confucian values reflect the qualities of the cosmos itself; human beings are part of a moral universe. Heaven and Earth are great and benevolent powers. The Five Constant Virtues also inform the workings of Nature: Heaven and Earth are ren, for they give and sustain Ufe; yi corresponds to the perfect regularity of aU natural processes; li has its counterpart in the hierarchical order that reigns in the universe, and zhi is, on a cosmic scale, the supernatural Intelligence of Heaven. Heaven (tian) is the supreme directive force, majestic yet impersonal; both the universe and human society are subjected to its Mandate (tianming). The perfect sage is not only a person of highest moral standing: he deeply experiences that metaphysical dimension, and in that sense he "forms a triad with Heaven-and-Earth" and "forms one substance with Heaven, Earth, and the myriad things."

This conception of a morally positive universe directed by the Mandate of Heaven had important ideological and ritual consequences; it formed, in fact, the basis of the Confucian state religion. It served to legitimize the position of the ruling dynasty and of the emperor as chief executor of the Heavenly Mandate, in his sacral role of Son of Heaven. The grand sacrifices to Heaven and Earth, which only the emperor was allowed to celebrate, constituted the apex of a hierarchically arranged system of official rites, as codified in the "sacrificial statutes" (sidian), to be performed by (in descending order) the emperor and his representatives, the magistrates on the various administrative levels, local gentry leaders, and individual households. The objects of sacrificial worship included the numinous powers of soil and grain; of mountains and rivers; of walls and moats; of celestial bodies; the spiritual power (ling) represented by great sages and heroes of the past; domestic deities (notably the god of the hearth) and the manes of ancestors in each household. It was a complicated, multi-layered complex of officially prescribed or approved cults, intimately related with the idea of legitimate power and authority on every level; taken as a whole it was a powerful element of integration and uniformity in state and society. All this also belonged to the sphere of zheng (in fact, the word often denotes "legitimate [rule]"); like the social component (san gang, etc.) and the metaphysical one (the being in the cosmic dimension), this ritual component was

²Kwang-Ching Liu, "Socioethics as Orthodoxy: A Perspective," in K. C. Liu (ed.), *Orthodoxy in Late Imperial China* (Berkeley, California, 1990), pp. 53-100 at 54.

part of the common Confucian heritage that was shared by all schools. It was orthodox, in the sense that the rejection of any part of it would be considered subversive and heretical.

Finally, the concept of *zheng* also comprised an individual component: the Confucian ideal of "self-cultivation" (修身, *shen;xiuyang*). As an indispensable part of the individual's effort to become a *junzi*, a "superior man" of wisdom and high moral standards, the idea of self-cultivation was as old as Confucianism itself, but in Neo-Confucianism it had acquired a deeper and broader significance, probably (but never explicitly) as a result of Mahāyāna Buddhist influence. Whatever their scholastic affiliation, Neo-Confucians proclaimed that in principle the ideal of Saintliness (*sheng*), i.e., the realization of a state of perfect inner harmony and equilibrium, was open to every human being. Everybody has the innate, spontaneous knowledge (*liangzhi*) and capacity (*liangneng*) to realize the virtues that form part of human nature (*xing*). According to the Cheng-Zhu Official interpretation, this nature itself does not directly reveal itself in practical action; it is the deepest nucleus of our being, the storehouse of the metaphysical principles. In practical life, our thoughts and actions are guided by our mind (*xin*, "heart"), and this *xin* is morally ambivalent. Its "better part" is pure and morally perfect, for it reflects the principles immanent in our nature. Its "worse part" is contaminated by the selfish desires and impure tendencies that themselves are the result of our contact with things and of our material endowment. However, it is possible to purify the mind and to realize our perfect nature by an arduous process of introspection, self-examination, study, and moral discipline, and by maintaining an attitude of mental concentration and vigilance (called *jing*, literally "reverence").

In late Ming times, Confucian self-cultivation had given rise to a type of meditation with religious overtones; as regards its outer form (sitting cross-legged, combined with respiratory exercises), it was no doubt inspired by the Chan-Buddhist practice of "sitting in meditation," but its content and purpose were completely different. Such Confucian meditation, called *qingshi*/"quiet-sitting," was practiced in the early morning or at the end of the day, in a secluded room, sometimes for a considerable time. It was aimed at reaching a state of mental equilibrium, or of "no-mind"; free from the disturbing influence of emotions—a return to one's inner nature. Just as in Chan Buddhism, the term *gongfu*, "exertion, labor," was sometimes used for this kind of spiritual exercise.

In spite of its Buddhist origin, it is not clear to what extent *qingshi* can be considered a religious practice, although it certainly belongs to

the more general category of "spirituality." De Bary's characterization of *jingzuo* as a kind of "examination of conscience" seems to be too limited.³ It has probably been best defined by Busch, as "a restful return of the mind to itself, a passive awareness of its nature, wherein the mind cleans itself from all selfish desires and the heavenly norm, embodied in it, emerges."⁴

This brief survey of the scope and content of "Confucian orthodoxy" may serve to highlight the basic difference between the Confucian and the Christian worldviews. In the Confucian conception of *zheng*, the focus is on social morality, political legitimacy, and ritual correctness. The supramundane is there, as a metaphysical dimension, but only to the extent that it is directly related to social and political values and to human nature. "Faith" in the Christian sense, as an unquestioning acceptance of a supernatural revelation laid down in scriptures of divine inspiration, does not play any role. Heaven (or its ancient metaphors like *shangdi*, "the Sovereign-on-High," or *zhuzai*, "the Lord-Overseer") is vaguely described as the highest principle and guiding force in the universe, but no attempt is made to define it more closely—*tian* is important because of its activity in the human sphere (what Chung-ying Cheng aptly has called "the worldliness of the religious reality of Heaven"),⁵ not as a worthy object of "theological" thought in itself. Confucian orthodoxy does not include any coherent explanation of human suffering, as Buddhism did with its theory of karma and rebirth, nor is it concerned with the hereafter. It does not include such typical religious elements as prophecy, miracles, personified powers of good and evil, sacred spells, and exorcism.

Another notable fact is that in the Confucian doctrine about the spiritual aspects of the human being, very little attention is paid to the "soul." The entities called *hun* (made of subtle matter, and lingering on after death) and *po* (consisting of less refined *qi*, and falling apart) are regarded as a kind of elementary vital force, quite distinct from the aspects that really count in the here and now: human nature, mind, emotions, and individual physical endowment. The notion of "souls" does play a role in the ancestral cult, but even there those disembodied intelligences remain ill-defined and almost marginal, if compared to the

³William Th. de Bary, *The Unfolding of Neo-Confucianism* (New York, 1975), p. 175.

⁴Cf. Heinrich Busch, "The Tung-lin Shu yuan and Its Political and Philosophical Significance: *Monumenta Serica*, XIV (1949-1955), 1-163 at 125.

⁵Chung-ying Cheng, *New Dimensions of Confucian and Neo-Confucian Philosophy* (Albany, New York, 1971), p. 456.

absolutely central role played by the human soul in the Christian doctrine.

We may conclude that Confucian orthodoxy, defined as *zheng*, is limited in its coverage. It is most explicit and demanding when dealing with beliefs, norms, and rituals that are directly related to the social and political order and with individual self-perfection. From that central area it branches out into metaphysics, but there it leaves much room for varying interpretations and speculations, and it hardly contains any binding rules for private religious experience, like faith, hope for release, prayer, devotion, the awareness of sin, and protection against evil and misfortune. And precisely for that reason such "areas of low density" could be filled up by religious elements from outside: Buddhist devotion and soteriology, Taoist magic and eubiotics, popular beliefs and rituals—and no doubt also by the doctrine of the Lord of Heaven. Confucian orthodoxy generally did not stand in the way of such complements, if they did not affect its core area. In this sense, Christianity could indeed be "a substitute for Buddhism" (*yifo*).⁶ But the adoption of Christianity actually went far beyond taking the place of Buddhism, for it also pretended to offer its own interpretation of Confucianism itself. It was not, like Buddhism, an external religious system in its own right, that was allowed to operate in the empty spaces not covered by Confucian orthodoxy; as a monopolistic religion, it claimed to cover the whole human experience. By merging with Confucianism, Christianity itself became a part of *zheng*—in fact, its claim that it had come to purify Confucianism of later superstitious accretions and to restore original monotheism implied that it was more *zheng* than anything contemporary Confucianism could offer. Such claims had never been made by any other alien religion in China—in that respect it was a new phenomenon in the history of Chinese thought.

Christianity and *zheng*

The fact that the spokesmen of Christianity situated their doctrine and their way of life firmly on the side of *zheng* had far-reaching consequences. The claim itself is often and very explicitly made, by missionaries and by converts alike, just as their opponents spared no argument to disprove it.

⁶Cf. Xu Guangqi's preface to *Sabbathino de Ursis*, "Hydraucus," *Taixi shuifa* (1612), in *TXCH*, III, 1506: Christianity may serve "as a complement to Confucianism and as a substitute for Buddhism," *bu ru yifo*.

That the doctrine of the Lord of Heaven offers the true interpretation of the Classics, and thereby has penetrated into the very heart of the Confucian scriptural tradition, is most clearly stated by Wang Zheng in his treatise on "Standing in Awe of Heaven and Loving Other People" (Wei tian ai renji lun, 1628). After having heard the explanations given to him by Dídaco de Pantoja (of which he presents a very interesting summary) during one of his visits to Beijing, he realizes the true meaning of the Mandate of Heaven (i.e., in a Christian context, the wiU and intention of the Lord of Heaven), and of aU the passages in the Classics that refer to Heaven or its synonyms. He is elated by this discovery, for suddenly he has found the key to whatever he has learnt so far (a relevant remark, for Wang Zheng met de Pantoja during one of his many attempts to gain the finshi degree, his head crammed with memorized scriptures and commentaries).⁷ Zhu Zongyuan also describes the contribution of Christianity in terms that belong to the standard vocabulary of zheng: it enriches Confucianism with its detailed "method of cultivating one's spirit and nourishing one's nature" (xiu shen yang xing) and makes us "return to the root" (gui gen); only now have we come to understand the true meaning of the Six Classics and the Four Books; unfortunately, "superficial scholars do not understand this."⁸ Any Confucian could recognize the key concepts of his own doctrine in the words of the author of an anonymous pamphlet: Christianity is "the right way of preserving the mind, nourishing one's Nature, self-cultivation, and submission to [Heaven's] Mandate."⁹

If Christianity is "orthodox," it foUows that it shares the Confucian abhorrence of "heretical" and "licentious" beliefs and cults (a point most explicitly made, also because opponents tended to identify it with such subversive movements). Even some sympathetic outsiders were convinced that Christianity should be used as a means to discourage sectarianism and to bring the people back to the orthodox way!¹⁰ Christian publications could serve the same purpose: some Fujian Uterati urgently asked Father Aleni to translate many such books "in order to ex-

⁷TCLRIP^.

⁸DKW, pp. 6¹-7a.

⁹XSWB, p. 10*.

¹⁰The most interesting case is the proclamation issued in 1635 by Lei Chong, prefect of Jiangzhou, in which he extols A. Vagnoni and his doctrine as an antidote against sectarian movements; text appended to Huang Mingqiao's *Tianxue chuangai* (1639); translation in Erik Zürcher, "A Complement to Confucianism: Christianity and Orthodoxy in Late Ming China," in *Norms and the State in China*, edd. Huang Chun-chieh and E. Zürcher (Leiden, 1993), pp. 71-72. Cf. also the proclamation of Zuo Guangxian, prefect of Jianning (Fujian),

pose heresy and extol orthodoxy" (pi xie chong zheng); the Heavenly Doctrine is "the only public-spirited and orthodox one" (wei yi gong zheng), and a sure remedy against aU heretical teachings and deviant schools."''

However, in its opposition to heresy, Christianity was much more radical than Confucianism, which, as we have seen, generally made a distinction between respectable organized Buddhism and Taoism and the "subversive" teachings of uncontroUed sectarian movements. Christian monopoUsm did not (and could not) make such a distinction: any beUef or cult that does not form part of Confucian-Christian synthesis is by definition to be condemned as xie. This wholesale rejection of both institutional and popular Chinese religions (including such "superstitious" practices as geomancy and astrology) created a united front between Christians and orthodox Confucian fundamentaUsts. It is not without reason that the Christian leader Yang Tingyun, when organizing his father's funeral, banned aU superstitious practices, and buried him according to the strict rules of Zhu Xi's "FamUy Ritual" (Jiali).²

If the Christian message of a single, personal God was to be integrated into the core area of zheng, it could not do so in the Buddhist or Taoist way, by simply adding its own deity as an external complement; the evidence had to be found within the Confucian tradition itself. As is weU known, the integration took place through a daring reinterpretation of some ancient cultic terms (notably tian, "Heaven") and of a considerable number of key passages in the Confucian canon. The most basic element in this Christianized Confucianism was the personification of the highest cosmic force or principle, the transformation of the abstract, impersonal Heaven into the personal Lord of Heaven. To Chinese Christians the worship of that Tianzhu was the hallmark of their faith; in every exposition of the Christian doctrine this personification of the Confucian Heaven forms the first and most fundamental theme. The beUef of the Chinese converts was, first and foremost, characterized by what may be caUed "Confucian monotheism."

extolling Aleni and the doctrine of the Uterati from the West "as a support for the ruler's civUizing transformation" (texts and translation in S. Couvreur, *Choix de documents, lettres officielles, edits, mémoriaux, inscriptions. . . . Textes chinois avec traduction en français et en latin* (3d printing; Hokien-fou, 1901), pp. 30-35.

¹KDRCX 10.

²2XQYX, pp. 6'-7", also in LXYf, I, 26h-27*.

The Lord of Heaven: "Confucian Monotheism"

Christianity was rightly denoted by the name "the Doctrine of the Lord of Heaven" and not by any term *UteraUy* corresponding to "Christianity." One of the most outstanding characteristics of late Ming lay Christianity is that in the writings of Chinese converts only a minor role is played by what in the European perspective always has constituted the very essence of the creed: the Incarnation, Passion, and Resurrection. In their works the absolutely central role is played by the person of God as the creator, the supreme ruler of the universe, the "great Father-and-Mother," and the righteous but stern judge of souls, even to such an extent that in some of their writings the person of Jesus does not figure at all.¹³

This one-sided concentration on the theme of monotheism cannot be blamed upon the Jesuit missionaries, for in their own Chinese writings (including illustrated texts) they have paid ample attention to the Incarnation. And there are some exceptions: the unique "Diary of DaUy Admonitions," *Kouduo richao* (Li Jiubiao's record of conversations held by Aleni and some other missionaries in Fujian between 1630 and 1640) contains several passages that testify to a considerable interest in, and familiarity with, the themes of Incarnation and Redemption.

However, those passages also show that for sympathetic outsiders and even for some converted *Uterati*, the Incarnation remained a source of perplexity. It was hard to believe that the Lord of Heaven was born from a virgin of low social standing; the idea that he had assumed the form of a human being was felt to be a profanation of his majesty, and, above all, if true Redemption had only been made possible by Jesus' self-sacrifice, what about the fate of the saints and sages of the Confucian tradition, the virtuous rulers of high Antiquity—and of Confucius himself?

Another stumbling-block was, understandably, the related dogma of the Trinity. Both the missionaries and some Chinese converts have tried to throw light upon that mystery, but we cannot expect their audience to have been satisfied by their explanations. The mystery is described using a style and terminology that must have reminded Chinese readers of the most abstruse Buddho-Taoist "Dark Learning" speculations of early medieval times. The argument was further obscured by the use of

¹³Notable examples of such "Tianzhu-ist" texts are Wang Zheng's *WTAR* and *RHY*, and Han Lin's *DS*.

the word *ti*, which means both "body" and "substance" (in a philosophical sense). One example may suffice: "Jesus' body, soul, and divine nature constituted one and the same substance (*tongtt*). [The Father] reflected (*zhao*, another traditional concept) in his own inner being his mysterious omnipotence, perfect goodness, and infinity of his fundamental nature, and from his inner substance he created the image (*xiang*) of that mysterious omnipotence, perfect goodness, and infinity, and that was the Son. . . ." So much for Aleni; Yang Tingyun makes a similar attempt at explanation, using several images and similes.¹⁵ However, it is quite significant that in a key passage in which Yang Usts six points of similarity and resemblance between Confucianism and Christianity, the Incarnation is not mentioned; the main thrust of the argument is to represent Christianity as an enriched and deepened version of Confucianism, and as a revival of original monotheism.¹⁶

The image of the personalized Heaven, the divine autocrat, no doubt stimulated the religious imagination. The impression it made upon the Chinese audience must have been deepened by the very frequent use of two powerful metaphors: God is our "great Father-and-Mother" (*da fumu*), and he is the great Ruler (*dajun*). No images could have been more significant and rich in associations in a Chinese environment. Since God is our Father-and-Mother, his worship is analogous to the respect and submission that a filial son owes to his parents;¹⁷ it follows that our duties toward God are even superior to the Five Human Relations;¹⁸ whoever sins against God's will is lacking in filial piety;¹⁹ one who does good without serving God is like a son who behaves well in society but neglects his own parents.²⁰ In Han Lin's Christian exegesis of the Six Maxims of the first Ming emperor (*Duoshu*), the first maxim, "Be filial towards your parents," is explained as the worldly counterpart of the Christian principle of "loving our great Father-and-Mother."²¹

The God-Ruler analogy is also elaborated, with interesting political overtones. God is the sole legitimate Ruler, and we have to obey his de-

¹⁴KDRC, III, 31"; cf. also III, 25"-26"; TV, 20"-21b, and SSLX, pp. 24"-25b.

¹⁵DYP, II, 593-598.

¹⁶IDYXP, I, 2'-3b; translation of the whole passage in Nicolas Standaert, *Yang Tingyun, Confucian and Christian in Late Ming China: His Life and Thought* (Leiden, 1988), pp. 206-208; cf. also E. Zürcher, "Jesuit Accommodation and the Chinese Cultural Imperative," in *The Chinese Rites Controversy*, ed. D. E. Mungello (Nettetal, Germany, 1994), pp. 42-44.

¹⁷WTAR, ppA6b-17'.

¹⁸LXYf, I, 8".

¹⁹>WTAR, pA&.

²⁰KDRC, III, 27'-28".

²¹IDS, I, 1'-3".

crees, just as an official serves the one legitimate monarch and acts according to the latter's "orthodox" (zheng) political doctrine; serving the Buddha or other deities amounts to following a usurper or a rebel leader.²² Wang Zheng explicitly relates the worship of Heaven (in the monotheistic sense) to legitimate rule: China adored the one God in Antiquity, when the people recognized the authority of the king of Zhou. In the spring and autumn period he still enjoyed some prestige. But during the era of the Warring States, a time of usurpation and lawlessness, the idea of legitimate rule was lost, as was the knowledge of the one God; as a result, heretical doctrines arose, and false gods "usurped" the position of the Lord of Heaven.²³ Elsewhere, in a memorial to the throne of 1622 about the necessity of strengthening the national defense, Wang argues that fearing and respecting Heaven is the best way to safeguard the legitimate rule—the emperor is, after all, the Son of heaven; Heaven is like his Father, and father and son "share the same Ufe breath."²⁴

The personalization of the Confucian Heaven also had far-reaching consequences for the way in which the immaterial aspects of the human being could be interpreted. The idea that our nature (xing) is "Heaven-ordained," reflects the virtues of the cosmos itself, and therefore is "basicUy good" (benshan) was a fundamental assumption in Neo-Confucian orthodoxy of whatever denomination. How could this very positive image of human nature be aUgned with the Christian conception of the created soul, beset with original sin, and bound to be lost if it is not saved by its conversion and by the grace of God? At first sight the two views seem to be irreconcilable; yet, as we shaU see, some interesting attempts were made to solve the contradiction.

Human Nature: Soul and Body

The Christian approach to the Confucian view foUowed different paths. In the first place, the personaUzation of Heaven implied that the Confucian idea of a "Heaven-endowed" human nature acquired a new meaning: in the Christian perspective, the Lord of Heaven has UteraUy created each individual xing and infused it into the physical body. The

²²JCDaC1VI, 2·-3"; SSL, I, 2b, 3'.

²³W7TAR, p. 14".

²⁴Cf. Fang Hao, "Wang Zheng zhi shiji ji qi shuru xiyang xueshu zhi gongxian," in Fang Hao liushi zidinggao (Taibei, 1969), p. 330.

difficult problem of its "basic goodness" (as opposed to the Christian concept of ingrained sin) could be solved by an ingenious reinterpretation of the word *ben* ("root," hence "basic, original"), taking it not in an ontological sense (*benshan* = "fundamentalUy good"), but as referring to an original, pristine condition (*benshan* = "originalUy good", i.e., at the time of creation, before the *FaU*). In spite of later contamination, something of that original goodness is preserved; after baptism has removed the burden of original sin (*yuanzut*), that goodness can be restored through moral self-cultivation, devotion, and the performance of good works. In the second place, the concept of the human rational soul (*linghun*) was given the central role which it naturaUy had to play in a Christian context. As has been noted above, in Neo-Confucianism the role played by the soul is marginal, and in any case it is something quite different from human nature or the mind. In the Christian discourse no distinction is made between soul and nature; occasionaUy we even find the combined form *lingxing* as a synonym of *linghun*." By blurring these distinctions, the Confucian concept of Heaven-endowed Nature acquired a whole range of new connotations: a human Soul/Nature, created yet eternal, endowed with rationalUy, and thereby fundamentally different from the lower and destructible souls of plants and animals.

How the two approaches were combined in actual practice is vividly illustrated by a curious scene that took place in Fuzhou in 1625, shortly after Giulio Aleni's arrival in Fujian; the episode is reported only in a contemporary western source,²⁶ but it is no doubt authentic. Aleni was invited to a meeting of a local Confucian academy (*shuyuan*). The theme chosen for discussion is well known and is also often quoted in Chinese writings: it is the opening phrase of the canonical Doctrine of the Mean (*Zhongyong*), which reads, "What Heaven has ordained is caUed human nature" (*tian ming zhi wet xing*). As the discussion develops, Aleni is asked to comment, and he naturaUy avaUs himself of this opportunity to present his interpretation before such a learned audience. His argument runs as foUows: "Heaven" must not be taken to mean an impersonal principle or mechanism; it means the Lord of Heaven. "Nature" here does not refer to our present debased state that is beset

²⁵E.g., *SSi*, I, 5".

²⁶M. Dias, *Histoire de ce qui s'estpassé es Royaumes . . . delà Chine, en l'année 1625, jusques en Fébrier de 1626, tirées des lettres adressees au R. Père Général de la Compagnie de fésus* (Paris, 1626), pp. 179-180; cf. also E. Zürcher, "The Jesuit Mission in Fukien in Late Ming Times: Levels of Response," in E. B. Vermer (ed.), *Development and Decline of Fukien Province in the 17th and 18th Centuries* (Leiden, 1990), pp. 432-433; and Daniello Bartoli, *DeWHistoria della Compagnia de Gesu*. La Ciña, Terza Parte dell'Asia (Rome, 1663), pp. 81 1-813.

by sin, but to the perfect Nature that God has "ordained," i.e., given to man, before the FaU. That Nature has degenerated, but since it is endowed with the knowledge of good and evU, it can choose the right way, and with God's help be restored to its original perfection. Aleni's interpretation leads to a spirited debate, which, unfortunately, has not been recorded.

Here we see the Christian interpretation of the Confucian dogma: the perfect goodness of human nature is narrowed down to its primordial state, the innocence of Paradise. Yet it is not completely lost. According to Aleni, as recorded by Li Jiubiao, God has given to us a "metaphysical light" (*chaoxing zhi ming*) that transcends the defects of our natural constitution and like the sun Uluminates everything;²⁷ and, elsewhere: wickedness is not innate; how could the perfect God have given us a bad nature? We are not the same as regards character and temperament, but that is due to our physical endowment (*qibin*); the difference between goodness and evil is mainly the result of "practice"²⁸ (*xi*, an impUcit yet unmistakable reference to a weU-known passage in the Confucian Analects).²⁹ Even in the worst sinners the spontaneous propensity toward goodness (*liangxin*, the "good mind," another Confucian key term) is preserved.

For Chinese converts the pattern was famiUar: in spite of aU our bad inclinations, we still may be saved by trying to recover our original nature. For them this idea was especiaUy comforting, because it would imply that their virtuous but unbaptized ancestors could have been saved by the "metaphysical Ught" of their nature, and the same would be true of China's ancient saints and sages. To them, the concept of original goodness was not a theoretical issue: it directly concerned the fate of their own departed relatives and moral heroes. Time and again questions are asked about that deUcate topic: What about our ancestors? Can one be saved by virtue alone? Does Confucius reaUy burn in heU?³⁰ The moral conflict is poignantly brought forward by a Christian scholar: how can one enjoy the heavenly bliss while one's own parents are tortured in heU?³¹ In all such cases, the answer is some-

²⁷KDRCY1, 27". Cf. TYZD, pp. 1' and 5", where this inner Ught is rendered by the Confucian term *ming de*, "bright virtue," borrowed from the first chapter of the Great Learning. ²⁸KDRC11IV-W.

²⁹Cf. Lunyu 17.2: "By nature, people are close to each other; it is by practice that they grow widely [apart]"; *xing xiangjin ye, xi xiang yuan ye*.

³⁰On this deUcate topic see Jacques Gernet, *Chine et christianisme. Action et réaction* (Paris, 1982), pp. 239-241.

³¹KDRC, III, 3"-3b.

what ambiguous—the missionaries had to balance between their own theological principles and the existential demands of their Chinese audience.

However, to some extent a hopeful answer could be found in the theory of the "three stages of revelation," and that was no doubt the reason why that scholastic construct so often appears in our Chinese sources. According to that scheme, the first stage, caUed "the Natural Teaching" (xingfiao) took place at the very beginning, when God endowed our first ancestors with insight and knowledge of good and evil. The second period started with the revelation of the Ten Commandments to Moses; that was the "Written Teaching" (shufiao); the Incarnation marked the beginning of the third and most complete revelation, variously caUed the "Teaching by Grace" (enjiao, chongjiao), "of Love" (aijiao), or "of Personal [Manifestation]" (shenjiad)?2

It is clear that for the Chinese "concerned scholars" the first phase, that of the Natural Teaching, was of crucial importance. Zhu Zongyuan equates it with spontaneous wisdom and good impulsive capacities (liangzhi, liangneng)P Yang Tingyun goes further (not caring about the Fall and the effects of original sin): according to him, this state of original wisdom corresponds to the perfect virtue and pure monotheism of the Chinese highest Antiquity, when the Natural Teaching was contained in the human mind, and when people were able to avoid evU on account of their liangzhi and liangneng. Saints and sages presented it in their teachings. It is the happy state reflected in China's most ancient classics, the Book ofSongs and the Book ofDocuments. This was already stretching the Christian scheme to the limit; he definitely goes beyond it when he adds: "[In highest Antiquity] people naturaUy stood in awe of Heaven, so there was no need for the Incarnation."³⁴ The unorthodox idea that the Incarnation was not a decisive new beginning but rather a useful complement is also voiced by Zhu Zongyuan: the Chinese who Uved before the arrival of Matteo Ricci stiU could rely upon the Ungering effect of the Natural Teaching to reach Heaven. The "Teaching by Personal [Manifestation]" is more complete, and it is therefore easier to fuUy realize one's Nature" (jinxing) by that way³⁵ In another treatise it is expUctly said that God has used "the Chinese saints

³⁴For a discussion of these Three Phases as interpreted by Yang Tingyun see Standaert, *op. cit.*, pp. 129-130.

³⁵DKW, p. 4T.

s<€>yp,p.585.

KDKW, p. 48b. For such rather far-going interpretations of salvation by downgrading the necessity of the Incarnation, see also Zürcher, "Jesuit Accommodation," pp. 48-49.

and sages of our past" to make his "orthodox instructions" (zhengxun) known to the people.³⁶ Thus, by this mixture of Confucian positivism and Christian ideas about natural theology, China's unbaptized but virtuous souls were saved, as was her face.

So far we have been dealing with Christian adaptations of the Confucian concepts of human nature and its qualities. However, as noted above, there also was the Christian preoccupation with the soul (Qinghun) as the spiritual entity residing in the material body (rousheri), and here we are faced with a whole range of ideas that had no counterpart in the Confucian tradition, or, indeed, in Chinese religious thought. Starting from a (thoroughly un-Chinese) absolute distinction between a material body and an immaterial spirit, the soul is said to be eternal, indestructible, residing in the body but basically autonomous, a strictly individual moral agent responsible for all the individual acts of mind, speech, and body, and therefore the object of eternal reward, expiation in Purgatory, or eternal condemnation after death. It was a complex of alien ideas that gave rise to many questions. Since the most important function of the "soul" in Chinese tradition is related to the ancestral cult (the soul of the departed ancestor "descending" into the spirit-tablet on the altar during the ritual, and consuming the invisible essence of the sacrificial food), it had to be made clear that departed souls have left us forever (except in some rare cases, when God allows them to visit our world as spectres); that, being immaterial, they cannot accept food, let alone superstitious offerings like paper money, and they are unable to confer blessings and to react to prayers.³⁷ Another traditional belief to be refuted was that the soul disintegrates shortly after death: the soul does not consist of "essential ether" (Jingqi), but is wholly immaterial; unlike the vegetative and sensitive life-force of plants and animals, the human soul is eternal.³⁸

It is clear that in the Christian-Confucian complex the ideas regarding the immaterial aspects of the human being suffered from a certain incoherence. On the one hand, it was a Christian adaptation of the Confucian notion of innate goodness; on the other hand, the "soul" had to play a very prominent role, as it formed the very basis of the Christian (or rather Mediterranean) construct, and this soul could not easily be integrated into the Chinese tradition.

*BfL, p.4\

"E.g.,/CDÄC7,IV,II"-12-.

*>SSLX, pp. 19"-19^ZMCW; pp. 7b-8b; WTAR, pp.38b- 39".

Another consequence of the belief in the immaterial nature of the soul was the sharp distinction made between body and soul, and the absolute superiority of the latter—a Platonic dichotomy that was unknown in Confucianism. We find some clear statements about the body as the source of seduction, lust, and sin: the body is the natural enemy of the soul, for the soul delights in true principles and the body in carnal pleasure;³⁹ like an unwilling horse, the body has to be whipped into obedience.⁴⁰ This very un-Chinese condemnation of the body forms the background of certain ascetic practices; as we shall see, such exercises, aimed at "subduing the self" (*kefi*), played an important role in the lives of Christian devotees.

Teachers, Priests, and Ritual

In regard to Chinese culture as a whole, it is hard to subscribe to C. K. Yang's model of "diffuse religion," a system in which sacral activities are not localized in specialized institutions (like churches) and guided by full-time religious specialists, but are incorporated in social and political institutions (the lineage, the bureaucracy, the guild, etc.) that themselves are not primarily religious.⁴¹ On the contrary, the large Buddhist and Taoist monasteries were specialized religious organizations of great complexity, inhabited by religious specialists who had obtained their status through ordination or initiation rites, and on the popular level China was teeming with full-time experts like soothsayers, mediums, and faith-healers who did not operate within secular organizations. However, as far as the cultic aspects of Confucianism are concerned, the "diffuse religion" model certainly applies, in the sense that Confucianism was a system without priests. It did have a whole hierarchy of cultic centers, ranging from the Altar of Heaven to the ancestral altar in the household, but on all levels these cults were integrated into social and political institutions, and the rituals were performed by non-specialized persons, from the emperor down to the family head.

In that respect Roman Catholic Christianity as an ecclesiastical religion had no way to accommodate itself to Confucianism; the priest simply had no Confucian counterpart. Institutionally speaking, it would have been much easier to integrate the Christian sacerdotal functions into the Chinese Buddhist monastic system, as the Nestorians had done

³⁹KDRC, IV, 7".

⁴⁰KDRC, VI, 17"-17b.

⁴¹Cf. Yang, *op cit.*, pp. 20-21.

almost a thousand years earlier, but for a variety of reasons that was the last thing the Jesuits wanted to do. They consciously avoided the use of pagan terminology: the Church was not called a *si* or a *miao*, but *tang*, "HaU," or, more specifically, *Tianzhu tang*, "HaU of the Lord of Heaven," and instead of using Buddhist expressions for priest or monk, they mostly referred to themselves by the outlandish term *duode*, an abbreviation of *sacerdote*. Mass was referred to as "the *misa* sacrifice" (*misa fi*), or *zhanli*, "ritual of veneration"; for many cultic terms like "sacrament" and "ecclesia" transcriptions from the Latin were used. The position of the Christian priest and his rituals in a Confucian context as an alien body was enhanced by the fact that the Mass had to be celebrated in Latin, in spite of the Jesuit attempt to get the Pope's permission to do so in Chinese.

The priest is clearly set apart from the lay believers; only the *duode* has the authority to celebrate Mass, to grant the absolution after the confession of sins, and (except in extreme circumstances) nobody but he can perform baptism.⁴² Unfortunately, we know very little about the actual performance of ritual in the church from texts by Chinese authors; works written by missionaries such as Aleni and Brancati⁴³ describe them in detail, even including the Latin names of every part of the Mass vestments, but such texts are purely prescriptive and probably do not reflect the actual practice. In principle, attendance of Mass (held every Sunday and on other days of observation) was a religious duty, but for many believers that must have been impossible. Regular attendance could be expected if a church was within walking distance, but the small churches or chapels that had been set up by local groups of believers in distant places were only rarely visited by a priest who could celebrate Mass and administer the sacraments of baptism and confession. According to Fan Zhong, Christians should try to attend Mass as often as possible, armed with a "Mass calendar" (*zhanli ridan*) for the whole year; but those who cannot do so should fulfill their religious duties at home, privately worshiping God every Sunday⁴⁴ The texts contain references to private altars and icons kept at home, perhaps often

⁴²Cf. SJXY, pp. 8b-9", and DYP, II, 617-618, about the status of the priest as derived from the authority of the pope, and therefore from the authority of God himself. Zhang Geng (LXGJ, pp. 2b-3") draws an interesting parallel between the priest who during Mass is the representative of God and the ancient Chinese funerary ritual during which a young boy, called "the corpse" (*shi*), represented the deceased ancestor and therefore was venerated in spite of his youth.

⁴³Aleni in his very detailed MSJY and Brancati (especially about the Eucharist and Confession) in his SJSG.

⁴⁴^???,???.?-10'.

combined with the ancestral altar; very wealthy converts such as Yang Tingyun and Xu Guangqi could afford to have real housechapels. In a major urban Christian center, where the church formed part of the mission house, the missionaries may have used their own funds for its building and upkeep, but the more modest local sanctuaries were built by private initiative and kept up by the community. Contributions could also be made in kind, or by voluntary labor: an edifying story tells us about a pious Christian whose sins were forgiven because he "had decorated the images of the church in Quanzhou, working for forty days and nights without asking for any remuneration."⁴⁵

All this belongs to a sphere that is far removed from that of the scholar's studio or the Confucian academy. In a Confucian milieu, the Jesuits, as "Uterati from the West" and as propagators of what I have called "Confucian monotheism," conformed to another traditional role, that of the teacher. In the Confucian ideal scheme of human relations, the teacher-disciple relation is a derivative of the father-son role pattern: the teacher (*xiansheng*) is considered a source of learning and wisdom as well as a moral example, especially by his circle of disciples (*dizh*) who owe him respect and unfailing loyalty. Many testimonies of both converts and sympathizers clearly show that this indeed was their role. Some outstanding missionaries like Ricci, Aleni, and Schall were deeply admired for the way in which they approached the ideal of the Confucian teacher and moral guide.

It should be added that this was facilitated by the fact that, as far as we can gather from the sources, the Jesuits did not really inform their Chinese disciples about the real nature and aims of their own organization. From the few vague indications contained in Jesuit texts about Europe, mainly dealing with learning and examinations, they may have gotten the impression that this Society of Jesus (*Yesu hut*) was some kind of scholarly and humanitarian association (*hut*), a very familiar phenomenon in Confucian circles.

Thus, in late Ming times the Jesuits had to play two very different roles that typologically belonged to two different spheres; on both scores they performed admirably, but it created an inner tension that never was dissolved.

Lay Christianity: "Exertion" and "Merit"

In the eyes of outsiders, Christianity was considered a demanding religion; its rules and obligations are "severe" (yan). One of the Fujian scholars declares that he would be prepared to embrace Christianity if its regulations were not so yan;⁴⁶ another recognizes its orthodoxy (zheng) but still hesitates because of its "severity."⁴⁷ Christian zealotry tends to provoke ridicule: outsiders often sneer at us when they see how we toil at observing the Ten Commandments and performing our religious duties like prayer, recitation, thanksgiving, and churchgoing.⁴⁸ Christians must realize that by their deviant behavior they differ from the crowd; conversion will surely lead to ridicule, but the convert should bear that mockery as a wholesome trial.⁴⁹

We may assume that in such passages an implicit comparison is made with the practice of lay Buddhism, which indeed was less demanding. From the Christian side we often hear the argument that Buddhists expect to be saved by the mechanical performance of outward rituals like the chanting of scriptures and kowtowing, whereas in Christianity such acts of worship always must be based upon genuine devotion and remorse.⁵⁰

In the practice of lay Christianity a central role was played by a well-defined set of spiritual exercises and observances that are subsumed under the term gongfu, "work, labor, exertion"; as we have seen, the same term was also used in Chan Buddhism for the "work" of meditation, and in Confucianism for the discipline of self-cultivation.⁵¹ However, although Christian Uterati fu Uy accepted the parallel with Confucian xiu shen, the Chan practice of silent meditation directed toward "gaining insight into one's [true] Mind" (ming xin) was rejected as being too passive. Mere self-reflection apart from practice is useless, like a mirror that does not reflect anything if placed in a dark, secluded room. Christian gongfu must be active, and based upon the constant

⁴⁶AZWC1VDIIP.

⁴¹SSL, I, 15*.

«ADAC, VI, 15'-16".

«55?, ??, 1--2».

⁵⁰Rg., SSE, I, 13'-13b; £yP, V 619-620.

⁵¹ADAC, II, 10" ("the gongfu of subduing the self"); *ibid.*, ("the gongfu of the Seven Victories"); *ibid.*, III, 5", and VI, 6'-6" ("the gongfu of meditation"); *ibid.*, Will, 31'-31" (applied to both recitation and meditation).

practice of self-cultivation and daÜy self-examination (ri xing, another Confucian key term).⁵²

In lay Christianity the aim of aÜ "exertion" is clearly defined: religious discipline and the performance of good works are directed toward the generation of "merit" (gong), a term that is constantly used in that context. Of course, the belief in the salutary effect of spiritual exercises, penance, and good works as a means to "lay up for thyself a treasure in heaven" (Matthew 6:20) was part of the European input. But it is significant that gong is a central concept in Chinese reÜgion as a whole, and in particular in lay Buddhism. In Mahâyâna lay Buddhism the primary aim of aÜ reÜgious acts is the production of merit (punya, gong) that by its positive force will eliminate the evil karma, cause weÜ-being in the present Ufe, and lead to a better rebirth, both for the devotee and for other beings. Such merit can be produced in many ways: by devotion, recitation, prayer, pious vows, self-mortification, pÜgrimage, etc., as weÜ as by rituals performed by priests on the devotee's request.

In late Ming times the conception of karmic retribution as a kind of balance of positive and negative acts had given rise to the widespread custom of daÜy recording one's good deeds and transgressions (quantified according to a system of positive and negative points) in a so-caÜed "ledger of merit and demerit" (gongguo ge, of Taoist origin, but later also practiced in Buddhist and Confucian circles).⁵³ In view of the pervasiveness of the custom, it is not surprising that Christians also engaged in a kind of moral administration, but considering their preoccupation with sin and repentance, it is interesting to note that according to Li Jiubiao Christians kept a register only of their sinful deeds, as a support for critical self-examination and remorse. The "worldly" type of gongguo ge is condemned, because noting down one's virtuous deeds as weÜ will only lead to laxity and arrogance.⁵⁴

However, in spite of its moral rigor, the Christian method of accumulating merit could be criticized by orthodox Confucians as being self-centered, since it is exclusively aimed at one's own salvation. In a discussion of Aleni with the staunchly Confucian former Grand Secre-

⁵²ADACVII, 22". The term rixing is derived from Analects 1.4: "I daÜy examine myself on three points," wu ri san xing wu shen.

⁵³For Aleni's criticism of the traditional Gongguo ge see his interesting conversation with a member of a Taoist association, as reported in KDRC, IV, 12*-12".

⁵⁴SSZ, III, 11".

tary Ye Xianggao (he had been a partisan of the Confucian moral rearmament movement known as the Donglin Party), Yeh remarks that we must do good for its own sake, not in order to be rewarded in the hereafter; we must avoid evil, but not for fear of punishment. We Confucians despise the Buddhists precisely because they are always talking about karmic retribution. Aleni's argument, viz., that the true believer simply acts with the purpose to fulfill the task that God has given him, not in order to be rewarded or to avoid punishment, may have been theologically sound, but hardly relevant for the average Christian. And when Aleni adds that, unfortunately, most people are unable to act so disinterestedly and therefore need reward and punishment as incentives, he comes dangerously close to a "pious opportunism" that sounds Buddhist rather than Christian.⁵⁵

A typical Christian dimension was added to the concept of gong by combining it with the theme of the free will, a subject that is often mentioned and apparently appealed to the imagination. God has endowed the human soul with the capacity to distinguish between good and evil, and that freedom of choice is his most precious gift. The human being has been created in such a way that he can opt for the good (ke wei shan),⁵⁶ not so that he necessarily will do so (ding wei shan). If man had been programmed, as it were, to do good, his gong would carry no merit, just as the fire does not earn any merit by being hot.⁵⁷ Gong requires a free choice and conscious effort.

Lay Christianity: Baptism and Confession

Of all the sacraments, two appear to have been regarded as most essential to lay Christians: those of Baptism (lingxi) and Confession-and-Absolution (gaofie, a contraction of gaozui and fiezui). It should be noted that our sources do not contain any reference to the sacrament of Matrimony; in Christian communities marriage apparently remained what it always had been—a private contract concluded between the heads of two households.

Baptism was essential, as it ritually confirmed one's admission to the Church and to the community of believers. It was the culminating point

⁵⁵SSZX, pp. 21'-24-.

⁵⁶ADACV, II"-12b.

⁵⁷SSZX, pp. 12b-14b.

of the whole process of adopting Christianity. In his pamphlet "Brief Introduction to the Holy Doctrine" (Shengjiao xiaoyin, 1633), Fan Zhong has given us a brief description of that process, as a standard procedure. It consists of three stages: (1) a preparatory phase expressing the aspirant's clean break with the past, followed by (2) a phase of study and instruction, and (3) baptism.

During the first phase, the aspirant formally abandons his heretical religion (xiejiao); he burns all his idols and "false scriptures" (wei feng), and solemnly renounces all superstitious rituals like (pagan) fasting, taboos, worship, and chanting. Whatever possessions he may illegally have acquired, he returns to the rightful owner; if he does not possess them any more, he shall compensate the owner; if the owner cannot be found or identified, the goods or the money shall be "offered to God," i.e., given to the poor.

During the phase of instruction he memorizes the "Essence of the Doctrine of the Lord of Heaven" (Tianzhu fiao yao), and especially the five holy texts, viz., the Paternoster (Tianzhu jing), the Ave Maria (Shengmu jing), the Credo (Xinjing), the Ten Commandments (Shijie), and the Prayer of the Holy Name (Shenghao jing).⁵⁸ After having memorized these texts he shall ask a missionary or an experienced believer to explain their meaning.

The third phase starts with a formal expression of remorse for all the aspirant's former sins and a solemn promise to observe all the Christian precepts, after which baptism takes place. Normally only a priest has the authority to administer it, but in exceptional situations (like imminent death) baptism can be performed by a literate layman who knows the ritual and is able to read the formulary, or even by a non-believer who can do the same. Only if no man, either Christian or pagan, is available, may a woman confer baptism.⁵⁹

Outsiders tended to be mystified by the use of holy water. A non-

⁵⁸Cf. Aleni's enumeration of the most basic Christian texts, which he compares to the Confucian Five Classics used in the state examinations: (1) the Credo; (2) the Ten Commandments; (3) The Fourteen Works of Mercy (i.e., J. Rho's AJXQ); (4) the Seven Victories (i.e., Didaco de Pantoja's QK); and (5) the Seven Sacraments. However, the texts actually memorized probably were limited to the standard liturgical texts as figuring in the *Symbolum apostolorum*; cf. Wang Zheng's preface to DYP (1621); his faith is based upon the *Xingbaolu* (*Symbolum*), and especially upon the Credo, of which D. de Pantoja had made a richly annotated version, posthumously published under the title *Pangzi yiqian*.

⁵⁹SZYF, pp. 7^a-8b.

Christian scholar remarks that "the water of the sea cannot wash away one's sins"—how could one drop of holy water do so? His suggestion that the Christian ritual is akin to the Buddhist sprinkling of water with willow-twigs is indignantly repudiated by Aleni: Christian holy water may outwardly look like ordinary water, but it contains a spiritual power (shenneng) that eliminates sin.⁶⁰

Baptism, though essential, was a one-time experience. For the actual practice of religion, the sacrament of confession-and-absolution was even more important, firstly, because the believer was expected to make his confession at regular intervals, whenever he had the opportunity to do so, and, secondly, because it conformed to a familiar pattern: as is well known, confession and self-accusation have a long tradition in China, both within and outside the religious sphere. In any case, the fact that the complex of sin, remorse, confession, and absolution looms so large in our texts warrants the conclusion that Chinese Christians regarded it as one of the most essential religious obligations.

Li Jiugong treats confession-and-absolution as a spiritual exercise in self-purification, almost in a mechanical way. Confession should be performed as frequently as possible. First one confesses the most grievous sins; after these have been forgiven, one turns to the lighter ones. In this way one progresses from day to day, till one is free from sins. It is useful to note down the more serious sins one has committed, and to confess them again.⁶¹ Fan Zhong adds that if no priest is available, the believer can also obtain God's forgiveness by self-accusation (zisong) and sincere repentance.⁶² The obvious resemblance to Buddhist rituals of penance (chan) is disclaimed by Yang Tingyun; according to him Buddhist penance is no more than a routinized outward ritual, not based upon genuine self-examination. He also aptly observes that in Buddhist chan sins are confessed in very general terms, whereas Christian confession relates to specific sinful acts committed by the individual believer.⁶³

The marked prominence of confession and absolution is, of course, directly related to the Christian preoccupation with the wages of sin: the expectation of divine retribution in the hereafter, and the severity of God's verdict, which is absolute and irrevocable. Outsiders may be

e.KDRC, \, & - & .

"SSZ, 1,9*- 10'.

62SJXY, pp. 8b-9".

65DFP, II, 624-625.

amazed at this severity, but both Li Jiugong and Zhu Zongyuan are uncompromising on this point: good is good and bad is bad; there is no intermediate zone. Therefore, reward and punishment are completely separated; unlike worldly justice, there is no gradual scale of rewards and punishments in the hereafter.⁶⁴ More than anything else, the belief in sin, expiation, and retribution appears to have colored the religious life of the Chinese Christians. The canonical Confucian expression *wei Han*, "standing in awe of Heaven," which they used so often, in their case had acquired a much more pregnant meaning—they *walked in the Fear of God*.

Meditation, Self-examination, and Asceticism

Our texts contain some interesting data about spiritual disciplines to which at least some Chinese believers subjected themselves. Here again we are dealing with a cross-cultural hybrid. There are echoes of the Jesuit Spiritual Exercises, and a clear influence of de Pantoja's work about the "Seven Victories [over the Seven Cardinal Sins]" (Qike, 1614). On the other hand, there also were indigenous Chinese roots: Christian meditation shows some affinity to Confucian "quiet-sitting" (*jingzuo*); the chanting of sacred texts and the more rigorous forms of Christian asceticism at least formally resemble the Buddhist practices of psalmody and self-mortification.

Meditation (*moxiang*) is said to be a "spiritual labor" (*shengong*) that has to be performed daily as a work of spiritual purification. It is not necessary to do it at dawn or at the end of the day (a clear reference to Confucian *jingzuo*), but one must select a time when one is not burdened by any business, and when one's thoughts are pure.⁶⁵ From the texts we can get an impression of the themes that were used as subjects for meditation. One such text enumerates the following seven themes: (1) God is your great Father, so serve him with perfect filial piety and sincerity; (2) All men are your younger and elder brothers, whom you must love and help; (3) Your former sins are a pitfall, so take care not to fall into it again; (4) Worldly wealth and status are a temporary halting-place that you will have to leave soon; (5) Your worldly af-

⁶⁴SSZIII, W-IQh;DKW, p. 16".

⁶⁵SSZ, I, 9".

"Ibid., pp. 8b-9'.

fairs are basicUy unimportant, so do not burden your spirit with them; (6) Time passes fast, like an arrow or a wave; (J) God's peace is your most precious possession.⁶⁶

It is useful to combine meditation with reciting sacred texts (song, nian; both terms are very common in Buddhist ritual). According to Aleni, this combination of meditation and chanting has three salutary effects: it liUs the memory with edifying subjects; it stimulates the understanding of right principles, and it arouses the right emotions.⁶⁷ The recital of holy scriptures (no doubt the memorized standard texts mentioned above, such as the Paternoster and the Credo) is also an effective way to close off the mind; no evU thoughts wiU arise when one is "chanting facing the Lord" (dui zhu chi song; i.e., in front of an image?).⁶⁸

This type of meditation was directed toward quiet recoUection. More rigorous forms of discipline are denoted by the term &e/;>,"self-control" or "subduing the self," an expression derived from the weU-known Lunyu phrase keji fu li, "to subdue oneself and to return to the Rites." It originaUy referred to the Confucian discipline of moral self-cultivation, but in Christian usage it was much more associated with sin and penance, and therefore with acts of abstinence and bodUy mortification. The concept of ke, "subduing," acquires the meaning of "forceful suppression." Aleni says so very explicitly in the statement made in the Doctrine of the Mean that "following human nature is caUed the Way" (shuai xing zhi wei dao); he would like to replace shuai, "to foUow," by ke: the Way consists in rigorously subduing human nature.⁶⁹ And elsewhere: "Subdue [your nature], again and again!" (ke zhi you ke zhi).⁷⁰ Much more than in Confucianism where asceticism is mainly associated with deep mourning and not with the expiation of sins, this Christian keji took the form of bodUy abstention and discipline.

Fasting (zhai, a weU-known practice in Chinese religion from time immemorial; in Buddhism especiaUy associated with vegetarianism) formed a regular part of Christian reUgious life; if duly combined with the awareness of one's sins and with remorse, it was considered a form of keji. In his Di zui zheng gui, "Correct Rules for the Ablution of Sin," a text which in spite of its prescriptive nature is clearly adapted to Chi-

⁶⁷ADACVIII, 31'-31b.

⁶⁸SZYF1P^.

⁶⁹ADACH, 10".

⁷⁰ibld., p. 10'.

nese circumstances, Aleni not only mentions the regular rules of abstinence to be observed during Lent and on every Friday, but also special and generally more severe kinds of fasting, specifically aimed at the expiation of sinful deeds. They include acts of disciplinary fasting imposed by the priest as a way of penance, as well as voluntary fasting practiced as a form of asceticism, such as abstaining from cooked food or from food altogether for a couple of days.⁷¹ Such self-imposed fasting was probably aimed at the fulfillment of a vow (*fa yuan*), a very common Chinese religious custom. However, as is to be expected, a sharp distinction was made between the Christian practice and the Buddhist one, the latter being branded "superstitious" because it was combined with the belief in rebirth.⁷²

Not infrequently far more rigorous types of asceticism are mentioned. The Chinese Christians had the examples to follow near at hand, for the mortification of the flesh was extensively practiced in contemporary Europe, as well as by some Jesuit missionaries in China. In his Chinese biography, Aleni himself is said to have regularly done so, in the dead of night, "chastising himself with a whip and confessing his sins on behalf of other people, in order to appease the Lord's anger,"⁷³ and some missionaries were especially noted for their asceticism.

It was certainly also practiced by Chinese converts. Especially in Fujian, believers are said often to have "indulged in long and bloody disciplines, carrying iron chains," to such an extent that Aleni had to restrain them.⁷⁴ He had to do the same with the young zealot Zhang Shi when the latter had made the vow to chastise his body with no less than a thousand lashes during the forty days of Lent.⁷⁵ Yang Tingyun is praised for having slept in an upright position and having worn a coarse rope-belt for years.⁷⁶ Not everybody engaged in such feats of bodily penance: Fan Zhong admits that he himself does not have the will-power or the courage to do so, but he expresses his admiration for some of his "friends in the Doctrine" (*zaijiao wujiao*), who "subdue themselves by mortification" (*ku shen keji*) by rigorous fasting, flagellation, wearing a

⁷¹OZZG, IV, 13"-14".

⁷²DATT, pp. 21'-21".

⁷³S/AX, p. 7b.

⁷⁴Cf. Aloys Pfister, *Notices biographiques et bibliographiques sur les Jésuites de l'ancienne mission de Chine* (2 vols.; Shanghai, 1932-1934), II 132.

⁷⁵ZS, p. 3".

⁷⁶FOFC, p. 9".

horsehair shirt or rags and a bronze girdle (tongdai: chains?); by sitting and sleeping on the floor, eating coarse food, and observing sexual abstinence.⁷⁷ Even though such acts of chastising the flesh were no doubt confined to a minority among the believers, they must have contributed to the general image of Christianity as a "severe" (yan) religion.

Outward Signs of Christian Faith

One of the arguments against the allegation that Christianity was a subversive sect was that Christians did not conceal their faith: both the missionaries and their converts were said to practice it openly. The sources confirm that this was indeed the case. Even from the outside the home of a Christian family could be recognized, for Christians shared in the general Chinese custom of marking their front doors with auspicious and protective signs or images: they mostly used the sign of the cross for that purpose,⁷⁸ but we also hear of Christians marking their doors using "paper-cut characters."⁷⁹

Inside the house Christians kept one or more icons ("holy images," shengxiang), either separately or combined with the ancestral altar," on a pure spot in the house," for daily worship, recital, and prayer.⁸⁰ Several types of religious images were used: God the Father and Jesus in different representations and the Virgin with Child; occasionally we also hear of images of angels and patron saints.⁸¹ Very little of all this has been preserved, probably as a result of the prohibition of Christianity in 1724; the only late Ming Christian image that has undoubtedly been used as an icon is the curious hybrid (a mixture of the Virgin with Chū and the white-robed Guanyin) known as the "Madonna of Laufer."⁸²

⁷⁷SDFIP¹¹.

¹⁸Ibid., p. 9¹.

¹According to the record of the judicial interrogation of A. Vagnoni and others, Nanjing, 1616; cf. PXJ, I, 22¹.

¹⁰SZYF, p. 9¹.

⁸¹Cf. DFP, II, 590-592: the Lord of Heaven represented as ruler of the universe, or suffering on the cross, or as one of the Trinity; the Virgin depicted with bambino; LXYf, ?, I'-2", II, 2h-4b and 12'-12b: icons used in exorcism and faith-healing; *ibid.*, II, 21'-22' and 47b-49': pictures of guardian angels; *ibid.*, II, 31'-32b: picture of one's patron saint.

⁸²Cf. Pasquale M. d'Elia, *Le origini dell'arte cristiana in Cina (1582-1640)* (Rome, 1939), p. 51. The painting forms part of the Berthold Laufer collection in the Field Museum of Natural History, Chicago.

Several kinds of privately owned, distinctively Christian objects and substances, used in the cult or for magical protection, are mentioned in our sources, and especially in edifying tales and miracle stories. They include holy water, rosaries, amulets (mostly representing the Agnus Dei), and crucifixes.

In observing the outward signs of Christian faith, outsiders must have been struck by the custom of making the sign of the cross (*hua sheng-hao*), described as "touching the forehead, the breast and the mouth"; it was considered a powerful protection against evil of all kinds.⁸⁵ Li Jiu-gong tells us that unbelievers laugh at the Christians who cross themselves "when leaving and entering [their homes], at meals and before lying down [to sleep]";⁸⁴ Yang Tingyun adds that they also do so before undertaking any important action.⁸⁵ Yang himself is said to have successfully used it in his home town to subdue a demon who possessed a spirit-medium. As usual, the medium transmitted the demon's messages by writing with the planchette. As soon as Yang had made the sign of the cross, the planchette-brush stopped writing. After the demon had been asked why he did so, the brush reacted by writing, in large characters, *wei tian*: "I fear Heaven!"⁸⁶

Herewith we have entered the sphere of "Christian magic," a twilight zone in which Christian practices merged with those of Chinese traditional religion.

Magic and Miracles

At first sight, here we are far removed from the so-called Confucian rationality and its stated principle of "keeping away from the supernatural." We should, however, keep in mind that although the Confucian orthodoxy, as defined above, did not cover the area of exorcism, faith-healing, and direct communication with the unseen powers, it did not proscribe them either, as long as they did not threaten the moral order.

⁸⁵DATT, pp. 23b-24".
"LXYf, II, 6b.

⁸⁵DFP, II, 628-630. According to Yang, the Buddhists have plagiarized the Christian cross and changed it into the swastika.
"6LXYJ, II, 6".

At all times literati have felt free to make use of religious professionals and magical techniques without feeling that they in any way were betraying their Confucian principles.

Within the limits of this paper it is impossible to do justice to this aspect of late Ming Christianity. For the general features I may refer to my preliminary paper published many years ago,⁸⁷ but the subject deserves a much more extensive treatment. The information is mainly found in a number of quotations from four now lost collections of Christian edifying and miraculous tales; the quotations have been preserved in a single late Ming manuscript.

The first main theme of the stories, most of which are situated in various places in Fujian, is the superior saving power of Christian practices as compared with corresponding traditional Chinese exorcistic and healing techniques. Demons that possess or terrorize their victims are chased away by the superior spiritual power (*ling*) of Christian prayer, holy objects, and the recital of sacred texts; patients suffering from grave disease are miraculously cured by the same means; people escape from disasters through divine inspiration or the use of Christian talismans. The second main theme concerns the direct experience of supernatural truth, basically in two ways (both of which are deeply rooted in Chinese religious lore): the revelation of divine texts or messages, and stories about revival from temporary death, in which a resurrected Christian reports about his experiences in the hereafter, sometimes in remarkable detail.

These materials show us a glimpse of what must have been the reality of Christian life outside the narrow circle of the few Jesuits and their scholarly friends. The milieu is purely Chinese; the foreign missionaries play only a marginal role. The stories form the expression of a simple belief in the power of the Lord of Heaven and the efficacy of its rituals, and conversion is not the result of subtle theological reasoning, but of the down-to-earth awareness that "it works."

The modern reader is tempted to view these beliefs and practices as characteristic of "popular," non-elite Christianity, but that would be quite wrong. Also on the level of Christian literati, the supernatural and the miraculous were fully accepted. There are some statements that

⁸⁷Cf. E. Zürcher, "The Lord of Heaven and the Demons: Strange Stories from a Late Ming Christian Manuscript," in *Religion und Philosophie in Ostasien. Festschrift für Hans Steiniger zum 65. Geburtstag* (Würzburg, 1985), pp. 357-376.

show how much value they attached to "faith" (xin), a value that does not rank high in Confucianism. We ourselves do not know what is good or bad, so we must fully surrender to God's intentions.⁸⁸ The attempt rationally to understand God's mysteries is like trying to know about the light by looking into the sun—it will only produce blindness.⁸⁹ Li Jiugong is most outspoken: we must first believe and understand afterwards, and not the other way round; faith is what leads us (yin) to understanding, and understanding is the reward (bao) of faith.⁹⁰

Social Values and Social Action

As we have seen, the Confucian moral orthodoxy, zheng, had as its core area the ordering of state and society on the basis of the Three Bonds, the Five Human Relations, and the Five Constant Virtues. This was not conceived of as a Utopian ideal to be realized in the distant future (in fact, any kind of millenarian doctrine was considered highly subversive). In spite of sordid reality, it was assumed that these basic social values were already in principle embodied in the hierarchical order of society as it was. Any doctrine advocating fundamental political or social change would therefore place itself outside the pale of moral orthodoxy.

The fact that Christianity was presented as standing firmly on the side of zheng also implied that it claimed fully to conform to Confucian social and political values, and to contribute to their realization. This acceptance of the socio-political status quo is amply borne out by our sources.

In the ritual sphere, the converts were allowed to continue the funerary and commemorative rites in honor of their ancestors; although their intention was changed (prayers and sacrifice no longer being offered to the ancestor's souls, but to God for their benefit), the ceremonial remained substantially the same. Converted literati could go on performing their ritual duties in the temple of Confucius and, if they were officials, take part in state ceremonials, provided they did so with the right intention: they should honor Confucius as a great man, and re-

⁸⁸SSZIII12"-12".

⁸⁹SSLX, pp. 29*-29b.

⁹⁰SSZ, I, 5'.

gard the sacrificial rites of the state religion as actualy being directed toward the Lord of Heaven. Of course, the grand imperial sacrifices to Heaven and Earth were accepted as legitimate (and interpreted as an expression of the emperor's "public-spirited," gong, concern for the well-being of the people, and therefore basicly different from superstitious prayers that only serve private interests, si). On the other hand, it is stated that the Chinese Christians' worship of the Lord of Heaven is not sacrilegious; it is true that only the emperor is authorized to sacrifice to Heaven, but the Christian cult is an act of gratitude (bao) and not a sacrifice (Ji).⁹¹

As regards the hierarchical ordering of society, the Christian values in general conformed to the orthodox pattern. It is, for example, significant that the second part of Li Jiugong's "Record of Reflections" (Shensi lu, ca. 1670), which deals with social behavior, consists of quite traditional observations without any sign of Christian influence, whereas the content of the first and third sections, "About Heaven" and "About Myself," is distinctively Christian. The degree to which the existing social hierarchy is accepted is aptly illustrated by Aleni's explanation of the Fourth Commandment, "Honour thy father and thy mother." The obligations due to one's parents are here extended to cover all kinds of seniors and superiors; altogether they form a picture of impeccable orthodoxy. The list of sinful acts (you zui) includes, among others, the cases of inferiors not submitting to their superiors; pupils disobeying their teacher; subjects violating the laws of the authorities (guanfu); slaves and servants lacking in respect toward their masters, etc. On the other hand, the master of the house commits a sin if he maltreats his slaves and servants, and the husband if he does not provide his wife with her daily necessities.⁹²

In the same way, social inequality is not only accepted but most explicitly justified: such distinctions are natural, like the qualitative difference between head and feet in the human body; if there were no poor,

⁹¹ADAC, LTI, 2 lb-22"; DAIT, p. 6'. It is not explained why priests, who do "sacrifice" to the Lord of Heaven (the Mass is called misaji), do not infringe upon the imperial prerogative.

⁹²DZZG, I, 14b-16'. The important role of traditional social values in Christian life is also clearly illustrated by Fan Zhong's four "rules that must be observed" (SIXY, pp. 5b-7"). Apart from the first rule, which enjoins the worship of the one true God, the other three are (2) obediently serving one's parents, elder brothers, seniors, and teachers; (3) not harming others, in accordance with the impulsive good mind Qiangxiri that is part of our fundamental nature (benxing), and (4) being frugal in every respect and not abusing one's authority as an official.

who would be wiUing to perform hard and humble labor?, and, with an interesting theological legitimation: if everybody were weU-to-do, how would the rich have an opportunity to gain merit by charity?⁹³

There is, however, one important exception to the general acceptance of the social structure—the absolute prohibition of polygamy, i.e., of taking a concubine. On this point no accommodation was possible; the standard reason for taking a concubine, viz., to get male offspring when the marriage remained chUdless or only produced daughters, was rejected in no uncertain terms, and baptism was conferred only after the aspirant had sent away his concubine(s). We know of several cases in which baptism was withheld from very promising candidates untU they had done so. Wang Zheng, the "piUar of the faith" in Shaanxi, was even for some time excommunicated because at an advanced age he had taken a concubine. He was admitted again only after having sent her away and having written a statement of self-criticism—a curious document that has survived.⁹⁴

It is possible that in this respect Christianity to some extent has improved the position of women, although in many cases the disposal of the concubine may have only worsened her situation. In any case it may be significant that Aleni's "list of sins" mentioned above does not include female insubordination. As regards polygamy, he also makes some interesting statements: man and woman are absolutely equal as far as their souls are concerned; that women are less intelligent than men is only the result of their physical endowment; being chUdless has nothing to do with lack of filial piety; and, most surprisingly, if being childless is caused by the man's physical condition, would the woman then be entitled to take a second husband?⁹⁵

Thus, with the exception of concubinage, Christianity did not represent a threat to the existing social order and to Confucian moral orthodoxy. On the contrary, Christianity, being zheng, actively contributes to its realization. This argument is often used by spokesmen of Christianity and occasionally even by sympathetic outsiders: Christianity furthers the "civUizing influence" (jiaohua); it teaches people to be fiUal, loyal,

⁹³ADAC, II 20"-21b, and LV, 4'-5b.

⁹⁴It is appended to Adam Schall's (Tang Ruowang) collection of edifying tales, "Daily Record [made at] the Chongyi Church," Chongyi tang riß suibi (Xi'an, 1638).

⁹⁵ADAC, II, 28'-29S and IV, 22b-23'. Cf. also DKW, 37"-39": Mencius' statement that "having no posterity is the most grievous form of lack of filial piety" refers to one particular case and cannot be generalized.

and law-abiding, and to fulfill all their social and ritual obligations. It can support the government in its fight against subversive sectarian movements.

The argument that Christianity is a civilizing force is often backed up by referring to the European situation, as it had been described by the Jesuits in Utopian terms: ever since its conversion to Christianity, Europe had been a region of peace, prosperity, and perfect social order.⁹⁶ And as far as western social ethics ("the Study of Norms," *yili zhi xue*) are concerned, the basic categories are identical with those of the Confucian Great Learning: self-cultivation (*xiu shen*), regulating the family (*qijia*), and pacifying the AU-under-Heaven (*ping tian*).⁹⁷ "Thus western scholars have found all the right procedures, in every detail, for [the implementation of] the Three Bonds, the Five Constant Virtues, and the Five Human Relations."⁹⁸ The argument sounded convincing and promising; Xu Guangqi even proposed "to try it out" in one township—you see that it works!

The most remarkable manifestation of Christian principles used to disseminate Confucian orthodox values is the "Book of the Warning Bell" (*Duoshu*, 1641) by Han Lin, the leading Christian scholar in Jiangzhou (Southern Shanxi). It is a Christian (or rather "Confucian monotheistic") explanation, written in semi-vernacular language, of the six moral injunctions proclaimed by the first Ming emperor and known as the "Six Maxims" (*Uu yan*) or the "Sacred Edict" (*shengyu*). They were universally used as an instrument of elementary Confucian indoctrination, to be memorized by the whole population. In the late Ming the Six Maxims had to be recited and explained every fortnight at the meetings of the "Community Covenant" (*xiangyue*) in every district and township in the empire.

Han Lin's Christian exegesis of the Six Maxims was not just a private initiative: he had been invited to write it by the prefect of Jiangzhou to improve the morals of the local population, and its publication was

⁹⁶For the acceptance of this idealized image of Europe see E. Zürcher, "A Complement," esp. pp. 77-80. Zhu Songyuan's positive reaction to this glorified Great West (*Taixi*) is reflected by a lengthy passage in *DKW*, pp. 50b-51b, which may be unique in premodern Chinese literature: the West is superior to China on seven points, ranging from noble customs and universal peace and order to technology and international commerce.

⁹⁷*IXXF*, pp. 40-41.

⁹⁸"Letter to a fellow-villager," *Da xiangren shu*, in Xu Mouxi, *Zengding Xu Wending gong* (Taipei, 1962), chap. 1, p. 13; not in *XGQf*, since the compiler Wang Zhongmin questions its authenticity, on rather flimsy grounds.

sponsored by no less than eighteen officials and literati, none of whom is known to have been Christian. Their patronage clearly indicates that they indeed appreciated Han Lin's Christian principles for their "civiUzing influence."

It is not possible here to treat the content of Han Lin's "Warning BeU"; I may refer to the summary I have published elsewhere.⁹⁹ Han Lin extensively Ulustrates each maxim with a mixture of arguments and examples taken from Christian and Confucian lore. Irrespective of the question whether it ever actually was used in xiangyue meetings (it probably was not), it remains the most explicit expression of Christianity bolstering traditional values—here it has become integrated into the very heart of Confucian orthodoxy.

But Confucian orthodoxy did not stop at moral indoctrination. "Caring for the people" had at least ideaUy always been one of the objectives of the Confucian order. Organized charity had started in Buddhist circles, and remained an important area of Buddhist activity, but it was partly taken over by non-Buddhist pManthropists, and especially in late Ming times there were many "Societies of Doing Good" (zuoshan hut) of Confucian inspiration.¹⁰⁰ Also in this respect Christianity created its own varieties of existing practice.

Almost from the start, the Jesuits had encouraged their converts to set up lay congregations (hui) after the European model, and this foreign seed no doubt found fertile soil in an environment that was teeming with clubs, societies, and associations of every description, most of which also had a religious dimension. We have many references to Christian associations, set up by pious Christians, also at their own initiative. Sometimes, as in the rather well-documented case of Yang Tingyun, a former Buddhist charitable society would be transformed into a Christian one after the leader had been converted.¹⁰¹ In aU known cases, the inspiration for the Christian element in charitable activity was provided by the "Seven [Corporal] Works of Mercy," as described in Jacobus Rho's "Explanation of the Practice of Mercy" (Aijin xingquan, 1631).

The information about most of such voluntary associations is fragmentary, but in one case—the "Humanitarian Society" founded by Wang

⁹⁹Cf. Zürcher, "A Complement."

¹⁰⁰Cf. Joanna E. Handlin-Smith, "Benevolent Societies: The Reshaping of Charity during the Late Ming and Early Ch'ing," *JAOS*, 45 (1987), 309-337.

¹⁰¹Cf. Standaert, *op. cit.*, pp. 74 and 84-90.

Zheng in Xi'an—the complete statutes have been preserved (Renhui yue, 1633). The program of activities is formally derived from the Seven Corporal Works of Mercy as expounded by Rho, but in actual practice it is limited to the three main functions of traditional Chinese charity: feeding the hungry, attending the sick, and the burial of abandoned corpses. Membership is open to all classes, including simple peasants, merchants, and artisans; women may contribute but cannot become members, and Buddhist and Taoist monks are excluded. Wang Zheng realizes that his society is a modest local initiative, but in the last paragraph of the statutes he develops a grand vision. In due time more and more renhui of this (Christian) type will be set up in all the provinces; the authorities will come to recognize their excellence and grant financial support, and in the end the network will even be highly appreciated by the emperor. Thus the renhui will serve the twofold purpose of spreading the message of Christian charity and contributing to general well-being and public morality.¹⁰²

Conclusion: The Two Faces of Late Ming Christianity

In the course of the last thirty years, the study of the early Chinese response to Christianity has largely been concentrated upon what here has been called "the critical dialogue with Confucianism." The focus is understandable and justifiable, but it has produced a somewhat unbalanced picture. It has highlighted the role played by the Jesuits as *xiru*, "literati from the west," and their most prominent scholarly converts, their attempts to accommodate Christianity to the Confucian worldview, and the positive and negative responses. This is, of course, an essential aspect. The dialogue produced a sophisticated and highly original hybrid: a monotheistic and puristic version of Confucianism, strongly opposed to Buddhism, Taoism, and popular "superstition." In some parts of this paper I have tried to do justice to the importance of that scholarly dialogue.

However, that is by no means the whole story—the conventional image is incomplete and has to be filled in by highlighting the other face of early Chinese Christianity. The Jesuits were not only "literati from the west," they also were double "sacerdotes"; their converts were

¹⁰²ZZZF, p. 9".

not only Confucian disciples but also devotees; Christianity was not just an intellectual construct but a living minority religion, a complex of beliefs, rituals, prayer, magic, icons, private piety, and communal celebration. In that whole sphere of religious practice Christianity was by no means a semi-Confucian hybrid; in fact, in all respects it came much closer to devotional Buddhism than to Confucianism.

Thus, in the Chinese elite environment, Christianity had to combine two roles that were almost incompatible. As a doctrine, expressed at a high level of philosophical and theological articulation, it could act as a "complement to Confucianism"; as a religion, it was bound to show close analogies to precisely those indigenous beliefs and practices which they rejected as superstitious. It could not confine itself to one of those two spheres as Confucianism and Buddhism did; true to its nature as a monotheistic Mediterranean religion, it had to encompass both. The two faces of early Chinese Christianity constituted an internal contradiction that never was solved, and that no doubt has contributed to its final breakdown in the early eighteenth century.

Abbreviations

- AJXQ = Aijin xingquan, "Explanation of the Works of Mercy," by Giacomo Rho (Luo Yagu), 3j-, 1633.
- BJL Bian jiao lun, "On Distinguishing the [True] Doctrine," short (6 fols.) apologetic treatise by Duan Gun and Han Lin, Jiangzhou, c. 1630.
- DCWX = Tianzhujiao dongchuan wenxian, "Documents concerning the Spread of Christianity to the East," Zhongguo shixue congshu (Taipei, 1965).
- DKW = Da kewen, "Answers to a Guest's Questions," by Zhu Zongyuan, c. 1631 (the edition used dates from 1697, with a preface by Lin Wenying).
- DS Duoshu, "Book of the Warning BeU," by Han Lin, Jiangzhou, c. 1640; modern edition by Chen Yuan, based upon the Zikawei copy, Beijing, 1919-
- DYP Dai yi pian, "Instead of Doubting," apologetical treatise by Yang Tingyun; preface by Lin Qi dated 1621. Reproduced in DCWX, pp. 471-631.

- DYXP = Daiyi xupian, sequel to DYP, also by Yang Tingyun, 2 j., revised by Zhang Geng, 1635. Manuscript copy, Bibliothèque Nationale (Courant no. 7111).
- DZZG = Di zui zheng gui, "Correct Rules for the Ablution of Sins," by Giulio Aleni (Ai Rulüe), Aj.; first edition c. 1627; the edition used is a reprint of 1847.
- JJ fujie, "Memorial of Apology," by Dídaco de Pantoja (Pang Diwo) and Sabbathino de Ursis (Xiong Sanba), 1616. Manuscript copy, Bibliothèque Nationale (Courant no. 7321).
- KDRC = Kouduo richao, "Diary of Oral Admonitions"; sermons and conversations of Giulio Aleni and three other missionaries, recorded by Li Jiubiao, 8/.; prefaces dated 1631, 1632, and 1633, but covering the period 1630-1640.
- LXGJ = Ling xi gao jie yao gui, "Essential Rules for Baptism and Confession," short (10 fols.) treatise by Zhang Geng. Manuscript, Bibliothèque Nationale (Courant no. 7249).
- LXYJ = Li xiu yi jian, "A Mirror Exhorting to [Self-]cultivation," compiled by Li Jiugong, 2 j.; the second jian known only from a single manuscript copy (Courant no. 6878). Compiler's preface dated 1639.
- MSJY = Misa ji yi, "The Meaning of the Mass Sacrifice," by Giulio Aleni (Ai Rulüe), 2j.; first edition Fuzhou, 1629; the edition used is a reprint of 1843.
- PXJ Po xieji, "Collected Documents for the Destruction of Heresy," collection of anti-Christian materials compiled by Xu Changzhi, 8j., 1639/1640. Japanese edition of 1855.
- PZYQ = Pangzi yiquan, "Posthumous Explanations by Master Pang," extensive explanation of the Credo by Dídaco de Pantoja (Pang Diwo), published shortly after his death in 1618.
- QK Qi ke, "The Seven Victories," by Dídaco de Pantoja (Pang Diwo), 1624; in TXCH (1624; Taipei reprod. Vol. III, pp. 689-1126).

- RHY = Renhui yue, "Statutes of the Humanitarian Society," by Wang Zheng (Xi'an, 1634).
- SJAX = SijiAi xiansheng xingji, biography of Giulio Aleni by Li Sixuan, shortly after 1640. Two slightly different manuscript copies from Bibliothèque Nationale (Courant nos. 1016 and 1017-1).
- SJSG = Shengjiao si gui, "Four Rules of the Holy Doctrine" (viz., Mass, Fasting, Confession, and Eucharist), by Francesco Brancati (Pan Guoguang), c. 1662.
- SJXY = [Tianzhu] shengjiao xiaoyin, "Brief Introduction to the Holy Doctrine," a short (11 fols.) treatise in vernacular by Fan Zhong (Hangzhou, first edition 1633).
- SSL = Shensi lu, "A Record of Reflections," by Li Jiugong, posthumously collected and published by his son Li Yifen, 3 j. (Fuzhou, c. 1670).
- SSLX = Sanshan lun xueji, "Record of Discussions on Learning [held in] Sanshan (= Fuzhou)," by Giulio Aleni (Ai Ruliie); first edition shortly after 1627; the edition used here is the reprint (Macao, 1847) reproduced in WXXB, Vol. I, pp. 419-493.
- TXCH = Tianxue chuhan, "First Portfolio of [Texts about] Heavenly Studies," collection of texts about Christianity and European science, compiled by Li Zhizao, 1628; photographic reprint, Taipei, 1965 (Zhongguo shixue congshu), 6 vols.
- TZSP = Tianzhu shenpan mingzheng, "Clear Evidence of Divine Judgment," brief pamphlet (6 fols.) recording the experience of the revived Yan Doubin in the hereafter, noted down by his son Yan Weisheng, 1640.
- WXXB = Tianzhu jiao dongchuan wenxian xubian, continuation of DCWX, 3 vols., Taipei, 1966 (Zhongguo shixue congshu).
- WTAR = Wei Tian ai renji lun, "On the Highest Principles of Fearing Heaven and Loving Human Beings," by Wang Zheng; preface by Zheng Man dated 1628. Manuscript, Bibliothèque Nationale (Courant no. 6868).

- XGQJ = Xu Guangqi ji, "Collected Works of Xu Guangqi," edited by Wang Zhongmin (Beijing, 1963).
- XXF = Xixuefan, "General Survey of Studies in the West," by Giulio Aleni (Ai Rulüe); first edition 1623; included in TXCH (1628); reprint, Taipei, 1972 (Zhongguo shixue congshu).
- YQYX = Yan Qiyuan xiansheng chaoxing shiji, "The Transcendent Facts Concerning Master Yang Qiyuan"; Christian biography of Yang Tingyun (1557-1627), by Ding Zhilin, c. 1630. Manuscript, Bibliothèque Nationale (Courant no. 3051-C).
- XSWB = Xing shi wen pian; polemical tract containing twenty-six critical questions about all kinds of superstitious ideas and practices. Anonymous. Bibliothèque Nationale (Courant no. 7100-11).
- ZP**= [Shengchao] zuo pi, "An Aid to Exposure"; an anti-Christian treatise by Xu Dashou, c. 1624; in PXJ, j. IV.
- ZS**= Zhang Shi; the hagiographic account of the life of "Michael" Zhang Shi, who died c. 1624, aged 19; by Xiong Shiqi and Zhang Fu. Manuscript, Bibliothèque Nationale (Courant no. 1098).
- TYZD = Tui yuan zheng dao lun, a short tract by A. Vagnoni, edited (jiao) by Xu Guangqi (before 1616 because here Vagnoni is still called Wang Yiyuan; after the persecution he called himself Gao Yizhi). Bibliothèque Nationale (Courant 7100-1).

BRINGING CHRIST TO THE NATIONS:
SHIFTING MODELS OF MISSION
AMONG JESUITS IN CHINA

BY

Jean-Paul Wiest*

Introduction

From the late nineteenth century on, one of the striking differences between the work of Protestant and Roman Catholic missionaries in China was the greater emphasis placed by Protestants on developing Christian institutions of higher education. For the Catholic Church, the legacy of the condemnation of the Chinese Rites by Rome in 1742 had been the forsaking of Matteo Ricci and his Jesuit companions' efforts to convert China from the top down. Catholic missionaries became mostly interested in the masses of China, not in its intelligentsia. It was not until around the time of the First Plenary Council held in Shanghai in 1924 that the hierarchy of the Catholic Church again began to attach importance to higher education, but by then rising nationalism made the opening of schools under western auspices very difficult.

There had been, however, one major exception. Since their return to China in 1842, the French Jesuits professed that Ricci's methods of evangelization, although "indirect" in nature, were "the most effective of all because they allowed missionaries to influence the highest circles of the Chinese society."¹ This led, in 1903, to the launching of Zhendan University in Shanghai. The Jesuits aimed at providing Chinese youth with a first-rate higher education in a Christian environment and, by the same token, at providing Chinese society with an elite that would be Catholic or at least well disposed toward Christianity.

*Mr. Wiest is Research Director of the Center for Mission Research and Study at Maryknoll, New York.

¹Joseph de la Serviere, *Histoire de la Mission du Kiang-Nan* (2 vols.; Zikawei, Shanghai, 1914), I, 41. See also *Lettres des Nouvelles Missions de la Chine, 1841-1868* [hereafter cited as LNM] (Lithography, n.p., n.d.), II, 317, letter of Poissemeux, January 30, 1850. The term "indirect evangelization" refers to means, other than direct preaching, used by missionaries to draw non-Christian people's attention and interest.

Yet, as this paper will show, the (indirect) missionary approach adopted by the Jesuits of Zhendan was based on an understanding of mission substantially different from that of their confreres of the sixteenth, seventeenth, and eighteenth centuries in China. The disparity of missionary styles between the two groups is striking. What was the significance of these shifts in the Roman Catholic Church's understanding of itself and its mission and how did they affect the coming of age of an indigenous Chinese Catholic Church?

I. Models and Images of Mission

Over the centuries, missionaries have been motivated by different perceptions of their role and have used countless means and ways to expand the influence of Christianity. A closer look at these various understandings and styles of mission reveals, however, that they are all variations or refinements of three basic models associated with three distinct images.²

The model most prevalent during the Middle Ages was that of the crusader. The crusades were special armies dispatched outside the frontiers of Christendom by the pope and the European kings to confront, repel, and subjugate by force people labeled as infidels. The conquistadors of the sixteenth century were just a later version of the alliance between the cross and the sword to push further out the frontiers of the non-Christian world. Linked to the military aspect of this model was its very hierarchical structure. The crusaders and the conquistadors were carrying out orders that came all the way down to them. The basic image for this model is that of a pyramid with the bulk of those at the bottom being sent out. Mission was a one-way activity. In this context, to suggest that non-Christian regions could bring something to Christianity would have been preposterous.

The geographical division between a Christian and a non-Christian world lasted well into the first part of this century. As for the confronta-

²My approach to the topic of mission is different from the one adopted by David Bosch in his masterpiece book, *Transforming Mission: Paradigm Shifts in Theology of Mission* (Maryknoll, New York, 1991). While Bosch analyzes the various shifts in theological thinking on mission, I consider changes in styles of mission as exemplified by the ways in which missionaries carry out their task. Some of my insights were triggered by a lecture entitled "Mission to the Nations" given by Donald Dorr of the St. Patrick's Missionary Society at the Center for Mission Research and Study at Maryknoll, New York, on November 2, 1995.



tional element, it still survives but for the most part evolved into a military imagery and vocabulary that was appropriated by the next model.

In the Roman Catholic Church the period from 1850 to about 1965 marks the heyday of the frontier model. The missionaries are those who work beyond the frontiers of Christian faith and Western civilization among people often labeled as pagans and uncivilized. As in the preceding model, these non-Christians have to be conquered for Christ, but this time through spiritual weapons and with the help of the real or imagined benefits of westernization. Mission is still understood as a conquest in geographical terms with the missionaries being a special breed of heroic persons bringing Christ to foreign lands. They are admired for their ruggedness, their willingness to risk their lives, and their endurance in the midst of adverse climatic and cultural conditions. Thanks to them, the frontiers of the Church are pushed farther and farther away. The image that comes forth is not just that of heroic persons being sent out, but also of gatherers and civilizers -who founded faith communities³ patterned after those of the Catholic Church in Western societies. These missionaries, however, rarely settle for long in one place, for their training and calling are more that of lone rangers who, once law and order has been established, move on to new locations beyond the frontiers of Christian faith and civilization.

The apostolic letter *Maximum Illud* of November 30, 1919, was the first of a series of attempts by the Holy See to denounce the dangers of such an understanding of mission. While praising western missionaries for their commitment, zeal, and audacity to take on great challenges, the papacy begged them to practice humility and to discard a militant, condescending, or culturally imperialistic attitudes.⁴ It was not until the time of Vatican Council II, however, that changes began to happen in earnest and on a large scale. Today the frontier model still lingers on in the attitudes and mentality of some missionaries for whom it is hard to let go of their militant theology. It also hampers the transformation of missionary groups whose structures and institutions were set up to support such a model.

The Greek word for church used in the New Testament is *ekklesia*, which means a gathering, an assembly.

This document was reinforced by the encyclical letter *Rerum Ecclesiae* of Pope Pius XI released on February 28, 1926. Both letters not only pointed to flaws in the attitudes of many western missionaries but also affirmed the rights of "natives" to govern their own local church.

Catholic missionaries nowadays are called upon to be more like patient and respectful messengers and witnesses of the good news to all people. This model is certainly not new. The early church after it was born in a cross-cultural milieu and, throughout the first centuries, its success came from its ability to adapt to many contexts, letting indigenous people express their faith in a wide variety of liturgies—Syriac, Roman, Coptic, Armenian, Ethiopian, Maronite, and so forth. The advent of Constantine marked a major watershed in understanding mission, because for the first time the Christian religion became the religion of the establishment. The early model of mission gave way to more triumphalistic models, emphasizing the Church as the bearer of culture and mission, as an outreach movement from the civilized to the uncivilized, from the superior culture to the inferior cultures. Only in the past thirty years or so has the style of mission practiced in the first centuries become prevalent again, and the full implications of this change for the Catholic Church are as yet far from being fully understood.

The key aspects of this style of mission can be described as follows. Catholic missionaries are people whose special vocation is to go beyond the existing frontiers of the Christian faith to dialogue with people of other religions or with no religion. These boundaries are not understood any more as a geographical division between western and non-western countries for it has become too obvious that western civilization can no longer be identified with the Christian message. As messengers, missionaries are not passive carriers but active witnesses who in their daily life interpret the Christian message the best way they can. They retain their own cultural and religious identity while becoming as much as possible one with the people they have been sent to; they have to share the life, appreciate the culture, the values, even the religion of these people, and yet be firm and steadfast in opposing what is contrary to the Christian message. This is not possible without being sensitive to the myriad ways the spirit of God has already been at work beyond the frontiers of the Church, long before missionaries themselves got there. The Christian message, however, never becomes translated—contemporary theologians would say inculturated or contextualized—until the local people make it theirs, not just by deciphering it accurately but also by enhancing its meaning with precious spiritual gems already present in their own cultural and religious heritage. In this process, missionaries are not

¹For more on the theology behind these terms, see Bosch, *op. cit.*, pp. 420-432, 447-457; and Lamin Sanneh, *Translating the Message: The Missionary Impact on Culture* (Maryknoll, New York, 1989).



just one-way transmitters of the Christian message; they in fact receive it back—the same and yet different—from the people they have evangelized. Homebound missionaries then, in what has been described as reverse mission, become also harbingers of this enriched message to their culture and church of origin. Today mission encompasses the five continents and entails a continual reciprocal evangelization and enrichment between peoples all around the world. The image that comes to mind with this messenger model and global understanding of mission is that of a complex of interconnecting circles, symbolizing on the one hand the diversity of cultures and religious expressions and on the other hand mutual enrichment, human solidarity, and unity of faith.

?. The Missionary Style of the First Jesuits in China

Matteo Ricci has been heralded by many historians and theologians as a pioneer for his efforts to integrate Christianity and Chinese culture by following a policy of cultural accommodation. The richness of the research available on the early Jesuits' brilliant but controversial apostolate of science, philosophy, and Christian faith makes it easy to identify four key elements in Ricci's missionary style. Two account for his success, and two point to flaws in his approach to China.

1. Respect for the Chinese Cultural Heritage

First of all one should recognize that Ricci's method of evangelization was not something that he came up with all by himself. His missionary approach was shared by a distinct group of people raised and nurtured in what Andrew Ross described as "the cultural golden age of a specifically Catholic humanism."⁶ Indeed, when one considers the key figures in the initial period of the Jesuit presence in China, they were all Italians who, like Ricci, were imbued with the ideas of the Italian Renaissance and were intellectually prepared in the Roman College of the Society of Jesus, the future Gregorian University. Foremost among them was Alessandro Valignano, whom the General of the Society in 1573 appointed Visitor to the East. As the person in charge, he was the one whose insight and determination set the tone and held the course of the Jesuit missions in

⁶Andrew C. Ross, *A Vision Betrayed: The Jesuits in Japan and China, 1542-1742* (Maryknoll, New York, 1994), p. 206.

China for more than thirty years until his death in Macao in 1606. Convinced that the Chinese culture contained elements that could be a foundation for the rebuilding of an indigenous Christian church and a new Christian culture, Valignano entrusted the task to Ricci, and every new initiative that Ricci took was done with his full agreement.

Ricci's style of mission resembles in many ways that of the early church and prefigures its modern revival. He carefully avoided the pitfalls of cultural confrontation and instead followed a policy of cultural accommodation, hoping to reconcile two disparate systems of faith and thought. He was thus reviving the theological tradition of the Greek Fathers who, like Clement of Alexandria, knew how to bring the heritage of Homer and Plato to the service of Christian thought. Just as his use of the science and instruments he brought with him from the West dazzled Chinese intellectuals, so did his mastery of the Chinese language and cultural tradition.

His patience, tolerance, understanding, and respect for the Chinese people and culture, combined with his outstanding scholarship, enabled him to adapt himself to the Chinese environment and to gain the confidence and friendship of many. Ricci knew how to gain people's hearts, and it showed in his treatise *On Friendship* (*Jiaoyou lun*),⁷ and in his kindness and good manners. Many Chinese were drawn to him and to the Christian message he brought.

2. Independence from Western Political Powers and Yet Respect for China's Political Order

Another aspect of early China Jesuits' style of mission was the striking contrast between their relationship to the political order of Europe and that of China. When, in 1534, the Society of Jesus was created specifically as a religious group at the exclusive service of the pope, free from political interference and not bound by traditional ecclesiastical structures,⁸ it was a first attempt to replace the Christian missionary activity under the authority of the Holy See. This was a sharp departure from the attitude of the popes of the last decades of the fif-

⁷*Thei'eor-OM lun* or *De Amicitia* was published in Nanchang around the year 1595.

⁸In addition to the three regular vows of chastity, poverty, and obedience to their superiors, the Jesuits take a fourth vow of service to the pope in whatever form he sees fit. Regarding this vow, the Constitutions of the Society of Jesus read, "The vow which the Society made to obey the pope as the supreme vicar of Christ without excuse, meant that

teenth century who had issued a series of bulls entrusting the evangelization of newly discovered lands to Spain and Portugal. At first, the traditions of medieval Christendom prevailing in the Iberian peninsula and dominions with its close alliance of throne and altar, the throne being always the senior partner, were too strong for the young society to oppose and, like the rest of the Church, it bowed to the embracing royal authority. The same conquistador spirit fueled the growth of the Spanish and Portuguese spheres of influence and the Christianization of the world. And yet almost from the beginning, Francis Xavier, the Society's foremost missionary, rejected this collusion between European colonial expansion and conversion to Christianity. As early as 1548, he wrote to King John III of Portugal to denounce an evangelization conducted at the point of the sword along the western coast of India.⁹ This forced Christianization was in total opposition with his own approach based on respect between different cultures. The main motivation behind his move to Japan and his preparation for entering China was to live in countries where people would be free to accept or reject his preaching without outside interference or threat.

From what was said previously about Valignano, it is not surprising to find him espousing Francis Xavier's practice of distancing mission work from the secular powers of the Iberian peninsula. One of Valignano's outstanding accomplishments, beginning with his appointment as Visitor in 1573, was precisely to assert his spiritual authority above the political control of the Portuguese Padroado and the Spanish Patronato, and by the same process to achieve a measure of independence for the Jesuits in China. From the start, his insistence on recruiting Italian Jesuits for his missions indicated a commitment to find missionaries not deeply affected by the conquistador understanding of Christianity and the world. From experience, he knew that the Italians of the period were free from this infection.

This, however, did not mean that Ricci and his Italian confreres lacked political shrewdness. Born in the century of Machiavelli in a

members were to go to any place whatsoever where he judges it expedient to send them for the greater glory of God and the good of souls, whether among the faithful or the infidels." See G. E. Ganss, *Ignatius of Loyola: The Spiritual Exercises and Selected Works* (New York, 1991), p. 307.

⁹Letter of Francis Xavier to John III, King of Portugal, Cochin, January 20, 1548, in Henry James Coleridge, *The Life and Letters of St. Francis Xavier* (London, 1927), II, 6-15. See also Georg Schurhammer, *Francis Xavier: His Life, His Times* (Rome, 1980), III, 346.

country full of rivalries between princes, Ricci displayed, during all his years in China, an art for observing political trends and choosing the kind of people capable of forwarding the success of his enterprise. He secured the friendship of high-ranking, upright officials who opened for him, step by step, the way to Beijing and ultimately the forbidden city, residence of the Wanli emperor. Ricci thought that, just as the West following the conversion of Constantine had gradually evolved into a Christian empire, so would China after the conversion of its emperor.

Yet when it came to proclaiming the core of the Christian message of God's universal and salvific love and every person's vocation to become a child of God, Ricci and his companions stood firm in what was a challenge to the Chinese ritualized order and way of thinking. Although many literati were able to see in these teachings a pledge of greater fidelity to the emperor and to the country, others, especially after the death of Ricci in 1610, accused the Jesuit missionaries of undermining the imperial order by preaching the cult of the Lord of Heaven and the equal dignity of all men before God.

3. Debating Technique and Interpretation of Chinese Classics

The method of cultural accommodation implemented by Ricci and his companions aimed first at proving that no irreconcilable differences existed between Chinese culture and Christian message and secondly at dressing up this message as much as possible in Chinese garb. The official patronage bestowed by the Kangxi emperor in 1692 on the Catholic Church in the empire attested to the success of the Jesuits' approach to evangelization.

This success nonetheless had at least two serious flaws. The first one can be traced to the confidence of the Jesuits in themselves as carriers of God's truth and in the power of their reasoning to persuade others to submit to this truth. Ricci for instance, behind the facade of Chinese courtesy, was a militant, relentless interlocutor committed to stripping of their errors Buddhist and Taoist monks as well as Confucian scholars. His western logic, codified in the rigid laws of scholastic argumentation, aimed at proving the absurdity of the adverse positions.¹⁰ He

¹⁰The matter was further complicated by the fact that although Ricci's mastery of the Chinese language was superb, the structure of the discourse and the words he used to



seemed to have, for the most part, ignored the Chinese literati's own conception of the dialogue which, on the contrary, aimed at reconciling contradictions and always kept a door open for the adversary to bow out gracefully.

Although this aspect of Ricci's approach led to much confusion and misunderstanding, one should keep in mind, as mentioned previously, that his usual demeanor, far from being confrontational, placed great emphasis on harmonious relationships. Through his kindness, his good manners, and his profound knowledge of Chinese customs he won the hearts of many Chinese people.

Ricci made another mistake when, in his eagerness to root the Christian faith into the Chinese cultural milieu and traditions, he embarked on a misconstrued interpretation of the Chinese Classics. Eager to reject the neo-Confucian metaphysics of his time as a deviation while keeping the ethical Confucian principles which, for the most part, conformed to the Christian teachings, Ricci claimed to have found the Christian concept of God as a personal being in the original Confucian thought. To find traces of the Christian revelation in an allegedly pristine form of Confucianism, he submitted the Chinese Classics and Confucius himself to many distortions. In this futile attempt, Ricci and his companions succeeded only in embarrassing their supporters among the literati and in giving fuel to their adversaries who accused them of knowing nothing about Confucian thought.

m. The Return of the Jesuits to China

When Hubert Cousin de Méricourt arrived in Beijing in January, 1773, he became the last European Jesuit to set foot in China for almost seventy years. The causes of this long interruption are complex and stem, in part at least, from the protracted Chinese Rites Controversy of the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries that crippled the Roman Catholic Church in China and almost destroyed the Jesuit order.¹¹ West-

convey his concepts resulted in significant misunderstandings with his Chinese interlocutors. For an excellent treatment of this topic, see Jacques Gernet, *Chine et christianisme: Action et réaction* (Paris, 1982).

"Briefly stated, the Chinese Rites Controversy had to do with the translation of the term "God" into Chinese and the permission given by the Jesuits to Chinese Christians to continue the performance of honors rendered to Confucius and ancestors in accordance

ern missionaries in that country were then divided into two camps that expended much energy in denouncing each other to the Holy See. At the core of the dispute was the accommodating attitude toward the Chinese cultural heritage championed by most Jesuits but opposed by other missionary groups. By the early eighteenth century, the papacy repeatedly ruled against the Jesuits' position. The Qing court was outraged by what it considered an interference by the Holy See in its internal affairs and an affront to its ancient ceremonial and customs. In 1724 a revengeful Yongzheng emperor banned Christianity and expelled all western missionaries from China. Only a few Jesuits employed at his court as scientific advisors were allowed to remain. Thereafter, the steady flow of Jesuits coming to China fell to a trickle and finally dried out with the suppression of the order in 1773.

Over the years, the Qing government did not always strictly enforce the ban against Christianity. In fact, several missionary groups continued to secretly send some of their men into the provinces of China. Yet, they could not send many because the Jansenist crisis -within the Catholic Church and the antireligious climate prevailing in several European countries had sharply depleted their ranks and was threatening their very existence. In contrast to the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries, which had been times of great spiritual renewal and missionary activity for the Roman Catholic Church of Europe, the eighteenth century was a time of lassitude and retreat.

The dawn of the nineteenth century, however, brought a religious revival that was particularly strong in France. Some outstanding figures rose to boost this movement. In 1802 François Chateaubriand in his *Génie du Christianisme* appealed to the aesthetic and emotional values of Catholicism. Frédéric Ozanam organized the *Société de Saint Vincent de Paul* to promote apostolic zeal among the Catholic youth. In 1822 he took an active part in the founding of *L'Oeuvre de la Propagation de la Foi*. This organization developed into the primary fundraising institution of the Catholic Missionary establishment and through its magazine, *Annales de la Propagation de la Foi*, became an

with the customs of the country. For a good historical study of the question, see George Minamiki, *The Chinese Rites Controversy from Its Beginning to Modern Times* (Chicago, 1985); for an in-depth analysis of the positions of the different principals and the long-lasting impact of the controversy, see David E. Mungello (ed.), *The Chinese Rites Controversy: Its History and Meaning* ("Monumenta Sérica" Monograph Series, Vol. XXXIII [Netetal, Germany, 1994]).

effective tool for popularizing the missionary cause. In the 1830s the Dominican Henri Lacordaire preached at Notre Dame of Paris his Conférences, which contributed immensely to the revival of Catholicism among French intellectuals. Other Catholic apologists, like Louis Veuillot, linked patriotism, colonialism, and missionary enterprise by appealing to the Gesta Dei per Francos tradition and to the sense of mission civilisatrice newly gained from the industrial revolution.¹²

In this context of revival, religious congregations began to flourish again in France. One of them was the Society of Jesus re-established by Pope Pius VII in 1814, as the last Jesuit advisor in Beijing was on his death bed. The success of its recruiting efforts are impressive. By 1858 there were 1,500 French Jesuits; twenty years later, they had passed the 3,000 mark and accounted for almost one-third of the order's total size.¹³

As they grew in number, the French Jesuits assumed a predominant position in the field of education. In 1878, with twenty-nine excellent secondary schools and a bright student body of 11,000, the Jesuits controlled the formative years of 55% of the student population not attending public schools. Moreover, by successfully preparing adolescents for the entrance examinations to the Grandes Ecoles such as the Ecole polytechnique, the Saint Cyr military officer school, and the naval academy, they put in place a network of devoted supporters among future leaders in the civil and military administrations at home and overseas.¹⁴

These efforts came to a sudden, but only temporary, halt with the anticlerical reorganization of education promulgated in 1879 by Jules Ferry, the minister of education. The measure, which denied most Catholic orders the right to teach in France, further reinforced the missionary impetus of the French Jesuits, already a majority among Jesuit missionaries. Their number rose to 630 in 1879 and reached 1,000 by the turn of the century.

Meanwhile the Holy See had received several letters from Chinese

¹²Jean-Paul Wiest, "Catholic Activities in Kwangtung Province and Chinese Responses: 1848-1885" (Ph.D. dissertation, University of Washington, 1977), pp. 29-30, 33-35.

¹⁵Jean Lacouture *Jésuites: une multibibliographie*, Vol.11: Les revenants (Paris, 1992), pp. 206, 296.

¹⁴For instance, from 1871 to 1879, the Jesuit Collège Sainte Geneviève in Paris graduated 316 students who gained entry to the Ecole Polytechnique and 669 to Saint Cyr; see also Lewis Pyenson, *Civilizing Mission: Exact Sciences and French Overseas Expansion, 1830-1940* (Baltimore, 1993), pp. 12-13.

Catholics and from Bishop Louis de Bési, vicar apostolic of Shandong and administrator of the Nanjing diocese, begging the Jesuits to return to China and resume their missionary and scientific works.¹⁵ It comes as no surprise that when Cardinal Giacomo Filippo Frانسoni, prefect of the Propaganda Fide, decided in 1841 to respond favorably to these letters, the choice of Jan Phüip Roothaan, superior general of the Society of Jesus, fell on the French, the stronger group within the Society. The timing was almost perfect. On the one hand, within the following decades, the French Jesuits, as we have seen, would be able to provide a steady flow of missionaries. On the other hand, the opening up of China and the need for reforms and western science would provide the Jesuits with another opportunity to bring Christianity to an educated Chinese elite.

IV. The French Jesuits at Zhendan: Their Understanding of Mission and Their Missionary Style

In April, 1841, three French Jesuits, Claude Gotteland, François Estève, and Benjamin Brueyre, left the port city of Brest in France for China. After a lapse of sixty-nine years, they were the first contingent of a new generation of Jesuits sent to revive the splendor of their 622 predecessors who, since 1582, had come in the footsteps of Francis Xavier to bring the knowledge of Christ to the Chinese people.¹⁶ But these new Jesuits and their French confrères who for more than a century would come to Shanghai, were in many ways unlike a Matteo Ricci, a Lazzaro Cattaneo, or a Niccolo Longobardo. Their conception of China, their attitude toward the Chinese people, and their understanding of civilization differed sharply from that of the earlier Jesuits.¹⁷ A study of

¹⁵Louis Wei Tsing-sing, *La Politique missionnaire de la France en Chine, 1842-1856* (Paris, 1957), pp. 45-53, 82-84, 91-92; LNM, I, 34-36, letter of Gotteland, July 22, 1842. See copies of two letters by Chinese Christians in Serviere, op. cit., Vol. I, appendices 1 and 2.

¹⁶LNM, I, 7, letter of Gotteland, May 6, 1841. Joseph Dehergne, *Répertoire des jésuites de Chine de 1552 à 1800* (Paris, 1973), pp. 397-407. Among those Jesuits, seventy-eight were native Chinese.

¹⁷For a study of the images of China presented to the European society by the French Jesuits of the nineteenth century, see my paper entitled "Les Jésuites français et l'image de la Chine au XIX^e siècle" to appear in *Actes du Huitième Colloque International de Sinologie de Chantilly* (1995).

the Jesuits at Zhendan reveals that although the strategy of concentrating on the educated class remained the same, changes in motivation and viewpoint precluded the reviving of Ricci's policy of cultural accommodation and led to a different missionary style and understanding of evangelization. The form might have been the same, but the spirit behind it was not.

1. Continuing Matteo Ricci's Legacy of Working among the Educated

The three French Jesuits landing near Shanghai in 1842 carried clear instructions from their provincial in Paris. Estève and Brueyre were assigned to the traditional missionary tasks of preaching, baptizing, and establishing parishes among the masses. But Gotteland, the superior of the group, had brought along crates full of scientific instruments for the establishment, among other things, of an observatory. His orders were to resume the scientific and educational work of his predecessors and, prior to his departure, he had perfected his knowledge of astronomy under one of the most renowned astronomers of the time, Charles Louis Largeteau. But the pressing demand of responding to the needs of the 70,000 Chinese Christians spread out in the huge diocese of Nankin delayed the launching of the scientific program he had conceived.¹⁸ The correspondence of his successors clearly reflects the same resolve on the part of the leadership of the reborn Jesuit order to emulate the work begun by Ricci and to convert China from the top down. In 1849 Joseph Gönnet wrote in anticipation:

When will at least a few of us share some of the prestige that surrounded the early Jesuits? Until that day comes, we will never convert the bulk of the Chinese people. . . . Our confreres understood that the conversion of the highest civil servants in the empire would necessarily be followed by that of the entire nation, and experience has proved them right.¹⁹

Finally, the following year, Augustin Poussemeux had enough manpower at his disposal to assign five Jesuits to work among China's educated and influential elite. The goal he set in front of them was unequivocal:

Once we gain more freedom to follow in the footsteps of our famous predecessors in China, and once we know enough Chinese literature to earn

¹⁸Archives françaises de la Compagnie de Jésus [AFCJ], Fichier 217, letter of Gotteland to T.R.P Général, September 22, 1842. LNM, 1, 425, letter of Gotteland, December 3, 1846.

¹⁹LNM, 11,307, letter of Gönnet, October 22, 1849.

the respect of the literati, we will then reach for the higher stratum of the society and not only cater to the Christians and the poor. ... AU efforts should lead to grasp this great people by the head; we wUl never conquer it as long asjtêe are satisfied with grabbing it by its feet.²⁰

In the pursuit of this goal, the French Jesuits were relentless. Shanghai rather than Beijing became their new center, and their efforts developed along two lines, scientific research and academic teaching. The results were impressive. Their first published scientific notes began to appear in 1855, and by 1873 they had already built a permanent meteorological observatory. This was followed by the opening of an astronomical observatory in 1894 and a magnetical observatory in 1908.²¹ They also began as early as 1868 to assemble collections which achieved world fame under the names of Heude Museum of Natural History and Museum of Chinese Antiquities.

In the field of education, their efforts aimed first at putting in place a system that would channel students from elementary to high schools, and prepare the most talented ones for official examinations and more advanced studies. By 1860 they were already responsible for the education of 5,600 students in 224 primary schools for boys and eighty-nine for girls in the Jiangnan mission territory.²² In Xujiahui, they ran the Collège Saint Ignace, a secondary school with ninety boarders.²³

The creation of an establishment of higher learning for the Chinese youth took a longer time. Finally, on February 28, 1903, they joined with Ma Xiangbo, a former Jesuit and a renowned scholar, to open an institution which was given the symbolic name of Zhendan, which means dawn.²⁴ The French designation Université l'Aurore was chosen as its

²⁰LNM, 11, 317-318, letter of Poissemeux, January 30, 1850; Serviere, op. cit., 165.

²¹The meteorological observatory was located in the garden of their main residence in Xujiahui, a suburb of Shanghai. The astronomical and the magnetical observatories were both situated a short distance away from the city, the first one in Sheshan and the other in Lujiabeng.

²²In 1856 the Propaganda Fide had entrusted to the Society of Jesus the two provinces of Jiangsu and Anhui, commonly known under the name of Jiangnan.

²³LNM, II, 238-239, letter of Gotteland, January 22, 1849; ?, 331-333, letter of Poissemeux, April 23, 1850; III (part 1), 72, letter of Languillat, June 4, 1854; III (part 3), 255, statistics. Serviere, op. cit., I, 171-173. In French, the school was always officially known as Collège Saint Ignace; in Chinese, however, the name Xuhui Gongxue (Xujiahui College) rapidly replaced the awkward transliteration Sheng Yinajue Gongxue (St. Ignatius College).



other legal name and appears on all the official documents. Over the years, Aurore developed into an excellent academic institution with unique characteristics, earning the double-edged reputation of being a French university on "Chinese soil. Entering students with a limited knowledge of French were required to take a special one-year course in that language. The structure and curriculum evolved over the years but remained closely modeled on the French system of education. By 1949, just before the Communist takeover, the university comprised four faculties: law, science and engineering, medicine and dentistry, and Literature. In July, 1951, the government asked all the Jesuit professors to leave the campus and declared Aurore closed.

There is ample evidence that the high professional and scholarly standards in the various subdisciplines of science, law, and medicine produced Zhendan graduates who made significant contributions to China's modernization.²⁵ Even today, alumni of the last graduating classes, in spite of their advanced age, still play an influential role as educators and professionals in Taiwan and on the mainland.

2. Mixing Missionary Enterprise with French Civilization

Throughout the nineteenth century and well into the twentieth, a phenomenon of convergence took place abroad between French missionaries, including the Jesuits, on one side, and the various French governments and their representatives on the other side. Putting aside the often antagonistic attitude opposing them on the home front, both

²⁴For details on the events leading to and the people involved in the creation of Zhendan, see Ruth Hayhoe, "Towards the Forging of a Chinese University Ethos: Zhendan and Fudan, 1903-1919," *The Chinese Quarterly*, 94 (June, 1983), 323-341; Jean-Paul Wiest, "A Clash of Visions: The Beginnings of Aurora University, 1842-1905," paper presented in October, 1992, at the alumni meeting of Aurore Mondiale Association held in Shanghai and at the Second International Conference on the Historiography of the Catholic Church in China held in Taipei. For publications in Chinese, see the sections on Zhendan and Ma Xiangbo in *Fudan daxue zhi, diyijuan, 1905-1949* (Shanghai, 1985); and Gu Yulu, "Zhendan daxuedi zhuangjian he bianqian," *Zhongqiao wenti tansuo, 1987 nian wenji* (Shanghai, 1988), pp. 140-150.

²⁵See for instance, Gu Changsheng, *Chuanjishi yu jindai Zhongguo* (Shanghai, 1981), pp. 364-367; Joseph de la Servière, "Une Université française en Chine, L'Aurore de Shanghai," *Relations de Chine*, 2 (April, 1925), 15-19; "Le Rayonnement de l'Aurore en Chine et à l'étranger," *Bulletin de l'Université l'Aurore*, 33 (1936), 8-11.

sides collaborated in combining the two notions of Gesta Dei per Francos and Mission civilisatrice. The French missionaries believed that their country's civilization had a very special role to fulfill in the divine plan of evangelization of the world; the governments of France too often equated the French civilizing role with colonial and economic expansion and regarded missionaries as agents of their political interests abroad. Otherwise, why would an anticlerical government such as that of the Third Republic continue to promote abroad the French protectorate over all Catholic missions—formally ended with the French Act of Separation between state and church of 1905—and finance their schools and hospitals?

Among missionaries, this blend of patriotism, colonialism, and missionary enterprise resulted in attitudes which sometimes departed sharply from Ricci's policy of cultural accommodation. Even the Jesuits at Zhendan who claimed to follow in the footsteps of Ricci were affected. Their approach differed from that of their early mentor on two major counts: they were imbued with a strong sense of superiority in their own religion and civilization and they expected the backing of the French government.

a. Emphasis on French Culture

For the Jesuits at Zhendan, Ricci and his successors of the eighteenth century had gone too far in their attempts to root Christianity in the Chinese milieu and to find traces of the Christian God in the most ancient Chinese books. The condemnation of the Chinese Rites by the Holy See had closed the case. Moreover, the China they found was not the civilized country described by Ricci. They saw a backward country run by an inefficient and corrupt government, torn apart by rebellions, weakened by famines and plagues. They thought that by bringing their system of education and the Christian faith to China they would form an elite who would spearhead the rebuilding of the country on a new base.

Zhendan in a sense epitomized such an effort. In the pursuit of this goal, the French Jesuits at Aurore never felt a strong necessity to excel in the knowledge of the Chinese language.²⁶ Some could speak the

²⁶It should be made clear that we are writing only about the Jesuits at Zhendan and not the Jesuits in China in general. The Chinese linguistic works and dictionaries of other

Shanghai dialect rather weU; yet few could handle Mandarin, the official national language. But, after aU, their purpose was not so much to acculturate themselves to China as to bring the best of French education to China. So French, not Chinese, became the language used for teaching, and all students had to learn it.

When the Jesuits realized that Ma Xiangpo, the founder of Aurore, was developing an academic institution that did not correspond to their norms, they forced him to resign in March, 1905. What is often known as the first Aurore had barely existed for two years.²⁷

Ma had in mind a school that -would combine the Chinese system of Shuyuan with a curriculum mostly borrowed from American and French educational systems. He preferred to gather young adults already well-educated in Chinese classics. The curriculum stressed the learning of Latin and several modern foreign languages and offered students the choice of specializing in Uberal arts or in the sciences. Ma did not believe that a rigorous lecture system of teaching was necessary with mature students beyond the learning of the basic elements and rules. Then, following this traditional way of learning from the master in a closely knit group, he aimed at guiding students to apply the theory learned in class to the more complex elements of their study untU they could completely proceed on their own. As for the day-to-day administration of the school, he left it in the hands of the students.

At the root of the disagreement between Ma Xiangpo and the French Jesuits lay a completely different view of what China needed and what Aurore should become. Whereas Ma dreamt of creating something new, the Jesuits envisioned an universit  that -would match those in France. The structure of the latter called for a strong authority at the top, a weU-defined course of studies, and a homogeneous and obedient student body. The Jesuits, therefore, blamed Ma for his lack of firm authority. They blamed the student self-government body for interfering with the direction of the school and for distracting students from their studies. As for the curriculum, the Jesuits considered it to be too broad and ambitious. They also felt it reflected too much the whim of students and

French Jesuits such as Aloys Pfister, L on Wieger, and S raphin Couvreur are proof of their excellent command of the language.

²⁷Ma Xiangpo with a group of students opened another university which he thought would restore the original idea and spirit of Zhendan, and named it Fudan, short for Fu Zhendan, the restored Aurore.

not enough the consensus of the faculty. Finally, they strongly opposed the participation of Aurore students in anti-government activities and faulted Ma for harboring revolutionaries on campus. They thought the reputation of the school had been compromised and, as one remedy, favored the enrollment of a younger, more malleable, less politically-minded student body.²⁸

Beginning with the fall of 1905, the French Jesuits developed a curriculum that espoused the aims and goals of the French educational tradition and never became the meeting point between Chinese and western culture that Ma had dreamt to foster. Most teaching was done in French, with an emphasis on lecturing and laboratory work. The study of Chinese literature was never successfully implemented. The faculty of literature, offering courses on the important books and authors of both Chinese and French cultures, failed several times for lack of students, and in 1949 it was still on very shaky ground.

From the beginning the Jesuits had to defend the "French first and always" rule that they enforced at Zhendan. Their justification for not using English was as follows:

The Chinese people like to go back to the origins of things and they know that, in matters of science, French owes much to Latin and is its main scion. . . . They trust teachers such as [French Catholic] missionaries whose knowledge of Latin and Greek make them versed in the etymology of the scientific vocabulary of all disciplines. . . . They know that French represents a good half of the world civilization, and that it is the key to disinterested higher studies, in short to science.²⁹

As Aurore celebrated its twentieth anniversary, three letters addressed by the rector to his superior in Paris revealed the intrinsic relationship the Jesuits saw between promoting the French language, contributing to China's development, and advancing the cause of the Catholic religion. In the first letter, Father Pierre Lefebvre insisted that French was unique to Zhendan and essential for its survival:

If you plan, within a few years, to have all the courses taught in Chinese, please stop all projects of construction and development. This measure

²⁸Zhendan daxue ershiwunian xiaoshi (Zikawei, Shanghai, 1928), p. 2. Gu Yulu, *op. cit.*, p. 142. See also Ruth Hayhoe, "A Chinese Catholic Philosophy of Higher Education in Republican China," *Tripod*, 48 (December, 1988), 51-53.

²⁹AFCJ, Fichier 2-51 complément, "l'Aurore, Université française de Lo Kawei, près Changhai" (ca. 1907), p. 4.

would indeed be the death warrant of Aurore, because students would not apply here to find what is already well provided by other institutions.³⁰

In the second letter, Lefebvre vented his strong displeasure for having been ordered to use Chinese in religious education classes:

When the apostolic delegate asked what we did [in catechetical classes and in our sermons], I explained to him we did it in French because it seemed more useful for our students and for promoting the holy cause. Now that things have been decided against us, I wash my hands of the whole business if results are not as good as those we obtained before.³¹

The third letter showed that replacing French by English as the classroom language had been to the detriment of The Institute for Commerce and Industry, the other Jesuit institution of higher learning, run in Tientsin by the Jesuits since 1922. Hidden behind the terse and sarcastic tone lay Lefebvre's own analysis of the failure to enroll more students: the switch to English had made it much harder for Chinese adolescents taught French in missionary schools to apply to the Tientsin institute; and in the mind of Chinese Catholics, English meant Americans, thus Protestants.

There has been no substantial increase in the student population, and the recruitment among Christians [i.e., Catholics] has dried up. One of the Fathers was telling me that we should hand the school over to the Americans! Those who advocated that we should abandon this poor French language are probably not so triumphant any more.³²

A symbolic but very telling sign of this French pride can also be found in the modification made to the original logo of Zhendan. Until 1918, it was fittingly enough that of a morning sun rising from a stylized Oriental countryside. In 1919, however, the Jesuits added to the design an enormous rooster crowing lustily at the shining orb of the rising sun.³⁵ The hidden meaning of the new logo becomes obvious when one

³⁰AFCJ, Fichier 323, letter of Lefebvre to R.P.F. Mollet, April 21, 1928.

³¹AFCJ, Fichier 323, letter of Lefebvre to R.P. Provincial, September 28, 1928. The apostolic delegate at that time was Archbishop Celso Costantini.

³²AFCJ, Fichier 323, letter of Lefebvre to R.P. Provincial, October 22, 1929.

³⁵There is a possibility that the addition happened earlier, in late 1912, when Aurore changed its Chinese name from Zhendan Xueyuan to Zhendan Daxue. The earliest occurrence of the new logo I have come across, however, is in school catalogues beginning with the year 1919.

remembers that the cock or rooster had been one of the most cherished and ancient symbols of France. When the place was known as Gallia and its inhabitants the Gauls were known as Galli—Gallus being the singular form—the name for a rooster was also gallus. Because of this similarity between the two names, the rooster became the embodiment of how the people saw themselves. Above all, like the rooster whose song made the sun rise, the French have long considered that their mission was to let the rays of civilization shine upon the world.

It would be a mistake, however, to infer from the above that the Jesuits at Zhendan were so engrossed in their own sense of cultural superiority that they failed to develop a close relationship with the students. On the contrary, they displayed that same deep respect of the "other" as a person, which has been a constant trademark of the Society of Jesus. As Zhendan grew, one of the recurring complaints found in the correspondence and school diaries of the successive rectors was that they had to rely more and more on a lay faculty who did not provide an around-the-clock care of the students. The rectors always wished for an increase of Jesuit professors—preferably young—who would be entirely devoted to the students and develop a close relationship with them.³⁴

The Jesuits at Zhendan were keen to infuse this spirit of service and dedication into their students. For instance, during the trying period of 1937 to 1939 which transformed Shanghai alternatively into a war zone or a refugee zone, the Jesuits often responded in ways that would involve their students. On campus some students helped to provide basic medical attention in a temporary Red Cross hospital installed in one of the buildings; others attended to the relief of refugees in a camp set up on their soccer field. Outside the campus third- and fourth-year medical students served in neighboring hospitals or accompanied their professors to more distant locations as volunteers for a couple of months at a time. Others helped another professor, Father Jacquinot, to dispense relief in a "special security zone for refugees" he had set up on the outskirts of Shanghai.³⁵ Then, years later, when other difficult times arose with the implementation of the Communist regime, the Jesuits at Zhen-

³⁴See for instance, the entry made by Father André Gaultier in the school diary on February 2, 1935.

³⁵AFCI, Zhendan diary 1937-1939. See also G. Germain, "L'Aurore et la guerre," *Bulletin de l'Université l'Aurore*, 6/3 (1945), 569-577.

dan showed the same dedication to teaching and to their students. They stayed at their posts in spite of many difficulties and humiliating circumstances. They left only when they were forced to do so prior to the closure of the university.

This care for others and dedication of the Jesuits to their task never resulted in massive conversions among the student population. There were none until 1919 and never more than three per year until 1933 when eleven students were baptized. The number of baptisms remained around ten annually until 1939, when it climbed to above twenty and reached an average of about twenty-five per year until 1949. At the same time, while the total student population rose from twenty-one in 1903 to 1,600 in 1949, the number of Catholics reached 30% in 1940 and thereafter remained steady.³⁶

There is no doubt that the French Jesuits imparted to their students, Catholics and non-Catholics alike, a legacy of deep commitment to their compatriots and their country. In my personal contacts with alumni, I found that whatever political option they took, the regime they chose to support or the country they opted to live in, they all attributed their sense of care and service to their Jesuit professors. As a whole, Zhendan alumni are a group of people proud of their university and grateful to the Jesuits for teaching them to be better persons, intellectually and morally.

b. Relying on the Support of the French Government to Zhendan

One might be tempted to describe the French Jesuits in China as political chameleons because of their ability to adapt to the changing governments of France and China. On the home front, they gained for their educational pursuit the backing of the July Monarchy, the Second Republic, the Second Empire, the Third Republic, the Vichy Government, and the Fifth Republic. In China, Zhendan was welcomed under the imperial government, received official recognition from the Nationalists in 1912, remained open under the Japanese occupation of Shanghai and

³⁶These figures do not include students enrolled in the Zhendan secondary school begun in 1933 by the Jesuits, but include those of the Aurora College for Women begun in 1939 by the Dames du Sacré Coeur.

the Wang Jingwei puppet government between 1937 and 1944, and then regained full recognition from the Nationalists.

A closer look at the situation revealed that the French Jesuits had no deep political commitment. They certainly would not be strong supporters of French governments that often vehemently opposed the presence, let alone the work, of the Society of Jesus on French soil. They took no part in Chinese politics either and did not want their students to become involved. Those who did were quickly dismissed. We recall that one of the reasons that led to the closing of the first Aurore was precisely the Jesuits' opposition to political activities among students. The Jesuits viewed political manifestations and upheavals as a nuisance that deterred students from studying. On October 27, 1911, the rector, Jacques de Lapparent, wrote in the school diary,

The revolution that started on the 12 or 13 of October in Wuchang has spread to several provinces. . . . Those among our students whose families live in these areas are worried. . . . This situation is not conducive to schoolwork but teaching will continue however as if nothing happened.³⁷

Eight years later the viewpoint was still the same. Following the outbreak of the May 4th Movement, Yves Henry, the new rector, wrote in praise of the students who opted to return to class and prepare for examinations rather than continue participating in the movement:

It was not that these students liked their country less than the others. But they understood that their first duty as a citizen was to be [well] trained in order to later on lead others by their science, loyalty, and dedication, and that the greatest evil one can inflict upon a country is to disrupt education.³⁸

Like a chameleon -which adjusts its color to any background for protection and for catching prey, the French Jesuits blended into the political context to protect and further their mission of education and conversion; but they never considered participating in the transformation of the political context as part of their mission. They followed Chinese rules and regulations on education to the letter and adjusted to the changes. Thus as early as 1912, they obtained official recognition of the university and the degrees it conferred; and in 1931, in accordance with a new law, they appointed a Chinese citizen, Dr. Hu Wenyao, as presi-

³⁷AFCl, Zhendan diary, October 27, 1911.

³⁸Université l'Aurore, 16^e année scolaire, 1918-1919 (Shanghai, 1919), p. 7.

dent of Zhendan. But for them, Dr. Hu was nothing more than a figure-head chosen to satisfy Chinese authorities; the real control of the university remained in the hands of the Jesuit rector.³⁹

When the Sino-Japanese war engulfed the country, they chose to keep Zhendan open and to follow the directives of whatever political power was in charge of Shanghai. As a result they were accused by some Chinese patriots of being opportunists or turncoats. A close look at their correspondence and school diaries, however, reveals that in reality they had to fend off suspicions of being a hotbed of anti-Japanese sentiments, had a low opinion of Wang Jingwei, and did not agree with his pro-Japanese stance.⁴⁰

There is ample evidence that the French Jesuits thought of manipulating their government to the benefit of Zhendan by relying on the French protectorate over Catholic missions and promoting the notion of *Mission civilisatrice*.

From the beginning, the Jesuits were successful in enrolling support for the development of their educational enterprise from French civil and military officials in Shanghai and Beijing. The list includes Charles de Montigny, first consul in Shanghai in 1850, and his successor, Victor Edan; Baron Jean-Baptiste Gros, French plenipotentiary to China in 1857; General Cousin-Montauban, commander of the French expeditionary corps in 1860; Count Louis de Rochechouart and Jules Patenôtre, who between them occupied the post of ambassador in Beijing for most of the time between 1868 and 1885. These people contributed to the excellent reputation of the Shanghai Jesuits among French governmental circles, so much so that in 1898 Stephen Pichón, the ambassador in Beijing, received instructions from the French Foreign Ministry to facilitate the opening of a school of higher education to be run by the Society of Jesus. Through Pichón, the French government was thus involved in the early negotiations that led to the opening of Zhendan and has ever since felt obligated to support that institution.⁴¹

³⁹AFCJ, school diary, three typed pages included at the end of year 1932.

⁴⁰See, for instance, AFCJ, Zhendan diary, entries for January 14 and the month of December, 1936; April 24-25 and May 10-26, 1937; January 8 and March 29, 1938; September 25, 1939; March 29 and September 26, 1940; May 16 and November 11, 1942; January 14 and 30, February 2, March 2, July 2-4 and 30, October 30, and November 29, 1943; March 10, August 24, September 15, and November 13, 1945.

⁴¹Archives of the French legation in Beijing (kept in Nantes, France), carton 72: *Ecoles françaises en Chine—1898*. It is interesting to note that even today the French govern-

The Jesuits were able to provide Zhendan with the protection, the academic recognition, and the financial support of their government. Protection was constantly shown in subtle ways such as the frequent calls of the rector to the consulate, the many visits of French naval and civil officials to the campus, and the customary participation of the consul in graduation ceremonies. More overt displays such as flying the French flag or posting French sentries at the entrance of the university happened very rarely.

Academic recognition was something that the Jesuits relentlessly pursued from very early on. Their first victory came in 1918, when the diplomas delivered at the end of the *Cours préparatoire* (Preparatory Course)—which later on became Zhendan secondary school—were granted equivalency to the French *Baccalauréat* by the French Ministry of Public Education.⁴² Steady improvement in the depth and breadth of the curriculum in the departments of each faculty finally paid off. By the mid-thirties, a significant proportion of Zhendan graduates going to France for advanced studies gained access to the doctoral programs at the Sorbonne and other prestigious French institutes.

Financial support from the French government and other non-religious French sources was also considered crucial to the survival and growth of *Aurore*. While seeking for funds, the Jesuits always made sure to emphasize the role of Zhendan in defending the honor of France and its civilization and in counterbalancing the influence of the German, British, and American institutions of higher education.

By 1913 the French Ministry of Foreign Affairs began allocating a small subsidy of 1,000 francs to Zhendan. In 1916 the ministry reached an accord with the Jesuits guaranteeing major financial support to Zhendan from the French government; but in return the Jesuits agreed that

the direction and the administration of *Aurore*, while remaining autonomous, would retain a specifically French character. Teaching would be conducted in French; the director and the majority, or at least the majority, of the professors would be French citizens.⁴³

ment continues to provide assistance to Shanghai Second Medical University, which was established on the grounds of Zhendan in 1952.

"Université l'Aurore, 16^e année scolaire, 1918-1919, p. 2.

⁴³AFCJ, Fichier 2-55, letter of Stephen Pichón, foreign minister, to the Jesuit procurator in Shanghai, February 19, 1919. After 1939 the French government stopped requiring that

As a result the subsidy for that year increased to 15,000 francs and to 25,000 in 1917, plus a one-time gift of 5,000 francs from the Ministry of Education. In 1919 the Ministry of Foreign Affairs began to add its subsidy to three categories: laboratories and library, salaries and trips of lay professors, and student scholarships; in 1921 two more categories were added—for salaries of missionary professors and purchase of scholarly magazines. These subsidies were adjusted annually to reflect inflation, additions to the teaching staff, and the increase in the number of scholarships. Between 1919 and 1945, they grew from a total of 128,000 to 1,600,000 francs a year.

In addition, the government made generous special one-year allocations to cover costs of construction or new instruments. In 1919, for instance, the university received an additional amount of 450,000 francs for the purchase of land and the erection of new buildings.⁴⁴ This by itself could explain why in that year a proud Gaúic rooster began to adorn the school emblem. Some fifteen years later, this now traditional symbol of Zhendan would be enshrined in a large tessellated translucent window set on the south wall commanding the main entrance of the new library and administration building.⁴⁵

The other important non-religious and politically motivated patron of Aurora was the municipality of the French Concession of Shanghai. In 1915 it contributed 300,000 francs for new construction and for relocation to the university grounds of the Jesuit observatory of Sheshan and the natural history museum then at Xujiahui. Until the concession was returned to China in 1945, the municipality remained a generous supporter of Zhendan and handled the yearly transfer to the university of its share of the money coming from the Boxer indemnity, an amount which by the late 1930s was worth 30,000 Chinese dollars which amounted to about 180,000 French francs.⁴⁶

a strict majority of the professors be French. The roster for the school year 1948-1949 lists some 110 faculty: 26 were French Jesuits, 26 were non-Chinese lay professors (but not necessarily French citizens), and the rest were all Chinese: Université l'Aurore, Catalogue des professeurs et étudiants, No. 37, 1948-1949.

"AFCJ, Fichier 2-51, "Rapport de 1920 à Monsieur le Député," pp. 1-5; Fichier 2-55, "Subsides et allocations accordées à l'Aurore"; School diary, January 6, 1945.

4, "Aurora University of Shanghai," *The Far Eastern Review*, 9 (September, 1936), 390-391.

⁴⁶AFCJ, Fichier 2-51, "Rapport de 1920 à Monsieur le Député," pp. 1-5; School diary, February 8, 1938, and January 6, 1939.

Conclusion

We can now attempt to answer the question raised in the beginning about the significance of these shifts in the Roman Catholic Church and how they affected the coming of age of an indigenous Chinese Catholic Church.

Alessandro Valignano and Matteo Ricci were part of a small movement that fought against the main current to revive an understanding of mission and a vision of church based on the respect of all human beings. The vision they brought to China, other Jesuits of the same generation carried to other countries, Robert de Nobili to India and Alexandre de Rhodes to Vietnam, for instance. I suspect that as novices, these Jesuits must have resonated to the stories of pioneers in that movement: the Dominicans Antonio de Montesinos and Bartholomew de Las Casas, who, a few decades earlier, had denounced the ruthless methods of the Spanish conquistadors in the Americas.

The model promoted by Valignano and Ricci resembled that of the first missionaries who preached Christ around the Mediterranean and allowed indigenous people to express their faith within their own culture. But for the western powers, motivated by a conquistador view of the world, the Jesuits' attitude of accommodation toward China and aloofness toward them was suspicious. Accused by their missionary detractors of confusing pagan and Christian rites, the Jesuits failed to gain the support of the Holy See. Not only did this missionary vision of the early Jesuits not prevail, but it was a major cause of the suppression of the Society in 1773. The vision did not die, however; it lay dormant until the turn of the twentieth century. The Vincentian Vincent Lebbe was the first to revive it in China; then a generation of Jesuit thinkers, led by Pierre Charles, professor at Louvain and pioneer of the theology of Inculturation, began to expand its horizon.⁴⁷ Since Vatican Council II this vision has become again the main guide for the Catholic Church's missionary effort.

Did Ricci really believe that he had found God in the sacred books of Confucianism, or was it pure missionary strategy to challenge and transform the Chinese world view? The debate is still open. Some modern

⁴⁷Father Pierre Charles taught theology and missiology at the Catholic University of Louvain for forty years until his death in 1954. It was one of his disciples, the Jesuit theologian J. Masson, who first coined the term "inculturation" in 1962.



scholars affirm that it was indeed a strategy and that Ricci's ultimate goal might have been in fact to get rid of Confucianism altogether.⁴⁸ Others continue to uphold Ricci in finding God in the Chinese traditional culture and wisdom. In my opinion, Ricci went astray only because he tried too hard to do something he was not qualified to do. The inculturation of Christianity—which is not only a process of insertion into a culture but also a unique and distinct expression out of that culture—is a slow process. What Ricci claimed to have accomplished is something which, in other cultures, has always taken generations or centuries and has never been done by an outsider but by the indigenous people themselves. As gifted as he may have been, Ricci was bound to fail. But his failure is a reminder of what still needs to be accomplished. Just as much as it was the Greek Fathers such as Clement of Alexandria who brought the heritage of Homer and Plato to Christian thought, only the Chinese themselves can mold together their own traditional heritage and the Christian faith.

The French Jesuits who taught at Zhendan during the first part of the twentieth century were motivated by a totally different model of mission from that of Ricci, although they saw themselves following in his footsteps. The mistake they made was to take what was just a strategy in Ricci's view, that is, the conversion from the top down through indirect means, as the core of his method. What animated Ricci's method was the conviction that the success of Christianity in China depended on the missionaries becoming Chinese with the Chinese and on the Gospel becoming part of the Chinese culture. The Jesuits at Zhendan believed in the benefits of French civilization and Christian faith for China. They were not interested in fitting themselves into the Chinese society; they had no sympathy for the students' political aspirations; they never mentioned adapting the Gospel to China.

In a sense the French Jesuits at Aurore were very much the products of their time and displayed many characteristics of the frontier model presented earlier. Even among those who arrived after 1920, there seems to be no evidence that they were influenced by the missiological approach of their contemporary, Pierre Charles. For the most part, they came to China as bearers of French civilization which they believed would draw the Chinese to Christ; but it is equally true that they did not intend to promote the political, economic, and colonial ambitions of

⁴⁸See, for example, John D. Young, "Some Reflections on the Significance of Matteo Ricci in China," *Tripod*, 14 (April, 1983), 37.

the French government. And yet, by cultivating the protection and the financial support of that government, they chose to ignore the fact that the French government was manipulating them for its own interests abroad. They also failed to recognize that any association with such ambitions was in the end counterproductive to their dream of converting China's intellectual elite.

Interestingly enough, the coming of age of a truly indigenous Chinese Catholic Church was made possible with the victory of the Communist atheist regime which shook China loose from its subservience to the West.

Chinese Glossary

Ai,	Rulüe	X % 4
	aijiao	fi lfc
Aijin	xingquan	S, #f ft it
Ai Rulüe yu Mingmo Fuzhou shehui	31	Hi "t- \$1 fò ft & ?
	baao	&
Bays, Daniel	EH	Sie-
	ben	if.
	benshan	if &
Bertuccioli,	G	-fe fë &
Bian	jiaolun	#1 4& ffr
	biannian	£\$ #-
Bianyuan - zhongxin - dongfang - xifang	i	% . 4" ^" ^ TF I? 2G
Brook, Timothy	h	jE R,
bu	iu	il -lf
bu ru yi	fo	\$\$ jf # \$
Camps,	Arnulf	# 40 £
	chan	Sç
	chaoru	\$ Ü
chaowending	xitong	Ä -it ^ J^ St
chaoxing zhi	ming	M '14 -f. \$
Charbonnier,	Jean	jj'1l
Chen	Yuan	Hf if
Chen	Weiping	&# ^
	chongjiao	% &
Chongyi tang riji	suibi	# - 3Ê 0 fc Bt *
	chongzhuang	# H
Collani, Claudia	von	fâ IS #
Covell,	Ralph	^ i£ f
da	fumu	^C 5i #
Da	kewen	!S- \$. \$
Da xiangren	shu	^)?\$?#
Dai yi	pian	Ktitfâ
Daiyixupian	&&!	£%
	dajun	^C ^-
Dang xifang yujian	dongfang:	^ S ^T îS JL ^ # :
Guoji hanxue yu hanxuejia	@	W; % & M 'lk Q \$.
Di zui zheng	gui	\$ 3l i£ \$
difangzhi	4& #	·>
ding wei	shan	^ -^ #

Ding **Zhilin** T & *
 Diyi ye yu peitai: Ming Qing **zhiji** % - ~%&f&ffc:tyi:fc
 de Zhongxi wenhua **bijiao** jL \$ E^ ? ® X ft

dizi # -f

Donglin ^ #

Duan **Gun** & g

dui zhu chi **song** Sj- i # IS

duode I? II

Duoshu & ?

Dushu % ?

enjiao Jf, #.

Ershiyi **Shiji** - + - # Ä

fa **yuan** |ç £8

Fan **Zhong** Ia tI

Fang **Hao** # |E

Feng **Chengjun** %i %.&

Flynt, **Wayne** % % Jg,

gaojie £ M

gaozui .& H

gong A

gong iç

gongfu X £

gongguo **ge** I^ i6 #,

guanfu M

gui **gen** If #.

Han **Lin** \$ S

He **Zhaowu** ft & \$,

heru fr H

Hou **WaUu** ft *h A

hua ft

Huang **Mingqiao** f[% ?t

Huang **Yinong** ?, - JI

hua **shenghao** 4 S? flu,

hui #

huan ?|

ji #

jia **ji** % if

Jiangzhou £\$ #|

jiaohua # ft

Jidujiao yu mingmo **ruxue** ^ if ^ .H *ñ %| ?§ ^

- jie zu** M #
 Jihe **yuanben** S& ft Jf, %.
 Jin, **Guantao** & fH y\$
Jing <k
Jingbu 15 -gfl
Jingqi H &
 Jingti renwei de Yangjingbin xuefeng ¥Vb Aífatt} fi-JIR
- Jingxue** \$1 ^
Jingzuo # ^
Jinxing # &
Jiujiao II #.
Jujie ? A
Junzi 31" ?
 Kangxi chaoshi hanren shidafu dui liyu de iS18<\$fIB\$3ÊA:bÀ'
 taidu jiqi suo yansheng de **chuanshuo** £. f& ?\$| \$. \$ Å£ A A
- kaozheng** ^" If
 Katholieke Universiteit Leuven fá% % & & & A ^
- Keji** ^rZ,
 ke ji fu £ £ ft H
 ke wei shan ^T ^ #.
 ke zhi you ke zhi % £ X)£ ;L
 Kouduo richao O If H #"
 ku shen ke j i If ?" 3t &
 Lei **Chong** \$ #
 Leung, Philip Yuen-sang pík yt É.
 Li Madou jiao you renwu biao f| 3| í #P :SÈ À #7 4fe
 Li Madou pingzhuan !! S\$ If ff #
 Li Madou zai zhon guo de %; S\$ f[fe "f If é*J :iè
 huodong yu yingxiang % H ^ ^?
Lixiuyijian JK/ # - ft
L S
L <<
 Li **Guangzhen** f?fc %
 Li **Jiubiao** F ?* 1f
Lijiugong \$ X\$1
 Li **Ruiliang** \$ 4 ft.
 Li **Sixuan** F jfö "£
 Li **Tiangang** ^ ^ \$;i
 Li **Yifen** F # #
 Li **Zhizao** f ;t II

liangneng	ft*
liangxin	
liangzhi	ft*«
Lin Qi	
Lin Jinshui	
Lin Wenying	
Ling xi gao jie yao gui	
ling	S
linghun	
lingxi	*\$.%.
lingxing	
Lishi yanjiu	
Lishi de chensi	* & ft JA &
liuyan	
Liu Dong	
Liu Kuang-ching	<<* * *
Liu Qingfeng	
Lixiu yijian	J>>#-H
Luo Yagu	I * * *
Malatesta, Edward J.	
Menegon, Eugenio	
miao	JIT
ming de	8 <<
Mingmo Qingchu lixue yu kexue guanxizailun	#01 *tt&
Mingmo tianzhujiao shuru shenmo "xixue"? Juyou shenmo lishi yiyi?	fr* "ff£- ?* #ft* * * * S* ?
Mingmo tianzhujiao yu ruxue de jiaoliu he chongtu	ft £ ft*» J+ ?
mingxin	W «i:
misa ji yi	ft* <<<<
misa ji	* * *
moxiang	?<<
Mungello, D.E.	át-#r
Nanggong Shudu	
Ng, Peter Tze-ming	
nian	
nianpu	¥11
Pan Guoguang	* *
Pang Diwo	jftjè Ä
Pangzi yiquan	Ä -?-ät ft

Pei	Huaxing	£ ft ft
Pfister, Lauren	F -	# Hl fc
pi xie chong	zheng	M :?? ^ iE
ping tian	xia	? f' T
		#L
Poxie		£ W &
qi		# %-
		&
qibin		Ulf
Qike		-b £
ren		t
Renhui	yue	fc "t- #7
rixing		B ^f
Rong	Zhenhua	fMf
roushen		^J JJ
Rule, Paul		fc ^J
san	gang	? \$
sanjiao	heyi	? \$ ^p -
Sanshan lun xue		E dj Ht £ it
shangdi		J: %
Sheishi zhongguo yanjiuzhong de women		Üil't S9f ^ toil
		Äfl
Shen	Que	jc :M-
	sheng	iE
[Shengchao] zuo		[S<<)]£<<
Shenghao	jing	U SI jlf
Shengjiao si	gui	H \$ O \$,
Shengjiao	xiaoyin	l? \$ /J^ 5l
Shengmu	jing	g #1 *f
	shengong	fl X
	shengxiang	£ \$.
	shengyu	It
	shenjiao	£ %.
	shenneng	# E
Shensi		<< Jg. ft
Shi	jie	+ \$
	shi	f
	shibu	¿ Ip
shuai xing shi wei	dao	F t£ ¿L U! sit
	shujiao	# ^c
	shuyuan	# ??
		f

s! . *
sidian ^ ^
 Siji Ai xiansheng **xingji** & £ ? £ £ £ £
 Siku quanshu **zongmu** 0 /\$ £ ? & S If \$
 duiyu 'Xixue* de **pingjia** ff £ ft ff fif
 Siku quanshu **zongmu** 0 ^ £ ^p i* g
SONG li
 Standaert, **Nicolas** B "l S.
 Sun **Shangyang** \$ \$ g
 Tianzhu **jiaoyao** ^ I 4& Jc
 Taixi **shuifa** * l? * &
Taixi %,%
tang g
 Tang **Ruowang** 6%j %0%
 Tang **YI** £ A
 n <<
tian ^
tianming ^ ^
 tian ming zhi wei **xing** ? ^ l If &
 Tianxue **chuangai** * ##&
 Tianxue **chuhuan** ? 4M.U7 ®
 Tianzhu **jing** j ? ?
 Tianzhujiao dongchuan wen **xian** ^ i Ü £ ?? £. JR
 Tianzhujiao dongchuan wenxian xubian 3<?-%.% %&%!.%
 [Tianzhu] shengjiao **xiaoyin** (^ ±) g \$ 4s 5l
 Tianzhu shen pan **mingzheng** ^ £ 3£ #! \$ If
 Tianzhu **shuyi** ? ; If A
 Tianzhu **tang** ? ? j£
 Tiedemann, R. **G.** & # j£
tongdai £ \$
tongti | n
 Tm yuan zheng dao **lun** tē #, IE \$ #
waiyi ^
 Wan **Meixiu** jé *
 Wang Zheng zhi shiji ji qi shuru? \$???? #. & &
 xiyang xueshu zhi **gongxian** A W ^ ^ Br ^ ^ jR
 Wang Peter **Chen-main** J ^ j ^
 Wang **Zheng** j g£
 Wang **Zhongmin** ? ? ??
 Wang **jiafeng** l £ JS,
 Wang **Yiyuan** ? - p
 Wang **Zhongmin** £ , £

wei	jing	& íS
wei	tian	? ^
wei tian ai ren ji	lun	^ ^ ? ? # ^
wei yi gong	zheng	"t -A- IE
Wei	Zhongxian	ft & W"
Wenhua chuanbozhong de xingbian	5	ft HiS + ft ^ Ä
Wenti yu	fangfaji	H * Ä # * IE
Wickeri, Philip	L	ft £ *]
wu	chang	£ if
wu	lun	5. fà
wu ri san xing wu	shen	-S- B ? . % \$ %
	X	
	xiang	&
	xiangyue	% #j
	xiansheng	\$t E.
	xiaoshuo	i- £
	xiaoxuelei	/h 4£ ff
	Xie	3P
	xiejiao	\$ fc
Xiguo	jifa	IS B fe }£:
	Xin	ft
	Xin	<"
Xing shi wen	pian	8 # 5C JU
xing xiang jin ye, xi xinag yuan	ye	'Lé ^S à£ -fe » W ^S i& 4 .
	xing	tfc
	xingjiao	lU
	xinjiao	tr It
	Xinjing	ft ig
Xiong	Sanba	Ai E \$£
Xiong	Shiqi	iS
xiu	shen	^ J^
xiu shen yang	xing	#- A # 10-
xiu	yang	#1 #
Xixue	fam	W if A
Xu	Guangqi	# * #
Xu Guangqi	J	# * # £
Xu	Mouxi	# \$7 \$
Xu	Changzhi	fr jé
Xu	Dashou	ft ~k ±
Xu	Rulei	% Jp f
Xu	Zongze	& £ *

yan	
Yan Doubin	
Yan Weisheng	
Yang Qiyuan xiansheng chaoxing shiji	
Yang Tingyun	<< ?
Yang Zhen'e	# ifi H
Ye Xianggao	Uli] <<
Yesu hui	JP ft*
yi	
yifo	
yiduan	
yili zhi xue	
yin	5l
yin	
Yiwenzhi	
you zui	
Young, John D.	<<ft ft
Yu, Carver Tatsan	
yuanzui	
zai jiao wu you	fe%.%X
Zaihua yesu huishi liezhuan ji shumu bubian	fe\$w&t±n&
zajialei	
Zengding Xu Wending gong ji	
zhai	
Zhang Shi	
Zhang Fu	&#
Zhang Geng	
Zhang Kaiyuan	
Zhang Yongtang	
zhanli ridan	
zhanli	
zhao	BS
zheng	IE
Zheng Man	HfSJP
zhengxun	IEt)ll
zhi	*
Zhong Mingdan	
Zhongguo muluxueshi	
Zhongguo sixiang tongshi	t iJ5<<*Jt

Zhongguo wenhua yu jidujiao? SI £ ft #1 á£ lflfc
 de **chongzhuang** ft X ft ?? tt
 Zhongguo yu jidujiao: Zhongguo **het** IHSilt :
 Ouzhou wenhua zhi **bijiao**? B f" Ufe iml >C ft
 ¿Ltfc,«
 Zhongwai guanxi shi xuehui tongxun" f ír M j£ jfe. í£ *
 Zhongwai guanxishi **luncong**? ¿t M J^ jfe. ffr Hr.
 Zhu **Zongyuan**. ^ ^ 7C
 Zhuo **Xingping** Í- \$f -f"
zhuzai ¿ \$
zibu -J- \$5
zisong ll e&
 Zuo **Guangxiani** ?rj &
 Zuoshan **huī** ?& # " #
 Zürcher, **Eric** ft S Í"

SAN DIEGO DE ALCALÁ
AND THE POLITICS OF SAINT-MAKING
IN COUNTER-REFORMATION EUROPE

BY

L.J. Andrew Villalon*

On July 2, 1588, with the Spanish Armada poised to sail against England, Pope Sixtus V (1585-1590) ushered Diego de Alcalá (also known as Diego de San Nicolas del Puerto) into that exclusive company of men and women regarded as saints by the Roman Catholic Church. In so doing, Sixtus created the first saint of the Counter-Reformation period.¹ It was no accident that sainthood came at the hands of this particular pope or at the precise historical moment when Philip II of Spain was preparing to launch his Enterprise of England. It was the politics of saint-making² which gave the Spanish king what he would reckon as one of the great achievements of his reign; and which, incidentally was to supply the sixth largest city in the United States with its name.

After exploring briefly the poorly documented career of a none-too-remarkable fifteenth-century Franciscan friar, this article will examine in detail the events of the following century which would lead the Church to declare him a saint. For Diego de Alcalá was one of those saints whose canonization resulted not so much from what he had done in his lifetime, but instead from circumstances arising long after his death—in his case almost exactly a century thereafter.

*Mr. Villalon is an associate professor of history in the University of Cincinnati. Research on which the present article is based was partially financed through a grant from the University of Cincinnati Research Council. An earlier version of the article was presented in October, 1994, at the Sixteenth Century Studies Conference in Toronto. Special thanks are owed to Dr. Sander Goodman of the University of Cincinnati.

"The last canonization before Diego's had been that of Antoninus of Florence in 1523. The great historian of the papacy, Ludwig von Pastor, is in error when he states, "In 1588 the Pope [Sixtus V] celebrated the canonization of the Dominican, Louis Bertrand, and in 1588, that of the Franciscan lay-brother, Diego de Alcalá." St. Louis Bertrand did not die until 1581, and was not canonized until 1671. Pastor, *The History of the Popes from the Close of the Middle Ages*, Vol. XXI: Sixtus V, ed. Ralph Francis Kerr (London, 1932), p. 138. Donald Attwater, *The Avenel Dictionary of Saints* (New York, 1981), p. 220.

The political nature of the process is explored in Kenneth L. Woodward's *Making Saints* (New York, 1991).

The only near-contemporary source dealing with the life of San Diego, the Latin form of whose name is Didacus, is a collection of short depositions taken by the church authorities in Alcalá during the years immediately following his death (1463-1467).¹ Although more than 150 persons testified, primarily concerning miracles brought about by the friar's intercession, only about a score of these witnesses had known him personally, and fewer still could contribute any meaningful information about his activities. This single source, of which the original seems to have disappeared in the fire that destroyed the Archivo Central de Alcalá de Henares in 1939, exists in a sixteenth-century copy preserved in the Escorial. It formed the basis of the *vitae sanctorum* composed for the canonization proceedings.⁴ Working almost entirely from these *vitae*, several later hagiographers have also produced accounts, principal among them a Spanish Franciscan named Antonio Rojo, whose *Historia de San Diego de Alcalá* appeared in 1663, on the bicentenary of the saint's death.⁵

The sources agree that the future saint was born in the small village of San Nicolás del Puerto, near Seville, around the year 1400. At a young age, he retreated to an isolated hermitage in the neighborhood, where he practiced a life of evangelical poverty.⁶ Eventually, having decided to join the Franciscan Order, Diego approached the friary of Arizafa, several kilometers from Córdoba, where he applied for entry as a lay brother. After completing his novitiate, he spent some years living there, then moved to the larger Franciscan establishment in Seville, known as the Convento del Casa-Grande.

¹Catálogo de los Manuscritos Castellanos de la Real Biblioteca de el Escorial (3 vols.; San Lorenzo de el Escorial, 1929), I, 271, item and II, 14.

⁴Pietro Galesini, *Sancti Didaci Complutensis canonizatio quam Sixtus V Pont. opt. max. . . .* (Rome, 1588). Ambrosio de Morales, *Vita B. Didaci Complutensis* (written ca. 1567) in volume three of Morales' collected works entitled *Opuscula histórica quorum exemplaria in R. D. Laurentii Bibliotheca vulgo del Escorial custodiuntur*, edited by Francisco Valerio Cimentes (Madrid, 1793).

⁵Fra Antonio Rojo, *Historia de San Diego de Alcalá. Fundación y Frutos de Santidad que ha Produzido su Convento de Santa María de Jesús* (Madrid, 1663). The twentieth century has seen at least one entry in this hagiographic tradition—a 99-page pamphlet by Antonio Hernández Peralles, entitled *Breve compendio de la vida de fray Diego de San Nicolás del Puerto vulgarmente conocido por San Diego de Alcalá* (Seville, 1964). Unfortunately, this work is little more than a modernized condensation of Rojo.

⁶Based on his early seeking after a religious life, Donald Weinstein and Rudolph Bell would categorize Diego as a "child saint," one of several categories which they establish in their important work, *Saints and Society* (Chicago, 1982).

Not until around 1440 did a break occur in what had until then been the very ordinary pattern of Fra Diego's existence.⁷ He and another Franciscan brother, Juan de Santorcaz, were dispatched to the Canary Islands, which had in recent decades come into the possession of Castile, there to assume direction of the order's small monastery on the island of Fuerteventura. Although some hagiographic accounts of the saint's career extol his evangelizing efforts, other evidence indicates that the conversion of Fuerteventura's native population had probably been largely accomplished before his arrival.

Diego eventually decided to shift his attention to the as yet unsubdued island of Grand Canary, where efforts at conversion might win him a martyr's crown.⁸ However, upon arriving off the coast, his intentions were thwarted by the sudden onset of a storm and the reluctance of the ship's crew to leave him alone on such an unfriendly shore. Consequently, he returned to Fuerteventura, where he continued to serve as guardian of the monastery until he returned to Spain around 1449.⁹

In 1450 the Castilian branch of the order named Fra Diego to assist its principal representative, Alonso de Castro, at a general conclave in Rome. The pair joined pilgrims from all over Europe flocking to the Eternal City in that Holy Year. While a few were Franciscans scheduled to attend the same meeting, the vast majority came to celebrate both a Jubilee Year and the canonization of a recently deceased member of the Franciscan Order, Bernardino of Siena. When, in the hot summer months, Alonso de Castro contracted a disease which was raging through the overcrowded city, Diego took over his care, later attending other victims in the convent where he was staying. Only with the return of cooler weather and Brother Alonso's recovery did the pair begin their long journey homeward.¹⁰

Upon his return to Spain, Diego moved north from Seville, living for a time in several different convents, until finally settling in the Franciscan monastery of Santa Maria de Jesús in Alcalá de Henares, recently founded by one of Spain's most famous "warrior clerics," the archbishop of Toledo, Alonso Carrillo. Here, the lay brother spent the closing years

⁷Sources differ as to the precise date of this episode in Diego's life. One tradition has him returning to Spain as early as 1444; another places his recall in 1449-

⁸Rojo, *op. cit.*, p. 97.

⁹Several modern sources suggest that Diego's recall may have resulted from conflict with the civil authorities over treatment of the native population. *Bibliotheca sanctorum*, iv, 606. *Dictionnaire d'Histoire et de Géographie Ecclésiastiques*, XW, 436.

¹⁰Later historians would dub 1450 the Jubilee of Six Saints, due to the fact that six of those who attended, including four Franciscans, would eventually achieve sainthood.

of his life, in the city from which he takes his name and in which he died on November 12, 1463."

According to the later hagiographic accounts, at the end, Diego displayed many of the typical signs associated with sanctity. He maintained an unshakable patience in the midst of adversity. He endured without complaint the painful infection of his left arm, which ultimately caused his death. When the wound was drained, the suppurations are said to have emitted a pleasing smell (*buen olor*), "against all nature."¹² Diego begged the community to provide him only the humblest of burials. He died clutching a small wooden cross and praying in Latin—"something worth noting since he had never before in his life been heard to utter a word in that language."¹³

After death, the body was said to have defied decomposition. Marvelous lights were seen in the chapel where it rested overnight. As the population of Alcalá filed past the coffin, some kissed the corpse or its habit, others actually tried to cut off pieces of the habit or pluck hairs from the head.

Although the body was at first buried in the Franciscan cemetery, it was almost immediately disinterred by order of the monastery's guardian, who placed it in a wooden coffin and then had it displayed over a period of several months to visiting luminaries, including Archbishop Carrillo and King Henry IV (1454-1474). It was apparently the king who ordered that a chapel be built to house Diego's remains. Miracle stories soon began to circulate.

These are the basic facts of a career not unlike that of many late medieval members of the mendicant orders. While its most noteworthy feature—the friar's involvement in overseas evangelizing—served as precursor to the coming age of European expansion, such service was not without its medieval precedents. During the later Middle Ages, Franciscans worked in many non-European settings including the Crusader Kingdoms of the Near East, the empire of the Great Khan, and, most recently, in the lands discovered by the Portuguese during their voyages down the west coast of Africa. Many of these assignments involved far greater hazards than those encountered by Brother Diego in the Canary Islands; and some of the friars undertaking them won the crown of martyrdom which had eluded him.

¹²At the time of canonization, the church declared November 12 to be the saint's feast-day.

¹³RoJo, *op. cit.*, p. 128.

¹⁴*Ibid.*, p. 131.

What is more, stories involving great humility, heroic suffering, exemplary death, non-decomposition of the corpse, and supernatural prodigies (in particular, the performance of miracles) not infrequently grew up around holy men throughout Christendom.

By the fifteenth century, Diego's veneration as a "local saint" in the region around Alcalá would have placed him among those whom the Church officially recognized as *beati* (blessed).¹⁴ The closing centuries of the Middle Ages had witnessed two opposing trends. On the one hand, the papacy had increasingly monopolized canonization. At the same time, there was a notable proliferation in the number of local saints, whose only authentication derived from popular piety. To reconcile these trends, later medieval popes erected a distinction between *sancti*—those few who had come through the official, papal-dominated process—and *beati*—the many who had not. In order to move up from the latter category to the former required the kind of powerful patronage which few local saints could muster.

Such was the case with Diego until, ninety-nine years after his death, fortuitous circumstances brought his remains into contact with the gravely injured Prince of Spain, Don Carlos.

?

The "real" Don Carlos, as distinct from the mythic figure one encounters in Schüler and Verdi,¹⁵ was born in 1545, the eldest son of Philip II and his first wife, Maria of Portugal. Early in life, the prince, who was plagued by poor health, began to show signs of mental instability. As the years passed, his actions became increasingly violent and bizarre, finally forcing his royal father to take drastic action.¹⁶ In January, 1568, King Philip and several trusted officials burst into the young man's chambers

¹⁴Diego may also have won a following around Seville, in the region of his birth.

¹⁵In a monograph tracing the literary impact of the Carlos myth, Frederick Lieder lists 105 different versions of the myth. See: Lieder, *The Don Carlos Theme* ("Harvard Studies and Notes in Philology and Literature," Vol. 12 [Cambridge, Massachusetts, 1930]).

¹⁶Four Venetian ambassadors have left reports detailing the prince's odd behavior during the decade before his arrest—Federigo Badoaro (1557), Antonio Tiepolo (1563 and 1567), Giovanni Soranzo (1565), and Sigismundo Cavalli (1568). *Le Relazioni degli Ambasciatori Veneti al Senato*, ed. Eugenio Albéri (Firenze, 1861), Series II Vol. 5, pp. 74-75. L. E. Gachard, *Carlos V y Felipe II a través de sus contemporáneos* (Madrid, 1944), pp. 52-54, 109-111, 144-145. James C. Davis (ed.), *The Pursuit of Power* (New York, 1970), pp. 87-95. Luis Cabrera de Córdoba, *Felipe Segundo, Rey de España* (2 vols.; Madrid, 1876).

and placed him under house arrest. Six months later, at the age of twenty-three, Carlos died under what many regarded as "mysterious circumstances."¹

Before the end of the sixteenth century, a formidable myth began to emerge, converting this sickly and unstable Hapsburg princeling into the Don Carlos of legend, whose tragic love for his stepmother, Elizabeth of Valois, and opposition to Spain's bloody policies in the Low Countries led to his death at the hands of his own father.⁸

While the imprisonment and death of Don Carlos overshadow the rest of his life, the young prince did appear briefly on the historical stage on a few other occasions, usually as a result of his eccentric behavior or his unsuccessful forays into the royal marriage market. The most important of these appearances began on April 19, 1562, when Carlos, during a visit to Alcalá, tumbled down a staircase and struck his head against a closed door. Despite a rise in temperature and some swelling of the glands in the neck, doctors did not at first consider the injury serious. Then, on the morning of April 28, matters took a decided turn for the worse as the wound began to fester. The infection spread rapidly, engulfing the patient's face, gluing both eyes shut, and then moving downward across his neck and upper torso. On May 5, with the infection still spreading, Carlos lapsed into a delirium, which would continue on and off for five days and nights.

A team of physicians, which eventually reached ten in number and included the great anatomist, Andreas Vesalius, did what it could. The doctors washed, cupped, and bled their royal patient. They gave him potions and anointed the wound with various ointments. They pared

¹Some contemporaries hinted at the possibility of poison, among them the English ambassador, Dr. John Man. Calendar of State Papers, Foreign Series [CSP/Foreign], (Elizabeth, 1566-1568) (London, 1871)IV1 513.

⁸When rumors began to circulate almost immediately after the arrest, Spanish ambassadors at Vienna and London informed Madrid that the Protestant camp was having a field day, spreading the word that Carlos had been imprisoned for his Protestant sympathies—a totally unfounded claim which later became part of the myth. Despite these warnings, the king, adopting the view that this was a personal matter, became stubbornly uncommunicative. Even his Austrian cousins, who had hoped to arrange a marriage with the Spanish prince, complained that they were not being told enough. Although interest in the affair waned after the prince's death, it resurfaced in 1580 when William the Silent, in his famous Apology, accused Philip II of infanticide. L. P. Gachard, *Don Carlos et Philippe II* (2 vols.; Brussels, 1863), II, 572-576. Colección de Documentos Inéditos para la Historia de España [CDIHE] (112 vols.; Madrid, 1842-1895), XXVII, 10. Calendar of Letters and State Papers relating to English Affairs preserved principally in the Archives of Simancas [CSP/Spanish] (Elizabeth, 1568) (London, 1892), II, 6-8, 21.

away damaged tissue and even began to driU through the skuU (though fortunately for the prince, they did not complete this procedure). AU their efforts were unavaUing. In the absence of the three things which might really have helped their patient—sterile surgical instruments, sterile dressings, and massive doses of antibiotics—most of what the doctors did was at best, useless, and at worst, harmful.¹⁹

Meanwhile, the concerned people of Spain had ideas of their own about how to restore their presumed future ruler to health. Philip II's subjects prayed and fasted in hopes of encouraging divine mercy. They removed relics from the churches and paraded them through the streets. FlageUants often accompanied these solemn processions, whipping themselves until their blood flowed. Major shrines and monasteries throughout Spain heeded royal requests that they pray for the stricken prince.²⁰

Citizens of Alcalá added their voices to the appeal for divine mercy. In the weeks following the accident, both the town and the university organized religious processions on Carlos's behalf. Then, on the afternoon of May 9, they made their supreme effort. Either the patient himself or one of those charged with his care had asked for the remains of Alcalá's "local saint" to be brought to the sickroom. This request was deUvered and the transfer accomplished with aU the formaUty common in sixteenth-century Spain.²¹ A member of the royal counCU, armed with what amounted to an order of "habeas corpus" from the king, arrived at the monastery for a meeting with various local officials, including the

"For a detailed account of the accident, the medical treatment which ensued, and the implications for the Don Carlos myth, see my article, "Putting Don Carlos Together Again: Treatment of a Head Injury in Mid-Sixteenth Century Spain," *Sixteenth Century Journal*, XXVI (Summer, 1995), 347-365. A valuable summary of medical practices in Spain during this period and the royal attempt to exercise greater control over the medical profession can be found in: David Goodman, *Power and Penury* (New York, 1988), pp. 209-260.

²⁰Jean Ebrard, Seigneur of Saint-Sulpice, replaced the Bishop of Limoges as French ambassador in time to witness and report back to his government the remarkable concern displayed by the Spanish people. *Ambassade en Espagne de Jean Ebrard, Seigneur de Saint-Sulpice de 1562 à 1565 et Mission de ce Diplomate dans le Même Pays en 1566* (Albi, 1903), p29.

²¹In accordance with instructions laid down by the officials who effected the transfer, a complete record of the event was made by the three notaries present: (1) Sant Juan de Sardeneta, a scribe in the prince's household; (2) Baltasar Pardo, the apostolic notary at the university; and (3) Juan de Antequera, a notary in the service of the archdiocese. The resulting document is reproduced in Fr. Lucio María Nuñez, "Documentos sobre la curación del príncipe D. Carlos y la canonización de San Diego de Alcalá," *Archivo Ibero-Americano*, I (1914), 424-446; II (1915), 374-387; V (1918), 107-126, 421-430.

rector of the university, a representative of the vicar general of the Franciscan order, and the local vicar.

In the presence of illustrious witnesses and of three scribes charged with keeping a detailed account of the proceedings, they unlocked the stout outer casket of heavy wooden planks covered in iron and then opened the small inner coffin in which Diego lay.

Members of the order transferred Diego's remains to a bier decorated for the occasion with silk hangings. Taking up their burden, the friars marched out of the church and, with the dignitaries who had been present at the exhumation, took their place at the head of a procession. As they marched solemnly up the main street, they were joined by religious contingents from the city's other churches, citizens from all levels of society, and much of the student body of the university. Upon arriving at the palace, the bier, accompanied by leading members of its escort, entered the sickroom.

In the presence of their monarch, who was kneeling in prayer, the friars lowered their burden next to the prince's bed, and folded back the Franciscan robe which was covering Diego to expose part of his face to view. Although only semi-conscious and blinded by infection, Carlos reportedly asked for his eyes to be forced open, so that he might see the blessed remains. The chief steward, hoping to spare the young man the further agony which forcing open his eyes would entail, refused to allow it. Nevertheless, at the prince's request, the corpse was transferred to his bed, and Carlos who, despite his weakened state, had rallied enough to pray, reached over to touch it, after which he drew his hands across his diseased face.²²

Afterwards, the corpse was returned to the bier and began its journey back to its resting place. As the procession wound its way through Al-

"Dionisio Daza Chacón and Diego Santiago Olivares, the two royal physicians who have left detailed accounts of the injury and its treatment, insist that Carlos had little or no idea of what was happening around him. By contrast, others who were present in the sickroom, including a third physician, Cristóbal de Vega, remembered matters differently. Dr. de Vega told of the patient having touched the corpse. He also informed the commission that Fra Diego's remains had been brought to the sickroom at the personal request of Don Carlos. Another witness, Alonso de Mendoza, a master of arts and doctor of theology at the University of Alcalá, told of the prince's request to have his eyes opened. Mendoza went on to say that the prince

tenjendo puestas sus manos sobre el cuerpo y rostro del dicho fray Diego, levantó las manos y se las puso en su mismo rostro del dicho Príncipe, y ojos, y boca; y esto hizo dos veces, rezando en este tiempo algunas devociones.

cala, it entered each church along the route where prayers were recited and services conducted. At journey's end, Diego was replaced in his coffin which was fitted with five locks, the keys to which were entrusted to five different men.

Late that night (May 9) came the crisis. Despite the medical team's around-the-clock ministrations, the visit of Diego's remains, and the unceasing prayers of the Spanish people, Carlos appeared to be at death's door. Around midnight, the usually phlegmatic monarch, Philip II, who had watched his son's deteriorating condition with growing despair, gathered a few of his closest advisors and rode out into the stormy night. Rather than wait for the young man to die by inches, the king headed for a Jeronymite monastery near Madrid, there to pray and await the inevitable.²³

The doctors, who had no choice but to stay and treat their patient, held out little hope that he would survive the night. They had also to fear for their own safety, since a public outcry had arisen over their treatment of the prince, fueled by a number of physicians who, despite an absence from the scene, had not hesitated to criticize their colleagues.²⁴

Just as things seemed darkest came the first real break in the case. Despite predictions that death was imminent, Carlos managed to rally and survive the night of May 9, during which he enjoyed the first hours of peaceful sleep he had had in quite some time. By morning, his pulse seemed stronger, and his delirium had lessened.

Thereafter, the prince steadily improved. When Philip rode back to Alcalá on May 13, he found Carlos fully conscious and in his right mind.

The story told by Mendoza and de Vega agrees with the prince's own account, contained in the will which he drew up two years later. Dionisio Daza Chacón, "Relación Verdadera de la herida de cabeza del Serenísimo Príncipe nuestro Señor, de gloriosa memoria, la cual se acabó en fin de julio del año de 1562" (hereafter abbreviated "Chacón") in *CDIHE*, XVIII, 549. Diego Santiago Olivares, "Relación de la enfermedad del Príncipe D. Carlos en Alcalá por el Doctor Olivares medico de su cámara" (hereafter abbreviated "Olivares") in *Cd/#E*, XV, 562. Nuñez, *oj5.c.c.*, 1,431-434. "The Last Will and Testament of Don Carlos (1564)," in *CDIHE*, XXIV, 523.

²³In the words of the surgeon Chacón, the king departed "with a pain that we could all understand." Chacón, pp. 549-550. See also Olivares, p. 562.

²⁴According to the doctors, the medical team realized full well "the danger in which they all stood as a result of the rabble's indignation." Chacón, pp. 550, 560. See also Olivares, p. 572. Several ambassadors, including the French bishop of Limoges and Thomas Chaloner of England, reflected this public mood in their dispatches. In a letter of May 10, the Bishop of Limoges recorded his belief that the doctors had erred. Chaloner was even

As the days passed, the young man regained his appetite, and his temperature approached normal. On the sixteenth, the doctors felt confident enough to begin draining the abscesses which had closed their patient's eyes; and by the twenty-first, they were able to pronounce the right eye fully healed and the left well on its way to recovery. On May 19, the fever had disappeared for good. On June 14, Carlos left his bed for the first time, and, three days later, he walked through the palace to the king's quarters.

Late in June, he ventured outside, and on the twenty-ninth, attended a special Mass held in Fra Diego's chapel. Afterwards, the prince asked to view his benefactor's body. Since the five key holders were present, the keys were quickly produced and the coffin again opened. Once more, the Franciscan robe was folded back to show Carlos parts of the corpse, including those exposed during the visit to the sickroom. The coffin was then closed and sealed.²⁵

The prince continued to improve rapidly. He began taking afternoon walks in the fields around the city. On July 5, he again attended Mass, after which he strode into the main plaza to watch the bullfights and young men jousting with canes. Finally, on July 17, with the wound completely healed over, he left Alcalá and proceeded by easy stages to Madrid.

m

Even before Carlos had fully recovered, the debate began over who deserved the credit. While a few contemporaries looked to the doctors, most appear to have joined the English ambassador, Thomas Chaloner,

more graphic. In a report to the queen, he referred to members of the medical team as "bunglers" who "not searching the hurt deeply had promised all good hope to the King, and made untimely haste to the healing up of the incision, whereby the bone putrefied." Although the king had brought Vesalius from Madrid, his "better learning the Spanish medicens make not account of." Another of Chaloner's communiqués assured the English secretary, William Cecil, that "there is great fault ... in the negligent cure by his surgeons." Chacón, pp. 550, 560. Gachard, *Don Carlos et Philippe II*, Vol. II, Appendix, p. 634. Chaloner to the Queen (May 11, 1562), CSP-Foreign/Elizabeth (1562), pp. 26-30. Chaloner to Cecil (May 12, 1562), CSP-Foreign/Elizabeth (1562), p. 32.

²⁵Acting on instruction from several churchmen involved in the event, including Alonso Ferrete, the commissary general of the Franciscan Order in Spain, a notary named Baltasar Pardo made a record of these proceedings which was reproduced in Nunez, *op. cit.*, I, 436-444.

in dismissing their efforts as ineffectual. Spaniards, including both the patient and his royal father, believed that they saw the hand of Providence at work.²⁶ Since the king had implored all major shrines to pray for his son, and communities throughout the country had paraded their local saints, many now claimed at least partial credit for influencing the divine intervention.

Nevertheless, attention soon focused on the remains of Fra Diego. When first hearing of their visit to the sickroom, Ambassador Chaloner had astutely predicted that "if God sende the prince to escape, that fryer is not unlike to be canonized for his laboure."²⁷

Upon regaining his senses, Carlos greatly increased the likelihood of such an outcome by reporting an apparition which he had seen while still very near death.²⁸ According to the prince, on the night of May 9, a figure, dressed in Franciscan habit and carrying a small wooden cross, had entered the sickroom. The prince remembered asking the visitor if he were Saint Francis and, if so, why he had appeared without his stigmata. Although Carlos could not remember any specific reply to his questions, the shrouded figure had assured him that he would recover. Later, having concluded that Diego rather than St. Francis had visited him in the night, both the prince and his father vowed to work for the friar's canonization.²⁹

The reaction of Carlos's doctors sheds important light on the contemporary debate over his recovery and whether it should be ascribed to medical skill or divine intervention. C. D. O'Malley, author of several modern works which touch on the prince's injury,³⁰ states that the miracle theory was opposed by the physicians, "who understandably felt that their contribution to the prince's recovery was being over-

²⁶In mid-June, the French ambassador expressed the general view when reporting that Don Carlos "est venu à telle extrémité que l'on l'a tenu pour mort, sans poux ny parolle, mais depuis, quasi comme par miracle, il est revenu en bonne santé et convalescence." *Ambassade de Jean Ebrard*, p. 29.

²⁷Gachard, *Don Carlos et Philippe II*, II, 640.

²⁸For an account of apparitions seen by other Spaniards at about this time, see William A. Christian, Jr., *Apparitions in Late Medieval and Renaissance Spain* (Princeton, New Jersey, 1981.)

»Chacón, pp. 558-559.

³⁰C. D. O'Malley, *Andreas Vesalius of Brussels 1514-1564* (Berkeley, 1964); *Don Carlos of Spain: A Medical Portrait* (Los Angeles, 1969).

looked.³² In fact, the situation was not so simple: the medical team split dramatically on the question of whether the cure had resulted from their efforts or from divine intervention.

Among eighty-three witnesses who opted for a miraculous cure were Cristóbal de Vega and Hernán López 'el Portugués,' both physicians who had treated Don Carlos. De Vega went so far as to impugn the motives of several of his colleagues who had argued the case for medicine, by telling an ecclesiastical commission investigating the event, "these physicians were saying this in order to make their role in the cure seem greater than it was."³²

Whether or not de Vega numbered Dionisio Daza Chacón, the prince's personal surgeon, among these erring physicians cannot be known, for Chacón, who wrote the principal account of the injury, "played it safe." On the one hand, he praised the physicians for their tireless efforts and courage in the face of popular hostility; on the other hand, he acknowledged that God's mercy had ultimately made recovery possible, and he extolled any supernatural beings (including Fra Diego) who may have interceded on the prince's behalf. At the same time, he carefully avoided saying anything which might draw him into a debate between the relative role of medicine and the miraculous in effecting a cure.³³

By contrast, the prince's personal physician, Diego Santiago Olivares, stated unequivocally that the cure of Don Carlos was due primarily to medical skill rather than divine intervention. His account of the injury raises a defense of medicine by one who had labored hard to effect a cure, only to see his efforts severely criticized and then virtually dismissed. In Olivares, we detect an intimation of the future—of a world governed by science rather than religion, in which medicine and the patient's own recuperative powers would count for more than intervention by the deity.

Olivares did not go so far as to dismiss entirely the workings of Providence and was even willing to concede (albeit somewhat patronizingly) that Brother Diego may have played a role.

³²This statement, which appears in Vesalius (p. 300), as well as a similar one in Don Carlos of Spain (p. 11), were made despite O'Malley's familiarity with the article by Fra Lucio Nuñez which reproduced the "pro-miracle" testimony of both Dr. de Vega and Dr. Portugués. Nuñez, *op. cit.*, ll 433-434.

³³*Ibid.*

»Chacón, pp. 558-562.

I do believe . . . that God showed special favor to the prince and came to his aid, due principally to the intercession of . . . the Holy Virgin, and to the public prayers, processions . . . and fasting offered up all over Spain and in many foreign places. One can also piously believe in the intercession . . . of the blessed Brother Diego, to whom his Highness . . . has paid such devotion.³⁴

Nevertheless, he disputed the claim that a long-dead friar or anyone else had wrought a miracle. In his opinion, the medical effort had saved Prince Carlos, and he bridled at any attempt to dismiss or belittle that effort.

The cure was of natural origins. As a result of the remedies which were administered, the prince recovered; and only those [cures] are properly called miracles which are beyond the power of all natural remedies. . . . People cured by resorting to the remedies of physicians are not said to have been cured by a miracle since the improvement in their health can be traced to those remedies. . . ."

In retrospect, we can see that OUvares vastly overstated the case for sixteenth-century medicine. The prince appears to have survived in spite of, rather than because of, the medical procedures practiced upon him. Ironically, his fervent belief in Fra Diego may indeed have played a greater role in his survival than the best efforts of his physicians.

What is more, those like OUvares who were inclined to make the case for medicine soon fell silent. It would have taken no little courage to go on denying the miraculous nature of the cure once it became clear that both the royal family and the Spanish people firmly believed that a miracle had taken place and the Church was ready to endorse their belief. As a royal physician, OUvares depended upon the crown for his livelihood. If pressed too vociferously, his denial of the miraculous, which ran counter to his employers' desire for canonization, might well cost him his position. For most men, probably including OUvares, such a threat to their career -would have been enough to secure their silence.

As if this were not enough, lurking in the background was a danger far greater than mere loss of employment. By 1562, Europe was caught in the throes of the Counter-Reformation. In Spain, more than anywhere else, the forces of a resurgent Catholicism were gearing up to fight the Protestant menace. When efforts to purge the homefront of Protestant

³⁴OUvares, p. 570.

"Olivares, pp. 570-571.

sympathies could bring down even an archbishop of Toledo and former confessor of Charles V, no one was safe.³⁶

Throughout the Reformation, the cult of saints was a hotly debated issue. Catholics strongly reaffirmed their traditional belief in the efficacy of saintly intercession, while Protestants just as strongly denied it. In this highly charged atmosphere, the doctor's denial that Brother Diego had worked a miracle might have laid him open to the very real danger of being considered a Protestant sympathizer.

Olivares apparently recognized this. In the immediate aftermath of the prince's recovery, he had written to Cardinal GranveUe and perhaps to others, stating his belief that the cure was natural rather than miraculous; thereafter, as the movement to canonize Diego de Alcalá picked up momentum, the doctor fell süent. It may be that OUvares had too much integrity to soft-pedal his objections to the miracle theory, but too little courage to press home the claims of medicine. He had before him a chilling example of what could happen in the prevailing atmosphere of intolerance to a physician who meddled too deeply in religious affairs. In 1564, Miguel Servetus, the most important Spanish-born doctor of the period, had fled from his home in southern France to escape the Papal Inquisition only to be burned at the stake in Protestant Geneva!

TV

The campaign to have Diego de Alcalá officially recognized as a saint began even before the prince had completely recovered. Late in May, 1562, Alcalá and the neighboring villages wrote to Rome on the friar's behalf. Before the summer was out, other voices sweUed the chorus, including the leader of the Franciscan order in CastUe and the rector of the University of Alcalá. Many Spanish grandees who had been present in Alcalá as the drama unfolded added their letters.

On February 28, 1563, the crown formally entered the campaign when both Philip and Carlos petitioned Rome on Fra Diego's behalf.³⁷ The king clearly stated his belief that his son's survival had been "an obvious miracle."

"Archbishop Bartolomé de Carranza, who had delivered the last rites to Emperor Charles V, endured a seventeen-year heresy trial before the Spanish Inquisition (1559-1576) from which he emerged a broken man.

"Philip's correspondence with Rome is preserved in the Archivo General de Simancas (Sección de Estado) [hereafter AGS, Estado]. The letters which he and Carlos sent to Rome in 1563 can be found in AGS, Estado, legajo 901, fols. 10 and 11.

With the prince in the final stages [of the disease], beyond any sort of human remedy, our Lord saw fit to preserve him, due as we piously believe to the merits and intercession by that saint. And in order to recognize this and to give God the thanks which we owe him for so singular a favor, we wish and desire that Your Holiness canonize the sainted Brother Diego for His greater glory.³⁸

Philip went on to raise other arguments in favor of canonization:

The life which he [Diego] led while in this world and the many . . . miracles that he performed and has continued to perform after his death supply proof of his sanctity and how he is treasured by God. Moreover, it would redound to your [referring to Pius IV] service and glory and to the confusion of the many heretics living in these times.³⁹

Throughout his long fight to win sainthood for Diego de Alcalá, the king would continue to stress the inspirational value of a canonization in the on-going struggle against Protestantism, thereby linking his personal desires to the greater good of the embattled Catholic faith.

On May 1, 1564, nearly two years after the injury, the reigning pope, Pius IV (1559-1565), responded to the deluge of correspondence from Spain by establishing a commission of five cardinals—Alessandrino (Ghislieri), Araceli, Morone, Saraceno, and Vitellio—to examine the evidence and then draft a summary of Diego's career. Since the evidence would have to be gathered in Spain, the cardinals delegated the actual investigation to three local prelates—Diego de Covarrubias, Bishop of Segovia, Pedro de la Gasea, Bishop of Sigüenza, and Bernardo de Fresnada, Bishop of Cuenca.

The bishops accepted their charge in December, 1564, then moved with surprising celerity—the only example of such expedition throughout the entire process. In January, 1565, they journeyed to Alcalá, where they concluded their preliminary investigation before the end of the month and immediately forwarded the results to Rome.

Meanwhile, in May, 1564, Prince Carlos had taken what would turn out to be a farsighted precaution when he inserted into his will a clause, imploring his father never to abandon the canonization effort, even if he himself were to die before it could be accomplished.

³⁸Ibid.

³⁹Ibid.

Being in the grip of this sickness, despaired of by the doctors and left for dead by my lord father, and with the instructions for my interment having been given, the body of the sainted Brother Diego was brought to me. And when ... I touched it, I felt the improvement which our Lord God saw fit to bestow upon me. Since then, having had good reason to believe that I owe [my life] to [Brother Diego's] merits and his beneficent intervention with our Divine Majesty, I have had the intention of doing everything in my power to procure his canonization. . . . And I beg my lord, the king, that as a particular favor to me, he will procure this end which he too desires.⁴⁰

Despite the ultimate estrangement between father and his son, Philip honored this last request, for he was as firmly convinced as Carlos concerning Fra Diego's sanctity. Diplomatic correspondence preserved in the Archives at Simancas bears witness that in the two decades following the young man's death (1568), the king continued to pressure and cajole three successive popes—Pius V (1566-1572), Gregory XIII (1572-1585), and Sixtus V (1585-1590).

The death of Pius IV at the end of 1565 brought to the papal throne a Dominican friar, Michèle GhisUeri, who, upon his elevation in January, 1566, took the name Pius V The election of this zealous inquisitor and future saint absorbed (as papal elections always did) the attention of the cardinals, side-tracking for a time the canonization process. There followed a period of some months when matters progressed hopefuUy Philip II, who had strongly supported Pius Vs candidacy, had his ambassador in Rome, Luis de Requesens, vigorously press the cause of Diego de Alcalá.⁴¹ In response, the new pope, who as Cardinal Alessandrino (so called from his native place, Alessandria) had been a member of the investigating commission, now named as his replacement the Cardinal of San Clemente; after which the commission began to consider seriously the materials it had received from Spain.

After drawing up a summary for the pope, the cardinals initiated a second stage in the proceedings when, late in October, 1566, they instructed the three Spanish bishops to go to Alcalá and administer a carefulUy prepared interrogatory to aU those who beUeved they had witnessed a miracle at the time of the prince's injury.

Meanwhüe, PhUip named as his personal representative to these proceedings Ambrosio de Morales, a priest from Córdoba who had become

⁴⁰CDIHE, XXIV, 523-524.

⁴¹AGS, Estado 901 (January and February, 1566).

something of a royal "troubleshooter" in religious matters.⁴² The king also charged Morales with composing in Latin the spiritual biography of Diego de Alcalá (referred to as the *leyenda*) which would be required in the canonization process.⁴³

In February, 1567, Morales, the three bishops, and Dr. Pedro Martinez, a procurador fiscal named by the Holy See, returned to Alcalá, where they took testimony from eighty-three witnesses.⁴⁴ Typical was that supplied by Alonso de Mendoza, a member of one of Spain's most powerful noble houses, who was rapidly rising through the ecclesiastical hierarchy. Mendoza described in detail the grave state of the prince's health on May 9, the scene he witnessed in the sickroom, and the spectacular recovery which followed the visit of Diego's remains. He did not hesitate to say that

he believed and held it as certain that the improvement in the prince's health was the work of Our Lord, inspired by the merits of the said holy Brother Diego and that it was publicly held to be so throughout the realm. . . ."

Of the eighty-three of those interviewed, including the two physicians who had treated Carlos, apparently testified that the cure was indeed miraculous and that the miracle was due to the intercession of Diego de Alcalá.

The diplomatic correspondence which passed between Philip II and his ambassador in Rome during the mid-1560's was guardedly optimistic. Although questions were raised concerning how much the canonization would cost and how many months it might require, neither

"Correspondence appointing Morales as royal representative in the proceedings and commissioning him to write a life of Diego de Alcalá appears in Volume 3 of the collected works (pp. 190-205). It is followed by his *Vita B. Didaci Complutensis* (pp. 206-211) and a second piece entitled *Officium recitandum infesto B. Didaci Complutensis alias del S. Nicolao confessions nonpontificis* (pp. 212-232).

ZbU1111 190-232. The official name for such a history, the *leyenda* or "legend," does not, in this context, signify a myth.

"Córdoba, op. cit., II 348-349. According to Fra Nunez, who printed various selections from the proceso in his article on the canonization of Diego de Alcalá, a copy still existed in 1915 in the Archivo Central de Alcalá de Henares (Leg. ° 20: 471.) Nuñez, op. cit., L 426-427. Unfortunately, those archives fell victim to fire in 1939. A preliminary search in the Archivo Segreto Vaticano has failed to turn up the copy of the proceso which had been forwarded to Rome. A copy, however, does survive in the Biblioteca Real Monasterio de San Lorenzo de el Escorial, Catálogo de los Manuscritos Castellanos, II 271, item and 11.15.

"Nunez, op. cit., I, 433.

the king nor Requesens expressed any fear that it might encounter a serious obstacle. In March, 1567, Don Luis informed Philip that the powers he had been given were indeed adequate to carry through the canonization process. He strongly approved the king's decision to have Ambrosio de Morales write up the official account of Diego's life. He also approved the king's suggestion that a Latin translation of the investigation be composed in Spain, but reminded the king that care should be taken to have any such translation, as well as the Castilian original, signed by the three bishops. What is more, Requesens asked that arrangements be made as soon as possible for paying the canonization expenses.⁴⁶

The proceso accompanied by Morales' leyenda arrived in Rome in August, 1567, at which time notice was given to the pope and the documents were turned over to the commission of cardinals. Apparently, PhLUp had changed his mind about having a Latin translation made, for the cardinals immediately handed over the documents to "un doctor español" who was given the task. The ambassador informed Spain that, given the length of the document and the fact that only one person was working on its translation, no further progress could be expected before late autumn. Requesens promised that he would try to hurry matters along, but cautioned PhUip that they would be fortunate if the rest of the canonization process could be completed in as little as six months. He sent the king information concerning what he thought (incorrectly) had been the most recent canonization undertaken by Rome⁴⁷ and warned his majesty that the costs this time were going to be a good deal higher.⁴⁸

The ambassador's estimate of six months turned out to be an extreme case of wishful thinking. Late in the 1560's, the canonization process apparently lost papal support and ground to a halt, not to move forward again for nearly twenty years. In March, 1569, PhUip wrote to his new ambassador in Rome, Juan de Zuñiga, indicating his great disappointment at the recent turn of events:

What you have told me about his Holiness not being inclined to the canonization of the sainted brother Diego de Alcalá displeases me very much; and I am amazed to hear it for I have been told that the case was so well

⁴⁶AGSI Estado 905 (March 17, 1567).

⁴⁷Ambassador Requesens was mistaken. Francis of Paola, whose documentation he sent Philip, had been canonized in 1519, four years before Antoninus of Florence.

⁴⁸AGS, Estado 905 (September 15, 1567).

substantiated and the information so complete that there would be no difficulty whatsoever. And I strongly charge you not to let the matter drop, but to go forward with such zeal that if this blessed man deserves to be placed in the catalogue of saints, he not lose that honor due to human negligence."

Without papal backing, all such exhortations from Madrid would prove fruitless.⁵⁰ Although the papacy of Pius V yielded in 1572 to that of Gregory XIII, the movement for canonization did not resume. In fact, the diplomatic correspondence singled out Gregory as an even more intransigent barrier to progress than his predecessor.

Just why the papacy for almost two decades opposed Diego's canonization remains a mystery. The hagiographic accounts fail to indicate that such opposition existed, and instead convey a distinct impression that all delays in the process can be traced either to the press of business or bureaucratic red tape. Our knowledge that two popes dragged their heels comes instead from the diplomatic correspondence between Rome and Madrid in the years 1568-1585; and even this considerably more candid source fails to explain just why Pius and later Gregory balked at conferring sainthood upon the Spanish Franciscan.

Ironically, the first signs of papal opposition begin to appear toward the end of the 1560's, at a moment when Philip's domestic and international policies could only have pleased a hardliner like Pius V. These were the years when the king moved decisively to solve the problem of the Moriscos, descendants of men and women who earlier in the century had converted from Islam to Christianity rather than face expulsion from their homes in southern Spain. By the 1560's, the Moriscos had come to be regarded as a potential fifth column in Spain's on-going struggle against the Ottoman Empire. In an attempt to end the danger and to break their remaining ties with Islam, Philip uprooted them, moving thousands northward to be resettled among the towns and villages of Old Castile.

Equally pleasing to Pius would have been the fact that by the late 1560's, the Spanish Inquisition had finished eradicating all vestiges of

⁵⁰AGS, Estado 910 (March 12, 1569).

⁵¹In May, 1569, Philip reiterated his instructions to the ambassador in Rome to keep raising the issue of canonization with the pope. In September, the king, having been informed of the pope's anger at being reminded of the matter, praised his ambassador's efforts: "vos hizistes muy bien en dezirle lo que a [ejste proposito le dixistes." AGS, Estado 910 (May 26, 1569), (September 18, 1569).

Spain's nascent Protestant movement. Outside the peninsula, Philip's great general, the Duke of Alba, was rigorously suppressing heresy in the Low Countries. What is more, at the pope's behest, Philip had joined Venice and the Papacy in an anti-Turkish coalition whose campaign in the eastern Mediterranean would culminate, in 1571, in the great naval victory at Lepanto.

Relations between Philip and Pius did eventually cool, due primarily to the pope's decision to excommunicate the English monarch, Elizabeth. Nevertheless, the excommunication did not occur until 1570, long after the new Spanish ambassador in Rome, Juan de Zuñiga, had detected papal opposition to Diego's canonization.⁵¹

In the absence of significant policy differences between king and pope, other explanations must be sought. Perhaps Pius originally withheld his support to spur Philip to even greater efforts in behalf of papal policy, and during the ensuing period, momentum for canonization was lost. Perhaps as a Dominican, Pius V could not bring himself to preside over the canonizing of a member of the rival mendicant order. It may be that neither Pius nor his successor considered the friar's accomplishments sufficient to merit Christianity's highest accolade. Whatever the case, the issue of papal opposition clearly warrants further research.

Even in the face of papal indifference (or hostility), Philip continued his efforts. In September, 1583, he seized the occasion afforded by a church council in the Province of Toledo to remind the pope once again of the report which had been in Rome "for many years" and urge that His Holiness act upon it.⁵² At the same time, he wrote to his newest ambassador in Rome, Enrique de Guzman, Count of Olivares, asking whether anything remained to be done in Spain. He also forwarded letters from the archbishop, the canons, and the rector of the University of Alcalá, all favoring Diego de Alcalá's cause, to be turned over to whoever now had custody of the case.⁵³

In February, 1585, the beleaguered ambassador wrote back to Philip, explaining that he had done everything in his power. He had spoken three or four times to the pope and an infinite number of times to other important officials. He had explored "a thousand means" of bringing the business to a successful conclusion—all to no avail. Although the count had won a papal commitment to revisit the matter, he admitted to

⁵¹Pastor, *op. cit.*, XVIII, 217-220. Geoffrey Parker, *Philip II*, 3d ed. (Chicago, 1995), pp. 75-78, 96-111.

⁵²AGS, Estado 944 (September 12, 1583).

⁵³Ibid.

Philip that this seemed to have been made "more in the spirit of providing comforting words, than executing them." To help excuse his failure, OUVares reported a mysterious rumor sweeping through Rome that the first pope who undertook a canonization would immediately die. Although OUVares promised to continue his efforts in Fra Diego's behalf, he indicated that he must do so cautiously, so as not to disrupt other negotiations.⁵⁴

The turning point came several months later, with the elevation in April, 1585, of Felice Piretti to the throne of Saint Peter. Born of humble parents, Piretti had risen through the Franciscan order to become its vicar general under Pius V. Consequently, as pope, he would be predisposed to favor a sainthood which would add glory to the Franciscan tradition, a predisposition which would not have characterized either Pius V, a Dominican, or Gregory XIII, a secular. Sixtus also came to power with the express intention of completing tasks left undone by the predecessor whom he despised, and Diego's canonization followed under that heading.

Sensing the changed climate at Rome, Philip quickly contacted his ambassador, who reopened the matter with the new pope. For the first time in nearly two decades, the response was rapid and favorable. In May, OUVares was able to report back to Madrid that Sixtus had already appointed three judges from the Roman Rota, the court that handled ecclesiastical appeals, to review the case, a thing which Pope Gregory, who "had proceeded so unwillingly," had not accomplished in the preceding two years.⁵⁵

A sense of urgency now pervaded the diplomatic correspondence. All efforts had to be made to bring the matter to a successful conclusion while Sixtus still occupied the papacy. In the words of OUVares:

Your Majesty should command that [things] be done quickly, because it is a matter which will require time, and if (may it not please God) this pope should die . . . the matter might fall to another who does not wish to consider it, as I have written to your Majesty was the case with Pope Gregory.⁵⁶

⁵⁴AGS, Estado 946 (February 25, 1585).

⁵⁵AGS, Estado 946 (May 21, 1585).

⁵⁶Ibid.

The ambassador suggested that Philip convene the Cortes of Castile and have the representatives of the cities forward to Rome a letter indicating "the great fame" in which the blessed Brother Diego was held throughout the realm. He also pointed out that the process might be expedited were the king to provide as soon as possible a sufficient amount of money to cover the necessary expenses.

In November, 1586, Olivares reported to Philip that the *auditores* of the Rota were wrapping up their deliberations and would, within the week, issue a recommendation favoring canonization. The ambassador indicated his belief that "from this point forward, it will be just a matter of form and will go forward so easily that nothing will stop it."⁵⁷

Once again, he reminded the king that money to cover the expenses, several of which would come due at any moment, should be forwarded to Rome without delay. To give a better idea of the sums involved, Olivares included with this dispatch a seven-page document entitled "Memorandum of what it costs for a canonization—more or less."⁵⁸

The document listed eighty-six separate payments, ranging from a high of 3200 ducats to purchase hats for each of the forty cardinals who would attend the ceremony down to six ducats for the bellringers of St. Peter's. Nine hundred ducats would be required almost immediately to reimburse the *auditores* of the Rota. The five cardinals who would compose the new commission soon to be appointed by Sixtus were to receive 500 ducats for their work and a further 280 ducats to help defray the cost of outfitting them on the day of the ceremony.⁵⁹ The dispatch of papal bulls would cost 600 ducats. A wooden grandstand large enough to accommodate not only the cardinals, but also the many ambassadors, prelates, and Roman nobles in attendance could be erected for 300 ducats. The outfitting of the pope alone would consume hundreds of ducats, the decoration of the city and church, hundreds more. Five hundred ducats would be distributed among the many monks, nuns, and secular clerics throughout Rome who were called upon for their prayers thanking God for Brother Diego's miracles.

The canonization would prove a windfall for members of the papal court and household who would together receive several thousand ducats. Fifteen hundred would be earmarked for incidental and unan-

⁵⁷AGS, Estado 947 (November 2, 1586).

⁵⁸AGS, Estado 947 (undated).

⁵⁹Sixtus actually appointed more than five cardinals to the commission, thereby increasing this particular cost.

anticipated expenses. The total came to 20,954 ducats. Not included in this figure (although mentioned in the memorandum) was the cost of outfitting the ambassador and his household for the ceremony. Olivares left this amount blank, trusting it to his sovereign to decide how much he was willing to pay to have his representatives cut a splendid figure on the important day.

On December 11, within a week of having received Olivares' dispatch, Philip wrote back, sincerely thanking his ambassador for having "guided through the canonization of the holy Brother Diego" and indicating that the Count of Miranda had been ordered to provide immediately any sums up to 20,000 ducats which Olivares might require "in order that nothing be left undone for want of the necessary money"⁶⁰

Meanwhile, as predicted, the auditors issued a favorable report, stating that all necessary evidence had been gathered. Consequently, in January, 1587, Sixtus chose a new group of cardinals to conduct the official examination, "all those named by Pius IV at the beginning of the process having died."⁶¹ The reconstituted commission was led by Cardinal Marco Antonio Colonna and included Cardinals Farnese, Boneo, Santorio, Carrafa, Sarnano, de Medici, and Mateo.⁶² Their deliberations consumed another year and a half, but by the early summer of 1588, they too had returned a favorable verdict.⁶³

That the timing was purely coincidental seems highly unlikely. Not long after becoming pope, Sixtus V confronted the chain of events which inexorably and with escalating rapidity led up to the Spanish Armada.⁶⁴ From the moment his reign began, the new pope urged upon Philip the enterprise of England, only to hear that unending reprise—that such an enterprise would demand extensive financial backing from

MAGS, Estado 947 (December 11, 1586).

⁶⁰Rojas, op. cit., p. 193.

⁶¹Rojas states that six cardinals were appointed to the commission, but immediately goes on to list eight: op. cit., pp. 193-194. This appears to have been the last ad hoc commission of cardinals to oversee a canonization process. On January 22, 1588, Sixtus V issued the bull *Immensa Dei*, reorganizing the Roman bureaucracy into fifteen permanent congregations, each of which was to exercise a distinct administrative jurisdiction. One of these, the Congregation of Rites and Ceremonies, was entrusted with responsibility for preparing papal canonizations as well as the authentication of relics. However, since the canonization process for Diego de Alcalá was already in its final stages, it was left in the hands of the cardinalitial commission appointed a year earlier. Pastor, op. cit., XXI, 245-257. Woodward, op. cit., p. 75.

⁶²Parras, op. cit., p. 57.

⁶³The best and most readable account of this prelude to the invasion is still to be found in the early chapters of Garrett Mattingly's classic work, *The Armada* (Boston, 1959).

the papacy. However, when it came to advancing money for the project, Sixtus balked. He was already heavily committed in the bunding projects which would restore and modernize the city of Rome, and he had no intention of throwing papal gold into a project which might never come to fruition. The pope publicly promised a million ducats once Spanish soldiers had landed on the heretic island, but not before.⁶⁵

On the other hand, a consummate politician like Sixtus must have recognized that in Diego's canonization he had the perfect means for rewarding Spanish efforts and spurring on the often dutiful king without advancing any papal gold. He could satisfy Philip and provide inspiration to the Catholic world in a time of conflict, at no cost to his treasury, since the Spanish monarch was eager for an opportunity to pay the canonization expenses, despite the enormous costs he was already incurring for the Armada.

And so, as Europe surged forward toward a critical moment in its religious struggle, Diego de Alcalá came ever closer to joining Christendom's most elite company. In the summer of 1588, with the Spanish fleet gathering in northern ports for the attack on England, the canonization process reached its climax. On June 20, in a secret consistory, Cardinal Colonna brought a favorable report from the commission of which he was the senior member. Five days later, a public consistory heard Philip's representative deliver a lengthy oration about the candidate, followed by a gracious reply from the papal secretary. On June 27, a second public consistory witnessed the unanimous vote in favor of canonization.

The crowning moment came on July 2, 1588, during a dazzling ceremony conducted in Michelangelo's great basilica and attended by the pope, forty cardinals, numerous archbishops, bishops, and abbots, the diplomatic corps, and scores of Roman luminaries. In response to the formal petition, Sixtus intoned the crucial words:

For the honor of the Holy Trinity, Father, Son, and Holy Spirit . . . and the exaltation of the Catholic Faith and by the authority of the said Holy Trinity, and the blessed apostles, Peter and Paul, we have determined with the common consent of our venerable brothers, the cardinals of the Roman Church and all of the patriarchs, archbishops, and bishops resident in our curia, to inscribe the blessed brother Diego of San Nicolas, a Spaniard from the province of Andalucía, and member of the order of friars minor . . . in the catalogue of saints.⁶⁶

«Ibid., p. 54.

⁶⁶RojO, op. cit., p. 202.

After twenty-six years of patience and perseverance, Philip had his saint, just three weeks before his ill-fated Armada would sail against England.

vm

Following the ceremony, Philip sent the altar on which it had been performed.⁶⁷ The king also received a very special reward from his own church -which recognized the vital role he had played in obtaining sainthood for Diego. Early in April, 1589, the court arrived at Alcalá for ceremonies celebrating the event. Once again, the remains of Diego were removed from their resting place and marched through the streets in joyous procession. This time, however, when the coffin was closed, less of the saint remained within. The left hand had long since been removed to a separate reliquary, kept in the sacristy. Now, a lower leg bone, still containing some flesh around the knee, was detached and turned over to a royal secretary for delivery to the king. Philip had not only his saint, but also a fine relic to add to his extensive personal collection.⁶⁸

Together, the canonization and the relics given Philip by the pope and the Franciscan Order provided him some comfort during the dark days "which followed the disastrous defeat of the Armada. Although Philip eventually surrendered the altar to the Franciscan monastery where the saint lay buried, he retained the leg bone. Not surprisingly, it still resides today in the Escorial, the great monastery in central Spain which Philip built and which became the resting place for both himself and his son, Don Carlos.⁶⁹

⁶⁷AGS, estado 950. Rojo, op. cit., pp. 240-247. The altar was placed in the keeping of the Franciscan monastery of Santa María de Jesús, where San Diego was buried.

⁶⁸Nunez, op. cit., v. 1 119- 122. Rojo, op. cit., p. 230.

⁶⁹The Escorial still possesses the relics of San Diego which were surrendered to the king in 1589, including not only the leg bone, but also fragments of both the Franciscan habit and the shroud. Also residing in the collection of relics is the heart of Juan de Santorcaz, Diego's companion in the Canary Islands, which was presented to Philip II. Of greater significance from the historian's perspective, the Escorial preserves important documentation relevant to the canonization. This documentation can no longer be found in Alcalá de Henares due to the 1939 fire which destroyed the Archivo Central. Nor have I been able to uncover in the Archivo Segreto Vaticano the copy which was sent to Rome. Rojo, op. cit., pp. 98-99, 246-247. Inquiry from L. J. Andrew Villalon to the Biblioteca Real Monasterio de San Lorenzo de el Escorial (July 22, 1994) and the library's undated response.

FATHER DEMETRIUS A. GALIJTZIN: SON OF THE RUSSIAN ENLIGHTENMENT

Daniel L. Schlafly Jr.*

Father Demetrius Augustine Gallitzin (Dmitrii Dmitrievich Golitsyn) (1770-1840) cut a striking figure in early American Catholic history. He was born into one of Russia's most prominent families on December 22, 1770, in The Hague, where his father, Prince Dmitrii Alekseevich Golitsyn, was serving as Russian minister to The Netherlands. There, as in his previous diplomatic post in Paris, the senior Golitsyn avidly pursued the broad intellectual interests that earned him a distinguished reputation in the Russian and European Enlightenment.¹ His mother, Amalia von Schmettau, was the daughter of a Prussian field marshal. She, too, was devoted to culture and learning and, after separating from her husband in 1774, continued her own studies and carefully supervised the education of young Mitri and his sister Marianne in a Rousseauvian spirit which sought to develop the heart and the body as well as the mind. In 1786 she returned to the Catholic Church into which she had been baptized, led both her children to the faith in 1787, and went on to play a leading role in German pre-Romantic Catholic circles.²

*Mr. Schlafly is an associate professor of history in Saint Louis University.

¹A friend of Voltaire, Diderot, and Helvétius, Golitsyn published studies on geography, mineralogy, electricity, politics, and other subjects. See Nina I. Bashkina et al. (eds.), *The United States and Russia. The Beginning of Relations, 1765-1815* (Washington, D.C., 1980), for the text of a letter he wrote in 1777 to Benjamin Franklin discussing theories of lightning and electricity, pp. 41-43. Golitsyn so admired Franklin that he corresponded with the American although it was inappropriate for a Russian diplomat to have contact with the as yet unrecognized representative of the rebellious American colonies. N. N. Bolkhovitinov, *Rossiiia otkryvaet Ameriku, 1732-1799* (Moscow, 1991), p. 32. For Golitsyn's life, see G. K. Tsverava, *Dmitrii Alekseevich Golitsyn: 1734-1803* (Leningrad, 1985). Also see N. N. Bolkhovitinov, *The Beginnings of Russian-American Relations, 1775-1815*, trans. Elena Levin (Cambridge, Massachusetts, 1975), pp. 16-17 *ad passim*, in addition to his *Rossiiia otkryvaet Ameriku*. Unfortunately, Golitsyn's personal papers, preserved in Braunschweig, Germany, where he died in 1803, which undoubtedly contained material on his son's life, were destroyed in World War II. The little that Tsverava and Bolkhovitinov have on Demetrius is taken from sources already used by Gallitzin's earlier biographers.

²On her life and career, see, in addition to Tsverava, Pierre Brachin. *Le Cercle de Mün-*

Mitri arrived in Baltimore in 1792 for what was to be a stop on a grand tour of the United States and the West Indies but instead presented himself to Bishop John Carroll as a candidate for the priesthood. He was ordained in 1795 after studies at the new St. Mary's Seminary in Baltimore, the first priest to receive all of his minor and major orders in the United States. Named pastor of a tiny settlement in the wilds of western Pennsylvania in 1799, GaUitzin worked tirelessly and effectively there until his death on May 6, 1840. He founded a flourishing Catholic community, still bearing the name of Loretto which GaUitzin gave it, spending over \$150,000 of his own, his family's, and his friends' money to realize his dream, going deeply into debt in the process. He eagerly embraced his adopted country, becoming an American citizen in 1802, even raising and training a militia company in the War of 1812, although this indirectly aided the Napoleon he loathed for invading Russia.³ GaUitzin also was an early and eloquent apologist for Catholicism, publishing a number of tracts responding to Protestant charges of Roman errors, immorality, and anti-Americanism. His *A Defence of Catholic Principles*, for example, which was published in 1816, enjoyed great success both in Europe and America for its erudition and tolerant tone, as well as for the author's appreciation of the political liberty and religious freedom of his adopted land.⁴

ster (1779-1806) et la pensée religieuse de F. L. Stolberg (Lyon, 1952), and Ewald Reinhard, *Die Münsterische "familia sacra": Der Kreis um die Fürstin Gallitzin: Fürstenberg, Overberg und ihre Freunde* (Münster, 1953). Also see Mathilde Kohler, *Amalie von Gallitzin: ein Leben zwischen Skandal und Legende* (Paderborn, 1993), and Siegfried Sudhof (ed.), *Der Kreis von Münster: Briefe und Aufzeichnungen Fürstenbergs, der Fürstin Gallitzin und ihrer Freunde* (Münster, 1962).

³Albert Parry, "Prince Golitsyn: Apostle of the Kùegehies" *Russian Review*, IV (Spring, 1945), 31. In a letter to Bishop Carroll written July 4, 1814, Gallitzin called Napoleon's defeat "so great a blessing" and sang a solemn Mass for the occasion. Parts of the letter are reprinted in *The United States and Russia*, pp. 1084-1085. American public opinion was sharply divided, however, during the War of 1812, with some expressions of hostility to Napoleon and sympathy for Russia. See Bolkhovitinov, *Beginnings*, pp. 434-448.

⁴The best biography of Gallitzin is the account by Gallitzin's faithful disciple and co-worker in his last years, the Reverend Peter Henry Lemcke, *Life and Work of Prince Demetrius Augustine Gallitzin* (New York, 1941), which includes additional material and careful notes by Lemcke's translator, the Reverend Joseph Plumpe. A good popular account is Daniel Sargent, *Mitri: or the Story of Prince Demetrius Augustine Gallitzin* (New York, 1945). Also see Parry, *op. cit.*, pp. 18-37; Lawrence Flick, "Gallitzin," *Catholic Historical Review*, XIII (October, 1927), 394-469; and various short pieces and documentary material, Vols. XII, XIV, XVII-XX, XXII-XXIV XXVI, and XXVIII of the *American Catholic Historical Researches*. Also see Mary Wendelin Geibel, "Demetrius Augustine Gallitzin, Prince, Priest, and Pioneer" (Unpublished master's thesis, St. Bonaventure University, 1956). Two older biographies which include a number of excerpts from primary sources are Sarah Brownson, *Life of Demetrius Augustine Gallitzin* (New York, 1873),

It is no wonder, then, that GaUitzin has fascinated biographers. His missionary achievements, pastoral zeal, apologetic skiUs, and, not least, his personal piety and asceticism would have been more than enough to ensure his prominence, aside from his exotic heritage and unusual previous life. Then there was the appeal of a man who gave up wealth and privilege for a life of hardship and privation, "the prince who gave his gold away" as a twentieth-century children's biography labels him.⁵ And at a time when Irish and other Catholic immigrants were attacked as wild, ignorant, and un-American, Gallitzin was an obvious model of one who was law-abiding, educated, and patriotic. Thus John O'Kane Murray included a profile of Gallitzin in his catalogue of such New World Catholic heroes as Columbus, Champlain, Rose of Lima, and John Barry.⁶ Recently Gallitzin has even been claimed by Lithuanian-Americans, since the Russian Golitsyns were descended from the medieval grand dukes of Lithuania.⁷

GalUtzin's contemporaries and biographers were fascinated by the notion of the "Russian prince," a term inevitably used when GalUtzin's name came up; in 1840 Bishop Francis Patrick Kenrick composed an epitaph for his tomb which began "Dem[etrius] Augustinus] E[x] Principibus GaUitzin (Demetrius Augustine of the Princes GaUitzin)."⁸ Fascination,

and Thomas Heyden,⁹ *Memoir on the Life and Character of the Rev. Prince Demetrius A. de Gallitzin* (Baltimore, 1869), the latter by another co-worker of Gallitzin. A recent popular biography which emphasizes the Lithuanian origins of the Golitsyn family is Stasys Mazilauskas, *Pioneer Prince in USA* (Troy, Michigan, 1982). Good summary accounts are the profiles by Richard J. Purcell in the *Dictionary of American Biography*, VI, 113-115, Ferdinand Kittell in *The Catholic Encyclopedia*, VI, 367-369, and Daniel L. Schlaflyjr., in the *Modern Encyclopedia of Russian and Soviet History*, Xn, 71-74. There is a short entry on him in the *Entsiklopedicheskii Slovar'* F. A. Brokgauza i I. A. Efrona, XVIII, 52. The volume of the *Russkii biograficheskii Slovar'* that might well have included a comprehensive article on Gallitzin never appeared, since publication of the RBS was halted midstream by the 1917 revolutions. For a collection of Gallitzin's writings, see Grace Murphy (ed.), *Gallitzin's Letters: A Collection of the Polemical Works of the Very Reverend Prince Demetrius Augustine Gallitzin (1770-1840)* (Loretto, Pennsylvania, 1940).

⁵Sister Mary Fidelis Glass, *The Prince Who Gave His Gold Away: A Story of the Russian Prince Demetrius Gallitzin Told for Boys and Girls* (St. Louis, 1938).

⁶"Demetrius A. Gallitzin," in John O'Kane Murray, *Lives of the Catholic Heroes and Heroines of America* (New York, 1886), pp. 765-782.

⁷In 1964 the chargé d'affaires of the Lithuanian government-in-exile helped plant a tree in Gallitzin's memory in Prince Gallitzin State Park in Pennsylvania, praising him as "the first man to bring the Lithuanian national emblem to the United States." Mazilauskas, op. cit., pp. 153-154. His Lithuanian ancestry earned him an article in the *Enclopedica Lituanica* (6 vols.; Boston, 1970-1978), VI, 412-413.

⁸The full text is in Heyden, op. cit., p. 157. The Russian title the Golitsyns bore, kniaz', usually translated as prince, was used by a number of noble families, and does not imply, as in western Europe, a member of the ruling house.

however, did not mean real knowledge. Since until weU into the nineteenth century few Russians or Americans visited or wrote about each other's countries." "For most of them [Americans in the 1790's] it [Russia] was an exotic faraway place with strange customs."¹⁰ GalUtzin's associates were no exception. Despite his financial troubles, some of his backwoods parishioners beUeved that "aU the treasures of the Russian empire could be commandeered for the purpose of changing the AUeghenies into a paradise." " And even such an inteUigent biographer as Heyden reprints as true a fantastic claim that "the Emperor is the Patriarch, or Head of the Greek Russian Church" and "can, if he pleases, celebrate mass."

But if his new countrymen had Uttle concept of Russia, what about GaUitzin himseU? Born in The Hague, after the age of four he rarely saw his Russian father, who left his upbringing completely to his Prussian mother. In a November 11, 1806, letter to Bishop Carroll, GaUitzin caUed CarroU "a father to me, and more than my real father, according to the flesh. "3 He never went to Russia and by an 1807 edict of the Governing Senate lost his right to his father's estates by becoming a CathoUc and a priest.¹⁴ Father Lemcke, who was Gallitzin's constant companion for the

⁹In a letter Andrei IA. Dashkov, the first Russian diplomat accredited to the United States, wrote on December 8, 1809, to the Russian Minister of Foreign Affairs, Count Nikolai R Rumiantsev, to help Gallitzin get promised sums from Europe, he said Gallitzin "is the only person I know of Russian noble extraction who has settled in the United States." *The United States and Russia*, p. 625. See Bolkhovitinov, *Beginnings*, for a discussion of travelers and scientific and cultural ties between the United States and Russia. He includes a brief account of Gallitzin, p. 76.

"Norman E. Saul, *Distant Friends: The United States and Russia, 1763-1867* (Lawrence, Kansas, 1991), p. 33.

"Lemcke, *op. cit.*, p. 162.

"Quoted in Heyden, *op. cit.*, p. 188.

"Quoted *ibid.*, p. 108.

¹⁴D. A. Golitsyns property went to his wife when he died in 1803, who in turn left her inheritance in equal shares to Gallitzin and his sister, Marianne. When a decree of the Russian Senate, issued a year after his mother's death in 1806, excluded him, Marianne promised to give her brother his share of the whole which had gone to her. Although first his mother and then his sister did send occasional sums over the years, these were insignificant compared with the expenses he incurred in his mission and only a fraction of what he would have received from his parents. Heyden claims Gallitzin's father left 70,000 rubles plus three villages in Vladimir and Kostroma Provinces with 1,260 male serfs (*op. cit.*, ? . 50). According to Lemcke, there were two estates near Kaluga with 1,269 male serfs with a yearly income of 12,900 rubles (*op. cit.*, p. 163). All of Gallitzin's biographers discuss his tangled financial affairs. For his own summary of them, see his letters to James N. Causten of October 12 and November 8, 1836, quoted in *American Catholic Historical Researches*, LX (July, 1892), 98-101.

last six years of the missionary's life, remarked on "his complete ignorance of the laws and language of Russia."¹⁵

In addition, he defied his father and rejected what could have been a distinguished career in his nominal homeland by ignoring a 1794 order to report for duty in the Izmailovskii Guards Regiment, in which his father had enrolled him in infancy.¹⁶ For many years after coming to the United States he went by the name of Augustine Schmet or Smith, from his Catholic confirmation name and his mother's maiden name of Schmettau, although it was at his parents' request that he avoided using Golitsyn.¹⁷ As noted earlier, Gallitzin quickly mastered English and easily adapted to American mores and values. He was quick to take offense at any implication that he was anything but a patriotic American.¹⁸

Yet a tie remained. His title was still recognized in Russia,¹⁹ and in 1809 he successfully petitioned the Pennsylvania Legislature to resume the name Gallitzin instead of Smith.²⁰ One obvious reason for continuing to look to Russia was his hopes of receiving what he considered his just share of his inheritance. Although in a letter to Gallitzin's mother written January 12, 1795, his father claimed Mitri knew he forfeited any rights by becoming a priest,²¹ Father Demetrius continued to assert his

¹⁵Lemcke, *op. cit.*, p. 137.

¹⁶Lemcke reprints the text of the order and accompanying letter from Gallitzin's father he wrote on January 20, 1794, to his mother, who then relayed the news to her son (*op. cit.*, pp. 75-77). It was common practice for Russian nobles to enroll their sons as young as possible in elite units, of which the Izmailovskii was one, so they could earn seniority without actual service. Lemcke's account of Catherine II personally giving young Mitri his ensign's commission in 1774 cannot be true, however, even though Lemcke heard it from Gallitzin, since Catherine was not in western Europe then (*op. cit.*, p. 32).

¹⁷As stated in Gallitzin's December 5, 1809, petition to the Pennsylvania Legislature for legal recognition as Demetrius Augustine Gallitzin. Quoted in Flick, *op. cit.*, p. 431.

¹⁸"Thus when in 1808 a Republican lawyer claimed that Gallitzin's Federalist sympathies reflected a preference for aristocratic and monarchist principles, Gallitzin's response stressed the "duty which I owe as well to my adopted Country as to the Religion which I profess to avoid any suspicion of disloyalty." Letter to the editor of the Lancaster Federal Gazette, September 20, 1808. Quoted in Murphy, *op. cit.*, p. 298.

¹⁹He is listed in R.V. Dolgorukov, *Russkaia rodoslovnaia kniga* (4 vols.; St. Petersburg, 1854-1857), I, 297. Dolgorukov mistakenly lists Gallitzin's place of death as Baltimore rather than Loretto.

²⁰Gallitzin's letter and the legislature's approval are reprinted in Flick, *op. cit.*, pp. 430-433.

²¹Quoted in Lemcke, *op. cit.*, pp. 84-86. His father repeated this in a letter to Mitri written in June, 1799 (quoted in Lemcke, *op. cit.*, p. 122). Gallitzin's father mistakenly assumed his son was entering a monastery, which would have entailed a vow of poverty and renunciation of any property. Since I have not seen the text of the 1807 Senate decree disinheriting Gallitzin, I cannot say if it was based on this assumption or on his becoming a

status as a GoUtsyn in his long campaign to press his claims. In a February 5, 1801, letter to Bishop Carroll he mentions writing his father "to undeceive him from his expectations that I had renounced aU claims to the succession of his temporal estate."²² And an 1827 appeal caUing "upon the Charity of his fellow Christians" to help pay his debts began "Demetrius A. GaUitzin, son of Prince Demetrius of GaUitzin."²³

In his case a Russian noble title impUed more than status or inheritance. GaUitzin's father was one of many who by Catherine the Great's time were totaUy at home in the world of Western culture and leaning, and sometimes open to Western political ideas as well.²⁴ M. I. Bagrianskii, for example, studied at Moscow University, earned a doctorate at Leiden, did further study in Paris, and attended lectures in Berlin before returning to Russia in 1790.²⁵ Voltaire and Rousseau were so impressed

Catholic priest. At least until the reign of Nicholas I being a Catholic or even converting to Catholicism from Orthodoxy did not bring legal sanctions, although often there was family and social disapproval. See Daniel L. Schlafly, Jr., "De Joseph de Maistre à la Bibliothèque rose." *Le catholicisme chez les Rostopcin*, "Cahiers du monde russe et soviétique, XI (January-March, 1970), 93-109.

"Quoted in Sargent, *op. cit.*, p. 134.

"Quoted *ibid.*, pp. 225-226. Gallitzin enlisted the help of at least three Russian diplomats in this effort. The first was Dashkov, who served as consul general in Philadelphia from 1808 to 1811, then as minister in Washington from 1811 to 1819. See above, note 9. Baron Jacob Tuyl van Serooskerken, who served in the United States as chargé d'affaires in 1817 and from 1822 to 1826, helped Gallitzin draw up an appeal to Emperor Alexander I in 1825, which, unfortunately, remained unanswered. An English translation is in "Father Gallitzin's 'Historical Sketch of Some Events' in his Life" *American Catholic Historical Researches*, LX (July, 1892), 101-105. Baron Franz Freiherr von Maltitz, Russia's chargé d'affaires in America in 1826, gave him a large silver medal depicting Emperor Alexander I, which Gallitzin later was ready to sell in his financial distress (*ibid.*, p. 105). Heyden claims Maltitz lent Gallitzin five thousand dollars, but a year later magnanimously canceled the debt by lighting his cigar with Gallitzin's note at a dinner party which included Henry Clay among the guests (*op. cit.*, pp. 102-103). Another Russian diplomat, Pavel R Svin'in, who served as translator in the Russian legation at Philadelphia from 1809 to 1811, then as secretary of the Russian consulate general in the same city from 1811 to 1813, was, however, less sympathetic. In an article published in Russia in 1814, he criticized Gallitzin, whom he identified as "K. G." (Kniaz' or Prince Golitsyn), as someone "born and raised in a foreign land, in a foreign religion, according to foreign rules." Quoted in A. N. Nikoliukin, *Literaturnynnye svyazi Rossii i SSHA* (Moscow, 1981), p. 142. While the accusation has some validity, Gallitzin was baptized Orthodox, although his knowledge and practice of Orthodoxy were minimal.

"For discussions of this transformation of the Russian aristocracy in the eighteenth century, see, among many treatments, Isabel de Madanagz, *Russia in the Age of Catherine the Great* (New Haven, 1981); Erich Donnert, *Russland im Zeitalter der Aufklärung* (Vienna, 1984); and Hans Rogger, *National Consciousness in Eighteenth-Century Russia* (Cambridge, Massachusetts, 1960).

""Pokazaniia doktora Bagrianskogo," in A. N. Popov, "Novyie dokumenty po delu

when they met the Russian playwright Denis Fonvizin at a rendezvous de la République des lettres et des arts that they wanted to make him a corresponding member.²⁶ Thus GalUtzin's father approved sending his son on a grand tour, "in the interest of his education," as he put it in 1794.²⁷ On January 28, 1794, he wrote his son to praise his "excellent observations" during his travels.²⁸

But how could GaUitzin's conversion to Catholicism and his choice of a clerical career be compatible with the Russian Enlightenment, which shared the hostility Western European intellectual circles felt toward organized religion? Frederick the Great once said of Catherine that "she has no religion, but she feigns piety,"²⁹ and a leading historian of the Russian Church described the attitude of the Russian nobility toward the Orthodox clergy in Catherine's time as "contemptuous."³⁰ This certainly was true of GaUitzin's father, and of his mother until her own return to the Catholic Church.

Thus, although Mitri was baptized Russian Orthodox, he had no contact with religion in his youth. "None of us [his family] ever went to any place of public worship," he wrote in a tract published in 1836, noting, "I was raised in the principles of infidelity, and felt for Revelation, Christianity, and its Ministers, the most sovereign contempt."³¹ No wonder, then, that his father wrote to his mother on January 12, 1795, "He [Mitri] will never get my consent or approbation to enter the clerical estate," calling him "an enthusiast who . . . abuses the precepts of the gospels."³² A letter Mitri received the following year from Father Bernhard Overberg, his mother's spiritual advisor, said, "We were all in the greatest anxiety lest a great tempest arise when your father should receive the news that his son had become a priest in America." Although "his anger was somewhat moderated" after his wife and her friends pleaded with him, "the idea,

Novikova," *Sbornik russkago istoricheskogo obshchestva*, II (1868), 130-133.

²⁶D. I. Fonvizin, *Sobranie sochinenii* (2 vols.; Moscow, 1959), II, 448-449.

²⁷In a letter to Gallitzin's mother, January 20, 1794. Quoted in Lemcke, *op. cit.*, p. 76.

²⁸Quoted *irf.*, p. 70.

²⁹"Elle n'a aucune religion, mais elle contrefait la dévote." Quoted in A. V. Kartashev, *Ocherkipo istorii russkoi tserkvi* (2 vols.; Paris, 1959), II, 452.

³⁰Igor Smolitsch, *Geschichte der russischen Kirche, 1700-1917* (Leiden, 1964), p. 244. "The state did not expect nobles to become priests. . . . The nobility also regarded the clergy as an inferior social status." Gregory Freeze, *The Russian Levites. The Parish Clergy in the Eighteenth Century* (Cambridge, Massachusetts, 1977), p. 186.

³¹"The Bible: Truth and Charity," in Murphy, *op. cit.*, p. 272.

³²Quoted in Lemcke, *op. cit.*, p. 85.

however, remained odious to him because he regarded it as the grave which doomed forever the splendor of his family"³³

It is not surprising, then, that Galutin's apologetic writings show a firmer grasp, not just of Catholicism, but also of Protestantism, than of Orthodoxy. He claims mistakenly, for example, that like Catholics, Orthodox believe in purgatory,³⁴ refers to the "Greek Protestant church,"³⁵ and cites no Eastern Christian source past the age of the Church Fathers in any of his writings.

At first glance Galutin seems to have repudiated the Enlightenment entirely in his fervent espousal of Catholicism. "Our age, dear sir," he wrote in his 1816 tracts *Defence of Catholic Principles* "is the age of incredulity commonly called the age of philosophy"³⁶ Some years later in *The Bible: Truth and Charity*, published in 1836, he condemned "the famous propaganda of Infidelity established at Paris for the purpose of destroying Christianity . . . whose motto was . . . *Ecrasez l'infâme*. . . . Among those Missionaries of Infidelity was the celebrated Diderot . . . [who displayed] a furious hatred against both Christianity and Monarchy"³⁷

Other Europeans of Galutin's generation embraced Catholicism after being raised in the skepticism of the Enlightenment,³⁸ a number of whom, like him, came from the Russian nobility. These Russian converts, too, had read widely in the serious writers of the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries; Aleksandra Goutsyna, for example, mentions Rousseau, Bacon, Pope, and Blackstone,³⁹ while Sophie Swetchine (Sonia Svechina), who later was prominent in Catholic circles in Paris, lists Voltaire, Rousseau, and Gibbon among others.⁴⁰ Like Galutin, they,

"Part of the letter is given in Lemcke, *op. cit.*, pp. 87-91. Overberg goes on to describe the elder Golitsyn's change of heart after he was snubbed in 1796 by the new emperor, Paul I. "Mitri, before dubbed stupid and simple-minded, was now commended as wise and fortunate because by his choice he saved himself from the servility of court life." *Ibid.*, p. 91.

MIn "A Defence of Catholic Principles," quoted in Murphy, *op. cit.*, p. 67.

"In "Six Letters of Advice to the Gentlemen Presbyterian Parsons," in Murphy, *op. cit.*, p. 228.

"Murphy, *op. cit.*, p. 104.

Ibid., p. 27.

³⁸See Fernand Baldensperger, *Le mouvement des idées dans l'émigration française, 1789-1815* (2 vols.; Paris, 1924), especially I, 182-225.

"Bibliothèque Slave, Collection Gagarine, Boîte XII.

⁴⁰M.-J. Rouët de Journel, *Une Russe Catholique: Madame Swetchine* (Paris, 1929), *passim*.

too, later ridiculed the Enlightenment they once had endorsed. "The supposed lumières de la raison are totally devoid of proof," commented Ekaterina Rostopchina,⁴¹ while another Russian Catholic convert, Varvara Golovina, expressed her dismay at the influence of the "new philosophy" during Catherine the Great's reign.⁴²

But in attacking the Enlightenment from their perspective as devout Catholics, Gaixitzin and other Russian converts used the same rational and scientific methodology as their more secular contemporaries, and Father Demetrius's long career bore the stamp of his early intellectual formation. "Talent was evident," Bishop Carrou wrote to Father Francis Nagot, S.S., the rector of St. Mary's Seminary, when recommending Mitri to him in 1792.⁴³ Too, while it was not surprising that his apologetics showed a firm grasp of scripture, Catholic theology, and church history, his intellectual horizons were not limited to these. His *A Defence of Catholic Principles*, for example, opens by noting that "by the help of natural philosophy physics, anatomy, astronomy, and other sciences, many of the beauties and perfections of nature have been discovered."⁴⁴ Gaixitzin goes on to cite Voltaire, Dryden, Locke, and Grotius; discusses Leibnitz, Virgil, and Plato; and refers confidently to Luther, Melancthon, Zwingli, Arminius, Foxe, Calvin, and Cranmer, as well as contemporary Protestant authors, in the course of a comprehensive and systematic presentation.⁴⁵ In the middle of the Pennsylvania wilderness he had a library of six hundred books in Latin, French, German, English, Greek, Dutch, and Italian. While many of these were religious, they included Jefferson's *Notes on Virginia*, Hume's *History of England*, and Blackstone's *Commentaries*.⁴⁶

Although none of the other Russian converts of this era, with the possible exception of Sophie Swetchine, produced works equal to Gaixitzin's, she sought to understand and defend their new faith in the rational and critical spirit of the Enlightenment. "I can assert that the Christian religion is not just the religion of love but also of science," Sophie Swetchine wrote to a friend in 1815.⁴⁷ Ekaterina Rostopchina's

4. Ekaterina Rostopchina, *Sommaire des vérités chrétiennes* (Paris, 1829), p. 90.

42. Varvara Golovina, *Memoirs of the Countess Golovine*, trans. G. N. Fox-Davies (London, 1910), pp. 35-36.

"Quoted in Sargent, *op. cit.*, pp. 77-78.

"Murphy, *op. cit.*, p. 15.

"*A Defence of Catholic Principles*," Murphy, *op. cit.*, pp. 13-111, *passim*.

For a partial description, see Sargent, *op. cit.*, pp. 263-265.

47. Letter to Roksandra Sturdza Edling, July, 1815. Quoted in Rouët de Journel, *op. cit.*, p. 131.

Sommaire des vérités Chrétiennes® and her Méditation sur le principe d'écouter l'Église⁴⁹ attempted a rational exposition of Catholic doctrines, emphasizing a refutation of Orthodox positions on such disputed points as the primacy of the pope.⁵⁰

In one important respect, however, Gallitzin was closer to the spirit of the Enlightenment than many Catholics of his time, let alone the often rigid and intolerant Russian converts. Although he defended Catholic doctrine, praised the Church's historical record, and criticized Protestant teaching and practice, he did not hesitate at one point to condemn "the execrable massacre of the French Calvinists, under Charles IX."⁵¹ He went on to say, "Catholic or Protestant potentates who abused their power, to force the consciences of men, and by tortures to oblige them to embrace their own creed, were monsters and not Christians."⁵²

It was precisely the toleration so prized by the Enlightenment that Gallitzin found most attractive about America, "where they [Catholics] may enjoy rational liberty and independence," as he stated in *The Bible: Truth and Charity*.ⁿ He was a loyal American for more than the benefits the constitution offered Catholics, however. In a letter to the editor of the *Lancaster Federal Gazette* written September 20, 1808, he praises "a Constitution that pries into no man's conscience, but leaves it to everyone's choice to make the sign of the Cross or not to make it, to read the Bible in Latin or in English, to go to mass or to meeting. ... O happy Constitution! and happy those that live under her protection."⁵⁴

When Gallitzin, to use his own words, "renounced all the flattering prospects of this world"⁵⁵ to spend his life as a Catholic priest in a wilderness mission, it was in one sense a complete break with his father's milieu of wealth, government service, and sophisticated discourse. But in a more important sense Gallitzin continued to exemplify the Enlightenment values of reason, tolerance, optimism, and intellectual curiosity. In the last analysis he remained, as he habitually described himself later in life, "Demetrius A. Gallitzin, son of Prince Demetrius of Gallitzin,"⁵⁶ and a true son of the Russian Enlightenment.

"See note 41.

⁴MS in the *Bibliothèque Slave*.

"Naturally, Gallitzin's primary concern was the often intolerant and unsophisticated Protestantism he and his fellow Catholics encountered on the frontier.

"In "A Letter to a Protestant Friend," Murphy, op. cit., p. 204.

nIbid.

"Murphy, op. cit., p. 276.

"Ibid., p.299-

"Quoted in Sargent, op. cit., p. 225.

*Ibid.

BOOK REVIEWS

General and Miscellaneous

Noah's Flood: The Genesis Story in Western Thought. By Norman Cohn. (New Haven: Yale University Press. 1996. Pp. xiv, 154. \$25.00.)

Norman Cohn, Astor-Wolfson Professor Emeritus at the University of Sussex, has written an excellent, but all too brief, survey of the Flood Story and the history of its interpretation. An added bonus are fifty-five black and white illustrations and twenty lavish colorplates. This book will serve, I hope, as a wholesome warning that while fundamentalism, on the one extreme of interpretation, has failed in its approach to the Flood Story, modern psychoanalytic eisegesis, at the opposite extreme, fares no better.

After outlining the flood stories in Mesopotamian literature, none of which have serious moral overtones, Cohn explains the distinctive features of the Genesis story. He then reviews early Christian allegorical and typological interpretations. The Flood became, for some, a figure of fire that would follow at the end of time, with Noah as a symbol of faithful Christians who lived with the Last Judgment always in mind. The survival of Noah was also viewed as a type of Christ's resurrection. For Justin Martyr the wood of the Ark prefigured the cross on which Jesus saved mankind. In Augustine's thought the Ark symbolized the Church, the only means of salvation for believers. Even Jerome, the premier biblical scholar of the age, shared similar ideas. Much more hypothetical, as one would expect, were the rabbinic interpretations that supplied numerous details lacking in the original story. Since Genesis makes no mention of specific sins, the rabbis made up a few: Men mated with other men's wives and even with their own daughters as well as with animals; animals also engaged in unnatural mating with other species. Equally fantastic were the descriptions of the shape and plan of the Ark.

Cohn's history demonstrates the egregious error of supporting scientific theories by appealing to Genesis. From a study of the biblical chronologies, James Ussher (1581-1656), Archbishop of Armagh and Primate of All Ireland, concluded that God created heaven and earth on Sunday evening, October 23, 4004 b.c., and that the Flood began on Sunday, December 7, 2349 b.c., and the Ark landed on Mount Ararat on May 6 the following year. These dates were taken at

face value by most scientists between the seventeenth and nineteenth centuries. Cohn cites examples of scientists who quoted texts from Genesis to corroborate their hypotheses regarding the formation of fossils, mountains, seas, and land masses. These authors harmonized geological and paleontological data gleaned from scientific observation with the biblical time frame regarding the age of the earth and cosmos. A Swiss geologist, Jean-André de Luc (1727-1817), even concluded that Genesis describes precisely what geology has proved—only divine revelation can account for that. The "six days" of Genesis 1 are epochs of indeterminate length; the geological strata show the characteristics of these epochs. The Flood occurred at the end of the sixth epoch; hence, in relatively recent times.

In the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries, scientists began to recognize that the earth had to be older than (the commonly accepted) 6,000 years; in fact, it is more like 4.5 billion years old. In 1840 Louis Agassiz proposed his theory of glaciation to account for current facts of geology. The ad hoc models of the "scriptural geologists" to reconcile earth science with Genesis began to crumble. As could be expected, however, attempts to date the earth by empirical methods (with no reference to the Bible) met with fierce hostility. Richard Kirwan (1733-1812), for instance, dogmatically rejected the high antiquity of the earth by insisting that such notions undermine society as well as religion and morality. Thus, Kirwan became a pioneer of fundamentalism. The *Genesis Flood: The Biblical Record and Its Scientific Implications* by John C. Whitcomb, Jr., a professor of Old Testament, and Henry M. Morris, a professor of hydraulic engineering, was published in 1961 and remains in print. This book is the principal source of what is known as "creation science," essentially nothing more than fundamentalist doctrine in which the "Flood geology" I described above plays a leading role. Perhaps more influential than all the fundamentalist literature, however, was the television film, "In Search of Noah's Ark" (1977), which purported to be a documentary but is nothing more than propaganda. The film claimed that the story of the Ark is "impeccably true," for remnants of the ship now rest on Mount Ararat in Armenia; the claim was effectively demolished by several scholars (e.g., H. M. Teeple, *The Noah's Ark Nonsense*, 1978).

The fundamentalists, however, do not have the last word in imaginative eisegesis. Earlier in this century some opined that the original meaning of the Flood lies in a nature-myth representing the movements of the sun and moon. Then followed psychoanalytic interpretations: the Flood had a urinary origin and the Ark was the maternal womb. Noah's exit from the Ark was birth to be followed later by procreation. Alan Dundes in *The Flood Myth* (1988) considers the story to be "an example of males seeking to imitate female sexuality."

Other fanciful interpretations abound, none of which take seriously the kind of literature the authors of the Genesis Flood Story composed. They did not write an historical or scientific treatise but rather their version, under divine inspiration, of an ancient story the essential truth of which is that human beings

are accountable for their moral choices, for God punishes sinners but rescues the innocent.

Alexander A. Di Lella, O.F.M.

The Catholic University of America

History of Paradise: The Garden of Eden in Myth and Tradition. By Jean Delumeau. Translated by Matthew O'Connell. (New York: Continuum Books. 1995. Pp. x, 276. \$29.50.)

In this volume Professor Jean Delumeau announces a new direction for his ongoing study of ideas central to the evolution of Western Christianity. Four prior books, beginning with *La peur en Occident* (Paris, 1978), explored concepts of fear, sin, anxiety, and reconciliation. But *History of Paradise* (original *Une histoire du Paradis* [Paris, 1992]), the first in a trilogy on ideas of human happiness, focuses on descriptions of Eden and Paradise, with special emphasis on the fourteenth through eighteenth centuries. Matthew O'Connell's translation captures Delumeau's style and charm, and deftly handles his extensive use of "firsthand documents," which allow readers to experience "their savor and truthfulness" (p. 2).

This exploration of conceptualizations of the Garden of Eden begins with patristic conflations of the Genesis myth with those of the pagan golden age and Happy Isles. Throughout the medieval period Europeans believed the earthly Paradise, although closed to mortals, still existed; patristic and medieval theologians, *mappae mundi*, and travel literature all demonstrate the persistence and importance of ideas of Paradise. Delumeau even connects the legend of Præster John to longing for earthly Paradise, and shows that fifteenth- and sixteenth-century voyages to Asia and America were partly stimulated by hope of finding Eden's garden. His sources draw vivid pictures of Paradise's bounty, beauty, and pleasant climate, where eternal youth, without toil or anxiety, would have guaranteed human happiness, were it not for the sin of Adam.

Delumeau's new direction notwithstanding, this volume is closely linked to his previous inquiry into the Western cult of guilt. Visions of Paradise ultimately undermined human joy, when hopes of discovering it gave way to conviction that the deluge had destroyed all vestige of Eden. Nimble romping through divergent sources, Delumeau finds Renaissance "melancholy" (a central theme in earlier works) in expressions of "regret for the lost golden age and fairy lands" (p. 119)—that is, Eden—and links this to Europe's developing passion for gardens and fountains. Even as sixteenth- and seventeenth-century Protestant and Catholic exegetes agreed that Paradise no longer existed, they remained keenly interested in the paradisaic state and original sin, and employed new linguistic tools to identify Eden's exact site, the instant of Paradise's creation, and the chronology of our first parents' stay therein and expulsion therefrom. The vol-

unic closes with the scientific discoveries and theory of evolution which undermined faith in Genesis in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries.

Although a tour de force by a meticulous researcher at the height of his powers, *History of Paradise* is not without flaws. Attempting to cover his topic's every aspect, Delumeau see-saws between centuries, often repeating himself. There are a wealth of endnotes (953 individual citations on pp. 237-270), with full bibliographical information in initial citations, but no bibliography. This makes checking references annoyingly tedious, and Delumeau frequently returns to sources, often in widely separated chapters, as he jumps back and forth in time. The index, which lists only persons cited, is of limited value and (as spot checks demonstrated) incomplete. Lastly, as might be expected in such a wide-ranging work, some sections, particularly the discussions of medieval cartography and travel literature, are quite superficial. These reservations stated, the patient reader will derive a wealth of interesting information and stimulation from *History of Paradise*.

James D. Ryan

Bronx Community College
City University of New York

The Archaeology of Early Christianity: A History. By William H. C. Frend. (Minneapolis: Fortress Press. 1996. Pp. xix, 412; 3 plans, 8 maps, 16 b/w figures, 10 color figures. \$3900.)

Reverend Professor W. H. C. Frend, D.D., F.B.A., Professor Emeritus of Ecclesiastical History (Glasgow) and Anglican Divine, is one of this century's great figures in the study of early Christianity. Frend is a master narrator, and I found his most recent book a treasure-trove of personalities, places, and events that have shaped our current understanding of the material world brought into being by the earliest Christians. Frend paints with a very broad brush. He begins his version of the story with Helena, Constantine, and Eusebius, arguably the first "archaeologists" of early Christianity, and he concludes somewhere in the tomorrow, asking pointed questions about the prospects (in his view rather dim) for the study of early Christian archaeology; the latter, he warns,

may well suffer the fate of New Testament studies and become starved of new materials. . . . Reworking a static data base is the way to fossilization and irrelevance. . . . (p. 388).

Archaeology consists in fifteen chapters. Chapter One concerns the Constantinian discoverers of their Christian antecedents. Two begins (ca. 413) with Jerome's Sunday visits to the catacombs and ends in the seventeenth century, but the focus is on Bosio, Chifflet, Mabillon, and Camden, in other words Italian, French, and British antiquarians of the seventeenth century. Three concerns the eighteenth century not a highpoint in the study of early Christianity, although it

did produce important historical works by TiUemont, von Mosheim, and Gibbon. Four, entitled "Napoleon," focusses on discoveries in Egypt, especiaUy Nubia, which is one of Frend's particular interests. Five concerns mid-nineteenth-century French excavations in Algeria and the Donatists (another Frend domain in which he has distinguished himself); Chapter Six recounts the work of Cardinal Lavigerie in Algeria and Tunisia; of de Vogüe in Syria; of de Rossi in Rome; and of Leblant in early Christian Provence. Seven concerns W. M. Ramsay in Turkey. Eight covers the years leading up to the outbreak of World War I: the French in Tunisia and Algeria; the British (Ramsay and BeU), Austrians, Germans, and Americans in Turkey and northern Syria; the EngUsh and Germans in Egypt and Nubia; the Germans and French in Ethiopia and central Asia; de Rossi's followers in the Roman catacombs; Bulic, Dyggve, and Egger in the Balkans. Nine and Ten concern the important achievements (notably the Franco-American project at SaUyeh/Dura) of the interwar period, 1919-1940. Eleven recounts the excavations under St. Peter's, at Toura, Nag Hammadi, and Qumran (on which now see R. Donceel, *OEANE* [New York, 1997], s.v.). The last three chapters concern field work carried out since 1945 along with publications and episodic accounts of meetings held in the postwar period. The book concludes with a map of the Roman Empire, an appendix that gives the dates of the thirteen *Congressi Internazionali di Archeologia Cristiana*, a select bibliography, and a general index. Frend covers a huge amount of ground in this book.

It is difficult to summarize a book of this scope. Within limits, I think one can identify certain themes. Frend is not altogether comfortable with archaeology in the service of the Church, especiaUy when the Church is Rome. He is a bit more sanguine when it comes to archaeology in the service of European nationalists, including his beloved British and his only slightly less admirable Gallic coUeagues. Frend believes in the necessity of holding firm on scientific archaeological methodology. He treats documents and Uterature and material culture as evidentiary parts of an historical continuum; here I beUeve he is right on target, and his approach should be seen as a healthy corrective to the tendency of contemporary pedants who seek ever more to departmentaUze and divide up the study of late antiquity into a warren of specialties and subspecialties. Frend sees the real connections between the development of early Christian archaeology and the evolution of other disciplines, including prehistory and classical archaeology; here I think there is a lot more to be said. Frend is a firm believer in the value of interdisciplinary scholarship, and it is clear that he also beUeves in the power of co-operative efforts, including those that bring together persons of differing ethnic, national, and denominational backgrounds.

WiUiam Frend is unquestionably an "encyclopédiste savant"; he has warm words of appreciation for Dölger and especiaUy Leclercq, and his own work (including this book) constitutes eloquent testimony to his extraordinary powers of historical synthesis. He is a friend of archaeology in the trenches; at one place (p. 353) he equates art historians, those incurable theorists of form, incessantly debating the typology of Christian art, with aristocrats, and he compares them with the "foot sloggers," the dirt archaeologists (no doubt persons like himself). He Uk

ens the explosion of new finds in the years 1965-1990 to Pandora's Box, I presume without its lid. How this fits with his overall view that more is better and less leads to ossification (as cited above) and methodological navel gazing I do not know.

Paul Corby Finney

University of Missouri

Baptism and Change in the Early Middle Ages, c. 200-c. 1150. By Peter Cramer. [Cambridge Studies in Medieval Life and Thought, Fourth Series, 20.] (New York: Cambridge University Press. 1993. Pp. xx, 356. \$59.95.)

This book is part of a very distinguished series and was written by someone who, the reader quickly discovers, has an amazing depth of understanding of the thought of the Middle Ages. The axis of Cramer's thesis is the viewpoint of eleventh- and twelfth-century thinkers who question their past. Indeed, the entire book is an attempt to account for the eventual twelfth-century loss of understanding of sacrament, or at least a loss of confidence in it. The genesis of the development is best captured by the word "change" in the book's title. This "change" is described in the six chapters which comprise the book. Cramer views them as essays which are to some extent independent of one another.

The first essay or chapter treats Hippolytus of Rome, author of the Apostolic Tradition, in Hippolytus, the natural symbol of water provides the ground for a moral approach to baptism, and this is set in the context of a certain "crisis": "I will try to show from the Tradition and elsewhere that the 'crisis' of baptism reflects this leaning to the abstract, and is partially a crisis about what it is to know the divine" (p. 23). Cramer indicates how the baptism of Hippolytus is comparable to entry into Gnosticism. Indeed, the use of older forms, with new meanings, partially accounts for Christian baptism's constantly shifting perspective as it develops through the centuries.

The second essay traces the contribution of Tertullian and Ambrose in this shifting perspective. The key themes here are conversion and martyrdom, myth and dream. One suspects that Cramer has spent years studying Tertullian and Ambrose.

The third essay deals with the contribution of Augustine. This contribution is so rich and Cramer's analysis so thorough that it is unfortunate that the reader wasn't given a summary at the end of the chapter. It is with Augustine that the "sacramental and the ethical become one" (p. 88) and one sees "the need to baptize early, the necessity of infant baptism rather than its possibility or desirability, is perhaps the most obvious legacy of Augustine to the Middle Ages" (p. 125).

The fourth essay goes from Augustine to the Carolingians. The change here is from the ethical understanding of Augustine to the juridical. The certainty now comes from the forms of the rite of baptism themselves.

The fifth essay describes the Carolingian age and is labeled the diminishing of baptism. It is a time when "the momentary effulgence of baptism was pushed out on to the periphery" (p. 206) and when "sacrament turns into magic" (p. 219).

The sixth and final essay treats what was Cramer's starting-point, the view-point of the twelfth century, which he calls a time of "falling short" or a time concerned with a sense of loss. His insights into baptism come frequently as parallels to the twelfth-century thinking on eucharist.

The six chapters are complemented by two Excursuses on the baptistry. They include fourteen illustrations which, unfortunately, are a bit dark and thus hard to appreciate. The book concludes with a twenty-five-page bibliography which is extremely helpful.

This book is not for the beginner. Cramer interweaves history, theology, philosophy, poetry, semiotics into a tapestry that is masterful, but complex and difficult. The reader would have been greatly aided by summaries at the end of each chapter and especially by a synthesis at the end of the book. Still, the book is to be read, and indeed re-read. In so doing, one will learn not only a great deal about the sacrament of baptism, but also a great deal about the Middle Ages in the West.

Gerard Austin, O.P.

The Catholic University of America

Eastern Christian Worlds. By Mahmoud Zibawi. Translated from French by Madeleine Beaumont. (Collegeville, Minnesota: The Liturgical Press. 1995. Pp. 272; color pls. 96, b/w figs. 188. \$99.95.)

In a.d. 451, the Council of Chalcedon was convened to resolve conflicting definitions of Christ's nature, but, instead, the Church split into two major factions—the Monophysites, who followed the doctrinal position of the patriarch of Alexandria, and the so-called Chalcedonians, who adhered to the position formulated by Pope Leo of Rome and supported by the patriarch of Constantinople.

The churches of Egypt and Syria followed the Monophysite position, and by the seventh century, the Churches of Nubia and Ethiopia were securely in the Monophysite camp, headed by metropolitan bishops appointed by the Monophysite patriarch of Alexandria. These churches are the subject of *Eastern Christian Worlds* by Mahmoud Zibawi, author of *The Icon* (1993) and himself a painter. Introductory chapters include broad surveys of church history and the rise of Islam and its art. The author then moves to chapter-long discussions of each Eastern Church—the Syrian, the Armenian, the Egyptian, and the Ethiopian (the Nubian is omitted)—its history, traditions and practices, and art. Such an undertaking would be a daunting challenge for any specialist in the his-

tory of the Eastern Churches. Zibawi proceeds by summarizing or excerpting from more scholarly treatments of the subjects, an approach which results often in superficial or severely abbreviated essays, with names, terms, or events that remain unexplained. This can be quite frustrating for the reader with limited knowledge of the topics. For example, the Palestinian ampoules are referred to as the "famous ampoules of Jerusalem" with neither explanation, photograph, nor reference to the definitive monograph *Ampoules de Terre Sainte* by André Grabar in the footnotes. Zibawi's text contains passages that are flawed, as, for example, the discussion of Iconoclasm, or wrong, such as the statement that "Ethiopian writing adapts the Sabaeen alphabet and adds consonants to it" (pp. 211-212). The opposite is true: the Ethiopian writing system adds vocalization to consonant forms.

The author's true purpose appears to be an appreciation of the arts of the Eastern Churches. The text is well larded with aphorisms and quotations from religious hymns apparently intended to create a lyrical framework for the presentation of the visual materials, but the aphorisms are sometimes nonsensical: "The Abbasid caliphate ends forever" (p. 93) or, "Paradoxically, art ignores history and its events" (p. 61). The works of art in the illustrations contradict the latter observation.

The layout of the color plates is not well conceived, nor are reasons clear for the choices of works of art illustrated. The choices of Ethiopian art illustrated in the color plates are especially problematic. If this book is to be the reader's only exposure to Ethiopian religious art, she or he will acquire a false sense of its quality. The Nursing Madonna in a private collection in Paris (Pl. 82) is said to date to the eighteenth century, but appears more likely to be a twentieth-century painting, perhaps produced for the Addis Ababa tourist market, and there is certainly no reason to include a huge detail of the nursing infant (Pl. 83). Color plates of some Syriac (Pls. 6, 8-11) and Coptic miniatures (Pls. 65-67) give little sense of the manuscripts they decorate. The quality of color plates is uneven; some are too garish. Because the color plates themselves have neither plate number nor caption, it is very difficult to find a specific plate while reading the text and equally difficult to identify an object while browsing the plates.

Marilyn E. Heldman

University of Missouri, St. Louis

A History of the Church in Ukraine, Volume I: To the End of the Thirteenth Century. By Sophia Senyk. [Orientalia Christiana Analecta, Volume 243] (Rome: Pontificio Istituto Orientale. 1993. Pp. xvi, 471. Paperback.)

The author is a Basilian Sister of the Ukrainian Catholic Church and a professor of church history at the Pontifical Oriental Institute in Rome. This volume constitutes real progress in the area of ecclesiastical historiography of Scythia-Rus'-Ukraine. In it we find responsible care in the use of the original sources,

combined with objective and scholarly judgments. There is no national ethnic or confessional prejudice or partisanship—so common among historians writing on Eastern Slavic church-related topics.

However, there are some deficiencies. On page 8, the author has written: "though the Apostle Andrew did not travel through Rus' . . ." and she upholds the "legend of the Apostle Andrew." Today we must revise the historiography on St. Andrew in Scythia, for there is very strong evidence of his presence all round the Black Sea. The biblical, archaeological, patristic, conciliar, hagiographical, historical, and monastic evidence for a Christian presence in Scythia-Rus'-Ukraine from apostolic times to St. Vblodymyr has been assembled and reviewed in my book: *The Apostolic Origin of the Ukrainian Church* (Parma, Ohio, 1988). We only offer a few highlights here.

Colossians 3:11 implies that St. Paul met Scythians who were Christians. Both St. Hippolytus in *On the Twelve Apostles* and Origen, quoted by Eusebius in his *Ecclesiastical History*, Book III, chap. 1, make it clear that the Holy Apostle Andrew received Scythia as his missionary territory. Tertullian in *Adversus Iudaeos*, chap. 7, St. Athanasius in *Concerning the Inhumanization of the Word*, chap. 51, St. Jerome in his *Epistle to Laeta*, and many other witnesses speak of Scythian Christians. St. Clement, Bishop of Rome, was banished and died in Crimea around 101 a.d. St. Martin I, Pope of Rome, was also banished to Crimea and died there in 655 a.d. St. Hermon, Bishop of Jerusalem, at the end of the third century, had jurisdiction over Scythia and ordained bishops for that region: Ephrem, Basil, Jepharius, and two others whose names are not preserved. In Tanais two churches have been uncovered: one from the first and one from the second century. Further, many Christian graves and burial sites from the second century are well documented. Thus in the face of early witnesses and subsequent commentary, we hold that the presence of St. Andrew in Scythia should be accepted as more than mere "legend."

In the case of Ukrainian Christianity, one might well see a fusion of possibly four apostolic traditions: (1) from St. Andrew personally; (2) from St. Peter, his brother, through Pope St. Clement; (3) from St. Paul, the Apostle of the nations, through St. Andronicus and his successors, down to Sts. Cyril and Methodius; and (4) from St. James, brother of the Lord and first bishop of Jerusalem, through Hermon of Jerusalem, who ordained bishops for Chersonesus and other regions of Scythia.

The treatment of "The Pagan Religion of Rus'" (preferably "Pre-Christian") consists of two and a half pages in which there are a few inaccuracies and shortcomings. In order to understand Ukrainian church history, it is important first to grasp Ukrainian spirituality and religiosity. The peasant has a spiritual and mystical bond with Mother Earth (or soil) as a secret, sacred, and life-giving power. This is based on a cosmic religious sense and panentheism (not pantheism), that is, a strong sense of the immanence of God in His creatures. Among these people, there is little of the phobos-type (fear) of religion; rather the eros-type and the agape-type, which are based on effective mutual and social life and

love, and culminate in the gews-religion, or the social soUdarity of a clan. The wovas-type of religion (legal aspect and codes) is not popular. Therefore, there is no feeling for strict orthodox dogmatic formulations, a high degree of individuaUsm, and detachment from any legalistic or canonical decisions. Among these people, there is an intense emotionality, sentimentality, an exaggerated delicacy of feeling, and a lyricism which at times obscures the intellect and will, but does penetrate aU aspects of culture and reUgion. There is also a profound tendency to introversion.

Chapter VII deals with the reUgious culture of Kievan Rus' (pp. 298-419). The author gives a concise and precise description of the material aspect of that culture. Unfortunately, we do not find any adequate definition of culture in general or of religious culture in particular. Its formal aspect and distinctive characteristics remain obscure. Culture, which is central to all branches of human knowledge, creativity, ethos, Weltanschauung, reUgion, poUtics, etc., consists of explicit and implicit patterns of behavior acquired and transmitted by symbols, constituting the distinctive achievements of human groups, including their embodiment in artUacts. The essential core of culture consists of historicaUy derived and selected (that is, traditional) ideas, and especiaUy the values attached to them. The distinctive characteristics of the reUgious culture of Kievan Rus' (both pre-Christian and Christian) are: (1) a tendency to portray the sacred, the redeemed, the divinized and glorified primarily under the aspect of beauty—this is the strong aesthetic dimension; (Z) an interpretation of the history of Kievan Rus' as a sacred history of salvation, a series of the mighty acts of God (or of the gods) as Creator and Giver of Grace; (3) a very strong prophetic stance as a means of foretelling the future; and an aetioloUgical stance (Greek: *aitia*: "cause") which gives an interpretation of present situations in the Ught of past events, which are seen as causes of the present; thus there is a search for the one and unique historical perspective combining past, present, and future; and (4) a strong eschatoloUgical trend which perpetuaUy anticipates an apocalyptic or catastrophic future.

This book is the best in EngUsh to date on the history of the Church in Ukraine, deserving to be used as a guide in graduate studies. We hope that the three volumes projected wiU be of the same or of higher quality.

Petro B.T. Bilaniuk

University of St. Michael's College, Toronto.

El Solar Carmelitano de San Juan de la Cruz: La antigua provincia de Castilla (1416-1836). By Pablo María Garrido, O.Carm. (Madrid: BibUoteca de Autores Cristianos. 1996. Pp. liii, 381.)

The Spanish Carmelites of the Ancient Observance, sometimes referred to as Calced CarneUtes, are the envy of the rest of their Order since they have so richly benefited from recent explorations of their historical records by

Carmelite scholars. Balbino Velasco Bayón's three-volume *Historia del Carmelo Español*, synthesized in his *Los Carmelitas: Historia de la Orden del Carmen, W: El Carmelo Español*, has investigated thoroughly the medieval Carmelites in Spain and the various Spanish provinces since then. See reviews in this journal ante, LXXVIII (October, 1992), 644-645, and LXXXI (October, 1995), 611-613. Now a confrere of Velasco Bayón, Pablo Garrido, has turned a more organic look at the Carmelite province of Castile with an interest in revealing the Carmelite soil from which arose Juan de la Cruz and, for that matter, Teresa of Ávila, whose monastery of the Incarnation was, at least at first, under the jurisdiction of this province. The final establishment by Pope Clement VIII of the Discalced Carmelite Order as a separate entity did not occur until 1593, two years after the death of Juan de la Cruz. A major stumbling block in the study of mystics, no less so for Juan de la Cruz and Teresa de Jesús, has been the persistent lack of historical context. Garrido in this book is especially concerned to provide the immediate past and immediate subsequent history that make it possible to interpret adequately the writings of Juan de la Cruz. For Teresa see Garrido's *El Hogar Espiritual de Santa Teresa* (Rome, 1983).

In 1281 the Carmelite Constitutions listed Spain chronologically as the last of ten provinces. In 1416 Aragón and Castile became separate provinces with the latter holding precedence within the Order. The Castilian province was suppressed at the time of the Spanish Exclaustration in 1836. The province was revived as a commissariat in 1948 and established as a province in 1984. Garrido's study of the province has been welcomed as a critical resource for the fiftieth anniversary of the 1948 revival.

Garrido's history of the Carmelite Province of Castile is the result of many years of extensive research and publications. For these publications and those of Velasco Bayón, see the valuable bibliography of manuscripts and printed sources as well as published studies on pages xiii-liii. Readers are well served by the index of persons and places on pages 349-381. Leaving aside the works of Juan de la Cruz and Teresa de Jesús, Garrido has an appendix with a list of manuscripts and works published by members of the province.

Garrido's text, the first of further projected volumes, is concisely composed with well-crafted thematic presentations that include a study of Carmelite evangelization through various members of the province who served as bishops in the Spanish colonies of the New World.

Keith J. Egan

Saint Mary's College
Notre Dame, Indiana

Catholic Peacemakers: A Documentary History. Volume Two: From the Renaissance to the Twentieth Century, Parts I and II. Edited by Ronald G. Musto. [Garland Reference Library of the Humanities, Volume 1372.] (New York: Garland Publishing, Inc. 1996. Pp. xlv, 522; xlv, 523-979- \$ 150.00.)

Publication of Ronald G. Musto's narrative survey *The Catholic Peace Tradition* (Orbis, 1986) was welcomed by many as a more inclusive and ecumenical interpretation of this tradition than that conventionally and more narrowly focused on Thomism and the "just war" theory. In one breathtaking volume, Musto traced the continuous stream from the Church's earliest martyrs and pacifists to contemporary peacemakers. The book was intended to be the first of three related works. The second was *The Peace Tradition in the Catholic Church. An Annotated Bibliography* (New York: Garland, 1986). The third is this two-volume compendium of primary and secondary documentary sources that is comprehensive in scope and will, no doubt, remain the standard in this field for many years to come. This review addresses only the second volume of this last work.

Documents are gathered into chapters that parallel similarly titled ones in the original narrative history. The editor's introductions to the chapters and to the individual documents provide historical context especially valuable to the non-specialist audience for whom he writes. Some of the introductions are elegant little historiographical essays in themselves. The volume lends itself to being a source book to accompany and enrich the study of the narrative history. Its varied contents include, inter alia, official church statements, articles, book excerpts, speeches, sermons, and position statements of peacemaking organizations; they have been updated to include the developments occurring during the decade since the history's publication.

A chapter in the historical narrative that originally explored European peacemaking from Vatican Council II to the rise of the Polish Solidarity movement has been expanded to include essays and other statements related to the Czechoslovakian Velvet Revolution of 1989. In addition to the contributions by Vaclav Havel, Vaclav Benda, and others, is the appearance of a random selection of particularly poignant slogans used in the Prague street protests: "People! Be good to each other."

The chapter on Third World Liberation brings not only the witness of Gustavo Gutierrez, Leonardo Boff, Dom Helder Câmara, and the Mothers of the Plaza de Mayo but also some later voices, such as those of Haiti's Jean-Bertrand Aristide and the Jesuit martyrs of El Salvador. Among the latter is Ignacio Ellacuría, who acknowledges the pluralism of Christian approaches to solving the conflict raised by violence and calls for a resolute denunciation of violence. The chapter on peacemaking in the United States also includes developments of the last decade, notably statements regarding the death penalty and the Persian Gulf War. Musto concludes the work with an admittedly subjective sample of current Catholic thinking on war, peace, and justice. In this sampling he gives the last

word to religious and lay voices—prophetic, controversial, spiritual—determined in their pursuit of the peace of the Gospel.

This impressive work should be treasured and housed in, at very least, the libraries of every Catholic parish and educational institution. Its value, however, is not confined to these. It will remain an important standard resource for courses on peace studies, church history, and adult Christian education.

For all its merit, this work suffers from lack of clarity in presentation and organization. Sometimes a document that is excerpted from a published collection or secondary source remains undated and carries only the publication date of the subsequent published source. Each part begins with a full table of contents covering both volumes, i.e., all four parts. More confusing, however, is the full numerical list of texts that also appears at the front of each part; it would be greatly improved if, in addition to the number, it provided the reader with the appropriate page. Readers who cannot easily find what they are looking for but persist after the initial frustration are rewarded richly.

Patricia A. Gajda

The University of Texas at Tyler

Orders of Knighthood and of Merit. The Pontifical, Religious and Secularised Catholic-founded Orders, and their relationship to the Apostolic See. By Peter Bander van Duren. (Gerrards Cross, Buckinghamshire: Colin Smythe. Distributed by Oxford University Press, New York. 1995. Pp. xvi, 714. \$125.00.)

Lord Melbourne would have enjoyed reading this book. The paradoxical spirit of the British Prime Minister's comment, "I like the Garter; there is no damned merit in it," would have been enhanced by the evidence in this book that secular republics have often imitated Christian monarchies in rewarding their meritorious citizens by admission to Orders of Knighthood and of Merit. Decorations answer some need in men's minds, and the scramble for "gongs" will last as long as human life on this planet. Catholic teaching has emphasized that external marks of honor are bestowed appropriately upon those recipients who are inwardly meritorious.

The relationship between the Holy See and the many Catholic-founded Orders of Knighthood between the eleventh and the early eighteenth centuries has not always been well understood by individual pontiffs and their advisers. They might have given priority to other matters altogether, or they might have been misled by partisan representations from a particular phalanx of knights. Such is the thrust of Dr. van Duren's pen, as he writes this invaluable work of reference, and one worth reading also for its tone of scholarship. Often the author's pen-portraits of certain pontiffs, cardinals, and archbishops are more arresting than their respective photographs in this lavishly illustrated tome.

Outside the European chivalries which still draw up lists of the great and good to be honored with the appellation chevalier or commendatore, there exist also more shadowy organizations which style themselves Knights of This or That. These latter often cause offense to the former by using similar names, thereby confusing a general public less familiar than Dr. van Duren with the history of the ideals of Christian service and chivalry. His book is a warning to those glib readers who might have been enrolled among Knights or Dames of spurious organizations instead of joining the real thing.

Besides contributing to contemporary sociology, Dr. van Duren contributes insights into other academic disciplines besides the obvious ones of history and heraldry. In fact his book has echoes of an older European tradition of collaborative book-making, exemplified by Diderot and his contributors to the *Encyclopédie* between 1751 and 1772. The orthodox abbé Edme Mauret (1713-1755) had contributed to the *Encyclopédie* about thirty or so separate references to aspects of the Order of St. John and of Malta, basing them on the abbé Vertot's uncritical history of the Hospitallers, published at Paris in 1726. An intriguing subplot of Dr. van Duren's book is where does he begin and Archbishop Hyginus Eugene Cardinale end? The author had first intended to update Archbishop Cardinale's own published study, *Orders of Knighthood, Awards and the Holy See* (1983).

Even to readers not immediately attracted by the subject matter of his book, Dr. van Duren patiently demonstrates from diverse, conflicting evidence written in several languages how trans-European cultural history might be conceived and expressed. In teasing out some particular strands of this cultural history, Dr. van Duren reminds all students of the pitfalls of sloppy translation from Latin into the vernacular. Throughout he rightly distinguishes between the juridical usage of a term and its misleading "false friend" in common speech. By dipping into this book, all historians will be reminded from this distinctive context of the awesome difficulties of plying their trade.

David F. Allen

University of Birmingham

Ancient

The Rise of Christianity. A Sociologist Reconsiders History. By Rodney Stark. (Princeton: Princeton University Press. 1996. Pp. xlv, 246. \$24.95.)

Ever since Luke decided that it was time for him to create order in the confusion surrounding the early history of Christianity, many have undertaken the same task. Think of all the books that were written in this century alone, beginning with the monumental *Mission and Expansion of Christianity* by A. Harnack (1908) up to *The Rise of Christianity* by W. H. C. Frend (1984). Add to these all the commentaries on Luke and Acts, and the number is truly great.

Now along comes yet another attempt, perhaps more modest in size, to understand what happened and why, "most excellent Theophilus," "did a tiny and obscure messianic movement from the edge of the Roman Empire dislodge classical paganism and become the dominant faith of Western civilization" (p. 3). Like Luke, who was a physician, Rodney Stark is neither a historian nor a theologian. By training, he is a sociologist, and he uses the tools of his trade to analyze the early Christian phenomenon: a new perspective, therefore, with interesting and challenging results.

In the first chapter, "Conversion and Christian Growth," Stark deals with the numerical growth of Christianity as a percentage of the total population of the Roman Empire, and with the ways by which new converts were made. Using as models the Church of the Latter Day Saints and the Unification Church, he suggests that in the growth of any new movement, "social networks," i.e., a "structure of direct and intimate interpersonal attachments" (p. 20), are decisive. The first converts always come from the closest circle, i.e., the founder's family. This was so in the case of Mohammed and the Mormons, and, Stark says, "the rule extends to Jesus too, since it appears that he began with his brothers and mother" (p. 18). (But did he? John 7:5 and Mark 3:31-35 indicate otherwise.)

Chapter 2, "The Class Basis of Early Christianity," refutes the formerly widely held view that Christianity initially was a "proletarian movement." Here the Mormons and Christian Science are used for comparison to show that "cult movements" never are proletarian. Chapter 3, "The Mission to the Jews," claims that this was probably very successful. Chapter 4, "Epidemics, Networks and Conversion," examines Christian and pagan attitudes toward the great plagues that struck the Roman empire in the second and third centuries. The response of Christians to these disasters was so much more positive than that of the pagans that the superiority of Christian doctrine, on which their actions were based, became obvious, while paganism failed.

In addition, as a result of the plagues, pagan birth rates declined while Christian birth rates increased. Chapter 5, "The Role of Women in Christian Growth," deals with sex ratios in Christian communities as compared to pagan society and the higher status that women enjoyed in early Christian culture. This was also a result of Christian teachings (prohibition of abortion and infanticide), which resulted in the higher birth rate and thus in a numerical growth.

Chapter 6, "Christianizing the Urban Empire: A Quantitative Approach," uses statistical evidence to show "what characteristics of cities were conducive to Christianization." As a continuation of this theme, Chapter 7, "Urban Chaos and Crisis: The Case of Antioch," deals with the physical and social structures of Roman cities, because the rise of Christianity was "shaped by the socio-cultural environment of those who first put it into written words" (p. 147). In a basically chaotic society, Christianity offered new social relationships and thus served as a revitalizing force.

Chapter 8 is entitled "The Martyrs: Sacrifice as Rational Choice." According to the author, martyrdom was a rational choice because it offered rewards that made Christianity a "good bargain" and a "good deal" (p. 178). Chapter 9 focuses on "Opportunity and Organization." In discussing the opportunity for a new religion to emerge in a certain cultural environment, Stark takes advantage of the language of economics, such as supply and demand, to describe the spread of religion: religions are (he firms and beUevers are consumers. In its organization, the Church was an exclusive community consisting of committed members, unlike the various pagan religions.

The final chapter is "A Brief Reflection on Virtue." Here the author develops his thesis that Christian doctrines were behind a new moral vision that was far superior to paganism. This, then, is the final reason why Christianity eventually replaced paganism.

The points proposed in this book by Professor Stark are to be taken seriously because they are based on solid research and faultless arguments. No doubt some people will be offended by his detached approach to the Early Church as merely one of many alternatives and to religious communities as subject to the law of supply and demand. But this is what makes his book new and worth reading: it offers a fresh look which makes the reader stop and think. Professor Stark could make many more contributions to this field of scholarship (how about an examination of Communism and Christianity and the establishment of Marxist "religion" in Eastern Europe?), but, unfortunately, he has decided that this book is his last excursion into religious history and that he will return full time to sociology. For historians of the Church, this is a loss indeed.

Stephen Benko

Sonoma, California

After the Apostles: Christianity in the Second Century. By Walter H. Wagner. (Minneapolis: Fortress Press. 1994. Pp. xvi, 287. Paperback.)

The author maintains that there are no studies which tell the story of the challenges and leaders of the second century by bringing together in a comprehensible way the events, ideas, and people involved. Treating the second century as a critical period when Christianity, beset with internal and external conflicts, struggled with many important issues in forging its identity, the author focuses on five challenges to Christianity: (1) Who created the world and what value does the world have? (2) What is the nature and destiny of humans? (3) Who was Jesus? (4) What roles does the church have? (5) How are Christians and culture related? The author has chosen five important Christian thinkers, each of whom deals with these challenges in different ways: Ignatius of Antioch, Justin Martyr, Clement of Alexandria, Tertullian and Irenaeus of Lyons. The

book has three parts. Part I consists of four chapters which provide a historical sketch of first-century Christianity and aspects of Jewish-Christian relations, together with an extended discussion of the political, philosophical, educational, and religious context of Greco-Roman paganism during the first and second centuries after Christ. Part II consists of five chapters each of which focuses on one of the five challenges to Christianity and surveys the various answers proposed by Judaism and early Christianity. Part III consists of six chapters, five of which summarize the responses to each of the five challenges by the five Christian leaders mentioned above, and the sixth provides a concluding general overview of the views of each of the five leaders, including an assessment of where they agree and disagree. On the problem of the creator and the creation, all five thinkers held that the Supreme Deity made the world and willed it to be good. The issue of human nature and destiny is more complex, but all generally agreed that human beings are linked both to the physical world and the celestial realm, that humans have a degree of free will, and that the disorder and evil in the world originated with angelic corruption supported by human beings. On the identities of Jesus, Wagner argues that each leader based his christology on the logos theology of the Fourth Gospel, though some (Justin and Clement) held that he was the supreme angel, while Tertullian and Irenaeus taught that the Logos was the manifestation of the Supreme God. On the roles for the Church, all five agreed that the Church was essential in God's plan of salvation for humans and the cosmos, and that it was the continuation of the people of God in the Old Testament. On Christians and society, some emphasized the positive (the Logos could enlighten humans and lead them to salvation) while others the negative (the world was under the influence of Satan and the Logos affected salvation by taking on the roles of victim and liberator). The discussion, of course, is far richer than this short summary can hope to capture.

This book is a carefully structured exercise in historical theology in which the five focal theological issues selected by the author are meticulously placed within appropriate historical and social contexts of the second-century world. This is an excellent textbook which should provide a convenient framework for discussion in courses focusing on the earlier phases of Christian historical theology when used in conjunction with the actual texts of each of the five Christian thinkers.

David E. Aune

Loyola University of Chicago

Gnostic Truth and Christian Heresy. A Study in the History of Gnosticism. By Alastair H. B. Logan. (Edinburgh: T & T Clark. Order from Books International, Inc., Herndon, Virginia. 1996. Pp. xxiv, 373; 2 plates. \$49.95.)

Historical criticism of the Gnostic literature was at first revived and then perhaps a bit confused by the find of the Nag Hammadi materials. Alastair Logan's

study brings it to the fore again by using patristics as well as a very thorough analysis of the Apocryphon of John and defending Irenaeus by urging that "any blatant misrepresentation would surely have triggered Gnostic protests" (p. 1). His use of the Fathers gives depth to his work—and raises problems; e.g., Irenaeus 1.30.9 contradicts 1.30.6 (p. 210, n. 99) on the formation and nature of man, while there are "doublets" in Irenaeus' accounts of the earliest Gnostics. In addition, Gnostics did criticize his accounts at least of their Ururgical texts, according to Hippolytus (Refutation 6.4Z).

Logan clearly states his three "hypotheses." (1) "The form or forms of Gnosticism found in the so-called 'Sethian' texts cannot be understood apart from Christianity." (2) "One is justified in seeking both a central core of ideas, a myth or myths based on and concretely expressed in a rite of initiation as a projection of Gnostic experiences, and in treating it as a valid form (or forms) of interpreting Christianity." (3) "Irenaeus' summary in *Adv. haer.* 1.29 is closest to the original form of the Christian Gnostic myth of Father, Mother, and Son, and it underwent progressive development including 'Setianization'" (pp. xviii-xxi). One can thoroughly agree with the first and third points but question the meaning of "valid form," while also wondering what "Gnostic Truth and Christian Heresy" means.

While Logan usually relies on his own astute exegesis of Nag Hammadi texts, he sometimes calls on Irenaeus' testimony (or testimonies) about Saturninus of Antioch, who set forth an anti-Jewish system (with reverse exegesis of the Old Testament), anticosmic as well (not just docetic), and discussed the descent/ascent of the divine spark and the final restoration of the elements. Saturninus thus anticipated later Nag Hammadi ideas, though he did lack the crucial figure of the Mother Sophia and perhaps a rite of initiation (pp. 41-42). Admittedly Irenaeus' account is incomplete and inconsistent at the end (pp. 168-169, 172, 183, 186-187), where Logan finds an "unresolved tension": salvation is "by nature" or by divine grace as a lifelong possession of believers, or as a gift to believers, capable of being lost (p. 213, Cf 266). But Saturninus may have included Sophia and initiation as well, since Irenaeus treats him as the heir of Simon and Menander, both of whom taught about the female First Thought and practised magic or magical baptism.

Is the "tension" in Irenaeus genuinely Gnostic or does it come from his combining two sources, the first of which could be Justin's lost Syntagma? His text can probably be divided in two, with one version mentioning the god of the Jews, whom Christ came to destroy, saving believers; archons; and Satan (two terms found in Justin), and the other saying that the Savior (not found in Justin) came to save the good when the Father wanted to destroy the demons and the evil men they aided (see my *Irenaeus of Lyons* [Routledge, 1996]). Though Irenaeus regarded the two as consistent (just as for Simon Magus he runs together Acts 8:9-23 with material from Justin and elsewhere), can they really have come from the same source? If they cannot, Logan's first and third hypotheses still stand, but the end of the second one remains rather obscure.

Robert M. Grant

University of Chicago (Emeritus)

Italia ascética atque monástica: Das Asketen- und Mönchtum in Italien von den Anfängen bis zur Zeit der Langobarden (ca. 150/250-604). By Georg Jenal. [Monographien zur Geschichte des Mittelalters, Band 39, I and II] (Stuttgart: Anton Hiersemann. 1995. Pp. xxiv, 471; xiv, 473-1024. DM 436.)

It is sobering to realize that thirty years have passed since Friedrich Prinz's *Frühes Mönchtum im Frankenreich* swept away the remains of a tradition of historiography and supplanted it with a fresh view of Gaulish monasticism's earliest centuries, showing the link between the image of Martin of Tours and the ambitions of Merovingian monarchs, who revived Martin as their patron when they found it convenient, as against the Lérins-based tradition that had in fact populated the monasteries of the fifth and sixth centuries. Georg Jenal now sets out to do a similar service for earliest Italian monasticism.

The first three hundred pages of the heavy two-volume study consists of positivist amassing of information: who, what, when, where, every name docketed. Obvious figures loom large (Eugippius, Cassiodorus), but fragments have been assiduously collected as well. For the coastal resort of Rimini, for example, we find mention (p. 8) of the *vita* of a monk named Bassus (date utterly unknown, reported in Eugippius' sixth-century *Life* of Severinus) who lived on a mountain named Titas near the city (anyone who has stayed in the Hotel Titano atop San Marino's mount there will assume he has been close to the legend at least). Later (p. 281), several letters of Gregory the Great point to a monastery of Saints Andreas and Thomas there (in some disagreement with the local bishop). Not much substance, but with good maps (provided at pp. 953ff), the geography of our knowledge can be limned: not much in the Po valley not much in Apulia and Calabria, more down the central line from Ravenna to Rome and along to Naples and up to Beneventum, and of course a boom in what we know of Sicily from the letters of Gregory the Great.

On the basis of such patient amassing of material, the last five hundred pages of the work (840 pages of text and two hundred pages of bibliography, tables, and indices) erect an interpretive structure, or rather set of structures characterized by a traditional idea of social history. Separate chapters study: the influence of Jerome on Italian monastic ideas, then the influence (kept apart from his erstwhile friend on these pages as much as possible) of Rufinus, resistance to monasticism (and in a separate essay, monasticism's critique of secular, especially "pagan" culture), issues of poverty/property, education, and the role of monasticism in the clergy generally. These last chapters have a disjointed quality about them, with major figures (e.g., Gregory the Great) getting subchapters under each of several topics. There is rather more attention back to the predictable major figures in these chapters than one might have hoped, but that is in part a reflection of the nature of the surviving evidence, which informs us abundantly of a few figures and but sparsely of many others. Except when taken as collections of data, saints' lives (especially Gregory the Great's *Dialogi*) seem underexploited, perhaps mistrusted, but the most surprising absence is any ex-

tended discussion of the influence of John Cassian. Cassian gets more attention for his brief personal presence in Italy than for the pervasive influence of his books both directly (Benedict, Cassiodorus, and Gregory the Great were all smitten with him) and indirectly (through the texts he influenced, notably the "rules" of the "Master," Benedict, and Eugippius).

On the other hand, the patient elucidation of Jerome's and Rufinus's ideas and their influence constitutes the most important contribution of the work. It is in those leading figures that Jenal sees the lines of opposition laid down and played out between a western style of monasticism (Rufinian, less ascetic) and an eastern (Hieronymian, more austere) in which the texts and ideas of Origen were deployed by all sides to their advantage. If we knew more of some of the shadowy figures whose names appear so briefly in the early section of this work, it would be a pleasure to draw lines of influence more clearly, but in the absence of anything comparable to the centralizing influence of the Merovingians, that is far from possible. That the story ends, as well, with Gregory the Great leaves the reader eager for more, because it is in the history of the mediation of his ideas to Italian and western monasticism generally that the next great untold story of early monasticism will be found. Jenal lays foundations and supplies detailed information that will be of immense use to scholars in many areas of late antique and early medieval history.

James J. O'Donnell

University of Pennsylvania

The Rise of Western Christendom. Triumph and Diversity, AD 200-1000. By Peter Brown. [The Making of Europe.] (Cambridge, Massachusetts: Blackwell Publishers. 1996. Pp. xvii, 353. \$24.95.)

No historian has been more apt to surprise his readers than Peter Brown. Always concerned to strip away the "patina of the obvious that encrusts human action" (as he once put it in an essay), he has done more to rescue the past from the tyranny of stereotypes than any living historian. The variety of the means whereby he has been able to achieve this defy specification. In his hands the wayward and idiosyncratic can become more revealing than the typical: some small incident, a phrase, or a scene, portrayed from an unusual angle, under an oblique light, presented with the artistry and in the bewitching language of an Irish wizard, with vast learning able to draw on revealed and unfamiliar evidence, combines to stop his reader in his tracks. Brown challenges our imagination to "ask ourselves whether the imaginative models that we bring to the study of history are sufficiently precise and differentiated, whether they embrace enough of what we sense to be what it is to be human" (as he said to his students in London in his Inaugural Lecture in 1977). His work has not so much changed the way we see a crucial period of European history, but enlarged our sense of what historical understanding is about.

His new book aims to "tell in its own way a story that is already well known . . ." (p. x). It is, indeed, very much in its own way. That the book is perhaps less surprising than so much in Peter Brown's writings is in very large measure the result of their success in shaping a generation's view of the history of Late Antiquity and the early Middle Ages. That we have come to give weight to the religious and cultural assumptions and expectations of Late Roman persons in their history and that we are far more sensitive to the ways in which these determined their approach to the administrative and political developments in their societies, we owe mainly to Peter Brown's work. The air of familiarity about his account of the formation of western Christendom is a measure of his achievement.

It is hard to single out any among the many muminating discussions. The re-description of "barbarians" (pp. 8-12), the marveUously lucid and humane account of the christological debates of the fifth century (pp. 70-75), the treatment of "paganism" as the power of the past to re-emerge in the Christian present (pp. 98-99), the pages on Gregory of Tours and the Christian world of sixth-century Gaul (pp. 107-110), the illuminating comparison of country and city-Christianity in the East and the West (pp. 116-117), of Chalcedonian and dissident communities (pp. 130-131), the description of a nouvelle cuisine of a simple, "rustic," Christianity put forward as a self-conscious alternative to the re-UGion of the old high culture by men such as Caesarius of Aries and Gregory of Tours (pp. 151-152), and the portrayal of "micro-Christendoms" more or less isolated from a larger ecumenical world, driven to pursue their own form of completeness reflecting in microcosm "the imagined, all-embracing macrocosm of a world-wide Christianity" (p. 218): these seem to the present reviewer among the high points. Perhaps most important, because most often neglected, is the underlying conception of Christianity as less a fixed quantity than a constantly developing body of normative belief and practice, variable not only in time but also from place to place.

Rich in insights, highly readable and informative, the book will give those unfamiliar with the period a sense of its shape and interest, to those more at home in it a great deal to ponder, and to both sorts much deUght.

R.A. Markus

Nottingham

History and Religion in Late Antique Syria. By Han J.W. Drijvers. [Variorum Collected Studies Series, 464.] (Brookfield, Vermont: Variorum, Ashgate Publishing Co. 1994. Pp. xii, 305. \$87.50.)

Professor Drijvers has had a remarkable career at the University of Groningen. Beginning with his groundbreaking study of Bardaisan (1966), he has labored to transform the study of Syriac Christianity from the stepchild of theology to a subdiscipline of the study of Late Antiquity. The present volume

contains a reprint collection of nineteen articles originally published between 1983 and 1992. This was a remarkably fruitful decade of scholarly enterprise. The first section includes ten articles in which aspects of problems related to the roots of Syriac Christianity were re-examined. He studied the relationships between Jews and Christians, pseudepigraphical literature produced and/or transmitted in Syriac, the theology and influence of Tatian, and Syriac Christian spirituality. He argued throughout that the roots of early Syriac Christianity are to be found in middle-Platonic thought and not in some sentimental theory of Jewish Aramaic origins.

Another group of articles in this collection dealt with Marcion and the Marcionites who were competitors of Bardaisan and the Manichaeans as well as Ephrem of Syria. In articles which have yet to receive serious consideration in early Christian studies, Drijvers, correctly I would argue, identified Marcion's philosophical system as dependent upon a particular middle-Platonic perspective. This analysis which goes against the standard fare found in generations of textbooks on early Christianity will require significant re-examination of the relevant texts.

The third branch of the collection presents two of Drijver's most controversial articles. These deal with Manichaeism. What has offended many scholars of Syriac studies, although few have made serious efforts to present arguments to the contrary, is the identification of the *Doctrina Addai* as a "Christian" response to the challenge posed by a letter of Mani to Manichaean believers at Edessa rather than a treatise reporting on the evangelization of Edessa by one of the Apostles. As Drijvers would be the first to recognize, the *Doctrina Addai* and related documents are complex in themselves and from periods where our understanding is complicated by the dearth of documents.

The final three articles provide groundbreaking probes into the relationship between Syriac Christianity and Islam during the seventh and eighth Christian centuries. The first explored Anthony of Tagrit's writing about the providence of God; the second examined a Syriac apocalyptic text known as *The Gospel of the Twelve Apostles*; the third reflected on the relationships between Jews, Christians, and Muslims in Northern Mesopotamia during the early Islamic period. In these articles, Drijvers insists upon the continuity between the earliest days of Syriac literature and the issues which arose in the interaction between religious traditions in the seventh and eighth centuries.

In each of these areas of inquiry, Drijvers will be challenged and corrected. One suspects, for example, that the work on early Syriac Manichaeism will be brought into greater clarity as one works both with Ephrem of Syria and with Manichaean documents from throughout West Asia and the Eastern Mediterranean. As well, this reviewer would argue that Drijvers may not have gone far enough in grounding Bardaisan and the early Marcionites in Northern Mesopotamian culture and warranting them as proponents of Christian visions. These comments and others above are not meant to detract from the contribution of Drijvers. To the contrary, Drijvers has been able to transform the way in

which the Syriac texts and contexts are discussed. AU who have written on aspects of these matters since Drijvers have been required to take his work into account. The present volume makes a significant contribution by bringing together texts necessarily published in less accessible places.

David Bundy

Christian Theological Seminary
Indianapolis, Indiana

The Early Byzantine Churches of Cilicia and Isauria. By Stephen Hill. [Birmingham Byzantine and Ottoman Monographs, Volume 1.] (Brookfield, Vermont: Variorum, Ashgate Publishing Co. 1996. Pp. xxvi, 280, 62 figures, 127 plates. \$94.95.)

The Roman province of Cilicia is particularly rich in standing remains of the early Byzantine period, more so in its mountainous western part (Isauria) than in its eastern plain (Pedias). As usual happens in the Near East, ancient monuments are preserved in inaccessible and sparsely populated districts, while they tend to disappear in centers of substantial and continuous habitation. This circumstance has created the impression that the Cilician monuments were somehow marginal and rustic. Had they survived in major cities like Tarsus and Seleucia (Süfke), the picture might have been very different.

The Christian remains fall between the fourth and early seventh century and include some ensembles that have attained a measure of fame among scholars: the cult center of St. Thecla at Meryemlik (outside Süfke), Alahan, and Corycus. Mopsuestia has yielded only one, badly excavated basilica, but Anazarbus, long deserted, is better represented by three churches of impressive dimensions. Anemurium, which has been systematically excavated, has six churches, all fairly small. The other sites covered in this book are relatively obscure.

Dr. Hill, who has explored Cilicia for two decades and, furthermore, had access to the unpublished field notes of the late Michael Gough, has now produced a highly useful catalogue of all known early Byzantine churches of the area to a total of 170. The entries are arranged alphabetically by location and contain a full summary of what is known about each monument. The significance of this material is analyzed in a substantial introduction in which the author seeks to rescue the Cilician churches from their obscurity and ends up by making some fairly bold claims on their behalf.

His argument, in brief, is as follows. All the Cilician churches are basilicas, but they exhibit certain peculiarities, notably a passage or adjunct behind the apse, sometimes containing one or more separate chapels. Previous scholars have not known what to make of this passage. Dr. Hill argues convincingly that it was martyrial on the analogy of the Constantinian shrines in the Holy Land, which combined basilica and martyrium. The next step in the argument concerns the

transept, which is present in a dozen CUician churches. Its purpose, the author maintains, was to provide access to the eastern passage, and since the latter was a local feature, it follows that the transept, too, was not imported from elsewhere, but developed on the spot. Finally, there is the old problem of the origin of the domed basUica, represented here by at least two examples (the "Cupola Church" at Meryemlik and Dag Pazan). It has usuaUy been assumed that the domed basilica, representing as it does the crowning achievement of early Byzantine architecture, was invented in some major center, but at ConstantinoUe it appears only in the sixth century. If the CUician examples are earlier, is it not possible to suggest that they exhibit the first experiments in the development of that particular form?

Two other considerations are relevant. First, it is estabUshed that Isaurians had in antiquity a reputation as skUled masons. Second, the most likely period for a major building program in those parts is the reign of the emperor Zeno (474-491), himseU an Isaurian. After the bloody suppression of the Isaurians by the next emperor, Anastasius, the province probably declined, and Justinian is not recorded as having initiated much buUding, except for a few bridges in Cilicia.

Dr. HiU has presented a well-argued case for considering Cilicia/Isauria a creative architectural center in the last quarter of the fifth century, even if occasionally (notably for Alahan) he seems to be pushing the evidence a little too far. His book wiU certainly remain an indispensable work of reference for some time to come. My only complaint concerns the poor photographic reproductions, some reduced to the size of a postage stamp. They give a very inadequate impression of the quality of the monuments.

Cyril Mango

Exeter College, Oxford

Augustine. *His Thought in Context*. By T. Kermit Scott. (Mahwah, New Jersey: PauUst Press. 1995. Pp. iv, 253. \$14.95.)

Kermit Scott, a professor of philosophy in Purdue University, has written this general introduction to the thought of Augustine. The subtitle points to the first major section: Augustine's world. He sketches a grim picture of the late Roman Empire, not an unjust one, but one that relies heavUy on The Class Struggle in the Ancient Greek World of de Sainte-Croix. In Scott's view, Augustine, without intending to, offered the perfect ideology for sustaining the class structure of this cruel world.

The lengthy second section, "The Search for God," affords the author the opportunity to proceed through a biographicaUy structured account of Augustine's quest as recounted in the Confessions. First there was the basic CathoUc worldview absorbed from Monica, then the flirtation with Manichaeism, the en-

counter with the Christian Platonists of Milan, and ultimately the reversion to a more sophisticated form of his childhood beliefs. Each of these stages is labeled a "myth." The final "imperial myth" seems to boil down to the belief in an omnipotent God to whom all must be subject. This in turn is what upholds the social status quo of power and submission throughout most of subsequent history.

The final section selects some of Augustine's teachings which are deemed to be central. Predestination is discussed at length. The author goes on to show that the non-philosophically based ideas of the fall and original sin complete the circle of human impotence. We cannot even begin to save ourselves without God's grace. Scott concludes that while Augustine's system is admirably consistent, the ultimate flaw comes down to the question of why there was a fall in the first place, whether it be angelic or human.

While there are a few factual errors, e.g., Nebridius never became a bishop but probably died even before Augustine was ordained a priest (p. 88), the work offers a clear presentation of some of Augustine's principal lines of thought. The author acknowledges that there are many areas of Augustine's thought that he does not take into consideration. I think, however, that these unavoidable omissions in the end detract from the book. In his conclusion, he speaks of the "atomistic souls" of Augustine's thought which have given rise to western individualism. A consideration of his views on the Church and Christian community would have tempered such a generalization.

Western tradition, like this book, has not equally developed all the many facets of Augustine's masterful synthesis. While the work is insightful from a philosophical point of view, it does not convey the fire at the heart of Augustine's life and thought. The not very philosophical category of love is conspicuous by its absence.

Robert B. Eno, S.S.

The Catholic University of America (Published posthumously)

Veiled Desire: Augustine on Women. By KLM Power. (New York: Continuum, 1996. Pp. xi, 328. \$27.50.)

KLM Power suggests (p. 17) that St. Augustine of Hippo might not only have been the first psychologist but also the first postmodernist, for his work can carry "all meanings to all readers." Power offers her own perspective on the ancient saint, one informed by Mary Douglas's anthropology, Kleinian psychology, Jungian Archetypal theory, and the sensitivities of contemporary feminism. Power writes as a psychologist and feminist theologian with the fundamental aim of "critiquing structures which constrain both men and women to remain half-human, and demonstrating how interpretations of sexual difference are central to Christian anthropology" (p. 14). In this book she tries to show that Au-

gustine set up a theological symbol system which not only echoed but also reinforced the prejudices of his own age and contributed toward the subordination of women in succeeding centuries.

I found the work difficult to review. It is a long book, poorly structured and excessively endnoted (the diligent reader will, at times, be flicking backwards and forwards from the main text at every new sentence). Whilst allowing for the author's feminist intentions, I found her relentless polemic against Augustine tiring and actually rather dull after a while. Her hermeneutical method proceeds by examining Augustine's experience, offering a modern psychological interpretation of it, and then giving an explanation of the theology that allegedly results. But I have some serious doubts about this. Firstly, psychological categories such as "denial," "repression," "the grief process," belong within distinctly modern interpretations of the human psyche, and we cannot with confidence transport these interpretations onto a culture and a time which is essentially strange to us. Secondly, Power's preference for psychological explanations underrates the importance of the Bible and Judaeo-Christian thought forms on Augustine. For example, is it really plausible to suggest that Augustine's hostility to goddess worship reflected his fears of the autonomous, fertile woman, and that his hangups led him to substitute for the sexual Roman goddesses an asexual Mary (p. 208)? Was it not more likely that he had scriptural and theological problems with the goddesses?

I was unconvinced by the central thesis of the book. Far from reinforcing the subordination of women, it seems likely that Augustine's sophisticated male-female symbol system (based on a male sapientia and a female scientia) is, by the standards of his age, a "feminist" attempt to explicate the problematic verse 1 Cor. 11:7 in a way which shows that women (as well as men) are made in the image of God. Power would have done well to have reckoned with the feminist Augustinian scholar Kari Børresen's article "Patristic 'Feminism' The Case of Augustine" (*Journal of Augustinian Studies*, No. 25, 1994) on this point. It seems to me that Augustine's views on women are interesting precisely because he is more "feminist" than many of the other Church Fathers, yet is still unable to escape the basic assumption of the temporal subordination of women which was taken for granted in the ancient world.

There are some nice turns of phrase. For Augustine "the married woman had to meet all her husband's sexual needs, preferably whilst desiring a sexless marriage" (p. 127), expresses well the psychological predicament in which Augustine's approval of marital fidelity but hostility to concupiscence places one. Some interesting questions are raised: why, for example, did Augustine say so little in the *Confessions* about his siblings? Surely his early relations with them would have provided some useful material for his doctrine of original sin. But the genuine insights tend to get lost in a text which needed much more careful editing.

Robert Innes

St. John's College, Durham, England

The Making of a Heretic: Gender, Authority, and the Priscillianist Controversy. By Virginia Burrus. [Transformation of the Classical Heritage, Vol. XXIV] (Berkeley: University of California Press. 1995. Pp. xi, 252. \$45.00.)

Using the distinction between public life and private life as her point of departure, Virginia Burrus proceeds to investigate the Priscillianist controversy in terms of a paradigm which has grown out of the relationship between *polis* and *oikos* in late antique culture. Since the city is dominated by males and the household by females, the stage is set for a gender study, which Burrus develops in three stages: the person of Priscillian, the heresy of Priscillianism, and the immediate reception of the entire controversy. First, Priscillian's ascetical teaching and its concrete practice involved the migration of males into the female realm and, above all, of females into the male realm, which was interpreted by the contemporary authoritarian structure as a dangerous deviation. A primary preoccupation of the Council of Saragossa in 380 was the practice of mixed-sex study groups which represented a violation of a fundamental principle of social order in the public sphere, namely, the separation and subordination of women. Since the charismatic ascetics, namely, Priscillian and his followers, had challenged the authoritarian bishops, the small episcopal gathering at Saragossa attempted to consolidate the bishops' public authority and define the social organization. For example, participation in the episcopally led public eucharistic celebration was required of all women were prohibited from the private "meetings of strange men." Second, equally important to Burrus' thesis is the defining of Priscillian in terms of the other. By means of rhetorical "labeling strategies" on the part of Priscillian's opponents, the figure of the historical Priscillian is transformed into a symbol of deviance. Priscillian's favorable regard for the apocrypha makes him vulnerable to the charge of Manichaeism. The author uses Priscillian's Apology to establish the errors of which he was accused and his Letter to Damasus to reconstruct the historical chain of events. As the controversy unfolds, Priscillian and his friends argue their case in Bordeaux, Milan, Rome, and Trier. Ultimately charges of sorcery, sexual immorality, and Manichaeism made the affair more than a simple case of heresy. The emperor, Magnus Maximus, eager to court episcopal support, presents himself as the champion of orthodoxy and orders the execution of Priscillian, the widow Euchrotia, and three other companions. In their demise Priscillianism is born to be condemned several years later at the Council of Toledo in 400. Third, Burrus considers the reception of the controversy in the writings of Sulpicius Severus and Jerome. The reinterpretation of the ascetic heretic Priscillian by two ascetic orthodox writers is particularly interesting. Wishing to distance themselves from the accusation of sexual promiscuity and the subversion of gender roles, they reach back into an earlier stage in the history of Christianity and apply the label "gnostic" to Priscillian in order to characterize him as an insidious seducer of women. Although they are ascetics, both Severus and Jerome emerge as defenders of the boundaries of the public male and private female spheres. Finally, it should be noted that Würzburg, Universitätsbibliothek Ms. th. q. 3 is the unique witness to eleven Priscillianist tractates, which were edited by G. Schepss in 1889. Since

the manuscript is anonymous, the authorship of the tractates is still debated. Following Schepss and more recently H. Chadwick against G. Morin, A. D'Alès, and B. Vollmann, Burrus attributes both the Apology and the Letter to Damasus to Priscillian himself. Should this attribution be called into question, the central section of the author's argument would be jeopardized for lack of evidence.

Kenneth B. Steinhauser

Saint Louis University

The Lives of Simeon Stylites. Translated with an Introduction by Robert Doran. [Cistercian Studies Series, Number 112.] (Kalamazoo, Michigan: Cistercian Publications. 1992. Pp. iv, 241. \$36.95 cloth; \$15.95 paperback.)

Simeon Stylites was one of the most famous and exotic of the Syrian ascetics and at the same time one of the least characteristic. From such exotic examples has grown a picture of monastic life in Syria, now perhaps popularized beyond sober assessment, of ascetical extremists, which in turn has generated analyses that attempt to root Syrian asceticism in gnosticism and Manichaeism. A good deal of the credit for this distortion goes to the work of Arthur Vööbus, whose writings in this area are ripe for re-evaluation on many points, especially with regard to the origins and early development of Syrian monasticism. In Simeon's case, his original monastic community deemed him a disobedient extremist who was asked to leave the monastery. His subsequent career was obviously one that increasingly inspired widespread admiration, but it appears from the lives here translated that Simeon wanted nothing so much as to be left alone. But that was beyond his control, and he made the best of a bad situation by devoting some time to preaching, giving spiritual counsel, settling disputes, all without losing sight of his principal goal, union with God in the singular way to which he felt called. His stance during the christological controversy of the mid-fifth century was ambiguous. As a result he continued to be venerated by both Chalcedonians and their opponents throughout Late Antiquity.

The very thorough presentation of translations of three different lives of Simeon will allow readers to ferret out almost everything that has been recorded about this saint. A sober, comprehensive study of early Syrian monasticism should provide a background against which both Simeon and the introductory material in this book can be better evaluated. Such a study has yet to be written.

David Johnson, SJ.

The Catholic University of America

Cultural Identity and Cultural Integration: Ireland and Europe in the Early Middle Ages. Edited by Doris Edel. (Portland, Oregon: Four Courts Press, c/o ISBS. 1995. Pp. 208. \$49.50.)

Because of its vague title, I expected this collection of essays to resemble many others, that is, to be disorganized and eclectic. But, surprisingly, this is a relatively coherent, thematically linked set of articles, originally delivered at a conference on Celtic Studies at the University of Utrecht, held in celebration of the seventieth anniversary of a chair in the same discipline. Although the authors include both old hands and new faces, and although the book is divided into two sections ("Literarization" and "Christianization"), almost all the essays discuss the effect of Latin cultural influences on a society that never officially hosted the Romans as invaders. And despite the very short introduction, the essays readily reveal their connecting themes.

Every medievalist agrees that Ireland was different in the Middle Ages. Debates in recent years have focused on the quality and quantity of difference. The editor and authors of this book hold that the Irish participated vigorously in the Christian culture of the continent, but that they became literate and practiced literacy differently. This occurred for three reasons: because the Irish accepted literacy willingly, not as part of an imperialist culture imposed by Romans; because the "native" people (the Irish) had been in place for centuries before they became literate (unlike, say, the Germanic tribes) and hence could more easily assimilate their traditions and the written word; and because literacy was not, by itself, transformative of the culture. Laws, for instance, retained an archaic, poetic component and preserved ancient institutions once finally committed to writing.

The essays cover everything from cosmology to epic, Latin nouns to historical writing. One of the best pieces is by Marina Smyth, on the Irish view of the cosmos as expressed in seventh-century Hiberno-Latin texts. Smyth shows how the Irish accepted the very poor science of the Christian Fathers but added some local features to their cosmology; for instance, they emphasized the phases of the moon and sun, and had a fondness for birds. Giselle de Nie also contributes an illuminating discussion of Gregory of Tours and Caesarius of Arles that places the beliefs of both bishops in the social context of Christian practice and symbols. De Nie counters interpretation of Gregory as a superstitious simpleton, instead analyzing his use of magical miracles to depaganize his neighbors in preparation for a full-scale, interior, literate conversion to Christianity. The latter essay is not about Ireland, but is consistent with the book's themes.

The old nativist-versus-Christian argument of Celticists and historians has given way here to a more civilized, rational understanding of a complex process of literacy and religious change. Although some of the contributions are less innovative than others, they are also more accessible to non-specialists. For example, Pádraig ó Riain's essay on the location of Irish churches on territorial boundaries, which had as much to do with profits as sacred space, will be old

hat to Celticists. But most readers will find it and the other essays to be a good introduction to a Christianizing culture.

Lisa M. Bitel

University of Kansas

Medieval

Medieval Canon Law. By James A. Brundage. [The Medieval World.] (New York: Longman, 1995. Pp. xii, 260. \$12.99 paperback.)

In the course of the last fifty years American historians of the Middle Ages have come to realize the remarkable role canon law played in the development of Western Europe. Canon Law "formed a crucial component of medieval life and thought. Its rules affected the lives and actions of practically everyone, its enforcement mechanisms were increasingly able to reach into everyday affairs at all social levels, from peasant villages to royal households, and the ideas debated in the canon law schools constituted an influential and pervasive element in medieval intellectual life." "The records of church courts and the archives of ecclesiastical administrators "make up a very large fraction of the evidence that survives from the Middle Ages" (p. ix).

Up until the appearance of this volume, however, novices had at hand no really appropriate survey of the discipline in English, beyond articles in encyclopedias and the Dictionary of the Middle Ages. There was only the history of the sources in Amleto Cicognani's *Canon Law*, but that was outdated (1935), and the one hundred pages devoted to the classical period served mainly as a reference source. The 1951 lectures of Bishop R. C. Mortimer of Exeter at the Berkeley campus of The University of California, later published as *Western Canon Law*, though exceptionally well worth reading even today, necessarily lacked the desirable depth. Constant Van de WeU's *History of Canon Law* (1991), No. 5 of the University of Louvain's "Theological and Pastoral Monographs," was too brief; it made no attempt to deal with significant issues and was not helpfully organized.

Brundage, on the other hand, has managed to give an in-depth treatment of a very complex subject while avoiding the temptation of the expert to include less significant authors and developments. Especially valuable, even to one knowledgeable in the field, are the up-to-date bibliographical references in the notes. The two appendices, the Romano-canonical citation system and the biographical notes on the major canonists of the classical period, will also prove useful to professional historians.

The first three chapters survey chronologically the development of law from its beginnings in the early Christian Church, through the early Middle Ages, and culminating in the classical period from Gratian (1140) to the Black Death (1348). The symbiotic relationship between the two learned laws, canon law and

Roman law, "(so called in contrast to customary law and municipal statutory law, which were not typically subjects of formal study in university law faculties)" and the meaning of the *ius commune* are particularly well analyzed.

The next chapter demonstrates the extent to which canon law affected the private life of individuals. "Church courts exercised jurisdiction, for example, over marriage and the termination of marriage, the legitimacy of children, all types of sexual conduct, commercial and financial behaviour, the legitimate times and conditions of labour, poor relief, wills and testaments and burial of the dead" (p. 71). The chapter on public life explains how "out of the elaboration of canonical corporation theory, emerged some novel political ideas that have subsequently become basic to modern Western notions about constitutional government" (p. 104). Two chapters deal with church courts and procedure and with canonical jurisprudence. A final chapter explores the widespread ramifications of canon law in Western societies.

In conclusion, "the speculations and insights of medieval canonists remain enshrined both within the common law tradition of the English-speaking world and within the civil law heritage of Continental Europeans. This is most obviously true in family law and testamentary law, but canonical tradition is also evident in many other branches of the law—contracts, torts, property law, and corporation law among them. . . . Medieval canon law, in short, constituted a fundamental formative force in the creation of some of the elemental ideas and institutions that continue to this day to characterize Western societies" (p. 189). Brundage, a past president of the American Catholic Historical Association and the author of numerous books and articles, offers here a brilliant appreciation of medieval canon law.

John E. Lynch

The Catholic University of America

Art and Architecture in Byzantium and Armenia: Liturgical and Exegetical Approaches. By Thomas F. Mathews. [Variorum Collected Studies Series CS510.] (Brookfield, Vermont: Variorum, Ashgate Publishing Company, 1995. Pp. xii, 295. \$124.95.)

This is another in the Variorum series of collected studies containing, like the others, reprints of the author's articles culled from disparate and often hard-to-find sources. These span the period from 1962 to 1994 and demonstrate Mathews' continued interest in the interrelated areas of liturgy, architecture, and church decoration. The author's brief introduction acknowledges that additional debate on some of these topics has taken place in print, and that at least one of his studies "requires modification" in the light of later archaeological work. Unfortunately, even though only three of the included studies postdate 1986, the introduction refers to fewer than a dozen additional titles (two by Mathews himself) that update the research here. The book is extensively illus-

trated with black-and-white prints of varying quality, and there is a brief index. Numerous typographical errors in the original articles have not been corrected.

Studies I-III deal with architecture and liturgy: "An early Roman chancel arrangement and its liturgical uses," "Architecture and Uturgy in the earliest palace churches of Constantinople" (translated from its original publication in French), and "'Private' Uturgy in Byzantine architecture: toward a re-appraisal." The latter study in particular remains fundamental, but aU of them demonstrate the author's familiarity with Greek and Latin texts as weU as with archaeological material.

Studies IV-VI are largely descriptive reports on Armenian and Byzantine churches, from the very brief "Observations on St Hfipsimē" to the longer "Notes on the Atik Mustafa Paşa Camii in Istanbul and its frescoes" and "Observations on the church of Panagia Kamariotissa on Heybeliada (Chalke), Istanbul." More recent research on the Atik has confirmed Mathews' observations about a porch, or flanking chapels, surrounding this Middle Byzantine church (and all the others in Constantinople), and uncovered traces of Byzantine decoration unknown to him.

The iconography of Armenian and Byzantine manuscripts and frescoes is the focus of Studies VII-X: "The early Armenian iconographic program of the Ējmiacin Gospel (Erevan, Matenadaran Ms 2374, olim 229)," "The epigrams of Leo SaceUarios and an exegetical approach to the miniatures of Vat. Reg. Gr. 1," "The annunciation at the weU: a metaphor of Armenian monophysitism," and "The Genesis frescoes of Alt'amar." These are wide-ranging inquiries, and the close text-and-image exegesis of the Leo Bible offers a model for such studies.

Finally, Studies XI-XIV represent the author's analysis of how Byzantine domed churches and their decoration operated for Orthodox viewers, and how particular images functioned in their specific architectural contexts: "Cracks in Lehmann's 'Dome of Heaven'," "The sequel to Nicaea II in Byzantine church decoration," "The transformation symboUsm in Byzantine architecture and the meaning of the Pantokrator in the dome," and "Psychological dimensions in the art of Eastern Christendom." There is some repetition in the last two, which deal extensively with the image of the Pantokrator and suggest paraUels with Hindu and Buddhist spirituality and artistic symboUsm. Three of these last four studies date to 1986 or later and thus are representative of the author's more recent research. An abiding interest in the interdependence of art, architecture, and religious praxis unifies Mathews' scholarship and unites the articles in this handy compUation.

Linda Safran

The Catholic University of America

Culture and Religion in Merovingian Gaul, A.D. 481-751. By Yitzhak Hen. [Cultures, Beliefs and Traditions: Medieval and Early Modern Peoples, Volume 1.] (Leiden: E. J. Brill. 1995. Pp. xiv, 308. \$80.00.)

Dr. Hen utilizes an impressive array of sources and modern studies to reconstruct the cultural and religious life of Merovingian Gaul. The aim is a comprehensive picture of the interacting religious and cultural forces that characterized a society once—perhaps in some circles still—regarded as the outstanding representative of "dark age" decline. Archaeological and anthropological findings supplement the reconstruction, but the bulk of evidence comes from the writings of churchmen, and so the picture cannot be complete. Yet there is still the possibility of a synthetic treatment giving coherence to the pieces of Merovingian remains. Such an undertaking in English has been long awaited, with the few previous works of a similar breadth usually coming from continental Europe.

Hen perceptively discusses language and literacy before focusing on the Catholic liturgy (chapters 2-5) as a cultural expression of religious and social interaction. After mentioning the relevant liturgical sources and the monastic centers responsible for their production, he arranges his treatment of Merovingian worship under three subdivisions corresponding to the main liturgical cycles: the temporal, commemorating Christ's life; the sanctoral, honoring the holy dead; the personal, celebrating events in an individual's lifetime. The sources pertaining to the cycles reflect a people's committed participation in the Church's life. The closely examined liturgical texts and the reconstructed sanctoral calendars also show, respectively, a "certain detachment" (p. 60) from Roman influences and much local flavor in the veneration of saints.

Chapter 6 considers paganism's survival in the Merovingian kingdoms. The old belief system, he argues, was at best a marginal religion nearly dead by the sixth century. Sources mentioning pagan practice are regarded as having no "basis in reality" (p. 177). This reader feels that here the evidence is not allowed to speak; it seems forced to fit a narrow outlook.

The book ends with an overview of secular entertainments. As alternatives to the vanishing pastimes of previous eras (like gladiatorial shows), the athletic played vigorous ball sports while the sedentary enjoyed a board game resembling backgammon. For males a socially defining leisure activity was heavy drinking.

Hen has a deep sympathy for an era maligned since the Carolingians. He redresses the *damnatio memoriae* overshadowing the period's achievements. Indeed, he compellingly shows how Merovingian cultural developments provided precedents for the Carolingians (though the latter suppressed the knowledge of Merovingian influence by claiming to be innovators rather than borrowers).

But the coherent picture never emerges. The separate sketches of culture remain as parts not related to a whole. Colorful portions are also missing. With Arianism and Judaism hardly discussed and paganism dismissed as barely having a

marginal place within society, Latin Christianity is the sole belief system extensively treated (the title's inclusive "religion" misleads). Even this exclusive focus overlooks the varieties of religious expressions within the Church. For a scholar who challenges so many prevalent views, Hen accepts too readily the opinion that a scarcity of living holy people marked this era. Hermits, widows, practitioners of *secreta conversio*, *pauperes* on a church's *matricula*, and other holy lay people who cluttered the religious landscape of Merovingian Gaul are not represented. Merovingian society itself is generically presented. While specific entertainments are admirably discussed, individual social groups are overlooked. Their absence is noticeable. After all, the sources say more about the poor than they do about backgammon. Certainly any investigation into the Merovingian past will be hindered by the nature of the evidence. But this evidence is so much richer than what Hen's study shows.

John Kitchen

Toronto, Ontario

Late Merovingian France: History and Hagiography, 640-720. By Paul Fouracre and Richard A. Gerberding. [Manchester Medieval Sources Series.] (Manchester: Manchester University Press. Distributed by St. Martin's Press, Scholarly and Reference Division, New York. 1996. Pp. xi, 397. \$69-95 clothbound; \$24.95 paperback.)

This splendid volume provides an important addition to the general studies of and translated sources from the Merovingian era which have appeared over the last decade from such Anglophone scholars as Patrick Geary, Judith George, Edward James, JoAnn McNamara, Raymond Van Dam, and Ian Wood. Alongside an impressive body of continental, largely German, scholarship, these works have significantly altered our view of the Merovingian kingdoms, showing how vibrantly Roman political and religious forms survived under Frankish kings. Fouracre and Gerberding have now cogently completed the rehabilitation of the *rois fainéants*—those who ruled from the death of Dagobert through the death of Chilperic II. They appear on their own terms in the words of carefully translated contemporary sources, rather than in those of Carolingian propagandists, or in a Gibbonesque narrative of decline and fall, or in hazy notions of Germanic ethnic identity. Their reigns emerge as a period of complex and intense syncretism which led from the empire of the Romans to that of the Carolingians.

The volume is not simply a source collection, but is in effect a comprehensive reconsideration of these seventy years of Frankish history, albeit one which will not surprise readers of, for example, Ian Wood's *The Merovingian Kingdoms, 450-751* (London, 1994). The volume begins with a lengthy introduction in which the editors present a concise political history of the period, then consider the problems presented by hagiography as a source for political and social

history, and finally discuss the use of Latin within the Frankish kingdoms and in these sources more particularly. The body of the volume consists of eight translated sources. The bookends are historical works, selections from the *Liber Historiae Francorum*, a laconic contemporary source positively inclined to the Merovingians (which Richard Gerberding early analyzed in an excellent monograph), and the *Annales Mettenses Priores*, a piece of Carolingian propaganda. In between these bookends are six hagiographic sources, concerning the Uves of two queens and four bishops: Balthild, Audoin, Aunemund, Leudegar, Praejectus, and Geretrud. Together they constitute roughly one-half of the hagiography composed in this period. Each source is preceded by a lengthy commentary. Collectively these introductions provide a thorough examination of a good number of the sources of the period—which will be invaluable to other scholars. They make a convincing case, for example, that the *Acta Aunemundi*, although composed in the tenth century, preserves authentic seventh-century traditions. The introduction and commentary are substantial: of the 370 pages of text in the volume, less than 150 are occupied by the translations.

The scholarship to be found in the editors' own text is revisionist history at its most sensible and compelling: solidly based on the sources, but using interpretative imagination, supplemented by such modern theoretical techniques as deconstruction (explicitly discussed by the editors) and anthropology (implicitly present in their discussion of conflict resolution and family alliances). The discussion of the use of hagiography is in particular a masterful condensation of a complex debate into several clear pages. My only critique is that the focus of the volume is solely on political history, albeit in the general sense adopted by the editors: "how would society now keep the peace" (p. 2). Thus the religious life of the period remains oddly on the sidelines. The only substantive discussions of the impact of Irish monasticism, for example, occur in the commentaries on two specific texts, and these briefly summarize the asceticism of the Irish monks before considering problems such as the development of immunities and the economic base of the Columbanian communities at some length. Even more curiously the cult of relics goes virtually unremarked, even though the paperback edition sports the photo of a reliquary on its cover.

The scholarly achievement of Fouracre and Gerberding is considerable, for they have provided the most comprehensive consideration of the late Merovingian kingdoms—and most particularly the contemporary sources—now available. Their pedagogic achievement, however, while considerable, leaves some problems, at least for the American classroom. It is certainly a great boon to have these sources available in translation. A decade ago, the would-be teacher of the Merovingians had little available except for the *Books of Histories of Gregory of Tours*. Now a substantial percentage of the narrative sources for the period have been provided precise and well-annotated English translations through the efforts of the scholars mentioned above. This book will have a useful place alongside these others, but I suspect that most American undergraduates will find the introduction and commentary heavy going. Also, the political focus of the editors has caused them to omit sources, such as the life of Fursey,

which would have helped to illuminate the importance of Columbanian monasticism (although, admittedly, the main action of that text occurs during the reign of Dagobert). The addition of a timeline would have aided greatly in the classroom, while a brief essay providing critical guidance to the seventeen-page bibliography might have benefited beginning research students.

These complaints are small in comparison to the great achievements of the volume. This is a book which will be used and appreciated by both scholars and students. It deserves a place in every college library, while the laudable grace of Manchester University Press in making it simultaneously available in paperback means that many medievalists can place it gratefully on their own shelves.

Thomas Head

Washington University in St. Louis

Symeon the Holy Fool: Leontius's Life and the Late Antique City. By Derek Krueger. With English translation of the *Life of Symeon the Holy Fool*. [Transformation of the Classical Heritage, XXV] (Berkeley: University of California Press. 1996. Pp. xvi, 196. \$35.00.)

This work examines the *Life of Symeon the Holy Fool*, written by Leontius in the seventh century, in relation to late antique literary heritage, early Byzantine hagiographical traditions, and the urban environment of the late antique city. The book originated as the author's doctoral dissertation and was reworked to its present form by revision of the original, and by the addition of two chapters (I: "Leontius of Neapolis and Seventh Century Cyprus," and IV: "Holy Fools and Secret Saints") and a conclusion stating the author's observations on Cynics, Christians, and Holy Fools. The book also contains an appendix with an English translation of the *Life of Symeon the Holy Fool* written by Leontius of Neapolis. The *Life of Symeon* recounts the Saint's tonsure, his ascetic life in the desert, his decision to go to Emesa in an effort to convert its population to Christian virtue, and his decision to appear as a fool for Christ's sake. The last aspect of the *Life* is at the center of Derek Krueger's examination. His assessment of the *Life* in the context of its Christian and non-Christian literary antecedents adds to the understanding of this particular hagiographic genre, the *Life of the Holy Fool*. The English translation of the *Life of Symeon* complements the available French, German, Italian, Greek, and Russian translations.

An image of seventh-century Cyprus in the first chapter establishes the social, political, and economic background of Leontius's ecclesiastical career. The urban setting of Leontius's Neapolis had all the basic features of any late antique city—an agora, baths, and schoolhouse. In fact, the author suggests it was Neapolis that Leontius had in mind when describing Emesa in the *Life of Symeon*. In the second chapter Krueger attempts to deal with the difficult problem of identification of the sources used by Leontius for the composition of the

Life. Contrary to Mango's view that Leontius may have used a no longer extant sixth-century paterikon, Krueger argues in favor of Evagrius Scholasticus's Ecclesiastical History as the inspiration for the construction of the Life. Chapters three and four present the Byzantine hagiographical tradition combined with tales of Holy Fools and the concept of secret sanctity as a form of supreme humility. In chapters five and six the author connects the classical literary tradition of the Cyme philosophers, especially the writings and anecdotes associated with Diogenes the Philosopher, with parallels in the Life of Symeon. The author illustrates the influence exerted on Christian theologians and writers by the moral philosophy of Cynics. This correlation is made clear particularly in regard to the urban environment considered full of corruption and moral depravity by both Christian thinkers and Cynic philosophers. Chapter seven examines analogies between the events in the life of Christ and that of Symeon with the view that Christ must be the model of sanctity in any saint's vita. In the conclusion Krueger offers some valuable thoughts on how the Life of Symeon may have been used as a didactic tool to instruct Leontius's audience toward conformity to the norms of society and Christian spirituality.

Stamatina McGrath

Dumbarton Oaks

"The Gentle Voices of Teachers": Aspects of Learning in the Carolingian Age.
Edited by Richard E. Sullivan. (Columbus: Ohio State University Press. 1995.
Pp. xiv, 361. \$49.50 clothbound; \$18.50 paperback.)

This book grew out of six papers read at a conference masterminded by Professor Richard Sullivan in 1989. His preface evokes "gentle voices" (the phrase is from an Alcuin in nostalgic mood) in a world "anything but gentle." A sense of Carolingian hard times recurs in Sullivan's list (pp. 53-54) of "factors" inimical to the nurturing of "culture": "constrained material resources, anemic societal infrastructures, massive illiteracy, brutality of manners, endemic violence, adherence to diverse and 'primitive' mind-sets running counter to the light of learning." It depends, of course, on what you mean by culture. This is not a book about material culture in the archaeologists' sense (there is scant reference to archaeology here), but nor do the authors concern themselves with the wider Carolingian world sketched with a certain roughness by the editor. Sullivan acknowledges that his is a cultural history which neglects "the little people and the realms where they lived their silent, unlettered, culturally unadorned lives." It is clear what this book is not—and what, perhaps, a broader vision might have made it. Still, "learning" is tackled here from a variety of standpoints, all of them of interest to students and scholars working in Carolingian and other parts of the medieval field. Are Carolingianists too specialized, asks Sullivan (p. 82)? If they are, this book may be all the more timely.

Do not be put off by the Introduction, specially written by Sullivan for the book, rather than the conference, yet perplexingly remote from the rest of it, including Sullivan's own Chapter 2. "Factors shaping Carolingian studies" include a ritual incantation of the names of French structuralists (p. 15) followed by other (partly overlapping) lists of "seminal thinkers" (p. 19) of the postmodernist brigade, of avatars of "the new social history," "the new cultural history," and the annalists, all cited in voluminous footnotes with scarce a reference to anything written on the Carolingian period. All allegedly represent "currents of thought" of which Carolingianists, hitherto negligent, it seems, "must be aware." Well, those assembled in this book may not be unaware—but they are clearly old-fashioned, theoretically unaccredited jobbing historians: Lawrence Nees (p. 217) points out that his Carolingians were already postmodern in their receptivity to multivalent messages; Thomas Noble (p. 228), eschews poststructuralism to "proceed on the assumption that Theodulf [in the *Libri Carolini*] had both the means and the will to articulate his own views"; while David Ganz (p. 262), fires off some refreshingly acerbic criticisms at those who apply "concepts such as literacy, dramatic narrative, or 'the social function of grammatica' ... to the sources in an effort to discover original insights." Frankly, this book is all the better for its contributors' sticking resolutely to their trade—one learned, in the cases of Contreni and Noble, in Sullivan's own workshop: good historians that they are, they parade no postmodernist warrant for the importance of close critical readings, and contextualizing, of their texts. Theory they no doubt have under their belts, where it belongs: what they have produced are beautifully crafted, custom-made pieces of scholarship.

Appropriately the first substantial chapter (Chapter 2) is the master's: Sullivan's observations on the context of cultural activity are specific, and telling. He stresses how an upstart dynasty sponsored reform, of which high culture was part and parcel, to establish its legitimacy. He both affirms and qualifies the importance of Charlemagne's mandate, rightly saying that some have exaggerated the Great Man's personal responsibility for the renaissance that bears his name (isn't the tendency reinforced, though, by the shorthand use—especially by Americans? certainly much in evidence in this book—of "Carolingian" to denote not only, adjectively a chronological period but also, as a noun, all those who lived during it: better call a Frank a Frank, and keep the Carolingians as a dynasty). But Sullivan adds contextual factors he thinks hitherto relatively disregarded: the importance of the period before 750 in establishing preconditions, and the crucial supporting roles of three "power groups"—episcopacy, aristocracy, and monks. Sullivan calls for further research on the spiritual life, on language and communication, and on individuals' inner urges including "the urge to laugh" (p. 80). This stimulating chapter ends by suggesting that there were eighth- and ninth-century "contextual similarities" in Latin Europe, Byzantium, and the Muslim Near East, and simultaneous conservative responses in all three cultural zones to "a common set of challenges": a ripe subject indeed for future comparative research in the wake of Judith Herrin.

In Chapter 3, John Contreni contributes an engaging survey of what went on in the "more than 70" schools that "flourished" (simultaneously?) in the Carolingian Empire. Rural priests were "the point men of the new society": a metaphor (out of M. Weber via M. Mann?) that evokes the determinative action of a specialist group (Suavian's aristocracy does not reappear here) in redirecting social change. Contreni emphasizes the centrality of the Bible to education at every level, highlighting the importance of the Psalms, and—in a typically illuminating touch—of the Psalms as songs. Contreni himself has the good teacher's twin gifts of communicating "fascination," embodied here (let no one henceforth add, 'improbably' . . .) in glossaries, and chiding constructively, as modern scholars are made to see that their neglect of the science-based quadrivium reflects, not the ninth century's One Culture but the bifurcation of the twentieth century's Two.

Part of this neglect affects music, whose centrality to Carolingian religious culture has till recently been appreciated by few save musicologists. Richard Crocker conveys vividly the emblematic role of that music: because it maintained Roman models, musical notation was invented in ninth-century Francia "to supplement memories and stabilize the repertory" (p. 146), while at the same time musical innovations displayed Frankish creativity, none more sublimely than the sequence, transmitted down the centuries by anonymous cantors. Readers of this book can only lament their absence from Crocker's "virtuoso performance of Carolingian chant" in 1989, recalled by Ganz. Perhaps a future reprint could be accompanied by a CD?

Chapter 5, short but sweet, contains another, this time multi-media, case-study in the reception and transformation of tradition: Bernice Kaczynski elegantly demonstrates how, in the eighth and ninth centuries, in text, exegesis, hagiography, and visual representation, a new book-culture produced a new St. Jerome. Kaczynski might have pointed out the cross-reference in the Dagou Psalter's dedicatory verse: Jerome's "drawing of the thorns from the Psalter" recalls the one, and still famous, miracle credited to Jerome in his ninth-century *Vitae*.

Nees and Noble, in the next two chapters, really do follow Sullivan's precept to contextualize. Nees, as ever contentious, cogent, and crystal-clear, convincingly argues that some Carolingian art actively reshaped models inherited from Christian Antiquity, and carried specific messages for contemporaries. Not only a court product like the Dagou Psalter covers (Nees' account at pp. 190-191, stressing the papal presence in the center of the upper back scene, should be compared with Kaczynski's at p. 75), but the Gundohinus Gospels (for which Nees wisely rejects the term "provincial"), and in particular the Majesty image at fol. 12T, must be understood as contributions to debates on Adoptionism and Iconoclasm respectively. Still more might have been said about Charlemagne, where, probably, was produced c.802 the Gospel Lectionary whose ivory cover scenes Nees plausibly links with Anti-Adoptionist theology. Yes, Alcuin may well have "sponsored" this work; but why should Abbess Gisela, Alcuin's own patron and

arguably a proponent of political ideas in her own right, not be considered at least as a possible co-sponsor? Nees's other theme is the double-edgedness of images: his readings of the David-Uriah scene on the cover of Charles the Bald's Psalter, and of the portrait of Charles as "resembling Josiah and Theodosius," according to the accompanying inscription, in the same book, are persuasive precisely because they include ambiguities. Art-works could be at once paeans of monarchy in general and critiques of particular kingly misconduct. Nees's approach is amply vindicated by work published since he wrote this paper, by Nikolaus Staubach, Val Flint, and others.

Tom Noble sketches the political background to the *Libri Carolini*, then addresses himself with characteristic incisiveness and verve to what that much-cited, seldom-read, work is about. Biblical interpretation was fundamental to the *Libri Carolini* author, Theodulf: the attack on Byzantine literature was nothing less, Noble implies (though without quite saying so), than a *translatio regni* from "Romans" to Franks. Ecclesiastical tradition here is Latin tradition, yet one in whose articulation the Franks now claimed a voice of their own. Synods should represent "every part of the Church." Noble draws out the corollary: "The Franks were adjusting conciliar theory to historical reality . . . They did not feel that their 'monarch,' the pope, adequately represented them" (p. 244). Nevertheless, Noble still insists, following Anne Freeman, that there was nothing antipapal in the *Libri Carolini*. The truth was that the Franks wanted to have their cake and eat it: their ultimately self-serving "passion for doing things more Romano, and placing the pope at the centre of the Church" were perfectly compatible in practice with insistence on a particular pope's toeing the Frankish line. Noble shrewdly notes near the outset of his piece (p. 231) the change in the wider political scene in 787 signalled by the breaking-off of the engagement between Charlemagne's daughter and the Empress Irene's son. This perception might have done more to inform Noble's subsequent discussion (background is not the same thing as context). The *Libri Carolini* were a piece d'occasion, or rather de conjoncture: the pope had apparently failed to grasp the consequences of 787 for the Franks' attitude to Byzantium, and hence for their judgment on the Second Council of Nicaea. The icon issue was bound to present itself, now, in a new form, and the pope had to be brought abreast of the Franks' new agenda, which was, and on this point Noble is absolutely clear, to substitute themselves for the Greeks as heirs of Israel and of Rome.

David Ganz's *Conclusion* is much more than a summary of, or even reflection on, the foregoing chapters. He begins with a survey of the historiography of the Carolingian period from the sixteenth century to the twentieth, and argues, without quite spelling out as firmly as the importance of the point requires, that much of what currently passes for knowledge of "the Carolingian achievement" is in fact myth, and well-worn at that. Ganz's critique, with its sharp ideological edge, in some ways prefigures that of Robert Morrissey in *L'empereur à la barbe fleurie* (1997), and is just as timely. Rejecting, pace the *Suivan* of Chapter 1, "the sirens of poststructuralist critical theory" (p. 272), Ganz, heeding

the Sullivan of Chapter 2, returns resolutely to context and its abundant diversity. Echoing Nees on multivalent symbols and Noble on ideological cross-currents, Ganz asserts the lack of homogeneity in a Carolingian culture that was in fact many cultures. He argues for, and perhaps exaggerates a little, a lack of group-consciousness among scholars contrasting strikingly with what emerged in the twelfth century. He focuses unerringly on tensions between "the values of monks and the aristocratic world they often left" (p. 261). Other tensions emerge when Ganz recalls German historiography of the 1930's which, for all its Nazi taint, highlighted something often missing from more recent anodyne portrayals: Karl Hampe pitted Charlemagne, "the original-German layman," against "the ecclesiastical-classical educational ideal" (cited by Ganz, p. 267). To acknowledge these contradictory elements in Carolingian culture is not necessarily to diminish it. Jacques Le Goff's question from a twelfth-century perspective (in *Les intellectuels au moyen âge*, 1969, English translation 1974, uncited by anyone in Sullivan's team) was unsympathetic but undeniably shrewd: "can you have a Renaissance that hoarded instead of sowing?" Ganz's own fleeting comparison with the twelfth century hints at other reservations. If only he had said what "specific needs Carolingian education was conceived to meet" (p. 270) or what activities he thinks "can properly be annexed to the realm of cultural history" (p. 273). A teacher who gets scarcely a look-in in this book was Dhuoda: she was part of a civilizing process at the heart of Carolingian learning, which itself presupposed much sowing. Ganz's reminder (and it is not gentle) that education was a form of power is *à propos*. Perhaps, after all, Carolingianists need a stiff dose of Foucault and (a seminal thinker who fails to make Sullivan's list) Gramsci. Did "Carolingian education," as Ganz claims (p. 275), "control the institutions and values of the Frankish Empire"? If so, who controlled Carolingian education? The Frankish elite, heterogeneous as it was, faced no simple task in asserting hegemony. Ganz, like Sullivan in Chapter 2, is alert to echoes of striving and struggle. "Gentle voices" can be deceptive. Alcuin and the rest wished theirs to be voices of command. This book, intermittently amplifying the masters' voices, leaves no doubt that the teachers were heard.

Janet L. Nelson

King's College London

Medieval Christian Perceptions of Islam: A Book of Essays. Edited by John Victor Tolan. [Garland's Medieval Casebooks, Vol. 10; Garland Reference Library of the Humanities, Vol. 1768.] (New York: Garland Publishing, Inc. 1996. Pp. xxi, 414. \$60.00.)

In his introduction, John V Tolan tells us that "the authors of these essays provide a series of vignettes, of discrete examples of medieval perceptions of Islam." His characterization is well put, since the volume is largely composed of descriptive essays, most dealing with lesser-known sources. The result is quite

useful and will find a place in many libraries. Since some of the texts are of eastern origin and all deal with theological, historical, and literary materials, the range of the fifteen essays is broad both in geographical and chronological terms. In the first essay, John Lamoreaux discusses early eastern responses to the expansion of Islam. This is followed by David Bundy on Syriac and Armenian sources concerning the conversion of the Mongols to Islam and Craig Hanson's discussion of Manuel I Comnenus's theological intervention regarding the Muslim view of the deity. Kenneth B. Wolf updates his earlier work on the Cordobán martyrs, and Thomas Burman provides an interesting discussion of Trinitarian theological issues aimed at Islamic views on Divine unity, as found in the *Taht al-wāhdaniyah*. In the section on theological responses in the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries, David Burr and Philip Krey contribute interesting discussions of Franciscan writings on Islam that reveal the nuances in their works. Rather surprisingly, John Lomax's essay on Frederick II and the Saracens is included here. The section on Islam in Western vernacular literature leads off with a very interesting article on Jacob van Maerlant by Geert Claassens, followed by essays on Andrea da Barberino's *Guerrino Meschino* by Gloria Aulair and on *Sire John Mandeville* by Frank Grady. The concluding part, dealing with the sixteenth century, is also varied. John Geary writes about Arredondo's *Castillo inexpugnabile de la fee*; Rhona Zaid discusses Ginés Pérez de Hita's *Guerras Civiles de Granada*, and Palmira Brummett treats of western—largely Venetian—efforts to understand Shah Ismail Safavi.

Given the variety in these works, detailed discussion is difficult, but some points need to be made. In general, specialists in literature tend to ignore historical work and rely on interpretations drawn from their own fields. The result can be interesting in terms of insights, but also results in a degree of superficiality, especially in dealing with clearly historical issues. Given the controversial nature of this field, there is need for greater co-operation. Perhaps this volume will be helpful. Certainly, there are some fine historical essays, including the work of Kenneth Wolf and David Burr, already well known to specialists. William Hyland's edition of the "*Miraculum noviter factum*" makes a fine contribution to conversion literature with its Christological imagery and the unresolved questions regarding its origin. Claassen's excellent article on Jacob van Maerlant raises numerous fascinating questions as does the discussion by Rhona Zaid of Ginés Pérez de Hita. Unfortunately, her explanations tend to rely more on her own reading of the material than on an understanding of the historical context. Two essays raise difficult issues. Craig Hanson does not, in my view, provide a sufficient explanation of Manuel's attempt to eliminate *anathema no. 22*, directed against the God of Mohammed. His main point, while interesting, ignores other aspects of the controversy. John Lomax's essay on Frederick II and the Saracens needs further work. It suffers from a misunderstanding of the texts. For example, he attributes to Gregory IX views expressed in "*Ubique [sic] nobis impietates*," which were clearly part of the complaint made by the monks of San Lorenzo and compounds the problem by mistranslating the text. His entire line of argument is based on a series of assumptions

that ignore the shifting character of papal-imperial relations in this period. Finally, this volume would have profited from additional study of such recent works, omitted from the bibliography, as Michael Koehler's *Allianzen und Vorträge zwischen frankischen und islamischen Herrschern* (Berlin, 1991), with its superb insights into both western and Islamic sources. On the whole, however, the editor and contributors have made a worthwhile contribution to an important but often vexed field of study.

James M. Powell

Syracuse University

Remembering Kings Past: Monastic Foundation Legends in Medieval Southern France. By Amy G. Remensnyder. (Ithaca, New York: Cornell University Press, 1995. Pp. xv, 355. \$49.95.)

Monks of the eleventh and twelfth centuries imaginatively recreated their past to serve the needs of the present, writing accounts of events that they were fairly certain were true, or wished were true, or at least which supported the current needs of their monasteries. Amy Remensnyder here examines such imaginative recreation specifically through the foundation legends created by the black monks of some forty houses located in the southwest quadrant of France. Though concentrating especially on written accounts (these sources are discussed in depth in the appendix), she also treats the portrayal of such legends in the sculptural programs on the fronts of monastery churches (as at Conques and Perse), and suggests how the very decoration of the manuscripts in which these legends were written helped convey the dignity of glorious, generally royal foundations.

Remensnyder's work is highly original, thoroughly researched, and convincingly presented. Like Patrick Geary's recent *Phantoms of Remembrance* (Princeton, 1994), a book which also treats the ways in which medieval writers reshaped their past, though using very different sources and analytic framework, Remensnyder's *Remembering Kings Past* draws much of its strength from her unwillingness to treat "authentic" and "forgery" as meaningful categories. Even "authentic" accounts of foundations necessarily record as momentary a series of events that often had stretched over years, by the time that land was obtained, a group of monks assembled, relics acquired, and a new church consecrated. (Thus one should not be surprised to find a long-dead donor as a signatory in an authentic foundation charter if he or she had given some of the original land or privileges, even though the charter was drawn up only years later.) And to dismiss forgeries as worthless because not factually accurate, as this book makes clear, would be to miss the fascinating questions of how the monks would have liked to see their past, and the events that impelled them to depict a past that should have existed.

Remensnyder's argument unfolds gradually and carefully. After exploring the question of real versus legendary in Part One, she turns in Part Two to the founders that southern French monks chose, often in defiance of chronology, to have first established their houses. Perhaps surprisingly in a period in which kings were distant and shadowy figures, the monks of the period between about 1000 and 1200 chose by preference to attribute their foundations to Clovis, to Pippin the Short, and to Charlemagne. Clovis represented a link between Roman and Frankish rule; Pippin the Short could subsume any authentic deeds of Kings Pippin I and II of Aquitaine into a much more glorious context; and Charlemagne was, by the late eleventh century, linked expressly with the epic king of the *chansons de geste*. Some monasteries, by positing a series of barbarian invasions and refoundations, were able to have all three kings memorialized as their founders. These kings were often given connections to relics of Christ, such as pieces of the True Cross or the richly developed accounts of the Holy Foreskin, which connected Frankish monarchs with the King of Kings.

In Part Three Remensnyder turns to the context that inspired monks to recreate their origins, the starting points that defined their monasteries. She argues that foundation legends were used especially as weapons in conflicts, not in general with lay aristocrats or local bishops, as might be expected, but rather with other monasteries. From the eleventh century onward, she suggests, as monasticism became more hierarchically organized, monks often struggled to maintain their identity in the face of incorporation, often unwilling, into a monastic order. A foundation legend that defined their separate existence, supported by the might of a glorious king (or in some cases a glorious if equally legendary pope), was a useful tool in that struggle. Only in the thirteenth century, when (with the Albigensian Crusade) the Capetian kings of France began to appear in the south, did royal figures have to be dealt with in the present, rather than being past creators and defenders of liberty.

Constance B. Bouchard

University of Akron

Christendom and Its Discontents: Exclusion, Persecution, and Rebellion, 1000-1500. Edited by Scott L. Waugh and Peter D. Diehl. (New York: Cambridge University Press. 1996. Pp. vii, 376. \$59.95.)

This collection provides an excellent sampling of current study of the tensions and controversies from the eleventh century onward between the reviving secular and ecclesiastical rulers of Europe, on the one hand, and minorities and movements of dissent, on the other. The authors and editors dialogue intelligently with each other, and, taken as a whole, the book, and presumably the 1991 UCLA conference which was its origin, display careful organization. Unfortunately, the introduction, apparently in ignorance of a large body of criticism,

accepts the late John Boswell's assertion that the treatment of "homosexuality" (an anachronistic term) shifted (p. 4) "from tolerance to aggressive hostility during this period" (it is the idea of an earlier tolerance which causes the greatest problems).

Part I contains six articles on "Heterodoxy, dissemination, and repression." In the first R. I. Moore applies to the Gregorian reform views he has long been developing, seeing in consolidation of seigneurial authority, Uterate clerical culture, and new communities resulting from the revival of the economy, three factors central to the growth and suppression of heresy. An excellent contribution is marred by the occasional cheap shot (see pp. 23-24) and too single-minded concentration on power categories. Two fine case studies follow, the first, by Peter D. Diehl, describing how reluctance to prosecute heresy -was overcome in thirteenth-century Italy; and the second, by James Given, examining the inquisition in medieval Languedoc in order to understand how the drive for conformity accommodated itself to local power structures. Mary A. Rouse and Richard H. Rouse, using Durand of Huesca as an example, trace the dissemination of sermon models from the schools to preachers. Always, as Clifford R. Backman shows (but one could wish for more precision in some of the claims made) in the case of Arnau de Vauanova, pragmatic considerations influenced ecclesiastical judgments. On all sides, as Anne Hudson explains for the Lollards in a clear but not particularly theological alert exposition, preaching was a prime tool for dissemination of ideas, and indeed the spread of preaching and of heresy were intimately connected.

In the first of three essays on "Women's religious aspirations," Anne L. Clark uses Elisabeth and Ekbert of Schönau to explore the relation, sometimes opportunistic on both sides, between women's aspirations and ecclesiastical hierarchy. Clark is not very sophisticated, theologically and otherwise, and uses poorly informed writers such as R. Howard Bloch for her discussion of medieval misogyny, herself thinking in rather one-dimensional feminist power categories, though at the end seeing some of the limitations of the category "misogyny" itself. In a brief tale well told, E. Ann Matter examines the asymmetrical but interdependent relations between a patron, Ercole d'Esté, and a mystic, Lucia Brocadel da Narni. Then Katherine Gill, in a brilliant piece on organized women's religious communities in the fourteenth through sixteenth centuries, shows how women negotiated the spiritual environment they desired.

The first of four essays on non-Christian minorities, by Carlo Ginzburg on the conversion of Minorcan Jews during the fifteenth century, probes an early instance of violence between Jews and Christians and the ways in which modern historians, specifically Peter Brown, have sometimes downplayed tension between groups. Like Gavin I. Langmuir in the following part, Robert Chazan shows that developments in Christian theology could have unanticipated effects on minorities: renewed emphasis on Christ's humanity and suffering helped stereotype the Jews as his murderers. Chazan additionally shows how the rapid changes in twelfth-century society with their accompanying anxieties worked

to the disadvantage of Jews. He intelligently disagrees with some of the other authors of the volume, especially Moore, arguing against (p. 224 n. 11) "the interchangeability of persecuted outgroups." For the late thirteenth-century western Mediterranean, David Abulafia analyzes the interconnected causes of oppression of Muslims and Jews. Olivia Remie Constable shows that one area in which the three faiths could co-operate was in slaving on the Spanish frontier. This tracked shifts in power: in the eighth century most slave buyers were Muslim or Jewish, in the thirteenth, Christian.

The final part of the book contains three articles rethinking boundaries. The exposition of Christian doctrine in the first, by Langmuir studying the origins of persecution of Jews in Christian theological development, is far from accurate. Both book and otherwise very suggestive article have considerable analysis in which anxieties and doubts express themselves in aggressiveness: one might be forgiven for thinking this as much a psychological reading of a contemporary history department as of medieval Christendom. The second and third essays, Richard Kieckhefer on saints, witches, and necromancers, and Edward Peters on exegesis, examine the question of what intellectual exploration of Christianity was possible, and how boundaries were set. Kieckhefer evokes the clerical underworld of holy necromancy, and Peters gives a well-informed account of the struggle over the definition of the boundaries of tradition in high medieval theology.

Glenn W Olsen

The University of Utah

Church and Society in Byzantium under the Comneni, 1081-1261. By Michael Angold. (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1995. Pp. xvi, 604. \$89.95.)

This massive work of over 600 pages is an ambitious overview of the inner history and development of the Greek-speaking Orthodox Church during a crucial century and a half in the Middle Ages: the period begins with the accession of the great emperor Alexius I Comnenus (1081) and closes with the recapture of Constantinople from the Latins in 1261. The title "Church and Society" indicates the parameters of the study: the Church is constantly viewed in relation to the civil society in which it flourished. Thus relations with the Emperor, with the government and leading families, and with the bulk of the population are recurring themes. Indeed the vital question that surfaces throughout the book is that of the Emperor's role in the Church, and students of the Anglican establishment will find much to ponder in this sustained attempt by the Byzantine Emperors to "harness the authority of the Church" by adopting the role of epistemonarches ("overseeing [supreme?] ruler"). Of particular interest are the studies of the writings of several key bishops, the survey of monasticism during this period, an original attempt to assess the influence of canon law on marriage

and the role of women, and investigations of the manifestations of popular piety with their pagan overtones and of heretical movements, in particular of Bogomilism.

The methodology is synthetic, solidly based on the primary sources, often effectively summarized, and supported by a thorough and conscientious weighing-up of secondary sources. The book is an excellent introduction to a very wide variety of topics and writers, presented with objectivity, sensitive appraisal, and admirable clarity. Despite the wide sweep and complex narrative the overall theme remains dominant and rises in intensity and interest as the work proceeds. The author is helped partly by the great work of his predecessors (especially the French Assumptionists like Paul Gautier and Jean Darrouzès), partly by his British contemporaries (outstanding works developing in greater depth some of the topics treated here have appeared recently from the pens of Paul Magdalino and Rosemary Morris).

The writer is primarily a historian, and theologians should not expect a speculative analytic approach. He also suffers from a blind spot as far as liturgy is concerned. Occasionally one may question certain assumptions, e.g., the downplaying of the role of clerics in education, or the importance given to some sources, like Neophytos of Cyprus. Certain themes cry out to be investigated further, such as the work of Balsamon, who surely deserves a book to himself. Again, some patterns are read into a series of events which are not self-evident, as when the Church is cast in a somewhat sinister power role in relation to baptism and marriage. But the overall judgment cannot be in doubt: the author has confirmed his mastery in the field of Byzantine studies, and this volume is to be welcomed as a great work.

Joseph A. Muniuz

Campion Hall, Oxford

The Boundaries of Charity: Cistercian Culture and Ecclesiastical Reform, 1098-1180. By Martha G. Newman. [Figuræ: Reading Medieval Culture.] (Stanford: Stanford University Press. 1996. Pp. xx, 388. \$49.50.)

The Cistercian Order in the twelfth century has often seemed paradoxical: an order whose leaders preached retreat from the world at the same time as they became involved in many of the major political and ecclesiastical events of the period, an order based on radical poverty whose houses became very wealthy. Scholars once spoke of a conflict between "ideal" and "reality," in the assumption that within its first two or three generations members of the Order, faced with pressing political and economic realities, were forced to abandon their earlier ideals. Within the last ten years or so, however, it has come to be understood that this approach both creates an artificial "ideal" which in many ways owes more to twentieth-century concepts of withdrawal and poverty than to twelfth-

century concepts, and necessitates postulating "decadence" in a period, the second half of the twelfth century, when Cistercian prestige was in fact at its highest.

Martha Newman, building on this earlier work, carries it further by incorporating for the first time Cistercian theology into a discussion of the monks' political and economic activities. Her central, eminently convincing argument is that the ways that the monks interacted with the world around them can best be understood as the product of the monasteries' internal culture. This culture, she points out, was created in a constant dialogue with the cultures of the secular aristocracy and of the developing schools, because new Cistercian converts came to the cloister not as boys but as young knights or scholars. Thus Newman suggests that Cistercian culture should be seen not as a complete rejection of the physical world but rather as an attempt to redeem and reform that world. Just as theological discourses on the Song of Solomon by men like Bernard of Clairvaux used the language of physical love to describe the love between God and His people, so the Cistercians used the unity created both between monks within a house and between the individual houses of the Order to serve as a model for what the world might strive to be.

The primary element of this Cistercian culture, according to Newman, was *caritas*, the love (or "charity" of the title) that tied together monks, different houses, and indeed the whole Christian people. The first half of the book discusses the creation of this distinctive culture, based both on an analysis of Cistercian sermons and treatises and on a survey of how the Order spread and recruited its monks. In the second half, Newman addresses the issue of how this culture functioned during the first three generations of Cistercian history. (Oddly she never fully explains why she stops at 1180, although the cover blurb suggests that the rise of bureaucracies and legalism may have outcompeted Christian charity as a way of structuring society.) For the Cistercians love was not bounded by the monastery walls but included all of humanity, and hence Cistercian involvement in ecclesiastical reform, heresy and politics outside the cloister should not be seen as a falling away from ideals but rather the fulfillment of the responsibilities imposed by those ideals.

The book is clearly written and thoroughly researched (though it is irritating to have the notes at the end), being based on the archival as well as printed sources from all of the major Cistercian monasteries in the Burgundy-Champagne region, the Order's heartland. It should be read not only by those working on the Cistercians but by anyone interested in the relationship of church and society and the nature of ecclesiastical reform in the twelfth century.

Constance B. Bouchard

University of Akron

Cross Cultural Convergence in the Crusader Period: Essays Presented to Aryeh Grabois on his Sixty-Fifth Birthday. Edited by Michael Goodich, Sophia Menache and Sylvia Schein. (New York: Peter Lang. 1995. Pp. xxvii, 334. \$69.95.)

Cross Cultural Convergences in the Crusader Period brings together sixteen papers by Israeli, British, French, and Italian scholars on a miscellany of subjects related mainly, but not exclusively—H. E. J. Cowdrey's study, "Peter, Monk of Molesme and Prior of Juüy" throws new light upon early Cistercian history—to crusading and to intercultural contacts. Apart from the obvious predominance of these two themes, however, the volume lacks thematic unity and the reader will be hard-pressed to know where to start. This notable deficiency is underscored further by the absence of an introduction and index, by the peculiar arrangement of the papers alphabetically according to the names of the authors, and by the appallingly uneven standards of editing. To derive the best of this book, the reader must determine his/her own agenda.

A good start can be made with the papers devoted to aspects of crusading and the Military Orders. These include studies by Elizabeth A. R. Brown ("A Sixteenth-Century Defense of Saint Louis' Crusades: Etienne le Blanc and the Legacy of Louis IX"), Jean Richard ("Le siège de Damas dans l'histoire et dans la légende"), Sophia Menache ("Rewriting the History of the Templars according to Matthew Paris"), Joshua Prawer ("The Venetians in Crusader Acre"), and Sylvia Schein ("The Miracula of the Hospital of St. John and the Carmelite EUantic Tradition—Two Medieval Myths of Foundation?"). Of crucial importance, however, are the studies by David Abulafia ("Trade and Crusade, 1050-1250") and Jonathan RÜey-Smith ("Early Crusaders to the East and the Costs of Crusading, 1095-1130") of economic aspects of crusading. Addressing the problem of the causal relationship between trade and crusade, Abulafia argues convincingly that the crusades did not revolutionize European trading patterns in the eastern Mediterranean, as many have supposed, but "marked only a further stage in the existing process of commercial expansion" (p. 1). For RÜey-Smith, economic issues are tied closely to the problem of crusaders' motivation. Using the evidence of monastic and cathedral cartularies, he demonstrates that the widely-held perceptions of crusading as a colonizing enterprise and an opportunity for personal enrichment are untenable. Crusading was not merely expensive; it often brought financial ruin to a crusader's family. Whatever motives prompted men to take the cross, they were not, as RÜey-Smith's evidence clearly shows, informed by expectations of personal gain.

The second theme, intercultural contacts, offers a similarly broad range of studies. Papers by Franco Cardini ("Note per una preistoria deU'esotismo nella Firenze medievale"), Yvonne Friedman ("Women in Captivity and their Ransom during the Crusader Period"), Michael Goodich ("A Chapter in the History of the Christian Theology of Miracle: Engelbert of Admont's (ca. 1250-1331) *Expositio super Psalmum and De miraculis Christi*"), Jeannine Horowitz ("Quand les Champenois parlaient le Grec: La Morée franque au XIII^e siècle, un

bouillon de culture"), Elena Lourie ("Cultic Dancing and Courtly Love: Jews and Popular Culture in Fourteenth Century Aragon and Valencia"), Avrom Saltman ("Barcelona Cathedral MS 64 and the Hebraica Veritas"), Joseph Shatzmeyer ("Jewish Converts to Christianity in Medieval Europe 1200-1500"), and Kenneth R. Stow ("By Land or Sea The Passage of the Kalonymides to the Rhineland in the Tenth Century") treat such diverse topics as the impact of Islam upon Florentine culture, the experiences of female prisoners of war in Palestine, anti-Jewish elements in Catholic theology and exegesis, the Hebraicization of the Champenois settlers in the Péloponnèse, the trans-Alpine route followed by Jewish travelers, and the deeply ambiguous relations between Catholic Christians and Jews throughout Europe.

What is striking is the readiness with which Catholic Europeans frequently embraced the imaginative and creative elements and impulses of foreign cultures, assimilating and reshaping them to produce a rich cultural hybrid. Cardini, for instance, points out that in Florence, where diverse aspects of Islamic culture were absorbed into Florentine arts and literature, the result was nothing less startling than the development of "una nuova cultura" (p. 58). In the crusader Principality of Achaia and the Morea, where Catholic Champenois exercised lordship over the indigenous Greeks, the consequences, mutatis mutandis, were not entirely dissimilar. Horowitz, who has made a close study of the linguistic evidence, points out that in the course of the thirteenth and fourteenth centuries, the Champenois were gradually Hebraicized through a process of "osmose interculturelle" (p. 135). What evolved from this, she observes, was "une entité tout-à-fait originale ... un amalgame complexe, plus absolument français, pas vraiment grec, mais certainement 'Moréote'" (p. 122).

Such apparently fruitful coexistence and intercultural borrowings did not, however, tend to characterize the contacts between Catholic Christians and Jews. True, Jews and Christians did occasionally meet on common ground and in an atmosphere of mutual sympathy and interest, as Shatzmeyer and Lourie demonstrate. An astonishing number of Jews underwent conversion voluntarily; Christians and Jews are discovered joining hands in Christian ring-dancing, and the amorous yearnings of young Jewish men, the *filocapti*, were shaped evidently by the ideals of Christian romantic literature. But however empathetic these contacts may have been, the burden of the evidence still points to an enduring mutual antagonism.

Whatever its defects in production, *Cross Cultural Convergences* is essential and indeed timely reading for those interested in intercultural and interreligious relations. Medieval peoples were not uncompromisingly xenophobic; at the same time, however, they set very real limits to intercultural assimilation. And, it was these limits, and the cultural integrity which they preserved, that gave rise to the ambiguities, tensions, and overt hostilities which are depicted so effectively in the studies presented here.

Penny J. Cole

University of Toronto

Possessing the Land: Aragon's Expansion into Islam's Ebro Frontier under Alfonso the Battler, 1104-1134. By Clay Stalls. [The Medieval Mediterranean: Peoples, Economies and Cultures, 400-1453, Volume 7.] (Leiden: E.J. Brill, 1995. Pp. xv, 337. \$115.50.)

The conquest of the great Muslim taifa of Zaragoza by the tiny Christian kingdom of Aragón in 1118 was a spectacular event and one destined to have enduring significance for the development of medieval and early modern Iberia. It has been, moreover, an event whose history has been neglected on the whole. The reign of Alfonso I of Aragón has not been the subject of an adequate history. While a collection of his documents has been recently (1990) published, this latter cannot be styled a fully critical edition, and a more general framework for one has not been established by a fundamental study of the chancery practices of the early kingdom of Aragón. This book, then, is a hopeful sign that its subject is beginning to attract the attention it merits.

In six chapters Stalls furnishes first a sketch of Alfonso's conquest of that taifa, then a treatment in turn of his role in the administration of that conquest, of the role of the new Christian nobility there, of that of new Christian settlers of humbler status, of the place of the post-conquest Christian church, and finally of the continuing significance of the conquered Muslim population. The very importance of this material makes it doubly the pity that the work will be so difficult to use.

Since the book builds so strongly on individuals cited in the documents it is regrettable that so few of the former appear in the inadequate, four-and-a-half-page index. Moreover, the particular focus of the study, that makes it so valuable, also enhances the need for a strong context of related studies and this is most imperfectly supplied. Works such as Defourneaux on the French in medieval Spain and Ledesma Rubio on *Cartas de población* that are cited in the footnotes fail to appear in the bibliography. Other works that one expects to see, Luis Rubio, *Documentos del Pilar* or Dufourcq and Gautier-Dalché on Iberian economic and social history appear in neither. The combined effect is unsettling.

The author makes important points about important subjects. This area of Aragón, along with Murcia and Valencia, was one in which a Muslim population remained numerous and relatively prosperous right up until the expulsion. Stalls details that fact and the way in which it affected both the possibilities of Christian settlement and the legal and economic forms that governed the relations of the conquered and conquerors. He also points up the limited character of both royal and noble authority and effectiveness during at least the early years of the reconquest. His views will and should attract attention and argument.

Nevertheless, the book suffers from a too limited initiative on the part of its author. While retaining the particular focus on the lands of the middle Ebro, he should have cast his net wider at least for purposes of comparison. As it is, he

asks his readers to depend excessively on his research which is clearly limited in both intensity and scope. But sometimes he is clearly wrong. For example, Bishop Miguel of Tarazona was not French but Aragonese, and Bishop Pedro of Librana may well not have been Bearnese despite Lacarra's assertions to that effect (p. 225). Bishop Miguel was, in fact, the brother of the Aragonese noble Fortún Aznárez. Moreover, Fortun did not disappear as lord of Tarazona after 1126 (p. 126) but was tenant in 1132 and was so as late as 1149. These may be particulars, but they do bear on one major argument of Stalls regarding the extent, and indirectly the motivation, of Alfonso Fs employment of French nobles and churchmen in his new conquest.

Again a wider frame of reference might have deterred the author from too hastily accepting the ability of any Aragonese noble to field a force of three hundred knights (p. 139). Such a force required royal resources as even his own footnotes suggest. Or again, it is perhaps unwise to depend too much on a copy of a charter of confirmation by Affonso VII in 1134 to establish the privileges of the barons and infanzons of the middle Ebro (p. 276). The diplomatic of that document is strange by Leonese standards, and its language and orthography strongly suggest the thirteenth rather than the twelfth century.

In brief, this book will be useful, but it is seriously flawed, and caution is indicated. It is a pity that it was rushed into publication without further work. The basic conception has great promise.

Bernard E Reilly

VUlanova University

Sämtliche Werke: lateinisch/deutsch, VI. By Bernhard von Clairvaux. Edited by Gerhard B. Winkler. (Innsbruck: TyroUa-Verlag. 1995. Pp. 711. 980 öS; 138,-DM.)

Bernard's sermons 39 to 86 on the Song of Songs are translated into German in this hefty volume. The German is faced by the Latin, reproduced photomechanically from volume 2 of the critical edition by Jean Leclercq et al. (*Sancti Bernardi opera* [Rome: Editiones Cistercienses, 1958]). The errors in that edition, remarkably few in number and usually obvious typos, are listed and corrected on pages 697-699 of this volume.

The translators, Hildegard Brem and Kassian Lauterer (both Austrian Cistercians), are to be commended for the accuracy and clarity of their work. Their accomplishment is enhanced by the remarkable fashion in which they have captured the spirit of Bernard's lofty and complex style.

That style is discussed in some detail in Professor Winkler's introduction (pp. 31-43). He sees Bernard employing the various classical stylistic levels in a manner appropriate to the content of the sermons: "elevated" style (*stilus sublimis*) for his doctrinal statements, "artistic" (*stilus subtilis*) more often for his moral

teachings, "usual" or "customary" (*stilus moderatus*) when conveying an apparently realistic description of everyday monastic life. In the last, Winkler observes, Bernard is seen as a close observer of human nature as well as employing an art of characterization worthy of an epic poet.

Winkler comes down convincingly on the side of those who see all these sermons as Bernard's own, despite the stylistic anomalies present in the last two (85-86), which have led some to see these as from the hands of Bernard's secretaries. I agree with Winkler. But I disagree when Winkler describes Bernard's *Weltanschauung* as "Neo-Platonic-Augustinian." Bernard is surely Augustinian in his theology of grace, but his anthropology is poles apart from Augustine's. There is no hint of Neo-Platonism in Bernard's epistemology or metaphysics.

On page 37, Winkler declares: "It is widely known that Bernard was not a theologian who thought or wrote in a systematic manner." One who has read Bernard's treatises *De gratia et libero arbitrio* or *De diligendo Deo* might well disagree. Even in the case of the Song sermons, Winkler himself discovers a pattern (pp. 39-41). The first series of sermons (1-38), he says, concerns "dogmatic" theology, the second (39-86) "moral" theology. I suspect Winkler is as uncomfortable as I with this categorization, since he acknowledges (on p. 41) that the distinction had not developed until the twelfth century. With Winkler's characterization of the second group of sermons, those contained in this volume, as "ecclesiological," I am much more comfortable. Bernard's profound vision of the Church is surely a fundamental component of his spiritual teaching and, as Winkler says, "the literary form through which he describes the spiritual life" (p. 41).

The index to this volume (pp. 700-711) is reasonably good, though far from complete. I prefer that found on pp. 219-228 in the fourth volume of the English translation of the Song sermons issued by Cistercian Publications (Kalamazoo, Michigan, 1980).

The notes to the German translation are perhaps the most useful section of the volume for those who do not need a translation or would prefer the English. Although these notes are extensive (pp. 656-696), profound, and thorough, they seem to betray an unfortunate ignorance of the extensive scholarship on Bernard done on the western side of the Atlantic.

John R. Sommerfeldt

The University of Dallas

The New Knighthood: A History of the Order of the Temple. By Malcolm Barber. (New York: Cambridge University Press. 1994. Pp. xxii, 441; 14 figures, 17 plates. \$69.95.)

There has long been a need for an up-to-date and reliable history of the Order of the Temple in English. Malcolm Barber has now supplied that desideratum with *The New Knighthood*, a lucid account of the Order from its modest beginnings in the Holy Land around 1119 to its dramatic dissolution by papal decree in 1312.

Although the loss of the main archive (probably during the Ottoman conquest of Cyprus in 1571) hampers discussion of the growth of the Order in the East, Barber argues for a more vigorous expansion of the nascent Temple than is suggested by William of Tyre's oft-quoted account of its foundation. Greater early success renders explicable not only the recognition accorded to the Templars at the Council of Troyes in 1129, but also the evidence from about the same time for the first of the grants of European lands that would rapidly transform the Temple into a great international order. Yet, some churchmen harbored reservations about the warrior monks. Bernard of Clairvaux hailed them as "the new knighthood," but it was not until the Templars received a succession of papal privileges between 1139 and 1145 that doubts about the validity of their profession were effectively silenced.

By the mid-twelfth century, the Templars had assumed a vital role in the military affairs of the Latin East. They were known amongst Christians and Muslims alike for their bravery and devotion to the defense of the crusader principalities, and already held strategically important fortresses and territories. As the military situation deteriorated in the late twelfth and thirteenth centuries, rulers granted even more extensive possessions to the Order. Barber treats these matters in detail, and shows that as the Temple acquired greater lands and independence in the East it became more frequently embroiled in disputes with the rival Order of the Hospital and with secular rulers. The Templars may have believed that they were simply protecting their legitimate interests, but outside observers often interpreted these disputes as unedifying displays of pride and avarice.

Barber does not attempt a thoroughgoing treatment of the Order in the West, but surveys its possessions and outlines their organization and management in order to explain their crucial importance to Templar enterprises in Syria and Palestine. The majority of Templars spent their entire lives in the West, but the whole machinery of the Order was geared to the support of its presence in the East. Only by drawing upon the rich resources furnished by the European estates, could the Order sustain its ongoing warfare against the Muslims. The need to transfer revenues from the western lands stimulated the development of the Temple's financial institutions, and crusaders, secular rulers, and the papacy soon availed themselves of the Order's services and expertise.

With the loss of the last Christian strongholds on the Levantine coast in 1291, the Templars were, in the eyes of many, deprived of their *raison d'être*. Although they strove to continue their military operations from Cyprus, they could no longer invoke their defense of the Holy Land to deflect criticism. In such circumstances, they were ill-equipped to defend themselves against the charges of heresy and moral corruption brought against them by Philip IV of France in 1307. Barber—whose *The Trial of the Templars* (Cambridge, 1978) remains the definitive study on the suppression of the Order—provides a concise analysis of the proceedings against the Order and its abolition, and concludes the book with a chapter on the literary and "pseudo-historical" legacy of the Temple.

The *New Knighthood* is a welcome contribution to the scholarly literature on the Temple, and will long remain an essential work for anyone interested in the Order.

William G Zajac

University of Wales Swansea

Templars, Hospitallers and Teutonic Knights: Images of the Military Orders, 1128-1291. By Helen Nicholson. (New York: Leicester University Press. Distributed in the United States and Canada by St. Martin's Press, New York. 1995. Pp. xvi, 207. \$59.00 clothbound; \$24.95 paperback.)

The author begins by clearly stating her objectives and then sets out to accomplish them in a straightforward manner. The book is, as its title claims, a study of the images which the military religious orders evoked in the twelfth and thirteenth centuries, that is, how they were viewed by various segments of society. After a general introduction, which sets forth the methodology and the types of sources employed, a brief chapter presents a chronological framework for studying contemporary attitudes toward the military orders. The book is concerned with the three major orders, Templars, Hospitallers, and Teutonic Knights, in Western Europe; Spain is excluded since it has already been studied in detail. A chapter deals with the attitudes of Christian rulers toward the orders, another with those of the clergy, and then those of various classes of the laity, as well as those of non-Christians. A chapter treats of the representation of the orders in literary sources such as chronicle, epic, romance, and legend. Then the author considers the self-image of the orders, what they thought of themselves and the image they sought to present. There is a brief chapter on the impact of the orders in the loss of Acre in 1291. Among other things, the conclusion notes—to nobody's surprise—that there was some praise for the orders and some criticism; the criticism grew stronger as time went on, especially after 1250. This is followed by the notes, an extensive bibliography, and an index.

This book originated as a doctoral dissertation at Leicester, in 1989, and has not divested itself of the characteristics of that genre. Although it seems, judging from the notes and the bibliography, that a great deal of research has gone into this volume, it has not been well digested and presented. The writing is repetitive and at times does not make much sense. The author's enthusiasm for the subject is very impressive, but her accuracy less so. One example can lead to a general conclusion, and the sources, including secondary literature, do not always accord with what she reports of them. There is an exceptionally high usage of such words as "probably," "likely," "apparently," and "perhaps." It is not clear that the author always understands the nature of the sources. On pages 58-60, for example, she compares five medieval cartularies with Delavie Le Roulx's *Cartulaire général de l'ordre des Hospitaliers* without seeming to realize that the latter is not a medieval work but a modern compilation of selected documents. All told, while this book contains a great deal of information on an interesting topic, it is an excellent example of why dissertations should not immediately be turned into published books.

George T. Dennis, SJ.

The Catholic University of America

The Medieval Church in Scotland. By Ian B. Cowan. Edited by James Kirk. (Edinburgh: Scottish Academic Press. 1995. Pp. xv, 254.25.00)

Co-ordinated scholarship has achieved a renaissance of Scottish historical studies: combined efforts have blossomed and fructified; fresh light has been shed on many chapters of Scotland's story and restimulated interest into her cultural past.

Obviously, an institution as fundamental as the medieval Church was near the heart of the enterprise. Everything about her was not always transparent, but neither was the record totally opaque. This reassessment of facts with a view to narrating them dispassionately and lucidly, with truthful rigor and objectivity, even at the cost of abandoning long-defended partisan positions, has amicably engaged academics of both the Calvinistic and Roman Catholic traditions.

Eminent among them was Professor Ian B. Cowan of Glasgow University, whose premature death has removed an acclaimed leader from the field of ecclesiastical history. We are deprived of a qualified, talented professional, boundless in energy and enthusiasm, endowed, above all else, with an endearing personality. It is so regrettable that his life was cut short, when his extensive investigation and acquired knowledge of primary sources, his accumulated expertise, might have burgeoned into something authoritative, original, and unsurpassable in quality.

In tribute to his memory, it was deemed appropriate to reprint a selection of Ian's contributions to various periodicals, all treating of topics united by a common theme, with the added advantage of providing a single index to diversely

dispersed texts. Hence the volume *The Medieval Church in Scotland*, skillfully edited by James Kirk, consisting of twelve essays in which Professor Cowan had concerned his exploration of the institutional evolution of the Church from the twelfth to the fifteenth century. There is also a Foreword from the pen of Professor Gordon Donaldson, friend and mentor of Ian Cowan, and a "Bibliography of his Works," contributed by Peter W Asplin, which in itself offers an eloquent testimonial to his prowess as a scholar.

This selection offers the reader grass-roots material concerning certain key features of the organization and structure of the Scottish Church throughout the Middle Ages. Separate essays treat the development of the parochial system (*Scottish Historical Review*, XL, 43-45); the appropriation of parish churches (*An Historical Atlas of Scotland*, c.400-c. 1600, pp. 37-38); the emergence of the urban parish (*The Scottish Medieval Town*, pp. 82-98); vicarages and the cure of souls (*Records of Scottish Church History Society*, XVI, 111-127); the religious and the cure of souls (*Records of the Scottish Church History Society*, XIV, 215-230); the organization of secular cathedral chapters (*Records of the Scottish Church Society*, XI, 19-47); the Church in the Diocese of Aberdeen (*Northern Scotland*, I, 19-48); the Church in Argyll and the Isles (*Records of the Scottish Church History Society*, XX, 15-29); the Church in the Highlands (*The Middle Ages in the Highlands*, pp. 91-100); the monastic history of the diocese of St Andrews (*Medieval Art and Architecture in the Diocese of St Andrews*, pp. 7-15); Church and Society in the Fifteenth Century (*Scottish Society in the Fifteenth Century*, pp. 112-135); and lastly, patronage, provision, and reservation, in other words, pre-Reformation appointment to benefices (*The Renaissance and Reformation in Scotland: Essays in Honour of Gordon Donaldson*, pp. 75-92).

It was no easy task to select from a bibliography of 163 titles (of which half are reviews of works by others) the essays linked by a common theme, but the result is this eminent volume which will be treasured by generations of scholars.

Charles Burns

Archivito Segreto Vaticano

Gilbert of Sempringham and the Gilbertine Order, c. 1130-c. 1300. By Brian Golding. (New York: Clarendon Press, Oxford University Press. 1995. Pp. xvi, 508. \$95.00.)

The Gilbertine Order has finally received the extensive study it deserves with Golding's exhaustive work. Within the last decade, several scholars have treated this English order for nuns, lay sisters, lay brothers, and canons from its mid-twelfth-century origins through the canonization of its founder, Gilbert of Sempringham, in 1202. Using this literature and the primary sources, Golding offers his own interpretation of the order's early years. In addition, he provides what

has been lacking in the recent studies: a history of the order that extends to the beginning of the fourteenth century and a discussion of each of the twenty-seven Gubertine foundations. Golding's book will become the standard reference work on the Gilbertines.

In Part One, Golding treats St. Gubert, the Gubertine Rule, and Iue in the Gubertine communities. Since Gilbert's Vita and the Gilbertine Rule are the most extensive surviving documents for the order, they have already received significant attention from other scholars. But after re-examining the evidence, Golding proposes new interpretations, some of which are debatable. For instance, he decides that the first seven women who in 1131 accepted enclosure at Sempringham under Gilbert's supervision had more in common with anchoresses than with nuns. While Golding is right to emphasize that many monasteries for women begun in England at that time had eremitic origins, Golding's decision to call these women anchoresses is questionable.

Golding also reconsiders crucial developments that occurred after Gubert's 1147 visit to Cîteaux. When Gilbert was unsuccessful in his attempt to persuade the Cistercians to assume responsibility for the nuns, lay sisters, and lay brothers he had established at Sempringham and Haverholme, he decided to add canons to his communities and devise his unique system of "double monasteries." Although Golding's theories about the reasons for Gubert's decisions are plausible, too little documentation survives to prove Golding's hypotheses over those of the other scholars he critiques. Particularly helpful, however, is Golding's survey of the pre-existing monasteries for women and men that could have influenced Gilbert's design for his order. Golding, like scholars before him, can only surmise about life in the communities on the basis of economic charters and the Gilbertine Rule, but he masterfully combines the piecemeal evidence into an informative narrative.

In Parts Two and Three, Golding provides the most detailed account yet of the Gubertine foundations: nine double monasteries, four houses for canons only, and four eleemosynary foundations established by 1189; four other foundations made between 1189 and 1300; and six foundations that failed to survive. Golding analyzes the status of the founders and benefactors, changing "patterns of endowment," and the resources available for each community. His discussion of Gubertine utilization of the churches they received as gifts vividly illustrates the actual consequences of the twelfth-century transfer of spiritual possessions from lay to religious owners. Particularly impressive is Golding's ability to use fragmentary accounts of rents, wool production, water mills, and fishponds to give a rich depiction of the Gubertines' resources.

Golding's detailed analysis of the documentary evidence and the work of other scholars will give readers unfamiliar with this controversial religious order for women and men a thorough introduction to the complex issues surrounding its development. Scholars already familiar with the debates should find Golding's revisionist views about the order's origins tenable, if not always completely per-

suasive. By including so much historiography in the text, Golding's own version of the early history of the Gubertines can at times be difficult to follow. But the reader who perseveres will gain a thorough knowledge of the Gubertine's origins, development, internal organization, economic system, and social context.

Sharon K. Elkins

Wellesley College and Pope John XXIII National Seminary

The Restoration of the Monastery of Saint Martin of Tournai. By Herman of Tournai. Translated with an Introduction and Notes by Lynn H. Nelson. [Medieval Texts in Translation.] (Washington, D.C.:The Catholic University of America Press. 1996. Pp. xxix, 248. \$34.95 clothbound; \$ 19.95 paperback.)

Herman of Tournai was a mediocre historian, but Lynn Nelson is a very good translator and commentator. Herman composed the *Liber de restauratione sancti Martini Tornacensis* about 1142. Herman's text is confusing: there are many people with the same name, the narrative doubles back on itself, and Herman had an apparently irresistible desire to write about the politics and marriages of the great, all of which interrupted the flow of the narrative about the restoration of Saint Martin's. In spite of such problems of composition, Herman recounted the troubled history which followed the refounding of an abandoned monastery in Tournai. Herman reported that during a famine in 1090, the cathedral canons expelled from the cathedral precincts starving refugees, who took refuge at the ruined monastery. Nelson argues convincingly that the canons' act of cruelty set in motion eighteen years of ecclesiastical, clan, and urban struggle until the monks and canons were reconciled in 1108.

The foundation or "refoundation" of a monastic house in an urban setting was, at least in this case, disruptive because it threatened the economic interests and religious domination of the cathedral chapter. The monks of Saint Martin's demanded the return of properties which they claimed had been "lost" centuries earlier and which they believed were in the possession of the cathedral chapter. Different branches of the dominant kin group, whom Nelson calls the Osmonds, became embroiled in the bitter and violent quarrel between the cathedral chapter and the monastery, which after some hesitation had adopted the Cluniac way of life. By paying careful attention to genealogy, Nelson demonstrated that the Osmonds divided into political alliances centered on the monastery and the cathedral chapter respectively. Chicanery and violence, often carried out among relatively close kin, marked the long-running quarrel. Nelson's analysis is a sober corrective to overly rosy views of the cohesiveness of medieval kin groups.

The translation is clear and idiomatic, with much interesting detail about religious, social, and political life in Tournai and its environs in the late eleventh and early twelfth centuries. The translation is complemented by abundant, useful notes and by six appendices which help the reader understand important top-

ics embedded in the text. Nelson is especially good at showing that the seemingly ecclesiastical quarrel was in fact a complex socio-political struggle among kinsmen and their supporters in a small city. A teacher could use this well-translated and richly annotated book for many purposes in an undergraduate class. My only reservation is that in the extensive notes, the translator is occasionally very judgmental about the moral behavior of these long-dead people.

Joseph H. Lynch

The Ohio State University

Religion and Devotion in Europe, c. 1215-c. 1515- By R. N. Swanson. [Cambridge Medieval Textbooks.] (New York: Cambridge University Press. 1995. Pp. xv, 377. \$69.95 clothbound; \$18.95 paperback.)

This volume presents a general survey of Latin Christianity from the Fourth Lateran Council to the eve of the Reformation. Aimed at a general audience of undergraduates and scholarly non-specialists, it eschews all but essential footnotes and documentation. Yet by condensing the disparate themes of late medieval Christianity into a compact and orderly synthesis, it also offers specialists many useful reminders of how particular issues and movements reflected the underlying dynamics of the era.

As the title suggests, the book focuses less on institutional Christianity than on the ways people understood and lived their religion. However, the Church as "the body of the faithful" still plays the dominant role in Swanson's approach: for him the crucial dialectic involved "the reactions of the widely defined Church to the demands and dictates of Christianity" (p. 7), especially as they affected spiritual life. As the desire for more satisfying and reassuring forms of devotion increased among the laity, old practices were transformed and new ones arose to challenge clerical control over the Church as a whole. Thus for the clergy the major problem was how to satisfy, limit, and direct the upsurge of lay spirituality which threatened to escape the immediate influence and control. Ultimately the need for supervision and control meant that tension between the prescriptive religion of the clergy and the increasingly individualized "religiosity" of the laity dominated the spiritual life of the era.

The book's organization correspondingly moves from the "dictates of Christianity" to the devotional needs of the laity. Two chapters consider the content of the Christian faith and its dissemination to the faithful. Three more survey the structures of religious life, the rituals of devotion, and the concerns of charity and salvation. Another two address the issues of lay piety and the need for clerical control, and it is here that Swanson returns to the idea that late medieval Christianity was not imposed from above, but "created from the bottom upwards" (p. 90). In his view, many of the religious innovations of the era were the result of lay invention, and the clergy struggled to keep up and control the proliferation of popular devotions. As a result, distinguishing between orthodoxy

and heresy became more critical than ever, and the need for exclusion led to the creation of scapegoats.

The final chapter sums up the state of Western Christianity circa 1515, and in Swanson's judgment the situation was far from bleak. Considered in its own terms rather than anachronistically, late medieval religion was a vibrant and dynamic form of Christianity, which, despite many problems, responded in many ways to the needs of the people. Doubt and skepticism existed, but had little overall impact. There was a hope for some major reform, but no general sense of crisis. The Reformation was probably unforeseeable, and medieval Christianity was neither decadent nor on the verge of collapse. However, once the Fifth Lateran Council (1512-1517) failed to accommodate reformist pressures, more strident voices seized the initiative and put an end to the development of the medieval Church.

Scholars will certainly find much to consider and change in this assessment of late medieval religion. Nevertheless, the author has produced a masterful survey of a large and difficult field which deserves the attention of everyone concerned with these issues.

Steven D. Sargent

Union College

Laienfrömmigkeit im späten Mittelalter: Formen, Funktionen, politisch-soziale Zusammenhänge. Edited by Klaus Schreiner with the aid of Elisabeth Müllner-Lückner. [Schriften des Historischen Kollegs, Kolonien, 20.] (Munich: R. Oldenbourg Verlag, 1992. Pp. xii, 411. DM 108,-)

This volume contains sixteen essays written for a colloquium organized by Dr. Klaus Schreiner in Munich in 1988 on the topic of "lay piety in the social and political context of the late Middle Ages."

Dr. Schreiner opens the book with a long conceptual introduction which rejects the tendency of recent scholarship to frame the study of medieval religion within the categories of "elite" and "popular" piety. He argues that this dualistic approach, which contrasts the religion of the literate clerical elite with that of the illiterate laity, is not flexible enough to account for the diverse forms of religious expression found in the primary sources. He finds the German term *Volksfrömmigkeit* (folk piety) particularly objectionable, since it is "burdened with the conceptual and political prejudices of the previous half century" (p. 7) and thus represents a poor equivalent for the notion of "popular religion." Moreover, because the concept of *Volk* refers not to a social class, but most of society, it is useless for establishing connections between particular social groups and then religious outlooks. To reinforce this argument, Schreiner presents evidence documenting how literate, non-elite laymen developed their

own religious culture in the later Middle Ages. He concludes the essay by urging historians to reject the category of *Volksfrömmigkeit* in favor of the less problematic and more flexible concept of *Laienfrömmigkeit* (lay piety).

The other fifteen essays address various aspects of lay piety and are grouped into seven sections. The first contains two essays on legal and dynastic influences on lay piety. Based on an analysis of the connection between devotion and spiritual patronage, Wolfgang Brückner argues that in medieval and early modern Europe devotion meant not only emotional commitment, but also concrete, legal submission to a spiritual overload. Then Elisabeth Kovács describes the efforts of the early Habsburg rulers to represent the dynasty as a *stirps regia et beata* which included saints such as the Babenberger Margrave Leopold III (d. 1136), who was canonized in 1485.

The next section offers three essays on the piety of the peasantry and nobility. Francis Rapp characterizes the pilgrimage practices of the Alsatian peasantry by examining thirty-four late-medieval saints' shrines in the Bishopric of Strassburg, especially their patrons, geographical and social appeal, finances, and reputations for wonder-working. Adalbert Mischlewski describes the rise and fall of the late medieval cult of St. Anthony in both its plebian and noble forms, including the curious custom of donating pigs (*Antoniussschweine*) to the Antonine Hospitallers. Franz Machilek surveys the piety of the Franconian nobility, especially the religious foundations they established, the spiritual patrons and pilgrimage sites they favored, and the confraternities they joined.

Two essays on the influence of the *Devotio Moderna* on lay piety constitute another section. Anton G. Weiser discusses lay participation in the *Devotio Moderna* in Zwolle, stressing that the movement both affected society and helped produce a new kind of Christian self-consciousness among its followers. Heinrich Rütting describes the piety of the lay brothers of the Windesheim Congregation, concluding that, although their lives chiefly embodied the values of obedience and service, they also took the initiative in promoting distinctive forms of devotion within their ranks.

The question of laymen as the audience for religious writings provides the focus of the next section. Georg Steer examines the paradigm for lay Christianity presented in the vernacular *Rechtssumme* of the fourteenth-century Dominican preacher Brother Berthold, contrasting it with Meister Eckhart's mystical approach to spirituality. Volker Honemann compares the conceptual treatment of lay literacy in two fifteenth-century treatises: the "*de libris teutonice usus*" of Gerard Zerbold van Zutphen and the "*Laienregel*" of Dietrich Engelhus. Petty Bange surveys vernacular (middle Dutch) expositions of the Ten Commandments, concluding that, although composed by clerics, such works reveal much about the realities of everyday life in late medieval society.

Two essays on visual aspects of popular piety form another section. Konrad Hoffmann analyzes the images of death in Hans Holbein's "*Die Bilder des Todes*" (Lyons, 1538), and "*Alphabet mit Todesbildern*," along with those on a dagger

sheath Holbein designed, and interprets them within the context of Erasmian humanism and the Reformation. Richard Trexler examines lay piety in the New World, specifically the custom of holding conversations with cult effigies practiced by the indigenous peoples of Central and South America, which the Spaniards called "speaking with the Devil."

Another pair of essays discuss the political and social dimensions of public piety. Miri Rubin elucidates the meaning and symbolic value of late medieval Corpus Christi processions, warning against purely functionalist and narrowly political approaches to these public rituals. Peter Ochsenbein investigates the "Great Prayer of the [Swiss] Confederates," a long vernacular liturgy of the early sixteenth century, which the clergy and common people of rural Switzerland recited to ward off evil and reaffirm their political and social identity.

The book's final section consists of one long essay by Heinrich Dormeier on the religious controversy over the morality of fleeing the plague. Through a careful analysis of letters, treatises, and sermons by humanists, clerics, and reformers in Italy and Germany, Dormeier reveals the spectrum of opinions on this question and shows how the issue of brotherly love gradually became the main focal point of the discussion by 1600.

Steven D. Sargent

Union College

Patrons and Defenders: The Saints in the Italian City-states. By Diana Webb. [International Library of Historical Studies, Volume 4.] (London and New York: I. B. Tauris Publishers. Distributed by St. Martin's Press, New York. 1996. Pp. vii, 343. \$55.00.)

Medieval and early modern Italy's burgeoning cult of saints has stimulated numerous recent studies written from social, religious, feminist, and urbanistic perspectives. Here, Diana Webb returns to politics to examine the role of patron and other saints' cults in the development of Italian civic culture in a manner reminiscent of but much ampler than H. C. Peyer's *Stadt und Stadtpatron*. Disavowing any claims to provide a study of the "interior state of religious devotion," she reminds readers that "the line between public and private devotions was, however, indistinct" (p. 26), and addresses "how the urban community, considered primarily as a political entity ruled by laymen, came to employ the saints for its own purposes" (p. 6)—notably in the consolidation, articulation, and legitimation of public power. Drawing on a wealth of saints' lives, miracle collections, chronicles, and especially urban statutes and account books from dozens of northern Italian and particularly Tuscan cities from the fourth to the fifteenth century, she illustrates two essential developments; first, the transition in the twelfth century from ecclesiastical toward lay control of saints' cults, and

then, from the thirteenth century onwards, the manner in which cities embraced additional cults to develop elaborate urban "pantheons."

A brisk series of case studies illustrates how bishops from Ambrose onwards promoted cults of patron saints to bolster their own authority, and how church reformers such as Peter Damián in turn appealed to local cults to generate lay support for their own programs. But the political attraction of saintly power lay precisely in its capacity to encompass broader urban communities and their countryside. Webb teases out of her reticent sources evidence that over the twelfth century formerly passive audiences of the *fidelis populus* were transforming themselves into active communities of elite urban cities whose officials were increasingly assertive in the invention and translation of saintly relics that enhanced the authority of their emerging communal governments.

Growing civic control of patronal cults comes fully into view in the compilations of statutes that began to be produced in the thirteenth century. Without presuming an identity between legal precept and religious belief and practice, Webb rightly underscores the statutes' ideological value as "affirmations of the values to which the rulers of urban society professed to subscribe on behalf of their subjects" (p. 95). Her richest chapters illustrate the patterns, motives, and modalities whereby civic governments expanded their calendars of publicly observed saints' days and elaborated their regulation of the rituals, oblations, and festivities by which they were observed. By 1200 most cities had either appropriated the cult of their bishop-patron, embraced a less-encumbered figure like Florence's Baptist or, as at Bologna, elevated a non-Petrine patron free of papal associations. The thirteenth-century spread of the mendicant orders and the campaign against heresy, factional and inter-city struggles between Guelphs and Ghibellines, the rise of signori and new oligarchies in the early fourteenth century, and the expansion of territorial states later on all provided occasions for the commemoration of saints associated with parties or victories. But when oblations to the saints of victors were required in submission to power, those of the vanquished were often embraced too as further sources of legitimacy and stabilizing continuity. The addition of games, races, and commercialism to many *fieste* may have given them an increasingly secular aspect, but Webb detects by the fifteenth century an increasing sensitivity to distinctions between their sacred and profane aspects. The proliferation of local cults may also account for the expanding popularity by the late fourteenth century of universal devotions like those of the Virgin and Corpus Christi.

Her commitment to respecting local variations requires that Webb present much of her supporting material in "snapshots." Her final three chapters, devoted to an in-depth study of the Siennese cult of the Virgin, therefore, provide welcome middle-ground analysis. The story of Siena's adoption of the cult on the eve of the Battle of Monteperti in 1260 is a handle for reviewing Siennese devotions to the Virgin in the thirteenth century, and the literary development of the Monteperti legend in the fifteenth. Siennese account books allow her to follow in detail the fourteenth-century elaboration of Siena's "pantheon," and oc-

casional efforts to curtail it. The mid-fifteenth-century campaigns for the canonizations of Catherine and Bernardino enhanced civic pride without abating the Virgin's popularity.

Webb's decision not to discuss the vast literatures on Catherine and Bernardino is circumspect, and echoes choices taken for earlier periods. She draws fruitfully on the insights of Peter Brown, Patrick Geary, and Miri Rubin on saints' cults and rituals, and on the contributions of Chiara Frugoni, Alba Maria OrseUi, Richard Trexler, and André Vauchez on the Italian context. The resulting panorama she offers is broad, richly detailed, and surveyed with wit and acuity. It is an important reminder that in Italy the Church's eleventh-century reclamation of its sacrality was accompanied by new lay claims on spiritual power as well, and that strategies to control and manipulate legitimating sacred power were central to the construction of the Renaissance state.

David S. Peterson

Newberry Library

L'Église et le droit dans le Midi (XIIP-XIV siècles). [Cahiers de Fanjeaux No. 29. Collection d'histoire religieuse du Languedoc aux XIIP et XIVe siècles.] (Toulouse: Editions Privat. 1994. Pp. 448. 165 F paperback.)

This volume is a collection of papers presented at a colloquy held in 1993, the twenty-ninth in a series treating the religious history of the Midi. It is organized under three headings: canonists and their works; the birth and growth of canon law in the Midi; and the implementation of canon law.

Henri Gules has compiled a very useful biographical listing of over fifty professors at the University of Toulouse in the fourteenth century. He has also traced the teaching careers of a number of Benedictine abbots. García y García investigated five libraries which hold the most important juridical sources of the medieval period. In addition to unearthing several manuscripts previously unknown, he has called attention to some Spanish adaptations of Meridionale canonical works as well as Spanish texts inspired by them. Henri Vidal surveyed thirteen councils held in the Narbonne-Albi region during the thirteenth and fourteenth centuries. The 489 canons adopted, though very juridical in character, are not concerned with political events or with theology, much less with Scripture and custom; rather they borrow from previous ecumenical and provincial councils. The canons dealing with Jews are a case in point. Jacques Paul's paper on the clerk's register of the Carcassonne inquisition for the years 1249-1258 proposes a procedure against heretics quite different from that known from the register of Jacques Fournier or the sentences of Bernard Gui. Instead of preventive detention, the judges would release the accused on bail guaranteed by the fidejussors. The individual was obliged under oath to submit

beforehand to the future penance. His condition was thereby changed from that of a guilty party to that of a penitent.

Canon law, as outlined by Jacques Verger, began to be taught in the universities of the Midi (Toulouse, Montpellier, Avignon) during the course of the thirteenth century. By the fourteenth it was the discipline that attracted the most students, even if Roman law was more prestigious. The statutes provide a detailed knowledge of the program of studies: the curricula, the teaching methods, and the examinations. The main text was the Decretals of Gregory IX.

In all, there are fourteen essays by thirteen contributors, mostly university professors from the south of France.

John E. Lynch

The Catholic University of America

Processus Bernardi Delitiosi: The Trial of Fr. Bernard Délicieux, 3 September-December 1319- By Alan Friedlander. [Transactions of the American Philosophical Society, Vol. 86, Pt. 1.] (Philadelphia: American Philosophical Society. 1996. Pp. xn, 393. \$30.00.)

Prominent in modern accounts of late Languedocian Catharism are the activities of two wandering Cathar perfects, Guillaume Pages and Bernard Costa, attested in depositions which now survive in a seventeenth-century copy, MS Paris BN Doat 26. In 1319 a Franciscan expressed skepticism about the truth of these depositions and the real existence of the two perfects: in his way, attempting what Robert Lerner achieved on a broader scale in his 'Heresy of the Free Spirit' (1973), where a sect which had been prominent until then in histories of heresy was demonstrated to be a fabrication based on leading questions, torture, and confessing personalities. The Franciscan was Bernard Délicieux, and he was giving witness during a trial in which he faced four charges: (1) impeding the inquisition, (2) plotting an insurrection against the king of France, (3) plotting the death of the Dominican Pope Benedict XI, and (4) supporting the Spiritual Franciscans. The documents of this trial have now been carefully edited by Alan Friedlander, who has also supplied an historical introduction, an appendix of biographical notes on persons mentioned in the trial, and a glossary providing modern identifications of Latin place-names. Testimony to Friedlander's useful edition is that it immediately suggests the need for further publications. First of all, Friedlander introduces what is at the front of the stage in this edition, the proceedings, the texts, and the outlines of Délicieux's life; he has no room to do more. For one intelligible context of Délicieux's attack on Dominican inquisitors, earlier southern French Franciscan and Dominican hostility; for a setting of Délicieux within the context of his order; for an account of Délicieux's curial friends; for the strange lapse of fifteen years between the (alleged) commission of charges 1-3 and the trial: for these the

reader must still turn to earlier accounts of Délicieux, such as Yves Dossat's in *Cahiers de Fanjeaux*, 10 (1975). For further consideration of Arnold of Vulanova, to whom Délicieux was alleged to have supplied substances with which to murder Pope Benedict XI, the reader must turn to those who have studied Arnold as a physician (Michael McVaugh) or Arnold as Spiritual Franciscan sympathizer (Robert Lerner). Clearly the time is now ripe for a major monograph on Délicieux, preferably written by Friedlander. Secondly, there is the theme which opens this review. Languedocian depositions have long been relatively exempt from the brush which has tarred northern-European trials. "Tared"? Think only of the mad inquisitors Conrad of Marburg and Robert Le Bougre, the tortured Templars, and Lerner's Free Spirit suspects. Now, the Languedocian depositions may contain much story-telling and mendacity, as Natalie Davis pointed out in her *Annales* review of Montaillou. But those who read these southern depositions are impressed by their circumstantiality, lack of heavy leading questions, and deponents' relative freedom, even discursiveness, when replying. So, the standard historians, from Jean Guiraud to Jean Duvernoy and the late Msgr. Eugène Griffe, have contentedly got on with the job of using these depositions to reconstruct Languedocian Catharism, and exploiting them to produce pictures of quite remarkable quotidian detail and color. Perhaps they should not be so confident. Often these depositions pose a subtler problem than the northern ones. Deponents respond without extraordinary pressure and with a fair degree of truth, but respond within a framework of questions which reflects a churchmen's view of what constitutes a sect; a deposition may therefore be true, but untrue in that it only confirms one angle on "reality." Délicieux's calling into question the very existence of two Cathar perfects, and the "heretics" they performed in the years of their alleged activities (c. 1260-1283), shows that southern depositions can on occasion also pose the crudest problem—and also indicates further complexity. For Friedlander points out that one Paris BN manuscript, Doat 32, contains depositions in an enquiry in 1330, which investigated the reliability of precisely the registers in which these two perfects appeared. Since it is the famous inquisitor Jacques Fournier, one of Délicieux's careful judges in 1319, who in 1330 is taking seriously the doubt and unreliability of material in Doat 26, his capacity thus to question earlier inquisition suggests we should have a very high estimate of his capacity as an inquisitor when attempting to discern the truth—or to discern 'truth' from his angle. So, finally, Friedlander's edition puts into brilliant high light the need for a fresh and overall look at Languedocian inquisitors and their techniques, the depositions, the 1330 inquiry (which needs editing), and the questions all these raise about the discerning of "truth."

Peter Biller

University of York

Nicolaus Minorita: *Chronica. Documentation on Pope John XXII, Michael of Cesena and the Poverty of Christ with Summaries in English. A Source Book.* Edited by Gedeon Gal, O.E.M., and David Flood, O.F.M. (St. Bonaventure, New York: Franciscan Institute Publications, 1996. Pp. 300, 1238. \$68.00.)

In 1317 leaders of the Franciscan order finally received papal help in suppressing the spiritual Franciscans. John XXII ordered rebellious spirituals to stop arguing and obey their superiors. Those who refused were referred to the inquisitors, and some of those who continued their defiance were burned at the stake the following year. That hardly settled the problem, since a number of those who had purportedly submitted soon left their houses and continued their defiance as fugitives; but John's action marked an important stage in the process, since it changed the remaining spirituals from dissidents into heretics.

Unfortunately, in 1321 those same Franciscan leaders found themselves in an uncomfortably similar situation. A difference of opinion between a Dominican inquisitor and one of his expert advisors, a Franciscan, allowed the pope to launch an investigation into the question of whether Christ and his apostles were absolutely without possessions, individually or in common. The result was a 1323 papal bull that decided they were not. It had been preceded by a 1322 bull proclaiming that the Franciscan order and not the papacy owned the material goods used by the friars. Both announcements reversed what Franciscans had long seen as cornerstones of their observance. Leaders of the order protested, at first politely and then less so. In 1328 Michael of Cesena, the same minister general who had presided over the suppression of the spirituals, escaped from the papal court at Avignon and began a long Franciscan government in exile under the protection of John XXII's arch-enemy the Emperor Ludwig of Bavaria. The handful of friars who joined him in *The Great Escape* included William of Ockham. They would spend the rest of their lives firing polemical salvos at John XXIII but exile would remain the lot.

The whole affair is extremely well-documented, thanks in part to a brother named Nicolaus, a follower of Michael of Cesena, who collected and copied many of the pertinent texts. The resultant chronicle offers a source book for those interested in following the battle. It is edited here by two of the best textual scholars working today and is an invaluable research tool for those interested in Franciscan and papal history. For those who do not feel up to reading the gigantic Latin text (370 folios in the Paris manuscript), David Flood furnishes English-language summaries at the beginning of each chapter. There will probably be a great many people who never get beyond Flood's summaries. The argument was an extremely tedious one. Anyone who spends much time with the chronicle will appreciate why such a potentially interesting controversy has received so little attention from modern scholars.

Flood also provides an introductory chapter summarizing the history of the Franciscan poverty dispute from its beginnings until 1321, the only genuinely

problematic part of the book for this reviewer. Flood argues—as he did in earlier works like *Francis of Assisi and the Franciscan Movement* (1989)—that the Franciscan movement was born as a socio-economic alternative to the nascent capitalism of Assisi. The implications of this perspective become apparent when he considers ideals like poverty and the imitation of Christ, elements most scholars imagine were basic to Francis' project. In Flood's view, they entered the picture more or less as tactical maneuvers countering Assisi's attempt to marginalize the movement that challenged and judged its values. "Franciscan poverty then, began as a defensive maneuver to deal with Assisi's ostracism." Or in the case of imitating Christ,

Instead of quietly and humbly accepting their lot, the brothers outmaneuvered Assisi. (As in economics, so now with society, they were breaking the monopoly of those in power to define what is real.) . . . They swept the imputation of insignificance aside by drawing Jesus into the excluded group.

Flood presents the late thirteenth-century spiritual leader Petrus Iohannis OUVi as a major hero of the movement; yet—despite Flood's impressive record of scholarship on OUVi—his description of the latter's difficulties with the order seems remarkably generic. He devotes some space to OUVi's argument for poverty in the eighth of the Questions on Evangelical Perfection and implies that an explanation of OUVi's troubles can be found there; yet question eight does not directly address the issue of *usus pauper* as a part of the vow, and that is the issue that divided OUVi from his confreres. Flood makes no effort to examine question nine or the Treatise on *Usus Pauper*, both of which deal explicitly with the *usus pauper* controversy and offer a better sense of what OUVi at least thought the argument was about.

In every other respect, however, the achievement is a major one. Scholars should be grateful to these two scholars for editing a massive work like Nicholas' chronicle and to the Franciscan Institute for daring to publish it despite the current tight market for scholarly works.

David Burr

Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University
Blacksburg

La Parrocchia nel Medio Evo: Economía, Scambi, Solidarietà. Edited by Agostino Paravicini Bagliani and Véronique Pasche. [Italia Sacra: Studi e documenti di storia ecclesiastica, Vol. 53] (Rome: Herder Editrice e Libreria. 1995. Pp. xxvii, 325. Lire 12.000 paperback.)

This volume presents papers from a seminar organized to broaden consideration of exchange within the parish to include spiritual as well as material transactions. The selections certainly achieve this goal, but the chronological and geographical emphases of the volume are not well indicated in its title. Most of

the contributions focus on the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries and, although published in Italy, French parishes dominate the collection.

So too do the dead. More than anything, this volume reveals the centrality of death in the economic and spiritual exchanges of the late medieval parish. Contributions illumine the roles of burial fees in the parish economy (Delmaire, pp. 27-41, and *Le Bourgeois-Viron*, pp. 42-59), of endowed commemorative Masses in the parish liturgy (Staub, pp. 231-254, and Lemaitre, pp. 255-278), of private funerary chapels in the division of space within the parish church itself (Hubert, pp. 209-227), and of funerary repasts in the sustenance of the parish's poor (Dubuis, pp. 279-303). Jacques Chiffolleau's broad, synthetic essay, "L'Économie paroissiale en Provence" (pp. 61-117), integrates these themes with the more narrowly economic concerns of earlier work. Distinguishing three "moments" (before 1260, 1260-1340, after 1340) in the history of parochial exchanges in Provence, he focuses on the middle period and its "recomposition assez complète de toute l'économie paroissiale, qui tient en grande partie aux transformations du système bénéficiai mais qui a aussi des implications et des présupposés de nature strictement religieuse" (p. 66). Chiffolleau masterfully shows how changes in the economic support of the parish, particularly the increasingly important role of commemorative prayer for the dead, affected the clergy's relationship with the laity and set the stage for the great reform movements of the sixteenth century.

Indeed, the emphasis on both late medieval sources and the relationship between spiritual and fiscal needs recommends this volume to scholars of the Protestant and Catholic Reformations. For medievalists, moreover, it offers suggestions and examples of sources we can use to study the parish. Particularly valuable in this regard is Antonio Rigon's overview of sources relating to congregations of clergy in northern Italy (pp. 3-25). Records of disputes, wills, parish registers, and necrologies (obituaires) are also highlighted by various authors in the collection. Especially intriguing is Daniela Rando's description (pp. 169-207) of a fifteenth-century episcopal register of priests admitted to the diocese of Trent. The opening pages of Rando's essay set out a highly significant research agenda exploring the proportion of foreign priests in the diocese, the movement of clergy regionally, and both the causes and results of clerical itinerancy.

In sum, this volume presents valuable research on the medieval parish. It contributes to our understanding both of the parish on the eve of the Reformation and the development of beliefs, practices, and records associated with the commemoration of the dead. Additionally, specialists in the ecclesiastical history of the regions of the Valais, Provence, Guyenne, and the Hanse, and of the dioceses of Arras, Thérouanne, Beauvais, Nuremberg, Tivoli, and Trent will want to consult the respective essays in this volume.

Maureen C. Miller

Hamilton College

Visitas pastorales de Valencia (Siglos XIV-XV). By M.'MUagros CárceI Ortí y José Vicente Boscá Codina. [Facultad de Teología San Vicente Ferrer, Series valentina, XXXVIII] (Valencia: Universitat de Valencia, Facultat de Geografia i Historia, Departament d'Història de l'Antiguitat i de la Cultura Escrita. 1996. Pp. xii, 803. Paperback.)

Pastoral visits offer a wealth of information for social historians, and this carefully prepared volume records those undertaken in Valencia from 1337 to 1427. An introductory chapter places the visits in context. Although most parishes were found to be in an acceptable state, in some there were serious problems.

During the episcopal visits both clergy and laity were interrogated; in 1383 Bishop Jaume d'Aragó asked Jaume Serra, rector of the church of Alzira, about his relationship -with the woman living under his roof, a concern which arose from the widespread problem of concubinage in the diocese. He was also asked about the fabric of the church and its chapels, and the fulfillment of obligations by priests who held benefices there, twenty-eight of whom were fined for their negligence (pp. 86-87).

In 1396 a number of deficiencies were found in the fabric of the cathedral together with a lack of devotional and processional books; Friar GU d'Elvira was said to be ignorant of the meaning of the Mass and the vicar to read very badly and be incapable of administering Holy Baptism. The same year in Liria (pp. 236-238) the rector of Sant Tomas was known as an unsatisfactory preacher and attendance at his church was poor; in Oliva (p. 128) the vicar had an impediment in his speech which rendered it unintelligible. Worse were the less frequent sins of usury, sodomy, indecency, blasphemy, gambling, inebriation, brawling, keeping undesirable company, rape, and the invocation of demons, of almost all of which the vicar of Luxent was accused. A man without modesty, guilty of gross indecency during his frequent periods of inebriation, a gambler and disturber of the peace (p. 147), he would leave his parish unattended for at least three days at a time (pp. 143-151). Other priests held multiple benefices or engaged in outside work with the resultant neglect of their parishes.

The laity were not exempt from censure either; in the church of Sant Salvador (Valencia) there was a serious problem of concubinage, even cohabitation with non-Christians (p. 235). Attendance of Conversos at Mass was irregular, and one man in Ribaroga was indicted for copying Muslim customs (p. 290). It was customary to warn or punish offenders according to the gravity of their sins, and the letters recorded the fines imposed, the instances of excommunication, and in some cases the absolution of the transgressors. Other injunctions included the placement of Na Major, an indigent parishioner, in the Morvedre poorhouse (No. 117); permission for Jews to enlarge a synagogue (No. 104); time until Saints' Day for GuiUem DezcoU to complete a retable for the altar in the chapel of Saint Mary Magdalene (No. 38); replacement of beams on the roof at Finestrat (No. 70), and repair of the bell at Xirivella (No. 74).

Accurate transcriptions and meticulous scholarly attention to detail are salient features of this work. The explanatory preliminary chapters and exhaustive indices render it an invaluable source for scholars of medieval Valencia, and one which should find a place on the shelves of all major research libraries.

Jill R. Webster

St. Michael's College
University of Toronto

Gender and Heresy: Women and Men in Lollard Communities, 1420-1530.
By Shannon McSheffrey. [Middle Ages Series.] (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press. 1995. Pp. xiii, 253. \$38.95 cloth; \$18.95 paperback.)

Shannon McSheffrey's detailed study of eight Lollard communities in southeast and south central England (1420-1530) examines the interplay of gender, social status, familial linkages, and literacy to counter the idea that medieval heretical communities were more attractive to women than was orthodox religiosity. In arguing that Lollardy was not notably attractive to or supportive of women, McSheffrey keeps an eye on comparative findings relating to early modern and modern religious groups and on recent debates regarding literacy levels and patriarchy.

The evidence is drawn from bishops' registers, court books, and wills, with a judicious use of Foxe where original records are missing. Only occasionally does this study draw support from the literature of Lollardy. The narrative analysis rests on a matrix of names of persecuted Lollards listed in the appendix, which McSheffrey has sorted by gender, relationship to other Lollards, and literacy (defined as reading in English).

McSheffrey's primary finding is that women composed a relatively small percentage of recorded Lollards (28%), that they did not assume public teaching roles, were not in leadership positions, were more likely than men to have family connections with other Lollards, and were therefore more likely to have been attracted to Lollardy for familial rather than ideological reasons. They also had far lower literacy rates than men (3% as opposed to 19%). McSheffrey details one significant exception to this picture—a group of female Lollards in Coventry who met together and looked to the leadership of one Alice Rowley, a woman of higher social status who seems to have been able, uniquely, to cross gender lines and provide leadership to the male Lollards from more modest social levels.

Despite the strengths of this study, McSheffrey's work raises questions. She argues that men controlled the movement at the public, conventicle level, and that women listened, learned, and sometimes taught only in informal, private circumstances. Considering the privy nature of conventicles, however, the distinction is problematic, and court documents, more routinized after 1428, often

use the same language for men as women (e.g., "counseling or defending heretical doctrines in privy conventicles or assemblies"). A few stronger women in the movement (Auce Harding, Hawisse Mone, Margery Baxter) are quite possibly not given the due in McSheffrey's emphasis on the private nature of their actions.

McSheffrey argues that LoUard literacy rates support assessments of a low level of literacy in late medieval England, but what low and high literacy means she does not say. In my work, which she cites as arguing for high literacy her figures and mine (an estimated 25% male literacy rate) converge nicely.

Some of her conclusions—husbands had greater influence on wives than the reverse (p. 92), neighbors were particular targets of proselytizing (p. 75), and her larger conclusion (p. 136) that women could stretch their gender roles only when their social status gave them some precedence over men—require more evidence than the sources presently allow. The evidence for women is more suggestive than conclusive (partly because, as McSheffrey notes, authorities were less interested in them); what evidence there is represents only a proportion of the actual cases, and the information provided by legal documents is often sparse. More evidence from LoUard writings might strengthen her conclusions. Her effort to close with comparative conclusions regarding orthodox devotional practices and their attractiveness to female piety needs further fleshing out. Overall, this is an intriguing but inconclusive study that provides important support to an argument offered by others studying continental heresies, viz., that medieval heresies, upon close examination, do not appear to have provided women with greater leadership roles or outlets for their religiosity than did orthodox religious practices.

Jo Ann Hoepfner Moran

Georgetown University

Early Modern European

Tradition and Authority in the Reformation. By Scott H. Hendrix. [Collected Studies Series, CS 535.] (Brookfield, Vermont: Variorum, Ashgate Publishing Co. 1996. Pp. xii, 330. \$89.95.)

Seventeen previously published articles and chapters are organized around the topics of Scripture and the Fathers, Church, Society, and Luther's Authority; fourteen of the seventeen are from the 1980's and early '90's. Most of the essays focus on two figures in the German Reformation: Martin Luther and Urbanus Rhegius (1489-1541).

"Luther Against the Background of the History of Biblical Interpretation." Protestant exegetes did not mark a clear new era in biblical interpretation.

Luther never gave up aUegory. Luther maintained a grammatical and theological approach that must be appUed to (his) "today." The contrast between Luther and the tradition is one of balance.

The study of Luther and medieval exegesis has continued the same view of Hendrix (of 1983), namely, that there is not a radical departure with Luther from medieval approaches; this holds true for areas other than exegesis as weU.

"The Authority of Scripture at Work: Luther's Exegesis of the Psalms." Seven rules indicate how Luther understood sola scriptum: learn to copy the model (trust in the strength of the Lord), dUigently inspect the text (even every word), apply the tools of interpretation (languages), relate the text to experience (palestra), pray for the inspiration of the Spirit, seek out the central core, acknowledge the inexhaustibility of Scripture.

The approach to Scripture is likened to the approach to a work of art, which, while Hendrix caUs this an "imperfect Ulustration," I would caU a distraction.

Rhegius was a Protestant preacher in Augsburg (1524-1530) and superintendent in Lüneburg (1530 to his death in 1541). In two articles ("Use of Scripture"; "Use of the Church Fathers") Hendrix tries to distance Rhegius from his nineteenth-century (Lutheran) biographer, Gerhard Uhlhorn, when it comes to what Hendrix caUs Rhegius's "ecclesiasticle" or "apostolic" principle of Scripture interpretation, which goes beyond sola scriptura to include at least the aid of the fathers. Uhlhorn says Rhegius did not practice what he preached; Hendrix says he did. Both Uhlhorn and Hendrix see appeal to Church Fathers as a deviation from sola scriptura. Hardly. Sola scriptura is not biblicism; with Luther it was a short-hand polemical phrase that needs the fuller sentence in context to be understood (Scripture alone and not the pope). Luther went beyond Scripture to articles of faith, the practice of tradition, and reason for authorities. Hendrix knows this.

In four selections Hendrix uses categories from famUy therapy (intergenerational behavioral theory known as contextual therapy). In one of his "initial attempts" ("Luther's Loyalties and the Augustinian Order"), we see "a monk and not a monk" earn entitlement by crediting his father's care (in his dedication of *De votis monasticis iudicium*, 1521, to his father Hans). When Luther transferred his loyalty from monastic vows to the ministry of the Word, he parentified Christ. The loyalty bond of faith that ties believers to Christ as to a parent deters beUevers from basing then faith on their internal power. Nurture comes from outside.

Hendrix disdains psychohistory, and rather focuses on relational developments. In his second attempt at this ("Luther's Contribution to the Disunity of the Reformation"), Luther does not emerge as a healthy theologian seen from therapeutic lenses. Luther felt deeply that he was owed more appreciation and loyalty than he received. A certain relational imbalance resulted that fueled his disdain for his opponents.

In Hendrix's later uses of family therapy, Luther emerges far more balanced and healthy, and his theology is allowed to stand on its own feet. In "Deparentifying the Fathers," one cannot help wondering if the therapist isn't trying to prove that the Reformers had a healthy ("balanced") relationship with their spiritual parents.

In "A Multilateral View of Anticlericalism," one needs a balanced picture of the two sides of the anticlerical controversy, meaning here that the Catholic clergy's side of the attack needs to be heard. The Catholic clergy suffered; their lot was hard work, no pay, and no respect. While exaggerated, the sources do show that priests were justifiably frustrated, despondent, hungry, miserable, guilt-ridden, and ashamed. The ideal of priesthood could not be fulfilled. "Why should they work harder for nothing?"

Sounding like a lecture, the necessary humor is there: priests selling beer to supplement meager income, a priest preaching against adultery when his "whore comes openly to church and my bastards sit right in front of me."

Under Church are two articles on late medieval "ecclesiology" ("In Quest of the Vera Ecclesia"; "Hus and Luther Revisited"). In these I find a theological beat or two missing. Ecclesiology in Hendrix's terms leans in the direction of the ecclesiastical (institutional), not the ecclesiological (doctrinal). What passes for ecclesiology here are issues of papacy, power, Rome, institution: The Roman structure. Perhaps the term ecclesiology is anachronistic; tracts on de ecclesia are more modern than medieval. Medieval concern for church is expressed in *Unam sanctam* concerning papal power; for Hus the concern is papal corruption. Pope, canon law, conciliarism focus on ecclesiastical matters of organization. The older definition of ecclesiology is the science of building and decorating the church; the newer is the theology of the church. I find Hendrix's ecclesiology somewhere in between these definitions.

"Luther et la Papauté." Did Luther change his views of the papacy between 1513 and 1520? No. Did Luther make contradictory statements about the authority of the Word and the papacy during 1518-19 as Remigius Bäumer maintains? No. At the end (1545) as well Luther maintained a consistent ecclesiology based on the Word of God.

"Toleration of the Jews in the German Reformation: Urbanus Rhegius and Braunschweig (1535-1540)." Rhegius's strong plea for toleration of the Jews stands in sharp contrast to the later Luther, Chemnitz, and Bucer. While he shared some of the anti-Jewish prejudice of his contemporaries, his advocacy of Rabbi Samuel (to be allowed to live and teach Hebrew in Braunschweig) and his rebuke of the anti-Jewish clergy in Braunschweig show a kinder face to the Jews than the dominant frown of Luther has allowed to appear.

A credible mix of studies from the now Professor of Church History at Gettysburg Lutheran Seminary.

Kenneth Hagen

Antifraternalism and Anticlericalism in the German Reformation: Johann Eberlin von Giinzburg and the Campaign against the Friars. By Geoffrey Dipple. [St. Andrews Studies in Reformation History.] (Brookfield, Vermont: Scolar Press, Ashgate Publishing Co. 1996. Pp. x, 244. \$74.95.)

Johann Eberlin von Giinzburg was a prolific Protestant pamphleteer, but he has received little attention in recent scholarship. In part this is due to the rather scattered, seemingly incoherent, nature of his writings. However, his work deserves attention for several reasons. In contrast with most other friars who were quite young when they left their order, Eberlin was over fifty years old when he left the Franciscan Order to join the Protestant camp. Further, the Catholic controversialist from the Franciscan Order, Thomas Murner, paid Eberlin the compliment of making his "Fifteen Confederates" a prime target of his attack on Protestant authors.

Dipple's study offers the reader a thorough review of more than a century of research on Eberlin and the German Franciscans. Prominent among the fruits of this review is the suggestion made in a German dissertation from 1902 that the usual chronology for the writing and publication of the "Fifteen Confederates" should be revised. Dipple utilizes this revised chronology in an attempt to create a more coherent understanding of the development of Eberlin's thought.

Two major themes emerge in Dipple's study. First, he focuses on the great antifraternalist attack of 1523. Having been attacked by the Provincial of the south German Franciscans, Luther intensified his own attack on monastic vows and rallied former Franciscans among his followers to add to the debate. These writings did not merely echo the humanists' critique of the friars' failure to live up to the spiritual ideals; they called these ideals into question. Secondly, in an attempt to trace a more coherent pattern in Eberlin's writings, Dipple suggests that Eberlin moved from his Franciscan milieu through a period of alliance with German humanists to an anticlerical radicalism which was then moderated by his acquaintance with Luther's teachings during his stay in Wittenberg.

Two questions emerge from this careful study. Is continuity the only model appropriate for the analysis of Eberlin's writings? Eberlin possessed a volatile personality which might account for abrupt changes in his thought. Or again, on his frequent visits in northern Switzerland, Eberlin probably encountered a Protestant tradition which gloried in the discontinuity between the darkness of the false preaching during the old age and the new light of the true gospel. Eberlin's conversion to Protestant beliefs and thought may have occurred in discontinuous bursts.

Further, Eberlin's critique of tithes and benefices receives little attention from Dipple. To be sure, Eberlin's comments on this topic are rather reserved, but the atmosphere into which he sent his writings was incendiary. Indeed, these issues lay at the heart of the peasants' cause. How do we measure the distance between Eberlin's intentions and the reception of these themes among his readers? We know that Thomas Murner in his "On the Great Lutheran Fool"

accused Eberlin of fomenting radical upheaval. The case for Eberlin's moderation might be challenged.

These questions aside, Dipple offers the reader a superb survey of historiography and a fresh and thorough review of Eberlin as well as other anticlerical authors. Our view of the turmoil of the early 1520's is enhanced and put in sharper focus by this study.

Paul L. Nyhus

Bowdoin College

The World of Rural Dissenters, 1520-1725. Edited by Margaret Spufford. (New York: Cambridge University Press. 1995. Pp. xx, 459. \$79.95.)

In *The World of Rural Dissenters* Margaret Spufford has put together a volume of material with much greater coherence than most collections of essays. Professor Spufford and a group of her former students, and other historians working in similar areas, address key issues pertaining to what one might call the sociology of religious nonconformity in rural and small-town England in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries. These questions have long puzzled historians: what was the social, economic, status, or occupational profile of pre-Reformation Lollards and later Puritans, Quakers, Baptists, and Familists; what types of communities fostered religious dissent and what does the geographical typology of dissenting communities tell us about the propagation of nonconformity; and what connections (if any) were there between the places which experienced heresy early in the period and other forms of dissent after the Restoration?

These are complex and weighty problems in their own right. In order to address them adequately, the authors need to confront other ancillary problems as well; the circulation of cheap printed material of religious and other sorts, the nature of road networks and communications in the late Tudor and Stuart periods, and surname turnover in different types of agricultural environment are just a few examples. In short, Spufford and her colleagues have brought to bear upon the problem of rural nonconformity the best of current English local historical practice. The results are stunning in their detail and provocative in their implications, and will pre-empt any tendency historians may have in future to make simple generalizations.

One badly damaged generalization is the notion that the later Lollards were predominantly humble people, alienated from the society in which they dwelt: "Lollards were not insignificant members of isolated communities. They were found at all levels of rural and county society and they were totally intergrated into that society" (p. 132). Likewise, those who were involved in later nonconformity spanned the gamut of social types in Tudor/Stuart English society; the later seventeenth-century sectarians and the Elizabethan followers of the Fam-

Uy of Love in rural Cambridgeshire emerge as neither "the meaner sort" nor a proto-bourgeoisie nor as splinter groups divorced from their parish communities. Moreover, the authors argue strongly and with a wealth of examples against the picture (sketched by, among others, Keith Thomas) of the rural poor as largely cut off—whether through poverty, illiteracy, or indifference—from the basic tenets of orthodox Christianity or its radical offshoots: "there was in the seventeenth century a kind of general familiarity, in the alehouse, the cobbler's shop, the miller's, the baker's, and many cottages, even of those exempt from taxation on grounds of poverty, with religious discussion and argument" (p. 85).

A group of parishes in the ChUtens region in southern Buckinghamshire, where there had been a large number of LoUards in the 1520's and congregations of Quakers and Baptists 130 years later, serve as a limiting test case of an area with a remarkably continuous history of religious dissent, and thus as one focus of "microscopic study" (p. 29) for the book. In some of the most detailed and painstaking of the local-history spadework (on the basis of surname longevity and genealogy traced from tax lists and parish registers), Nesta Evans demonstrates both the relative geographical immobility and the familial descent of nonconformists over the period; family, trading, and community networks as opposed to economic or social determinist explanations are all the more critical for understanding the propagation of religious dissent (a conclusion recently underscored independently by Shannon McSheffrey's work on the earlier LoUards, *Gender and Heresy: Women and Men in Lollard Communities 1420-1530* [Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1995]). There were indeed intimate connections between earlier and later dissenters, though (as Patrick Collinson points out) there is still room for debate about the nature of the connections.

In his "Critical Conclusion" to the volume Collinson draws together the strands of what must be called the "Spuffordian" conclusions and notes that they are "about so much more than rural dissenters" (p. 396). He also notes that the volume has little to say about "the first (post-Reformation) dissenters," that is, Catholics (p. 392).

L. R. Poos

The Catholic University of America

A Proper Dialogue between a Gentleman and an Husbandman. Edited by Douglas H. Parker. (Buffalo: University of Toronto Press. 1996. Pp. ix, 291. \$55.00.)

This critical edition gives us a full introduction with commentary, glossary, and variants framing fifty pages of primary texts. Two sixteenth-century poems, "An A. B. C. to the spiritualte" and a "Dialogue" between a landowner and a farmer, preface two late medieval prose tracts on the excessive wealth and power of the clergy, and the legitimacy of an English Bible.

For the Uterary scholar, the introduction draws the helpful distinction between equivocal dialogues, such as *Utopia*, and univocal ones, such as *A proper dyaloge* (1529, 1530) and *Rede Me and Be Nott Wrothe* (1528) (University of Toronto Press, 1992). Having edited both works, Parker argues plausibly from stanza-form and diction that William Roze and Jerome Barlowe, ex-Franciscan Observants, composed both verse satires.

For the historian, the introduction surveys anticlerical protests from MarsU-ius of Padua, Lorenzo VaUa, and anonymous Lollards. The notes document many historical events, such as the conflict between King John and the papacy, King Henry V's persecution of the LoUards, and the burning of WUUam Tyndale's New Testament, the first EngUsh version made from the original Greek.

The most chaUenging thesis which Parker proposes is that WUliam Tyndale edited and emended at least part of the medieval tract, *A compendious olde treatyse*. Vais, brief work was printed separately in 1530, included in *A proper dyaloge* later in 1530, and reprinted in *Foxe's Book of Martyrs* c. 1563. Margaret Deanesly (1920) and Curt F. Bühler (1938) have published a dUferent version taken directly from a medieval manuscript, which Parker gives in an appendix for the sake of comparison.

Besides rearranging much of the medieval material, the sixteenth-century version of *A compendious olde treatyse* abbreviates a series of scriptural references and omits quotations from Jerome's various biblical prologues, changes which Tyndale could have made. Parker argues, moreover, that Tyndale adds to the medieval text characteristic features: a Pauline introduction; three pungent sidenotes on Robin Hood, an upside-down tree, and Nicholas de Lyra; frequent use of "Antichrist"; the vivid phrase "ydle beUyes" (v. 1325), which I note is also found in Tyndale's *Parable of the Wicked Mammon* (Parker Society, 1848, 42:95).

But would Tyndale have defended vernacular scriptures by accepting the appeal of the medieval text to the Apocrypha *Machabees*, *Tobit*, and *Judith* (w. 1346, 1598, 1604)? Would he have left uncorrected the assertion that the Gospels were written in the language of the countries where they were preached: Matthew in Judea, Mark in Italy, Luke in Achaia, John in Asia (w. 1597-1598)? Would he not have explained that the New Testament was finaUy written in Koine Greek?

In spite of Parker's gracious reference to the forthcoming Catholic University edition of Tyndale's tracts of exegesis and polemic, we wUl not include *A compendious olde treatyse* among his *Independent Works*. Apart from a debatable Unk to Tyndale, this exemplary edition of Reformation poems and pre-Reformation tracts stands on its own merits.

Anne M. O'Donnell, S.N.D.

The Catholic University of America

The Society of Jesus in Ireland, Scotland, and England 1541-1588. "Our Way of Proceeding?" By Thomas M. McCoog, SJ. [Studies in Medieval and Reformation Thought, Volume LX.] (Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1996. Pp. xiii, 316; 7 plates.)

This highly significant book may mark the beginning of a profound shift in the way that Jesuits write the history of their order and in the way they approach the history of English Catholicism. A good bit of the credit for compelling the Jesuit historians to so modify their views must go to recent scholars of early modern English Catholic politics such as Peter Holmes and Arnold Pritchard. Like Holmes and Pritchard before him, McCoog documents in this book what all parties must finally accept as indisputable fact: that English Jesuits like Robert Parsons worked actively and tirelessly throughout the 1580's to overthrow the political and religious establishment of Elizabethan England. According to McCoog, such political activities began no later than mid-1581, or immediately after the collapse of the ill-fated 1580-81 mission that resulted in Edmund Campion's execution and Parsons' permanent exile on the Continent. McCoog contends that most of the political activity of the early 1580's, moreover, was focused on Scotland as a means of forcibly reconverting England. Parsons in particular was convinced that James VI might yet be won over to the true faith. Here McCoog is, I think, drawing upon the thesis advanced in my 1994 article on the 1580-81 debacle.¹ He agrees that this "Scottish strategy," as I called it, lay at the heart of Parsons' plans in the years preceding the Spanish Armada.

Yet McCoog is at great pains to say that the original intention of the 1580-81 mission was pastoral. He cites the instructions given to Campion and Parsons by the Jesuit General Everard Mercurian that the missionaries were to limit their actions and conversations to religious matters. It was Campion's demise that served as a political epiphany for Parsons, and it marked "a new phase in the history of English Catholics," as weU (p. 184). It also coincided with the demise of the ultra-Protestant earl of Morton and the ascendance of the Catholic duke of Lennox in Scotland, the first of James's three great "favorites." But qualification is in order, for Mercurian's instructions granted exceptions in cases of the Jesuits' "most faithful and trusted friends," and so political conversations were permitted with those of "proven faithfulness and trustworthiness" (pp. 138-139). Nonetheless, McCoog purports to have found no documentary evidence for any political scheming on the part of Parsons prior to the dramatic events of mid-1581. He need have looked no further than Parsons' own memoirs to find it, however. Parsons recalled many times in the years following the 1580-81 disaster (e.g., in his "political retrospect") that one of the primary reasons that he and Campion had gone to England was to seek a conversion of James VI as a means of restoring Catholic government and society in England. This goal is evident in Parsons' writings from the late-1570's onward. In short,

¹"English Catholicism and the Jesuit Mission of 1580-1581," *The Historical Journal* 37 (1994), 761-774.

McCoog is not as yet comfortable with the ultimate implication of his work: that Jesuits like Parsons would not and could not sacrifice religious ends to a false modesty regarding the use of political means. But McCoog's ambivalence will not minimize the startling importance of his contribution as a Jesuit historian to the history of this period. He has shattered a major taboo and has begun to bring English Jesuit historians into the mainstream of Tudor-Stuart historiography.

Michael L. Carrafiello

East Carolina University

Apologia del Beneficio di Christo e altri scritti inediti. By Marcantonio Flaminio. Edited by Dario Marcatto. [Fondazione Luigi Firpo, Centro di Studi sul Pensiero Politico, Studi e Testi 5.] (Florence: Leo S. Olschki Editore. 1996. Pp. 225. Lire 50.000 paperback.)

The early 1540's in sixteenth-century Italy have long been identified as a crucible for the religious crisis experienced by the spirituali, especially those who followed the teachings of the Spaniard, Juan de Valdés. When Valdés died in 1541, many of his disciples, including Marcantonio Flaminio, relocated from Naples to Viterbo, forming a new circle around Cardinal Pole. Thanks to the editor of this important collection, Dario Marcatto, more light has been shed on Flaminio's close connection to the Beneficio di Christo, his religious thought and spiritual devotion, his theological debt to Valdés, and his association with the spirituali at Viterbo and beyond.

The Beneficio di Christo—Flaminio's revision of Benedetto Fontanini da Mantova's original—was published in Venice twice in 1543, and quickly became one of the most popular devotional works for the spirituali. Orthodox Catholic authorities, however, soon considered its possession a litmus test for heresy. The Dominican Ambrogio Catharino Politi condemned it as heretical in 1544 in *Compendio d'errori et inganni luterani contenuti in un libretto senza nome de Tautore, intitolato "Trattato utilissimo del benefitto di Christo crucifisso."* Shortly after the publication of the *Compendio*, Flaminio began to write the *Apologia del Beneficio di Christo*, the central text in this collection. Marcatto's introduction sets out enough of the *Compendio* so that the reader understands that Flaminio does not contest each point in his *Apologia*; rather, he underscores the benefit of Christ's death as the true believer's justification. Through footnotes and parallel texts, Marcatto points the reader to similar passages in the writings of Juan de Valdés and in Flaminio's other works.

The collection contains two other works and a handful of letters. The *Meditationi et orationi formate sopra Vepistola di San Paolo a Romani*, written in 1542 and dedicated to Giulia Gonzaga, is an extended prayer and meditation on the first eight chapters of the epistle to the Romans. The *Modo che si dee tenere ne Tinsegnare et predicare il principio della religione Christiana [trattatelli]*

is a grouping of five shorter pieces, two by Valdés and three by Flaminio, on topics including Christian penitence and justification by faith. Four letters follow between Flaminio, Alvise Priuli, Pietro Carnesecchi, and GiuUa Gonzaga. Taken together, these works show the vitality of religious discussion in Italy before the official condemnation by the Council of Trent in 1547 of the doctrine of justification by faith alone.

Much of the excitement generated by this collection is due to its origin: the *Processo Carnesecchi* contained in the archives of the Roman Inquisition. That Marcatto has been allowed to examine—indeed print—these documents, raises the hope that soon these collections will be available more generally.

Michelle M. Fontaine

University of Arkansas at Little Rock

Latin American

Roma nei Caraibi: L'organizzazione delle missioni cattoliche nelle Antille e in Guyana (1635-1675). By Giovanni Pizzorusso. [Collection de l'École française de Rome, 207.] (Rome: École française de Rome. 1995. Pp. xv, 366.)

This is a scholarly work that exhibits monumental research in an area that has been largely ignored in the literature on this topic. By examining in detail Catholic missionary efforts in the smaller Caribbean islands and the coast of South America during the baroque period, Giovanni Pizzorusso has provided a service for scholars who have focused almost exclusively upon the better-known and more amply documented Mexican and Peruvian experiences. In contrast to the Iberian possessions where the missionary efforts usually did not have to resolve national differences, this book shows how the competing monarchical interests in the Caribbean made for a major difference in the organization of evangelization. Citing an English immigrant to Barbados in the first of four chapters, Pizzorusso describes the Caribbean as "A Babel of Nations." He points out that unlike the experience in Spanish America, Catholic missionaries to the Caribbean had to confront Protestantism, while simultaneously trying to assuage conflicts arising from national and linguistic differences among themselves. Moreover, they had to minister not only to the native peoples indigenous to the Caribbean but also to African slaves.

Chapters Two and Three document the disputes between Dominicans and Capuchin Franciscans (and eventually the Jesuits) over matters of ecclesiastical jurisdiction. These disputes were complicated by rivalries between the French, who had recently asserted political control of many of the islands, and the Spanish, who had established the missions earlier. In Chapter Four, the author evaluates the solution: the maintenance of a centralized control over the missions by the Vatican Congregation de Propaganda Fide that proposed creating an Apostolic Vicariate and a seminary for native clergy, like Laval in Quebec, Canada.

That solution was never applied, as King Louis XIV of France intended episcopal appointments as a mode of royal control and, like the Spanish monarch, opposed the erection of any more vicariates in the colonies. Although they were strange bedfellows with the Gallican aspirations of the French crown, the interests of the religious orders in preserving their own foundations coincided with this opinion. As a result, it was not until 1850 that an episcopal see was erected in this region.

Pizzorusso's well documented study supports the view that far from being a timid and passive agency, Propaganda was a creative and visionary force in baroque Catholicism. Overall, the author supplies a wealth of detail and ample citations to sustain his positive view of the Holy See. The drawbacks to the book, ironically, lie in its erudition. The four chapters are really more like four related but independent dissertation-type studies. No doubt European scholars are protected from the dragon of consumerism that increasingly forces academics publishing in English to write books with overly prose and the suspense of historical drama. But this book would be easier to read with a bit more dash. We also are not told enough about visionary humanist clerics like Raymond de Breton, O.P., Henri de la Borde, S.J., or Jean-Baptiste Dutertre, O.E., each of whom has contributed mightily to contemporary knowledge of the linguistic, cultural, and historical evolution of these multi-racial and multi-ethnic Caribbean societies. When all is said and done, however, this is a highly specialized work of great value and an indispensable resource for future research that needs to dispel some unfortunate stereotypes of baroque Catholicism.

Anthony M. Stevens Arroyo

Brooklyn College

Magistrates of the Sacred: Priests and Parishioners in Eighteenth Century Mexico. By William B. Taylor. (Stanford: Stanford University Press. 1996. Pp. xv, 868. \$75.00.)

Massive is the word which springs to mind in considering William B. Taylor's most recent contribution to colonial Latin American historiography. It is truly as comprehensive a work on the topic as one is likely to enjoy. The fruit of many years in the archives, it will stand as a cornerstone for future research on the eighteenth-century Mexican Church. This is the first major study of the Bourbon Church in Mexico, since Nancy Farriss wrote in 1968.

At its most basic level Taylor's work is a view of the Bourbon reforms in Mexico. This broad range of changes which occurred in the administrative structure of the Spanish overseas empire is seen through the prism of the clergy and their parishioners. It is a unique undertaking in which the scope and consequences of the changes are analyzed through one of the parts, rather than focusing on the part to draw conclusions about the whole. Taylor has chosen to analyze two different areas in an attempt to come to grips with issues of commonality. He has

focused on the large archdiocese of Mexico, which stretched from Tampico in the north to Acapulco in the south, measuring some 150 miles wide, and the diocese of Guadalajara, located in western Mexico, nearly reaching Saltillo in the north, and widening as it flowed to the southwest.

Deep within Taylor's work he seeks to understand four seeming paradoxes of late colonial Mexico (p. 4). How could the colonial system stand for nearly four centuries without a standing army, given that it was based on a relatively rigid social system with little upward mobility and much real inequality? Were parish priests of the late colonial world truly separate from the world and at the same time of the world? What then would lead some of these priests to fuel back an insurgency which could bring about the loss of their own position of privilege? Last, how did anticlericalism develop in the region when the Church was not perceived as in decline? The seeking of answers to these questions provides the reader with a deep subtext which runs through the work.

This book is divided into four large parts. The first part, consisting of three chapters, sets the stage for the study. It considers the nature of change under the Bourbon reforms, the physical geography of the two regions under consideration, and the nature of local religious traditions in the parishes. The second part takes the parish priests as its theme. In six chapters, Taylor studies the process whereby young men became priests in eighteenth-century Mexico. He looks at their career patterns, their sources of income, their outside occupations as judges and teachers, the aspects of their daily life and labors, and lastly their occasional failings. The third part changes the focus to the parishioners and the religious life of the parishes. This part has four chapters which detail the cycle of religious obligations and celebrations, the importance of saints and images of the sacred, the importance of sodalities, *cofradías*, in the life of the parish, and the array of lay workers who assisted the priest in his duties. Lastly Taylor takes the interface between the priest and parishioner and looks at the larger colonial world. This section moves through four chapters which study the interplay between local officials and disputes with the priest, leadership which emerges in the pueblos, the interactions between the priests and larger political authorities, and lastly disputes over fees charged for the administration of parochial services. These chapters lead the reader to the Conclusion, which is an analysis of the role of the parish priest in the Independence movements of Mexico.

Taylor finds in the policies of the Bourbon reformers the seeds which led to the participation of some of the parish clergy in the insurrection for Independence. Where previous studies have focused on the upper clergy, and especially their reaction to the loss of the legal privilege of the *fuero*, Taylor looks to the dynamic of the parish as the key to understanding the reaction of the lower clergy. The metaphor of the parish priest as pastor, father, and judge for his parishioners was subtly undermined by the Bourbons. While the policy of Europe largely succeeded in centralizing power in the state, in the Americas, where the sole representative of the state was often the parish priest, these re-

forms in fact eroded the legitimacy of the state. Frequently parish priests could not remain loyal to a political order which did not allow them to exercise fully what they felt were their moral responsibilities to their parishioners. While only a small fraction of parish clergy actually became active in the insurgency, the neutrality of the vast majority of the clergy proved to be far more damaging to the Spanish rule in Mexico.

In short, Taylor has written a thorough, well-researched, well-reasoned analysis of the relationship of the parish clergy to their parishioners and to the larger state in eighteenth-century Mexico. It is a study which, in spite of its large scope, reads well. The arguments and examples flow easily, carrying the reader along. It is essential reading for anyone studying the history of Mexico on the eve of Independence.

John E Schwaller

University of Montana

Church and State in Bourbon Mexico. The Diocese of Michoacán 1749-1810.

By D. A. Brading. (New York: Cambridge University Press. 1994. Pp. xiii, 300.)

Church and State in Bourbon Mexico is largely based on material which Brading collected in Mexico in the late 1970's, before embarking on the reading and "hard writing" that resulted in *The First America*. This new book, the author explains in his preface, is the concluding volume of his trilogy on Bourbon Mexico (the first two studies being *Miners and Merchants in Bourbon Mexico* and *Haciendas and Ranchos in the Mexican Bajío*). But *Church and State* is in fact a different kind of study. It is a collection of essays on various aspects of church life in the Diocese of Michoacán during the last half-century of Bourbon rule, which includes much new material, and some which has been published previously (in Chapter 12, for example, on the last bishop of Michoacán, Manuel Abad y Queipo, Brading returns to themes which he covered in *The First America*, and indeed some of the text comes directly from there).

Although Brading does not pursue a single thesis in *Church and State* (he rather modestly claims that this study has a more "introductory character" than the preceding volumes and calls for more research into some of the topics covered), there is much useful information in this, his latest contribution. The book is divided into three sections. The first section, entitled "The Religious Orders," includes essays on the writings of mendicant chroniclers, on the Oratorians, and on the expansion of the female orders of nuns and beatas. Especially interesting, however, are the chapters dealing with the causes and consequences of the 1767 Jesuit expulsion and with the controversy surrounding the secularization of parishes, a measure which had a serious impact on the religious orders in Michoacán (as elsewhere in Spanish America) and led to considerable conflict between secular and regular clergy and between bishops and royal patrons—that is, between "the ecclesiastical and civil structures of the Spanish

state in Mexico." From this section, we also learn much about the Uves of several prominent clerics, as weU as nuns and beatas, aU of whom Brading treats sympatheticaUy. Indeed, as the author reminds us early on, "one bad priest was apt to generate more episcopal paperwork than ten good priests quietly going about their business" (p. xu).

The second and third sections—"Priests and Laity" and "Bishops and Chapter"—include essays on the secular clergy, on confraternities, brotherhoods, parochial income, on popular reUgion, bishops and chapters, tithes and chantries, and on the thinking of the three key clerical figures of the early nineteenth century—Manuel Abad y Queipo, Miguel Hidalgo, and José Maria Morelos. AU these chapters contain much that is informative and useful. In these chapters Brading uses case histories of young men denied entry to the priesthood because of non-white ancestry, shows the growing number of unbeneficed priests residing in the diocese in the decades preceding the outbreak of the 1810 Insurgency, demonstrates the serious inequaUty between the wealthy curas and the under-educated and often unemployed priests, many of whom lived in poverty and were reduced to begging for alms, and explains the ways in which the last generation of Spanish bureaucrats repeatedly sought to curtaU the influence, privUeges, and prerogatives of the Mexican clergy. "At aU points," Brading argues, "the church . . . found its jurisdiction chaUenged and reduced," leading to a growing divide between "the secular and spiritual arms of the monarchy." Popular reUgion, too, came under increasing attack by the end of the eighteenth century. FinalUy, with the Consolidation decree of 1804, church wealth and income also became a target to be plundered by the crown. U there is a central theme running through this study, it is that such repeated attacks on the Church aUenated a substantial portion of the Mexican clergy and contributed to the widespread participation of clerics in the 1810 Insurgency. As the author reminds us at various points in *Church and State*, the enlightened ministers of the Bourbon period wanted above aU to curtaU ecclesiastical power, no longer viewing the Church "as the mainstay of the crown's authority over society," though it should perhaps have heeded the warnings of Francisco Javier de Iizana y Beaumont, penned in 1809, that "he who has the priests has the Indies."

Caroline A. Williams

University of Bristol

West Indian

The Catholic Church in Haiti: Political and Social Change. By Anne Greene. (East Lansing: Michigan State University Press. 1993. Pp. vii, 312. \$28.95.)

ParadoxicaUy Haiti's history is richer than the country itseU. Not much is scientificaUy known about its religious history, aside from myths created by Hollywood through the distortion of what Voodoo reaUy is. But this poor country is more than this African reUgion. And that is what Greene shows the reader

through this book. I would call this a ground-breaking study of an important part of Haiti's religious history.

Since the time when the whole of Hispaniola was under Spanish control, the official religion of the colony was Catholicism. This situation did not change after the French took over. One of the main tasks of Catholicism was to bring into the flock through conversion the substantial slave population of the colony. But for many this was only done in part, since they didn't give up their African beliefs. What we know today as Voodoo is a syncretism of African and European religious traditions, Protestantism included. This book presents the presence of the Catholic Church and Voodoo as the two main religions and how they affected and were affected themselves by the political situation of the country through different time periods. The author also studies the Protestant presence and its influence in this struggle.

The book has several shortcomings, including repetition. Many times after a subject has been covered, the author repeats it again almost verbatim, and sometimes several times. Additionally at the end of the book, under the subtitle "The Church Elsewhere" she gives detailed information on the Catholic Church in the Philippines, El Salvador, and even Colombia which is not pertinent to the discussion. In Chapter 7, which is the last one, Greene loses her objectiveness and draws a picture of Jean-Bertrand Aristide which is quite critical.

Aside from these weak aspects I believe the way the author treats the subject, how she is able to analyze the different periods of silence and outspokenness through which the Catholic Church passed; the way she presents the struggle between the Catholic Church, Voodoo, Protestantism, and the government; how the three religions allied in a given moment against the government; how each one of them in turn aligned itself with the government in different periods, is fascinating. To read Greene's book is to give oneself the opportunity to know a little bit more about how the Haitians have had to struggle against adversity.

Floyd McCoy

San Juan, Puerto Rico

History of the Catholic Church in Jamaica. By Francis J. Osborne, SJ. (Chicago: Loyola University Press. 1988. Pp. xii, 532. \$12.95.)

Father Osborne's history is a very important contribution to the knowledge of this Caribbean island. Not much has been written on the religious development of Jamaica. It was part of the Spanish empire from the voyages of Columbus until the English wrested the island from Spain in 1655.

This book is centered on the history of the Catholic Church during the Spanish and English periods. The influence of this institution during the Spanish period is so pervasive that most information on the Church is related to the political administration and social development. This primal role makes the book a worthy one.

To be able to give the reader a general understanding of the long history of the Catholic presence in Jamaica, Father Osborne begins with the Arawak Indian period and follows with their evangelization and the establishment of the institutional Church administered by abbots (a unique case in the history of the colonial Church) in 1516. When the island was taken by Protestant England in 1655 a new religious development took place; the Catholic Church was reduced to a secondary role in the colony. From that time until the first half of the nineteenth century, the Church merely survived, administered by charismatic missionary priests. In 1837 the island came under the Vicariate of Jamaica, British Honduras, and the Bahamas. The Jesuits' presence dates from this period. Also, when the island became a diocese in 1887, the first bishop was chosen from that religious order. At present Jamaica has been governed by a Jamaican-born archbishop since 1971. Under the archdiocese are the suffragan sees of Belize, Hamilton in Bermuda, Montego Bay, and Nassau. Although there is a significant Catholic population, the Protestant presence outnumbers them.

Father Osborne brings together new information, interesting details, and extensive research in this work. An ambitious project, it also has its loopholes. The author sometimes relies too heavily on a single source of information, as when writing about Bishop Balbuena's presence in the see. Also, new research on the Arawaks' presence in the Caribbean was not utilized by Father Osborne. As a matter of fact, using Peter Martyr as a reliable source for the period is questionable, since he actually wrote a secondhand account. It is my recommendation that the author, in a future edition of this valuable book, should update the bibliographic sources used for this work.

Floyd McCoy

San Juan, Puerto Rico

Far Eastern

Japan and Christianity: Impacts and Responses. Edited by John Breen and Mark Williams. (New York: St. Martin's Press. 1996. Pp. xii, 189. \$49.95.)

This significant volume brings together ten papers delivered at an international conference on Christianity in Japan held in St. Mary's College, Strawberry Hill, Twickenham, England, in 1991. The authors, who include one Japanese, are all well qualified and share a deep interest in their subject. Most have teaching positions at universities in England or Japan. One, a Norwegian, teaches systematic theology at the University of Oslo. Their special competencies vary from language and literature to history and religion.

In addition, there is a very helpful introduction by the two editors, John Breen and Mark Williams, lecturers in Japanese studies at two different British universities, whose papers are also included. Their introduction serves to present the relationship of each of the papers to the general theme of the volume: the encounter of Christianity with Japanese culture from the time of the arrival

of the first Christian missionaries at the end of the sixteenth century to the present, a theme which they rightly observe has not received the attention it deserves in the scholarly world.

The first four chapters are largely concerned with the initial missionary period. The first chapter, by Stefan Kaiser, presents the Japanese translation of various Christian terminology from the sixteenth to the nineteenth century. The second, by Michael Cooper, treats western-style Japanese paintings of both secular and religious subjects during the early period of contact with Christianity. The third chapter, by Ohashi Yukio, offers some unusual perspectives on the early Tokugawa persecution. The fourth, by Stephen Turnbull, identifies the elements of acculturation in a principal text, *Tenchi Hajimari no Koto*, of the *Kakure Kirishitan* (underground Christians).

The next three chapters are related mainly to the period of restoration. Chapter five, by Joseph Breen, considers the historical significance of the Urakami incident as it affected the newly established Meiji government. Chapter six, by Notto R. Thelle, treats the importance of the Christian encounter with Buddhism from the same period to the present. Chapter seven, by Helen Ballhatchet, considers the conflict between the theory of evolution and Christianity as realized in Japan in the late nineteenth century.

The final three chapters are involved especially with the modern era. Chapter eight, by Christal Whelan, examines oral and written sources of the *Kakure Kirishitan* to present their condition today, Chapter nine, by Mark Williams, considers the various social forms which Japanese Christianity has adopted to the present. In the last chapter Mark R. Mullins presents the development found in the work of Japanese Christian authors directed to the compatriots.

The volume is very attractively presented, though one could perhaps have wished for more space between lines for easier reading. There are six pages of plates in black and white offering nine examples of classical Japanese art that point up the encounter between Christianity and Japanese culture. Finally, there is an excellent "Select Bibliography." Though not providing the last word on many of the issues raised, the volume offers a good overview and indicates many areas deserving of further study. It should certainly be welcomed by all those with an interest in Christianity in Japan.

Robert T. Rush, SJ.

General Secretariat, Catholic Bishops' Conference of Japan

Christianity in China from the Eighteenth Century to the Present. Edited by Daniel H. Bays. (Stanford: Stanford University Press. 1996. Pp. xxii, 483-\$55.00.)

This pathbreaking volume is one of the latest products of the History of Christianity in China Project. Launched in 1985, this postdoctoral project en-

couraged studies of Christianity that paid special attention to Chinese materials and Chinese participants. Made possible by a grant from the Henry Luce Foundation, Inc., it was inspired by the late Dr. John K. Fairbank and directed by Dr. Daniel H. Bays, professor of history in the University of Kansas.

During the four years of awards, 1986-1989, thirty-four papers were written and presented in two symposia, held in Lawrence, Kansas. The result has been a number of significant studies, some having already appeared as monographs, for instance, *The Forgotten Christians of Hangzhou*, by D. E. MungeUo (reviewed ante, LXXXII [October, 1996], 747-748).

Of the twenty chapters in this book, aU but one were part of the History of Christianity in China Project. Bays has grouped them into four sections, each preceded by a short introduction in which he highUghts what are, in his opinion, the significant themes brought out by the authors.

Part I offers a more complex and less rigid explanation of the links between Christianity and Chinese society than the interpretative schemes put forward in 1963 by Paul Cohen in *China and Christianity* and in 1982 by Jacques Gernet in *Chine et Christianisme*. Contrary to Gernet, who argued that the Chinese were basicAUy unable to understand the essential concepts of Christianity because of their cultural predispositions, the authors in this section, reinforcing the findings of other recent studies, describe Chinese communities that were able to internalize Christianity by imbuing it with their own cultural flavor of belief and behavior. SimUarly these authors modify Cohen's interpretation by showing that, in the countryside in particular, conflicts between Christians and non-Christians had often less to do with the local eUte trying to uphold their status and prerogatives than with the disruption brought by Christian conversions and beliefs to the traditional social and cultural integration of the vUlage.

Part II shows a clear connection between Christianity and ethnicity whUe Part III focuses on Christianity as an important factor in the shaping of many Chinese women's identity and roles. These two parts contain several examples of exceUent use of interviews.

Part IV provides good case studies of the immensely complex and arduous process of making the foreign imported Christian reUgion a domestic product.

Most of the leading scholars in the study of Protestant Christianity in China have contributed a chapter. Because of the title of the book and the authors involved, one would therefore expect a more thorough description and analysis of contemporary Christianity in China, but chapter 9 on Christianity and Hakka Identity and chapter 20 on Pentecostal and Charismatic Christianity in Taiwan are too narrowly focused to satisfy the reader. Moreover, as Bays acknowledges, with only four studies and none covering the period after the early 1900's, CathoUcism is underrepresented. This raises several questions: Why are so few American scholars studying Roman CathoUc Christianity in China? Few as they are, why did only three participate in the History of Christianity in China Project? What about European and Chinese scholars of Roman CathoUc Christian-

ity in China? Were they also invited to submit a proposal and if so, why did they stay away?

Overall, this volume is noteworthy for eschewing the usual focus on foreign missionaries and being mostly China-centered. It brings together papers that draw largely on previously unused or underused Chinese sources and reveal many new facets of the history of Christianity in China. As a whole, it is a significant contribution to our understanding of the process of inculturation of Christianity that is still taking place in China and in many non-Western cultures.

Jean-Paul Wiest

Center for Mission Research and Study at Maryknoll

Jesuit Missionary Letters from Mindanao. Volume Two: The Zamboanga-Basilan-Joló Mission. Edited, Translated, and Annotated by José S. Arciua, SJ. (Quezon City, Philippines: Philippine Province Archives of the Society of Jesus, 1993. Pp. xxxii, 564. \$30.00.)

This is a fine collection of letters from three missions where the frustrations and dangers faced by Jesuit missionaries far outnumbered their successes in converting Moslems and upland minorities to Christianity. The volume is arranged in three sections (Zamboanga, 1880-1898, Basilan, 1880-1896, and Joló, 1875-1898), and within each section in chronological order. It is valuable for ethnographic data especially on Subanon culture and Basilan (less so on Joló and Siassi), for insights into Jesuit resettlement and conversion efforts, for making the acquaintance of some individual Jesuits of great personal character, and, most of all, for understanding, through their eyes, the dynamics of Philippine regional history in the late nineteenth century. The editor, José Arciua, provides useful annotations, especially short biographies of each priest. His translation from Spanish reads smoothly, with only a few awkward moments. He includes four letters on a controversy over the baptism of a high Moslem official in Joló which are not among the published letters in Spanish.

Arciua does not attempt to hide the fact that his heart is on the side of the priests as they struggle to convert their recalcitrant flock. One wonders if the fathers were actually met with "immense joy" by residents of Isabel, Basilan, and if those residents were, as he says, "liberated for eventual conversion and baptism" (p. xxvi). One wonders, as well, about their decision to ban Zamboanguenos from access to books (p. xxvi). The volume also suffers from an annoying lack of good maps to help the reader locate places mentioned in the letters. These caveats aside, Arciua has provided a rich collection of original source materials previously not available in English.

The Zamboanga section is the longest, with 69 letters, 42 of these from Juan Quintana (15), Estanislao March (9), and Joaquín Sancho (18). Quintana and March are keen observers of Subanon culture. Sancho is a more militant warrior against Moslems; his letters also give vivid accounts of visits among the Sub-

anon and of the cholera epidemic in 1889. Pio Pi's letter (#55) is of great interest for its discussion of strategy for conversion and of obstacles in the way of success.

The BasUan mission produced only 37 letters, 24 of these by Pablo Cavalleria. With the help of a Tagalog ex-convict, Pedro Cuevas, who had become a local datu, the Jesuits were able to gain some converts, mostly among tribal peoples who then resettled in Isabela or the other towns (#4, 9, 22). But theirs was a "difficult" mission (p. 384), and their enmity toward Moslems eventually strained their relationship with the aU-important Cuevas, who was anxious to Uve and let live with the JoJo Sultan and local Moslems (#26). CavaUeria, like Pi, provides a heart-wrenching description of the cholera epidemic (#17), which kiUed at least 1200 on BasUan. But his most fascinating letter describes the reasons preventing Moro conversion, including the government's readiness to work with and recognize local Moslem leaders, the fact that Moslems didn't have to pay tribute, the "ceaseless transit of foreign Moros, who, titled 'Haji,' travel around these islands," and the Chinese traders who "generaUy support Islam and embrace it U convenient" (#28). Of great interest to scholars today is this conflict of interests and strategies between the Jesuits, Spanish secular authorities, and local Chinese.

Letters from the JoJo mission, 66 m aU, 23 from Estanislao March and 20 from Gaspar Colomer, prove to be both the most exciting to read and the most poUtical, although they are not as valuable for ethnographic data as are those from the other missions. Sprinkled throughout are vivid descriptions of the Spanish assault on the JoJo Sultanate and the war that ensued. At times the priests lived literaUy in an armed camp, and they were always in danger of attack by juramentados, two of whom badly slashed Father Battlo and another priest in 1879 (#10-12). FaUing to assuage the fears of most Jolóanos who would run in terror at their approach (#6), the priests tried to work with former Christians captured by Moslems, only to bewaU the fact that most captives chose to stay with their Moslem famiUes (#14). The Moslems, this "bloody and arch-savage Islamic horde" (#27) "nauseating to see" (#23), must not, they avowed, be coddled as the government, through its local Spanish Governor, was doing. That government, which won by force of arms the right to appoint the sultan, then had to arm and help protect him from his Islamic enemies, embroiling Spain in local poUtics whUe the priests looked on with mounting exasperation (#43-45). Unable to agree with their feUow Spaniards (they suspected one Governor General of being pro-RecoUect, #4), the Jesuits found themselves more and more isolated, for they had Uttle faith in Christian FUipino aUies either. They dismissed "indio and mestizo" clergy offhandedly (#4), and then, after "the ManUa incident" of 1896 (the Revolution!), they became suspicious of aU FiUpinos, Christian and otherwise (#50). After a conspiracy was uncovered within the local garrison and nine FUipino officers were executed (#54-55), and after "deportees" (exiled revolutionaries) began to arrive from ManUa, the fathers saw enemies behind every bush. In one of his last letters. Father Colomer summarizes the situation as foUows (p. 538):

Joló is hell's antechamber. Here the missionary does not enjoy the comforts which other apostolates promise. From the convento I can see the idols and the lights with which the Chinese honor them. The Christians waUow in the most repugnant vices. . . . The peninsulars barter . . . a carabao [for] a Moro woman, or pay her so much a week as though she were a Singer sewing machine.

Thanks to José Arcilla's exceUent coUection, the English reader today is able to dweU with Jesuit fathers who Uved a century ago as though they were Uving next door. But the reader who opens this volume expecting to learn of Western successes in changing FUipinos wiU be disappointed. The residual strength of PhUippine minority cultures prevails in virtually every letter. Far from being central figures in a colonial enterprise, the priests reveal themselves to be, despite aU their impressive personal conviction and courage, peripheral players in the great drama of late nineteenth-century Philippine history.

Ronald K. Edgerton

University ofNorthern Colorado

NOTES AND COMMENTS

Association News

The president of the American Catholic Historical Association, Uta-Renate Blumenthal, upon the recommendation of the first vice-president, David J. O'Brien, has appointed Georgette Dorn of the Library of Congress and Christopher Kauffman of the Catholic University of America co-chairmen of the Committee on Program for the Association's seventy-ninth annual meeting, which will be held in Washington, D.C., on January 8-10, 1999. Those who wish to propose papers or (preferably) complete sessions should write by January 13, 1998, to Professor Kauffman in care of the Department of Church History, The Catholic University of America, Washington, D.C. 20064; telephone and fax: 202-319-5099.

Congresses, Conferences, Meetings, Symposia, Colloquia, and Lectures

Under the auspices of The Center for the Book in the Library of Congress in co-operation with the Interpretive Programs Office, the Folger Institute, and the Washington Colloquium for the Humanities a program was held in the Thomas Jefferson Building of the Library of Congress on June 4, 1997, to mark the opening of an exhibition entitled "Let There Be Light: William Tyndale and the Making of the English Bible." The speakers were David Scott Kastan of Columbia University and David Daniell of the University of London, and their topics were "The Noyse of the New Bible: Religion and Politics in Henrician England," and "William Tyndale: Courage and Genius behind the English Bible." The exhibition, which closed on September 6, included the first printed English translation of the New Testament of 1526, the Cologne Fragment of 1525 (ten sheets of the same, printed by Peter Quentel before his press was shut down), and other books and documents from the Library of Congress and the British Library. The exhibition was previously shown at the Huntington Library in San Marino, California, and at the New York Public Library. The Library of Congress is offering for sale the British Library's handbook, *Let There Be Light: William Tyndale and the Making of the English Bible*.

The centenary of the death of Father Augustus Tolton (1854-1897), the first black priest born in the United States and founder of the first black Catholic church in Chicago, who was ordained in Rome on April 25, 1886, was celebrated on July 12-13, 1997, in Quincy, Illinois, where he had attended school

and received the sacrament of confirmation. Cyprian Davis, O.S.B., of the St. Meinrad School of Theology, delivered an address. Roy Bauer, pastor of St. Peter Church in Quincy and co-chairman of the Father Tolton Centennial Pilgrimage, has published a twenty-eight-page booklet on the priest's life entitled "They Called Him Father Gus" and has placed a statue of him across from a church hall named in his honor.

A symposium commemorating the bicentenary of the founding of Mission San Fernando, Rey de España, was held in the mission church in Mission Hills, California, on September 6, 1997. In the morning papers were read by John R. Johnson of the Santa Barbara Museum of Natural History on "The Indians of San Fernando Mission," by Doyce B. Nunis, Jr., emeritus of the University of Southern California, on "The Friars of San Fernando Mission, 1797-1835," and by David Hornbeck of the California State University, Northridge, on "The Economic life of San Fernando Mission." In the afternoon Norman Neuerburg, emeritus of the California State University, Dominguez, presented "New Insights into the Convento Building: An Archaeological and Historical Résumé," and Francis J. Weber, director of San Fernando Mission, spoke on "San Fernando, Rey de España: Its Role in the New Millennium."

A colloquium on "Port-Royal et le Protestantisme" was held at Montpellier on September 25-27, 1997. Among the twenty-eight scholars who presented papers were Jacques Gres-Gayer of the Catholic University of America ("L'idée d'Église chez les jansénistes et chez les protestants") and Otto Seußes of Hamilton, Ontario ("Convulsions à Paris et dans les Cévennes").

The quincentenary of the birth of Philipp Melancthon was commemorated by a lecture given by Matthias Asche of Tübingen in the Universität Nikolauskloster in Passau on September 30, 1997, during a meeting of the Gesellschaft zur Herausgabe des Corpus Catholicorum.

At the conference on "Time and Space in Women's Lives in Early Modern Europe," which will be held on October 8-11, 1997, at the Istituto Trentino di Cultura in Trent, papers will be read by Francesca Medici of the University of Reading on "Lo spazio del chiostro: clausura, costrizione e protezione nel XVII secolo," and by Anne Jacobson Schutte of the University of Virginia on "Sante and Streghe in Early Modern Italy: Stepsisters or Strangers?"

The American Cusanus Society will sponsor three sessions on Nicholas of Cusa at the Thirty-third International Congress on Medieval Studies, which will be held at Western Michigan State University, Kalamazoo, on May 7-10, 1998. In the first, on "Rhetoric and Reform at the Council of Constance," which is being organized by Thomas M. Izbicki, papers will be read by Chris L. Nighman, Christopher Belluto, and Philip Stump; in the second, on "The State of the Study of Late-medieval Exegesis, which is being organized by Lawrence Hundersmarck, papers will be read by Peter Casarella, Gerald Christianson, and Philip Krey; in the third, on "Eckhart and Cusanus," papers will be read by Nicholas Largent, Bruce Milem, and Elizabeth Brient. Further information may be obtained

from the headquarters at the Society at Long Island University, C. W. Post Campus, Brookville, New York 11548.

The International Society for the Comparative Study of Civilizations has issued a call for papers in preparation for its twenty-seventh annual meeting, which will take place at Reitaku University, Kashiwa City, Chiba Prefecture, Japan, on June 11-14, 1998. Papers, panels, round tables, and workshops are sought on the processes, structures, and texts of past and present civilizations, on the theories and methods conducive to civilizational studies, and most earnestly on the special theme of this meeting, viz., "The Emergence of the Pacific Rim Civilizations?" Abstracts of proposed papers should be sent by November 15, 1997, to the chairman of the program committee, Midori Yamanouchi Rynn, in care of the Department of Sociology, University of Scranton, Scranton, Pennsylvania 18510-4605; telephone: 717-941-6137; fax: 941-6367; home telephone and fax: 689-4401.

Proposals for papers on any aspect of Quaker history are solicited for the twelfth biennial meeting of the Conference of Quaker Historians and Archivists, which will be held at the Stony Run Meeting in Baltimore, Maryland, on June 19-21, 1998. Anyone who wishes to propose a paper should send by December 31, 1997, a one-page abstract of it to John W. Oliver in care of the Department of History, Malone College, Canton, Ohio 44709-3897; telephone: 330-471-8100; fax: 330-454-6977.

The International Society for the Study of European Ideas will sponsor a workshop entitled "The Holocaust and the Waning of the Modern Narrative" during the conference on "Twentieth-Century European Narratives," which will be held at the University of Haifa on August 16-21, 1998. Proposals for papers should be submitted by December 15, 1997, to Donald J. Dietrich in care of the Department of Theology, Boston College, Chestnut Hill, Massachusetts 02167; telephone: 617-552-3880; fax: 617-552-0794; e-mail: Donald.Dietrich@bc.edu.

An interdisciplinary congress of historical studies under the auspices of the Historical Institute of the Order of the Most Holy Trinity will be held in Rome on September 16-19, 1998, in observance of the eighth centenary of the approval of the rule of the Trinitarians (December 17, 1198). The theme will be "La Liberazione dei 'Cattivi' tra Cristianità e Islam—Oltre la Crociata e il Jihad: ToUeranza e servizio umanitario." The congress will be divided into five sections: (1) text and context of the Trinitarian rule; (2) the alternatives, the new ways, "prophetism"; (3) poverty, the poor, money, and economic investment; (4) the "postwar" era: captivity and captives; and (5) the captives: ransom, redemption, liberation. Anyone who wishes to present a paper should write its title, state the section to which it pertains, and give a summary and the text by March 31, 1998. Those who present papers will be allowed fifteen minutes for the reading, but a longer text may be published in the proceedings (Atti). Accepted papers that for organizational reasons cannot be presented orally will nevertheless be published in the Atti. The registration fee is \$45; it entitles the registrant to a discount of twenty percent on the price of the Atti. Those inter-

ested should write to the Segreteria Congresso RT (1198), Piazza S. Maria aUe Fornaci 30, 00165 Roma, Italy; telephone: 39.6.631969; fax: 635264.

The International Committee of Historical Sciences has selected Oslo, Norway, as the site of the Nineteenth International Congress of Historical Sciences, which wiU be held on August 6-13, 2000. Previous congresses have attracted as many as 4,000 participants. The Congress wiU consist of three major themes of one full day each, twenty specialized themes with half a day each, and twenty-five round table discussions. In addition to the regular sessions, twenty-two affiUated international organizations (The International Commission for Comparative Ecclesiastical History included) and eighteen internal committees wiU hold meetings during the Congress. The official languages of the Congress wiU be EngUsh and French; simultaneous translation wUl be provided for aU plenary sessions. Oslo wiU be celebrating its mUennium at the same time with many concerts, shows, exhibitions, and other cultural attractions. Anyone wishing to be placed on the mailing Ust of the Congress should send his name and address to The Nineteenth International Congress of Historical Sciences, Department of History, Post Office Box 1008 Blindem, N-0315 Oslo, Norway; telephone: (+47) 22 85 69 07; fax: (+47) 22 85 52 78.

Causes of Saints

In the Cathedral of Notre Dame at Paris on August 22 Pope John Paul II solemnly declared Frédéric Ozanam blessed (see ante [April, 1997], p. 357).

At then spring meeting held in Kansas City, Missouri, the National Conference of Catholic Bishops agreed unanimously in a voice vote on June 19 that the cause of Father Michael McGivney (1852-1890), a priest of the Diocese of Hartford and founder of the Knights of Columbus, should be initiated. It was not a formal action of the conference but rather an expression of opinion about the appropriateness of beginning the process in accord with the regulations of the Congregation for the Causes of Saints that require such a consultation prior to the introduction of a cause.

Commemorative Postage Stamp

The United States Postal Service released in Miami on September 15 a thirty-two-cent stamp bearing the portrait and name of "Padre Félix Várela." When the chairman of the Postal Service Board, Tirso del Junco, unved the design early in August, he commented, "The design is like its subject: modest, understated, powerful in its simpUcity." He also extolled Várela as a "great Hispanic American" and "a saint" who worked "to lift the spirits of the downtrodden." He caUed Várela, who was born in Havana, Cuba, in 1788 and died in St. Augustine, Florida, in 1853, "a great defender of Uerty, but above aU, an exemplary priest." Father Várela, he said, estabUshed the first Spanish-language newspaper in the United States (El Habanero, which he edited from 1824 to 1826), pubUshed a number

of articles on human rights and religious tolerance, and worked toward improving co-operation between Spanish- and English-speaking Americans. A philosopher and politician, Father Várela spent the last thirty years of his life in the United States, mainly in the Diocese and Archdiocese of New York, of which he was vicar general. He established churches and charitable shelters and engaged in public debates with Protestant ministers. The release of the purple stamp was part of the celebration of National Hispanic Heritage Month. It is the thirty-eighth stamp with a Hispanic theme; it was a sudden addition to the 1997 stamp program, thanks to the influence of Tirso del Junco, a surgeon born in Havana, who has been actively advocating the commemoration of more Hispanic figures on stamps.

Manuscripts

A database containing incipits of Latin manuscripts on philosophy and theology from the Middle Ages is being developed at the Catholic University of Louvain-la-Neuve as part of an international project. Nearly 100,000 incipits have been assembled for the "Repertorium Initiorum Manucriptorum." Those beginning with the letters A, B, and C are now available on disks. Each year a further section of incipits will be distributed. Those who would like to receive this year's documentation accompanied by a user's manual should write to Jacqueline Hamesse in care of the Institut Supérieur de Philosophie, Collège Cardinal Mercier 14, 1348 Louvain-la-Neuve, Belgium; fax: (0) 10 47.82.85; e-mail: academia.belgio@heua.stm.it. The subscription price for the letters A, B, and C is \$200.

Library

In December, 1995, W Michael Mathes donated his research library on the history of colonial Mexico to El Colegio de Jalisco, Zapopan. At that time construction of a separate library building to house the 45,000-volume collection was begun at the college. The Biblioteca Mathes was opened on limited hours to researchers in August, 1996, and in April, 1997, cataloguing of modern printed books was placed on line. The ceremony of inauguration of the Biblioteca Mathes was held on May 27. Cataloguing of the 7,000 rare and colonial Mexican imprints, maps, microfilms, photographs, and sound recordings should be finished by the end of 1997. To maintain fields in which Dr. Mathes specialized, an on-going acquisitions program has been established. Direction of the library is under Dr. Mathes, who is assisted by a full administrative, reference, and technical staff. Full service including copying and reference correspondence is available. The library is open to the public from Monday to Friday, from ten o'clock in the morning to seven in the evening. It is located at 5 de Mayo 321, 45100 Zapopan, Jalisco, Mexico; telephone: 633 21 96; fax: 633 65 00; e-mail: <http://www.class.udg.mx/-coljal/-biblio-html>.

Exhibition

The Concordia Historical Institute Museum is presenting a special exhibition on the life of Philipp Melancthon in commemoration of the quincenariary of the Reformer's birth. Rare books and documents from the Reformation era are displayed. The exhibition will remain on view through January, 1998. Further information may be obtained by telephone (314-505-7900) or e-mail (chi@trucom.com). Those who cannot go to the museum but have Internet access may take a "virtual tour" of the exhibition by visiting the Institute's web page at <http://www.chi.lcms.org>.

Grants

Among the twenty-six recipients of grants awarded by the New Jersey Historical Commission on April 11 were the New Jersey Catholic Historical Records Commission (South Orange), which received \$2,010 for the publication of "New Jersey Catholicism: An Annotated Bibliography," and John Fea of Stony Brook, New York, who was given \$8,000 for research on his doctoral dissertation to be entitled "Religion in Southern New Jersey, 1740-1820."

Thomas F. O'Connor, ES. C, public services librarian at the Cardinal Hayes Library, Manhattan College, has received a research travel grant from the Cushwa Center for the Study of American Catholicism to examine the significant role played by the Catholic publishing house of Sheed & Ward in the Catholic intellectual and literary revival by introducing European Catholic authors to American Catholics and by fostering Catholic writers in the United States.

Matrix

Matrix: A Collection of Resources for the Study of Women's Religious Communities, 500-1500, is now online at <http://matrix.divinity.yale.edu>.

Matrix is a collaborative research project made available on the World Wide Web by an international group of scholars of medieval history, religion, history of art, archaeology, and other disciplines, as well as librarians and experts in computer technology. Our goal is to document the participation of Christian women in the religion and society of medieval Europe. In particular, we aim to collect and make available online all existing data about all professional Christian women in Europe between 500 and 1500 A.D. The project draws on both textual and material sources, primary and secondary, although its basis is unpublished archival evidence. It addresses a variety of individuals and groups in medieval Europe, and a range of ecclesiastical institutions, including monastic houses of every size, affiliation, and rule. Our editorial intentions in selecting and presenting material are both scholarly and pedagogical—Matrix is designed for use by scholars, students, and anyone interested in the study of women, medieval Europe, or the history of Christianity.

Matrix began in the 1980's when a team of medievalists directed by Mary McLaughlin, together with Susanne Wemple, Heath DiUard, and Constance Berman, began to gather data on women's religious communities. Their intent was to produce a three-volume repertoire of monastic communities. The original project, funded by the National Endowment for the Humanities, produced a vast wealth of information (over 3000 pages) which has remained unpublished in any form. Much of the data was encoded and entered into a now-inaccessible computer database. In 1994, these data were turned over to a new group of scholars for development and publication. Under the stewardship of Katherine GiU, the extraction and publication of the database in electronic format began, first at Mount Holyoke College, and now at Yale University and the University of Kansas. A new editorial board, composed of Katherine GUI, Lisa Bitel, and Marilyn Dunn, is now guiding the project, with a larger board of advisors and regional editors assisting.

The basis of Matrix is the Monasticon, a repertoire of profiles of religious women's communities. The Monasticon can be used to find individual histories of communities or can be searched as a database. Matrix also includes Biographies, which contain entries on individual men and women associated with the communities in the Monasticon; a Chartulary of primary source documents; a Bibliography of published and unpublished sources; a Glossary; an Archive of articles; and a Visual Library of site plans, images, and maps.

Matrix is a project in progress. Unlike a traditional repertoire or bibliography, the data are continuously updated, edited, and expanded. AU material in Matrix is refereed by the editorial board, advisors, or regional editors. Much of the original material has been loaded into a database, and a preliminary Monasticon (consisting largely of records of English communities) has now been launched onto the World Wide Web. The Monasticon is currently being updated, edited, and expanded, and it is planned to launch other parts of Matrix as soon as possible.

Matrix is very much a project-in-progress. Contributions, corrections, suggestions, and queries are welcomed. Communications should be addressed to Lisa M. Bitel in care of the Department of History, 3001 Wescoe Hall, University of Kansas, Lawrence, Kansas 66045; e-mail: lbitel@falcon.cc.ukans.edu.

Publications

All the articles published in the issue of the *Bulletin of the John Rylands University Library of Manchester* for autumn, 1996 (Volume 78, Number 3), are related to the theme "The Church of the East: Life and Thought." Following an "Introduction" by the guest editors, J. F. Coakley and K. Parry, are these thirteen articles: J. A. McGuckin, "Nestorius and the Political Factions of Fifth-Century Byzantium: Factors in His Personal Downfall" (pp. 7-21); S. P. Brock, "The 'Nestorian' Church: A Lamentable Misnomer" (pp. 23-35); A. V. Williams, "Zoroastrians and Christians in Sasanian Iran" (pp. 37-53); Victoria L. Erhart,

"The Church of the East during the Period of the Four Rightly-Guided Caliphs" (pp. 55-71); A. Gelston, "The Origin of the Anaphora of Nestorius: Greek or Syriac?" (pp. 73-86); Luise Abramowski, "Die Uigurische Homilie des Ps. Narses mit dem Messbekenntnis und einem Theodor-Zitat" (pp. 87-100); J. Habbi, "L'Importance de la culture dans l'Église d'Orient Assyro-Chaldéenne" (pp. 101-110); S. H. Griffith, "The Muslim Philosopher Al-Kindi and His Christian Readers: Three Arab Christian Texts on 'The Dissipation of Sorrows'" (pp. 111-127); E. C. D. Hunter, "The Church of the East in Central Asia" (pp. 129-142); K. Parry, "Images in the Church of the East: The Evidence from Central Asia and China" (pp. 143-162); J.-M. Fiey, O.P., "Comment l'Occident en vint à parler de 'Chaldéens'?" (pp. 163-170); Mar Aprem, "Mar Narsai Press" (pp. 171-178); and J. F. Coakley, "The Church of the East since 1914" (pp. 179-198).

ReUcs and reUquaries in the Middle Ages form the theme of all the articles published in the first issue of *Gesta* for 1997 (Volume XXXVII). The authors and titles are as follows: Caroline Walker Bynum and Paula Gerson, "Body-Part ReUquaries and Body Parts in the Middle Ages" (pp. 3-7); Barbara Drake Boehm, "Body-Part ReUquaries: The State of Research" (pp. 8-19); Cynthia Hahn, "The Voices of the Saints: Speaking ReUquaries" (pp. 20-31); Ellen M. Shortell, "Dis-membering Saint Quentin: Gothic Architecture and the Display of ReUcs" (pp. 32-47); Scott B. Montgomery, "Mittite capud [sic] meum . . . ad matrem meam ut osculetur eum: The Form and Meaning of the ReUquary Bust of Saint Just" (pp. 48-64); and Thomas Head, "Art and Artifice in Ottoman Trier" (pp. 65-82).

"Catholics in a Non-Catholic World" is the theme of the articles published in the issue of *U.S. Catholic Historian* for spring, 1997 (Volume 15, Number 2). The contents follow: Tricia T. Pyne, "The Politics of Identity in Eighteenth-Century British America: Catholic Perceptions of Their Role in Colonial Society" (pp. 1-14); Lesly Woodcock Tentler, "Reluctant Pluralists: Catholics and Reformed Clergy in Ante-Bellum Michigan" (pp. 15-34); Diane Batts Morrow, "Outsiders Within: The Oblate Sisters of Providence in 1830s Church and Society" (pp. 35-54); Paul Gules, "Catholic Ideology and American Slave Narratives" (pp. 55-66); Kathleen Tobin-Schlesinger, "The Changing American City: Chicago Catholics as Outsiders in the Birth Control Movement, 1915-1935" (pp. 67-85); and Thomas J. Sheuey "What the Hell is an Encyclical?: Governor Aured E. Smith, Charles C. Marshall, Esq., and Father Francis P. Duffy" (pp. 87-107). More articles on this theme will appear in the next issue.

The Canadian Catholic Historical Association's *Historical Studies* for 1996 (Volume 62) contains papers read at the 1995 annual meeting of the Association's English section. Held at the University of Quebec at Montreal, that meeting was devoted to the theme "Religion and Secularism in Canada." The following articles are published: Sheuea Andrew, "Seigniorial Education: The Problem of Convent Schools in Acadian New Brunswick, 1858-1886" (pp. 15-32); Pasquale Fiorino, "The Nomination of Bishop Fallon as Bishop of London" (pp. 33-46); Paul Laverdure, "Sunday in Quebec, 1907-1939" (pp. 47-61); Peter MacLeod, "Catholicism, Alliances, and Amerindian Evangelists During the Seven

Years' War" (pp. 63-72); Nicole Neatby, "Student Leaders at the University of Montreal During the Early 1950's: What Did Students Want?" (pp. 73-88); SheUa Ross, "For God and Canada': The Early Years of the CathoUc Women's League in Alberta" (pp. 89-108); and David Seljak, "Why the Quiet Revolution Was Quiet': The Catholic Church's Reaction to the Secularization of Quebec after 1960" (pp. 109-124). The second half of the volume consists of Études d'histoire religieuse, published by the Société canadienne d'histoire de l'Eglise cathoUque. Three articles are presented: Jean Pirotte, "Les stratégies missionnaires du XLXe au début du XXe siècle: Une mise en perspective générale de l'intérêt pour les missions du Grand Nord canadien" (pp. 9-29); Achiel Peelman, "Les missionnaires oblats et les cultures amérindiennes au 19e siècle: Les Oblats en Oregon (1847-1860)" (pp. 31-47), and Jean de BonvLUe, "Le discours des évêques québécois sur la presse de 1850 à 1914" (pp. 49-70).

The issue of *Archivo Ibero-Americano* for July-December, 1996 (Volume LVI, Numbers 223-224), is an homenaje to Padre José Lerchundi on the centenary of his death. After an introduction by the editor on "El Centenario del P. Lerchundi y la Misión de Marruecos en A.I.A." (pp. 481-485) the following articles appear: Mohammed Ibn Azzuz Hakim, "La figura del padre Lerchundi en el seno de la sociedad marroquí" (pp. 487-507); Gaspar Calvo Moralejo, "El P. Lerchundi. Notas para su biografía" (pp. 509-537); Bárbara Herrero Muñoz-Cobo, "Novedades en la obra Lingüística del padre José Lerchundi" (pp. 539-551); Ramón Lourido Díaz, "Documentos de la S. C. de Propaganda Fide y la Prefectura Apostólica de Marruecos en tiempos del P. Lerchundi" (pp. 553-591); Ramón Lourido Díaz, "Fuentes documentales y bibliográficas sobre el P. Lerchundi" (pp. 593-598); Ramón Lourido Díaz, "Las Instituciones médico-sanitarias creadas por iniciativa del P. Lerchundi" (pp. 599-630); Ramón Lourido Díaz, "El padre Lerchundi, puente de enlace entre los arabistas europeos y los intelectuales marroquíes" (pp. 631-658); Ramón Lourido Díaz, "La tipografía hispano-árabe de la Misión Franciscana de Marruecos" (pp. 659-677); Ramón Lourido Díaz, "El Padre Lerchundi y las pecuUares motivaciones de su acción socio-cultural en Marruecos" (pp. 679-726); Antonio Peteiro, "El padre Lerchundi, hombre de iglesia y renovador de la Misión Franciscana de Marruecos" (pp. 727-755); Miguel VaUeLUo Martín, "Actitudes y reacciones del P. Lerchundi en el campo educativo" (pp. 757-808); and Miguel VaUeLUo Martín, "El P. Lerchundi y los Colegios de Misiones de Santiago y Chipiona" (pp. 809-927).

The fifth International Congress on the Franciscans in the New World in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries was held at the Monasterio Franciscano de la Rábida on April 24-29, 1995. Its proceedings have now been published in the volume (LVII) of the *Archivo Ibero-Americano* for 1997 (Numbers 225 and 226 combined). The ponencias y comunicaciones are as follows: M. del Carmen García de la Herrán and M. del Mar Grana Cid, "Notas bibliográficas para el estudio del franciscanismo en la América Contemporánea" (pp. 3-65); Josep Ignasi Saranyana, "Medio siglo de la Revista Eclesiástica Brasileira" (pp. 67-78); Julián Heras, O.F.M., "Principales archivos y bibliotecas de la Orden Franciscana en el Perú actual" (pp. 79-105); M.a del Mar García Roldan, "Expe-

diciones en el A.G.I, sobre las misiones de Sonora y Sinaloa a comienzos del siglo XIX" (pp. 107-126); Antolín Abad Pérez, O.F.M., "Archivo Ibero-Americano y su entronque americanista" (pp. 127-135); Hermenegildo Zamora Jambolina, O.F.M., "Documentos reales relacionados con la Orden Franciscana en los libros registro en el último tercio del siglo XVIII y primero del XIX" (pp. 137-261); JuUán Heras, O.F.M., "Restauración y actividades de los Franciscanos del Perú a partir del siglo XIX" (pp. 263-296); Luis Carlos MantUla, O.F.M., "Los franciscanos en la Independencia de Colombia" (pp. 297-337); Luis Olivares Molina, O.F.M., "El proceso emancipador y los Franciscanos en el Cono Sur, particularmente en Chile" (pp. 339-389); Manuel de Castro y Castro, O.F.M., "Franciscanos mexicanos exclaustrados y guerrilleros en el siglo XIX" (pp. 391-419); Carlos de Rueda Iturate, "Envío de misioneros franciscanos a Nueva España (1790-1830)" (pp. 421-432); Rocío de los Reyes Ramírez, "Fray Pedro García de Panés, obispo de Paraguay (1809)" (pp. 433-442); Inmaculada de la Corte Navarro, "Fray Antonio Sánchez Matas, obispo de La Paz (1818-1825)" (pp. 443-450); Marcela Corvera Poiré, "La provincia de San Diego de México en los siglos XIX y XX" (pp. 451-470); Mariano Cuesta Domingo, "Pervivencia de modelos de exploración territorial tras la Independencia de América del Sur" (pp. 471-514); Gaspar Calvo Mondejo, O.F.M., "El P. Pedro Gual, apóstol de Hispanoamérica" (pp. 516-540); Odorico Sáiz Pérez, O.F.M., "El P. Andrés Hertero y la restauración de los colegios franciscano-misioneros del Perú y Bolivia (1834-1838)" (pp. 541-564); M.a del Carmen Urbano Delgado, F.F.M., "Presencia de las Franciscanas Misioneras de María en Hispanoamérica (siglo XX)" (pp. 565-607); Felipe Abad León, "La devoción a San Francisco Solano hoy en La Rioja argentina" (pp. 609-637); José Luis del Río Sadornil, "Un pionero del desarrollo en la Amazonia Peruana: el P. Luis Agustín López Pardo" (pp. 639-707); José Martí Mayor, O.F.M., "El P. José M. VUa, misionero y etnólogo" (pp. 709-729); PUar Hernández Aparicio, "El envío de misioneros al Colegio de Propaganda Fide de Moquegua, 1795-1818" (pp. 731-757); Sebastián García, O.F.M., "América en la legislación general de la Orden Franciscana (siglos XIX-XX)" (pp. 759-779); Francisco Morales Valerio, O.F.M., "Los Franciscanos ante los retos del siglo XIX mexicano" (pp. 781-807); David Pérez, O.F.M., "Los Franciscanos a través del arte en la Audiencia de Charcas" (pp. 809-860); Vicenta Cortés Alonso, "El Padre L. Gómez Cañedo y los Archivos" (pp. 861-872).

Numbers 5-6 combined (1997) of the *Revue des Ordinations Episcopales* contains Usts of the 316 ordinations of bishops that took place throughout the world in 1995 and 1996. The *Revue* is edited by Charles N. Bransom, Jr., of Mango, Florida.

Personal Notices

Robert I. Burns, SJ., professor emeritus of the University of California at Los Angeles, has been elected Corresponding Member of the Institut d'Estudis Catalans, the official academy of arts and sciences for the Catalan peoples of Spain.

Frank de la Teja of Southwest Texas State University was given the Carlos Castañeda Award of the Texas Catholic Historical Society at the Society's annual meeting held on March 7, 1997, at St. Edward's University, Austin. Dr. de la Teja is editor of the Society's journal, *Catholic Southwest*.

Sister Grace E. Donovan, S.U.S.C, second vice-president of the American Catholic Historical Association, has left Stonehill College to become international archivist of her congregation, the Holy Union Sisters, in Rome.

Keith J. Egan has been appointed to the newly created Joyce McMahon Hank Aquinas Chair of Catholic Theology in Saint Mary's College, Notre Dame, Indiana.

Walter Wolkovich-Valkavicius of Norwood, Massachusetts, was inducted into the Order of Gediminas by the Ambassador of Lithuania, Alfonsas Eidintas, in execution of a decree of the President of the Republic. The conferral ceremony took place at the Lithuanian Embassy in Washington on August 20, 1997. Father Wolkovich was honored "for his lifetime historical and musical activities."

Obituary

Robert F. Byrnes, Distinguished Professor Emeritus at Indiana University, died on June 19 at Ocean Isle, North Carolina, where he was taking part in an annual family gathering. In his last book, *V. I. Kliuchevskii: Historian of Russia* (Indiana University Press, 1995), Professor Byrnes quoted a line from Henry Adams: "a teacher affects eternity: he can never tell when his influence stops." The line he chose for Kliuchevskii is an apt choice for an appreciation of his own life and work. A distinguished, much-published scholar with a long record of achievements both in and out of academia, Robert Byrnes valued especially, and was valued for, his role as teacher, and friend and mentor, for generations of students and many others who never had the privilege of enrolling in a course with him.

Born on December 30, 1917, and raised in a small town in up-state New York, Waterville (a community "civilized, generous, and patriotic," he later recalled), in a family of twelve children, Professor Byrnes cherished all the values his parents and teachers exemplified. At Amherst College he benefited, he once wrote, from a "broad liberal education by immensely dedicated faculty." He entered Harvard University in 1939, intending to pursue an awakening interest in Russian history. Since Harvard offered little in Russian studies, he took his Ph.D. degree in French history. In 1943 he became an analyst for military intelligence, specializing on the Japanese electronics industry. In 1945 he was offered a one-year position at Swarthmore College, and an opportunity to teach a course on Russia.

Byrnes' career in Russian history proved one of the most distinguished and most significant for the development of Russian studies. He was among the first young scholars invited to the newly founded Russian Institute at Columbia Uni-

versify. He founded and led the Inter-University Committee on Travel Grants, which in several guises over the years proved vital to the growth of scholarship on Russia and East Europe, fostering, in the face of the deepening Cold War, an ever broader exchange of students and scholars to promote as much dialogue as possible. He founded and directed for many years the Russian and East European Institute at Indiana University, which became one of the leading American centers. He served as the elected president of major scholarly societies, including the American Catholic Historical Association (in 1961) and the American Association for the Advancement of Slavic Studies, the main organization for Russian and East European studies in this country. He chaired the Indiana University history department for many years and edited the *American Historical Review*. He served often as consultant to government agencies, including the Department of Defense and the State Department.

His scholarship, presented in twenty books and a great many articles, reviews, and conference papers, contributed to knowledge of Russia in many ways, but none more important than analysis of the role of intellectual leaders. His 1968 biography of Pobodonostsev doubtless will remain a definitive study of conservatism in Old Regime Russia, while his new biography of Kuvshinov richly illuminates the fate of Russian moderate liberalism. Among his many penetrating articles, some of the most instructive are appreciations of the life and work of teachers and historians significant in the development of Russian studies in this country, from Archibald Cary Coolidge at Harvard at the turn of the century to the late Donald Treadgold at the University of Washington. Byrnes valued in these men their intelligence and perseverance but most of all their integrity and commitment to worthwhile causes.

The list of the honors he earned, from Phi Beta Kappa at Amherst in 1939 to Kennan Center Fellow at FeUow in 1995, is long and distinguished, as are the honorary degrees and trusteeships from many universities and learned societies. Byrnes took special pride in the many students who became themselves distinguished, well-known figures in academia, government, and the learned professions. He seemed to take equal pride in those who had not become well known, but who contributed to the well-being of the community in many vocations. He was unfailing in his cheerfulness and the courtesy he showed to all. Finally, he took special pride in his family, his wife Eleanor, and their seven children and seventeen grandchildren. It was a rare letter to a colleague, or convention conversation with friends, in which he did not mention them, with evident happiness. Professor Byrnes was a distinguished scholar and a generous colleague and friend. His influence will long be felt in the lives of those he touched.

James T. Flynn

College of the Holy Cross

PERIODICAL LITERATURE

general and miscellaneous

- Southern Perspectives on Christian History. Frans J. Verstraelen. *Neue Zeitschrift für Missionswissenschaft*, 53 (2, 1997), 99-113.
- "An Airier Aristocracy": The Saints at War. Christopher Holdsworth. *Transactions of the Royal Historical Society*, 6th ser., VI (1996), 103-122.
- La penisola di Alicarnasso in età bizantina (la parte). Vincenzo Ruggieri, SJ., Franco Giordano, Alexander Záh. *Orientalia Christiana Periodica*, 63 (1, 1997), 119-161.
- Grafmonumenten van de kerk van Sint-Juliaan-der-Vlamingen te Rome. Johan Ickx and Leopold Winckelmans. *Bulletin de l'Institut Historique Belge de Rome*, LXVII (1997), 225-314.
- Administratie en archief van het voormalige norbertinessenklooster van Gempe (s-Hertogenbosch) in Sint-Joris-Winge: een lang en eeuwenoud verhaal. Stefan Van Lwi. *Analecta Praemonstratensia*, LXXIII (1-2, 1997), 48-74.
- The "Dumbarton Oaks Hagiography Project." Reflections of a User. Ugo Zanetti. *Analecta Bollandiana*, 115 (1-2, 1997), 166-193.
- Jean Leclercq en Medio Evo. Gregorio Penco. *Studia Monástica*, 38 (2, 1996), 401-409.
- Religione e storia nel pensiero di Omodeo. GUolamo Imbruglia. *Rivista Storica Italiana*, CTX (Jan., 1997), 198-244.
- Faith and History: Reflections on the Work of the ASCH. Barbara Brown ZLkmund. *Church History*, 66 (June, 1997), 284-302.
- Writing the History of a Religious Teaching Institute: Guidelines for Research, Sources and Methods (19th and 20th Centuries). Paul Wynants. *Salesian Studies*, YIII (Spring, 1997), 91-142.
- Nouvelle proposition d'identification des vestiges découverts sous la basilique Sainte-Marie-Majeure de Rome: un sanctuaire de Cybèle. Françoise Van Haepelen. *Bulletin de l'Institut Historique Belge de Rome*, LXVII (1997), 65-98.
- Constantine and Jerusalem. E. D. Hunt. *Journal of Ecclesiastical History*, 48 (July 1997), 405-424.

- The Importance of Bread in the Diet of Monks in the Judean Desert. Yizhar Firsichfeld. *Byzantion*, YSSH(X, 1996), 143-155.
- Athanase d'Alexandrie, l'Église et les moines: À propos de la Vie d'Antoine. Annik Martin. *Revue des sciences religieuses*, 71 (Apr., 1997), 171-188.
- La Vie d'Hypatius de Gangres (BHG 759a), Jean Malalas et l'impôt du xylélaion. Avshalom Laniado. *Analecta Bollandiana*, 115 (1-2, 1997), 133-146.
- Les privilèges du clergé d'après la Lettre 104 de S. Basile. Jean Gascou. *Revue des sciences religieuses*, 71 (Apr., 1997), 189-204.
- Jerome and the Sham Christians of Rome. John Curran. *Journal of Ecclesiastical History*, 48 (Apr., 1997), 213-229.
- Socrates Scholasticus' Church History: Themes, Ideas, Heroes. Ivan Krivushln. *Byzantinische Forschungen*, XXIII (1996), 95-107.
- Un traité syriaque jacobite contre les partisans de Paul de Béth Ukkâmê (564-581). Luc Lontie. *Orientalia Christiana Periodica*, 63 (1, 1997), 5-51.
- Beyond Cemetery WaUs: Early Medieval Funerary Topography and Christian Salvation. Bonnie Effros. *Early Medieval Europe*, 6 (1, 1997), 1-23.
- From Benedict's Rule to Charlemagne's Renaissance: Monastic Education in the Early Middle Ages—and Today. John J. Contreni. *American Benedictine Review*, 48 (June, 1997), 186-198.
- Church and Chapel in Medieval England. Nicholas Orme. *Transactions of the Royal Historical Society*, 6th ser., VI (1996), 75-102.
- Die selige Langobardenkönigin Theodelinde—"Brückenbauerin" zwischen getrennten Völkern und Kirchen. Johannes Hofmann. *Zeitschrift für Kirchengeschichte*, 108 (1, 1997), 12-31.
- Symbolic Expressions of Sanctity: Gertrude of Nivelles in the Context of Merovingian Mortuary Custom. Bonnie Effros. *Viator*, 27 (1996), 1-10.
- La Vie de Sainte Madelberte de Maubeuge. Édition du texte (BHL 5129) et traduction française. Paul Bertrand. *Analecta Bollandiana*, 115 (1-2, 1997), 39-76.
- St. Austraberta of PavUly in the Anglo-Saxon Liturgy. Alicia Correa. *Analecta Bollandiana*, 115 (1-2, 1997), 77-112.
- Use of Sources in the Canons of the Council of Trullo. Jeremy Williams. *Byzantion*, LXVI (2, 1996), 470-488.
- L'ermite et le prince. Les débuts de la vie monastique à Conques (fin VHP-début LXe siècle). Hervé Oudart. *Revue Historique*, CCXCVII Jan.-Mar., 1997), 3-39.

- Sight and Church Reform in the Thought of Jonas of Orléans. David F. Appleby. *Viator*, 21 (1996), 11-33.
- The Sack of San Vincenzo al Volturno. Richard Hodges. *History Today*, 47 July, 1997), 19-26.
- Les peintures du rez-de-chaussée de l'église de Lagami (Haute-Svanéthie). LUIa Evseeva. *Byzantion*, LXVI (1, 1996), 81-100.
- La Passion de S. Géréon de Cologne (BHL 5446). Une composition d'époque ottonienne. Jean-François Nieu. *Analecta Bollandiana*, 115 (1-2, 1997), 5-38.
- The Tale of a Happy Fool: The Vita of St. Philaretos the Merciful (BHG 1511z-1512b). A. Kazhdan and L. F. Sherry. *Byzantion*, LXVI (2, 1996), 351-362.
- The Early Abbesses, Nuns and Female Tenants of the Abbey of Holy Trinity, Caen. John Walmsley. *Journal of Ecclesiastical History*, 48 (July, 1996), 425-444.
- El diplomatarí del monestir de Santa Cecília de Montserrat. ILLAnys 1079-1200. índex. Francesc Xavier Altes i AguUó. *Studia Monástica*, 38 (2, 1996), 291-400.
- Le problème de l'attribution d'un texte rouennais du XIe siècle: les Acta archiepiscoporum Rothomagensium. Louis Violette. *Analecta Bollandiana*, 115 (1-2, 1997), 113-129.
- The Crusader Lordship of Marash in Armenian Cilicia, 1104-1149. George T. Beech. *Viator*, 27 (1996), 33-52.
- Dona dantes et vota voventes. De strichting en dotatie van het norbertijnenklooster te Postel (1128/1138-1179). Arnoud-Jan A. Bijsterveld. *Analecta Praemonstratensia*, LXXIII (1-2, 1997), 5-47.
- St Bernard of Clairvaux, the Low Countries and the Lisbon Letter of the Second Crusade. Jonathan Phillips. *Journal of Ecclesiastical History*, 48 July 1997), 485-497.
- Richard Lionheart and English Episcopal Elections. Ralph V Turner. *Albion*, 29 (Spring, 1997), 1-13-
- Ein Privileg Papst Innocenz' III. für die Kirche SS. Sergio e Baccho in Rom als Quelle für die mittelalterliche Topographie. Andrea Sommerlechner. *Mitteilungen des Instituts für Österreichische Geschichtsforschung*, 105 (1-2, 1997) 30-42.
- I fondamenti del regime di cristianità al Lionese I (13 luglio 1245). Alberto Meloni. *Cristianesimo nella Storia*, XVIII (Feb., 1997), 61-76.
- Die Verhängung des Kirchenbannes über Graf Meinhard II. von Tirol (1259-95). Brian A. Pavlac. *Veröffentlichungen des Tiroler Landesmuseums Ferdinandeum*, 75/76 (1995-96), 219-232.
- Zamora's Nuns in the Oven. Peter Linehan. *History Today*, 47 (Mar, 1997), 46-51.

- Das Säulenmonument, die Engel- und Prophetendarstellungen im letzten Buch der Franziskaner: "Die Befreiung des Häretikers Petrus von Aversa" in der Oberkirche San Francesco in Assisi. Gerhard Ruf. *Wissenschaft und Weisheit*, 59 (2, 1996), 243-259.
- The Reader as Author of the User-Produced Manuscript: Reading and Rewriting Popular Latin Theology in the Late Middle Ages. Eric H. Reiter. *Viator*, 27 (1996), 131-169.
- The Parisian Franciscan Community in 1303. William J. Courtenay *Franciscan Studies*, 53 (1993), 155-173.
- The Dedication of the Chora Monastery in the Time of Andronikos II Palaiologos. Natalia Terziatnikova. *Byzantion*, LXVI (1, 1996), 188-207.
- An Innocent Abroad: The Career of Simon Mepham, Archbishop of Canterbury, 1328-33. Roy Martin Haines. *English Historical Review*, CXII (June, 1997), 555-596.
- L'antica presenza in Roma dei Servi di Maria: da Sant'Eusebio (1331) a San Marcello (1369). Ubaldo Maria Todeschini, O.S.M. *Studi Storici dell'Ordine dei Servi di Maria*, XLVI Q-II, 1996, 7-29.
- La chiesa ed il convento di Santa Maria dei Servi di Ferrara dalla fondazione (1339) al 1424. Francesco Gobbo. *Studi Storici dell'Ordine dei Servi di Maria*, XLVI (I-II, 1996), 31-126.
- Conrad of Megenberg: The Parisian Years. William J. Courtenay. *Vivarium*, XXXV (Mar., 1997), 102-124.
- "Die Ordnung, die das Capitel von Zitel . . . hat gemacht" (HS 3, 111): Eine bisher unbekannte Handschrift der Sr. Regula im Archiv der Abtei Lichtenthal. Sr. M. Pia Schindele, O.Cist. *Freiburger Diözesan-Archiv*, 116 (1996), 79-122.
- The Vanishing Vision: Late Medieval Crusading. Nigel Saul. *History Today*, 41 (June, 1997), 23-28.
- Late Medieval Care and Control of Women: Jean Gerson and His Sisters. Brian Patrick McGuire. *Revue d'Histoire Ecclésiastique*, XCII (Jan.-Mar., 1997), 5-36.
- Dominican Friar, Lay Saint: The Case of Marcolino of Forlì. Daniel Bornstein. *Church History*, 66 (June, 1997), 252-267.
- The Opponents of Bishop Pecok. R. M. Bail. *Journal of Ecclesiastical History*, 48 (Apr., 1997), 239-262.
- Antijudaismus und spätmittelalterliche Bußfrömmigkeit: Die Predigten des Franziskaners Bernhardin von Buxtehude (um 1450-1513). Hans-Martin Küster. *Zeitschrift für Kirchengeschichte*, 108 (2, 1997), 147-175.
- Die Pest—Strafe Gottes oder Naturphänomen? Eine frömmigkeitsgeschichtliche Untersuchung zu Pesttraktaten des 15. Jahrhunderts. Thilo Esser. *Zeitschrift für Kirchengeschichte*, 108 (1, 1997), 32-57.

Jean Marchard and Guichard de Rovedis: Clerical Patrons and TheU Manuscripts in Lyons around 1500. EUzabeth Burin. *Viator*, 27 (1996), 189-214.

SIXTEENTH century

Feste Uturgiche ed altre "AUegrezze" aU'Annuziata di Pistoia fra U Cinquecento e U Settecento. Davide Maria Montagna, O.S.M. *Studi Stortci dell'Ordine dei Servi di Maria*, XLY1 (J-n, 1996), 127-164.

Bosch's "Christ Carrying the Cross." Gordon Marsden. *History Today*, 41 (Apr, 1997), 15-21.

Erasmus of Rotterdam and Judaism: A Reexamination in the Light of New Evidence. Hilmar M. Pabel. *Archive for Reformation History*, 87 (1996), 9-37.

Luther, Emser and the Development of Reformation Anticlericalism. Geoffrey L. Dipple. *Archive for Reformation History*, 87 (1996), 38-56.

Das Gespänn Cochläus/Dietenberger im Kampf gegen Luther. Adotf Laube. *Archive for Reformation History*, 87 (1996), 119-135.

Margareta von Treskow, eine unbekannte Flugschriftenverfasserin der Reformationszeit. Gisela Möncke. *Zeitschrift für Kirchengeschichte*, 108 (2, 1997), 176-186.

Rural Organization and Receptivity to Protestantism in Sixteenth-Century Europe. Rosemary L. Hopcroft. *Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion*, 36 Cune, 1997), 158-181.

The Reformation and Parish Morality in Brandenburg-Ansbach-KUmbach. C. Scott Dixon. *Archive for Reformation History*, 87 (1996), 255-286.

Reformierte Sittenzucht zwischen kommunaler und territorialer Organisation: Graubünden, 16.-18. Jahrhundert. Ulrich Pfister. *Archive for Reformation History*, 87 (1996), 287-333.

Penitence and Prophecy: George Cavendish on the Last State of Cardinal Wolsey R. H. BritneU. *Journal of Ecclesiastical History*, 48 (Apr., 1997), 263-281.

Reformatörischer BUndersturm—Export ins Nichts? Skulpturen zwischen ökonomischer und karitativer Verwertung. Jörg Rosenfeld. *Archive for Reformation History*, 87 (1996), 74-89.

Paulus Volzcius Offenburgensis—Benediktinermönch zwischen Reform und Reformation. Eugen Hillenbrand. *Freiburger Diözesan-Archiv*, 116 (1996), 5-20.

Der Apostel Thomas in China. Die Herkunft einer Tradition. Jürgen Tubach. *Zeitschrift für Kirchengeschichte*, 108 (1, 1997), 58-74.

Andersheit und Kommunikation. Das Missionsverständnis Francisco de Vitorias (1546). Michael Sievernich. *Neue Zeitschrift für Missionswissenschaft*, 53 (2, 1997), 81-98.

- Calvin and the Libri Carolini. James R. Payton Jr. *Sixteenth Century Journal*, XXVIII (Summer, 1997), 467-480.
- The Lectures of John Calvin and the Nature of His Audience, 1555-1564. Peter Wilcox. *Archive for Reformation History*, 87 (1996), 136-148.
- Charity and State Bounding in Cinquecento Florence: Vincenzo Borghini as Administrator of the Ospedale degli Innocenti. Philip Gaxitt. *Journal of Modern History*, 69 (June, 1997), 230-270.
- Ein religiöses Mahnschreiben Kaiser Ferdinands I. Ernst Laubach. *Archive for Reformation History*, 87 (1996), 90-118.
- Ferdinando dei Medici: la formazione di un cardinale principe (1563-72). Stefano Calonaci. *Archivio Storico Italiano*, CLIV (JV, 1996), 635-690.
- The Limitation of Statutes: Elizabethan Schemes to Reform New Foundation Cathedral Statutes. James Saunders. *Journal of Ecclesiastical History*, 48 (July, 1997), 445-467.
- Konfessionelle Bildpropaganda des späten 16. Jahrhunderts: Die Nas-Fischart-Kontroverse 1568/71. Harry Oelke. *Archive for Reformation History*, 87 (1996), 149-200.
- Paolo Sarpi a Milano giovane collaboratore del cardinale Carlo Borromeo (1574-1575). Davide Maria Montagna, O.S.M. *Studi Storici dell'Ordine dei Servi di Maria*, XLVI (I-II, 1996), 245-257.
- Georges Klontzas et l'image de l'union des églises. Lydie Hadermann-Misguich. *Byzantion*, LXVI (2, 1996), 346-350.
- Moral Supervision and Poor Relief in the Reformed Church of DeUtrecht, 1579-1609. Charles H. Parker. *Archive for Reformation History*, 87 (1996), 334-361.
- Fuippo Neri, il santo di Roma. Alessandro Scurani, S.I. *Civiltà Cattolica*, 148, 1 (Mar. 1, 1997), 452-460.
- San Pietro Canisio. Julius Oswald, S.I. *Civiltà Cattolica*, 148, 1 (Mar. 15, 1997), 543-557.

SEVENTEENTH AND EIGHTEENTH CENTURIES

- The Consistory of the Scots Church, Rotterdam: An Aspect of "Civic Calvinism," c. 1600-1800. Rab Houston, *Archive for Reformation History*, 87 (1996), 362-392.
- Das Testament und das Glaubensbekenntnis des todkranken 21-jährigen Johann Gerhard (1603): Kritische Edition und Kommentar. Johann Anselm Steiger. *Archive for Reformation History*, 87 (1996), 201-254.
- Loyalty, Religion and State Power in Early Modern England: English Romanism and the Jacobean Oath of Allegiance. M. C. Questier. *Historical Journal*, 40 (June, 1997) 311-329.

- La lunga stagione della caccia alle streghe in Val Leventina. L'opéra repressiva del Magnifico Ufficio di Faido nel XVII secolo. Matteo Scanni. *Nuova Rivista Storica*, LXXX (Jan-Apr., 1997), 131-158.
- An Oxford College, Two Parishes and a Tithe-Farmer: The Modernisation of Tithe Collection. A. W. Purdue. *Rural History*, 8 (Apr., 1997), 1-19.
- Un Masaniello quacchero: James Nayler. Stefano ViUani. *Rivista di Storia e Letteratura Religiosa*, XXXIII (1, 1997), 67-91.
- Lo studio di Chieti per la formazione dei chierici nella corrispondenza dei PP Generali. Osvaldo Tosti. *Archivum Scholarum Piarum*, XXI (No. 41, 1997), 203-283.
- The Worcester House Declaration and the Restoration of the Church of England. Barry TiU. *Historical Research*, LXX (June, 1997), 203-230.
- La querelle des hôpitaux à Nîmes au XVIIIe siècle. Jacques Perrier. *Bulletin de la Société de l'Histoire du Protestantisme Français*, 143 (Apr.-June, 1997), 165-173.
- William Rogers and His Correspondence. John Fendley. *Recusant History*, 23 (May, 1997), 285-317.
- To Make a Martyr. The Popish Plot and Protestant Propaganda. Alan Marshall. *History Today*, 47 (Mar, 1997), 39-45.
- Nicolas Rouand (1642-1678), Claude-François Poupart des Places (1679-1709) et la dévotion à la Sainte-Famille. Yves Poutet. *Mémoire Spiritaine*, No. 5 (1, 1997), 24-32.
- Essai sur le charisme spiritain au fil de l'histoire, de 1703 à 1839. Henry J. Koren. *Mémoire Spiritaine*, No. 5 (1, 1997), 7-23.
- Staatsbeamter und katholischer Bischof—Joseph Vitus Burg (1768-1833) aus Offenburg zwischen Historiographie und Ideologie. Hubert WoU. *Freiburger Diözesan-Archiv*, 116 (1996), 41-59.
- Les protestants dans la ville: Lyon vers 1789. Yves Krumenacker. *Bulletin de la Société de l'Histoire du Protestantisme Français*, 143 (Apr.-June, 1997), 175-186.
- Dom Joseph Cuthbert Wilks (1748-1829) and English Benedictine Involvement in the Cisalpine States. Geoffrey Scott, O.S.B. *Recusant History*, 23 (May, 1997), 318-340.
- Goethes Kritik am Christentum in den Venezianischen Epigrammen (1790). Konrad Rahe. *Zeitschrift für Kirchengeschichte*, 108 (2, 1997), 187-212.
- Le discours de Mirabeau (1749-1791) sur le célibat des prêtres. Jerom Ver-cruyse. *Lias*, 23 (2, 1996), 261-320.
- Franz Xaver von Neveu (1749-1828)—Ein Offenburger auf dem Basler Bischofsstuhl. Marco Jorio. *Freiburger Diözesan-Archiv*, 116 (1996), 21-40.
- Incredulità e rigenerazione nella Lombardia del triennio repubblicano. Luciano Guerci. *Rivista Storica Italiana*, CLX (1, 1997), 49-120.

- Una devozione politica tra '800 e '900. Daniele Menozzi. *Rivista di Storia e Letteratura Religiosa*, XXXIII (1, 1997), 29-65.
- From Hagiography to History: A Critical Re-examination of the Forty Years of "The Life" of Mother Margaret HaUahan and of Its Manuscript Sources. Stephen H. Hancock. *Recusant History*, 23 (May, 1997), 341-371.
- Die Konkordatspolitik des Kurerzkanzlers und Fürstprimas Karl Theodor von Dalberg und seines Konstanzer Generalvikars Ignaz Heinrich von Wessenberg in den Jahren 1803 bis 1815. Franz Xaver Bischof. *Zeitschrift für Kirchengeschichte*, 108 (1, 1997), 75-92.
- Wellington and the "Open Question": The Issue of Catholic Emancipation, 1821-1829. Richard W Davis. *Albion*, 29 (Spring, 1997), 39-55.
- Sulla genesi delle Cinque piaghe di Antonio Rosmini. Paolo Marangon. *Rivista di Storia e Letteratura Religiosa*, XXXIII (1, 1997), 93-129.
- Religion, Gender and Education in a Durham Parish during the Early Nineteenth Century. James A. Jaffe. *Journal of Ecclesiastical History*, 48 (Apr, 1997), 282-301.
- Gladstone and German Liberal Catholicism. Peter C. Erb. *Recusant History*, 23 (May, 1997), 450-469.
- 1848: Un clergé démocrate dans les vieilles colonies françaises. Philippe Deslé. *Mémoire Spiritaine*, No. 5 (1, 1997), 136-146.
- Un réseau ultramontain en France au milieu du 19^e siècle. Daniel Moulinet. *Revue d'Histoire Ecclésiastique*, XCII (Jan.-Mar., 1997), 70-125.
- Newman and "The Philosophy of Byron." John R. Griffin. *Cristianesimo nella Storia*, XVm (Feb., 1997), 77-90.
- The Catholic, the Irish Delinquent, and the Origins of Reformatory Schools in Nineteenth Century England and Scotland. John A. Stack. *Recusant History*, 23 (May, 1997), 372-388.
- Bishop Turner, the Salford Diocese and Reformatory Provision, 1854-1872. David Lannon. *Recusant History*, 23 (May, 1997), 389-407.
- Episcopal Authority and Clerical Democracy: Diocesan Synods in Liverpool in the 1850s. Peter Doyle. *Recusant History*, 23 (May, 1997), 418-433.
- Lettre des fils du pasteur Jacques Reclus à Zoé Tuyès (Steeg), 1856-1863. Lucien Carrive. *Bulletin de la Société de l'Histoire du Protestantisme Français*, 143 (Apr.-June, 1997), 189-244.
- Le Père Jules Leman et la fondation du collège de Blackrock, en Irlande. Sean Farragher. *Mémoire Spiritaine*, No. 5 (1, 1997), 37-62.
- L'éphémère fondation de Notre-Dame d'Afrique d'après un témoin oculaire. Bernard Ardura. *Analecta Praemonstratensia*, LXXIII (1-2, 1997), 75-104.
- Et in Suburbia Ego: Father Bampneld and the Institute of St. Andrew. Stewart M. Foster, O.S.M. *Recusant History*, 23 (May, 1997), 434-449.

- DaUe soppressioni aUa rinascita: U sine proprio neUa prospettiva di una "histoUe au ras du sol." Giuseppe Buffon, O.F.M. Antonianum, LXXII (Apr.-June, 1997), 261-301.
- L'Amitié Batiffol-Lagrange. Bernard Montagnes. Bulletin de Littérature Ecclésiastique, XCVIII Oan.-Mar., 1997), 3-20.
- Theodor Wacker (1845-1921). Hugo Ott. Freiburger Diözesan-Archiv, 116 (1996), 61-78.
- La Nunziatura di Parigi. PoUtica e reUgione a fine Ottocento. Laura CivUiini. Nuova Rivista Storica, LXXX (Jan.-Apr., 1997), 101-130.
- ColoniaUsm, Corporeality and Character: Methodist Missions and the Refashioning of Bodies Ui the Pacific. Richard Eves. History and Anthropology, 10 (1, 1996) 85-138.
- La provincia Piceno-Piemontese dei Servi di Maria (1890-1899). Franco Maria AzzaUi, O.S.M. Studi Storici dell'Ordine dei Servi di Maria, XLVI (I-II, 1996), 165-220.
- St. Edmund's CoUege, Ware and St. Edmund's CoUege, Cambridge: Historical Connections and Early Tribulations. V Alan McClelland. Recusant History, 23 (May, 1997), 470-482.
- Faith in the Nation? The Church of England in the 20th Century. Andrew Chandler. History Today, 41 (May, 1997), 9-15.
- L'envoi de Prémontrés à Madagascar. Vingt et une lettres du P. Godefroid Madelaine en 1901. Dominique-Marie Dauzet. Analecta Praemonstratensia, LXXIII (1-2, 1997), 105-135.
- Premiers contacts des spiritains avec les peuples de la région centrale du Nigeria. Vincent O'Toole. Mémoire Spiritaine, No. 5 (1, 1997), 63-92.
- Joseph Schmidlin—Deutung und WirkUchkeit. Zum Aufsatz "Zwischen Vision und Sendung" von Horst Rzepkowski. Karl MüUer. Neue Zeitschrift für Missionswissenschaft, 53 (2, 1997), 115-129.
- "White Bolsheviks"? The CathoUc Left and the SociaUsts Ui Italy 1919-1920. John M. Foot. Historical Journal, 40 Qune, 1997), 415-433.
- Prisoner of History: The Eastern Orthodox Church in Poland in the Twentieth Century. Edward D. Wynot, Jr. Journal of Church and State, 39 (Spring, 1997), 319-338.
- Da Paolo Ubaldi a Giuseppe Lazzati: la Letteratura cristiana antica neU'Università Cattolica del S. Cuore. Luigi E Pizzolato. ^wwra, LXXI (Jan.-Apr., 1997), 153-180.
- Monks and Ecumenism: The Case of Lambert Beauduin. Patrick Lyons, O.S.B. American Benedictine Review, 48 (June, 1997), 129-160.
- Tout ou rien: Soeur IsabeUe Joantéquy (1895-1942). Soeur Paul GUolet. Mémoire Spiritaine, No. 5 (1, 1997), 93-106.

- Frömmigkeit und KonfessionaUsmus in der Diaspora. Zur Mission eines adeligen Kapuziners in Lettland (1929-1984). Bernhard Löffler. *Archiv für Kulturgeschichte*, 79 (1, 1997), 123-151.
- Metarezension zu ErzbischofJaeger im Dritten Reich. Heribert Gruß. *Theologie und Glaube*, 87 (2, 1997), 266-278.
- "Aufhebung" und Weiterleben der theologischen Fakultät Innsbruck (1938-1945): Fakten, Reaktionen und Hintergründe während des Zweiten Weltkriegs. Karl-?. Neufeld. *Zeitschrift für Katholische Theologie*, 119 (1, 1997), 27-50.
- EngUsh CathoUcs and the Proposed Soviet Alliance, 1939: James Flint, O.S.B. *Journal of Ecclesiastical History*, 48 Ouly 1997), 468-484.
- Die Bedeutung von Kirche, Religion und christlichem Glauben im Umkreis der Attentäter des 20. Juli 1944. Christoph Strohm. *Zeitschrift für Kirchengeschichte*, 108 (2, 1997), 213-235.
- U gesuita Giovanni Fausti secondo la testimonianza del p. Giuseppe Valentini. Vincenzo Poggi, S.I. *Civiltà Cattolica*, 148, II (Apr. 5, 1997), 43-52.
- "Hofprediger der Demokratie" Evangelische Akademien und poUtische BÜdung in den Anfangsjahren der Bundesrepublik Deutschland. Leonore Siegele-Wenschkewitz. *Zeitschrift für Kirchengeschichte*, 108 (2, 1997), 236-252.
- Women and the Significance of ReUgion in Australia. Roger C. Thompson. *Sins of Omission? Women in the History of Australian ReUgion and ReUgion in the History of Australian Women. A Reply to Roger Thompson*. Anne O'Brien. *Australian Historical Studies*, 28 (Apr, 1997), 118-135.

AMERICAN AND CANADIAN

- Roman CathoUcs, Not Papists: Catholic Identity in Maryland, 1689-1776. Beatriz Betancourt Hardy. *Maryland Historical Magazine*, 92 (Summer, 1997), 139-161.
- A Plea for Maryland CathoUcs Reconsidered. Tricia T. Pyne. *Maryland Historical Magazine*, 92 (Summer, 1997), 163-181.
- New Divinity Schools of the Prophets, 1750-1825: A Case Study in Ministerial Education. David W Kling. *History of Education Quarterly*, 37 (Summer, 1997), 185-206.
- From Linares to Galveston: Texas in the Diocesan Scheme of the CathoUc Church to the Mid-Nineteenth Century. Patrick Foley. *Catholic Southwest*, 8 (1997), 25-44.
- EUzabeth Seton—Mission of Education: Faith and Willingness to Risk. Betty Ann McNeU, D.C. *Vincentian Heritage*, XVU (3, 1996), 185-199-
- The Sisters of Charity in Cincinnati: 1829-1852. Judith Metz, S.C. *Vincentian Heritage*, xyil (3, 1996), 201-244.

- An HeU or a Rebel? Charles Grandison Finney and the New England Theology. AUen C. Guelzo. *Journal of the Early Republic*, 17 (Spring, 1997), 61-94.
- Wilhelm Lohe. (Jerhard H. Mundinger. *Concordia Historical Institute Quarterly*, 70 (Spring, 1997), 2-19.
- RudoU Lange's Letter Written One Year before the Founding of the Missouri Synod. Edward J. Arndt. *Concordia Historical Institute Quarterly*, 70 (Spring, 1997), 21-37.
- Early Years of C. A. T. SeUe: An Autobiography. William H. Nielsen and George R. Nielsen (Trans, and Ed.). *Concordia Historical Institute Quarterly*, 70 (Summer, 1997), 53-69.
- Ulysses S. Grant, Nativist. Tyler Anbinder. *Civil War History*, 43 (June, 1997), 119-141.
- They Ventured to Texas: The European Heritage of Women ReUigious in the Nineteenth Century. M. Monica LaFleur, C.C.V.I. *Catholic Southwest*, 8 (1997), 45-64.
- Reclaiming the Land of the Bible: Missionaries, Secularism, and EvangeUcal Modernity. Ussama Makdisi. *American Historical Review*, 102 (June, 1997), 680-713.
- "Among These American Heathens": CongregationaUst Missionaries and African American Evangelicals during Reconstruction, 1865-1878. Karin L. Zipf. *North Carolina Historical Review*, LXXIV (Apr., 1997), 111-134.
- A Conflict of Associations: The National Camp-Meeting Association for the Promotion of Holiness Versus the Methodist Episcopal Church. A. Gregory Schneider. *Church History*, 66 (June, 1997), 268-283.
- Sin and Grace on the Cattlemen's Frontier. Thomas W. Spalding, CEX. *Records of the American Catholic Historical Society of Philadelphia*, 107 (FaU-Winter, 1996), 65-75.
- Sargent's Truncated Triumph: Art and Religion at the Boston PubUc Library, 1890-1925. Sally M. Promey *Art Bulletin*, LXXIX (June, 1997), 217-250.
- Segregated CathoUcism: The Origins of Saint Katharine's Parish, New Orleans. Douglas J. Slawson. *Vincentian Heritage*, XYII (3, 1996), 140-184.
- The Founding and Early Expansion of the Salesian Work in the San Francisco Area from Archival Documents, Part II: Early Expansion (1897-1910). Arthur J. Lenti, S.D.B. *Journal of Salesian Studies*, VIII (Spring, 1997), 21-90.
- Canada: Naissance de la province spiritaine. Gaétan Renaud. *Mémoire Spiritaine*, Kio. 5 (1, 1997), 107-135.
- A Very FuU and Happy Life: Kathleen Thompson Norris and Popular Novels for Women. Una M. Cadegan. *Records of the American Catholic Historical Society of Philadelphia*, 107 (Fall-Winter, 1996), 19-38.



- An Alliance of Convenience: Independent Exhibitors and Purity Crusaders Battle Hollywood, 1920-1940. David A. Horowitz. *The Historian*, 59 (Spring, 1997), 553-572.
- Segregation and Desegregation at The Catholic University of America. C. Joseph Nuesse. *Washington History*, 9 (Spring/Summer, 1997), 54-70.
- Thinking on One's Own: Catholicism in the American Intellectual Imagination, 1928-1960. John T. McGreevy. *Journal of American History*, 84 (June, 1997), 97-131.
- Paul Hanly Furfey: Insights from a Spiritual Pilgrimage. Bruce H. Lescher. *Records of the American Catholic Historical Society of Philadelphia*, 107 (Fall-Winter, 1996), 39-63.
- From the Ranks of the Ordinary People: Father Cox and Pittsburgh in the 1940s. Sally Witt. *Pittsburgh History*, 80 (Summer, 1997), 52-59.
- Evangelist Percy Crawford and The King's College in Delaware, 1941-1955. Gerald F. Vaughn. *Delaware History*, XXVII (Spring-Summer, 1996; Fall-Winter, 1996-97), 19-41.
- In the Court of the "Queen of Sciences." Sandra Yocum Mize. *Records of the American Catholic Historical Society of Philadelphia*, 107 (Fall-Winter, 1996), 1-18.
- The Religious Sculpture of Charles Umlauf. Francine Carraro. *Catholic Southwest*, 8 (1997), 65-88.
- The Relationship of Werner Elert and America. Lowell C. Green. *Concordia Historical Institute Quarterly*, 70 (Summer, 1997), 75-93.
- A Catholic for President? John E. Kennedy and the "Secular" Theology of the Houston Speech, 1960. Mark S. Massa. *Séjournaï of Church and State*, 39 (Spring, 1997), 297-317.
- The Catholic Archives at San Antonio: Twenty-Five Years of Preserving the Historical Treasures of the Church in South Texas. Robert D. Kinna. *Catholic Southwest*, 8 (1997), 89-116.

LATIN AMERICAN

- Bartolomé de Las Casas. Eine advokatorische Ethik im Disput um die Legitimität der spanischen Conquista. Matthias Gillner. *Theologie und Glaube*, 87 (2, 1997), 245-259.
- Los últimos denigradores residuales de Las Casas. Juan Luis Becerra García. *Enrique Díaz Araujo*. Isacio Pérez Fernández, O.P. *Studium*, XXXVII (1, 1997), 61-107.
- La buena nueva de la revolución del poncho. Agustín Bravo Muñoz. *Cristianesimo nella Storia*, XNUI (Feb., 1997), 91-134.
- Libertação e alteridade—25 anos de historia da Teologia da Libertação. José Ramos Regidor. *Revista Eclesiástica Brasileira*, LVII (Mar., 1997), 118-138.

OTHER BOOKS RECEIVED

[Books that were sent to scholars to be reviewed but of which no review has been received are indicated by an asterisk.]

- Archivi (Gli) dei partiti politici. Atti dei seminari di Roma, 30 giugno 1994, e di Perugia, 25-26 ottobre 1994. [Pubblicazioni degli Archivi di Stato, Saggi 39] (Rome: Ministero per i beni culturali e ambientali, Ufficio centrale per i beni archivistici. 1996. Pp. 419. Paperback.)
- Archivi (Gli) per la storia dell'alimentazione. Atti del convegno Potenza-Matera, 5-8 settembre 1988. Vols. I-III. [Pubblicazioni degli Archivi di Stato, Saggi 34.] (Rome: Ministero per i beni culturali e ambientali, Ufficio centrale per i beni archivistici. 1995. Pp. 717; 719-1359; 1361-2029. Paperback.)
- "Atkin, Nicholas. Church and Schools in Vichy France, 1940-1944. [A Garland Series of Outstanding Studies and Dissertations: Modern European History: France.] (New York: Garland Publishing, Inc. 1992. Pp. xiv, 269. \$63.00.)
- Aubert, R. (Ed.). Dictionnaire d'Histoire et de Géographie Ecclésiastiques. Fascicule 150: Iriberry-Isle; Fascicule 151: Isle-Izvorov; Fascicules 152-153: Izvorov-Japon. (Paris: Letouzey et Ané. [1995; 1996; 1997.] Col. 1-256; 257-512; 513-1024. 265 FE; 288 FE; 535 FF. paperback.)
- Autorité (L) et les autorités en régime de civilisation chrétienne. Tome XVIII: L'Hérésie, Documents de travail, 1994-1995; and Tome XLX: La Tolérance, Documents de travail, 1995-1996; Séminaire de Bernard Plonger, Cycle des études du doctorat. (Paris: Institut Catholique de Paris. 1995; 1996. Pp. 178; 169. Paperback.)
- Bidischini, Elisabetta, and Leonardo Musci (Eds.). Guida agli archivi storici delle Camere di commercio italiane. [Pubblicazioni degli Archivi di Stato, Strumenti CXXVII, Unione italiana delle Camere di Commercio, industria, artigianato e agricoltura.] (Rome: Ministero per i beni culturali e ambientali, Ufficio centrale per i beni archivistici. 1996. Pp. 194.)
- Bologna, Marco (Ed.). Gli Archivi Pallavicini di Genova, II: Archivi aggregati. [Pubblicazioni degli Archivi di Stato, Strumenti CXXVIII, Atti della Società Ligure di Storia Patria, Nuova Serie, Vol. XXXV (CLX), Fase. II] (Rome: Ministero per i beni culturali e ambientali, Ufficio centrale per i beni archivistici. 1996. Pp. 473. Paperback.)
- Carucci, Paola, Fabrizio Dolci, and Mario Missori (Eds.). Volantini antifascisti nelle carte della Pubblica sicurezza (1926-1943). [Pubblicazioni degli

- Archivi di Stato, Strumenti CXXIV, Archivio Centrale dello Stato.] (Rome: Ministero per i beni culturali e ambientali, Ufficio centrale per i beni archivistici. 1995. Pp. 241. Paperback.)
- "Clark, Elizabeth A. The Origenist Controversy: The Cultural Construction of an Early Christian Debate. (Princeton: Princeton University Press. 1992. Pp. xv, 287. \$45.00.)
- "Cummins, J. S. A Question of Rites: Friar Domingo Navarrete and the Jesuits in China. Brookfield, Vt.: Scholar Press. 1993. Pp. xvi, 349. \$67.95.)
- "Dodson, Michael, and Laura Nuzzi O'Shaughnessy. Nicaragua's Other Revolution: Religious Faith and Political Struggle. (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press. 1990. Pp. xii, 279. \$39.95 cloth; \$12.95 paper.)
- Errera, Andrea. Arbor Actionum: Genere letterario e forma di classificazione delle azioni nella dottrina dei glossatori. [Archivio per la storia del Diritto, medioevale e moderno, 1.] (Bologna: Monduzzi Editore. 1995. Pp. xv, 406.)
- Feloni, Giuseppe (Ed.). Inventario dell'Archivio del Banco di San Giorgio (1407-1805), vol. IV: Debito pubblico, Tomo 7 and Tomo 8. [Pubblicazioni degli Archivi di Stato, Archivio di Stato di Genova.] (Rome: Ministero per i beni culturali e ambientali, Ufficio centrale per i beni archivistici. 1996. Pp. 374; 403. Paperback.)
- Fin du monde et signes des temps: Visionnaires et prophètes en France méridionale (fin XIIF-début XV siècle). [Cahiers de Fanjeux, Collection d'histoire religieuse du Languedoc aux XHP et XIVe siècles, 27.] (Toulouse: Éditions Privat. 1992. Pp. 396. 155 F. paperback.) Contents: I. "L'attente eschatologique autour de 1300": Edith Pasztor, "L'apport de Raoul Mansueti à l'histoire de l'eschatologie médiévale" (pp. 21-31); Paul Amargier, "Robert d'Uzès revisité," Annexe, "Les testaments de Robert d'Uzès (1293)" (pp. 33-47); Glauco Barone, "L'oeuvre eschatologique de Pierre Jean-Olieu et son influence. Un bilan historiographique" (pp. 49-61); Roberto Rusconi, "A la recherche des traces authentiques de Joachim de Flore dans la France méridionale" (pp. 63-80); Claude Carozzi, "Extase et visions chez Frère Roger de Provence" (pp. 81-105); Francesco Santi, "La vision de la fin des temps chez Arnaud de Villeneuve. Contenu théologique et expérience mystique" (pp. 107-127); Hélène Millet et Dominique Rigaux, "Aux origines du succès des Vaticinia de summis pontificibus" (pp. 129-156); II. "Crise et espoir de renouveau de la papauté d'Avignon au Grand Schisme": Louis Boisset, "Hommage à Madame Jeanne Bignami Odier" (pp. 159-170); Sylvie Barnay "L'univers visionnaire de Jean de Roquetaillade" (pp. 171-190); Martine Aurel, "Eschatologie, spirituelle et politique dans la confédération catalano-aragonaise (1282-1412)" (pp. 191-235); Colette Beaune, "Perceforest et Merlin. Prophétie, littérature et rumeurs au début de la guerre de Cent-Ans" (pp. 237-255); Jean-Patrice Boudet, "La papauté d'Avignon et l'astrologie," Appendice: "Epistola magistri Johannis de Mûris ad dementem sextum" (pp. 257-293); André Vernet, "Les visions cos-

miques d'Opicinius de Canistris" (pp. 295-307); Matthew Tobin, "Les visions et révélations de Marie Robine d'Avignon, dans le contexte prophétique des années 1400" (pp. 309-329); Bernard Montagnes, "Prophétisme et eschatologie dans la prédication méridionale de saint Vincent Ferrier"(pp. 331-349).

"Flaxman, Radegunde. *A Woman Styled Bold: The Life of Cornelia Connelly, 1809-1879*. (London: Darton, Longman and Todd. 1991. Pp. xvi, 363. £30.00.)

Fonti archivistiche e ricerca demografica. Atti del convegno internazionale, Trieste, 23-26 aprile 1990. Vols. I and II. [Pubblicazioni degli Archivi di Stato, Saggi 37.] (Rome: Ministero per i beni culturali e ambientali, Ufficio centrale per i beni archivistici. 1996. Pp. 723; 725-1498. Paperback.)

Fonti e problemi della politica coloniale italiana. Atti del convegno Taormina-Messina, 23-29 ottobre 1989. Vols. I and II. [Pubblicazioni degli Archivi di Stato, Saggi 38.] (Rome: Ministero per i beni culturali e ambientali, Ufficio centrale per i beni archivistici. 1996. Pp. 631; 633-1277. Paperback.)

Ford John T, C.S.C. (Ed.). *Religious Liberty: Paul VI and Dignitatis Humanae*. A Symposium Sponsored by The Istituto Paolo VI and The Catholic University of America, Washington, D.C, 3-5 June 1993. [Pubblicazioni dell'Istituto Paolo VI, 16.] (Brescia: Istituto Paolo VI; Rome: Edizioni Studium. 1995. Pp. viii, 202. Lire 40.000 paperback.)

"Franchi, Antonino. *Il Conclave di Viterbo (1268-1271) e le sue origini*. (Assisi: Distributed by Edizioni Porziuncola. 1993. Pp. 125.)

"Gameson, Richard (Ed.). *The Early Medieval Bible: Its Production, Decoration and Use*. [Cambridge Studies in Palaeography and Codicology] (New York: Cambridge University Press. 1994. Pp. xiv, 242. \$64.95.)

"Gerrish, B. A. *Continuing the Reformation: Essays on Modern Religious Thought*. (Chicago: University of Chicago Press. 1993. Pp. xvi, 283. \$49.00 cloth; \$19.95 paper.)

Kremer, Klaus, and Klaus Reinhardt (Eds.). *Unsterblichkeit und Eschatologie im Denken des Nikolaus von Kues*. Akten des Symposiums in Trier vom 19. bis 21. Oktober 1995. [Mitteilungen und Forschungsbeiträge des Cusanus-Gesellschaft, 23] (Trier: Paulinus-Verlag. 1996. Pp. xv, 200. DM 58 paperback.)

Kulczycki, John J. *The Polish Coal Miners' Union and the German Labor Movement in the Ruhr, 1902-1934: National and Social Solidarity*. (New York: Berg. 1997. Pp. xv, 283. \$46.00.)

"Lefebvre, Philippe. *Les pouvoirs de la parole: L'Église et Rousseau (1762-1848)*. (Paris: Les Éditions du Cerf. 1992. Pp. 491. 195 F paperback.)

Magistere e pietà mariana in Giovanni Battista Montini-Paolo VI. Giornata di Studio in collaborazione con l'Istituto Superiore Marchigiano di Scienze Religiose "Redemptoris Mater!" Loreto, 6 maggio 1995. [Pubbl-

- cazioni deU'Istituto Paolo VI, 18.] (Brescia: Istituto Paolo VI; Rome: Edizioni Studium. 1996. Pp. 117. lire 25.000 paperback.)
- "Not siamo Chiesa": Un Appelle dal popólo di Dio: "Pitt democrazia nella Chiesa." Il dibattito in corso sul grande movimento popolare nella Chiesa cattolica. Introduction by Luigi Sandri. [Nostro tempo, 54.] (Turin: Claudiana. 1996. Pp. 239. Lire 28.000 paperback.)
- "Ocker, Christopher. Johannes Klenkok. A Friar's Life, c. 1310-1374. [Transactions of the American PhUosophical Society Volume 83, Part 5.] (PhUadelphia: The American PhUosophical Society. 1993. Pp. viii, 116. \$15.00 Paperback.)
- Rabinow, Paul. Essays on the Anthropology of Reason. [Princeton Studies in Culture/Power/History.] (Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press. 1996. Pp. xvU, 190. \$14.95 paperback.)
- "Richard, Jean, and Louis O'NeiU (Eds.). La question sociale hier et aujourd'hui: Colloque du centenaire de "Rerum Novarum." 12 au 17 mai 1991, Université Laval, Québec. (Sainte-Foy, Québec: Les Pressses de l'Université Laval. 1993. Pp. x, 614. 49\$ Can.)
- Taft, Robert E, SJ. (Ed.). The Christian East: Its Institutions & Its Thought. A Critical Reflection. Papers of the International Scholarly Congress for the 75th Anniversary of the Pontifical Oriental Institute, Rome, 30 May-5 June 1993. [OrientaUa Christiana Analecta, 251.] (Rome: Pontificio Istituto Orientale. 1996. Pp. 704. Paperback.) Contents: I. Studying the Eastern Christian Churches: Major Papers: Vittorio Peri, "L'Oriente cristiano' a Roma neU'ultimo secólo" (pp. 21-54); Carmelo Capizzi, S.J., "La poUtica religiosa ed ecclesiastica di Giustiniano" (pp. 55-84); Emmanuel Lanne, O.S.B., "Un christianisme contesté: l'Orient cathoUque entre mythe et réaUté" (pp. 85-106); Christian Hannick, "ChristUch-orientalisches Denken Ln slavischer Umformung—Traditionsbewahrung und Entwicklung eigener Züge," (pp. 107-128); Michel van Esbroeck, SJ., "Perspectives pour l'étude des Eglises du Caucase" (pp. 129-144); André de HaUeux, O.F.M., "Vingt ans d'étude critique des EgUses Syriaques" (pp. 145-180); Ugo Zanetti, S.J., "Les chrétiennes du NU: Basse et Haute Egypte Nubie, Ethiopie" (pp. 181-216). Communications: Vincenzo Poggi, S.J., "I primi professori del Pontificio Istituto Orientale" (pp. 217-244); IL Eastern Christian ReUgiosity Expressed and Lived: Liturgy, Art, SpirituaUty, Popular ReUgosity: Major Papers: George T Dennis, SJ., "Popolar ReUgious Attitudes and Practices in Byzantium" (pp. 245-264); Gabriele Winkler, "Der armenische Ritus: Bestandsaufnahme und neue Erkenntnisse sowie einige kürzere Notizen zur Liturgie der Georgier" (pp. 265-298). Communications: Massimo Bernabö, "Tradizioni siriache neUe miniature degli Ottateuchi bizantini" (pp. 299-312); Pauline Donceel-Voüte, "La mise en scène de la Uturgie au Proche Orient rVe-LXe s.: les 'provinces Uturgiques' " (pp. 313-338); Cesare Giraudò, S.J., "Anafore d'Oriente per le Chiese d'Occidente" (pp. 339-352); Habtemichael-Kidane, "U 'Deggwa'—Ubro Uturgico deUa Chiesa d'Etioopia" (pp. 353-388); Adriana

Mitescu, "La spirituaUtà del sigiUo e del sacramento eucaristico negli 'Insegnamenti del principe Neagoe Basarab' e U 'Liturgijar' di Macarte" (pp. 389-426); Ionna Zervou-Tognazzi, "Testimonianza apostólica e iconiche anatiposis" (pp. 427-434); III. institutions and Social Structures Ln the Christian East: Major Papers: Angeliki E. Laiou, "The Church, Economic Thought and Economic Practice" (pp. 435-464); Spyros N. Troianos, "Ostkirche und profanes Recht" (pp. 465-484); Alexander Kazhdan, "ConstantinopóUtan Synaxarium as a Source for Social History of Byzantium" (pp. 485-516); Communications: Jan Sergiusz Gajek, M.I.C., "La realta ecclesiale neUa Comunità degli Stati Indipendenti—sfida aUa teología ecuménica" (pp. 517-530); IV: Eastern Christian Theology: Official Doctrine, Historical Reality, Modern Hermeneutics: Major Papers: Gerhard Podskalsky, S.J., "Ostkirchliche Theologie in der Westkirche: Alternative (Antithese), Annex oder AUeUmittel?" (pp. 531-542); Hans-Joachim Schulz, "Die Pneumatologie des hl. BasiUus: Impuls zur Neubesinnung auf die hermeneutische Struktur der Theologie und der kirchlichen Lehrverkündigung als bekenntnis- und liturgiebezogene Schriftauslegung" (pp. 543-564); Dorothea Wendebourg, "'Pseudomorphosis'—ein theologisches UrteU als Axiom der kirchen- und theologie-geschichtUchen Forschung" (pp. 565-590); Communications: Dimitry Afinogenov, "Iconoclasm and Ecclesiastical Freedom: Two Approaches in Ninth-Century Byzantium" (pp. 591-612); Miguel Ma Garjo-Guembe, "Die Komplementarität der Traditionen als methodisches Prinzip für den Dialog zwischen Orthodoxie und KathoUzismus" (pp. 613-630); Gorazd Kocijanlii, "He Who Is and Being: On the Postmodern Relevance of Eastern Christian Apophaticism" (pp. 631-650); SÜvia Ronchey "Il Martirio di San PoUcarpo e gU antichi Atti dei martiri da Baronio a oggi: dottrina ufficiale e realtà storica" (pp. 651-670); V The Prize-Winning "Joseph Essay": MaxweU E. Johnson, "The Archaic Nature of the Sanctus, Institution Narrative, and Epiclesis of the Logos m the Anaphora Ascribed to Sarapion of Thmuis"(pp. 671-702).

"Van AUen, Rodger. *Being Catholic: Comonweal, From the Seventies to the Nineties*. (Chicago: Loyola University Press. A Champion Book. 1993. Pp, xx, 203. \$12.95 paperback.)

Vaucher, André (Ed.). *La religion civique à l'époque médiévale et moderne. (Chrétienté et Islam)*. Actes du coUoque organisé par le Centre de recherche "Histoire sociale et cultureUe de l'Occident. XIF-XVIII siècle" de l'Université de Paris X-Nanterre et l'Institut universitaire de France (Nanterre, 21-23 juin 1993). [CoUection de l'École française de Rome, 213-] (Rome: École française de Rome. 1995. Pp. vi, 571. Paperback.) Partial contents: Michel Sot, "La topographie religieuse et la référence aux origines de l'église de Reims au Xe siècle" (pp. 9-19); Evelyne Patlagean, "L'entrée de la Sainte Face d'Edesse à Constantinople en 944" (pp. 21-35); Roberto Leggero, "Il diavolo, le reUquie e la rifondazione di Lodi" (pp. 37-45); Andrea TUatti, "DaU'agiografia aUa cronaca. Le Inventiones degU antichi patroni padovani fra interpretazione storiografica e svüoppo di una coscienza

cívica (secc. XI-XII)" (pp. 47-64); Antonio Rigon, "S. Antonio da 'Pater Padue' a 'Patronus civitatis'" (pp. 65-76); Anna Benvenuti, "I culti patronali tra memoria ecclesiastica e costruzione dell'identità cívica: l'esempio di Firenze" (pp. 99-118); Noël Coulet, "Dévotions communales: MarseiUe entre samt Victor, saint Lazare et saint Louis (XIIP-XV' siècle)" (pp. 119-133); Jacqueline HadziiossU, "L'ange custode de Valence" (pp. 135-151); Franco Cardini, "Crociata e religione cívica nell'ItaUa médiévale" (pp. 155-164); Pierre Kerbrat, "Corps des saints et contrôle civique à Bologne du XIP siècle au début du XVle siècle" (pp. 165-185); Daniel Bornstein, "Le ConseU des Dix et le contrôle de la vie religieuse à Venise à la fin du Moyen Âge" (pp. 187-200); Giuseppina De Sandre Gasparini, "L'amministrazione pubblica dell'evento reUgioso: qualche esempio deUa Terraferma véneta del secólo XV" (pp. 201-217); Cécile Caby, "Culte civique et inurbamento monastique en Italie à la fin du Moyen Âge. Le culte de b. Parisio de Trévisé" (pp. 219-234); Michelle Fournie, "Confréries, bassins et fabriques dans le Sud-Ouest de la France: des oeuvres municipales" (pp. 245-263); Marina Montesano, "Aspetti e conseguenze deUa predicazione cívica di Bernardino da Siena" (pp. 265-275); Darnel Russo, "ReUgion civique et art monumental à Florence au XIVe siècle. La décoration peinte de la salle capitulaire à Sainte-Marie-NouveUe" (pp. 279-296); Patricia H. Labalme, "ReUgious Devotion and Civic Division Ui Renaissance Venice: The Case of Lorenzo of Giustiniani" (pp. 297-308); Stanislaw Bylina, "La religion civique et la religion populaire en Pologne au bas Moyen Âge" (pp. 323-335); Bernard ChevaUer, "La religion civique dans les bonnes viUes: sa portée et ses limites. Le cas de Tours" (pp. 337-349); Jean-Michel Matz, "Le développement tardU d'une religion civique dans une vUe episcopale. Les processions à Angers (v. 1450-V.1550)" (pp. 351-366); Giulia Barone, "Le culte de Françoise Romaine: un exemple de religion civique?" (pp. 367-373); Paolo GolineUi, "Quando il santo non basta più: simboli cittadini non reUgiosi nell'Italia bassomedievale" (pp. 375-389); Dominique de CourceUes, "Les goigs dans l'économie paroissiale des diocèses catalans des XVle et XVIP siècle" (pp. 391-399); Joanna Cannon, "Marguerite et les Cortonais: iconographie d'un 'culte civique' au XIVe siècle" (pp. 403-413); Christian de Mérindol, "Iconographie du sceau de ville en France à l'époque médiévale et religion civique" (pp. 415-428); Catherine Vincent, "Lieux de piété et lieux de pouvoir à Poitiers entre le XIIP et le XVe siècle: la confrérie du Corps de ville dite aussi du Cent" (pp. 429-444); Martial Staub, "Eucharistie et bien commun. L'économie d'une nouveUe pratique fondatrice à l'exemple des paroisses de Nuremberg dans la seconde moitié du XVe siècle: sécularisation ou religion civique?" (pp. 445-470); Marc Venard, "La religion civique exprimée par l'image. Les saints tutélaires et protecteurs de l'ancienne cité d'Avignon" (pp. 471-479); Pierre Ragon, "Images miraculeuses, culte des saints et hispanité dans le Mexique colonial (1648-1737)" (pp. 481-495); Henri Bresc, "Conclusions" (pp. 497-511); Anne Benvenuti Papi, "BibUographie sur les formes de l'identité cívica à travers les cultes locaux dans l'Italie communale" (pp. 513-515).

- "Vazquez Janeiro, Isaac, O.F.M. (Ed.). *Caeli novi et terra nova: La evangelización del nuevo mundo a través de libros y documentos anteriores al 1600 existentes en el archivo y en la Biblioteca del Vaticano. Exposición conmemorativa, Sala Sixtina de la Biblioteca Vaticana (12 mayo- 12 octubre 1992)*. (Vatican City: Ciudad del Vaticano, Biblioteca Apostólica Vaticana. 1992. Pp. 258.)
- VitaU, Stefano, and Piero Giordanetti (Eds.). *Archivio Rodolfo Mondolfo. Inventari*. [Pubblicazioni degli Archivi di Stato, Strumenti CXXVI.] (Rome: Ministero per i beni culturali e ambientali, Ufficio centrale per i beni archivistici. 1996. Pp. 750. Paperback.)
- WUson, Thomas R. *St. Bernard Church, Mount Lebanon, Pennsylvania. Photography by Edward A. Massery assisted by Alexander Denmarsh. Design and art direction by Joseph Nicholas Kravec*. (Mt. Lebanon, Pa.: St. Bernard Church. 1995. Pp. 255.)
- Winkler, Gerhard (Ed.). *Bernhard von Clairvaux: Sämtliche Werke, lateinisch/deutsch, Band VII*. (Innsbruck: Tyrolia-Verlag. 1996. Pp. 776. DM 134.)