UTA-RENATE BLUMENTHAL

President of the

American Catholic Historical Association

1997

The Catholic Historical Review

VOL. LXXXIV APRIL, 1998 No. 2

THE PAPACY AND CANON LAW IN THE ELEVENTH-CENTURY REFORM

Uta-Renate Blumenthal*

In the eleventh and early twelfth century the age-old Christian concepts of individual renewal, renovation, restoration, and reformation took on a new and wider meaning. The ideal of individual Christian renewal was linked with the notion of the renewal of society as a whole, that is to say of the Church as a whole.1 This renewal, a remarkable unfolding of intellectual sophistication, coincided not only chronologically with what is justly called the "Twelfth-Century Renaissance"; it was part and parcel of the same developments.2 They were accompa-

*Dr. Blumenthal is a professor of history in the CathoUc University of America. She read this paper as her presidential address at a luncheon held in the Sheraton Seattle Hotel and Towers on Saturday, January 10, 1998, during the seventy-eighth annual meeting of the American Catholic Historical Association.

'For further literature see Gerhard B. Ladner, "Two Gregorian Letters: On the Sources and Nature of Gregory VH's Reform Ideology," Studi Gregoriani, 5 (1956), 221-242, esp. 224 f.with a quotation from a letter of Gregory VII:". . . Quapropter quod in ecclesia . . . corruptum fuit et est, nos ad honorem Dei et salutem totius christianitatis innovare et restaurare cupimus . . ." (JL 5006). Throughout this paper the abbreviation "JL" indicates the calendar of papal letters compiled by Vh.]aíié,Regesta pontiflcum romanorum, 2nd rev. ed., edd. S. Loewenfeld, F. Kaltenbrunner, and R Ewald (2 vols.; Leipzig, 1885 and 1888; reprint Graz, 1956).

The term, originally coined by Charles Homer Haskins in response to Jakob Burckhardt's concept of the Renaissance, has been confirmed in Robert Benson and GUes Constable with Carol D. Lanham, Renaissance and Renewal in the Twelfth Century (Cambridge, Massachusetts, 1982), celebrating the fiftieth anniversary of the publication of Haskins' Renaissance of the Twelfth Century (Cambridge, Massachusetts, 1927). Ecclesiastical renewal (cf. the remarks by the editors on p. xxviii) as well as the equally significant economic revival are not part of the considerations. See now Giles Constable, The Reformation of the Twelfth Century (Cambridge, England, 1996), and PhyUis G. Jestice,

nied by a new emphasis on ancient as well as familiar collections of canon law and the rediscovery of Roman law.3 My topic forms one aspect of this renaissance. Paul Fournier's famous papers on Roman canonical collections at the time of Gregory VII and on the pontificate of Urban II as a turning point in the history of canon law have provided an invaluable basis for much subsequent work, but they presupposed the "Gregorian" reform as a fait accompli, ascribing "Gregorian" collections to reformers in the circle of the contemporary pontiff, Gregory VII (1073-1085).4 I would like to look at canonistic materials, the reform, and the papacy from a different perspective. These remarks will explore canon law as origin, inspiration, and source for the renewal and reform of the Church in the eleventh century, particularly with regard to reform of and by the papacy.

Scholarship of the last decade or two has thoroughly revised the old assessment dating back at least to the Magdeburg Centuries that the eleventh-century reform was based on a rediscovery of the Pseudo-Isidorian forgeries, "Nicht Pseudo-Isidor, sondern die Kirche wurde neu entdeckt!" Horst Fuhrmann convincingly concluded his magisterial analysis of the fate of the False Decretals in Rome since the 870s. This fabrication, very likely compiled around 850 near or at Reims to defend episcopal rights, was available at the papal court and even cited haphazardly in papal letters for almost two hundred years before Pope Leo IX and his collaborators in December, 1053, used excerpts from the Decretals in support of their conviction of the pre-eminent place of the Roman See in correspondence with Africa (JL 4304, 4305) and Constantinople (esp. JL 4302).5 It has been said that in these letters "there

Wayward Monks and the Religious Revolution of the Eleventh Century (Leiden, New York, Cologne, 1997).

3For the latter, see Stephan Kuttner, "The Revival of Jurisprudence," in Renaissance and Renewal, pp. 299-323, esp. 304 ff.

4Paul Fournier, "Les Collections canoniques romaines de l'Epoque de Grégoire VII," Mémoires de l'Académie des Inscriptions et Belles-Lettres, 41 (1920), 271-396, and idem, "Un tournant de l'histoire du droit: 1060-1140," Nouvelle revue historique de droit français et étranger, 41 (1917), 129-180. Peter Landau recently upheld Fournier's point of view, but Landaus perspective is very different (Landau, "Wandel und Kontinuität," [as in ?. 9 below], pp. 229 f.).

5Horst Fuhrmann, Einfluß und Verbreitung der pseudoisidorischen Fälschungen von ihrem Auflauchen bis in die neuere Zeit ("Monumenta Germaniae Histórica," Schriften, Vol. 24/1-3 [Hanover, 1972, 1973, and 1974]) here Vol. 2, pp. 339-353, quotation on p. 353. For a different approach but similar conclusions see Ronald Knox, "Finding the Law; Developments in Canon Law during the Gregorian Reform," Studi Gregoriani, 9 (1972), 419-466.

appears a conception of the primacy differing significantly from that of the pre-reform period" with an emphasis on a second, alternative "Roman tradition" elaborated, for example, by Pope Leo I and Pope Gregory I. This second view, for centuries only a shadowy presence if that, sees Peter as princeps apostolorum and Rome "as head of all the churches." The concept was emphatically represented by the Constitutum Constantini.6 The "Donation of Constantine" used by the papacy in the letter of 1053 to Michael Kerullarios, patriarch of Constantinople, was ultimately derived from the version transmitted by the Pseudo-Isidorian Decretals.7 It may be said, therefore, that beginning Ln the 1050's papal letters increasingly paid attention to and used the Pseudo-Isidorian Decretals, not, however, that they were suddenly discovered in a forgotten, dusty corner of the papal archives. Pseudo-Isidore, therefore, does play a role in eleventh-century developments, constituting a ready reservoir of ringing statements about the nature of papal authority. They were modified and adapted without hesitation when they were at odds with eleventh-century views, but were invaluable nevertheless in providing legal support for both old and new themes. A comparison of Pseudo-Isidorian materials, both authentic and false, found in the Decretum of Burchard of Worms around 1022 with those found in Gratian's Decretum of 1140" revealed a stark numerical contrast: 141 excerpts in Burchard versus 400 in the case of Gratian, very largely a result of the activities of collectors between c. 1080 and 1 100.9

6I. S. Robinson,/l«f&orz'i)' and Resistance in the Investiture Contest: The Polemical Literature of the Late Eleventh Century (Manchester and New York, 1978), p. 26, with further Uterature in the notes on p. 52. Fuhrmann, op. cit. ,II, 353. For the Roman primacy in general see Hubert Mordek, "Der römische Primat in den Kirchenrechtssammlungen des Westens vom IV. bis VIIL Jahrhundert," in // Primato del vescovo di Roma nel primo millennio: Ricerche e testimonianze, ed. Michèle Maccarrone (Pontificio Comitato di Scienze Storiche, "Atti e documenti," Vol. 4; Atti del Symposium storico-teologico, Roma, 9-13 Ottobre 1989 [Vatican City, 1991], pp. 523-566, and Rudolf Schieffer,"Der Papst als Patriarch von Rom," in the same volume, pp. 433-451, and ibid., pp. 707-736, the stimulating paper of Horst Fuhrmann, "Widerstände gegen den päpstlichen Primat im Abendland."

'Fuhrmann, Einfluß und Verbreitung, II, 383-385.

The most recent article regarding Gratian's work is Anders Winroth,"The Two Recensions of Gratian's Decretum," Zeitschrift der Savigny-Stiflung für Rechtsgeschichte, Kan. Abt. 83 (1997), 22 ff.

'Peter Landau, "Wandel und Kontinuität im kanonischen Recht bei Gratian," in Sozialer Wandel im Mittelalter: Wahrnehmungsformen, Erklärungsmuster, Regelungsmechanismen, edd. J. Miethke and K. Schreiner (Sigmaringen, 1994), pp. 215-233, here p. 218 f. It should be noted that as Landau demonstrated " [es] erscheinen bei Gratian sehr häufig andere TextsteUen oder anders abgegrenzte Textfragmente als bei dem Wormser Bischof."

Old texts read from a new perspective could and did wreak havoc when they were used to take the measure of conventional ideas and customary practices. One dramatic illustration is a passage from the Romuald Vita of Peter Damián. Damián reminded readers how Romuald was almost slain by clerics who, Romuald claimed, were simonists, because money had changed hands at the time of their ordinations, a "custom [that] was widespread throughout that monarchy till the times of Romuald, and hardly anyone knew that this sin was the simoniacal heresy," Damián explains to his readers in an aside. Romuald saved himself, when he succeeded in persuading the clerics that they, indeed, were guilty of this crime. It was a simple task: he ordered them to get out their canonical collections: "Bring me your books of canons, and prove by the witness of your pages that I am speaking the truth!"[10] Enthusiastic and diligent search for what appeared useful among canonistic writings is documented again and again by mid-century. Anselm, the biographer of Bishop Wazo of Liège (d. 1048), recorded in the 1060's how Wazo, described as scrutator studiosissimus, and his assistants searched the gesta pontiftcum Romanorum, their decreta, and the auténticos cañones in order to come up with a correct response to an inquiry sent to the bishop by Emperor Henry III (d. 1054) in connection with the election of a successor to Pope Clement II (d. 1048). The reply declared that neither divine nor human laws anywhere—and the holy fathers agreed tam dictis quam scriptis—would state anything other than that the pope could be judged by no one except by God alone." There was nothing new about this argument except its application. It is for Bernold of Constance better than for anyone else that recent scholarship has succeeded in illustrating how manuscripts were studied with an eye for contemporary needs, how excerpts were made, and how citations found their way into new collections, letters, and trea-

[10] "Petri Damiani Vita beati Romualdi, ed. Giovanni Tabacco ("Fonti per la Storia d'Italia," Vol. 94 [Rome, 1957]), c. 35, here p. 75, lines 9-18; for further literature see J. Joseph Ryan, Saint Peter Damiani and His Canonical Sources (Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies, "Studies and Texts," Vol 2 [Toronto, 1956]), p. 23, text #2, and Hans Peter Laqua, Traditionen und Leitbilder bei dem Ravennater Reformer Petrus Damiani (1042-1052) ("Münstersche Mittelalter-Schriften," Vol 30 [Munich, 1976]), pp. 51 f., ?. 39 and esp. p. 54 with n. 49 with the suggestion that the text speaks to Damián rather than to Romuald.

[11] "Anselm, Gesta episcoporum leodiensium, c. 65, ed. R. Koepke ("Monumenta Germaniae Histórica," Scriptores, Vol. 7 [1846; repr. 1995]), pp. 228 f. See also Hartmut Hoffmann, "Von Cluny zum Investiturstreit," ^raf«'i>/«r Kulturgeschichte, 45 (1963), 165-203; repr. with additions in Cluny: Beiträge zu Gestalt und Wirkung der cluniazensischen Reform, ed. Helmut Richter ("Wege der Forschung," Vol. 241 [Darmstadt, 1975]), pp. 319-370, here 341ff.

tises. The hands of Bernold and of two other clerics at Constance have been identified in extant manuscripts. Marginal and interlinear glosses show how manuscripts were used as notebooks, consulted, discussed, and sometimes copied when Bernold was at work on his polemical letters. His high regard for the Council of Nicaea (325), his concern for priestly celibacy, but also his views on papal authority emerge as clearly from the glosses as do his scholarly skills and style of argumentation.12

The two most widely accepted theories regarding the roots of the reformation of the eleventh century postulate first the influence of Lotharingian schools of law and secondly the spread of monastic reform, with the latter theory taking pride of place." Once the Lotharingian theory has been rejected as it must be, given Fuhrmann's work, and with a more realistic evaluation of the role of Cardinal Humbert of Silva Candida, a monk at Moyenmoutier and relatively uneducated prior to his arrival in Rome," the suggestion that canonical collections influenced the eleventh-century reform in Rome has so far received relatively Uttle attention.15 One reason for this may be exaggerated claims by some scholars, such as that the reform was centrally directed on the basis of a handbook, a collection like the compilation in Seventy-Four Titles, for instance, analyzed by Paul Fournier in a memorable phrase as

"Earlier literature is indicated in the recent paper by Linda Fowler-Magerl, "Fine Distinctions and the Transmission of Texts," Zeitschrift der Savigny-Stiftung für Rechtsgeschichte, Kan. Abt. 83 (1997), 146-186, esp. pp. 166 f.; Martina Stratmann, "Zur Rezeption Hinkmars von Reims durch Bernhard von Hildesheim und Bernold von Konstanz," Deutsches Archiv, 44 (1988), 170-180; I. S. Robinson, "Zur Arbeitsweise Bernolds von Konstanz und seines Kreises: Untersuchungen zum Schlettstädter Codex 13," Deutsches Archiv, 34 (1978), 51-122, esp. pp. 57 f., 94 ff, 100, 112; idem, Bernold von Konstanz und der gregorianische Reformkreis um Bischof Gebhard III., Freiburger Diözesan-Archiv, 109 (1989), 155-188. Stratmann has shown that Bernold's De excommunicatis vitandis used the Hincmar texts as transmitted and elaborated by Bernard. The study of Johanne Autenrieth, Die Domschule von Konstanz zur Zeit des Investiturstreits: Die wissenschaftliche Arbeitsweise Bernolds von Konstanz und zweier Kleriker dargestellt auf Grund von Handschriftenstudien (Stuttgart, 1956), remains fundamental.—Professor Fowler-Magerl has kindly allowed me to see her article ahead of publication, and I would like to thank her once again.

"A convenient summary is found in I. S. Robinson, Authority and Resistance, pp. 1-11.

"Blumenthal, art. "Humbert von Silva Candida," Theologische Realenzyklopädie, 15 (1986), 682-685; cf. Fuhrmann, Einfluß und Verbreitung, II, 340: "Vom Vorleben jener 'Franzosen und Lothringer' her gesehen, ist ein stärkerer Akzent auf den Falschen Dekretalen nicht ohne weiteres anzunehmen. . . ."

15Cf. Hubert Mordek, "Kanonistik und gregorianische Reform: Marginahen zu einem nicht-marginalen Thema," in Reich und Kirche vor dem Investiturstreit: Vorträge beim wissenschaftlichen Kolloquium aus Anlaß des achtzigsten Geburtstags von Gerd Tellenbach, ed. Karl Schmid (Sigmaringen, 1985), pp. 65-82.

"Le premier manuel de la réforme." The Seventy-Four Titles (74T) now turns out to be a collection dedicated largely to administrative-judicial procedures that were widely applicable; it is even argued that it had been compiled especially for monastic houses.16 Noteworthy remains, however, a more extensive use of the Pseudo-Isidorian Decretals than ever before, except for the early Collectio Anselmo dedicata)1 The reason, I am convinced, was the growing emphasis on papal decretals—if this anachronistic expression be permitted for the sake of brevity—demonstrated so strikingly by the reception of decrees and decretals of Pope Paschal II (1099-1118). For Paschal decretals vastly outnumbered concUiar canons which still had been the predominant texts preserved in canonical collections for the pontificate of Gregory VII.18 The emphasis of 74T was so unusual that almost immediately a fourth section was added: consisting entirely of concUiar canons.19

A canonical coUection could respond to many diverse needs, and—so it would foUow—would also have been compiled for diverse reasons. The author of 74T as weU as the date of composition are stiU debated,20 but the collection nevertheless illustrates the point. It has

"John T. Gilchrist (ed.),Diuersorum patrum sententie siue Collectio in LXXIV títulos digesta ("Monumenta Iuris Canonici," Series B: Corpus Collectionum, Vol. 1 [Vatican City, 1973]) with an English translation and commentary as idem, The Collection in Seventy-Four Titles: A Canon Law Manual of the Gregorian Reform ("Mediaeval Sources in Translation," Vol. 22 [Toronto, 1980]). Paul Fournier.'Le premier manuel canonique de la réforme du XIe siècle," Mélanges d'archéologie et d'histoire de l'École Française de Rome, 14 (1894), 147-223, 285-290; Horst Fuhrmann/Über den Reformgeist der 74-Titel-Sammlung," Festschrift für Hermann Heimpel zum 70. Geburtstag (Göttingen, 1972), II, 1101-1120; Linda Fowler-Magerl, op. cit.,p. 153: "The 74T was compüed to support the claims of monastic communities to freedom from outside intervention."

'This is also emphasized by Peter Landau, op. cit. ,p. 218.

18 Figures and bibliography are given in my "ConciUar Canons and Manuscripts: The ImpUcations of Their Transmission of the Eleventh Century" Proceedings of the Ninth International Congress of Medieval Canon Law [Munich, 13-18 July 1992], edd. Peter Landau and Joerg Mueller ("Monumenta Iuris Canonici," ser. C: Subsidia, Vol. 10 [Vatican City, 1997]), pp. 357-379 at 373.

19On what became the Collection in Four Books see John Gilchrist, "Changing the Structure of a Canonical Collection: The CoUection in Seventy-four Titles, Four Books, and the Pseudo-Isidorian Decretals," in In lure Veritas: Studies in Canon Law in Memory of Schäfer Williams, edd. Steven B. Bowman and Blanche E. Cody (Cincinnati, 1991), pp. 93-1 17 with further bibUography

'"See n. 11; Fuhrmann, Einfluß und Verbreitung, II, 486 ff., presents the füllest and best documented discussion of different theories with extensive bibliographies. Now to be added are the interesting arguments of Fowler-Magerl, op. cit., esp. pp. 152-166. Dr. Fowler-Magerl argues for different stages of composition as well as links to French collections (pp. 156, 165). She would date 747* as it has come down to us "toward the end of the 1050s or beginning of the 1060s . . ." (p. 154), even though she found traces of the

been estabUshed that the collection, which survived in relatively numerous copies, indeed was transcribed not only in episcopal circles but also in at least two geographically widely separated Benedictine abbeys, Saint-Denis and Farfa, together with the abbeys' cartularies and thus used in support of their privUeges.21 A second specific use of 74T had a very different purpose. Enlarged by an appendix compiled by Bernold of Constance, the same coUection was brought from Rome to southern Germany to strengthen the papal party there after the events of Canossa. Bernold included in the Swabian appendix a text found under the date of May, 1077, in the register of Gregory VII, but ultimately derived from Gregory the Great. It concerned the deposition and excommunication of kings who disobeyed the commands of the ApostoUc See. Bernold's appendix in general gave "the work a much more powerful thrust," beginning with the question of what to do with excommunicated bishops—an issue highly relevant during Gregory's struggle with Henry FV of Germany, but totally aUen to the anonymous compUer of 74T, who had even increased the protection of bishops from accusations by subordinates compared to the False Decretals.22 StUl another user of the coUection 74T was a monk from the monastery of Hersfeld, an imperial partisan, who wrote the at the time most sophisticated treatise in support of the monarchy, the Liber de unitate ecclesiae conservanda, which could be said to adhere to ninth-century CaroUngian views about the relationship between regnum and sacerdotium." FinaUy, one last example for widely divergent uses of 74T. No less a contemporary of Gregory VII than Bishop Anselm II of Lucca adopted and adapted so many of the chapters of 74T that Friedrich Thaner, editor of the first six books of Anselm's Collectio canonum, included a partial edition of 74T as collectio minor in his footnotes.24

postulated earlier version of 74T in MS Paris, B. N., Nouv.acq.lat. 326 from Saint-Denis, Paris (p. 156). Cf. Fuhrmann, Einfluß, II, 490 f., ?. 181.

21For Saint-Denis see Fuhrmann, Einfluß, ?, 490 f.; for Farfa see the edition by Theo Kölzer, Collectio Canonum Regesto Farfensi inserta ("Monumenta iuris canonici," ser. B, Vol. 5 [Vatican City, 1982]).

"Johanne Autenrieth, "Bernold von Konstanz und die erweiterte 74-Titelsammlung," Deutsches Archiv, 14 (1958), 375-394. The texts specificaUy referred to are c. 316 and c. 330 of GUchrist's edition. See also Knox, op. cit., p. 447, and particularly Fuhrmann, Einfluß und Verbreitung, ?, 501-506, for an analysis of the distinctions between the Pseudo-Isidorian Decretals and 74T. Fowler-Magerl hypotheticaUy suggests that Gregory's legate, Archbishop Hugh of Die and Lyons,"brought with him . . . the surviving form of the 74T" to the council of Poitiers held in 1078 ("Fine Distinctions," p. 178).

"Zelina Zafarana, "Ricerche sul 'Liber de unitate ecclesiae conservanda,'" Studi medievali, ser. 3. vol. 7 (1966), pp. 617-700.

"Innsbruck, 1906-1915; repr. Aalen, 1965.

While it is true that Anselm, with Bernold of Constance the most fervent advocate of papal prerogatives in the eleventh century, relied more frequently on the Pseudo-Isidorian Decretals directly than on the texts from the Decretals assembled in 74T, the powerful influence of the opening titles of the 74T on Anselm of Lucca is undeniable.25 Correspondence aside, the formulations of the primacy in this collection were the earliest canonistic expression of the concept as it was evolving in the context of the eleventh-century ecclesiastical reform, whether the coUection is dated c. 1060 or to the 1070's. It should be noted that Gregory VII himself never quoted 74T; moreover, his policies differed in several respects.26 The same can be said regarding the Collectio canonum of Anselm of Lucca, which is often linked with Gregory's name and policies. A rubric in one of its manuscripts, BibUotheca ApostoUca Vaticana, Barb. lat. 535, declares that the autentica et compendiosa collectio had been compiled at the time of Gregory VII at this pontiff's request. Without further proof, however, the rubric cannot be taken at face value, for the codex contains a posthumous recension of Anselm's work. The manuscript in question was written at Lucca during the pontificate of Paschal II (1099-1118). "Gregory the Priest" who commissioned the Liber de vita Christiana from Bonizo of Sutri toward the end of the century, also cannot be identified with Pope Gregory VII under any circumstances.27

No example could show more clearly than 74T that the customary approach to the issue of canon law and reform is too narrow and that scholars StUl are not sufficiently aware of the huge loss of manuscripts that has to be taken into account in any analysis.28 What is striking for aU

2,Cf. Fuhrmann, Einfluß und Verbreitung, ?, 5 12: "96 Kapitel hat Anselm wahrscheinlich den Sentenzen entnommen, l 37 jedoch den Falschen Dekretalen" with ?. 235.

2"Horst Fuhrmann, "Das Reformpapsttum und die Rechtswissenschaft," in Investiturstreit und Reichsverfassung, ed. Josef Fleckenstein (Konstanzer Arbeitskreis für mittelalterliche Geschichte, "Vorträge und Forschungen," Vol. 17 [Sigmaringen, 1973]), pp. 175-203, here p. 188, ?. 31. Fuhrmann points out that the insert in Reg. 7.2 (p. 461) did not originate in the papal chancery. The first pontiff to quote 74T(c. 260) is Pope Paschal II at the Lateran CouncU of 1110 (Blumenthal, The Early Councils of Pope Paschal II: 1100-1110 [Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies, "Studies and Texts," Vol. 43 (Toronto, 1978)], p. l 19, c. 4 with further literature). For differences between the policies of Gregory VII and 74T see Fuhrmann, Einfluß und Verbreitung, II, 507 f. and esp. n. 224.

27Kuttner, "Liber canonicus. A Note on 'dictatus papae' c. 17," Studia Gregoriana, 2 (1947), 387-401 , here at p. 388, ?. 7; Fuhrmann, Einfluß und Verbreitung, Lf, 5 10 n. 228.

28Fowler-Magerl, op. cit., is an excellent reminder, as are the recent pubUcations regarding the Collectio Britannica by Martin Brett (see n. 33), Robert SomerviUe (see n. 33), and now Erich Lamberz, "Zur ÜberUeferung des VII. Ökumenischen KonzUs," Deutsches Archiv, 53 (1997), 1-43, p. 9 with ?. 17, reconfirming the use of die papal archives in

areas of reform, be it liturgy, education, clerical morals, or behavior by the laity, is a constant appeal to the sacred authorities. These, therefore, cannot be sought in any particular collection of patristic and canonistic materials. Rather, the "sacred authorities" must be sought in the traditions of the Fathers in the widest sense, frequently, but not necessarily, found in the numerous canonical coUections and florilegia so assiduously preserved and compüed by private collectors in the CaroUngian period and earUer. "We may boldly affirm that the very idea of a canon law book' and of its possible authority is definitely outside the purview of all eleventh-century reflexion on the sources of law," wrote Stephan Kuttner as early as 1947.29 Not until 1210 did a pontiff sponsor an official canonical coUection on his own initiative, when Innocent III sent the Compilatio tertia to the University of Bologna. For the eleventh century all attempts to come to simUar conclusions are inconclusive at best.

Given the eleventh-century fascination with old texts, the revival of canon law and its usefulness to the reformers for ideological as well as practical reasons, it is not surprising that the period beginning with Burchard's Liber Decretorum (c. 1022) up to Gratian's Concordance of Discordant Canons or Decretum (c. 1140) is famous for the creation of many new coUections.30 They could be compUed exclusively from old material, but "new" material was usually included as weU.31 By "new" I mean both material that had played only a minor role or no role at aU in canonical coUections up to and including Burchard's Liber Decretorum

Rome by the compUer of the Britannica, at least for JE 2448 of Pope Hadrian I. See Landau, op. cit., pp. 230-233, for a Ust oí Britannica texts which are found in Gratian's Decretum.

"Stephan Kuttner, "Liber canonicus," p. 398.

'"Paul Fournier and Georges Le Bras, /ftsto/re des collections canoniques (2 vols.; Paris, 1931 and 1932; repr. Aalen, 1972), with bibUographical references to Fournier's individual studies is StUl invaluable. For brief introductions to the collections see the handbooks by A. van Hove, Prolegomena ad codicem iuris canonici, 2nd ed. (Mechlin-Rome, 1945); Alfons Maria Stickler, Historio iuris canonici latini (Turin, 1950), and Antonio García y García, Historia del derecho canónico, Vol. 1: El primer milenio (Salamanca, 1967). The importance of the canonistic activity from 1080 to 1100 has been particularly stressed recently by Landau, op. cit., p. 217, and idem,"Die kirchUche Justizgewährung im Zeitalter der Reform in den Rechtssammlungen," in La Giustizia nell'alto Medioevo ("Settimane di studio del Centro Italiano di Studi suU'Alto Medioevo," Vol. 44 [Spoleto, 1997], pp. 427-456, at 427 f.:"[die] Rechtsordnung in dem am Ende der Reformzeit stehenden Decretum Gratiani [erhielt] eine Gestalt . . . , die weitgehend auf den erst in der Zeit zwischen 1070 und 1140 in das kanonische Recht integrierten QueUenmassen beruhte."

ä'For examples of coUections consisting of old material and the 'renaissance' of old collections see Mordek,"Kanonistik und gregorianische Reform," pp. 74 f.

or the Collectio duodecim partium and some chronologically "new" canons in most instances.32 Additions to the older corpus of ancient and medieval canonical collections in the eleventh century were derived from papal councils, for example, from papal letters or decretals, in particular those of Nicholas I and Gregory the Great, but Roman archival documents (as in Deusdedit 3.191-189), excerpts from formulary collections like the Liber diurnus, the Liber Pontiftcalis, and the Ordo romanus played a role as well. The writings of the Latin as weU as Greek Church Fathers also greatly increased in importance as did Roman law. Much of this material was shared widely, and historians beginning with Theodor Sickel thought of the resulting common source as an intermediate unsystematic and vast compilation of source material that did not survive.33 This hypothetical source collection in turn served like a stone quarry for the collections that have survived, argued Paul Fournier, who was convinced that the undertaking "had been inspired by Gregory Yjj »m -PjlJg js unlikely Dut \t must be noted that Gregory's chancery continued the recently revived practice of keeping official registers. The

1Tt is almost impossible to distinguish reform and pre-reform collections. Generally applicable is the thesis of Ovidio Capitani elaborated in his Immunità vescovili ed ecclesiologia in età 'pregregoriana' e 'gregoriana' (Spoleto, 1966). The characteristics of Burchard's coUection are still debated. Cf. Fuhrmann, Einfluß, II, 447-450 and 454-458 with a discussion of E Pelster's article, "Das Dekret Burkhards von Worms in einer Redaktion aus dem Beginn der Gregorianischen Reform," Studi Gregoriani, 1 (1947), 321-351. For Burchard's sources see Hartmut Hoffmann and Rudolf Pokorny, Das Dekret des Bischofs Burchard von Worms ("Monumenta Germaniae Histórica," Hilfsmittel, Vol. 12 [Munich, 1991]) with bibliography. For the Collection in Twelve Parts see Jörg Minier, Untersuchungen zur Collectio Duodecim Partium (Münchener Universitätsschriften, Juristische Fakultät, "Abhandlungen zur rechtswissenschaftlichen Grundlagenforschung," Vol. 73 [Ebelsbach, 1989]).

33If there reaUy was such A collection then it might have looked like the Collectio Britannica, the Collectio Barberiniana, and/or the Tripartita attributed to Ivo of Chartres. For a recent discussion and bibliography see Fuhrmann, Einfluß, II, 529-533; for the Collectio Barberiniana (BAV MS Barb. lat. 538) see also Linda Fowler-Magerl, "Vier vorgratianische Kanonessammlungen," in Aspekte europäischer Rechtsgeschichte, Festgabe für Helmut Coing zum 70. Geburtstag ("lus Commune," Sonderhefte, Vol. 17 [Frankfurt/Main, 1982]), pp. 123-146; for the Collectio Britannica Robert Somerville with the collaboration of Stephen Kuttner, Pope Urban LL, the Collectio Britannica and the Council ofMelfl (1089) (Oxford, 1996), and Martin Brett,"Urban II and the Collections Attributed to Ivo of Chartres," in Stanley Chodorow (ed.), Proceedings of the Eighth International Congress ofMedieval Canon Law ("Monumenta iuris canonici," Subsidia, Vol. 9 [Vatican City, 1992]), pp. 1-21, as weU as Peter Landau's analysis oí Britannica excerpts in Gratian's Decretum (op. cit., pp. 221-225 and the appendix, pp. 230-233). The reception of Britannica texts strengthened the legal position of the pontiff (p. 224).

,4Fournier, "CoUections canoniques romaines," pp. 391 and 392. Despite the complete lack of evidence the idea is stiU current; see Robinson, Authority, pp. 39 ff.

original register of Gregory VII is still preserved in the Archivio Segreto.35 It shows clear traces of changes, corrections, etc., made by chancery personnel contemporary to the time of entry, and we know that it was consulted and excerpted by collectors such as Cardinal Deusdedit together with other archival material and that it was copied.36 It obviously was not impossible for outsiders with access to the Curia to check the papal registers, make extracts—or even tear out leaves well into the pontificate of Innocent III.37 The respect for the canons as well as the interest in ancient, authentic texts, and increasingly also contemporary papal decrees, was so widespread that it appears quite unnecessary to assume that compUers would have needed papal encouragement before they undertook their researches.

The contrary might be closer to the truth, for the research activity just shown for Rome was typical for the eleventh century throughout France and the Empire as weU as Italy. To begin with, not Roman but primarily CaroUngian writings and canonical coUections were sought out, recopied, abbreviated, rephrased at times, and re-employed, quite possibly in a new context. Noteworthy, for instance, is the influence of Hincmar of Reims; for example, a block of texts for Hincmar's Pro ecclesiae libertatum defensione is found in the 74-Titles and related coUections.38 Hincmar's Opusculum LV capitulorum of 870 inspired Bernard of Hüdesheim directly, and indirectly his student, Bernold of Constance, who was familiar with Hincmar's text both through Bernard's De damnatione schismaticorum of 1076 and through the canonical collection of Sémur compüed in Poitiers in the late 1050's.The Libellus of Smaragdus has been identified by J. Joseph Ryan among the canoni-

"Vatican City, Arch. Segreto, Reg. Vat. 2; see Hartmut Hoffmann, "Zum Register und zu den Briefen Papst Gregors VII.," Deutsches Archiv, 32 (1976), 86-130, and Hans-Eberhard Hilpert, "Zu den Rubriken im Register Gregors VII. (Reg. Vat. 2)," Deutsches Archiv, 40 (1984), 606-61 l. For the critical edition by Erich Caspar see n. 42.

"RUdOU0 Schieffer, "Rechtstexte des Reformpapsttums und ihre zeitgenössische Resonanz," in Überlieferung und Geltung normativer Texte des frühen und hohen Mittelalters, edd. Raymund Kottje and Hubert Mordek ("QueUen und Forschungen zum Recht im Mittelalter," Vol. 4 [Sigmaringen, 1986]), pp. 51-69, here pp. 57-60. Schieffer concludes that access to the register was the exception rather than the rule.

"Blumenthal, "Papal Registers in the Twelfth Century," in Proceedings of the Seventh International Congress of Medieval Canon Law (Cambridge, 23-27 July 1984), ed. Peter Linehan ("Monumenta iuris canonici," Series C: Subsidia, Vol. 8 [Vatican City 1988]), pp. 135-151, and eadem, "Bemerkungen zum Register Papst PaschaUs IL," Quellen und Forschungen aus italienischen Archiven und Bibliotheken, 66 (1988), 1-19.

'"Besides Gilchrist's introduction of the critical edition (see n. 16), see idem, "Eleventh and Early Twelfth Century Canonical CoUections and the Economic PoUcy of Gregory VII," Studi Gregoriani,9 (1972), 377-417 at pp. 400 f.

cal sources of Peter Damián, and Johanne Autenrieth identified manuscripts containing works of Amalarius of Metz and Ratramnus among those that were glossed and excerpted at the cathedral school of Constance in the second half of the eleventh century.39 It might be that the excerpt from Deuteronomy (Deut. 17:8-13), opening the coUection in 74-Titles and the only independent biblical quotation included, was inspired by a passage in Jonas of Orleans' De institutione laicali.40 These examples for CaroUngian precedents reveal once again the strong emphasis on continuity which characterized the eleventh-century reform. It may seem as if I had strayed far afield, but an exclusive focus on Roman material and the papacy would completely distort the picture of the eleventh-century reform and canon law. It is remarkable how the widespread emphasis on the careful scrutiny of received texts and on their sanctity, that is an anxiety to observe them to their full extent, could lead to criticisms of contemporary society that would have been unthinkable in earlier centuries. From the 1050's to the 1070's a certain ambivalence in the appUcation and interpretation of precedents in canon law can be observed; new concepts appear side by side with the customary CaroUngian views and have to be accommodated.

The manuscript evidence for the researches and interests of Bernold of Constance mentioned earUer is impressive. No such evidence exists for the papacy. Innumerable manuscripts have been lost everywhere, but the situation for Rome is much worse than elsewhere. Rome as provenance could only be established for a handful of codices by Paola Supino Martini.41 Most of them are liturgical books. At best a delicate "nota bene" mark in the margins, just possibly datable to the eleventh century, may be aU that reveals contemporary interest, unless one deals with martyrologies or necrologies where erasures, additions, and substitutions can be clearly traced. The aU-important links between liturgy and poUtics in later eleventh-century Rome are a topic in their own right, but would lead too far afield in the present context, even though manuscripts establish an undeniable link between martyrologies with the approximately contemporary insertion of papal names and, for instance, c. 23 of the dictatus papae, declaring that by the merits of Saint

"J.J. Ryan, op. cit., p. 192; Autenrieth, op. cit.

"Book II, c. 20 = PL, Vol. 106, col. 209B. The comparison lepram et leprant is omitted in 74-Titles, 1?.

"Roma e Tarea gráfica romanesca (secoli X-XII) ("Biblioteca di scrittura e civUtà," Vol. 1 [Alessandria, 1987]).

Peter every canonically ordained bishop of Rome is sanctified.42 Reverence for papal decrees would be a natural consequence.

But what about canon law? Papal letters and concUiar decrees are our best source. I alluded earlier to the reliance on the Pseudo-Isidorian Decretals under Pope Leo LX. Little can be said about the short reigns of his immediate successors although the Lateran Council of 1059 under Pope Nicholas II was a momentous event of great significance and its canons became widely known through papal encyclical letters, repetition by his papal successors, and as part of, or additions to, canonical collections.43 It would seem that the best case for juridical interests on the part of a pope could be made for Victor III (1086-1087), to whom Cardinal Deusdedit dedicated his canonical collection, albeit not really in the spirit one might expect from such a dedication.44 Before his election Desiderius, as he was then known, was abbot of Montecassino. It was he who guided the abbey and its scriptorium during its golden age. The register of Pope John VIII was copied by its monks, and several canonistic manuscripts can be associated with the scriptorium as well, including three early and good copies of the Collection in Seventy-four Titles.4i But despite this impressive evidence for his abbacy Victor's reluctant and extremely brief pontificate once again reveals no sign whatsoever of a papal concern with any one particular coUection or that he any more than any of the other popes of the eleventh century stand behind new coUections.46 There is no hint to be found anywhere that Pope Victor III had asked for the collection that Deusdedit dedicated to him. Gregory VII, then, to whose Dictatus Papae I have already referred, would appear to be the exception, for there can be no doubt

42TtUs topic wUl be examined in my study of Gregory VII (forthcoming). For the text see the critical edition of Gregory's register by Erich Caspar, Das Register Gregors VtI. (MGH.Epistolae selectae" [2 vols.; Berlin, Dublin, Zurich, 1920 and 1923; repr. 1967]), p. 207 (Reg. 2.55a, c. 23). Horst Fuhrmann, "Über die HeUigkeit des Papstes,"Jahrbuch der Akademie der Wissenschaften in Göttingen (1980), 28-43.

eDetlev Jasper, Das Papstwahldekret von 1059: Überlieferung und Textgestalt (Sigmaringen, 1986); Rudolf Schieffer, "Rechtstexte" (as in n. 36), emphasizes, however, the lack of response to the election decree outside of Rome.

"Victor WoU von GlanveU, Die Kanonessammlung des Kardinals Deusdedit (Paderborn, 1905; repr. Aalen, 1967), pp. 29 f., for the dedication. For its interpretation see Blumenthal, "Fälschungen bei Kanonisten der Kirchenreform des 11. Jahrhunderts," in Fälschungen im Mittelalter ("Monumenta Germaniae Histórica," Schriften, Vol. 33, 1-6 [Hanover, 1988 and 1990 for part 6]), Part 2, 241-262, esp. pp. 254 ff. with bibUography.

"H. E. J. Cowdrey, The Age of Abbot Desiderius: Montecassino, the Papacy, and the Normans in the Eleventh and Early Twelfth Centuries (Oxford, 1983), pp. 95 ff. For the register of John VIII see Dietrich Lohrmann, Das Register PapstJohannes VIII. (872-882) ("Bibliothek des Deutschen Historischen Instituts in Rom," Vol. 30 [Tübingen, 1968]).

46Mordek,"Kanonistik und gregorianische Reform," ? 81.

that the theses of the famous document are canonistic Ln nature.47 In fact, they correspond in style to the rubrics of many a canonical coUection, and it used to be argued that it was the index of a lost canonical collection or the index for a collection still to be compUed. The rubric indicates dictation by Gregory VII. The entry is found in the original register of the pontiff between letters of March 3 and 4, 1075, and would thus appear to date from these days, given the chronological organization of the register. The principles which they embody are in some instances reflected in Gregory's poUcies, but this is not always the case, nor can all of them be found in extant canonical collections. On the contrary, at times the clauses of the Dictatus Papae clearly contradict the canonical tradition, as Horst Fuhrmann emphasized. It is a very puzzling document, but at best we can speculate as to its purpose. The register gives no hint except in a negative sense: there is no indication that the clauses were ever intended for distribution. At least one contemporary, however, did not pass them by. He recognized the significance of Gregory's declarations, and included them in the original recension of the Liber Tarraconenses, a canonical coUection dating from 1085-1090 that originated in west central France, probably Poitiers.48 As for much of Gregory's correspondence and legislation, therefore, the echo of the Dictatus Papae was very feeble.49 The document clearly lacked juridical precision and reflected convictions and opinions rather than generaUy accepted canonical principles.

Two contemporaries left us comments which precisely fit this picture of Gregory VII as a non-lawyer. Bernold of Constance described Hildebrand in the Micrologus de eccelsiasticis observationibus as a

47See Caspar's edition of Reg. II, 55a, pp. 201-208 (as in n. 42) for the text. The vast literature is indicated by Hubert Mordek, s.v."Dictatus papae" in Lexikon des Mittelalters, vol. 3 (1985), col. 978-981. See in particular also idem, "Proprie auctoritates apostolice sedis: Ein zweiter Dictatus papae Gregors VIL?", Deutsches Archiv, 28 (1972), 105-132, with the response by Friedrich Kempf,"Ein zweiter Dictatus papae: Ein Beitrag zum Depositionsanspruch Gregors VIL," Archivum Historiae Pontificiae, 13 (1975), 119-139; Horst Fuhrmann, "Papst Gregor VII. und das Kirchenrecht: Zum Problem des Dictatus Papae," Studi Gregoriani, 13 (1989), 123-149, here esp. pp. 140 ff., and idem,"Quod cathoUcus non habeatur, qui non concordat Romanae ecclesiae. Randnotizen zum Dictatus Papae," in Festschrift für H Beumann zum 65. Geburtstag, edd. K.-U. Jäschke and R. Wenskus (1977).

4eRudolf Schieffer, "Rechtstexte des Reformpapsttums und ihre zeitgenössische Resonanz," pp. 60-62, and Linda Fowler-Magerl, "Fine Distinctions," p. 179, where she suggests hypotheticaUy Hugh of Die as intermediary. Both authors also Indicate the relevant manuscripts including the Turin collection which used the Tarraconensis.

49John Gilchrist, "The Reception of Pope Gregory VII into the Canon Law (1073-1141)," Zeitschrift der Savigny-Stiftung für Rechtsgeschichte, Kan. Abt. 59 (1973), 35-82, and idem, ibid. ,66 (1980), 192-229. Schieffer/"Rechtstexte," pp. 56-62.

busy scholar, scouring the archives in Rome, "aU apostolic traditions," making sure that what he recovered would actuaUy be observed.50 As Bernolds treatise shows, what was meant were Uturgical rites, and of the pontiff's great interest in the liturgy there can be no doubt.51 The second contemporary to be mentioned here is Peter Damián. In a letter of his addressed to Hildebrand as archdeacon in the winter of 1058, Damián reports on the eventual success of his mission to MUan, referring in the course of the letter to a frequently repeated request of HUdebrand: "... You have wisely . . . asked me ... to go through the decrees and vitae (gesta) of the Roman pontiffs and to excerpt and coUect in a smaU volume in the new style of compUations whatever seems to pertain especially to the authority of the Apostolic See."52 Hildebrand himself, therefore, did not want to search papal records or to put together a collection "in the new style," although Bernold's statement teUs us clearly that he never had such hesitations when it came to Uturgy. He recognized his limitations as a canonist.

StUl, Gregory's register is replete with references to the sacri cañones, sancti cañones, auctoritas canonum, patrum decreta, decreta sanctorum canonum, regula canonum, divinae leges, to scripta or lex dei.^ This characteristic way of referring to the canons cannot ordinarily be dismissed as intentionally vague or misleading. Although ready to jettison decisions of his predecessors which he considered incorrect, Gregory was generally conscious of himself as a legislator standing in the unbroken tradition of his predecessors, obligated to adhere to the "concord of canonical tradition." His own decisions, in turn, would bind his successors. His letter of January, 1075, to King Sancho of Aragon spells this out. An episcopal appointment was at issue. Bishop Sancho

"Bernold of Constance, Micrologus, c. 14, PL, Vol. 151, col. 986.

"Reinhard Elze,"Gregor VIL und die römische Liturgie," Studi Gregoriani, 13 (1989), 179-188.

"Peter Damián, letter #65, ed. Kurt Reindel, Die Briefe des Petrus Damiani ("Monumenta Germaniae Histórica," Die Briefe der deutschen Kaiserzeit, Vol. 4, 1-4 [Munich, 1983, 1988, 1989, 1993], Vol. 2, pp. 228-247, here 229 f., with the extensive bibUography in notes 8 and 9: Hoc tu suptiliter, . . . frequenter a me karitate . . . postulasti, ut Romanorum pontificum decreta vel gesta percurrens quicquid apostolicae sedis auctoritati spetialiter competeré videretur, hinc inde curiosus excerperem, atque in parvi voluminis unionem nova compilationis arte conflarem. See Robinson, Authority and Resistance, pp. 27 f., on the influence of Damian's formulation of the Privilegium Romanae ecclesiae in this letter, referred to as Actus Mediolani.

^Gregorii VII Registrum, ed. Erich Caspar (as in n. 42), index s.v. cañones, sacri. Numerous additional examples are also given by John Gilchrist, "Eleventh and early twelfth century canonical collections and the economic policy of Gregory VH," Studi Gregoriani, 9 (1972), 377-417, esp. part l.

of Huesca had come to Rome, asking to be relieved of the burden of his office, since he was Ul and close to death. Sancho was accompanied by two clerics whom both the bishop and the king of Aragon thought suitable as successors. Gregory and his advisors agreed in general, but raised one serious obstacle: both were illegitimate. Gregory argued that for this reason the canons would not permit the consecration of either one, and, moreover, the pontiff wrote to King Sancho, he would not be able to decree otherwise, since he did not wish to pass on anything to his successors by deed and authority contrary to the holy Fathers. "For it is customary that the holy apostoUc see tolerates many things out of reasonable consideration, but the see never diverges in its decrees and laws from the concord of canonical tradition."54

The decrees to which Gregory referred were quite recent in origin. They were those of Pope Leo LX and of the Lateran council of 1059, repromulgated by Gregory VII at one of his own councils.55 We may note here, therefore, that the "concord of the canonical tradition," as understood by Gregory, included papal decrees as well as concUar canons. His thought is close to that of Peter Damián, who defined as authentic canons those which had been "either created by the venerable councils or promulgated by the holy fathers, the pontiffs of the apostolic see."56 This is a significant change in mentaUty The "traditions of the fathers" were ordinarily understood as any material which had been accepted into the canonical collections. Foremost among these materials were conciUar canons. The Synod of Chelles in 994 declared expressly that papal decisions were invalid when they disagreed with the "decrees of the fathers," a disagreement that was made equivalent to "dissent from the church."57 Gregory VII very consciously saw primarUy his predecessors in office as the fathers whose decrees, including conciUar canons, had created a concord of canonical tradition that was to be observed without fail. He identified papal decrees with the commands of the Holy Spirit: apostolic mandates—once again he refers to canons of Leo LX—are mandates of the Holy Spirit. Gregory VII, nevertheless, also claimed the prerogative of creating new law.58 The overriding issue was the papal duty to guard the Lord's flock, even If it should require new

MReg. 2.50, pp. 190 f., at 191, lines 20 ff. with Caspar's note.

"The date of this particular council is unknown; see my "Pope Gregory VII and the Prohibition of Nicolaitism," in Clerical Celibacy and Ecclesiastical Reform, ed. Michael Frassetto (forthcoming 1998).

"Letter #3 1, ed. Reindel, at p. 304; see also Ryan, Saint Peter Damián, p. 138, text #19.

57Fuhrmann,"Reformpapsttum," p. 185, n. 25 with citation.

58Fuhrmann,"Papst Gregor VII. und das Kirchenrecht," esp. pp. 133-136.

legislation (consilium), "lest together with the law, the souls of men should be lost."59 It is, therefore, not only dictatus papae c. 7 which postulates abstractly that "he alone is aUowed to issue new laws because of contemporary needs . . J'60; we find the same argument in his letters; but he used the prerogative rarely. As for many of his contemporaries, Gregory's reverence for the decisions of the Fathers, primarily his predecessors as pontiffs, as we have seen, was profound and very real even If he presented them, to paraphrase Peter Damián, in the new style.61

More illuminating for Gregory's attitude to the canonical tradition and the strong influence it exerted upon him is his "restoration" of the primacy of Lyons. It was a disastrous undertaking that played havoc with the archbishoprics of Sens and Bourges, for only Radulf, the archbishop of Tours and close friend of Gregory VII, was wUling to accept the totally unexpected claims of the archbishop of Lyons as "primate." The term "primate" was extremely ill-defined and therefore could be used in various contexts. In their eagerness to protect bishops from metropolitan interference, the forgers of the Pseudo-Isidorian Decretals had created this spurious dignity as an instance of appeal, but without clear demarcations. Primates were the equivalents of the ancient pagan priests; they were bishops of the primae civitates.62 With an astonishing boldness Gregory VII and his advisors combined the decrees attributed to Anaclete with the Notifia Galliarum in order to grant Archbishop Gebuin of Lyons a primacy that corresponded in extent to the post-Diocletian province Lugdunensis prima. Rouen, Lug. secunda, Tours, the ancient Lug. tertia, and finally Sens, around 400 a.d.

5'Reg.2.45,p. 184.

<i"Reg.2.55a,c.7,p.203SeeFuhrmann,"Reformpapsttum,"p. 186, n. 26, for bibliography as weU as Schieffer, "Rechtstexte," pp. 56 ff.and Landau, "Justizgewährung," pp. 429-435. For new law and the doctrine of dispensation see also my "Opposition to Pope Paschal II: Some Comments on the Lateran Council of 1112," Annuarium Historiae Conciliorum, 10 (1978), 82-98 at 88 with bibliography, and the stimulating arguments of Stanley Chodorow, Ideology and Canon Law in the Crisis of 1111," in Proceedings of the Fourth International Congress of Medieval Canon Law, Toronto, 21-25 August 1972, ed. S. Kuttner ("Monumenta iuris canonici," Series C: Subsidia, Vol. 5 [Vatican City, 1976]), pp. 54-80 at 66 ff.

61Fuhrmann,"Papst Gregor VIL und das Kirchenrecht," pp. 136-140,gives several examples for Gregory's reinterpretation and reformulation of traditional texts .See also ibid., ?. 145.

í2Horst Fuhrmann, "Studien zur Geschichte mittelalterUcher Patriarchate, IL TeU," Zeitschrift der Savigny-Stiftung für Rechtsgeschichte, Kan. Abt. 40 (1954), 1-84, here p. 72; see ibid. ,pp. 61-84, for the foUowing paragraph.

Usted as Lug. quarta, were to be subject to Lyons. The new arrangement—it had no practical effects—was nonetheless strenuously resisted by all concerned except the archbishop of Tours, and in particular by Richer, archbishop of Sens, who was deposed for this reason by Urban II at the council of Clermont although he had as his defender the greatest canonist of that age, Ivo of Chartres. Despite a sound skepticism—and vast learning—Horst Fuhrmann concluded that it is not impossible that Gregory VII indeed intended no more and no less than the restoration of the "statuta patrum."[63] The "decrees of the fathers," in this case consisted of long excerpts from Pseudo-Isidore, making up more than two thirds of the letter dispatched to Rouen, Tours, and Sens (Reg. 6.35). In the privilege for Gebuin of Lyons (Reg. 6.34) the arenga commands pride of place: "Wishing as far as divine grace permits to imitate the traces of the ancient holy fathers (antiqua sanctorum patrum vestigia) whom we succeed in the administration of this see albeit unworthy and far unlike in merit, it behooves us to preserve the rights which they bestowed . . . immutably."[64] This attitude is typical for Gregory VII, and evidently also for Urban II in the context of the primacy of Lyons. The attitude, in one sense passive, could be revolutionary, as we have just seen—not, however, necessarily by creating new law but simply by realizing canonistic traditions and reinterpreting them. These were vastly enriched in the decades from 1080 to 1140. The new jurisprudence was acutely aware of the difficulties that could arise when "contrariness" could not be explained as "diversity," a problem faced by Gratian, when he compUed the Concordia discordantium canonum in the 1140's, but by then Bernold s dictum had long been accepted as the norm: the pope is iudex canonum sive decretorum^

[a] Ibid., p. 79- Lotte Kéry, Die Errichtung des Bistums Arras ("Beihefte der Francia," Heft 33 [Sigmaringen, 1994]), pp. 370 with further references.

[63] Reg. 6.34, pp. 447 f. Fuhrmann, "Papst Gregor VII. und das Kirchenrecht," argues that the long excerpt from Pseudo-Isidore in Reg. 6.35 of 1079 was probably brought to Rome by Gebuin of Lyons who had petitioned for the privilege he obtained in Reg. 6.34 (pp. 131 f.)

[64] Bernold of Constance, "De statutis ecclesiasticis sobrie legendis" ("Monumenta Germaniae Histórica," Libelli de lite, Vol. 2), p. 157, 3; see the bibliography in Fuhrmann.'Reformpapsttum," p. 191, n. 36.

CONVERTING THE SAUVAGE:
JESUIT AND MONTAGNAIS IN SEVENTEENTH-CENTURY NEW FRANCE

BY

Peter A. Goddard*

> The name sauvage[1] gives rise to so very disparaging an idea of those who bear it, that many people in Europe have thought that it is impossible to make true Christians of them. But such persons do not reflect that God died for the barbarian as well as for the Jew, and that his spirit breathes where it wills. Good trees bear good fruits. . . . not only are true Christians among these sauvage peoples, but also many more in proportion than in your civilized Europe.[2]

At the vanguard of efforts to revitaUze early modern Catholicism, Jesuit missionaries arrived in New France with the ambitious aim of converting the scattered peoples of the northern forests to a pure and rigorous Christianity. Working on the frontier of an expanding faith and a burgeoning civilization, these French Jesuits offer an important window into conversion activity in the early modern world. In their thought, the process of Christianization was dependent upon the introduction of the institutions characteristic of advanced European social

"Dr. Goddard is an assistant professor of history in the University of Guelph. He wishes to thank James Muldoon and Cornelius Jaenen for their comments on earlier drafts of this paper.

'The French term sauvage, in its early modern context, denoted the lack of the cultural and social attributes of civilized humanity. Unlike the later English "savage," sauvage did not reflect racial connotations which would make it entirely pejorative. Rather, it served as foil to and opposite of civil, or "civilized. "The term thus embodied condescension for social inferiors; as such, it could be applied to backwards or rustic French men and women as peoples, like the aboriginal population of the Americas, whose attributes suggested primitive life. For early French ideas of the bon sauvage, see Olive P Dickason, The Myth of the Savage (Edmonton, 1984), pp. 63-84.

2Claude Allouez, Relation of 1672-73, in Reuben Gold Thwaites (ed.), The fesuit Relations and Allied Documents (73 vols.; Cleveland 1896-1901), Vol. 58, p. 85. Henceforward cited as "fR" The definitive series of mission writings, Lucien Campeau (ed.), Monumenta Novae Franciae (J vols.; Rome and Montreal, 1967-) will, when completed, supersede the nearly 100-year-old Thwaites bilingual edition. Henceforward cited as "MNFr

life and especiaUy of its control over what was perceived as depraved human nature. Thus French Jesuits caUed for ordered settlement, the uprooting of superstition, the reformation of the family, and the close regulation of individual behavior, or civilité, as essential elements of a demanding model of conversion. Yet Jesuits also tried to retain those aspects of autochthonous culture which did not contradict the faith, including "natural" virtues which would assist in the construction of the primitive church. Jesuits attempted to buffer new Christians from the corrupting effects of European contact, and, as the passage quoted above suggests, sought to raise the standards of CathoUcism everywhere through the example of the sauvage convert. New France was a laboratory for Jesuit efforts: tension and contradictory thrusts characterized their mission strategy.

Seventeenth-century French Jesuits were beneficiaries of the rich missionary tradition of medieval Christianity. Since its 1540 founding, the Society had been devoted to "the advancement of souls and the propagation of the faith" among Turks, the peoples of the New World, and other infidels, schismatics, and pagans.3 Jesuits conceived of this activity, even in the wilderness of New France, as a continuation of the history of conversion of Northern Europe, coterminous with the assertion of Roman order. The Jesuit approach suggests both Gregory the Great's drive to complete the sacralization of monasticism through the preaching to pagans, and Boniface's concern to instruct in a calm and rational manner. By being all things to aU men, the Society would find the necessary foundations for Christian belief in the diversity of human experience.4

Jesuits sent to New France were weU equipped for this mission. Renaissance linguistic science allowed them to investigate diverse cultures, beliefs, and practices. Their classical education, in which both Aristotle and Cicero figured prominently, prompted Jesuits to compare native Americans to the ancient Scythians or to the tribal peoples of the Roman frontier. Shared news or "relations" of other missions permitted comparative analysis: native peoples of Canada could be likened to the Guaranis of Paraguay, or contrasted with the Chinese or Japanese. Re-

'John OHn, Catholic Reform from Cardinal Ximenes to the Council of Trent 1495-1563 (New York, 1990), p. 83 ("First sketch of the Society of Jesus" [1539]).

'Peter Duignan, Early Jesuit Missionaries," American Anthropologist, 60 (1958), 725-732. For the culture of the founding Jesuits, see John W. O'Malley, The First fesuits (Cambridge, Massachusetts, 1993), pp. 243-283.

flective of both classroom learning and practical experience, as magisteriaUy synthesized by José de Acosta, Jesuits upheld a reUgious anthropology which understood spiritual progress in historicaUy and culturally relative stages.5 The humanity of even the most barbarous and nomadic of the northern forest peoples was recognized, and was deemed a sufficient basis for conversion.

Products of the Reformation-era upheaval in Western Christianity, and of acute ideological pressures within France itself, Jesuit missionaries of New France also embodied the early modern addiction to sectarian conflict and to gloomy theology. They reflected the post-Reformation "rising consciousness of sin" and its consequent demand for penitence." Departing from the optimistic model of mission elaborated by Acosta, many expressed an exaggerated Augustinian pessimism concerning the prospects of "natural man" and maintained that only a completely new way of life could offer hope of salvation.7 This outlook identified the pagan as a thoroughly corrupt individual whose natural virtues were eclipsed by both universal and particular sin and whose isolation from the Word impeded even grace from reaching him or her. Only discipUned, educationaUy-minded religious institutions could convert, let alone control, this faUen nature. Seeking to extirpate pagan customs and to "overthrow the country," this confrontationalist outlook, with its harsh appraisal of native culture, its apocalyptic preaching, and

The unsurpassed account of Jesuit learning in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries is François de Dainville,ía géographie des humanistes (Paris, 1940). French Jesuits employed the insights of José de Acosta, the sixteenth-century Jesuit missionary to Peru whose Natural and Moral History of the Indies [1591] described the nomadic aboriginals as the lowest category of human existence, and who could be "reduced to civility" if necessary. On Acosta, see Luis Martin.'The Peruvian Indian through Jesuit Eyes: The Case of José de Acosta and Pablo José de Arriaga," in The fesuit Tradition in Education and Missions, ed. Christopher Chappie (London and Toronto, 1993), pp. 201-213.

"John H. Elliott, "Renaissance Europe and America: A Blunted Impact," in Images of America in Europe, ed. Fredi Chiapelli (2 vols.; Berkeley, 1976), l, 16; for the Augustinian preponderance in French theology, see Marie-Christine Varichaud, Ia Conversion au XVII' siècle (Paris, 1975), pp. 2-5; 80-81.

"See Henri Bremond, Histoire littéraire du sentiment religieux en France, Vol. 5.La conquête mystique. L'Ecole du Père Lallemant et la tradition mystique dans la Compagnie defésus (Paris, [1935] 1967), pp. 3-65, for a discussion of Augustinian spiritualism among Jesuits who were active in the Canadian mission up to 1650. For the Augustinian tendency in seventeenth-century France, see Robin Briggs, Communities of Belief. Social and Cultural Tensions in Early Modern France (Oxford, 1989), p. 239; Lawrence W B. Brockliss, French Higher Education in the Seventeenth and Eighteenth Centuries (Oxford, 1987), p. 247; Charles E. Williams, The French Oratorians and Absolutism, 1611-1641 (New York, 1989), pp. 7-29; 90-93.

its reliance upon the instrument of fear, would contend with the older tradition of accommodation and reasoned argument.

The conversion of the native peoples of New France thus reflected the missionary project in an age of turmoil. These missionaries were concerned not simply to preach but also to conquer, and to extend a lettered and ordered Christianity to those mired in Ul-formed or perverse belief. This program of fundamental change, or metanoia, was coincident with what has been identified as the "civUizing process," the imposition of a higher degree of social discipline on early modern European individuals and communities.8 It was the strategy of social and cultural elites, mindful of the chasm between the "good" and the "traditional" in religious practice. Conversion involved the wholesale transformation of the pagan—or nominal Christian—into neophyte displaying the internalized rigor of a disciplined faith.9 This program reflected the medieval heritage of accommodation, overlain by the stridency of confessional battle, the assertiveness of a dominant class, and the urge to demonstrate rigor in a competitive spiritual climate. Modern observers have been seduced by Jansenist caricatures of Jesuit strategy as "laxist" and by a modern urge to see the Jesuits as rationalist and accommodationist.10 Yet these seventeenth-century Jesuits promoted a mission strategy of considerable severity, if motivated by the optimistic example of the first apostles.

The Jesuit strategy of conversion is evident in the design of their Canadian mission in the first half of the century. Following their 1625 establishment in Canada, Jesuits sought out the most sedentary and

"For the standard account of this process in early modern European history, see the works of Norbert Elias, The Civilizing Process, trans. Edmund Jephcott (2 vols.; New York, 1978, 1982).

The theology, spirituality, and social practice of reformed Catholicism are discussed by Jean Delumeau, Catholicism between Luther and Voltaire (New York, 1984), and John Bossy, Christianity in the West 1400-1 700 (Oxford, 1985), pp. 115-140. For post-Tridentine Catholicism as a foundation for modern missionary Christianity, see Andrew E. Barnes, "On the Necessity of Shaping Men Before Forming Christians: The Institutionalization of Catholicism in Early Modern Europe and Modern Africa," Historical Reflections, 16(1989X222-227.

"'Urs Bitterli, Cultures in Conflict, trans. Ritchie Robertson (Stanford, 1989), pp. 96-108; John H. Kennedy, fesuit and Savage in New France (Hampden, Connecticut, 1971), pp. 100- I08,passim. In The Invasion Within: The Contest of Cultures in Colonial North America (Oxford, 1985),pp. 71 -127, James Axtell describes the confrontationalism of the Jesuits, but emphasizes their willingness to "adopt a culturally relative stance toward their prospective converts" (p. 71) and to "allow or encourage a certain amount of syncretic blending of old and new beliefs and practices" (p. 110).

agricultural peoples, who most resembled the semi-pagan, minimaUy Christianized villagers of the remote French countryside. Borrowing heavUy from earlier Franciscan intelhgence and the fur traders' penetration of the Great Lakes region, Jesuits targeted the Ouendats, or "Hurons," of Georgian Bay. These Iroquoian peoples, numbering perhaps 25,000 in a tribal confederacy, would be the targets of the Jesuits' most ambitious mission in the first half of the seventeenth century. With their fishing, their planting and harvesting, their rustic superstitions and pagan rites, Hurons could be likened to the corrupt backsliders of traditional rural Christianity. Hurons allowed their grasp of the tools of life, and their relative sophistication, to engage in vice and corruption characteristic of the path of perdition. In the mission to the Hurons, the object of conversion was not simply individual salvation but also the reformation of the whole polity. If only the Church could be estabUshed among them, Hurons would create the ideal reformed Catholic community, embracing and disciplining individual, family, clan, vUlage, and nation.

The 1634-1650 mission to the Hurons was an exciting if ultimately unsuccessful chapter in missionary activity in New France." Over a longer period, Jesuits engaged in a more ambitious mission to convert the more truly sauvage Algonquian12 peoples of the Laurentian (Canadian) shield. Nomadic hunters and gatherers, the Algonquian tribes provided the valuable fur harvest of the northern river basins. In exchange, the French offered both trading opportunities and protection against traditional Iroquoian enemies. To the Jesuits, Algonquian lives seemed harder than those of the animals they trapped, the boreal forest not so much the mantle as the excoriation of these poor peoples. Surely they would receive Christian doctrine as eagerly as they accepted respite from neolithic rigors. Algonquians presented the opportunity of high-powered charity, akin to a modern development project. Their conversion would demonstrate the power ?? dévot civUization over nature and barbarism. More than the mission of the Iroquoian peoples, then, the at-

"See Lucien Campeau, La mission des Jésuites chez les Hurons 1637-1650 (Montreal, 1987), and Bruce Trigger, The Children ofAataensic.A History of the Huron People to 1660 (Montreal, 1987), pp. 665-840.

,2Montagnais, Algonquian, Nipissing, Attikamek, Ojibwa. See the Historical Atlas of Canada,Vo\. 1 (Toronto, 1987), plates 33-35. A standard historical ethnography is Alfred G. Bailey, The Conflict of European and Eastern Algonkian Cultures 1504-1 700, 2nd ed. (Toronto, 1969); a more recent account of the early mission is found in Alain Beaulieu, Convertir les fils de Cain: fésuites et amérindiens nomades en la nouvelle france, 1632-1642 (Quebec, 1990).

tempt to convert the Algonquians in the first half of the seventeenth century puts the French Jesuit strategy of bringing "natural" peoples into a rigorist church in fuU relief.

Among the Algonquians, the prime candidates for total transformation through conversion were the people known as the Montagnais, hunters of the lower St. Lawrence region and the people with whom Jesuits in Canada had first come into contact. Jesuits described this Algonquian tribe as a "completely uncivil" folk roaming the "kingdom of wild beasts."13 These "natural men and women" were not significantly further from edification than were backwards and superstitious French peasants. "Ordinarily lacking instruction," however, and lacking the apparatus of proper religion, the Montagnais were mired in unchecked wildness.14 But conversion would allow them to surmount their barbaric life: before Christianization of Germany, England, and Spain, Europeans themselves had been no more civilized." The Montagnais, in other words, were Uke the ancient Gauls before hearing the Word; they were sauvage, gripped by nature and bereft of grace. Conversion was attendant upon, but also part of, the attainment of civilization.

At first, the missionaries were hopeful that the example of French civUization—a handful of traders, soldiers, and isolated colonists—in their shifting midst, would serve to convert the Montagnais. But experience quickly proved otherwise, as the newcomers found it difficult to exert leverage over a people incomprehensibly wedded to what appeared to be primitive ways. As inquiry proceeded, however, and knowledge of language and culture advanced, the Jesuits became familiar with the barriers to the conversion of such a benighted people. "The more one advances in the language, the more one understands their curses," wrote Paul Le Jeune, architect of the Algonquian missions and Superior at Québec from 1632 to 1639·16

Specifically, the goals of stability, order, and tranquillity seemed beyond the Montagnais, who, according to the missionaries, behaved in a

""Relation de Canada," Mercure François, 19 (1633), 775.

ufR,Vol. 5, p. 153(1633).

7Ä,Vol.5,pp.31-33 (1632).

^'Mercure François, 19 (1633), 797. On the importance of Paul Le Jeune in directing the mission and in furnishing the most comprehensive account of the spiritual predicament of the Montagnais, see Peter Goddard, "Paul Le Jeune: Anthropology and the Problematics of Post-Tridentine Conversion," Proceedings of the Eighteenth Meeting of the French Colonial Historical Society, 1992 (Cleveland, 1993),pp. 14-25.

wanton and improvident manner. They feasted mdiscriminately in times of plenty, only to court famine through seasons of scarcity. While God forbade sensual excess and gluttony, these Algonquian hunters appeared to revel in it.17 Men, women, chUdren, and dogs mingled together at night, for warmth in smoke-fLUed cabannes, something the missionaries described as "more than intolerable."18 The entire community satiated itself in disregard of order, hierarchy, and propriety at its irregular mealtimes and apparently haphazard patterns of hunting and other subsistence activity. The Montagnais approached the ordered material and spiritual economy of the French with avidity and greed, gorging themselves on the carefuUy hoarded stocks. Slaves to their appetites, the Montagnais scarcely gave opportunity to their reasonable selves, allowing no planning, saving, calculating. Or so it seemed.

Compounding the problem was the Montagnais' lack of self-awareness. "Filthy in their clothing, posture, Uving places, and diet," they were yet free of shame: "everything which gives contentment to their senses, is regarded as proper (honnesté)!'19 While the Montagnais also possessed many positive attributes—notably their stoical endurance, their deference and politeness amongst themselves, and their wiUingness to share—even these virtues were the result of their untamed state, and as a consequence plâtrée, or inanimate. Jesuits saw salvation for the Montagnais in their elevation to a higher plane. Here was an opportunity for metanoia, for conversion to work its full power to create new men and a new civilization.

Le Jeune advocated the following strategy to convert the Montagnais: to learn their language; to establish hospitals (hôpitals) to attract and to succor the nomads, to settle them in réductions proximate to French habitation, and to establish seminaries in order to indoctrinate their chüdren.20 Le Jeune's program reflects Jesuit confidence in pedagogy—the great weapon of these soldiers of the church militant.21 It also reveals the powerful sense that the taming of the Montagnais must precede their conversion. Once extracted from their brutal natural

1TR, Vol. 6, pp. 281-283 (1634).
l"Mercure François, 19 (1633), 797.
"/A1Vol. 6, p. 261 (1634).
1JRNoI. 14, pp. 125-129 (1638).
21On Jesuit pedagogy, see Aldo Scaglione, The Liberal Arts and the fesuit College System (Amsterdam and Philadelphia, 1986), and François de Dainville, L'éducation des fésuites (Paris, 1977).

world, the Montagnais would surrender their pagan barbarism and submit to ordered civiUzation.

In laying out this long-term program of conversion, Jesuits were at the same time suggesting their fitness for a kind of spiritual captaincy over these peoples, serving as both the directors of sauvage transformation, and a buffer against nefarious European influence. The civilization to which the Montagnais would submit was Christian, purified and ordered as much as the post-lapsarian world would allow. We must note that Jesuits sought to create this civilization anew, rather than to copy the French version of the old world. Jesuits drew criticism for this sort of Utopian proposal, notably in the case of the Paraguayan reducciones.22 Wherever they went, however, the Jesuits had no intention of simply reproducing European customs and mores. Fadings in that civilization had been the source of decadence and division in the Western Church.

As Paul Le Jeune indicated, Christianization of the Algonquian peoples was predicated above aU on their sedentarization. Without fixed settlements, fields and farms to hold them, these hunter-gatherers were beyond the reach of the Word. "They are so occupied in seeking their livelihood in these woods, that they lack the time, so to speak, to save themselves."23 The consequent need to wrest these peoples from their nomadism, which the missionaries regarded as the worst of their scourges, and to introduce agriculture among them, was a saUent theme in missionary writing on New France. In 1638, Jesuits established a réduction at Sillery, modeled on the Paraguayan example.24 Settlement was not a purely practical process, however, designed to house and feed the native converts. It was also a means of instilling order and hierarchy in their midst. Only agricultural community would encourage people "accustomed to idleness and shiftlessness, to embrace serious work," that is, a regular and disciplined pattern of life, an earthly yoke to match that of the faith. Farming would settle inconstant spirits as well as wandering bodies. Despite the inability of the réduction successfully to de-

22See Antonio Ruiz de Montoya, The Spiritual Conquest Accomplished by the Religious of the Society offesus in the Provinces ofParaguay, Paraná, Uruguay and Tape [1639] (St. Louis, 1993), for a contemporary mission effort, which employed a similar thrust into the "primitive" in order to secure a pure and uncorrupted Christian community.

25/Ä, Vol. 6, pp. 147-149 (1634).

2TA, Vol. 14, pp. 205-207 (1638). For the réduction policy, see Marc Jetten, Enclaves amérindiennes: les "réductions" du Canada 1637-1701 (Québec, 1994), pp. 35-87.

fend against Iroquoian raids and the attractions of the fur trade, the annual reports spoke glowingly of the project: communal agricultural Ufe was so consonant with the primitive Church that an enormous investment seemed justified.

Settlement alone, of course, would not ensure conversion: Christianization was not a passive process. The Jesuits sought not only to influence living patterns, but also to confront and vanquish falsehood and to teach true doctrine. This entailed coming face to face with native reUgion and rooting it out. According to the Jesuits, the Montagnais did not follow a religion that actively conspired against Christianity, as did the apparently DevU-worshiping peoples of New Spain and South America. Rather, they held nonsensical mental habits and customs, so nebulous as to inspire only by historical inertia. "If you push them, they do not persist: they foUow a certain routine in their superstitions, for which they cannot account."25 Missionaries found little coherence in the teaching of Montagnais shamans—prime competition—but felt that they could be won over, and their flocks along with them, through disputation and demonstration. According to the missionaries, shamanism was a social phenomenon which thrived only because of generalized ignorance.26 Teaching would thwart it. And with the Jesuit thus supplanting the shaman, the Church militant might gain the leading role among the Montagnais. The Relations offer many examples of missionary harangues against traditional practice, highUghting not so much its diabolical origins as its futility and counterproductivity Jesuits were no more accommodating of such belief than they were of the Protestant heresy in Europe itself: both met with the Jesuits' refusal to credit alternative spiritual potency, and a scoffing condemnation as foUy27

In order to build the Church, Jesuits had to instruct potential converts in the rudiments of the sacramental system, especiaUy the elements of penitence and the idea of obedience. Only teaching could inscribe what the missionaries perceived as the "tabula rasa" of the sauvage with the necessary knowledge. Only instruction could give rise, at the moment of baptism, to a decisive break with the old life and embrace of the new. The pattern of mission among the Mon-

2TA1VoL 5, p. 131(1633).

2The unsurpassed account of Algonquian religion is found in the Relation of 1634 \fR,Vol.6,pp. 157-227]. See also ibid.,Vol. I6,p. 149 (1639).

"See Real Ouellet (ed.), Rhétorique et conquête missionnaire: lejésuite Paul Lejeune (Québec, 1993), for the similarity in the rhetorical strategy of refuting the sorcerers and countering the Protestant preacher.

tagnais—the work of instructing, reshaping, and reforming this pagan community—differed little from the blueprint suggested for the re-christianization of the French countryside.28 The effort demanded the full range of pedagogical, organizational, and dramatic techniques, but in the case of the Canadian mission, spread over years rather than the few weeks or months typical of missions to the peasants of France.

Annual mission relations published from 1632 to 1672 described the myriad acts of instruction that Jesuits performed among the native peoples.29 These encounters between the black-robed Europeans and the reserved, still skeptical Montagnais and others illustrate the power of Jesuit pedagogy and the ways in which the Word could be translated in this most desolate of situations. Of course, the reader gains only a one-sided picture, one which tends to underline the difficulty of conversion of these barbares, but also to highlight the resourcefulness and persistence of the Jesuits, their acceptance among these peoples and their growing mastery of language. Even if there was no torrent of conversions, at least the Jesuits were making progress: Le Jeune could report that following instruction, the Montagnais and others "now laugh at their own absurd notions, and are adapting themselves and accustoming their minds to receive our truths."

The missionaries were at pains to point out that baptisms were hardly indiscriminate, especiaUy among the young catechists:"It is necessary either to see great indications of the spirit of God in their souls, or to wait untU they are protected by the authority of some person who has influence among them."30 The process of instruction extended to adults: missionaries reported serious encounters conducted over the passing of a pipe, in which earnest discussion followed the Jesuits' three-pronged discourse: "One their chimerical belief, refuting their vague notions; another, the reality of a God; and the third, his justice, which I tried to prove by natural reasons."31

2"See Pierre Champion, Vie du P. Rigoleuc (Paris, 1686), and Antoine Boschet, Le parfait missionnaire (Paris, 1697), for a contemporary discussion of missionary strategy in the French countryside. See also Louis Châtellier, La religion des pauvres. Les missions rurales en Europe et la formation du catholicisme moderne XVF-XIX' siècles (Paris, 1993), pp. 22-58.

2The best example might be that found in the Relation of 1637, "De l'instruction des petits sauvages" [T^, Vol. 11, pp. 221-237].

"Ibid., p. 233.

3TA1VoL 12,p. 149(1637).

Baptism would not be conferred on adults in good health, untU the Jesuits had "tried them and kept them for some time in the rank of Catechumens, as was done in the primitive Church."32

Smallpox epidemic and war, increasingly common over the decades of intensive missionary work in the middle of the seventeenth century, ensured that despite their careful pedagogical drive, Jesuits won a majority of converts through deathbed baptism—gains for the Church triumphant rather than militant. Some missionaries grew frustrated with the slow pace of conversion and with the Montagnais' tendency to return to their traditional beliefs and practices once they were beyond the direct influence of the French. The project of preaching to the Montagnais in their own language, and using reason to illuminate the path to conversion, was not working as well as these rhetoricians had hoped. Notably, the concepts of sin, the fall, and redemption through Christ were difficult to translate. Speaking of a prospective convert who yet lacked comprehension of the Christian message, Le Jeune wrote:

> My only trouble was to make her feel sorrow for her sins. The sauvages have not this word "sin" in their language, though they certainly have it in their customs. The word for wickedness and malice, among them, means a violation of purity, as they have told me. So I was puzzled to know how to make her understand sorrow at having offended God.33

The Montagnais were also reluctant to examine seriously the tenets of the religion offered by the Jesuits. The Jesuits noted deference and politeness and encountered no doctrinal argument which they could not refute. But polite interest did not lead ineluctably to conversion:

> If these barbarians would only display some curiosity to know about things, this would be the gate to true knowledge. But they are as cold as marble, and are so imbued with this indifference that you would say they are surprised at nothing. This quaUty would be of use U they were Christians, for their minds would be less subject to errors; but at present I would rather have them show a little more activity and a little more fire.34

Le Jeune ascribed this problem to a fundamental difference in character between Frenchmen and savages. His compatriots expressed curiosity and enthusiasm, while "our savages are distant from this ardor."35

i2ibid.,p.i4i.
"JR, Vol. 6, p. 137(1634).
3TR1Vol. 11, pp. 209-211 (1637).
"Ibid., p. 115.

Stoical and difficult to impress, they might be better suited to attrition than to contrition. Jesuits adopted an increasingly harsh and strident approach to impress the fundamental requirements for salvation. Termed the "pastorale de la peur" or "pastoral of fear" by French historians of religion,36 the strategy employed the blunt instrument of hell-fire preaching, with its emphasis on sin and its menace-laden demands for penitence.

Awareness of the efficacity of fear reached a high point in 1637: the missionaries henceforward asserted that "fear is the forerunner of faith in these barbarian minds."37 It proved a useful tool in the suppression of wicked customs:"The dread of punishment is beginning to gain such an ascendancy over their minds, that, although they do not so soon amend, yet they are, little by little, giving up their evil customs."38 During the smaUpox epidemics which struck the Montagnais with regularity from I635 onwards, widespread fear and suffering produced compliant souls in a minimum of time: here is the Jesuit report of a "wicked woman of the country" (described elsewhere as a "sorceress"), stricken by sickness: "Affliction opens the eyes of the understanding; this wretched creature demands Baptism, cries to God for mercy, protests that she believes; she astonishes us by a sudden change; we grant her what could not be refused to her without impiety."39

Accounts of hell-fire preaching are legion through the Relations of 1635- 1640. In 1637, one of the many victims of disease gained baptism upon showing the fatal signs. Le Jeune feared she had not received sufficient instruction, and indeed, when she recovered somewhat, "returned to the thoughts of the present life, she conceived a horror for us." Le Jeune redoubled his efforts:

> representing to her the complaints her soul would make in its despair and in the flames … I related to her something of the rage and fury of the devUs. She could not endure these threats; she began to weep, and to grind her teeth; and, without saying anything to me, she went out of the cabin on aU

36See Jean Delumeau, Sin and Fear, trans. Eric Nicholson (New York, 1990), pp. 329-421; Bernard Dompnier, "Pastorale de la peur et pastorale de la séduction. La méthode de conversion des missionnaires capucins," in La conversion au XVIF siècle. Actes du XIF Colloque de Marseille, ed. Roger Duchêne (Marseilles, 1983), pp. 257-273.

3TA1VoL 11, p.89 (1637).

"Ibid.,p.215.

3TA1VoL 14, p. 183 (1638).

> fours, as they say, for she could not stand on her feet, and lay down on the snow.[40]

In the same epidemic, a sickened youth who had resisted the overtures of the Jesuits finaUy experienced both the terror and to a lesser degree the compassion of the true faith:

> when I approached to give him instruction, as he was very sick, he wrapped himself up in his robe, and would not listen to me at aU. I tried, therefore, to frighten him with the fear of hell,—so that, indeed, I made him weep; as soon as I became aware of this, I redoubled my efforts, and with greater earnestness said, "Thou dost not fear eternal death, and thou fearest the death of thy body; whether thou beUevest or dost not beUeve, thou art dead, thou canst do no more; and, not content to suffer the long pain of thy disease, thou wishest to suffer the horrible torments of hell; if I hated thee, I would let thee go into the flames, but I have compassion for thy soul; listen, and see U what thou art taught is bad."[41]

Missionaries adopted this technique because it achieved a compUant outlook on the part of a prospective convert, who may already have been engulfed by fear.

Understandably, the word circulated among the Montagnais that whUe baptism was nearly always fatal, it was the only way to free oneself of the highly disturbing preaching of the Jesuits. This sentiment shows clearly in Le Jeune's account of a stricken woman's baptism on February 28, 1637:

> As I expressed some surprise at the long resistance she had made to us, a young Savage told me that I need not be astonished at it,—that many of their nation had this idea, that baptism is injurious to Ufe, but that it is a good thing with which to protect onesetf from the fires with which we threaten them. So this is why some do not consent to be baptized untU they have lost all hope of being able to recover their health.[42]

It is difficult to get a sense of what baptism reaUy meant to the Montagnais when the foreign faith was introduced alongside a series of devastating epidemics. Few seem to have regarded it as an unaUoyed boon; many accepted it with a degree of fatalism. We know that most recipients of the sacraments experienced the sacred rites only as part of the trauma of terminal illness. For the Montagnais in the first half of the sev-

"TA1VoL 11, p. 115(1637).
"Ibid.,p. 107.
i2Ibid.,p. 119.

enteenth century, baptism and conversion took place most often against a backdrop of fear, both of mysterious death and of the new factor, the ghastly afterlife. The Jesuits saw utility in this: sickness was a sign of God's power over life, and the mortality of the epidemic served to clear the ground for the new religion. "God demoUshes only to rebuild better than before."[43]

The "pastorale de la peur" also involved visual and theatrical instruments which provoked salutary terror and anxiety in the Montagnais minds. Woodcut prints portraying the horrors of purgatory were already in use, but Le Jeune sought a sharper shock. In a 1637 discussion on visual representations of the fate of unbeUevers, Le Jeune mused that Protestants had been wrong to condemn these images "which have such good effects":

> These sacred pictures are half the instruction that one is able to give the Savages. I had desired some portrayals of hell and of lost souls; they sent us some on paper, but that is too confused. The devils are so mingled with the men that nothing can be identified therein, unless it is studied closely.[44]

IdeaUy, nevertheless, illustrations should more clearly depict the inferno:

> three, four, or five demons tormenting one soul with different kinds of tortures—one applying to it the torch, another serpents, another pinching it with red-hot tongs, another holding it bound with chains,—it would have a good effect, especially U everything were very distinct, and U rage and sadness appeared plainly in the face.[45]

In 1640, the Canadian mission entered the realm of the theatrical. The Governor Montmagny had ordered "une Tragicomédie" to honor the newly born dauphin. For the benefit of the assembled Indians, the Jesuits presented a play in which

> We had the soul of an unbeliever pursued by two demons, who finaUy hurled it into a hell that vomited forth flames; the struggles, cries, and shrieks of this soul and of these demons, who spoke in the Algonquian tongue, penetrated so deeply into the hearts of some of them, that a Savage told us, two days afterward, that he had been greatly frightened that night by a very horrible dream.[46]

[43] 4TA1Vol. 16, p. 111(1639).

[44] "T^, Vol. 11, p. 89 (1637).

[45] "Ibid. See François-M. Gagnon, La conversion par l'image. Un aspect de la Mission des fésuites auprès des Indiens du Canada au XVII" siècle (Montréal, 1975), which analyzes the use of images in Acadian missions in the 1670's.

[46] 4TK1Vol. 18, pp. 85-87 (1640).

The Jesuits were to employ every means to coax, cajole, entertain and terrify, inteUectualize and emotionalize their message.

As demoralization spread on the heel of epidemic devastation, some Montagnais grew weary of the incessant message of perdition. Winter disputations at the Trois Rivières mission produced a typical complaint:

> having spoken to them very fuUy of HeU and of Paradise, of punishment and of reward, one of them said to me, "HaU of thy discourse is good, the rest is worth nothing. Do not speak to us of those fires, for that disgusts us; speak to us of the blessings of Heaven,—of living a long time here below, of living at our ease, of the pleasure we wiU experience after our death,—for it is thus men are won; when thou speakest to us of those blessings, we think in our hearts that that is good, and that we surely desire to enjoy it . . . but those threatening words thou usest do not serve at aU to that end.47

Le Jeune responded that he would be remiss in his duties, and indeed would be wicked himself, were he to fail to warn the Montagnais of the agonizing unhappiness (malheur) which awaited the unbeUever.48 A resistant woman complained that Le Jeune "does nothing but chide me, and speak to me of death, crazing me in my sickness." Le Jeune admitted, "As I could not make the faith enter her mind through the hope of heaven, I had tried to gain admission for it through the dread of heU."49

As evangelization increased its reliance on the instrument of fear, the mental blocks to conversion became more apparent. So too did the gulf between notions of divine justice and redemption and Montagnais animism. Accustomed to conceiving of an undifferentiated afterworld more or less coincident with the present, they baulked at the radical distinction between heaven and heU. In 1637, Le Jeune detailed the instruction of a" Capitaine Sauvage" the neophyte MaKheabichtichiou.50 Le Jeune tried to impress upon him that unless a division between the good and the bad, the godly and the damned, was enforced, the turmoU of the present would be repUcated in the afterlife. Sinners would not get their just deserts due to misguided solidarity:

> You say that you all go to the same place; there are among you most detestable men; dost thou wish to go with them? Then you wiU be fighting and quarreUng in the other world, as you do in this. That is not credible. The good all go to Heaven, the bad all into the flames. God has placed us between Heaven and HeU, to teach us that we can go to one of these two ex-

4TJ?, Vol. 11, p. 207 (1637).
"Ibid., pp. 113, 207-209.
i9Ibid., p. 113.
"Ibid., pp. 149-165.

> tremes. And, as our soul is immortal, it wiU be forever happy or miserable. This life is short, the other is very long; do not be like dogs, which think only of the body.[51]

The Relations portray converts as mocking their kinsmen for their faUure to understand the central dynamic of reformed Christianity: that change was the prerequisite of salvation, and that prideful self-sufficiency and heretical obstinacy guaranteed perdition:

> "What! . . . dost thou think thy soul wiU have no consciousness after death? Is it thou who hast created it, that thou shouldst speak of it with this obstinacy? thou placest all thy dependence upon thy apprehensions, fuU of errors as they are; and I who believe in God, I lean upon his word; it is he who has drawn souls from nothing, and consequently can speak of them with aU truth. Reason teaches thee that he who has given thee being demands some acknowledgement thereof, on pain of punishment."[52]

This Christianity stressed punishment and discipline in the next world and implied it for this one as well. To the query of how good God could be if He cast men into eternal fires, Le Jeune responded, "He was good, but he was also just, rewarding each one according to his works." If one offended a superior, one deserved punishment:

> Now know that God is a very great Captain. He punishes as a God and rewards as a God; and, as he bestows upon us great blessings, so he punishes us with severity, if he sees us wicked and proud,—us, who are only worms of the earth.[53]

Converts were taught to understand that to believe was not enough; they needed also to obey.

By the early 1640's, Jesuits had settled a fraction of the Montagnais in réductions, had undermined traditional belief, and had produced a compliant outlook through stern and terrifying preaching. Yet missionaries still awaited the fundamental transformation of these peoples into the maUeable and disciplined spiritual beings of reformed Christianity. This stage of conversion demanded the careful reformation of manners and the teaching of the proper outlook—internal and external—of the true dévot. Jesuits took a censorious approach to the appalling lack of civilité among the Montagnais. Le Jeune suggested that native manners could be reformed through charity; those who displayed "any public impudence, or who indulge in outrages and insane acts" would find the

5TiWd., p. 161.
"TR1Vol. 14, pp. 163-165 (1636).
VJR, Vol.11, p.209 (1637).

door barred to them.54 Montagnais dependence would serve as a kind of lever: "if we all should agree to exclude without doing them any harm, those who commit acts so at variance with reason and nature, we would soon see a change among them."55 Other missionaries noted an increase in decorum, docility, and gravity among their native charges. This transformation could go too far, when new converts imagined that to be good Christians, they had to Uve "tout à fait à la Françoise." Missionaries cautioned that "rustic candor is preferable to defective courtesy."56 Perhaps unavoidably, however, the new Christians, Uving close to the French settlement and dealing frequently with French authorities, took up important if superficial elements of the French way of life.

Consistent with the idea of conversion as the overturning of traditional Ufe, Jesuit Relations portrayed neophytes as "new men," the embodiments of virtue in contradistinction to the impure ways of their fellows. The 1636 drowning of the young Montagnais convert baptized "Fortuné" called forth this eulogy:"He was neither liar, nor quarrelsome, nor glutton, nor lazy: the four vices which seem to be born with these peoples, good-for-nothing and Ubertine to the fuUest extent."57 Baptism had turned this fortunate soul into a true dévot; he had prayed at every meal, confessed frequently, and experienced douleur, or sorrow, for his sins. He thus broke from his cruel and filthy culture.58 Other new converts renounced their peers and their own famflies. One young man told the Jesuits that his baptism had "stopped his ears" :"I no longer hear the licentious words that heedless youths sometimes utter in our cabin. It is impossible to understand how glad my heart is to free itself from its sins."59

Jesuits explained the relatively small number of neophytes through reference to this demanding model of conversion. St. Augustine, not to mention the dévots of seventeenth-century France, would have been pleased at the virtue attained through conversion: "They imagine that those who are baptized must quit their sins and their vices, to lead a new life: which is true."60 In 1639, Le Jeune reported how firmly this understanding was rooted among the Montagnais converts, who were even critical of apostatizing colonists: "They believe that to be a Chris-

5Ti?, VoI.9, p.263(l636).
KIbid.
56TA1Vol. 29, pp. 127-129 (1645-46).
5TA1Vol. 9, pp. 223-225 (1636).
"Ibid., p. 223.
"T*, Vol. 18, p. 139 (1640).
60TR1Vol. 14, p. 223 (1638). See Augustine of Hippo, The City of God, Bk. XLX, chap. xxv.

tian and a foe to vice, is one and the same thing."[61] Other Jesuit sources speak of the discipline with which the converts upheld the Christian life: Lenten fasting and processions in the most severe winter weather, and engaged participation at Mass and sermon. Indeed, these "chrestiens sauvages" were a powerful example of righteous living compared to the worldly elements of the French colony. Only conversion spared them the corruption of the ungodly European.[62]

Yet the newly devout Montagnais illustrated the weakness of the high-powered program of conversion promoted by these Jesuits. The 1640 Relation claimed that 1200 adult neophytes in réductions at Québec and Trois Pdvières Uved in "most delightful happiness and innocence"—according to the broad intent of reformed Catholicism—and daily proved that "there is no barbarian condition that is proof against God's goodness."[63] At Trois Rivières, Christian Montagnais tolerated no "public fault" and used the solidarity of the faithful to suppress deviance "with a zeal -which we had never dared to expect from the sauvages"[64] Discussing the means of conserving themselves in the faith, the zealous argued that any and all shortcomings warranted emprisonment, forced fasting, and other punishment. The converts practiced self-flagellation as penance for infractions involving alcohol or attendance at divine services.[65] A noted ethnohistorian has argued that this enthusiasm may be evidence of a kind of syncretism, in which Algonquian mysticism intersected with Catholic rigorism.[66] Whether precontact Montagnais ever sought out such mortification of the flesh in the name of a new God remains unclear.

Excessive zeal, however, was unsettling, as was the resort to constraint to preserve the faith. Having unleashed the forces of rigorism, missionaries then advised against proceeding with too much severity. "Zeal without knowledge is a poor guide."[67] Jesuits were aware that external observance did not necessarily reveal inner piety; they wondered whether in their "indiscreet piety" the neophytes were simply imitating the French, mistaking exaggerated politesse for true Christian expression.

61TA1VoL 16, p. 43 (1639).

62See Le fournal desfésuites, ed. Laverdière and Casgrain [1871] (Dubuque, 1970), pp. 14-15; 22-23.

63TA1Vol. 18, p. 119(1640).

6TA1Vol. 20, p. 143 (1640-41).

aIbid.,pp. 143-145, l49-151;TÄ,VoL29,p.79 (1645-46).

"Cornelius Jaenen, The Role of the Church in New France (Toronto, 1976), p. 70.

6TA1Vol. 29, p. 127 (1645-46).

Yet the communities of Montagnais converts represented a breakthrough for the Jesuits, as a statement of their efficacy against doubters and skeptics back home. Here was proof that "Christ's grace was more powerful than Nature."[68] The loosening of traditional bonds aUowed the reshaping of individuals who were responsive only to the Christian God, receptive to discipline, and "horrified by their former superstitions." Prayer had replaced dancing, as hymn-singing had banished drumming.[69] A note of embarrassment creeps into later missionary accounts of the new communities: perhaps the Montagnais neophytes resembled too much the dévot extremists who advocated a quasi-theocratic police state back in the cities of France.[70] However, this was one fruit of the Jesuit strategy: the former hunters settled and lived according to theocratic principles, with a new and in many cases foreign individual and collective discipline, enforced by missionary surveUlance. Conversion had created new men, but also Christian community raw and confused, rather than pure and simple. Most of the gains had been to the Church triumphant; the Church militant remained an embattled and extreme minority, whose members rejected their former selves at the expense of traditional community, and who Uved at the crest of a wave of enthusiasm which in Canada, as in France itself, would prove difficult to sustain.[71]

The Montagnais converts were thus assimüated, at least in part, to the French project in seventeenth-century North America. The total transformation sought by Jesuits in the first half of that century gave way to a more flexible approach, less insistent upon the literal inscription of Christian rules on native society. Later missionaries would adopt the "flying mission" to Algonquian peoples of the hinterland; no longer was it thought essential or practical to settle these hunters. Jesuits came to the view that "while they live in the woods, they are still men": grace could operate in forest as weU as fields.[72] In the twentieth century, the strategy to convert the Montagnais appears quixotic and furnishes an identity mainly in the negative for Montagnais themselves. These boreal peoples know CathoUcism, but as resurgent Montagnais culture attests,

'•"/«,Vol. 18, pp. 111-113 (1640).

6JR, Vol. 22, p. 45 (1642).

7"See Alain Talion, La Compagnie du Saint-Sacrament (Paris, 1990), pp. 107-154.

"¦Briggs, op. cit. ,p. 364.

72See Paul Ragueneau's promotion of mission to Algonquian peoples in the deep interior, where "they have no other Church than the woods and forests; no other Altar than the rocks on which break the waves of this Lake."/R,Vol. 33, pp. 151-153The change in strategy is summarized by John W.Grant,Moo« of Wintertime (Toronto, 1980), pp. 47-58.

not in the form in which Le Jeune and his rigorist confrères had hoped.73

The Jesuit strategy was to instruct but most of aU to reorganize traditional native life into a form which aUowed for more comprehensive surveUlance of nature and the elimination of customs and beUefs which hindered grace. They proposed the rigorous implementation of a sacramental regime, with attention to the interior conduct of neophytes and their evaluation as individuals rather than as members of kin-groups or community. Such was the concept of conversion, as understood by seventeenth-century French elites, applied to peoples so apparently bereft of the basic guidance and restraints of civUized life.

Conversion of the Montagnais in the first half of the seventeenth century proved to be a task beyond the immediate capacity of the Jesuits—itself a bitter disappointment, so confident were they of their comprehensive strategy. Yet viewed from beyond the immediate confines of the mission to New France, the mission assumed a success more than numbers would indicate. The New Christians, a now select group living apart from the barbarizing conditions of an old culture, could be held up as exemplars of a new, disciplined kind of Christianity, a religion which aUowed them to transcend sauvage conditions and alight with confidence on the path of civUization. In such a wholesale transformation of sauvage peoples lay a triumph for the militant Church: it demonstrated unequivocaUy that grace had powers greater than nature, and that the prescriptions offered by the Jesuits, in particular, had great efficacy. WhUe future generations of missionaries went back to the forests with the Algonquians, the example of drawing these peoples out of the woods in order to convert them would not be forgotten and would provide the basis for the colonial reserve system.

Jesuits had come a long way from their medieval forebears. The strength of their program lay in its capacity to penetrate and to adapt to local cultures. Yet the militancy of seventeenth-century members of the order may have run at cross-purposes to the very flexibility of its approaches. Experts in the brinksmanship of early modern confessional battle, Jesuits in New France demanded absolute expressions of the faith, and despite an advanced understanding of native culture they showed Uttle patience in allowing the gradual transformation of these pagans. The heightened assault of preaching and castigation reflects the

73For the subsequent development of Christianity among the indigenous population, see Grant, op. cit., pp. 239-263. On the Montagnais and the contemporary culture of northern hunters, see Hugh Brody, Living Arctic (Toronto, 1987).

breakdown of a more hopeful project: that these people might adapt their own natures to a pure and simple Christianity, and that whole communities might enter intact into the faith. Instead, conversion brought individuals into the Christian tradition as interpreted by the rigorist church, while hastening the disappearance of a traditional way of life.

CATHOLIC EVANGELIZING IN ONE COLONIAL MISSION: THE INSTITUTIONAL EVOLUTION OFJOS PREFECTURE, NIGERIA, 1907-1954

BY

Andrew E. Barnes*

This article describes the development of the Catholic mission to the Northern Province of the British colony of Nigeria during the colonial era. Its primary concern is to illustrate the complexity of the social/historical forces involved in shaping the institutional character of a mission, and then, as an example, to chart the institutional evolution of part of the mission to Northern Nigeria to diocesan status. Because of his contribution to this evolution, a second focus details the actions taken by Monsignor WiUiam Lumley, Apostolic Prefect of Jos (1934-1954), in regard to evangeUzing the indigenous population, and underlines the importance of these actions in the larger history of Christianity in Northern Nigeria.

Born out of a successful effort by the French Province of the Society of African Missions (SMA) to lay claim to territory previously under the jurisdiction of the Holy Ghost Fathers, the mission to Northern Nigeria was first estabUshed in 1907. Rome officially recognized it as a mission territory by naming it the ApostoUc Prefecture of Eastern Nigeria in 1911· Since the French Province of the SMA could never adequately staff the prefecture, Rome in 1929 granted a renamed and somewhat larger prefecture of Northern Nigeria to the Irish Province of the same order. In 1934 this prefecture was divided into two; the southern/eastern half becoming the prefecture of Jos, the northern/western half becoming the prefecture of Kaduna. In 1954, six years before Nigeria

*Dr. Barnes is an associate professor of African and European history in Arizona State University, Tempe.

Abbreviations used in the notes below:

AHA=Arewa House Archives, Kaduna, Nigeria
JDA=JoS Diocese Archives, Jos, Nigeria
NAK=National Archives, Kaduna, Nigeria
PRO=PuWiC Record Office, London, Great Britain
SMAC=Society of African Mission Archives, Cork, Ireland

won its independence, both prefectures were promoted to dioceses. The concern here is with the original prefecture of Eastern, then of Northern Nigeria, and the later prefecture of Jos. The mission in these years evolved from an (unofficial) government outpost into a (de facto) immigrant African church, and then, still serving as an immigrant church, developed into a (rural) school system for indigenous Africans.

The Mission as (Unofficial) Colonial Outpost

Government poUcy in Northern Nigeria toward Christian missions during the colonial era was based upon the concept of containment. Areas were placed in three categories: Muslim-controlled and -populated; Muslim-controlled but predominantly "pagan" in population;"pagan"-controlled and -populated. Missionaries were permitted to establish stations only in areas in the last category. Muslim-controUed and -populated regions werein the extreme north and centered around urban emirates. Muslim-controlled but predominantly "pagan" regions were mostly adjacent to these emirates. "Pagan"-controlled and -populated areas were in the belt of tropical forest which stretched a hundred or so mUes north of the Niger-Benue waterway, and in the savanna lands upon what was first caUed the Bauchi, then later the Jos Plateau. In effect, Christian missions were held back from proselytizing in the densely populated, commerciaUy developed cities which had once made up the Sokoto Caliphate, and were directed instead toward hunter-gatherer and peasant societies too remote or pugnacious to have been conquered or "civiUzed" by Muslims.1

Even within the region in which they were allowed access, the government further sought to discourage missionaries from their preferred practice of traveling from village to vUage preaching through interpreters.2 The government wanted missions to take the leading role in "civUizing" individual ethnic groups, a task administrators understood to involve settling in a given location and concentrating on supplying medical services and vocational training. Behind this set of constraints was a desire to inhibit the appearance in the North of the Christianized

1On the colonial government's views of the relationship between "pagan" territories and the Muslim emirates, see J. A. BaUard, " Pagan Administration' and Political Development in Northern Nigeria," Savanna, I (June, 1972), 1-14. On resistance to Muslim conquest see James H. Morrison, "Plateau Societies' Resistance to Jihadist Penetration," in Elizabeth Isichei (ed.), Studies in the History ofPlateau State, Nigeria (London, 1982), pp. 136-150.

2See E. R T. Crampton, Christianity in Northern Nigeria (London, 1976), pp. 45-72.

Africans perceived by officials to be the source of social and political unrest in Southern Nigeria.3

The Protestant missions against which these restrictions were aimed did not accept them passively. Organized with the goal of reviving the crusade against Islam or, as the letterhead of the Sudan United Mission announced, of giving the peoples of Northern Nigeria a choice between "Christ or Mohammed," the missions understood their task as identifying and aiding potential converts. As the group eventually known as the Sudan Interior Mission explained in justifying an earlier name change from the "African Industrial Mission" to the "African Evangelistic Mission," the change was necessary to dispel the impression that its object "was to civUize rather than evangelize."4 Almost from the start the missions lodged individual protests in London about the controls imposed on their activities in Northern Nigeria.5 Lack of success with this approach led the missions to join together and take their case to the International CouncU of Missions. Pressure from this organization had some impact, and in 1927 the newly appointed governor-general of Nigeria, Sir Graeme Thomson, reversed previous policy and announced that in the future Christian missions would be allowed to proselytize in Muslim territories. In Northern Nigeria itself, missionaries continually challenged the government's ban on itinerant evangelical preaching. They also resisted the government's efforts to pressure them into evangelizing through schools and to determine the curriculum in the schools they did maintain. Among themselves the missions declared and maintained a policy of "spheres of influence," by which they agreed not to compete but to work together to place the maximum number of mission stations in the maximum number of viUages.6

The Catholic mission profited by the battle between colonial administrators and Protestant missionaries, becoming to administrators if not a model mission, at least one that they could point to as realizing their ideas of how a mission could best serve the region. These ideas were remarkably medieval. In its first incarnation, the Catholic mission, like some twelfth-century frontier abbey, served as an agricultural extension

JOn government perceptions of African Christians as the source of most of colonial Nigeria's social ills see A. E. Barnes, " Evangelization Where It Is Not Wanted' ": Colonial Administrators and Missionaries in Northern Nigeria during the First Third of the Twentieth Century, Journal of Religion in Africa, 25 (1995), 412-441.

4James H. Morrison, "Jos Plateau Societies: Internal Change and External Influences 1890-1935" (Ph.D. dissertation, University of Ibadan, 1976), p. 270.

»See, for examples, PRO CO/583/63; PRO CO/583/82.

'See Barnes,"Evangekzation," and Crampton op. cit., pp. 60-72.

service, a dispensary, and a hostel for travelers going to and from Nigeria's northern and southern cities.

The three French (Alsatian) SMA priests who canoed up the Benue in 1907 were directed by mission headquarters in Lyons simply to find a way to stay alive, the order having no money to subsidize them. The leader of the group, Monsignor Oswald Waller, had already had six years' experience as a missionary in Egypt and eight more in Dahomey. In Egypt he had acquired some real expertise in agriculture.7 The group arrived with no idea of -where to estabUsh a mission. They were directed by the mission priest in Lokoja, then the northernmost Catholic mission station, to the district of a resident administrator with known Catholic sympathies. Captain (later Major) U. F. Ruxton, the administrator in question, influenced them—with a promise of a road in the not-too-distant future—to settle at a large viUage in the lowlands just south of the Jos Plateau. The viUage of Shendam was the seat of the Long Goemai, or paramount chief of the Goemai (Ankwe) people. It had previously served as a garrison for troops from the Royal Niger Company, and the people had already displayed a tolerance, if not an interest in Europeans. During their first year, the priests lived off the generosity of the Long Goemai, who clearly perceived some value in having a resident set of Europeans.8

Over its first few decades in Shendam, the Catholic mission grew in three ways, all in response to opportunities provided by the government. First, it became an agricultural mission. Monsignor Waller took credit for introducing yams, cassava, and sweet potatoes into the region. During a visit a few months after the mission was set up in Shendam, Captain Ruxton gave it an iron plow and a bull to puU it. The priests first used it in 1910, to the amazement of a large crowd which gathered to see how it was possible for a bull to dig up the earth. Over the next few years the government sent teams of herdsmen with their animals to the

7Jarleth Walsh, S.M.A., The Growth of the Catholic Church in the Diocese of fos 1907-1978: The Contribution of the Society of African Missions to its Development (Ibadan, 1993), pp. 17-61. On the beginnings and initial development of the prefecture see also the Shendam Mission Coutumier (hereafter "Mission Diary") and J. Mouren, "The Catholic Missions in Northern Nigeria: Foundation and the First Years, 1906-1910" (written memoir by one of the first missionaries), both avaUable SMAC; J. Strebler, "Shendam, Berceau de l'Eglise du Nigeria du Nord," Ralliement, Numéro special (Strasbourg, 1964).

"See Walsh, op. cit., pp. 23-24. See also E. M. Maigada, "The Catholic Mission m Goemailand, 1907-1971 "(B.A. thesis, University of Jos, 1971); John Ola Agi, "The Goemai and their Neighbors: an Historical Analysis," m Isichei, Studies, pp. 98-107. On Major Upton FitzHerbert Ruxton see Robert Heussler, The British in Northern Nigeria (London, 1968), pp.

mission to learn how to use the plow. The priests also planted orange and lemon trees and supplied administrators with home-grown tobacco. From the start they had acquired sheep, buying up the animals the government claimed from local peoples as tax. Various sympathetic administrators also supplied them with cattle and oxen. In 1916, a rebellion by the Montol (MontoU), a local people, against government taxes resulted in a large expedition of government troops which confiscated aU of the Montol's livestock. The Catholic mission bought so many of these animals that it had to turn several buUdings into stables.9 Since the government wanted missions to push agricultural development, it publicized the Catholic mission's farm far and wide. Various agricultural "experts" were sent in to take a look. Even rival Protestant missionaries came to see what all the noise was about. At one point Captain Ruxton arranged for the transportation of some of the mission's maize to an agricultural fair in Lagos (where it won second prize).10

Second, the mission came to serve as a regional dispensary. Walsh, in his history of the mission, describes how the priests early began to go into Shendam and baptize dying inhabitants. Villagers made a connection between the priests "water of God" and the subsequent demise of all who were sprinkled with it, with the result that sick viUagers were carted off and hidden in the hüls by their relatives before the priests could get to them.11 Still, in 1914, during an outbreak of smallpox, the mission became a government-suppUed vaccination center. From that date the mission diary records instances of Africans traveling for as many as four or five days to be treated for snake bite. The dispensary became an important enough aspect of the mission's activities that in 1928 one of the priests spent some time in Kano taking a government-sponsored course in first aid.12

The third and perhaps the most important way in which the mission grew was by becoming a hostel for Europeans passing through the region on their way to the cities of the north and south. Many government officials used the mission as a rest house, bringing their wives for a few days of relaxation. The hunting in the surrounding area was ap-

"See Walsh, op. cit., pp. 26-28; Strebler, op. cit., pp. 22-24; Elizabeth Isichei,"Colonialism Resisted," in \sichei, Studies, pp. 217-219.

10On the buU and plow see Mouien, op. cit., pp. 11-12.On teams of herders see Mission Diary,passim for 1911-1914. On the prize for corn see Mission Diary, entries for October 25, 1910, and January 31, 1911.

"Walsh, op. cit., pp. 42-43.

12Mission Diary, I9I4-1920,passim.

parently exceUent, and large organized hunts were annual events in which administrators, other expatriates, and several of the priests participated. Also, administrators used Shendam as a staging point for their expeditions against local peoples who refused to pay their taxes. There was some talk of developing the village as an administrative center, but the development of tin mining and the building of the raUroad to the mining region shifted government interest farther north up on the plateau.13

The most important way in which the mission did not grow was as a center of evangelization. It is perhaps emblematic of the mission's (lack of) success in this regard that the first two Africans baptized were two condemned prisoners on their way to be executed." The mission made extensive use of local people during harvest seasons. And once the priests acquired some facility in local languages, every week one would tour the vUlage, greeting and speaking with the people. And over the course of the first decades, the mission estabUshed stations in other Goemai villages. But whUe the Goemai saw the benefit of having the mission in their midst, for example, seeking refuge in the compound In Shendam during the Montol uprising, they were largely unresponsive to the priests' proselytizing. Twenty-five of the thirty-four people baptized during the mission's first ten years In existence were baptized "in danger of death." In 1912 one famUy was willing to aUow two young sisters to be baptized. Another little girl received baptism the foUowing year. But the Goemai could not be induced to allowed their young men to become Christians.15

Several administrators, however, brought young boys freed from slave traders to the priests to raise, so gradually a coterie of "mission boys" came into existence. Not all the mission boys received baptism, and some that did, did not remain Christian. StUl, their arrival provided the priests with shepherds. This development relieved some of the tension which had built up between the mission and the Long Goemai, to whom the priests had turned to supply village boys for the unwelcome and locaUy unfamUiar task of stock-tending.16 Monsignor WaUer was opposed to building a mission through schools, believing that aU that education produced was Africans full of pride and eager for material gain.17

"See Mission D'ary, passim for 1907-1925.
"Walsh, op. cit., p. 42.
KIbid., pAi.
16See Mouren, op. cit., pp. 17-19.
17WalSh, op. cit., p. 51.

He did consent to a school for the mission boys, however. Under pressure from his subordinates, in 1913 he aUowed this school to be opened to local boys. By 1919 the school had grown large enough that there was talk of making it into a primary school and seeking government support. But in 1922 it was discovered that two of the boys taken in, both sons of chiefs, were already married (one had two wives). Since the expectation was that at the completion of the program students would receive baptism, and since it was felt that boys already married "in pagan fashion" would not make good Christians, both boys were expelled. The repercussions of this act led to the decline of the school, from forty students in 1919 to only ten six years later. At this point a government official fortuitously intervened. He appeared one day without warning to evaluate the school and its students. Announcing the students to be "perfect," he immediately hired them all as government census takers at what was for local people the astronomical sum of four pounds a month. After that, the mission had no problem with getting students for its school.[18]

During the years that the mission had Uttle success with local people, it did serve as a chapel for Catholics in Northern Nigeria. Some of the Europeans passing through were CathoUcs seeking an opportunity to perform religious devotions. On several occasions African Catholics also stopped at Shendam. For example, in 1919 a couple from the Cameroon were baptized, confirmed, took communion, and got married one morning, then in the evening had their three chUdren baptized.[19] In 1918, Catholics from the Southern Province living in the sabon gari, or "new town" created for Southerners adjacent to the city of Kano, wrote to Monsignor WaUer requesting the services of a priest. Waller traveled there himself, and became so involved that he decided to move there permanently in 1921. Getting permission to build a church in Kano took several years of battle with the resident administrator, but in 1922 permission was granted. In 1925, Saint Elizabeth's of Kano opened to become, in Walsh's words, "the defacto but not dejure capital of the prefecture."[20] Also in the 1920s, priests from the mission

"The story is narrated by Walsh, op. cit., pp. 54-55. Note that in his version of the story Jatau gives figures of forty for 1919 and twenty-five for 1925. See Peter Jatau, The Catholic Church in the Field of Education in Northern Nigeria considered from the Principles of Canon Law (J.CD. dissertation, Pontificia Universitas Urbaniana, Rome, 1967), pp. 102-103.

"Mission Diary, entry for May 2, 1920.

20See Walsh, op. cit., pp. 58-59.

began to make an annual tour of the railroad camps, baptizing and performing other religious rites for the Southerners working there.21

As Monsignor WaUer used to counsel his missionaries, survival is the first order of life. What the Catholic mission got in exchange for following the government's lead was sufficient material support not only to survive, but to prosper with Uttle subsidization from Europe. Jean Benoist's study of Catholic missions in the French Sudan suggests that the willingness to serve as an extension of the colonial government was part of the French Catholic missionary mentality.22 Certainly the French priests were more accommodating to the demands of administrators than were Protestant missionaries, or Irish missionaries would be. No doubt, Captain Ruxton had been weU-meaning in his suggestion of Shendam. StiU it is worth pointing out that placing the mission in a remote place, among people with Uttle previous exposure to what was then labeled "civilization," exactly fit the government's ambitions for the role of missions in the development of the North. And as the priests discovered when they tried to establish mission stations in northern cities, administrators could be far less sympathetic and supportive when it was a question of missionary intrusion into what the government considered Muslim territory. The ways in which the Catholic mission to Northern Nigeria initiaUy developed placed it at a disadvantage in the competition for converts. While the Catholic mission was limiting itself to piecemeal conversions in GoemaUand, coUectively the Protestant missions were establishing themselves everywhere In the North the government would allow.

The Mission as (De Facto) Immigrant Church

Between 1925, when Monsignor WaUer returned to Europe for good, and 1934, when the prefectures of Jos and Kaduna were erected, the Catholic mission to Northern Nigeria developed in three distinct ways: the French mission gave way to an Irish one; the rural mission centered around Shendam gave way to an urban one dispersed among northern cities; and a mission associated with government plans for the social de-

21MiSSiOn Oiary, passim for the 1920's.

"Joseph Benoist, Eglise et pouvoir colonial au Soudan français : les relations entre les administrateurs et les missionnaires catholiques dans la Boucle du Niger, de 1885 à 1945 (Paris, 1987).

velopment for indigenous Northern traditionalists became associated first and foremost with the spiritual needs of immigrant Southern Catholics. In effect, the mission ceased to function as a farm and hostel in the lowlands south of the Jos Plateau and took on a new persona as the spiritual center of a coUection of ethnic communities carving out a niche for themselves in inhospitable urban environments.

The replacement of the French by the Irish put the Catholic mission on much more solid footing. The Irish Province of the SMA supplied enough men to effectively double the number of priests in the prefecture to approximately eight at any given time. Equally important was the greater financial support granted the mission by the Irish Province. While the mission continued to be underfunded, the Irish SMA did provide sufficient support to relieve the dependency on the farm in Shendam. New missionaries thus were free to be posted to urban areas. Financial support from Ireland also allowed the mission to shift its focus from introducing Christianity to peasant traditionalists to pasturing already converted ethnic minorities. Unlike the case in the foundation of the mission in Shendam, there were few friendly government officials eager to aid in the consolidation of a Catholic presence in northern cities. There was, in fact, active government resistance. Support from Ireland, however, permitted the missionaries to weather the disappearance of the government support which had been so crucial to the mission's early survival.

Behind all these developments was the ongoing immigration of Africans from Nigeria's Southern Province.[23] The migration had its start in the 1910's, when the tin mines opened on the Jos Plateau. But it had its greatest boost during the 1920's, when the colonial government pushed the railroad Unes as far north as Kano, opening up public- and private-sector jobs to which Southerners flocked. Particularly attractive were clerical jobs, created by the expansion of both government and commercial bureaucracies and available because local people had no command of English.[24] Concerned that Southerners would corrupt the indigenes, the government segregated the newcomers in the aforementioned sabon gari areas of the cities and in barakins (work camps)

"For an overview on Christian Southerner migration to Northern Nigeria see Crampton, op. cit., 137-144.

24On the development of tin mining on the Jos Plateau, see BiU Freund, Capital and Labour in the Nigerian Tin Mines (Atlantic Highlands, New Jersey, 1981). On the development of Jos Township, see Leon Plotnicov, Strangers to the City: Jos, Nigeria (Pittsburgh, 1981).

along the railroad line.25 Christian missions were allowed into these areas in order to provide for the spiritual needs of the Southerners. Thus even before Thomson's reversal of government policy toward Christian proselytizing in northern cities, a Christian presence in these cities was a fait accompli. Administrators zealously watched, however, to make sure that the missionaries did not branch out and try to incorporate indigenous peoples into their congregations.

After decades of frustration down in Goemailand, it is not surprising that mission leaders came to identify Southerners as the future of the Catholic mission. In his 1927 annual report to Propaganda Fide, after explaining (erroneously) that three-fourths of the population of Northern Nigeria was Muslim, and thus off-limits to proselytization, Father Schahl, pro-prefect and effective leader of the French mission after Monsignor Waller's departure, described the remaining quarter open to evangelization as naked cannibals, some of whom could not even count to ten.26 He consciously contrasted these Northerners with "inteUigent and enterprising" immigrants from the South, of whom he noted in his 1931 annual report:

> They are generally reliable. If once they become Catholics, they continue to come regularly to Church, and a good many are sincere and loyal Christians to the end of their lives.27

Monsignor Porter, who served as prefect apostoUc of the short-lived prefecture of Northern Nigeria from 1930 to 1933, in his 1932 annual report echoed Schahl's views, describing Southerners as "our people."28

For "our people," the missionaries concentrated on building churches and schools. Besides in Kano, churches were constructed in Zaria, Kaduna, Minna, and Jos. Each of these churches had a resident priest. Each also had a school attached. In the "line" stations along the raUway which connected these cities, schools -were constructed. These schools doubled as centers where Mass was offered during the priests' periodic visits.29

"See Plotnicov, op. cit., pp. 40-50; G. O. Olunsanya.'The Sabon Gari System in Northern States of Nigeria,"Nigeria Magazine, no. 94 (September, 1967), pp. 242-248; H.J. B. AUen, "Aspects of Urban Administration in the Northern States of Nigeria," Savanna, I (June, 1972), 17-18.

26SMAC, Annual Report to Propaganda Fide, 1927.

27SMAC, Annual Report to Propaganda Fide, 1931.

28SMAC, Annual Report to Propaganda Fide, 1932.

29See Jatau, op. cit., pp. 102-108; Walsh, op. cit., pp. 62-73.

The desire to develop existing Catholic communities came to take precedence within the mission over the eagerness to create new ones. By the late 1920's it had become clear that schools presented the most promising avenue for evangelizing indigenous non-Muslims. Preoccupation with Southerners and their needs, however, inhibited such a movement. Down in Shendam the missionaries had used Monsignor Waller's absences (first in Kano, then in Europe) as an excuse to ignore his strictures and to build a system of schools which fed the central school in Shendam.30 This approach bore fruit with the emergence in the late 1920's of the first group of Shendam-trained Goemai teacher-catechists.31 The Irish thought to buUd on this first step. An obstacle, however, was that the government prohibited the use of teachers from the Southern Province in schools for Northern students. Before expansion through schools could be attempted, it was necessary to train a larger corps of teacher-catechists. In 1932, a "Vernacular Training College" (VTC) was opened at Shendam with twelve students.32 In compliance with government regulations, the school offered a program in teacher training taught in Hausa, certifying students to teach in Northern Province schools. The plan was to expand outward from the Goemai base and to use teacher-catechists to evangelize the North.33

WhUe a plan to missionize indigenes existed, it had a far lower priority and claim on mission resources than the building up of Southerner communities. Monsignor Waller had made Kano the defacto capital of the prefecture. Thus Rome's decision to pass over Kano is revealing. Kano was the seat of a great and ancient emirate. Establishing a prefecture there would have invited open conflict with the government. Jos and Kaduna were both, in a way, sabon gari. Kaduna achieved prominence only after being designated the new Northern capital in 1916. Jos emerged at about the same time because of its climate and the tin mining Industry. Population growth in both cities was the result of Southern immigration. In choosing Jos and Kaduna, Rome affirmed the conviction, put forward in the reports it received from the prefects, that growth in Northern Nigeria would come through the expansion of immigrant Catholic communities.

»Walsh, op. cit., p. 57.

"See Maigada, op. cit., pp. 58, 63-64; Walsh, op. cit., p. 75.

,2Worth noting in comparison is that the Sudan United Mission also opened a "Training Centre" in 1932, at Gindiri. Of its eighteen original students, fifteen went on to become evangelists (preachers). Only three became teachers. Albert Ozigi and Lawrence Ocho, Education in Northern Nigeria (London, 1981), p. 33-

"See M. Flynn, "Shendam's New Training College," African Missionary, 1931, pp. 10-1 l; Jatau, op. cit., pp. 107-108; Walsh, op. cit., p. 76.

The Mission as a (Rural) School System

Between 1934 and 1954 in Jos prefecture priorities were reversed, and the establishment of an indigenous church became the object of the mission's attentions and resources. Southerners continued to migrate north, however, and Southerner communities continued to grow. So for most of the period the mission simultaneously maintained two essentially autonomous institutional existences, the first as a network of urban community churches for Southerners, the second as a network of rural schools for Northerners. The only link between the two was the priests who served the first as chaplains and the second as managers.

The network of rural schools which came into existence represented an innovation which merits some explanation. Evangelization through schools was a common strategy followed by missions in Africa. Two factors, however, viz., government restrictions against other types of evangelization, and African demand for reading and writing skiUs, gave the strategy added importance in colonial Northern Nigeria, an importance the Catholic mission was the first to recognize and exploit.

Colonial administrators never conceded defeat in their battle to restrict proselytizing in Muslim areas. The Protestant missions' apparent triumph in 1927 in their battle to gain access to the Muslim emirates was an illusion. Administrators simply developed more sophisticated tactics, for example, responding most favorably only to applications for mission sites which made promises to provide dispensary services, and inserting a clause in the "certificates of occupancy" which missionaries had to obtain before building on a site that required the missionaries to agree not to "pubUcly proselytize" in any vUlage with a "Mohammedan or predominantly Mohammedan" population.34

In 1927 an external evaluation of Nigeria's educational system (by a missionary) condemned both the inadequacy and the Muslim bias of existing Northern programs.35 The evaluation triggered a decision to

"On dispensaries see C.N.Ubah.'Christian Missionary Penetration of the Nigerian Emirates, with Special Reference to the Medical Missions Approach," in The Muslim World, 77 (1987); on "certificates of occupancy" see PRO CO 583/176/1014.

"See A. G. Fraser, "Report on the Educational System of Northern and Southern Provinces of Nigeria," AHA-K. 5172/v. 1. For the reaction of local officials, see this file and also AHA-CC. 0032 (1928). For the reaction of government officials in London see PRO CO 583/157/18. See also Andrew E. Barnes, "Some Smoke behind the Fire: The Fraser Report and Its Aftermath in Colonial Northern Nigeria," Canadian fournal ofAfrican Studies, forthcoming.

amalgamate the departments of education in the Southern and Northern Provinces and to find a director of education who could handle the delicate task of "sav[ing] the situation" in the North.[36] E. R.J. Hussey, the man chosen for the task, unveiled in 1930 an ambitious plan for a state-maintained school system which would address the identified problems, while precluding any need for reliance on mission schools. The world-wide depression of the early thirties prohibited the implementation of this plan, forcing the government to turn again toward the missions for assistance in educating the peoples in traditionalist areas.[37]

Several of the Protestant missions, however, continued to balk at the idea of fostering secular education.[38] In response Hussey reformed and promoted an older form of reUgious class known as a "Class in ReUgious Instruction" (CRI). CRTs had no official form and previously had not been regulated. They had fiUed the niche between a primary school and a catechism class, potential converts needing to learn to read before they could learn the catechism. As reformed by Hussey, CRTs permitted the acquisition of reading skills sufficient to read devotional Uterature and of mathematical skills sufficient to count up to 1000. They were taught in the vernacular by indigenous Northerners. In order to make CRIs attractive to mission directors, Hussey exempted them from government inspection.[39] Protestant mission leaders remained relatively lukewarm, seeing CRIs as a prod toward a commitment to school development and away from the forms of evangelizing they preferred such as itinerant preaching.[40]

Monsignor William Lumley, the first and only prefect of Jos, saw CRIs differently. As he observed in his annual report to Propaganda Fide in 1939:

> Primitive natives who wish a school accept the Religious Instruction Class as a school at the onset. Government gives its approval for Classes for

[36] As commented by Hans Vischer, former Director of Education for the North, in minutes to the Colonial Office file on amalgamation of the two education departments. See PROCO 583/157/18, p. 6a.

[37] See PRO CO 583/173/826, and A. R. AUen, "The Effects of the Slump on Education in the Northern Provinces of Nigeria (1929-1939)," Savanna, I (June, 1972), 197-207.

[38] For examples of missionary sentiment on this topic, see PRO CO 583/166/6, pp. 29, 54-55.

[39] See PRO CO 583/194/14, and F. O. Ogunlade, "Differential Trends in the Development of Western Education in Nigeria: The Case of the Middle Belt" (dissertation, University of Birmingham, 1982), pp. 106-110. See also Niels Kastfelt, Religion and Politics in Nigeria: A Study in Middle Belt Christianity (London, 1994), pp. 41-42.

[40] As Ogunlade pointed out, Protestant missions changed their attitude toward CRTs only in the 1940's. See Ogunlade, op. cit., pp. 221-222.

> Religious Instruction easily—not so for new schools. Once a Religious Class has been in existence for about two years, it is easier to get permission to open a school in the same place.41

Lumley recognized that whUe the Catholic mission had remained isolated down in Shendam, the Protestant missions had gotten a three-decade head start on establishing mission stations. This head start had aUowed them to "take possession of nearly all the accessible places of any importance."42 He also grasped the tactical value of CRIs, however, as a quick and simple way to establish a Catholic presence where it had not previously existed. Lumley placed CRIs at the heart of his strategy to establish some sort of parity between the Catholic mission and the Protestant missions In the region.

In seeking to interest missions in evangeUzation through schools, the government was responding to a popular demand for education. In Northern Nigeria the arrival of the British and their schemes for colonial development occurred abruptly in less than a generation. Suddenly villagers were confronted by a group of aliens demanding their labor and livestock. As suddenly, however, the presence of African clerks and soldiers among these aliens made villagers conscious of new ways to obtain wealth and status. The sight of Southerners dressed in European clothes, conversing in European languages, spending European money suggested to Northerners that there was something worth imitating about Southerners and their ways.43 And it did not take Northerners long to make the association between the inteUectual skiUs Southerners displayed and the religion the latter professed.

Available documents do not provide much information on African responses to mission initiatives. The success of the Catholic mission, once it began to missionize through the estabUshment of CRIs, though, suggests that indigenous Africans were more than merely receptive to proselytization made in the context of schools. As the SMA missionary Father Joseph Maguire observed in an interview about making first contact, vUage elders were the ones who brought up the subject of schools.44 Most of them, he went on to comment, figured that alone hav-

"SMAC, Annual Report to Propaganda Fide, 1939.

42SMAC, Annual Report to Progaganda Fide, 1934.

"Administrators noted the tendency of Northerners to imitate Southerners; see NAK 30844 and AHA 37914.

"Oral interviews conducted by the author with Father Joseph Maguire, S.M.A., Tudan Wada parish, Jos diocese, April-June, 1993 (hereafter "Father Maguire interviews"). At the time of the interviews, Father Maguire had been on mission in Northern Nigeria since 1948. Edited transcripts of the interviews are on deposit at SMAC. Interview on April 21, 1993.

ing a school in the viUage would suffice to bring down the "manna" of material prosperity.45 The mission in Goemailand, it wUl be remembered, had Uttle success until it estabUshed a school, and that school had Uttle success untU its value in terms of jobs in the European world was demonstrated. As one administrator observed in rejecting a Catholic mission appUcation for a site for a school, the only reason local youths wanted the school was that they thought "they would obtain salaried posts from which they and their parents may derive material benefit."46 And as Bruce pointed out in his comparative study of Christian-versus-Muslim evangelization among the Pyem, a regional ethnic group, in the 1940's and '50's, the terms "Christian" and "school" were synonymous for the Pyem, both words signaling individuals with aspirations for employment with the colonial state.47 Native Northerners understood the rewards to be gained from Western intellectual skiUs. They recognized that schools could provide these sküls, and they appreciated the utility of missions as suppliers of schools.

In evangelizing through schools, Lumley hit upon the one mission-provided commodity, education, for which the local African market was insatiable.48 Missionaries had ignored that demand before, fearful of the consequences of introducing Africans to secular learning. Lumley was the first missionary to realize that promising the rural people of Northern Nigeria this world was the one way to get them to contemplate the Christian idea of the next.

The Catholic mission did not have sufficient funds to develop and maintain both Southern churches and Northern schools. So Monsignor Lumley made the decision to leave Southern communities to themselves as much as possible, and to direct the mission's resources toward evangelizing local peoples. In assessing this decision, it seems fair to see it as motivated less by disapproval of Southerners, and more by a vision of a Northern-based church. Lumley shared in the general perceptions of expatriates in the North that Southerners were presumptuous and uncontroUable, "Protestant-minded" as he labeled it.49 Most of the immi-

"Father Maguire interviews, April 15, 1993.

«NAK Zaria Prof. C 4071, p. 17.

47Richard Bruce, "The Growth of Islam and Christianity: The Pyem Experience," in lsichei,Studies,pp. 224-241, at 234.

48The demand was so great that even private individuals petitioned the government to be aUowed to teach "night studies" in their homes to their neighbors. In at least two instances permission was granted as long as classes were kept under ten students. See NAK Mak. Prof. 3718.

49SMAC, Annual Report to Propaganda Fide, 1938. For examples of Protestant missionaries voicing simUar negative impressions of Southerners, see Crampton, op. cit., p. 139.

grant CathoUcs were Igbo who had been converted by Holy Ghost Fathers. Many continued to send any extra funds they had south to help maintain the churches in their home viUages.50 For Lumley, to concentrate on the needs of the Igbo was to help maintain the glory of the Holy Ghost Fathers at the expense of his own order.

More important, however, was his determination to win the indigenous peoples of the Northern countryside for "the One True Church." He looked upon non-Muslim indigenous Northerners in much the same way as Father Schahl had, except that he was convinced that they could make "progress" in the acquisition of civüization and that their gratitude would provide the basis for their evangelization. As noted above, Lumley was convinced that to expose the indigenous Northerner to the material benefits of Western civilization was to make a friend for the Catholic Church. One of his first initiatives was a scheme to get vUagers to maintain their compounds more neatly by an offer of a cash prize not only to the tidiest school students, but to their teachers.51 Father Maguire, who served his first years as an SMA missionary under Lumley, remembers Lumley in his later years, seated in the evening at a mission station, surrounded by village children to whom he tossed pieces of candy as a reward when one of them answered some query correctly.52 It was out of eagerness to evangelize Northerners that Lumley expressed the sentiment that the upkeep of Southerner schools and churches was a "tax" on the energies and resources of his missionaries.53

It had not been this way in the beginning. Initially Lumley had attempted to get through to Northerners by involving Southerners in their evangelization, arranging for several affluent Southerners to take in Northerners as "houseboys."54 A few years later, however, he was complaining that Southerners:

> . . . live a life apart from the indigenous natives of Northern Nigeria. Their attitude towards the latter is one of negative indifference and superiority. They refer to them as backward, and as "naked pagans."55

His response to the faUure of this initiative was to separate the service of Southerners from the mission to Northerners. Priests were cho-

50As Monsignor Lumley noted in his annual report for 1936. See SMAC, Annual Report to Propaganda Fide, 1936.

51SMAC, Lumley, "Letter, January 18, 1936."

"Father Maguire interviews, June 6, 1993-

53SMAC, Annual Report to the "Work of the Holy ChUdhood," 1934-35.

54SMAC,Annual Report to Propaganda Fide, 1935.

55SMAC, Annual Report to the "Work of the Holy ChUdhood," 1937.

sen and assigned to urban churches, leaving the rest of the missionaries to evangelize the countryside.56 Priests assigned to urban churches dealt almost exclusively with Southerners, alternating their time at the church with visits to isolated Southerner enclaves.57 Southerner communities had a socio-economic niche in the North because of their monopoly of inteUectual skills such as English. One of their primary expectations was that the Catholic mission would aid in passing these skUls on to their offspring. The mission developed a network of senior primary schools, with eight grades, going from Infants 1-2 through Standard 6. They were taught in English and subsidized by school fees. Teachers for these schools were recruited from the South. Very few Northerner children ever attended them.58

Meanwhile, Lumley concentrated on developing a rural school system built upon CRTs and manned by indigenous teacher-catechists. Lumley used CRTs as seedlings for mission stations, nurturing those where there was a positive response into junior primary schools. Local assistance was expected for this latter development, both with the application process before the colonial government and with the making of mud-bricks for the walls and the coUecting of grass for the roof. Most schools started out as Standards I—II. Some matured into Standards HI-IV. A teacher catechist was assigned for each grade, with a headmaster being appointed once a school reached Standard FV, the highest grade permitted for a junior primary school. AU instruction was in Hausa. Once buUt, the school served also as the assembly haU for aU mission-related activities, and as the priest's dormitory when he made a visit.59

This strategy depended upon a steady supply of teacher-catechists. Since the 1920's young Goemai males had been aware of the career op-

56Father Maguire interviews, May 4 and 12, 1993.

5"Once a year, for example, the priests assigned to Ste. Theresa's in Jos Township traveled several hundred miles to Maiduguri, near Lake Chad, to spend a week or so hearing confessions and giving communion to the members of the Igbo community there. See Father Maguire interviews, May 4, 1993-

"Father Maguire interviews, May 4, 1993- WhUe it is difficult to make comparisons, for the purposes of discussion it can be said that the system of education followed in colonial Nigeria featured a six-year primary education (Standards I-VI) followed by (up to) four years of secondary education in more specific areas. A school of Standards 1-iy a "junior primary school," would provide training roughly equivalent to Grades 1-6 in the American system, Standards V-VI providing a terminal degree functionally equivalent to an American high school diploma. On education in Nigeria see David B. Abernathy, The Political Dilemma of Popular Education: An African Case (Stanford, 1969); A. Babs Fafunwa, History ofEducation in Nigeria (Ibadan, 1991).

¦"Father Maguire interviews, April 15, 1993·

portunities for teacher-catechists. By the 1930s, young men from other ethnic groups had also become aware. In 1937 a second VTC was opened further south at Udei. In his 1939 annual report Lumley boasted of having, between Shendam and Udei, 110 boys "in training."60 Many of these boys never completed the four-year junior primary school program. Most only took the one-year course for a category "B," or entry level teaching certificate. AU had no more than the most rudimentary exposure to Western civilization—their education had been exclusively in Hausa. But even this superficial exposure provided a comparatively deeper understanding of Europeans and their ways than possessed by villagers living in isolation. Thus as teacher-catechists, male African converts created status for themselves in viUage society as "experts" on the outside world. And as a school matured and the number of"experts" stationed in the viUage increased, the Catholic presence took on a local image of a coterie of successful African mediators between the European and African worlds.61 As mentioned above, vülager leaders sought schools for their villages because they believed that schools would instantly bring material prosperity. It is interesting that when they discovered this not to be true, they still remained respectful of the school and the mission, perhaps because the presence of the teacher-catechists reminded them of the status Christian conversion could provide.62

In developing itself as a rural school system, the mission was stiU following the lead of the government, both in evangelizing through schools and in segregating Northerners from Southerners. It would be to slight Lumley's missionary strategy, however, to say that he was only following the path of least resistance. WhUe the Catholic mission never followed a policy of setting up stations in places where Protestant stations already existed, it did officiaUy reject the "spheres of influence" policy which, as foUowed by the Protestant missions, prohibited a mission from estabUshing a station in a territory claimed by another mission.63 A competition developed between the Catholic and various Protestant missions which the colonial government sought to control through the granting of "certificates of occupancy" for the land on which to build schools and churches.64 But as Lumley observed, the gov-

60SMAC Annual Report to Propaganda Fide, 1939-

"Father Maguire interviews, April 15; May 4, 1993-

^Father Maguire interviews, May 4, 1993-

"Crampton, op. cit., p. 149.

"One example of a confrontation which reached the level of government intervention took place m Kabba Province between the Roman Catholic Mission (Holy Ghost Fathers) and the Church Missionary Society (Anglican) between 1932 and 1934. See AHA 17227. Another took place in Idoma Division (Benue Province) between the Roman CathoUc

ernment was far more flexible about granting permission to open a CRI, than a school. Thus CRIs provided the Catholic mission with a loophole for evading government control of mission expansion and for establishing its presence even in places where Protestant missions had already taken hold.

In 1931, the prefecture of Northern Nigeria had approximately 300 native Northerner students in school, almost all in the Shendam area. In 1953, Jos prefecture had more than 4000. In 1931, Northerners represented about twenty percent of the 1300 students in Catholic schools across the North. Twenty years later they represented close to sixty percent of the 6600 students in Jos prefecture mission schools. In 1931, there were only seven schools for Northerners, again aU in the Shendam area. By 1953, there were ninety-five CRTs and schools spread out across Jos prefecture. The Catholic mission had essentially caught up ¦with the Protestant missions. And whUe the overwhelming majority of the 23,000 Catholics in the prefecture at the later date were Southerners, still an indigenous base had been established.65 Perhaps the best testament to the effectiveness of Lumley's strategy was that when, during the 1940's, the colonial government began to pay the salaries of all teachers, the Protestant missions adopted the same practice of aggressively using CRIs to advance their missions.66

The Achilles' heel of Monsignor Lumley's strategy was finance. Few viUagers had the capacity to financially support the mission's activities. The money for the maintenance of the immigrant churches was provided mostly by Southerner communities themselves. The money for the rural school system, however, had to be cobbled together from various sources: Catholic relief agencies such as the Work of the Holy ChUdhood and the St. Peter Claver Society; educational grants from the colonial government; contributions from Ireland; and, it should be ad-

Mission (Holy Ghost Fathers) and the Primitive Methodists in 1935. See NAK Mak Prof AR/INT/I/13. In Jos prefecture confrontations never reached this level. StUl, Walsh noted the friction which developed between the Catholic Mission and the Sudan United Mission in Kwalla (Plateau Province), and Kogoro (Zaria Province), whUe Crampton noted the confrontation which developed between the same two missions in Mumuye (Adamawa Province). See Walsh, op. cit., pp. 102-103, 116-118; Crampton, op. cit., pp. 149-150. An example of (the non-granting of) a Certificate of Occupancy being used by the government as a device to control the entry of the Catholic mission into a territory previously occupied by a Protestant mission took place in 1935 at Kankada, in Zaria Province. See NAK Zaria Prof.C 4071, pp. 14-17.

"Statistics for the 1930's taken from Jatau, op. cit., pp. 106-107; for the 1950's from Walsh, op. cit.,pp. 124-125.

"Ogunlade, op. cit., pp. 221-222.

mitted, Monsignor Lumley's wiUingness to borrow large sums of money without any clear idea about how they were to be repaid.[67] This latter source, unfortunately, was the one most heavily drawn upon. In a 1950 letter requesting funds from the provincial, Lumley admitted to being £10,000 in debt.[68] Three years later, the provincial was writing to Lumley, threatening to stop sending any monies if Lumley did not find a way to liquidate the debt of £4,000 he owed to the province.[69]

Another trade-off was the alienation of the Southerner communities through "benign neglect." Lumley simply ignored them as much as he could. Southerners, however, never gave up on their efforts to get the mission's attention. In 1945, the leaders of the Bukuru CathoUc community wrote Lumley a letter which suggested that if the "very sorry plight" of the local school was not addressed, Catholic parents would be forced to send their children to the schools of "pseudo missionary bodies" such as the Church Missionary Society.[70] When the ApostoUc Delegate came on official inspection In 1951, leaders of the Jos Catholic community tried to go over Lumley's head and interest the ApostoUc Delegate Ln their complaints.[71]

It did not help Lumley's efforts to control Southerners in Jos prefecture that their kinsmen further north in Kaduna prefecture flourished as the central concern of the mission. Worried that returning missionaries were passing on word of Southerner frustrations, and making invidious comparison between Kaduna's achievements and his own "evangelisation work," in a 1949 letter to the provincial Lumley commented:

> I consider Kaduna's policy disastrous—one . . . which will compromise our work for the North and Northerners. It is playing into the hands of those who want the Catholic mission to be identified with the Southerners in Northern Nigeria as "our people," and to keep us away from the Northern areas and Northerners as somebody else's people . . . [72]

Lumley was being unfair to Monsignor John McCarthy, prefect of Kaduna, who encountered much suffer government resistance to the evangelization of the countryside in the Muslim emirates which made

[67] See Walsh, op. cit., pp. 92, 125.

[68] SMAC "Confidential letter from Lumley to Provincial (KeUey), November 27, 1950." Note that the provincial responded by sending £5000.

[69] SMAC "Letter from the Provincial to Lumley," May 22, 1953.

[70] JDA. 'Letter from the Church members, Catholic Mission, Bukuru, to Monsignor Lumley. August 8, 1945."

[71] JDA, "Letter from Lumley to Father Hughes (priest in charge at Jos), May 8, 1951."

[72] SMAC, "Lumley to SMA Provincial, August 7, 1949"

up the bulk of his territory. In Kaduna prefecture the fate of the Catholic mission was necessarily tied to the development of the Southerner communities. Lumley was right, however, to sense that the importance he attached to buUding an indigenous base to the Catholic presence in Northern Nigeria, an importance which he felt justified all costs, was not appreciated back in Europe. In 1954, when Kaduna prefecture, like Jos, was elevated to a diocese, Monsignor McCarthy was chosen its first bishop. Lumley did not receive a simUar appointment.[73]

Conclusion

Both Crampton and Walsh identified the absence of any prohibition against alcohol consumption as a factor which helps explain the alacrity and ease with which the CathoUc mission, once it began to expand, successfuUy established itself in territories already claimed by Protestant missions.[74] Perhaps, but Africans had a more rational reason for turning to Catholicism. A more perceptive assessment is provided by Ozigi and Ocho, who observed that:

> The Dutch Reformed Church working in Tiv land lost many of its converts to the Roman Catholic Mission because the Roman Catholics preferred to have a curriculum which met the expressed demand of the people for a fuU literary education that would afford employment in government and commercial firms.[75]

The problems confronting the Protestant missions went beyond their predilection for evangelization through preaching and their refusal to concede defeat in a battle with government officials they could never win. Christianity as it was Introduced into Northern Nigeria by Protestant missions offered Africans Uttle that they could recognize as having positive social value. Until the 1930's, Christianity's first and foremost identity was as a crusade against Islam. Government success in containing the missions in traditionalist areas promoted a second guise as a crusade against traditional life and culture. Nudity, multiple wives, beer, traditionaUsts were informed, were the devices of Satan,

"Monsignor John Reddington, Vice-Provincial of the Irish SMA, became the first bishop of Jos. Lumley's reaction was to resign from the SMA. He finished his career as a parish priest in England. See Walsh, op. cit., pp. 122-123.

74See Crampton, op. cit., p. 150; Walsh, op. cit., p. 119.

"Ozigi and Ocho, op. cit., p. 35.

whose minion on earth had been Mohammed. It is not clear how much of these negative formulations came through in the simultaneous translations interpreters made of the sermons missionaries preached in their tours of vUlage centers and market places. It is clear that Christianity presented in this fashion did not motivate many conversions.

The arrival of Christian Southerners in the region created the identity which allowed Christianity to expand. Northerners admired the intellectual skills possessed by Southerners and aspired to emulate the Southerners' conquest of at least part of the European's world. Southerner immigration made education the one thing that could draw the attention of Northerners to a mission and its message.

The earliest Catholic missionaries shared many of their Protestant opponents' convictions. The need to survive, however, forced them to be far more accommodating to government poUcies. Catholicism did not spread in the region through missionary initiative, but through social forces beyond the missionaries' control. If we accept the premise that the ultimate goal of the mission was the evangelization of the indigenous population, we must also acknowledge that the CathoUc mission turned away from this goal in responding to the needs of Southern immigrants.

Monsignor Lumley should be given credit for pointing the CathoUc mission in the right direction. To be fair to his predecessors, the impact of Southerner Immigration on Northerners only became discernible in the 1920's. Also, the changes in government regulations which made expansion through CRI s possible did not come until after 1930. Still, Lumley's astuteness in regards to the opportunity before him has to be admired.

Lumley's role in the broader history of the Christian evangelization of Northern Nigeria also should be acknowledged. In seeking a share of the indigenous population for Catholicism, he changed the nature of the competition for converts, certifying evangelization through schools as the strategy to follow, and equally important, forcing the Protestant missions to spend less time on pressuring the government for access to Muslim populations and more time on protecting non-Muslim potential converts from Catholic encroachment. In the short term the colonial government was the greatest benefactor from his actions. In the long term, however, Lumley's actions granted the Catholic Church a foothold among the permanent, as opposed to transient, African population in

the region. The importance of this development became clear during the Nigerian Civil War (1967-1970) when Igbo migrants fled for their lives back to their homeland in the South. A Catholic presence continued in Jos diocese during this period, thanks to indigenous peoples whose conversions began during Lumley's tenure.76

"Father Maguire interviews, May 4, 1993; Walsh, op. cit., p. 163.

AMERICAN CATHOLICS AND THE ENVIRONMENT, 1960-1995

Patrick ???tt*

In 1991 the American Catholic bishops published "Renewing the Earth," their first pastoral declaration on the environment, and two years later the United States Catholic Conference established its Environmental Justice Program. Many other churches had taken simüar steps in the 1970's and 1980's, placing environmental issues on the agenda of American Christianity. These developments encouraged Catholics to think in new ways about the natural world, about their relationship with it, and about God's purposes. Problems came with the opportunities, however. One was the difficulty of attributing religious significance to issues such as global climate change (aUeged human-induced global cooling in the 1970s, warming in the 1990's) around which swirled basic scientific disagreements. A second was the danger of pursuing incompatible goals, such as trying to continue the CathoUc tradition of working to alleviate poverty but at the same time trying, for environmental reasons, to restrain economic growth. A third was the risk of dUuting or losing the Christian message by adopting an outlook with a distinctly anti-Christian pedigree—at a time when Catholics were devoting special attention to the protection of human life, for example, some environmentaUsts were arguing against the idea of favoring humanity at the expense of other species. A fourth problem, voiced especiaUy by Catholic conservatives, was recent American CathoUcism's tendency to conform to secular trends at the expense of its own traditions. One disgruntled Catholic wrote, in 1990 ^Environmental enthusiasm is likely to make inroads into any part of the U.S. Catholic church not firmly rooted and grounded in orthodox faith. The moral torpor, the widespread sense of

*Dr. Allitt is an associate professor of history in Emory University. An earlier version of this paper was delivered at a conference of the U.S.C.C.'s Environmental Justice Department in June, 1997, and the author would like to express his gratitude to the conference participants, its organizers, Walt Grazer and Jill Ortman-Fouse, and to Professor John McGreevy of the University of Notre Dame, all of whom offered useful criticisms. He also wishes to thank the Graduate School of Arts and Sciences of Emory University for its financial support.

accidie, is palpable in the pews after the American hierarchy's twenty-five year effort to transform the Church into a gentler, kinder annex of the Department of Human Services."1 By now it is possible to explain how some American Catholics came gradually to accept environmental ideas while others remained convinced that they were incompatible with their faith.

Modern American environmentalism had developed in response to public dissatisfaction about poUuted air, land, and water in the 1950s and 1960's. Some of the pollution was plain to see, hear, and smell: urban sprawl, choking smog, the Cuyahoga River on fire, ocean oil spills off Santa Barbara, dying fish in harbors, lakes, and rivers, jet aircraft contraUs and noise, bill-boards, litter, and irresponsible aerial spraying of pesticides that killed farm animals, birds, and pets as well as insects. Other environmental threats, by contrast, were invisible except through extensive study or the use of sophisticated scientific instruments: radioactivie fallout, overpopulation, and changes in the atmosphere and climate. Environmentalism was a pragmatic affair at first, with clear aims: to stop or reduce pollution, improve air and water quaUty, clean up the rubbish, protect endangered species and their habitats, set aside beautiful areas of wUd country for parks, wilderness areas, or wild and scenic rivers, and increase public education about the connections between living things. But it soon took on philosophical overtones, leading some environmentalists to advocate a complete overhaul of humans' self-conception and big changes in the American way of life.2

Environmental issues, especiaUy those with earth-changing imphcations, raised not only scientific and technical questions but also reUgious ones. What role did the Earth itself play in the Christian drama? What did the Bible say about it? Did God want people to dominate the natural world and exploit its resources, or to tread lightly upon its surface and cause the least possible disturbance? Did "nature" include or exclude human beings, and what were the impUcations for theories of "natural law"? What counted as relevant evidence in answering these questions? Scripture and tradition, surely, but perhaps findings from ecology, climatology, astronomy, and biology too. Christians, and especiaUy Catholic Christians, were forced onto the defensive almost at

1Tom Bethell,"The New Environmentalism," Crisis, 8 (June, 1990), 25.

Tor summaries of American environmental history since World War II see Philip Shabecoff, A Fierce Green Fire: The American Environmental Movement (New York, 1993), pp. 93-119; Kirkpatrick Sale, The Green Revolution: The American Environmental Movement, 1962-1992 (New York, 1993),pp. 11-28;Benjamin Kline, First Along the River: A Brief History of the U.S. Environmental Movement (San Francisco, 1997), pp. 73-86.

once because many environmentalists blamed the mess on the Christian frame of mind. An important early statement, Lynn White's "The Historical Roots of our Ecological Crisis" (1967), for example, laid blame for the spoliation of the Earth at the churches' door. Most Christians' attitude, based on God's injunction to Adam in Genesis to subdue and have dominion over the Earth, said White, had been one of thoughtless domination.3 Another early environmental best-seller, Paul Ehrlich's The Population Bomb (1968), argued for a drastic policy of population restriction. EhrUch had an anti-Catholic rhetorical flourish for every occasion. He described the CathoUc hierarchy, with its opposition to contraceptives, as a threat to the future of humanity, adding, "It takes a great deal of patience for a biologist familiar with the miseries of overpopulation to read through documents that represent the views of even enlightened' Catholics."4

But whUe the nascent environmental movement was making these criticisms at the end of the 1960's, most American CathoUcs were busy elsewhere, involved with quite different problems: the faUout from Vatican CouncU II, the CivU Rights Movement, ecumenism, and the beginnings of Liberation Theology. A handful of CathoUc writers mentioned newsworthy aspects of the environment in the midst of these upheavals, but in the volatUe Catholic world of the late 1960's it was remote from their main interests. In the 1970s, likewise, especiaUy after the Supreme Court's decision in Roe v. Wade (1973), opposition to abortion took center stage for many Catholic activists, while in the 1980s Cardinal Joseph Bernardin's "seamless garment" principle of reverence for threatened human life linked anti-abortion work to opposing nuclear weapons, opposing the death penalty, and working for economic justice.5 What these diverse Catholic preoccupations of the 1960s, 1970's, and 1980s aU shared, of course, was the assumption that Catholics must take responsibihty for other human beings and do everything they could to protect and improve human life, especially the lives of the weakest and most vulnerable people.

The overwhelming importance and distinctiveness of human life in aU these concerns set Catholics at odds with environmental radicals,

'Lynn White, "The Historical Roots of Our Ecological Crisis," Science, 155 (March 10, 1967), 1203-1207.

4Paul R. Ehrlich, The Population Bomb (New York, 1968), esp. pp. 142-147; the quotation is from p. 144.

5On Catholic political and public issues in the 1970's and 1980s see the essays in Mary Segers (ed.), Church Polity and American Politics: Issues in Contemporary American Catholicism (New York, 1990).

who denied or de-emphasized it. Neither did Catholic observers appreciate the elitist attitudes they found among moderate environmentalists. A Commonweal editorial admitted the gravity of some environmental issues in 1981 but added that the environmental movement "frequently has a distressingly elitist side, displaying a somewhat aristocratic indifference to the economic pressures and the cultural attitudes that shape the experiences of most people."6 Catholics were, accordingly, lukewarm to environmentalism through most of the 1960's, '70's,and '80's, showing no more than occasional bursts of enthusiasm when environmental affairs made headlines in the secular press. In 1971, for example, the editors of America proposed an environmental "fast" for Lent of that year. Let it be a season of short showers, conservation of paper, glassware, and electricity, they wrote, a season of walking instead of driving whenever possible, and of picking up litter. "Regardless of public policy, a concern for the environment must begin with the individual. For the Christian this is a worthy crusade."7 It turned out to be more of a passing whim than a "crusade," however. America never mentioned the idea again.

Commonweal, America, and other Catholic journals sometimes declared environmental deterioration a world-threatening crisis but then showed that they did not reaUy believe it by moving onto quite different topics and not even mentioning the environment for months at a time. Events that drew their notice included the first Earth Day, April 22, 1970, the first OPEC oil squeeze and the Energy Crisis of 1973, the Three MUe Island nuclear accident and the second Energy Crisis, 1979, the Chernobyl nuclear disaster in the Soviet Ukraine, 1986, and the wreck of the Exxon Valdez on Good Friday, 1989·8 In most cases, how-

6Editorial, "Remembering the Good Earth," Commonweal, 108 (June 19, 1981), 355-356. See also Editorial, "Soft Path to the Future," Commonweal, 108 (February 27, 1981), 99-100, with criticism of "the Robert Redfords and the Clamshell Alliances," who should be working "to wed their ecological concerns with the economic anxieties of the labor and social justice communities."

7Editorial,"Lent and Ecology," America, 124 (March 6, 1971), 222-223.

"On Earth Day, see Edward Sullivan, "The Growing Danger to Our Environment," ¿Xg/î, 49 (March, 1970), 13-23; editorial, "The Ultimate Pollution," Commonweal, 92 (May 8, 1970), 179-180; Peter Riga, "Ecology and Theology," The Priest, 26 (June, 1970), 16-21; Richard Leliaert, O.S.C, Ecology: Catchword or Crisis?" Homiletic and Pastoral Review, 70 (May, 1970), 573-578; John Sheerin, C.S.P.Our Poisoned Earth," Catholic World, 211 (June, 1970), 98-99; editorial,"Ecology Crusade Gathers Steam," America, 122 (March 21, 1970), 286-287; on the first energy crisis, editorial, "The Energy Challenge," Commonweal, 99 (December 21, 1973), 307-308; on Three Mile Island, editorial, "Talking Energy

ever, Catholic writing on environmental problems was linked to more famUiar themes in Catholic social criticism and theology: condemnation of a heartless capitalist economy and the military-industrial complex, denunciation of America's profligate consumer society, and sympathy for the world's hungry and poor. "We have to prove not that pollution is wrong," went one characteristic contribution to the National Catholic Reporter in 1970, "but that production, particularly the production of luxuries, is wrong."9 The CathoUc press never made the jump away from a strictly human-centered approach to these issues until the early 1990's and it remained very rare even then. Thus it was receptive to continued experimentation with high-yield crop strains to meet the challenge of feeding hungry nations, rather than condemning such work as a sinister form of genetic engineering.10 Catholic faith in American technological know-how remained high in the 1970s. "American technology has to a large degree created the problem [of poUution]," admitted the editor of the Catholic World in 1970, but he went on to express confidence that more American technology could clean it up "if we take the job seriously.""

Many Catholic writers were enthusiastic about the possibilities of nuclear power too, especially after the 1973 OPEC boycott had shown America's vulnerability when it depended on energy sources from the politically volatile Middle East. This enthusiasm is understandable. Civilian nuclear power, boosted by the government since the 1950's, had promised at first to be cheap and inexhaustible, and enjoyed a swords-into-plowshares image when compared to nuclear weapons. Its technical and economic problems were mounting by the 1970's but did not yet seem unmanageable. In 1976 one writer urged Catholics to reflect on the astonishing power of nuclear fission, and regretted that it was

after Harrisburg," Commonweal, 106 (April 27, 1979), 227-228; editorial, "At Harrisburg," America, 140 (April 14, 1979), 297-298; on Chernobyl, editorial, "Lament for Chernobyl," Commonweal, 113 (May 23, 1986), 291-292; on the Exxon Valdez see editorial,"This Precious Home for all us Earthlings.Mraen'ca, 160 (April 22, 1989), 363; editorial, "The Mote and the Beam," Commonweal, l 16 (May 5, 1989), 260-261.

'David Perkins, "Testing the Zen Spirit," National Catholic Reporter (hereafter cited as NCR), 6 (January 7, 1970), 8. On the twentieth anniversary of Earth Day Commonweal made almost exactly the same point, lamenting that in those two decades "no coherent vision has been developed … to challenge the patterns of our throwaway culture … ; the relendess pace of consumption on this finite orb has become even more threatening to human survival," editorial, "First Light," Commonweal, l 17 (April 6, 1990), 205.

'"See for example, Eric Walther, "Food, Energy, and Environment Triangle," Catholic World, 220 (October, 1977), 222-225.

"John Sheerin, C.S.P,"Our Poisoned Earth," Catholic World,2\\ (June, 1970), 98-99.

not yet the subject of official teachings. "To most people in the Church nuclear power is a non-issue. The Church has not articulated anything about it—by encyclical or pronouncement—so it just doesn't exist. Yet it's the function of religion to give value to whatever is around us. And like it or not, this is an atomic age. With atomic power we have the transformation of matter, molecular transformation, which is just what miracles are all about. And without a theological approach to this power our understanding of it must be incomplete."12 Commonweal condemned "knee jerk opposition to nuclear power" in 1976, adding that too many environmentalists were "hysterical" when it came to reviewing the problems of waste disposal and the possibility of accidents. Their search for energy alternatives "through windmiUs, firewood, solar energy converters and the like" were "all very quaint but, with the possible exception of solar energy, aU geared to life in another century." Of course, nuclear power was potentiaUy hazardous,"but the task is to conquer these problems, not retreat before them as the dark ages did before pestilence and disease."13

The National Catholic Reporter was the first Catholic journal to take a more jaundiced view of nuclear power, partly because it recognized that nuclear power and nuclear weapons usually went together, with fuel from the one providing warhead materials for the other.'4 Archbishop Raymond G. Hunthausen of Seattle, a fervent anti-nuclear weapons advocate, made this connection in the early 1970's and was among the first Catholic anti-nuclear power activists.15 Two Jesuit scientists, WiUiam Millerd and Albert Fritsch, warned in 1974 that even peaceful nuclear power threatened an unmanageable waste problem and increased atmospheric radiation and vulnerabUity to terrorism.16 The accident at Three Mile Island in 1979, whose aftershocks brought a halt to nuclear expansion in America, began to turn more Catholics against nuclear power. The National Catholic Reporter described the

12William Lanouette, "The Nuclear Power Issue," Commonweal, 103 (July 30, 1976), 488-492. Compare Robert Morrissey, "Nuclear Controversies," America, 140 (January 27, 1979), 52-54, an impartial and nuanced account of the benefits of nuclear energy, and the technical difficulties of putting it on line.

"Editorial, "A Nuclearized Future?" Commonweal, 103 (December 3, 1976), 71-72.

"McKinley Olson, "The Reactor," NCR, 13 (April 8, 1977), 3. See also, Sidney Lens, "The Last Will and Testament of the 1970s to Future Generations," ibid., 14 (November 18, 1977), and Katie Eberfeld, "Anti-Nuke Adherents Share Worries Without Sharing Ideologies," ibid., 15 (December 15, 1978), 1,4.

"Bill Kenkellen, "Religious Groups Join Anti-Nuclear Movements," NCR, 15 (May 18, 1979)3,15,20.

16Tom Dorris, "Nuclear Energy for Peace: Beatific Vision or Nightmare?" NCR, 11 (December 6, 1974), 4.

Nuclear Regulatory Commission's refusal to evacuate the Middletown-Harrisburg area, and its delay in announcing the accident, as "one of the most mammoth deceptions ever perpetrated on the American people."17 America conceded that "we have listened too readily to proponents and too reluctantly to opponents of atomic energy, "but even then it remained critical of anti-nuclear advocates' exploitation of the event: "Balanced and wise answers wUl not be found in rallies and sloganeering."18 In the aftermath of the accident the Catholic bishop of Harrisburg, Joseph T. Daley, made a statement urging a moratorium on new nuclear plant construction until the risks were better understood, but he was careful to praise the "honesty and integrity" of TMI and NRC workers.19 MeanwhUe, Christians in Harrisburg began turning up at church in record numbers. Attendance at daily Mass in the Seven Sorrows of the Blessed Virgin Mary Church doubled.20

As these mixed reactions to nuclear power indicate, American Catholics, while periodicaUy sounding notes of environmental concern, also feared that the environment might be a distraction, retarding economic growth and modernization while drawing energies away from more important issues, especially poverty. At the time of Earth Day, 1970, for example, several Catholic commentators denigrated its importance. "We ought to get it quite clear where we stand," wrote Sidney Callahan in the National Catholic Reporter. "Faced with the choice of saving the redwood forests or one child's brain potential which wiU be damaged by lack of protein, then I say 'good-bye redwoods, and good-bye trumpeter swans, and good-bye wild rivers, which only a fanuly making $20,000 [a lot in 1970 dollars!] can afford to enjoy. . . . Sorry, but people do come first, last, and always."21 One Commonweal contributor that year wrote that "ecology" was no more than a "genteel rest-home for affluent idealists" discouraged by their inabUity to end poverty, racism, and the war in Vietnam. Another agreed that "for faint-hearted suburban Uberals, secretly tired of the bruising civil rights, fair-

"Sidney Lens,"Official 'Line' Destroyed by Nuke Leak," NCR, 15 (April 6, 1979), 3.

'«Editorial, "At Harrisburg," America, 140 (April 14, 1979), 297-298; editorial, "Exorcizing Nuclear Demons," America, 140 (May 19, 1979), 402. For the impact of TMI on Catholic writers, see also editorial, "Talking Energy After Harrisburg," Commonweal, 106 (April 27, 1979), 227 (still cautiously pro-nuclear), and, in the same issue, John Garvey, "Arrogance Syndrome," pp. 23 1-232 (decidedly anti-nuclear).

"Bishop Joseph T. Daley, "A Statement on Nuclear Plant Construction," Catholic Mind, 78 (March, 1980), 21-25.

20David Shribman, "TMI Panic 'led people back to God,"NCR, 16 (February 8, 1980), 24.

2lSidney Callahan, "A Child over a Redwood," National Catholic Reporter, 6 (May 8, 1970), 21.

housing and anti-poverty battles, it is welcome balm."22 Others speculated that environmental legislation then under consideration in Congress and many state governments might, if passed, bankrupt businesses and cost working men their jobs. Economic growth and widespread employment were welcome avenues away from poverty; tight environmental controls might inadvertently aggravate it.23 One priest wrote that he dreaded hearing this confession from a parishioner: "'Bless me father for I have sinned. I polluted the air,' this submission whUe poor Joe suffers in the foul stench of his poverty." He argued against making environmentaUsm a reUgious issue because it was a distraction from fighting "the greatest poUution" of aU—poverty.24

Many CathoUcs were critical too because they saw poUtical restrictions, imposed in the name of environmental protection, as an attack on citizens' freedoms. "We can clean up our pollution," warned America in 1970, but "we may not be able to recover our liberty."25 The creation of a big federal bureaucracy, the Environmental Protection Agency (EPA), to poUce the environment and, in some instances, to override property rights, seemed to many Catholics, particularly those with a poUticaUy conservative outlook, a cure far worse than the disease it was meant to redress. These conservatives, among them Michael Novak, George Weigel, WUUam Simon, and contributors to journals like This World, Crisis, and later First Things, pointed out as time passed that many environmental crisis predictions had not come to pass. The world's population-to-food ratio was improving, not getting worse; energy resources were not exhausted; raw material prices were declining, not rising; increases in efficiency and human inventiveness made us less dependent on iron laws of raw materials shrinkage; citizens of Los Angeles and other cities enjoyed a far cleaner atmosphere than they had in 1970. Environmental apocalypticism, in other words, lacked credibiUty; it had repeatedly faUed the test of experience.26 In his landmark defense of free markets, The Spirit of Democratic Capitalism (1982), Novak also criticized environmentalists' tendency to sentimentaUze nature, as though it were harmless and delicate. On the contrary, said Novak: "In

"Michael Harrington, "The Politics of Pollution," Commonweal, 92 (April 17, 1970), 111-114; Wes Barthelmes, "Pollution and the Poor," Commonweal, 91 (February 21, 1970), 549-550.

"Russell Gibbons, Hard-hats, Hyacinths, and Returnable Bottles," Commonweal, 94 (June 25, 1971), 324-325.

"Letter from the Reverend Anthony Fasline, Commonweal, 92 (March 27, 1970), 71.

2,Editorial,"Safeguarding the Quality of Liier America, 122 (May 23, 1970), 548.

26See, for example, Herbert London, "Ecocatastrophe Again," First Things, 1 (June/July, 1990), 8-9.

volcanoes, earthquakes, erosions, poisonous waters and gases, floods, windstorms, hurricanes, tornadoes, and weather patterns that pitilessly wipe out entire harvests, the face of nature has often been hostUe toward human beings … ; nature as weU as humankind has needed to be 'tamed.'"27 Novak and his fellow Catholic neoconservatives were convinced that economic growth was good, and that market capitalism provided it better than any other system, in a religiously defensible way. In their view curtauing economic productivity, as advocated by many environmentalists, would have catastrophic economic effects, harming rather than helping the developing world.28

No issue, not even economics, generated more controversy among Catholics between the late 1960's and the early 1990's than sex, contraception, and abortion. The intra-CathoUc debate over contraceptives in the late 1960's took place alongside the environmental population debate. Paul Ehriich, Garrett Hardin, Lawrence Lader, and other theorists of the population explosion regarded the Catholic prohibition on contraception as criminal in an overpopulated world. This CathoUc teaching, wrote Ehriich, "contributes to misery and starvation for biUions, and perhaps the end of civilization as we know it."29 Pope Paul VI infuriated them when he published Humanae Vitae in 1968, upholding the traditional teaching. But he gave heart to CathoUcs who still beUeved contraceptives were immoral, and these traditionalists led the way in condemning the populationists' claims of imminent catastrophe. A law professor in the University of Notre Dame, Charles Rice, author of The Vanishing Right to Live (1969), identified numerous areas of guess and bias in Ehrlich's population statistics and projections, and concluded that his book was "a fraud from beginning to end."3" The traditionalist journal Triumph agreed in a 1971 editorial: "So many mUions have

"Michael Novak, The Spirit of Democratic Capitalism (New York, 1982), p. 269. This view from the right is similar to Sidney Callahan's unsentimental view from the left. "In a fallen world a volcano eruption can get you, no matter how tenderly you care for the animals and plants. Nature may not be completely red in tooth and claw but then it's no nurturing mother's breast either. We shape it to survive and its fulfillment depends on us." Callahan, "Child over a Redwood."

2aMichael Novak, Capitalism and Socialism: A Theological Inquiry (Washington D.C, 1979); idem (ed), Liberation South, Liberation North (Washington, D.C, 1981).

29Paul R. Ehriich, The Population Explosion (New York, 1990), p. 143. See also Garrett Hardin, "The Ghost of Authority" (1966), in his Naked Emperors: Essays of a Taboo-Stalker (Los Altos, California, 1982), pp. 231-240; idem, Mandatory Motherhood: The True Meaning of "Right to Life" (Boston, 1974); Lawrence Lader, Breeding Ourselves to Death (New York, 1971), p. 29.

"'Charles Rice, The Vanishing Right to Live (Garden City, New York, 1969), pp. 112-115.

been spent over the last decade to advance the myth [of a population crisis] that most men seem convinced of its truth, and seek rescue in a veritable sea of estrogen and vaginal foam."31 Other defenders of Church teaching admitted that overpopulation might be part of the problem, but denied that the appropriate response was to attack the CathoUc family. An indignant priest, Father Peter Riga, declared: "I wish those who berate the parents of three or four chfldren would try to remember this elementary fact. It is not just population which is at fault here—it is a whole mentality and the value-system of an entire people."32

Not all Catholics were pleased by Humanae Vitae, however (to put it mildly), and those who had been hoping for a change in the teaching, in line with the advice given to Paul VI by the majority of his pontifical commission in 1966, used claims about overpopulation as a stick with which to beat the pope. Charles Curran, then a controversial priest-professor of theology at the CathoUc University of America, played the environmental overpopulation card in his angry dissent to the encyclical, which won the support of six hundred Catholic teachers. The pope showed, he said, "an almost total disregard for the dignity of millions of human beings brought into the world without the slightest possibility of being fed and educated decently."33 For a time, in other words, pro-contraceptive Catholics found the population branch of environmentalism a welcome source of information and statistical projections. They became jittery, however, when populationists like Garrett Hardin and Edgar Chasteen argued that government-sponsored contraception and abortion should in some circumstances be compulsory.34 CathoUcs from nearly all points of the political spectrum condemned abortion and after Roe v. Wade (1973) tended to minimize the overpopulation argument from fear that it might imply pro-abortion sympathies.35 By 1981 Commonweal, which had condemned Humanae Vitae in 1968,

ä,Editorial,"The Myth Exploded," Triumph, 6 (February, 1971), 45.

"Peter Riga,"Ecology and Theology," The Priest, 26 (June, 1970), 16-17.

"Editorial, "The Theologians' Retort," Commonweal, 88 (August 23, 1968), 553.

MSee Edgar Chasteen, "The Case for Compulsory Birth Control," in Daniel Callahan (ed), The American Population Debate (Garden City, New York, 1971), pp. 274-278.

"Theological Studies devoted a special issue to population, Vol. 35 (1974). The contributors, Arthur McCormack, Francis X. Murphy, J. Bryan Hehir, John Thomas, Denis Hurley, and others noted the proliferation of misinformation about overpopulation but admitted that some Catholics were unwilling to face up the gravity of the issue which, in certain parts of the world, was grave. See in particular McCormack, "The Population Explosion: A Theologian's Concern?"p. 19.

was scoffing at overpopulation theorists as the "all-too-faithful heirs of Malthus and the Social Darwinians."36

Other Catholics sought to deny the moral high ground to population control advocates. A traditionalist, Robert Whelan, for example, pointed out similarities between Greenpeace's anti-population rhetoric, which described human population growth as a "plague," to Hitler's rhetoric in Mein Kampf describing Jews as a "virus." Earth First! s declaration that "massive human diebacks" would be a "good thing" were, said Whelan, just like Hitler's justification of the Holocaust as a sanitation measure. Whelan also noted that abortion had become more widely accepted at the same time and in the same western countries that were receptive to the idea of animal rights. Was it a coincidence, or were these two changes "both part of the same equation, which involves a radical re-assessment of the value which we place on human beings in the order of creation?"37 In an ironic turn of events, some poUcy analysts, notably Ben Wattenberg, were arguing by the late 1980's that America's great problem was wnrfer-population, and that the nation would be economicaUy and strategicaUy weakened unless it found ways to increase its population. Not surprisingly, Catholics who had always opposed contraception and government intrusions against reproduction, were among the first to celebrate and affirm Wattenberg's population revisionism.38

If population and sexuality were the most divisive issues between Catholics and environmentalists, they could at least find some common ground on agricultural questions. The small minority of American Catholics who were farmers, and their organization, the National Catholic Rural Life Conference, had a pragmatic, production-oriented view of the land. The problems they faced in the 1970's included soil erosion, aquifer-depletion, and chemical residue buUd-ups (aU mainstream environmental issues), but they were far more concerned about threats to the survival of the famUy farm, threats which came from agri-business

"Editorial, "Remembering the Good Earth," Commonweal, 108 (June 19, 1981), 355-356.

"Robert Whelan, "Greens and People," Human Life Review, 19 (Fall, 1993), 23-32. See also Robert Whelan, Joseph Kirwan, and Paul Haffher, The Cross and the Rainforest: A Critique ofRadical Green Spirituality (Grand Rapids, Michigan, 1996).

"Ben Wattenberg, The Birth Dearth (New York, 1987). See review by William McGurn in Crisis, 6 (March, 1988), 45-47. James McFadden, the Catholic editor of the Human Life Review, reprinted a section of Wattenberg's Birth Dearth even though Wattenberg was prochoice: Wattenberg, "What Dangers Ahead?" Human Life Review, 13 (Fall, 1987), 71-75.

corporations and from lack of profitability. Responding to a request by severely squeezed South Dakota farmers in the late 1970's, a group of seventy-two Midwestern bishops from the prairie, plains, and mountain states issued a pastoral letter in June, 1980, entitled "Strangers and Guests: Community in the Heartland." The letter, drafted by John Hart, included a warning against monoculture and a plea to preserve genetic diversity, and showed that environmental language was entering the Catholic lexicon. Summarizing the history of changes in the American heartland over the last two centuries, for example, it argued that the land itself was suffering: "It suffered from the neglect of conservation practices ... ; it suffered from the nutrient-depletion practices of others. ... It suffered from lack of reforestation. ... It suffered from careless mining practices. . . ." FinaUy, on a non-utUitarian point: "it suffered from a lack of appreciation for its beauty."39 The bishops also made a standard environmental move when they noted that addressing these problems, "we in the heartland" could take advantage of "both the Native American and the Judeo-Christian traditions" which inculcated "a sense of reverence for the land as God's gift for us and a mandate to share the land's benefits."40 They linked preservation of this rich land to feeding the hungry of the Third World, and urged the Federal Government to provide subsidies to ensure that family farming could continue in the area.41 What they failed to mention was that the great problem of American farming was overproduction, which glutted the market every year and drove even subsidized prices down beyond the level of economic viability for small family farmers.

By the late 1980's and early 1990's more and more sectors of American public IUe had begun to accept the idea of environment as something vulnerable that had to be nurtured rather than as something wild and dangerous that had to be conquered. After scorning environmentalists in his first administration (1981-1985), President Ronald Reagan had been forced to fire his confrontationaUy anti-environmental Secretary of the Interior, James Watt, and his EPA administrator, Anne Gorsuch, in 1983 in favor of "greener" candidates.42 The RepubUcan presidential candidate, George Bush, took a big step further in 1988, campaigning with the promise that, if elected, he would be the "envi-

"Seventy-two Midwestern Bishops.'Strangers and Guests," Origins, 10 (June 26, 1980), 84. See also Hart's environmental theology, The Spirit of the Earth: A Theology of the Land (New York, 1987).

"Ibid., p. 87.

"Ibid., p. 92.

"Jonathan Lash, Katherine Gillman, and David Sheridan, A Season of Spoils: The Reagan Administration's Attack on the Environment (New York, 1984).

ronmental president," and criticizing his opponent, Michael Dukakis, for neglecting Boston's pollution-choked harbor. Bush, the victor, appointed a Catholic, WiUiam K. Reilly as his EPA Administrator, the first Catholic to hold such a senior environmental position in government.43 In his first year in office ReiUy wrote in Commonweal that Catholics should take their role as stewards of the earth more seriously, and he urged the nation's bishops to make a pastoral declaration on the environment.44 In the next general election, 1992, the Democratic party chose the most prominent environmental advocate on Capitol HiU, Tennessee's Senator Al Gore, Jr., as its vice-presidential candidate, just after the publication of his environmental manifesto Earth in the Balance.,45 Whatever their actions, in other words, both parties recognized that concern for the environment (or at least giving the appearance of concern for the environment) had become part of the political mainstream.

These years of the late 1980's and early 1990's also marked the flowering of Catholic interest in the environment, not just as an issue in the news but as a fit subject for theology. Scattered earUer works had begun linking various aspects of Catholic tradition to environmental concerns, notably Bernard Häring's Free and Faithful in Christ (1978) in Germany, Sean McDonagh's To Care for the Earth (1986) in Ireland, and John Carmody's Ecology and Religion (1983) in the United States.46 Catholics who felt unconstrained by tradition in the 1980's incorporated feminist or New Age ideas and the insights of other religions (Sufism, Taoism, Hinduism, Buddhism, and the religions of the Native Americans) into their environmental theology, while scanting Christian particulars.47 For example, Thomas Berry, a Passionist priest and probably the best-known CathoUc environmental writer of the 1980's,

"Philip Shabecoff, "William Kane Reilly," New York Times, December 23, 1988, Section I, p. 25. Reilly, a pragmatic environmentalist, was president of the Conservation Foundation and the World Wildlife Fund.

"William K. Reilly untitled article, Commonweal, 116 (November 17, 1989), 619.

"Al Gore, Jr., Earth in the Balance: Ecology and the Human Spirit (Boston, 1992). Commonweal praised the book and Clinton's choice of running mate, noting, "Now in 1992 we see that nature's breaking point is nearer than we thought." Editorial, "Green Ticket, or Thicket?" Commonweal, 119 (August 14, 1992), 4-5.

"Bernard Häring, Free and Faithful in Christ: Moral Theology for Clergy and Laity, Vol. Ill (New York, 1981), pp. 169-208; Sean McDonagh, To Care for the Earth (Santa Fe, 1986); John Carmody, Ecology and Religion: Toward a New Christian Theology of Nature (New York, 1983).

"Feminist and ecological issues are blended in Rosemary Ruether, Gaia and God: An Ecofeminist Theology of Earth Healing (San Francisco, 1992), and Elizabeth D. Grey, "The Parable of the Sandhill Cranes: Women, Men and the Earth," Catholic World, 233 (July/August, 1990), 182-186.

scolded his fellow CathoUcs for their "amazing insensitivity" to this "most urgent of issues." He criticized the Ten Commandments for neglecting ecological issues and proposed a twenty-year moratorium on Bible-reading.48 Matthew Fox, O.P., head of the Institute of Culture and Creation Spirituality at Holy Names CoUege in Oakland, California, saw the idea of original sin as Earth-denying and substituted the idea of the Earth as an "original blessing." Fox also argued for a drastic reconceptuaUzation of Catholic theology, away from a vertical "faU-redemption" model and toward a horizontal "creation" model. He contributed to the recovery and celebration of such mystics as Meister Eckhart and HUdegard of Bingen, whom he placed in his Creation pantheon.49 His flair for publicity, dramatic simplifications, and New Age ideas won Fox a wide audience, but most academic theologians kept him at arm's length. Fox raised Catholic eyebrows by claiming in his journal Creation that animals can be our spiritual guides and by collaborating with a self-proclaimed witch, Starhawk. The Vatican sUenced him for a year in 1987, after which his provoking style and outlandish claims (such as that he took spiritual advice from his dog) led even former sympathizers, like the feminist theologian Rosemary Ruether, to distance themselves.50 In 1992 he disobeyed his Dominican superiors when they ordered him to leave Oakland and go to a monastery in Chicago, and they dismissed him from the order in March, 1993- Leaving the Catholic priesthood altogether that year, he went in search of "greener" pastures among the EpiscopaUans.51

More CathoUc theologians began writing on the environment as the decade turned, stimulated by a papal declaration on the environment on New Year's Day, 1990, and the Bishops' Pastoral of 1991, "Renewing the Earth." The bishops' language was, if anything, less marked by environmental rhetoric than that of the earlier Midwestern bishops' "Guests

48Thomas Berry, The Dream of the Earth (San Francisco, 1988). For "amazing insensitivity" and "most urgent issues," see Thomas Berry, "Spirituality and Ecology," Catholic World, 233 (July/August, 1990), 161.

"See in particular Matthew Fox, Original Blessing: A Primer in Creation Spirituality (Santa Fe, 1983).

"'Ruether, "Matthew Fox and Creation Spirituality: Strengths and Weaknesses," Catholic World,233 (July/August, 1990), 168-172.

"Matthew Fox, Confessions: The Making of a Postdenominational Priest (San Francisco, 1996), pp. 5-16 (on his expulsion), 163-178 (on his conflict with the Vatican), pp. 136-137 (on Starhawk). See also "Fox Dismissal Requested," Christian Century, 109 (February 19, 1992), 183-184; Lawrence Wright, "The Sensual Christian," Rolling Stone, November 14, 1991, pp. 78-87, 189.

and Strangers." It stuck close to Catholic tradition, summarized the relevant biblical teachings and resources in the Church's history, notably St. Francis of Assisi, and linked the bishops' new environmental interest to their work of recent decades, in the hope that they could "buUd bridges among the peace, justice, and environmental agendas and constituencies." Maintaining a strictly anthropocentric focus, they pointed to connections between "natural ecology and social ecology," and argued that "it is the poor and powerless who most directly bear the burden of current environmental carelessness." They opposed coercive population policies, insisted that "environmental progress cannot come at the expense of workers and their rights," and added that "solutions must be found that do not force us to choose between a decent environment and a decent life for workers." They gave a guarded tribute to the free-market economy but balanced it by describing Western consumerism as "the single greatest source of global environmental destruction."[52] Confirming their appeal to all citizens, not just Catholics, the bishops agreed in the following year to join liberal Protestants, EvangeUcals, and Jews in the National ReUgious Partnership for the Environment.[53]

CathoUc journals began to give environmental theology more attention too. One 1990 issue of the Catholic World, for example, was devoted to "caring for the endangered earth," and the editor began by declaring that Americans must now undertake "a fundamental, gut-wrenching change of attitude" in order to "see the Kingdom of God in terms of cosmic harmony, not human domination."[54] Catholic environmental theologians, meanwhUe, aimed to connect new environmental ideas to older themes in Catholic tradition, but they generally eschewed Catholic particularism and borrowed freely from Protestant theology and Process philosophy.[55] Turning firmly away from the biocentrism of Fox, Berry, and other New Age eco-theologians, Drew Christiansen, SJ., a distinguished contributor to CathoUc environmental theology, argued

"U.S. CC, "Renewing the Earth: An Invitation to Reflection and Action on Environment in Light of Catholic Social Teaching," in Drew Christiansen and Walter Grazer (eds.), And God Saw That It Was Good: Catholic Theology and the Environment (Washington, D.C, 1996), pp. 237, 224, 225, 234, 235.

»Ibid.,p.4.

"Richard Sparks, editorial, Catholic World, 233 (July/August, 1990), 146.

"On the development of Protestant ecological ideas see Robert B. Fowler, The Greening of Protestant Thought (Chapel Hill, North Carolina, 1995). Among the most influential Protestant eco-theologians were Paul Santmire, James Gustafson, James Nash, and John Cobb. For examples of these themes in Catholic environmental theology see, for example, Anne Clifford, "Foundations for a Catholic Ecology of God," in Christiansen and Grazer, op. cit., pp. 19-46; John F. Haught, The Promise of Nature: Ecology and Cosmic Purpose (New York, 1993), pp. 14-20; Michael J. Himes and Kenneth R. Himes,"The Sacra-

that "our sense of the ultimate goodness of existence comes not from nature [itself] but from historical encounter with a personal God."56 The challenge for Catholic environmentalists, he added, was to "advance a fair reading of the historical record," to "help environmental theology evolve in a way that is consistent with Christian tradition," and "to elaborate a nuanced ecological ethic." Theology, he summarized,"can be ecological without becoming biocentric."57

Among its biblical dimensions were: reinterpreting the meaning of the Genesis creation story, questioning the significance of God's charge to Adam that he must subdue and have dominion over the Earth; reexamining the Noah story, God's rainbow covenant, and the meaning of celebrations of the natural world in the Psalms. However, Catholic environmental theologians did not find it easy to link Jesus directly to ecological sensitivity, and they passed over in sUence such episodes as the hungry Jesus angrily withering the fig tree when he found it not bearing fruit, even though it was the wrong time of year (Matthew 21:18-22). Biblical evidence was likely to be inconclusive in any event—it was certainly possible to construe familiar passages as pro-environmental, but it would not have been difficult for counter-environmentaUsts to match text for text in making the opposite case. Because the Bible was written in times and places where the idea of environmentalism was unknown, the biblical element of environmental theology was always vulnerable to anachronism and eisegesis.58 Environmental theologians also looked to the saints for inspiration, though under the same burden of anachronism. St. Francis of Assisi, not surprisingly, made the best showing—he was the one prominent figure in Christian history to be granted an indulgence even by Lynn White in his condemnation of Christian approaches to the environment.59 The Benedictines won an honorable

ment of Creation: Toward an Environmental Theology," Commonweal, 117 (January 26, 1990), 42-49; Charles M. Murphy, At Home on Earth: Foundations for a Catholic Ethic of the Environment (New York, 1989).

"Drew Christiansen, S.J., "Christian Theology and Ecological ResponsibilityMraereca, 166 (May 23, 1992), 450.

"Drew Christiansen, review of James Nash's Loving Nature in America, 166 (May 23, 1992), 465.

wFor biblical supports to Catholic environmentalism, see Clifford, "Foundations," pp. 24-36; Murphy, op. cit., pp. 84-98; Dennis Hamm,"The New Testament and Environmental Justice: A View From Luke," U.S.C.C. Environmental Program Paper, June, 1996, unpublished; and Carol J. Dempsey, "Ecology, and Covenant: The Biblical Grounding of an Environmental Ethic," ibid.

"See in particular, Zachary Hayes, O.F.M., "Saint Francis of Assisi and Nature: A Model for 21st Century Spirituality," U.S.C.C. Environmental Program Paper, June, 1996, unpublished.

mention too, for siting their monasteries in places of natural beauty and for meticulously cultivating them over the centuries in a sustainable way.60

MeanwhUe the whole project of Catholic ecological theology found articulate opponents.61 As early as 1970 James Schall, SJ., an American theologian at the Gregorian University in Rome, described ecology as a new "American heresy" which was "subtly undermining the destiny and dignity of man himself" by denying humanity its special place in God's creation.62 SchaU remained a committed opponent and in 1990, on the twentieth anniversary of the first Earth Day, he explained the reviving interest in environmentaUsm not as an opportunity for Christian development but as a surrogate for the statist socialism that was failing aU around the world. Environmentalism, he added, was reaUy an attack on nature rather than a defense of it because its exponents, like the socialists they had outlived, demanded a drastic transformation of human nature.63 Another long-term opponent was Richard Neuhaus. At the time of the first Earth Day he had been a radical Lutheran minister, who scorned the event as a distraction from the fight against poverty and racism, and whose In Defense of People (1971) was probably the first book-length refutation of American environmentaUsm. By 1990 he had converted to Catholicism and moved into the front rank of Catholic neoconservatives. His dislike of environmentalism had survived this swing from left to right, however, and he, like SchaU, denounced it as statist sociaUsm in a new guise (whUe affirming the actual progress made on pragmatic environmental issues since 1970).64

[60]"Hugh Feiss, O.S.B., "Watch the Crows: Environmental Responsibility and the Benedictine Tradition," in Christiansen and Grazer, op. cit., pp. 147-164. However, this view is ahistorical. The Benedictines' original motive was to be out of "the world," and away from temptation. Medieval Europeans did not admire rural beauty—contemporary praise for their sites depends on the Romantic conception of the wild beauty of nature, a nineteenth-century idea.

[61]For a classic example of conservative-Catholic criticism see Donna Steichen, "Crystal Ball Catholicism," Crisis,! (July/August, 1989), 24.

[62]James Schall, S.J., "Ecology: An American Heresy?" America, 124 (March 27, 1971), 308-311. See also John Sheets, "Theological Implications of Ecology," Homiletic and Pastoral Review,!! (June, 1971), 57-65.

[63]James Schall, S.J.,"Our Fragile World," Crisis, 8 (June, 1990), 40-41.

[64]Neuhaus, In Defense of People: Ecology and the Seduction of Radicalism (New York, 1971); idem, "The Many Causes of Environmentalism," First Things, 1 (August-September, 1990), 67. For his later views see his "Christ and Creation's Longing," in Max Stackhouse (ed), Environmental Ethics and Christian Humanism (Nashville, 1996),pp. 125-138.

The debate continues, and it is still too soon to say whether environmentalism will have a lasting influence on either Catholic intellectual life or on the practices of ordinary Catholics (which appear not to have been much affected, hitherto). Catholics were among its least enthusiastic recruits, which is not surprising when we consider early environmentalists' general hostility to Christianity and their particular criticism of Catholics' pro-life ideas. The Catholic Church has always nurtured a strongly anti-utopian principle, and always taken people in their weakness as well as their strength. It knows that calls for self-sacrificing changes to our way of life often falter in the face of mundane reaUty. Heroic asceticism is for the few, and environmental radicals who demanded a transformation of human life, even to the extent of treating people as just one among the earth's many occupants, no more important than any other creatures, generated little enthusiasm among Catholics. Moderate Catholic environmentalism, on the other hand, especially theories of Christian stewardship and self-restraint in the light of Catholic tradition, showed signs of flourishing by the mid-1990's, at least among inteUectuals, even if the Catholic in the pew was slow to follow. Catholic environmental lethargy may seem discouraging but it has its reassuring side too. Many of the more breathless environmental scenarios published twenty or thirty years ago proved to be false alarms, and Catholics must be pleased that they put none of their moral authority behind them.

THE SEVENTY-EIGHTH ANNUAL MEETING OF THE AMERICAN CATHOLIC HISTORICAL ASSOCIATION

Report of the Chairman of the Committee on Program

The Association met at the same time as the American Historical Association at the Washington State Convention Center in downtown Seattle between January 8 and 11, 1998. The days were clear and bright but unusuaUy cold for Seattle, and a rare threat of snow, which indeed failed to materialize, had many attendees concerned about return flights. Association members praised local restaurants, the many marine and lake views, and the intimacy of the city in contrast to larger venues.

The morning of Friday, January 9, saw two sessions. A session on "Challenges to Orthodoxy in the Patristic Age," chaired by Professor Harold Drake of the University of California at Santa Barbara, heard first a presentation by Professor Elizabeth DePalma Digeser of Saint Norbert College on "Porphyry and the Arians: Christianity and Mainstream Roman Culture." Professor Digeser offered the hypothesis that Arius was actuaUy trying to strike a middle ground between SabeUanism and the theories of Porphyry that reduced Jesus to the role of a spiritual guide. Then foUowed Professor Christine McCann of the University of California at Santa Barbara, whose topic was,"The Pelagians and Spiritual Mentoring: Within the Tradition?" Comparing the spiritual counsels of the Pelagians to those of Saints Jerome and Augustine, Professor McCann found little difference in this area. FinaUy Professor R. M. Frakes of Clarion University spoke on "Defending Against Heretics: New Functions for the Defensor Civitatis in the Late Fourth and Early Fifth Centuries." Far from simply "defending," these local officials were ordered by imperial decree, under threat of heavy fines, to seek out heretics, seize their property, and whip and exile their associates. The presentations were followed by comments by Professors Alberto Ferreiro of Seattle Pacific University and Professor Michael WUliams of the University of Washington.

Concurrently on the morning of January 9, Professor Mel Piehl of Valparaiso University chaired and served as commentator for a gathering titled, "Alternative Perspectives on Catholic Intellectual Life." This group heard first a presentation from Professor David J. O'Brien of the College of the Holy Cross speaking on "Thomas Merton and John Courtney Murray: Perspectives on the American CathoUc Experience." Using the metaphor of center/edge, Professor O'Brien compared the journeys of Merton and Murray occasioned by the problematic

of being Catholic and American during the middle third of the twentieth century. He argued that Murray made a theological journey from the margin to the mainstream by developing distinct languages for civil and ecclesiastical realities. His legacy is a vision of shared political responsibility for the culturaUy and religiously pluralistic United States, made possible through a public phUosophy based on the traditions of reason and natural law. Merton, in contrast, moved from the center of society to the margin of Catholic monasticism, and then back to a different kind of center. His legacy, O'Brien continued, is a larger, more inclusive view of the common life of humans, one that places God, not Church, at the center. Then Professor Frank Sicius of Saint Thomas University in Miami spoke on the question of "William Miller's Design: The Catholic Worker as a Foundation for a New Catholic Intellectual History," summarizing MLUer's project for a Catholic history, itself having arisen from Miller's research on the "Catholic Worker." Miller believed that in the 1960's and 1970's most Catholic scholars lost their nerve for studying Catholic thought and social history and so pursued exceUence as defined by Harvard and Yale. For Miller, researching and interpreting the history of the Catholic Worker Movement offered a way to search for what had been lost in the quest of Catholics for middle-class status. Miller wanted Catholic history to remain outside the modern progressive myth, instead revealing transcendent meaning. Professor Piehl, in his comments, noted Miller's tie to Seventh Day Adventism and suggested that this might explain Miller's view of time and history. MLUer, Piehl said, wanted to put Catholic assimilation on the edge and put smaU bands of radicals at the center of the story of Catholicism. Lively discussion followed.

The afternoon session heard three papers that seriously challenged some conventional conceptions of medieval ecclesiastical history. Professor Robert Brentano of the University of California at Berkeley presided over a panel titled, "New Images of Ecclesiastical Leadership in the Twelfth and Triirteenth Centuries." Most startling was a paper by Professor Constance Berman of the University of Iowa that questioned the traditional notion that reUgious orders and congregations have a singular "founding moment"; rather, she suggested, based on her studies of the charters of Cîteaux, a more critical scrutiny of documents poses a model of a more gradual development of a "founding" consciousness, after which the "founding moment" may be a creation of historiography: "Was the Cistercian Order Founded in 1098, 1 1 19, or 1 147?" Similarly Professor Cathy Jorgensen Itnyre of the CoUege of the Desert offered an arresting picture of the dilemmas and resources of a twelfth-century "Gregorian" reforming bishop very far from Rome: "Spirituality and Power: Saint Porlakr of Iceland." Then Professor Coriiss Slack of Whitworth CoUege presented a likewise iUuminating view in her paper, "Gervase of Prémontré and the Pattern of Crusade Patronage in the Early Thirteenth Century," based on her analysis of unpublished letters and charters. Professor Slack reported that the chief motivations for crusade vows were atonement for attacks on church property and the prestige of having joined a distinguished company, while "more devout" motives included honoring a church within the patronage of one's family or imitating an ancestor who had won fame on crusade.

Late Friday afternoon some members gathered for a business meeting featuring the reports of the Secretary and Treasurer and of the Chairmen of the several Committees. Then at 5:30 there began a social hour in the Aspen Room of the Sheraton Hotel, a cheerful respite from the work of the sessions.

On the foUowing morning there were again concurrent panels, one medieval and European, the other centered in the United States in the first half of this century. In the medieval panel,"Women of the Third Order in Medieval Europe: New Evidence and Interpretations of Their Origins and Historiography," presenters made a powerful case for the important role played by Third Order groups in offering to many religious women an alternative to a life either atomistically lay or alternatively fully cloistered. The first paper was presented by Ms. Lori Pieper, S.F.O., from Fordham University on "The Franciscan Vocation of Saint Elizabeth of Hungary"; Ms. Pieper's recent discovery of a Franciscan manuscript life of Saint Elizabeth makes clearer the ties between the saint and the friars. Then Ms. Anne M. Schuchman from New York University spoke on "UmUiana De' Cerchi: Anatomy of Late Medieval Piety," underscoring the complex interplay of the restricted life and choices of a Florentine wife in thirteenth-century Florence versus the demands of the Franciscan apostolic life to which UmUiana felt caUed. Next Sister Roberta A. McKelvie of Reading, Pennsylvania, presented "Angelina of Montegiove: A Prototype for Third-Order Women," an attempt to extract what Uttle can be known of the genuine Angelina from the impositions of more conventionally hagiographical accounts largely shaped by styUzations responding to issues of the moment. Professor Richard F. Gyug of Fordham University then spoke on "Bizzoche, Tertiaries, and Holy Women in Later Medieval Dalmatia." Professor Gyug traced a full spectrum of types of religious life among women, from cloistered Clarisses to cloistered Tertiaries to solitaries to smaU groups of laywomen who simply sought sanction to live together in a small house under a wide variety of rules and affiliations. Chairing and commenting on the panel was Professor Arthur Fisher of Seattle University.

The panel on "Catholics in America: The Roosevelt Years "was chaired by Professor Patricia Killen of Pacific Lutheran University. Here again we were fortunate to be given insight into very important but little-known areas. The first paper, by the Reverend Earl Boyea of the Sacred Heart Major Seminary in Detroit, treated "The Catholic Bishops and the Recognition of Russia." Through a careful analysis of correspondence, Father Boyea illustrated the diverse positions of the bishops and their different ways of thinking through the theological and political issues bearing on recognition. Then Reverend Monsignor Robert Trisco of the Catholic University of America explored the role of the "Papal Envoy in Wartime Washington: Amleto Cicognani, 1939-1945," detaUing Cicognani's humanitarian work on behalf of refugees, prisoners of war, and Jews. Further, Father Trisco's meticulous scholarship also suggested important questions about how transnational ecclesiastical institutions function to hold up to nations transcendent values and concerns lost in the heat of war. In turn, the third paper returned us to broad constructions of inteUectual history and the CathoUc sense of setf and nation with Professor Anthony Burke Smith of the

University of Pittsburgh, who spoke on "Converting to Catholicism in America: Fulton J. Sheen and the Changing Narratives of Americanism in the 1940's."Professor Smith sketched how the liberal press viewed Sheen and his CathoUcism as reactionary and dangerous, while the popular press constructed Sheen as an "ace converter," a view at once more positive and yet less serious. Smith urged that seeing Sheen as an example of the move from subculture to mass culture offers a different way to consider the question of assimilation. Professor Killen, in her comments, noted problems in trying to understand Catholic assimilation during the years of the Great Depression and World War II precisely because all of society and culture were markedly changed by these events. She proposed instead a denominationally comparative approach to the topics in aU three papers as a way to clarify what were specificaUy Catholic, versus what were more general, issues of social change during this era.

At midday on this same Saturday, we were privileged to attend the Presidential Luncheon, also in the Aspen Room of the Sheraton Hotel. Professor David J. O'Brien spoke to us as incoming President of the Association. Following lunch Professor Mary J. Oates, C. SJ., presented the John Gilmary Shea Prize to Professor Dauril Alden of the University of Washington for his work, The Making of an Enterprise. The Howard R. Marraro Prize was awarded to Professor Silvana Patriarcha of Columbia University for her work, Numbers and Nationhood. Then we were treated to the best course of aU, a magisterial lecture by the President of the Association, Professor Uta-Renate Blumenthal, speaking on "The Papacy and Canon Law in the Eleventh Century Reform."All seemed sorry to have to leave when the festivities perforce ended.

The afternoon of January 10 saw a single session on "CathoUcism in Postwar Europe: The Dialogue with Modernity." Professor David Kertzer of Brown University chaired this panel, which focused on three distinct national experiences. Professor Steven F. White of Mount Saint Mary's CoUege showed an ItaUan leader at pains to adjust to new political realities and to reconcile his own spirituaUty with his political principles in his revealing treatment, "Alcide de' Gasperi and the Calvary of Democracy." Professor James Kennedy of Hope CoUege portrayed a national church in profound reorientation in "The Demise of PoUtical Catholicism in Post-Vatican II HoUand," foUowed by an even less encouraging picture painted by Mr. Mark Edward Ruff from Brown University in his paper,"Catholic Youth Work in the Federal Republic of Germany and the Dialogue with Modernity, 1945-1968." OveraU, these papers could not help but leave us grateful for the renewal brought by Vatican Council II.

Sunday morning a Mass for the Living and Deceased Members of the Association was celebrated by the Reverend John Scott, O.S.B., a professor of history at Saint Martin's CoUege in Lacey, Washington. Father Scott's homily inspired us to reflection (as well as to the energy for the final sessions).

Sunday morning's presentations were aU focused on areas which traditionaUy have received relatively Uttle attention. The first dealt with "The Faith and the Other," and was ably chaired by Professor Kan Liang of Seattle University, with

the collaboration of Father Thomas Connelly, S.J., a Jesuit of the Oregon Province and an expert on Jesuit missions to Native Americans. Regrettably Professor Constantine Simon, SJ., of the Pontifical Institute of Oriental Studies in Rome, who was to have co-chaired and co-commented this session with Professor Liang, contacted the Program Committee shortly before the Annual Meeting to explain that he had been unavoidably detained in Rome. He was missed, and the Committee is accordingly extremely grateful to Father Connelly for having accepted, on such short notice, the invitation to bring his perspective to the group; his comments were spirited and enlightening; he brought aspects of the frontier of CathoUc faith vividly and directly into the room. The first paper, by Professor Ines A. Murzaku of Saint John Fisher College and formerly Professor Simon's student, treated "The Jesuits in Albania, 1841-1945," with particular emphasis on the cultural conflict between the Jesuits' Catholic teaching and the deeply rooted local practice of vendetta. Then Professor Leslie Woodcock Tender spoke on "Confession on the Great Lakes Frontier: Problems of Language and Culture," in which she revealed the difficulties faced by priests in pioneer communities, the intense mutuality of the cultural frontier, and how the missionaries were moved by their experiences. The third paper, by Professor Ray NoU of the University of San Francisco, recapped the current state of knowledge of the aftermath of Jesuit inculturation in China: "The Chinese Rites Controversy, 1645-1941: What Matteo Ricci Hoped to Avoid."

The second Sunday morning session treated "Asian CathoUcs on the West Coast," under the chairmanship of Dr. Jeffrey M. Burns, the Director of the Chancery Archives for the Archdiocese of San Francisco. Dr. Burns himsetf offered the first paper as a setting of the context, "Asian CathoUcs on the West Coast: An Historical Perspective." He was followed by Professor Young Mi Angela Pak of the Graduate Theological Union in Berkeley, who spoke on "CathoUc Converts: Asian Women and the Conversion Experience." Professor Rachel Bundang of the Union Theological Seminary in New York then addressed "The FUipina Experience with the CathoUc Church in the United States," and Professor Madeline Duntley of the CoUege of Wooster brought the subject to a sharply local focus with her paper on "Seattle's Japanese-American Catholics, 1920-1950: Asian Integration and the Impact of Internment." As Professor Albert Acena of the College of San Mateo stressed in his comments on the session, all of these papers represented new and very promising paths of inquiry.

As Sunday waned and news reports stiU threatened snow, members scurried for their flights, warmed by scholarly insights and by old and new friendships. As visitors departed and Puget Sound was left with only its smaU guard of historians, we bade all good-by and wondered when, Lf ever, we would see their Like here again.

The Committee on Program, Professor David Alvarez of Saint Mary's CoUege of California, Professor Alberto Ferreiro of Seattle Pacific University, Professor Patricia KiUen of Pacific Lutheran University, and Father John Scott, O.S.B., of Saint Martin's CoUege, plus the undersigned as chairman, express our heartfelt

thanks to Monsignor Robert Trisco and to Ms. Maryann Urbanski for help and guidance in countless ways, as weU as to the many members without whose valuable scholarship and professional enthusiasm no such meeting would be possible at aU. Further, much the same must be said of the exemplary work of the other four members of the Committee on Program, and particularly of Professor KUlen, who was my mentor throughout.

Arthur L. Fisher, Chairman
Seattle University

Report of the Committee on Nominations

In this election 385 baUots were cast. The results are as foUows:

For First Vice-President (and President in the foUowing year):

Thomas A. Brady, Jr., University of California at Berkeley 145
James D.Tracy, University of Minnesota 235

For Second Vice-President:

Sister MaryAuce Galun, O.S.U 209
Sister Dolores Liptak, R.S.M 176

For the Executive Council (three-year term, 1998, 1999, 2000):

Section I:

R. Scott Appleby, University of Notre Dame 165
Christopher J. Kauffman, The CathoUc University of America 217

Section II:

Georgette M. Dorn, The Library of Congress 165
Susan P. Schroeder, Loyola University Chicago 206

For the Committee on Nominations (three-year term, 1998, 1999, 2000):

Harold A. Drake, University of California at Santa Barbara 172
Raymond A. Mentzer, Montana State University 189

COMMITTEE ON NOMINATIONS

Robert Emmett Curran, SJ.
Georgetown University

Maureen C. Miller
Hamilton College

J. Dean O'Donnell, Chairman
Virginia Polytechnic Institute
and State University, Blacksburg

Report of the Committee on the John Gilmary Shea Prize

The members of the Committee on the John Gilmary Shea Prize for 1997 were Professor Frederic J. Baumgartner (Department of History, Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University, Blacksburg), Professor John C. Moore (Department of History, Hofstra University), and Professor Mary Oates, CSJ. (Department of Economics, Regis CoUege).

Nineteen books, published between July 1, 1996, and June 30, 1997, were submitted for the Shea Prize this year. The Committee selected as the winning book Dauril Alden's The Making of an Enterprise: The Society of Jesus in Portugal, Its Empire, and Beyond, 1540-1 750, which was pubUshed by Stanford University Press in 1996.

Professor Alden was presented with the award at the presidential luncheon of the American CathoUc Historical Association, which was held in Seattle on Saturdayjanuary 10, 1998. On behalf of the Committee Mary Oates read the following citation:

The Making of an Enterprise by Dauril Alden, professor of history in the University of Washington, addresses a topic that has not received much attention in EngUsh: the Portuguese Church in the colonies. Based on impressive primary research in thirty-five archives and libraries on five continents, it is a magisterial exploration of the complex interaction of religion, economics, and politics across time and culture. Its conclusions are measured and objective and are richly supported by statistical tables, maps, illustrations, and appendices.

The book focuses on three major themes: the organization and membership of the Society of Jesus, its involvement in secular political affairs, and its financial enterprises. Drawing upon exceUent personnel and genealogical data, Alden skUlfuUy analyzes the ethnic origins of the Jesuits who served in the Portuguese Assistancy, critical factors influencing the choice and promotion of Society leaders, and the estabUshment of standards for admission to and dismissal from the Society.

Through comprehensive examination of the Society's involvement in affairs of state around the world, Alden sheds new Ught on the powerful mutual influence of reUgion and poUtics and explains cogently why diplomatic relations between the Society and heads of secular governments varied considerably over time and place.

Tb further their spiritual work, Jesuits in the Portuguese Assistancy undertook a diverse range of economic projects that brought the Society great material wealth. Alden's exploration of their financial activities as landowners, traders, producers, estate managers, and investors provides compeUing perspectives on why they succeeded in some places and not in others. It also demonstrates convincingly that, despite growing wealth and economic power, the Society of Jesus continued to honor its reUgious commitment and spirit.

A splendid study, The Making of an Enterprise will be a valuable reference work for social scientists as well as for church historians. In the judgment of the Committee, of the many fine books submitted for the John Gilmary Shea Prize this year, it is the most distinguished.

Mary J. Oates,
Chairwoman

Report of the Committee on the Howard R. Marraro Prize

The twenty-third annual Howard R. Marraro Prize of the American CathoUc Historical Association is conferred on Dr. Silvana Patriarca, as associate professor of history in Columbia University in the City of New York, for her first book, Numbers and Nationhood: Writing Statistics in Nineteenth-Century Italy, which was pubUshed by Cambridge University Press in 1996.

Silvana Patriarca masterfuUy explores the language of statistical literature in nineteenth-century Italy. She uncovers the professional mentalities of Uberals who practiced numerical social science from the Restoration to the Risorgimento, and shows how the logic of description supported the nationalists' agenda. Her monograph casts the collection of figures that came to characterize the Italian school after Unification in a comparative context, and it gives fresh insight into the ways by which statistical representations accentuated the divide between North and South.

Alexander Grab, Chairman
University of Maine

Auce Kelikian
Brandeis University

John E. Monfasani
State University of New York
at Albany

The Peter Guilday Prize

After a hiatus of several years the Peter Guilday Prize is being conferred again this year. The recipient is Dr. Christopher M. BeUtto, an assistant professor of ecclesiastical history in St. Joseph's Seminary, Dunwoodie, Yonkers, New York. His article, entitled "The Early Development of Pierre d'Ailly's Conciliarism," was published in the issue of the Catholic Historical Review for April, 1997 (Volume LXXXIII, Number 2, pages 217-232).

In this article, grounded in textual analysis of primary sources that had not previously been examined in detail, the writer delineates the stages in the concUiar thought of Pierre d'Ailly (1350-1420), one of the foremost fathers of the Council of Constance, whose formative, early career has largely been overlooked by modern scholars. In addition, Dr. Bellitto re-examines the ways in which d'Ailly, in spite of his often contradictory roles as chanceUor of the University of Paris, royal servant, and papal cUent, deftly and successfuUy navigated through the complex politics surrounding the resolution of the Great Western Schism in its first two decades.

One of the referees commented: "The originaUty of the article consists in its much clearer delineation of the early development of d'AiUy's conciUar thought within the context of the royal, ecclesiastical, and university politics in Paris as well as in its considerable modification of the highly opportunistic motives attributed to d'AiUy's actions and thought during this same period." The other referee stated that "the heart of the work—the analysis of the memoranda d'AiUy submitted to the Paris councUs of 1395 and 1396—offers balanced and worthwhile insights into the development of his concUiarist thought in an often neglected period of his career."

Robert Trisco,
Editor

Report on the John Tracy Ellis Dissertation Award

In the first year it was held, the competition for the John Tracy ElUs Dissertation Award attracted eighteen entries from seventeen Universities (the University of Michigan being the only institution represented by more than one entry).

The committee, which consisted of PhiUp Gleason (chairman) of the University of Notre Dame, Robert I. Burns, SJ., of the University of CaUfornia at Los Angeles, and Thomas J. Shelley of Fordham University, faced a difficult task, since aU the entries were of impressive quaUty. By way of recognizing their overall exceUence, the committee selected two for honorable mention. They are Katharine Brophy of the University of Michigan for her topic, "Strangers and Sojourners: PUgrimage, Penance, and Urban Geography Ui Rome, 1350-1423," and Evelyn Sterne of Duke University for her topic, "AU Americans: Class, Church, and Citizenship in an Immigrant City [Providence, Rhode Island], 1880-1940."

The first winner of the John Tracy EUis Dissertation Award is Julia Boss Knapp of Yale University. Ms. Knapp's dissertation, entitled "Relating New France: The Catholic Church and the Project of Cultural Translation, 1610-1760," will place Jesuit missionary work in Canada Ln its transatlantic context by exploring, on the one hand, how the Counter-Reformation background influenced the self-understanding and perceptions of the missionaries and, on the other, how their

writings were received on the continent, shaping, among other things, the expectations of later generations of missionaries. Approaching her topic as a case study in communications history, Ms. Knapp wUl bring to bear on the Jesuit Relations and other classic sources methods derived from recent work on "the history of the book." As a preparation for her project she has aheady completed pre-dissertation work in two doctoral programs at Yale—history and Renaissance studies—and she plans to use the $1,200 purse that accompanies the EUis Award to support her research in Rome.

On behaU of the American CathoUc Historical Association, the Committee extends congratulations to Julia Knapp, Katharine Brophy, and Evelyn Sterne. We also take this occasion to thank all who submitted entries and to wish each of them a speedy and successful completion of their projects. We look forward to hearing much more from them in the future.

Philip Gleason,
Chairman

Report of the Secretary and Treasurer

For the first time we are holding our annual meeting in the Pacific Northwest, thereby making it easier for our members who live in this part of the country to be present. We have also given our members living in Seattle and its vicinity the opportunity and responsibUity of organizing the sessions. Let me begin this report by thanking the Committee on Program and particularly its chairman, Dean Arthur L. Fisher of Seattle University, for overcoming initial dtfficulties and in the end presenting eight sessions of diverse appeal—two more than the expected minimum.

The other committees have also risen to the challenges facing them, as they will evidence in their individual reports, and we are grateful to them all. In the absence of a report from it we should make special mention of the committee that organized the spring meeting at the University of Virginia under the chairmanship of the Reverend Gerald P. Fogarty, SJ. That was the first spring meeting conducted without any sponsorship from the administration of the institution at which it was held, and although Father Fogarty determined the registration fee very cannily, there was in the end a net loss, which had to be suppüed from the Association's treasury. Consequently, this is the first year in which the spring meeting appears under the heading of "expenses" in the financial statement.

For the first time too the Association is conferring its new John Tracy Ellis Dissertation Award, which we hope wiU attract more young scholars to our activities. I express our collective gratitude to the three members of the committee, namely, Professor PhUip Gleason, the chairman, the Reverend Robert I. Burns, SJ., and the Reverend Thomas J. Shelley. In 1996 these three members drafted the regulations, and in 1997 they judged the applications and chose the winner. From now on, the committee on the award will be a standing commit-

tee of the Association; each of its members wiU serve for three years, and one will be replaced each year. Like the Committee on the John Gilmary Shea Prize, its members wiU represent the main areas of research on the history of the Catholic Church. Contributions to the John Tracy EUis Memorial Fund, which supports the award, are stiU being soUcited. The same is true of the Association's Endowment Fund.

Lastly, we should thank the two persons who during the past year have converted their annual memberships into Ufe memberships, namely, Dr. Mary EUzabeth Brown of New York and Professor Joseph H. Lynch of the Ohio State University. We appreciate both the financial and the moral support that their munificence embodies. There are now fifty-seven individual and fourteen institutional life members.

One IUe member of long standing and eleven other members who had been paying dues annually for longer or shorter periods have died during the past twelve months. We mourn the foUowing:

Brother Patrick Byrd, O.C.D., of the Carmelite Monastery, San Antonio, Texas, a student member since 1991

Professor Robert E. Byrnes, emeritus of Indiana University, a member since 1952 and president in 1961

Reverend Professor Robert B. Eno, S.S., of the CathoUc University of America, a member since 1973 and advisory editor of the Catholic Historical Review since 1990

Reverend Monsignor Edward R. Glavin of Amsterdam, New York, a member since 1964

The Reverend Robert A. Graham, SJ., of Los Gatos, CaIUornia, a member since 1959 and winner of the John Gilmary Shea Prize in the same year

Professor Ernst C. Helmreich, emeritus of Bowdoin College, a member since 1983

Reverend Monsignor Robert MuUigan of Rockville Centre, New York, a member since 1982

The Most Reverend John G. Nolan, AuxiUary Bishop of the Archdiocese for the Military Services, a member since 1982

The Most Reverend Joseph T. O'Keefe, Retired Bishop of Syracuse, a member since 1976

Reverend Monsignor Edward A. Synan of the Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies and the University of Toronto, a member since 1992

Mrs. Mary Margaret Thompson of Portland, Oregon, a member since 1993

Professor Bernard C. Weber, emeritus of the University of Alabama, a IUe member since 1967

May their souls and the souls of all the departed members of the American CathoUc Historical Association through the mercy of God rest in peace.

In addition to these twelve deceased members we have lost eleven members through resignation and fifty-nine (fifty-seven individuals and two organiza-

tions) through faUure to respond to the renewal notice and the two reminders. We may compare these figures to the eighty-four who lapsed, the ten who resigned, and the fifteen who died in 1996. In other words, the total losses in 1997 were eighty-two, whUe Ln the previous year they were 109. We can find some consolation in this lower number, for our gains were the same. In 1997 seventy new members were enroUed, and five former members who had ceased to pay their dues for a year or more renewed their membership, making a total of seventy-five; in 1996 we also counted seventy new and five renewed members. Twenty-two of the seventy new members are students; in 1996 fifteen of the new members were students. In all there are now seventy-seven student members (six more than in 1996). There are also thirty-three retired members (two fewer than in 1996). Subtracting the seventy-five gained from the eighty-two lost, we have ended the year with a net loss of seven members, which is to be compared with the net loss of thirty-four in 1996. Consequently, we begin this new year with a total membership of 1,105.

As treasurer I wish to point out that the Association has again suffered a net operational loss of more than $13,000, which has been made up by the income from investments. Even if that amount were reduced by crediting the equivalent of the annual dues of thirty-five doUars for each of the seventy-one IUe members, the loss would stLU be nearly $11,000. IdeaUy the annual dues should be increased by ten doUars, simply to balance the operating budget. To add to the urgency, however, the director of the Catholic University of America Press, Dr. David J. McGonagle, and the business manager of the Catholic Historical Review, Mr. Gordon A. Conner, have been compeUed to raise the subscription rate to forty doUars beginning in 1998, because the John D. Lucas Printing Company of Baltimore has increased its charges and because other expenses, such as salaries, have also risen. The Press wiU continue to aUow the Association a discount of twenty percent but, even so, will charge it thirty-two doUars per year for each member's subscription. Other costs for the Association are also rising steadUy, especiaUy the annual increment in the office secretary's salary and benefits, haU of which is paid by the Association. Hence, it is inevitable that the dues in aU categories of membership, which have remained fixed since 1995, should be increased.

I wish to repeat my thanks to my two colleagues at the CathoUc University of America, Dr. Jamshed Y. Uppal and Dr. Reza Saidi, both associate professors Ln the Department of Economics and Business, who, though not members of the Association, have again in the past year devoted much time to it as members of our Committee on Investments. The committee decided to sell much of the Association's stock, especiaUy in corporations in which we held relatively smaU numbers of shares, and to reinvest the proceeds in Bankers Trust Investment Equity 500 Index Fund and the T. Rowe Price Equity Index Fund. The dividends from the former fund have just begun to appear in the financial statement, and those from the latter wiU be included for the first time next year.

On the whole our investments, as was to be expected, have increased in value in the past year. The net value of our portfolio held in street name by Alex. Brown & Sons as of November 30, 1997, was $704,858. 12, including the money fund, stocks, and the equity funds. In addition, we stUl have several holdings apart from our portfoUo with Alex. Brown & Sons, the current value of which is as follows:

First Union National Bank: certificate of deposit (October 12, 1997)	2,473.75
T. Rowe Price GNMA Fund: 3,544.484 shares at $9.54 per share (November 28)	33,814.38
Vanguard GNMA Portfolio: 3,538.858 shares at $10.37 per share (September 30)	36,697.96
Vanguard GNMA Portfolio: 466.511 shares at $10.37 per share (September 30)	4,837.72
Vanguard High Yield Bond Portfolio: 847.767 shares at $8.03 per share (November 30)	6,807.57
Vanguard Preferred Stock Fund: 1,239. 197 shares at $10.05 per share (September 30)	12,453.93
To these should be added the portfolio held by Alex. Brown & Sons	704.858.12
Hence, the Association's total invested assets were valued at	801,943.43

This figure represents an increase of $185,753.71 over 1996. The growth is due partly to the reinvestment of the income from the Washington Mutual Investors Fund, the first two GNMA portfolios listed above, and the Vanguard Preferred Stock Fund, but mainly to the appreciation of some of our stocks and shares Ln the mutual funds.

For the Association's journal 1997 was a remarkable year. Our eighty-third volume consists of 849 pages in Arabic numerals, twenty-four preliminary pages in Roman numerals, and a thirty-one-page index. The number of pages in Arabic numerals far exceeds the 608 provided for in the budget; the excess was paid for by contributions—some large and many smaU—totaling $9,212. I sincerely thank all who have helped to enlarge the volume so notably* By contrast the volume for 1996 contains only 782 pages Ln Arabic numerals.

"Mr. Maurice Adelman, Jr., Miss Charlotte Ames, Mr. Robert J. Armbruster, Reverend Dr. WUliam A. Au, Dr. John J. Augenstein, Reverend Robert C. Ayers, Reverend Paul F BaUey, Ms. Carla Bang. Dr. Mary F. Bednarowski, Dr. Martin J. Bergin, Jr., Mr. Clifford J. Berschneider, Professor Joseph A. Biesinger, Professor MaxweU Bloomfield, Reverend Dr. Thomas S. Bokenkotter, Reverend Monsignor Myles M. Bourke, Professor Henry W Bowden, Professor Thomas A. Brady, Jr., Reverend Leo R Broderick, Dr. David H. Burton, Professor Caroline W. Bynum, Professor Joseph F. Byrnes, Reverend John Cabrido, S.D.B., Professor WiUam J. CaUahan, Reverend Daniel E. Carter, Mr. Joseph C. Castora, Reverend Thomas H. Clancy, S.J., Mr. Aloysius Clarke, Reverend Dr. Peter Clarke, Reverend Dr. RoryT. Conley, Professor Robert H. Connery, Professor Jay Corrin, Brother Emmett Corry, O.S.F., Reverend Richard E Costigan, S.J., Reverend Robert Crocken, SJ., Mr. Timothy R Cross, Professor Ronald S.

In this volume we have published fourteen articles, one of which was Professor WiUiam J. CaUahan's presidential address of last January and three of which were papers originaUy delivered at a symposium in Hong Kong in 1996 on the history of Christianity Ln China. I am grateful to the director of the symposium, Professor D. E. Mungello of Baylor University, and the editorial co-ordinator, the Reverend Edward J. Malatesta, SJ., of the Ricci Institute at the University of San Francisco, for enabling us to publish these articles. Also pubUshed in the volume are one piece of misceUany, the Association's annual reports, three review articles, 215 book reviews, and twenty brief notices.

I regret that the authors of accepted articles have had to wait so long for pubUcation. At present we have on hand two dozen manuscripts ready for composition. Perhaps further contributions wUl enable us to reduce this accumulation by adding pages to future issues; we already have nearly $3,000 avaUable for that purpose.

In 1997 we received forty-five manuscripts, five fewer than in 1996. They may be divided by field and disposition as shown in the foUowing table:

	Accepted	Conditionally accepted	Rejected	Pending	Total
General		1			1
Ancient and Medieval	3		3		6
Early modern European	2	2	3		7
Late modern European	3	3	4	2	12
American	4	3	8	1	16
Canadian			1		1
Asian and Pacific	1	1			2
Total	13	9	19	4	45

Cunsolo, Reverend Robert E. Curran, S.J., Mr. L. Chris Curry, Ms. Maribel Dietz, Diocese of Saint Cloud, Mr. R. A. Dowd, Reverend Monsignor Walter J. Edyvean, Brother Patrick EUis, F.S.C., Reverend Edward J. Enright, O.S.A., Mr. Salvador P Escoto, Reverend George R Evans, Reverend Dr. John W. Evans, Reverend Gerald E Fogarty, S.J., Dr. MicheUe M. Fontaine, Reverend Monsignor John T Foudy, Dr. AUen J. Frantzen, Professor John B. Freed, Right Reverend A. L. Gabriel, Dr. Charles R. GaUagher, Mr. Richard C. Garvey, Reverend Joseph R. Gibino, Reverend Paul E. Gins, O.S.M., Reverend Leopold G. Glueckert, O.Carm., Alexander W Gotta, MD., Dr. Virginia Gould, Dr. PhUip A. Grant, Jr., Professor Walter D. Gray, Reverend Peter N. Graziano, Ms. June-Ann Greeley, Professor Paul F. Grendler, Professor Jan T. Hallenbeck, Professor Martin J. Havran, Dr. Thomas F. Head, Reverend Lawrence R. Hennessey, S.T., Mrs. Gertrude Higgins, Reverend Bennett D. Hill, O.S.B., Reverend Carl

The complete absence of any articles in Latin American history is to be noted and regretted. We do, of course, publish book reviews in that field.

According to the reqtured "Statement of Ownership, Management, and Orculation" filed with the United States Postal Service by our business manager, Mr. Conner, and dated September 30, 1997, the total paid circulation of the Catholic Historical Review was 1,865; in addition, there was a free distribution of 164, almost all of which were exchanges with other periodicals. Hence, the total distribution was 2,029. Of the 1,865 subscribers approximately 1,102 were members of the Association; the rest were mostly libraries and other institutions. In 1996, by comparison, there were five more exchanges and twenty-five more paid subscriptions. The number of direct subscribers seems to have declined by fifteen, but it fluctuates from year to year.

Last February we lost one of our advisory editors, Reverend Professor Robert B. Eno, S.S. (as I mentioned before), who was also a prolific reviewer in his field of ancient church history. While we honor his memory, I wish to thank the remaining advisory editors, Reverend Professor Jacques M. Gres-Gayer, Professor Nelson H. Minnich, and Professor Glenn W Olsen, for theU willing and expert assistance. I am also grateful to Dr. Lawrence H. Feldman for again compUing the general index so carefully, thoroughly, and expeditiously.

In the executive office of the Association and the editorial office of the Review I am indebted to our faithful and reliable secretary, Ms. Maryann Urbanski, for her accurate management of our membership records, unerring entering into the computer of the titles in many languages for the sections of the journal we caU "Periodical Literature" and "Other Books Received," producing also on the computer the letters I dictate into a recording device, and performing countless other tasks efficiently and cheerfuUy in spite of her unrelenting phys-

Hoegerl, CSS.R., Reverend Monsignor John V Horgan, Reverend Joseph G. Hubbert, CM., Reverend Dr. John Jay Hughes, Reverend Monsignor Richard A. Hughes, Reverend Leon M. Hutton, Mr. Victor Ibabao, Professor Christopher Kauffman, Reverend Leonard J. Kempski, Professor Zoltan J. Kosztolnyik, Professor Peter J. Kountz, Reverend Dr. Raymond J. Kupke, Reverend Monsignor Andrew P. Landi, Professor Emmet Larkin, Dr. Charles F Lasher, Mrs. Joan M. Lenardon, Reverend Monsignor Paul A. Lenz, Mr. Dominic Letterese, Reverend Thomas A. Lynch, Reverend John E Lyons, Reverend Michael E Lyons, Reverend Ambrose Macaulay, Dr. Ellen A. Macek, Mr. Walter H. Maloney, Jr., Professor Matthew J. Mancini, Dr. Raymond J. Maras, Dr. Dennis D. Martin, Most Reverend Joseph E Martino, Ms. Maureen S. McArdle, Reverend Dr. John R. McCarthy, Dr. Lawrence J. McCrank, Dr. Frederick J. McGinness, Reverend Thomas C McGonigle, O.E, Dr. Mary M. McLaughlin, Reverend Monsignor Robert O. McMaUi, Reverend Dr. Vincent J. McNaUy, Reverend Robert F. McNamara, Dr. David C MUler, Professor Samuel J. T MiUer, Reverend WUson D. Miscamble, C.S.C, Professor John C Moore, Dr. James Muldoon, Reverend Dr. Francis J. Murphy, Dr. AUan Nelson, Dr. Michael C. Neri, Dr. Louis J. Nigro, Professor Thomas E Noble, Dr. Ray R. NoU, Ms. Theresa Notare, Professor Doyce B. Nunis, Jr., Professor Francis Oakley, Professor Maurice R. O'ConneU, Reverend Fergus O'Donoghue, S.J., Most Reverend Gerald O'Keefe, Profes-

ical afflictions. Her labor has been somewhat Ughtened by work-study undergraduate assistants, Mr. Joseph Smith in the second semester of the last academic year and Miss Wendy Nuefer in the first semester of the current year. Also Ln the faU term we have benefited from the assistance of a graduate student, Miss Samantha McLaughlin, who has undertaken several useful and long-postponed projects.

Last summer we acquired a fax machine of our own as weU as an answering machine. Although we cannot afford a dedicated line, we are receiving and transmitting things by fax with greater convenience than ever before. I have also obtained from the Catholic University's computer center an electronic-maU address for the Review and the Association, consisting of the two acronyms joined together thus: cua-chracha@cua.edu. It was pubUshed for the first time on the reverse of the title page of the October issue of the Review. We have already expedited communications with contributors of articles and book reviewers in New Zealand, Great Britain, and places in the United States.

In this new year we look forward to our first spring meeting in Indianapolis, where our host will be Marian CoUege, on the last Friday and Saturday of March.

In the newspaper reports on the Synod for America, which was concluded on December 12,1 have noticed that one of the proposals made, which may or may not be incorporated into the final exhortation being prepared by Pope John Paul II, is that the faithful should be helped to appreciate more the martyrs and other saints of the Western Hemisphere. The same recommendation, of course, could be made for the universal Church. Besides the heroes of the faith who have long been recognized and venerated, others, especially some put to death in the French Revolution, the religious persecution in Mexico, the Spanish CivU War, and the Communist oppression of eastern Europe, as weU as in missionary lands, have in recent years been declared blessed or canonized by

sor Glenn Olsen, Dr. John R. Page, Dr. Matthew L. Panczyk, Reverend Louis B. Pascoe, S.J., Dr. and Mrs. Robert E. Paul, Dr. John T. Phelan, Reverend Dr. John E Piper, Jr., Reverend Charles W Polzer, SJ, Dr. Robert E. Quigley, Mr. John F. Quinn, Ms. Peggy A. Rabkin, Reverend Francis A. Regan, Mr. Charles J. Reid, Jr., Professor Alan J. Reinerman, Reverend James W Reites, SJ., Mrs. Margherita Repetto-Alaia, Reverend John Kevin Ring, Mr. John Robinson, Professor John E Roche, Professor John D. Root, Professor Anne C Rose, Professor Francis J. Rayn, Dr. James D. Ryan, Professor José M. Sanchez, Reverend Monsignor Robert J. Sarno. Dr. Daniel L. Schlafly, Professor John A. Schutz, Sister Marie Scott, C.S.A., Professor Paul S. Seaver, Reverend Monsignor Francis R. Seymour, Dr. WUUam D. Sharpe, Reverend Dr. Thomas J. Shelley, Dr. Albert Shumate, Mr. John J. Simons, Dr. W. Barry Smith, Mr. George T. Spera, Right Reverend Matthew Stark, O.S.B., Mr. George C Stewart, Jr., Dr. Stephen J. Sweeny, Reverend Charles J. T Talar, Mr. Daniel E Tanzone, Professor Leslie W Tender, Professor Samuel J. Thomas, Reverend Dr. Thomas W. Tifft, Dr. WUUam J. Tighe, Professor James D. Tracy, Reverend Edward R. Udovic, CM., Professor Nicholas Varga, Reverend Jeffrey von Arx, S.J., Captain Andrew J. Walsh, Sister Janet Welsh, O.P., Reverend Arthur Wheeler, C.S.C, Dr. Joseph M. White, Professor Joseph L. Wieczynski, Dr. Alexandra Wilhelmsen, Dr. John Wolffe, Reverend Dr. Martin A. Zielinski.

the Holy Father, or their causes are being promoted. Surely this is a matter worthy of the attention of many of our members.

I wish aU the professional historians among our members a productive new year. I encourage them also to propose sessions or papers for the next annual meeting, the last that wUl be held in the 1900's, in the nation's capital.

Robert Trisco

Financial Statement

Fund Statement (as of December 15, 1997)

Cash;		
Balance as of December 15, 1996	10,724.89	
Increase (Decrease): see Exhibit A	(13,316.16)	
Transfer from investment income	15.204.00	
Balance as of December 15, 1997		12,612.73
Investments: see Exhibit B		290.208.83
Total Fund Resources		302,821.56

Statement of Revenue and Expenses (Exhibit A)
(for the period December 15, 1996, through December 15, 1997)

Revenue:			
Membership fees (annual)		32,900.00	
life membership fees		1,200.00	
Annual meeting, 1996/97		3,340.00	
Spring meeting		4,034.00	
Rental of mailing Ust		150.00	
Endowment Fund		337.33	
Dividends (cash)		582.93	42,544.26
Expenses;			
Office Expenses:			
Secretary	12,811.82		
Telephone	45.28		
Supplies, printing	1,720.95		
Postage	290.17	14,868.22	
Catholic Historical Review			
Subscriptions		31,080.00	
Annual meeting, 1996/97		3,781.42	
Annual meeting, 1997/98		717.62	
Spring meeting		4,295.81	
John Gilmary Shea Prize		500.00	
Peter GuUday Prize		100.00	
Bank charges		14951	
Discount on checks		38.84	
MisceUaneous		329.00	55.860.42
Operational surplus—Net gain (loss)			(13,316.16)

Investments (Exhibit B)

General Fund

Balance as of December 15, 1996		224,841.82
Income from investments (dividends and interest):		
Abbott Laboratories	840.00	
Alex. Brown Cash Reserve Fund	(785.20)	(paid SF's)
American Electric Power Company	540.00	
BT Investment Equity 500 Index Fund	1,36987	
DTE Energy Co	510.88	
Edison International	1,300.00	
First American Financial Corp	59.94	
General Electric Company	2,704.00	
ITT Hartford Group, Inc	320.00	
ITT Industries, Inc	120.00	
Johnson & Johnson	1,184.00	
Montana Power Company	720.00	
Rayonier, Inc	59.50	
T Rowe Price GNMA Fund, Inc	2,205.23	
Vanguard GNMA PortfoUo	2,483.48	
Vanguard High Yield Corp. PortfoUo	582.93	
Vanguard Preferred Stock Fund	784.77	
Van Kampen American Capital Bond Fund	1,540.00	
Washington Mutual Investors Fund	3.681.13	20,220.53
Capital gains:		
Vanguard GNMA PortfoUo	917	
Washington Mutual Investors Fund	6.829.02	6.838.19
		27,058.72
Less dividends received as revenue (Exhibit A)		(582.93)
Total income from investments		26,475.79
Less transfer to cash		(15,204.00)
Balance as of December 15, 1997		236,113.61

Special Fund I—Howard R. Marraro Prize

Balance as of December 15, 1996:		
Alex. Brown Cash Reserve Fund	6,815.87	
Central & Southwest	7.966.47	14,782.34
Investment income:		
Alex. Brown Cash Reserve Fund	331.93	
Central & Southwest: dividend	552.00	
capital gain	532.41	1,416.34
Prize and luncheon		(535.0O^
Balance as of December 15, 1997		15,663.68

Special Fund II—Anne M. Wolf Fund

Balance as of December 15, 1996:		
First Union National Bank CDs	2,824.18	
Alex. Brown Cash Reserve Fund	5.033.27	7,857.45
Investment income		
First Union National Bank CDs	169.06	
Alex Brown Cash Reserve Fund	245.62	414.68
Balance as of December 15, 1997		8,272.13

Special Fund III—Expansion of the CHR

Balance as of December 15, 1996		1,863.35
Contributions		9,912.00.00
Expense		f9.0l6.18-)
Balance as of December 15, 1997		2,759.17
Special Fund IV—Endowment		
Balance as of December 15, 1996		
Vanguard GNMA PortfoUo		4,542.50
Investment income		363.86
Transferred to Exhibit A		(363.86)
Balance as of December 15, 1995		4,542.50
Special Fund V-J. T.Ellis Memorial Fund		
Balance as of December 15, 1996		22,614.92
Contributions		700.00
Investment income		
American Electric Power Company	240.00	
Central & Southwest	23100	
DTE Energy Co	312.00	
Edison International	100.00	
Montana Power Company	240.00	
Alex. Brown Cash Reserve Fund	63.61	1,118.61
Capital gains (losses)		
American Electric Power Company	248.22	
Central & Southwest	(1,203.56)	
DTE Energy Co	(27.00)	
Montana Power Company	573.55	(408.79)
Award		(1,200.00)
Luncheon		(35.0O-)
Balance as of December 15, 1997		22,857.74
Total investments		290,208.83

New Members

Prof. Albert A. Acena, 212 South El Camino Real, #52, San Mateo, CA 94401-4405

Rev. Gary P. Applegate, J.C.L., Sacred Heart & St. Casimir Parishes, 1401 Second Avenue, Leavenworth, KS 66048

Mr. Can Araz, AUa Deri, Mithatpasa Cad. No. 27/C, Beyazit, Istanbul. Turkey

Mr. Robert J. Armbruster, 68 East Central Avenue, Bergenfield, NJ 07621-1318

Mr. Gregory S. Beirich, 538 Merton Street, #1, Toronto, Ontario M4S 1B3, Canada

Mr. Thomas G. Benz, S.J., 12 Linnaean Street, Cambridge, MA 02138

Prof. Doris L. Bergen, Department of History, 219 O'Shaughnessy HaU, University of Notre Dame, Notre Dame, IN 46556

Ms. Anne Bertrand, 20 Oak Street, Rhinebeck, NY 12572-1303

Rev. Tewalde Beyene, Franciscan House, P.O. Box 1185, Asmora, Eritrea

Ms. Kay J. Blalock, 65 N 325 W. Angola, IN 46703-9776

Ms. Heather Lynn BIock, Aggie Village, IK, Utah State University, Logan, UT 84341

Rev. John A. Boehning, 65 East 89th Street, New York, NY 10128-1284

Dr. Robert Bunting, 30 MUler Drive, Durango, CO 81301

Mr. Joseph P. Byrne, 1249 Athens Road, WintervUle, GA 30683
Sr. Margaret CantweU, S.S.A., The Sisters of Saint Ann Archives, 1550 Begbie Street, Victoria, B.C. V8R 1K8, Canada
Mr. Thomas Carry, III, 20 Quinley Way, Waterford, CT 06385
Dr. G. A. Cevasco, Department of English, St. John's University, 8000 Utopia Parkway, Jamaica, NY 11439
Mr. Jonathan B. Couser, 86 Grafton Street, New Haven, CT 06513-3148
Dr. John J. Delaney, Department of History, Kutztown University, Kutztown, PA 19530
Rev. Michael J. Dolan, St. Mary's Church, 626 WiUard Avenue, Newington, CT 06111-2614
Prof. L. S. Domonkos, Department of History, Youngstown State University, One University Plaza, Youngstown, OH 44555-3452
Bro. Cyril R. Drnjevic, O.S.B., Mount Angel Abbey, One Abbey Road, St. Benedict, OR 97373
Rev. Daniel E Dwyer, O.F.M., Siena CoUege Friary, 515 Loudon Road, LoudonviUe, NY 12211-1462
Mr. Barry Fitzgerald, 119 Beavers Road, Northcote 3070, Victoria, Australia
Rev. Kenneth R Flint, P.O. Box 4, Charlestown, RI 02813
Mr. Charles R. GaUagher, Archivist, Diocese of Saint Augustine, Catholic Center, P.O. Box 24000, Jacksonville, FL 32241-4000
Rev. James E Garneau, 340 Taylor Street, NE, P-32, Washington, DC 20017
Rev. Dr. C. Kevin Gillespie, SJ., Loyola College, 4501 North Charles Street, Baltimore, MD 21210
Prof. Michael E. Goodrich, Department of History, University of Haifa, Mount Carmel, Haifa 31905, Israel
Mr. James Guba, 122 Ivy Drive, #9, Charlottesville, VA 22903
Rev. Kenneth W. Henz, 1805 John Glenn Road, Dayton, OH 45420
Dr. Robert Ingoglia, FeUcian College, 262 South Main Street, Lodi, NJ 07644
Mr. Michael Jacobs, 4100 West Willcrest Drive, #102, Greenfield, WI 53221
Ms. EUen Joyce, c/o Centre for Medieval Studies, 39 Queen's Park Crescent East, Toronto, Ontario M6G SAO, Canada
Mr. AIbUi J. Kazanowski, 21869 Woodland Crest Drive, Woodland HUIs, CA 91364-5252
Dr. John F. Kenney, 2550 Dana Street, Berkeley, CA 94704-2878
Dr. Patricia O. KiUen, Department of Religion, Pacific Lutheran University, Tacoma, WA 98447-0003
Rev. Rene KoUar, O.S.B., St. Vincent Archabbey, 300 Fraser Purchase Road, Latrobe.PA 15650
Bro. Jason Kudrna, O.S.B., 330 Market Street, Brighton, MA 02135
Dr. Jaime R. Lara, 310 Junípero Serra, #201, San Gabriel, CA 91776-1245
Dr. Amy Leonard, 2913 Harper Street, Berkeley, CA 94703
Mr. Roberto Lint-Sagarena, 223 Halsey, Apt. B, Princeton, NJ 08540
Rev. Michael W Maher, SJ., 3601 LindeU Boulevard, St. Louis, MO 63108-3393
Rev. Mark S. Massa, S.J., Spellman Hall, Fordham University, Bronx, NY 10458

Dr. Katharine Massam, Department of History, University of Adelaide, South AustraUa 5005, Australia

Rev. Michael Mendl, S.D.B., P.O. Box 639, New RocheUe, NY 10802-0639

Dr. Victoria M. Morse, 2501 Benvenue Avenue, #1 l, Berkeley, CA 94704-3050

Sr. M. CecUia Murray, O.E, Dominican Sisters of Hope, 320 Powell Avenue, Newburgh, NY 12550

Dr. Ines A. Murzaku, 3242 Leeward Circle, Walworth, NY 14568

Dr. Roberta A. McKeMe, O.S.E, 234 Grace Street, Reading, PA 1961 l

Prof. James F. McMUlan, Department of History, University of Strathclyde, Richmond Street, Glasgow Gl IXQ, Scotland

Dr. William G. Naphy, Department of History, University of Aberdeen, Old Aberdeen AB24 3FX, Scotland

Mr. William L. North,2501 Benvenue Avenue, #11, Berkeley, CA 94704-3050

Mr. Edward R. Pirozzi, 45 Montfern Avenue, Brighton, MA 02135-2514

Rev. Dr. Jack W Porter, 7432 Lions Head Drive, #D, Indianapolis, IN 46260-3459

Mr. Gregory Ripple, Department of History, Fordham University, 441 East Fordham Road, Bronx, NY 10458

Dr. Paul R. Rivera, 4130 Bayhead Drive, #106, Bonita Springs, FL 34134

Dr. Antonina Nina Sahaydachny, Col. Univ. Sta., EO. Box 250169, New York, NY 10025

Dr. Anne M. Schuchman, 20 Waterside Plaza, Apt. 3 IK, New York, NY 10010-2617

Rev. John D. SUcox,Jr.,SS. Philip and James Church, 701 East Lincoln Highway, Exton, PA 19341

Rev. John J. Silke, Portnablagh, Co. Donegal, Ireland

Ms. Cathy Skidmore-Hess, 103 VaUey Road, Apt. 52, Statesboro, GA 30458

Mrs. Thérèse Maddon StringfeUoe, 1-B Woodland Way, Greenbelt, MD 20770

Miss Barbara L. Tarbuck, 1000 Conestoga Road, B-125, Rosemont, PA 19010

Prof. Thomas Tentler, 904 South Main Street, Ann Arbor, MI 48104

Ms. Magdalena O. Teter, 83 Park Terrace West, 2B, New York, NY 10034

Mr. Tracy S. Uebelhor, 220 Illinois Street, Ferdinand, IN 47532

Mr. Frankie White, 512 S.W 34th Street, #16, Gainesville, FL 32607

Ms. Shelley Amiste Wolbrink, 3311 Monteith Avenue, Cincinnati, OH 45208

Dr. John Wolffe, The Open University, Walton HaU, MUton Keynes MK7 6AA, United Kingdom

MISCELLANY

SCOTLAND, PARSONS,AND CARRAFIELLO

BY

Thomas M. McCoog, SJ.

In his review of The Society ofJesus in Ireland, Scotland, and England 1541-1588: "Our Way of Proceeding?" (ante, LXXXIII [October, 1997], 805-806), Dr. Michael Carraflello dismisses my claim that I could find no documentary evidence of Robert Parsons's involvement in any political intrigue before mid-1581 by suggesting that I "need have looked no further than Parsons' own memoirs." More than once I have consulted Parsons's writings and, despite allegations originally made by Dr. CarrafleUo in his article, "English Catholicism and the Jesuit Mission of 1580-1581," in The Historical Journal, 37 (1994), 761-774, and repeated in his review, such evidence is not there. Because I hope to write a more detaUed article on "Spain, Scotland, and the Society of Jesus in England, 1580-81," I shaU try to be brief here.

Dr. CarrafieUo informs us that we can find proof that a "primary reason" for the English Jesuit mission was "to seek a conversion of James VI as a means of restoring Catholic government and society in England" in Parsons's writings from the late 1570's. With the exception of a few documents in the archives of BaUiol CoUege, the novice register in the Jesuit Archives in Rome, and three letters,' I know of no other extant writing from the 1570's—unless Dr. CarrafieUo has discovered something in some archives he has not named. In the extant works known to me I find no reference to James VI and Scotland. Perhaps I am being too literal. Should I assume, as does Dr. CarrafieUo, that Parsons is referring to "the forcible restoration of England to the catholic fold" in his statements that some are "quite ready to shed their blood for the Catholic reUgion in England, if occasion should offer" and "there wanteth not desire in divers to adventure there bloud in that mission" (art. cit., p. 765)? Are these statements about rmlitary preparedness or religious commitment: there are Catholics ready to suffer anything, even death, for their faith? Moreover, can we assume that Parsons Ln-

'His entry in the register can be found in Archivum Romanum Societatis Iesu, Rom. 171/A, fol. 35'. The letters can be found in Leo Hicks, SJ. (ed), Letters and Memorials of Father Robert Persons, SJ. (London: Catholic Record Society, 1942), CRS, Vol. 39, pp. 1-28. The material in the archives of Balliol College is discussed in Peter Norris, "Robert Persons, SJ. (1546- 1610), and the Counter Reformation in England: A Study of His Actions within the Context of the Political and Religious Situation of His Times" (unpublished Ph.D. dissertation, University of Notre Dame, 1984).

tended something military simply because he used the word "enterprise" in a letter to WUUam Good because this "term," according to Dr. CarrafieUo, "certainly had a political meaning a decade later" (ibid.)?

I quibble over words. I would rather address Dr. CarrafieUo's evidence. In the review we are told that Parsons recalled "many times" in later years that the "Scottish strategy" was a motive for the English mission. In his article the "many times" are reduced to two (art. cit., p. 769). The first cited source is "Father Persons' Autobiography" edited by John H. Pollen, SJ.[2] Dr. CarrafieUo correctly quotes the foUowing passage:

> An other cause also of my coming over was to make a mission of Scotch fathers into Scotland, which by letters I had procured before from the General, and f. E" Hayes and f. Wm Critton were appointed, but first to take direction from me: wherefore upon conference with f. Critton at Roan he went to Scotland and I sent Rafe Emerson with him, and promised to expect his returne at Roan as I did.[3]

If Dr. CarrafieUo had read the rest of the page, he might have reaUzed that he has misdated the passage. Parsons was discussing events between the capture of Edmund Campion in July of 1581 (first line on the page) and Father Crichton's return from Scotland in AprU of 1582 (first line of paragraph following the above cited text). He was explaining reasons for his "coming over" to France—not to England. A comparison of this passage with Parsons's letter to Claudio Acquaviva on October 21, 1581, confirms this.[4] Thus his conclusion that "Parsons both sanctioned and planned this political activity as an integral part of his making the journey to England in the first place" (art. cit.,p. 769) collapses.

His second citation comes from Parsons's "A Political Retrospect," written on July 6, 1603, a letter to Henry Garnet via his secretary Anthony Rivers (vere Henry Floyd):

> . . I suppose you know, or have heard, that from our first entrance into England in the yeare 1580, one special care of myne was by request and order of this owr new kings good mother to seek his conversion to Cath. religion, and to that end also his greatest advancement that could be wished or hoped for, in which desyre and endevour concurred all our friends both in England, and out of England . . .[5]

I can cite three similar statements from Parsons's letters but I shall quote only one. After James's accession to the EngUsh throne, Parsons, a "poore worme of the earth," joined his praise to those of the mighty princes of Christendom at

2Printed as part of"The Memoirs of Father Robert Persons," in Miscellanea II (London: Catholic Record Society, 1906), CRS1VoL 2, pp. 12-47.

'Ibid,p.30.

<See Hicks, Letters ofPersons, pp. 95-96 (Latin), 107 (English translation).

Tn Pollen,"Memoirs,"p. 213.

the "great fortune and prosperous entrance of your Majesties raiyne." The Jesuit explained that he was not opposed to James but

> … Lf true love do consist more in deeds than in wordes, as a very wise and holy man advertiseth, then are there extant tokens of my love and zealous affection towards your Majestie and yours, then of many others together, it being notorious to many, and to be confirmed by the attestation of divers great Princes, and by the testimonie of good offices done with them, and benefyts obtayned from them, by my sollicitation in favour and service of your Majestie when your RoyaU person stood in most danger, as I may say with no imputation of vaunt, that no one man perhaps of either nation, is knowne to have labored so much, nor to have made more wearisome jornayes, nor passed greater perils in that behatfe then my selfe. And this continued not for a smaU tyme but for a dozen yeares together at least, to witt, from the yeare 1580 unto 1593 or thereabout. . . .6

In the succession struggle, Parsons had backed a loser; now he sought to explain to the winner how much he had supported the Bung over the years. The three letters and the "PoUtical Retrospect," all written between 1600 and 1603, refer to events at least twenty years earUer. AU proclaim that Parsons's concern for James and his work in the Bung's interest began in 1580. But should we read this as a precise terminus a quo or as an approximation, a "thereabout" such as the 1593 terminus ad quern of the last-cited letter? And what form exactly did Parsons's devotion to James take? Should we assume that it always involved intrigues and alliances?

In footnote 2 on page 178 of my volume, I rejected Dr. CarrafieUo's version of the "Scottish strategy" because he failed to take into account Everard Mercurian's aversion to political involvement and the power of the stUl very alive Protestant Earl of Morton. To these objections I now add another. If "launching the Scottish enterprise" was a reason for the English mission, why did the Society not inaugurate a simultaneous mission to Scotland either as a companion or an alternative? Despite earlier petitions from Scottish Jesuits, that mission was estabUshed only after Parsons's return to the continent in the summer of 1581.7 Moreover, given the presence of certain weU-connected Scots such as WUUam Crichton, Edmund Hay, and James Gordon in the Society, why was an Englishman selected for such a deUcate mission?

London

"Parsons to James I and VT, October 18, 1603, Stonyhurst College Archives, Anglia III, 36. The other letters are to William, Lord Douglas, Earl of Angus, Rome, January 14/24, 1600, Stonyhurst College Archives, Coll P 414, and to James VL, Rome, August 18, 1602, Stonyhurst College Archives, Anglia III, 20.

'See Society offesus, pp. 121, 181-182.

BOOK REVIEWS

General and Miscellaneous

Mary through the Centuries: Her Place in the History of Culture. By Jaroslav Pelikan. (New Haven: Yale University Press. 1996. Pp. xii, 267. $25.00.)

In this companion volume to his highly successful Jesus through the Centuries (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1985), Jaroslav Pelikan, Sterling Professor of History Emeritus at Yale University, offers an educated but nonspeciaUst audience an engaging and informative account of the multi-faceted impact of the Blessed Virgin Mary on devotion, theology, and culture. Pelikan concentrates on material from the patristic period through the nineteenth century: bibUcal texts are presented briefly and incompletely, and apart from discussion of Pope Pius XII's definition of the Assumption and a few pages on the Second Vatican CouncU, little attention is paid to the twentieth century.

Lavishly Ulustrated with thirty-seven well-chosen photographs (about hatf in color), Mary through the Centuries is structured chiefly as an account of diverse but often complementary titles and images of Mary, usuaUy presented in pairs chosen to reflect polarities and thus to suggest a certain balance in overaU estimation. A loose historical framework is gained by examining the titles and images in the sequence Ln which they achieved their greatest prominence, but the book does not take the form of a straightforward chronological presentation. This procedure, whUe effective in some respects, has certain disadvantages: it causes, for example, patristic and medieval theological and liturgical developments relevant to the Immaculate Conception and the Assumption to be relegated to the concluding chapters of the book, since the timing of the dogmatic definitions of 1854 and 1950 ultimately determines the location of this material. As a result, Pelikan does not fufiy succeed in conveying a clear picture of the historical development of Mariology. Particularly useful sections include the accounts of Mary as Second Eve and as Theotokos and the treatment of the Marian teaching of the Reformers. Much attention is devoted to art (especiaUy depictions of the Annunciation) and literature (especially Dante and Goethe). Doctrinal and devotional material is treated sympatheticaUy and on the whole accurately, while modern revisionist interpretations are viewed with notable reserve.

Mary through the Centuries may be recommended as a reUable guide to its chosen topic. There are deficiencies: some repetition, often of minor points,

perhaps due to the book's origin as a lecture series; disproportionate focus on material which the author has studied in earlier publications; attribution of exaggerated content to the dogma of the Assumption in an attempted paraphrase using the words of the seventeenth-century Spanish mystic Maria de Agreda (p. 204); misidentification of Lumen Gentium as the first document adopted by the Second Vatican Council (p. 212). But the book fulfills the author's goal of providing an appealing popular account of the varied and generaUy positive impact of Mary on the history of culture.

John P. Galvin

The CathoUc University ofAmerica

Histoire de la pénitence des origines à nos Jours. By Philippe RouiUard. [Petits Cerf-Histoire.] (Paris: Les Éditions du Cerf. 1996. Pp. 210. 140 FF.)

This concise survey of penance from the New Testament to the present is at once a history of the subject and a historical document. It is history written from the perspective of the present, by a not-disinterested reformer. The author is a Benedictine monk who teaches sacramental theology at St. Anselm's in Rome, and thus knows his subject. Aside from certain emphases one might quarrel with, the only error I found was the identification of De vera et falsa penitentia as a letter of the late tenth century (p. 159). He obviously sympathizes with some of the reforms and reformers he describes, but he can also betray his disapproval (e.g., of the Roman Catechism's gloss on "ego te absolvo," p. 172). In his conclusion he invokes the pluralism of this long history to establish the fact and legitimacy of institutional change and to suggest ways to remedy the current decline in confession. That situation is dramaticaUy conveyed by a supporting document that records "une chute spectaculaire" of confession among French Catholics.

Frequency	% 1952	% 1974	% 1983
at least once a month	15	1	1
a few times a year	18	16	8
once a year	18	12	5
less than once a year	8	13	13
never	37	54	69
unknown	3	4	4

One suspects that the decline among French CathoUcs complying with the minimal obligation—from 51% in 1952 to 14% in 1983—has probably not been arrested in the subsequent thirteen years. At the same time, as Professor RouiUard notes, Catholic church-goers do not need statistics to teU them that the decrease in confession has coincided with a rise in the number of communicants among those who attend Mass.

The historical survey is a lucid simplification of the standard narrative, farmliar to readers of Bernhard Poschmann, Cyrille Vogel, or the article "Pénitence" in the Dictionnaire de Théologie Catholique. The periodization itself reveals this historical orthodoxy: New Testament origins; excommunication and reconcUiation from the second to the sixth centuries; tariffed penance, sixth to the twelfth century; confession and penance from Lateran CouncU IV to Trent; the CouncU of Trent to the eighteenth century; the French Revolution to Vatican CouncU II; and developments after Vatican Council II. It is a narrative untouched by revisionist questions: were the Penitentials practical manuals? was there much lay confession before 1215? was confession frequent before the Counter-Reformation took hold? doesn't public penance remain important after the twelfth, even into the sixteenth century? But given the purpose of this Uttle book, the author did weU to keep the story line uncompUcated. For whatever the actuaUties of practice over this long history, the surviving record amply justifies retaining this narrative, and provides the author examples of the institutional diversity that inform his hopes for a revival of a church-centered penance adapted to the modern situation.

The eighty-seven supporting documents that span the twenty centuries of the narrative are aU very brief, in the style of Denzinger and Bettenson (pp. 131-204). They include not only commonplaces (Mt. 16:13-19; St. Cyprian and the Council of Carthage; canon 21 of Lateran CouncU IV; the curé d'Ars, etc.) but also examples of reconciliation in Byzantine, Anglican, and Russian rites. The author alludes in text and documents to contemporary practice in Korea, Chad, the Reformed Church of France, and a few European parishes where Catholic confession remains strong. Documents in the modern section—from rituals to anecdotal accounts—illustrate the sensitivity in contemporary pastoral thinking to the psychological and cultural dimensions of religious experience. While searching for signs of life, however, Professor RouiUard has not ignored the situation that his statistics on French observance make plain. And whether the Catholic tradition can exploit the broadened perspectives of the post-Vatican CouncU II era, recapitulate the adaptive pattern the author sees in his long history, and stage a comeback for confession, remains to be seen.

Thomas Tentler

University of Michigan

The Vincentian Family Tree: A Genealogical Study. By Betty Ann McNeU, D.C. Edited by Martha Beaudoin, D.C, Stafford Poole, CM., and Edward Udovic, CM. [Vincentian Studies Institute Monographs, I.] (Chicago: Vincentian Studies Institute. Available at DePaul University Bookstore, Vincentian Heritage Department, 2419 North Sheffield Avenue, Chicago, IL 60614. 1996. Pp. xxviii, 255. $20.00 paperback.)

The Vincentian Family Tree is the first volume of a new monograph series published by the Vincentian Studies Institute. Its purpose is to trace the development, over time and across cultures, of the spiritual descendants of Vincent de Paul (1581-1660). As noted in the introduction,"The mission, spirit and rules of Vincent de Paul have been adapted to many cultures since their emergence in seventeenth-century France and have generated a majestic family tree." This volume sketches the shape of that tree, identifying Catholic and non-Catholic groups around the world that claim their roots in this stiU vibrant mission.

The scholarship reflected in McNeU's volume is impeccable. Basing her research on a genealogical perspective that positions Vincent de Paul as family patriarch (Ln order to make distinctions between generations of his foUowers and himself as founder), McNeil traces members of the "Vincentian family" (i.e., congregations who, in some way, trace their origin or spirit back to Vincent de Paul) from its beginnings in 1625 to the present. She describes clearly her methodology and decision rules, noting honestly their limitations. The scope of the project is simUarly superb. She used both established networks and creative contacts to obtain critical background data from congregations around the world.

Along with the brief historical context pertinent to the development of the extended Vincentian famUy over the centuries, McNeil offers lengthy footnotes throughout the text. These provide anecdotal information and source references for the reader who desires additional data. Ample appendices offer supplemental information such as geographical distribution and federation affiliation. In the text itseU, the presentation of each of the nearly 270 groups reviewed includes an address for further contact.

The "ImpUcations" that McNeU discusses near the end of Chapter 2 (p. 32) pose questions for rich conversation among members and leaders of the Vincentian family. They also provide direction for those interested in networking for service to the poor in the Vincentian tradition.

Beyond its relevance for those interested in the spirituality and development of the Vincentian famUy, this volume can be a valuable resource for other groups of reUgious who share a common spirituality. It offers a means to study the dispersion of their spirit and the manner in which this has been incarnated over the centuries and across cultures. To students of history and individual personaUty, it demonstrates how one person, passionately committed to an idea, can influence positively and impact profoundly the lives of both contemporaries and those yet to be born. For believers in the work of the Spirit, it serves as testimony to the continuance of the mission of Jesus through the work of his foUowers. The volume documents the efforts of women and men to read the signs of the times and respond to them in the context of their own

founding spirit. It provides a key resource for those who wish to focus on the Vincentian FamUy Tree Ui the forest of God's faithful foUowers.

Miriam D. Ukeritis, CSJ.
Sisters of St. Joseph of Carondelet, Albany (New York) Province

Miracles and the Modern Religious Imagination. By Robert Bruce MuLUn. (New Haven, Connecticut: Yale University Press. 1996. Pp. xi, 322. $30.00.)

Robert Bruce Mullin has crafted a very smart study of the idea of miracles in the English-speaking world in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries; his book, in fact, should contribute in important ways to reshaping the scholarly conversation about the theological fault Lines that defined GUded Age religion.

On one level, MulUn's study is about the coUapse of the revered Protestant idea of a "limited age of miracles." For 300 years, English-speaking Protestants had agreed that miracles—direct divine intervention in the course of nature and history in response to personal, petitionary prayer—had been limited to the apostolic church, and were granted then for only two reasons: to highUght bibUcal revelation and to aid in the establishment of Christianity. This idea had achieved something close to doctrinal status in the centuries after the Reformation in the Anglo-American world because it performed three essential functions: it helped to define the crucial dividing line between sober, Bible-beUeving Protestants and the magical, pagan world of CathoUcs; it anchored the unique authority of the New Testament in "mighty acts" different from aU subsequent, post-apostolic "wonders"; and—especially after the rise of the "New Science"—it aUowed Protestants to combine a belief in the biblical miracles of Jesus with the Enlightenment vision of regular, orderly "Nature."

By the mid-nineteenth century, this pan-Protestant belief was under attack from a number of positions: from Protestant exponents of higher criticism like Charles Briggs; from agnostic practitioners of evolutionary science like Aldous Huxley; from Christian advocates of faith healing like John Alexander Dowie; and from "romantic" religious thinkers like Horace Bushnell. MuULn argues that by the final period of his study (1850-1930) the belief in the "limited age" had lost it hegemonic role in defining the beUefs of Protestants, and was limited to outposts of the older orthodoxy like Princeton Seminary.

But MuUin's story is a nuanced and sophisticated tale eschewing the heavy-handed traditional interpretation pressed by some inteUectuaI historians—that the assault on the miraculous was part of an inevitable evolution of naturaUstic principles of "modern science" after Darwin. MuLUn convincingly shows that the GUded Age debate over the miraculous witnessed the rise of a large and vocal countervaUing movement within the North Atlantic Protestant community that saw miracles as increasingly important in the modern world, and wit-

nessed as weU a dramatic reaUgnment of debate partners in the discussion, as many devout Protestants found more succor from Catholics than from feUow Protestants in the culture-wide fracas. MuUin demonstrates that by 1915 the belief in the "limited age" was simply no longer accepted by many English-speaking beUevers, and that an emergent interest in the "ministry of healing" had led to three distinctive positions on the miraculous that stiU define, to a large extent, contemporary religious discourse about the miraculous: a "therapeutic" model of miracles, that sees the divine working in natural categories; a "sacramental/Uturgical" model, that emphasizes the role of grace operating through formaUy ordained ecclesiastical channels; and a "thaumaturgical" model, that argues that God intervenes directly in the Uves of the faithful.

This is an extremely important and well-written study, and contributes in three significant ways to reshaping the discussion of religion in the North Atlantic world in the GUded Age: first, Mullin demonstrates that debates focused on the miraculous may very weU be at least as important as the discussions about the authority and inspiration of scripture in understanding the splintering and realignment of the Protestant mainstream in the hatf-century after 1875; secondly, MuUin shows that this debate appears to have replaced the traditional Catholic-Protestant division in defining the "parties" of theological discussion by the early years of the twentieth century, and thus posits an "ecumenical" sentiment across Reformation Lines earUer than usually recognized by religious historians; and thirdly, Mullin convincingly argues for a far more important role for the AngUcan/Episcopal tradition in defining the issues and "sides" of the cultural debate over reUgion than traditionally assigned to it in a field that has focused far more on the Reformed tradition. This is essential reading for scholars of GUded Age religion, ecumenical relations, and American popular culture.

Mark S. Massa

Fordham University

Piety and Poverty: Working-Class Religion in Berlin, London and New York, 1870-1914. By Hugh McLeod. [Europe Past and Present Series.] (New York: Holmes & Meier. 1996. Pp. xxx, 264. $45.00.)

Hugh McLeod shows a predUection for units of three in his latest book, in which he continues his study of the impact of modernization and urbanization on religious beliefs and practices among the working class. He traces this theme in three major cities, Berlin, London, and New York, in the hatf-century before World War I, in each city considering working-class attitudes to religion among Protestants, Catholics, and Jews. Most previous studies of this topic, he contends, have been either general surveys that overlooked specific factors or detailed local investigations that were deficient in comparative analysis. By contrast, in this work he claims to offer "a third kind of study, which is both local and comparative" (p. xxvi).

McLeod rejects the deterministic thesis which views modernization as inevitably leading to a decline in religion. On the contrary, he notes that several aspects of modernization actuaUy favored the growth of reUgion. Nonetheless, the alienation of many workers from church and synagogue was one of the salient features of nineteenth-century European history. McLeod identifies three "generai'factors which shaped this attitude: (1) intense class conflicts that weakened loyalty to the established churches, (2) successive emancipation movements of peasants, workers, and women that often had an anticlerical dimension, and (3) inteUectuaI movements that undermined fundamentalist religious beliefs (p. 205).

To these general factors McLeod adds the particular circumstances that were present in each of the three cities under discussion. He traces the evolution of working-class disaffection with religion through three stages: (1) the gradual loosening of ties with the church, (2) the decline In regular church attendance, and (3) a complete break with the church including the rejection of the traditional "rites of passage." According to these criteria, by 1900 the working class in Berlin had reached the third stage; the London workers were in the second stage, and "the position in New York was one of complete confusion because of the wide differences among ethnic groups" (pp. 103-104).

One of the most valuable features of this book is the detaUed description of the variety of working-class attitudes to reUgion in the three cities. McLeod's sources (which he spent fifteen years coUecting) include interviews with elderly workers, public records, parish statistics, and even such unusual documents as the impressions recorded by the PauUst priests as they gave parish missions in many New York City neighborhoods. His comparisons between Berlin and London are often informative and interesting, but conditions in New York City were so different from those in the other two cities that McLeod frequently has to strain to find common ground among aU three. Moreover, as he himself admits, the same kinds of documentary evidence were not available for all three cities.

One of McLeod's most revealing conclusions about working-class religion, at least in London and New York, is that non pratiquant did not necessarily translate into non croyant. In fact, in New York in the period under review Catholicism flourished as the children of the pre-famine Irish immigrants, and later the chUdren of ItaUan immigrants, were transformed in many instances from nominal Catholics into regular churchgoers. Equally striking, and weU documented in this study, is the difference that one sympathetic clergyman could make in retaining the religious loyalty of the workers. So much for the inevitabUity of secularization in the modern world!

Thomas J. Shelley

Fordham University

Ancient

Storia dell'Italia religiosa, I: L'antichità e il medioevo. Edited by André Vauchez. [Storia e Società.] (Bari: Editori Laterza. 1993. Pp. xvi, 612; 20 plates. Lire 50,000.)

The editors of this book have shown a great deal of courage in imagining its subject and Ln approaching that subject with the structure they have chosen. In fact, it could be argued that there cannot be a religious history of something called Italy stretching from the pre-Roman period to the Second Vatican Council (in the early sixteenth century). It would not be an unreasonable argument; but readers aware of the activities and work of Gabriele De Rosa (one of the general editors of this volume) and André Vauchez would probably agree that if anyone could make this a subject, and this a way to treat the subject, they could. They have chosen not to write a single narrative controlled by a single mind, like, say, Colin Morris's The Papal Monarchy, but rather to put together seventeen essays by twelve eminent French and ItaUan scholars (and it is a very French-Italian production). Four of the writers contribute more than one essay: GiuUa Barone, Grado Merlo, and Roberto Rusconi, each two; André Vauchez himself, three and an introduction. Although the repeaters do not always speak in the same voice, their repeated presence gives a sense of continuity and connection to the book. The preface and introduction suggest that the editors were aware of difficulty, and both pieces persuade the, at least already persuaded, reader that there was an Italy, and less successfully at least in terms of the offered essays, that there is a real connection between pre-Roman and Vatican Council II, as Vauchez suggests (p. 7), for example, in the attachment of the people of questo paese to the visibUity of the sacred. Vauchez's introduction seems to promise an approach which, probably fortunately, is not really much pursued except in one of Vauchez's own essays, which deals with relics, sanctuaries, and sacred space, and in Chiara Frugoni's essay on, at least according to its title, iconography and the religious life in the later Middle Ages (thirteenth to fifteenth centuries), and in the last part of Paolo GolineLU's essay.

The essays are arranged in chronological, but of course not completely chronological, order. They are repeatedly forced to provide continuum and generaUzation, not the most enticing kind of writing. That they face their jobs differently a glance at the numbers and kinds of footnotes makes clear. But, of course, historians as talented as these men and women are cannot be kept from presenting much of value and interest and even some surprises. Most obviously briUant is that part of Giorgio Cracco's essay (which covers the period from the Lombards to the Carolingians) which creates in "The miracoW of Gregory the Great" a focused, ItaUan, vivaciously active, Gregory, shorn of aspects (and bibUography) that would distract from his Italian importance. Frugoni, who proclaims the impossibiUty of doing too much in so little space, adapts her skiU to the volume's seeming purpose and approaches an applied piety (devozione "applicata"), images of practical use and in public places; she offers a model

iconographical deconstruction of a 1464 gonfalone by Benedetto Bonfigli. Roberto Rusconi twice shows his unusual ability to combine the long, broad coverage helpful to this kind of venture with repeated thought-provoking insight and cheering example. Jean Guyon provides what seems to me a dense Uttle masterpiece in his essay on the first centuries of the Christian mission in Italy; and Grado Merlo in the first of his essays, on monastic reform and the vita apostólica, ties and evokes with accomplished mastery, as in his use of CamaldoU and VaUombrosa. GolinelU's relatively long essay on organizational structure and reUgious Ufe in the age of particularism is, especially in its first ten pages, fuU of crisp information and argument. Jean-Marie Martin confronts and analyzes the existence of and relations between Lombard, Greek, Islamic, and Norman, in the South, through the twelfth century.

This book complements rather than replaces the long essays by Giovanni MiccoU and Jacques LeGoff in Einaudi's 1974 Storia d'Ltalia; it does not have the sustained magisterial gravity of the Miccoli essay or the continued witty insight of the LeGoff. It does have the advantages as weU as the disadvantages of many voices, of being in some senses dialogic. The voices sometimes refer to each other as does Barone to Vauchez (p. 372); they sometimes capture the valuable voices of other historians not included in the volume, as Vauchez does that of Mario Sensi (p. 471). There are repeated treats: from whom would any reader rather read a sharp half-paragraph on the significance of the cult of San Rocco than from André Vauchez (pp. 482-483)? This is a book (wrapped prettily in what the publishers assume is a Giotto fresco, from Assisi) that any reader concerned with medieval Italy or with the history of religions wiU want to have on his or her shelf; that reader will be aware of the book's necessary limitations.

Robert Brentano

University of California, Berkeley

Ordonner la fraternité. Pouvoir d'innover et retour à l'ordre dans l'Église ancienne. By Alexandre Faivre. (Paris: Les Editions du Cerf. 1992. Pp. 555. 299E)

This book by Alexandre Faivre is a coUection of essays and papers on the topic of church institutions and organization in the early centuries, after the apostoUc period and up to the end of the fifth century. Much of the material has to do with the critical period between 180 and 260, when the distinction between cleric and lay emerged and became standard, and the role of the episcopacy took the shape that in essence has prevaUed up to our time. On this same question of church organization, other essays include a survey of canonico-Uturgical resources, the emergence of the notion of the rule of faith, the development of a synodal and concUar procedure for dealing with problems, the clergy in the writings of Saint Augustine, the place of women in the Church, and the role of lay theologians. Due to the occasional nature of the pieces here gath-

ered together there is a measure of repetition, but on a whole the work is a well-presented and coherent unit. It is very clearly written. The care shown in the examination of the pertinent literature will no doubt recommend it to the historian, but the clarity of presentation makes its scholarly work readily accessible to the more general reader who wants to know more about the ways in which church institutions developed and took shape.

There are several matters of interest for both historian and theologian. Faivre shows the divergence in the leadership and organization of churches up to the third century, and shows how the episcopal organization came to dominate. He also explains how the notions of cleric and lay, up to that point largely unknown, took firm hold in the third century. The factors in this development are examined, including the need for authority, the organization of offices into a state of life, the remuneration of those devoted to the service of the Church, and most of aU the development of a cultic notion of Uturgy. As Faivre shows, the motivation for the kind of organization adopted and for the authority claimed by bishops was often practical and responded to the need for unity in Uturgy, life, and doctrine. The theological justification was then given by the appeal back to the scriptures and the apostoUc tradition. There are two points that this reviewer would like to underline. First, a reading of this work can help to clarify the nature and development of tradition. This is never a clear Unear development but the result of the many diverse factors that contribute to the statement of doctrines and the authority of bishops, so that these cannot be weU understood unless all the factors are weighed. Second, the basic fraternité or fellowship of the church community, in which all may have some service to render, charismatic or institutional, was at an early stage suffocated by the prevalence of the clergy/laity distinction. This gave rise to a clerical dominance in every area of church life, except for the contribution of finances, due to reasons often more practical than theological. There are no answers here to current questions in ecclesiology and ministry, but the historical contribution to the understanding of how things developed cannot be ignored.

David N. Power, O.M.I.

The Catholic University ofAmerica

The Virgin and the Bride: Idealized Womanhood in Late Antiquity. By Kate Cooper. (Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press. 1996. Pp. xU, 180. $37.50.)

Studies of asceticism and gender in Late Antiquity and Early Christianity have flourished in recent decades. Cooper engages this discussion by tracing the shifting character of pagan and Christian rhetorical constructions of female virtue, especiaUy as these were embodied in discourses on marriage and celibacy. Beginning with Plutarch's Erötikos (chap. 1), then proceeding through ancient novels (chap. 2) and early Christian apocrypha (chap. 3), Cooper demonstrates how a rhetoric of female virtue served in an economy of power rela-

tions among men: marital chastity and household harmony were broadcast as emblems of a man's suitability for public office and devotion to the common good (one thinks immediately of the Pastoral Epistles and their requirements for the episcopacy).

Similarly, Cooper argues, the ancient novels, with their titillating stories of desire deferred (but ultimately consummated), served to harness marital pleasure to the common good, that is, to the establishment of households and the replenishment of society by procreation. Against this background the apocryphal acts of the early Christians appear deliberately to mimic and invert the Greco-Roman ideology of erös. As Cooper sees it, the asceticism of the apocrypha was less an argument for asceticism per se than it was a "rhetorical weapon" that chaUenged traditional sources of authority (household, city) and claimed an alternative, Christian basis of authority, namely, the moral superiority of the (male) ascetic teacher.

In chapters 4-5 Cooper turns to Christian Uterature of the late fourth and early fifth centuries. She focuses primarily on the debates between "traditionalists" and "separatists" in the Church at Rome, that is, between those Christians (probably always the majority) who remained committed to marriage, family, and the social order and those who adopted celibacy or other forms of ascetic practice. EspeciaUy welcome is Cooper's attempt to reconstruct on the basis of disparate and fragmentary sources something of the understanding of marriage as a "civic partnership," an ideal, she plausibly argues, that was shared by pagan and Christian alike, at least among the Roman aristocracy.

In her final chapter Cooper turns to little-known Roman sources (the Liber ad Gregoriam and the Gesta of the Roman martyrs) to show how earlier images of the female hero and martyr were adapted to discourses for married women. Unlike the apocryphal literature of the second and third centuries (which, Cooper argues, was not much concerned with the actual behavior of real women), the later Christian texts were specifically intended to delineate the identity and enhance the status of the Christian matrona.

Informed by socio-linguistic theory and weU-grounded in social history, Cooper's study sheds considerable new light on the rhetorical processes by which Christianity contributed to the transformation of late ancient society, especiaUy Ln matters of gender and sexuality. At times, despite her own expUcit intentions (pp. 73-74), her discussion seems to reduce the Christian (and non-Christian) sources merely to strategies in a competition for status. In other words, the reUgious or theological character of the discourse is barely acknowledged. Nevertheless, Cooper has established herself as an important voice in the ongoing discussion of asceticism and gender in early Christianity.

David G. Hunter

University of St. Thomas
St. Paul, Minnesota

Rome and the African Church in the Time of Augustine. By J. E. Merdinger. (New Haven: Yale University Press. 1997. Pp. xvi, 267. $40.00.)

The theme of this book is more limited than the title would suggest. Dr. Merdinger is concerned with African appeals to Rome, upon which her verdict is that "the pope's advice was eagerly solicited by Augustine and his coUeagues in some cases, whereas at other times they were very disturbed by papal interference in what they considered to be a strictly intramural affair" (p. Lx). This may sound like ecclesiastical opportunism; but in the fifth century the powers and immunities of individual ecclesiastical provinces were less clearly denned than they were later to become and need to be evaluated by contemporary circumstances and not by the assumptions of later ages. A century ago, English-speaking scholars of dUferent communions, Like EW. Puller and John Chapman, although immensely learned, interpreted the events of the patristic age In the Ught of the ecclesiological beUefs of their own communions. At the end of the twentieth century we can recognize that the Fathers did not anticipate either the Reformation or the Vatican CouncU of 1870. Canon law was in its Infancy, though ecclesiastics were beginning to acquire an interest in exploiting it. One may regret that Merdinger, in her introductory chapter, does not say something about the development of canonical legislation in the fourth and fifth centuries: of the Macedonian bishop Sabinus, who made a coUection of concUar decrees favoring his own party (Socrates,iZFI,8);ofBasU of Caesarea, writing his canonical letters to AmphUocius; of Theophilus of Alexandria denouncing John Chrysostom.whom he beUeved, wrongly, to have received into communion the Four Tall Brethren, whom TheophUus had expelled from Egypt: "I think you know the regulations of the canons of Nicaea, which forbid a bishop to judge a dispute outside his own area. If not, please learn them and keep clear of complaint against me. If I am to be judged it should be by Egyptians, and not by you, who are seventy-five days' journey away"(Palladius,Di«tog. 7). Chrysostom was himseU to rebuke Epiphanius of Cyprus for uncanonical behavior in ordaining a man Ln Constantinople without securing John's authorization (Socrates, HE VI, 14). Bishops, sensitive to their prerogatives, could now appeal to conciUar decrees, and especiaUy to those of the great and holy synod of Nicaea, to uphold their rights. The Africans were no exception to this rule, despite a general regard and affection for the Roman see.

Merdinger's book faUs into two parts. In the first, after an introductory general chapter, she deals with the background to the fifth century in the persons of three distinguished theologians: TertuUian, Cyprian, and Optatus of MUevis, aU of whom, in different ways, Alústrate the attitude of the African Church to Rome: respect, combined with independence. In this context she might have made more of the behavior of the African bishops Ln the condemnation of Pelagius as Ulustrating the African attitude to Rome. The Africans were happy enough to appeal to Pope Innocent I to excommunicate Pelagius and Caelestius (neither of whom, it may be observed, was a member of their own Church), but when Innocent's successor, Zosimus, sought to reopen the case, they flatly

opposed him. Augustine was never more the canon-lawyer manqué than Ln his famous declaration: "Two councils have already sent letters to the Apostolic See; rescripts have been received; causa finita est—'leave to appeal refused'" (Serm. 131, 10). Merdinger sees Augustine, if not necessarUy as the initiator of the reforming CouncU of Hippo of 393, as F. L. Cross believed, then at least as the enthusiastic collaborator of Aurelius of Carthage in that enterprise (p. 66).

The second part of Merdinger's study concerns the legal aspect of the relations between North Africa and the papacy in Augustine's time. She recognizes the dUficulty of the enquiry: "Investigating North African canon law … is like entering a minefield" (p. 63), admits the subjective element in any conclusions which may be drawn in the present state of our knowledge (pp. 83, 87, 178, 179, etc.), and speaks of "the fluidity of ecclesiastical judicial procedure in [Augustine's] day. Had there been strict regulations according to which a troubled church was expected to appeal to Carthage or Rome, the evidence would be patent in African canon law and in Augustine's correspondence" (p. 143). She gives generous recognition to the work of F. L. Cross and Charles Munier in elucidating the textual tradition of African concUar legislation (pp. 64-65); to William Frend and Serge Lancel, for their work on various cases, particularly those of Bishop Honorius (pp. 145-146) and Antony of Fussala (pp. 166-169, 178-179);and to the service to scholarship ofJohannes Divjak,by his discovery and pubUcation in 1981 of twenty-seven hitherto unknown letters of Augustine (p. xi), including one (Letter 20*) which threw new and vivid Ught upon the case of Antony of Fussala (pp. 157 ff.). Nevertheless, despite the labors of these and other scholars and Merdinger's own investigations, there are gaps in the information avaUable to us which make the interpretation of some African canons, such as Canon 10 of the CouncU of Hippo of 393, controversial (p. 85). What is clear is that the canons of the CouncU of Nicaea enjoyed a position of particular authority in the African Church (p. 200). They constituted a decisive argument against Pope Zosimus in the Apiarian affair of 419- Zosimus had cited from the Canons of Sardica, supposing them to be Nicene. The Africans declared that U his canons could be found among those of Nicaea, they would accept them. They could not, and so, for the Africans, the pope's case faUed (p. 135), to be renewed, again unsuccessfuUy, by Pope Celestine in 425/426, being vehemently rejected by the Africans in the letter Optaremus (pp. 188-195).

Apiarius was, however, a presbyter. The position of a bishop was more complicated. In principle the possibility of an appeal to the Roman see had been estabUshed by the great Athanasius himseU in 339. Merdinger emphasizes that Augustine did not decline to serve as a papal commissioner in Mauretania Caesariensis in 418 (pp. 136-137). Again, Ui 419, in the case of Bishop Honorius,Augustine had no objection to Pope BonUace adjudicating the matter. Indeed, in 420, he actuaUy urged his friend Alypius, then in Italy, to bring the affair to the pope's attention, since he was confident that the pope would regard the matter

as did the Africans (p. l49;Ep. 22*, 7; 11 Divjak).Yet again, in the case of Antony of Fussala, Augustine's disreputable protégé, Merdinger notes that "the Africans co-operated fuUy with the pope from the moment that Antony turned to him" (p. 160). AureUus of Macomades, the primate of Numidia, could have ended the case at the synod of GUva in 422, but did not: "no one seemed to think that Antony was doing anything Ulegal by appealing to Rome so late. . . . The evidence suggests that throughout Antony of Fussala's case the Africans can turn to Rome for help, and this is what is most important" (pp. 164, 182). Merdinger, foUowing the conclusions of Charles Munier, considers that it was not untU the Council of Carthage of 424 that the African bishops, outraged by the further appeals to Rome of Apiarius of Sicca Veneria, appealed to the Nicene canons to forbid episcopal appeals to Rome, as weU as those of inferior orders. The twentieth Council of Carthage of 525 repeated the prohibition of 424: Ut nullus ad Romanam ecclesiam audeat appellare (CCSL \49, 266).

In her conclusions Merdinger considers that the earliest traditions of Tertullian, Cyprian, and Optatus Uved on in fifth-century Africa: independence, combined with an increasing reUance on the ApostoUc See up to a certain point. She sees the Apiarius case as "a water-shed in African-Roman relations" (p. 206), and here the canons of Nicaea provided an impressive defense against Roman intervention. At the same time, this did not lead to any break in communion with Rome. Merdinger's final paragraph (apart from an epilogue) can hardly be bettered as a summary of her argument:

> The Africans emerged from round two of the Apiarius affair as the defenders of Nicaea and a vocal critic of the papacy. From the Divjak letters, it is clear that they were at the same time becoming increasingly dependent on the papacy for judicial decisions and advice. The very principles which they had once used to combat heretics and schismatics—apostolic tradition and unity with the source—now bound them to the great church at Rome, more tightly sometimes than they wished.

Gerald Bonner

Durham, England

Medieval

Studien zu den Quellen der frühmittelalterlichen Bussbücher. By Ludger Körntgen. [QueUen und Forschungen zum Recht Lm Mittelalter, Band 7.] (Sigmaringen: Jan Thorbecke Verlag. 1993. Pp. xxiü, 292. DM 98,-.)

Since the middle of the nineteenth century the study of early medieval penitentials has, on the whole, been in a state of disarray. The editions of penitentials in Councils and Ecclesiastical Documents relating to Great Britain and Ire-

land1 and in Wasserschleben's2 and Schmltz's3 volumes, excellent as they were for the nineteenth century, at times gave different names for the same penitential, presented only partial texts of some penitentials, and were based on what is now known to have been an inadequate number of manuscripts. The two major exceptions to the confusion Ln the editing of the penitentials were in FLnsterwalder's edition of the Cañones Theodori in 19294 and Bieler's exceUent edition of the Irish penitentials in 1963.5 In 1978 Vogel pubUshed a useful introduction to the penitentials as a whole in the series Typologie des sources du moyen âge occidental, but much of the confusion of the past remained, so much so that a few years later in the same series A.J. Frantzen made an attempt, not always successful, to clear up matters.6 In the late 1970's the situation regarding the large number of continental penitentials began to change. Raymund Kottje, who would pubUsh his fundamental study of the penitentials of HaUtgar of Cambrai and Rabanus Maurus Ln 1980,7 first announced the establishment of a major program, sponsored by the Volkswagen Stiftung, to study and edit the Continental penitentials.8 The first volume to emerge from this program has now appeared in the Corpus Christianorum series, Paenitentialia minora Franciae et Italiae saeculi VIII-IX? During his work both at Augsburg and Bonn Kottje involved a number of his students, including Frantzen, who used material gathered in Augsburg for his own studies, and the author of the volume here under review, who soon distinguished himself with work such as that on

1Councils and Ecclesiastical Documents relating to Great Britain and Ireland, ed. A. W Haddan and W. Stubbs after Spelman and Wilkins (Oxford, 1869).

2E W H. Wasserschieben, Die Bussordnungen der abendländischen Kirche (Halle, 1851; repr. Graz, 1958).

5H. J. Schmitz, Die Bussbücher und die Bussdisziplin der Kirche (Mainz, 1888; repr. Graz, 1958); and Die Bussbücher und das kanonische Bussverfahren (Düsseldorf, 1898; repr. Graz, 1958).

4P W Finsterwalder, Die Cañones Theodori Cantuariensis und ihre Überlieferungsformen (Weimar, 1929).

5T¡be Irish Penitentials, ed. L. Bieler, with an appendix by D. A. Binchy (Scriptores Latini Hibemiae V [Dublin, 1963; repr. 1975]).

6C. Vogel, Les 'Libri Paenitentiales' (Typologie des sources du moyen âge occidental, 27 [Turnhout, 1978]); A.J. Frantzen.Aíís à jour (Turnhout, 1985).

'Raymund Kottje, Die Bussbücher Halitgars von Cambrai und des Hrabanus Maurus: ihre Überlieferung und ihre Quellen ("Beiträge zur Geschichte und Quellenkunde des Mittelalters," 8, ed. H. Fuhrmann [Berlin, New York, 1980]); and see this reviewer's assessment in The Catholic Historical Review, LXVIII Oanuary 1982), 118-119.

"See Raymund Kottje, "Die frühmittelalterlichen kontinentalen Bussbücher: Bericht über ein Forschungsvorhaben an der Universität Augsburg," in Bulletin of Medieval Canon Law, n.s. 7 (1977), 108-1 11; and "Erfassung und Untersuchungen der Frühmittelalterlichen kontinentalen Bussbücher. Probleme, Ergebnisse, Aufgaben eines Forschungsprojektes an der Universität Bonn," Studi Medievali, 3rd ser., 26 (1985), 941-950.

"(Paenitentialia Franciae, Italiae et Hispaniae Saeculi VHI-XI, torn. 1) ed. Raymund Kottje, coop. L. Körntgen and U. Spengler-Reffgen (Corpus Christianorum, ser. tat. ,Vol. 156 [Turnhout, 1994]).

the 'first' Roman penitential Ui the manuscript, Vatican, BAV Arch. S. Pietro H 58.10 The study under review is in part the result of Körntgen's doctoral work at Bonn.

The volume is divided into three major sections, the first on the Paenitentiale Ambrosianum and its relation to the famous Irish Paenitentiale Cummeani, the second on the sources of the Paenitentiale Ps.-Romanum and related penitentials, including what Körntgen caUs the Paenitentiale Oxoniense II, and the third an edition of the Paenitentiale Ambrosianum and an incipit-explicit 'edition' of the Paenitentiale in duobus libris.

The first section of the volume deals with the Paenitentiale Ambrosianum, so-called because it appears in a late ninth- or early-tenth-century Bobbio manuscript now in the Biblioteca Ambrosiana in Milan, MS. G 58 sup. This text was edited as long ago as 1896 by O. Seebass," but he saw it in the context of the Carolingian Renaissance and did not realize its importance vis-à-vis the earUer Paenitentiale Cummeani. Then in 1990 Michèle Tosí published an edition of this same penitential with commentary in the somewhat obscure Archivum Bobiense (12-13 [1990-91]), a work not cited in Körntgen's study. On the basis of a careful study of its sources and contents, Körntgen argues that the Paenitentiale Ambrosianum was compUed ca. 550-650 in a monastery in Ireland or Britain and provided the source of the Paenitentiale Cummeani. While the Paenitentiale Ambrosianum has a monastic character—related in an indirect way to the Regula Benedicti—it also has a secular or lay character for use by a priest hearing confessions, perhaps in Britain because British texts appear therein. The Paenitentiale Ambrosianum is constructed around the list of vices in John Cassian's work, which Cummean also used, and provides an extensive medical metaphor prologue, also found in Cummean but in a shorter form.

Körntgen's exciting discovery of a 'new' ancient Irish-British penitential studied in the first major section of his work is matched in the second section by an equally important discovery of the major source of the Paenitentiale Ps.-Romanum, which formed a part of the widely diffused Carolingian penitential of Halitgar of Cambrai. It has been weU known that Halitgar's penitential was supposedly compiled of ancient and authentic canons as a result of the condemnation by several Carolingian synods of the earUer Insular and Continental penitentials, whose canons appeared to lack antiquity and authenticity. Most of

10L. Körntgen,"Ein italienisches Bussbuch und seine fränkischen Quellen. Das anonyme Paenitentiale der Handschrift Vatikan, Arch. S. Pietro H 58," in Aus Archiven und Bibliotheken: Studien zum Recht und zur Kirchengeschichte des Mittelalters: Festschrift für Raymund Kottje zum 65. Geburtstag, ed. H. Mordek ("Freiburger Beiträge zur mittelalterlichen Geschichte," 3 [Bern, Frankfurt/M, Las Vegas, 1991]), pp. 189-205.

"O. Seebass, "Ein bisher noch nicht veröffentlichtes Paenitential einer Bobbienser Handschrift der Ambrosiana," Deutsche Zeitschrift für Kirchenrecht, 3. Folge, Bd. 6 (1896/97), pp. 24-50.

the canons in HaUtgar's work are indeed taken from these antique and authentic sources, but in book 6 there are a number of canons attributed simply to a Paenitentiale Romanum. Over the years it has been surmised that HaUtgar got these canons from the scrinium of the Roman Church or alternatively took them from Frankish sources and added the Roman attribution to lend authenticity to them, but Uttle has been done to pin down the sources of these 'Roman' canons. Now Körntgen has identified the major source Ln what he caUs the Paenitentiale Oxoniense II, n so-caUed because the primary manuscript in which it is found, probably written in the later tenth century in northern or northwest France and taken to Exeter where Old English notations were added, is now in Oxford's Bodleian Library, MS Bodl. 311.13 Fragments also exist from a much older manuscript written in the early ninth century in northern Italy and now scattered in libraries in Stuttgart, Darmstadt, and Donaueschingen. Together with being the source of canons in the Paenitentiale Ps.-Romanum, the Paenitentiale Oxoniense II was also a source for many other penitentials, including the important and hitherto unnoted Paenitentiale in duobus libris, both Merseberg penitentials, the Fleury and Hubertense penitentials, the penitential in the Stuttgart manuscript HB VI. 112, and the Roman and south Italian penitentials in Vatican, BAV Arch, di S. Pietro H 5814 and the Beneventan-script codex Vatican, BAV Vat. lat. 1349 with the Collection in Nine Books.15

Penitential discipline Ui the Paenitentiale Oxoniense II is unusual in several ways, including penances measured in weeks, not years, and references to a number of active 'pagan' practices. Both internal evidence and manuscript origin lead Körntgen to place the compUation of the Paenitentiale Oxoniense II in northeast Francia before the middle of the eighth century. Almost simultaneously with the appearance of Körntgen's volume, Rob Meens, who himself has produced a fine edition of the tripartite penitentials,16 advanced an ingenious and interesting theory that the penitential, reflecting unusual pagan practices, was compUed by WilUbrord for his pastoral work in the south of the Low Countries along the Maas on which WUlibrord traveled to Utrecht and Frisia (Susteren, Aldeneik, etc.).17

,2Now edited in Paenitentialia minora, pp. 179-205.

"On the manuscript, see this reviewer's Law and Liturgy in the Latin Church, 5th- 12th Centuries (London, 1994), II, 523; LX, 70, n. 23.

"On the structure of this important manuscript, see this reviewer's, Law and Liturgy, pp. 4-9; and "South and Central Italian Canonical Collections of the Tenth and Eleventh Centuries (non-Gregorian)," in A History ofMedieval Canon Law, eds. W Hartmann and K. Pennington (Washington, D.C, in press since 1993).

"On this collection, see this reviewer's "South and Central Italian Canonical Collections of the Tenth and Eleventh Centuries."

"Rob Meens, Het tripartite boeteboek. Overlevering en betekenis van vroegmiddeleeuwse biechtvoorschriften (met editie en vertaling van vier tripartita) ("Middeleeuwse studies en bronnen,"41 [Hilversum, 1994]).

l7Rob Meens, "Willibrords boeteboek?" Tijdschrift voor Geschiedenis, 106 (1993), 163-178.

The work on penitentials by Kottje's 'school' has been characterized over the years by (1) an indefatigable search for new manuscripts containing penitentials; (2) a careful and perceptive comparison of penitentials and their canons, a laborious task given their similarities; (3) an unusual care in the presentation of texts; and (4) detaUed studies on the contexts in which the different penitentials appeared, their character and tendencies, and the use to which they were put. AU of these qualities are found in Körntgen's superbly researched volume, placing it firmly in the now distinguished tradition of penitential studies originating at Augsburg and Bonn with Professor Kottje.

Roger E. Reynolds

Pontifical Institute ofMediaeval Studies, Toronto

The Celtic Monk: Rules and Writings of Early Irish Monks. By Uinseann Ó Maidín, O.C.R. [Cistercian Studies Series, Number 162.] (Kalamazoo, Michigan, and Spencer, Massachusetts: Cistercian Publications. 1996. Pp. 216. $35.95 hardcover; $17.95 paperback.)

This attractive Uttle volume gives us in translation a number of early Irish monastic rules, together with "a random coUection of poems, Utanies, and Latin hymns" (the latter not translated). The editor's hope is that the result will be to make the doctrinal (sic; 'edifying'?) content of these documents "more widely known, understood and used." The world thus presented to us is very much a male one (hagiography and other archival material might have been exploited to 'explain' female Irish cénobites, a Brigit or a Samtharm); and the book rather perpetuates the outmoded idea that the early Irish church was (purely) monastic.

Monasticism of the Celtic (if the word be allowed) type lasted in Ireland from the sixth century to the twelfth, and religious had avaUable a variety of works—liturgical, biblical, legal, hagiographical, and so on—to encourage devotion and scholarship. The present collection would not perhaps claim to be representative. But the writings of the culdee reform movement of the eighth and ninth centuries, which make up the bulk of the misceUany, left a profound mark on Irish spirituality, literature, and art. Included also are earlier—such as the Apgitir Crabaid, most probably (the editor is hesitant about this) by Coimán Ela (d. 611)—and later compositions. The translations draw on sound scholarship (if the proper attribution is not always made) and are carefully annotated. Illustrations of sites and crosses embellish the work, e.g., the striking Moone cross, one of the biblical sermons in stone associated with the culdee movement. We are reminded of Ireland's major rôle in the evangelization of barbarian (including Anglo-Saxon) Europe in the centuries after 600 and of the debt repaid by the Carolingians, in areas as diverse as inspiration for Irish figure sculpture, learning, poetry, and kingship.

Riagol meant both 'rule' and 'tract,' and the editor includes a most interesting twelfth-century treatise on the Eucharist. The 'rules' are reaUy primers of monastic piety. They do, of course, presume organized communities (with allowance for hermits), and these documents throw a great light on Irish monastic spUituality. The Rule of Columbanus, the only surviving rule of Irish origin in Latin, might have been included, and perhaps also a cáin (e.g., that of Adomnán). The cana were ordinances of great interest to monasteries, for not only did they seek to raise the moral tone of society, but they were imposed when the abbot went on circuit, thus generating taxes. So c«w=law=tax. The life of the founder was also treasured and read in the monasteries of his or her federation, and an excerpt or two from vitae might have warranted inclusion.

The Celtic Monk could weU serve as a reader for an introductory course on early medieval Ireland. There are rather too many errata, and for the next edition the editor might submit the text to the scrutiny of a competent historian.

John J. Silke

Portnablagh, County Donegal

The Deeds of God through the Franks. A Translation of Guibert of Nogenfs "Gesta Dei per Francos." Translated and edited by Robert Levine. (Rochester, New York: The BoydeU Press. 1997. Pp. v, 166. $63.00.)

Abbot Guibert of Nogent's Gesta Dei per Francos is an account, in Latin, of the First Crusade from its proclamation by Pope Urban II in November, 1095, to the Crusaders' capture of Jerusalem LnJuJy, 1099. Writing around 1110, Guibert was revising earUer histories of the expedition because he thought that they lacked both the rhetorical polish and the theological insight appropriate to the lofty subject of God's holy war.

An English translation of this cruciaUy important work has been long overdue, and students of crusading, medieval reUgion, and historiography will welcome Robert Levine's effort to fill the void. They will regret, however, that the work has not been done to a higher standard. WhUe the translation is generally readable, if not consistently idiomatic, as instanced in the ubiquitous use of "lo," there are disheartening lapses—e.g., "speed afoot" (p. 77) and "the dipping of the mouthful" (p. 31)—where Levine is content with nonsense. Trie translation is marred further by a staggering number of typographical, grammatical, and syntactical errors, by mistakes in spelling—"Hanibal" (p. 64), "Bythinia" (p. 62), "homage" but "hommage" (both occurrences on p. 6l),"guUey" (p. 74), and "vicount" (p. 119)—and by egregious inconsistencies and inaccuracies in names and identifications: Pompeius Trogus (p. 115) appears as "Tragus Pompeius" (p. 8) and "Gnaeus Trogus Pompeius" (p. 27 and n. 49), and Fulcher of Chartres (pp. 6, 15) as "Fulker" (pp. 6, 15) and "Fulker of Charters" (p. 161). Ernest "Baker" (p. 6, n. 23) should read Barker, "Turnholt" (pp. 18, 19) is Turn-

hout,"A. R. Gibbs" (p. 18) is H. A. R. Gibb; Eustace of "Bologne" (p. 139) was Eustace of Boulogne; Antioch was situated on the Orontes, not on the "Pharphar" ("Pharfar" p. 95); "Alexandriola" (p. 104) is Alexandretta; Raymond, vicomte of Turenne is identified mystifyingly as "Viscount of Torena" (p. 119 n. 192); and Geoffrey of Montescaglioso is rendered meaninglessly as "Geoffrey of Mont Scabieuse" (p. 68) and "Godfrey of Mount-Scabieuse" (p. 102).

The errors are too numerous to list, but these should suffice to warn readers to approach this translation with circumspection, and preferably with a reUable gazeteer and a copy of Rosalind HUl's splendid edition, translation and annotation of the Gesta Francorum et aliorum Hierosolimitanorum (Oxford, 1962). There is no index.

Penny J. Cole

Trinity College
University of Toronto

The Military Orders: Fighting for the Faith and Caring for the Sick. Edited by Malcolm Barber. (Brookfield, Vermont: Variorum, Ashgate PubUshing Company. 1994. Pp. xxviii, 399. $99.50.)

This volume is made up of forty-one papers read at a conference on the MUitary Orders held at St. John's Gate, Clerkenwell, London, in September, 1992. The editor, Malcolm Barber, is to be congratulated for the way in which he has given to this coUection a coherence rarely achieved m works of this kind. Fourteen contributions relate to the Knights of St. John, eight to the Templars, seven to the Teutonic Order, four to the Spanish Orders, whUe the remaining eight approach the topic in a more general way. Jean Richard, the doyen of Crusading studies, has written an introduction to the book in which he succeeds in assigning to each contribution its place in the wider context of crusading history.

In the studies of all the Orders there is a strong emphasis on regional history and this reflects a general trend in crusading studies. The volume opens with a magisterial essay by Michael Gervers about the estate management of the HospitaUers Ln Essex, and Enrique Rodrtguez-Picavea MatUla has produced an impressive account of the agricultural exploitation by the Order of Calatrava of its estates in the Tagus vaUey.

The medical work of the Orders was one of the main themes of the conference, and Anthony LuttreU has written an outstanding survey of the hospitaUer activities of the Knights of St. John on Rhodes, where "the sick were served their meals on silver dishes and drank from sUver spoons" (p. 71). Susan Edgington has contributed an interesting background paper on the state of medical knowledge among the first Crusaders and has drawn attention to an early example of the use of animals (in this case a bear) to test the efficacy of medical treatment.

Archaeological evidence is of central importance in studying the early history of the Orders. Peter Megaw has written about the castle of Paphos in Cyprus, which he has spent a lifetime excavating, and which he argues is an Hospitaller foundation closely resembling Belvoir in Galilee. Denys Pringle has produced a survey of the towers on the Jerusalem-Jericho road which were almost certainly buUt and manned by the Templars for the protection of pilgrims.

A good deal of new Ught is shed on the Templars by the contributors to this volume. Jonathan PhilUps argues cogently that their licensing as an Order at the Council of Troyes in 1128 was closely linked to an attempt to launch a new crusade against Damascus. Peter Lock has found evidence that the Order had a more proactive role in the Fourth Crusade and the setting up of the Latin Empire than it is normaUy credited with. WhUe Helen Nicholson, in a paper on the image of the Military Orders in medieval romances, has shown that the Templars were regarded as particularly weU disposed to lovers in difficulties, perhaps, as she suggests, because it was a topos that young men crossed in love became Templars, just as simUarly circumstanced young men in nineteenth-century novels joined the Foreign Legion.

This volume is not designed for specialists alone but also has much to offer to those with a more general interest in Crusading studies. James Brundage has written a very wide-ranging essay on the response of the MiUtary Orders to the need for trained lawyers in the thirteenth century. The Teutonic Order scores particularly highly in this regard, while the Templars get the lowest rating: "... the Templars seem to have opted out of the legal culture that had begun to dominate Western Christendom . . . and it may not be an exaggeration to suggest that ultimately some of them paid for this with their lives" (p. 352). Robert Irwin has redated and explained the significance of a source which has remained enigmatic since it was first pubUshed in 1882,Za devise des Chemins de Babiloine. Jürgen Sarnowsky has addressed the important question of why the Teutonic Order had such a low profile in defending eastern Europe against the attacks of the Mongols and later the Ottomans. Finally, those who teach Crusading history to students who cannot read German will find the survey article by Udo Arnold,"Eight Hundred Years of the Teutonic Order," particularly useful.

The conference was not concerned solely with the role of the Military Orders in the Middle Ages, but also with their activities in the modern world. The extent to which some of them were able to rise above the religious divisions of the sixteenth century has been particularly impressive. Walter Rodel describes how the Hospitaller Bailiwick of Brandenburg, though it became Lutheran, remained affiliated to the Order and to its CathoUc Grand Master; whUe Udo Arnold describes how the Teutonic Order for "nearly 300 years . . . was a triconfessional institution [of Calvinists, Catholics, and Lutherans] . . . the non-CathoUcs had their seat and vote in the General Chapter . . . and only the Grand Master consistently has been a Catholic throughout the Order's entire his-

tory ..." (p. 231). This is one of the many topics dealt with in this exceUent book which leaves the reader anxious to find out more.

Bernard Hamilton

University of Nottingham

Runaway Religious in Medieval England, c. 1240-1540. By E Donald Logan. (New York: Cambridge University Press. 1996. Pp. xix, 301. $59.95.)

ReUgious vows, like those of marriage, were for life. To leave the monastery was to commit apostasy and be subject to excommunication; as Gerald of Wales expressed it, this was to leave the path of truth and salvation. Not surprisingly, therefore, comparatively few took such a step, accompanied as it was with uncertainty in this world and damnation in the next. The total population of medieval English religious is notoriously hard to gauge; the numbers of runaways can similarly never be more than impressionistic; yet, if Logan is right (and his figures are as convincing as any), no more than about 7% of religious were renegades. However, this figure masks considerable fluctuations, peaking (at over 16%) in the generation foUowing the Black Death, a statistic which sheds further light, and from a new perspective, on the monastic crisis of those years.

Yet though these figures are lower than those of popular imagination they still constitute a minority of the discontented, who have only now found their historian. Moreover, at the same time we should not infer that 93% of religious were content in their vocation. Logan's analysis of the fugitives clearly demonstrates the tensions inherent in any monastic house, which might result either in apostasy or in suUen acceptance.

Logan's magisterial study is a tour de force that nearly juxtaposes case-studies (which he analyzes to great effect) with more general contextualizations, whUe the inclusion of a register of all known apostates is an invaluable guide to further research. His survey begins in the mid-thirteen century, by which time records, papal, episcopal, and royal, are sufficiently rich to enable detaUed analysis, virtually all religious foundations in England had been made, and the codification of canon law on apostasy was secure. Yet to begin here is to enter in medias res and more could have certainly have been said to advantage about earlier runaways and more use made both of the twelfth-century canonists and later synodal legislation. Nevertheless, this study is to be most warmly welcomed as the first authoritative account of a much-neglected field; its findings must now be taken into account by aU scholars of monastic history.

Brian Golding

University of Southampton

Fragments of Ockham Hermeneutics. By George Knysh. (Winnipeg: WCU CouncU of Learned Societies. 1997. Pp. 165)

George Knysh's 1968 Ph.D. thesis on WUUam of Ockham's poUtical theory was a valuable source for Ockham speciaUsts even before it was belatedly published as Political Ockhamism Ln 1996. The author has now printed some ancülary material that he prepared at the same time as the thesis. It deals with Ockham's most enigmatic work, the vast, sprawUng Dialogus. This treatise is organized Ln the form of a dialogue between a Master and a Disciple. At the outset, the Disciple asks the Master to explore every possible answer to the questions that wiU be raised without ever revealing his own opinion. The problem, therefore, is to identify (U possible) Ockham's personal views in the mass of material that is subsequently presented.

Knysh's book opens with a long, carefuUy annotated bibUography of previous approaches to this question. Some authors cited the most radical views expressed in the Dialogus in order to support an interpretation of Ockham as a "revolutionary." Others thought it impossible to ascertain Ockham's personal opinions in such an impersonal work. Perhaps, some argued, Ockham was "certain of nothing but his doubts." The most promising approach suggested that we evaluate the Dialogus by comparing the views expressed there with those that Ockham stated more clearly in his other writings.

Knysh accepts the last approach but goes beyond it. He argues that the Dialogus was not at all an impersonal work but rather that it reflects Ockham's very personal engagement with the cause of the dissident Franciscans who rejected Pope John XXII's teaching on apostoUc poverty. Knysh also maintains that we can nearly always ascertain Ockham's personal opinions by considering the structure of the Dialogus itself, while looking to Ockham's known stance Ui the poverty controversy to confirm our readings. Sometimes only one answer to a question is presented. Some answers are dismissed summarily, others lovingly elaborated.

Here I can give only one rather simple example. At Dialogus 1.6.16 the Disciple asks whether Catholics should support an appeal against a pope accused of heresy. The negative answer is stated briefly and refuted in a later chapter. The positive answer is developed in detail in three conclusions. Arguments against them are presented but dismissed. The argument in favor of the appeal is never directly refuted. And we know that Ockham did in fact join Ln such an appeal against John XXII. So here the internal structure of the argument and the external "clue" combine to give us a clear understanding of Ockham's real intention.

Knysh takes us through many difficult passages of the Dialogus in a simUar fashion. The argumentation is often intricate, but reasonable and persuasive

throughout. Future students of the Dialogus wiU find much helpful guidance in these "fragments of hermeneutics."

Brian Tierney

Cornell University

Church and Society in the Medieval North of England. By R. B. Dobson. (Rio Grande, Ohio: Hambledon Press. 1996. Pp. xvi, 323. $60.00.)

This volume contains thirteen articles previously appearing from 1965 to 1992 and aU concerned with the history of the Church in northern England; the focus of all but two articles is the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries.

In his introduction Dobson observes that the records of the northern church are uneven, Uttle surviving from the diocese of CarUsle, a rich repository from the prior and chapter at Durham, and a complete set of archiépiscopal registers from York. In the first article he appropriately compares the cathedral cities and their chapters (secular canons in New York, Benedictines at Durham, and Augustinian canons at Carlisle).

Dobson notes that it is often dUficult to discover in medieval documents the individual monk or bishop; nevertheless, he is able to shed considerable Ught on the IUe of Richard Bell, prior of Durham and later bishop of Carlisle, and he presents an incisive analysis of the reasons for the failure of Archbishop Alexander NeviUe of York (removed in 1388). In discussing the c. 1070 origins of Selby, the first Norman abbey in northern England, Dobson also shows his ability to sift fact from legend.

The articles complement and intersect weU with one another. Two adjacent articles study the church of Durham's relations with Scotland—the faüure of Bishop Fordham to appear at the English defeat at Otterburn Ln 1388 and the monks' loss of Coldingham in 1478, the last English monastery on Scottish soU, despite their expensively-gained papal support. Next Dobson studies the career of Prior Bell, who tried in vain to save Coldingham. Then follows a study of the political role of Edward Fs archbishops of York whom the king depended on because of his Scottish policy and his poor relations with the archbishops of Canterbury. A later archbishop of York, Alexander NevUle, Dobson notes Ln the next article, faUed in his attack against the elite residentiary canons of York Minster. Dobson then provides a detailed study of the thirty-four fifteenth-century residentiary canons, whose wiUs display some of the criteria proposed as indicative of heterodoxy—but these men were "highly orthodox and conventionaUy pious" (p. 220). Then foUows a study of Richard Ill's relations with the church of York in which the York residentiary canons played a key role. Richard hoped to set up a chantry at York. Two articles deal with York chantries, first the perpetual type and then York citizens' interest in chantries. Dobson's last chapter discusses the low level of historical writing in Durham and York at the end of the Middle Ages.

The book has a well-constructed index, and in a few places the author has added notes to update articles. Despite the nature of the book, there is Uttle repetition. The two articles on York chantries are the lone exception although much of his study of the social origins and monastic lives of Durham monks has since appeared in chapter two of his Durham Priory 1400-1450. A young scholar might note the numerous occasions when Dobson points out an area deserving of further study; for example, the success of the archdiocese of York in fuLfiUing its obügations and roles "must await an intensive exploration of the voluminous and almost entirely unpubUshed records of the late medieval chapter and diocese of York" (p. 196).

This is a valuable collection of articles if for no other reason than that the province of Canterbury overshadows its northern counterpart. Hambledon Press should be congratulated for printing this kind of book which makes avaUable a substantial body of work from a single scholar which would otherwise be difficult to access.

John W Dahmus

Stephen F.Austin State University
Nacogdoches, Texas

Early Modern European

Donna, disciplina, creanza cristiana dal XV al XVlI secólo. Studi e testi a stampa. Edited by Gabriella Zarri. [Terni e Testi, Nuova Serie, 36.] (Rome: Edizioni di Storia e Letteratura. 1996. Pp. 800. Lire 150.000.)

This massive volume is divided into two almost equal parts. The first contains nineteen essays, while the second consists of an extensive preliminary finding Ust of Italian vernacular books from the later fifteenth to the seventeenth century intended for the instruction of women in the norms of Christian life. These norms dealt with general deportment, proper conduct Ui women's different states of life, and ideals of spiritual and moral development. AdditionaUy a large category of books presented models of Christian life and virtue through biographies of or reflections on activities and the spirituality of female saints and women who were beatified or possessed of heroic virtues.

In her brief introduction Gabriella Zarri, a leading scholar on early modern Italian women, notes that whUe the theme of the volume is the relation of women and books, its specific aim is to explore the role of the printed word in the process of what has come to be caUed disciplining, whether social or religious. Ultimately, the primary objective of this work is to help readers gain a better understanding of how female identity was constructed in Italy especiaUy during the post-Tridentine period. The CouncU fathers had stressed that women's proper sphere was the famUy and the church, and a myriad of printed

works reinforced theU teaching. Women were readers and in some cases, authors of works that presented a basicaUy monastic ideal of female comportment. Chastity, humility, and obedience were systematically exalted, and women were exhorted to be pious, dress modestly, and go about with head bowed and eyes downcast—in brief, to become paragons of behavior that would lead to good order in church, family, and society.

The editor guided a team that compiled the finding-list or repertorio of 2626 works from printed sources like catalogues or bibliographies, and holdings of mostly Northern Italian libraries. By way of introduction, Paola Tantulli explains criteria for inclusion of works in the repertorio. Clear cross-references and several indexes, for example by title, author, or editor, greatly facilitate its use. Because no general catalogue of Italian rare books exists, this list will be particularly valuable to anyone doing research on early modern Italian women.

The essays in the first part of the volume are grouped into three sections of unequal length, titled "Printed texts, books and women readers," the long second section on "DiscipUne and comportment: construction of a model" (subdivided into "Model," "Rule," and "Norm"), and lastly "The model interpreted." It goes without saying that some essays are more pertinent to the theme of the volume than others. But together, they illustrate the kinds of questions that might be raised by the books listed, and include some fine and informative discussions of models for virgins, wives, widows, and nuns. EspeciaUy interesting are essays examining the impact which Tridentine marriage norms had on famUy and society.

This is an important reference work for students of early modern Italian society and religion. It is encouraging that the Italian government supported publication of this specialized volume. The relatively small number of its foreseeable readers wiU stand in no proportion to its significance for scholars.

Elisabeth G. Gleason

University ofSan Francisco

Sotto I'occhio del padre. Società confessionale e istruzione primaria nello Stato di Milano. By Angelo Turchini. [Annali deU'Istituto storico italo-germanico, Monografía 29.] (Bologna: Società éditrice il Mulino. 1996. Pp. 468. Lire 40.000 paperback.)

This is a wonderftiUy comprehensive and detaUed study of pre-university education in the city and state of Milan from 1500 to the early decades of the seventeenth century. Only about eight percent of the schools in the city and territory of Milan were public in the modern sense, meaning state-supported. Nevertheless, MUan and its territory had an abundance of free education provided by schools sponsored by church organizations, lay confraternities, and endowments. This exceUent book describes and measures the free schooling available to the boys and girls of MUan.

The book begins by discussing the several endowed charity schools founded in MUan in the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries, then notes the new educational initiatives of the Catholic Reformation. The largest and most important of these were the Schools of Christian Doctrine. Meeting on Sundays and hoUdays throughout the year, the Schools of Christian Doctrine offered two and one-half hours of instruction and provided books, which were combination catechisms and primers, at cost. These schools taught religious instruction and reading first, plus writing to more advanced pupils and those who had no other opportunity to learn. From their beginning in 1536, the Milanese Schools of Christian Doctrine grew to embrace 7,000 lay volunteers who taught, or otherwise assisted the teaching of, 7,000 boys and 5,400 girls in 1599- Other free schools also existed, and Turchini mentions them all.

While one might expect the metropolis of Milan to provide a certain amount of schooling, the most interesting and surprising aspect of Turchini's research is the extensive free schooling available in small towns and rural areas. Although part of this was the consequence of charitable foundations, the Schools of Christian Doctrine were again the most important providers. Turchini found about 40,000 boys and girls in catechism schools distributed across 900 parishes in the diocese of MUan in the late sixteenth century. Other boys benefited from the so-caUed "teaching prebend" established by Archbishop Carlo Borromeo in the 1570's. A canon, supported by a prebend, was attached to a local church with the duty of teaching boys the catechism, writing, and Latin without charging fees. Thanks to the great availability of free schooling, Turchini estimates that about fifty percent of the boys and girls in the city and territory of Milan attained basic Uteracy in the late sixteenth century. One suspects that this may have been the highest literacy rate to be found in any part of Europe. In addition to his main themes, the author provides information on teacher mobility and pay, female teachers and pupUs, and much else.

Turchini demonstrates the links between the prescriptions of such CathoUc Reformation pedagogical theorists as Silvio Antoniano and the training in the schools. He notes that Catholic Reformation education embraced both right doctrine and good behavior. Personal honesty, control of the passions, and correct comportment in daily life were emphasized.

The book is based on a wealth of archival information, catechism booklets, contemporary pedagogical treatises, and extensive secondary Uterature. Numerous tables present detailed information, but do not substitute for the narrative. This book should be read along with other recent contributions, such as Guerrino PeUiccia's La scuola primaria a Roma dal secólo XVI al XIX (Rome, 1985), reviewed in this journal (ante, LXXLV [October, 1988], 607-608). This is an excellent contribution to the growing Uterature on schooling in Renaissance and Catholic Reformation Italy.

Paul F. Grendler

University of Toronto

Thesaurus de la littérature interdite au XVF siècle: Auteurs, ouvrages, éditions avec Addenda et corrigenda. By Jesús Martínez De Bujanda with the assistance of René Davignon, Ela Stanek, and MarceUa Richter. [Index des Uvres interdits, Volume X,] (Sherbrooke, Québec: Éditions de l'Université de Sherbrooke, Centre d'Études de la Renaissance; Geneva: Librairie Droz. 1996. Pp. 840. $80.00 Canadian.)

Congratulations to Jesús Martínez De Bujanda and his exceUent team of collaborators who with the publication of this tenth volume bring to completion a project formaUy proposed in 1981 and launched in 1984 with the publication of volume 5. They have provided historians of religion, phUosophy, science, and literature with a major research tool that goes well beyond Die Indices Librorum Prohibitorum des sechzehnten Jahrhunderts published by Franz Heinrich Reusch (1825-1900) in 1886 and reprinted in 1961. WhUe they have added lists not found in Reusch's collection, they have not provided a new edition of his lists for England (pp. 5-22) or Liège (pp. 282-288) or Bavaria (pp. 328-341) or those issued by Vidal de Bécanis forToulouse (pp. 130-135) and by the Senate of Lucca (pp. 136-137). The criteria used for excluding these, while including others that are similar, remain unclear.

The introduction provides a brief summary of what can be learned from the previous nine volumes about sixteenth-century book censorship for religious reasons in Catholic lands. Beginning in 1524 in the Low Countries with imperial placards and in 1526 in England with an archiépiscopal mandate, books Usted by author or title or both were condemned as heretical. But it was only with the faUure of the reUgious colloquies (1540-41) and the beginning of the CouncU of Trent (convoked 1542, opened 1545) that the theological faculties of the universities of Paris (1544-45) and Louvain (1546) drew up extended lists of heretical works that were issued with the backing of civil authorities. These lists, subsequently revised, were incorporated into the indices compUed by the Portuguese and Spanish inquisitions. Under Paul IV a commission of the Roman Inquisition drew up an extensive Ust of forbidden books promulgated in 1559 that was considered in many Catholic quarters as too extreme. Although its content remained virtually unaltered, this index was modified on the urging of the Council of Trent to allow for the expurgation of dangerous passages in otherwise useful books and for the reading of non-reUgious works authored by heretics. Local authorities were also permitted to add to the list titles of their own choosing. This so-called Index of the CouncU of Trent, issued in 1564 by Pius IV, was adopted by local authorities in Liège, Antwerp, Bavaria, Portugal, and Spain, although the latter two preserved their autonomy from Rome whUe so doing. When authorities in Antwerp (1571) and later in Spain (1584) acted on their own in deciding which passages were to be expurgated from heretical books, Rome moved to assert its prerogative of ajudicating doctrinal questions. In 1571 the Congregation of the Index was established to update the 1564 index and decide what needed expurgation. Responding, as Roman congregations did, to requests for advice, the new congregation drew up a list in 1576

which it circulated in manuscript form and which became the basis for local Italian indices that increasingly condemned works for immorality. Repeatedly revised, the index was formally promulgated in 1596 by Clement VIII. It allowed for the expurgation of half of the works condemned, set the rules for the way to expurgate, urged a co-ordination of local efforts with Rome, and allowed bishops, inquisitors, and universities to Ucense others to hold and read condemned works. By its censorship of books on the grounds of faith and morals, the Roman indices came to extend church control over many areas of intellectual and social life.

The introduction also provides some statistical information based on the 2,150 author-identified and 1,092 anonymous works condemned in the various indices. The most frequently condemned of the 1,946 identified authors were Luther, Erasmus, Calvin, and Melanchthon. Three-fourths of all the 6,133 editions published by 1,354 printers in 193 towns came in decreasing order from Basel, Paris, Lyon, Geneva, Antwerp, Venice, Strassburg, Frankfurt am Main, Wittenberg, Zurich, Cologne, Augsburg, Nuremberg, London, and Leipzig. The number of prohibited works published steadily increased over the 1520's and '30's, reaching its peak in the 1540's, and then declined foUowing the Council of Trent and the comprehensive Roman and Spanish indices issued in 1559 and thereafter.

The volume includes a variety of catalogues. Works listed alphabeticaUy by author or title with references to the indices in which they were condemned occupy pages 49-418. Another list organized alphabeticaUy both by place and then by name of the printer fills pages 421-738; works lacking their place of publication or printer's name are on pages 738-744. Banned editions of the Bible in Latin, Greek, and the vernacular (but strangely not those Ln German) are on pages 745-751. Another listing (pp. 753-789) provides the location of various presses. Revisions to the indices published in the first nine volumes are given on pages 793-811, and a concordance is provided for the differing number systems used in volumes V and VII and Ui volume VIII for the Roman Index of 1559. The volume concludes with information on and a photocopy of the printed Florentine index of 1553/54 and transcriptions of the manuscript index of Paolo Constabili (1576), and a brief account of the index of Giovanni di Dio (1576).

Given his mastery of this material, we eagerly await De Bujanda's promised synthetic work dealing with the authors, titles, and diffusion of condemned books and with the cultural significance of these indices.

Nelson H. Minnich

The Catholic University ofAmerica

Hutterite Beginnings: Communitarian Experiments during the Reformation. By Werner O. PackuU. (Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press. 1995. Pp. xi, 440. $59.95.)

At the 1943 annual meeting of the American Society of Church History, Harold S. Bender delivered the presidential address entitled "The Anabaptist Vision," thereupon published in the Society's journal, Church History (13 [March, 1944]) 3-24, and in The Mennonite Quarterly Review. That paper reflected the sporadic but growing interest over the immediately preceding decades in what was later caUed the "Radical Reformation," and now in the present volume "communitarian experiments," during the sixteenth-century split in Western Christendom. The vehicle of that interest was the pubUcation of sixteenth-century archival materials, hitherto suppressed or ignored.

The story of that split, the Protestant Reformation, had been told, and told polemicaUy, by the principals, the once dominant Roman Church and the reforming dissenters, Martin Luther and his peers. Though the gap between the two establishments, the Catholic and the Protestant, proved unbridgeable, they both, and for the same reasons, ruthlessly suppressed the "radical" and "communitarian "ferment, then known as Anabaptist. Meanwhile, as Western history unfolded over the next few centuries, "bottom-up" stirrings were increasingly to challenge the "top-down" legacies in church and polity alike. In that context, Bender's "Anabaptist Vision" became both a benchmark and a catalyst in ways that he could not have foreseen.

Compared to the trickle of sixteenth-century Radical Reformation sources and studies preceding Bender's presidential address, in the haU-century that followed that trickle has grown into a flood. Even so, that flood has been relatively confined to the ivory tower. And perhaps it is just as weU. As Werner PackuU points out Ui his superb study of Hutterite Beginnings, at that stage of historiography, the "dialectic between reUgious convictions and social situation had been decided in favor of the former." While Bender's vision meanwhile has been criticized for that reason, and the story that he told has meanwhile been recast, both his earlier account and subsequent revisions reflect trends in historiography more broadly.

Hutterites, by far the most durable of the religiously-grounded communal (as distinct from monastic) "experiments" in the post-Reformation West, along with Mennonites and Amish are the extant groups descended from the original Reformation era. When Luther and Zwingli unexpectedly found themselves severed from Rome, they faced a profound crisis. What now will be the basis of religious and political legitimation? Both were attracted to the "bottom-up" imagery of Matthew 18 ("where two or three are gathered . . ."). But despite their reforming impulses, they remained children of their age—political and religious cohesion appeared inseparable. When the peasants marched (1524/25), the latter reflex prevaUed. The ax fell, figuratively and, alas, literally.

MeanwhUe many who had heard the reformers' evangeUcal preaching, and were reading the gospels now appearing for the first time in the vernacular, thought and acted otherwise. Ideas spread (pamphleteering), missioners—and refugees—traveled. Where the medieval Catholic order was fully in control, as in South Tyrol, the ferment was at once vigorous but in the end successfuUy suppressed. Where that order was contested, as in Moravia to the North, here and there, there was wiggle-room. If the Tyrol was the womb of the Hutterite movement, Moravia, with its feudalist resistance to imperial power, served as cradle.

In our own century, with its base communities and smaU Christian communities and charismatic groups and Bible churches, house churches, feUowship groups, and on and on, the story that PackuU teUs is profoundly instructive. But it is a scholarly work, for scholars, objectively and elegantly done. But between the scholars and the grass roots are the people who "man" (and "woman") the posts in established churches in all the traditions. Perhaps they are most in need of the story here told, and able to assimilate. TTUs story needs to be transmitted for and to them.

The one thing missing in the volume here viewed is a conclusion. Meanwhile PackuU has not only a distinguished research record from which this substantial volume emerges but hints of more to come. This reviewer can well forgo that summary as PackuU moves to the next stage. He is not yet ready to write a conclusion, and should not be distracted. And by the way, he is a Lutheran, not a "seU-serving" communitarian!

Paul Peachey

The Catholic University ofAmerica (Emeritus)

The Making ofan Enterprise: The Society ofJesus in Portugal, Its Empire, and Beyond, 1540-1750. By Dauril Alden. (Stanford: Stanford University Press. 1996. Pp. xxxi, 707. $75.00.)

Worldwide evangelical campaigns by religious orders were inalienable parts of that period known untU recently as the "expansion of Europe." No order was as dynamic, effective, or controversial as the Society or Company of Jesus, which received papal approval in 1540. Sons of Loyola were active partners in Portuguese and Spanish UUtiatives in establishing a European presence Ui Africa, Asia, and the Americas.

For more than two decades Dauril Alden—whUe authoring a steady stream of meticulously researched and pioneering articles primarily on BrazU—has dedicated himseU to researching the Portuguese Assistancy. This included continental Portugal and its empire and parts of India, Japan, China, and Southeast Asia. This is the first of a projected two-volume study and carries the story from 1540

to 1750. The primary focus is not on spiritual, educational, or cultural dimensions of the Assistancy, but on organization and economic and financia] underpinnings which enabled the Society to fuLfiU its mission as specified in the Constitutions and subsequent responsibUities not initiaUy considered. Reflecting this emphasis, the bulk of the book treats governance, recruitment, manpower, and fiscal administration (Part III, pp. 229-318) and financial resources and economic foundations of the enterprise (Part FV, pp. 321-567). Parts I and II provide an exceUent overview of the founding of the Society and Portuguese Assistancy, and expansion of the Jesuit enterprise into Africa, India, Asia, and Brazil. A concluding section examines lack of support beleaguering the Society at home when confronted by a hostile monarch, erosion in Southeast Asia and China, problems in India stemming from indigenous and European conquests of Portuguese holdings, successes in Brazil and even more heated controversy over aUegations of excessive wealth, and the suggestion that the sons of Loyola had strayed from God and embraced Mammon. Alden is global in his approach but the focus is on Portugal, India, East Asia, and Brazil.

The author "locates" the Society with regard to medieval precedents and to contemporary orders in Europe, and readers wiU find comparisons to missionary activities in other European overseas empires. At all times the Jesuit enterprise is seen in the global context of mUitary, political, and economic change. He makes the important point that Jesuit pragmatism and close relations with secular and religious leaders in Europe and overseas enabled the Society to enjoy exceptional success but exposed it to hostility. In Portugal the fate of the Society was closely linked to the fortunes of the crown and, on a more personal note, to the relationship between kings and their Jesuit advisers and confessors. The Society was vulnerable to political, military, and economic circumstances beyond its control: Anglo-Dutch and indigenous attacks by Sinhalese, Mughal, Omani, and Marathi resulting in Portuguese territorial losses denied the Jesuits their spiritual outposts and contributed to the collapse of Portugal's Eastern empire.

The Society as here presented fuUy merits the assessment (p. 4) that it was "the most dynamic, successful, influential, and controversial of the new Orders created during the turbulent sixteenth century." The new Society had unique features: a centralized pyramidal system of governance, a general appointed for life, absence of distinctive garb, failure to sing Mass and office in choir, refusal (with rare discretionary exceptions) to admit women, and no Third Order. Alden notes how the Society assumed responsibUities not contemplated initiaUy: the most significant was in higher education. Others were whoUy secular and inappropriate: royal assignments to mint coins, manage granaries, serve as superintendents of fortresses in northwestern India, manufacture armaments, and undertake delicate diplomatic assignments. The author does not gloss over the opportunistic, pragmatic, and manipulative aspects of an enterprise which showed shrewd understanding of the distinction between power and authority, keen awareness of the relationship between political power and economic circumstances, and sensitivity to changing power relationships in Portugal, Rome,

Europe, and overseas, most notably in India, China, and Japan. Nor wiU any reader persist in the belief that the enterprise was homogeneous: a clear message is that the Society's policies and practices were tailored to local conditions. If the Society was forceful in Brazil in promoting establishment of villages, China demanded a more subtle approach. It comes as a surprise to learn how image-conscious (to use modern jargon) was the leadership.

Propinquity to power and the powerful at home and abroad, a willingness to adapt and accommodate, and the combination of increasingly severe recruiting problems and the necessity to create and maintain an adequate financial base to sustain the enterprise, aU generated controversy. From the outset the Society was the object of attacks born of jealousy, was cast as scapegoat for faUures including the exaggerated charge of being responsible for the coUapse of the Estado da India, and the victim of religious and secular rivals with political agendas. To reach a balanced assessment in the heat of such controversy demands objectivity of the historian. Professor Alden has navigated between the ScyUa of being an apologist for the Society and the Charybdis of ensuring that dissident voices are heard. He corrects (citing chapter and verse in the case of contemporaries and colleagues) errors, misrepresentations, or misunderstandings which have become part of the historiography on the Society. A sampling includes: he shows that there was greater participation by Jesuits in the activities of the Inquisition than has generaUy been acknowledged and that the Jesuits were not hostile to the Holy Office; that the image of a "finely tuned machine" (p. 229) humming along without incident at a high level of efficiency is over-laudatory; that, despite their rural missions, the Jesuits were strongly urban-oriented and located; that ties of loyalty by religious to the Society were not as absolutely exclusive as hoped by the founder; that fathers general were not as autocratic as portrayed but delegated responsibilities, and that the chain of command was vulnerable to being undermined by time and distance; that the discipline was not as heavy-handed as often depicted; and that some of the most distinguished religious in the Assistancy were not Portuguese gives the lie to charges of xenophobia. It becomes apparent that the Society was neither as independent nor as powerful as often portrayed in the historiography and that the half-dozen Assistancies did not always march to the same drummer. On the issue of whether Jesuits were conservative or innovators in estate management and agricultural practices, Alden concludes that the record supports both points of view.

Alden addresses the most serious and longstanding charges leveled against the Society by contemporaries and by historians: unfair competitive advantage stemming from exemption from payment of tithes and customs dues; unseemly wealth; latifundists who engrossed excessive amounts of land; violation of vows of poverty. Controversy over exemption from payment of tithes and other dues, and charges of disloyalty and unpatriotic behavior, were put to rest by a solomonlc royal judgment in the 1750's that all his majesty's subjects were Uable. On the financial and economic charges, Professor Alden has accumulated a mass of data: "AU known extant accounts of the Assistancy were consulted

for this study" (p. 618). He distinguishes between visible (property, territorial holdings, agricultural estates), and invisible (rental income, interest-bearing loans, property liens, and government and personal annuities) assets. Professor Alden confirms the role of the Society as a major property holder of productive rural estates but also showing a surprisingly high return from its extensive urban holdings, notably in eighteenth-century Brazil. His researches also document extensive investment practices and lending by CoUeges (with the notable exception of Jesuit Colleges in the province of Brazil and the vice-province of the Maranhäo which were not major lenders) and expanding investment portfolios from the seventeenth century to 1750. He provides a sobering assessment of the other side of this apparent wealth, and makes the general point that some aUegations, such as riches derived from trading in pearls and gems in seventeenth-century India, were based on gossip rather than reaUty. Legacies could involve the Society in extensive litigation and were often a mixed blessing. He also points to the cost of the evangelizing enterprise: for building, upkeep, and repairs to churches, coUeges, and seminaries; food and lodging for the religious; the heavy burden of travel costs; salaried staff and purchase of slaves. The Society was not immune to acts of God and man: fire, droughts and flooding, crop failures, war, currency fluctuations, and vacillating markets. Unpredictable levels or withdrawal of royal financial support also forced the Society to find alternative revenue sources to underwrite the enterprise. Professor Alden does not deny that there were some excesses: ornamentation of churches or libraries, heavy purchases of slaves in BrazU, overuse of house servants in some colleges, and the indulging of individual weaknesses such as for European foods and wine. Correctly, he notes that the vow of poverty was a personal pledge and not binding on the Society. But his researches lead him to the conclusion that the financial records do not confirm an excess in the financial health of the Society, that the Society profited less from its property holdings and financial practices than aUeged by its critics, and that although there may have been lapses, by and large Jesuits led spartan and modest lives and that the Society used its revenues to achieve legitimate and stated goals.

If there were successes in Japan and China, there were other regions where the enterprise failed to meet expectations: Persian Gulf, Ethiopia, Mozambique, abandonment of Cabo Verde, and controversial roles in Kongo and Angola. The Society's resUience and commitment were tested after expulsion from Japan and ensuing redeployment to Vietnam and Cochin China. Alden also examines the sometimes inconsistent record of the Society as regards non-Europeans. The strong Jesuit defense of Amerindians contrasted with a double standard concerning Amerindian and African slave labor. Professor Alden acknowledges that the Society depended on African and Asian slaves from Japan to Brazil, but emphasizes the less publicized discussion within the Society concerning the propriety of ownership of slaves. That the Society acted in accordance with contemporary views in accepting the institution of slavery may be true as he asserts, but the fact remains that this stance represented a failure on the part of the Society and of the Church to condemn the institution. Alden firmly rejects

the contention—made by Charles Boxer, James Duffy, and Gerald Bender—that the Society was "active" in the slave trade from Africa to BrazU, but acknowledges that the Society may have expressed interest in the trade and may have sporadicaUy dispatched slaves on its own account or on behalf of others. But, usually Jesuits bought their slaves on the open market. Alden also examines in detail the policies and practices toward whites born overseas and non-whites or mixed-bloods and accepts that there existed discrimination against peoples of host nations: some were admitted as catechists, but few were ordained.

The perspective is virtually exclusively Eurocentric. There are few non-European "voices." Non-European language sources have not been consulted. This is defensible in view of the focus of the work, but it would have been interesting to have an alternative perspective on the Jesuit enterprise. The exception to this lies in China and Japan.

Professor Alden assumes the important role of a senior scholar leaving a legacy of ideas and potential avenues for further research. These include: relationships between assistants and generals; the Jesuit influence exerted over persons making wills in articulo mortis; the important roles of temporal coadjutors; reconstruction of the slave trade from Mozambique to India, notably Goa; and the size of completed families of slave couples on Jesuit and non-Jesuit estates in BrazU in the later eighteenth century. His quantitative and prosopographical analyses of the composition—age, provenance, longevity, admissions, and dismissals—of the Jesuits show the great potential for further quantitative research.

This is a meticulously researched, superbly documented study whose text and footnotes will be mined by generations of historians. WhUe the initial parts are based on primary and secondary printed sources, as the volume progresses (and notably in the economic sections) there is heavy reliance on unpublished manuscript sources. WhUe the Archivum Romanum Societatis lesu is the most heavily used, there has been extensive consultation of national and regional archives in Portugal and her former empire. The geographical breadth of sources other than in Portugal underlines the fact that research on the history of the Portuguese Assistancy, no less than that of Portugal itsetf, cannot be adequately conducted solely in Portuguese or even European archives. The very richness of this study and its importance as a reference work would have been enhanced by a more complete index and a full bibliography or at least a bibliographical index. The publisher is to be congratulated on a virtuaUy error-free text, with the consistent exception of erroneous accentuation of the Portuguese word cámara. Tables and graphs are clear, maps are useful, and Ulustrations complement the text.

Professor Alden has accompUshed a major feat of historical scholarship. One feels that he would agree with the assessment of Charles R. Boxer: "Whatever the human failings of the sons of Loyola . . . the impartial historian is bound to admit with Protestant Peter Mundy: "And to speak truly, they neither spared cost nor labour, diligence nor danger to attain their purpose' :Ad majorem Dei

gloriam'.' Alden has shown himself to be an impartial historian. While acknowledging its shortcomings, the Society has earned the respect of this distinguished scholar, who states: "I bear no reUgious affiliation and hold no brief for or against the Jesuits or any other religious body" (p. viii). The Making of an Enterprise concludes in 1750 when the Society was at a crossroads but with the prognosis far from good for the future of the Society. The second volume The Destruction of an Enterprise wiU show how weU grounded were apprehensions as to the continuing longevity of the Portuguese Assistancy.

A.J. R. Russell-Wood

The Johns Hopkins University

Il concilio di Trento e il moderno. Edited by Paolo Prodi and Wolfgang Reinhard. [Annali deU'Istituto storico italo-germanico, Quaderno 45.] (Bologna: Società éditrice il Mulino. 1996. Pp. 575. Ute 58.000.)

This volume presents the atti of a week of study and discussions held to celebrate the 450,h anniversary of the opening of the CouncU of Trent. Twin introductions by the organizers (Paolo Prodi and Wolfgang Reinhard) reveal the focus of meetings that week: the history of the Council against the backdrop of contemporary poUtics and law on one hand, and against the backdrop of modernizing religious persons and institutions on the other. In his introduction, Prodi explained that the organizers hoped to move forward the study of the long-range significance of the CouncU in relation to the birth of modern western political culture. From firm conviction that the old controversy concerning Reformation, Counter-Reformation, and Catholic Reform has been overcome, he argues nicely for a more complex picture of the CouncU and the forces behind it by pointing out the research—including his own—that Ulustrates the impact of the modern state upon the Church. It is no longer possible to maintain that the Council was a simple battle between reformers hoping to purify the Church and conservatives attempting to defend traditional ecclesiastical prerogatives against the reformers. Rapport between the papacy and other sovereigns aUowed the formation of an equilibrium, albeit one retaining areas of potential conflict, that was epitomized, for Prodi, in the distinction between doctrine and statements of positive law in concUar decrees. Reinhard's essay on Trent and the modernization of the Church as a social institution begins with far less optimism, asserting that Catholics today still see that Council as either an assertion of authentic orthodoxy or as a ruinous victory of conservatism and reaction. He maintains that Trent was characterized by defensiveness and reaction to Protestantism whUe arguing that the Council still contributed to both the relative and the absolute modernization of the Church. The published results of the week of study Prodi and Reinhard envisioned should provide the grist for much discussion in graduate seminars on the political, social, and reUgious history of early-modern Europe.

What foUows in the volume are essays that, in the mam, present the state of current scholarship on a set of topics permitting reconsideration of the connection between the Council and emerging modernity. Some, like Konrad Repgen's essay on the religious law of the Holy Roman Empire, Umberto Mazzone's on the bureaucratic structure of Trent, Peter Burschel's on the modernity of post-Tridentine models of sanctity, plus those by Volker Reinhardt and Carlo Poni on scientific thought in the era of Trent, do Uttle for me other than raise problems. Their suggestions concerning modern political, reUgious, and intellectual commitments demonstrate the reason for my lingering doubt about the very intent of the conference itseU. It is essentially an exercise in anachronism to attempt to identify modernity—or even the beginnings of it—in any earlier age.

The real historical significance of Trent can be found through consideration of the Council's long-term history on its own, without struggling to find it either anticipating or stifling modernity. That is precisely what the vast majority of the other essays in this volume accomplish. They identify ambiguities and inconsistencies that riddled the discussions, decrees, and implementation process in the age of Trent. Adriano Prosperi and MUiam Turrini provided essays on confession that identify ambiguity Ui the real practice of the sacrament of penance. Giancarlo Angelozzi found the same when considering the history of the decree on dueling, in which the Council issued no univocal condemnation of the practice, but rather contributed to a larger debate on early modern violence and its control. Anne Conrad considered matters related to the place of women in Tridentine religiosity, concluding that ecclesiastical attempts to force women to consolidate, claústrate, and contemplate met with serious opposition that reflects their coUective ability to find new opportunities and to develop autonomy. Gabriella Zarri found a complex reality behind the discipUning action of post-Tridentine parish reformers hoping to clean up the practice of marriage, a complexity mirrored in contention over the decree itseU, for fuUy one-quarter of the councU fathers had serious misgivings about the restrictions of Tametsi, a pattern she finds unique in voting at Trent. Understanding the nature and impact of this Council wiU move forward, in my opinion, U the approach taken by the best pieces in this coUection, those by Angelo Turchini and CecUia Nubola on diocesan visitation records, is emphasized. Rather than searching for evidence of modernity, or for material to reinforce or contradict one of the old images of the period, they have begun to gauge and describe the real effect of Trent upon the Christians of the early-modern age. Their conclusions wiU startle some. While "modernization," U it is to be identified in early-modern ecclesiastical institutions, may have involved progressive clericalization, it was similar to the bureaucratization of contemporary civU government. Although visitations came to be associated with control, correction, submission, and obedience, their successful outcome required collaborative work with representative institutions—like cathedral chapters—that belie a simple centralization model. For even with papal reinforcement, dioceses were complicated institutions that

could rarely be dominated, as even the administration of prelates like Carlo Borromeo can demonstrate.

This volume—like aU the others Ln this series—represents a body of crucial information for all those interested in early-modern reUgious history.

William V Hudon

Bloomsburg University

William Byrd: Gentleman of the Chapel Royal. By John Harley. (Brookfield, Vermont: Scolar Press. Ashgate Publishing Company. 1997. Pp. xvi, 480. $76.95.)

In his preface to this important study the author explains that his dual purpose has been "to summarize the currently avaUable biographical information about Byrd and to provide a brief account of his music with particular emphasis on its chronology." This is an impressive achievement, for WiUiam Byrd's legacy, by the time of his death at the age of eighty-three, was weU over five hundred compositions, varying from the short to the extremely complex, in a variety of styles, so that Harley has had to review a wide range of manuscript and printed sources. Born in London in 1540, Byrd's association with the WhitehaU palace chapel began as a gifted chorister who benefited from advanced teaching Ui voice, musical instruments including the organ, and composition from a number of masters, such as his Ufelong friend, Thomas TalUs. In the reign of Mary Tudor, whUe he was between the age of thirteen and eighteen, Byrd had his last opportunities to sing and hear publicly the Latin Uturgical music, to which he would bring his extraordinary talents over three decades later in new compositions. In 1572, after Byrd had previously served at Lincoln cathedral as organist and master of the choristers for nine years, he was called back to be enrolled as a "Gentleman of the Chapel Royal." At Whitehall he was a member of an official choir of twenty-four male singers and organists, joined by twelve boy choristers, who provided the music for the services attended by the queen and her household.

Harley's five biographical chapters and his conclusion, aptly entitled "Postscript," wiU be of considerable value to students of English Reformation history. Over five decades Byrd composed memorable hymns, motets, and anthems for the AngUcan rites, but privately composed others for his Catholic cUcle. WhUe his brothers and sisters were Protestants, Byrd with his wUe and chUdren were staunch recusants. Harley has documented the proceedings for recusancy against him and his wife for close to forty years (pp. 68-70, 127-131) yet finds no evidence of payment of the statutory fines or imprisonment. Meanwhile, one of his household, John Reason, was a prisoner several times (pp. 70-73). Apparently his open immunity from the penal code was due to his patrons, both Protestants and Catholics, and a letter to the attorney general from the queen's council (p. 126). Another favor from the queen was her grant in 1575

to Byrd and TaUis of a monopoly for twenty-one years of printing music, for which they dedicated to her a book of Latin motets (pp. 55, 216-217). In 1592 Byrd limited his attendance at the chapel, for he wished to compose a major Catholic liturgical series. This began Ui 1595 with the private printing of a new Ordinary of the Mass (Kyrie, Gloria, etc.) for three, four, and five voices (pp. 306-316) which he intended for CathoUc households where Mass was secretly celebrated. TheU considerable popularity led to new printings. To complete this unique updating of English Catholic worship Byrd pubUshed in 1606 and 1608 his two-volume Graduada ac cantiones sacrae, in which official prayers, hymns, and antiphons for the feasts such as Christmas, Annunciation, or Corpus Christi were arranged for the voice and could be selected by each household for their private Masses. Dedicated to two close friends, Baron Petre and the earl of Northampton and with the Ucence of a notorious persecutor, Bishop Richard Bancroft (pp. 317-340) the appearance of these books was a milestone in English CathoUc music occasioned by the fortunate immunity from persecution of one of that century's greatest composers. John Harley has shed considerable light on a rarely appreciated aspect of the English Reformation.

Albert J. Loomie

Fordham University

Celestial Sirens: Nuns and Their Music in Early Modern Milan. By Robert L. Kendrick. (New York: Clarendon Press, Oxford University Press. 1996. Pp. xxi, 556. $95.00.)

Current scholarship has produced a wealth of learned writings on an old, but only recently explored, source of modern history—the lives and activities of nuns within the cloister. This phenomenon may in part be due to the current interest in women's studies in general; in musicology, in particular, it is evidence of pushing the boundaries of archival research. Celestial Sirens, along with Craig Monson's Disembodied Voices, EUssa Weaver's works on the theatrical performances of nuns in Florentine convents, and Caroline Walker Bynum's Holy Feast and Holy Fast, are impressive evidence of the richness of these sources. Since the nuns studied in these works were subject to both civU and ecclesiastical authority, their very lives and activities are among the most thoroughly documented in early modern history.

In Celestial Sirens Robert Kendrick constructs a conceptual framework of the reUgious, economic, and political circumstances of the period in which the subjects of his study lived. He traces the musical activities of five generations of nuns in Milanese convents (from ca. 1570 to well into the eighteenth century), through the tenure of eight dUferent archbishops—ranging from the restrictive Carlo Borromeo to his more permissive nephew Federico Borromeo. Examination of the nuns' musical activities during this period reveals not only conflicts between clergy and secular authority, but also power struggles among the

clergy themselves, and at times factionaUsm inside the cloister. This very class distinction within the convents had its practical consequences for the musical lUe of the nuns. The converse (sisters without final vows who had brought a smaller dowry to the order) did the menial work in the cloister, thus allowing the professed nuns greater leisure to pursue musical studies.

Despite the Church's attempts to Umit family control of the patrician nuns by enforcing strict clausura, the occasional infiltration of secular music and the need for male tutors sometimes placed the nuns at the center of suspicion and even controversy. Their situation is more or less symboUzed by the very space in which they functioned musically: the dichotomy between the Ulterior church in which they performed and the exterior church to which travelers came and visiting dignitaries were brought to hear them.

There is much to be learned from the proscriptions of the various archbishops just as there is from the music performed in the cloister. WhUe Kendrick's study is essentially a musicological investigation, his exploration of non-musical documentation is sensitive to the dilemma in which the nuns sometimes found themselves; the very musical achievements for which they were recognized sometimes resulted in their being subject to extreme discipUnary measures. Despite these dUficulties, it is clear from the music performed that many of these women—perhaps the most famous musicians in early modern MUan—reached an impressive degree of skill. The level of their virtuosity is attested not only by the repertoire of works written for and dedicated to them by weU-known composers of the time (thirty-eight listed in Appendix C), but also by the impressive compositions of the nuns themselves. Kendrick's work concentrates especiaUy upon Sisters Claudia Sessa, Claudia Rusca, Maria Catarina CaUgari, Rosa Giacinta BadaUa, and especiaUy Chiara Margarita Cozzolani. It is evident from their compositions that these cloistered women were closely in touch with current stylistic tendencies and techniques such as the application of vocal ornaments (gorgid), the trend toward the duet style of writing, polychoral techniques, and even the sacred concerto employing instruments.

One of the merits of Celestial Sirens is the generous sampling of the music provided by nearly one hundred examples of varying length, accompanied by Kendrick's meticulous analysis. A certain amount of speculation regarding performance practice of this music is inevitable: Kendrick addresses the question of generic scoring for male or female choirs, the matter of cleffing and interpretation of "actual pitch" Ln the performance of works for equal voices, and the possibUity of transposition and/or use of gamba or other instruments on the bass line. Regarding this latter practice, it is interesting to note that certain of the singers' names appear in convent records with the designation "bassus." WhUe Kendrick deftly balances detailed musical analysis along with the discussion of ecclesiastical proscriptions, he does not obscure the more truly spiritual issues of what this music says of the life of these nuns in a period that is said to have effected the "feminization of piety."

With Celestial Sirens Kendrick provides the English-speaking reader with an erudite exploration into the subject of nuns' music, supported by truly impressive documentation of hitherto unstudied archival sources. These are generously quoted in the often lengthy footnotes, as weU as in the nearly one hundred pages of appendices. The book, however, does presuppose a good working knowledge of Italian and Latin. Although most of the Latin texts of motets are translated in the notes, there are long, and very significant passages of both Italian and Latin (especiaUy in the appendices) that are untranslated. Moreover, the reader needs at least a famUiarity with the vocabulary of classical rhetoric. WhUe Kendrick does provide a very useful glossary of ecclesiastical terminology, a comparable lexicon of rhetorical terms would make the book a bit more "reader-friendly."

Finally, despite the vast amount of material through which Kendrick guides the reader, he does not lose sight of his subject, and explores the question of the dichotomy in the lives of these musical nuns—the idea of the convent as a sort of seraglio with the nuns as ill-concealed opera singers, prized and paraded for their musical excellence, while also being suspect, or even at times censured, for pursuing the very talents that brought them—and the city—renown. Theirs was a dUficult task, balancing fame with humiUty—the ideal of religious Ufe. The fact that they not only persevered Ui both, but actuaUy prevaUed, predicates not only a high degree of talent, but also a sincerity of dedication. Let us hope that Kendrick's praiseworthy achievement will prompt further exploration of this complex history and bring to light more of the compositions of these musical women inside the cloister.

Cyrilla Barr

The Catholic University ofAmerica

La città e i poveri: Milano e le terre lombarde dal Rinascimento all'età spagnola. Edited by Danilo Zardin. [Edizioni Universitarie Jaca, Vol. 100.] (MUan: Jaca Book. 1995. Pp. 431)

This volume contains, besides the introduction by the editor, fifteen papers first presented at a conference in Milan in 1992. It is a particularly feUcitous achievement for at least three reasons. First, it has the advantage of focusing on a specific locality, a locality extraordinarily rich in historical sources, and of approaching it from a variety of perspectives. This assures depth in coverage and also helps forestall facUe generalizations from just one kind of evidence. Second, it is a good example of integration of the study of religion, literature, economics, and poUtics. Third, although the contributors are with the exception of Brian PuUan not well known outside Italy, they are all skilled practitioners of our métier, beginning with the editor, Danilo Zardin, who provides a fine overview of the volume in his introduction.

The importance of the subject can hardly be overestimated, for it is stiU with us in our cities today. Sad to say, there is Uttle indication that we handle it better than did early modern Italians. Even given the greater complexity of the urban situation today, there is some indication that we handle it worse. In any case, the subject has also been of keen interest historiographicaUy ever since Pullan's groundbreaking Rich and Poor in Venice (1971), in which he chaUenged the sharp contrast historians drew between Protestant and Catholic poor relief.

As the dean of such studies, Pullan's contribution on "poverty," "charity," and "new forms of social assistance" from the fifteenth to the seventeenth century is, therefore, of special interest and weight. He cautions against drawing too firm a line of demarcation between late medieval and early modern attitudes and practices in these regards and also against doing the same between Protestants and Catholics. Nonetheless, differences there were, and in the latter case he points specificaUy to the continuation of confraternities within Catholic territories, once again vindicating recent scholarship on the utterly crucial but long-forgotten role these institutions played in almost every aspect of Catholic culture.

Confraternities appear passim in any number of articles, for, besides being an institution in their own right, they funded or otherwise supported other institutions or themselves developed into different ones. For that reason Angelo Bianchi's article on the Somascans is especiaUy iUuminating. From what amounted originaUy to a confraternity gathered around Gerolamo Miani that created the first orphanages, as distinct from foundling homes, it devolved into a reUgious order. Moreover, from providing such refuges for "street kids" it further devolved by the end of the century into a teaching order, foUowing a pattern that was not unique in the sixteenth century and was, of course, extremely significant.

Luigi Prosdocimi's, Angelo Giorgio Ghezzi's,and Giorgio Cosmacini's articles on hospitals and other forms of care for the sick, GiuUana Albini's on the Monti di Pietà, and Flavio Rurale's on religious orders aU suggest the variety of institutions that tried to address various aspects of the problem and indicate the complexity of their relationships to each other. Although marginal groups—"vagabonds," gypsies, prostitutes, etc.—come up for discussion in many of the articles, Stefano D'Amico and Giovanni Liva address them professedly, with D'Amico providing interesting statistics about income, the contrast between urban and suburban poverty, and similar matters. Claudia di FUippo Bareggi and Paolo Pissavino describe debates and opinions about poverty in literature, the press, and political tracts, and Mina Gregori concludes the volume with a fascinating description of the images of poverty and illness in seventeenth-century art.

No treatment of MUan during this period could stand without reference to Carlo and Federico Borromeo, and Angelo Turchini provides a judicious review of ecclesiastical legislation and the pastoral practice especially of those two great archbishops. This long and important article is placed about half-way

through the volume, surrounded by others that put it in large context, an indication of how radically historical studies have shifted in the past fifty years from the great-men approach.

Some issues recur throughout the volume. Politicians looked upon poverty, or on the problems it entailed, as a threat to public order. Even as they tried to aUeviate its miseries and spoke the language of Christian charity, they had their eyes on sustaining the political and economic status quo. Nonetheless, the religious image of feeding Christ by feeding the poor propelled many of the initiatives. These initiatives were remarkable in their variety and, often, in their flexibUity and effective response to concrete situations. They were interested in charity and mercy, not justice. They were "medieval"; they were "modern." Even as they flourished they bit by bit lost or unwittingly surrendered ground to centralizing bureaucracies, thus becoming even more "modern."

JohnW.O'Malley.SJ.

Weston Jesuit School of Theology

Teresa von Avila. Humanität und Glaubensleben. By Jutta Burggraf. (Paderborn: Ferdinand Schöningh Verlag. 1996. Pp. 510. DM 88,-.)

The author of this extraordinary book—"Teresa of Avila—Humanness and the Life of Faith"—has invested all of her erudition and experience in examining the life and spirituality of the Carmelite foundress with particular emphasis on her human qualities and the interaction between her personality and her deep faith. In her introduction, Burggraf states that the human being has an innate dignity due, she says, to our theomorphic dimension. That we are created in the image of God may be indemonstrable, but it can be clearly discerned when the human being engages in loving relationship with other human beings. God is love, and so when man or woman acts out of love, the God-image is most perceptible.

This acting out of love—humanitas as a concept—appears in the later books of the Old Testament but more so in the New Testament. The more one is like God, the more one is truly human. A concept gains credibUity when it is studied through the human relationship of a celebrated person especiaUy as expressed in word and action. In Teresa of Avila we have that famiUar person who has a reputation for extensive relationships in which her faith and her love interact. Her human foibles or faUings are not ignored, nor are they exaggerated. Attention is paid to the positive attitude of the saint for human values and the development of the personality. To treat Teresa justly one has to honor her individual humanness to which belong limits and weaknesses as weU as strength and finally, the victory of divine grace.

Burggraf examines first what Teresa means to say and recount when setting up her "way of perfection" and, second, what she inadvertently reveals of her

personality in dealing with contemporaries while herseU walking that "way." She investigates in Part I Teresa's outstanding talents and basic principles. Part II looks at the external factors which influenced her humanitas, the historical milieu, culture, society, and the church politics of her country and tune. Part III estabUshes how and why Teresa can be called a "singular phenomenon" in that she practiced what she preached. Did she truly motivate others to draw nearer to God? How did she manUest her personality in concern for the Reform and in her leadership of the monasteries she founded? Part IV explores the relationship between Teresa's humanness and Christ's humanitas. This touches on her relationship with God, on the uniqueness of Teresa's mysticism and theology which resulted in a powerful missionary zeal. Lastly, the summary in Part V demonstrates the specific contribution Teresa's life as witness has made toward estabUshing the identity of a Christian and indirectly the identity of a Christian theologian.

In 510 pages, the book Uves up to the expectations it raises. One is startled at seeing a six-page Ust of abbreviations plus 2,581 footnotes, and a bibliography of 926 books and articles. Whatever has appeared about Teresa of AvUa in EngUsh, French, German, Latin, and Spanish seems to be included. This veritable Teresian encyclopedia would be an asset to every Carmelite library, and each province should have at least one copy. Despite these formidable statistics the book is not stuffy, but rather refreshing and instructive.

Sister Josephine Koeppel, O.C.D.

Carmelite Monastery
Elysburg, Pennsylvania

Conversion, Politics and Religion in England, 1580-1625- By Michael C. Questier. [Cambridge Studies in Early Modern British History.] (New York: Cambridge University Press. 1996. Pp. xiv, 240. $59.95.)

Dr. Questier has written an interesting and provocative book which should be read by anyone working in the area of Elizabethan and Jacobean reUgious history. Entering the battle over the nature of "EngUsh CathoUcism" and when/U England became a "nation of Protestants" through an examination of the phenomenon of conversion to and from the Church of Rome, he reminds those working in the field that religious allegiance was for some sixteenth- and seventeenth-century men and women a question of conversion and obedience to God's grace, not merely of obedience to the commands of the monarch or a way of preserving property. In establishing that as his goal, Dr. Questier then encounters some methodological problems. How does one establish the reUgious beliefs of the majority of EngUsh Catholics or of English Anglicans? How significant are the examples of conversion which Dr. Questier produces? Is there a dUference between the conversion narratives of the clergy and those of the laity? How many of these narratives of conversion are there?

While Dr. Questier's analysis of the conversion narratives themselves is significant, the question remains: how significant is conversion for the mass of the people? Religious motivation is difficult to assess: how many men and women simply went along with the changes because they were mandated by the queen? How many were devoted to the old religion simply because they did not like the new? How many people accepted the priests' definition of what it meant to be a member of the Church of Rome? In dealing with these conversions and with his analysis of recusant literature, Dr. Questier lumps together clergy and laity, those residing in England and those living in exUe. Does that clarify the material, or does it muddy the issue? His use of evidence is also interesting. He uses Cardinal William AUen in exUe (p. 14, n. 6) as a reUable source for the state of Catholics in England and John Pym (p. 6, n. 9) as a reliable source for the granting of de facto toleration to Catholics. Neither source seems reliable.

Problems with the use of evidence and its significance continue in the work. In Chapter Six Dr. Questier cites my article on James I and his Catholic subjects without mentioning that the material I present is limited to the city of London and Middlesex county, which are not representative of the entire realm. He then uses the material to argue that the king and councU were enforcing conformity after the Gun Powder Plot, when enforcement of conformity fines did not occur until after the failure of the Great Contract and may, more plausibly, have been collected for financial rather than religious reasons.

There are some interesting bibliographical gaps in the work. The author points out the similarity between evangelical AngUcans (Puritans) and Catholics (the author seems to limit them to Jesuits), yet does not make reference to Patrick McGrath's Papists and Puritans under Elizabeth I. Nor is there any reference to Conrad Russell's "Arguments for Religious Unity in England, 1530-1650."

The book's strength is its analysis of the conversion narratives which allow us "windows into men's souls" so that we can see why some moved from church to church and what their motivation was for the journey. The significance of these journeys is important, but not as important as the author would like to believe because we do not know how many others went through similar conversion experiences. For the rest of the population historians are left with the outward activity of recusants and church papists from which to infer their religious belief.

John J. LaRocca, SJ.

Xavier University
Cincinnati, Ohio

Calvinist Exiles in Tudor and Stuart England. By Ole Peter GreU. (Brookfield, Vermont: Scolar Press, Ashgate PubUshing Company. 1996. Pp. x, 249. $76.95.)

Now that we possess this study, Grell's earlier volume on The Dutch CaI-vinists in Early Stuart London (1989), Andrew Pettegree's Foreign Protestant Communities in Sixteenth-Century London (1986), and Keith Sprunger's Dutch Puritanism (1982), the dimensions of the pan-European 'Calvinist' Reformed connection are becoming clearer, stretching from Lucca in the south, Poland in the east, to London and Edinburgh in the British Isles from the 1550's to past the Revocation of the Edict of Nantes in the late seventeenth century. Particularly for those of us who focus parochiaUy on the English story, it is important to be reminded that Continental influence and interchange did not cease with the contributions of Martin Bucer and Peter Martyr to the Edwardian Reformation.

GreU's current volume coUects eleven articles and chapters in books, aU but one of which had appeared before but scattered over a variety of EngUsh and Dutch publications. Although there is inevitably some repetition—Archbishop WUUam Laud's attempt to impose an English unUormity on the stranger churches in the years after 1634 appears in several contexts in several chapters—and a primary focus on the Dutch, GreU is not concerned exclusively with either the Dutch church at Austin Friars or with the EUzabethan and Early Stuart history of these exUes. In fact, one of his most interesting iUustrations of the truly international connections of the Reformed exiles concerns the three prominent Lucchese families—the Burlamachis, Calandrinis, and Diodatis—who left Lucca a generation after Peter Martyr and whose ramified families turned up in Geneva and Hamburg as weU as Amsterdam and London. Franciscus Gomarus, the Dutch theologian and leading anti-Remonstrant, had studied at Oxford and Cambridge in the early 1580's, and a generation later such notorious Puritans as John Bastwick and Alexander Leighton were to study at the new university of Leiden.

If the international nature of the Reformed community is one theme that runs through this volume, another is the gradual decline of the Dutch church at Austin Friars, initially the largest, richest, and most powerful of the exUc communities—when James I raised a loan of £100,000 from the City in 1617, another £20,000 was extracted from the merchant strangers, Dutch and French—but one which after the 1590's no longer received any new influx of refugees and by the 1630's was faced with a generation of young people for whom Dutch was no longer easUy understood. In 1625 the Dutch community hired Ben Jonson to write the commendatory verses to celebrate the coronation of Charles I, ultimately raising close to £1,000 for a triumphal arch; in 1661 the Dutch and French churches together barely managed to raise £400 toward the celebration of Charles II's coronation. Symbolic was the transformation of Jan de Groot, deacon of the church at Austin Friars, who became Master of the Brewers' Com-

pany in 1641 and Alderman of London a decade later, now known to his EngUsh colleagues as John Great.

Paul S. Seaver

Stanford University

Church and Culture in Seventeenth-Century France. By Henry PhUips. (New York: Cambridge University Press. 1997. Pp. Lx, 334. $59.95.)

The Catholic Reform movement began to have a significant impact in France during the seventeenth century, after the conclusion of the devastating religious wars. The Church undertook to assert its authority over society through its educational system, its missionary efforts in rural areas, and its promotion of activities designed to instill in the various segments of society a more intense religious consciousness. However, as Professor PhiUips informs us, the reforming efforts of the French Church were hampered not only by secular trends within French culture, especiaUy in science and phUosophy, that became increasingly influential at this time, but by forces within the Church itseU as well. In order to inspire in the hearts and minds of the faithful a greater respect for the authority of the Church, ecclesiastical officials at aU levels undertook to develop a clearer understanding of Catholic tradition and doctrinal orthodoxy. This task proved to be impossible to accomplish given the profound dtfferences of opinion that existed between GalUcans and ultramontanes, Jesuits and Jansenists, and the regular and secular clergy on these matters. Such differences of opinion inevitably weakened the authority of the Church at a time when the authority of the French state was increasing, often at the expense of the Church.

The authority of the Church was brought into question Ui the area of science and phUosophy, not because Descartes and others intended to chaUenge that authority but because they challenged the authority of Aristotle, whose phUosophy, configured to reUgious belief by medieval scholars, was viewed by the Catholic hierarchy as a whole as essential to the maintenance of that authority. Furthermore, consideration of "the new phUosophy" took place in areas beyond the control of the Church—in the salons, at public lectures, and in the newly established royal academy of science.

The most direct chaUenges to the authority of the Church, in PhiUip's opinion, were from the Jansenists, Protestants, libertines, atheists, and deists, aU of whom the Church attempted to suppress without success. The Jansenists in defense of their own version of CathoUc orthodoxy defied both the hierarchy and the state. The Huguenots, especiaUy those in exüe after the revocation of the Edict of Nantes, helped to develop a poUtical culture Ui the Netherlands and In England that was antithetical to the culture of the Old Regime to which the CathoUc Church had contributed so much. As for the Ubertines, atheists, and

deists, their role in undermining the authority of the Church lay not so much in the direct chaUenge that they posed to that authority but in suggesting the possibility of social values that did not require the validation of Catholic orthodoxy.

In framing his argument, Phillips uses the concept of space because spaces, he says, foUowing Foucault, are related to power and control. Thus there are frequent references to the space of belief, of dissent, of hostUity, etc. Framed in this way, the argument sometimes seems too abstract, and the issues of power and control are not clearly worked out. Nevertheless, the book provides a useful overview of French culture at a critical moment in its history.

Alexander Sedgwick

The University of Virginia

Mazarin. The Crisis of Absolutism in France. By Geoffrey Treasure. (New York: Routledge. 1995. Pp. xv,413· $39.95 clothbound; $22.95 paperback.)

The period from the death of Louis XIII in 1643 to the beginning of the personal reign of Louis XIV in 1661 was one of the most tumultuous and complex in French history. It was as well the "age of Mazarin," the cardinal-minister who merged Italianate style with French statecraft, who increased French glory and reputation at the expense of revolts, social tension, and economic dislocation, and who has provoked passionate reactions from contemporaries and historians alike. The difficulties in understanding Mazarin's life and times mean that only accomplished historians—recently Georges Dethan and Pierre Goubert and now Geoffrey Treasure—could hope to offer satisfactory biographies of Giulio Mazarini. Treasure's mastery of seventeenth-century France, seen in earlier books, is evident in this rehabilitation of Mazarin, a man Treasure obviously admires but not to the extent of ignoring the first minister's shortcomings.

For Treasure, Mazarin's greatness Ues in his accomplishments, notably his success in diplomacy and his training of Louis XIV. Diplomacy was his métier, beginning in Rome in the service of Pope Urban VIII and ending with the marriage of Louis XIV to Maria Teresa, Infanta of Spain. Mazarin's close attention to foreign affairs (he was his own foreign minister) centered on the Thirty Years' War and on Spain, France's great, but declining rival. Even during the worst days of the Fronde, Mazarin doggedly pursued his goals: defensible frontiers and a political hegemony to match French cultural and linguistic influence. His achievements include, of course, the Peace of Westphalia and the Peace of the Pyrenees.

In increasing French territory and security, Mazarin followed closely the policies of Richelieu, who had recognized the papal diplomat's talents. Treasure sees Mazarin and Louis XIV as heirs to Richelieu's absolutism, although the Sun King proved to be more aggressive in foreign policy than the two cardinal-ministers. Treasure might have addressed the nature of absolutism, especially in light of the historiographical baggage that the term holds.

Mazarin left to France not only political security, but also his magnificent U-brary and paintings. Here was seen Italy's influence on France, for although Mazarin devoted himseU—at the cost of his health—to the French monarchy, he remained Roman in his aesthetic sense, in his love of books, art, and music, to which one might add his sense of courtesy.

Motivated by personal ambition and by devotion to his casa (he gave support to his sisters and nieces) as weU as by loyalty to France, to Anne of Austria, and to Louis XTV, Mazarin fit easUy into behavior and attitudes common to early modern elites. He never considered the burden of war finance (increased taxation) on those who could least afford to pay. His greed was rampant; from 1650 untU his death in 1661, he accumulated a fortune valued at thirty-nine million livres, surpassing Richelieu's twenty-four milUon (amassed over a longer period of time).

Mazarin made mistakes, as Treasure points out. WhUe he was diUgent in his duties, resUient against setbacks during the Fronde, and tough when the situation warranted, Mazarin misunderstood the motivations of parUamentary/rondeurs, in part because he imperfectly grasped French legal tradition. According to Treasure, the cardinal-minister might have Ustened more attentively to his opponents and might have been more astute in evaluating public opinion. His great mistake during the Fronde was to arrest Condé, who thereby became a martyr for the frondeur cause. But it was Condé who eventually had to leave France whUe Mazarin secured the monarchy, stronger than ever after the Fronde, although the strength rested on a consensus with the eUtes that impeded the crown's freedom of action.

Treasure's is a traditional biography that relates twenty years of French history as well. There is nothing here of psychohistory and no speculation about Mazarin's sexuaUty beyond a denial that he and Anne were lovers. The sources no doubt limit our understanding of Mazarin, always conscious of the figure he presented. We know more of Mazarin's reUgious beliefs—his was a formal CathoUcism, little interested in religious reform (he was a great pluraUst) or Ui theology, except when it troubled the state, as with Jansenism.

Treasure is especially enjoyable in the many biographical vignettes of the seventeenth-century rich and infamous, and even of much lesser-known personaUties. These political and psychological portraits appear normaUy in the endnotes, which are as rich as the text. Alas, the endnotes omit references to Treasure's sources, frustrating scholars who might want to foUow up on his research. The "Bibliographical Note" and "Select BibUography," whUe to the point, do not compensate for the lack of a traditional citation format. One wants to learn what manuscripts Treasure consulted.

Like Geoffrey Treasure's other books, Mazarin is perceptive, detaUed, and valuable, essential reading for aU historians of le grand siècle.

Richard M. Golden

University of North Texas

Terpsichore at Louis-le-Grand: Baroque Dance on thefesuit Stage in Paris. By Judith Rock. [Original Studies Composed in English, Number 13, Series 3] (St. Louis: Institute ofJesuit Sources. 1996. Pp. viii, 212. $22.95 paperback.)

Judith Rock merits praise for this fascinating case study of the interaction of theater arts, reUgion, and politics in the reign of Louis XTV Using previously ignored printed and manuscript sources, Rock shows how drama and ballet at the Jesuit coUege in Paris played an integral, major part in French culture and society of the late seventeenth and early eighteenth centuries. Seeking to make learning enjoyable, French Jesuits encouraged their students to act and to dance. Yet performances at the Jesuit college in the French capital were not merely amateurish, in-house exercises. Students performers were joined by professionals hired from the Paris Opera; Charpentier and other leading composers of the day composed for the Jesuits; Louis XIV himself, whose name the coUege bore, frequently attended performances, as did the Parisian elite of nobiUty, bourgeois, and clergy. Using Hercules, Jupiter, Mars, or Charlemagne as aUegories for the reigning king, these performances celebrated the achievements of the French monarchy. Drama and dance on the Jesuit stage also served to glorify the Catholic faith, the virtuous life, the beauty and harmony of creation.

Not everyone was pleased. Jansenists, ever-ready to criticize the Jesuits, never tired of lambasting theater at Louis-le-Grand and elsewhere. According to these austere disciples of Cornelius Jansen, theater and ballet encouraged self-love and bad morals. So much delight and enjoyment could not be condoned! In a Jansenist perspective, acting and dancing were sinful; Angélique Arnauld broadened this condemnation even further, asserting that art was nothing but lies and vanity. With the same kind of reasoning (or lack of it), the University of Paris joined the Jansenist excoriation of theater, whether such theater was Jesuit-sponsored or not. In 1685, putting an end to a centuries-long tradition, the University suppressed all stage performances in its precincts.

It was precisely as a school for teaching virtue that the French Jesuits envisioned the arts of drama and dance. To pirouette, to preach, to paint: audiences could be taught moral lessons as they viewed a performance on stage, just as audiences were edified by pulpit oratory and by reUgious painting. Teach, delight, and move hearts from vice to virtue: the Jesuits believed that the actor or dancer could do this just as well as the orator or painter.

More speculative, and thus most intriguing, is Rock's discussion of gender and the Jesuit stage. Noting that female characters and personifications were played by boys, Rock asks if any of the dancers borrowed from the Opera were women. Some of the best Opera dancers of that era were women; if masks and voluminous costumes permitted male students to play female roles, did they also aUow women to play male roles? Examining the moral messages conveyed at Louis-le-Grand performances, Rock also asserts that audiences were not presented with a "misogynist" theater, but rather with one that conveyed "a certain respect for women as decision makers and independent thinkers, capable of challenging the assumptions of men" (p. 176). If Rock is correct on this last

point, historians inclined to classify the Catholic Reformation as "patriarchal" may need to revise such a label.

Thomas Worcester, SJ.

College of the Holy Cross

An Irish Theologian in Enlightenment France: Luke Joseph Hooke 1714-96. By Thomas O'Connor. (Portland, Oregon: Four Courts Press. 1995. Pp. 218. $39.50.)

Readers of R. R. Palmer's Catholics and Unbelievers in Eighteenth Century France wiU recognize the name. Luke Joseph Hooke, a Parisian doctor, professor at the Sorbonne, was directly associated with the two major confrontations between the Faculty of Theology of Paris and the French Enlightenment: the theses of Abbé de Prades and the censure of J. J. Rousseau's Emile. He wrote influential theological treatises that had him catalogued as a CathoUc apologist. In this work, that appears to be adapted from a doctoral dissertation, Thomas O'Connor attempts to reconsider this judgment by looking at the context as weU as the content of Hooke's theological vision. The book could be divided accordingly into two parts, the first presenting the background, famiUal and educational, foUowed by the divine's major achievements in the Faculty; the second one being an analysis and evaluation of Hooke's opus magnum, Principia religionis naturalis et revelatœ (1752). A last chapter forms the conclusions.

The first part is informative and useful, as very little has been written on the history of the Faculty of Theology of Paris in the eighteenth century. When Hooke entered the Faculty, in 1734, the Jansenist party had been decimated (more than 200 doctors were expelled) but a remnant survived, stiU influential by the support they received from Parlement, that clashed repeatedly with another group, the "Independents," who sought to defend the traditional authority and autonomy of the body. A third party, smaUer in size, comprized the "Modernizers" (a term borrowed from Palmer) who attempted to come to terms with the issues raised by the Enlightenment. Hooke was clearly a member of this circle, but he got in trouble when one of his disciples, the Abbé M. de Prades, defended in 1751 theses of major ordinaria that displayed the influence of the Encyclopédie. He was able, nevertheless, to regain his influence and successfuUy arranged the censure of Rousseau's Emile (1762). He never regained his chair in Theology but in 1766, he was able to obtain the recently endowed chair of Hebrew at the Sorbonne and was elected in 1778 librarian of the Mazarine Library. He refused to take the oath to the Civil Constitution and died in retirement in a home for miUtary veterans at St. Cloud.

The second part intends to be a new and much more positive evaluation of Hooke's contribution as a theologian. O'Connor shows that the Irish doctor's originality goes much further than simple apologetics, because of his desire to take seriously the criticism of the Philosophes and to respond with an Enlight-

enment theology. This Hooke attempted by a "revitalized theology of reUgion" that distinguished him both from the conservative apologists and the antichristian Deists or Atheists. His major importance and contribution lay therefore in the domain of theological method, its problematics, its typology. In the author's eyes this approach deserves to be taken seriously, despite the fact that the "Modernizer ways" Hooke opened were not followed in the aftermath of the French Revolution that destroyed the world in which they were developed.

An important study, therefore, that might have been more forceful in its original state with a scholarly apparatus. The first part, particularly, suffers from a number of approximations, minor errors, and lack of references that, at times, make it difficult to grasp the nuances of an admittedly complex historical and intellectual context. Some of the judgments and interpretations could be disputed, as they must have been during the defense of the dissertation. A few recent works have been overlooked, among them Philippe Lefebvre's important Les Pouvoirs de la parole. L'Eglise et Rousseau 1762-1848 (Paris, 1992).

Jacques M. Gres-Gayer

The Catholic University ofAmerica

Late Modem European

As One Sent. Peter Kenney SJ., 1779-1841. His Mission in Ireland and North America. By Thomas Morrissey, SJ. (Washington, D.C: The CathoUc University of America Press; Blackrock, Co. Dublin: Four Courts Press. 1997. Pp. xii, 529. $54.95.)

In his foreword Emmet Larkin welcomes this biography as worthy of the historical importance of its subject as a maker of the modern Irish church. Peter Kenney was a key figure in the early nineteenth-century reorganization of the Society of Jesus in Ireland and the United States. He was an outstanding orator. Archbishop Murray of Dublin declared that "the only other orator whom I ever thought of comparing him to was Daniel O'ConneU." He moved easUy among the movers and shakers of Irish Catholicism. Murray, Archbishop MacHale of Tuam,"J.K.L." Games Doyle of Kildare and Leighlin), and other bishops were his friends. He was the trusted adviser of Blessed Edmund Rice in the foundation of the Irish Christian Brothers, of Teresa Ball with the Loreto sisters, and of Mary Aikenhead with the Irish Sisters of Charity. He served as superior of the Irish Jesuit mission and later as provincial of the Irish vice-province. He was twice the Jesuit general's official visitor to the missions of Maryland and Missouri and helped put both on a firm footing. He dealt successfully with conflicts between "nativist" American-born Jesuits and the Europeans who had joined them. In Ireland he had been vice-president of Maynooth and he opened Clongowes Wood College. In America he helped set Georgetown CoUege on a steady course and was involved with the problems of getting permission to charge tuition at St.

Louis University, contrary to then-standard Jesuit practice. Other issues were Jesuit slave holding and the growing controversy between proponents of an urban apostolate and those who wished to retain the emphasis on rural ministry characteristic of the Maryland mission since its foundation. Kenney was party to the overaU startup of the restored Jesuit order as one of the first novices in England, as a scholastic in SicUy, and as a delegate of the Irish Jesuits to meetings in Rome, where he died. On one occasion during his SicUian sojourn he accompanied a British naval cruiser on an abortive mission to rescue Pope Pius VII from Napoleon. AU these tales Morrissey has told weU in a readable and valuable book.

James Hennesey, SJ.

Christ the King Seminary
East Aurora, New York

'By Whose Authority?' Newman, Manning and the Magisterium. Edited by V Alan McCleUand. (Bath: Downside Abbey Press. 1996. Pp. x, 290. $44.00.)

This collection consists of fourteen essays by eight weU-known scholars of nineteenth-century religious history in Great Britain. A couple of the essays are very similar to work previously published, and two of the essays are about lesser-known Tractarians, Robert Wilberforce and T. W AUies. Thus, the title of this volume is a bit misleading, especiaUy since the theme of magisterium is scarcely evident in several of the essays.

Manning, WUberforce, and AUies came into the Church partly as a result of the Gorham Trial and its verdict that Baptismal Regeneration was an "open" question in the Church of England. The verdict, to my mind, was a fatal blow to the high-church party in the EngUsh Church, and the scandal it generated might help explain the vigorous Ultramontanism of converts like William George Ward and Manning. It is, therefore, a pity that the essay on Wilberforce has no mention of his exceUent book on Erastianism. The Allies essay, as well, would have been so much better U it had included some discussion of AUies' many writings on behaU of the CathoUc cause in England.

As noted above, several of the other essays are removed from the professed theme of the volume. The study on Tractarian conversions reflects a wide range of reading in the conversion narratives, but given the personal nature of such an act as conversion, it might be dUficult to suggest a formula. The most famous of these narratives is, of course, Newman's Apologia, and when Father Vincent Blehl suggests (p. 44) that Manning may have attempted to have the book placed on the Index, some documentation ought to have been provided. There was indeed serious friction between Manning and Newman, and some might question the wisdom of putting both in the same volume. But Manning also said that he would put his name on anything Newman wrote, sight unseen, and did

work toward a reconciUation with Newman. Others wiU puzzle at the assertion (p. 29) that the No-Popery agitation tended to diminish after 1850. Some have argued just the opposite, and it would be hard to surpass Pusey's Eirenicon (1865) or Gladstone's Vaticanism (1874) for sheer bUe.

The Magisterium adds to the more than 800 books, articles, dissertations, and coUections of essays on Newman written since the centennial of his death in 1990. The various collections have been the result of various Newman "friends"—though several of these coUections are overtly hostUe—inviting friends, pubUshing their work, and sometimes reviewing the results of these convocations. Since most of these meetings are by invitation only, dissent and contrary opinions are excluded, save for a hostile reference or footnote. Since Dr. Peter Benedict Nockles and some of the others have made a Uvely career for themselves in chaUenging my own work, I can only invite readers to choose for themselves.

On the positive side, graduate students ought to read this volume. The essays are jargon-free, without any innuendo about Newman's modernism or ecumenism, and without any of the shabby attacks that characterize several of the most recent coUections.

John R. Griffin

University of Southern Colorado

Death in the Victorian Family. By Pat JaUand. (New York: Oxford University Press. 1996. Pp. xii, 464. $45.00.)

Victorian England is often perceived in the popular mind as a period of cultural repression and reUgious hypocrisy. Much of what that age valued has been denied in the more permissive atmosphere of late twentieth-century culture to the point that accurate analyses of Victorianism—and particularly Victorian reUgion—must bear the burden of popular bias and an inteUectuaI climate far removed from the world of the Victorians. Historians like Gertrude Hirnmetfarb have sought to temper our perceptions with studies of Victorian society and thought that point to the common virtues held by most Victorians which transcended class, gender, and ideology. These transcendent virtues provided a core of beUefs which blended traditional ideas with new socio-economic realities.

Pat JaUand's work on death in Victorian England foUows in a simüar vein. Drawing on detaUed personal accounts of the deaths of close family members found in fifty-five diaries and memoirs (the same sources used in her earUer work, Women, Marriage and Politics, 1860-1914), JaUand offers a revealing picture of the process and perception of death in middle-class Victorian society. JaUand chaUenges PhiUpe Aries' view, included in his ground-breaking study The Hour of Our Death, that nineteenth-century death and dying conformed to a Romantic ideal of the "beautiful death." JaUand, instead, insists that Victorians blended earUer Christian traditions of the ars moriendi with a prevaU-

ing EvangeUcal influence, resulting in the ideal of the "good Christian death." Trie "good Christian death" prevaUed most often Ui Victorian Uterature and reUgious tracts, requiring as it did "a rare combination of good luck, convenient Ulness and pious character" (p. 38). However, JaUand's case studies reveal an honest perception of the reality of human suffering and the reUgious ideal of a better afterlife, aided by a medical profession which recognized the limits of its science and worked to befriend and comfort the dying patient. This dominant EvangeUcal approach did change after 1870, and was shattered after 1914 when the Great War presented overwhelming instances of "bad deaths" (sudden, violent, or suicidal deaths). In the meantime, however, Pat JaUand's descriptions of the varieties of death experiences in nineteenth-century England offer a valuable contrast to current controversies over the ethics of death and dying. This book deserves a wide audience for its thoughtful and thoroughly professional approach to a topic of vital contemporary concern and interest.

Richard J. Janet

Rockhurst College
Kansas City, Missouri

Christentum und Revolution. Die christlichen Kirchen in Württemberg 1848-1852. By Stefan J. Dietrich. [Veröffentlichungen der Kommission für Zeitgeschichte, Reihe B: Forschungen, Band 71.] (Paderborn: Ferdinand Schöningh. 1996. Pp. 490. DM 98, -.)

Carl Becker once wrote that a historian does not stick to the facts; the facts stick to him. But surely he did not have Stefan Dietrich's Christentum und Revolution Ui mind. For here is a historian who does nothing U not stick to the facts.

The subject of Stefan Dietrich's book is the reaction of Christians to the Revolution of 1848. Dietrich concentrates on the pubUshed opinion of Catholics and Protestants in the state of Württemberg. In this context, he has unearthed a great deal of otherwise obscure writings contained in church communications, Christian newspapers, high-minded theological treatises, and polemical pamphlets. With diUgence and a broad sweep, he has gathered this material together and has quoted it at length, letting the documents speak for themselves.

The result is a more detaUed understanding of the reaction of the Christian churches in Württemberg to the Revolution of 1848. Not surprisingly, they thought the Revolution to be a turning point in the history of providence. The CathoUcs beUeved it to be a divinely inspUed Revolution that would result in the Uberation of the CathoUc Church from state domination. Protestants had a dimmer view, seeing the Revolution as punishment for the EnUghtenment. As one moved deeper into the religious right, to Pietism, the theme of divine punishment became more prominent still, some Pietists beUeving that the Revolution prefigured the apocalypse.

Dietrich provides exhaustive detaU of the religious positions that structured the reaction to the Revolution. He also shows that Protestants and Catholics had quite different understandings of German nationaUsm. CathoUcs and Pietists still moved in the world of old régime patriotism; they were ready to offer sacrifice for the fatherland but were free of nationaUst excess. In the Protestant camp, by contrast, the beginnings of a confessionaUy-determined modern nationalism were already discernible. As Protestants beUeved their denomination to be an expression of German essence, they welcomed Prussia as the Protestant power fated to unify the nation. CathoUcs, for their part, stiU saw the glory of the nation in the old Empire and were, as such, backwards-looking. If Dietrich is right, it also means that religion, more than South-German particularism, structured ideas of German nationalism in Württemberg in 1848.

"The course of the Revolution," Dietrich writes, "led to a new confessionalization" (p. 336). Partly a product of differing reUgious interpretations of the Revolution, the new confessionaUzation also resulted from the missionizing attempts of both churches. But here the Catholics proved more aggressive, as Protestants (but not necessarily Pietists) resisted the "superficial" Christianity that seemed to come along with organization. Catholics, however, felt no compunction on this score. Through missions and the formation of increasingly dense organizational networks, they began to form the unified mUieu that would serve as the basis for CathoUc poUtics in the second half of the nineteenth century.

Dietrich's account is soUd and competent. He is also to be commended for writing even-handed interdenominational religious history. Yet he steadfastly refuses to compare his results with the conclusions of other scholars. Thus there is no comparison with Jonathan Sperber's work on WestphaUa or Clemens Rehm's interesting book on Catholics in the Diocese of Freiburg. Moreover, Dietrich bridles before even the most tentative engagement with wider conceptual issues, particularly in respect to the construction of national identity. Consequently, the work is a mine of judiciously organized detaU. But it wiU require historians who do more than stick to the facts to integrate this material into a more complex understanding of the intersection of reUgion, nationalism, and civil society in the middle of the nineteenth century.

Helmut Walser Smith

Vanderbilt University

The Cross & the Sickle: Sergei Bulgakov and the Fate of Russian Religious Philosophy. By Catherine Evtuhov. (Ithaca, New York: CorneU University Press. 1997. Pp. xU, 278. $42.50.)

The tortured and tumultuous years of the early twentieth century, pervaded by the cataclysmic implosion of the ancien régime and the emergence of a new

Bolshevik state, marked not only vast social and poUtical upheaval, but also a period of enormous cultural and inteUectual change. In particular, the UitelUgentsia—renowned for its monomaniacal devotion to the revolutionary ethos—underwent profound changes, as significant components shifted from a materiaUstic worldview to one deeply influenced by neo-Kantian, reUgious, and ultimately non-revolutionary perspectives. EspeciaUy in the inter-revolutionary years of 1907-1917, many in the intelUgentsia abjured the evolutionary mission and applauded the famous coUection of essays caUed Vekhi ("Landmarks") that became symbolic of the nonrevolutionary spiritual quest in the inteUigentsia. AU this has been the subject of considerable research, especially in recent years, including such rich, archivaUy-driven studies as M. A. Kolerov's TVe mir, no mech. Russkaia religiozno-filosofskaia pechat' ot 'Problem idealizma' do 'Vekh; 1902-1909 (St. Petersburg, 1996).

This book offers an inteUectual biography of Sergei Bulgakov (1871-1944) before his emigration in 1923. Over the past few decades, we have already had close studies of other seminal figures, such as P. B. Struve, and Evtuhov's biography now adds another key figure. More than most other members of the inteUigentsia, Bulgakov—son of a priest, former Marxist, Christian sociaUst, and firm beUever in the essential "religiousness" of the Russian people—laid great emphasis on the need for a "reformation" and fundamental renewal of the Russian Church. The author describes the development of his general phUosophical views, waxing interest in the Church, and role in the Church CouncU of 1917-18. This study draws upon a broad corpus of printed sources, some essential archival coUections (including the archives of the Church CouncU in St. Petersburg), and a broad range of secondary studies to place Bulgakov in a larger perspective. AU this aUows the author to demonstrate the close link between Western culture and Russia's SUver Age and to explore the dynamics of a new religious engagement among members of the inteUigentsia.

The result is a close analysis and summary of Bulgakov's thinking, and how his views evolved from the 1890's to the Revolution of 1917. One might wish for more on the resonance that his work evoked, greater detail on the issues of church reform that he raised, and attention to the vast church press that became integral to the public discourse on Orthodoxy and its problems. There are some gaps in the bibliography (e.g., Roman Rasslet, Kirche und Revolution in Rußland [Cologne, 1969], and Günther Schulz, Das Landeskonzil der Orthodoxen Kirche in Russland 1917/18: ein unbekanntes Reformpotential [Göttingen, 1995]). But these minor lacunae cannot detract from the significant value of this new monograph, which offers a reliable, sensitive study of a seminal inteUectual figure and his attempt to foster a rapprochement between the intelUgentsia and Orthodox Church in the early twentieth century.

Gregory L. Freeze

Brandeis University

Political Catholicism in Europe, 1918-1965. Edited by Tom Buchanan and Martin Conway. (New York: Clarendon Press, Oxford University Press. 1996. Pp. ix, 312. $85.00.)

Compare the number of major English-language books on European poUtical CathoUcism with those on socialism or fascism. This is not an issue of quality, since the field is distinguished by such able general studies as Michael Fogarty's and by admirable monographs from Richard Webster, R. E. M. Irving, Noel Cary, and others. But whUe such works merit praise as high as that bestowed on any books on sociaUsm, the number of studies does not do justice to one of the most important phenomena of our century. One explanation for the dearth of English-language works on European poUtical CathoUcism is that it is a subject largely foreign to most of the English-speaking nations, with Ireland as the clear exception. Although CathoUc parties have made themselves felt and even dominated politics in many European (and Latin American) nations, they have never constituted a real force Ln North America or Britain. Another reason might be political Catholicism's sUppery nature. It does not fit easUy into the dominant liberal-fascist-marxist scheme of twentieth-century Anglo-American political thought. For this, poUtical CathoUcism bears some of the blame. It has manifested itsetf aU over the spectrum, from Salazar's Estado Novo to Sturzo's Partito popolare, from Maritain to Maurras.

This diversity is addressed in Political Catholicism in Europe, 1918-1965, edited by Tom Buchanan and Martin Conway. The two recognize the differences within the world of Catholic poUtics but add that, nevertheless, a "distinctive CathoUc tradition has been evident in many—if not aU—of the countries of Europe . . . and that significant simUarities existed between these manifestations of poUtical CathoUcism for it to be possible to consider it as a European phenomenon" (p. 6). If our studies of Marxism can include Stalin, Mao, and Gramsci.then why couldn't a survey of poUtical Catholicism embrace Ignaz Seipel and Giuseppe Dossetti?

Buchanan and Conway have assembled an impressive group of essays. Along with Conway's introduction, France, Italy, Spain, Portugal, Germany, Belgium, the Netherlands, Great Britain, and Ireland are represented. AU of the essays are first rate, although they are not uniform. This is inevitable. The 1918 and 1965 dates, for example, are not hard and fast and are quite rightly manipulated by the authors to make their essays more complete. In the Spanish case, for instance, 1975 makes more sense than 1965. Europe's 1918 to 1965 landscape, furthermore, is crossed by a very high waU—the war years from 1939 to 1945. And although aU chapters cover the ¦whole span, most of them lean predominantly into the earUer, though shorter, era before World War II. This tempers our understanding of poUtical CathoUcism because, in most countries during the 1920's and 1930's, the subject cannot be considered without reference to its relationship to the radical right. WhUe some leaders such as Sturzo opposed fascism, others made deals with it and have justly drawn criticism from the left. On the other hand, for the most part, poUtical CathoUcism after World War II was

different. UsuaUy as Christian Democracy, its record was cleaner and, with the possible exception of Belgium, it achieved more success in the fifty years after 1945 than during the thirty years before it. Of course, critics stUl note, as does Karl-Egon Lonne in his essay, that postwar Christian Democrats StiU leaned toward conservatism. Lonne sees this in part as a result of the triumph of Jesuit personalist thought over Dominican Christian socialism. John PoUard also recounts the faUure of the ItaUan DCs left wing during the 1950's, or perhaps more exactly, the Party's reluctance to experiment. The ItaUan case, especiaUy, begs the need to carry the analyses past the mid-1960's and end with the catastrophe of the 1990's.

Some chapters maintain a strictly poUtical focus while others, particularly the one on the Netherlands by Paul Luykx, enrich the discussion with considerations of political Catholicism's social impact. The place of the Holy See, furthermore, is sometimes missing in the analyses. Although part of Conway's introduction addresses this, a separate essay, specificaUy on Rome and politics, might have added something to the collection. Furthermore, one wishes that an essay on Austria could have been included. The editors lament this in their introduction. And, because of eastern Europe's exceptional circumstances after 1945, that region receives no attention in this book.

FinaUy, one great plus in a collection like this is that it enables the student of one country to appreciate better the work accomplished by coUeagues "across borders." SoUd research on each country is amply displayed here by the wealth of notes to each chapter, and the reader benefits. These footnotes, alone, in Buchanan's and Conways's admirable book wiU keep this student occupied for a long time.

Roy Domenico

The University of Scranton

From Malines to ARCIC: The Malines Conversations Commemorated. Edited by A. Denaux in coUaboration with J. Dick. [Bibliotheca Ephemeridum Theologicarum Lovaniensium, CXXX.] (Leuven, Belgium: Leuven University Press/Uitgeverij Peeters. 1997. Pp. ix, 317. BF. 1,800 paperback.)

This volume, comprising essays in English or in French, is the outcome of a commemoration of the five conversations between a few Catholic and Anglican theologians that took place in Malines under the responsibUity of Cardinal Désiré Mercier between 1921 and 1926. This, however, is the topic of Part I: it includes a historical survey of the conversations, by Emmanuel Lanne, two texts presented during the conversations, notably Lambert Beauduin's paper, "The Anglican Church, United, Not Absorbed" (1925), a Report on the meetings (1927), an annotated bibliography by John Dick, in which his volume The Malines Conversations Revisited (1989) occupies a surprising amount of space, and an essay on "Ecumenical Contacts between Belgium and England since the Malines Conversations," by Adelbert Denaux.

Part II examines the dialogues that foUowed Vatican CouncU II, namely, the work of ARCIC (AngUcan-Roman Catholic International Commission>I (1969-1981) and -II (since 1981), on the assumption that they were made possible largely by the experience of Malines. This section is, however, unequal. "A Brief History of ARCIC," by Denaux, is more complete and exact for ARCIC-II, of which the author became a member in 1993, than for ARCIC-I. The Preparatory Commission, with its three meetings (1967-1968), receives only fifteen lines, is not analyzed, and its membership is not even indicated. Nonetheless, its Malta Report (1968) set the perspective, methodology, and ecclesiology of ARCIC-I. The main dUficulties and tensions of the dialogue are passed over. The contribution of national dialogues to the international commission is overstated. The Usting of the titles or topics of essays presented at the meetings is highly selective, and the membership of some subcommissions is missing. Incidentally, ARCIC, I or II, never met at "Casa Cardinale Piazzo" (Venice), as reported six times, but at Casa Cardinale Piazza. One point seems to be ignored: When they gathered at Windsor Castle in 1981, most of the participants had no idea that this would be their last meeting; in 1980 they had been assured that there was no reason for their commission not to continue for several more years! Thus the Final Report was not a planned document, but the result of abruptly ending a dialogue that had momentum for much more.

These shortcomings are happUy countered in two papers by members of ARCIC-I, the AngUcan Christopher Hill, and Jean-Marie Tillard, who both present a global vision. Several ceremonial addresses given at the commemoration follow. A Ust of participants, mostly Belgian, foUows. Apart from TiUard, bishops Clark, Duprey and HiU, the surviving members of ARCIC-I were not even invited!

Part III comprises an extensive bibliography of ARCIC Missing, however, is Pro and Con on Ordination of Women. Report and Papers from the Anglican-Roman Catholic Consultation (1975; pp. 114).

On the whole, a disappointing book, redeemed by two exceUent papers.

George H. Tavard

Assmption Center
Brighton, Massachusetts

Los bienes de los jesuítas: Disolución e incautación de la Compañía de Jesús durante la Segunda República. By Alfredo Verdoy. (Madrid: Editorial Trotta. 1995. Pp. 422.)

This is the first detaUed study of the Spanish Republic's 1932 dissolution of the Society of Jesus and the nationalization of its property. Father Verdoy, a Jesuit historian, has mined the Jesuit and government archives to produce a sub-

stantial work that succeeds in dispelling much of the myth and conjecture about the controversial events surrounding the Spanish Jesuits and their property in the years before the outbreak of the Civil War in 1936.

The book is divided into two parts. The first part is an examination of the Spanish Jesuits in the years before the proclamation of the Republic in AprU, 1931,up to the decree dissolving the order in January, 1932. The statistics are aU there: at the beginning of 1931, there were 3001 Jesuits in eighty communities; they operated twenty-one colegios teaching 7,000 students along with 5,500 students at the Jesuit-run universities; they pubUshed some forty periodicals; and thousands of poor students were taught by Jesuit-sponsored groups. Despite the work they did with the poor, the Jesuits were hopelessly compromised by their identification with the monarchy and Primo de Rivera's dictatorship. They were victims of anticlerical violence even before AprU, 1931: one of their residences in Gijón was burned in 1930, and their response was to enroll some of the Jesuit brothers in the local militia to get training to prevent further attacks, an action that was countermanded by Jesuit General Ledochowski in Rome.

Once the Republic was proclaimed, there was more anticlerical incendiarism; the Jesuits knew that dissolution or expulsion was coming, and they began to scramble to sell their property or hide it. The Constitution of 1931, which became law in December of that year, caUed for the legal dissolution of the Jesuits and a prohibition on their teaching, along with the confiscation of their property, which was to be used for educational and charitable ends. The decree of dissolution was enacted in January, 1932, and a special commission, the Patronato, was set up to handle the confiscation of all Jesuit property. Most of the Jesuits left then· residences to stay with other religious or with friends, while seminarians were sent abroad to continue their studies.

AU of this activity, along with the arguments in the constitutional debates, the views of individual Jesuit provincials, and those of the anticlerical politicians and press are given full exposition in the first half of the book. It is the second half that commands the greater interest, for it detaUs the operations of the Patronato.

The Patronato found that it was no simple task to confiscate Jesuit property. Much of the property—schools, residences, some stocks in the Madrid electrical company, and a few rural estates—was held either by associations of alumni with corporate standing at law (and therefore did not legaUy belong to the Jesuits), or else was mortgaged to the hUt, or owned by diocesan authorities, or owned by "straw men" to whom the Jesuits had turned their property over to hold for them. By law, the Patronato became the owner of aU Jesuit property and therefore became liable for the mortgage payments the Jesuits had owed on their property. The Patronato became embroiled in legal disputes with the associations of alumni who owned the schools, and it spent much of its time trying to track down the actual owners of property. By October of 1933, when

new elections returned a conservative majority to the Cortes, which now became dependent on the votes of the Catholic CEDA, the Patronato had nationalized some 141 million pesetas worth of Jesuit property, about two-thirds of what the author estimates total Jesuit property to have been worth at the time.

The CEDA-Radical governments of 1933-1935 put a halt to the confiscations, and the Patronato devoted most of its time after 1933 returning property to the associations and straw men; a 1934 decree limited the confiscations to property actuaUy held by the Jesuits, and it ended the legal existence of the Patronato, turning over its activities to the Treasury Ministry. The anticlerical press was outraged, but the returns continued until the Popular Front government was elected in February, 1936. The new anticlerical government ordered the confiscations to continue unabated, but before much action could be taken, the war broke out in July, 1936.

This is a fine study, replete with weU-documented examples from the different Jesuit provinces. On balance, the author says that the confiscations did not achieve their desired end: very few chUdren benefited from the transformed Jesuit schools; only in Barcelona did the municipality put the schools to good use. In the end the chief result of the action against the Jesuits was to contribute to turning Catholics against the RepubUc.

José M. Sánchez

Saint Louis University

Julius Kardinal Döpfner: 26. August 1913 bis 24.JuIi 1976. Edited by Klaus Wittstadt. [Würzburger Diözesangeschichtsblätter, Band 58.] (Würzburg: Bistum Würzburg. 1996. Pp. 234.)

By any Standards, Cardinal Julius Döpfner was one of the most prominent and influential leaders of the Catholic Church in postwar Germany. Born in 1913 Ui the Franconian village of Hausen, he studied phUosophy and theology in Würzburg and Rome, where he was ordained to the priesthood for his native diocese of Würzburg in 1939 and obtained a doctorate from the Gregorian University in 1941 with a dissertation on the relationship of nature and grace according to John Henry Newman. After brief service in two parishes and on the staff of the diocesan seminaries, he was appointed Bishop of Würzburg, not yet thirty-five years old, in 1948. In later years, he became Bishop of Berlin (1957-1961), Cardinal (1958), and Archbishop of Munich-Freising (1961-1976). Döpfner also served as one of the four moderators of the Second Vatican Council from 1963 to 1965, as President of the West German Bishops' Conference from 1965 untU his death in 1976, and as President of the Joint Synod of the West German Dioceses from 1972 to 1975. His efforts in the latter two capacities made him the chief spokesman for the Catholic Church in Germany in the tumultuous decade immediately foUowing the Second Vatican Council.

The work under review, edited by Klaus Wittstadt of the University of Würzburg and pubUshed to commemorate the twentieth anniversary of Döpfner's death, contains five disparate pieces of widely varying length and importance. In an opening section (pp. 9-100), Antonia Leugers edits forty-seven previously unpublished letters which Döpfner wrote between 1932 and 1944 to his close friend and former fellow student Georg Angermaier; Angermaier's letters to Döpfner have not been preserved, and most passages referring to the famUies of Döpfner and Angermaier have been deleted. Written chiefly from Italy, Döpfner's candid letters reflect notable seU-perception, maturing spirituality, and frequently critical assessment of the strengths and limitations of educational methods at the Gregorian University and the German CoUege. Interest in theological and religious matters, especially those concerning the place of individuals within the Church, is evident throughout. Noteworthy in view of recent theological discussions are Döpfner's comment that "our image of God has surely become too masculine" (p. 59) and his support of balanced use of feminine analogies for God (pp. 58-59). Perusal of this correspondence sheds considerable light on Döpfner's personal and theological development in a formative period of his Ufe.

In the foUowing section (pp. 101-125), misleadingly entitled "Bischof JuUus Döpfner und die Diözese Würzburg," the editor provides an occasionaUy hagiographical overview of Döpfner's entire Ufe. After a short review (pp. 127-134) of Döpfner's contribution to Vatican CouncU II by Paul-Werner Scheele, the current Bishop of Würzburg, Wittstadt studies other aspects of the same topic, with particular attention to Döpfner's suggestions to the newly elected Pope Paul VI on the continuation of the Council (pp. 135-150). Reproduced as an appendix to Wittstadt's article are the cover letter and first page of these suggestions, the first page of a memorandum on Paul VTs coronation, and the letter of Cardinal Amleto Cicognani informing Döpfner of his appointment as a moderator of the CouncU (pp. 152-156). The remainder of the volume (pp. 158-234) contains previously published material assembled by Ernst Tewes, AuxUiary Bishop of Munich-Freising and a close coUaborator of Döpfner; included are various addresses of Döpfner and texts by Tewes and other associates of Döpfner on selected aspects of his IUe and work.

As is evident from this summary, this coUection wiU primarily be of interest to students of Cardinal Döpfner's Life, though some sections are also informative on the history of Vatican CouncU II. Some printing errors should be noted: notes 73 (Ui part) and 76-79 of Wittstadt's first contribution are Incorrect, and one should read "fruchtbar" rather than "furchtbar" in his description of Döpfner's goal in applying divine revelation to the work of the Church (p. 120).

John P. Galvin

The Catholic University of America

Yöurs Is a Precious Witness: Memoirs ofJews and Catholics in Wartime Italy. By Margherita Marchione. (Mahwah, New Jersey: PauUst Press. 1997. Pp. x, 260. $14.95.)

Margherita Marchione, a Filippini Sister, has written an engaging book focusing on CathoUcs and the Holocaust. She has appropriately dedicated it to the late Jesuit historian, Robert A. Graham, who did much to correct the false interpretation of the Vatican's role with respect to the Jews during World War II (see "Epilogue"). Quite rightly, she notes (p. 57) the faUure of those, including John E Morley in his study, Vatican Diplomacy and the Jews During the Holocaust (1980), to make use of aU four volumes of the Holy See's documents relating to its humanitarian efforts in World War II.

The book is divided into three parts. After introducing the story of the Holocaust in Italy, Marchione reviews its major developments. Then she focuses on Italian Jews and what was done for them in Rome, Milan, Ferrara, Assisi, Genoa, Florence, and Venice. At the same time, she surveys the work of the FUippini Sisters, the Redemptorists, the FatebenefratelU, the Salesians, and the Sisters of Zion, and reviews the policies of the Vatican and the actions of Pope Pius XII. Lastly, the author deals with the aftermath of the Holocaust in the testimonials from Jews about the role of the Catholic Church and Pius XII, in the relations between CathoUcs and Jews, and in the documentation relating to what is covered in the text.

Marchione's study reveals some interesting detaUs: the various ways in which Italians risked their lives (and institutions) to save Jews; the view that San Saba in Trieste had the only operational gas chamber in a concentration camp outside of Poland (pp. 99 and 130); the ways of providing refugee Jews with documents, food, shelter, and even opportunities to exercise their reUgious beUefs and practices; the roles which religious brothers, sisters, and priests, in addition to certain cardinals and bishops, played Ui helping Jews; and the Nazi massacres of Italians in Tuscany.

This reviewer's own study, The Jesuits and the Third Reich (1989), had suggested that religious orders and congregations constitute a fertile area for more studies about Catholics and the Holocaust. Within the parameters of her book's subtitle, Marchione has contributed markedly to such a development. However, the list of religious groups compUed by Renzo De Felice and reprinted in her work (pp. 218-221) indicates that much more remains to be uncovered about Rome. If this is the case for one city, it is also true for the other cities surveyed in her book.

Perhaps Marchione's study may caU to mind such movies as Conspiracy of Hearts (I960), The Scarlet and the Black (1983), and The Assisi Underground (1984), in addition to such books as Michael O'CarroU's Pius XII (1980) and

Susan Zuccotti's The Italians and the Holocaust (1987). WhUe Marchione's work is an exceUent source for anyone wanting to learn more about the relationship of the Catholic Church and Pope Pius XII to the Jews in World War II, it is also a remarkable story of courageous CathoUcs, lay and reUgious, who risked their lives to save Jews during the Holocaust.

Vincent A. Lapomarda

College of the Holy Cross

Correction

Errors occurred in the address of the Reverend James Connelly, CS.C.,in the issue for April, 1998 (Vol. LXXXIV, No. 2, p. 370), where his appointment to the chairmanship of the committee organizing the spring meeting in 2002 at the University of Portland was announced. It should read: telephone: 503-943-7343; fax: 503-943-7399; e-mail: connelly@up.edu.

NOTES AND COMMENTS

Association News

At its meeting held in Seattle on January 8, 1998, the Executive Council of the American Catholic Historical Association gratefully accepted the invitation of VUlanova University and Cabrini College to hold its spring meeting on their campuses next year. The dates wiU be March 19-21, 1999- Thomas Greene wUl be the chairman of the organizing committee. Proposals for sessions or individual papers should be sent to Professor Greene by October 1, 1998, in care of the Department of History, VUlanova University, 800 Lancaster Avenue, VUlanova, Pennsylvania 19085-1699; telephone: 610-519-4677; fax: 610-519-6200.

At the same meeting the Executive CouncU also accepted with equal gratitude the invitation of the president of the University of Portland, the Very Reverend David T.Tyson, CS. C, to hold its spring meeting at his institution Ln 2002, when the university will be celebrating the centenary of its founding. The university was founded by the Archbishop of Portland, Alexander Christie, as Columbia University in 1901 and was confided to the direction of the Congregation of Holy Cross in 1902; Ui 1935 the name was changed to the University of Portland. The chairman of the organizing committee wUl be James ConneUy, C.S.C. The dates of the meeting will be March 22-23. Although no date for the submission of proposals has yet been fixed, members of the Association are welcome to write to Father ConneUy at any time in care of the Department of History, University of Portland, 5000 North Willamette Boulevard, Portland, Oregon 97203-5798; telephone: 503-283-7100; fax: conneUy@up.edu.

The Executive CouncU, moreover, decided to increase the dues in all categories as follows: for ordinary members forty doUars; for retired members (after twenty consecutive years of membership) thirty doUars; and for student members twenty-eight doUars. The fee for IUe membership wUl remain six hundred dollars untU June 30, 1998; beginning on July 1 it will be seven hundred and fifty. These increases were necessitated by the higher prices being charged by the company that prints the Catholic Historical Review, by increments in the salaries of the secretary in the editorial office and Ln the offices of the Catholic University of America Press, and by greater expenses for other things.

The president of the Association, David J. O'Brien, has appointed Jo Ann H. Moran and Jeffrey von Arx, SJ., both of Georgetown University, to the Committee on Program for the seventy-ninth annual meeting, which wUl be held in Washington, D.C, on January 8-10, 1999 (see ante LXXXIII [October, 1997], 819).

Conferences, Meetings, Institutes, Workshops

"Race and Gender in the Texas Catholic Church" was the theme of the annual meeting of the Texas CathoUc Historical Society, which was held in Austin on March 6, 1998. Papers were read by Juliana Barr, a doctoral candidate at the University of Wisconsin at Madison ("Body and Soul: Franciscan Attempts to Control Indian SexuaUty in Eighteenth-Century Texas"), and by Dedra McDonald, a doctoral candidate at the University of New Mexico ("Private Problems, Public Solutions: Fractured Families and the Church on New Spam's Far Northern Frontier").

One of the thirteen sessions on the program of the spring meeting of the American Society of Church History, which wiU be held on April 2-4, 1998, at the Florida State Conference Center, TaUahassee, is entitled "Catholics: On the Borders of Religious Identity." Under the chairmanship of Sandra Yocum Mize of the University of Dayton, Timothy Matovina of Loyola Marymount University will speak on "Public Ritual and Ethnocentric Identity at San Fernando's Cathedral, San Antonio, Texas"; CecUia Moor of the University of Dayton wUl read a paper entitled "Can a Catholic Be 'Black like me'? ChaUenges to African-American Conversion to CathoUcism; and Walter Gollar of Xavier University, Cincinnati, wUl speak under the title "Faith, FamUy, and Freedom in the African-American Experience of AntebeUum Kentucky."

More sessions on reUgious history than usual wiU be staged at the ninety-first annual meeting of the Organization of American Historians, which will take place in Indianapolis, Indiana, on April 2-5, 1998. In a session entitled "Boundaries of Cultural Acceptance and ReUgious Dissent in the Late 1960s," Andrew Moore of the University of Florida will read a paper on "Alabama and Georgia CathoUcs and Vatican II: The Boundaries of Cultural Acceptance and ReUgious Dissent," and Samuel J. Thomas of Michigan State University wUl read one on "Boundaries of Dissent and Due Process: A Case Study in American Catholic Leadership." Una Cadegan of the University of Dayton wiU preside at the session.

At the twenty-third annual Sewanee Mediaeval Colloquium, which wUl be held at the University of the South on April 3-4, 1998 (see ante, LXXXIII [July, 1997], 544-545), Rosamund McKitterick of Newnham College, Cambridge, wUl deUver a lecture at one of the plenary sessions on "The Reading of History at St Amand in the Ninth and Tenth Centuries." In another plenary session Brian Stock of the University of Toronto and the CoUège de France wiU speak on "Reading and SeU-Knowledge in the Middle Ages: Some Thoughts on Augustine and His Influence." In a session on "Reading and the Religious life" papers wiU be read by John V Fleming of Princeton University on "Some Pages from the Franciscan Book"; by Marylou Ruud of the University of West Florida on "Reading Miracles at Sempringham: GUbert's Instructive Cures"; and by Mary Jane Morrow of Duke University on "Participation in Monastic literary Culture: Latin Literacy among Four EngUsh Benedictine Nunneries."

The forty-sixth study week of the Centro ItaUano di Studi suU'Alto Medioevo, which wUl take place at Spoleto on April 16-21, 1998, will revolve around the theme "Ideologie e pratiche del reimpiego nell'Alto Medioevo." Among the numerous papers that will be presented are "Les remplois dans le domaine Uturgique à l'époque carolingienne: baptême et pénitence," by Jean Chellini of the Université d'Aix-MarseUle III; "Le remploi en hagiographie: une 'lois du genre' qui étouffe l'originalité?" by Marc van Uytfanghe of the University of Ghent; and ". . . ut haec aedes Christo Domino in Ecclesiam consecretur. Il riuso cristiano di ediflci antichi tra tarda antichità e alto medioevo," by GiseUa Cantino Wataghin of the University of Türin.

The Center for Early Modern History at the University of Minnesota wUl sponsor a research conference in recognition of the work of Stanford Lehmberg on May 1-3, 1998. The theme will be "State ReUgion and Folk BeUef in the Early Modern World." Conference registrants wUl receive copies of the papers three weeks in advance. The papers wUl be discussed at the conference, not read. The basic registration fee is $100. Further information may be requested of Debra Salata, Assistant Director, Center for Early Modern History, 715 Social Sciences Building, University of Minnesota, Minneapolis, Minnesota 55455; telephone: 612-625-6303; e-mail: CEMH@tc.umn.edu.

In conjunction with the Humanities and Social Science Foundation of Canada Congress, the Canadian CathoUc Historical Association wUl hold its next annual meeting at the University of Ottawa on May 28-29, 1998. AU the papers will deal with Catholics in Canada. Copies of the program may be procured from Margaret Sanche at St. Thomas More College, 1437 College Drive, Saskatoon, Saskatchewan S7N 0W6, Canada; telephone: 306-966-8914 or -8900; fax: 306-966-8904; e-mail: sanchem@sask.usask.ca.

A workshop on "The Study of the Bible from Isidore to Remigius of Auxerre" wUl be conducted on June 5-6, 1998, at the Atelier Médio-Latin, Université de Paris FV-Sorbonne, and the Institut d'Études Augustiniennes. Inquiries will be answered by Michael Gorman, whose address is Via Quadronno 9, 20122 Milano, Italy.

An interdisciplinary conference on "Early Medieval Rome and the Christian West" will take place at the University of St Andrews, Scotland, on June 11-15, 1998. Further information may be obtained from Elsie Johnstone in care of the School of History, St Katherine's Lodge, University of St Andrews, St Andrews, FUe KY16 9AL, Scotland.

To celebrate the opening of an exhibition entitled "Religion and the Founding of the American Republic," which will take place in the recently restored Thomas Jefferson BuUding of the Library of Congress on June 4, 1998, a symposium wiU be held in the Coolidge Auditorium of the same building on June 18 and 19 under the chaUmanship of Jaroslav Pelikan of Yale University. Among the scholars presenting papers wUl be Thomas E. Buckley, SJ., of the Jesuit School of Theology at Berkeley ("Separating Church and State in Nineteenth-Century

VUginia"), Mark A. Noll of Wheaton CoUege ("RepubUcanism and Religion: The American Exception"), and Michael Novak of the American Enterprise Institute ("Trie Influence of Christianity and Judaism on the Founders"). After it is closed in Washington on August 22, the exhibition wiU be mounted Ui other venues around the country.

A Summer Humanities Institute for College Teachers entitled "Redefining the Sacred in Early Modern England" will be directed at the Folger Institute by Richard D. McCoy, professor of English at Queens CoUege and the Graduate School and University Center at the City University of New York, from June 22 to July 31, 1998. The institute wUl explore the varieties of religious thought and experience in the EngUsh Reformation along with current scholarly approaches to the subject, giving special emphasis to the adaptation of primary materials from the Folger Library's coUections for instructional purposes. Among the members of the visiting faculty wiU be Patrick Collinson, Regius Professor of Modern History Emeritus in the University of Cambridge, Eamon Duffy, dUector of studies Ui theology at Magdalene CoUege, Cambridge, Christopher Haigh, lecturer in modern history in the University of Oxford, Peter Lake, professor of history in Princeton University, and Diarmaid MacCuUoch, lecturer in the Faculty of Theology in the University of Oxford. Although enrollment in the conference is open, preregistration is necessary. Information may be obtained by telephone from Martha Fay at 202-675-0333 or by e-mail at institute@folger.edu.

The theme of the first York Interdisciplinary Alcuin Conference, which wUl be held in York on July 17-19, 1998, is "Alcuin of York and Court Culture." Requests for copies of the program should be addressed to Louise Harrison at the Centre for Medieval Studies, University of York, King's Manor, York YOl 2EP, England.

A second Oxford International Newman Conference wiU be held at Oriel College, Oxford, on August 10-13, 1998. The theme wUl be "Newman and the Word." The convenors are Ian Ker of the University of Oxford and Terrence Merrigan of the CathoUc University of Leuven. Some of the keynote speakers will be Gabriel Daly, Louis Dupré, Ian Ker, Fergus Kerr, Allster McGrath, Terrence Merrigan, William Myers, David Tracy, and T. R. Wright. Papers, which may require from twenty to thirty minutes for oral presentation, must be submitted in duplicate by June 1, 1998, to the conference coordinator, PriscUla Frost, at 10B Littlegate Street, Oxford OXl IQT, England; telephone: +44(0) 1865 794727; fax: +44(0) 1865 794695; e-mail: enquiries.oxconf@pop3.hiway.co.uk.

The thirty-first Kölner Mediävistentagung wiU be devoted to the theme "Geistesleben im 13. Jahrhundert—Neue Perspektiven." The dates wiU be September 8-11, 1998. Those who wish to take part should write to the Thomas-Institut der Universität zu Köln, Universitätsstrasse 22, D-50923 Köln, Germany.

Manuscripta will host the twenty-fifth Saint Louis Conference on Manuscript Studies on October 9-10, 1998, in the Pius XII Memorial Library at Saint Louis University. Papers, limited to twenty minutes for oral presentation, will be ac-

cepted in such areas of manuscript and textual research as codicology, palaeography, papyrology, epigraphy, illuminations, textual criticism, cataloguing formats, and computer applications. Abstracts of papers, up to 200 words in length, should be submitted by August 1. Correspondence concerning papers and attendance may be addressed to the Conference Committee in care of Manuscripta, Pius XII Memorial Library, Saint Louis University, 3650 Lindell Boulevard, Saint Louis, Missouri 63 108-3302; e-mail: ermatcj@slu.edu.

The twenty-thUd International Conference on Patristic, Medieval, and Renaissance Studies wiU be held on October 9-11,1 998, at VUlanova University. At the plenary sessions James McEvoy wiU speak on Robert Grosseteste, and Alfred Ivry on Averroes. Those who wish to participate should write to the director of the conference, Thomas A. Losoncy, in care of the Department of Philosophy, VUlanova University, 800 Lancaster Avenue, VUlanova, Pennsylvania 19085-1699; telephone: 610-519-4690; fax: 610-519-4639.

The 900th anniversary of the birth of Hildegard of Bingen will be commemorated at two conferences this autumn (besides the one reported «rafejanuary, page I60). The first, scheduled for October 23-24, wUl take place at California State University, San Bernardino. A special concert of Hildegard's music wiU be performed by Anonymous 4. AU related fields of study are welcome. Abstracts of papers should be sent by July 1, 1998, to Lanny Fields in care of the Department of History, CaUfornia State University, 5500 University Parkway, San Bernardino, CalUornia 92407; telephone: 909-880-5524; fax: 909-880-5985; e-maU: lfieIds@wUey.csusb.edu or criggs@wUey.csusb.edu.

The other conference, entitled "The Greenest Branch: A Conference on the 900th Anniversary of the Birth of Hildegard of Bingen," wiU be held on November 5-8, 1998. The sessions wUl be located at St. Michael's College, Trinity College of Vermont, and the University of Vermont in Burlington. Interested persons should telephone Shyla Foster at 802-425-5229.

The Abbey of Alcalá la Real, which was a singular reUgious and administrative enclave in the ecclesiastical geography of Spain from its foundation in 1341 to its suppression Ln 1851, wiU be the site of the second Jornadas de Historia, which will be held on November 12-14, 1998. The theme wül be "Geografía e Instituciones Eclesiásticas y Mentalidades Religiosas"; only papers dealing with the history of the abbey, its abbots, or cabildos seculares nullius will be accepted. This event wiU be the first step in the plans of the City of Alcalá la Real to establish itseU as a center of study of church history. Anyone who desires to present a paper should communicate with the Secretaría de las Jornadas, Ayuntamiento de Alcalá la Real, Area de Cultura, Plaza Arcipreste de Hita, 23680 Alcalá la Real, Jaén, Spain; telephone: 953 / 58 00 00; fax: 953 / 58 22 27: e-mail: alcalareal@futurnet.es.

The Accademia di San Carlo will hold its dies academicus on November 20-21, 1998, on the theme "Cultura e religione neUa MUano del '600."The program is not yet fixed, but interested persons may at any time send requests for a

copy to the secretary, P. Fedele MereUi, at the Accademia, Piazza Pio XI, 2, 20123 Milano, Italy.

The next annual meeting of the PoUsh American Historical Association wiU be held in Washington, D.C, on January 7-9, 1999. Proposals for papers should be submitted to the vice-president of the Association, Thomas S. Gladsky, at 1026 Williamsburg Drive, Charleston, IUinois 61920; e-maU: G1026wd@advant.com.

Siena CoUege wiU sponsor the fourteenth annual interdisciplinary conference on World War II on June 3-4, 1999. With the title "World War II—A Sixty-Year Perspective," the focus wiU be on the year 1939, although papers dealing with broad issues of earlier years wUl be accepted; aU proposals, nevertheless, should be rooted in, or show relevance to, the anniversary year. Proposals for papers should be submitted by November 15, 1998, to the codUector of the conference, Thomas O. KeUy, II, in care of the Department of History, Siena CoUege,515 Loudon Road, Loudonville, New York 1221 1-1462; telephone: 518-783-2512; fax: 518-786-5052; e-maU: legendziewic@siena.edu.

Commemoration

The 250th anniversary of the founding of the Mission of San Francisco Xavier de Horcasitas was commemorated on October 4, 1997, with a Mass celebrated by the Most Reverend John McCarthy, Bishop of Austin, Ui whose diocese the mission was located. It was founded by Franciscans from Querétaro at a site on the San Gabriel River near RockwaU and was one of three missions in the area known coUectively as the San Xavier Missions. A presidio was built nearby to protect the missions. The site was verified by an archaeologist, Kathleen GUmore, through investigations carried out in 1967 and 1983. The land is now part of a working ranch, but the owner has permitted the construction of a permanent rock altar on a concrete slab surrounded by a rock waU with an iron gate; Mass is offered there annually, but the site is closed for the rest of the year.

Causes of Saints

On November 9, 1997, in St. Peter's Square Pope John Paul II beatified two bishops. One was Giovanni Battista Scalabrini (1839-1905), Bishop of Piacenza and founder of the Missionaries of St. Charles, whose IUe is so weU known, especiaUy for his work on behatf of the Italian immigrants in the New World, that it need not be sketched here. Trie other was Vilmos Apor (1892-1945), Bishop of Györ in Hungary. The sixth chUd of a noble Hungarian famUy, he was born in Segesvár and reared by his mother, since his father died while he was stiU a child. As a seminarian he studied theology at the Jesuit faculty in Innsbruck and received a doctorate. He was ordained a priest for the Diocese of Nagyvárad (now Oradea Mare in Romania) in 1915 and served in a parish in Gyula, where

he distinguished himself by his love of the poor; he established a coUege and invited religious congregations to the city. In 1941 Pope Pius XII appointed him Bishop of Györ. While World War II raged, he strove to aUeviate the distress and suffering of his people. He energeticaUy devoted himseU to strengthening the moral and religious education of youth. When racial laws were enacted in the country he defended the victims of injustice and raised his voice against the political authorities responsible for it. In writings and sermons he condemned persecution and brutal actions, thereby risking his own safety. During bombardments he immediately went to the aid of the victims. As the battle lines drew near, he sheltered refugees in his episcopal palace and withdrew to a small room. He was especiaUy eager to protect women who were threatened by the advancing Soviet Army. On Good Friday afternoon in 1945, when some drunken Russian soldiers arrived and demanded access to the ceUarT irTwhich approximately one hundred women and girls had taken refuge, with the intention of taking them to the military barracks, Bishop Apor refused them entry; after a long altercation a Russian officer shot him in the forehead, hand, and abdomen. Though he feU to the ground, the soldiers departed, leaving the women untouched. He died of peritonitis on Easter Monday, April 2. When the Communists seized power, the crypt of the CarmeUte church in which he was buried was closed lest he be venerated as a hero and martyr. After the change of government a splendid tomb was built for him in a chapel of the cathedral of Györ, where the faithful Ught votive candles, deposit flowers, and pray for his canonization.

The cause for beatification of Father Michael J. McGivney (1852-1890), founder of the Knights of Columbus, was officiaUy opened on December 18, 1997, with a ceremony in the chancery office of the Archdiocese of Hartford. Archbishop Daniel A. Cronin had been notified by the Congregation for the Causes of Saints that Father McGivney's cause might proceed; this announcement was made several months after the American bishops unanimously agreed, on June 19, 1997, that it was appropriate to initiate the cause (see ante, LXXXIII [October, 1997], 822). The postulator of the cause, Gabriel B. O'DonneU, O.P., an assistant pastor at St. Mary Parish Ln New Haven, said at the ceremony: "Father McGivney was renowned for his priestly virtue and his concern for the families of immigrant working men in the second hatf of the nineteenth century." Lf Father McGivney is ever canonized, he wiU be the first diocesan priest of the United States to be declared a saint.

Grants

The Institute for the Study of American Evangelicals has announced a project of using hymn-texts as a source for illuminating American Protestant history. It is seeking proposals for competitive grants of $1,500 for article-length papers that study some aspect of the 300 most often republished hymns from approx-

imately 200 major hymnals and tunebooks (1737-1960), a list of which wUl be supplied upon request. Proposals and supporting materials must be received by AprU 30, 1998. Information about application may be obtained from the Institute at Wheaton College, Wheaton, Illinois 60187; telephone: 630-752-5437; e-maU: isae@wheaton.edu.

Awards

At its annual meeting for 1997 the Canadian Catholic Historical Association conferred the George Edward Clerk Award on Terrence Murphy, professor of history in Memorial University of Newfoundland, St. John's. According to the citation on the medallion, Professor Murphy was honored "for exceUence in teaching, research, scholarship, and editorial work and in furthering the understanding of religious history in Canada."

At the annual meeting of the Society for ItaUan Historical Studies held in Seattle in January, 1998, its Award and Citation Committee conferred the 1998 "Citation to a Senior Scholar" for achievement over the course of a career on Paul Grendler, who has retired from the University of Toronto. RecaUing his six books, more than fifty articles, and innumerable book reviews, the Committee wrote: "His works have made an immense contribution to our understanding of the Italian Renaissance, of Humanism, of the Church, and of education."

Research Program

The Cushwa Center for the Study of American CathoUcism at the University of Notre Dame has announced a new program of research entitled "CathoUcism in Twentieth-Century America." The project seeks to integrate the experiences and contributions of Catholics more fuUy into the narratives of American history, to enhance coUaboration between historians of Catholicism and other American historians and social scientists, and to promote the study of Catholicism by graduate students and by established scholars working outside the field. For these purposes the Cushwa Center wUl support innovative and carefully conceived research projects that examine the various relations between Catholicism and American society in the twentieth century. The project wUl fund research in two broad areas of inquiry. The "public presences" of CathoUcism in the United States and the historical experiences of Catholic women, lay and religious. In each area a working group of scholars, comprised of steering committee members and grant recipients, will convene on four occasions over the next three years in order to discuss and critique work Ln progress. Further information may be obtained from the director of the Cushwa Center, R. Scott Appleby, at 614 Hesburgh Library, University of Notre Dame, Notre Dame, Indiana 46556-5629; e-maU: cushwa.l@nd.edu.

Archives

According to a statement issued by the Vatican Press Office on January 14, the Congregation for the Doctrine of the Faith has announced with the approval of Pope John Paul II that it will aUow scholars greater access to its hitherto closed archives. The holdings include files dating back to the Roman Inquisition that were transferred to the Sacred Congregation of the Holy Office when it was founded by Pope Paul III in 1542. However, not aU the files transported to Paris by order of Napoleon Bonaparte were returned to Rome. The archives consist of about 4,500 volumes, "of which," the announcement stated, "only a smaU part deals with heresy trials."These records are housed in the congregation's headquarters, the Palazzo del Sant'Uffizio, located south of the southern colonnade of the Piazza San Pietro on extraterritorial property, and are separate from the Secret Vatican Archives. In addition, the congregation wiU open the archives of the former Congregation of the Index, which was founded in 1571 and suppressed in 1917 by Benedict XV, who transferred all its powers to the Holy Office. "The history of the censorship of books and of theories throughout these centuries deserves special mention," the statement said. The doctrinal congregation has documents of its own dealing with official examinations of writings in addition to holding the entire archive of the Congregation of the Index.

Although some of the records have been avaUable for consultation since 1991, the possibUity was not publicized; the rules for access were strict, and only very few scholars actuaUy asked to consult the documents. According to the new rules, the archives are open to qualified researchers with a university degree "who are associated with university institutions or institutes of higher research, with no distinction of country, religious faith or thought." Only a letter of presentation from an academic or ecclesiastical authority which attests to the scientific and personal honesty of the scholar wiU be required. Requests wiU be considered from scholars wishing to examine archival material dating up to the end of the pontificate of Leo XIII (1903). In an interview with the Catholic newspaper Avvenire, Romeo De Maio, professor of Renaissance history in the Federico II University at Naples, said that the new rules mark a changed attitude of the congregation toward scholars and a recognition of the value of research, even U its main purpose is not to defend the Church. In another interview, Franco Cardini, a professor of history in the University of Florence, said that researchers will be forced to admit that a large part of the "black legend" surrounding the Church is just that—a legend; he added, "Precise legislation existed which safeguarded the defendants. That does not mean, however, that there were not judicial errors and abuses."

As part of its new access poUcy, the Congregation for the Doctrine of the Faith announced the publication of a series of archival materials. The first volume, aUeady published, is titled "The Validity of Anglican Orders" and includes documents from the theological commission formed by Leo XIII; the investigation resulted in the apostolic letter Apostolicae curae in 1896.

The Vatican statement added that the Congregation for the Doctrine of the Faith intended to form an Association of Friends of the Archives to support the scientific, structural, and financial development of the archives.

The Vatican Library

After thirteen years of service Leonard E. Boyle, O.P., has retired as prefect of the Apostolic Vatican Library, and Raffaele Farina, S.D.B., has taken his place. During Father Boyle's tenure many changes occurred that made the coUections more accessible to scholars. The holdings were made avaUable through an online catalogue. He expanded the reach of the service to include the library collections of many of the national academies in Rome. URBS, as the network is known, is now a central source for finding research materials in many of the most important libraries in the city. The Vatican Library is the technical hub of this network, thanks to Father Boyle and his staff. He also launched a number of projects to make the manuscript holdings more accessible to the public. Through the Belser-Verlag the Library issued several fine reproductions of some of its most beautiful manuscript volumes. Working with IBM, Father Boyle was part of a larger effort to capture digital images of manuscripts and to make them available through world-wide networks. FinaUy, he promoted the compilation by WiUiam T. Sheehan, C.S.B., of a catalogue of the Library's incunabula and its publication. Father Boyle continues to reside in Rome as president of the Leonine Commission.

Don Raffaele Farina, a Salesian of Don Bosco, was secretary of the Pontifical Committee for Historical Sciences for several years and remains a member of it. From 1987 to 1991 he was under-secretary of the Pontifical Council for Culture, and from 1991 to 1997 he was rector of the Pontifical Salesian University in Rome. He is also a member of the Editorial Committee of the Librería Vaticana Editrice. Don Farina is the fifty-third prefect of the Vatican Library, although the title "prefect" was not used untU 1910; previously the title custode was used. The first custode was Demetrio Gauzzelli, who was appointed by Pope Sixtus IV on March 1, 1481, and remained in office untU March of 1510.

The catalogue of the incunabula in the coUections of the Vatican Library, compiled by William T. Sheehan, C.S.B., is entitled Bibliothecae Apostolicae Vaticanae Incunabula and comprises volumes 380, 381, 382, and 383 in the series Studi e Testi, published by the Vatican Library. Volume I contains an introduction which is really a history of the Ubrary and of its incunabula collections, and then the entries for the letters A-C Volume II contains the letters D-O, and Volume III, P-Z. Volume FV contains an "Index to Printers," concordances from the numbers assigned to the same editions of incunabula in other catalogues and Ubraries to the numbers assigned to them by Father Sheehan for the Vatican copies, and a bibliography of books or journal articles that have cited or referred to Vatican copies, as weU as an index to that bibliography by call number by which one can ascertain whether someone has written something about a

specific Vatican copy. The Vatican collection contains 7,926 volumes representing 5,205 editions; of these seventy-eight are printed on veUum, and 114 are catalogued with the manuscripts; in addition, there are some 350 duplicates (for a total of 8,276 volumes). The project was generously supported by the American Friends of the Vatican Library at every step of the way to publication.

Publications

In its issue for autumn, 1997, The Innes Review (Volume XLVIII, Number 2) continues its series of "Articles Marking the 1400th Anniversary of Columba's Death" (see ante, LXXXIV [January, 1998], 165). The new articles are "Res, tempus, locus, persona: Adomnán's Exegetical Method," by Thomas O'Loughlin (pp. 95-111), and "Dunkeld and the Origin of Scottish Identity," by Dauvit Brown (pp. 112-124).

The issue of Speculum for October, 1997 (Volume 72, Number 4), is devoted to the theme "Approaches to Early-Medieval Art." FoUowing an introduction by Lawrence Nees (pp. 959-969) there are seven articles: Anthony Cutler, "The Right Hand's Cunning: Craftsmanship and the Demand for Art in Late Antiquity" (pp. 971-994); Michael Ryan, "The Derrynaflan Hoard and Early Irish Art" (pp. 995-1017); Charles Barber, "The Truth in Painting: Iconoclasm and Identity in Early-Medieval Art" (pp. 1019-1036); Henry Maguire, "Magic and Money in the Early Middle Ages" (pp. 1037-1054); Celia Chazelle, "Archbishops Ebo and Hincmar of Reims and the Utrecht Psalter" (pp. 1055-1077); Cynthia Hahn, "Seeing and Believing: The Construction of Sanctity in Early-Medieval Saints' Shrines" (pp. 1079-1 106); and Werner Jacobsen, "Saints' Tombs Ui Frankish Church Architecture" (pp. 1 107-1 l43)There are also numerous plates.

The quatercentenary of the Edict of Nantes has been commemorated in the issue of the Bulletin de la Société de l'Histoire du Protestantisme Français for January-June, 1998 (Volume 144). Michel Grandjean and Bernard Roussel have coUected essays under the general heading "Coexister dans l'intolérance: GEdit de Nantes (1598)," as foUows: Grandjean, "Présentation" (pp. 7-14); I. La date de l'Édit: Jean-Louis Bourgeon, "La date de l'édit de Nantes: 30 avril 1598" (pp. 17-50); ?. Autour de l'Édit: Philip Benedict, "Les vicissitudes des églises réformées de France jusqu'en 1598" (pp. 53-73); Marianne Carbonnier-Burkard, "Les préambules des édits de pacification (1562-1598)" (pp. 75-92); Mario Turchetti, "L'arrière-plan politique de l'édit de Nantes, avec un aperçu de l'anonyme De la concorde de l'Estat. Par l'observation des Edicts de pacification (1599)" (pp. 93-114); Bernard Roussel, "Les synodes nationaux de 1594, 1596 et 1598: le dUficUe maintien d'une 'bonne union et intelligence' entre les églises réformées" (pp. 115-133); Beatrice NicoUer, "Édit de Nantes et traité de Vervins: une simultanéité fortuite?" (pp. 135-158); HL Négociateurs: Robert Descimon, "L'homme qui signa l'édit de Nantes: Pierre Forget de Fresnes (tl8 avrU 1610). Éléments de biographie" (pp. 161-1 74); Janine Garrisson, "Les grands du parti protestant et l'édit de Nantes" (pp. 175-186); Mitsuji Wada, "La représentation

des régions à l'assemblée générale protestante au 16e siècle: le cas de la province Saintonge-Aunis-Angoumois"(pp. 187-206); Hugues Daussy'Au coeur des négociations pour l'édit de Nantes: le rôle de Philippe Duplessis-Mornay" (pp. 207-224); Nicolas Fornerod, "L'édit de Nantes et le problème de la coexistence confessionneUe dans la pensée de PhUippe Duplessis-Mornay" (pp. 225-252); OUvier Fatio, "La vérité menacée. L'apologétique de PhUippe Duplessis-Mornay" (pp. 253-264); IV. Réception: Gabriel Audisio,"La réception de l'édit de Nantes en Provence (1598-1602)" (pp. 267-282); Marc Venard, "L'Église catholique bénéficiaire de l'édit de Nantes. Le témoignage des visites episcopales" (pp. 283-302); Françoise Chevalier, "Les dUficultés d'application de l'édit de Nantes d'après les cahiers des plaintes (1599-1660)" (pp. 303-320); Raymond A. Mentzer.'Tédit de Nantes et la chambre de justice du Languedoc" (pp. 321-338); Alain Talion, "Rome et les premiers édits de tolérance d'après la correspondence du nonce Santa Croce" (pp. 339-352); Bertrand Haan, "Les réactions du Saint-Siège à l'édit de Nantes" (pp. 353-368); V. Interprétations: Hubert Bost, "Élie Benoist et l'historiographie de l'édit de Nantes" (pp. 371-384); Guy Bedouelle,"De la thèse et de l'hypothèse: l'édit de Nantes et les catholiques français au 19" siècle" (pp. 385-398); Patrick Harismendy, "Un édit 'impensable' pour les historiens protestants? (1797-1948)" (pp. 399-414); David El Kenz,"Le 'service du Roy' contre le 'service de Dieu'?" (pp. 415-428); Gottfried Hammann, "Pour une lecture ecclésiologique et oecuménique de l'édit de Nantes" (pp. 429-446); Bernard Cottret, "Pourquoi l'édit de Nantes a-t-il réussi?" (pp. 447-461); VI. L' Europe des paix religieuses: Bernard Vogler, "Les protestants alsaciens et les paix de religion (1535-1648)" (pp. 465-469); ClaUe Gantet, "Une paix religieuse en 1648" (pp. 471-488); Olivier Christin, "L'Europe des paix de reUgion: semblants et faux-semblants" (pp. 489-505); and Solange Deyon and Patricia Guyot, "À propos de l'iconographie de l'édit de Nantes" (pp. 507-508).

The papers on the theme "PellegrUio Tibaldi pittore e architetto dell'età borromaica" that were presented at the study days November 8 and 9, 1996, under the auspices of the Accademia di San Carlo in MUan, have now been pubUshed in the eleventh volume (1997) of the Accademia's journal, Studia Borromaica, as follows: Sandro Benedetti, "Aspetti e connessioni neU'architettura deUa riforma cattolica tra Roma e MUano" (pp. 13-45); Marzia GiuUani, "Nuovi documenti per la biografía e la formazione cultúrale di Pellegrino Pellegrini" (pp. 47-69); Stefano Della Torre, "Elementi distintivi deU'architettura peUegriniana" (pp. 71-80); Maria Luisa Gatti Perer,"Un prototipo di 'artium concordia' tra Cinque e Seicento e l'evoluzione del Itnguaggio classico durante l'episcopato di Federico Borromeo" (pp. 81-107); Aurora Scotti,"Un disegno di architettura militare di PeUegrino Pellegrini e qualque riflessione a margine di alcuni fogU" (pp. 109-130); Adele Buratti Mazzotta,"L'architettura del PeUegrini tra teoría e rappresentazione" (pp. 131-151); T. Barton Thurber, "PeUegrino Tibaldi and the RebuUding of Cathedrals in Post-Tridentine Italy: The Planned Reconstruction of the Duomo of Vercelli" (pp. 153-166); Marco Navoni, "Tentativo di lettura liturgica-teologica delle 'Instructiones Fabricae' " (pp. 167-178); Francesco Ripishti,"Un

primo progetto per U nuovo battistero del Duomo di MUano" (pp. 179-192); and John Alexander, "Documentation of the Loggia dei Mercanti Ui Ancona, 1556- 1564" (pp. 193-238).

A guest editor, Roberto Rusconi, has gathered six articles on the theme "Santi della Chiesa neU'ItaUa contemporánea" for the issue of Cristianesimo nella storia for October, 1997 (Volume XVIII, Number 3). The authors and their titles are as foUows: Roberto Rusconi, "Fame di santità" (pp. 503-523); Francesco De Palma, "Le cause di beatificazione Ui Italia. Un approccio storico-statistico" (pp. 525-555); GiuUo Sodano,"La santità a Napoli nell'Ottocento, tra innovazioni e continuità" (pp. 557-578); Giovanni Maria Vian, "Papi e santi tra Rivoluzione francese e primo doppoguerra. Per una storia delle canonizzazioni tra Pio VII e Benedetto XV (1800-1922)" (pp. 579-606); Alberto Melloni,"La causa RoncalU. Origini di un processo canónico" (pp. 607-636); and SUvia Manganelli, "Un santo medico nella Napoli contemporánea. Alcune osservazioni sul caso di Giuseppe Moscati"(pp. 637- 657).

"SpirituaUty and Devotionalism" is the theme of the issue of U.S. Catholic Historian for fall, 1997 (Volume 15, Number 4). The following articles are published: Joseph P. Chinnici, O.F.M., "Culture and Prayer: Towards a History of Contemplation in the Catholic Community in the United States" (pp. 1-16); Cyprian Davis, O.S.B., et al., "No Crass, No Crown: The Journal of Sister Mary Bernard Deggs" (pp. 17-28); Ronald L. Sharps, "Black Catholic Gifts of Faith" (pp. 29-55); Steven M. Avella with Jeffrey Zalar, "Sanctity in the Era of Catholic Action:The Case of St. Pius X" (pp. 57-80); Margaret M. Reher, "Mission of America: John J. Burke in Peru" (pp. 81-93); Mary B. O'Brien and Patricia M. MUler,"A Woman of Vision: An Interview with the Founder of the GraU Movement in the United States" (pp. 95-105); and Mark Massa, S.J., "Young Man Merton: Erik Erikson, The Mountains of Purgatory, and the Post-War 'Catholic Revival' " (pp. 107-125).

Personal Notices

Joseph M. McShane, S.J., formerly of Fordham University, has been appointed president of the University of Scranton.

John W O'Malley, SJ., of the Weston Jesuit School of Theology, Cambridge, Massachusetts, has been elected a member of the American Philosophical Society. In March, 1998, Father O'Malley also became president of the Renaissance Society of America for a two-year term.

Obituaries

Anthony H. Deye passed away from congestive heart failure on January 21, 1998. Born in John's Hill, Kentucky, on August 28, 1912, he attended Covington

(Kentucky) Catholic High School, St. Gregory Seminary in Cincinnati, and the North American College in Rome. The experience of Fascism and Nazism in Europe made him committed to civU rights and education (especially the study of history) as means for improving human relations. Ordained on December 8, 1937, he returned to the United States and spent the next nine years in various associate pastor and chaplain posts as a priest of the Diocese of Covington, Kentucky. During this time he became a part-time history teacher and dean of students at St. Thomas More College (which merged into VLUa Madonna CoUege in 1945), earned an M.A. degree in history from the University of Cincinnati (1944), volunteered at an African American parish, and developed recreational programs for inner-city children. The last activity led to his appointment as director of the diocese's new Camp Marydale from 1947 to 1952.

Father Deye next spent four years in fuU-time graduate work at the University of Notre Dame. He returned as a full-time history instructor and academic dean at ViUa Madonna CoUege. In 1959 he finished his dissertation, "Archbishop John Baptist PurceU of Cincinnati: Pre-Civil War Years," and received his Ph.D. degree. His dissertation remains a very useful source of information. Father moved in 1963 to the diocese's St. Pius X Seminary to teach history, but continued through 1985 to do occasional adjunct work at ViUa Madonna College (renamed Thomas More CoUege in 1968). He was a member of the American Catholic Historical Association since 1943 and gave a presentation at its sixty-ninth annual meeting held in Cincinnati in 1988.

From 1970 to 1987 Father Deye returned to parish work. After retiring in 1987, he remained active in priestly work until moving into a nursing home in 1997. WhUe history always remained an important part of Father Deye's personal IUe, he was best known as the "conscience of the diocese," an activist for civil rights (he participated in Reverend Martin Luther King's Selma-to-Montgomery march in 1965), compassion for the poor, the elimination of pornography, and quaUty education. Many friends and former students wUl remember him for his humiUty, kindness, gentleness, and joy for Life.

John Cimprich

Thomas More College

Edward J. Malatesta, SJ., co-founder of the Ricci Institute for Chinese-Western Cultural History at the University of San Francisco, internationaUy known biblical scholar, and historian of the Church and Jesuits in China, died suddenly of a pulmonary embolism in Hong Kong on January 27, 1998,at the age of sixty-five. At the time he was completing his thirty-second journey to China.

Edward Malatesta was born on May 31, 1932, in Paterson, New Jersey. After graduating from Bellarmine CoUege Preparatory School in San Jose, he entered the Society of Jesus on August 14, 1948, at the Sacred Heart Novitiate in Los Gatos. He was ordained a priest at St.-Leu d'Esserent-sur-1'Oise in France on Sep-

tember 6, 1961. He took his final vows on August 8, 1965, at Alma CoUege in Los Gatos. He received numerous academic degrees: a B.A. in Latin and Greek from Santa Clara University in 1953, an M.A. in phUosophy from Gonzaga University Ui 1955; an S.T.L. from Les Fontaines, ChantUly, France; a diploma in biblical languages from the Institut Catholique de Paris; and a license and doctorate in Sacred Scripture from the Pontifical Biblical Institute in Rome Ln 1965 and 1975.

Father Malatesta first taught at St. Ignatius College Preparatory School in San Francisco. Later he was director of the international tertianship in Berkeley and a frequent guest lecturer at the University of San Francisco Summer Theology Program. He first gained renown as a biblical scholar. From 1966 to 1977 he was a professor of biblical spirituaUty at the Pontifical Gregorian University in Rome, specializing in the Letters of St. John.

In the late 1970's Father Malatesta made a mid-Ufe career change with permission of the Superior General of the Society of Jesus, Pedro Arrupe, who allowed him to pursue a Ufelong ambition—to conduct research on the Jesuits and the Church in China—on one condition, viz., that Father Malatesta learn Mandarin in two years. After intensive study of the language in CalUornia, China, and Taiwan, he worked from 1982 to 1984 on the China Jesuit History Project in Los Gatos with Father Francis Rouleau, SJ. In 1984 he co-founded the Institute for Chinese-Western Cultural History with the CalUornia Province of the Society of Jesus. In 1988 the Institute became the research arm of the University of San Francisco's Center for the Pacific Rim and a few years later was named after Father Matteo Ricci (1552-1610), pioneer ItaUan Jesuit missionary to China.

Barbara Bundy, executive director of the Center for the Pacific Rim, said: "Father Ed touched and enriched many lives in his brief and brilUant lUe. He had such a grand vision for the encounter between Christianity and culture in his beloved China—and he was always involved in literally dozens of projects at any one time, turning dreams into reaUties for many people. I treasure most his deep goodness and his indefatigable energy."

Father Malatesta was a member of the American Catholic Historical Association since 1984.

A funeral Mass was celebrated on February 18 in St. Ignatius Church in San Francisco; the interment was in Santa Clara Mission Cemetery in Santa Clara. Contributions may be made to the Edward J. Malatesta, SJ., Memorial Fund at the Ricci Institute.

Marlon Villa

University of San Francisco

PERIODICAL LITERATURE

general ajnd miscellaneous

Modernity and the Construction of Roman Catholicism. Joseph Komonchak. Cristianesimo nella stone, XVIII (June, 1997), 353-385.

La Edad Moderna y el problema de la secularización. Arsenio Ginzo Fernández. La Ciudad de Dios, CCX (May-Aug., 1997), 495-540.

L'évolution du CoUège des Cardinaux dans l'Église de la seconde moitié du XXe siècle. Aimé-Georges Martimort. Bulletin de Littérature Ecclésiastique, XCVIII (July-Sept., 1997), 251-260.

Devozioni dogali. Gino Benzoni. Studi Veneziani, N.S. XXXI (1996), 15-25.

Johann Adam SchaU von BeU und sein 400. Geburtsjubiläum 1992. Roman Mzlek,S.V.O.Archivun Historicum Societatis Iesu, IXVl (Jan.-June, 1997), 51-74.

Sisters in Doing the Truth: Dorothy Day and St. Thérèse of Lisieux. Peter CasareUa. Communio,XXTV (FaU, 1997), 468-498.

Origines et fondements du droit de la stablilité des ministres ordonnés dans l'Église d'Orient G"-Ve siècles). Bernard CaUebat. Bulletin de Littérature Ecclésiastique, XCVIII (July-Sept., 1997), 21 1-233.

La Constitutio Antoniniana e Io sviluppo deU'impero e deUa chiesa neU'età dei Severi. Enrico dal Covolo. Augustinianum, XXXVII (Dec, 1997), 303-309.

Der Kaiser mit dem Christogrammnimbus zur sUbernen Largitionsschale Valentinians in Genf. Achim Arbeiter. Antiquité Tardive, No. 5 (1997), 153-167.

Historicité et actualité des canons disciplinaires du concile d'Elvire. PhUippe Badot and Daniel De Decker. Augustinianum, XXXVII (Dec, 1997), 311-325.

Jérôme et le clergé du temps: idéaux et réalités. Pierre Hamblenne. Augustinianum,XXXVll (Dec, 1997), 351-410.

Virilité physique et sainteté féminine dans l'hagiographie orientale du IV= au VIIe siècle. N. Delierneux. .ßt-.??«#?«, LXVII (1, 1997), 179-243.

Julie, manichéenne d'Antioche (d'après la Vie de Porphyre de Marc le Diacre, ch. 85-91). Madeleine Scopello. Antiquité Tardive, No. 5 (1997), 187-209.

Le cause deUa decadenza del clero nel Dialogo sulla vita di Giovanni Crisostomo di Palladio. Enrico Cattaneo. Augustinianum, XXXVII (Dec, 1997), 333-349.

La vision du martyre de saint Hippolyte ou la mortification transfigurée: Prudence, Peristephanon 11. Géraldine Viscardi. Latomus, 56 (Apr.-June, 1997), 360-381.

Audientia episcopalis: Problematik zwischen Staat und Kirche bei Augustin. Kauko K. Riikas. Augustinianum, XXXVII (Dec, 1997), 459-481.

Sin, Citizenship, and the Salvation of Souls: The Impact of Christian Priorities on Late-Roman and Post-Roman Society. Sabine MacCormack. Comparative Studies in Society and History, 39 (Oct., 1997), 644-673.

Writing as Devotion: Hagiographical Composition and the Cult of the Saints in Theodoret of Cyrrhus and Cyril of Scythopolis. Derek Krueger. Church History, 66 (Dec, 1997), 707-719.

Il battistero paleocristiano di Piacenza. Paolo Piva. Antiquité Tardive, No. 5 (1997), 265-274.

Desperately Seeking Sidonius: The Realities of Life in Fifth-Century Gaul. John Percival. Latomus, 56 (Apr.-June, 1997), 279-292.

Sidoine Apollinaire pasteur d'âmes. Françoise Prévôt. Antiquité Tardive, No. 5 (1997), 223-230.

Die Usurpation des BasiUskos (475-476) im Kontext der aufsteigenden monophysitischen Kirche. Michael Redies. Antiquité Tardive, No. 5 (1997), 211-221.

Priscilianismo galaico y política antipriscilianista durante el siglo v. Josep VileUa Masana. Antiquité Tardive, No. 5 (1997), 177-185.

Two UnpubUshed Psychophelitic Taies. John Wortley. Greek, Roman, and Byzantine Studies, 37 (FaU, 1996), 281-300.

La monarquía visigoda y la Iglesia en Levante. Las raices de un país. Luis Ángel García Moreno. Hispania Sacra,XLlX (Jan.-June, 1997), 253-277.

Sobre el obispado pamplonés en época visigoda. Koldo Larrañaga Elorza. Hispania Sacra,XUX (Jan.-June, 1997), 279-317.

De nuevo en torno a los primeros siglos del obispado de Pamplona. Juan José Larrea. Hispania Sacra,XLlX (Jan.-June, 1997), 319-326.

El fantasma del Priscilianismo, Apringio de Beja y el Apocalipsis. Andrés Barcala. Hispania Sacra,XUX (Jan.-June, 1997), 327-348.

Le voyage de Damien d'Alexandrie vers Antioche puis Constantinople (579-580)—Motivations et objectifs. Phüippe Blaudeau. Orientalia Christiana Periodica, 63 Ql, 1997), 333-361.

Vers la naissance du purgatoire. Amnistie et pénitence dans le christianisme occidental de l'Antiquité tardive au Haut Moyen Age. Peter Brown. Annales, 52 (Nov.-Dec, 1997), 1247-1261.

Le parrainage, "l'hospitalité" et l'expansion du christianisme. Gabriel Hermann. Annales, 52 (Nov.-Dec, 1997), 1305-1338.

Christianity in Greater Syria: Surrender and Survival. J. L. Boojamra. Byzantion, LXVII (1, 1997), 148-178.

The Construction of Episcopal Sanctity in Early Anglo-Saxon England: The Impact of Venantius Fortunatus. Simon Coates. Historical Research, LXXI (Feb., 1998), 1-13.

Individual Anonymity and Collective Identity: The Enigma of Early Medieval Latin Theologians. Thomas O'Loughlin. Recherches de Théologie et Philosophie médiévales, LXFV (2, 1997), 291-314.

NapoUtains et Lombards aux VIIP-XP siècles. De la guerre des peuples a la "guerre des saints" en Italie du Sud. Thomas Granier. Mélanges de l'École française de Rome, Moyen Age, 108 (2, 1996), 403-450.

Strategie agiografiche altomedievali in un leggendario di Faifa. Eugenio Susi. Cristianesimo nella storia, XVIII (June, 1997), 277-302.

Letaldus of Micy and the Hagiographie Traditions of the Abbey of NouaUlé: The Context of the Delatio corporis S.Juniani. Thomas Head. Analecta BoIlandiana, 115 (3-4, 1997), 253-267.

Maria und das ottonisch-salische Königtum. Urkunden, Liturgie, Bilder. Ernst-Dieter Hehl. Historisches Jahrbuch, 117 (2, 1997), 271-310.

Proclamations of Power and Presence: The Setting and Function of Two Eleventh-Century Murals in the Lower Church of San Clemente, Rome. John Osborne. Mediaeval Studies, 59 (1997), 155-172 and 2 plates.

Réforme, reconquista, croisade. L'idée de reconquête dans la correspondance pontificale d'Alexandre II à Urbain IL Jean Flori. Cahiers de civilisation médiévale, 40 (Oct.-Dec, 1997), 317-335.

La construction d'une utopie: l'Empire de Prêtre Jean. HUário Franco Jr. Journal of Medieval History, 23 (Sept., 1997), 211-225.

La "Chanson de Roland" dans le décor des églises du XIP siècle. Deborah Kahn. Cahiers de civilisation médiévale, 40 (Oct.-Dec, 1997), 337-372.

Iglesia y violencia en torno a la idea de cruzada (siglo XII). Carlos de Ayala Martínez. Hispania Sacra, XLIX (Jan.-June, 1997), 349-361.

A Leper in Purple: The Coronation of Baldwin IV of Jerusalem. Stephen Lay. Journal of Medieval History',23 (Dec, 1997), 317-334.

Women on the Third Crusade. Helen Nicholson./owr««/ of Medieval History, 23 (Dec, 1997), 335-349.

Richard Lionheart: Bad King, Bad Crusader? Michael Markowski. Journal of Medieval History, 23 (Dec, 1997), 351-365.

Il vescovo Guido oppure i vescovi Guido? Cronotassi episcopale assisana e fonti francescane. Nicolangelo D'Acunto. Mélanges de l'Ecole française de Rome, Moyen Age, 108 (2, 1996), 479-524.

L'encadrement et l'instruction religieuse des fidèles d'après les statuts synodaux des diocèses de Genève et de Sion (XIIP au XVe siècle). Franco Morenzonl. Zeitschrift für Schweizerische Kirchengeschichte, 91 (1997), 7-37.

La courtoisie de François d'Assise. Influence de la littérature épique et courtoise sur la première génération franciscaine. Lise Battais. Mélanges de l'Ecole française de Rome, Moyen Age, 109 (1, 1997), 131-160.

Traduire le franciscanisme. Introduction aux premières "vulgarisations" des Légendes de Saint François d'Assise (France-Italie, XIIP-XV' siècles). Marc Boriosi. Collectanea Franciscana, 67 (3-4, 1997), 389-430.

San Damiano nel 1228. Contributo alla"questione clariana." Maria Pia Alberzoni. Collectanea Franciscana, 67 (3-4, 1997), 459-476.

Benedictine Masters of the Medieval University of Paris: Careers and Regency. Thomas Sullivan, O.S.B. Medieval Prosopography, 18 (1997), 189-208.

Les exempta au service de la prédication de la croisade au 13" siècle. Jeannine Horowitz. Revue d'histoire ecclésiastique, XCII (Apr.-June, 1997), 367-394.

Les hommes de culture dans la diplomatie pontificale au XIIIe siècle. Bruno Galland. Mélanges de l'Ecole française de Rome, Moyen Age, 108 (2, 1996), 615-643.

Norwegen, das Papsttum und Europa im 13. Jahrhundert. Mechanismen der Integration. Martin Kaufhold. Historische Zeitschrift, 265 (Oct., 1997), 309-342.

The CarmeUte Rule after 750 years. Joachim Smet, O.Carm. Carmelas, 44 (1, 1997), 21-47.

La formazione del concetto di infaLUbUità pontificia nella riflessione francescana suUa povertà da Pietro di Giovanni Olivi a Guglielmo di Ockham. Luca Parisoli. Collectanea Franciscana, 6! (3-4, 1997), 431-458.

Douceline, Delphine et les autres ou la sainteté féminine en Occitanie à la fin du Moyen Age. Georges Passerat. Bulletin de Littérature Ecclésiastique, XCVIII (July-Sept., 1997), 235-250.

Sacre et théocratie. Le cas des rois de Sicile Charles II (1289) et Robert (1309). Jean-Paul Boyer. Revue des Sciences Philosophiques et Théologiques, 81 (Oct., 1997), 561-607.

Prélude aux sermons joyeux: l'équivoque hagiographique et la sanctification facétieuse du XIIIe au XVe siècle. Jacques E. Merceron. Le Moyen Age, CIII (3-4, 1997), 527-544.

Schuld oder Präjudizierung? Die ProtokoUe des Templerprozesses im Textver-

gleich (1307-1312). Anke Krüger. Historisches Jahrbuch, 117 (2, 1997), 340-377.

Relations de dépendance spirituelle entre corps de ville et ÉgUses paroissiales en Hongrie au bas moyen âge. Marie-Madeleine de Cevins. Revue d'histoire ecclésiastique, XCII (Apr.-June, 1997), 395-418.

Causa singularis discordiae e situaçào italiana no Defensor Pacis de Marsilio de Pádua. Floriano Jonas Cesar. Patrística et Mediaevalia, XVIII (1997), 20-28.

Na Prous Boneta and Olivi. David Burr. Collectanea Franciscana, Cl (3-4, 1997), 477-500.

The Rotten Apple and the Good Apples: Orthodox, Catholics, and Turks in Philippe de Mézières' Crusading Propaganda. Kiril Petkov. Journal of Medieval History, 23 (Sept., 1997), 255-270.

Der Kleriker Ulrich von Wirtemberg als ein Wegbereiter württembergischer Expansion? Ein biographischer Beitrag zur Rolle des Weltklerus im Werdungsprozeß des frühmodernen Württemberg. Oliver Auge. Blätter für württembergische Kirchengeschichte, 96 (1996), 9-29.

Saints and Rebeis: Hagiography and Opposition to the King in Late Fourteenth-Century England. Mary-Ann Stouck. Medievalia et Humanística, New Series: No. 24 (1997), 75-94.

Holy Man, SuppUcant, and Donor: On Representations of the Miracle of the Archangel Michael at Chonae. Glenn Peers. Mediaeval Studies, 59 (1997), 173-182 and 3 plates.

From Oxford to Prague: The Writings of John Wyclif and His English Followers in Bohemia. Anne Hudson. Slavonic and East European Review, 75 (Oct., 1997), 642-657.

Signs of the Apocalypse in Late Medieval Italy: The Popular Preaching of Bernardino of Siena. Franco Mormando. Medievalia et Humanística, New Series: No. 24 (1997), 95-122.

Did Margery Kempe Suffer from Tourette's Syndrome? Nancy R Stork. Mediaeval Studies, 59 (1997), 261-300.

Abstinence and Reform at the council of Basel: Johannes Nider's De abstinencia esus carnium. Michael D. BaUey. Mediaeval Studies, 59 (1997), 225-260.

La costituzione deUa compagnia di Antonio deUa Casa e Jacopo di Michèle di Corso Donati presso la corte pontificia (1438-1440). Federico ArceUi. Studi Romani, XLV (Jan.-June, 1997), 5-26.

Mariage et empêchements canoniques de parenté dans la ˛société portugaise (1455-1520). Maria de Lurdes Rosa. Mélanges de l'École française de Rome, Moyen Age, 108 (2, 1996), 525-608.

The Making of a Fifteenth-Century Venetian Cardinal. SteUa R. Fletcher. Studi Veneziani, N.S. XXXI (1996), 27-49.

Tra valdesiani e gesuiti: gU Spatafora di Messina. Carmen Salvo. Rivista Storica Italiana, CLX (May, 1997), 541-601.

Reiche, Kirchen und Kurie im späteren Mittelalter. Erich Meuthen. Historische Zeitschrift, 265 (Dec, 1997), 597-637.

Bernardino Gadolo ou les débuts de l'historiographie camaldule. CécUe Caby. Mélanges de l'École française de Rome, Moyen Age, 109 (1, 1997), 225-268.

sixteenth century

Michelangelo's Risen Christ. William E. WaUace. Sixteenth Century Journal, XXVIII (Winter, 1997), 1251-1280.

La capUla de los Abarca en el convento de San Agustín de Salamanca y fray Luis de León. José Barrientos García. La Ciudad de Dios, CCX (May-Aug., 1997), 383-412.

Philipp Melanchthon und Mathias Grünewald. Reiner Marquard. Zeitschrift für Kirchengeschichte, 108 (3, 1997), 295-308.

R Kaspar Sager, O.F.M. Dominikus Göcking, O.F.M. Wissenschaft und Weisheit, 60 (2, 1997), 231-256.

Blessed Adrian Fortescue:A Martyr without a Cause? Richard Rex.Analecta Bollandiana, 115 (3-4, 1997), 307-353.

Cardinals Guidiccioni and Ghinucci Faced with the Solemn Approbation of the Society of Jesus. Joseph F. ConweU, S.J. Archivum Historicum Societatis Iesu, LXVI (Jan.-June, 1997), 3-50.

Sozialdisziplinierung? Ein Plädoyer für das Ende des Etatismus in der KonfessionaUsierungsforschung. Heinrich Richard Schmidt. Historische Zeitschrift, 265 (Dec, 1997), 639-682.

The Angel of the Wilderness: Russian Icons and the Byzantine Legacy. Ellen C Schwartz. Byzantinoslavica, LVII (1, 1997), 169-174 and 10 plates.

Battesimo e diritti civili dalla Riforma protestante al giuseppinismo. Elena BrambUla. Rivista Storica Italiana, CLX (May, 1997), 602-627.

Female Monasticism and Family Strategy: The Guises and Saint Pierre de Reims. Joanne Baker. Sixteenth Century Journal, XXVIII (Winter, 1997), 1091-1108.

La donna attraverso i processi per causa matrimoniale nella diócesi di Feltre del Cinquecento. Lorella Lazzaretti. Studi Veneziani, N.S. XXXII (1996), 49-82.

Scottish Cistercian Monasteries and the Reformation. Mark Dilworth. Innes Review,X\N\)l (Autumn, 1997), 144-164.

Aspectos eclesiásticos del monasterio cisterciense de la Valldigna en los siglos XVI y XVIL Eugenio Ciscar PaUarés. Hispania Sacra, XLLX (Jan.-June, 1997), 191-232.

Confessionalization and Popular Preaching: Sermons against Synergism in Reformation Saxony. Patrick T. Ferry. Sixteenth Century Journal, XXVIII (Winter, 1997), 1143-1166.

Petrus Canisius in seiner Zeit. Norbert Brieskorn, SJ. Stimmen der Zeit, 216 (Jan., 1998), 26-36.

Kanonisches Recht und reformierte Konfessionalisierung im Kanton Bern im 16. Jahrhundert. Die "Sententiae. Ex Decretis Canonicis Collectae" des Berner Dekans Johannes Haller. Johanna WiU Armstrong. Zeitschrift für Schweizerische Kirchengeschichte, 91 (1997), 39-54.

Eretici ed ebrei nei concili e nei sinodi di san Carlo Borromeo. Riccardo Bottoni. Studia Borromaica, 11 (1997), 239-275.

Primacy of Individual Conscience or Primacy of the State? The Clash between Dirck Volckertsz, Coornhert and Justus Lipsius. Gerrit Voogt. Sixteenth Century Journal, XXVIII (Winter, 1997), 1231-1249.

The Collegium Mauritianum in Hesse-Kassel and the Making of Calvinist Diplomacy. Holger Thomas Graf. Sixteenth Century Journal, XXVIII (Winter, 1997), 1167-1180.

Proceso carismático de Calasanz. Miguel Angel Asiain. Archivum Scholarum Piarum,XXl(No. 42, 1997), 1-25.

The "Union" of Brest and the Ecclesiology of Sister Churches. Waclaw Hryniewicz, O.M.I. Eastern Churches Journal, 4 (Spring, 1997), 107-124.

The PoUtics of Religious Conformity and the Accession of James I. Michael Questier. Historical Research, LXXI (Feb., 1998), 14-30.

seventeenth and eighteenth centuries

Mixité sociale, habitat et propriété: la paroisse Saint-Jacques de Valenciennes en 1602 d'après un registre du 100e. Yves Junot. Revue du Nord, LXXIX (Apr.-Sept, 1997), 413-427.

Fonti e parametri per Io studio dei processi per stregoneria Ln vaUe Leventina 1610-1687. Matteo Scanni. Zeitschrift für Schweizerische Kirchengeschichte,91 (1997), 55-94.

Sándor Dobokay's autobiographische Aufzeichnungen (1620). Antal Molnar. Archivum Historicum Societatis Iesu, LXVI (Jan.-June, 1997), 75-88.

Nove lettere inédite ed un frammento del Beato Pietro Casani. Osvaldo Tosti. Archivum Scholarum Piarum,XXI (No. 42, 1997), 51-65.

Der Kirchenkonvent in Württemberg. Beate Popkin. Blätter für württembergische Kirchengeschichte, 96 (1996), 98-1 18.

Falsificación de moneda en conventos cordobeses en 1661. Javier de Santiago Fernández. Hispania Sacra,XUX (Jan.-June, 1997), 233-250.

Stato, Chiesa e toUeranza nel pensiero di S. Pufendorf. Fiammetta Palladini. Rivista Storica Italiana, CLX (May, 1997), 436-482.

Robert Munro, Secular Priest in the Highlands (1645-1704). Gerald FitzGibbon, SJ. Innes Review, XLVIII (Autumn, 1997), 165-173.

Les mambours paroissiaux dans le plat pays hainuyer aux 17e et 18e siècles. Philippe Desmette. Revue d'histoire ecclésiastique, XCII (Apr.-June, 1997), 419-473.

Lo studio di Chieti neUa corrispondenza dei Padri Generali. Osvaldo Tosti. Archivum Scholarum Piarum,XXl (No. 42, 1997), 67-107.

Destinazione e tipología deUe reUquie di un Santo deU'Età Moderna. Leonida Besozzi. Studia Borromaica, 11 (1997), 277-296.

Le ordinazioni dei suddiaconi nel carteggio e nei registri deU'Archivio storico deUa diócesi di MUano. Attilio Cereda. Rassegna degli Archivi di Stato, LVI (Sept.-Dec., 1996), 525-546.

Le curé de Châtillon-sur-Loire et les protestants au début du XVIIIe siècle. Didier Boisson. Bulletin de la Société de l'Histoire du Protestantisme Français, 143 (Oct.-Dec, 1997), 639-662.

Die Lustreise der kleinen Leute—zur geselligen Funktion der barocken Wallfahrt. Peter Hersche. Geselligkeit und Gesellschaft im Barockzeitalter. Edited by Wolfgang Adam (Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz Verlag. 1997), pp. 321-332.

"Lutherisch Werden"—Rekonfessionalisierung als paradoxe Folge aufgeklärter Religionspolitik. Peter Hersche. Ambivalenzen der Aufklärung: Festschrift für Ernst Wangermann. Edited by Gerhard Ammerer and Hanns Haas (Vienna: Verlag für Geschichte und Politik. 1997), pp. 155-168.

L'esortazione e la norma. Le lettere pastoraU nei territori austriaci. Liliana Ferrari. Cristianesimo nella storz«, XVIII (June, 1997), 303-351.

Des livres pour le séminaire de Lausanne: un "Mémoire" de Mathieu Morel-Duvernet (1735). OUvier Fatio. Bulletin de la Société de l'Histoire du Protestantisme Français, 143 (Oct.-Dec, 1997), 593-638.

Il quadro deUa cosï detta "apparizione" di Sebastiano Conca. L'Archivista. Archivum Scholarum Piarum,XXl (No. 42, 1997), 27-49.

Blacks in the Gordon Riots. Marika Sherwood. History Today, 47 (Dec, 1997), 24-34.

Die Zivilkonstitution des Klerus von 1790 als revolutionäres Kirchenreformprogramm im Zeichen der Ecclesia primitiva. Klaus Fitschen. Historisches Jahrbuch, l 17 (2, 1997), 378-405.

"When Ulster Joined Ireland": Anti-Popery, Presbyterian Radicalism and Irish RepubUcanism in the 1790s. I. R. McBride. Past & Present, 157 (Nov., 1997), 63-93.

nineteenth and twentieth centuries

Les missions belges et néerlandaises au cours des 19e et 20e siècles. Dries Vanysacker. Neue Zeitschrift für Missionswissenschaft, 53 (4, 1997), 241-270.

True to the Ratio Studiorum? Jesuit Colleges in St. Petersburg. Daniel L. Schlaflyjr. History ofEducation Quarterly, 37 (Winter, 1997), 421-434.

The Roman CathoUc Church and the Tsar in Nineteenth-Century Belorussia (Belarus). Andrej Piattchits. Orientalia Christiana Periodical (II, 1997), 461-490.

L'alto clero toscano dal "Viva Maria" alla caduta di Napoleone. Simone Bonechi. Annali della Fondazione Luigi Einaudi,XXX (1996), 237-306.

El Gobierno de los Carmelitas en España bajo el régimen de la "ínter Graviores" de Pío VII (1804-1838). Pablo María Garrido, O.Carm. Carmelas, 44 (1,1997), 48-104.

La Chiesa ticinese deU'Ottocento nei documenti degli archivi vaticani. Fabrizio Panzera. Zeitschrift für Schweizerische Kirchengeschichte, 91 (1997), 95-118.

Australian Catholics and Congregational Singing: An Historical Investigation. Diane Gome. Australasian Catholic Record,lXXTV (Oct., 1997), 417-431.

Baptism, Authority, and the Problem of Zakonnost' Ln Orenburg Diocese: The Induction of over 800 "Pagans" into the Christian Faith. Paul W Werth. Slavic Review, 56 (FaU, 1997), 456-480.

Conversion Methodology and the Case of Cardinal Newman. Jeffrey D. Marlett. Theological Studies, 58 (Dec, 1997), 669-685.

Early Salesian Regulations: Formation in the Preventive System. John Rasor. Journal of Salesian Studies, VIII (Fall, 1997), 206-268.

Lettres des filles du pasteur Jacques Reclus à Zoé Tuyès (Steeg), 1856-1863. Lucien Carrive. Bulletin de la Société de l'Histoire du Protestantisme Français, 143 (Oct.-Dec, 1997), 663-730.

Cari Johann Greith und Josef Fessier—KirchUche Beziehungen im Rheintal zwischen Bregenz und Chur. Arthur Brunhart. Zeitschrift für Schweizerische Kirchengeschichte, 91 (1997), 119-137.

Saint with a Human Face: Don Bosco in Father Giulio Barberis' Original Chronicle. Arthur Lenti. Journal of Salesian Studies, Vlll (FaU, 1997), 153-205.

The French Marist Brothers in Colonial AustraUa. Noel Dennis. Australasian Catholic Record, LXXFV (Oct., 1997), 466-478.

Fissures in Late-Nineteenth-Century English Nonconformity: A Case Study in One Congregation. Dale A. Johnson. Church History, 66 (Dec, 1997), 735-749.

La première année de la Revue du clergé français. Un projet editorial au service d'une ambition inteUectuelle (décembre 1894-novembre 1895).

Louis-Pierre SardeUa. Revue des Sciences Philosophiques et Théologiques, 81 (Oct., 1997), 609-628.

Historical Sketch of the Oratory of Don Bosco in Malta. Paul ¥ormos&. Journal of Salesian StudiesNlll (Fall, 1997), 269-309.

St. Anthony's Bread; The Modernized Religious Culture of German Catholics in the Early Twentieth Century. Helena Waddy. Journal of Social History, 31 (Winter, 1997), 347-370.

Kirche, PluraUsmus und totaUtärer Staat. Untersuchungen zum Dekanat Herrenberg in der Zeit der Weimarer Republik und des Nationalsozialismus (1919-1939). Norbert Haag. Blätter für württembergische Kirchengeschichte, 96 (1996), 127-201.

Establishment of Capuchin Order in India. Il: Breaking the Deadlock and Striking Root (1916-1926). Benedict Vadakkekara, O.F.M.Cap. Collectanea Franciscana, 61 (3-4, 1997), 501-566.

De Mercier à Maritain. Une seconde génération thomiste belge (1920-1930). Philippe Chenaux. Revue d'histoire ecclésiastique, XCII (Apr.-June, 1997), 475-498.

The DUemma of Accommodation: Reconciling Christianity and Chinese Culture in the 1920s. Xiaoqun Xu. The Historian, 60 (Fall, 1997), 21-38.

Zum Aufstieg der Deutschen Christen. Das "Zauberwort" Volksmission im Jahre 1933. Siegfried Hermle. Zeitschrift für Kirchengeschichte, 108 (3, 1997), 309-341.

Das österreichische Konkordat 1933/34 im politischen Kontext. Maximilian Liebmann. Theologisch-praktische Quartalschrift, 145 (4, 1997), 349-362.

Schützenvereine im "Dritten Reich." Etappen der Gleichschaltung traditionaler Vereinskultur am Beispiel des ländlich-kathoUschen Schützenvereinswesens Westfalens 1933-1939. Michael Schwartz. Archiv für Kulturgeschichte, 79 (2, 1997), 439-484.

Un escrito del R José Llovera (1874-1949) sobre la Guerra CivU Española. Fernando Mülán,O.Carm. Carmelus, 44 (1,1997), 125-161.

Dietrich Bonhoeffer and Benedictine Monasticism: "Life Together." Susan Quaintance, O.S.B. American Benedictine Review, 48 (Dec, 1997), 347-360.

Ökumene im Krieg. Evangelisch-katholische Gespräche und innerprotestantische Vergewisserungen in der Endphase des "Dritten Reiches." Christoph Mehl and Jörg Thierfelder. Zeitschrift für Kirchengeschichte, 108 (3, 1997), 342-375.

A Short History of the Catholic Bishops' Conference of the Philippines, 1945-1995. Ruperto C. Santos. Philippiniana Sacra, XXXII (Sept.-Dec, 1997), 395-449.

Giuseppe Dossetti Giuseppe Alberigo. Cristianesimo nella ston«, XVIII (June, 1997), 249-275.

Church, FamUy and Sexuality in Australia in the 1950s. David Hilliard. Australian Historical Studies, 28 (Oct., 1997), 133-146.

L'editoria cattolica nel periodo postconcUiare. Il caso deUa Queriniana. Lucia Ceci. Annali della Fondazione Luigi Einaudi, XXX (1996), 393-431.

AMERICAN AND CANADIAN

The Heritage of John Winthrop: Religion along the Stour VaUey, 1548-1630. Francis J. Bremer. New England Quarterly, LXX (Dec., 1997), 515-547.

Converting the New Light: Presbyterian EvangeUcalism in Hanover, Virginia. PhiUp N. MxAder. Journal of Presbyterian History, 75 (FaU, 1997), 141-151.

Between Crucifix and Lance: Indian-White Relations in California, 1769-1848. James A. Sandos. California History, LXXVI (Summer-Fall, 1997), 196-229.

"The ChUd of the Wilderness Weeps for the Father of Our Country": The Indian and the Politics of Church and State Ui Provincial California. Michael J. González. California History, LXXVI (Summer-FaU, 1997), 147-172.

America's PoUtical Covenants, the Bible, and Calvinists. James H. Smylie Journal of Presbyterian History, 15 (FaU, 1997), 153-164.

"God—and a Religious President ... or Jefferson and No God": Campaigning for a Voter-Imposed ReUgious Test in 1800. Frank Lambert. Journal of Church and State, 39 (Autumn, 1997), 769-789.

"Helpers in The Gospel": Women and Religion in Louisiana, 1800-1830. Dolores Egger Labbé. Mid-America, 79 (Summer, 1997), 153-175.

Religious Tracts, Evangelical Reform, and the Market Revolution in Antebellum America. Mark S. Schantz. fournal of the Early Republic, 17 (Fall, 1997), 425-466.

Thomas Chalmers (1780-1847) in North America (ca. 1830-1917). Mark A. Noll. Church History, 66 (Dec, 1997), 762-777.

The Defense of the Forgotten Center: Charles Hodge and the Enigma of Emancipation in AntebeUum America. Peter J. WaUace. Journal of Presbyterian History, 75 (FaU, 1997), 165-177.

Healing and Conversion: Medical Evangelism in James Bay Cree Society. Ronald Niezen. Ethnohistory, 44 (Summer, 1997), 463-491.

A Dog's Life for Christ: The Life and Times of George Deshon, 1823-1903. Michael J. ConnoUy Paulist History, 7 (Winter, 1998), 3-27.

George Deshon and the Clash of Visions in Early PauUst Leadership, 1858-1888. John 0. Allen. PauUst History, 7 (Winter, 1998), 29-41.

"A Good Girl Has Reason to Be Satisfied with Her Condition in Life": George Deshon and the Guide for Catholic Young Women. Mary Beth Fraser. PauUst History, 7 (Winter, 1998), 43-54.

The Mercy Brigade: Roman CathoUc Nuns Ln the Civil War. Michael F. Fitzpatrick. Civil War Times Illustrated, 36 (Oct., 1997), 34-40.

The English Work of the Missouri Synod. WUUam DaUmann. Concordia Historical Institute Quarterly, 70 (FaU, 1997), 99-109.

Standing Shoulder to Shoulder: Protestant and CathoUc Relations in Olpe, Kansas, 1875-1914. Anita L. Specht. Mid-America, 79 (Summer, 1997), 177-198.

"A Multiplicity and Diversity of Faiths": Religion's Impact on Los Angeles and the Urban West, 1890-1940. Michael E. Engh.S.J. Western Historical Quarterly,XXVlll (Winter, 1997), 463-492.

Dorothy Day and the Catholic Worker Movement. Mark and Louise Zwick. Communie, XXLV (Fall, 1997), 415-467

Reintroducing VirgU Michel: Towards a Counter-Traditon of CathoUc Social Ethics m the United States. Michael J. Baxter,CS.C Communie, XXW (Fall, 1997), 499-528.

The Monastic Vision of Richard Felix. Joel Rippinger, O.S.B. amenai« Benedictine Review, 48 (Dec, 1997), 372-395.

"In the Main Line of the Enemy's Fire": Catholic Devotion, Social Action, and FamUy PoUtics Ui the Cold War Era. Kathryn A. Johnson. Mid-America, 79 (Summer, 1997), 117-151.

"Nothing to Advertise Except God": Christian Radio and the Creation of an EvangeUcal Subculture in Northeast Ohio, 1958-1972. Jay D. Green. Ohio History, 106 (Summer-Autumn, 1997), 171-191.

Quelques influences françaises sur l'historiographie religieuse du Québec des dernières décennies. Jean Roy. Revue d'histoire de l'Amérique française, 51 (Autumn, 1997), 301-316.

Peter Minard and North Carolina: Beginning in Simplicity. Evelyn Mattern, S.ECC American Benedictine Review, 48 (Dec, 1997), 428-456.

Ecclesial Confrontation in Los Angeles: Father Dubay and the Batman Syndrome. Francis J. Weber. Southern California Quarterly, 78 (Winter, 1996), 323-346.

LATIN AMERICAN

Religión y Lengua Fundamentos de la Integración Iberoamericana. Antonio Cacua Prada. Boletín de Historia y Antigüedades, LXXXIII (Oct.-Dec., 1996), 955-976.

Der piktografische Katechismus des Fray Pedro de Gante O.F.M.: ein inkulturierter Katechismus. Hans-Jörg Witter. Zeitschrift für Missionswissenschaft und Religionswissenschaft, 81 (3, 1997), 181-201.

El Padre Simón y el ViUano del Danubio. Mario Germán Romero. Boletín de Historia y Antigüedades, LXXXIV (Jan.-Mar., 1997), 63-69.

Apuntes para la Historia de la Catequesis en el Nuevo Reino de Granada. Mario Germán Romero. Boletín de Historia y Antigüedades, LXXXII (Oct.-Dec, 1995), 997-1044.

Documentos sobre los franciscanos de Hispanoamérica. Siglo XVI. Manuel de Castro y Castro. Hispania Sacra,XUX (Jan.-June, 1997), 143-170.

Fray Luis Zapata de Cárdenas, segundo Arzobispo de Santafé de Bogotá, en la Varia historia de Zapata de Chaves. Mario Germán Romero. Boletín de Historia y Antigüedades, LXXXFV (July-Sept., 1997), 799-81 l.

Ubaté y los Franciscanos (l 576-1997). Luis Carlos Mantilla R., O.F.M. Boletín de Historia y Antigüedades, LXXXV (July-Sept., 1997), 823-859.

Iglesias de San Juan de Pasto. EmUiano Díaz del Castillo Zarama. Boletín de Historia y Antigüedades, LXXXII (Oct.-Dec., 1995), 1049-1068.

A Sense of Belonging: Colonial Indian Cofradías and Ethnicity in the VaUey of Lima, Peru. Paul Charney. The Americas, 54 (Jan., 1998), 379-407.

Vivienda y vida privada: la transformación de los conceptos por la acción evangelizadora de la Compañía de Jesús (provincia Jesuítica de Paraguay, 1604-1767). Norberto Levinton. Hispania Sacra, XLLX (Jan.-June, 1997), 171-188.

Michael Joannes Alexius Schabel SJ. "Noticia de Coraçao, Bonayre, Oraba" 1705 and "Diurnum" (1707-1708). Christine W. M. Schunck. Archivum Historicum Societatis Iesu,VXVl (Jan.-June, 1997), 89-162.

Mexican Society and the Franciscan Order in a Period of Transition, 1749-1859· Francisco Morales, O.EM. The Americas, 54 (Jan., 1998), 323-356.

Noticias críticas sobre la vida sacerdotal del sabio Don José Celestino Mutis. Luis Carlos Mantilla R., O.F.M. Boletín de Historia y Antigüedades, LXXXV (Apr. -June, 1997), 521-553.

Juan Nuix i Perpinyà, SJ., frente a Bartolomé de las Casas, O.R Isacio Pérez Fernandez, O.R Studium, XXXVII (2, 1997), 281-325.

Bicentenario de la Muerte, El Arzobispo Virrey (1723-1796). Roberto M. Tisnés J., CM.F. Boletín de Historia y Antigüedades, LXXXIII (July-Sept., 1996), 729-756.

"A Chosen People": Religious Discourse and the Making of the RepubUc of Guatemala, 1821-1871. Douglass Sullivan-Gonzalez. The Americas, 54 (July, 1997), 17-38.

Un Santo Bogotano. La Recoleta de San Diego y el Padre Almansa. Antonio Cacua Prada. Boletín de Historia y Antigüedades, LXXXIII (Oct.-Dec, 1996), 1139-1180.

The Mexican Catholic Church and Constitutional Change since 1929. Peter L. Reich. The Historian, 60 (Fall, 1997), 77-86.

OTHER BOOKS RECEIVED

Alberigo, Giuseppe (Ed.). Il Vaticano IF.fra atiese e celebrazione. [Istituto per Ie scienze reUgiose, Bologna, Testi e ricerche di scienze religiose, N.S., No. 13.] (Bologna: Società éditrice Il Mulino. 1995. Pp. 250. Lire 30.00 paperback.)

Alexander, Kay. Californian Catholicism. [The Religious Contours of California—Window to the World's Religions, Vol. 1.] (Santa Barbara: Fithian Press. 1993. Pp. 134. $9.95 paperback.)

Alvis, Joel L., Jr. Religion and Race: Southern Presbyterians, 1946-1983- (Tuscaloosa: University of Alabama Press. 1994. Pp. viii, 197. $19.95 paperback.)

Angela of Foligno: Complete Works. Trans. Paul Lachance, O.F.M. [Classics of Western Spirituality] (Mahwah, N.J.: PauUst Press. 1993. Pp. xii, 424. $18.95 paperback.)

Aritonang, Jan S. Mission Schools in Batakland (Indonesia), 1861-1940. [Studies in Christian Mission, Volume 10.] (New York: E.J. BrUl. 1994. Pp. xiii, 379. $108.75.)

Barber, Malcolm. Crusaders and Heretics, 12th-14th Centuries. [Collected Studies Series.] (Brookfield, Vt.: Variorum, Ashgate Publishing Company. 1995. Pp. x, 289)

Barbour, Hugh, Christopher Densmore, EUzabeth H. Moger, Nancy C. Sorel, Alson D. Van Wagner, and Arthur J. Worrall (Eds.). Quaker Crosscurrents: Three Hundred Years of Friends in the New York Yearly Meetings. (Syracuse, N.Y.: Syracuse University Press. 1995. Pp. xxix, 432. $59.95 cloth; $19.95 paperback.)

Bauman, Michael, and Martin I. Klauber (Eds.). Historians of the Christian Traditiow.Their Methodology and Influence on Western Thought. (NashviUe, Tenn.: Broadman and Holman. 1995. Pp. vi, 631. $49.99.)

Becker, Marjorie. Setting the Virgin on Fire: Lázaro Cárdenas, Michoacán Peasants, and the Redemption of the Mexican Revolution. (Berkeley: University of California Press. 1995. Pp. xix, 188. $45.00 cloth; $17.00 paperback.)

Berg, Dieter (Ed.). Spiritualität und Geschichte: Festgabe für Lothar Hardick OFM zu seinem 80. Geburtstag. [Saxonia Franciscana, Band 2, Beiträge zur Geschichte der Sächsischen Franziskanerprovinz.] (Werl, Germany: Dietrich-Coelde-Verlag. 1993. Pp. xiii, 277. 49.80 DM paperback.)

Bernardino de Sahagún. Primeros Memoriales. FacsimUe Edition. (Norman:

University of Oklahoma Press in Cooperation with the Patrimonio Nacional and the Real Academia de la Historia, Madrid. 1993. Pp. 190, 176 color facsimiles. $160.00.)

Black, Nancy Johnson. The Frontier Mission and Social Transformation in Western Honduras: The Order of Our Lady of Mercy, 1525-1773- [Studies in Christian Mission, Volume 14.] (Leiden: EJ. BrUl. 1995. Pp. xni, 194.)

Bono, James J. The Word of God and the Languages of Man: Interpreting Nature in Early Modern Science and Medicine; Volume 1: Ficino to Descartes. [Science and Literature.] (Madison: University of Wisconsin Press. 1995. Pp. xi, 317. $50.00 clothbound; $22.95 paperback.)

Boyer, John W Culture and PoUtical Crisis in Vienna: Christian Socialism in Power, 1897-1918. (Chicago: University of Chicago Press. 1997. Pp. xvi, 702. $24.95 paperback.) OriginaUy published in 1995 and reviewed by James Shedel ante, LXXXIII (January, 1997), 121-122.

Bradleyjames E., and Richard A. Müller (Eds.). Church History. An Introduction to Research, Reference Works, and Methods. (Grand Rapids, Mich.: WiUiam B. Eerdmans Publishing Company. 1995. Pp. xvi, 236. $1900 paperback.)

Burnett, Amy Nelson. The Yoke of Christ: Martin Bucer and Christian Discipline. [Sixteenth Century Essays and Studies, Vol. 26.] (KirksvUle, Mo.: The Sixteenth Century Journal. 1994. Pp. xii, 244. $35.00.)

Butler's Lives of the Saints, January. New full edition, revised by Paul Burns. (CollegeviUe, Minn.: The Liturgical Press. 1995. Pp. xxxii, 224. $24.95)

Caraman, PhUip, SJ. A Study in Friendship: Saint Robert Southwell and Henry Garnet. [Series 4: Studies on Jesuit Topics, No. 16.] (Saint Louis: Institute of Jesuit Sources. 1995. Pp. xii, 124. Paperback.)

Caspers, Charles, Gerard Lukken, and Gerard Rouwhorst (Eds.). Bread of Heaven: Customs and Practices Surrounding Holy Communion. [Essays in the History of Liturgy and Culture, No. 3·] (Kampen, Netherlands: Kok Pharos PubUshing House. 1995. Pp. 271. 65.00 DU. paperback.)

Chenaux, Philippe. Paul VI et Maritain: Les Rapports du "Montinianisme" et du "Maritainisme." [Istituto Paolo VI, Saggi 3·] (Brescia and Rome: Edizioni Studium. 1994. Pp. 120. Lire 25.00 paperback.)

Chêne, Catherine. Juger les vers: Exorcismes et procès d'animaux dans le diocèse de Lausanne (XV-XVF s.). [Cahiers Lausannois d'Histoire Médiévale, No. 14.] (Lausanne: Section d'histoire de l'Université de Lausanne. 1995. Pp. 194. Paperback.)

Cipriani, Giovanni. GH Obelischi Egizi: Política e Cultura nella Roma Barocca. [Accademia Toscana di scienze e lettere La Colombaria, Studi, Vol. 131.] (Florence: Leo S. Olschki Editore. 1993. Pp. 205. Lire 45.000.)

Colarossi, Bruna (Ed.). Imaging Technologies for Archives: The Allied Control Commission Microfilm Project, Seminario, Roma 26-27 aprile, 1996. [PubbUcazioni degli Archivi di Stato, Quaderni deUa Rassegna degli Archivi

di Stato, No. 81.] (Rome: Ministero per i beni culturaU e ambientaU, ufficio centrale per i beni archivistici. 1997. Pp. 196. Paperback.)

Cole, Charles C. Jr. Lion of the Forest: James B. Finley, Frontier Reformer. [Ohio River VaUey Series.] (Lexington: University Press of Kentucky. 1994. Pp. xv, 271. $32.95.)

Constable, Giles. Three Studies in Medieval Religious and Social Thought. The Interpretation of Mary and Martha; The Ideal of the Imitation of Christ; The Orders of Society. (New York: Cambridge University Press. 1995. Pp. xix, 423. $59.95.)

Cormack, Margaret. The Saints in Iceland: Their Veneration from the Conversion to 1400. [Subsidia Hagiographlca, No. 78.] (Brussels: Société des Bollandistes. 1994. Pp. xvi, 296. 2900 BEF paperback.)

Cowing, Cedric B. The Saving Remnant: Religion and the Settling of New England. (Urbana and Chicago: University of IUinois Press. 1995. Pp. vii, 351. $39.95 cloth; $19.95. paperback.)

Deshman, Robert. The Benedictional of Aethelwold. [Studies in Manuscript Illumination, No. 9] (Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press. 1995. Pp. xxiii, 287, 213 halftones, 35 color illust. $99.50.)

Dillon, Myles. Early Irish Literature. [Celtic Studies.] (Portland, Oreg.: Four Courts Press, c/o International SpeciaUzed Book Services. 1994. Pp. xix, 192. $15.00 paperback.)

DUlon, Myles. The Cycles of the Kings. [Celtic Studies] (Portland, Oreg.: Four Courts Press, c/o International SpeciaUzed Book Services. 1994. Pp. viii, 124. $15.00 paperback.)

Dilworth, Mark. Scottish Monasteries in the Late Middle Ages. (New York: Edinburgh University Press, distributed by Columbia University Press. 1995. Pp. viii, 102. $25.00 paperback.)

Domin-Jacov, Maria (Ed.). Opitius Pallavicini (1680-1688), Volume 1: 10 VIII 1680-29 III 1681. [Acta Nuntiaturae Polonae, Tomus XXXTV] (Rome: Institutum Historicum Polonicum Romae. 1995. Pp. xxxi, 449. Paperback.)

Donovan, Daniel. Distinctively Catholic: An Exploration of Catholic Identity. (Mahwah, N.J.: PauUst Press. 1997. Pp. vi, 210. $14.95 paperback.)

Dreuille, Mayeul de. La Bouenza, 1892-1992: Les Sources de l'Église au Congo. [Eglise aux quatre vents.] (Paris: Beauchesne. 1994. Pp. 140. 120 FF paperback.)

Duranti, Luciana. / documenti archivistici: La gestione dell'archivio da parte dell'ente produttore. [PubbUcazioni degli Archivi di Stato, Quaderni délia Rassegna degU Archivi di Stato, No. 82.] (Rome: Ministero per i beni culturaU e ambientaU, ufficio centrale per i beni archivistici. 1997. Pp. vüi, 231. Paperback.)

Dyson, R. W (Ear). James of Viterbo: On Christian Government, De Regimine Christiano. (Rochester, N.Y.: Boydell Press. 1995. Pp. xxvU, 160. $45.00.)

Eales, Richard, and Richard Sharpe (Eds.). Canterbury and the Norman Conquest: Churches, Saints and Scholars, 1066-1109. (Rio Grande, Ohio: The Hambledon Press. 1995. Pp. xxüi, 182. $55.00.)

Ens, Adolf. Subjects or Citizens? The Mennonite Experience in Canada, 1870-1925. [ReUgions and Beliefs, No. 2.] (Ottawa: University of Ottawa Press. 1994. Pp. xi, 266. Paperback.)

Faherty, WUUam Barnaby, SJ., and Kevin Laheen, SJ. The Fourth Career ofJohn B. Bannon: St. Louis Pastor, Southern Chaplain, Confederate Agent, Irish Jesuit Orator. (Portland, Oreg.: C & D Publishing. 1994. Pp. 110. $24.95 case bound; $12.95 soft cover.)

Fenwickjohn R. K., and Bryan D. Spinks. Worship in Transition: The Liturgical Movement in the Twentieth Century. (New York: Continuum Books. 1995. Pp. viii, 202. $17.95 paperback.)

FouUoux, É. (Ed.). Vatican LL Commence . . . Approches Francophones. [Instrumenta Theologica, 12.] (Leuven: Bibliotheek van de Faculteit der Godgeleerdheid van de K. U. Leuven. 1993· Pp. xU, 392. Paperback.)

franchi, Antonino. Ascoli Imperiale: da Carlo Magno a Federico II, 800-1250. [Studi e Documenti, No. 1.] (Ascoli Piceno: Istituto Superiore di Studi Medioevali. 1995. Pp. 308. Paperback.)

Frend, WUUam H. C. The Archaeology ofEarly Christianity.A History. (London: Geoffrey Chapman, a CasseU imprint. 1997. Pp. xix, 412. $3500 paperback.) Originally published in 1996 and reviewed by Paul Corby Finney ante, LXXXIII (October, 1997), 729-731.

Furcha, E.J. (Trans, and ed.). The Essential Carlstadt: Fifteen tracts by Andreas Bodenstein (Carlstadt) from Karlstadt. [Classics of the Radical Reformation, Vol. 8.] (Scottdale, Pa.: Herald Press. 1995. Pp. 449. $4995.)

Gameson, Richard. The Role ofArt in the Late Anglo-Saxon Church. [Oxford Historical Monographs.] (New York: Oxford University Press. 1995. Pp. xüi, 312. $65.00.)

GeIm, Richard J. Politics and Religious Authority: American Catholics Since the Second Vatican Council. [Contributions to the Study of Religion, 36.] (Westport, Conn.: Greenwood Press. 1994. Pp. xiii, 151. $4995.)

Gough, Deborah Mathias. Christ Church, Philadelphia: The Nation's Church in a Changing City. (Philadelphia: Barra Foundation, University of Pennsylvania Press. 1995. Pp. xxüi, 425. $29.95 cloth; $14.95 paperback.)

Graves, Michael A. R. Thomas Norton: The Parliament Man. (Cambridge, Mass.: BlackweU. 1994. Pp. xU, 420. $5995.)

GraybUl, Lyn S. Religion and Resistance Politics in South Africa. (Westport, Conn.:Praeger Publishers. 1995. Pp. vii, 157. $49.95.)

Guimaräes, AtUa Sinke. In the Murky Waters of Vatican II. [EU, EU, Lamma Sabacthani? Volume 1.] (Métairie, La.: MAETA. 1997. Pp. xvi, 453. Paperback.)

HaU, Edwin. The Arnolflni Betrothal: Medieval Marriage and the Enigma of Van Eyck's Double Portrait. [CaUfornia Studies in the History of Art, Discovery Series, No. 3] (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press. 1994. Pp. xxi, 180, 16 ftiU-color plates. $45.00.)

Halmo, Joan. Antiphons for Paschal Triduum-Easter in the Medieval Office. [Musicological Studies, Vol. LXIV] (Ottawa: The Institute of Mediaeval Music. 1995. Pp. XV, 192.)

Hayes, Alan L. (Ed.). Church and Society in Documents, 100-600 A.D. (Toronto: Canadian Scholars' Press Inc. 1995. Pp. xiv, 282. $3395 paperback.)

Henery, Charles R. (Ed.). A Speaking Life:John Keble and the AngUcan Tradition ofMinistry and Art. (Nashotah, Wis.: Nashotah House. 1995. Pp. xvU, 149. Paperback.)

Herlihy Kevin (Ed.). The Irish Dissenting Tradition, 1650-1750. (Portland, Oreg.: Four Courts Press. Distributed by International Specialized Book Services, Inc. 1995. Pp. 130. $1950 paperback.)

Herrera, R. A. Donoso Cortes: Cassandra of the Age. (Grand Rapids, Mich.: WUUam B. Eerdmans PubUshing Company. 1995. Pp. xxii, 144. $20.00 paperback.)

Hinson, E. Glenn. The Church Triumphant: A History of Christianity up to 1300. (Macon, Ga.: Mercer University Press. 1995. Pp. xxi, 494. $45.00.)

Homan,Gerlof O.American Mennonites and the GreatWar, 1914-1918. [Studies in Anabaptist and Mennonite History, No. 34.] (Scottdale, Pa.: Herald Press. 1994. Pp. 327. $19.95 paperback.)

Huel, Raymond (Ed.). Western Oblate Studies 3: Proceedings of the third symposium on the history of the Oblates in Western and Northern Canada, Faculté Saint-Jean, Edmonton, May 14-15, 1993- (Edmonton: Western Canadian Publishers. 1994. Pp. v, 158. Paperback.)

Hultgren, Arland J. The Rise ofNormative Christianity. (Minneapolis: Fortress Press. 1994. Pp. xiii, 210. Paperback.)

Hummel, Ruth and Thomas. Patterns of the Sacred: English Protestant and Russian Orthodox Pilgrims of the Nineteenth Century. (London: Scorpion Cavendish Ltd. for The Swedish Christian Study Centre, Jerusalem. 1995. Pp. xix, 76. £10.00 paperback.)

Jedin, Hubert (Ed.). History of the Church English Translation edited by John Dolan. Abridged by D. Larrimore Holland. Vol. 1: The Early Church; Vol. 2: The Medieval and Reformation Church; Vol. 3: The Church in the Modern World. (New York: Crossroad. 1993. Pp. xviii, 765; xviii, 1054; xvi, 1067. $50.00 each.)

Jones, Martin D. W The Counter Reformation: Religion and Society in Early Modern Europe. [Cambridge Topics in History.] (New York: Cambridge Univesity Press. 1995. Pp. iv, 171. $14.95 paperback.)

Jütte, Robert. Poverty and Deviance in Early Modern Europe. [New Approaches to European History.] (New York: Cambridge University Press. 1994. Pp. xvi, 239. $4995 cloth; $14.95 paperback.)

Kleine-Ahlbrandt, WiUiam Laird. The Burden of Victory: France, Britain and the Enforcement of the Versailles Peace, 1919-1925. (Lanham, Md.: University Press of America. 1995. Pp. xiii, 342. $66.00 library binding; $41.00 paperback.)

KUngshirn, William E. Caesarius of Aries: Life, Testament, Letters. [Translated Texts for Historians, Volume 19] (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press. 1994. Pp. ix, 157. $15.95 paperback.)

Lacroix, Pierre, Andrée Renon, ÉUane Vergnolee, and Marie-Claude Mary (Eds.). Pensée, Image et Communication en Europe Médiévale: À Propos des stalles de Saint-Claude. (Besançon: ASPRODIC 1993. Pp. x, 293·)

Ladner, Gerhart B. God, Cosmos, and Humankind: The World of Early Christian Symbolism. Trans. Thomas Dunlap. (Berkeley: University of California Press. 1995. Pp. vii, 334. $45.00.) OriginaUy published as Handbuch der frühchristlichen Symbolik: Gott, Kosmos, Mensch, by Belser AG, Stuttgart and Zurich, in 1992.

Ladous, Régis. Des Nobel au Vatican: La fondation de l'Académie pontificale des sciences. (Paris: Cerf. 1994. Pp. 219-114 E paperback.)

Lang, Timothy. The Victorians and the Stuart Heritage: Interpretations of a Discordant Past. (New York: Cambridge University Press. 1995. Pp. xiv, 233. $49.95.)

Langjudith. The Angels of God: Understanding the Bible. (New York: New City Press. 1997. Pp. 240. $12.95 paperback.)

Lanza, Franco. Paolo VL e gli scrittori. [Saggi 4.] (Brescia and Rome: Istituto Paolo VI—Edizioni Studium. 1994. Pp. 179. Lire 28.000 paperback.)

Lapomarda, Vincent A. The Order of Alhambra: Its History and Its Memorials. (Baltimore: The International Order of Alhambra. 1994. Pp. xii, 105. $10.00 paperback.)

Lazzaretti, Lorella (Ed.). Inventario dei Fondi G. Lercaro e G. Dossetti. [La documentazione bolognese per la storia del Concilio Vaticano IL] (Bologna: Istituto per le Scienze Religiose. 1995. Pp. 152. Paperback.)

Le décor des églises en France Méridionale (XlLF-milieu XV" siècle). [Cahiers de Fanjeaux, No. 28.] (Toulouse: Privat. 1993. Pp. 424. 180 FF paperback.)

Leighton, C D. A. Catholicism in a Protestant Kingdom: A Study of the Lrish Ancien Régime. [Studies in Modem History.] (New York: St. Martin's Press. 1994. Pp. x, 218.)

Levasseur, Donat, O.M.I. Les Oblates de Marie Immaculée dans l'Ouest et le Nord du Canada, 1845-1967, Esquisse historique. [Western Oblate Studies, No. 3.] (Alberta: Western Canadian Publishers. 1995. Pp. xü, 345. $20.00 paperback.)

Maza, Manuel, SJ. Iglesia Cubana: Cinco Siglos de Desafios y Respuestas. (Santo Domingo:Amigo del Hogar. 1995. Pp. 55. Paperback.)

MUanichJerald T Florida Indians and the Invasion from Europe. (GainesvUle: University Press of Florida. 1995. Pp. xix, 290. $29.95.)

Mission and Inculturation. [BuUetin de l'Institut Historique Belge de Rome, Vol. LXIV] (Turnhout, Belgium: Brepols. 1994. Pp. 270.)

Molitor, Hansgeorg, and Heribert Smolinsky (Eds.). Volksfrömmigkeit in der Frühen Neuzeit. [KathoUsches Leben und Kirchenreform im Zeitalter der Glaubensspaltung, Heft 54.] (Münster: Aschendorff. 1994. Pp. 138. 32.00 DM paperback.)

Monson, Craig A. Disembodied Voices: Music and Culture in an Early Modern Italian Convent. (Berkeley: University of California Press. 1995. Pp. xxv, 354. $38.00.)

Montag, Warren. The Unthinkable Swift: The Spontaneous Philosophy of a Church of England Man. (London:Verso. 1994. Pp. viii, 174. $59.95.)

Mulchahey, M. Michèle (Ed.). Fra Nicola da Milano: Collationes de beata virgine,A Cycle ofPreaching in the Dominican Congregation ofthe Blessed Virgin Mary atlmola, 1286-1287. [Toronto Medieval Latin Texts, No. 24.] (Toronto: Centre for Medieval Studies, Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies. 1997. Pp. viü, 119. $89.00 CAN paperback.)

Mulder-Bakker, Anneke B. (Ed.). Sanctity and Motherhood: Essays on Holy Mothers in the Middle Ages. [Garland Medieval Casebooks, Volume 14; Garland Reference Library of the Humanities, Volume 1767.] (New York: Garland Publishing, Inc. 1995. Pp. viü, 360.)

Nichols,JohnA.,and Lillian Thomas Shank, O.C.S.O. (Eds.). Hidden Springs:Cistercian Monastic Women, Volume Three: Medieval Religious Women. 2 vols. [Cistercian Studies Series: No. 113, Books Ï and 2.] (Kalamazoo: Western Michigan University for Cistercian Publications. 1995. Pp. xii, 443; vüi, 445-820. $85.00 hardback; $50.00 paperback the set.)

Niessen, James (Ed.). ReUgious Compromise, Political Salvation: The Greek Catholic Church and Nation-building in Eastern Europe. [The Carl Beck Papers, Number 1003] (Pittsburgh: The Center for Russian and East European Studies, University of Pittsburgh. 1993. Pp. 68. $6.00 paperback.)

NoU, Mark A., David W. Bebbington, and George A. Rawlyk (Eds.). Evangelicalism: Comparative Studies of Popular Protestantism in North America, the British Isles, and Beyond, 1700-1990. [Religion in America.] (New York: Oxford University Press. 1994. Pp. xv, 430. $55.00 cloth; $19.95 paperback.)

Nutt, Rick L. Toward Peacemaking: Presbyterians in the South and National Security, 1945-1983- (Tuscaloosa: University of Alabama Press. 1994. Pp. x, 177. $19.95 paperback.)

Ohlmeyer, Jane H. Civil War and Restoration in the Three Stuart Kingdoms: The Career of Randal MacDonnell, Marquis of Antrim, 1609-1683.

[Cambridge Studies in Early Modern British History] (New York: Cambridge University Press. 1993. Pp. xxiii, 357.)

O'Mahony Anthony, Goran Gunner, and Kevork HintUan (Eds.). The Christian Heritage in the Holy Land. (London: Scorpion Cavendish Ltd. for the Swedish Christian Study Centre, Jerusalem. 1995. Pp. xi, 317. £15.95 paperback.)

O'Malley, WiUiam J. The Pursuit of Happiness: Evolving a Soul. (AUen, Tex.: Thomas More. 1998. Pp. 320. $24.95.)

O'MaUeyJohn W, Thomas M. Izbicki, and Gerald Christianson (Eds.). Humanity and Divinity in Renaissance and Reformation: Essays in Honor of Charles Trinkaus. [Studies in the History of Christian Thought, Volume LL] (New York: E.J. BrUl. 1993. Pp. x, 325. $91.50.) Part Three: "Renaissance and Reformers," contains the foUowing articles: Morimichi Watanabe, "Nicholas of Cusa and the Reform of the Roman Curia" (pp. 185-203); Donald Weinstein, "Explaining God's Acts to His People: Savonarola's Spiritual Legacy with the Sixteenth Century" (pp. 205-225); Paul F. Grendler, "Man Is Almost a God: Fra Battista Carioni between Renaissance and Catholic Reformation" (pp. 227-249); and Heiko A. Oberman, "The Pursuit of Happiness: Calvin between Humanism and Reformation" (pp. 251-283).

Oberman, Heiko A. The Impact of the Reformation. (Grand Rapids, Mich.: WUUam B. Eerdmans PubUshing Company. 1994. Pp. xi, 263- $1999 paperback.) A coUection of previously published essays; some have been translated into English.

Oktavec, EUeen. Answered Prayers: Miracles and Milagros Along the Border. [Southwest Center Series.] (Tucson: University of Arizona Press. 1995. Pp. xxvi, 239- $35.00 cloth; $14.95 paperback.)

OUn, John C. Erasmus, Utopia, and the Jesuits: Essays on the Outreach of Humanism. (Bronx, N.Y: Fordham University Press. 1994. Pp. xx, 105. $25.00 cloth; $15.95 paper.)

Ostorero, Martine. "Folâtrer avec les démons": Sabbat et chasse aux sorciers à Vevey (1448). [Cahiers Lausannois d'Histoire Médiévale, No. 15.] (Lausanne: Section d'histoire de l'Université de Lausanne. 1995. Pp. 323. Paperback.)

Outhwaite, R. B. Clandestine Marriage in England, 1500-1850. (Rio Grande, Ohio: The Hambledon Press. 1995. Pp. xxiv, 196. $40.00.)

Painter, John. Mark's Gospel: Worlds in Conflict. [New Testament Readings.] (New York: Routiedge. 1997. Pp. xvii, 245. $65.00 hardback; $22.99 paperback.)

Pazos, Antón M. (Ed.). La Historia Religiosa en Europa, Siglos XLX-XX. (Madrid: Ediciones de Historia. 1995. Pp. x, 132.)

Pearsall, Arleen Epp. Johannes Pauli (1450-1520) on the Church and Clergy. (Lewiston, N.Y.: Edwin MeUen Press. 1994. Pp. vii, 253. $8995.)

Peri. Vittorio. Lo Scambio Fraterno tra le Chiese: Componenti Storiche délia Comunione. (Vatican City: Librería Editrice Vaticana. 1993. Pp. 489. Lire 50.00 paperback.)

Petit, Loretta, O.P. Friar in the Wilderness: Edward Dominic Fenwick, O.P. (Chicago: Project OPUS. 1994. Pp. x, 40. $10.00 paperback.)

Rafferty, Oliver R Catholicism in Ulster, 1603-1983-'An Interpretative History. (Columbia: University of South Carolina Press. 1994. Pp. xiv, 306.)

Ramet, Sabrina Petra, and Donald W Treadgold (Eds.). Render unto Caesar: The Religious Sphere in World Politics. (Lanham, Md.: The American University Press. 1995. Pp. xi, 463. $69.50 cloth; $2995 paperback.)

Rattue, James. The Living Stream: Holy Wells in Historical Context. (Rochester, N.Y:Boydell and Brewer, Inc. 1995. Pp. vii, 183. $45.00.)

Rogal, Samuel).John Wesley in Ireland, 1747-1789- [Studies in the History of Missions, Vol. 9.] (lewiston, N.Y.: Edwin MeUen Press. 1993. Pp- vii, 477. $89.95.)

RomaneUo, Marina. Le Spose del Principe: Una storia di donne: la Casa secolare dette Zitette in Udine, 1595-1995. (MUan: Franco AngeU Storia. 1995. Pp. 184. Lire 28.000 paperback.)

RoncaUi, Angelo G. (Giovanni XXIII). La predicazione a Istanbul: Omelie, discorsi e note pastorali, 1935-1944. Ed. Alberto Melloni. [BibUoteca deUa Rivista di Storia e Letteratura Religiosa, Testi e documenti, XV] (Florence: Leo S. Olschki. 1993- Pp. 418. Paperback.)

Rubinjulius H. Religious Melancholy and Protestant Experience in America. [Religion in America.] (New York: Oxford University Press. 1994. Pp. xii, 308. $35.00.)

Ryan, Frances, D.C, and John E. Rybolt, CM. Vincent de Paul and Louise de Marillac: Rules, Conferences, and Writings. [Classics of Western Spirituality.] (Mahwah, N.J.: PauUst Press. 1995. Pp. xix, 320. $18.95 paperback.)

Sack, James J. From facobite to Conservative: Reaction and Orthodoxy in Britain, c. 1760-1832. (New York: Cambridge University Press. 1993. Pp. xi, 292.) The last chapter deals with "The Right and Catholicism."

Sáez, José Luis, SJ. Cinco Siglos de la Iglesia en Santo Domingo. (Santo Doniingo: Amigo del Hogar. 1995. Pp. 59. Paperback.)

Sales, Rosemary. Women Divided: Gender, Religion and Politics in Northern Ireland. [International Studies of Women and Place] (New York: Routledge. 1997. Pp. xvi, 236. $75.00 cloth; $24.99 paperback.)

Salinas Araneda, Carlos, and Antonio Garcia Garcia (Eds.). Una década de bibliografía sobre el Derecho Canónico Indiano. (Salamanca: Instituto de historia de la teología española. 1994. Pp. 58. Paperback.)

Sanderson, Warren. Early Christian Buildings: A Graphic Introduction, 300 to 600. (Champlain, N.Y: Astrion PubUshing. 1993. Pp. 121, 126 b/w iUust. $24.95 paperback.)

Schmidt, Leigh Eric. Consumer Rites: The Buying and Selling of American Holidays. (Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press. 1995. Pp. xvi, 363. $24.95.)

Schneider, Robert A. The Ceremonial City: Toulouse Observed, 1738-1780. (Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press. 1995. Pp. x, 202. $24.95.)

Sheingorn, Pamela (Trans.). The Book of Sainte Foy. (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press. 1995. Pp. xiii, 329. $44.95 cloth; $1995 paperback.)

Sjoestedt, Marie-Louise. Gods and Heroes of the Celts. Trans. Myles DUlon. [Celtic Studies.] (Portland, Oreg.: Four Courts Press, c/o International Specialized Book Service. 1994. Pp. xxi, 104. $15.00 paperback.)

Sparks, Randy J. On Jordan's Stormy Banks: Evangelicalism in Mississippi, 1773-1876. (Athens: University of Georgia Press. 1994. Pp. ix, 281. $45.00.)

Starowieyski, Marek (Ed.). The Spirituality of Ancient Monasticism: Acts of the International Colloquium held in Cracow-Tyniec, 16-19th November 1994. [Pontificia Academia Theologica Cracoviensis, Facultas Theologica, Studia rv/l.] (Cracow: Wydawnictwo Benedyktynów. 1995. Pp. 250. $22.00 paperback.)

Stoichita, Victor I. Visionary Experience in the Golden Age of Spanish Art. [Essays Ln Art and Culture.] (Seattle: University of Washington Press. 1995. Pp. 224. $25.00 paperback.)

Stoyanov, Yuri. The Hidden Tradition in Europe. The Secret History of Medieval Christian Heresy. (New York: Arkana, published by the Penguin Group. 1994. Pp. xix, 309. Paperback.)

Taft, Robert E Liturgy in Byzantium and Beyond. [Variorum CoUected Studies Series.] (Brookfield, Vt.: Variorum, Ashgate Publishing Company. 1995. Pp. xii, 345. $95.00.)

Thielicke, Helmut. Notes from a Wayfarer: The Autobiography of Helmut Thielicke. Trans. David R. Law. (New York: Paragon House. 1995. Pp. xxi, 422. $29.95.)

Troupeau, Gérard. Etudes sur le christianisme arabe au Moyen Age. [Variorum CoUected Studies Series.] (Brookfield, Vt.: Ashgate Publishing Company. 1995. Pp. x, 290. $89.95.)

Valantasis, Richard. The Gospel of Thomas. [New Testament Readings.] (New York: Routiedge. 1997. Pp. xvii, 221. $55.00 hardback; $17.99 paperback.)

Weber, Francis J. Catholic CaUfornia Essays: Some Historical Reflections. (Ashland, Ohio: BookMasters, Inc. 1994. Pp. ix, 265. Paperback.) This is the eleventh volume of coUected columns that were originally published in The Tidings.

Wengert, Timothy J., and Charles W Brockwell, Jr. (Eds.). Telling the Churches' Stories: Ecumenical Perspectives on Writing Christian History. (Grand

Rapids, Mich.: WiUiam B. Eerdmans Publishing Company. 1995. Pp. xxii, 134. $15.00 paperback.)

Westmeier, Karl-WUhelm. The Evacuation of Shekomeko and the Early Moravian Missions to Native North Americans. [Studies in the History of Missions, Volume 12.] (Lewiston, N.Y: The Edwin MeUen Press. 1994. Pp. Lx, 444. $109-95.)

White James F. Roman Catholic Worship: Trent to Today. (Mahwah, N.J.: PauUst Press. 1995. Pp. vii, 174. $11.95 paperback.)

Wind, James R, and James W. Lewis (Eds.). American Congregations, Volume 1: Portraits of Twelve Religious Communities; Volume 2: New Perspectives in the Study of Congregations. (Chicago: University of Chicago Press. 1994. Pp. xi, 712; Lx, 292. $34.95; $22.50.)

WooUey Reginald MaxweU (Ed). The Canterbury Benedictional (British Museum, Harl. Ms. 2892.). (Rochester, N.Y: The Boydell Press for The Henry Bradshaw Society. 1995. Pp. xxvi, 178. $63-00.) First published in 1917.

Wosh, Peter J. Spreading the Word: The Bible Business in Nineteenth-Century America. (Ithaca, N.Y: CorneU University Press. 1994. Pp. xiii, 271. $35.00.)