The Catholic Historical Review

VOLUME LXXXTV

1998

Published Quarterly by
The Catholic University of America Press
Washington, D.C. 20064
1998

Table of Contents

GENERAL INDEX

Volume LXXXIV (1998)

The Catholic Historical Review

VOL. LXXXIV OCTOBER, 1998 No. 4

INDULGENCES AND SAINTLY DEVOTIONALISMS IN THE MIDDLE AGES

BY

Robert W Shaffern*

Indulgences, which were (and still are) remissions of temporal penalty for sin granted by the episcopal authority of the Catholic Church, have long been associated with mechanicalism, decadence, and formalism in later medieval Christianity.1 This association originated in the medieval period itself and was, of course, inherited by the Protestant Reformation. Critics such as Jean Gerson (c. 1420) lamented the numbers of indulgences and sizes of the remissions being granted by Christendom's prelates as an attack on true penitence and contrition.2

"Dr. Shaffern is an assistant professor of history in the University of Scranton. He wishes to thank Professors David L. D'Avray, Richard Kieckhefer, William J. Dohar, C.S.C, and Timothy M. Thibodeau for their invaluable comments and suggestions.

'Joseph Lortz, The Reformation in Germany, trans. Ronald Wallis (New York, 1968), I, 119-120, for instance, claimed that indulgences were the worst abuse in the later medieval Church. Henry C. Lea, A History of Auricular Confession and Indulgences in the Latin Church (New York, 1896), III, 1, claimed that by the end of the Middle Ages indulgences were solely a revenue-producing scheme of the papacy and religious orders. Richard W. Souther, Western Society and the Church in the Middle Ages (New York, 1970), pp. 136-143, attributed the increasing numbers of indulgences in the later Middle Ages to the desire of the popes to extend their authority, though he sympathized with Sixtus rV's desire to accommodate his cardinal's pleas for remission. More recently Thomas Tender, who little used saints' lives in Sin and Confession on the Eve of the Reformation (Princeton, 1977), pp. xv-xvi, argued that "when the horrors of purgatory are preached, and sinners urged to take up a harder regime of penitential exercises, or take advantage of indulgences, the simplicity of control by guilt and comfort by absolution is belied."

2John Gerson, Opusculum de indulgentia in L. Dupin (ed.), Opera omnia (Antwerp, 1706), II, 515. Indulgences, probably apocryphal, of 40,000 years have been found in late medieval books of hours. See Eamon Duffy, The Stripping of the Altars (New Haven, 1992), p. 287.

John Wycliffe (c. 1380) and Wessel Gansfort (c. 1489)3 questioned seriously the Church's authority to remit penalties for sin because indulgences lacked scriptural authority, an argument that may also be found in the earliest discussions of the Schoolmen. Indulgences, however, remained popular throughout the later Middle Ages despite the eloquence and prestige of these critics, and so historians in recent years have begun to examine the popularity of indulgences as a part of medieval spirituality. In a recent study of the relation between papal authority and religious movements, David L. D'Avray argued that the proliferation of indulgences ought more properly to be understood as a religious movement than as a problem within the later medieval church.4 The traditional perspective, in his view, results from "an obtrusive consciousness of the eventual reaction."5 Not only the critics but the enthusiasts must also be heard.

To that end, Richard Kieckhefer expressed the need for historians of medieval religion to explore the connection between saintly piety and indulgences in the Middle Ages.6 The medieval saints, who were the models of late medieval devotion and interior spirituality, were zealous collectors of indulgences. At the same time, the saints accepted the need for ecclesiastical mediation in the remission of sin. Church authority itself relied on the intercession and merit of saints who already possessed their eternal reward. Indeed, in addition to the passion of Christ, the merits of deceased saints were invoked to prove the efficacy

'In Heiko Oberman, Forerunners of the Reformation (New York, 1966), pp. 99-119. A translation of Wycliffe's criticism of indulgences may be found in Robert Vaughan (ed.), Tracts and Treatises of John de Wycliffe (London, 1845), pp. 195-198. Another fourteenth-century dispute over indulgences is described by Robert W Shaffern, "A New Canonistic Text on Indulgences: De quantitate indulgenciarum of John of Dambach, O.P. (1288-1372)," Bulletin of Medieval Canon Law, 21 (1991), 25-45. The discussions of the early Schoolmen may be found in Nikolaus Paulus, Geschichte des Ablasses im Mittelalter (Paderborn, 1922), I, 212-252.

4David L. D'Avray, "Papal Authority and Religious Sentiment in the Late Middle Ages," in Diana Wood (ed.), The Church and Sovereignty, c. 950-1918 ("Studies in Church History," Subsidia, 9 [Oxford, 1991]), P-395. See also Etienne Delaruelle, "La vie religieuse dans les pays de langue française à la fin du moyen âge," in La piété populaire au moyen âge (Turin, 1975), pp. 21-22, and L'Eglise au temps du grand schisme et de la crise conciliaire (1378-1449) (Paris, 1962), I, xii-xiii.

'David L. D'Avray, op. cit., p. 408.

'Richard Kieckhefer, "Holiness and the Culture of Devotion: Remarks on some Late Medieval Male Saints," in Renate Blumenfeld-Kosinski and Timea Szell (eds.), Images of Sainthood in Medieval Europe (Ithaca, New York, 1991), p. 304.

of indulgences. Papal proclamations of indulgences often called upon the authority of Saints Peter and Paul, the two great patrons of Rome.7 For Catherine of Siena, Bridget of Sweden, Peter of Luxembourg, and others, the quest for indulgences accompanied interior conversion to the imitatio Christi. Indulgences and the saints met in several different ways in medieval religion. First, prelates granted indulgences as approval and encouragement to saintly cults. Second, prelates, at the behest of saintly founders, granted indulgences to promote new devotional movements. Third, the saints eagerly sought indulgences for the benefit of their own souls or those of their followers.

Medieval prelates granted untold numbers of indulgences to promote the cult of the saints, the oldest expression of popular piety in the Middle Ages. This promotion usually came in the form of indulgences granted for the visitation of a saint's shrine; so the practice of pilgrimage was also crucial. Indulgences were far less likely to be granted to a shrine built in honor of a long-venerated saint, such as a martyr, or an apostle, or a late antique bishop such as Saint Martin of Tours.8 Bishops and popes were more eager to support the cult of a newly-canonized saint. Pope Clement V presided at the translation of the relics of the holy bishop Bertrand of Comminges in 1309 and granted an unusually liberal indulgence of fifteen years and fifteen quarantaines (one quarantaine equalled forty days) to those who visited the sanctuary on the day of the feast, seven years and seven quarantaines to those who visited during the octave, ten years and ten quarantaines to those who visited on a Marian feast, and three years and three quarantaines to those who visited during the octave of these feasts.9 Pope John XXII thus promoted the veneration of Thomas Aquinas, who was canonized in 1323:

> So that a multitude of Christians may more ardently and profitably visit Thomas's venerable tomb, and that the feast of that confessor may be celebrated with joy, we, by the mercy of omnipotent God and by the authority of His saints and apostles Peter and Paul, remit one year and forty days of enjoined penance to all truly penitent and confessed, who shall make visi-

7For a recent discussion of early medieval views on the powers of these two saints, see Uta-Renate Blumenthal, "History and Tradition in Eleventh-Century Rome," Catholic Historical Review, LXXLX (April, 1993), 185-196.

"Bernard Guillemain,"Les papes d'Avignon, les indulgences, et les pèlerinages," in Les pèlerinages (Toulouse, 1980), p. 262.

"7Wrf.,p.257.

> tation there seeking Thomas's suffrages on the anniversary of the feast; and to pilgrims who visit the said tomb within seven days immediately following the feast in subsequent years, one hundred days of enjoined penance.10

Pope John supported other saintly cults in the same way. Three years before Thomas Aquinas, he approved the canonization of Thomas of Hereford. For this visitation he granted two years and eighty days of indulgence in the first year, and one hundred days in every following year." In so favoring the cults of newly-canonized saints, John was merely following the policy of his predecessors back to Gregory LX, who promoted the cult of Saint Anthony of Padua (canonized 1233) and of Saint Dominic (1234) with an indulgence each of one year, and of Saint Elizabeth (1235) with an indulgence of one year and forty days.12

Although far less commonly, veneration of the saints of old also attracted the patronage of prelates, especially if an extraordinary event related to a saint's cult took place. The transfer of a saint's relics was often the occasion for a grant of indulgence. Henry of Braine, the archbishop of Rheims, granted an indulgence of forty days for the occasion of the transfer of the relics of the martyrs Timothy and Apollinaris, among others, to the church of Saint Timothy. He furthermore tied the veneration of these saints to a more recent person of veneration, Saint Thomas Becket, by declaring "the said translation to be celebrated … on the morrow of the feast of the holy archbishop Thomas of Canterbury."13

Even rarer were indulgences granted to saints' shrines where miracles, the most extraordinary kind of manifestations of saintly power, because wrought by God himself, had been performed. Pope Eugene III in 1145 endowed the church of Saint James the Apostle in Pistoia with an indulgence of seven days because

> the church of Pistoia has demonstrated many splendid and diverse miracles by the merits of Saint James at its altar, for the remorse of the faithful; for we have learned from our venerable brother Atto, the pious bishop of that town, and from other sources, that the blind, the lame, the feeble, and those afflicted by many other sufferings receive the complete restoration of

"Magnum bullarium romanum a beato Leone magno usque ad s. d. n. Benedictum XIII (Luxembourg, 1727), I, 204.

nIbid. ,p.2O0.

aIbid., I, 74, 78, and 79.

"Th. Gousset, Les actes de la province ecclésiastique de Reims (Reims, 1942), II, 355-356.

> health at that church and altar through the prayers and merits of Saint James, as we have proclaimed.14

Indulgences of this kind were, nonetheless, unusual, and Eugene's grant of only seven days may indicate that he was reluctant to recognize the miracles. This indulgence probably originated among the faithful of Pistoia, for the popes often responded positively to requests for indulgences.15

That eagerness was plain in the career of Juliane of Liège, who "had struck a chord with her idea of public, regular, concerted celebration of the eucharist."16 She enlisted the help of Hugh of St. Cher, cardinal legate (and therefore the pope's representative) and, according to the canonist Hostiensis, author of the treasury of merit doctrine,17 in order to popularize the new devotion. Hugh, whose Dominican order was often responsible for administering pastoral care to religious women, wished to encourage Juliane's efforts. Devotion to the Eucharist was especially strong among religious women.18 Hugh's help was generous and significant, for he declared that "we, in order to urge the faithful that they may more reverently celebrate and observe the feast [of the Blessed Sacrament]; to all penitent and confessed, who shall piously travel to a church where the office of the same feast is celebrated, on the same day and through the octave, mercifully relax one hundred days of enjoined penance."19 Juliane had drawn the attention of the Dorninicans to eucharistie devotion through her visions of the Eucharist. In one vision she saw the moon, of which a segment was darkened by a blemish. Twenty years later, a second vision revealed to her that that moon rep-

,4Patrologia Latina (hereafter AC)1Vol. 180, col. 1063:"Plurima clara dlversorum miraculorum genera, beati Jacobi apostoli meritis ad sacratissimum altare suum, ad compunctionem fidelium, in Pistoriensi ecclesia demonstravit; nam sicut venerabili fratre nostro Attone eiusdem civitatis religioso episcopo, et aliis pluribus referentibus, agnovimus, caeci, claudi, contracti, et alii diversis languoribus debiles, in eodem loco, per beati, ut diximus, Jacobi preces et mérita, optata salutis remedia percipere."

"D'Avray, op. cit.,p. 396.

16Mili Rubin, Corpus Christi: The Eucharist in Late Medieval Culture (New York, 1991), p. 172. On the significance of food imagery for medieval religious women, see Caroline Walker Bynum, Holy Feast and Holy Fast: The Religious Significance of Food to Medieval Religious Women (Berkeley, 1987).

"Hostiensis, Summa áurea (Lyon, 1537), Y 67; 288"*.

"Rubin, op. cit., p. 168.

"Acta Sanctorum (hereafter AS), April, Vol. I, p. 462: "Nos enim ad invitandum fidèles quod festum illud venerabilius célèbrent et observent; omnibus poenitentibus et confessis, qui ad ecclesiam ubi Officium agetur de eodem, ipso die et per octavas, accesserint reverenter, centum dies de iniunctis sibi poenitentiis misericorditer relaxamus."

resented a Christian church not fully complete because it lacked the feast of Corpus Christi. Her visions were taken as incontestable signs of divine approbation of her devotion.20 With Hugh's patronage, the popularity of the feast of Corpus Christi spread throughout his legation of Germany.21 Veneration of the Blessed Sacrament went on to become one of the most important devotional observances of later medieval and modern Catholicism.

Most often, however, the saints' relation to indulgences was the same as that of the devout Catholics—as collectors of indulgences for their own spiritual benefit. The connection between indulgences and saintliness extended beyond the promotion of saintly cults. The saints' lives testify that the holy men and women of the Middle Ages were zealous collectors of indulgences. One of Saint Louis's last charges to his son and successor Philip was to obtain indulgences constantly.22 One of Louis's biographers, in fact, testified that Louis even received indulgences while on crusade:

> Besides, when he was in North Africa—because he desired to gain the indulgences granted by the papal legate there to those who carried building stones, or gave help with the works that had to be done—he sometimes carried stones and other similar things, and performed the works of humility.25

Louis's actions are remarkable, since plenary indulgence (full remission of penalty) had been granted to crusaders since the First Crusade. He was, in a sense, gathering a superabundance of indulgences by performing good works of humility beyond what a mathematical calculation of penitence and atonement would suggest.

In an uncharacteristic passage in the vita of Catherine of Siena, one of Christendom's great fourteenth-century spiritual leaders, much of the desire for indulgences seems to have been rooted in a fear of the

20RuMn, op. a'?., pp. 169-170.

2lIbid.,p. 174.

22AS, August, Vol. Y p. 756.

25/lS, August, Vol.y p. 585 :"Praeterea, quando erat trans mare, quia lucrari cupiebat indulgentias, quas legatus Romani pontificis trans mare largiebatur illis, qui saxa portabant, operibusque faciendis ferebant auxilium, hac de causa lapides quandoque portabat, aliave similia, operaque humilitatis exercebat. Id etiam faciebat, uti creditur, ut bonum aliis praeberet exemplum."

pains of purgatory which was common among her contemporaries.24 Her biographer and member of her "family,"25 Raymond of Capua, explains that while at the sulfur baths her mind conjured up "a vivid picture of the pains of hell and purgatory; and I [Catherine] prayed my Creator, whom I had so offended, in his mercy to take in exchange for the pains of the next world which I knew I had deserved."26 Her anxiety over the torments of purgatory extended to her loved ones, and reflected the contemporary, arithmetical image of atonement inherited from the twelfth and thirteenth centuries, namely, the treasury of merit. That image became a doctrine in the teaching of the thirteenth-century Schoolmen, which said that Christ and the saints had won for all Christians an infinite treasury of merit, which could be distributed to the properly disposed by episcopal and papal authority. Indulgences were a kind of withdrawal from the superabundant merit contained in the treasury, which also meant that Christians could keep a spiritual accounting as they made satisfaction for sin, whether an indulgence was worth forty days, one hundred days, or several years of penance.27 After she had despaired of her father's recovery from illness, Catherine asked God

> to grant him the further grace of entering straight into glory without passing through the pains of purgatory. But in reply to this she was told that justice must of necessity be done, at least in one way or another; it is impossible for a soul that has not been fully cleansed to enter into a possession ofthat resplendent glory.28

God was at first reluctant to grant her wish, but she continued to plead, saying that she would make satisfaction for her father's transgressions.

"Richard Kieckhefer has argued that fourteenth-century saints' lives were free of obsession with the afterlife and its torments, Unquiet Souls: Fourteenth-Century Saints and Their Religious Milieu (Chicago, 1984), pp. 130-131.

2On the spiritual families of the later Middle Ages, see David Heriäry, Medieval Households (Cambridge, Massachusetts, 1985), pp. 122-123As a member of her family, Catherine would have been responsible for Raymond's spiritual progress.

"Raymond of Capua, Life of St. Catherine, trans. Conleth Kearns, O.P. (Wilmington, Delaware, 1980), 1.7.70 (p. 64).

27The first indulgences (c. 1075) stipulated that they would remit a fraction of penalty. More precise quantities, like numbers of days or years, became more common in the second half of the twelfth century. On the arithmetical images of indulgences, see Robert W Shaffem,"Images, Jurisdiction, and the Treasury of Merit,"Journal ofMedieval History, 22 (September, 1996), 237-247.

"»Life ofSt. Catherine, 2.7'.220 (p. 209).

God agreed, but told her that henceforth he would "transfer his penalty to your account, and you must bear it till the day you die."[29] When Raymond himself fell seriously ill, he asked Catherine to pray for the pardon of his sins. She obliged but took the further step of requesting an official document from the Curia authenticating the pardon.[30] This document could well have been a confessionale, which was so popular during the late Middle Ages. A confessionale gave its bearer's confessor the right to grant a plenary indulgence at the moment of death.[31] Similarly, when Catherine herself lay in her deathbed, and after she had made her last confession and communion, she "asked for the plenary indulgence which had been graciously granted in her favor by the two popes, Gregory XI and Urban VI."[32] The examples of Catherine and Louis mean that arithmetical images did not necessarily mean an arithmetical, mechanical piety, but could well mean a richer experience of the imitation of Christ.

Catherine, of course, was not alone among the saints in requesting a deathbed indulgence. In his last illness, Saint William Gnoffi

> perceived that the day of his death had now arrived, because he was stricken with fever, and because he was tormented by a pain in his chest; he took to his bed. He quickly asked that a priest be summoned, from whom he often received valid indulgence of sins and then most devoutly the most sacred viaticum of the body and blood of our Lord Jesus Christ, as he had always faithfully believed and humbly adored.[33]

William received indulgences frequently throughout his exemplary life and also unto death. Furthermore, William's biographer connected the quest for indulgences with the reception of the viaticum, another important devotional practice of the later Middle Ages. Indulgences were also linked to other, common forms of saintly piety. The vita of the boy cardinal Peter of Luxembourg, after describing a short life rich in humility, filled with prayer and harsh ascetic discipline, and constant veneration of the cross, likewise mentions Peter's desire to obtain a plenary

[29] Ibid., 2.7.222 (p. 210).

[30] Ibid., 1.9.88-89 (pp.80-82).

[31] Francis Oakley, The Western Church in the Later Middle Ages (Ithaca, New York, 1979), p. 118.

[32] Life of St. Catherine, 3.4.364 (p. 338).

[33] AS, April, Vol. II, p. 466: "Cum sibi iam mortis diem superesse conspicaretur, tum febri correptus, tum pectoris angore extortus, lecto decubuit. Sacerdotem ocius accersiri mandat a quo pluries obtenta peccatorum indulgentia, sacratissimum denlque corporis et sanguinis domini nostri Jesu Christi viaticum tarn devotissime suscipit, quam fidelissime semper credidit et humillime adoravit."

deathbed indulgence: "Happy, they say, the most devout cardinal, about to go forth from this world to God, wishing to be absolved so that he would be with Christ, deserved to obtain by apostolic authority a plenary absolution from penalty and guilt at his hour of death."34

The saints not only sought out indulgences for the hour of their death, but throughout their lives, whether in times of distress or in the ordinary course of life. The Hundred Years' War had devastated the estate and fortunes of Jane Mary of Maillé's family. Her husband was crippled in battle, and his castle destroyed and vassals slain. After his death, she was forced out of her home and scorned by her acquaintances.35 Rather than complain or succumb to discouragement, Jane Mary, now freed from worldly cares, patiently undertook a penitential life, which included the quest for indulgences:

> Thus made truly poor and truly needy, from then on she was not able to have house or lodging either by purchase or lease, for when charity grows cold iniquity flourishes, and her enemies, at the devil's instigation, spoke with her host; he, bent on gain, forgot all mercy and rather harshly threw her out of her ancient residences, in which she had lived honestly and devoutly for many years. Thus freed from worldly cares she visited churches so that she began visiting the tombs of the saints, and so she would receive the indulgences.36

Jane Mary's quest for indulgences led her all over France, even to the royal chapel, where she often adored the standards of the Redeemer.37 Thus, in her case, dispossession and suffering were the occasions for her search for indulgences.

Indulgences were not only sought during great crises like imminent death or dispossession. They were often a regular part of saintly piety. After her conversion, the Englishwoman Margery Kempe made several long pilgrimage journeys, first to Canterbury, then to Compostela,to the Holy Land, and finally to Rome in 1415 for the confirmation of the can-

34AS, July, Vol. I, p. 454: "Felix, inquam, cardinalis devotissimus, ex hoc mundo ad deum transiturus, dissolvi cupiens et esse cum Christo, authoritate apostólica absolutionem plenariam a poena et a culpa in mortis articulo meruit obtinere."

"Kieckhefer, Unquiet Souls, pp. 54-55.

56AS, March, Vol. LU, p. 738: "Sic vere pauper et veré mendica effecta, deinceps domum vel hospitium per locatum sive conductum habere non valuit: nam frigescente caritate abundavit iniquitas, et aemuli eius, diabolo procurante, cum suo hospite locuti sunt: qui lucro intendens, omnis miserationis oblitus, earn eiecit de domo satis dure, in qua remanserat annos multos honeste et devote. Sic igitur a curis mundalibus expedita ecclesias visitabat ut coeperat, loca sanctorum visitans, ut indulgentias consequeretur."

i7AS, March, Vol. III, p. 741.

onization of Bridget of Sweden.38 While in Italy she made the trip to Assist to get the Portiuncula plenary indulgence, which was traditionally available, "on Lammes Day, when there is great pardon of plenary remission, for to purchase grace, mercy, and forgiveness for herself, for all her friends, for all her enemies, and for all the souls in purgatory."39 Ida of Louvain and her spiritual family welcomed and were on good terms with preachers who urged them to receive indulgences:

> There was in that time a certain friar of the Order of Preachers, on close and friendly terms in Christ with Ida, the same servant of Christ. This friar, through grace given and invested by the authority of the apostolic see and of the most high pontiff, in order to win for the Lord a faithful and worthy people, the seekers of good works, devoted himself assiduously to the office of preaching: and those whom he taught internally by the word of preaching, he marked externally by the sign of the living cross, after first putting before his listeners the indulgence of their sins, and setting out for them the indulgence available for their sins. For he was given such a grace from the Lord in this work that there was scarcely anyone, however hard their heart, who could help himself from taking the cross of the Lord.*

The good will exhibited between this Dominican and Ida's followers can only mean that, like the preacher, she taught her family that holiness meant also the quest for indulgences.

Finally, indulgences were related to one of the most important themes in the history of late medieval sanctity—devotion to the passion of Christ.41 This theme was especially dear to the fourteenth-century Dominican mystic Henry Suso. For the young Suso, participation in Christ's passion meant an extreme asceticism. From his eighteenth until his fortieth year of age, he beat himself bloody, wore a hair shirt, an iron

»Kieckhefer, Unquiet Souls, p. 184.

wThe Book of Margery Kempe, ed. Sanford Brown Meech ("Early English Text Society," 212 [Oxford, 1940]), p. 79. The translation is mine. For a recent discussion of indulgences for the dead, see Robert W. Shaffern, "Learned Discussions of Indulgences for the Dead in the Middle Ages," Church History, 61 (December, 1992), 367-381.

4MS, April, Vol. II, p. 174:"Erat eo tempore Frater quidam Ordinis Praedicatorum, eidem Christi famulae satis in Christo familiaris et intimus: qui Sedis Apostolicae Summique Pontificis auctoritate subnixus, officio praedicationis, ad acquirendum domino fidelem populum et acceptabilem sectatoremque bonorum operum, assidue per datam sibi gratiam instabat attendus: et quos verbo praedictationis erudiebat interius, hos exterius vivificae Crucis triumphal! signáculo, praemissa sibi peccatorum indulgentia, consignabat. Tantam enim a domino gratiam assecutus fuerat in hoc opere, quod vix aliquis illo tempore, quantumcumque duri cordis existeret, a suscipiendo salutari signo crucis dominicae se potuerit."

4,Kieckhefer, Unquiet Souls, p. 89.

chain, and a barbed cross under his scapular. Even in cold weather, he refused to warm his feet, so that they bled as he stood in choir with his brothers. "After the servant had led a life filled with the exterior penitential exercises … his whole physical being had been so devastated that the only choice open to him was to die or to give up such exercises. And so he gave them up." In fact, he had a vision wherein God told him that such exercises were not the final steps on the path to spiritual fulfillment.42 Instead, Suso turned to contemplation which led to detachment from worldly concerns. He even counseled those charged to his pastoral care to avoid excessive ascetic discipline.43 Above all, Suso was looking for a daily spiritual program centered on consideration of Christ's passion and which would engage in works of satisfaction for sin. He found part of his desires in the quest for indulgences:

> Eternal Wisdom: My stern justice requires that in all of nature any injustice, be it great or small, has to be atoned for and corrected. Now how should a sinner, who perhaps has committed more than a hundred serious sins—and, according to theological writings, each serious sin requires seven years of atonement or else the unaccomplished atonement has to be performed in the scorching furnace of grim purgatory—alas, when should this miserable soul have finished its penance? When should its long period of anguish be over? How long this would last! Yet look! It can easily do penance and make amends through my innocent and noble suffering. The soul can simply reach into the precious treasure of the merit I earned and draw on it for itself. Even if it were supposed to burn in purgatory for a thousand years, it has removed the guilt and done its penance in a short time so that it enters into eternal joy without any purgatory.44

For Suso, receiving an indulgence was no exterior exercise like those he had undertaken in his younger days, but was a concrete manifestation of interior conversion and devotion to the crucified Christ:

> It [drawing upon the treasury of merit] is accomplished as follows: 1. A person considers with a sorrowful heart very carefully and often the seriousness and number of his offenses, for which he has so clearly deserved angry

"Life of the Servant, pp. 15, 16, 18; in Frank Tobin (ed. and trans.), Henry Suso: The Exemplar with Two German Sermons (Mahwah, New Jersey, 1989), pp. 87-89, 97.

"Arnold Angenendt, "Seuses Lehre vom Ablaß," in Remigius Bäumer (ed.), Reformatio ecclesiae (Paderborn, 1980), pp. 149-150.

"Little Book of Eternal Wisdom, 14, pp. 251-252. Although Suso does not here use the word 'indulgence,' his reference to the 'treasure of merit' is unmistakable. Several years after he wrote the Little Book of Eternal Wisdom Pope Clement VI declared official the treasury of merit doctrine in the bull Unigenitus (1343). Thus, Suso's remarks are an important anticipation of Clement's bull.

> looks from his heavenly Father. 2. He should then consider as nothing his own acts of atonement because, compared to his sins, they are a drop in the ocean. 3· He should then joyfully consider the immensity of my atonement because the smallest drop of my precious blood that flowed abundantly all over out of my loving body could atone for the sins of a thousand worlds. And yet each person draws this atonement to himself only to the extent that he identifies with me by suffering along with me. 4. Finally, a person should humbly and beseechingly sink his small self into the immensity of my atonement and cling to it.45

Suso also linked indulgences to his Christo-centric piety in his later Latin revision of Little Book of Eternal Wisdom, the Horologium sapientiae. He encouraged his readers to say daily prayers for the protection of the Church and increased devotion to the Savior. Of course, the Lord's Prayer was the most efficacious for this purpose, but another would also suffice: "Blessed be the name of our Lord Jesus Christ, of God, and of the glorious Virgin Mary, his mother for ever and ever. Amen. And for this prayer indulgences are granted. The purpose of this prayer addressed to this name is so that . . . this marvelous name may be revived in some way and take its place and be renewed in the hearts of the faithful."46 According to Suso, one of the recognized spiritual masters of his era, indulgences were not only an encouragement to good works, but an exterior manifestation of conversion from religious indifference to sincere desire to grow closer to Jesus.

Perhaps the most striking examples of indulgences and holiness come from those saints who had either received commands to obtain indulgences in visions, or whose quest for indulgences led to visions. Visions, which were extraordinary manifestations of saintly power, were the signs of God's grace working within a man or woman.47 Sometimes, the mere desire or intention to obtain an indulgence resulted in visions which themselves were assurances that sin had been forgiven. Margaret of Cortona (1247-1297) was a strikingly beautiful peasant girl who attracted the amours of a local noble. Her suitor could not, of course, marry her because of her social status. Nonetheless, the two lived together until Margaret's lover was discovered murdered. This event

"Little Book of Eternal Wisdom, 14, p. 252.

*Henry Suso, Horologium sapientiae, ed. Pius Künzle, O.E ("Spicilegium Friburgense," Vol. 23 [Freiburg, 1977]), 2.7 (p. 599): "Benedictum sit nomen domini nostri lesu Christi Dei et gloriosae virginis Mariae matris eius in aeternum et ultra. Amen. Et de hoc exstant indulgentiae. Ratio huius orationis de hoc nomine est . . . ut inquam, hoc mellifluum nomen aliquo modo reviviscat et cordibus fidelium inculcetur ac renovetur."

"Kieckhefer, "Sainthood," pp. 12-13.

prompted Margaret's conversion to a severely penitential life.48 She became especially devoted to the cult of Saint Francis of Assist, to whom she prayed "with precious tears" that she would be made worthy of a plenary indulgence before she died. Her biographer states that her prayers moved Saint Francis to intercede with the Lord for her, such that she was fully absolved of all penalty. Margaret received a vision in which the Redeemer himself told her that he fully absolved her from her sins.49 In Margaret's case, her desire for a plenary indulgence led to such fervent prayer that she did not even need one! Her biographer does demonstrate, however, that indulgences accompanied efficacious prayer and interior conversion.

Indulgences also brought visions to the Prussian wife and mother Dorothy of Montau. Like Margery Kempe, Dorothy's penitential observance included frequent and lengthy pilgrimages. Her husband accompanied her on three journeys from their home and around Aachen to the "land of the Eremites," among whom they stayed for a year and a half, for the purpose of visiting a shrine dedicated to the Virgin Mary. Dorothy also made a pilgrimage to Rome in 1349 and stayed six months, long enough to participate in the Jubilee declared by Clement VI, which of course included a plenary indulgence. During this pilgrimage, she had visions "of supernatural apparitions, she saw saints and heard the voice of Christ, of the most blessed Virgin, and of some saints."50 Like Margaret, the penitential fervor created in Dorothy by the quest for indulgences resulted in a sign of sanctity already attained by the two women, for visions were "God's deeds rather than the saints'," being totally dependent on the will and power of God.51

A vision of Bridget of Sweden is an even more compelling testament to the close relation between indulgences and the imitation of Christ.

"Daniel Bornstein, "The Uses of the Body; The Church and the Cult of Santa Margherita da Cortona," Church History, 62 (June, 1993), 163-167.

"AS, February, Vol. Ill, p. 311:"Haec lacrymosis precibus suum Patrem B. Franciscum quadam die rogavit, ut suis meritis ei dignaretur acquirere plenariam indulgentiam omnium delictorum. Qui suis suffragantibus meritis dilectae filiae Pater a Domino impetravit, ut ei vivae vocis oráculo plenissime indulgeret. Quod quidem donum Margaritae concessit Altissimus expresse loquens in anima, dicens: Ego Jesus Christus, Alius summi et aeterni Patris pro te crucifixus, ab omnibus tuis defectibus plenarie te absolve."

KAS, October, Vol. XIII, p. 497:"In ilia [peregrinatione] autem visione supernaturali intellectuali, vidit imagines et audivit voces Christi, Virginis beatissimae et aliquorum sanctorum."

"Richard Kieckhefer,"Imitators of Christ: Sainthood in the Christian tradition," in Sainthood: Its Manifestations in World Religion, ed. Richard Kieckhefer and George D. Bond (Berkeley, 1988), p. 20.

While she was living in Sweden, Christ appeared to Bridget in a revelation. He commanded her in this vision to make the Jubilee pilgrimage to Rome because "there is a compendium—i.e., a shorter way—to heaven because of the indulgences that the holy pontiffs have merited by their prayers." Not only should Bridget make the journey as a penitential exercise, said Jesus, but also as his envoy and voice to the pope and emperor.[52] Bridget made the journey and virtually became a resident of the Eternal City, "not only because of the indulgences but also because of the promises to be fulfilled,"[53] namely, that Clement VI would return the papal court from Avignon and meet with Charles V Bridget received other revelations concerning the worthiness of indulgences. She was told that seekers of indulgences who intended to abandon sin and live according to the will of God will gain remission of sin, or at least will be led to confession and contrition. God told her that if a man should die one thousand times for his sake, it would not render him worthy of the Beatific Vision, but indulgences enabled him to participate fully in this glory. In a life lasting a millennium, no man could suffice for his sins; yet indulgences remove the debt; one with indulgences who dies in perfect charity and true contrition will be forgiven guilt and remitted penalty.[54] Christ and his mother assured Bridget of the efficacy of the Church's ministrations. Before her trip to the Holy Land, a Franciscan friar confided to her that he doubted whether sinful priests and prelates had the power to grant absolution and remission. Mary appeared to Bridget and told her that God forgives all the truly contrite, even the Franciscan who had confessed his doubts to her. Mary further explained that a pope who is without heresy possesses full and complete authority to bind and to loose from God through his succession to Peter.[55]

Just as Margery Kempe would in the following century, Bridget received one of the most famous visitation indulgences in all Christendom, the Portiuncula, which was also one of the most controversial, since its foundation depended upon an alleged vision of St. Francis. While in Assist, Bridget despaired of its efficacy, but Christ appeared to her and asked her why she was so troubled. She answered that she worried because of those who said that Saint Francis had fabricated the in-

[52] Life of St. Bridget, 64-65, in Marguerite Tjader Harris (ed.), Birgitta of Sweden: Life and Selected Revelations (Mahwah, New Jersey, 1990), p. 92.

[53] Ibid., 75 (p. 94).

[54] Revelations 4.16 and 102. See also Lea, op. cit., III, 47-48.

[55] Revelations 7.7.1-17 (pp. 168-170).

diligence. Jesus then assured her that He Himself had granted it and that no pope would ever recall it.[56] The Portiuncula indulgence itself was the result of a vision attributed to Francis, thereby making it one of the most famous and most controversial in all Christendom. The Portiuncula was the church near Assist rebuilt by Francis. Francesco Bartoli, a Franciscan friar, wrote a history of this indulgence in 1334. According to Francesco, Christ told Francis that he wished the church to be given to his mother Mary.[57] Excited by his vision, Francis had the church repaired after obtaining it from its original owners, the Benedictines. Francis saw that then Christ, Mary, and the angels were in the Portiuncula. He hastened to the church, and encountered the Savior and his mother there. Francis requested of Jesus:

> Our most holy Father, I, a sinner and a wretched thing, humbly beseech that you may deign to grant this grace to the human race, that you concede mercy and indulgence of all sins to each and every person coming to this place and entering this church, by whom confession shall have been made to a priest and penance shall have been taken up. And I ask of the most blessed Mary, your Mother, the advocate for the whole human race, that she may deign to aid me in this and to intercede with your most pious and clement Majesty.[58]

Mary graciously obliged and asked her Son to grant Francis's request. Jesus granted Francis's wish and told him to seek out Pope Honorius III. Francis was commanded to tell the pope that the Savior wanted a plenary indulgence to be granted to the Portiuncula. Honorius was at first reluctant, and the cardinals fretted that such an indulgence would mean the end of the crusades, but Francis persisted. Honorius finally consented to grant the church a plenary indulgence one day out of the year, and asked Francis what proof he would need of the grant. Francis replied that the wishes of Christ were all the proof he needed.[59]

"Lea, op. cit., Ill, 243.

"Bartolus of Assisi, Tractatus de indulgentia s. Mariae de Portiuncula, ed. Paul Sabatier (Paris, 1900), pp. 2-3.

™Ibid.,p. 14 "Sanctissime pater noster, supplico ego miser et peccator quatenus faceré digneris hanc gratiam generi humano, quod concedas veniam et indulgentiam omnibus et singulis venientibus ad locum istum et introeuntibus ecclesiam istam, omnium peccatorum suorum universaliter et singulariter de quibus confessionem fecerint sacerdoti et mandatum susceperint. Et supplico beatissimae Mariae matri tuae advocatae generis humani quatenus pro huiusmodi me adiuvare et apud tuam piissimam et clementissimam maiestatem intercederé dignetur."

"Lea,qp.ai.,p.237.

Though the controversy surrounding the validity of the Portiuncula indulgence has already been well documented,60 the importance of this story lies in the popularity of an indulgence whose origins were attributed to a vision of medieval Christendom's most beloved saint. The story itself is a microcosm of medieval Christianity—a saint's vision, the veneration and intercession of Mary, and mediation granted through the authority of the Church. The Portiuncula was unheard of until 1267—leading one to believe that the attribution to a vision of Francis is indeed a legendary story. In succeeding decades the validity of the indulgence would be called into question, which prompted Francisco Bartoli's treatise on its origins. Nonetheless, pilgrims continued to visit the church, as the cult of Francis and the influence of his order grew; by 1295 the crowds at the Portiuncula were a measure for large assemblies.61 Paulus, who wrote the magisterial history of indulgences in the Middle Ages, at times believed in the historical veracity of the indulgence, but at other times doubted it; he pointed out that—consistent with the growth of his cult—although early lives of Francis contain no mention of the Portiuncula, as time made of Francis a greater legend, so anything connected with him became more wonderful and sometimes fantastic. The Portiuncula was one such addition to his legend.62

By the 1330's the Portiuncula indulgence was known and famous throughout Christendom.63 Bridget traveled far to receive it and wept copiously when doubts about its authenticity were raised. Although medieval and modern scholars have debated the historical veracity of this indulgence, the greater historical significance of the Portiuncula indulgence, as observed by Peter of John Olivi, is the great devotion to the Passion of Christ to which its popularity testifies. That devotion St. Francis taught by imitation:

> It is valuable to consider zealously, as if an eyewitness, the imitation of the passion of Christ wrought in the mind and flesh of St. Francis, and that one experience the vastness of the divine mercy flowing from the passion of

The most recent examination of the abundant literature on the Portiuncula is by Pierre Pèano, "L'indulgence de la Portioncule: origine et signification," in Alessandro démenti (ed.), Indulgenza nel medioevo e perdonanza di Papa Celestino (Aquila, 1987). My thanks to Mr. Thomas Luongo of the University of Notre Dame for bringing this collection of articles to my attention.

"Franz Ehrle,"Die Spiritualen, ihr Verhältnis zum Franciscanerorden und zu den Fraticellen," Archiv für Litteratur und Kirchengeschichte, 1 (1885), 544.

"Nikolaus Paulus, Geschichte des Ablasses im Mittelalter (Paderborn, 1923), II, 316.

65Pèano, op. cit.,p. 54.

> Christ, just as one experiences that mercy in the reception of the indulgence and in the change of heart that accompanies it.64

The great Franciscan theologian observed that Saint Francis himself scorned juridical niceties. What really mattered was the imitatio Christi.6,7 For the faithful of the later Middle Ages, this indulgence was a celebration of the humility and charity of the Poverello.

The Portiuncula indulgence could not have been the only indulgence so esteemed. As Kieckhefer has observed, fears of the afterlife do not loom large in the saints' lives of the fourteenth century, and for that matter, neither do they appear important for thirteenth-century saints' lives. Thus, the saints' lives reject Umberto Eco's suggestion in the best-selling Name of the Rose that the fourteenth century "replaced the penitence of the soul with a penitence of the imagination, a summons to supernatural visions of suffering and blood," a piety based on fear of death rather than of conversion to a more blameless life.66 Catherine and Bridget and Margarite did not live in perpetual fear of the fires of purgatory; so why then should indulgences be so important for them? Why make the heroic efforts to receive indulgences in Rome or the Holy Land? The fourteenth-century saints' quest for indulgences was quite in keeping with the spirituality of earlier periods, wherein interior conversion and works of charity, like indulgences, were keystones. That spirituality continued into later eras, for in the late fifteenth century the Netherlandish Brothers of the Common Life, whose very movement was distinguished by an emphasis on interior, individual piety, asked for indulgences to be attached to the prayers they said.67 Geert Groóte, one of the movement's founders, strongly urged his brothers to read Suso's Horologium sapientiae. The Brothers took no vows but lived in religious communities that emphasized devotion to Christ's Passion. Reflection and prayer were their means to progress in the cultivation of virtue. Even though the visions of the saints were extraordinary ana-

"Pierre Pèano (ed.), "La 'Quaestio fr. Petri Iohannis Olivi' sur l'indulgence de la Portioacvíe" Archivum Franciscanum Historicum, 14 (1981), 73:"Vehementer valet intueri oculata fide renovacionem passionis Christi factam in mente et carne beati Francisci et experiri magnitudinem miseracionis divine manante a passione Christi sicut homo experitur in perceptione indulgencie et in immutacione cordis ipsam concomitantis."

6,Pèano,"L'indulgence,"p. 58.

"Umberto Eco, The Name of the Rose, trans. William Weaver (New York, 1983), p. 119.

67R. R. Post, The Modem Devotion: Confrontation with Reformation and Humanism ("Studies in Medieval and Reformation Thought," Vol. 3 [Leiden, 1968]), pp. 400-401.

logues to contemplation and were sometimes responsible for conversion from a sinful to a holy life, still they believed that the regular cultivation of virtue, in which indulgences played a role, was the most obvious sign of the imitatio Christi. For those persons who were properly disposed, as Olivi suggested, indulgences could foster a more fervent devotion to Christ. All indulgences required that penitents confess and be contrite. Medieval critics of indulgences most often doubted church authority, not the disposition of penitents. If a Lutheran dichotomy between exteriority and interiority was not assumed, as in the cases of the saints, then indulgences encouraged reflection and meditation on the Eucharist, as in the case of Juliane of Liège, or the Passion, as in the case of Suso. Indulgences certainly did encourage repetitiveness in prayer and penitential exercises, but for many that repetitiveness was an aid to contemplating Christ's saving mission, much as monks in their communities recited the Psalms, or modern Catholics recite the Hail Mary over and over again while praying the rosary. Repetitiveness nurtured virtue. By regular prayer or good work, individual Christians became holier persons and became more Christ-like. For the saints considered here, indulgences certainly did foster growth in interior devotion to Christ.

Furthermore, the saints' lives suggest that their own reasons for procuring indulgences, either for the benefit of their own souls or for the purposes of promoting new devotionalisms, were shared by their less saintly contemporaries. As Aviad M. Kleinberg stated in his recent study of medieval sanctity,". . . saints do not constitute a distinct population."[68] Kieckhefer further observed:

> The more we know about the piety of devout Christians in the late Middle Ages, however, the more difficult it becomes to distinguish them from their sainted contemporaries, or a fortiori from those beati whose cult lacked papal confirmation. All these groups shared in what we might call the culture of devotion. . . . The more we know about late medieval piety, the less distinctive the saints appear.[6]

In addition, the textbook treatment that portrays the later medieval faithful at the mercy of the unscrupulous pardoners seems likewise to be a fabrication. Pilgrims and almsgivers knew real from phony sanctity.

*Aviad M. Kleinberg, Prophets in Their Own Country (Chicago, 1992), p. 17.
wKieckhefer,"Holiness," pp. 290-291.

"The belief that medieval people were not aware of the practical aspects of the veneration of saints is both unfounded and anachronistic. Medieval people were quite capable of making very perceptive, mundane—often highly skeptical—observations on the saints and their followers."[70] Those skeptics also understood that receptions of indulgences were more often spiritually edifying than they were empty gestures.

"'Kleinberg, op. cit., p. 19.

THE INFLUENCE OF THE JESUITS ON THE CURRICULUM OF THE DIOCESAN SEMINARY OF FIESOLE, 1636-1646

BY

Kathleen M. Comerford*

Both Protestant and Catholic Reformers considered educational changes to be integral for ensuring the effectiveness and continuation of the Reformations. In particular, religious leaders recognized that the clergy's education must be improved; for Catholics, this would mean training both regular and secular priests. To address the issues important to Catholic Reformation education fully, therefore, historians must pay attention to all clerics. However, many have assumed that there was a clear distinction between the education provided for potential priests by religious orders and that of diocesan seminaries. Based on the understanding that the latter institutions were created by order of the Council of Trent for the purpose of training the secular clergy, many historians of education and of religious orders have argued that the Tridentine diocesan seminaries were run only by the diocese and only for the diocese, without assistance or interference from religious orders, for example, the Society of Jesus. This argument is supported by, for example, the early Jesuit prohibitions against involvement in diocesan education, Carlo Borromeo's expulsion of the Society from his seminaries, and the move by General Aquaviva to withdraw the Society's support from seminaries.1 However, a study of both primary and secondary materials reveals that such a dichotomy between "Tridentine diocesan

*Dr. Comerford is an assistant professor of history in Benedictine College, Atchison, Kansas. This paper is based in part on the author's dissertation, "Education and the Catholic Reformation: The Diocesan Seminary of Fiesole (1575-1675)" (University of Wisconsin-Madison, 1995) and was written while she was a visiting assistant professor of history at Hanover College. An earlier version was presented for the American Catholic Historical Association's spring meeting in Milwaukee in April, 1995, and subsequent revisions were made possible in part by a grant-in-aid from the Friends of the Libraries of the University of Wisconsin-Madison (1996). The author wishes to thank Robert M. Kingdon, Thomas Deutscher, and Susan H. Spruell Mobley, for their comments.

'For the Jesuit decrees on this subject, see below; also see J. C. H. Aveling, The Jesuits (New York, 1981), p. 203.

seminaries" and "seminaries of religious orders" is too fine a distinction to make. Diocesan seminaries were not exclusively diocesan. In many places in Italy, there was some connection, whether direct or indirect, to religious orders: perhaps in a limited way, for example, hiring Dominicans to teach cases of conscience; or perhaps in a very broad sense, for example, an eventual takeover by the Society of Jesus. As a test case, the diocesan seminary of Fiesole, founded in 1636/7, will be studied here.

In 1563, the creation of seminaries in each diocese was legislated at Session 23, Chapter XVIII (de Ref.) of the Council of Trent ("Directions for establishing seminaries for clerics . . "). The boys admitted to diocesan seminaries were to study "grammar, singing, ecclesiastical computation, . . . Sacred Scripture, ecclesiastical books, the homilies of the saints, the manner of administering the sacraments, . . . and the rites and ceremonies." The local clergy, including the bishops, should be the instructors, or should choose "competent substitutes."[2] These directives were to be enforced by the bishop, and the seminaries were subject to his frequent visitation.[3] The Council of Trent thus defined the function of seminaries in a specifically educational way, with an emphasis on disciplinary measures and the pastoral duty of the priests to be trained; in other words, the educational "program" was meant to be explicitly tied to the cura animarum but not necessarily "theological" in the academic sense.

Modern historians have modified the Tridentine definition somewhat, emphasizing the training of clerics for the exercise of their ecclesiastical duties, but also focusing on moral and practical (including

2HJ. Schroeder, O.P., Canons and Decrees of the Council of Trent. Original Text with English Translation (St. Louis, 1941) pp. 175-178; Latin, pp. 446-449: Twenty-Third Session. Decree on Reform. Chapter XVIII: "Directions for establishing seminaries for clerics, especially the younger ones; in their erection many things are to be observed; the education of those to be promoted to cathedral and major churches": "the holy council decrees that bishops, archbishops, primates and other local ordinaries urge and compel, even by the reduction of their revenues, those who hold the position of instructor and others to whose position is attached the function of reading or teaching, to teach those to be educated in those schools personally, if they are competent, otherwise by competent substitutes, to be chosen by themselves and to be approved by the ordinaries. But if these in the judgment of the bishop are not qualified, they shall choose another who is competent, no appeal being permitted. . . . The aforesaid instructors shall teach what the bishop shall judge expedient. In the future, however, those offices or dignities, which are called professorships, shall not be conferred except on doctors or masters or licentiates of Sacred Scripture or canon law and on other competent persons who can personally discharge that office."

>Ibid.,pp. 175-176;Latin, 446-447.

disciplinary) training.4 Some highlight the distinction between seminaries and previously existing educational establishments, both the mendicant collegi and the universities.5 Pietro Tocchini and Pietro Lazzarini noted that a student in the diocese of Lucca saw a clear distinction between Tridentine seminaries and precursors such as the Collegio Capranica or contemporary institutions such as Jesuit colleges: the novelty of the former was "the diocesan character of these [Tridentine] colleges and the obligation of a communal life for the clergy with their superiors to whom their cultural and spiritual formation is tied."6 Antonio Rimoldi emphasized the "total and exclusive dependence" of diocesan seminaries on the local bishops.7 Recently, John O'Malley defined the "Tridentine diocesan seminary" as "a free-standing and programmatically integral institution reserved exclusively for the future diocesan clergy under the direct jurisdiction of the local bishop."8 Thus, diocesan seminaries have been seen as separate from religious orders; administration was a matter for the diocese, specifically for the bishop, and the clergy trained at the institution were to be secular priests prepared for service within the diocese.

These statements are only partially correct. Regardless of the kind or depth of influence, it is clear that at least in the seventeenth century religious orders in general, and the Jesuits in particular, had definite connections to diocesan seminaries. The relationship derives in part from historical factors; the Jesuit model of education was very influential in the sixteenth-century development of diocesan seminaries. Jesuits were active in the early Tridentine discussions on clerical schools in 1546, and their own institutions for training clergy became a kind of model for the later decree of 1563-9 On the other hand, there does not

4Dizionario de erudizione storico-ecctesiastica da s. Pietro sino ai nostri giomi (Venice, 1853), Vol 63, s.v. "Seminario," p. 306; The Catholic Encyclopedia, XIII (1912), 694-695, s.v. "Seminary, Ecclesiastical," by A. Viéban.

'E.g., Luigi Mezzadri,// Collegio Alberoni di Ptacenza (1 732-1815) (Rome, 1971), pp. 96, 99. Mezzadri's distinction arises not only from the educational program of the different institutions, but the living arrangements. The universities did not provide systematic preparation for parish priests and allowed students to continue to live in their homes (p. 38).

The student in question, who was later a teacher there, was Egidio Forcellino da Feltre; his dates are not noted, but he appears to be an early seminarian. Pietro Tocchini and Pietro Lazzarini, Storia del Seminari di Lucca (Lucca, 1969), p. 19.

'Antonio Rimoldi, "Le Istituzioni di San Carlo Borromeo per U clero diocesano milanese,"£« Scuola Cattolica,9h (1965), 428.

"John W. O'Malley, The FirstJesuits (Cambridge, Massachusetts, 1993), p. 233.

'For more on the Jesuit connection to the decrees at Trent, see Mario Barbera (ed. and trans.), La "Ratio Studiorum" e la parte quarta dette costituzioni della compagnia di

seem to be a basis for suggesting that Jesuit connections with Italian seminaries were the norm; Aldo Scaglione surely overstated his case when he remarked that it is "natural" to identify Jesuits with Tridentine seminaries because they were "often joined" due to Jesuit expertise and resources.10 John O'Malley has stated that despite this, the Jesuits resisted involvement in the diocesan seminaries where they could, in large part because of the lack of independence from the episcopal power structure which such involvement invariably meant. Diocesan seminaries were under the direct jurisdiction of the local bishop, but the Jesuits, like other religious orders, had a separate administrative structure and were not ordinarily subject to the authority of the bishop. Preferring to keep their independence, they opposed such involvement.11 Congregation 2, Decree 18 of the Society of Jesus (1565), "Seminaries of clerics are not to be accepted," is a very clear expression of this:

> [I]t did not seem proper to accept [Tridentine diocesan seminaries unless] . . . the foundation was perpetual and so exceptional that this kind of seminary would also abundantly provide for a jointly established college of the Society and if the Society had a sufficient number of suitable staff and if independent governance of it were entrusted to the Society … [in which case] it could be accepted by dispensation of the superior general, but not otherwise. . . . [I]f ever such a commitment were to be accepted, professors in this kind of seminary should not be provided distinct from those who lecture in our schools.12

By 1682, this last part had to be reiterated; Congregation 12, Decree 25 prohibits "assigning some professors to episcopal seminaries whose charge the Society has undertaken and assigning different ones to teach

Gestù (Padua, 1942); Barbera, "L'origine dei Seminari a norma del Concilio di Trento," La Civiltà Cattolica, 91, III (1940), 215-221; Hubert Jedin, Geschichte des Konzils von Trient. Band IV/2: Dritte Tagungsperiode und Abschluß (Freiburg, 1975), pp. 72-74; and James A. O'Donohoe, Tridentine Seminary Legislation: Its Sources and Its Foundation (Louvain, 1957), esp. pp. 33-48 and 63-88.

"'Aldo Scaglione, The Liberal Arts and the Jesuit College System (Amsterdam and Philadelphia, 1986), p. 59; he refers to Theodor Kurrus, Die Jesuiten an der Universität Freiburg im Breisgau 1620-1773: 1 (Freiburg im Breisgau, 1963).

"Owen Chadwick, "The Seminary," in The Ministry: Clerical and Lay ("Studies in Church History," Vol 26, ed. W.J. Shiels and Dana Wood [Oxford, 1989, and Cambridge, Massachusetts, 1990]), p. 11; O'Malley, op. cit., pp. 236-237; for the Jesuit Congregations on this subject, see n. 12, infra.

12John W Padberg, Martin D. O'Keefe, and John L. McCarthy, For Matters of Greater Moment: The First Thirty Jesuit General Congregations. A Brief History and Translation of the Decrees (St. Louis, 1994), p. 116.

in our schools," because that situation could produce disadvantages including "the need to multiply so many professors and the burdens with which the colleges and houses of those provinces are weighed down beyond their strength and income."[13]

However, in practice, Jesuits became more involved in seminaries after the sixteenth century. In addition, there were later developments in educational theory and practice within both the religious orders and the dioceses. Tridentine seminaries were originally meant to be separate from religious orders, and they were indeed independent organizations; for example, out of approximately seventy Italian diocesan seminaries built before 1600, only the Roman Seminary was run by Jesuits in the early seventeenth century.[14] Still, among diocesan seminaries established in Italy in the late sixteenth and early seventeenth centuries, many employed instructors from different religious orders, including Jesuits.[15] In addition, though the Jesuit curriculum, the Ratio studiorum, was more rigorous than that in most diocesan seminaries, it surely influenced these seminaries, as did the secular studia humanitatis which preceded it. Both the Constitutiones of the diocesan seminary of Fiesole and the library inventory of that institution demonstrate the similarities between Jesuit and diocesan education in one case. Local seminaries in Italy in the seventeenth century were not only "Tridentine" and "diocesan," but frequently were also on some level connected to religious orders. This dimension has not always been appreciated in the historiography of seminaries. It has been all but ignored in the historiography of education in the period of the Catholic Reformation, which has rarely considered diocesan seminaries, and

[13] Ibid., p. 341. In general, the Jesuits preferred to keep to their own matters; see, e.g., Paragraph 623 d, Part VII of the Jesuit Constitutions: "when there are some things which are especially incumbent upon the Society or it is seen that there are no others to attend to them, and other things in regard to which others do have care and a method of providing for them, in choosing missions there is reason to prefer the first to the second." The Constitutions of the Society of Jesus, trans, and ed. George E. Ganss (St. Louis, 1970), p. 276.

[14] Using a variety of sources, including local histories and official Catholic Church publications, I have arrived at this number of Italian seminary openings.

[15] For example, Orvieto, which opened in 1614, combined with the local Jesuit college in 1653, and Pavia hired Jesuit maestri for philosophy in the 1640's and 1650's. Eraldo Rosatelli, "Lineamenti storici del Seminario Vescovile di Orvieto," Bollettino dell'Istituto Storico Artístico Orvietano, XXV (1969), 5-62, and Luigi Valle, ? Seminario Vescovile di Pavia dalla sua fondazione aU'anno 1902 (Pavia, 1907), p. 56. The Somaschi Fathers took over the seminary in Vicenza from 1584 to 1707; Luigi Caliaro, 5forte del Seminario Vescovile di Vicenza (Vicenza, 1936), pp. 24-25 and 30.

has focused instead on institutions run exclusively by and for religious orders.16

This study centers primarily on the first decade of operation of the seminary in Fiesole, 1636/7-1646, the time between the writing of its Constitutiones by the founding bishop, Lorenzo della Robbia, and the first inventory of books in the seminary library. Della Robbia provided for the teaching of grammar, humanities (i.e., history and poetry), rhetoric, philosophy, cases of conscience, writing, and singing." This differed from the subjects outlined in the decree of the Council of Trent: at Fiesole, there was no constitutional provision for the study of Scripture, nor for teaching the administration of sacraments other than confession. Aside from these omissions, della Robbia actually had created a more sophisticated program, adding philosophy and humanities; he had also taken into account the possibility of low levels of literacy by including writing along with grammar. Both the books students were required to bring with them to the seminary of Fiesole (including "some spiritual books" and the Catechism of the Jesuit Robert Bellarmine) and the directives on behavior of seminarians emphasized devotion, obedience, and the practical pastoral aspects of theology, the cura animarum or care of souls.18

"For a discussion of this historiography, see Mark R. Forster, The Counter-Reformation in the Villages: Religion and Reform in the Bishopric of Speyer, 1560-1720 (Ithaca, New York, 1992), p. 6; for an example of that characterization, see Philip T. Hoffman, Church and Community in the Diocese of Lyon, 1500-1789 (New Haven, 1984), pp. 1, 42, and the majority of the commemorative studies, e.g., Franco Molinari,"Il Seminario di Piacenza e il suo fondatore," in Ravennatensia III.Atti del Convegno di Bologna (1968) (Cesena, 1972), pp. 21-65. Education history is also deficient in this respect; see, e.g., Pietro Braido (cd.),Esperienze di pedagogía cristiana nella storia. Vol. 1: Sec. TV-XVII; Vol.2:Sec.XVII-XIX ("Enciclopedia délie Scienze dell'Educazione,"Vol. 25 [Rome, 1981]); Paul Grendler, Schooling in Renaissance Italy: Literacy and Learning, 1300-1600 (Baltimore, 1989); Luigi Secco, La pedagogía della Controriforma: Teoría e scienza dell'educazione (Brescia, 1973); Luigi Volpicelli (ed.), ? pensiero pedagógico della Controriforma (Florence, I960); and William Harrison Woodward, Studies in Education during the Age of the Renaissance, 1400-1600 (New York, 1965). For the most part, seminaries are absent from these studies.

"Archivio del Seminario di Fiesole (ASemFí), unfoliated MS, Confirmatio et Constitutiones Seminara Fesulani.Anno Domini MDCXXXLX. Urbanus PP VIII. ad Perpetuam Rei Memoriam. "Militantis Ecclesiae regimini," fols. 3" (by my count).

"The Constitutiones do not require the students to bring particular books; rather, the prefect and/or maestri should decide: "libri secondo il bisogno e parère del Prefetto degli studii e Maestro; qualche libro Spirituale, la Dottrina Christiana del Belarmino [sic], il Breviario, ö offitiolo, Corona o Rosario," Confirmatio et Constitutiones, fol. 20". There is a

Despite the omission of Scripture from the list of required disciplines, some teaching of that subject did occur in the seminary of Fiesole, at least at mealtimes. In 1640, there were references to one or more Dominican lecturers on Scripture, one of whom appears to have been the same person as the first instructor of cases of conscience. There is no more information available either for them or for this position beyond one entry in the Ricordi of the seminary and two indications of salary in the account books; as a result it is not clear that Scripture was taught regularly.19 In addition, there were no instructors of speculative, moral, or positive theology. This lack of attention to academic theology teaching seems not to have been an exception in diocesan seminaries. Thomas Deutschere study of the diocesan seminary in the city of Novara, opened in 1565, demonstrated that the curriculum at this institution consisted of the study of the Catechism of the Council of Trent, cases of conscience, ecclesiastical ceremonies, and singing.20 According to Carlo Fantappiè, moral and dogmatic theology were taught fairly frequently in the mid- to late eighteenth century, but polemical theology and Scriptures still were not.21

Neither was theology, in most cases, a subject that seminarians studied in other locations. It is true that there were some connections between the diocesan seminary and schools of religious orders; for example, in Novara, there is evidence that the Jesuit and Cannobian educational institutions were closely related to the diocesan seminary. Deutscher noted that by the mid-seventeenth century the ratio studio-

1635 Latin version of the Constitutiones which did not include a similar section; the 1639 Italian version is the one with papal confirmation, so I take it as more authoritative.

"Archivio Vescovile di Fiesole (AVescFi), VTI.60: In questo Libro chiamato, Ricordi, e Copie di Mandati, si noteranno tutti Ii ordini, e mandait, che dal Governatore del Seminario giomalmente si faranno; e pero da carte una fino a 40 servira per Mandati, e da c. 40 ftno a 80 per Ricordi, e da 80 sino alla fine si faranno TInventarii de Mobili del Seminario [1637-/709], fol. 43' refers to a Giuseppe Alippi, "Lettore Domenicano,"who lectured in Scripture. Angelo Paccivechelli,O.P.,who was identified in Ricordi as maestro di cast and filosofia on November 8, 1639 (fol. 41') was also listed as a maestro di teología in November, 1639-January, 1640, in ASemFi 249: Entrata ed Uscita, 1637-1670, fol. 241", and in Ricordi as being too Ul to continue as lettore in Teología on November 1, 1640, fol. 42".

20Thomas Deutscher, "Seminaries and the Education of Novarese Parish Priests, 1593-1627," Journal of Ecclesiastical /ftstory, 32 (1981), 306.

!1Carlo Fantappiè, "Istituzioni ecclesiastiche e istruzione secundaria nell'Italia moderna: i seminari-collegi \escovüi? Annali dell'Istituto Storico Italo-germanico in Trento, XV (1989), Tabella 2: "Insegnamenti curriculari e facoltativi impartiti in alcuni collegi italiani,"p.229.

rum of the Jesuit schools had a profound influence on clerical education in Novara, and that the Cannobian School of Novara trained "the great majority of priests" either alone or in combination with the seminary.22 However, I have found evidence of non-seminary education for only a very small number of Fiesolan seminarians in my sample of 417; out of a total of nine, only one, Giacomo di Lorenzo de Franci, went to the Jesuit College in Florence in 1639. a The reason given for de Franci's outside training was that he was to become "maestro"; he did serve as maestro delTumanità, maestro di grammatica, and maestro del seminario, as well as rector and governor of the seminary.24 No other maestri, however, are identified as having received Jesuit training. In none of these cases is there evidence to suggest that the purpose of going to the schools of the religious orders was to train in theology. The seminary in Fiesole, like others in Italy and abroad, was influenced by the Jesuit curriculum—it included the humanistic subjects of rhetoric, philosophy, and grammar—but in this case, apparently operated alone instead of in co-operation with outside educational institutions. In any event, it still did not provide teaching in theology, medicine, mathematics, or the natural sciences, as might be found in a Jesuit College or a university.

Because of the clear influences of religious orders on Tridentine seminaries, "diocesan" must refer to the students and "graduates," and even to some extent to the curriculum, rather than to the academic staff. Although the seminary of Fiesole agreed to accept students from other dioceses, out of a total of 417 people identified at some point as students, I found only twenty-five from outside the diocese in the forty-year period for which I have records. This group of twenty-five includes

22Thomas Deutscher, "The Growth of the Secular Clergy and the Development of Educational Institutions in the Diocese of Novara (1 563-1 772),*Journal ofEcclesiastical History, 40 (1989), 393-394.

23There was no Jesuit establishment in the diocese of Fiesole until the nineteenth century, and none survives today. For information on the foundation, see Giuseppe Raspini, La Chiesa Fiesolana e Ie sue Istituzioni (Fiesole, 1993),PP- 98, 252. None of the Fiesolan Jesuit foundations continues until today. The Florentine Jesuit house was opened in 1552. Three of the other students left for the University of Pisa; two were paid for from the decime ecclesiastiche of the "Studio di Pisa"; and two others went to "studi maggiori." Ricordi and the Entrata ed Uscita series.

24"15 gennjaio]: fu determinate che Jacopo Franci n[ost]ro alunno andassi a studio in fiorenza al collegio de PP Giesuiti accio si faccia perito nelli studii per poter serviré di maestro al n[ost]ro sem[ina]rio et il d[etto] d[ie] di ando al d[etto] Collegio, dovendo dopo gli studi ritirarsi dal priore in S. Maria in Campo, con che deva vivere a spese del n[ost]ro sermo." Ricordi, iol. 42'.

twenty-one students from the city of Florence, in the valley below Fiesole.25 Students in this seminary were mostly from nearby areas, in fact almost entirely from the diocese of Fiesole, and they stayed in those areas and in the seminary once they were ordained.26 The maestri hired to teach were also secular clergy, with the exception that Dominicans were hired to teach casuistry.27 Some of the seminarians also held staff positions, and a relatively small number of men from the diocese rotated academic and administrative staff positions from 1636 to 1675. As far as I know, none of those men rose to importance on an international level, even in other parts of the Italian peninsula. Clearly, the seminary community was diocesan.

"The other three were from the dioceses of Siena (one student) and Arezzo (two students), both of which, like Florence, bordered the diocese of Fiesole. The students from other dioceses, like "those who did not want to be churchmen," were to be charged full tuition. Confirmatio et Constitutiones, fol. 4". The numbers for non-seminarian candidates for ordination from outside the diocese were far higher than for seminarians from outside the diocese; I estimate as high as 41% of the promotions to any order (which is to say not individual clerics, but promotions) from 1635 to 1675 were from other dioceses. The overwhelming majority of those were also Florentines. For centuries the dioceses of Fiesole and Florence were engaged in jurisdictional disputes, eventually resulting in the transfer of the bishop of Fiesole to Florence, where the archbishop of that city (the metropolitan of the province) could keep watch over the bishop of Fiesole. On the conflicts, and the geography of the dioceses of Florence and Fiesole (the latter of which is not contiguous), see Alberto M. Fortuna and Lorenzo M. Fortuna, "Fiesole antica: Leggende, archeologia e storia" (pp. 9-36); Giuseppe Raspini, "La struttura organizzativa della diócesi dal medioevo agli inizi del '900" (pp. 63-74); and Raspini, "La sovranità civile dei vescovi di Fiesole" (pp. 199-202), in Fiesole: una diócesi nella storia. Saggi, contributi, immagini (Fiesole, 1986).

26No complete list of seminary students or non-seminary diocesan ordinations for the first forty years of the institution (1636-1675) exists except the one I have compiled using ordination records and the Ricordi of the seminary. The Libri ordinationes frequently, but not unfailingly, identify candidates for ordination by name and town of origin. The number of non-Fiesolans is based on these designations and the location of certain individuals in the cittadinari fonti of the Archivio di Stato in Florence (ASF). Less than 9% of the men in this seminary community were citizens of Florence, whether they resided in the city of Florence or not (the diocese of Fiesole overlapped with the contado of Florence). By contrast slightly over 12% of non-seminarians ordained in Fiesole were citizens of Florence. ASF, Cittadinari, Quartiere di S. Croce, Filza 3 (1500-1600) and Filza 4 (1600-1700); Quartiere di S. Giovanni, Filza 3 (1500-1600) and Filza 4 (1600-1700); Quartiere di S. Maria Novella, Filza 3 (1500-1600) and Filza 4 (1600-1700); and Quartiere di S. Spirito, Filza 3 (1500-1600) and Filza 4 (1600-1700).

27The five men identified as maestro de casi were all Dominicans: Angelo Paccivechelli (1638-1640), Giovanni Domenico Tiburzi (1640-1646), Angelo Civiglioni (1651-1654), Anselmo Maria Sardini (1655- 1662), and Raimondo Maccian[t]i (1662-1670). No one was listed in that position from 1646 to 1651. ASemFi, Ricordi, and the Entrata ed Uscita series,passim.

However, "diocesan" does not necessarily mean "secular"; there was a definite affinity for the Society of Jesus at the institution. This is evident from several sources, including inventories of the library, taken in 1646, 1703-1715, and 1720. These lists of books, which I use with the Constitutiones to suggest a possible reconstruction of the curriculum, are not indicative of a very ambitious educational program, particularly in theology.28 To begin with, even by contemporary standards, the library was small. At a size of seventy-four volumes in 1646, Fiesole's collection was dwarfed by, for example, the Abbaye Sainte-Geneviève in Paris, which held between 500 and 600 volumes in 1630 and between 7,000 and 8,000 in 1673·29 There are no standard elementary scholastic grammars such as those of Donatus, Priscian, or Alexander de Villedieu; no copies of Aristotle or Plato, or any other works on logic; only one catechism; and a limited collection of canon law. The largest categories of books are history (nine volumes), Scripture study (eight volumes), casuistry (six volumes), and rhetoric (sacred, six volumes; secular, five volumes). The seminary library reflected the practical needs of the parish clergy and did not attempt to create an intellectual elite, as the Jesuit colleges did; contemporary Jesuit gymnasia and universities contained books of Hebrew and Greek grammar, prose and poetry; arithmetic; mathematics; physics; metaphysics; astronomy; and geometry.30 Rather,

"The archives hold documents dated 1646, 1703-1715, and 1721, which are called inventories. See the attached appendix for the citations and a description of the collection from 1646. For examples of using non-curriculum documents to reconstruct a curriculum, see, among others, Charles Homer Haskins, Studies in the History of Mediaeval Science (New York, 1924, I960), pp. 356-376, and Alfonso Maierii, University Training in Medieval Europe, trans, and ed. Darleen N. Pryds (Leiden, 1994), pp. 10-16.

2'Nicholas Petit, "La bibliothèque de l'Abbaye St-Geneviève," box in Claude Jolly, "Unité et diversité des collections religieuses," in Jolly (ed.), Histoire des bibliothèques françaises, Vol. 2; Les Bibliothèques sous l'Ancien Régime 1530-1789 (Paris, 1988), p. 21.

MSee, for example, Tables 7 and 8 in Joseph S. Freedman, "Aristotelianism and Humanism in Later Reformation German Philosophy: The Case of Clemens Timpler," in The Harvest of Humanism in Central Europe: Essays in Honor of Lewis W. Spitz, ed. Manfred Fleischer (St. Louis, 1990), pp. 228-230; Thomas H. Clancy,^« Introduction to Jesuit Life: The Constitutions and History through 435 years (St. Louis, 1976), who prints two lists of recommended reading for Jesuit Novice Masters and Tertians in 1581 and 1616, pp. 123-126. For comments on letters written between Jesuits in Italy in the sixteenth century which note some specific books read in Jesuit seminaries, see Andrea Battistini, "I Manuali di retorica dei Gesuiti," in Gian Paolo Brizzi (ed.), La "Ratio studiorum." Modelli culturali epratiche educative dei Gesuiti in Italia tra Cinque e Seicento (Rome, 1981), pp. 77-120. Kurrus summarized the library of the Universität Freiburg in Die Jesuiten an der Universität Freiburg, p. 100. However, see Candido Pozo, "La Facoltà di teología del Collegio Romano nel XVI secólo," in L'Università Gregoriana: Istituzione ignaziana ("Archivum Historiae Pontificiae," Vol. 29 [Rome, 1991]), pp. 26-27, which discusses the

it was the purpose of the seminary to produce a group of men capable of exercising pastoral and sacramental duties. Still, the influence of the Society of Jesus on the first extant inventory (1646) is quite noticeable. Men from a variety of religious orders (Benedictines, Dominicans, Franciscans, Jesuits, Oblates, and Regular Canons) wrote books held by the seminary, but the Society of Jesus dominates. This may have to do with the management of the seminary when the library was created: Bishop della Robbia had a Jesuit education. Eight different Jesuits were the authors of nine books, including two histories, a loci communes, two Biblical commentaries, one work of sacred oratory, and one which is not clearly identified; a tenth book was probably written by yet another member of the Society of Jesus.31

Beyond the direct evidence of Jesuit authors, there is evidence of Jesuit influence among non-Jesuit authors. One of the casuist texts was written by Robert (Gregory) Sayer, a Benedictine monk who had been educated at the Jesuit English Seminary at Douai and the Jesuit English College at Rome.32 The northern humanist Justus Lipsius, author of a devotional book in the seminary, both considered joining the Society of

teaching of pastoral matters, e.g., cases of conscience, in Jesuit schools, and the statutes of the Seminario Romano, printed in Massimo Marcocchi, La Riforma Cattolica: documenti e testimonianze. Figure ed istituzioni dal secólo XV alla meta del secólo XVII, Vol. 2 (Brescia, 1970), pp. 65-77.

"The works by Jesuits to which I am referring are Diego de Baeza (1582-1647), Commentaria moralia in evangelicam historiam; Francisco Labata (1549-l6$l), Apparatus Concionatorum; Francisco de Mendoza (Mendoca, Mendonça) (1572-1626), Commentaria in libros Regum and Viridarium sacrae ac profanae eruditionis; Pedro Juan (Joâo) Perpiñá (Perpinyá, Perpinian) (1530-1566), Orationes (exactly which collection of his sermons was in the library is unclear); Luis de la Puente (1554-1624), Expositio moralis et mystica in Canticum Canticorum; Martin Antoine del Rio (Delrio) (1551-1608), the unidentified "Martino del Rio singularis locorum"; Jacques Salían (1558-1640), Annales ecclesiastici Veteris Testamenti; Famiano Strada (1572-1649), Della guerra di Fiandra; Orazio Torsellino (1 545- 1599), Vita di S. Francesco Xaviero. The possible tenth author is Alfonso Rodriguez (1538-1616), who may have been the author referred to in the citation "Due Tomi del Rodrigues." If the unidentified Catechism is Bellarmine's (which the students were required to own) rather than the Catechism of the Council of Trent (an equally logical choice), there could be eleven Jesuit authors in the library. Of particular interest in this list is Perpiñá, who was a famous orator and professor of rhetoric at the Roman College in the years 1561-1565 (Mario Fois, "L'insegnamento delle Lettere al Collegio Romano," in L'Università Gregoriana: Istituzione ignaziana, pp. 46, 52); though he certainly was not della Robbia's teacher, he probably had some influence on the selection of rhetoric texts at the Roman College.

"Leslie Stephen and Sidney Lee (eds.), Dictionary of National Biography from earliest times to 1900, Vol. XVII (Oxford, 1917, 1973), s.v. "Sayer, Robert," by Thompson Cooper.

Jesus and was spiritually advised by Martin Antoine Del Rio, S.J., who was the author of one of the volumes in the seminary.33 In addition, there are other suggestions of Jesuit influence: Aquinas, Cicero, and Quintilian, all of whom are represented in the library, were standard parts of the Jesuit rhetoric curriculum, and exegetical theology, for example, the Moralia of Gregory I, was an important focus of early Jesuit theology teaching.34 The Jesuit curriculum developed through the later sixteenth and the seventeenth centuries to include an emphasis on moral theology, particularly in the discipline of casuistry. The number of texts related to the formation of confessors establishes another connection, although a Jesuit favorite, Cajetan's Summula, did not appear on a Fiesolan list until the eighteenth century.35 A final link is the Life of one of the first Jesuits, Francis Xavier, by Orazio Torsellino, SJ.; this is the only spiritual biography in the inventory.36 In addition to these direct and indirect connections, the association between the seminary of Fiesole and the Society of Jesus is evident in the continued participation in the Ignatian Spiritual Exercises at least throughout the seventeenth century. Della Robbia stated in his Constitutiones that seminarians were to spend eight days making the Spiritual Exercises of Ignatius of Loyola upon their final promotion.37 In 1690, Bishop Filippo Neri Altoviti made explicit reference to students annually participating

"Jason Lewis Saunders,/wsrî<s Lipsius: The Philosophy of Renaissance Stoicism (New York, 1955), p. 120.

540n Jesuit curricula, see esp. Francesco C. Cesáreo, "Quest for Identity: The Ideals of Jesuit Education in the Sixteenth Century," pp. 17-33, and Paul G. Crowley, "Theology in the Jesuit University: Reassessing the Ignatian Vision," pp. 155-168, both in Christopher Chappie (ed.), The Jesuit Tradition in Education and Missions: A 450-Year-Perspective (Scranton, 1993), and Mario Scaduto, Studi e Cultura: il pensiero ignaziano nella sua evoluzione (Rome, 1974).

"Of course, the Jesuits were criticized, especially by the Dominicans, for moral laxity in their particular form of casuistry. See O'Malley, op. cit., pp. 137-152, esp. 145-147. However, this issue was of less importance in Italy than in France, and there is no indication of a conflict in Fiesole between Dominican maestri and Jesuit methods, books, or the priests who administered the Spiritual Exercises.

4TIle Prediche del B. Ignazio in the inventory probably does not refer to Loyola, but may be Ignazio della Croce, a Discalced Augustinian; I have found no indication of his dates of birth or death—only a single reference: "Ignatius a Cruce, Prediche quadragesimali, Napoli, 1774," in Luciano Allegra, Ricerche sulla cultura del clero in Piemonte: le biblioteche parrocchiali nett'arcidiocesi di Torino, sec. XVH-XVIII (Turin, 1978), p. 152. Other sermons of Ignazio della Croce were published in 1746, 1747, 1755, and 1763.

^Confirmatio et Constitutiones, fols. 12"-13'. Jesuits were obligated, after 1608, to make the Spiritual Exercises annually. Ganss, op. cit., p. ?. 21. The exercises were from the beginning not restricted to members of the Society of Jesus: paragraph 649, Part VTJ, states: "The exercises of the first week can be made available to large numbers; and some examinations of conscience and methods of prayer (especially the first of those which are

in the Spiritual Exercises.™ There is no copy of the Spiritual Exercises recorded in the seventeenth or eighteenth centuries, though it is clear that the seminarians did make them, travelling to Florence to fulfill the obligation.39

The Jesuit ratio studiorum was based on similar educational theory but different educational goals from the seminary of Fiesole. The curriculum of the Jesuit seminary was longer, more systematic, and more rigorous; while not as difficult as that of Jesuit universities, it certainly outdistanced diocesan seminaries. In addition to the subjects della Robbia prescribed for the seminary of Fiesole, the Jesuits often taught mathematics and positive and scholastic theology. The curriculum of the Jesuit Roman Seminary, for example, consisted of grammar, humanities, rhetoric, philosophy, scripture, and theology.40 This differed from the subjects taught in Fiesole on several counts: music, writing, and cases of conscience were not taught in the Roman seminary, and theology was not taught in Fiesole. The differences can be explained by referring to the Jesuit sense of their mission. Ignatius of Loyola resisted the demands of both the church hierarchy and the people to have the Jesuits engage in chanting the hours in common; he did allow the non-Jesuit students in the schools to learn singing, but was reluctant to distract scholastics from "apply[ing] their efforts to the pursuits that are more proper to our vocation."41 Those in the Roman Seminary who were inclined more to parish life than to life as a Jesuit were, after 1575, separated and given a "less intellectual and more practical" education (i.e.,

touched on in the Exercises) can also be given far more widely; for anyone who has good will seems to be capable of these exercises." Ibid., p. 283. Ln addition, Balthazar Tellez, a Portuguese Jesuit, stated that the Exercises benefited the members of the Society, but "how much more important and profitable they will be for the seculars, who are more involved in the things of the world." Chronica da Companhia di Lesu, na provincia de Portugal (Lisbon, 1645), p. 184.

"AVescFi VII. 1/A. 18: Editto sopra la contribuzione e tassa del Seminario di Fiesole. Filippo Neri Altoviti per la Grazia di dio e della S. Sede Apostólica Vescovo di Fiesole, e Conte du Turicchi (Florence, 1690).

"Not only do the Constitutiones mandate the Exercises (Confirmatio et Constitutiones, fol. 13"), but the Ricordi make mention of the absence of the seminarians for the purposes of the Exercises: e.g., March 31, 1642 stile florentino: "come il di sopradetto [March 31, 1642] ando a Firenze a far gl'esercitii di S. Ignatio, come comandano le constitution! del Seminario M. Francesco Fabbrini."

"See, e.g., Domenico Rocciolo, "Font! per la storia del Seminario Romano," Ricerche per la Storia Religiosa di Roma: studi, documenti, inventari, 7 (1988), 392, who states that the seminarians took Latin grammar, humanities, rhetoric, philosophy, Scripture, and theology classes at the Collegio Romano. See also n. 30, supra.

"Constitutions of the Society of Jesus, pp. 261-262; see O'Malley, op. cit., pp. 159-160.

one without philosophy and theology), which focused above all on preaching and the administration of the sacrament of confession, much like the "typical" diocesan seminary. In the more rigorous program of the Roman College, cases of conscience were read on feast days, but not as part of the regular course of study.42

For the case of Fiesole, it seems most likely that the period of the most significant Jesuit influence was the episcopacy of Lorenzo della Robbia, which ended in 1645. Later library inventories do not show as strong a Jesuit presence. The list from 1703 to 1715 contains none written by Jesuits, and the 1721 record of a donation by Luigi Maria Strozzi, bishop of Fiesole from 1716 to 1735, includes three books by Jesuit authors (BeUarmine's catechism, Jacques Saltan's Annales ecclesiastici, also found on the 1646 inventory, and Sebastian d'Abreu's Institutio parocht) along with the Summula of Cajetan, which the Jesuits favored. Even though one text is the same as in 1646, and Bellarmine was a required purchase for students in the 1630's and was in the library in 1721, in general it is clear that the later books did not "replace" the earlier Jesuit texts. Considering that approximately sixty years passed between the time these lists were compiled, it is difficult to understand what happened to the books. Since the seminarians still practiced the Spiritual Exercises and there were texts written by members of the Society in 1721, the Jesuit connection was not completely severed; yet the change is still curious and difficult to explain from the sources. In general, it would seem that the influence that the order had on the institu-

"Rocciolo, op. cit., p. 392. Cases of conscience were taught in some Jesuit colleges. Laynez and Ignatius both advocated the study of casuistry, though Ignatius relegated it in Part IV of his Constitutiones to a marginal role in positive theology. Among manuals used by Jesuits were the Summa Navarra used in Fiesole in the beginning of the seventeenth century; the Summula peccatorum of Cajetan used in Fiesole in the beginning of the eighteenth century; and the Direttorio of Juan de Polanco. Giancarlo Angelozzi, "L'lnsegnamento dei casi di coscienza nella prattica educativa della compagnia di Gesù," in Brizzi, op. cit., pp. 121-162; see Polanco's Chronicon for 1553, printed in Monumenta Paedagogica Societatis Iesu. Edidit ex integro refecit nevisque textibus auxit Ladislaus Lukács, Vol. I: 1540-1556 (Rome, 1965), p. 568. See ibid., pp. 263-264, for comments on casuistry in Part FV of the Constitutions of the Society of Jesus. Hieronymus Nadal cautioned against neglecting the discipline, particularly when there are students who might not become Jesuits (ibid., p. 264 n. 9, quoting from Nadal, Scholia in Constitutiones et Declarationes S. P. Ignatii [Prato, 18831). This was not a required subject, however. Polanco sent a letter in 1554 to the rectors of the Italian colleges (meaning the lower schools) in which he recommended "some" lessons in Scripture on Sundays, "sometimes" (tal volta) substituting cases of conscience (Lukács, op. cit., p. 454 and n. 4). Logic and other "higher sciences" should not be taught. The prescription of reading cases on feast days in the Collegio Romano is found ibid., p. 441, from a 1553 letter of Polanco to Hadrian Adriaenssens in Louvain.

tion was mainly indirect (no Jesuit faculty, and only one student who attended the Jesuit college). This underscores the point that diocesan serninaries were not necessarily islands unto themselves, yet it also supports the claim that diocesan seminaries were not dependent on religious orders.

Elsewhere in Italy, the model of separation of Jesuit from diocesan seminaries should also be qualified. The only Italian diocesan seminary in the sixteenth and early seventeenth centuries which was operated exclusively by the Jesuits was the Roman Seminary43 However, there was also some Jesuit connection at the seminaries of Cremona, Orvieto, Novara, and Pavia, in personnel, curriculum, or both. Students in Cremona also went to Jesuit gymnasia; the seminary in Orvieto combined with the Jesuit college in the eighteenth century; and Jesuits taught philosophy and theology in the seminary of Pavia in the mid-seventeenth century.44 This does not mean that the connection between Jesuits and local seminaries was either inevitable or extremely close. All the other constitutions I found, like that of Fiesole, show the influence of both the ratio studiorum and the studia humanitatis, but follow neither slavishly. Scholastic theology and philosophy were very rare at seminaries, but there seems to have been something like exegetical theology at the seminary of Vicenza.45

Was the only connection between the Jesuits and the seminary in Fiesole historical and accidental? It is surely true that all diocesan seminaries have some connection to the Society of Jesus. The Jesuits had great influence on the formulation of the decree on seminaries at the Council of Trent. Some Italian seminaries had closer ties to the Society, and Fiesole was one of them. However, the ties there seem to have been strongest during the episcopate of Lorenzo della Robbia, and must therefore have sprung from his early association with the Jesuits—his own education was at the Jesuit Roman College, which taught according to the Ratio studiorum. In fact, the author of one of the texts kept

«O'Malley, op. cit., pp. 236-237.

44See Angelo Berenzi, Storia del Seminario Vescovile di Cremona (Cremona, 1925), pp. 77-79; Eraldo Rosatelli, "Lineamenti storici del Seminario Vescovile di Orvieto," Bolletino dett'Istituto Storico Artístico Orvietano, XXV (1969), 13-20; Luigi Valle, // Seminario Vescovile di Pavia dalla sua fondazione all'anno 1902 (Pavia, 1907), p. 56; and Silvio Tramontin, "Gli inizi dei due seminari di Venezia," Studi veneziani, 7 (1965), 363-377. Chadwick, op. cit., p. 7,discussed the positive impact the suppression of the Jesuits had on the diocesan seminaries, both in terms of acquiring buildings and expanding libraries.

45Luigi Caliaro, Store'« del Seminario Vescovile di Vicenza (Vicenza, 1936).

in the seminary under his tenure was Famiano Strada, a Jesuit who taught rhetoric at the Roman College during the period della Robbia was probably a student there.46 In addition, there is a clause in the Constitutiones which is practically taken verbatim from the Rules of the Roman Seminary, and which does not appear in two other diocesan Rules to which I had access: after being admitted to the seminary, students were required to take time apart from the others to contemplate the institution and the way of life they had chosen.47 The connection to the Society of Jesus neither strengthens nor -weakens the case for calling the seminary of Fiesole a "Tridentine diocesan seminary." As O'Malley convincingly argued, Ignatius and his immediate followers were not "Tridentine reformers" in the sense of actively pursuing the program outlined at the Council of Trent, but their reforms were nonetheless compatible. The influence of Jesuits on local seminaries in Italy is in accord with this statement.48 In addition, the "competent substitutes" clause in the Council of Trent's decree on seminaries, which allowed bishops to appoint others to carry out the educational functions assigned to them by the Council, could have been interpreted by some to mean employing Jesuits.49

"Scaglione, op. cit., ?. 107, identifies Strada as "professor of rhetoric "inl617. Della Robbia became bishop of Cortona in 1628 and of Fiesole in 1634, and died in 1645. I have not found a date of birth for Delia Robbia, but it is surely likely that he could have been taught personally by Strada. The book by Strada kept in the seminary was Della guerra di Fiandra.

"The Seminario Romano: "Subito che saranno ricevuti in casa, avanti che si mettino tra l'altri Collegian, si tenghino alcuni giorni separatamente, acciö in quel tempo considerino diligentemente l'instituto delà vita che vogliono pigliare, et Io considerino più intensamente, et si propongano più ferinamente nell'animo quel che hanno a fare, et s'apparecchino con più devotione a fare la sua promissione." Marcocchi, La Riforma Cattolica,No\. 1 (Brescia, 1967), p. 69. The Seminario Fiesolano: "Ricevuti che saranno in Seminario avanti si mettano tra gl'altri Collegiali, Staranno alcuni giorni separati, acciö in quel tempo considerino con più diligenza lo stato che dovranno pigliare, e facendo ancora reflessione particolare sopra i presentí statuti si proponghino fermanente nell'animo l'osservanza di essi." Confirmatio e Constitutiones, under the heading "Ordine Particolare per i chierici della Diocese di Fiesole che veranno in Seminario." This does not appear in the Seminario Maggiore di Firenze's "Costituzioni, Ordini, regolamenti per U buon regime del Seminario ed alunni (sec. XVIII-XIX)," Archivio Seminario Maggiore: Istituzioni, regoli, e decreti, Ar. 124, or in the Constitutioni del Seminario di Treviso [1592], printed in Giuseppe Liberali, Le origini del seminario diocesano (Treviso, 1971) as Doc. LXVIII, pp. 159-163.

48On this subject, see John O'Malley, "Was Ignatius Loyola a Church Reformer? How to Look at Early Modern Catholicism," Catholic Historical Review, LXXVII (April, 1991), 177-193.

"See n. 2, supra.

It might be more appropriate to adopt the convention of calling "Tridentine diocesan seminaries" by the name commonly used to denote them in Italian history: seminari vescovili, or "episcopal seminaries." In every diocese, bishops were given powers to put the Tridentine plans into action within certain guidelines.50 Fiesole's della Robbia took the outlines for seminary education from the Council of Trent and adapted them not only to his diocese, but to his educational experience, which was Jesuit. The available documentation suggests that for the period after della Robbia's episcopate, the bias toward things "Jesuitical" in the seminary of Fiesole declined, though it did not disappear. It would thus seem appropriate to attribute the visible Jesuit influence of the early decades of the seminary mainly to one bishop. Later bishops did not change della Robbia's Constitutiones or revoke the requirement of a retreat to take the Spiritual Exercises, but did not purchase or collect as many Jesuit texts as he had; at some point, "his" Jesuit texts were discarded or otherwise distributed. Some Jesuit influence was certainly felt in seminaries across Italy, but in varying degrees. Still, it is clear that the Jesuits did not stay only in their own seminaries, and diocesan seminaries did not exclude clergy in religious orders—Jesuits or others—from participating in the education of secular clerics. The seminary of Fiesole, especially in the first ten years of operation, is a clear example of this. It was in a sense a "hybrid" operation, combining components of elementary education with more sophisticated subjects, and showing influences of Jesuit, Tridentine, and diocesan models of organization and education. Whether or not such "hybridization" was the norm is a question that only local studies can address, but in the meantime the historiographical models should be re-examined.

Seminary Book Inventory, 1646

Sources: AVescFi VII. 1/A. 1/10, fols. 6?-7G; AVescFi VII.60, Ricordi, fols.80"

The organization is slightly different in VII.60, but all the same volumes are found in both places. Neither list includes mention of the books used for music, though some information on these can be found in the account books for the seminary. I assume that the music books

"'See Chadwick, op. cit., p. 10: "the seminary system was devised by bishops for the needs of bishops. Bishops had never been uncritical admirers of universities, great corporations which claimed independence of the bishops."

were kept in the Cathedral, because there are indications that the seminarians went there for their singing.

There are seventy-four titles on the list. Slightly over half (forty) of the books are theological in nature, though more pastoral than scholastic. There are two Bibles, one New Testament, one catechism, and eight works that have some relation to Scripture studies. There are six texts of casuistry (by Martin Azpilcueta, Martin Bonacina, Angelo Carletti di Chivasso, Sylvestro Mazzolini da Prierio, and Gregory Sayer, and the unidentified Somma del Sagro); a loci communes called Apparatus Concionatorum by Francisco Labata; the Opere of Augustine, Luis de Granada, and Stanislaus Hosius; Aquinas' Summa, Cajetan's Opuscoli; Francisco de Mendoza's Commentaria in libros regum and Viridarium sacrae, and Guillelmus Durandus' Rationale Divinorum Offlciorum. Four titles are devotional works: Jacopo Pinto's Cristo Crociflsso, Gabriele Fiamma's Vite de Santi, a Life of Francis Xavier, and the De Cruce of Justus Lipsius. Six are sacred oratory: Vincenzo Giliberti's Le sacre corone deU'anno ecclesiastico; Gregory I's Homélie XL, collections of sermons by Augustine and Joäo Perpiñan; Luis de la Puente's Expositio Moralis; and the unidentified Sermones Quadragesimales. This suggests a concentration on training priests for pastoral duties, rather than for careers as university theologians; certainly, some of the books can be classified as "scholastic," but the collection taken as a whole argues rather more for humanistic studies related to the cura animarum. The small holdings in canon law (three books) underline the difference between university and seminary education. Finally, there is the unidentified Prediche del B. Ignazio.

Thirty of the titles are not theological or related to pastoral duties. Four of these are compendia: Alessandro Calamato's Selva di concetti, Ambrosius Calepino's dictionary, Jean Tixier's Epitecta Textoris, and Zwinger-Lycosthenes-Beyerlinck's Theatrum vitae humanae. One is a grammar (Nani Mirabelli's Polyanthed). Nine are histories, classical or humanist, by Alexandrinus of Alexandria, Leonardo Bruni, Flavius Josephus, Pierre Matthieu, Valerius Maximus, Pliny, Johannes Rosinus, Jacques Saltan, and Famiano Strada. Erasmus's Adages appear in an expurgated edition. Five volumes are secular oratory: Bartolomeo Cavalcanti's La Retorica, Cicero's De Oratore, Luigi Groto's Orationes, Remigio Nannini's Orationi militari, and Quintilian's Orazione. There are editions of Cicero (besides De Oratore, there are De Officiis [with an unidentified commentator], his Opera Omnia and Epistolae familiares), Horace, Ovid, Tacitus, and Virgil; and other secular texts: Tom-

maso Garzoni's Sinagoga degl'Ignoranti, and Secondo Lancellotti's L'Hoggidi. These suggest a humanist model for the curriculum, since the library holdings are useful for the study of history, rhetoric, poetry, and "humane letters."

Four books are not clearly enough identified in the inventory even to permit classification by subject.

BISHOP LYNCHS CIVIL WAR PAMPHLET ON SLAVERY

DAVID C R. HEISSER

President Jefferson Davis in 1864 appointed Bishop Patrick Neison Lynch of Charleston, South Carolina, to be Commissioner of the Confederate States of America to the States of the Church. An ardent Confederate, Bishop Lynch undertook a mission to Europe to win recognition by the Holy See. As part of his contribution to the Southern cause he wrote a tract on slavery which was published in Italian, German, and French, but never in English.1 This article discusses Lynch's participation in the Confederate propaganda effort, considers his ideas in the context of the time, and presents representative selections from his original English text.

Lynch accepted appointment on March 3, 1864; on April 4 Secretary of State Judah P. Benjamin instructed the Bishop to seek recognition and, more importantly, to work for "enlightening opinions and molding impressions" of European leaders. Lynch was to receive a monthly salary of $1,000 plus $500 for travel.2 In Patrick Lynch the Confederate

*Dr. Heisser is Reference/Documents Librarian in the Daniel Library, The Citadel, Charleston, South Carolina. His research has been supported by the Diocese of Charleston and the Cushwa Center for the Study of American Catholicism, at the University of Notre Dame. The author is conducting research for a biography of Bishop Lynch.

'The Diocese of Charleston will publish the full English text.

2Lynch to Benjamin, March 3, 1864, in "Reports of Bishop Lynch of Charleston, South Carolina, Commissioner of the Confederate States to the Holy See, American Catholic Historical Researches, 22 (1905), 248 (hereafter: Lynch, "Reports"); original commission, April 4, 1864, signed by Davis and Benjamin. Archives of the Diocese of Charleston (hereafter: CDA); Benjamin to Lynch, April 4, 1864, in James D. Richardson (comp.), A Compilation of the Messages and Papers of the Confederacy, including the Diplomatic Correspondence, 1861-1865 (2 vols.; Nashville, 1906), II, 470-473 (hereafter: Richardson, Messages); Leo Francis Stock, "Catholic Participation in the Diplomacy of the Southern Confederacy," Catholic Historical Review, XVI (April, 1930), 17; Willard E. Wight, "Bishop Patrick N. Lynch, Confederate Propagandist," unpublished paper given at the Forty-fourth Annual Meeting of the American Catholic Historical Association, Washington, D.C., December, 1963, pp. 3-4 (hereafter: Wight, "Lynch"); Henry Francis Wolfe, "War-Time Mission to Rome," Catholic Banner (Charleston, South Carolina), 49, no. 32 (I960), 13A. Lynch told Benjamin he hoped to conclude his mission in six months.

government chose an acknowledged leader of the Catholic Church in America. Born in Ireland, he was brought up in South Carolina and studied for the priesthood at the seminary of the Sacred Congregation for the Propagation of the Faith (Propaganda Fide), the department of the Roman Curia that administered the Catholic Church in America. Lynch had received his doctorate in Rome and spoke fluent Italian. He knew Alessandro Cardinal Barnabe, Prefect of the Propaganda Fide and an influential advisor to Pope Pius LX.3 When Fort Sumter fell to the Confederates Lynch ordered a Te Deum sung in his cathedral.4 He championed Southern independence in a public exchange of letters with Archbishop John Hughes of New York.5 Jefferson Davis admired Lynch for his work with sick and wounded servicemen and prisoners of war, and the Bishop was a member of the President's entourage during the latter's 1863 visit to Charleston.6 In an appeal to his faithful for prayers for peace Lynch praised the Confederate government and armies.7

During April, 1864, the Bishop ran the blockade and sailed to Europe.8 In Paris he met with Confederate agent John Slidell and propagandists Henry Hotze and Edwin De Leon, a fellow South Carolinian. Emperor Napoleon III gave Lynch an audience on June 14, and a few days later the Bishop traveled to Rome, arriving on the 26th.9 He took lodgings in that city, where he was to entertain prominent people and acquire a reputation for hospitality.10 To Giacomo Cardinal Antonelli,

3On Lynch see Richard C. Madden, "Lynch, Patrick Neison," New Catholic Encyclopedia,VUI, 1111-1112; idem, Catholics in South Carolina; A Record (Lanham, Maryland, 1985), chapters V-VI. On Barnabö see "Barnabö (Alessandro)," Dictionnaire d'histoire et de géographie ecclésiastiques, Vl, 858; Histoire universelle des missions catholiques (4 vols.; Paris, 1956-1959), III, 84-85.

'Charleston Mercury, April 15, 1861, p. 2. Explained as thanksgiving for the lack of bloodshed: Lynch to Horace Greeley, March 3, 1866 (copy). CDA, 34W3. See Greeley's criticism of Lynch: New York Daily Tribune, March 3, 1866, p. 6.

'Lynch to Hughes, Charleston, September 14, 1861, in John Tracy Ellis (ed.), Documents of American Catholic History (Milwaukee, 1962), pp. 347-356; Judith Conrad Wimmer, "American Catholic Interpretations of the Civil War" (doctoral dissertation, Drew University, 1979), pp. 202-204.

<John J. Craven, Prison Life ofJefferson Davis (New York, 1866), pp. 289-290; "The President's Movements," Charleston Mercury, November 5, 1863, p. 2.

'Patrick N. Lynch, "Pastoral Prayers for Peace," November 26, 1863. CDA, 29Y7.

"Wight, "Lynch," pp. 6-7; Lynch to his sister, Mother Baptista Lynch, April 15, 1864, in Willard E. Wight, "Some Wartime Letters of Bishop Lynch," Catholic Historical Review, XLIII (April, 1957), 30; original letter in: Archives of the Ursuline Sisters, Louisville, Kentucky.

'Lynch to Benjamin, June 20, 1864, in Lynch, "Reports," pp. 250-259; John Slidell to same, June 30, 1864, in Richardson, Messages, Il, 659.

"Paul J. Schmidt, Patrick N. Lynch, Bishop of Charleston, South Carolina, Commis-

Papal Secretary of State, he communicated the Confederacy's desire for recognition. Antonelli was polite but non-committal. On July 4 Pope Pius LX received Lynch in private audience as Charleston's ordinary, but not as Confederate representative. Pius said of North and South, "It is clear that you are two nations," expressed willingness to mediate and opposition to sudden emancipation. "But still," remarked the Pontiff, "something might be done looking to an improvement in [the slaves'] position or state, and to a gradual preparation for their freedom at a future opportune time."11 The Bishop had subsequent, cordial conversations with Pius and Antonelli, but made no progress toward recognition. Antonelli assured United States Minister Rufus King that Lynch was received only as a bishop making his ad limina visit.12 Just after his first audience with the Pope, Lynch wrote Benjamin, "I am now engaged in drawing up a paper on the actual condition and treatment of slaves at the South, at the request of Msgr. [Francesco] Nardi.one of the judges of the Rota, or supreme court of the papal States."13

All Confederate agents contended with the bad name slavery gave their country. These agents had organized a propaganda effort in Europe. Henry Hotze edited and published the Index, a London newspaper presenting the Southern perspective. Across the Channel, the Emperor and his supporters generally favored the South, and pro-government newspapers reflected this, but Napoleon III had to pay close attention to French public opinion. Edwin De Leon regarded slavery as an insurmountable public relations problem for the Confederacy among the French, who had abolished the institution in their territories in 1848. He published a tract emphasizing the contentment and fidelity of Confederate slaves.14 In Germany Eduard Maco Hudson,

sioner of the Confederate States of America to the States of the Church (1864-1865) (Excerpta of doctoral dissertation; Rome: Pontifical Gregorian University, 1967), p. 17; Rufus King to William H. Seward, June 26, 1865, in Leo Francis Stock, United States Ministers to the Papal States; Instructions and Despatches, 1848-1868 (Washington, D.C., 1933), p. 344.

"Lynch to Benjamin July 5, 1864, Archives of the Catholic University of America (hereafter: ACUA), Edward James Wallace Papers, Copy in Lynch's hand. Possibly this did not reach the Confederate government: Schmidt, op. cit., p. 22.

"David J. Alvarez, "The Papacy in the Diplomacy of the American Civil War," Catholic Historical Review, LXLX (April, 1983), 246-247.

"Lynch to Benjamin July 5, 1864, ACUA, Wallace Papers.

14Robert May (ed.), The Union, the Confederacy, and the Atlantic Rim (West Lafayette, Indiana, 1955), p. 17; Charles P. Cullop, Confederate Propaganda in Europe, 1861-1865 (Coral Gables, Florida, 1969), pp. 56 ff., 70-83; David H. Pinkney, "France and the Civil War," in Harold Hyman (ed.), Heard Round the World: The Impact Abroad of the Civil War

formerly acting first secretary of the United States legation in Prussia, wrote Der zweite Unabhängigkeits-Krieg in Amerika, describing slavery as a humane, paternalistic institution.15 James Williams, former United States minister at Constantinople, brought out The South Vindicated in London in 1862, and this appeared the following year in Germany, with a foreword by Hudson. Williams emphasized the property rights of slaveholders, estimating the slaves' value at $2,000,000,000. Berlin's big conservative daily, Die Kreuz-Zeitung, praised this book.16 In Italy a Confederate sympathizer named Manetta planted articles in the Turin newspapers and wrote reports for the Index." At Rome the daily L'Osservatore romano and La Civilità cattolica, a bimonthly edited by Jesuits—both reflecting the opinions of high Vatican officials—expressed skepticism about the aims of Lincoln's government and were often sympathetic toward the South.18

Lynch received help from Monsignor Ferdinando Mansi, a member of the College of Consultors in the Congregation of the Index, for an Italian translation and arrangements with a Roman publisher. The Bishop must have completed his work by mid-August, for the Italian edition, in the form of a letter to a "Dear Friend," bears the date of the Feast of the Assumption.19 The Italian version was published anonymously in late 1864 under the title Lettera di un missionario sulla schiavitù domestica degli Stati Confederati di America.20 Lynch sent a draft for review

(New York, 1969), p. 100; Edwin De Leon, Thirty Years ofMy Life on Three Continents (2 vols.; London, 1890), II, 47, 62, 68-69; idem, La Vérité sur les Etats Confédérés d Amérique (Paris, 1862), pp. 23-27; Frank Lawrence Owsley, King Cotton Diplomacy: Foreign Relations of the Confederate States ofAmerica, 2nd rev. ed. (Chicago, 1959), pp. 155, 160-168; "De Leon, Edwin," in Jon L. Wakelyn, Biographical Dictionary of the Confederacy (Westport, Connecticut, 1977), p. 169; Serge Gavronsky, The French Liberal Opposition and the American Civil War (New York, 1968), pp. 73-75.

"Eduard Maco Hudson, Der zweite Unabhängigkeits-Krieg in Amerika, 2nd rev. ed. (Berlin, 1862); idem, The Second War of Independence in America, tr. the author (London, 1863), title p., pp. v-x, 140-142; communication from Herr Michael Löffler, Humboldt-Universität, Berlin, February 25, 1996.

"'Ibid.James Williams, The South Vindicated (London, 1862), p. 36; idem, Die Rechtfertigung der Südstaaten Nordamerika's (Berlin, 1863), pp. iv-vi. On Williams see Wakelyn, op. cit., pp. 440-441; Owsley, qp. «f., pp. 158-l6l;Cullop,o¿>.«r.,pp. 117, 123.

"Cullop, op. cit. ,pp. 50-51.

"Anthony B. Lalli and Thomas H. O'Connor, "Roman Views on the American Civil War," Catholic Historical Review, LVII (April, 1971), 25-35.

"Mansi to Lynch, August 13, 1864, CDA, 31Hl; same to same, August 26, 1864, CDA, 31H6; same to same, September 17, 1864, CDA, 31K6; same to same, December 9, 1864, CDA, 3 1T6; Schmidt, op. cit., p. 25.

20(Rome, 1864).

by Edwin De Leon, who offered to translate it into French. In vain De Leon recommended that he publish under his own name, as his high reputation would lend credibility.21 For help with a German edition Lynch turned to Francis J. Shadier, a young man of German extraction studying for the Diocese of Charleston at the seminary of Mainz. Possibly Shadier did the German translation.22 In the autumn Lynch passed French and German drafts for review to Princess Wittgenstein, an acquaintance in Rome. Françoise zu Sayn-Wittgenstein-Berleburg (née Schweitzer) was a Catholic member of the highest German nobility. She had befriended Lynch and introduced him to influential people. The Princess approved of the German, but advised having a Parisian writer retranslate the French.23

In November the Bishop traveled north, visiting Turin and various German states, and was in Paris for Christmas. In Mainz he conferred with Shadier, met the local bishop, and so favorably impressed the seminary rector—the Ultramontanist and Catholic social leader Dr. Christoph Moufang—that the latter gave a public lecture to a local Catholic society, praising Lynch and his ideas.24 The German edition came out as Die Sclaverei in den Südstaaten Nord-Amerika's around January 10, 1865.25 The French version appeared in February as L'Esclavage dans les Etats Confédérés, par un Missionnaire. There were two Paris editions, identical except for paper quality, the first being deluxe.26 To the French booklet was appended a section from another work giving statistics on American blacks.27

21De Leon to Lynch, August 1, 1864, CDA, 31G5; Willard E. Wight, "Lynch," pp. 10-11.

"Information about the German edition comes from three letters Shadier wrote Lynch from Aschaffenburg, Bavaria, December 26, 1864, CDA, 31Y3; December 26, 1864, CDA, 31Y4; December 29, 1864, CDA, 31Y7; and Schmidt, op. cit., pp. 34-35. On Shadier see Madden, Catholics in South Carolina, pp. 105-106, 139, 141, 148.

"Princess Wittgenstein to Lynch, [no date] 1864, CDA, 31P5; Almanach de Gotha, 1863, pp. 206-207.

2On Moufang see Anton Brück, "Moufang, Christoph" in Erwin Gatz (ed.), Die Bischöfe der deutschsprachigen Länder, 1785/1803 bis 1945; ein biographisches Lexikon (Berlin, 1983),pp. 518-520.

"(Frankfurt a.M., 1865). Thanks for assistance in obtaining a copy of the German edition to Professor Peter Landau and Herr Andreas Thier, Leopold Wenger-Institut für Rechtsgeschichte, Universität München.

26(Paris, 1865); E. Dentu to Lynch, November, 1864, CDA, 31T5; communication from Professor Jean-Claude Carón, Université de Besançonjanuary 6, 1996.

27Jouaust to (probably) James Hamilton, December 23, 1864, CDA, 31W7; Hamilton to De Leon, December 23, 1864, CDA, 31Y1; same to Lynch, December 26, 1864, CDA, 31Y5; Wight, "Lynch," p. 11; Schmidt, op. cit., p. 35; Cullop, op. cit., p. 50; Lynch, Esclavage, pp. 137-143.

The Archives of the Diocese of Charleston preserves four handwritten drafts in English. The author has designated what is evidently an early version, with many emendations, as "Draft 1." Three more polished drafts have been labelled, respectively, "A" and "B" by an unknown hand, and "C" by the author.[28] Italian, German, and French versions are faithful translations of Draft C. Quotations in this article are from Draft C, unless otherwise noted.

Bishop Lynch's pamphlet was an ambitious Confederate propaganda salvo aimed at the single most difficult public relations problem faced by the South. It was part of a war effort, and its publication came in a time of desperation. This was one of the last Southern proslavery treatises and the longest published discussion of the institution by a Confederate prelate. Among Southern bishops Lynch stood out in that he had been brought up in a slaveholding family and was himself the owner of about ninety-five slaves. He and other slaveowning members of his family were benign by the lights of their day, and he characterized the institution as "patriarchal."[29] Slavery was a fundament of Southern civilization, and slaveholding was not uncommon among Catholic bishops, priests, and religious communities. Slaveownership was typical of leading Protestant and Catholic churchmen, who were among its most articulate apologists. Well-to-do Southern Catholics often owned slaves, and prominent laypeople of his diocese aided Bishop Lynch in the acquisition and management of his slaves. To Lynch and leading members of his flock the question of slavery was no abstract problem, but something central to their way of life.[30]

Southern white clergy—Lynch among them—typically defined slavery as a system of mutual obligations between master and servant and taught that slaveowners had clear Christian obligations toward their

2,Drafts 1, A, and B, CDA, Lynch Transfer FUe, folder GG; Draft C, CDA, Folder "Confederate States."

25LiSt of slaves purchased at auction by Bishop Lynch, January 21, 1861, CDA, 25Y8; Charleston, S.C., City Taxes, Lower Wards, I860, Charleston Library Society; Draft C, p. 43. The author is preparing an article detailing Bishop Lynch's experience, motives, and practices as a slaveholder.

'"Draft C, p. 88; Cyprian Davis, The History of Black Catholics in the United States (New York, 1995), pp. 68-69; E. Brooks Holifield, The Gentlemen Theologians: American Theology in Southern Culture, 1795-1860 (Durham, North Carolina, 1978), pp. 30-31; Larry E. Tise, Proslavery: A History of the Defense of Slavery in America, 1701-1840 (Athens, Georgia, 1987), pp. 124 ff.; Thomas Paul Thigpen, "Aristocracy of the Heart; Catholic Lay Leadership in Savannah, 1820-1870" (doctoral dissertation, Emory University, 1995), pp. 619 ff.; Madden, Catholics, pp. 68-69.

bondsmen.31 As did other Catholic prelates, Lynch opposed the abolitionists, associating them with Know-Nothingism and virulent anti-Catholicism.32 He followed his predecessor, Bishop John England of Charleston, and his metropolitan, Archbishop Francis Patrick Kenrick of Baltimore, in distmguishing between the slave trade, condemned by Roman Pontiffs from Pius II to Gregory XVT, and domestic slavery, teaching that the latter was licit.55

To Lynch a master had an inescapable duty to provide slaves with food, shelter, clothing, and health care, plus secure retirement in old age. He had applauded Bishop Augustin Verot's A Tract for the Times (1861) and had assisted in its distribution. Like Verot, Lynch stressed the whites' obligation to promote and uphold Negroes' marriages and their families' integrity. He shared Verot's view that "the laws of morality are not different for the different races of man. . . ."34 Like Martin John Spalding, formerly Bishop of Louisville and from April 3, 1864, Archbishop of Baltimore, he contrasted the slaves' happy state with the degraded condition of free blacks and feared that emancipation would unleash a race war leading to the Negroes' extermination.35 Lynch's opinions largely mirrored those of his personal friend and political ad-

"Eugene D. Genovese and Elizabeth Fox-Genovese, "The Religious Ideals of Southern Slave Society," Georgia Historical Quarterly, 70 (1986), 9-10.

"Madeleine Hooke Rice, American Catholic Opinion in the Slavery Controversy (New York, 1944), pp. 72 ff.; Edward Dennis Lofton, "Reverend Doctor James A. Corcoran and the 'United States Catholic Miscellany' Concerning the Question of Slavery and the Confederacy," Records of the American Catholic Historical Society of Philadelphia, 93 (1982), 86-97; Davis, op. cit., pp. 58-59. For writings of bishops and other Catholics see Kenneth J. Zanca (comp, and ed.), American Catholics and Slavery, 1789-1866: An Anthology of Primary Documents (Lanham, Maryland, 1994).

"Draft C, p. 13. Cf. John England to John Forsyth, September 28, 1840, in John England, The Works of the Right Rev. John England, First Bishop of Charleston (5 vols.; Baltimore, 1849), HI, 114-116; Joseph D. Brokhage, Francis Patrick Kenrick's Opinion on Slavery (Washington, D.C., 1955), pp. 123-131.

MAugustinVerot,^4 Tractfor the Times (Baltimore, 1861),pp. 11-12; Michael V Gannon, Rebel Bishop: The Life and Era of Augustin Verot (Milwaukee, 1964), pp. 49-50. Bishop John McGill of Richmond thought that failure to respect Negro marriages brought down God's wrath upon the South: see Wimmer, op. cit., p. 266.

"David Spalding (ed.), "Martin John Spalding's 'Dissertation on the American Civil War,'" Catholic Historical Review, LII (April, 1966), 81; Thomas W Spalding, Martin John Spalding: American Churchman (Washington, D.C., 1973), p. 141. Bishop William Henry Elder of Natchez warned of chaos if the slaves were freed en masse: Edward J. Misch, "The American Bishops and the Negro from the Civil War to the Third Plenary Council of Baltimore (1865-1884)" (doctoral dissertation, Pontifical Gregorian University, 1968), p. 74 (101).

versary, Archbishop Hughes of New York, arguably the most influential American Catholic figure of his time. Hughes thought slavery was sanctioned, if not ordained, by God, acceptable because it afforded blacks physical and economic security, and preferable to Africa's barbarous state. Hughes opposed the abolitionists' solution, because it failed to provide for Negroes' welfare once they were freed, and, if precipitate, would bring about "disruption" leading to a replay of the horrors of Haiti, which he described in the most lurid terms. The New York prelate saw gradual emancipation as "the only alternative to a reign of lawlessness and economic chaos."[36]

In his wartime essay Bishop Lynch disclaimed any intention to write "philosophy," seeking instead to give a scientific description and analysis of the actual institution.[37] He prefaced the German edition: "To say that freedom is better than slavery, is to my mind very much like saying that health is better than sickness. ... In these pages I have given ... a diagnosis of slavery."[38] American slavery had often been described by travelers, novelists, "philanthropists and fanatics," all of whom had distorted the facts. The ill-informed thought the American South a "slumbering volcano," ready to erupt in massive slave revolt. But the course of the war belied this, since, even following the Emancipation Proclamation, slaves continued to work contentedly for their masters: "I do not believe that five out of a thousand have voluntarily gone to the Yankee Armies."[39] Domestic slavery was "simply the continued retention in slavery of those who were originally brought in by the slave trade"—which he condemned.[40] Nevertheless, the slaves had left behind in Africa horrible conditions, an "almost normal state ... of bellum omnium in omnes. . . . [0]nly three years ago, the present King of Dahomey celebrated the obsequies of his Father by slaughtering, it is said, five thousand captives, letting their blood flow into the grave as a

"Walter G. Sharrow, "Northern Catholic Intellectuals and the Coming of the Civil War," New-York Historical Society Quarterly, 58 (1974), 36; idem, "John Hughes and a Catholic Response to Slavery in Antebellum America," Journal of Negro History, 57 (July, 1972), 256-262; Rena Mazyck Andrews, "Archbishop Hughes and the Civil War" (doctoral dissertation, University of Chicago, 1935), pp. 50-52, 62-65; Charles P O'Connor, "The Northern Catholic Position on Slavery and the Civil War: Archbishop Hughes as a Test Case," Records of the American Catholic Historical Society of Philadelphia, 96 (1986), 37.

"Summaries are in Wight, "Lynch," pp. 12-14; Schmidt, op. cit. ,pp. 37 ff.; Henry Francis Wolfe, "The Life and Times of Patrick Neison Lynch (1817-1882)" (unpublished manuscript, Charleston, South Carolina, 1929), pp. 66 ff.; Misch, op. cit., pp. 78 (108)-81 (115).

"Draft C, unpaged preface; Lynch, Sclaverei, pp. 3-4. Cf. Hughes's characterization of slavery as a sickness: Sharrow, "John Hughes," p. 259.

"Draft C, pp. 1-2, 3, 6. Draft 1,p. 3, has: "two in a thousand."

"Draft C, pp. 10, 13-14.

last tribute to the deceased King."41 Slaves enjoyed peace and security in the New World, where they could "at least obtain a knowledge of the true God, and might save their souls." Southern proslavery apologists frequently depicted Africa as "the scene of unmitigated savagery."42

There were three main classes of slaves: house servants, "those who hire their own time," and agricultural laborers. "The house servants do not differ in their treatment and work from the house servants in every civilised country, except that unfortunately three of them will not do as much work as one European or Northern white servant." These received no wages, but "they receive abundant gratuities, and love to give full evidence of it in the natty hats, the broadcloth coats and the polished boots of the men, the silks and ribbons and flashy jewelry of the women, as they parade the streets or assemble in church on Sundays."43

Slaves "who hire their own time," said Lynch, were numerous in cities and towns and "may be said to enjoy, at least to some extent, the privileges of freedom. ... [I]t is generally found that they become idle and dissipated, and plunge into drunkenness and other vices. . . . They are generally a bad population for themselves and for the other negroes with whom they mingle."44

Agricultural laborers, or field hands, constituted nine-tenths of the slave population. In a climate injurious to whites, "the African constitution claims its privilege and the negro exults in the fullness of health in a tropical heat. . . ." "[N]egroes receive in strong solid food, fully as much as they can consume, and have something over to satisfy a negro's natural inclination to waste. . . . The work of the [negro] ... is light; his food is abundant; his condition is one of comfort, his necessities in sickness and old age are all provided for."4'

"'Reference is to the funeral of King Gezo, staged in 1860 with much human sacrifice by his son, King Glele: see Robert Cornevin, Histoire du Dahomey (Paris, 1962), pp. 126-127.

"This view had been espoused by many Southern writers, including Lynch's friend and fellow Charlestonian, William Gilmore Simms: see George M. Frederickson, The Black Image in the White Mind: The Debate on Afro-American Character and Destiny, 181 7-1914 (New York, 1971), pp. 49-52.

"On Southern whites' belief in Negroes' laziness see Eugene D. Genovese, Roll, Jordan, Roll: The World the Slaves Made (New York, 1974), pp. 295-301. On Charleston blacks' Sabbath finery see Bernard E. Powers, Jr., Black Charlestonians: A Social History, 1822-1885 (Fayetteville, Arkansas, 1994), pp. 21-22.

«Draft C, pp. 31-32.

"Draft C, pp. 34-35, 37, 39-40. On relatively good food and health enjoyed by American slaves see Peter Kolchin, American Slavery, 1619-1877 (New York, 1992), p. 113.

Responding to charges of inhumane punishments and cruel treatment of slaves, the Bishop admitted that cruelty sometimes occurred in all societies: "But that is the fault of human nature, not the system of Slavery."[46] He defended flogging as the main punishment inflicted on slaves for wrongdoing. "Imprisonment for days or weeks would not answer. If the imprisonment be light and merely nominal, it ceases to be a punishment and becomes a reward, allowing the negro to indulge in that greatest of all his luxuries,—idleness. . . . Flagellation is used for slaves as for children, because it pains without inflicting injury, and punishes without incapacitating for work." "Where a negro is insubordinate, or vicious to an extent to demoralise the other negroes, and cannot be reclaimed by ordinary punishments, he is sold away from the scene of his offences."[47]

Legal proscription of black literacy resulted from fear of abolitionists' inciting slaves to insurrection, thereby bringing on "a renewal in their midst of the horrible atrocities of St. Domingo."[48] Dread of the "horrors of San Domingo" was particularly strong in Charleston and the South Carolina Lowcountry, where some 500 whites from Samt-Domingue had taken refuge in the 1790's following the great slave uprising. Their descendants were prominent in the Catholic community, and their atrocity stories profoundly influenced the attitudes of white Carolinians, who saw in Northern abolitionism a new French Revolution that would bring on another Haiti in their homeland. Yet, like most Southern white clergy, the Charleston prelate favored "oral religious instruction of the negroes, old or young in the doctrines of Christianity."[49]

Lynch stated that slaveowners' claims were limited to labor service. "[I]? the matter of Religion, of morality, and, in a measure, of his family relations does [the slave] hold himself free." Blacks might join any church they chose. "Essentially a sensuous race, loving the excitement

[46] Draft C, pp. 40-41.

[47] Draft C, pp. 40-45. Cf. the justification of flogging by Lynch's fellow South Carolinian, William Henry Hammond: "Letter to an English Abolitionist," in Drew Gilpin Faust (ed.), The Ideology of Slavery: Proslavery Thought in the Antebellum South, 1830-1860 (Baton Rouge, Louisiana, 1981), p. 189.

[48] Draft C, pp. 47-48. On South Carolina's strict laws, see Janet Duitsman Cornelius, "When I Can Read My Title Clear": Literacy, Slavery, and Religion in the Antebellum South (Columbia, South Carolina, 1991), esp. chap. 2.

[49] Madden, Catholics in South Carolina, p. 26; George D. Terry, "A Study of the Impact of the French Revolution and the Insurrections in Saint-Domingue upon South Carolina, 1790-1805" (M.A. thesis, University of South Carolina, 1975), pp. 174-178; Draft C, p. 44. On Southern clerics' concern for slaves' religious instruction, see Tise, op. cit., pp. 293-298; Kolchin, op. cit., pp. 128-129.

of an hour, and having generally good voices, and a natural sense of Music, the negroes love to join in prayer meetings or assemblies of their own, where much of the service consists of all singing hymns together; where the discourses are generally rude and impassioned. . . ." "With strong passions, and prone to give them license, the negroes run readily into Antinomianism."50 One black, "a prominent member of the Church being called to account by his minister, for licentiousness, and warned of the consequences of his sin before the judgment seat of God, is said to have replied; 'What does the Scripture say we must do to be saved? Believe, and be baptised. Well, I believe, and I have been baptised. I have got to be saved. That is all about it.'"51 Yet Negroes "believe firmly in the Divinity of our Saviour, and in the Redemption. . . ." Catholicism "has a wonderful power over the negroes, when they yield to God's grace. They love exercises of piety, and are enchanted by the pomp of the Ceremonial. They are naturally kind, are willing to make sacrifices for charity; and among our Catholic negroes we sometimes find exemplary instances of that to them most difficult virtue,—purity." Except in Maryland and Louisiana, with their large Catholic populations, little progress had been made in elevating the moral state of blacks. This was due to the scarcity of Catholic clergy. Yet only through Roman Catholicism could they "be raised from their present state of moral turpitude. . . ."52

" [T]he negroes are, as a race, very prone to excesses, and unless restrained, plunge madly into the lowest depths of licentiousness." This was not caused by slavery; in fact the free negroes were "far more immoral than the slaves," and plantation discipline worked to restrain immorality.53 The Bishop labeled "grossly false" the charge "that masters, abusing their authority over female slaves, riot in debauchery."54 Nonetheless, "[t]he passions of men exist and will seek their gratification

"•Draft C, pp. 48-51. Lynch was not alone in disparaging black worship. Cf. Albert J. Raboteau, Slave Religion: The "Invisible Institution" in the Antebellum South (New York, 1978), pp. 220-222; Robert Manson Myers (ed.), The Children of Pride: A True Story of Georgia in the Civil War (New Haven, 1972), pp. 482-483. Antinomianism: "If good works … do not help to salvation, so evil ones do not hinder it and therefore Christians are not bound to observe the law." The New Catholic Dictionary (New York, 1929), p. 52.

"This story had appeared in Frederick Law 01msted,^4/oi<raey in the Seaboard Slave States, with Remarks on Their Economy (New York, 1856), pp. 123-124; discussed in Genovese, op. cit. ,p. 245.

"Draft C, pp. 51-54, 56. Cf. Hughes's belief that Catholic leadership was needed to improve the Negroes: Sharrow, "John Hughes," p. 265.

"Draft C, pp. 57-59. Lynch shared Southern whites' generally low opinion of free blacks. Cf. Genovese, op. cit., pp. 398-400.

"Draft C, p. 59. Cf. Mary Chestnut's remark, "[W]e live surrounded by prostitutes." C. Vann Woodward (ed.), Mary Chestnut's Civil War (New Haven, 1981), p. 29.

whether Slavery exists or not." Some young, unmarried white men engaged in sexual intercourse with black females, "and . . . the partners of their guilt are generally free coloured women. It should be further noted as a fact, that just as such females abound, and debauchery is thrown into that channel, the white females are exempted from its influence. Nowhere save in Ireland are they so pure as in the South. . . . There is unfortunately too much libertinism between the white race and the negroes, whether free or slaves, in the South. But it replaces libertinism which would otherwise exist to a greater extent than it does, in the white race itself."55

Southern state laws did not recognize the validity of slave marriages, but slaveowners strove "to render the . . . unions of the negroes permanent." It was customary for a master to permit weekend conjugal visitations when husband and wife lived on different plantations, and often an owner would purchase a spouse from another so that the couple might live together. "So far as Catholic owners are concerned, they recognize and are guided by the teaching of the Church, and hold it to be a sin to separate a man and wife legitimately married."56 Lynch flatly and correctly denied the charge that many plantation owners bred slaves for profit.57

As to the future of slavery, he reviewed in turn different scenarios. Examples of manumission of individuals and families were "not rare." The Bishop lauded the unofficial practice of trusteeship, whereby a slave became nominally the property of a white who in fact left the person to live "in freedom, … at liberty to work and earn for himself."58 He opposed sudden, general emancipation: "Its first and immediate consequence would be to put two races face to face, in the most deadly antagonism and to inaugurate at once an inhuman war unparalleled in the history of the world."59 Uncompensated seizure of slaveholders' property—which he estimated at 9,000,000,000 francs—would exac-

"Cf. South Carolina Chancellor William Harper's view "that the intercourse which takes place with enslaved females, is less depraving in its effects, than when it is carried on with females of their own caste." "Slavery in the Light of Social Ethics," in E. N. Elliott, Cotton is King and Pro-Slavery Arguments (Augusta, Georgia, I860), p. 583.

"Draft C, p. 74. Owners usually did promote and respect slave marriages, and slave families were often strong: see Herbert G. Gutman, The Black Family in Slavery and Freedom, 1750-1925 (New York, 1976),pp.xxii,9, 14, 17;Kolchin,op.c¿í.,pp. 122-123.

"Draft C, pp. 75-76. Cf. Michael Tadman, Speculators and Slaves: Masters, Traders and Slaves in the Old South (Madison, Wisconsin, 1989), pp. 121-129.

"Draft C, pp. 81 -82. Cf. Marina Wikramanayake,^! World in Shadow: The Free Black in Antebellum South Carolina (Columbia, South Carolina, 1973), pp. 39-43.

wDraftC,pp.91-92.

erbäte this conflict.60 Freed Negroes would be ill-equipped to fend for themselves in the modern world, and "a very large portion would soon be found in such want as to become a burden on the charity of the rest of the community."61 He claimed that during the war at least a quarter-million Southern slaves had come under the jurisdiction of Union forces and been declared free. But the Northern army had failed to take good care of the freedmen, so that "not one half are now living." Each published edition of the pamphlet included a translation of an article from the London Index about the lamentable fate of freedmen under U. S. Army care on Louisiana plantations. The account was one of great pathos: blacks dying of hunger, disease, and despair—summed up, said the Bishop, in the cry of an expiring man to an army officer: "There is nobody to care for us."The quoted article was in fact based—with some embellishments—on genuine federal reports.62

Mass transportation of Negroes to Africa could not succeed, for this would require unparalleled and costly concerted efforts of all leading Christian countries. Societies the freedmen might establish in Africa would be dreadful. "Of self government the negroes are incapable. Left to themselves they would fall under a tyranny like San Domingo, equally cruel as ludicrous,—the ferocity of Africa clothed in a travesty of imperial Europe."63

In his conclusion the Bishop held out a glimmer of hope, a Catholic solution, as he saw it, and of special interest, since it foreshadowed some of his own postwar actions. "One feature of the African mind might guide us,—their innate, though vague reverence for Religion." Communities of freedmen "might be put under the entire charge of some religious body, like that of the Society of Jesus. The negroes would yield readily to this religious, almost theocratical rule. … It is only in such a way, that these communities can be successfully and prosperously governed. It is only doing on a larger scale what was done so well in the Indian missions of California and of Paraguay in the last century." Unless something of the sort could be achieved, "[a]t least then, the

"Draft C, p. 89. This figure represented slightly over $1.7 billion at the then-current rate of exchange in Paris.

6,DraftC,pp.92-93.

62Index (London), August 25, 1864, p. 538; reports by Treasury Agent W. H. Wilder to S. W Cozzens, Superintendent of Plantations, Bureau of Plantations, U. S. Treasury Department, esp. reports dated September 17 and 27, 1863, pp. 97- 103 and 118-121, in "Reports of Inspectors of Plantations to the Superintendent of Plantations," National Archives, RG 366, item 479.

6,Draft 1, p. 56. Reference is to the nineteenth-century Haitian monarchies. Cf. George Fitzhugh, "Free Negroes in Hayti," De Bow's Review, 27 (November, 1859), 526-549.

slaves of the Confederate States may ask to be left in their present state of quiet and content, awaiting the future which God only knows; and not be doomed at once to ruin, if not speedy extermination, for the sake of a mere theory."64

In keeping with Richmond's instructions, Bishop Lynch wrote for an audience of sophisticated, influential Europeans. Unsurprisingly, he did not present slavery as superior to European free labor systems, often characterized as inhumane by Southern apologists. He did not cite scripture in defense of servitude, nor cast his arguments in theological language. Lynch was a man of science—an early geologist—who often preferred to present his views as those of an impartial observer of nature.65 He did not follow the example of Bishop Auguste Martin of Natchitoches, Louisiana, whose 1861 pastoral letter cited the "curse of Ham" and other scripture in support of slavery. During 1864 the Holy Office was secretly scrutinizing Martin's epistle, and possibly some Vatican official warned Lynch against using such an approach. Ironically, just when the German and French editions were in press, the Confederate government dispatched Duncan E Kenner to Britain and France with a promise of general emancipation in return for diplomatic recognition. No available evidence indicates that Lynch was aware of the purpose of Kenner's secret mission, which proved a failure.66

Lynch's pamphlet caused a stir, though not as great as he hoped. In Rome La Civiltà cattolica welcomed a statement of the "true condition of slavery in the American South … set forth in this letter written by an impartial person, superbly weU-informed and of broad and just views." The Paris edition was hailed by Hotze's Index: "No one has had better opportunities than Dr. Lynch for forming a just estimate of the condition of the slaves in the Confederate States, since he has passed his

"Draft C, pp. 115-118.

"See, for example, Patrick N. Lynch, "The Liquefaction of the Blood of St. Januarius," Catholic World, 14 (1871-1872), 32-49, 200-212, 391-400, 526-549; idem, "Galileo Galilei and the Copernican System," American Catholic Quarterly Review, 7 (1882), 85-114.

MAuguste-Marie Martin, Lettre pastorale de Mgr l'Evêque de Natchitoches à l'occasion de la guerre du Sud pour son indépendance (Natchitoches, 1861), pp. 6-8; Maria Genoino Caravaglios, "A Roman Critique of the Pro-Slavery Views of Bishop Martin of Natchitoches, Louisiana," Records of the American Catholic Historical Society of Philadelphia, 83 (1972), 67-81; Zanca, op. cit., pp. 219-225. Francis Patrick Kenrick and Augustin Verot quoted scripture in defense of Negro servitude: Brokhage, op. cit., pp. 1 10-1 12; Verot,4 Tract for the Times, pp. 5-7. On the Kenner mission see Craig A. Bauer, A Leader among Peers: The Life and Times of Duncan Farrar Kenner (Lafayette, Louisiana, 1993), pp. 21 1-237.

whole life in the South, and exercised his holy calling there for the last twenty-four years." The British Army and Navy Gazette called the French edition of the pamphlet "by far the best which has appeared on the subject of slavery." Favorable comments on it appeared also in the London Standard, L'Unità cattolica of Milan, and other European papers.67 But severe criticism came from Catholic liberals in France. Count Charles de Montalembert declared in Le Correspondant, "I refuse to acknowledge the priestly character of the author … If the writer of this shameful book really were a priest, and if it had sufficed for him to live, as he says, among American planters for 24 years, to proclaim the utility and legitimacy of black slavery, to see in their very servitude the only possible barrier to their licentiousness, the sole fact of such perversion of moral feeling and priestly conscience would constitute the severest argument against the social and religious regime of the slave countries."68 Montalembert's friend and antislavery author Augustin Cochin wrote Lynch: "May I bless God with all my heart that he has at last permitted the death of this stubborn plague which weighed upon your country and the Christian conscience."69

Lynch wrote from what he considered a Catholic perspective. He published in Italy, France, and the German Rhineland—all Catholic countries. He asserted that Catholicism must play an essential role in the education and salvation of African Americans, especially if they won freedom. He foresaw a need for Church guidance, in particular by courageous religious communities. After the war the Bishop wanted to establish a model community for freedmen on an island off the South Carolina coast and tried to recruit missionary societies to work among black people in his diocese.70 This pamphlet documents a transition from defense of slavery to an apostolate to Negroes in the Diocese of

67Civiltà Cattolica (Rome), anno decimoquinto, serie V, vol. XII (1864), 217; "The Confederate Cause in France," Index (London), February 16, 1865, p. 106; Army and Navy Gazette (London), February 25, 1865, p. 122; Schmidt, op. cit., p. 53; De Leon to Lynch, February 28, 1865, CDA, 32E2; Mansi to same, December 9, 1864, CDA, 31T6; same to same, March 26, 1865, CDA, 32Gl; "Christenthum und Sklaverei;' Historisch-politische Blätter, 62(1868), 195-197.

fff"La Victoire du Nord aux Etats-Unis," Le Correspondant, 65 (May 15, 1865), 9-10; Edouard Lecanuet,Montalembert (3 vols.; Paris, 1899-1902), III, 402-403.

»Cochin to Lynch, May 28, 1865, CDA, 32M2; Gavronsky, op. cit., pp. 73-75.

'"Lynch to Father Edward Sorin, January 16, 1866, Archives of the Propaganda Fide (hereafter APF), Scritture riferite nei Congressi—America Centrale (hereafter Scritt. rif.), Vol. 21, fols. 85"-86^; Archives of the University of Notre Dame (hereafter AUND), MPRF, Reel 69, VIII, 23; same to Conseils Centraux de l'Oeuvre de la Propagation de la Foi, June 17, 1867, in Annales de la Propagation de la foi, 40 (1868), 81-90; Madden, Catholics in South Carolina, pp. 103, 112, 122.

Charleston. Although many of his views were shared by his brother bishops, Lynch went further than they in some of his characterizations of African Americans and he, alone among them, held high office in the Confederate government. The brochure came too late in the war to make any significant impact on the outcome. The bishop was shocked by the speed of the Confederate collapse, and many copies of the German and French editions went unsold.71 With its publication, the Bishop apparently felt that he had done all he could for his country and wanted to return home. On Christmas Eve, 1864, he wrote Cardinal Barnabö that he had sent his resignation to Richmond effective February, 1865, and hoped to sail for America around January 20.72 As things turned out he was not to see Charleston for another year, after the Confederate débâcle and a pardon from President Andrew Johnson.

71Lynch to Archbishop Martin John Spalding, May, 1865, Archives of the Archdiocese of Baltimore, 34U3; Shadier to Lynch, June 29, 1865, CDA, 32N5; Hamilton to same, September 15, 1865, CDA, 33A5; same to same, October 15, 1865, CDA, 33D3.

72Lynch to Propaganda Fide, December 24, 1864, APF, Scritt. rif., Vol. 20, fols, 1192™-1193\AUND, MPRF, Reel 66, III, 468. No evidence has been found that such a letter reached the Confederate government.

BOOK REVIEWS

General and Miscellaneous

Eternity in Time: Christopher Dawson and the Catholic Idea of History. Edited by Stratford Caldecott and John Morrill. (Edinburgh: T & T Clark. 1997. Pp. 214. $39.95.)

Christopher Dawson (1889-1970), although perhaps one of the century's more important historians, presents a seemingly contradictory legacy. His religious beliefs and innovative approach to historical study made him suspect in the eyes of the historical establishment of his day, while his ecumenism and reluctance to reify the Middle Ages reduced his influence among fellow Catholics, especially in his native England. Nonetheless, Dawson's work remains the most sophisticated attempt by a Christian historian to incorporate a providential vision into empirical analysis. His focus on "metahistory" as a means to discover the underlying purposes of history, has become even more crucial in our postmodern age, when the denial of true knowledge has become fashionable. And many of his methods—if not his conclusions—have been adopted by the contemporary historical profession.

This collection of papers arose out of a conference held at Westminster College, Oxford, in honor of the silver jubilee of his death, and treats of two main subjects. The first is an examination of Dawson and his work. The second purpose is to extract from that examination an historical approach that is both truly Catholic and fully compatible with general standards of scholarly rigor. As the subtitle indicates, what the essays explore is a Catholic idea of history, not simply a "Catholic history," which, as Dawson himself noted, too often becomes merely a"department of apologetics." Rather, Eternity in Time seeks a new synthesis between the reality centered in the Incarnation and the truths of history. The contributors demonstrate Dawson's profound sensitivity both to the complexity of history and to his conviction of its underlying unity.

Dawson's conclusion that religion is the key to history suffuses his work. "Every human culture must possess some spiritual dynamic, which provides the energy necessary for . . . civilization," he wrote in 1929, and his life was spent exploring the implications of that insight. His familiarity with the latest anthropological works and his immersion in the literature and beliefs of other cultures convinced him that historical approaches that attempt to explain religion in

terms of material factors will be insufficient to explain civilization or humanity's universal impulse toward the transcendent. As Fernando Cervantes points out, a secular view of history cannot comprehend the past as "an organic, intelligible whole" (p. 52). In contrast, Dawson saw history as the constant interpenetration of the eternal with the temporal that reveals an intelligible meaning. A Dawsonian history is open to theological norms and the revelation of the salvific plan, without, however, surrendering specifically historical norms or methods, a point made by Dermot Quinn in his essay (p. 74).

Francesca Murphy critiques what she calls a "deep-sea diving" approach to the past, which seeks to recover the lost glories, political or theological, of Catholicism. While useful and important, such archaeological history in fact echoes secular histories that find the reasons for cultural change in political or material terms. "Even if the findings of the Catholic side are true, [such] history is Marxist 'Catholic studies,' not Catholic history" (p. 124). Rather, drawing on Dawson's use of "symbolic" moments (such as the conversion of barbarian kings to Christianity) to dramatize the moral order that those symbols embody, Murphy calls Catholic historians to conceptualize the normal events of the world as infused with the divine. Only then, she argues, can Catholicism present a universal history that supplies the "perceptual apparatus" (p. 130) lacking in its secular counterparts.

Eternity in Time is an outstanding collection of essays that challenges secular standards of value in historical study and presents an alternative vision based in Catholic thought.

Gerald J. Russello

New York

Historical Dictionary of Catholicism. By William J. Collinge. [Historical Dictionaries of Religions, Philosophies, and Movements, No. 12.] (Lanham, Maryland: The Scarecrow Press. 1997. Pp. xx, 551. $58.00.)

This is a historical dictionary of Catholicism, not "a dictionary of the history of Catholics," the author tells us in the introduction. He has made an attempt, he says, to encompass all seven of Ninian Smart's dimensions of religion as they apply to Catholicism: practical-ritual, experiential-emotional, narrative-mythic, doctrinal-philosophical, ethical-legal, social-institutional, and material (artifacts). It is an extremely ambitious undertaking but one I believe he has accomplished in a brilliant way. In covering the whole history of the Church, he makes a judicious selection from the enormous mass of facts involved. All in all, a fine summary of the beliefs, rites, events, movements, memorable popes, saints, and other key persons in Catholic history. The summary of church history he provides in the introduction is a model of compression and delineates well the

main lines of development. An interesting entry is even devoted to the tasks facing it today.

The author, who teaches theology and philosophy at Mount Saint Mary's College, Emmitsburg, Maryland, had college teachers, students, and librarians primarily in mind, but the book deserves a wide audience. It is not a dry collection of facts but a lively, well written work, quite honest about the problematic aspects of the Church's history. It should whet the reader's appetite for more information on the topics treated. As I say, he doesn't shy away from the thorny issues but walks bravely, albeit cautiously, over such minefields as the area of sexual morality. On such issues as homosexuality, birth control, and divorce he provides a balanced assessment of the state of the question. His entry on dissent in the Church is a masterpiece of compression. Here he notes how limited private disagreement had been allowed long before the Second Vatican Council by authorized theological textbooks and how this opinion was alluded to by the Theological Commission of the Council. In an interesting observation on the current scene he believes the radical opposition between the world and the Church so characteristic of pre-Vatican Council II days has resurfaced to some extent with Pope John Paul II.

He provides a very full bibliography of some seventy-one pages. For anyone interested in the history of the Catholic Church, this is a most useful and up-to-date reference work. It has already found a place on the bookshelves above my desk.

Thomas Bokenkotter

Xavier University
Cincinnati, Ohio

A History of Heaven: The Singing Silence. By Jeffrey Burton Russell. (Princeton: Princeton University Press. 1997. Pp. xy 220. $24.95.)

In his preface Jeffrey Burton Russell states that he hopes "this present book will be a prolegomenon to a detailed, multivolume study of heaven" (p. xv), a study that all medievalists who admire his careful research and lucid style must eagerly await. Until then, the present volume provides a taste of what is to come in the form of an introduction for the general reader to "the human concept of heaven" (p. 3). Although Russell displays, as expected, a wide command of the sources, the book limits its scholarly apparatus to a mere forty-four footnotes, although it includes a healthy bibliography (pp. 191-210).

A History of Heaven follows the structure of Russell's four highly respected studies of evil—The Devil, Satan, Lucifer, and Mephistopheles—by being organized chronologically. After a conceptual first chapter, "Understanding Heaven," it moves rather quickly in a series of short chapters through classical and Jew-

ish views (chap. 2), early Christian theology (chap. 3), the influence of Greek concepts of the body and soul (chap. 4), eastern and western Christian theologians (chap. 5), monastic spirituality (chap. 6), otherworld journeys (chap. 7), scholastic notions (chaps. 8, 9), mysticism (chap. 10), and Dante (chaps. 11,12). Chapter 13, "Hearing the Silence," provides a short conclusion.

Not surprisingly, such a quick survey does not provide much opportunity for original contributions to scholarship. But this deficiency is more than balanced by numerous personal insights and a series of fascinating comments. Russell explains that "This book is a personal as well as historical statement. I believe in the Christian concept of heaven, not in the sense that this concept can fully or exclusively represent a reality that is beyond all human imagination and understanding, but in the sense that it, like other traditions, opens toward that reality." He then defines Heaven as "the song that God sings to the world out of his silence" (p. xiv), a view that informs the book's subtitle and conclusion.

Although a very personal book, it is also very thorough in introducing, summarizing, and critiquing a huge number of authors and texts ranging from the Hebrew Bible through Dante. If the survey sometimes threatens to become a mere listing, at other times Russell devotes greater attention to a few key thinkers such as Thomas Aquinas (pp. 125-140). Dante receives two entire chapters: the first provides a basic description of the Vita nuova and the Commedia through the Earthly Paradise scenes of the Purgatorio, a discussion that assumes very little previous knowledge of the poet; the second chapter, focusing in some detail on Paradiso, is more rewarding. I was disappointed only once by the book's emphases: it seems to me that, given the originality of her visions, Hildegard of Bingen deserves more than a short paragraph (p. 145).

The book is decorated with eighteen illustrations from medieval art, ranging from a ninth-century Apocalypse to paintings by Lucas Cranach the Elder in the early sixteenth century. Unfortunately, not a word is devoted to explicating these illustrations or showing their relevance to the traditions being studied. The book is written as if they don't exist, and it is possible they were included by the publisher to sell the book to a general audience. I hope Russell's promised multivolume study will focus on the ways in which artists—as well as theologians, exegetes, mystics, and poets—made important and original contributions to the concept of heaven. His usually stimulating insights on the visual representations would be most welcome.

Richard K. Emmerson

Western Washington University

Vom Apostelkonzil zum Ersten Vatikanum: Studien zur Geschichte der Konzilsidee. By Hermann Josef Sieben. [Konziliengeschichte, Reihe B. Untersuchungen.] (Paderborn: Ferdinand Schöningh. 1996. Pp. xii,600.)

Although the author addresses issues covering nearly two millennia, the heart of this book is the study of issues arising in the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries. In the first part, the focus indeed is on the councils of the Apostles and the Elders reported in the Acts of the Apostles and on the great councils of Nicaea, Constantinople, Ephesus, and Chalcedon. An intriguing aspect of this part is the attention given the legends which grew up around the early councils. Sieben also addresses in this part, as he does throughout the book, the question of the reception of conciliar decrees throughout the Church.

The second and third parts address at length, respectively, the Council of Basel and that of Ferrara-Florence. Here the studies have various points of departure, ranging from the influence of Aristotle on conciliar thought to Greek ideas about the role of a council in the Church. Here too the issue of reception looms large, involving not just disputes among ecclesiastics but the crucial role played by the princes of Europe in the reception of conciliar decrees. (The Pragmatic Sanction of Bourges [1438] is one of the most important among the examples of royal intervention which Sieben examines.)

The fourth part, and much the most interesting to the reviewer, illustrates the continuity of issues debated in the fifteenth century at the Council of Trent and down to the First Vatican Council. Jesuit thinkers loom large in Sieben's discussion of Trent, and the continuity of Gallican thought—overlapping with Jansenist opinion—into the time of the French Revolution receives due attention. (The Synod of Pistoia [1786] receives particular mention in the next to the last of these studies.) Here too the idea of reception by the universal Church is of crucial importance.

Throughout this volume, the depth of Sieben's research is notable. Alongside the usual sources for the history of councils and synods, he has employed texts like the Miraculum S. Euphemiae. Byzantine sources are permitted to speak for themselves, and Latin manuscripts have been consulted alongside printed texts. Moreover, the tone is irenic rather than polemical, a fault of much which is written on the late medieval councils. Some of the material treated will be familiar, but the attention given to writers like the Jesuit Alphonso de Salmerón is welcome. The most welcome aspect of the book is the emphasis on reception. It is too easy to become focused on the internal workings of councils, disputing the relative importance of the pope's authority weighed against that of the assembled fathers. Sieben makes us look at the way these issues played themselves out far from the seat of a particular council, not just in the decisions of prelates and the arguments of learned men but in the actions of princes.

Thomas M. Izbicki

Johns Hopkins University

Sacred Games: A History of Christian Worship. By Bernhard Lang. (New Haven: Yale University Press. 1997. Pp. xiii, 527. $40.00.)

This is no ordinary history of Christian worship. Lang, professor of religion at the University of Paderborn, is not so much a liturgical historian as an historian of religions. His background affords him a fresh view of the history of Christian worship, unencumbered by the debates characteristic of the profession.

Lang divides the subject into six "games" or basic components in which he finds "the essential meaning of Christian worship" (p. xi). These games are: praise, prayer, sermon, sacrifice, sacrament, and ecstasy. The book thus provides six interpretive essays in an attempt to uncover theological meaning through an investigation of historical and contemporary forms of worship. In the process Lang is most attentive to popular culture as well as to the general philosophical milieu in which forms of worship developed. An example of the former can be found in a number of illustrations that are interspersed through the book and especially the book jacket which portrays an early twentieth-century street procession of young girls approaching their first holy communion. An example of the latter is the extensive use that Lang makes of neo-Platonic philosophy in analyzing the theurgic aspects of the development of Christian worship forms. The result is a series of vignettes of both the origins, historical instances, and contemporary realizations of Christian worship tied together by a clear argument.

Certainly the most intriguing and provocative parts of this study are to be found in the chapters on "sacrifice" and "sacrament." Lang's professed aim is to recover a much more "ritual" portrait of Jesus than is normally drawn. For him the origins of the Last Supper are to be found in Jesus' attempt to replace Temple Sacrifice with a new sacrifice of bread and wine, representing self-offering and more available to the poor. In suggesting that the Last Supper represents a replacement of Temple Sacrifice Lang is in agreement with contemporary New Testament scholars like E. P. Sanders, Bruce Chilton, and N. T. Wright. I find Wright's approach, namely, that Jesus' institution of the Eucharist provides a new meal of the kingdom and representation of Jesus' own forthcoming sacrifice on the Cross, more persuasive than Lang's new sacrifice for the poor. Moreover, Lang's argument that the words "This is my body" and "This is my blood" (pp. 216-218) were spoken over animal sacrifices in the Temple is highly conjectural and rests upon a hunch more than upon evidence.

In addition Lang argues, on the basis of a picture of Jesus as "magician," that his followers turned his sacrificial gesture at the Last Supper into a sacrament by transforming it into a theurgic or magical celebration of making God present to worshipers (p. 357). I suspect that the rehabilitation of the concept of magic in the ancient world will be an important endeavor for liturgical historians in the future. Lang does not present enough evidence, however, to warrant such a radical discontinuity between the meal of Jesus and the meal of the early Christians.

Finally, one wonders if Lang's attribution of the Lord's Prayer to John the Baptist and his movement (pp. 78-80) is more provocation than history. He seems correct in underlining the political nature of this prayer, but offers no convincing evidence that it should have come from the circle of the Baptist rather than from Jesus.

This history of Christian worship contains a number of other features that are often lacking in standard liturgical histories. By providing essays on sermon and ecstasy the author draws a fuller picture of the experience of worship than can normally be found in such standard studies. In doing so Lang has written a book that will have to be dealt with by historians for a long time to come.

John F. Baldovin, SJ.

Jesuit School of Theology
Berkeley, California

The Death Penalty. An Historical and Theological Survey. By James T. Megivern. (Mahwah, New Jersey: Paulist Press. 1997. Pp. xiii, 641. $29-95.)

Capital punishment, like slavery, was one of those institutions of Roman law that the early Christians accepted as an ordinary mechanism of civil society. Occasionally, Christians (e.g., Lactantius) taught that all killing was wrong. More often, bishops (e.g., Ambrose and Augustine) rebuked the official authors of particular public executions or recommended mercy in particular cases. No established, coherent, fundamental opposition to the institution developed. At the beginning of the fifth century, Innocent I could say, "On this point nothing has been handed down to us." The Christian emperors (Theodosius, Justinian), codifying the law, freely incorporated the death penalty. The Gospel texts on forgiveness and love of neighbor had not been made a barrier against such law, nor had the example of enormous official error in the execution of Jesus provided a deterrent. The Old Testament, with at least thirteen capital crimes including blasphemy, stood as a ready repository of authority affording divine approbation of the practice.

The medieval Church got more deeply into its support as death became the punishment for heretics. Ad abolendam, X.5.7.9, of Lucius III in 1184 provided that the unrepentant or lapsed heretic was to be "left to the judgment of the secular power to be punished by punishment of death." R. H. Helmholz, The Spirit of Classical Law, says, "[N]o one doubted that the punishment being referred to was death" (p. 362). Megivern, relying on Edward Peters' Inquisition, sees the decisive step as Gregory IX's constitution of 1231, Excommunicamus. By this point the fiction that priests did not shed blood in turning heretics over to the secular power had been accepted without cavil by the canonists. Writing against this legal background, Thomas Aquinas's defense of capital punishment in general and of turning the lapsed over to the state to be killed sealed the official position with the prestige of a great theologian.

The course was set for centuries. Spectacular examples of error—Jan Hus, Joan of Arc, Girolamo Savonarola—did not shake confidence in this way of fortifying the faith. The outbreak of revolt against the papacy in the sixteenth century only enlarged the number of executions. In the bull Exsurge Domine, Leo X condemned proposition 35 of Martin Luther, "It is against the will of the Spirit to burn heretics."The Roman Catechism and the great Counter-Reformation theologians endorsed the practice. Suarez in De fide Theologica, Disputation 23, asked, "Can the Church justly punish the heretics with the punishment of death?" and confidently answered affirmatively. There was now not even a fiction: it was the Church that punished capitally. In the Papal States, the death penalty was an ordinary part of criminal law enforcement, used against brigands and heretics alike.

I draw the foregoing from Megivern's book. The author's method is a judicious use of secondary sources such as Peters supplemented by his own reading of texts such as Bellarmine's. He writes as an avowed critic of the death penalty today. His credentials include a doctorate in theology from the University of Fribourg and a licentiate's degree in Sacred Scripture from the Pontifical Biblical Institute. He currently teaches in the Department of Philosophy and Religion at the University of North Carolina. He sets out the horrors of the past as a way to charting the development of the present.

Over one-quarter of his book is devoted to this development since 1971, which reached its climax in March, 1995, when John Paul II issued the encyclical Evangelium vitae and taught that instances where the defense of society could only be accomplished by the death penalty were "vary rare, if not practically nonexistent." The road to that teaching had been undertaken by certain theologians—Franz X. Linsemann in nineteenth-century Tubmen and Jean-Marie Aubert (1978), Niceto Blázquez, O.P (1989), and Gino Concetti, O.F.M. (1993), to give three modern instances. The way had also been prepared by the vote of national Episcopal conferences, such as the 145 to 31 vote of the United States Catholic Conference in 1980 declaring that contemporary conditions in this country "do not justify the imposition of the death penalty."

As Megivern points out, secular voices and secular law preceded the theological insight. Up until the eighteenth century the direction of Christian thought was toward a hardening in favor of the death penalty. The first important critic was Cesare Beccaria (1764). In the nineteenth century the clearest condemnations came from a poet, Alphonse Lamartine, and a novelist, Victor Hugo. In our century the most eloquent abolitionists have been Albert Camus and Arthur Koestler. In reaction to the slaughter of World War II the European countries got rid of the institution (only Portugal had the honor of anticipating them by abolition in 1857). The Church has caught up with the governments.

This valuable book is of special interest in two regards: (1) Why is the United States so out of step with the rest of the civilized world? and (2) How can a papacy so tenacious of tradition move so quickly from what had been held so long? These difficult questions cannot, of course, be answered by one book. As

to the first, however, the impression is left that American Catholics have been poorly educated in the doctrinal development. As to the second, the book speaks occasionally of the new approach as "a retrieval" of tradition. But there was nothing to retrieve except the teaching of the Gospels, overshadowed by centuries of institutional practice. The lesson appears to be: the basic message of the Gospels, if attended to, can dissolve the thickest institutional crusts.

John T. Noonan, Jr.

United States Court of Appeals
for the Ninth Circuit

Koptische Kirche und Reichskirche. Altes Schisma und neuer Dialog. By Dietmar W. Winkler. [Innsbrucker theologische Studien, Band 48.] (Innsbruck: Tyrolia Verlag. 1997. Pp. 367. ÖS 480, -;DM 68,-;SFr65.)

This book, produced as a dissertation for the Catholic Theological Faculty of the University of Innsbruck, also forms part of a research project undertaken at the Institut für Liturgiewissenschaft, Christliche Kunst und Hymnologie in Graz. The goal of the project (comparative research into the christology and ecclesiology of the Oriental Orthodox Churches and the Roman Catholic Church) is the comprehensive analysis of the separation of these churches and of the present ecumenical dialogue.

Winkler has divided his book into three major sections. The first part (pp. 23-89) constitutes a very useful summary of the historical research (Grillmeier, Halleux, Martelos) that has been conducted on the christological controversies up to and including the Council of Chalcedon. The second part (pp. 90-200) attempts to follow the developments in Egypt after Chalcedon that led to the full separation of the Egyptian church from the Chalcedonian church in the sixth century with the establishment of rival hierarchies. This includes sections on Shenute, Timothy Aelurus, Peter Mongus and the Henoticon, Philoxenus and Severus of Antioch, Theodosius of Alexandria, observations on the Second Council of Constantinople, an analysis of texts from the liturgies of St. Basil and St. Gregory, and finally notes on the non-theological factors involved in the schism. Winkler presents a balanced and integrated picture of the various factors involved, theological and non-theological, especially the question of the historical rivalry between Alexandria and Constantinople, and the deposition of Dioscuros, all based on the best research of this century. He also gives a brief history of the polemical term "monophysite" and suggests the more accurate term"miaphysite"to designate the position of the main-stream non-Chalcedonian theology.

On one point it is necessary to add a correction (of which Winkler could not be aware). He suggests that after Shenute (whose writings he finds completely orthodox and free of contested technical terminology) we find no reflections of

the post-Chalcedonian disputes in the Coptic literature of upper Egypt (p. 109). The recently published homilies of Rufus of Shotep show on the contrary a keen sensitivity to theologically correct terminology. Additional unpublished material is likely to show the same.

In the third part of the book (pp. 202-334) Winkler traces the involvement of the Coptic Church in the ecumenical movement beginning with its participation as a founding member in the World Council of Churches in 1948 and later its participation also as a founding member in the Middle East Council of Churches and the dialogues with other churches to which these contacts led. He divides his discussion into dialogues between the Oriental-Orthodox Churches and the Orthodox Church (unofficial and official) and dialogues between the Oriental-Orthodox Churches and the Roman-Catholic Church (unofficial [those sponsored by Pro Oriente in Vienna] and official). Winkler explains the degree of agreement to which these discussions have led on christological questions and the degree of disagreement that remains on eccesiological matters, as well as the difficulties of translating theological agreement into visible communion among the churches. Winkler's work provides a veritable guidebook to these complex developments of the last fifty years. It would also be interesting to know what are the sources used by the Oriental Orthodox theologians participating in these dialogues (beyond the classical authors such as Cyril and Severus) and to what extent they accept western historical scholarship.

This is a very useful book, whether as a guide to the complexities of the christological disputes of the fifth and sixth centuries and recent research thereon or to the more recent and equally complex dialogues on the subject. A brief review cannot do justice to the many finely balanced discussions contained in it. An ample and useful bibliography completes it.

Mark Sheridan, O.S.B.

Pontificio Ateneo S.Anselmo, Rome

Historical Dictionary of the Orthodox Church. By Michael Prokurat, Alexander Golitzin, and Michael D. Peterson. [Religions, Philosophies, and Movements, No. 9] (Lanham, Maryland: Scarecrow Press. 1996. Pp. xvii, 440. $89.00.)

Students of the Christian Church may avail themselves of such fine reference works as the three-volume Encyclopedia of the Lutheran Church (1965), the eighteen-volume New Catholic Encyclopedia (1967 et seq.), the eight-volume Coptic Encyclopedia (1991), or the renowned Oxford Dictionary of the Christian Church, written largely from a British and Anglican perspective (1786 pp.; 3rd ed., 1997). The book here under review is a more modest but entirely welcome reference work on the Orthodox tradition and meets a long-felt need. Of the three authors Dr. Prokurat and Dr. Golitzin are both assistant professors of

theology, while Mr. Peterson is a professional librarian; all three are associated with theological institutions in the United States.

An introductory essay discusses, among other things, the Nicene-Constantinopolitan Creed (without the Filioque) as the basic statement of Orthodox belief, the world-wide distribution of Orthodox believers, the perception of Orthodoxy by contemporary Western historians and the media, and future challenges; among the latter the authors see a need for a "united witness of Orthodoxy on the international scene."

It is one of the strong points of this book that it does not limit its coverage to the Greek-speaking Orthodox churches, but rather gives equal attention to the Orthodox churches of the Balkans and Eastern Europe. Thus we find articles not only on John Chrysostom or Photius, but also on the Doukhobars or Alexander Nevskii. While biblical matters have been excluded—justifiably so, given the ready availability of various Bible dictionaries and commentaries—the chronological scope is also impressive: from Justin Martyr or Gnosticism in the second century to Archbishop Iakovos or the ecumenical movement in the twentieth century. The last 150 years receive, relatively, more attention than earlier centuries; thus the article on Georges Florovsky takes up a whole page, that on Constantine the Great only half a page. There are articles not only on historical figures and events but also on theological concepts, liturgical practices, and religious institutions. Important personalities of the West, such as Augustine of Hippo or Charlemagne, are not overlooked. Some technical terms are explained such as "autocephalous," Filioque, or Kyrie eleison. Controversial subjects are not avoided; thus it is pointed out that the meeting of the Ecumenical Patriarch Athenagoras (q.v.) with Pope Paul VI in 1964 and Orthodox involvement generally in the ecumenical movement (q.v.) have provoked some sharp criticism on the part of some.

The ambitious scope and limited space required of the authors that they be both brief and selective. Approximately 540 articles, not counting numerous cross-references, are competing for space on only 324 pages. Most articles are half a page long, a few even shorter. Some of the longer ones deal with such major topics as Christology, icons, monasticism, or the Russian Orthodox Church. Four articles are illustrated with line drawings: those on church architecture, iconostasis, liturgical utensils, and liturgical vestments. On the other hand, of the seven Ecumenical Councils only one, that of Chalcedon, is allotted an article of its own; and there is no article on the Theotokos, only a cross-reference to Mariology. Some omissions are surprising: homoios and homoiousios, proskynesis, and synaxarion; St. Spyridon, the emperor Theodosius, and Cardinal Bessarion.

A brief appendix lists the various Orthodox churches of the world; together with the map on page 19 it sheds light on a subject often misunderstood.

Individual entries in this dictionary, unfortunately, do not include bibliographical references. There is, however, an excellent bibliography, eighty-nine pages long and listing more than a thousand titles, most of them in English. It is

organized in twelve segments under such headings as Canon Law, Hagiography, or Liturgy; it separates, where appropriate, primary and secondary sources; it includes many books which do not focus on the Eastern Church but are of a wider interest. Greek and Russian titles are transliterated for the benefit of those not familiar with the Greek or Cyrillic alphabet. Both beginning and more advanced students will consult this bibliography to great advantage.

This dictionary provides concise, accurate, and up-to-date information on a wide range of subjects; it will satisfy those who do not require more than brief definitions. A multi-volume reference work, enlisting the participation of many experts and covering the same range of materials in greater depth, remains a desideratum.

The book is well produced; I have noticed few misprints (LXTHYS for IX0Y2;"Icononium" for"Iconium," s.v. Asia Minor; umlaut generally omitted in German references). The price is higher than reasonable.

Hans A. Pohlsander

State University of New York at Albany

The Reception of the Church Fathers in the West: From the Carolingians to the Maurists. Edited by Irena Backus. 2 vols. (Leiden: E.J. Brill. 1997. Pp. xxix, 469; vii, 470-1078. $338.50.)

It would be impossible to write a comprehensive history of the reception of the Church Fathers from the Carolingians to the Maurists in two volumes. What this work gives, rather, is studies of select subjects by an international group of scholars. Each of its twenty-six articles is written in or translated into English. The translations are sometimes infelicitous, fairly often have bad grammar and typographical and spelling errors, and are not always aware of English conventions. All have a bibliography. Some of the articles cover large topics, some are more modest in ambition. Their quality ranges from the pedestrian to the truly clarifying and permanently useful. The editor's introduction, which summarizes the separate chapters, is not fully in command of either English or some of the materials it describes. One frequently puzzles over whether the mistakes are of fact or expression: on page xii, Backus follows Willemien Otten (p. 12) in ascribing "adoration of images" to the Second Council of Nicaea. Then, summarizing Jean Werckmeister, she writes in regard to the period before 1200 of "the existence of several canon laws given that each Church [sic] possessed its own legislature." Werckmeister's translated language (p. 51), however, is not of each (presumably regional) "Church" having its own legislature, but its own law. Backus also (p. xix) follows Manfred Schulze's statement (p. 625) that Luther performed the "inestimable scholarly service" of showing that "the Fathers . . . could be mistaken," as if this were not a commonplace in the Middle Ages.

Part One, on the use of patristic sources until 1200, begins with a well-informed but not always precise and sometimes superficial study by WiUemien Otten of the place of the Fathers in Carolingian theology. Otten usefully examines Carolingian anthropology. An essay by Jean Werckmeister summarizes, especially in regard to the question of marriage, the reception of the Fathers into canon law. Perhaps the vagueness of remarks such as that Gratian did not consider the union of Mary and Joseph a true marriage (p. 71)"due to lack of a sensual dimension" is to be attributed to the translator. The better part of a century ago, Rudolph Sohm thought he saw the canon law after Gratian shifting from the categories of sacrament and mystery to that of legislation. Intentionally or not (the discussion could be clearer), Werckmeister shows by contrast that what Sohm labelled altkatholisch or theological law was not in fact ancient but a creation of the period from the eighth to the twelfth century, during which the writings of the Fathers played a greater role in law than they did before or after. Except for an undefended dating of the Codex Sinaiticus to the second century, E. Ann Matter gives an informed discussion of the Glossa ordinaria. Jacques-Guy Bougerol does the same for the Sentences of Peter Lombard, and returns in Part Two to continue the story with a fine article on "The Church Fathers is\dAuctoritates in Scholastic Theology to Bonaventura." Burcht Pranger's study of Anselm's,Abelard's, and Bernard's views of patristic authority, with its comparisons of what is common to these thinkers, and what distinctive to each, is especially thought-provoking. The contributions of Bougerol and Pranger make substantive contributions to their subjects, going well beyond the question of the reception of the Fathers.

Part Two, covering the later Middle Ages, begins with a well-informed study of Robert Grosseteste by Neil Lewis. Barbara Fleith then presents a research report on the Legenda Aurea, and Leo J. Elders gives a careful study of Thomas Aquinas' use of the Church Fathers. Erik Leland Saak's fine article on Augustine in the later Middle Ages pays attention to such relatively little-studied figures as Alfonsus Vargas, and explores the irony that just at the moment when the whole Augustinian corpus was available with scholarly apparatus, Luther's anti-Pelagian Augustine replaced the Augustine of history. Nikolaus Staubach presents a precise and up-to-date study of the Devotio Moderna.

Part Three (vol. 2) begins with a very clear and careful study by Charles Stinger on Italian Renaissance patristic learning. David Rutherford follows by returning to the study of Gratian's Decretum, now as a source of patristic knowledge in the Renaissance, specifically for Timoteo Maffei's In Sanctam Rusticitatem. With many shrewd comments, Jan den Boeft continues the analysis of Erasmus begun in Staubach's article. Manfred Schulze enters Luther's world, sometimes with a concomitant decline in clarity, but, as in Schulze's explanation of how the "philological" exegesis of Jerome and Erasmus anticipates "modern" exegesis in defusing texts through the search for uniform meaning, sometimes to wonderful effect. Unfortunately, Schulze seems unaware of how problematic Luther's turn to the so-called letter of Scripture and rejection of allegory was. He also tells us such things as that "most of the scholastic theolo-

gians had ranked [Augustine] among the embarrassments of church history" [!] (p. 625). The editor contributes an essay on Ulrich Zwingli and Martin Bucer, and Johannes van Oort a chapter on John Calvin. Ralph Keen's fine article on pre-Tridentine Counter-Reformation theology clearly lays out the issues, though occasionally making statements one would like to query or qualify The latter could also be said of Enrico Norelli's study of the Centuriators and Caesar Baronius. Keen is only one of the scholars of the post-medieval period who seem to forget that Abelard had already questioned the identity of Dionysius the Areopagite. Mark Vessey describes translations of the Latin Fathers into English from 1517 to 1611.

Part Four, on the seventeenth and early eighteenth centuries, begins with another article by the editor, this a good study on patristic scholarship in Calvinist orthodoxy which makes many illuminating comparisons between sixteenth- and seventeenth-century scholarship. E. P Meijering follows with a precise description of the Fathers in Calvinist systematic theology. Dominique Bertrand then considers the contribution of 154 Jesuits to patristics. In two very illuminating chapters, Jean-Louis Quantin treats the place of the Fathers in Roman Catholic and in Anglican theology. Finally, Daniel-Odon Hurel concludes with the Maurists.

Glenn W Olsen

University of Utah

Monuments of Endlese Labours: English Canonists and Their Work, 1300-1900. ByJ. H. Baker. (Rio Grande, Ohio: Hambledon Press with the Ecclesiastical Law Society. 1998. Pp. xx, 188. $45.00.)

English lawyers have not been known for their contributions to canonical jurisprudence. Apart from a relatively brief period during the twelfth century, they have been largely dependent upon works imported from the Continent for their knowledge of the canon and Roman laws. There was no English Hostiensis, no English Bartolus. This attractively produced new book will not upset this generalization. Indeed, it does not attempt to do so. However, it does demonstrate that there is an interesting history to be told about men whose careers were devoted to the ecclesiastical law in England.

After an overview of the subject and a word about the importance of the collection of papal decretals during the twelfth century, the author traces the careers and the contributions of writers on the Church's law who lived between 1300 and the eclipse of Doctors' Commons in 1865. Included from the medieval period are William Pauli (de Pagula), William Bateman, John Ayton, and William Lyndwood. Their work was of two basic kinds. The first, best represented by Pauli, was meant to distill the complex learning of the Continental ius commune down to a level where it could be used with profit by practicing

lawyers and parochial clergy. Pauli banished from his text the elaborate distinctions, doubts, and dissensiones characteristic of the learned laws. He put the communis opinio into a form that was easy to use. The second, best represented by Lyndwood, was designed to integrate the local law of provincial and synodal constitutions with the law of the Western Church. Its object was to harmonize, insofar as possible, local practice with the general canon law.

After the Reformation, English canonists, or civilians as they were more normally called, followed the path their medieval predecessors had laid out. Henry Swinburne, Francis Clarke, John Godolphin were the immediate successors. The first integrated the traditional law of wills and marriage with more recent English developments. The second wrote a procedural treatise on court practice, simplifying or eliminating most of the disputed points from the learned laws. The third did both. During the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries, most writers on English ecclesiastical law were busy men—judges, bishops, members of Parliament rather than academics—but few of them deviated from this pattern. Richard Burn's popular Ecclesiastical Law (4 vols., 1763), for example, both summarized existing practice and sought to harmonize it with the general law, although for him this was the English common law. The author pays Burn a high compliment by comparing his work with that of William Blackstone.

This is not a book that presents wholly new material. Many of the chapters have already appeared as articles, and Professor Baker has drawn upon research by other scholars. Nonetheless, his book adds real value. He has a perceptive eye for the revealing domestic detail. He excels in drawing the connections between the public lives and the scholarship of his subjects. His judgments about the merits of their work are always worth having. And in the fashion that has graced his work on the common law, he makes superb use of previously untapped manuscript sources. For anyone interested in the history of the law of the Church, this is a book worth having.

R. H. Helmholz

University of Chicago Law School

El santuario y el camarín de la Virgen de la Peña de Sepúlveda. By Antonio Linage Conde, Marta Alvargonzález, Herminda Cubilla Gonzalo, Raúl Gorriti Yanguas, and Amalia María Yuste Galán. (Sepúlveda: Hermandad de Nuestra Señora de la Virgen de la Peña de Sepúlveda. 1996. Pp. 389)

This book examines the art, architecture, and the history of the parish church of Santa María de la Peña, of Sepúlveda (in the Spanish diocese of Segovia), dedicated to the Virgin, whose image supposedly appeared in a cave on the banks of the Duraton River. This book is divided into two sections. The accomplished historian Antonio Linage Conde authors the first, a history of the church, concerned mainly with the early modern and modern period. The bulk of his his-

tory meticulously describes the church's acquisition of liturgical artifacts and art, in an attempt to illustrate the high quality of la Peña's religious life. He also pays homage to the clerics important in the history of the church.

The second—and most useful—part of the book examines the church's art, architecture, sculpture, liturgical manuscripts, and ecclesiastical artifacts. The church is romanesque, dating to the twelfth and thirteenth centuries; its altar constitutes one of the highlights of la Peña's art works. The camarín, the chamber of the Virgin and the storeplace for her jewels and other possessions, was finished in 1692, part of the Baroque additions to the original church. The art and architecture of la Peña is carefully placed in historical context. Sober judgments, for example, are offered on how la Peña's romanesque capitals suggest Aragonese influence, and how the construction of the camarín reflects the overall development of these structures in Spain. Also of interest is the discussion of the various masters, such as silversmiths, who contributed to la Peña's holdings.

The book's dedication to the Virgin of la Peña reflects its heartfelt and popular approach. Its extensive description of la Peña's architecture, art, and artifacts, supplemented by documentary appendices, should make it a useful reference tool for scholars interested in the rich artistic heritage of the Castilian church, especially in the early modern period.

Clay Stalls

University of California at Los Angeles

Los Carmelitas: Historia de la Orden del Carmen. VI: Figuras del Carmelo. By Ismael Martínez Carretero, O.Carm. (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos. 1996. Pp. Ii, 548. 3,365 ptas.)

This volume appears as an addition and culmination to the Spanish translation of The Carmelites: A History of the Brothers of Our Lady of Mount Carmel (4 volumes in 5; Darien, Illinois: Carmelite Spiritual Center, 1975-1985, with a new edition of volume 1 in 1988). The English original is by the American Carmelite Joachim F. Smet, founder and for many years director of the Institutum Carmelitanum, Rome, Italy. Smet's history should be much better known by historians than it is. The failure of recognition arises, not from any lack of reliable scholarship, but from its being an in-house publication by American Carmelites. Volume IV of Los Carmelitas is a history of Carmel in Spain, 1260-1980, by Balbino Velasco Bayón. (See review of Bayón's volume in this journal awte,LXXXI [October, 1995], 611-613).

Father Ismael Martinez's addition to Smet's history is a "gallery" of significant figures from the Carmelite families, Discalced and Ancient Observance, as well as of lay Carmelites. The prominence of Teresa of Avila, John of the Cross, and Thérèse of Lisieux, saints and doctors of the Church, has obscured Carmel's

other saints, blesseds, and charismatic figures. Martinez's work which amends this imbalance is not outdated hagiography but presents the lives of the saints of Carmel by way of a critical methodology and in a modern theological context. The result is a clear signal that it is more than time that a like collection be undertaken in English. The many "saints" of Carmel deserve to be known more widely than is presently the case. Much of the scholarly work that made Martinez's volume possible first appeared in Santi del Carmelo: Biografié da vari Dizionari, edited by Ludovico Saggi, O.Carm. (Rome: Institutum Carmelitanum. 1972; 403 pp.) An abridged version of Saggi's work appeared as Saints of Carmel, translated by Gabriel Pausback, O.Carm. (Rome: Carmelite Institute, 1972; 356 pp.). The Italian original has received little attention in English-speaking countries, and the abridged volume seems hardly to be have been noticed.

Martinez has divided his work into five parts: I: The Primitive Saints of Carmel, The Great Reformers of the Fifteenth Century; II: (Saints) In the Heart of the Church; III: Spiritual Masters; IV: The Great Witnesses of Carmel; The Martyrs of the Spanish Civil War, Witnesses of Human Values; Exceptional Figures of the Twentieth Century (Titus Brandsma and Edith Stein); V: Those Who Have Read the Signs of the Times.

Figuras del Carmelo has taken advantage of recent, solid scholarship. Oddly, some glaring mistaken dates appear here and there. The centenary of the death of Thérèse of Lisieux should read 1897-1997 (in the preface by A. Yubero, p. xiv). John of the Cross's birth date is 1542 (p. 189). The introduction is helpful. There are an extensive bibliography, pertinent or significant materials in footnotes, very useful indices, and carefully chosen black and white illustrations.

Keith J. Egan

Saint Mary's College
Notre Dame, Indiana

Histoire du Christianisme des origines à nosjours. Sous la direction de Jean-Marie Mayeur, Charles et Luce Pietri, André Vauchez, Marc Venard. Tome IX: L'Âge de raison (1620-1750) sous la responsabilité de Marc Venard. (Paris: Desclée. 1997. Pp. 1216. 480 FF.)

L'Âge de raison (1620-1750), the ninth in a projected series of twelve tomes appearing under the general title Histoire du Christianisme, avoids strict historical narrative and presents instead a collection of well documented articles arranged along four broad thematic lines. Because of its institutional focus, L'Âge de raison is mainly traditional in scope and it is the better for this. Those favoring esoteric investigations may not care for the book's organization or emphases, which are entirely in keeping with a survey of this type. However, L'Âge de raison defies easy categorization because it follows the two preceding

tomes surveying the Reformation era [t. 7, De la réforme à la Réformation (1450-1530) and t. 8,Le temps des confessions (1530-1'62O)], while also serving as the transitional volume to the revolutionary era (1750-1830) that is to be examined in the tenth volume of the series.

Fortunately, contributors to the ninth tome include such seasoned scholars as Bernard Vogler of Strasbourg and Willem Frijhoff of Rotterdam, who have deliberately written in a straightforward descriptive manner that avoids polemics and builds upon the consensus of scholarly opinion. As a collaborative work, L'Âge de raison primarily aims to synthesize. Each chapter contains extensive footnotes as well as selective bibliographies of mostly secondary sources in French. English titles, however, do not figure prominently, and the coverage of English history is less than satisfying. The volume's index also excludes subjects, thereby limiting its reference utility. In a volume that evaluates the entire Christian world, the paucity of reliable maps (only ten) is disappointing.

On a positive note, the editor, Marc Venard, professor emeritus of modern history at the University of Paris and president of the Société d'Histoire religieuse de la France, has assembled a readable, up-to-date survey of Christianity that covers the overlapping periods of Catholic Reformation and pre-Enlightenment. Professor Venard, who has contributed several pieces here, including a chapter on Christian culture and la morale (pp. 990-1033), has made use of nearly two dozen capable scholars, of whom all but six are French. Their emphasis is west-central European. The majority of the chapters deal with Roman Catholicism. Protestantism is covered and the Eastern Churches receive some, though by no means sufficient, comment. Readers probably should not expect otherwise in a publication that is mainly the product of French scholarship.

The only North American contributor is the University of Montreal's Professor Dominique Deslandres, who writes on Christianity in the New World. This chapter is lengthy but not out of place. It is, however, too ambitious, summarizing religious life in the different colonies (Spanish, Portuguese, French, English, Dutch), while also discussing Christian interactions with Native Americans and African slaves. Deslandres' description is included in Part lll,"Le Christianisme dans le monde" and therefore combined with two additional chapters: one of which is a brief description of Africa (examined by Philippe Denis of the University of Natal), the other a competent discussion of the propagation of the faith throughout the Far East and India. The latter is written by the Jesuit scholar Philippe Lécrivain, who offers a lengthy and conventional analysis of the Christian missionaries and their theological squabbling instead of focusing on the perplexing varieties of Asian Christianity.

In a volume that seeks to cover almost every major development from the Counter-Reformation to the early stages of the eighteenth-century Enlightenment, English readers will no doubt find L 'Age de raison puzzling as choice of title. Anticipating such reactions, Venard explains in his introduction how the French raison is entirely appropriate in this context because historically it has combined "reasonable," "reason," and "critical-rational" connotations. Not

that the Age of Reason is viewed by Venard as simply a "triumph of rationalism." Centrally important to the entire tome is how seventeenth-century Christian religious sensibilities—as typified by a more pronounced esprit confessionel—continually underwent subtle evolutions that were in their lasting impact no less significant than the fundamental structural changes encountered during the sixteenth century.

Part One, which includes a first chapter on "Affrontements et reconquêtes" provides an essential overview of the political-religious scene by delineating how monarchical governments promoted religious unity, while shaping clerical thinking along more identifiably statist lines. Established religious controversies, instead of fading away, became steadily entrenched in monarchical (and later, national) politics, contributing to how Europeans regarded sovereignty, jurisprudence (especially as it pertained to natural law), and the role of the people in government. Christian society is examined from a different angle in Part Two, "Regard à l'intérieur des Eglises" The first chapter, not surprisingly, provides a readable account of the "Continuité de la Réforme catholique" In it Bernard Dompnier of Clermont-Ferrand summarizes the most salient features of clerical behavior and outlook. Dompnier effectively synthesizes a huge corpus of monographic literature. Monique Cottret's exposition of Jansenist controversies also has merit. Her fine discussion is necessarily chronological, but she succeeds in bringing freshness to her description of the evolution of Jansenism from its sixteenth-century antecedents among pious Augustinians at the University of Louvain to the later manifestations among Gallican-minded parlementaires. Also worthy of mention are François Laplanche's two chapters (in Part Four) that examine major intellectual trends. Laplanche's first contribution, which reads like a compendium of published works, traverses the confusing labyrinth of seventeenth-century scholarship and controversy. His second, more successful, piece describes Christianity and culture of the pre-Enlightenment (pré-Lumières), when efforts were repeatedly made by Christian savants to reconcile traditional understandings of divine power with the human attributes of reason and newer concepts of natural law. Laplanche, the author of L'Ecriture, le sacré et l'histoire (1986), a mammoth study on French Protestant biblical commentary and disputation, is especially impressive when describing the historical thinking of Christian scholars who rejected radical Deism but nevertheless sought to defend scripture's authority by explicitly acknowledging the significance of cultural differences. Appropriately, Laplanche's nuanced description of intellectual life is the tome's final chapter. Complementing it is Venard's conclusion, which further repudiates the simplistic interpretation of a Christianity in full retreat before the scientific wisdom of the philosophes. Venard identifies several far-reaching developments, including the gradual "secularization of the Christian culture" as typified by the mutation of theological controversies into philosophical debates and by the explicit introduction of personal morality into the rule of law.

As a work of synthesis and summation, L'Âge de raison contains much that is commendable. In this weighty tome the dynamic historical dimension behind

an emerging early modern Christian conscience is given its due and assessed accordingly. Students who remain indebted to the older series Histoire de l'Eglise (1934-1960), edited by A. Fliehe and V Martin, will be drawn to this and other useful tomes in Histoire du Christianisme.

Finally, it should be noted that the editors of Histoire du Christianisme evidently appreciate The Catholic Historical Review: of nearly thirty scholarly periodicals found in the Table des Abréviations, the CHR is the only American journal listed.

David C. Miller

Kansas City, Missouri

Freedom and Religion in the Nineteenth Century. Edited by Richard Helmstadter. [The Making of Modern Freedom Series.] (Stanford: Stanford University Press. 1997. Pp. xiii, 446. $55.00.)

This important volume, part of a series exploring the concept of freedom, is the result of a fall, 1995, conference of scholars at the Center for the History of Freedom at Washington University in St. Louis. The eleven articles contained in this book are "case studies" of religious liberty which challenge the "liberal narrative" by first identifying traditional interpretations and then showing how to reread the historical record. The lengthy introduction rehashes the "master narrative of religious liberty" and then summarizes each of the articles in the book.

The broad and ambitious title indicates the wide-ranging content of the articles, the majority of which deal with Europe (particularly England and France but also Germany). Other articles explore religious liberty in the early United States, in Chile, and in British Protestant missionary activities in India and Africa. Another article dispels the Enlightenment notion that science necessarily supports religious liberty. While most articles focus on Christianity, one article addresses European Judaism, and another includes a discussion of Islam in French Algeria. The articles vary in length from twenty-two pages to forty-seven pages, and one "case study" (France) is divided into two parts for a total of sixty-nine pages. All presuppose some historical knowledge and all are well written. Because the broad range of topics raises interesting points of comparison and contrast, a concluding chapter in which the authors might have commented on and dialogued with each others' materials and conclusions would have been a valuable addition.

Several significant themes emerge in this volume: the transition in the nineteenth century from corporate liberty to individualistic liberty and the distinction between the two, the ambiguity and complexity of the concept of religious liberty, the role of religion in "cultural and ethnic identity," and the growth and the development of religious pluralism. Further, the authors look not so much at the church-state dimension as at the social, cultural context—including the

struggle for religious liberty within church structures. While acknowledging in the introduction the importance of the question of gender (meaning women) in the history of religious liberty, the absence of an in-depth analysis of this phenomenon is a regrettable lacuna—though several articles at least treat the issue briefly. Though there is no bibliography, there are fifty-two pages of notes, many of which refer to primary sources.

This book is of value to historians of religion and of the nineteenth century and will be useful in graduate seminars. It offers plenty of food for thought and ably demonstrates avenues for further research. Under one cover, it explores the concept of religious liberty in several countries (e.g., England, France, Germany, Chile, United States) and suggests possibilities for comparative historical analysis. It is a model of scholarly collaboration and of how one concept can be examined in various contexts and circumstances.

M. Patricia Dougherty, O.P.

Dominican College of San Rafael

Varieties of Ultramontanism. Edited by Jeffrey vonArx, SJ. (Washington, D.C.: The Catholic University of America Press. 1998. Pp. viii, 152. $34.95 clothbound; $1995 paperback.)

Ultramontanism is among those big categories that are at once unavoidable and hazy. Its emphasis on the authority of the papacy and the Roman Curia in the government of the universal Church is obvious. Beyond that, ultramontanism is perhaps more often used as a shibboleth, whether of acclaim or of reproof, than as a tool of historical analysis. As Jeffrey von Arx, SJ., reasonably observes in introducing the essays he has collected in Varieties of Ultramontanism, it "can only be properly understood by a careful study of its place and functioning within a particular context."

In an effort to refine ultramontansim into a more precise category, von Arx, who chairs the history department at Georgetown University, joined five other specialists to write on six cardinals who were "perceived in their time and in their locale to be very strong ultramontanes." The result is a lucid volume whose greatest contribution may lie in raising fundamental questions rather than delivering premature and partial answers. It is, however, striking that those ultramontane prelates whose minds were most immune to nostalgia for vanished regimes and least constrained by clericalism made the centralization of ecclesiastical authority seem as up-to-date and necessary as the contemporary centralization of political authority.

Eric Yonke offers a detailed study of the "tough yet elegant" Johannes von Geissel, archbishop of Cologne from 1845 to 1864. Working in an often politically hostile environment, the aristocratic Geissel succeeded in renewing his local church along lines that were both devotedly Roman and patently modern.

In contrast, as John W Padberg, SJ., suggests, the past was the cynosure for Louis-Edouard-Désiré Pie, modestly-born and unfailingly honest and intransigent. He blended loyalty to the Bourbon pretender as "God reestablished with his rights" and obedience to the Pope as the embodiment of the universal and supernatural dimensions of the Church. Emmett Larkin summarizes his magisterial history of Paul Cullen's decisive contribution to the modern definition of Irish national identity.

Jeffrey von Arx's subtle, close reading of Henry Edward Manning's creative political theology is an impressive preview of his major study of that protean and elusive figure. It fell to the late John Ciani, S.J., to evoke Camillo Mazzella, S.J., a theologian who achieved high ecclesiastical station apparently without leaving much of an intellectual mark. In narrating the career of William Henry O'Connell, archbishop of Boston from 1907 to 1944, Gerald R Fogarty SJ., once again displays his mastery of the inner history of the American hierarchy during that period.

At times the contributors to Varieties of Ultramontanism look beyond their institutional and ideological concerns to suggest that the Roman allegiance possessed a spiritual power that virtually ensured its triumph. If the most characteristic feature of modern Catholicism has been emphasizing God's mercy over His justice, then ultramontanism proved, in the main, to be the ecclesiology of mercy. For those in grave need, Pió Nono would probably have been a more attractive confessor than Ignaz Döllinger.

Robert E. Sullivan

University of Notre Dame

For Whom There Ls No Room. Scenes from the Refugee World. By Eileen Egan. (Mahwah, New Jersey: Paulist Press. 1995. Pp. vi, 374. $ 19.95.)

In June, 1998, Pope John Paul II sent a message of congratulations to the Catholic community of Kazakhstan on the occasion of the dedication of a new church in Almaty (L'Osservatore Romano, Edition in English, July 1, 1998). For those to whom the erection of a Roman Catholic church in the capital of one of the Muslim republics of former Soviet Asia seems incongruous, Eileen Egan's book, For Whom There Ls No Room, provides some clarification as she chronicles the forced movement of vast numbers of people since World War II. The deportation of families from the Volga, Ukraine, Poland, and the Baltic states to central Asia is just one of those stories.

As a sequel to Egan's 1988 history of the early years of Catholic Relief Services (For the Life of the World: Catholic Relief Services, the Beginning Years), the present volume chronicles the succeeding waves of refugees generated by the political upheavals since World War II, and the efforts of American Catholics to alleviate their sufferings through the work of Catholic Relief Services. The

historical background for Egan's book includes many familiar places and events—Yalta, Potsdam, the Iron Curtain, the Indian Partition, the World Refugee Year, the Hungarian Revolution, the Berlin Wall, and the Vietnam War. Against this backdrop, from her own personal experience with CRS, Egan recounts the saga of the refugees. The journey begins with a group of Polish D.R's resettled on a hacienda at Santa Rosa, Mexico, and moves on to a wartime refugee office in Barcelona, to a D.P. office in Hoechst, Germany, to an Escapee Reception Camp near Nuremberg, to a lamasary of exiled Tibetan monks at Varanasi, India, to a Maryknoll-run refugee center in Hong Kong, to the CRS office in Saigon. Along the way Egan introduces the reader to the individuals who comprise the refugee world—parentless children and childless parents, families, the elderly, and, in the case of Vietnam, whole villages.

There are several pitfalls in writing about the postwar refugee problem. One is that the text will devolve into a tiresome mass of meetings, organizations, legislation, and, worst of all, acronyms—NKVD, NCWC, CRS, CRALOG, UNRRA, AJJDC, IRO, PCIRO, and USEP among others. Another is that the reader will be either overwhelmed by or inured to the sorrow and suffering as the numbers reach staggering proportions. Miss Egan leads her readers past these dangers by effectively following two approaches to her story. For one, she always balances the refugee plight with the positive aspects of the story. Thus, we learn of the hospitality of the local Mexican government and people as the Polish refugees slowly integrate into their new surroundings. We see the selfless co-operation that grows between the charitable agencies of different religious groups, and between these groups and the various governmental organisms and non-governmental agencies. We are impressed with the heroism and sense of esprit de corps exhibited by the CRS workers who, like Miss Egan herself, sacrifice whole portions of their lives on behalf of suffering humanity. Most of all, we see the refugees as Miss Egan saw them, not as numbers, but as individuals with names and faces and stories that engage us.

For Whom There Ls No Room has secured a place among the historical literature of the postwar era by putting a human face on the plight of the refugees.

Raymond J. Kupke

Florham Park, New Jersey

History of Vatican LL, Vol. I: Announcing and Preparing Vatican Council LL: Toward a New Era in Catholicism. Edited by Giuseppe Alberigo; English version edited by Joeph A. Komonchak. (Maryknoll, New York: Orbis; Leuven, Belgium: Peeters. 1995. Pp. xviii, 527. $80.00.)

Carl Joseph Hefele alone was able to write the history of provincial and general councils to the mid-fifteenth century in seven volumes, and Hubert Jedin alone was able to write the history of the Council of Trent in four volumes

(bound as five), but apparently no single historian is capable of writing the history of the Second Vatican Council. Giuseppe Alberigo through the Istituto per Ie Scienze Religiose in Bologna has been promoting research and publication on this council for many years, and the resulting books and articles have been useful to him and the other four contributors to this volume. It would have been helpful to readers, however, to append a bibliography of these and other previously published works, and a stricter editorial control would have prevented repetitions and overlapping in the five chapters.

In the first chapter Professor Alberigo himself takes up "The Announcement of the Council," concluding that the decision to convoke it was entirely John XXILTs own, "a free and independent decision," "the fruit of a personal conviction of the pope" (p. 13). In fifty-four pages he sketches the pontiff's earlier life, reviews the reactions to the announcement in Catholic circles and among non-Catholic Christians, in the diplomatic sphere and in the press, and traces the development of the defining of the character of the council (ecumenical, pastoral, and turned toward the modern world but still in many respects traditional). The author speaks of "the suffocation from which contemporary Christianity was suffering" (p. 43)—a description that hardly rings true for American Catholicism, which was expanding in every way in the 1950's. Lastly, he touches on the establishment of the Antepreparatory Commission, initiating the persistent criticism of the Roman Curia's role during the preconciliar period.

The antepreparatory phase Qanuary, 1959-October, 1962) is investigated by Etienne Fouilloux of Lyons in Chapter II. He looks at the cold war and decolonization, the influence of the Orthodox synodal practice and the ecumenical movement in the West, the conciliar tradition among Catholics, and in a sweeping panorama the state of Catholicism on the eve of the council with emphasis on anti-Roman sentiments. Professor Fouilloux narrates the work of the Antepreparatory Commission, of which only the president and secretariat, he concludes, "played any really effective part" (p. 95). Then in various ways he analyzes the responses received from the bishops, religious superiors, Curial officials, and pontifical universities or faculties to the invitation to submit their opinions and suggestions; these were published in fourteen large tomes. Fouilloux makes the first attempt to study all the responses comparatively. His supercilious comments on the less progressive views, however, show that it is easier to be wise and far-sighted after the event than before. Finally, he criticizes the two-volume analytical survey of the suggestions, which, he claims,"displays the results of the screening of the vota by [Pericle] Felici's secretariat with the two sieves provided by the theology of the manuals and by canon law" and "distorts the antepreparatory consultation by reducing it to its skeletal structure" (pp. 143, 144). He finds even greater reductionism in the "Final Synthesis of the Resolutions and Suggestions" of the bishops (March 12, I960). The outcome, he asserts, was "an evident Romanization of the plan for the Council, both in the organization of the preparation and in the subjects it would treat" (p. 166).

The longest chapter, the third, by Joseph A. Komonchak, a professor of ecclesiology in the Catholic University of America, deals in detail with the work of the Central Preparatory Commission, the ten preparatory commissions, and the three secretariats. Besides the published sources he relies to good effect on the unpublished diary of the Dutch Jesuit, Sebastian Tromp, who was secretary of the Theological Commission, but he does not reveal where it is available to historians. The synopses of the schemata prepared by each of these commissions and by the Secretariat for Promoting Christian Unity, and the review and amendment of these texts, are thorough but inevitably tedious; the tedium is relieved only by the accounts of the conflicts between the Theological Commission or the Holy Office on the one hand and the Secretariat on the other. The reading is made even less agreeable by the use of arbitrary abbreviations; in one paragraph (pp. 302-303) the reader must remember the meanings of the following acronyms: CPC, TC, CLp SA, OR, BG, ST, LI, MI, SCM, RE, AL, and SCU! Father Komonchak also recounts the steps by which non-Catholic observers were invited to the council, the process by which the rules of the council were drawn up, and the discussions of a plan and the choice of agenda for the council. At the end he puzzles over some of the pope's decisions, omissions, and interventions that seem to have obstructed the implementation of his own goals; the author concludes that many papal actions "remain mysterious" (p. 335). But he overlooks the Pope's reliance on the Holy Spirit's expected movement of the assembled fathers; he does not even mention John XXILTs "Prayer for the Second Ecumenical Vatican Council" addressed to the Holy Spirit (published in his Journal of a Soul, p. 391).

In Chapter TVJ. Oscar Beozzo, O.F.M., of Säo Paulo, studies "The External CLimate," first in terms of public information about the preparatory work, which includes a broad survey of periodicals and books published in many countries. Then he reviews the activities of the national episcopal conferences, other contemporary events, especially the Synod of Rome, and the approaches to dialogue with Muslims, Jews, and communists.

In the last chapter Klaus Wittstadt of Würzburg devotes nearly one hundred pages to the "eve" of the council Guly 1-October 10, 1962), although in naming the "experts in a renewal of theology" he goes back many years prior to those dates. He depicts the general attitude of expectation prevailing in that summer; he recounts the sending of the seven schemata to the council fathers (thus retreading ground already trodden in Chapter III) and their positive and negative reactions; he follows John XXIITs actions almost day by day, especially his tone-setting radio message of September 11; he reports the appointment of experts (peritt); he surveys the treatment of the imminent council in the press of many countries; and lastly he describes the work of the Technical and Organizational Commission, which was responsible for the adaptation of St. Peter's Basilica into a council chamber with all the necessary accoutrements, equipment, services, and security. The arrival of the fathers in Rome, their lodging, and the Holy See's support of about one thousand of them who could not pay their

own traveling and living expenses are narrated in such a way as to build up suspense for the opening of the great assembly. Professor Alberigo has added a conclusion evaluating the significance of the preparatory work for the actual unfolding of the council in the years that followed.

Matthew J. O'Connell's translation of the chapters originally written in languages other than English appears to be accurate and smooth, although the Minister General of the Capuchins, Father Clement of Milwaukee, is called "Father Milwaukee"(p. 108,n. 100). There are separate indexes of persons and subjects. The printing, done in Belgium, is excellent. It is regrettable, however, that no illustrations, not even a photograph of the historic papal ceremony held in the Basilica of St. Paul outside the Walls on January 25, 1959, or portraits of the principal participants in the preparatory phase, have been included.

Volume II of this history has already been published, and the remaining three volumes are expected at brief intervals. Then perhaps a single historian will be able to synthesize it all in a unified presentation.

Robert Trisco

The Catholic University ofAmerica

Historia del Sínodo de los Obispos. By Manuel Alcalá, S.I. (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos. 1996. Pp. xxiii, 508.)

This historical account, even journalistic in the very best sense, covers fifteen assemblies of the postconciliar Synod of Bishops and is an invaluable source. It treats exhaustively nine of the ordinary sessions from 1967 through 1994 (each consisting chiefly of delegates elected by the conferences of bishops for the meeting), the two "extraordinary" sessions in 1969 and 1985 (chiefly the elected presidents of the episcopal conferences), and four special assemblies for particular churches or regions (Netherlands, Europe, Africa, and Lebanon).

The volume begins with a brief introduction on the nature of the new synods—consultative to the Bishop of Rome and not yet deliberative or legislative bodies, although the latter possibility was envisioned by Paul VI in the apostolic constitution Apostólica sollicitude of 1965. The chief element of this introduction is a brief discursus on the synod as a papal or conciliar initiative: the language of the papal document was also part of the conciliar decree Christus Dominus. In both cases the synod was defined as "representing the entire Catholic episcopate [totius catholici Episcopatus partes agens]," a phrasing deliberately omitted in the 1983 Code of Canon Law.

The chapters of this massive collection may seem uneven, but this is due to the developing nature of the synod itself and the growing quantity of documentation from succeeding sessions. In every chapter the background, participants, theme or themes under discussion, the general interventions, the lesser

gatherings (circuit minores according to language),the resulting statements and propositions, the council chosen for the periods between sessions, etc., are described. The conflicts are considered fully both minor and major (such as celibacy, contraception, and general sacramental absolution).

Special emphasis is understandably given to the role of the Spanish bishops, but never disproportionately or to the neglect of the other participants. Full statistical information is provided, for example, on the composition of the successive gatherings. Inevitably, uncertainties about individual names have crept in. As an instance of error, the Greek Orthodox Archbishop of Australia, Stylianos, is twice listed as from New Zealand (pp. 278 and 296).

One feature that is as valuable as the information itself are the author's brief evaluations at the end of each chapter. These are as useful as the factual records and are worthy of separate English translation.

As is evident, the synodal sessions after 1995 now require that a further volume be published soon. Perhaps this could be augmented in various ways, especially with a full analysis of the Synod of Bishops as a developing phenomenon in church life, the potential for its becoming a deliberative body, its integrity as an elected assembly in contrast to the college of cardinals as non-elected and curial (Roman) in character, and the like.

Once again, the Spanish Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos and, in particular, Manuel Alcalá have left us greatly in debt, and this work is strongly deserving of continuation.

Frederick R. McManus

The Catholic University of America

Man of the Century: The Life and Times of Pope John Paul II. By Jonathan Kwitny. (New York: Henry Holt and Company. 1997. Pp. xii, 754. $30.00.)

Jonathan Kwitny, for many years a feature writer for the Wall Street Journal, has with Man of the Century: The Life and Times of Pope John Paul II, offered the reading public yet another long and deeply felt biography of the present Holy Father. This is not a finished work of historical scholarship. Nor was it intended to be such. It is a biography; and as Allan Nevins reminds us in The Gateway to History (Garden City: Anchor, 1962), biography can be an important aid to history, especially when it "humanizes the past and enriches personal experience of the present in a way that history can seldom do" (p. 349).

There is, however, a danger. Unless biographers are ever alert, they can fall into the trap which Carl G. Gustavson has termed the "Great Man theory," whereby major developments of history are all too easily attributed to individuals who are presented as exerting "an almost superhuman control over the fate of their generation" (cf. A Preface to History [New York: McGraw-Hill, 1955], p. 123).

In the judgment of this reviewer, Jonathan Kwitny has not escaped the Gustavson trap. He is striving to refute the contention of Carl Bernstein and Marco Politi that Communism crumbled in Europe because of a secret collaboration between Pope John Paul II and President Ronald Reagan (cf. His Holiness [New York: Doubleday 1996]) and in the process concludes that virtually all of the credit for the crumbling belongs to the Holy Father. Thus, the result is not so much a clear-headed biography as a thesis straining to uncover proofs and often settling for a good deal less.

All the same, the book is well worth the time of a reader who wishes to learn more about the extraordinary successor of Saint Peter who has been shepherding the Catholic Church over the past twenty years. It presents the major events in his life gracefully and with immense respect, and it provides a good deal of insight especially into the years before he was elected to the papacy. Finally, it introduces the reader to many persons and groups in Poland who are not well known outside that nation and certainly appear to have exerted considerable influence on the character and outlook of Pope John Paul II.

Still, one cannot help but feel that an editor well acquainted with things Catholic ought to have been invited to go through the text in order to remove some of the more unfortunate inexactitudes. To imagine that the Belgian College in Rome can best be described in terms of "an American fraternity house" (p. 97), to define the Order of Malta as "a Church-sponsored anti-Communist group" (p. 184), to reduce the Tribunal of the Roman Rota to "a sort of Vatican supreme court for annulments" (p. 495), and to suggest—if this is what the author intended to suggest—that Fathers Ernesto and Fernando Cardenal of Nicaragua were "cardinals" (p. 466)—all of this, and much more, could have been and should have been corrected.

Moreover, it is regrettable that many of the most important achievements of Pope John Paul II in his spiritual leadership of the Church are accorded little or no serious attention. Two examples will suffice. The 1983 Code of Canon Law, which contains fundamental norms for every aspect of church life, is treated in one paragraph of four and one-half lines (p. 405); and the Catechism of the Catholic Church, arguably the premier doctrinal statement of the Holy Father's pontificate, is accorded two paragraphs, in one of which an ancient principle of Catholic moral teaching regarding theft is reported as something unusual and unexpected (p. 637).

Again, a reader who is acquainted with the Vatican and those who work there cannot help but be put off by some of the heartless characterizations that crowd the pages of the book. A sister who assisted Pope Pius XII is said to have been "a manipulative German nun" (p. 501), though many who knew her might maintain that she was a humble, obedient religious from Switzerland. Likewise, a cardinal, whom the author confesses he met only once, is said to be "overbearing, arrogant, snappish, and about as smiley as the faces on Mount Rushmore" (p. 497), though many who know him might maintain that not one of those adjectives fits him at all. What is more, it is never clear how descriptions

of this sort advance the argument or even the narration the author is attempting to develop. They appear merely gossipy and mean-spirited.

For the professional historian, however, what will perhaps be most unsettling about Man of the Century. The Life and Times of Pope John Paul II, is the manner in which the various materials are organized. The author leaps from subject to subject, leaving the readers on their own to piece things together as best they can. And some of the leaps border on the comical. For example, Section 11 of Chapter One opens with an anguished account of Stalin's massacre of Polish military officers in the Katyn Forest. The narrative concludes, a flourish is printed in the center of the page, and out of nowhere emerges a depiction of the future Pope as a young man emoting over a new play he had just read. One senses that we may be simply moving from one computer item to another.

Sometime years from now an authoritative history of the pontificate of Pope John Paul II will undoubtedly appear without a thesis to refute or defend and with events in the life of the Pontiff drawn together with precision, balance, and clear connections. The author or authors will do well to have read Man of the Century: The Life and Times of Pope John Paul II. For Jonathan Kwitny, because of his evident esteem for his subject and because of the abundance of facts he has amassed about that subject's friends and associates particularly in Poland, does indeed "humanize the past and enrich personal experience of the present" quite effectively; and as Professor Nevins observed, this can constitute an important contribution to the writing of serious history.

Most Reverend Edward M. Egan

Bishop of Bridgeport

Ancient

Encyclopedia of Early Christianity. Second edition. Edited by Everett Ferguson. 2 vols. (New York: Garland Publishing, Inc. 1997. Pp. xxvi, 657; 659-1213. $150.00.)

This is a thoroughly revised edition of the work first published in 1990 as a single volume. Now, divided into two handsome volumes, the whole format is a great improvement over its predecessor from the standpoint of looks and fabric. Bibliographies naturally have been updated, and cross references have been improved by repositioning and with respect to content. More than two hundred new articles have been added, among them: family, historiography, inspiration, justice, sculpture, Roman law, and sociological interpretation. A number of articles have been partially or totally rewritten or revised. Basilius Celix, for one, has been dropped. The Syriac-speaking area is much better represented this time around due largely to the efforts of David Bundy. Egypt is still somewhat less adequately covered. There are no articles on Hieracas, Nepos, the Alexandrian popes, Damián and Theodosius, or for the historians Eutychius (Sa'id ibn

Batriq) and John of Nikiou. A key figure in the Monophysite controversy, Pope Timothy II Aelurus, receives rather perfunctory treatment. Other omissions include Emperor Anastasius and Barsauma the monk, an important figure at the "Robber Synod" of Ephesus. Bar Hebraeus is there, but not Michael the Syrian. The article on the Secret Gospel of Mark, already outdated, is a mere historical curiosity in view of recent research. But these few negative remarks pale in light of the overall achievement of this comprehensive source. It is a testimony to the vitality and breadth of early Christian studies in North America. It is also testimony to the perceptive editing and revising skills of Everett Ferguson and his associate editors, Michael McHugh and Frederick Norris.

David Johnson, SJ.

The Catholic University of America

The World of the Early Christians. By Joseph F. Kelly. [Message of the Fathers of the Church, Volume 1.] (Collegeville, Minnesota: A Michael Glazier Book, The Liturgical Press. 1997. Pp, xviii, 231. $22.95 paperback.)

The World of the Early Christians is an attempt to provide an introductory text to the student of historical theology. The bulk of this treatment deals basically with the cultural life of the Christian within the early Church. The last section includes a tightly written history of major writers and events in the East and West for the first six centuries.

The author delves into such issues as the view of the physical world as seen by Christians, entertainments presumed to be morally licit, such aspects of daily life as slavery, wealth and poverty, women, church and state, and war and peace. Kelly is careful in his use of terminology, bearing in mind that he has written for the novice student of church history. He writes into his text origins for such terms as martyr and manuscript. He is also quick to point out the fallacy of such beliefs that persecution was continuous for the first three hundred years rather than the sporadic nature of such persecutions, which depended entirely on the whim of the person in authority.

In his treatment of women, Kelly cites primary texts but at times relies on secondary references. He would have been better informed if he had relied more readily on the primary sources. A text providing a sweeping view of the life of the early Christian is necessarily given to generalities. He draws a general statement, "Most Church Fathers saw the temptress Eve in all women." One might wonder where this author would place the correspondence of Jerome to women who are consecrated virgins, the writings of Ambrose of Milan on virginity, or the dialogue of Gregory of Nyssa with his sister Macrina on the soul and resurrection.

The last chapter of the text is a well written, concise, very readable narrative of significant people and events of the first six centuries of the Church. Kelly

brings a vibrancy to this volume in highlighting the roles of churchmen counteracting heretical movements and thus in turn writing theology that is called upon so readily today.

Kelly writes his World of the Early Christians with the premise that most students have "no knowledge of the ancient world." He has thus produced an engaging and readable study of the ancient Christian culture and history. Bearing in mind that the author is at times given to general statements which may sometimes be challenged, this edition is a worthwhile contribution to adult education programs and to the novice studying church history.

Sister Madeleine Grace, CVI.

University of St. Thomas
Houston, Texas

Perpetua's Passion: The Death and Memory of a Young Roman Woman. By Joyce E. Salisbury. (New York: Routledge. 1997. Pp. ix, 228. $19.95 paperback.)

The martyrdom of Perpetua and Felicitas (not "Felicity," please!) has been the subject of many scholarly editions and analyses. So why bring out a new book on this very old subject? The answer lies perhaps in the author's method of approaching historical problems through such disciplines as sociology and psychology. The result is a brief but compact treatment of all those historical, religious, and communal experiences which may have molded Perpetua's character and prepared her for voluntary, sacrificial death.

The book is very well organized around the central event of the trial and execution. We learn both what led to this event and what flowed from it. The first three chapters discuss Rome, Carthage, and the Christian community in Carthage. Chapter one deals with Roman customs of family and home, the role of the emperor as head of the extended family, and the general religious situation in the second and third centuries after Christ. Perpetua was a Roman, but also a Carthaginian: she was born and raised in Carthage and must have absorbed much of the city's spiritual heritage. The city's history, life, culture, and especially its infamous practice of human sacrifice are briefly introduced. We then learn how Christianity arrived in this city, its outstanding characteristics and its congregational life there. The actual story of Perpetua is told in Chapters four and five, entitled "Prison" and "The Arena." Her arrest, trial, and experiences in prison are vividly described; dreams which she herself put down in writing and then interpreted to her fellow prisoners are related and analyzed. These pages are perhaps the most original of the whole book and could alone make it worthwhile and rewarding reading. The description of the execution itself is based on eyewitness accounts. Perpetua and her fellow martyrs were treated like others who were to be executed. The Roman arena is well described, and

we learn that, as a rule, prisoners were not killed by the wild animals; these encounters stunned and perhaps wounded the condemned, but the actual killing was done by the sword, as happened in the case of Perpetua and her fellow martyrs. The final chapter, "Aftermath," answers the question people usually ask: "And then what happened? "What happened to Rome? Carthage? The Christian church in Carthage? And what happened to the memory of Perpetua as it is preserved in written form in her Passion How did the text become subject of sermons and interpretations and, perhaps more importantly, how did a Christian church inspired by the Holy Spirit become a church based on the hierarchy?—a crucial development. As an "aftermath" we also receive a brief but subtle reference to the beginning of the veneration of relics and the saints.

It is always easier to criticize a book than to write one. So let me try to correct just one possible confusion: "Quodvultdeo" mentioned on pages 172 ff. is Quodvultdeus, a pupil and friend of Augustine who lived through the barbarian invasion of Carthage but then fled to Italy and died in 453.

Readers of the Catholic Historical Review will not learn much new in this book about the history of Rome, Carthage, and early Christianity, but they will enjoy the different viewpoint, the new perspective, and the gentle feminine touch which does not spare even St. Augustine for his treatment of Perpetua and Felicitas.

Stephen Benko

Sonoma, California

Cassian the Monk. By Columba Stewart, O.S.B. [Oxford Studies in Historical Theology.] (New York: Oxford University Press. 1998. Pp. xv, 286. $60.00.)

John Cassian (c. 365-435) was one of the most prolific and influential writers of early monasticism. He was also a world traveler. This native of Romania made his novitiate in a Greek monastery in Bethlehem, but soon he and his fellow-novice Germanus went to Egypt, where they spent years sitting at the feet of the great desert hermits. In 400 A.D., Cassian was expelled from Egypt along with the other adherents of "intellectual" monasticism. He went to Constantinople, where he was made a deacon for John Chrysostom; then to Rome to report to the pope on Chrysostom's exile.

About 415, Cassian moved to Marseilles, where he founded two monasteries and wrote two extensive sets of "reports" on Egyptian monasticism, the Institutes and the Conferences. Because he was bilingual, Cassian was an indispensable bridge between Greek and Latin monasticism. His writings have been regarded through the centuries as a valuable window on the mind of the early monks.

And yet only two major studies of Cassian in English have been published since 1950. Probably the reason for this has been the need for a fresh translation

and the rambling, sometimes confusing, nature of Cassian's discourses. This situation has now changed, however, with a fine new translation of the Conferences by Boniface Ramsey (Paulist Press, 1997) and this magisterial study by Columba Stewart, O.S.B.

Cassian the Monk is not a particularly long book, having only 140 pages of text, but ninety pages of notes and thirty pages of bibliography show that it is massively researched. Although it is accessible to general readers, Stewart makes no effort to entertain them. Adequate comprehension can only be had by following his extensive cross-references within the text of Cassian; those who can do so should pursue his references to European literature. Stewart is one of those scholars who has read everything about his subject and condensed it into a deceptively simple text.

Stewart admits that Cassian is a prolix and unsystematic writer, but he has no difficulty in locating the heart of his method. Cassian is resolutely eschatological: everything in the monastic life must lead toward heaven. But since that is too vague a road-map, the monk needs a more detailed itinerary suited to his specific way of life. The intermediate goal of the monk's journey is purity of heart, which is in turn attained by monastic practices such as vigils, fasting, and so on. But Cassian continually insists that all these physical exercises are but means to higher ends. This means that although his physical descriptions of Egyptian monasticism are usually accurate, they are primarily intended as a guide to spiritual growth and not historical knowledge.

Cassian's approach could lead to a kind of angelism, which writers of the Alexandrian school do not always avoid. But often he is quite earthly and realistic. For example, in his discussions of monastic chastity, Cassian is astonishingly, even shockingly, frank. That was no doubt the reason why most of this material was never translated into English. Stewart, however, considers it one of the best places to understand Cassian's method. Probably Chapter Four on this subject is the outstanding contribution of the book to modern Cassian studies.

Why is chastity so important to Cassian? Certainly not because of prurience! He discusses the whole thing with the most amazing calmness. No, chastity is crucial to monasticism because it is so close to the very core of the human person. And it is also one of the most important symbols for spiritual progress. Cassian is well aware that simple repression is of little value; what is needed is a movement from discipline to love. We might be inclined to doubt the stories he tells of Egyptian monks who arrived at exalted states of chastity. Nonetheless, Cassian is a realist who attributes all real progress in this area to God's grace. And since sexuality is such a difficult area to control, the monk is absolutely driven to rely on God and not on himself.

In addition to chastity, Stewart has good chapters on prayer and the use of the Bible in Cassian. Although he cannot cover every aspect of Cassian's massive teaching, these three topics are probably the key ones. And Stewart has mastered them as completely as anyone I have read. This is a tour de force.

Is there anything I would change or improve? Perhaps only this: Stewart loves Cassian more than I do. He rarely has a critical word for him. Now, I believe that love is the best motive for writing about someone else and his work. And Stewart has made me love Cassian more than I used to. But there are some things about Cassian that I still cannot accept. He does not understand community; he moves too quickly from practical charity to "contemplation"; and, unlike Columba Stewart, he is a rambling, prolix writer.

Terrence G. Kardong, O.S.B.

Assumption Abbey
Richardton, Norh Dakota

Medieval

Prefaces to Canon Law Books in Latin Christianity: Selected Translations, 500-1245. Commentary and translations by Robert Somerville and Bruce C. Brasington. (New Haven:Yale University Press. 1998. Pp. viii, 247. $30.00.)

Canon law defines the institutional Church, as Somerville and Brasington note in their introduction, and churchmen began to compile collections of the canons almost from the outset of the Church's history. It soon became conventional for practitioners of this craft to include introductory statements in which they typically described the scope and sources of their collection, their methodology, and their reasons for undertaking the task.

It is in the nature of law books, however, that readers who consult them typically do so in order to deal with some particular difficulty and therefore read only those passages that they hope may assist in resolving the problem at hand. It is unusual for a reader to sit down and peruse a canon law collection from beginning to end. One consequence of this is that readers seldom consult the prefaces of the canon law collections that they use.

Somerville and Brasington maintain that this is a pity and, after reading their book, I am inclined to agree. They have selected and translated the prefatory statements (most of them fairly brief) to thirty-six canon law books, ranging in date from the letter that Pope Siricius (384-399) addressed to Bishop Himerius of Tarragona in 385 to the revised recension of the Ordinary Gloss on Gratian's Decretum that Bartholomew of Brescia completed about 1245. The authors supply notes and introductory statements that situate the law books whose prefaces they translate in their historical context and explain their significance.

The result is an attractive source book that is instructive, not only for the history of canon law, but also for the broader history of medieval jurisprudence. Somerville and Brasington wrestle valiantly with the daunting task of translating Latin legal texts produced over the course of nearly eight centuries. They are conservative translators, in the sense that they often choose to render idiomatic expressions literally and try to preserve the word order of the Latin text

so far as possible. One of their sources, Bishop Martin of Braga, observed ca. 633: "But since it is difficult for something to be translated sufficiently clearly from one language to another . . . certain things in those canons thus appear obscure to the unlearned" (p. 53). This passage fairly describes a problem that surfaces occasionally in these translations.

Somerville and Brasington have taken considerable pains to situate the prefaces they translate within the context of developments in legal thought from late antiquity to the mid-thirteenth century, and on the whole they have succeeded rather well. One minor lapse in this department may be worth mentioning. Two authors in this collection, Ivo of Chartres and Master Rolandus, refer in their prefaces to a legal axiom called the principle of Modestinus. Modestinus, a classical Roman jurist, defined the limits of law's power by asserting that laws can do only four things: they can command, forbid, allow, or punish human actions (Digest 1.3.7). Both Ivo and Rolandus paraphrased this principle in their prefaces, which suggests that they were familiar with the Digest text. The translators, unfortunately, fail to mention this.

But these minor criticisms should not obscure the value of this learned and useful book, which for the first time assembles a body of canonistic prefaces, presents them in an accessible form, and provides students of medieval canonical thought with a valuable new resource for study and teaching.

James A. Brundage

University of Kansas

La vie d'Etienne le Jeune par Etienne le Diacre. Introduction, édition et traduction. By Marie-France Auzépy. [Birmingham Byzantine and Ottoman Monographs. Volume 3·] (Brookfield, Vermont: Variorium, Ashgate Publishing Co. 1997. Pp. x, 357. $72.95.)

Like so many texts, this Life of St. Stephen the Younger has to be read at more than one level, a skill that requires considerable scholarly help. On the surface it looks like a laudatory account, written probably in 809 by a high-ranking deacon of the Great Church of Constantinople, describing the life and passion of a monk, Stephen, lynched by the mob forty years earlier at the instigation of the iconoclast Emperor, Constantine V. Stephen is presented as a man of great spiritual standing and horrifying asceticism. Do we have here one of the rare hagiographie texts that permit an insight into the reality of life while iconoclasm was at its height?

Fortunately, the French scholar responsible for this edition is above all a historian: she has an unrivaled knowledge of both the Greek and Latin sources on the period, and has already published several key studies on the iconoclast movement. In this publication she demonstrates both that the text has a clear propaganda role in the wider context of political events, and that it is itself con-

structed, rather like a patch-work quilt, from snippets of earlier lives (notably by Andrew of Crete and Cyril of Scythopolis) along with many extracts from the conciliar Acta (Nicaea II). For the first time one can study this fascinating Life in all its complexity.

The task facing any historian of this period lies in the proper evaluation of the contemporary chronicles: these were written by ecclesiastical authors, partisans of the victorious iconophiles. When this Life was commissioned the iconoclasts had suffered a crushing defeat, but the Patriarch, Nikephoros, surely the outstanding personality in the history of the Church at this time, was aware that below the surface simmered a violent dislike of the innovative icon-worship then being imposed, and a nostalgic attachment to the former imperial house of the Isaurians. A reaction must have seemed an imminent danger, and in a few years became a grim reality with the second phase of iconoclasm.

This volume is a mine of information for the historian, but also a delight for the philologist. The complicated manuscript tradition is carefully handled, and constantly illuminated with intelligent insights and a wealth of erudition. A minor complaint is that the negative apparatus does not allow one to be sure when all ten manuscripts are testifying (both B and E have serious lacunae): a one-line reference to the witnesses for each page would have been helpful. The main aspect not touched upon is the purely literary. If ever there was a text written to be read aloud it is this. The writer himself frequently appeals to his hearers, and the whole texture of the writing is rhetorical in the extreme—lavish in its scenes of cruelty, with hints of sexual impropriety thrown in for good measure. My own preference would have been for a closer attention to the original Byzantine punctuation, frequently helpful for the clearer understanding of the text. An unavoidable weakness is that the author could not consult the critical edition of the Pseudo-Damascene Letter to Theophilos, published too late for her to use. No matter, this edition is a tour deforce, and the Birmingham Centre for Byzantine Studies deserves to be congratulated on this outstanding addition to their Monographs.

Joseph A. Munitiz

Campion Hall, Oxford

The Formation of a Medieval Church: Ecclesiastical Change in Verona, 950-1150. By Maureen C. Miller. (Ithaca, New York: Cornell University Press. 1993. Pp. xx, 216. $35.00.)

This tidy book offers a clear description of the evolution of ecclesiastical institutions in a major diocese of the Véneto in the central Middle Ages. The work grew from a Harvard dissertation, of which it still bears some traces (the definitions on pp. 1, 2, 62, 97 of basic concepts are superfluous for a scholarly audience). Beyond the introduction, six crisply written chapters and a telegraphic

conclusion support the thesis that "profound," "rapid," and "important" change took place in the Veronese church during the two centuries upon which Miller focuses (A.D. 950-1150). Veronese archival and published sources enable Miller to show that after about 1000 Verona's bishops increased their control over the diocese, and especially over the many "new" parish churches appearing in these two hundred years (chap. 6). As imperial involvement in diocesan affairs slackened and a comune emerged, new ecclesiastical forms developed: the secular clergy was reorganized and its pastoral duties increased (chap. 2); the cathedral chapter lost authority (chap. 5); and non-Benedictine pious foundations proliferated (but not only because of the patronage of the new classes of people this period produced: chaps. 3-4). Miller identifies the cause of all this ferment: demographic growth.

Miller seldom leaves the shadow of Verona's campanili in her study. Both this narrow geographical focus, and the concern for a famously decisive period of "reform" in western Christendom, make The Formation of a Medieval Church stolidly traditional. But the institutional history of Verona's church in the Gregorian era is admirably situated by Miller in its social context, which renders this book different from much church history. One example of the results of this choice are the minibiographies (pp. 157-163, 165-174) of Bishop Rather (d. 972) and of the surprisingly human, embattled Bishop Tebaldus (d. 1157). These sketches successfully link the evolution of the bishopric to specific circumstances in the two men's lifetimes. Miller's navigation of the breakwaters between institutional and religious history imparts nuance and strength to her book. The Veronese church is here conceived as simultaneously a group of ecclesiastical institutions and a web of social, economic, and political ties between men.

The research upon which this books rests, including the Herlihian "computer assisted analysis" of charters (described on pp. 185-187) might have benefited from a whiff of postmodern skepticism. A more thorough Quellenkritik might have clarified how and why the documents were composed and what interpretative consequences arise from the patterns and accidents of documentary survival. Verona's phantoms of remembrance appear so fleetingly in these pages that one is left to wonder whether the "prodigious growth and expansion" (p. 22) of the number of religious institutions in the diocese after 1000 is not a mirage created by twelfth-century literacy, or by episcopally sponsored archival self-interest, rather than by an actual multiplication of churches. Compared to the 1100's, surviving early medieval records are few. This colors the image of the earlier period, which becomes hungry, persecuting, and turbulent (pp. 155, 142, 129) in retrospect. If the copious documents transmitted in the archives compiled during the central Middle Ages are not contextualized, inevitably the years 950-1150 will appear as "the most important period of change" in Verona's ecclesiastical history

In-depth, local studies can illuminate the situations of other places. Miller argues persuasively (pp. 7-10) that Verona was a "rather ordinary" place (p. 14)

whose experience is broadly representative of continental European dioceses. Verona had its peculiarities (it was vital to imperial Passpolitik, and between 813 and 1122 emperors appointed its pastors more assiduously than average), but Miller's findings will be a useful guide for future analyses of how churches changed in the hundred years before and after the reform-minded swept into Rome with Henry III.

Paolo Squatriti

The University of Michigan, Ann Arbor

Editor's note: The late publication of this review is in no way due to any tardiness of the reviewer.

The Pilgrimage to Compostela in the Middle Ages. A Book of Essays. Edited by Maryjane Dunn and Linda Kay Davidson. [Garland Reference Library of the Humanities, Volume 1829. Garland Medieval Casebooks, Volume 17.] (New York: Garland Publishing, Inc. 1996. Pp. xlix, 188.)

This book of essays, The Pilgrimage to Compostela in the Middle Ages, may disappoint readers expecting a scholarly study of the cult of St. James; nevertheless, reassured by Dunn and Davidson's two outstanding bibliographies on the pilgrimage and Compostela, one is advised to forge ahead. Essays include the editors' preface followed by an introduction and state of the question. Chapter titles promise a logical exposition of themes, but the authors seem ambivalent about their focus, and even their intended audience. Is this book for pilgrimage enthusiasts or for scholars? Essays are as follows: 1. "The Cult of Saints and Divine Patronage in Gallaecia before Santiago," by Alberto Ferreiro; 2. "The Geography and History of Iberia in the Liber Sancti Jacobi" by Colin Smith; 3. "Music and the Pilgrimage," by Vincent Corrigan; 4. "1494: Hieronymus Münzer, Compostela, and the Codex Calixtinus" by Jeanne E. Krochalis; 5. "The Pilgrimage to Santiago de Compostela in the Cantigas de Santa Maria" by Connie L. Scarborough; 6. "The Iconography of St. James in the Indianapolis Museums's Fifteenth-Century Altarpiece," by David M. Gitlitz; 7. "The Pilgrim-Shell in Denmark," by Vicente Almazán; and 8. "A Medieval Pilgrimage to Santiago de Composela on the Information Highway," by John Dagenais.

The essays, like any collections, are mixed in quality and could have profited from tighter editorial control. Many repeat history and legends, and most include excessive amounts of personal reminiscence of limited interest. The "Works Cited" section may be misleading since one expects more of those excellent bibliographers, Dunn and Davidson. This is not a bibliography; for example, the work of major scholars such as Plötz and Moralejo is ignored or undervalued, and Melczer's translation of The Pilgrim's Guide is regularly referred to while the superb translation and "gazetteer" of Shafer-Crandell and Gerson is barely mentioned. (The Shafer-Crandell, Krochalis, Stones translation is listed "in

press"). Readers should be alerted to the fine Metropolitan Museum publication, Spanish Medieval Art, with excellent essays on the pilgrimage and Compostela by Serefín Moralejo, David Simon, and others. In Dunn and Davidson, especially useful is Ferreiro's clear summary of the St. Martin/St. James transition and Smith's essay on historical geography. Corrigan's summary of music and liturgy provides an excellent introduction (only Dagenais mentions the video, "And They Sang a New Song"). Scarborough's essay on the Contigas is a tantalizing introduction to her continuing study. On the other hand, the notes on the Indianapolis Altarpiece are disappointing—even the description is inaccurate (e.g., paint loss and restoration are referred to as smudges) and details are misidentified. The pilgrim-shell essay might have included pilgrims' badges, for example their use on church bells in Scandinavia. In short, the editors and authors seem to capture the flavor of the modern pilgrimage, reflecting the range of attitudes and competencies found in amateurs and scholars. After all, Romantics as well as professional medievalists still delight in walking the road.

Marilyn Stokstad

University of Kansas

Pope Urban LL, The "Collectio Britannica", and the Council of Melfi (1089). By Robert Somerville, with the collaboration of Stephan Kuttner. (New York: Clarendon Press, Oxford University Press. 1996. Pp. xxii, 318. $98.00.)

The Collectio Britannica is one of the most intriguing pre-Gratian canonical collections. A single manuscript that now resides in the British Library (Add. 8873) documents its existence. Although called Britannica, few scholars think that the collection was put together in England. Unfortunately, in spite of numerous consultations with a large number of scholars, Somerville still has not been able to determine the manuscript's or the scribe's geographical origins with any certainty. Northern Italy seems to be the location of choice, but some scholars dissent and give it a trans-Alpine origin. The question is far from paleographical pedantry. If the collection were compiled in Northern Europe from Roman law materials and letters taken from the papal registers, its compilation would force us to rethink the juridical culture of the North at the end of the eleventh century.

The Britannica has been most important for the significant number of papal letters from the pontificates of Gelasius I, Pelagius I, Alexander II, John VIII, Urban II, Stephen V, and Leo FV. Inscriptions from the Letters of Leo, Stephen, Alexander, and Urban sometimes bear the notation "ex registro," which may indicate that they were taken directly from the papal registers. The practice of using this notation in the inscriptions of decretals persists until the beginning of the thirteenth century. By that time, however, "ex registro" clearly no longer means that the decretal was taken directly from the papal registers. The collection also contains large blocks of text from Justinian's Digest and Institutes. Its

Roman law contents are important because the Britannica is the first post-antique collection to contain material taken from the Digest. Consequently, the collection provides evidence of the rediscovery of the Digest in the second half of the eleventh century.

Somerville began working on Urban II as a graduate student at Yale University under the direction of Stephan Kuttner in the late 1960's. He completed a dissertation on the Council of Clermont (1095) that was subsequently published in 1972. This collaboration of master and student twenty-five years later is a double tribute: to Stephan Kuttner, who shared his vast knowledge and erudition with the main author until the last days of his life (t August 12, 1996), and to Somerville, who has produced a work that equals the precise and exacting scholarship of his old master. For Somerville, the book is a work of pietas in the word's original sense: "an attitude of dutiful respect toward those to whom one is bound" (Oxford Latin Dictionary).

The Britannica is the source of a significant number of Urban's letters from the first eighteen months of his pontificate. Of the forty-seven letters extant, thirty-nine are in this collection. Forty-one letters (one of these is from King Sancho Ramirez I of Aragon to Urban) and five texts that Somerville calls "historical notices" or just "notices" are contained on fols. 142"-15P. The canons of the council held at Melfi in September, 1089 are on fols. 151,-153G· Somerville has edited each of these texts, has provided a full scholarly apparatus that is exhaustive, and has translated each text (a particularly welcome service for scholars and students).

The historical notices are particularly interesting. They report on actions of Urban, refer to him in the third person, and were included, it seems, in the registers. If they were, indeed, placed in the registers, they can help us to understand just a little better one of the most puzzling texts attributed to Urban in Gratian'sDecreiMw,viz.,"Duae sunt, inquit, leges" (JL 5760; C. 19 q.2. c. 2). This text has baffled scholars because of its contents, its form, and its absence from any collection before A.D. 1100. It contains a radical statement of individual freedom of conscience that provoked jurists for centuries, and its form is that of a report on Urban's words, perhaps from a sermon. It begins: "There are two laws, he <Urban> said." Because of its format and other considerations Peter Landau has concluded that Urban was not the author of the text (Officium und Liberias Christiana [Bayerische Akademie der Wissenschaften, Philosophisch-historische Klasse, 3 (Munich, 1991)], pp. 66-75). Yet these five "notices" in Britannica that were probably enregistered with Urban's consent (one of the tests is attested by Pope Honorius III in the thirteenth century as being in Urban's register) are powerful evidence that Urban included material in his registers that does not conform to our expectations nor to the practices of previous and later popes. "Duae sunt" may be a falsification, but the five "notices" in Urban's register would suggest that it might have been placed in the register in that form and that even if it had not been in the registers and if it were a forgery, the compilers who placed it in their collections (Polycarpus, Gratian, and others)

would not have suspected it because its form was not that of a papal letter. They might have known Urban's registers contained similar texts.

Somerville has produced a splendid piece of work, and Oxford University Press has provided a suitably well-produced book. Urban studies will profit from this book for years to come.

Kenneth Pennington

Syracuse University

Violence and Daily Life. Reading, Art, and Polemics in the Citeaux Moralia in Job. By Conrad Rudolph. (Princeton: Princeton University Press. 1997. Pp. xii, 145; 59 illustrations.)

Conrad Rudolph's new book presents an interpretation of the decoration of Pope Gregory's Moralia in Job, contained in a manuscript completed in 1111 at Citeaux during the reign of its third abbot, Stephen Harding. This decoration, consisting of a full-page frontispiece and initial letters at the beginning of the prefaces and the thirty-five books that comprise this staple of the monastic literature in the early Middle Ages, has long attracted the attention of art historians for its draftsmanly virtuosity and enigmatic charm. A product of the heroic beginnings of Cistercian spirituality, it seems to dissent, in its apparent accommodation of aesthetic fantasy, from the ascetic ideals enunciated in the founding documents of the Order and later codified in its legislation. Rudolph notes that the manuscript betrays in its format and formal inconsistencies of the illumination some changes of heart on the part of its makers in the course of production. Originally designed to encompass two volumes, the first part was subdivided soon after its completion into three separate tomes. The second volume, which retained its homogeneity, is also much larger in its dimensions than its companion. The decoration was begun in a fairly restrained and sober manner, Books I and II having only smallish pen-work initial letters. Thereafter, the initials become formally more elaborate, though still conventional in their choice of imagery. From Book VIII onward, however, the space allotted to them becomes much larger, and their design exhibits the extraordinary mixture of variety and inventiveness for which the Citeaux Moralia is famous, departing from a literal construal of the text and forsaking as well the customary devices of allegory or overt symbolism in favor of an expressive medium that seems to be compounded of metaphor, allusion, or perhaps only hermetic self-reference. This imagery has not surprisingly constituted a challenge to the hermeneutical pride of modern readers. Modernists among them have celebrated in them a nearness to life and a certain vindication of the private or the gratuitous in the realm of aesthetic experience even in these remote and unpromising times. Rudolph belongs with the traditionalists or those for whom historical contingencies compel a search for religious meaning in works of monastic art even as obdurate to interpretation as these designs. Daily life in the title of the book

refers to the series of initials (Bks. XI, XIII, XV, XVI, XXI, XXVII, XXXTV) which are often regarded as reflections of the artist's curiosity about the world around him. For Rudolph, however, the naturalism of these letters, real as it is, harbors an allegorical dimension which is for him their essential point, lending emphasis to the value attached by the Cistercians on manual labor and the avoidance of the temptations of the secular world. A second group of initials (Frontispiece, and Bks. X, XVIII, XIX, XX, XXIII, XXVIII, XXLX, XXX, XXXI, and XXXIII) refers, according to the author, to the theme of violence, a term not altogether well chosen by him to designate spiritual struggle. His method is to concede the lack of any literal basis in the text for the often fanciful imagery of these initials, and appeal for an explanatory premise to a generalized "sense" embedded in Gregory's commentary. Thus, the lean and long-frocked figure prying open the jaws of a submissive dragon which outlines the letter Q at the beginning of Book XX is said to have been inspired by a passage in this section of the text which declares that "the elect, while in this world, never become overconfident of their spiritual security; instead they are always on watch against the plots of the enemy" (p. 45). The weird collection of wild animals, composite creatures, including a bearded and balding figure riding on the back of a naked man, is held to evoke "in a generic way" Gregory's depiction in the same book of the soul's spiritual travails through such expressions as "a storm of temptation," or "a turbulent sea darkened by the confusion of its own restlessness," and similar phrases (p. 58). As these examples indicate, Rudolph's interpretations are ingenious, often suggestive, and many readers may well find them convincing. The author would perhaps admit their speculative nature, which the final chapter of the book justifies by analogy with the capacious allegorical resourcefulness fostered by the meditative and exegetical protocols of monastic reading. For this reviewer, they do understate the playful dimension in these exegetical procedures and the strong intimations of satire that cling in palpable fashion to these striking images.

Walter Cahn

Yale University

Viterbo: Profile of a Thirteenth-Century Papal Palace. By Gary M. Radke. (New York: Cambridge University Press. 1996. Pp. xx, 354. $85.00.)

This volume is a study of the papal palace of Viterbo as an architectural artifact as well as in the context of the history and political ambitions of the city. The first half of the volume sets out the relationship between the commune of Viterbo and the papacy (Chapter 1), the various phases of construction of the papal palace (Chapter 2), the types and the allocations of space within the palace from the most exalted official reception halls to the latrines (Chapter 3), and, finally, the palace and its decoration in the context of local building traditions, papal architecture, and the influence of imported, "up-to-date" French

architectural models. The second half of the book is a detailed archaeological-architectural analysis of the monument section by section, with reconstructing drawings and a careful analysis of alterations and restorations. The volume concludes with an admirable series of plans, elevations, and sections, coded to represent the different areas and phases of construction. There are notes and an index, but no bibliography.

As the title suggests, the volume is based on the tradition of architectural analysis established by one of the great masters in the field, Richard Krautheimer, whose volume, Rome: Profile of a City, 312-1308 (Princeton, 1980), hovers in the background as the acknowledged model for this study. The meticulous analysis of the structure, the careful description of the phases of construction and their dating, and the contextualization of all this in the setting of the (presumptuous) attempts on the part of the Viterbo city fathers, especially the Gatti family, to co-opt the papacy into permanent residence at Viterbo, reflect the splendid model of architectural analysis established by Krautheimer and his many students, among them Radke's own former advisor, Marvin Trachtenberg. The volume is in the tradition of architectural history at its finest.

Yet Viterbo is strangely unsatisfying; it gives us both more and less than we really want. On the one hand, the relation of spacial configuration of this palace to other major palaces in Viterbo (of which there is no small number) is strangely lacking (the author makes comparisons only in relation to decorative detailing). On the other hand, the laborious analysis of construction phases and masonry that makes up the second half of the book is of such great density and detail that only the most stubborn and persistent reader will stay the course. Issues of great interest, such as the difference between local manual labor for the erection of flat wall surfaces versus specialized stonecutting for details such as the arcading, which was probably produced by itinerant masons paid by the piece, do not factor into the discussion; yet these are typical features of both palace and religious architecture in central and southern Italy. This sort of analysis has fundamental implications for the nature of the architecture under discussion.

Admittedly, palace architecture is an immensely difficult topic, as such structures are singularly subject to constant modification and are generally difficult of access. In this narrative, however, the papal palace of Viterbo seems to exist in something of a local vacuum, typologically speaking. While on the one hand the author has amply demonstrated the deep involvement of the Gatti family in building phases of the papal palace, the relationship of the spacial characteristics of this structure to models in Viterbo itself—such as the other Gatti palace—is absent.

More difficult still is the discussion of the broader intellectual frame for the duecento decorative motifs of the palace. Delays in the publication of this volume, partly as a result of the closing of the Architectural History Foundation and the transfer of the volume to Cambridge, have resulted in a text that seems to have come out of a time warp. With only a few exceptions, the notes are confined to publications dating up only through the early 1980's. Yet the past fif-

teen years have been exceptionally interesting for publication in the field of the history of the thirteenth-century papacy and curia (for example, the articles in Società e istituzioni dell'Italia comunale: Vesempio di Perugia (secoli XII-XIV) (Perugia, 1988), as well as Italian duecento architecture, some of which has been published in various articles by Radke himself. Thus fundamental recent studies that concern the importation of French elements and the mediation between local Italian traditions and foreign imports are missing (for example, Saggi in onore di Renato Bonelli [Quaderni dell'Istituto di Storia dell'Architettura], 1990-1992, or Il gótico europeo in Italia, edd. V Pace and M. Bagnoli [Naples, 1994]). In general, the volume tends to make abstraction of the Italian Eterature in favor of studies in English and in German, a weakness that often characterizes publications on medieval Italy produced by American scholars. The delay of the book and the inability of the author and/or editors to update the text in relation to the new literature present fundamental flaws in a study that might have been of central importance in the analysis of the intersection of indigenous building traditions with imported motifs in thirteenth-century Italian architecture.

Caroline Bruzeuus

The American Academy in Rome

Portals, Pilgrimage, and Crusade in Western Tuscany. By Dorothy F. Glass. (Princeton: Princeton University Press. 1997. Pp. xvii, 145. $39.50.)

This small book examines nine closely-related, twelfth-century narrative reliefs, most above entrance portals of Romanesque churches in Pistoia, Lucca, and artistically affiliated centers. The author's project began with a question about art along the Via Francigena, the primary pilgrimage route from northern Europe to Rome, then narrowed in scope to the portal from San Leonardo al Frígido, but in the end confronted perhaps the most difficult problem in Italian Romanesque sculpture, its iconography. The nine reliefs are deceptively transparent. We know their dates with some accuracy; some are signed and can be compared with other works by the same artists—some even bear inscriptions identifying the scenes depicted. What has been lacking, and what Glass has supplied, are the interpretive contexts within which the reliefs could become meaningful. A book with only sixty-eight pages of text is probably too slight to be described as magisterial; "lapidary," given the subject, might seem an unfortunate pun. So I will characterize this book as exemplary, an adjective already justly associated with Glass's earlier publications on Romanesque sculpture in Campania and on Cosmatesque pavements. Yet her most recent publication has a special excellence which places it among the very best studies of Romanesque art.

Glass teases meaning from the reliefs through close readings of their inscriptions and superlatively skiLlfiil formal analyses, illuminating her examples through comparison with related works especially, but by no means only, in

Italy. Convinced that "the subject matter was firmly grounded in present realities" (p. 61), she brings to bear on the reliefs her knowledge of history, liturgy, politics, hagiography devotional practices, and liturgical drama in order to identify a sense of something contemporary or "lived" in them. As she sums up her discussion of Sant'Andrea in Pistoia:"the portal sculpture is significant precisely because it transmutes episodes from the gospels into images that could have been perceived by medieval viewers in terms of events witnessed and known in twelfth-century Pistoia" (p. 18).

The author's interpretive contexts are diverse in kind. Some are temporal: the book opens with a chapter titled "Time and Place" and closes with chapters devoted to the past (chapter six) and the present (chapter seven). Other contexts explore aspects of Christian devotional practice (what Glass refers to as "paraliturgical activity" [p. 36]), suggested by the chapter titles "Adoration and Participation" (chapter two) and "Preaching and Serving" (chapter three). The most pervasive contexts, she suggests, are pilgrimage and crusade, understood not only in their literal but also metaphorical senses: so, "Marching to Jerusalem" (chapter four) and "Sailing from Byzantium" (chapter five). As she remarks, following her association of the Entry into Jerusalem (the subject of three of the lintels) not only with pilgrimage but also with Palm Sunday processions, "historical time fuses with actual time to become ritual time" (p. 62).

It would be hard to overstate the importance of this book for the study of Italian Romanesque sculpture. Thanks to Glass's work, fruitful discussion can now take place about the meaning of these reliefs. Indeed, this reviewer cannot resist responding to—not criticizing—some of her interpretations. The inscriptions, for instance, raise questions. Glass translates operarii and operarius (pp. 11, 19) as "workers" or perhaps "contractor." But the full texts, especially that from Sant'Andrea, together with the consideration that sculptors are more commonly identified by the material of their trade—hence latomus or lapicidas—raise the possibility that operarius means "head administrator of the project." If so, the inscriptions would record not the artists, but the patron, or at least the patron's representative.

The inscriptions identifying the narratives raise other important questions which are not only art historical. For instance, the garbled text of San Bartolomeo in Pantano is not really biblical, although it draws from Luke and John (as Glass points out). The first line, PAX EGO SUMVOBIS QUO SIT FIRMISSIMA DOBIS (p. 83, n. 7), might be extended and recomposed to read as EGO SUM PAX, PAX VOBIS, EGO SUM QUOD SIT FIRMISSIMA, PAX DOBIS. One wonders if biblical language has been used to create a kind of anagram and if so, by whom? A similar loose handling of scripture occurs in the Filius Getronis found in the Fleury Playbook, where the child paraphrases Psalm 135:15-17 ("pagans' idols . . . have mouths, but never speak, eyes, but never see, ears, but never hear, and not a breath in their mouths") when he says of the pagan god: "He is deceitful and bad; he is stupid, blind, deaf and dumb" (p. 44). Original literary compositions, perhaps like the sculpted narratives, seem to have been ere-

ated from linguistic snippets, ultimately from scripture but rephrased as "modern" speech and applied to new contexts. If the reliefs' relation to scripture is like that of the play's, would this provide insight into the process of artistic creation in the twelfth century?

While not denying all that Glass suggests about the significance of the Entry into Jerusalem,! would suggest additional resonance for this subject in relation to the time-worn, yet still valid assertion that every Christian church represents the Heavenly Jerusalem. This significance is embedded in the psalms, antiphons, and readings for the consecration of a church. Scholars might ask, not whether specific churches represent the Heavenly Jerusalem, but whether Italian Romanesque churches seek to visualize that paradigm and if so, what is specific to their time and place in the way they relate building and text. Perhaps, as Glass suggests, the Italians focused on "the directness of the here and now" (p. 62), but this may not have been more relevant to them than the afterlife nor indicative of disinterest in theology. Glass cites Boncompagno of Signa on memory as expressing the Tuscan world view; but Boncompagno is paraphrasing St. Augustine (e.g., Confessions, 10.8-20 and De Trinitate 11.7). If Tuscan culture was less involved with abstract theological speculation than northern Europe (p. 62), perhaps this was because the Italians read more Augustine, or were attracted to different aspects of his work. Memory, for Augustine, is identified with the consciousness itself and with inner vision. That seeing the events depicted on the reliefs led the Tuscan spectator to associate the events depicted with experiences in his or her own life and thus to live them is consonant with Augustine's understanding of how memory operates as well as with Glass's iconographie interpretations.

Christine Smith

Graduate School of Design
Harvard University

Stift und Stadt. Das Heiliggrabpriorat von Santa Anna und das Regularkanonikerstift Santa Eulalia del Camp im mittelalterlichen Barcelona (1145-1423). By Nikolas Jaspert. [Berliner Historische Studien, Band 24. Ordernsstudien, X.] (Berlin: Duncker & Humblot. 1996. Pp. 575; 21 maps, 5 tables and graphs. DM 138.00 paperback.)

This substantial work, initially Nikolas Jaspert's doctoral dissertation directed by Professor Kaspar Elm and defended in 1994 at the Freie Universität in Berlin, matured well beyond this stage to be placed by Professor Joachim Ehlers into the Berliner Historische Studien series as the tenth volume about religious orders in the Middle Ages. Rather than a traditional institutional history of one house or the other, this study aims at an histoire totale in the ethnographical style of New Cultural History, integrating the entwined histories of both houses,

the Knights of the Holy Sepulchre Priory of Sta. Anna and the Canons Regular convent of Sta. Eulalia, into the fabric of medieval Barcelonan daily life and vibrant civic culture. It is this combination of detail and intricate locality with broader contextualization of the Mediterranean world of the Crusades that is this study's strength. Despite the uniformity attributed by themselves and others to religious and military orders and their official identity, the Canons, Knights, their patrons and beneficiaries, formed intricate communities larger than their houses. These were not artificial, esoteric pre-organized coherent religious movements imported from some far-off inspirational centers, but were spontaneous and self-organizing, indigenous and semi-autonomous, brotherhoods that through affiliation grew into multi-type organizations and far-flung corporations that were highly influential in urban affairs and those of state for more than two centuries.

In his introductory chapter and tabular form in his appended source references, Jaspert lays out the archival fonds of Sta. Anna from the Arxiu Diocesa de Barcelona (ADB) which begin in the early 1140's during the resurgence of the crusade against the Muslim Ebro fortress kingdoms of Ilerda and Tortosa and subsequent major expansion of Arago-Catalunya and during the continuing struggle in the Holy Land. These records double in annual production after the 1220's and the Crown's expansion toward Valencia, reaching a crescendo in the 1330-1340's before the decline of the archives in 1350 and the end of the series in 1423 with the union of the priories and Sta. Anna and Sta. Eulalia—the terminus of Jaspert's study. In all, 3,181 originals and 688 transumpts or official copies from the Sta. Anna archives are analyzed in thirty-five diplomatic categories. Their data are augmented by gleanings from twenty other archives, especially the parchment series of the Royal Chancery in the Arxiu Corona d'Aragó (ACA) for political context, the see of Barcelona's grand cartulary or Libri Antiquitatum in the cathedral archives, and the ADB's Registra Communium. Jaspert also relied on the more than one hundred published collections of transcribed documents that exist for this region.

Jaspert supplies an extensive but not exhaustive fifty-page bibliography of the pertinent secondary literature which admirably crosses all language and political barriers (including contributions from the flourishing American school of medievalists too often ignored by peninsular historians). A larger bibliography exists, of course, for the Canons Regular, the new military and reformed monastic orders, and other religious movements in southern France and northeastern Spain, that could provide even more breadth for this local and regional study. One might have expected its findings to have been related to established generalizations in such institutional surveys for the peninsula as those by Luis G. de Valdeavellano or more regionally by J. M. Font i Rius, or the economic perspectives by J. Vicens Vives. The bibliography itself is presented in a vademécum style, a hybrid Social Science and Humanities system of its own, with short author-title-page references to the full citations in the bibliography. Although consistent internally, it does not conform with international bibliographic

standards (IFLA or ISO) or the professional styles preferred by certain disciplines in Anglo-American publishing. Author identifications in citations, for example, use initials only for first and middle names; name authority control is a problem in some cases (the normalization of Catalan and Castilian forms is always problematic); publishers' identities are omitted; and volumes in serials are not qualified by issue numbers. The index is a register of personal and place names, so subject access is limited; but the table of contents delineates in outline form both chapter and section headings as well as subheadings five-levels down, which thereby provides access to some parts as small as only two pages. The critical apparatus is remarkable for its 1800 footnotes integrating primary sources with references to the secondary literature. Standard bar-graphs are used; and computer-rendered mapwork seems minimalist, mostly political outline maps of northeastern Spain or of the extended medieval city of Barcelona with pinpoints and connectors indicating different institutions identified by icons and location numbers referenced in tables below. The book could have been enhanced by a good designer, illustration of both extant documents and monuments, and better depiction of the area's geographical features.

The book's organization is not entirely chronological, but is thematic inside a broad chronological framework from remote origins of both the Knights and the Canons in indigenous lay movements and confraternities coupled with urban growth. More formal structures were adopted under the influence of the Gregorian Reform generally, particularly the capitular reforms of Bishop Guillem de Torroja in the 1150's, the rise of Barcelona as a capital and maritime commercial power with the expansion of reconquest and heightened ambitions of the comittal House of Barcelona leading a federated Aragó-Catalan empire. A more formal system of affiliation between institutions supporting the military orders appeared for recruitment and financial backing of the Jerusalem venture, eventually leading to the peninsular organization of the Knights of the Holy Sepulchre into provincial priories at Calatayud for Aragón and Barcelona for Catalunya. The latter eventually had sixteen Catalan dependencies with various commanderies and parishes. Both Barcelonan priories were in the same suburban neighborhood, benefited from the same patronage, and participated in joint-ventures and charities; both communities adhered to the Augustinian Rule and gradually a fusion of liturgy, social functions, burial customs, architectural styles, and property development and inheritance occurred.

Jaspert refers to the period before 1220 as the "Golden Years" of growth and expansion when the Canons of Sta. Eulalia sponsored important charities, built hospitals, and allied themselves with the city's oligarchy; while the priory of Sta. Anna worked in collusion with the bishops and count-kings of Barcelona to further their mutual crusade and commercial interests in Spain and across the Mediterranean. But by the fourteenth century both houses, now large and official institutions, had lost some of their ground-level support, were identified with the urban core where they encountered competition by the mendicants; and whereas they once held the trust of the people generally in their interme-

diary role between town government and the Crown, they fell victims to the periodic hostilities between the local oligarchy and royal government, which was in constant need of money. The Priory of Sta. Anna became increasingly dependent upon royal patronage and a tool of the Trastamara dynasty, so that at the century's end, after a period of plague, warfare, and economic instability, the priories were in rapid decline. Their union in 1423 was an unsuccessful attempt at re-stabilization, and their decline continued until their demise in 1592 during the monastic reforms of Philip II.

While the first chapter (A) lays out some of the key questions, historiographie problems, and sources, chapter B investigates the origins of the Barcelonan Canons as part of the larger European phenomena of canonical/capitular reform and religious lay movements, but more particularly as a local development between the growth of military orders in Spain and focal point in Barcelona around a chapel of the Holy Sepulchre and a religious confraternity invoking the cult of Sta. Eulalia, Barcelona's historic martyr. Once establishing the foundation of a community of canons in the mid-century and initial development of the priory of Sta. Anna from common confraternal origins, chapter C treats the congruence issue, or the differences and similarities between formal structure of these orders and their religious aspirations with the business of pastoral care and social welfare. It dissects the workings of the priory of Sta. Anna and the nearby church of Sta. Eulalia and its expansion outside the medieval city on the plain to the northeast, Sta. Eulalia del Camp. Subjects include pastoral care, hospitals, alms distribution and other charities, liturgical innovation and the cult of the Holy Sepulchre, the construction of churches, bureaucratic developments of the Rule and statutes, and the patronage system that contributed to the priories' growth, the larger familia of the associated families whose members joined these communities, patrons and donors, benefices and properties.

The core of the study (chapter D) is the relationship between the Chorherrenstifte—this conglomerate of priories and churches, charitable institutions, and religious orders—and the city of Barcelona, especially its economic life. Sections include first the dedication, building, and endowment of the churches as socio-economic institutions, i.e., the expenditures and operations of the priories and their business partners, and the entwinement of the secular and religious, church and city-state, in Barcelona. A second section evaluates the impact of the priories on the citizenry, especially the confraternal aspects of its formation and continuance of a lay brotherhood or patronage associations for Sta. Eulalia and Sta. Anna, before showing how these priories acted as catalysts for the city's growth and expansion. Especially ingenious is Jaspert's depiction of the suburban growth of Barcelona outside the ancient walls around Sta. Anna and its plaza which eventually became the Puerta de Angel passageway between the old Roman center and a medieval incorporation of suburbs within a new outer-ring of medieval walls. Reconstructions of the city as by P Banks and others from archaeological remains and foundations of extant buildings in and around the Gothic Quarter map the layout of the city back to the 1320's and be-

yond to its Roman foundations. Jaspert shows how properties south and east of the modern Plaça de Catalunya were originally allods or freely held garden plots being filled in after 1200 along pathways and around the priory of Sta. Anna. Patterns of extramural growth along the creek-bed that flowed from a coastal ridge to the city's north walls and around to the sea down the modern Ramblas avenue, and along roads that converged toward the main gate, show that the priories were along the main corridor from the hinterland to the city and port, in a new suburban commercial center. The strategic location of the priories promoted this urban sprawl and vice versa, such growth contributed to the prosperity of the priories. Finally, the major players in the priories' secular life are depicted: the laity at large and up-and-coming families, the local nobility, the comital-royal house, the city consulate, the bishop and cathedral chapter of Barcelona, and other religious foundations. The last chapter (E) delineates the priories' dependencies and affiliations in the region and across the Hispanic kingdoms.

This history is decidedly secular, even if the subjects are religious foundations. As in the case of Cistercians where charter material survives in abundance but a dearth of narrative material makes discussion of spirituality difficult, the Canons Regular and Knights of the Holy Sepulchre must be judged by what they did more than what they thought. As Jaspert has noted elsewhere (Proceedings, 1996 International Medieval Congress at Leeds [Turnhout: Brepols, 1977], pp. 105-135), the ecclesiastical and monastic institutional history of the Arago-Catalan region is strong, but the house of Barcelona and its descendants lacked representation among medieval saints, and even though certain figures like Ramon Lull or Ramon de Penyafort stand out, the Church there does not have an abundance of religious authors or a great spiritual literature. This study likewise reinforces the depiction of Catalan religious institutions as businesses and largely social organizations. Jaspert's approach is prosopographical in this regard, rather than being purely economic, and two appendices of lay patrons and family reconstruction from the charters of Sta. Anna contribute to the growing anthroponomy of northeastern Spain, but he seems not to have used the innovative historical computing techniques designed for this kind of study, such as the application of Klieu software, the automated cartulary analysis developed by I. Kropac at Graz, the sophisticated nominal linkage in the Legia I-IV genealogical programs of Suzy Pasleu and C. Desama at Liège, or the anthroponomies sponsored by the Centre National de Recherche Scientifique (CNRS) and the concurrent social and familial reconstruction specifically for medieval Catalunya by Jordi Bolos i Masclans and Josep Maran i Ocerinijauregui, Repertori d'antropönims catalans [RAC] (Barelona: Institut d'Estudis Catalans, 1994). Nevertheless, this is representative of such New History and is commendable for its detail, synthesis, and insights.

Jaspert's study must be added to the list of essential titles for the history of medieval Barcelona and be regarded as a significant contribution to the historiography of northeastern medieval Spain. Moreover, as a case study of important

religious houses, it should be consulted by all who encounter the Canons Regular and Order of the Holy Sepulchre in their studies.

Lawrence J. McCrank

Davenport College
Grand Rapids, Michigan

The Rescue of the Innocents: Endangered Children in Medieval Miracles. By Ronald C. Finucane. (New York: St. Martin's Press. 1997. Pp. xii, 268. $49.95.)

In recent years, historians have discovered the value of medieval miracle collections as a rich source for the study of such themes as family structure, gender relations, folk medicine, and popular religion. Following the introduction of papal canonization in the twelfth century, legal and medical standards were applied to the recording and verification of the miracle, which was often based on the eyewitness testimony of those persons who had experienced or participated in a miraculous event. Such detailed testimony permits a microhistorical reconstruction of the daily concerns and mental world not only of the clergy and nobility, but also of the unlettered classes.

In this volume, Ronald Finucane skillfully examines over six hundred miracles reported in eight major collections (some still in manuscript form) from the twelfth to the fifteenth centuries, including those of Thomas Becket, Louis of Toulouse, Thomas Cantilupe, Dorothy of Montau, King Henry VI, Chiara of Montefalco, Nicholas of Tolentino, and Pope Urban V He focuses particularly on childbirth and the complications of neonatal existence, pregnancy, illnesses and accidents involving children. The expressions of grief and parental love, the concern to revive an injured or fatally ill child voiced in these sources, and the varied cultic practices and healing techniques employed to ensure the safety of the young, provide graphic documentary illustration of those attitudes and practices found in contemporary medical, philosophical, theological, literary, and hagiographical sources. Aries's claim that the Middle Ages treated its young with brutality or indifference is finally laid to rest. This work allows us to vicariously experience the affectional relationships within the family dealt with by Boswell, Bennett, Hanawalt, Herlihy and others.

Finucane's work provides firm statistical evidence for many of the conditions of childhood: the greater propensity of boys to accidents; the greater stress on saving endangered boys rather than girls by a ratio of about seventy to thirty; the considerable involvement of extended kinfolk in southern Europe in the care of children; the place of children at home and in the workplace; the prevalence of childhood disease in southern Europe and accidents in the north as causes of child mortality. These miracles provide us with valuable information concerning the many diseases and their symptoms to which children were prone, and the place of mothers, fathers, family, physicians, midwives, nurses,

and priests in the care of the young. An excellent illustration of many of Finucane's conclusions is provided by a full translation of the drowning and revival of Joanna of Marden found in the canonization record of Thomas Cantilupe, probably the best documented such report. In sum, this volume represents a good example of the high demands of meticulous scholarship, combined with the engrossing narration of the kind of local history which can bring us closer to the traumas and joys of medieval peasant society.

Michael Goodich

University of Haifa

Die Register Innocenz' III. 7. Band: 7. Pontifikatsjahr, 1204/1205. Texte und Indices. Edition supervised by Othmar Hageneder. Edited by Andrea Sommerlechner and Herwig Weigl, together with Christoph Egger and Rainer Murauer. (Vienna: Verlag der Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften. 1997. Pp. lxvii,495. 1590,00 öS paperback.)

With the appearance of the volume under review this definitive editorial project presents the enregistered correspondence for an interesting chronological slice in the history of Innocent IILTs pontificate. Excepting three missives from September, 1203, the letters range between late February, 1204, and mid-February, 1205. All in all, 231 registered letters and documents are presented here with detailed commentary.

The edited portion of the register was transcribed from folios 134-203 of Cod. Reg. Vat. 5. In their introduction to the manuscript (pp. vii-xvi) the editors present an exhaustive survey of codicological and paleographical information. A short list of the topics includes the average size and number of lines of written text per sheet, the various numberings of the folios and letters, the system of rubrication, titular formulae of addressees, the coloring of a letter's initial, a brief description of four marginal illustrations, and a discussion of other marginalia which seem often to mark individual letters considered by later scribes or readers as important. For example, twenty-five letters have marginal notations of the tituli wherein they would later be located in the Gregorian Decretals. The scribes themselves also come under scrutiny; almost all (226) of the letters were written by two different scribes; the five remaining were written by three other hands. Finally, the editors briefly discuss those manuscript indications which reveal whether original letters or concept drafts formed the archetype for registration.

The introduction to the edition (pp. xvi-lxvii) briefly discusses the two prior printed editions of de Bréquingy/La Porte du Theil (Paris, 1791) and Migne.PZ, Vol. 215 (Paris, 1855). In the edition under review it is claimed that paleographical data from the Reg. Vat. 5 ms. will permit additional dating information for the stages whereby many letters were copied into the register. Especially noteworthy here is the manner whereby the two main scribes alternated while

working on the main register and the special register on the German throne controversy. To their explication of editorial policies and conventions the editors append a bibliography of utilized editions or analyses of decretal collections (pp. xx-xxi), tables of letters sorted by scribe and lubricator (pp. xxi-xxii), a concordance of letter numeration according to the new edition and to the Migne edition (p. xxii), a bibliography of secondary literature (pp. xlv-lxvii), and tables of stages for the registration of letters by individual scribes (pp. xxiii-xxxvii), of expansions to abbreviated epistolary formulae (pp. xxxviii-xliii), and of bibliographical abbreviations (pp. xliii-xlviv).

Restrictions of space in this review allow only the most summary comments regarding the letters themselves. In some Innocent merely responds to his correspondents' specific questions regarding law or ritual observance. He dispenses advice on the settlement of a matrimonial case (#38), the proper observance of fasting on the vigil of feast days (#150), the extent of exemption from episcopal jurisdiction provided by certain types of letters of papal protection (#177), or the suitability for holy orders of an inadvertent parricide (#73). In a long reply (#169) to an English bishop the pope is obliged to give detailed answers in six separate matters. In other correspondence Innocent confirms the physical transfer of an Italian episcopal see from one place to another (#24), and asks an archbishop to agree to move a Hungarian priory (#57). Several letters (#320-321, 191) detail both the pope's refusal to accept the Florentine city government's attempt to move the see of Fiesole and his authorization of subsequent negotiations between the interested parties regarding a suitable alternative location.

In over two dozen letters Innocent takes various institutions (e.g., hospitals, religious houses, collegiate and cathedral churches) into papal protection, often confirming in the process their rights and properties (e.g., #16, 30, 60, 80, 115, 149). The provision of canonries and prebends, often in cathedral churches, serves as the subject for a dozen letters (e.g., #61, 71,98, 116, 123, 132). Innocent orders (#194) a French parish priest to threaten with excommunication those Christian servants who cohabit with their Jewish masters and refuse to withdraw from such service, while in another letter (#186) the pope advises Philip II Augustus to take steps against the allegedly abusive actions of Jews within France. In two other missives (#79, 212) the pontiff urges the same king to act personally against the Cathars within his realm. Innocent also authorizes his legates to grant crusade indulgences against these same heretics (#77).

A further dozen letters detail the promising, if ultimately fruitless, start to relations between the Apostolic See and the Bulgarians. Innocent sends a legate to crown Tsar Kaloyan and to deliver other royal insignia (#1, 8, 12, 230), receives in turn the tsar's submission of his kingdom (#4), elevates the archbishop of Tirnovo to primate (#2, 11), and awards pallia to the latter and other Bulgarian archbishops (#7, 10, 231). Innocent's tenuous control over the Fourth Crusade is chronicled in over a dozen letters. The Venetians and their doge are told to seek absolution for instigating the crusaders' attack on Christian Zadar (#18,

208). Although the pope takes Baldwin, the new Latin emperor, under his protection (#152-153) and strives to explain to the crusading host the providential significance both of their conquest of Constantinople and of the return of its church to Roman obedience (#154, 203), he nevertheless invalidates the crusader-Venetian treaty regarding the division of spoils as defective (#205-206) and reprimands his own crusade legates for abandoning their mission in the Holy Land without permission in order to travel to the imperial city (#223). At least two dozen letters illuminate other activities of Innocent's legates (e.g., #76, 124, 135, 210); see the fine short example of a legatine general mandate (#157). A like number of letters (e.g., #28, 34, 72, 215) indicates how his delegate judges adjudicated disputes over land, churches, ecclesiastical elections, prebends, and matrimony. Students of canon law will be interested in the letter beginning "Novit Ule" (#43), where the pope justifies his intervention "ratione peccati" between Philip II and John Lackland, and in a directive (#200) where the pope entrusts the great Huguccio with the investigation and, if appropriate, consecration of a patriarch-elect.

The seven indices include tables of incipits of letters, of exact or paraphrased biblical quotations, of decretals sorted by decretal collection, a register of recipients, an index of proper names, and appended corrections or additions. The editors complete the volume with six color photographs of interesting folios.

Robert C. Figueira

Lander University

English Episcopal Acta, Volume 13: Worcester 1218-1268. Edited by Philippa M. Hoskin. (New York: Published for the British Academy by Oxford University Press. 1997. Pp. liv, 192. $40.00.)

In this volume Dr. Hoskin provides historians access to the surviving acta of three Worcester bishops, William of Blois (1218-1236), Walter de Cantilupe (1236-1266), and Nicholas of Ely (1266-1268). Following the general approach of her predecessors in this series, she gives a brief biography of each of the bishops, discusses their households and officials, and elaborates on the formal structure of the documents. Four pages of plates follow. Most valuable perhaps of the four appendices are the three bishops' itineraries.

Dr. Hoskin prints all the extant acta in full except for five printed in earlier volumes of the Acta series and three "reflecting Walter de Cantilupe's political interests, where there is already a standard text" (p. liv). This nearly complete inclusiveness makes Hoskin's work particularly useful since the documents never before printed even in calendared form (slightly more than half of the 162 acta) survive in various repositories, while the printed versions come from a multitude of sources from the seventeenth through the twentieth centuries.

Dr. Hoskin has maintained the high professional standards of her predecessors although a few errors have slipped by. In the introduction, for example, the editor erroneously states that Walter's counterseal reads "qvem tenet tronvs . . ." even though several of her notes to the documents render the seal as "qvem tenet hie tronvs . . ." The editor has occasionally erred in rendering the Latin; read page 126, lines 13-14, as "auctoritate nostra dispensata . . . beneficia . . . non usque negligantur," not "auctoritate nostra dispenses . . . beneficia . . . usque negligatur." The summary for #48 should indicate the addition of three chaplains, six clerks, and five lay brothers, not three clerks and five lay "bretheren" [sic]. The two indices while extremely detailed could have been improved in a few subject headings like "vicar(age)" where at least five references were missed.

My chief criticism of this important work is that Dr. Hoskin could have improved some of the summaries without drastically increasing the length and expense of the book. In an era when fewer students know Latin, it would have been useful to have noted, for example, (#2) that Bishop William had not paid the exchequer five and a half of the required knights' fees, and his justification of his failure; (#21) that the "sisters" of Maiden Bradley hospital were lepers; that both #38 and #39 record the case of a man excommunicated for refusing to accept his lawful wife (only the summary for #39 makes the issue clear); (#111) that men from the Hereford diocese could beg in the Worcester diocese for aid to rebuild their cathedral church, but they must not preach.

But these minor criticisms notwithstanding, this is a valuable book for the church historian, and Dr. Hoskin has edited the acta dealing with appropriations of religious properties, institutions of vicars and rectors, significations of excommunications, indulgences, settlements of controversies between ecclesiastical personages or congregations, grants, documents relevant to the struggle between Henry III and his baronial opponents, burial rights, and hospitals skillfully, particularly in the dating of the documents.

John W Dahmus

Stephen F.Austin State University
Nacogdoches, Texas

Konrad von Urach (f1227): Zähringer, Zisterzienser, Kardinallegat. By Falko Neininger. [Quellen und Forschungen aus dem Gebiet der Geschichte, Neue Folge,Heft 17.] (Paderborn: Ferdinand Schöningh. 1994. Pp. 618. Paperback)

The detailed biography of this influential German Cistercian and cardinal seeks to gauge his role in politics and in ecclesiastical life during the first decades of the thirteenth century. A son to Count Egino IV of Urach as well as a scion of the princely Zähringen family through his mother Agnes (daughter of Duke Berthold FV of Zähringen), Konrad was born c. 1180 into fortunate circumstances. He entered the clerical career "fast-track" as soon as he reached his

majority, first becoming a Liège cathedral canon, then (1 199) a Cistercian monk at Villers in Brabant, and eventually being elected abbot of this monastery in 1208/09 at the age (roughly) of 30. Five years later (1213/14) he was elected abbot of Clairvaux, and two years after that (1216/17) he was elected abbot of Citeaux, the mother-house of the order.

In 1219 Pope Honorius III named Konrad cardinal-bishop of Porto and Sta. Rufina and utilized him subsequently in two extended missions as papal legate: he represented papal interests in southern France during the middle period of the Albigensian crusade, and he toured imperial territories north of the Alps in support of the preparations for Emperor Frederick II's proposed crusade to Latin Outremer. Upon Honorius's death Konrad declined to be chosen his successor and made way for Hugolino of Ostia's election as Gregory IX. Konrad himself did not survive Honorius long; probably among the first crusaders to leave Brindisi after the outbreak of pestilence there, he soon became another victim of the epidemic that postponed Frederick's promised departure and triggered the emperor's first struggle with Pope Gregory. Neininger is certainly correct in noting the untimely loss of a prelate whose experience and prestige could have mediated between these two formidable opponents in service to greater goals, namely, the crusade in particular and papal-imperial co-operation in general.

In his introduction Neininger notes that Konrad's importance lay in his capacity as a mediator, a middleman, a "fixer," whatever his position might have been at the time. The heart of the study is ordered according to five general themes: Konrad amidst his Urach and Zähringen relations; Konrad as a Cistercian; as a cardinal at the curia; as cardinal-legate in France; and as cardinal-legate in Germany. In two postscripts Neininger discusses Konrad during the final years of his life and provides a summary estimation.

Although Konrad's paternal kindred was by no means unimportant—containing as it did several bishops and abbots, his relatives through his Zähringen mother included not only both Frederick II and Louis VIII of France, but also the ruling houses of Brabant, Limburg, Geldern, Namur, Holland, Dagsburg, Montfort, and Châtillon. Neininger contends that these ties of kinship later made Konrad the ideal go-between or arbiter of disputes among a large range of powerful personalities, and also determined in part the institutional beneficiaries of many of his actions as prelate and legate.

The young cathedral canon's entry into monastic life can best be explained by the tight relationship between the Cistercians and both sides of his family. In Villers, a daughter house of Clairvaux, Konrad quickly made his mark, becoming prior and abbot in short order. His election to Clairvaux derived probably from recognition of his successful tenure at Villers. As the tenth successor to Saint Bernard, much of Konrad's time and energies were consumed in visitation and supervisory duties as father-abbot over approximately eighty daughter houses or on commissions from the general chapter of the order. In the latter capacity he attended the Fourth Lateran Council in 1215.

The culmination of Konrad's monastic career occurred in his election to the abbacy of Citeaux. As such he presided over two annual general chapters of the order (in 1217 and 1218), participated in a delegation sent by Honorius III to negotiate peace between the boy-king Henry III and his French opponents Philip II and Prince Louis, participated in another delegation sent to that same pope to secure privileges for the Cistercians, and for a time supported Simon de Montfort's crusade as preacher, counselor, provider of monastic personnel, collector of crusade funds, and conservator of crusaders' rights and property. Upon promotion to the cardinalate Konrad did not cease his assistance to his order, for he played a major role in the mediation of the serious internal dispute regarding the constitutional positions of the abbot of Citeaux, of the abbots of the four primary daughter houses, and of the general chapter of the order. He was an early supporter of the Dominicans as well.

Neininger also gives attention to another side of Konrad's monastic and legatine experiences, namely, his patronage and furtherance of women religious. Konrad was perhaps the otherwise unidentified abbatial patron of Mary of Oignies, the noted mystic who lived not far from Villers. He presumably played some role in the foundation and support of several Cistercian nunneries in the vicinity of Villers, and as abbot of Citeaux presided over the general chapter's direct incorporation of other nunneries into the order in a manner that enhanced their economic and organizational integrity. The author also details Konrad's activity as legate in the foundation, refoundation, and promotion of Cistercian nunneries in France and in Germany. Finally, it must not be overlooked that the legate also promoted the activities of his own chaplain, Rudolf of Worms, in the foundation of an order of penitent women, namely, the Magdalens.

Of his eight-year tenure as cardinal Konrad spent three in residence at the papal curia, mostly immersed in routine work (e.g., as a judge-auditor) and in consistorial responsibilities, as well as fulfilling those duties—chiefly in St. Peter's Basilica—incumbent on his position as bishop of Porto. The remaining five years witnessed Konrad as Honorius's legate on two distinct missions: January 31, 1220, to October 11, 1223, in southern France and Provence, and April 30, 1224, to July 15, 1226,in Germany and Bohemia. The detailed itinerary and discussion of his activities as legate occupy the largest portion both of Neininger's narrative (pp. 167-272) and of his appended source summaries and documents (generally from p. 317 onward). Here the author has quarried a wealth of information regarding the exercise of papal legatine authority during the early thirteenth century.

The reader can observe Cardinal-legate Konrad as a counselor and leader to one crusade against the Albigensians as well as an organizer and preacher of another. In these instances he championed again the canonical protections accorded crusaders, collected funds, assembled fighting personnel, and encouraged others to "assume the cross." In addition, Pope Honorius delegated him to hear cases, and Konrad himself often subdelegated cases to the adjudication of

other clergy. He acted also as an arbiter at the instance of disputants. The legate even confirmed agreements independently reached by disputing parties.

Drawing upon his general and special mandated powers Cardinal-legate Konrad conducted a great variety of tasks and funded his activities through the levy of procurations from local churches. He encouraged the orthodox, excommunicated the disobedient and heterodox, interdicted communities that defied ecclesiastical authority, and absolved penitents from spiritual penalties. The legate confirmed the rights, revenues, tithes, and other properties of religious houses and of other ecclesiastical institutions, supervised the repayment of their debts, reformed such institutions, assumed religious houses into the protection of the Apostolic See or Roman church, conducted or commissioned ecclesiastical visitations, and oversaw the rightful possession and exercise of patronal rights.

Cardinal-legate Konrad convoked church councils, promulgated local and provincial statutes, consecrated churches and altars, performed ordinations and consecrations into holy orders, authorized the translation of relics, granted indulgences to pilgrims and crusaders, and supported activities to convert heathens. He conferred prebends, investigated complaints against local ecclesiastical authorities, deposed or suspended unworthy incumbents, intervened in disputed ecclesiastical elections, confirmed valid elections, and filled ecclesiastical vacancies when expedient or when the canonical electors defaulted. Konrad oversaw and confirmed recuperations, reorganizations, donations, exchanges, incorporations, acquisitions, and preservations of ecclesiastical property. He conducted diplomacy with rulers and oversaw treaties on the pope's behalf to further the crusades and the maintenance of peace. The legate gathered information for Honorius regarding a wide range of matters. Sometimes Konrad's counsel alone moved others to act.

Both legations, despite Konrad's energy, nonetheless yielded mixed results. In southern France he was unable—hindered as he was by lack of support, especially from the Capetians—to bring the crusade to a successful conclusion. Neininger notes convincingly, however, that the legate's attempts to negotiate a framework for peace anticipated by a few years the ultimate victory for orthodoxy of the same strategy as represented by Louis VIII's crusade. Konrad's efforts during his German legation to enlist support for Frederick H's eastern crusade proved very fruitful; here the tragedy lay rather in his own premature death at a time when his conciliatory skills might have defused the abruptly explosive conflict between Gregory LX and the emperor. On a related topic, however, this reviewer finds questionable the author's assertion (p. 285) that Konrad's German legation represented a model for the utility of an intermediate institutional instance within the Church between head and members, an administrative "missed opportunity" in light of the subsequent centralization of power in pope and curia.

At the beginning of the volume Neininger places a table of commonly used abbreviations, a bibliography of printed primary and secondary sources, and a list of utilized archives and manuscripts. As mentioned above, much space (pp.

287-525) appended to the narrative is devoted to summaries (Regesten) of 434 documents concerning Konrad. The author rounds out his study with transcriptions of unpublished documents concerning Konrad (for the most part issued by him), a short discussion of the diplomatic of his documents (together with photographs of six representative pieces), a table of incipits of his legatine diplomas, an index of places and persons, and detachable fold-out genealogical tables indicating Konrad's relationship to those families and individuals who figured in his activities.

Neininger's final appraisal rings true: while Konrad of Urach was by no means an epochal figure of medieval history, a study of his life yields instructive glimpses of the various historical forces that enlivened the secular and ecclesiastical politics of his day.

Robert C. Figueira

Lander University

L'Ordre de Saint [sic!] Claire à Bordeaux avant la Révolution (1239-1580). By Hugues Dedieu, O.F.M. [Editiones Archivum Franciscanum Historicum.] (Grottaferrata [Roma] : Collegio S. Bonaventura. 1996. Pp. 180. Paperback.)

In a period in which the lives of women religious who are historical prototypes are being diligently researched, the history of the Clares of Bordeaux would appear to be a real discovery. It is, but in a vein far different from what one might expect, and therefore all the more interesting. Instead of being presented with a hagiographical ideal of the first fervor of a community imbued with the love of poverty, prayer, and community life, we are confronted with a rather cautionary tale. No preaching is necessary. The facts tell it as it is. Brother Hugues Dedieu gave himself the triple goal of presenting a historical synthesis of the monastery of the Clares of Bordeaux, together with data about its earliest occupants, and a careful detailing of its temporal possessions.

It was a monastery, probably never larger than twenty nuns, and dating to the very time of St. Clare of Assist herself (1239). At the time of their arrival in the medieval city, the Damianites were just one of many, many religious houses, closely crowded together, and were popularly known as "les Menudes."

For a while, they followed the Benedictine Rule, and eventually the Rule promulgated by Pope Urban IV (1263)· The nuns seem to have had no idea whatsoever of their foundress' desperate attempts to obtain "the privilege of poverty," not to mention her ideal of enclosure and love of the sacraments. These nuns had their possessions and also seem to have had little idea of enclosure. It certainly was no "ideal" for them. The story of the demise of the community in utter poverty, even disgrace, is not very edifying. The spiritual life was not nourished by any strong sacramental life, not to mention spiritual guidance under the aegis of the Conventual Friars or Cordeliers to whom they were sub-

ject. Sociologically, there was a fairly large aristocratic recruitment, and the families of the abbesses intervened at will. Though their property list was much more extensive than one might expect, the paradox was that the nuns had grave financial problems for reasons of war, bad management, and tenant neglect. As a consequence, these concerns overly preoccupied the superiors to the detriment of healthy religious life. The community, deeply in need of reform, and long on the decline, underwent its death throes in the sixteenth century. When this spiritually and materially deficient community was offered hospitality by a generous community of Annonciade nuns, the latter had ample reason to regret their goodness. It did not help that a scandal with one of the abbesses erupted, when it became known that she had five or six children. The account of a Canonical Visitation by the Provincial of the Franciscans in 1575 is especially interesting: the nuns are considered to be in a state of "real dissolution and public scandal, worthy of a strict prison and very rigorous penitence."

In its whole history there is not one nun who stood out for her reputation for some sanctity. Three and a half centuries of existence terminated the decline. The death date of the last religious is unknown. Dedieu concludes that "Clares and Annonciades of Bordeaux did not seem to be aware of the spiritual riches infused into the life of the Church by their respective foundresses, Clare of Assist and Jeanne de France." Understatement indeed!

There was a later attempt to re-establish a Clare monastery in Bordeaux: The Sisters of Talence, coming in 1930, unable to maintain the monastery, withdrew to Pessac in 1980. Dedieu provides the reader with ample archival sources. One appendix gives a chronological repertory of the monastery personnel: On the very first abbess: Salimbene's Chronicles tell us that she was mean, stupid, avaricious, hard and without charity for the sisters under her supervision. She was the niece of Pope Innocent IV, which should count for something. Other appendices give plans of the monastery, maps of its placement in Bordeaux, layout of the monastery properties, a little Gascon vocabulary to aid the reader. But one is left wondering about those women who spent their lives in that religiously impoverished atmosphere. This is a valuable contribution to religious history, though its lack of narrative style could be off-putting to a less than determined reader.

Sister Helen Rolfson, O.S.E

StJohn's University
Collegeville, Minnesota

The Ladies of Zamora. By Peter Linehan. (University Park: The Pennsylvania State University Press. 1997. Pp. xvi, 192. $35.00.)

Set in the second half of the thirteenth century, this narrative of conflict between the newly established mendicant Order of Preachers and the bishop of Zamora eventually caused repercussions in the wider ecclesiastical world and

led to the downfall of the Dominican Master General. The tale begins when two aristocratic ladies established a convent of nuns following the rule of St. Augustine as adapted by the Friars Preacher. Initially their relations with Bishop Suero of Zamora, who was one of the most experienced curial hands in the court of Alfonso X of Castile-León, were harmonious enough.

In 1279, however, Bishop Suero felt obliged to conduct an inquiry concerning reports that Dominican friars were visiting the convent all too frequently and for other than spiritual purposes. The text of his inquiry (included with a translation in the appendix) forms the nucleus of this book. Put on their oath, more than thirty nuns pointed the finger at one another, speaking of the disruption of conventual life, failure to observe the rule and to obey the prioress, the arrogance of some who disdained to eat with or to associate with others, the reception of love letters from clerical lovers, and the scandalous behavior of sisters who fornicated with visiting friars. The convent was torn apart by hostility between those who preferred to remain obedient to the bishop and those who claimed the privileges given to the Order of Preachers.

The matter might have remained an internal affair within the diocese of Zamora, but word of this disgraceful conduct reached the Roman Curia. In 1281 Maria Martinez, the prioress of Las Dueñas, addressed a letter to Cardinal Ordoño Alvarez accusing Frey Munio, the friar provincial of León, of demanding that the nuns not submit to the bishop. Despite that, Frey Munio was elected as the Dominican Master General in 1285. Five years later, however, Pope Nicholas IV, without offering an explanation, ordered Frey Munio's dismissal. Linehan speculates that the unspoken reason was the prioress's accusatory letter; but whether Frey Munio was merely an enemy of episcopal control or a participant in the lewd revels of the convent is not at all clear. Although the Dominicans at first resisted the papal command, they eventually capitulated. Despite his disgrace, Frey Munio was later elevated to the see of Palencia, but was subsequently forced to resign by Boniface VIII, perhaps because he was thought to have had a hand in forging a papal bull legitimating the marriage of King Sancho IV to his cousin, María de Molina.

Relying on solid archival research, Linehan has woven together many diverse strands to present an account of significant interest to students of medieval ecclesiastical politics, the departure of the Dominicans from their original ideals, and the relations between convents of nuns and their male superiors, whether bishops or friars. Appendices, maps, plates, an extensive bibliography, and an index are helpful aids to readers of this intriguing volume.

Joseph F. O'Callaghan

Fordham University

Bettelorden in Stadt und Land: Die Strassburger Mendikantenkonvente und das Elsass im Spätmittelalter. By Andreas Rüther. [Berliner Historische Studien, Band 26; Ordensstudien XI.] (Berlin: Duncker & Humblot. 1997. Pp. 517; 17 graphs and maps. DM 138 paper.)

Since the publication of Jacques Le Goff's famous charge in the Annales in 1968,"ApostoIat mendiant et fait urbain dans la France médiévale," scholars have sought to situate the friars in the late-medieval city. Andreas Rüther has expanded the inquiry to the countryside. He selected Strasbourg because all four mendicant orders settled in the city in the thirteenth century and because of the extensive extant documentation. At the heart of Rüther's work is an analysis of the property transactions in which the brothers were involved: the date, the location, the type (anniversary, testamentary bequest, purchase of a rent, etc.), the amount, the person(s) involved, and the citation. His findings are summarized in a ninety-three-page appendix and plotted on seventeen graphs and maps.

In actuality most of his evidence concerns the Dominicans and, to a lesser degree, the Franciscans. For example, for the entire 300 years of the convents' existence, Rüther obtained the names of 640 brothers; of these, 380 were Dominicans, 160 Franciscans, but only seventy Augustinians and thirty Carmelites (p. 124). Similarly, more than half of the 500 transactions Rüther investigated involved the Dominicans and a quarter the Franciscans (p. 130). The Dominicans were by far the wealthiest mendicant order; the Dominicans' annual income in 1419 was £511, compared to £.250 each for the Franciscans and Augustinians, and only £90 for the Carmelites. However, even the Dominicans' income was modest compared to the £1 , 182 of the secular canons of St. Thomas (p. 320). As these facts suggest, many of the Friars Preachers were the sons of the Strasbourg elite. The Franciscans enjoyed the support of a broader spectrum of society, especially after 1349, when the guilds gained a greater voice on the Rat. Both orders, in contrast to the Augustinians and Carmelites, had a network of terminal houses and holdings in the countryside. Rüther argues that these are indirect evidence for the friars' rural apostolate. The property transactions are a testimony to the friars' integration into Alsatian society but also to their abandonment of their original ideal of poverty. Not surprisingly, there were already bitter confrontations in the thirteenth century, the worst in Germany, between the friars and the secular clergy and the Rat. By the fifteenth century both the Dominicans and Franciscans, who resisted all efforts at reform, had lost much of their popularity, if the decline in donations and members is a gauge; and all four houses quickly succumbed in the 1520's.

Rüther devotes only twenty-five pages to the cura monialium, much of it a discussion of the orders' changing stance on the problem. I believe that the friars' involvement with women is central to understanding the peculiarities of their position in Strasbourg. By 1237, thirteen years after the Dominicans' arrival, there were five Dominican nunneries in Strasbourg; there is no comparable case anywhere else in Europe. The Dominicans must thus have had from the beginning extensive ties to the urban and rural elites, even if they have left no

trace in the records. For their part the Franciscans cared for two houses of Poor Clares and many béguines; neither the Augustinians nor Carmelites shared in this apostolate. By omitting the women, Rüther has told only half the story.

John B. Freed

Illinois State University

The Register of John Waltham, Bishop of Salisbury, 1388-1395- Edited by T. C. B. Timmins. [The Canterbury and York Society, Vol. LXXX.] (Woodbridge, Suffolk, and Rochester, New York: The Boydell Press. 1994. Pp. xxiv, 331. $45.00/£25.00.

The Register of William Melton, Archbishop of York, 1317-1340, Volume IV Edited by Reginald Brocklesby. [The Canterbury and York Society, Vol. LXXXV] (Woodbridge, Suffolk, and Rochester, New York: The Boydell Press. 1997. Pp. vii, 246. $53-00/£29.50.)

These episcopal registers are but two recent achievements in the Canterbury and York Society's longstanding efforts to make original source collections more accessible to students of medieval English church history. Episcopal registers are generic compilations of diocesan business and bear the necessary mark of the official, the formulaic, and the routine. Paging through these registers, one finds records of usual activities—ecclesiastical institutions, ordinations, numerous kinds of licenses of exemption, records of litigation, memoranda, papal and royal correspondence. Nevertheless, each register is different in ways that describe the unique circumstances of time, geography, religion, administration, pastoral care, and the personality of the prelate who presided over the see.

William Melton's York register is a massive compilation of some 370 folios covering the broad range of archiépiscopal activities. His register is really a collection of separate gatherings representing the business of subsidiary jurisdictions (archdeaconries) and major categories of activity such as the work of suffragans, vicars general, and management of temporalities. This particular volume, fourth in the editions of materials from Melton's register, comprises the folios (400'-477r) devoted to the Archdeaconry of Nottingham. Even with this contribution, the better part of Melton's register remains still in its original manuscript form. This volume represents, in effect, a smaller register within a larger one; its contents are arranged chronologically and encompass the broad range of Melton's activities regarding that section of his archdiocese. Consequently, it can be read as a sort of administrative chronicle and discloses with occasionally fascinating detail the local church history of an archdeaconry in northern England. The editor, Reginald Brocklesby, has summarized in English many of the quotidian and repetitive entries of the register segment while rendering in full Latin transcriptions those records which he judged deserving of a fuller pre-

sentation. It is completely satisfying in this respect. What is unfortunately lacking in this edition is an even modest introduction which would have enhanced the value of this tome for historians by noting the historical context of this register and some of the textual challenges the editor faced.

The register of John Waltham, bishop of Salisbury and Treasurer of England from 1391 to his death in 1395, is edited here in full. Typical of most English registers past the mid-fourteenth century, it was arranged topically according to the main areas of diocesan business. Whatever its original order, it suffered from the hands of well-intentioned seventeenth-century archivists who struggled to rationalize its arrangement. T. C. B. Timmins has taken great care in reorganizing the register as close to its original form as possible This same care is present throughout, from the reproduction of marginalia to the extensive and historically useful appendices that comprise roughly a third of the volume. These include non-registered letters from Waltham's correspondence, royal presentations to Salisbury benefices, visitation fragments, and the bishop's itinerary. This edition will be of considerable value for medieval English historians for a variety of reasons: the bishop's stature as a political figure in the reign of Richard II, his energetic pursuit of heretics in his diocese, and an exceptional devotion to parochial visitation. Records of the latter events, especially, indicate the sort of theological and religious currents prevailing in late fourteenth-century Salisbury. Unlike the Melton fragment, this register is fully translated or summarized in English, but in a style which seems more abbreviated and clipped than the economy of an edition would seem to warrant. Still, the historical content is indisputably here, and it is of considerable value for the historian and archivist.

William J. Dohar, CS. C.

University of San Francisco

Conciliarism and Papalism. Edited by J. H. Burns and Thomas M. Izbicki. (New York: Cambridge University Press. 1997. Pp. xxxiii, 315. $59-95 hardcover; $22.95 paperback.)

Nearly a century after conciliarism's high-water mark at Constance, followed by a death knell with Pius IFs Execrabilis in 1460, its major points of contention bubbled up in 1511. The occasion was a council held in Pisa and then in Milan by a handful of dissident cardinals backed by France's Louis XII, who was at war with Pope Julius II. In response, Julius II called the Fifth Lateran Council, which met beginning in 1512. The dueling councils and rhetoric renewed a debate about conciliar and papal authority chronicled in this new set of translations. First Cajetan, master general of the Dominicans, staunchly defended papal monarchy in his Auctoritas papae et concilii sive ecclesiae comparata. Jacques Almain, barely two months after receiving his theology doctorate at Paris, answered Louis XIFs call for a rebuttal. Claiming the supremacy of a general coun-

cil over a pope, Almain argued that the Church is a collective body and the pope a delegated authority; the Church retains the right to defend herself, even if the danger comes from her own minister. The editors continue with Cajetan's answer and then add a coda to Almain's position drawn from John Mair's 1518 commentary on Matthew's gospel. The three authors pursue their central points by revisiting familiar questions: Tb whom did Christ bestow his authority? What is the relationship between pope and general council, especially in the case study of an heretical pontiff? What is the nature of ministerial power? How should the Church and council be understood as a body or community with respect to its head? Who cannot fail: pope or council?

The collection is very helpful because the juxtaposition of opposing viewpoints highlights their differences. The editors successfully walk a fine line between plodding and florid prose, a task that is especially difficult since the authors wrote in a very programmatic style. They allow the reader to hear the passion behind the debate, as when Almain with relish described Cajetan as "a man of learning—if only he had not marred his learning with the stain of flattery and striven to defame and revile with his insolent words the most holy Councils of Constance and Basel" (p. 134). The volume also fits comfortably in the series "Cambridge Texts in the History of Political Thought," because apart from the topic of council and pope, at issue more broadly is the matter of whether civil government is a viable model with which to pattern or even discuss ecclesiastical government. For Cajetan, the answer is no; for Almain and his mentor Mair, yes. This collection should find a home on the shelves of historians, theologians, political scientists, and their graduate students interested in late medieval ecclesiology, particularly since this battle was joined just as the issues of ecclesiastical polity and authority were about to be re-evaluated in Luther's challenge and Rome's response.

Christopher M. Belutto

St.Joseph's Seminary, Dunwoodie
Yonkers, New York

"Muèrent les moignes!" La révolte de Páyeme (1420). By Matthias Wirz. [Cahiers Lausannois d'histoire médiévale, Vol. 19] (Lausanne: Section d'histoire, Faculté des Lettres, Université de Lausanne. 1997. Pp. 336.)

On a Sunday in May, 1420, the cry, "Death to the monks!" was proclaimed by the burghers and others of the city of Payerne as they invaded the Cluniac priory with whom they shared space in the city and to the authority of whose prior they were subject. "Crows, crows! Caw, caw!" was shouted one evening in the church, as the monks in their black habits chanted (or croaked) the divine office. For those of us who wear the habit of the monachi nigri and sing the divine praises daily in our abbey churches, an uprising such as that of the Payernois is to be fervently avoided! Quod absit\

This fine book by Matthias Wirz has as its stated aim not only to present the history of the insurrection which lasted almost the whole of 1421 and to identify the main players in the revolt but also to uncover its causes, surely multiple, and its significance. The primary source for Wirz's investigation is the procès verbale of the inquest launched at Payerne soon after the troubles by commissioners of the duke of Savoy, Amadeus VIII. One-hundred forty-eight witnesses were questioned by the three commissioners within a few weeks of the final acts of insurrection; while their responses may vary according to the intelligence or degrees of participation in the revolt, the strength of their feelings is evident throughout the testimony. Unfortunately, none of the priory's monks was called as witness, and so we have only one side of the story.

The first half of the book divides itself into three sections. The first investigates the relations between the city and the priory and prior; the second describes the organization of the inquest made by the duke's commissioners, providing both a list of witnesses called and the questions they were asked. The third section discusses the revolt itself, the secret meetings of the discontented, the riots on the feast of the Epiphany and on Mardi Gras, and the violence throughout the rest of year until November. The second half of the work presents a very competent edition of the inquest plus three letters from Duke Amadeus, an account of a hearing held by the duke with the two parties present, and the questioning of the witnesses. It is provided with an adequate bibliography and an index of names of persons and places.

While the book could have been enriched by a comparison of the Payerne revolt with other insurrections against monasteries (Fleury or Vézelay, for instance), it is a welcome addition to the literature of popular revolts in the Middle Ages as well as to that of the delicate (or violent) interplay between monk, monastery, and society.

Thomas Suluvan, O.S.B.

Conception Abbey

Early Modern European

El Renacimiento y la otra España. Visión Cultural Socioespiritual. By José C. Nieto. [Travaux d'Humanisme et Renaissance, No. CCCXV] (Geneva: Librairie Droz, S.A. 1997. Pp. 855.)

In the last few decades, and continuing into the most recent years, the ambiguous and contested religious beliefs of such sixteenth-century figures as Contarini, Pole, Morone, and Carranza have been newly investigated by Spanish, Italian, British, and American scholars. From such research it has at least become clear how genuinely perplexing and dangerously uncertain were the precise bounds of Catholic orthodoxy in that century until the early stages of the Council of Trent in the mid-1540's. In the consequently difficult task of identi-

fying the beliefs held at precise dates by such figures, the example of Juan de Valdés, who moved from Spain to Italy, has naturally emerged as important, and in understanding him scholars have been able to draw on the monograph, of 1970, by José Nieto. Furthermore, the last few decades have also seen a transformation of scholarly knowledge of the Spanish Inquisition, thanks to excellent, detailed studies by Spanish and other historians. A volume as vast as the one considered here might therefore be expected to prove of great value, as a contribution to the historical debate which continues about the range of religious beliefs in both Spain and Italy in the sixteenth century. Sadly, despite a considerable number of stimulating suggestions and observations in this monumental work, it proves to make little contact with that debate. Indeed, the terms of the debate seem to be virtually ignored, despite some reference in passing to relevant work on Pole and Carranza, though not Morone or Contarini. Nor does there appear to be any recognition of the extensive new research, much of it written in Spanish, on the Spanish Inquisition. Moreover, in all this vast number of pages no archival references would seem to be included as the result of the author's own researches, the few that do feature being apparently cited via the secondary literature. That secondary reading itself, in the extensive footnotes as opposed to the concluding bibliography, presents an extraordinarily dated picture, not only with regard to the Spanish Inquisition, for example, but also with reference to biblical scholarship for instance, despite references to twentieth-century Catholic liberation theology. It is also alarming that, at least for events in sixteenth-century Europe outside Spain or involving more than Spain itself, amazing assertions have been left uncorrected, which cannot simply be errors of printing or proof-reading, such as the attribution of eight wives to Henry VIII or the statement that no English Catholics took refuge in Spain.

It is possible, however, that this volume will be of interest to students of Spanish literature rather than professional historians. For it is clearly a further contribution to an older debate, conducted in the past by famous Spaniards of the nineteenth and twentieth century, about Spain's 'true' identity or about Spain's 'exceptional' character within Europe. For despite some apparent disclaimers early in these leisurely and repetitive pages, the terms of that other debate are clearly the object of attack, as the majority of references makes abundantly clear, where even extensive quotations from primary literature, of the sixteenth century above all, are often reproduced via secondary authors. The most persistent theme, indeed, is the need to reject the famous view of Bataillon that much if not most of the religious dissidence in sixteenth-century Spain was not properly Protestant but in effect Erasmian. On the contrary, it is asserted, the generic use by the Spanish Inquisition, then and later, of the term 'Lutheran' for all forms of alleged Protestant heresy remained revealingly correct; in that at least some of the Spaniards whom it condemned or who fled from it into exile in the sixteenth century had adopted for themselves, within Spain itself, essentials of magisterial Protestant belief, such as the rejection of works in addition to faith as necessary to salvation. This, it is proposed, happened in cases even where no knowledge of Luther's specific teaching can be shown to have influ-

enced those in Spain, and reflected rather the results of a Christian Humanist reconsideration of scripture. Such independent and spontaneous dissent is at first linked to vestiges of late medieval Christian heresy in the Iberian peninsula, for initially the impact of converso culture is made marginal, as indeed are the alumbrados as such. But after extended treatment of dissidents who were condemned within Spain, whether considered here as truly Protestant or not, and of exiles, the influence of converso tradition re-emerges in appropriate cases. Adriano Prosperi has recently reminded us that, for the Italian sixteenth century, Cantimori distinguished between Protestants and 'heretics' among the Italian exiles. But here the contribution of converso thought to native Iberian dissent is seen not in respect of ritual orthodoxy but in the genesis of a free-thinking stance later epitomized outside Spain by Spinoza.

A. D. Wright

University of Leeds

Priests and Prelates of Armagh in the Age of Reformations, 1518-1558. By Henry A. Jefferies. (Dublin: Four Courts Press. Distributed by International Scholarly Book Services, Portland, Oregon. 1997. Pp. 213. $49.95.)

This is a solid contribution to the current debate on the reasons for the failure of the Reformation in Ireland. Jefferies has combed the registers, "broken" but invaluable, of Primates Cromer and Dowdall, draws upon valuations and inquisitions, and works in the findings of archaeologists and economic historians. He provides, in fact, an outline of socio-economic conditions in the Armagh archdiocese from the mid-fifteenth to the early seventeenth century, so that his work is wider in scope than the title indicates. But its main thrust is to challenge the prevailing view that the late medieval Irish church was in decline. Archiépiscopal rule was effective, whether exercised directly within the "English" portion (Co. Louth) of the archdiocese or indirectly, through dean and chapter, in the larger Gaelic area. Here Conn O'Neill's firm control was a support for the Church (as was O'Donnell control in Tir Conaill—the present reviewer's 1995 study indicating this appeared too late for Jefferies to make use of); while priestly training at Armagh and other centers was satisfactory. Jefferies has read Duffy, Haigh, and other recent historians of the English church to effect, but a study of Scottish work, particularly that of McKay and Donaldson, might have prompted him to pursue parallels within Gaeldom.

A surprisingly dense network of churches and chapels, staffed by a priesthood for the most part Gaelic (even within the Pale) and often very poor indeed, provided a pastoral care satisfactory to the laity, who supported the building and improvement of churches. The primates made effective use of annual synods (combining, it might be said, the elements of both modern diocesan retreat and in-service training), visitations, and consistorial courts. David Dumville has recently stressed the importance of councils and synods for main-

taining Christian standards in Gaeldom in the early and central Middle Ages. Jefferies' findings indicate that they continued valuable to the end. Limited in power of collation, archbishops by inquisitions could "screen" candidates. Concubinage seems to have been at about the general European level, the higher the more remote from the archbishop's glance. Primates in dealing with it hewed, of course, to the Roman line. Religious appear in ancillary role, especially as preachers. Given the Irish monastic tradition and the work of friars (e.g., in Dowdall's friary of Ardee) in providing poor and sick relief, something might have been made of direct pastoral care by the orders.

The understanding one had from Gwynn of Cromer as reluctant reformer and of Dowdall (this supported by Bradshaw) as good conservative Catholic is here confirmed. Edwardian Protestantism did not appeal to the laity, whose willingness to build and repair churches had, however, been sapped. Beneficiaries of monastic spoils were reluctant to invest in a Catholic restoration that might not last. Jefferies' study does not extend into the Elizabethan period, but he stresses two important factors which prevented the Reformation from making progress in Armagh: failure by the crown (itself a large impropriator) to finance churches and livings, and the lack of attraction these poor livings held for Protestant missionaries. But the inherent strengths of the pre-Reformation Church have to be counted in estimating why the Reformation failed "to strike deeper roots."

This study is closely argued and attractively laid out, if the print is small. Financial and other complexities are admirably clarified. But more editorial rigor was wanted to assist the transition from thesis to book. There is over-much repetition: for instance, we are told six times (twice on one page) that William Hamlin was vicar of St. Peter's, Drogheda. Punctuation is uncertain, while syntax is too often faulty (e.g., pp. 17, 66). There is no guide to abbreviations; citation of sources is too inconsistent; the bibliography is slipshod, and the index far from complete. Richard FitzRalph is canonized (pp. 146, 162); and "rights" appears for "rites" (p. 166). Such minor irritants apart, Jefferies has taught us much; and this productive scholar's work is ongoing.

John J. Silke

Portnablagh, Co. Donegal

Tolerance and Intolerance in the European Reformation. Edited by Ole Peter Grell and Bob Scribner. (New York: Cambridge University Press. 1996. Pp. x, 294.)

Accepted theories about the growth of tolerance through the Renaissance and Reformation are corrected in this collection of essays by noted Reformation scholars. From Britain through Scandinavia and Eastern Europe to Italy and Spain, these scholars examine the attitudes of Protestant churches toward other

forms of Protestantism and, in several instances, toward Catholicism. The overall impression is not surprising to anyone familiar with the disputes that turned Europe into a bloody battlefield during the late sixteenth century and into the seventeenth century. Ole Peter Grell (p. 5) illustrates the sort of change that occurred in Luther himself: early on, Luther argued that religion was a matter of conscience and individual responsibility; the use of force was unjust. But almost immediately he called in secular powers to deal with blasphemy and sedition and so began the persecution of the Anabaptists that continued relentlessly through the century. It soon became manifest that churches backed by political power became intolerant and did not hesitate to engage secular power to punish offenders against true religion; minority churches, on the other hand, argued for tolerance.

But before one can discuss tolerance, one must know what the word meant in the sixteenth century. It meant "bearing with" someone or something that one finds unpleasant, as in "I found the food barely tolerable, but I shall tolerate it if I must." Today's notion of tolerance as acknowledging the right of all to religious liberty was far from the minds of sixteenth-century churchfolk. Bob Scribner argues effectively that both early Lutheran and Erasmian notions of tolerance "were all overridden in the course of the early Reformation" (p. 34). Scribner then outlines nine different types of tolerance in the sixteenth century, while Diarmaid MacCulloch's discussion is based on four attitudes of a dominant church toward minority groups: "concord by coercion, concord by discussion, tolerance and religious freedom" (p. 200). "Religious freedom" seems to have been found nowhere, at least in the sense that we understand it today. The essays in this volume lead one to conclude that the first and third possibilities occurred most frequently with an edge given to "concord by coercion."

The leading chapter, by Heiko Oberman, probes "the profile of pre-Lockean rationality in sixteenth-century Europe" by examining three test cases: of a woman accused of being a witch, of Jews and Marranos, and of religious dissent. From these cases, Oberman concludes that before the Reformation, "at the beginning of the century essential legal institutions and ideological convictions were already in place" so that during the sixteenth century, "old resources were mobilized and new solutions advanced, which mark the turn to that rationality which John Locke would proclaim as the foundation of a 'modern' tolerant society" (p. 31).

Philip Benedict's essay provides a fine sense of how France came to terms with two faiths through practical necessity and political expediency. Lorna Jane Abray in a well-researched, nicely argued essay, examines the limits of magisterial tolerance in Strassburg. Euan Cameron's fine chapter on Protestant identities in the later Reformation in Germany should have included, I think, some discussion of how Elizabeth of England's efforts to form a Protestant League were not only frustrated by German Lutheran lords but flatly countered by Lutheran troops sent to aid the cause of the French Catholic King against his Calvinist

subjects, an attitude summed up by Jacob Andreae's remark that a Jesuit is preferable to a Calvinist!

Hans Guggisberg's fascinating tale of the highly principled but unhappy Sebastian Castellio shows how vacillating was Basel's policy in the face of pressure from Calvin and Beza in Geneva. Guggisberg also argues that the "tolerance" of Basel was based more upon economic expediency than Erasmian humanism. The chapter is marred, however, by odd punctuation and nearly incoherent sentences that a sharp blue pencil should have corrected. The story of the London Reformed community and its trials after its expulsion under Queen Mary demonstrates how little tolerance the community learned from its own bitter experiences of intolerance. At every stage of its peregrinations, the group led by John à Lasco aided authorities in the persecution of Anabaptists, even those who had shared their homes with the weary refugees!

Cynicism seems to mark the attitude of both the politics of toleration in the Free Netherlands (Andrew Pettegree's essay) and that of Archbishop Cranmer (Diarmaid MacCulloch). Both persecuted Catholics and Anabaptists whenever they had political backing and argued for tolerance when they themselves were threatened. Norah Carlin's chapter, "Tolerance for Catholics in the Puritan revolution," challenges older scholarship. Not from Arminianism, but from the Levellers came true tolerance that included even Roman Catholics! The separation of church and state, which alone allows for the development of true tolerance, was the ground upon which Levellers and other Puritans (Roger Williams) argued for a toleration wider than that advocated by Locke forty years later, for Locke's "tolerance" excluded Catholics.

The last three chapters deal with eastern Europe: Bohemia, Moravia Oaroslav Pánek), Hungary (Katalin Péter), and Prussia and Poland-Lithuania (Michael G. Müller). The movement in Bohemia and surrounding lands was from a politically necessary toleration of Hussites by a Catholic royal house to an increasing intolerance fired by confessionalism and nationalism that divided "orthodox" Lutherans from other Protestants and both from Catholics, a sad concluding note.

I have not done justice to this fine array of essays, which ought to be required reading for all European historians and historians of ideas as well as those in the field of religious studies.

JillRaitt

The University ofMissouri, Columbia

Im Schatten der Confessio Augustana: Die Religionsverhandlungen des Augsburger Reichstages 1530 im historischen Kontext. Edited by Herbert Immenkötter and Günther Wenz. [Reformationsgeschictliche Studien und Texte, Band 136.] (Münster: Aschendorff. 1997. Pp. vi, 226. DM 80,-.)

The present volume is a collection of papers from a conference held at Augsburg in 1994 concerned with the discussions in the summer of 1530 that led to the Confessio Augustana and its Catholic refutation. By looking beyond the Protestants' Confession, the imperial Confutation, and Melanchthon's Apology, the authors of these essays have provided rare glimpses into the deliberations at Augsburg and new insights into the theological significance of the texts those deliberations produced.

Several contributors continue well-established lines of inquiry into partisan politics before and after the Diet. Among these are Rolf Decot, whose study of the history of political jurisdiction over religious affairs sets the 1530 Diet in contrast to medieval conceptions of the unity of church and empire and in harmony with assumptions in effect since the Diet of Speyer in 1526 and the church visitations that followed it. Eugène Honée, the dean of historians of the Diet, argues from his knowledge of the negotiations that the August and September proceedings, usually seen as different initiatives, should actually be seen as a single movement. Thus even though the Protestant minority changed its position during these months, the Catholic majority maintained continuity. And working from newly published sources, notably her own 1992 volume in the "Deutsche Reichstagsakten," Rosemarie Aulinger describes the efforts of Catholic princes from Mainz and the Palatinate to achieve peace with the Protestants. Aulinger's analysis, and the texts appended to it, provide valuable context for understanding the Nuremberg Peace of 1532.

Other essays are concerned with issues in the history of dogma, and rely on material that has long been available but not yet exhausted. These include Günther Wenz's study of the conflict over administering the cup to the laity, in which he makes careful use of a German translation, published by Theodor Kolde in 1906, of the (lost) Latin "ur-text" of CA 22. The late Bernhard Lohse's contribution assesses Erasmus's influence on participants at the Diet. Through scrupulous reading of the surviving correspondence Lohse finds an Erasmus far more conservative than the Protestant sympathizer of conventional historiography. As it turns out, Erasmus was fully informed of the proceedings at Augsburg, and hoped that the Emperor, as the Pope's agent, would allow no deviation from the Roman faith.

Christian Peters makes use of both published and unpublished material in his exploration of the genesis of Melanchthon's Apology. By means of scrupulous analysis of Melanchthon's surviving correspondence, Peters has discovered that the quarto edition that had appeared by early May, 1531, and which has been regarded as the authoritative version, was in fact only a provisional response

to the Confutatio, and that the long-neglected octavo edition that appeared in September of that year must be considered the definitive form of Melanchthon's Apology, especially with respect to the doctrines of justification, penance, and the Mass. As Peters makes clear here and in his fuller study, Apologia Confessionis Augustanae (Stuttgart, 1997), Melanchthon revised these articles, and especially the fourth article, on justification, carefully between May and August, 1531.

Not all of the papers focus on the events of 1530 or their aftermath; indeed the "shadow" of the title extends far, to remind us that the Diet was but one episode in a long course of development. In this spirit Reinhard Schwarz contributed two studies, one of Eck's doctrine of concupiscence in a series of theses for disputation from 1519, and the other of the degree of agreement on theological anthropology that can be found between Eck and Melanchthon. Schwarz finds the origins of Eck's position both in 1530 and at Regensburg in 1541 in these early theses, and also sees that differences between Eck and Melanchthon which had begun as semantic disagreements became substantive differences after 1530.

In his introductory essay Herbert Immenkötter makes note of the complexity of the documentary evidence that needs to be assessed before we can have a clear understanding of the Diet of Augsburg. The diversity of approaches employed in these essays on such a wide range of texts demonstrates that intensive research into even the most familiar events continues to yield rich historical and ecumenical benefits.

Ralph Keen

University of Iowa

The Christian's ABC. Catechisms and Catechizing in England c. 1530-1740. By Ian Green. (New York: Clarendon Press, Oxford University Press. 1996. Pp. xiv, 767. $125.00.)

It has been two decades since Jean Delumeau drew attention to the parallel efforts made by Protestants and Catholics in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries to raise the level of religious knowledge and spiritual awareness among their co-religionists. Although he does not endorse all of the Frenchman's sweeping generalizations, Ian Green, reader in modern history at Queen's University in Belfast, has compiled and collated an enormous amount of data that support Delumeau's principal argument. He draws on Prayer Book rubrics, royal injunctions, visitation articles, episcopal circulars, sermons, pamphlets, and a variety of treatises of the time. Green's principal source, however, is "the several hundred" Protestant catechisms composed between the Reformation and the early eighteenth century that come in a "bewildering variety" from

multi-volume works to booklets of a few pages, from question-and-answer-form to lengthy treatises.

Green divides his study into three parts. The five chapters in Part One describe the "medium," that is, the catechetical tradition(s) and theory, the tasks and techniques as they were practiced in church, school, and home. Green argues convincingly that catechizing "was not one but a series of activities and was not set in tablets of stone but forever adjusting to new situations and ideas." The Book of Common Prayer, metrical psalms, hymns, and preaching are some of the means that reinforced the memorization and retention of catechetical formulae.

Part Two concentrates on the "message" found in a selection of "best-selling or influential catechisms." Most focus on the four "staples" of catechesis—the Apostles' Creed, the Decalogue, the Lord's Prayer, and the Sacraments (baptism, holy communion). While some offer tell-tale clues to the theological leanings of their authors, for the most part the catechisms eschew polemics and deal cautiously with controversial points or simply omit them as in the cases of church government and forms of worship. In chapters 8 ("Predestination") and 9 ("Assurance, Justification, and the Covenant of Grace"), Green explores the most divisive issues of the time, and notes that the conformists and "godly" authors parted ways when it came to the role of the visible church vis-à-vis a theoretical ordo salutis. Despite the acrimony they displayed in their theological treatises, most authors muted their differences in the catechisms.

Part Three presents "A Finding List of English Catechisms." The list will be of special interest to librarians who must catalogue old and rare books because it offers detailed information about catechisms "produced, used, or recommended" in England c. 1530-1740. Green, careful to the point of tedium in his analysis of the sources, has produced a work that will be of interest to specialists in ecclesiastical, theological, devotional, educational, social, political, and literary history. In addition, he cites a broad range of secondary studies, including many doctoral dissertations produced in the United States, that students of the period will find helpful.

Readers might find themselves awash in detail were it not for Green's orderly introductions and clear summaries at the end of each chapter. The wealth of information he provides that is not readily available elsewhere even justifies the monograph's price. In addition Green's work opens new areas for research. He suggests, for example, that it would be worthwhile to compare the catechetical instruction presented to catechumens with the more advanced teaching given to churchmen. It might help explain why the churchmen, at first concerned with knowledge of the catechism, later in the seventeenth century shifted their emphasis to the understanding of doctrine. At the very end of the book, he raises the issue of rhetoric in general and religious language in particular, and concludes with the statement, "Perhaps the language of catechisms should be added to the growing list of modes of discourse in use in the early modern pe-

riod, and its relationship to those other modes examined more closely." This is simply the last aside in a work that is filled with provocative statements.

Berard L. Marthaler, O.F.M. Conv.
The Catholic University of America

The English Reformation and the Laity: Gloucestershire, 1540-1580. By Caroline Litzenberger. [Cambridge Studies in Early Modern British History.] (New York: Cambridge University Press. 1997. Pp. xvii, 218. $54.95.)

This important new book studies the impact of the various Henrician, Edwardian, Marian, and Elizabethan religious settlements on parish life in Gloucestershire. The author finds that the local reception of the official changes in liturgy, beliefs, and architectural setting signified more a withdrawal from Catholicism than a purposeful move toward Protestantism, and this situation persisted into the 1580's. That there was a distinction between the official and the popular reformations has long been recognized, as well as the fact that the English Reformation was a slow and delayed process—not only in many rural areas, but even in urban centers such as London. What particularly distinguishes this study is Dr. Litzenberger's reluctance to employ the labels Catholic and Protestant to describe people caught in such a shifting morass of changing religious settlements. Despite the efforts of the government to enforce religious uniformity by various Acts of Parliament, a range of popular religious opinions emerged that was too diverse to be subsumed by such labels.

The distinguishing methodology of this book is its thorough analysis of the preambles of last wills and testaments employing subtle distinctions of doctrinal belief which are then grouped into categories of traditional, ambiguous, and Protestant for purposes of quantification. More than 8,000 wills for Gloucester diocese survive from the period 1541 to 1580, and the author has scrutinized nearly half of the total, decade by decade. They are broken down into categories of gentry and commonalty, and include the wills of 1,325 women. The gentry were much more receptive to Protestant ideas during this period than ordinary folk, but their response certainly was not overwhelming; not until the late 1570's did their acceptance of Protestant doctrine approach 50% of the total. As for non-elite preambles, the expression of Protestant belief barely reached the 10% level by the mid-1570's. Instead of enthusiastically embracing the Protestant Reformation the overwhelming proportion of both elites and non-elites sought refuge in ambiguous preambles—especially when a particular religious settlement did not agree with a particular individual's own beliefs.

If Gloucester diocese is at all typical, what the author is telling us is that the English people gradually became Protestant by a kind of osmosis, i.e., the laity gradually absorbed Protestant culture and beliefs by exposure to the liturgy of

The Book of Common Prayer and reading of printed homilies in a setting stripped bare of Catholic images, rituals, and sacramentáis. Among other influences, Dr. Litzenberger discounts the leadership of the bishops of Gloucester, which was feeble, the preaching of sermons by the clergy, who were mostly unlearned, and the leadership of the gentry, who were faction-ridden.

Dr. Litzenberger's bottom-up approach to religious change is both refreshing and useful. However, considering how little progress distinctively Protestant ideas had made in Gloucester diocese by 1580, one could wish that the author had carried her study of the preambles of wills through to the end of the reign of Elizabeth. J. A. Froude was not the only historian who thought that England did not become Protestant in belief and culture until after 1588. Also, the thesis of protestantization by osmosis might carry more weight if Dr. Litzenberger had done a systematic study of the parochial clergy and also carried such a study down to the end of the reign. As it is, her evidence on the parish clergy, their lack of educational attainments, and the infrequency of preaching rests too much upon anecdote and stands in contrast to her very thorough, systematic, and persuasive study of the preambles of the last wills and testaments of Gloucestershire men and women. In other English dioceses, reforming bishops and Puritan patrons and magistrates had made considerable strides in improving the performances of parish clergy by the 1590's. Since the universities began to produce Protestant graduates of ability in sufficient numbers only in the 1570's, one can object that a reforming movement could hardly have made much headway by 1580, the terminal date of this book.

Roger B. Manning

Cleveland State University

I tempi del Concilio. Religione, cultura e società nell'Europa tridentina. Edited by Cesare Mozzarelli and Danilo Zardin. ["Europa délie Corti": Centro studi sulle società di antico regime. Biblioteca del Cinquecento, 70.] (Rome: Bulzoni Editore. 1997. Pp. 491. Lire 60.000.)

Nineteen essays, originally read as papers at a meeting in Trent in October, 1994, constitute this hefty volume dealing with religion, culture, and society in Europe during the second half of the sixteenth century. The length of the essays varies greatly: while most are printed conference papers, a few have been expanded into full articles. The majority of the contributions discuss specific aspects of the impact that the Council of Trent had on Europe.

Topics of individual essays range from examinations of how Tridentine decrees were applied to discussions of the council's effects on confraternities, models of sanctity, the ideal of the bishop, the Roman Inquisition, books on comportment, advice on the family, art, architecture, theater, and music. A number of the contributions remain fragments or drafts of what might become in-

teresting longer pieces. However, most are well worth reading because of their sound scholarship and useful bibliographies.

In my opinion, a few essays stand out and should be mentioned more specifically. By far the longest piece in the book is Agostino Borromeo's very useful "Italian Bishops and the Application of the Council of Trent." With his customary expertise, and on the basis of a survey of research of the last half-century, Borromeo concludes that Italian bishops were slower and less eager to apply Tridentine norms than older literature suggests. He focuses on episcopal residence (generally observed), the calling of provincial councils (progressively neglected), diocesan synods (called pretty regularly by the majority of bishops), pastoral visitations (generally conducted, but at longer intervals than the council recommended), and establishment of seminaries (slow). A companion piece to the above is Gigliola Fragnito's "Bishops and Religious Orders in Italy after the Council." She discusses in greater detail the problem of episcopal power when confronted with the growing influence of Roman congregations in the internal affairs of the Church. Drawing on her vast knowledge of archival material documenting the working of the Congregations of the Index and Inquisition, she argues that the role of the bishops was diminished and that the "coercive apparatus" of the post-Tridentine Church was privileged at the expense of ordinaries and the education of the diocesan clergy, as envisioned by the council.

Other articles of interest to historians are Massimo Firpo's "The 'Beneficio di Cristo' and the Council of Trent (1542-1546)" which reiterates several of his controversial theses found in previous publications, notably those casting doubt on the very existence of Catholic reform before Trent, and pointing to a severe ideological split between factions of Catholic cardinals and prelates. John Tedeschi in "A New Perspective on the Roman Inquisition" summarizes the results of his research into the history of that institution and the nature of inquisitorial procedures. He restates his conclusion that the tribunal of the Inquisition had a higher regard for careful judicial procedures and for human rights than other tribunals at the time. Genoveffa Palumbo brings together some interesting visual material in her "The Use of Images. Books of Saints, Books for Preachers, Doctrinal Pamphlets after the Council of Trent." She shows how images were used to reinforce social order and discourage any attempt to move beyond one's state or place in life. The last was particularly important in the instruction of women.

Space precludes discussion of each essay. As a whole, the collection is uneven, as is true for most volumes of this kind. But together, the essays illustrate many aspects of post-Tridentine Catholicism and culture and add to our knowledge of Counter-Reformation Europe, which currently is an area of innovative and lively scholarship.

EUSABETH G. GIEASON

University of San Francisco

Robert Parsons and English Catholicism, 1580-1610. By Michael L. Carrafiello. (Selinsgrove: Susquehanna University Press; London: Associated University Press. 1998. Pp. 186. $34.50.)

The past decade has witnessed a resurgence of scholarly interest in Robert Parsons. Victor Houliston's preparation of a critical edition of Parsons's most influential work, best known as The Christian Directory but initially published as The first booke of the Christian exercise (n.p. [Rouen], 1582), has generated a few articles. John Bossy has re-examined the source of much of Parsons's subsequent notoriety: his political activities in the early 1580's (e.g., their articles in The Reckoned Expense: Edmund Campion and the Early English Jesuits, ed. Thomas M. McCoog, SJ. [Woodbridge, 1996]). Two full-scale biographies have finally appeared: Robert Persons 'el architraidor': Su vida y su obra (1546-1610) (Madrid, 1990) by Federico Eguiluz and Robert Persons: The Biography of an Elizabethan fesuit (St. Louis, 1995) by Francis Edwards. Parsons also played a not insignificant role in my The Society of Jesus in Ireland, Scotland, and England, 1541-1588: "Our Way of Proceeding?" (Leiden, 1996, reviewed by Dr. Carrafiello in this journal ante, LXXXIII [October, 1997], 805-806). Unfortunately, this renaissance has passed generally unnoticed by Dr. Carrafiello. With the exception of Edwards' biography and my history, which are acknowledged in one footnote with the curt comment, "Jesuit historians like McCoog and Edwards have downplayed the political activism of their clerical predecessors" (p. 149, n. 3), Carrafiello discusses none of the above works. Indeed, only five works published since the completion of his doctoral thesis in 1987 are listed in the bibliography. Instead of building his position on a critical examination of the above-mentioned works and observing the new directions in recusant historiography charted by recent research of Alexandra Walsham, Michael Questier, Peter Lake, and others, the author situates his discussion of Parsons in the context of the Christopher Haigh and Patrick McGrath debate over revisionism in the mid-1980's and discusses anachronistic issues, e.g., why a "political biography of Parsons has not surfaced" (p. 11).

The author's sins of omission, unfortunately, are not restricted to secondary literature. In an "Appendix on Sources," Carrafiello says nothing about the Archivum Romanum Societatis Iesu, the single most important archives for a study of Parsons. Thus he ignores many important letters from Parsons to Claudio Acquaviva, the Jesuit Father General, from the early 1580's—letters discovered since Leo Hicks's edition of Parsons's pre-1589 correspondence in 1942—and from the 1590's. The archives at Stonyhurst College, although mentioned in the appendix, were not consulted. Instead he relied on photocopies at the Jesuit Provincial Archives in London because "the original collection at Stonyhurst is not open to the lay public or to the academic community at large"—an allegation easily refuted by many scholars who have ventured into the Lancashire countryside to peruse its manuscripts. Given these limitations, it is not surprising that "the prevailing view of Parsons" (p. 14) challenged by the author is no longer prevalent. Only uninformed "Current opinion on Parsons de-

clares that he was an ardent and monolithic supporter of Spain from the moment of his arrival in England in the 1580s" (p. 13); the better informed would have read A. Lynn Martin's seminal treatment of Parsons's "Scottish strategy" and subsequent involvement with the Catholic League in France (Henry III and the Jesuit Politicans [Geneva, 1973]). Useful summaries of A conference about the next succession to the crowne of Ingland (n.p., 1594), uncritically attributed to Parsons despite scholarly disagreement, and the "Memorial for the Reformation of England" are vitiated by unsubstantiated assertions: e.g., the top priority of the Jesuit mission to England was "toppling" the Elizabethan regime (p. 23), and reliance on misdated documents (see my reply, ante [April, 1998], 302-304).

Thomas M. McCoog, SJ.

Jesuit Archives, London

Landmarking: City, Church & Jesuit Urban Strategy. By Thomas M. Lucas, SJ. (Chicago: Loyola Press. 1997. Pp. xvi, 244. $34.95.)

Two distinct areas of inquiry—the history of the Society of Jesus and the history of Roman urbanism—meet in Thomas M. Lucas's Landmarking in a rare co-operative venture. On the one hand, this book makes an important contribution to the burgeoning interest in urban studies of the baroque period by connecting the concrete choices made by the earliest Jesuits in Rome and elsewhere about where to build, to the specific demands of the Jesuit ministry as they were shaped. Landmarking is adamantly about where to build, not what or how and so bypasses all of the issues of style that have dominated the discussion of Jesuit architecture until recently. On the other hand, Landmarking is very much about St. Ignatius of Loyola, recasting the founder as a man of pragmatic piety, or pious pragmatism, whose far-reaching vision led him to devote a surprising amount of his own energy to building the future of the Society, more brick by brick, than soul by soul.

The opening chapter traverses the Jesuit world, from Asia to Latin America, offering up suggestive juxtapositions of Jesuit urban strategies. From surprise usurpment (Goa), miraculous intervention (Peru), the argument of the legal brief (San Francisco), adaptive transformation (a barroom turned church in the Bowery), to the ingratiating effect of quinine (Beijing), the Jesuits from the sixteenth century to the present, Lucas argues, adapted their strategies for obtaining property to the situation at hand. This reading emphasizes Jesuit flexibility over fixed positions or rules, an argument that is hardly surprising; indeed that "flexibility" was perennially a much-criticized aspect of the Jesuit approach to moral and theological issues. But in this post-Colonial era, accommodation is one of the most recuperative ideas in Jesuit studies, one which recasts the Jesuits as much more sympathetic agents at the very forefront of complex encounters with alterity.

Before arriving at the central core of Lucas's original research on the subject, a rereading of the entire corpus of Ignatius's formidable correspondence—more than 9,000 letters—in light of urban stratagem with extensive statistical analysis of the subject in appendices, Lucas sets a couple of stages. He casts the modernity of Ignatius's methods against his "feudal" upbringing, showing how cosmopolitan he must have become by the time he gave up the pilgrim's cape and settled in Rome in 1537. Lucas dwells on the tension in the earliest years of the association between the unrootedness of pilgrimage (which Ignatius and the early companions yearned for intensely) and the decision ultimately taken to institutionalize the group and thereby establish fixed residences, while the special fourth vow of obedience to the pope to undertake missionary work opened up the possibility for any Jesuit to be rooted elsewhere.

To set these crucial decisions in context Lucas undertakes (Chaps. Ill-V) a very broad survey of the history and vicissitudes of the Christian pull to and away from the city, from Christ's own apostolate in Galilee, Paul's traversing of the Mediterranean world, to Constantine's political and urban strategies for locating the Church in Rome, caput mundi. With the pessimistic turn inward in Augustine's Civitas Dei, the city of man became an unsatisfactory way-station, almost desacralized. The rise of monasticism as a retreat from the city of man, a walled Utopian alternative, preceded the renewal of urban life in the communal period, coinciding with the rise of the mendicant orders, the competitive Franciscans and Dominicans who really set the stage for the Jesuits. Lucas highlights that these orders, in jockeying for position in dense urban fabrics, compelled legislation mandating fixed distances between religious houses, making it more difficult for the orders of the future to find footholds in cities already crowded with large religious complexes. And so it was fortuitous for the Jesuits that a new vortex of Rome's sprawling "center" was opening up with the reconstruction by Paul III of the Campidoglio. That is the site that would be settled on by Ignatius for the first Jesuit foundation (the Gesù and Casa Professa complex), but not without a period of intense decision-making about what the newly founded Society should do and therefore where they should be. Lucas shows us in greater detail than any before him that the site was chosen not only because it bordered with a papal palace (S. Marco) and with the seat of civic government, but was at the crossroads of the various needy communities on which their broad-minded urban ministry set its sights.

In one of the most interesting chapters of this book Lucas analyzes the language and substance of the early debates about the goals of the Society, tying that language to choices about location. He shows, through close reading of letters and documents, that the persistent emphasis on the "greater service of God" and the "more universal good" translated, effectively, as a self-conscious definition and targeting of a mass audience. Hence it is no wonder that the Jesuits became immediately controversial, with Ignatius writing to one of his companions in Florence only eight years after the founding of the Society, "We [already] have a reputation among some persons who do not trouble to find out the truth, especially here in Rome, that we would like to rule the world."

The perception that the Jesuits were intent on worldwide dominion, warranted or not, persisted, becoming a major leitmotif in the study of Jesuit architecture from art history's beginnings. While Lucas does not engage with the historiography around Jesuit architecture and the much-vexed issue of the Jesuit style (and this counts as something of a weakness here, given the rich literature on the subject), Landmarking makes three major contributions to that critical debate that should be highlighted.

The literature on the Jesuit style in architecture was inspired in part, and rightly so, by the clear institutional framework created by the Jesuits for building: basic guidelines about where and how to build, officials put in charge of supervising design worldwide, and, at one time even a proposal of building typologies for Jesuit churches. That history rehearsed many times in the literature and again in Landmarking in greater detail, has only recently proven useful once more as a framework for study. In addition to putting into a much richer context the where of Jesuit building, Lucas shows that those institutional rules in general and around building in particular were the product of a broader formulation, after Ignatius's death, of the founder's own practices. For example, the famous position of building supervisor, or revisore, was essentially the codification of a role Ignatius insisted on playing personally. In this sense Landmarking provides the genealogy of Jesuit rules for building in Ignatian practice.

Second, Lucas makes his own argument for a model of the Jesuit "modo nostro urbanístico" based on accommodation. There is a precedent even within the problematic discussion on Jesuit architectural style for emphasizing adaptivity over the idea of a fixed position, namely, in the very early studies (1907-1913) of Jesuit architecture in Spain, Belgium, and Germany by Joseph Braun, who proved that the Jesuits often built in a local style rather than imposing a singular Roman style on "submissive" cities, as the myth of the Jesuit style held. While Lucas's approach does not pretend to displace the study of Jesuit architecture in its traditional terms (namely style), he shows us that what surrounds the Jesuit building was every bit as important for our understanding of Jesuit-ness, as the building itself.

Finally, Lucas's study offers more fuel to the fire of the Jesuit style issue by demonstrating, not through buildings, but through letters and documents in which the structure of the Society was being worked out, that Rome had paradigmatic value in the Society. The Jesuits dictated interconnectedness through the regulated exchange of letters and reports, and they seem to have been careful to generate a desire for knowledge of what was going on in Rome. The imitation of Jesuit buildings in Rome (not always, but often enough) by far-flung Jesuits (from Sicily to Krakow) has been at the core of the debate about the "Jesuit style." Lucas does not address this subject directly, but the evidence he provides about centralization is extremely suggestive for this issue as well, and art historians would be advised to explore it further.

For readers already well-versed in the history of Roman urbanism and the history of monasticism, Landmarking may not offer enormous surprises until it arrives at the Ignatian material. Many of the individual chapters of the book synthesize previous scholarship and the primary research is limited to a thorough reading of Ignatius's letters, which while published, because they are in three languages and vast, are understudied. They certainly have never been looked at with Jesuit urbanism in mind. Nonetheless, this is a very sensitive work of synthesis, which carves out a new subject through a "discerning" weaving together of various heretofore disparate histories. What emerges from this broad sweep of the history of the Church, the city, Ignatius, and the early self-fashioning of the Society, is an immensely rich sense of purpose that, once forged out of contradictory traditions and impulses, radiated outward from Rome to all corners of the earth. Lucas calls it "a strategy."

One final word about Ignatius. Landmarking is in many senses a work of revisionist hagiography, a recasting of the founder of the Society of Jesus as a deeply practical man. While the Jesuits have always revered Ignatius as their founder (indeed one of his seventeenth-century hagiographers argued that his greatest miracle was the founding of the Society itself), they recognized in the seventeenth century that Ignatius was not a "popular" saint. The kind of organizational prowess that Lucas underscores here was not a criterion for sainthood in his time. One senses that Ignatius, in the late twentieth century, is coming into his own. As a Jesuit himself (who, Ignatian-style, undertook the restoration of the rooms in which Ignatius devised his strategies) Thomas Lucas has lessons from the Society's past for the Jesuits of today. The Society, he notes in his conclusion to Landmarking, affirmed their historic mission in the urban centers of the world in their most recent general congregation. But I wonder, if Ignatius were alive today, whether he wouldn't be setting his sights on suburbia, on those malls, where he would find the needy and the elite in close proximity and in great numbers.

Evonne Levy

University of Toronto

Tibet. The Jesuit Century. By Philip Caraman, SJ. [Number 20 in Series 4: Studies in Jesuit Topics.] (St. Louis: Institute of Jesuit Sources. 1997. Pp. viii, 154. $14.95 paperback.)

This short study describes the perilous journeys of Jesuits during the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries who discovered Tibet, where they established missions that might serve as intersecting points of a land route between China and India. Akbar the Great (1542-1605) of the Mughal Empire gave letters of introduction to Brother Bento de Goes (1563-1607), who left Agra in 1602 and reached Suzhou (Jiuquan xian) in western China via Kabul and the southern Gobi desert. Although he proved that Cathay and China were identical, some

confreres in Goa still heard accounts of Christian communities north of India. Intent on finding such communities, Antonio de Andrade (1580-1634) entered Tsaparang and sent his report that became "the first book ever written on Tibet." In Tsaparang the Jesuits set the cornerstone of the first Christian church in Tibet in 1626. The mission lasted only a few years due to widespread persecution. Earlier that same year Estavão Cacella and Joào Cabrai (1598-1669) made their way to Shigatse, the city of the Panchen Lama. To report on the prospects of a mission there, Cabrai returned to Patna, India, via Katmandu. Cacella made his way to Bengal, where he got a Jesuit companion to accompany him back to Shigatse. The companion died en route. Cacella re-entered Shigatse but died there within a week of his arrival. Thereafter the Jesuits decided that missionary work in Tibet should be temporarily halted.

With another Jesuit johann Grueber (1623-1680) left Rome in 1656 with orders to find a land route to China via Persia. This was impossible because of a war between Persia and its neighbors. Via Surat, India, and then the sea route to Macao, Grueber eventually reached Beijing. There he received orders to continue his exploration for a land route in reverse, that is, to proceed to India from Beijing. Grueber and his Belgian companion, Albert d'Orville (1621-1662), were the first Europeans to reach Lhasa. Grueber's drawing of the Pótala Palace, the residence of the Dalai Lama, was the only one published until a photograph appeared in 1901. Upon returning to Rome, Grueber indicated that the advantages and disadvantages of the sea and land routes were almost the same.

With what he considered papal approval personally given to him Ippolito Desideri (1684-1733) entered Lhasa in 1716 to establish a mission. Later, however, Propaganda Fide ordered him to leave and assigned the mission to the Capuchins. During his stay, Desideri, with his command of Tibetan, was engaged in philosophical discussions with the monks concerning Buddhist ideals and practices. His extensive 600-page manuscript account of Tibet, edited in 1904, established him in the eyes of Sven Hedin as "one of the most brilliant travellers who ever visited Tibet."

In addition to typographical errors, e.g., in Hedin's name, Caraman's view about sources and citations may be questioned. Tb claim,"For Grueber there are virtually no primary sources apart from a few letters in the Jesuit archives" misses the mark. Caraman does not list F. Baumann (ed.),fohannes Grueber.Als Kundschafter des Papstes nach China, 1656-1664. Die erste Durchquerung Tibets (Stuttgart, 1985), which discusses this issue. Scholars may question Caraman's decision to omit reference numbers for the quotations from Jesuit letters in the Roman Archives. Nonetheless, for a general audience Caraman is at his best in narrating the challenging travel conditions the Jesuits faced to reach and live in a land so little known. With the death of the author at Dulverston, Somerset, on May 6, 1998, this book is the last of his many fine and noteworthy contributions to ecclesiastical history.

John W. Witek, SJ.

Georgetown University

Autobiography of an Aspiring Saint. By Cecilia Ferrazzi. Transcribed, Translated, and Edited by Anne Jacobson Schutte. [The Other Voice in Early Modern Europe.] (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press. 1996. Pp. xxxi, 101. $30.00 clothbound; $14.95 paperback.)

Autobiography of an Aspiring Saint is a welcome and original contribution. It is an edition of an early text at a time when the publication of original sources is becoming increasingly difficult to arrange. The document is a significant portion of a trial conducted before the Venetian branch of the Roman Inquisition. Few such judicial records are available in critical editions even in the original language, not to menion in a reliable and fluent English translation. The segment of the proceedings presented here contains the defendant's autobiography, as presented orally to the tribunal and taken down by the court notary. Although long "apologies" are occasionally encountered in inquisitorial records, Cecilia Ferrazzi's account of her troubled life is the only full-length, complete, freely volunteered personal statement to have been found in a dossier of an Italian Holy Office trial. Moreover, it has to be counted one of the earliest examples of a female autobiography, a genre usually credited to mid-seventeenth-century English noblewomen.

Cecilia Ferrazzi, not herself a religious, directed a shelter in Venice that provided care and shelter to several hundred mostly indigent girls and young women, keeping them off the street and teaching them the rudiments of household skills. As surrogate mother, Ferrazzi met with her charges regularly to hear them publicly admit to their shortcomings and be admonished. This would form the basis of accusations against her that she was appropriating the priest's sacral role in confession and absolution. In the long and complicated trial conducted against her during 1664-65 much other evidence linking Ferrazzi to claims of special spiritual gifts, visions, spiritual healings, and miraculous experiences were proffered. Pretenses to sanctity were taken very seriously by ecclesiastical authorities, who mounted thirty-seven known trials for this crime. The celebrated case against one such false claimant, Maria Janis (the subject of a monograph by Fulvio Tomizza available in an English translation, also by Schutte), was completed just the year before the inception of Ferrazzi's own trial. The latter's judicial ordeal concluded with a sentence to imprisonment for seven years. Her lawyer promptly appealed to the Supreme Congregation of the Inquisition in Rome. Within two years her confinement was ameliorated to house arrest in the custody of the Bishop of Padua. After another two years she totally regained her freedom.

This complex and intriguing case whets our appetite to know more. The interested reader may pursue the subject further by consulting the Italian version of Ferrazzi's autobiography (of which the present work, with revised and expanded introduction, appendices, and bibliography, is a translation) and Schutte's several fundamental studies devoted to the careers of specific Venetian inquisitors, the establishment housing their activities, the developments leading to the growing presence of women as defendants in heresy trials and to

the case of Cecilia Ferrazzi herself, all cited in the course of the Autobiography. These investigations, as well as the present edition, are preparatory to a larger study that will encompass all the known Venetian "affected-sanctity" trials. Significant new findings further enriching an already intriguing story will undoubtedly be turned up. The recent opening to scholars of the central archives of the Holy Office in Rome, for example, may permit Schutte to shed light on the Supreme Congregation's deliberations over Ferrazzi's judicial appeal and its views concerning the heresy of which she had been convicted.

JohnTedeschi

Ferryville, Wisconsin

Religion and Political Culture in Britain and Ireland: From the Glorious Revolution to the Decline of Empire. By David Hempton. (New York: Cambridge University Press. 1996. Pp. xii, 191. $4995 hardback; $16.95 paperback.)

This book is based on the Cadbury lectures which the author gave at the University of Birmingham in 1993, and provides a consistently incisive and penetrating survey of an historical territory fully as complex and varied as the geography of the islands with which it is concerned. Hempton shows himself the master of an extensive range of scholarship, given additional depth by insights from his own considerable primary research. He ably challenges the simplistic generalizations of others while offering a satisfying interpretative framework of his own, building upon his perception of the "patchwork quilt" quality of British and Irish religious allegiances and his awareness of how closely these commitments and associations were woven in with other aspects of the rich tapestry of human Uves. He thus treats religion very seriously as a motivating and mobilizing force in its own right, while moving far outside the narrow confines of a more traditional kind of ecclesiastical history.

Readers of this journal are likely to be particularly interested in Hempton's examination of Irish Catholicism and its antithesis, Ulster Protestantism, two chapters in which the interplay of religion with politics is particularly finely drawn. In tracing the movement of the Irish Catholic Church from its relative weakness under the penal laws to its centrality in the life of the independent Irish state of the twentieth century, Hempton gives particular emphasis to links between faith, ethnicity, society, and politics. He also stimulatingly explores anti-Catholicism as a connecting link between the religious politics of the four component nations of the British Isles. The book would, however, have benefited from rather more detailed attention to the context provided by the spectacular growth of Catholicism in England and Scotland during the nineteenth century, and by the advance of Catholic influence in the Church of England. A further relative weakness is in the coverage of Scotland and Wales, which receive one

chapter between them, as opposed to two on Ireland alone, but even here Hempton has much to offer.

It should be noted that Hempton assumes quite extensive prior knowledge in the reader and that accordingly students would need first to have obtained from other texts a clear understanding of chronology and major developments. With that caution, however, this superb book can be unreservedly recommended as essential reading for all who are seeking to deepen and refresh their understanding of the nature and political context of religion in modern Britain and Ireland.

John Wolffe

The Open University

La Compagnia di Gesii nell'Lmpero Russo (1772-1820) e la sua parte nella restaurazione generate della Compagnia. By Marek Inglot, SJ. [Pontificia Universitas Gregoriana, Miscellanea Historiae Pontificiae, Vol. 63.] (Rome: Editrice Pontificia Università Gregoriana. 1997. Pp. xxv, 337. Lire 52.000; $36.00 paperback.)

The fall of Communism has rekindled interest in the survival of the Society of Jesus in the Russian Empire after the 1773 papal suppression. Farther Inglot succeeds brilliantly in presenting "the contributions of the Jesuits of White Russia to the work of restoring the Society of Jesus" (p. 28). He also gives a clear and comprehensive account of the "Russian" Society's governance, schools, and missions; its complicated relations with Roman authorities and the Roman Catholic hierarchy in Russia, its contacts with former Jesuits in Europe and America for the period 1772-1820, and its impact on the restored Society.

Inglot sketches the roles of Catherine II, Paul I, and Alexander I in the Jesuit story, as well as some of the broader educational, religious, and cultural contexts of the Empire. Here the author is less authoritative, although his overall depiction is valid. Particularly valuable are the appendices containing sixty-two pages of primary documents in the original languages, many previously unpublished, plus extensive citations from them in the text and footnotes. One, a 1773 Jesuit petition to Catherine II to implement the papal order of suppression, convincingly refutes critics who accuse the Jesuits of deliberate evasion and resistance. The numerous biographical notices on Jesuits and others are quite useful.

Inglot has mastered the vast resources of the Archivum Romanum Societatis Iesu and has made effective use of the Archivum Secretum Vaticanum,as well as of Jesuit archives in London, Cracow, and Madrid. He did not consult the Bibliothèque Slave or any Russian archives; many of their relevant holdings, however, are replicated in Rome. He cites almost all of the primary and secondary works on the "Russian" Jesuits, with the notable exception of Eduard Winter's biased

but comprehensive studies and William James's dissertation on Paul I and the Jesuits.

More serious is Inglot's failure to consult the Polnoe sobrante zakonov for the original Russian text of crucial tsarist decrees like Paul Ts 1800 ukaz granting the Jesuits the right to open schools in St. Petersburg and other privileges, or Alexander Ts orders of expulsion in 1815 and 1820, relying instead on translations and secondary works. His sources for the broader Russian context are thin; he relies heavily on Madariaga, Eidel'man, McGrew, and Serczyk, but where are Shumigorskii, Nikolai Mikhailovich, ShiTder, Schiemann, McConnell, or Hartley, to cite just a few? On religion and culture, he could have used Zacek, Pypin, and Sawatsky among others.

Few flaws mar an otherwise outstanding work. Peter Ill's remains were not disinterred from the Smol'nyi Convent (p. 18), but from the Aleksandr Nevskii Lavra. To say that French was "the language commonly spoken by the nobility and the upper bourgeoisie" (p. 110) is greatly exaggerated. Inglot's claim that "Western European Christian culture came to Russia via the Jesuits" (p. 121) ignores a host of other influences then and earlier, whether Ukrainian clergymen like Feofan Prokopovich and Stefan Iavorskii under Peter the Great or Pietist, Quaker, and other Protestant currents in Alexander Ts time.

Still, Inglot's work is a major contribution to Jesuit history. The primary source material and bibliography alone make it an indispensable reference, and in addition, the author presents a complex and important story clearly and convincingly. The multilingual text is remarkably free of errors and misprints.

Daniel L. SchlaflyJr.

Saint Louis University

NOTES AND COMMENTS

Association News

The president of the American Catholic Historical Association, David J. O'Brien, has appointed the first vice-president, James D. Tracy, chairman of the Committee on Program for the eightieth annual meeting, which will be held in Chicago on January 7-9, 2000. Members of the Association who wish to propose papers or (preferably) complete sessions should write by January 11, 1999, to Professor Tracy in care of the Department of History, University of Minnesota, 715 Social Sciences Building, 267 19th Avenue South, Minneapolis, Minnesota 55455; telephone: 612-625-6303; fax: 612-624-7096.

The American Catholic Historical Association's Spring Meeting

The Association held its spring meeting on Friday and Saturday, March 27 and 28, 1998, on the campus of Marian College in Indianapolis, Indiana. The planning committee was composed of five Ph.D. historians: C. Edward Balog (Illinois), Sue Bradshaw, O.S.F. (Georgetown), James J. Divita (Chicago), William J. Doherty (Indiana), the Reverend Jack W. Porter (Wisconsin/Madison), and Joseph M. White (Notre Dame). The first four are Marian History Department faculty; Porter is Indianapolis Archdiocesan Historian, and White is associate editor of U.S. Catholic Historian. Divita was committee chairman.

Almost one hundred attended the meeting, drawn from as far south as Florida, Louisiana, and Texas, as far west as Utah and Kansas, as far north as Wisconsin, and as far east as Massachusetts and Connecticut. Toronto and Louvain were also represented at the meeting. Participants were a good mix of university and college faculty, diocesan archivists, graduate students, free-lance historians, and interested lay people.

Presentations were organized into six sessions (three topics concurrently) during the two days in the various rooms of the James A. Allison mansion. European, American, and general topics were presented during each session to appeal to participants' broad interests in Catholic history. Among European topics were "Traditional Medieval Devotion," "Minorities in Early Modern Europe," and "Priests and Pastors in the Third Reich." American topics included "Catholic Religious Ministry during the Civil War," "American Catholics and Immigration—Two Different Views," and "American Anti-Catholicism." Some general topics

were "Catholicism since Vatican II," "Catholic Response to War," "Celebrating a Century of Vision: NCEA at 100," and "The Church in the World." Three papers delved into aspects of Catholic Indiana (Weinzaepfel, Protestant-Catholic relations in Indianapolis, Hesburgh).

Faculty recommended by panelists, faculty from Marian's History and Theology/Philosophy departments, faculty emeritae, and local historians served as moderators for all topics. Benedictine Brother Howard Studivant transferred guests between motel and campus by bus.

Although daily buffet lunch was served in a pleasant room overlooking the spring-fed lakes on campus, the Friday banquet was held off-campus in the Great Lakes Room, Best Western Waterfront Plaza Hotel in suburban Speedway. Almost seventy attended the banquet, including the President of Marian College and Mrs. Daniel A. Felicetti and Monsignor Frederick Easton, judicial vicar of the Archdiocese. The master of ceremonies, Balog, introduced Christopher Kauffman, Catholic University of America faculty member and editor of U.S. Catholic Historian, who spoke on the revealing nature of prefaces and introductions in selected books in American Catholic history.

The Most Reverend Daniel M. Buechlein, O.S.B., fifth Archbishop of Indianapolis, was the principal celebrant of the closing Mass in Chartrand Chapel with Porter, Marian College priest-faculty, and ACHA's own Monsignor Robert Trisco. The Mass, attended by about two hundred, also marked the centennial of the transfer of the episcopal see from Vincennes to Indianapolis ordered by Pope Leo XIII. The original apostolic brief was transported from the Archdiocesan Archives and exhibited during and after Mass. Divita read a translation of the document. Archbishop Buechlein also read a letter of greeting sent him for the occasion by Los Angeles Auxiliary Bishop Gerald E. Wilkerson, recently ordained titular bishop of Vincennes.

This was the first time the ACHA met in the Hoosier capital. For a few sunny days Indianapolis and Marian College were at the center of the American Catholic historical world. The complimentary letters which participants addressed to the chairman indicated that the event was academically valuable, socially satisfying, and eminently worthwhile.

James J. Divita
Professor of History

Meetings, Conferences, Symposia, and Colloquia

At the annual meeting of the Catholic Commission on Intellectual and Cultural Affairs, which will be held at Loyola Marymount University in Los Angeles on October 3, 1998, Joseph E Chinnici, O.F.M., of the Franciscan School of Theology in the Graduate Theological Union, Berkeley, California, will present a

paper entitled "Suffering as a Spirituality of Evangelization. The Catholic Experience, 1930-1985."

An international study conference will be held in Sarzana, Italy, on October 8-10, 1998, in commemoration of "Niccolö V nel sesto centenario della nascita." The papers will be grouped as follows: "Niccolö V e la fondazione della Biblioteca Vaticana," "Niccolö V e gli umanisti del suo tempo," "Niccolo y la sua diócesi e la sua famiglia," "Le arti in Lunigiana ai tempi di Niccolö V" and "Le arti a Roma durante il pontificato di Niccolö V. Those who wish to obtain copies of the papers should write to the Comitato Organizzativo in onore di Niccolö V, presso il Seminario Vescovile, Via Mascardi, 93, 19038 Sarzana SR Italy; fax: 39-0187 610060.

Many of the 206 sessions at the Sixteenth Century Studies Conference that will be held in Toronto on October 22-25, 1998, will be devoted to ecclesiastical history. Among the participants will be the following members of the American Catholic Historical Association (in the order in which they first appear in the program): James D. Tracy of the University of Minnesota, chairman of a session entitled "A Question of Social Purity: Sex, Marriage, and Gender in the Protestant and Catholic Reformation"; Robert Bireley, S.J., of Loyola University of Chicago, chairman and commentator at a session on "Early Modern Casuistry: Forms and Functions"; Lance Lazar of the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill, "The Institutional Face of Conversion in Early Modern Italy: The Houses for Catechumens," and chairman of a session on "Charity and the Reformation on the Venetian Mainland: The Hospital of Treviso"; Craig Harline of Brigham Young University, commentator at a session on "Catholicism in the Dutch Golden Age," and chairman of a session on "Widows in the Early Modern City"; Paul V Murphy of the University of San Francisco, "A Worldly Reform: Honor and Pastoral Practice in the Career of Cardinal Ercole Gonzaga (1505-1563)"; Robert M. Kingdon of the University of Wisconsin, Madison, "Recent Work in the History of Calvinism"; John Patrick Donnelly, S.J., of Marquette University, commentator at a session entitled "Transcending Traditional Categories: The Via Media Tradition in Reformed Theology," chairman of a session on "Peter Martyr Vermigli: Scripture and Method," and presenter of a paper on "Antonio Possevino: From Mercurian's Secretary to Papal Legate"; Elisabeth G. Gleason of the University of San Francisco, commentator at a session on "The Archives of the Roman Inquisition"; Thomas M. McCoog, SJ., of the Archives of the British Province of the Society of Jesus, chairman and commentator at a session on "The Jesuits under Mercurian—I: Biography," and presenter of a paper on "Mercurian, the English Mission, and the French Match"; Mark A. Lewis, S.J., of the Jesuit Historical Institute in Rome, "Nicolas Bobadilla as Reform Priest: Loyalty to the Church and to the Society of Jesus"; Jodi Bilinkoff of the University of North Carolina at Greensboro, commentator at a session on "The Authentication of Divine Voices," and presenter of a paper on "Widowhood and Religious Expression in Early Modern Avila"; Paul F. Grendler of the University of Toronto, chairman of a session on "Savonarola's Florence," and presenter of a paper, "'They Urinate in the Holy Water': German Protestant Students in Italian Uni-

versities"; Frederic Baumgartner of the Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University, chairman of a session on "The Jesuits under Mercurian—II: France, the Netherlands, and England"; Raymond Mentzer of Montana State University, chairman of a session on "Calvinism and the Social Order," and chairman and commentator at a session on "The Reformation in France"; John W O'Malley, S.J., of the Weston Jesuit School of Theology, chairman and commentator at a session on "The Jesuits under Mercurian—III: Spain, Bavaria, and Poland"; Francesco Cesáreo of the John Carroll University, chairman and commentator of a session on "The Jesuits under Mercurian—IV: Italy"; James Farge of the Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies, Toronto, "Erasmus, Paris, and the Profession of Theology"; and Virginia Reinburg of Boston College, "Ritual" in a session on "The Work of Bob Scribner."

At the forthcoming annual conference of the Society of Catholic Social Scientists, which will take place at the Franciscan University of Steubenville on October 23-24, 1998, John Lukacs, professor emeritus of history in Chestnut Hill College and past president of the American Catholic Historical Association, will speak at the plenary session on "Dawson, Tocqueville, and the Christian View of Historical Time." Other scholars will read papers on historical topics in various sessions: Timothy Brennan of the University of Kansas, "'Where is your pope?': The Teutonic Order, Boniface VIII, and the Conflict over the Rigan Bridge"; Kevin E. Schmiesing of the University of Pennsylvania, "The Battle for America's Past: American Catholic Historians and the Dilemma of Duel Identities, 1898-1928"; John F. Quinn of Salve Regina University, "Strained Relations: John Courtney Murray and John Fitzgerald Kennedy in I960"; Christopher O. Blum of Christendom College, "Alasdair MacIntyre and the Catholic Historian"; and Clement Mulloy of the University of Arkansas, "Sanger versus the Catholic Church: The Early Debate over Birth Control."

The Department of Archaeology and the Foundation Royaumont will sponsor an international colloquium on November 12-13, 1998, on "Citeaux et les femmes," which will be organized around the themes of the integration of women into the Cistercian Order and the architecture of its convents. Further information may be obtained from Odette Chauve in care of Colloque "Citeaux et les femmes," 95270 Asnières sur Oise, France.

The twenty-sixth annual Sewanee Mediaeval Colloquium will be held on March 26-27, 1999. The theme will be "Last Things: Apocalypse, Judgment, Millennium, and Millennialism in the Middle Ages." Anyone wishing to present a paper on a topic related to this theme should submit two copies of an abstract of it and two copies of a brief curriculum vitae to the Sewanee Mediaeval Colloquium at The University of the South, 735 University Avenue, Sewanee, Tennessee 37383; telephone: 931-598-1531; e-mail: sridyard@sewanee.edu.

The first International John Foxe Colloquium to be held in North America will take place at the Ohio State University from April 29 to May 2, 1999. Papers focused on Foxe's^4c£s and Monuments ("The Book of Martyrs"), in particular, or on other topics related to Foxe and his "world" will be welcome. Scholars are

invited to address Foxe's life and works, narrative or visual art, Reformation historiography, reception history, political or ecclesiastical history, iconography, iconoclasm, apocalypticism, Protestantism and print, execution spectacles, martyrology in Spain and New Spain, Catholic response, and similar topics. The program will include plenary lectures, panels, workshops, and round-table discussions. Anyone who wishes to present a paper should send a one-page proposal to Kevin Lindberg in care of the Department of English, The Ohio State University, Columbus, Ohio 43210-1370; fax: 614-292-7816; e-mail: Lindberg.2@osu. edu.

The Pontifical Commission for Latin America will sponsor a historical symposium on "Los Últimos Cien Años de la Evangelización en América Latina" to commemorate the Plentary Council of Latin America convoked by Pope Leo XIII and celebrated in Rome from May 28 to July 9, 1899. The symposium will take place on June 21-25, 1999, in Vatican City. An organizing committee, composed of specialists from various Roman universities and institutions, has been appointed; it has invited historians to submit suggestions or proposals. Anyone who wishes to respond should write to the vice-president of the Commission, the Most Reverend Cipriano Calderón, Titular Bishop of Thagora, in care of the Pontificia Comisión para América Latina, 00129 Vatican City State, Europe; fax: 39-6 698 84260.

Archives and Manuscripts

The library of St. Mary's Seminary and University in Baltimore will be expanded to house the archives of the Archdiocese of Baltimore, the archives of the American Province of the Society of St. Sulpice, and other collections. Half of the seven million dollars that the project will cost has already been pledged; construction will begin in 1999 and should be completed by the year 2000.

At an auction of Sotheby's/Mayfair in London on June 4 the Maryland Historical Society acquired for £17,000 the presumably original manuscript of the Relatio Itineris in Marilandiam composed by Father Andrew White, SJ. Neither Sotheby's nor the Society could confirm that the twelve stained and yellowing pages with reddish brown ink were actually written by the Jesuit after the voyage of 1633-34, but after a preliminary examination experts expressed belief that the document is indeed authentic. Although Sotheby's refused to disclose the provenance, it is supposed that the document came from the house of one of England's prominent remaining Catholic families; Father White died in an English noble's house in 1656. One other known Latin text of the same account is preserved in the Roman Archives of the Society of Jesus, but it is said to be a transcription, not in Father white's hand. The Society displayed both this Latin text and the only existing English-language version, also written circa 1634-35, which it had purchased some hundred years before, in a glass case at its headquarters in Baltimore this summer, along with two nineteenth-century paint-

ings depicting Father White at the landing of the Ark in southern Maryland. The Latin manuscript will not be displayed again until it can be properly conserved. The funds came from an endowment restricted to new acquisitions.

Awards

At the last meeting of the Texas Catholic Historical Society the Carlos E. Castañeda Award, given for dedicated service to the promotion of the history of Catholicism in Texas, was presented to the Most Reverend John McCarthy, Bishop of Austin. The Paul J. Foik Award, intended to give recognition to the best publication on Texas or Southwestern history, was conferred on Sister Patrice Slattery CCVL, for her two-volume work, Promises to Keep: A History of the Sisters of Charity of the Incarnate Word, San Antonio, Texas (San Antonio: Sisters of Charity of the Incarnate Word, 1995).

Help Sought

Mary R. Reichardt requests inquiries or submissions for a proposed collection of critical essays on Catholic women writers in any era or genre. Letters should be addressed to Dr. Reichardt in care of the Department of English, University of St. Thomas, 2115 Summit Avenue, St. Paul, Minnesota 55105-1096; telephone: 612-962-5620; fax: 612-962-5623; e-mail: mrreichardt@stthomas.edu.

Beatifications

On May 10, 1998, in front of St. Peter's Basilica Pope John Paul II beatified ten women religious martyred during the Spanish Civil War. Two of them, Mother Rita Dolores Pujalte Sánchez (1853-1936) and Sister Francisca del Sagrado Corazón de Jesús (1881-1936), were Sisters of Charity of the Sacred Heart of Jesus. In 1936 they were living at St. Susanna's College in Madrid; the former, who had been superior general from 1900 to 1928, was in retirement, and the latter was general secretary. On July 20, 1936, Republican soldiers attacked the college; the superior asked them to allow Mother Rita, because of her advanced age, blindness, and infirmity, and Sister Francisca, who was also ill, to depart. The two religious then took refuge in a nearby flat. Two hours later a group of armed radicals dragged them down the stairs, put them in a car, and took them to a suburb of Madrid, Canillejas, where they made them get out and then shot them. Seven other religious were members of the Madrid house of the Order of the Visitation of the Blessed Virgin Mary. In 1936 they were confined to an apartment; on November 18 a patrol of the Iberian Anarchist Federation broke into the apartment, seized the nuns, took them by van to a vacant area, and shot all but one, who had started to run when she felt the sister next to her fall but moments afterwards was captured and five days later was shot at the cemetery

wall in Vallecas on the outskirts of Madrid. The tenth new beata was Sister María Sagrario of St. Aloysius Gonzaga, born in 1881, who in 1936 was prioress of the Carmel of St. Anne and St. Joseph in Madrid. On July 20 the convent was attacked by a violent mob. She provided for the safety of the other sisters and took refuge with one of them in the home ofthat sister's parents. There the two were arrested on August 14 by Republican soldiers; Sister María Sagrario was interrogated by the secret police, but she refused to answer questions, not betraying anyone or revealing the whereabouts of the convent's valuables. On August 15 she was taken to the Pradera of San Isidro and shot.

Two weeks later in Turin the Holy Father beatified three more servants of God. One of them, Teresa Braceo (1924-1944), was brutally killed in the woods near Santa Giulia (in the Diocese of Acqui) by a German soldier who had abducted her on August 28, when she resisted him and tried to flee.

During his pastoral visit to Austria the pontiff declared blessed three more servants of God in Vienna on June 21. One of them was Sister Maria Restituta Kafka, who was born in Brno on May 10, 1894, and grew up with her family in Vienna. As a nurse she came into contact with the Franciscan Sisters of Christian Charity (the Hartmannschwestern) and entered their congregation in 1914. From 1919 on she worked as a surgical nurse and gained a reputation not only for professional skill but also for care for the poor and oppressed. She even protected a Nazi doctor from arrest which she thought was unjustified. After the Anschluss she made her total rejection of Nazism clear and public. She called Adolf Hitler a "madman." When she hung a crucifix in every room of a new wing of a hospital, the Nazis threatened to have her dismissed unless the crosses were removed. After her community argued that she could not be replaced, she remained as also did the crucifixes. Sister Restituta was soon arrested, however, and accused not only of hanging the crosses but also of having written a poem mocking Hitler. On October 28, 1942, she was sentenced to death for "aiding and abetting the enemy in the betrayal of the fatherland and for plotting high treason." Later she was offered her freedom if she would leave her religious congregation, but she refused. When Martin Bormann was asked to commute her sentence, he rejected the request, saying,"I think the execution of the death penalty is necessary for effective intimidation." While awaiting death, she cared for the other prisoners, as even communists later attested. After various requests for clemency were rejected by the authorities, Sister Restituta was decapitated on March 30, 1943.

Publications

A colloquium on "Les frontières de la mission (XV'-XIXe siècle)" was held at Rome on December 3-5, 1992. The papers presented there have now been published in the second number for 1997 (Volume 109) of Mélanges de l'École française de Rome, Italie et Méditerranée. After an introduction by Catherine Brice, the following articles are included: Claude Prudhomme, "Centralité ro-

maine et frontières missionnaires" (pp. 487-504); Dominique Deslandres, "Les missions françaises intérieures et lointaines, 1600-1650: Esquisse géo-historique" (pp. 505-538); Bernard Heyberger, "'Pro nunc, nihil respondendum7: Recherche d'informations et prise de décision à la Propagande: l'exemple du Levant (XVIIP siècle)" (pp. 539-554); Stefania Nanni, "L'idea di missione nella crisi della Chiesa di antico regime" (pp. 555-580); Giovanni Pizzorusso,"Propaganda Fide e le missioni cattoliche sulla frontiera política, étnica e religiosa délie Antille nel XVII secólo" (pp. 581-599); Matteo Sanfilippo, "L'abito fa il missionario? Scelte di abigliamento, stratégie di adattamento e intervenu romani nelle missioni 'ad haereticos' e 'ad infideles' tra XVI e XX secólo" (pp. 601-620); Bernard Dompnier,"La France du premier XVIIe siècle et les frontières de la mission" (pp. 621-652); Alain Cabantous, "Les finistères de la catholicité: Missions littorales et construction identitaire en France aux XVIIe et XVIIIe siècles" (pp. 653-669); Elias Kattar, "Les insurrections paysannes au Mont-Liban au XLXe siècle" (pp. 671-688); David Gentilcore,"'Accomodarsi alla capacita del popólo': stratégie, metodi et imparto délie missioni nel regno di Napoli, 1600-1800" (pp. 689-722); Paule Brasseur, "Les missionnaires catholiques à la Côte d'Afrique pendant la deuxième moitié du XLXe siècle face aux religions traditionnelles" (pp. 723-745); Willi Henkel, "L'idolatria come fondera della missione nell'America latina, sec. XVI" (pp. 747-755); Louis Châtellier,"La mission du XVIIIe siècle, aux frontières de l'esprit tridentin et de l'idéal des Lumières" (pp. 757-766); Adriano Prosperi, "Missioni popolari e visite pastorali in Italia tra '500 e '600" (pp. 767-783); and Luca Codignola, "Les frontières de la mission: efficacité missionnaire, acculturation réciproque et centralisation romaine" (pp. 785-792).

The papers presented at a convegno on "La pietà e la sua storia," which was held in Rome on December 9-10, 1994, have been published in Volume LX (1996) of the Archivio Italiano per la Storia della Pietà, as follows: Carlo DeIcorno,"Don Giuseppe De Luca e gli studi recenti sulla letteratura religiosa médiévale" (pp. 325-337); Annibale Zambarbieri, "Per una ricera sulla 'pietà' dei Kakure Kirishitan" (pp. 339-346); Agostino Paravicini Bagliani, "Il problema della spiritualità délie élites ecclesiastiche duecentesche" (pp. 347-354); Emile Goichot,"Une lecture française de 'Introduzione" (pp. 355-363); Paolo Prodi, "La ripresa deü'Archivio" (pp. 367-372); Mario Sensi, "L'eredità di Don Giuseppe De Luca negli eruditi preti" (pp. 373-378); Carlo Ossola, "Pietà e atiesa di senso" (pp. 379-390); Roberto Rusconi,"La pietà fra erudizione e critica" (pp. 391-394); Lucetta Scaraffia, "Fra storia e fede: rileggendo oggi l'Introduzione alla storia della pietà" (pp. 395-399); and Stefania Nanni, "La pietà délie missioni" (pp. 401-405). Among the articles published in the first part of the volume is "Peter Lombard's 'On those who repent at the End'—Theological Motives and Pastoral Perspectives in the Redaction of Sentences 4.20.1," by Thomas Tender (pp. 281-318).

The fourth centenary of the death of Benito Arias Montano (1527-1598) is commemorated in the issue of La Ciudad de Dios for January-April, 1998 (Volume CCXI, Number 1), with the following series of articles: Melquíades Andrés

Martin, "Una espiritualidad ecuménica (1575) en Arias Montano" (pp. 7-32); Juan Luis Suárez, "Arias Montano y la espiritualidad en el siglo XVI: Un estudio del Dictatum Christianum" (pp. 33-49); M." Asunción Sánchez Manzano,"La finalidad de los Comentarios a los XXXI primeros salmos de David, de Benito Arias Montano" (pp. 51-125);Jesús Luis Paradinas Fuentes, "Crónica de la cátedra de latinidad fundada por Arias Moreno" (pp. 127-151); Juan Francisco Domínguez Domínguez, "Barbaros . . . vocitant: Dos poemas inéditos de Antonio Márquez dedicados a Arias Montano" (pp. 153-178); and Gaspar Morocho Gayo, "Avance de datos para un inventario de las obras y escritos de Arias Montano" (pp. 179-275).

The fourth centenary of the beginning of Catholicity in New Mexico, of which Juan de Oñate took possession in the name of King Philip II on April 30, 1598, is celebrated with four articles in Volume 9 (1998) of Catholic Southwest, to witjames E. Ivey"The Baroque in New Mexico, 1620-1630" (pp. 9-23); Rick Hendricks, "Church-State Relations in Anza's New Mexico, 1777-1787" (pp. 24-42); Jesús F. de la Teja, "The Catholic Legacy at Paso del Norte, Gateway to Nuevo México: Photographs from the Catholic Archives of Texas" (pp. 43-52); and Enrique R. Lamadrid and Thomas J. Steele, SJ., "Indigenous Voice in Nuevomexicano Anti-clerical Satire: Humor, Rumor, and Marginalia, from the 'Mano Fashico' Numskulls to the 'Anti-cristo' of Taos" (pp. 53-74).

The relations between the spirit of the Counter-Reformation and "La reconquête catholique en Europe centrale" at the end of the seventeenth century and the beginning of the eighteenth are studied by eleven authors in the issue of XVII" Siècle for April-June, 1998 (Volume 50, Number 2). After a "Présentation" by Daniel Toilet (pp. 195-202), the articles are divided as follows: L'impulsion et les aspirations romaines: Bruno Neveu, "L'esprit de réforme à Rome sous Innocent XI (1676-1689)" (pp. 203-218); István-Gyorgy Toth, "Les missionnaires franciscains venant de l'étranger en Hongrie au XVIIe siècle avant la période de reconquête catholique" (pp. 219-231);Jean-MicheIThiriet,"Militaires et Contre-Réforme: le cas de l'Europe centrale" (pp. 233-246); Gaetano Platania,"Innocent XI Odescalchi et l'esprit de 'croisade'" (pp. 247-276); Les aspirations nationales: L'Europe centrale et balkanique: Maciej Serwafiski,"Jean III Sobieski et la Sainte-Ligue" (pp. 277-290); Dariusz Kolodziejczyk, "La reconquête catholique de la Podolie" (pp. 291-296); Jean Bérenger, "Le cardinal Kollonich et al Contre-Réforme en Hongrie" (pp. 297-313); Jean Nouzille, "Les Jésuites en Transylvanie aux XVIP et XVIIIe siècles" (pp. 315-328); Olivier Chaline,"La réveil de la Montagne Blanche, 1704-1729"(pp. 329-344); Juliusz A. Chroscicki, "La reconquête catholique dans l'architecture et la peinture religieuses (La Pologne aux XVIIe et XVIIP siècles)" (pp. 345-357); Une opposition à la reconquête catholique?: Emmanuel Caron, "Défense de la chrétienté ou gallicanisme dans la politique de la France à l'égard de l'Empire ottoman à la fin du XVIIe siècle" (pp. 359-372).

"Native-American Catholics" are the subjects of all the articles published in the issue of U.S. Catholic Historian for spring, 1998 (Volume 16, Number 2), namely, Christopher Vecsey, "Pueblo Indian Catholicism: The Isleta Case" (pp.

1-19); Maureen Anna Harp, "Faith, Conflict, and Conversion: Slovene Catholic Missions in the Upper Great Lakes, 1830s-1850s"(pp. 20-40);Thomas W. Foley, "Father Francis M. Craft and the Indian Sisters" (pp. 41-55); Mark Thiel, "Catholic Sodalities among the Sioux, 1882-1910" (pp. 56-77); James Carroll, CEC. ,"Self-Direction, Activity, and Syncretism: Catholic Indian Boarding Schools on the Northern Great Plains in Contact" (pp. 78-89); Marie Thérèse Archambault, O.S.E, "Ben Black Bear, Jr.: A Lakota Deacon and a 'Radical Catholic' Tells His Own Story" (pp. 90-106); and Carl E Starkloff, S.J., "Hindsight and Foresight: The Catholic Church and Native North Americans, 1965- 1997" (pp. 107-121).

Papers that were read at the sixty-fourth annual meeting of the English Section of the Canadian Catholic Historical Association, which was held at the Memorial University of Newfoundland on June 4-5, 1997, have been published in the Association's publication Historical Studies 1998 (Volume 64), as follows: Terence J. Fay, "The Canadian Messenger of the Sacred Heart, 1905-1927: Windows on Ultramontane Spirituality" (pp. 9-26); John Edward Fitzgerald, "Bishop Fleming and Irish Factionalism: Newfoundland Roman Catholicism, 1829-1850" (pp. 27-45); Mark G. McGown, "Harvesting the 'Red Vineyard': Catholic Religious Culture in the Canadian Expeditionary Force, 1914-1919" (pp. 47-70); Vincent J. McNally,"A Question of Class? Relations between Bishops and Lay Leaders in Ireland and Newfoundland, 1783- 1807" (pp. 71-90); Peter M. Meehan, "From College to University: The Basilian Fathers and Assumption, 1950-1963" (pp. 91-114); Sheila Ross, "Bishop McNaIIy and the Benedictines of Ampleforth" (pp. 115-134); Elizabeth Smyth,"English Canadian Women Religious and Their Work of History: A Starting Point for Analysis" (pp. 135-150); and John H. Thomas, "Quebec's Bishop as Pawn: Saint-Vallier's Imprisonment in England, 1704-1709" (pp. 151-160).

The same volume contains the Études d'histoire religieuse, 1998 (also Volume 64) of the Société canadienne d'histoire de l'Eglise catholique, consisting of these three articles (as well as a research note and book reviews): Frédéric Laugrand, "Premiers catéchismes et méthodes catéchistiques des missionnaires anglicans et oblats chez les Inuit de l'Arctique de l'Est (1852-1937)"(pp. 9-29); Jean Roy,"Entrer chez les Ursulines de Trois-Rivières, 1887-1918" (pp. 31-54); and Jacques Gagné, O.M.I.,"Le recrutement et la formation du clergé diocésain de l'archidiocèse d'Ottawa 1947-1997:Avant et après Vatican II"(pp. 55-69).

Between these two parts is "A Current Bibliography of Canadian Church History, 1997-1998,"forboth English and French Canada (pp. B1-B31).

"Australian Catholic History" is the theme of the first five articles in the April, 1998, issue of The Australasian Catholic Record (Volume LXXV, Number 2), namely, Patrick O'Farrell, "Writing the 1968 Catholic Church" (pp. 139-144); Tom Boland, "Thirty Years of the O'Farrell Era" (pp. 145-156); Gregory Haines, "Writing Parish History" (pp. 157-163); Austin Cooper, "A Select Bibliography" (pp. 164-179); and Stuart Moran, "How Did Australian Church Architecture of the Nineteenth Century Adapt European Trends to Australian Needs?" (pp. 180-183).

Personal Notices

Keith Egan, holder of the Joyce McMahon Hank Aquinas Chair in Catholic Theology at Saint Mary's College, Notre Dame, Indiana, was presented with the Spes Unica Award (for outstanding service over an extended period) at the college's honors convocation on May 3, 1998.

Mark A. Lewis, SJ., has been appointed by the Superior General of the Society of Jesus, Peter Hans Kolvenbach, SJ., director of the Jesuit Historical Institute in Rome. He succeeds Laslo Szilas, SJ., in this office. At the same time Father General Kolvenbach approved new statutes for the Institute. According to the statutes, the director's term is for six years and is renewable.

Jane E. Merdinger of the Catholic University of America has been declared by the Journal of the History of Ideas a co-winner of the Morris Forkosch Prize, which is given annually for the best book in intellectual history, on the merits of her book Rome and the African Church in the Time of Augustine (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1997).

Francis Oakley, Edward Dorr Griffin Professor of the History of Ideas in Williams College, was awarded in the summer of 1997 by the Graduate School of Yale University the Wilbur Lucius Cross Medal for "outstanding achievement as historian, administrator, and advocate for the liberal arts." In the spring of 1998 he was elected a fellow of the American Academy of Arts and Sciences in the history and archaeology class. He has also been appointed the Sir Isaiah Berlin Professor in the History of Ideas at the University of Oxford for the academic year 1999-2000.

James M. O'Toole has been appointed an associate professor of history in Boston College.

James M. Powell of Syracuse University has been elected a Corresponding Fellow of the Royal Historical Society.

Robert E. Sullivan has been appointed Senior Associate Director of the Erasmus Institute and concurrent associate professor of history in the University of Notre Dame. In the former position he is expected to devise ways of relating the institute and its programs to the permanent faculty of the university that will promote its Catholic identity.

Charles J. T. Talar has been appointed professor of systematic theology in St. Mary's Seminary and University, Baltimore.

Leslie Woodcock Tender has been appointed a professor of history in the Catholic University of America but will not begin teaching until the 1999-2000 academic year.

Birdsall S. Viault, professor of history in Winthrop University (Rock Hill, South Carolina), retired in December, 1997.

Obituary

Earl Francis Niehaus, S.M.,died of cancer on July 26, 1998,in New Orleans. He was born on January 6, 1924, in Wheeling, West Virginia, and completed the last two years of high school and the first two years of college at the minor seminary of the Marist Fathers and Brothers, St. Mary's Manor, in Langhorne, Pennsylvania. In 1944 he entered the Marist novitiate at Our Lady of the Elms on Staten Island, New York, and took his first vows in the Society of Mary on September 8, 1945. He spent the next six years at the major seminary of the Marists in Washington, D.C., finishing his college work and studying theology for four years. He was ordained priest on February 17, 1951. He then taught at Immaculata Seminary in Lafayette, Louisiana, for one year and at Notre Dame Seminary in New Orleans for the next eight. During this period he earned a B.A. degree at the University of Southwestern Louisiana and an M.A. degree in history at Tulane University. He received the Ph.D. degree from Tulane University in 1961 after writing a dissertation on "The Irish in New Orleans," which was published by the Louisiana State University Press in 1965. After teaching for one year at St. Peter Chanel High School in Bedford, Ohio, he became a professor in the Marist college seminary called St. Joseph's Manor in Bettendorf, Iowa, of which he later became superior. In 1967 Father Niehaus was appointed provincial superior of the Washington Province of the Society of Mary. Two years later, while attending the general chapter of his congregation in Rome, he was elected to the General Administration for an eight-year term and was also appointed Vicar General to the Superior General of the Society of Mary. After he returned to the United States he was pastor of St. Julian Eymard Parish in the section of New Orleans known as Algiers. In 1982 he began to teach at Notre Dame Seminary for the second time, and in the following year he became a professor of history in Xavier University, where he was to remain until he died. He was also chaplain to the Blessed Sacrament Sisters for a decade and served on various archdiocesan boards and committees and in the training program for the permanent diaconate. He was an associate editor of and contributor to Cross, Crozier, and Crucible, a volume commemorating the bicentennial of the establishment of the see of New Orleans in 1993. He wrote a long article on "The Catholic Church in Louisiana" for The Encyclopedia of American Catholic History (1997). In March of this year he appeared in the PBS documentary mini-series "The Irish in America—Long Journey Home," speaking on the Irish presence and legacy in New Orleans. Father Niehaus was a member of the American Catholic Historical Association from 1962 to 1966 and again from the beginning of this year; he read a paper at the Association's spring meeting in Indianapolis in March. He was interred in the Marist section of Mount Calvary Cemetery in wheeling, West Virginia.

PERIODICAL LITERATURE

general and miscellaneous

A World of Communities: The Value of Church History in Culturally Pluralistic Societies. Rowan Strong. Colloquium, 29 (Nov., 1997), 81-94.

Die Urkunden des Kollegiatstifts Baden (-Baden) im Erzbischöflichen Archiv Freiburg. Kurt Andermann. Freiburger Diözesan-Archiv, 117 (1997), 5-110.

Kirchturmurkunden vornehmlich aus Oberösterreich. Siegfried Haider. Mitteilungen des Instituts für Österreichische Geschichtsforschung, 106 (1-2, 1998), 1-30.

Obispos alaveses (1). Jesús María Alday CMF. Scriptorium Victoriense, XLFV (July-Dec, 1997), 331-430.

La Inquisición española y otras inquisiciones: Un debate histórico. Adriano Prosperi. Revista de Historia Jerónimo Zurita, No. 71 (1995), 189-198.

Adologio (1503-1835) y Libro de Gradas (s. XVII-XIX) del Monasterio de San Benito de Sevilla. Ernesto Zaragoza Pascual. Studia Monástica, 39 (2, 1997), 377-402.

A Married Clergy: Observance of the Norms Regulating the Marriage of Priests in the Ruthenian Uníate Church. Sophia Senyk. Orientalia Christiana Periodica, 64 (1, 1998), 175-192.

L'itinéraire d'un Père conciliaire. Le cardinal Léger. Gilles Routhier. Cristianesimo nella storia,XOÍ (Feb., 1998), 89-147.

Fasting in the Primitive Church. Joan L. Roccasalvo. Diakonia, 30 (2-3, 1997), 107-118.

Die Anfänge des Christentums in der Stadt Trier, Bischöfe und Märtyrer. Hans A. Pohlsander. Trierer Zeitschrift, 60 (1997), 255-302.

Les Vies de saint Mansuy (Mansuetus), premier évêque de Toul: aperçu du dossier et édition critique des textes inédits. Monique Goullet. Analecta Bollandiana, 116 (1-2, 1998), 57-105.

Pellegrino martire in urbe Bolitana e Pellegrino di Ancona: un'altra agiografia africana ad Aquileia? Paolo Chiesa. Analecta Bollandiana, 116(1-2, 1998), 25-56.

Prophecy in the Service of Polemics in Eusebius of Caesarea. Aryeh Kofsky. Cristianesimo nella storia, XLX (Feb., 1998), 1-29-

On Basil, Moses, and the Model Bishop: The Cappadocian Legacy of Leadership. Andrea Sterk. Church History, 67 (June, 1998), 227-253.

Salvien de Marseille: note critique. Philippe Badot and Daniel De Decker. Augustinianum. XXXVm (June, 1998), 223-277.

El monacato irlandés y su desarrollo insular y continental entre los siglos V y LX: un estado de la cuestión. Gustavo Alberto García Vivas. Estudios Eclesiásticos, 73 (Apr.-June, 1998), 307-321.

Dating the Baptism of Clovis: The Bishop of Vienne vs. the Bishop of Tours. Danuta Shanzer. Early Medieval Europe, 7 (1, 1998), 29-57.

Exemption monastique et conciles africains (525-536). Charles Munier. Revue Bénédictine, 108 (1-2, 1998), 5-24.

Byzantine Catholics in Sicily. Pasquale Magnano and George Gallaro. Diakonia, 30 (2-3, 1997), 89-105.

God the Father and Gregory the Great: The Discovery of a Late Roman Childhood. Carl A. Mounteer. Journal of Psychohistory, 26 (Summer, 1998), 436-448.

A vueltas con los obispos de Pamplona de época visigoda. Apostillas a una réplica. Koldo Larrañaga Elorza. Hispania Sacra, 50 (Jan.-June, 1998), 35-62.

MEDIEVAL

Die Speisegesetzgebung in den mittelalterlichen Bußbüchern (600-1200). Religionsgeschichtliche Perspektiven. Hubertus Lutterbach. Archiv für Kulturgeschichte, 80 (1, 1998), 1-37.

Did John Moschos Really Die in Constantinople? Andrew Louth. fournal of Theological Studies, 49 (Apr., 1998), 149-154.

Memorializing Gregory the Great: The Origin and Transmission of a Papal Cult in the Seventh and Early Eighth Centuries. Alan Thacker. Early Medieval Europe, 7 (1, 1998), 59-84.

La Bible racontée par les premiers musulmans. Jean-Louis Decíais. Nouvelle Revue Théologique, 120 (Apr.-June, 1998), 216-232.

Saint Cuthbert and War. John R. E. Bliese. Journal of Medieval History, 24 (Sept., 1998), 215-241.

La penisola di Alicarnasso in era bizantina. II/l parte: Le chiese di Tavsan Adasi e Monastir Dag: eredità monofisita? Vincenzo Ruggieri, and Franco Giordano. Orientalia Christiana Periodica, 64 (1, 1998), 39-74.

Women Pilgrims of the Middle Ages. Diana Webb. History Today, 48 (July, 1998), 20-26.

Die Verehrung des hl. Johannes (Ioann) von Rila in Bulgarien und in der Slavia Orthodoxa. Gerhard Podskalsky, SJ. Orientalia Christiana Periodica, 64 (1,1998), 159-173.

Kontakte und Beziehungen zwischen der Bishofsstadt Worms und der Abtei Lorsch während des Mittelalters. Gerold Bonnen. Jahrbuch für westdeutsche Landesgeschichte, 23 (1997), 89-104.

Romuald von Camoldi. Modell einer eremitischen Existenz im 10./1 1. Jahrhundert. Christian Schmidtmann. Studia Monástica, 39 (2, 1997), 329-338.

Translating the Tradition: Manuscripts, Models and Methodologies in the Composition of ^lfric's Catholic Homilies. Joy-ce Hill. Bulletin of the John Rylands University Library ofManchester, 79 (Spring, 1997), 43-65.

Les jongleurs dans les psautiers du haut moyen âge: nouvelles hypothèses sur la symbolique de l'histrion médiéval. Isabelle Marchesin. Cahiers de civilisation médiévale, 41 (Apr.-June, 1998), 127-139.

La colonne à l'époque romane. Réminiscences et nouveautés. Éliane Vergnolle. Cahiers de civilisation médiévale, 41 (Apr.-June, 1998), 141-174.

Religiöse Toleranz im Mittelalter? Überlegungen zum Umgang mit der "diversitas" im 11. und 12. Jahrundert. Heinrich Holze. Berliner Theologische Zeitschrift, 15 (1, 1998), 41-55.

Dating the Dialogues of Abbot Desiderius of Montecassino. William D. McCready.Revue Bénédictine, 108 (1-2, 1998), 145-168.

Il martirio di Teodoro Gabras (BHG 1745). Antonio Rigo. Analecta Bollandiana, 116 (1-2, 1998), 147-156.

Para el estudio de la Iglesia medieval castellana. Iluminado Sanz Sancho. Estudios Eclesiásticos, 73 (Jan.-Mar., 1998), 61-87.

"Qui seminat spiritualia debet recipere temporalia." L'episcopato di Città di Castello nella prima meta del Duecento. Sonia Merli. Mélanges de l'Ecole Française de Rome, Moyen Âge, 109 (2, 1997), 269-301.

Notre Dame of Paris and the Anticipation of Gothic. Stephen Murray. Art Bulletin, LXXX (June, 1998), 229-253

La catholicité et l'espace impérial au Moyen Age. Philippe Lécrivain. Recherches de Science Religieuse, 86 (Jan.-Mar., 1998), 99-121.

Hildegard von Bingen und ihre Verwandten. Genealogische Anmerkungen. Josef Heinzelmann. Jahrbuch für westdeutsche Landesgeschichte, 23 (1997), 7-88.

La bibliothèque de Geoffroy de Vendôme (1093-1132). Geneviève Giordanengo. Cahiers de civilisation médiévale, 41 (Apr.-June, 1998), 105-125.

Ritual Murder and the Subjectivity of Christ: A Choice in Medieval Christianity. Christopher Ocker. Harvard Theological Review, 91 (Apr., 1998), 153-192.

The Medieval Origins of the Western Natural Rights Tradition: The Achievement of Brian Tierney. Charles J. Reid, Jr. Cornell Law Review, 83 (Jan., 1998), 437-463.

A Papal Matchmaker: Principle and Pragmatism during Innocent Ill's Pontificate. Constance M. Rousseau. Journal of Medieval History, 24 (Sept., 1998), 259-271.

Les premiers commandeurs de l'Ordre Teutonique en Sicile (1202-1291). Évolution de la titulature, orjgines géographiques et sociales. Kristjan Toomaspoeg. Mélanges de l'Ecole Française de Rome, Moyen Âge, 109 (2, 1997), 443-461.

Entre gloire curíale et vie commune: le chapitre cathedral d'Anagni au XIIIe siècle. Pascal Montaubin. Mélanges de l'Ecole Française de Rome, Moyen Âge, 109 (2, 1997), 303-442.

God's Compass and Vana Curiositas: Scientific Study in the Old French Bible Moralisée. Katherine H. Tachau. Art Bulletin, LXXX (March, 1998), 7-33.

La Orden de Alcántara durante la Edad Media según la documentación pontificia: sus relaciones institucionales con las Diócesis, el Císter, otras Órdenes Militares y la Monarquía (segunda parte). Luis Corral Val. Hispania Sacra, 50 (Jan.-June, 1998), 5-34.

Some Mendicant Views of the Origins of the Monastic Profession. Andrew Jotischky. Cristianesimo nella storia,XlX (Feb., 1998), 31-49.

Goffredo de Prefetti and the Church of Bethlehem in England. Nicholas Vinceat.Journal ofEcclesiastical History, 49 (Apr., 1998), 213-235.

Le fondazioni francescane femminili in Molise ed in Puglia nel Duecento. Chiara Spalatro. Collectanea Franciscana, 68 (1-2, 1998), 217-243.

Foundation Dates of Scottish Carmelite Houses. Richard Copsey, O.Carm. Lnnes Review,XUX (Spring, 1998), 41-65.

Thomas d'Aquin compromis avec Gilles de Rome en mars 1277? Roland Hissette. Revue d'histoire ecclésiastique, XCIII (Jan.-June, 1998), 5-25.

Un prince en faillite. Jean de Flandre, évêque de Metz (1279/80-1282), puis de Liège (1282-1291). Alain Marchandisse. Bulletin de la Commission Royale d'Histoire, CLXIII (1997), 1-75.

La scelta topotetica délie penitenti fra Due e Trecento neU'Italia centrale. Mario Sensi. Collectanea Franciscana, 68 (1-2, 1998), 245-275.

Splendor and Peril: The Cathedral of Paris, 1290-1350. Michael T. Davis./lrf Bulletin, LXXX (March, 1998), 34-66.

Towards a New Edition of the Taxatio Ecclesiastica Angliae et Walliae auctoritate P. Nicholai TV circa A.D. 1291 .Jeffrey H. Denton. Bulletin of the fohn Rylands University Library ofManchester, 79 (Spring, 1997), 67-79.

A Barren Metal and the Fruitful Womb: The Program of Giotto's Arena Chapel in Padua. Anne Derbes and Mark Sandona. Art Bulletin, LXXX (June, 1998), 274-291.

Die Rechnung des Pastors zu Dierdorf für Erzbischof Balduin von Trier aus den Jahren 1346 bis 1351. Johannes Witsch. Jahrbuch für westdeutsche Landesgeschichte, 23 (1997), 105-138.

Un petit pèlerinage méconnu: Notre-Dame d'Esquerchin près de Douai (XTVe-XVT siècle). Jean-François Maillot. Revue du Nord, lXXX (Jan.-Mar., 1998), 29-63.

Medieval Italian Pilgrims to Santiago de Compostela: New Literary Evidence. Gloria AHaire. journal of Medieval History, 24 (June, 1998), 177-189.

Maidens' Lights and Wives' Stores: Women's Parish Guilds in Late Medieval England. Katherine L. French. Sixteenth Century Journal, XXLX (Summer, 1998), 399-425.

A Calendar and Text: Christ's Ministry in the York Plays and the Liturgy. Pamela M. Ydng. Medium /Evum, \SNll (1, 1998), 30-59.

The Parodie Sermon in Medieval and Early Modern England. Malcolm Jones. Medium /Evum, LXVI (1, 1997), 94-114.

Nicholas of Cusa: Continuity and Conciliation at the Council of Basel. Peter L. McDermott. Church History, 67 (June, 1998), 254-273-

Le discussioni sul filioque al concilio di Ferrara-Firenze (1438-1439). Luigi Chitarin. Divinitas, XL (Oct., 1997), 78-96.

Représentations provençales et piémontaises de la vie de saint Sébastien: procédés narratifs et sources textuelles. Marie-Pierre Leandri-Morin. Mélanges de l'Ecole Française de Rome, Moyen Âge, 109 (2, 1997), 569-601.

Miracle, Memory, and Meaning in the Canonization of Vincent Ferrer, 1453-1454. Laura A. Smoller. Speculum, 73 (Apr., 1998), 429-454.

Anthony, Son of Roelof, Laybrother of the Cistercian Abbey of Leeuwenhorst (1476-1517/18). Geertruida de Moor. Cistercian Studies Quarterly, 33 (3, 1998), 277-287.

La "Vie" en français de la bienheureuse Véronique de Binasco (t 1497). Sainteté, politique et dévotion au temps des guerres d'Italie. Jean-Michel Matz. Mélanges de l'Ecole Française de Rome, Moyen Âge, 109 (2, 1997), 603-631.

Patronage and Devotion in the Prayer Book of Anne of Brittany, Newberry Library MS 83. Kathleen Kamerick. Manuscripta, 39 (Mar., 1995), 40-50.

SIXTEENTH CENTURY

Devociones religiosas colectivas y conversos en Almagro: la Cofradía de Santa María de Mirabuenos (ss. XV-XVII). Miguel Fernando Gómez Vozmediano. Hispania Sacra, 50 (Jan.-June, 1998), 65-100.

Diplomática eclesiástica granadina: estructura burocrática, gestión y tipos documentales en el siglo XVI. Rafael Marín López. Archivo Teológico Granadino, 60 (1997), 121-199.

Humanism as Method: Roots of Conflict with the Scholastics. Charles G. Nauert. Sixteenth Century Journal, XXLX (Summer, 1998), 427-438.

Das Breve Leos X. an Georg Spalatin von 1518 über die Verleihung der Goldenen Rose an Friedrich den Weisen. Wolfgang Petke. Archiv jür Kulturgeschichte, 80 (1, 1998), 67-104.

Applied Theology at the Deathbed. Luther and the Late-Medieval Tradition of the Ars moriendi. Jared Wicks, S.I. Gregorianum, 79 (2, 1998), 345-368.

The Making of Religious Policy, 1533-1546: Henry VIII and the Search for the Middle Way. G. W. Bernard. Historical Journal, 41 (June, 1998), 321-349.

Papist as Heretic: The Burning of John Forest, 1538. Peter Marshall. Historical Journal, 41 (June, 1998), 351-374.

"I knowe not howe to preache": The Role of the Preacher in Taverner's Postils. Margaret Christian. Sixteenth Century Journal, XXLX (Summer, 1998), 377-397.

Clerical Polemic in Defence of Ministers' Maintenance during the English Reformation. Patrick Carter. Journal of Ecclesiastical History, 49 (Apr., 1998), 236-256.

Gesuiti italiani missionari in Oriente nel XVI secólo. Maria Iris Gramazio. Archivum Historicum Societatis Iesu, LXVI (July-Dec, 1997), 275-300.

Matemáticos españoles jesuítas de los siglos 16 y 17. Albert Dou, SX. Archivum Historicum Societatis Lesu, LXVI (July-Dec, 1997), 301-321.

Sebastiano Castellione J'idea di tolleranza e Topposizione alla política di Filippo IL Carlos Gufy. Rivista Storica Italiana, CX (Jan., 1998), 144-165.

Facciones cortesanas en el Consejo de Cruzada durante el reinado de Felipe II (1562-1585). Henar Pizarra Lorente. Miscelánea Comillas, 56 (Jan.-June, 1998), 159-177.

Protohistoria de los capuchinos en España (1578-1582). Tarcisio de Azcona, O.EM.Cap. Collectanea Franciscana, 68 (1-2, 1998),63-145.

Iglesia e Inquisición en la España Norteafricana: Oran y Mazalquivir a fines del reinado de Felipe II. Beatriz Alonso Acero. Hispania Sacra, 50 (Jan.-June, 1998), 101-132.

A Topographical Index of Hiding Places. Michael Hodgetts. Recusant History, 24 (May, 1998), 1-54.

Jacopo Tintoretto's Altarpiece of St Agnes at the Madonna dell'Orto in Venice and the Memorialisation of Cardinal Contarini. Michael Douglas-Scott./owrnalofthe Warburg and Courtauld Institutes, 60 (1997), 130-163.

SEVENTEENTH AND EIGHTEENTH CENTURIES

Crossing the Divide, Dividing the Cross: Religious and Secular Cultures in Seventeenth-Century France. H. Phillips. Bulletin of the John Rylands University Library of Manchester, 79 (Spring, 1997), 127-142.

Recursos y rentas de la mesa capitular de Jaén (siglo XVII). Hilario Rodríguez de Gracia. Hispania Sacra, 50 (Jan.-June, 1998), 223-249.

Heretics, Slaves and Witches—as seen by Guinea Jesuits c.1610. E E. H. Hair. Journal of Religion in Africa, XXVIII (2, 1998), 131-144.

Immagini per la predicazione: le "imprese sacre" di Paolo Aresi. Errninia Ardissino.i?w2'.sía di Storia e Letteratura Religiosa, XXXSV (1, 1998), 3-25.

The Devil in the Shape of a Man: Witchcraft, Conflict and Belief in Jacobean England. Malcolm Gaskill. Historical Research, LXXI (June, 1998), 142-171.

Das Jahrhundert des Schreckens im Zentrum der Pfalz. Die Deutsch-Ordenskommende Einsiedel ein Spieball der Zeit. Rudolf tendier. Jahrbuch für westdeutsche Landesgeschichte, 23 (1997), 257-282.

Petrus Christus's Our Lady of the Dry Tree. Hugo van der Velden. Journal of the Warburg and Courtauld Institutes, 60 (1997), 89-1 10.

Print and Pageantry in Baroque Rome. Laurie Nussdorfer. Sixteenth Century Journal, XXLX (Summer, 1998), 439-464.

Making Dead Men Speak: Laudianism, Print, and the Works of Lancelot Andrewes, 1626-1642. Peter McCullough. Historical Journal, 41 (June, 1998), 401-424.

Die antiportugiesische Rebellion in Mombasa im Jahre 1631. Luigi Clerici. TVeMe Zeitschrift für Missionswissenschaft, 54 (2, 1998), 132-136.

Quelques documents originaux (1634-1805) découverts dans les archives du "Père Christian" franciscain de Paris. Hugues Dedieu, O.F.M. Collectanea Franciscana, 68 (1-2, 1998), 195-215.

George Archangel Leslie,// Cappucino Scozzese. Ann Dean. Innés Review, XLÏX (Spring, 1998), 66-76.

L'evoluzione moderna di un'antica comunità religiosa russa: il "Nuovo Israele." Antonella Salomon! Rivista di Storia e Letteratura Religiosa, XXXlV (1, 1998), 61-94.

Rome et les protestants du Languedoc. Les missions des frères Lieurin au XVTP siècle. Frédéric Meyer. Mélanges de l'Ecole Française de Rome, Italie et Méditerranée, 109 (2, 1997), 853-879-

El recurso al santoral en Castilla, del barroco a la Ilustración, 1650-1834. Máximo García Fernández. Hispania Sacra, 50 (Jan.-June, 1998), 133-173.

Cofradía de clérigos de San Pedro Zar de Heredia. José Iturrate. Scriptorium Victoriense, XUV (July-Dec, 1997), 243-304.

El coleccionismo particular en el siglo XVII: los cuadros y los libros del doctor Antonio de Riaño y Viedma, cura de la iglesia parroquial de San Miguel, Madrid (1659)· Trevor J. Dadson. Hispania Sacra, 50 (Jan.-June, 1998), 175-222.

Jan Amos Comenio e la teología protestante del suo tempo. Emidio Campi. Cmtianesimo nella ston'a.XLX (Feb., 1998), 51-88.

Port-Royal insolite d'après le Recueil des choses diverses. Jean Lesacúnier. Revue des sciences religieuses, 72 (Jan., 1998), 51-76.

La reconquête catholique en Europe centrale (fin XVIT siècle-début XVIIIe siècle). Daniel Tollet. Mélanges de l'Ecole Française de Rome, Italie et Méditerranée, 109 (2, 1997), 825-852.

Papists' Horses and the Privy Council, 1689-1720. Anthony RJ. S. Adolph. Recusant History, 24 (May, 1998), 55-75.

Emblematische Viten von Jesuitenheiligen im 17./18. Jahrhundert. Éva Knapp and Gábor Tüskés. Archiv für Kulturgeschichte, 80 (1, 1998), 105-142.

The Christianity of Pedro TV of the Kongo, "The Pacific" (1695-1718). Adrian Hastings. Journal of Religion in Africa, KSNUl (2, 1998), 145-159.

Les missions protestantes au XVIIT siècle. Yves Krumenacker. Études Théologiques et Religieuses, 73 (1, 1998), 37-60.

Revelation 13 and the Papal Antichrist in Eighteenth-Century England: A Study in New Testament «segesis. Kenneth G. C. Newport. Bulletin of the John Rylands University Library of Manchester, 79 (Spring, 1997), 143-160.

Fonti documentarle e bibliografía per la storia dei monasteri subalpini: il caso di S. Benedetto di Muleggio. Giuseppe Banfo. Bollettino Storico-Bibliografico Subalpino, XCV (2, 1997), 423-469.

Conjuntos pictóricos de Juan García de Miranda en el convento de San Diego, en Alcalá de Henares (1725-1732). M. Teresa Jiménez Priego. Archivo Ibero-Americano, 58 (Jan.-Apr., 1998), 83-126.

Anti-Methodism in Eighteenth-Century England: The Pendle Forest Riots of 1748. Michael Francis Snape. Journal of Ecclesiastical History, 49 (Apr, 1998), 257-281.

From Demon Possession to Magic Show: Ventriloquism, Religion, and the Enlightenment. Leigh Eric Schmidt. Church History, 67 (June, 1998), 274-304.

The Enlightenment and Romanticism from a Theological Perspective. Martin Henry. Irish Theological Quarterly, 63 (3, 1998), 250-262.

We See a Ghost: Hogarth's Satire on Methodists and Connoisseurs. Bernd Krysmanski. Art Bulletin, LXXX (June, 1998), 292-310.

"Haeres . . . Thomae More Cancellarii": Fr. Thomas More, 1722-1795. Geoffrey Holt, SJ. Recusant History, 24 (May, 1998), 76-88.

Letters from Rome of John Thorpe. March 1781-March 1784. Geoffrey Holt, SJ. Archivum Historicum Societatis Iesu, LXVI (July- Dec, 1997), 323-355.

La Roma del Grand Tour. Memorie e immagini dei viaggiatori inglesi nel '700. Mirella BillLSiMiA Romani,XlN (July-Dec, 1997), 331-346.

Les "Mémoires pour servir à l'histoire des réfugiés françois dans les États du roi" d'Erman et Reclam. Viviane Prest. Bulletin de la Société de l'Histoire du Protestantisme Français, 144 (July-Sept., 1998), 603-615.

Los conventos de San Francisco y San Antonio en la villa de Aranda de Duero (Burgos) durante los siglos XVIII y XIX. José M". Abad Liceras. Archivo Ibero-Americano, 58 (Jan. -Apr., 1998), 5-82.

NINETEENTH AND TWENTIETH CENTURIES

The Blue Nuns in Norwich, 1800 1805. Margaret J.Mason. Recusant History, 24 (May, 1998), 89-122.

Anglicans and Baptists in Conflict: The Bible Society, Bengal, and the Baptizo Controversy. Roger H. Martin. Journal of Ecclesiastical History, 49 (Apr., 1998), 293-316.

La política delle sepolture nel primo Ottocento: un caso locale. Paolo Cozzo. Rivista di Storia e Letteratura Religiosa, XXXIV (1, 1998), 133-147.

The Star in the East: The Controversy over Christian Missions to India, 1805-1813. Karen Chancey The Historian, 60 (Spring, 1998), 507-522.

Un sermón liberal en la Córdoba del Trienio (1820) José García-Cuevas Ventura. Hispania Sacra, 50 (Jan.-June, 1998), 327-341.

Church or Protestant Sect?: The Church of Ireland, High Churchmanship, and the Oxford Movement, 1822-1869. Peter Nockles. Historical Journal, 41 (June, 1998), 457-493-

'How Many Sisters Make a Brotherhood?' A Case Study in Gender and Ecclesiology in Early Nineteenth-Century English Dissent. Timothy Larsen./owma/ of Ecclesiastical History, 49 (Apr., 1998), 282-292.

Der Kirchenbau König Friedrich Wilhelms TV als Bestandteil seiner Residenzgestaltung. Gerlinde Strohmaier-Wiederanders. Berliner Theologische Zeitschrift, 15 (1, 1998), 4-21.

The Beginning of the Jesuit Albanian Mission. Ines Murzaka.Diakonia, 30 (2-3, 1997), 153-163.

De l'hospice de Bordeaux à la côte d'Afrique, le premier frère missionnaire de Libermann, Grégoire Sey (1824-1857). Gérard Morel. Mémoire Spiritaine, No. 7 (1,1998), 28-43.

1848 als Geburtsstunde des deutschen Katholizismus? Unzeitgemäße Betrachtungen zur Erforschung des "Katholischen Vereinswesens." Dominik Burkard.Saeculum,49 (1, 1998),6l-106.

Cien años de propaganda católica: las misiones parroquiales en la archidiócesis Hispalense (1848-1952). José Leonardo Ruiz Sánchez. Hispania Sacra, 50 (Jan.-June, 1998), 275-326.

Lopera del Cardinale Cario VizzardelLi nelle trattative per la stipula del Concordato fra la Santa Sede e il Granducato di Toscana. Stefano Gizzi. Pió IX, XXVII (Jan.-Apr., 1998), 10-41.

Il parère del Cardinale Cario Vizzardelli sui quesiti posti da Papa Pió IX nell'agosto del 1848. Stefano Gizzi. ??? IX, XXVII (Jan.-Apr., 1998), 77-88.

Community and Mission: Spiritual Insights and Salesian Religious Life in Don Bosco's Constitutions. Arthur Lenti, S.D.B. Journal of Salesian Studies, LX (Spring, 1998), 1-57.

Pío TX e le Associazioni di San Francesco di Sales (ricerca storico-ascetica). Arnaldo Pedrini. Pio IX, XXVII (Jan.-Apr., 1998), 61-76.

Ioann of Kronstadt and the Reception of Sanctity, 1850-1988. Nadieszda Ydzenko. Russian Review, 57 (July, 1998), 325-344.

Le osservazioni del Cardinale Antonio Maria Cagiano de Azevedo sulla liceità di far parte del Parlamento Italiano. Stefano Gizzi. ??? IX, XXVII (Jan.-Apr., 1998), 50-60.

The Marist Brothers in Scotland before 1918. T. A. Fitzpatrick. Innés Review, XLIX (Spring, 1998), 1-10.

The Secularization of the Search for Salvation: The Self-Fashioning of Orthodox Clergymen's Sons in Late Imperial Russia. Laurie Manchester. Slavic Review, 57 (Spring, 1998), 50-76.

Mgr Gaume, l'Œuvre apostolique et le rachat des esclaves. Daniel Moulinet. Mémoire Spiritaine, No. 7 (1, 1998), 108-126.

Grammaire et diplomatie sous la Troisième République. La querelle du Nobis nominavit entre la France et le Saint-Siège (1871-1903)- Olivier Poncet. Mélanges de l'École Française de Rome, Italie et Méditerranée, 109 (2, 1997), 895-945.

De l'œuvre charitable à l'institution d'assistance: la société de Saint-Vincent de Paul en France sous la Troisième République. Bruno Oumons. Revue d'histoire ecclésiastique, XCIII (Jan.-June, 1998), 46-64.

Charles Stokes (1852-1895): An Irishman in 19^ Century Africa. Raymond Moloney, SJ. Studies, 87 (Summer, 1998), 128-134.

Lodovico Biagetti da Livorno (1836-1903): missionario, storico, scrittore. Giacomo Carlini, O.EM.Cap. Collectanea Franciscana, 68 (1-2, 1998), 147-194.

Can a Christian Be a Nationalist? Vladimir Solov'ev's Critique of Nationalism. Greg Gaut. Slavic Review, 57 (Spring, 1998), 77-94.

Histoire des spiritains en Suisse Joseph Carrard. Mémoire Spiritaine, No. 7 (1, 1998), 44-73.

Tourisme et diplomatie. Les visites officielles franco-italiennes de 1903-1904 et la Question romaine. Gilles Ferragu. Mélanges de l'École Française de Rome, Italie et Méditerranée, 109 (2, 1997), 947-986.

L'évolution religieuse du diocèse d'Auch au XXe siècle: déchristianisation et sursauts religieux (1914-1955). Maurice Bordes. Annales du Midi, CX (Apr-June, 1998), 205-235.

The Fate of the Catholic Clergy in the USSR, 1917-39- Roman Dzwonkowski. Religion, State & Society, 26 (Mar., 1998), 61-68.

Le Saint-Siège et la Conférence de la paix (1919). Diplomatie d'Église et diplomaties d'État. Giuseppe M. Croce. Mélanges de l'École Française de Rome, Italie et Méditerranée, 109 (2, 1997), 793-823.

Traditional Religion, Popular Piety, or Base Superstition? The Cause for the Beatification of Teresa Higginson. John Davies. Recusant History, 24 (May, 1998), 123-144.

Les Spiritaines à Madagascar: Vingt-sept ans d'apostolat dans l'île Rouge (1/2). Sœurs Anita Disier et Paul Girolet. Mémoire Spiritaine, No. 7 (1, 1998), 74-92.

The Influence of the Swiss Mission on Eduardo Mondlane (1930-1961). Teresa Cruz e Silva. Journal of Religion in AJrica, XXVIII (2, 1998), 187-209.

"Fray Lazo": el anticlericalismo radical ante el debate contituyente de la segunda República Española (1931). Manuel Alvarez Tardío. Hispania Sacra, 50 (Jan.-June, 1998), 251-273.

Studentenseelsorge im Spannungsfeld des Weltanschauungskampfes zwischen Katholischer Kirche und Nationalsozialismus 1933 bis 1945. Jürgen Brüstle. Freiburger Diözesan-Archiv, 117 (1997), 111-215.

Religion and Politics in Angola: The Church, the Colonial State and the Emergence of Angolan Nationalism (1940-1961). Didier Péclard./owwe/ oj Religion in Africa, XXNlll (2, 1998), 160-186.

Myth vs. Historical Fact: Response to Accusations against Pius XII. Pierre Blet, SJ. L'Osservatore Romano, Weekly Edition in English, 31 (Apr. 29, 1998), 16-17,19.

Protestants and Catholics in the German Democratic Republic, 1945-90: A Comparison. Victor Conzemius. Religion, State & Society, 26 (Mar, 1998), 51-59.

The Congregation of Christian Brothers in Scotland, 1951-1983. Frank A. Zwolinski. Innes Review, XUX (Spring, 1998), 11-40.

Jules Monchanin (1895-1957). Regards croisés d'Occident et d'Orient. Françoise Jacquin. Mémoire Spiritaine, No. 7 (1, 1998), 129-143

Church-State Relations in the Decolonisation Period: Hong Kong and Macau. Beatrice Leung. Religion, State & Society, 26 (Mar, 1998), 17-30.

Le Père Yves Congar au Concile Vatican II. Noëlle Hausman, S.C.M. Nouvelle Revue Théologique, 120 (Apr.-June, 1998), 267-281.

The Sacred Heart Seminary of Palo (Leyte): Under the Diocesan Clergy (1969-1994). Ramón Stephen B. Aguilos. Philippiniana Sacra, XXXlïl (May-Aug., 1998), 271-308.

The Progressive Christian Church and Democracy in South Korea. Chang Yun-Shik./owrw«/ of Church and State, 40 (Spring, 1998), 437-465.

AMERICAN AND CANADIAN

Le choix indifférent: mentalités et attentes des jésuites aspirants missionnaires dans J'Amérique française au XVIIe siècle. Giovanni Pizzorusso. Mélanges de l'Ecole Française de Rome, Italie et Méditerranée, 109 (2, 1997), 881-894.

Going to School with Savages: Authorship and Authority among the Jesuits of New France. Peter A. Dorsey William and Mary Quarterly, LV (July, 1998), 399-420.

The Quaker Bibliographic World of Francis Daniel Pastorius's Bee Hive. Alfred L. Brophy. Pennsylvania Magazine of History and Biography, CXXII (July, 1998), 241-291.

"We Have Come to Georgia with Pure Intentions": Moravian Bishop August Gottlieb Spangenberg's Letters from Savannah, 1735. George Fenwick Jones and Paul Martin Peucher. Georgia Historical Quarterly, LXXXII (Spring, 1998), 84-120.

The Franciscan Friars of Mission San Fernando, 1797-1847. Doyce B. Nunis, Jr. Southern California Quarterly, LXXTX, (Fall, 1997), 217-248.

An Annotated List of the Writings of Saint Elizabeth Ann Seton (1). Judith Metz, S.C, and Regina Bechtle, S.C. (Comp.). Vincentian Heritage, XVIII (1, 1997), 101-138.

Episcopal Versus Methodist: Religious Competition in Frontier Worthington. Virginia E. and Robert W. McCormick. Ohio History, 107 (Winter-Spring, 1998), 5-21.

"God's Representative in Our Midst": Toward a History of the Catholic Diocesan Clergy in the United States. Leslie Woodcock Tender. Church History, 67 (June, 1998), 326-349.

"We have left undone those things which we ought to have done": Southern Religious History in Retrospect and Prospect. Donald G. Mathews. Church History, 67 (June, 1998), 305-325.

The Journal of Mother Rose White: The Earliest History of the Sisters of Charity of Saint Joseph's, Emmitsburg, Maryland. Betty Ann McNeil, D.C. (Ed.). Vincentian Heritage, XNlIl (1, 1997), 19-56.

The Indian Via Crucis from Mission San Fernando: An Historical Exposition. Norman Neuerburg. Southern California Quarterly, LXXLX (Fall, 1997), 329-382.

"Pillars in the Same Temple and Priests of the Same Worship": Woman's Rights and the Politics of Church and State in Antebellum America. Nancy Isenberg. fournal ofAmerican History, 85 (June, 1998), 98-128.

American Vincentians in 1877-1878. The Mailer Visitation Report (l).John E. Rybolt, CM. Vincentian Heritage, XVIII (1, 1997), 57-83.

Notable Vincentians (8): Aloysius Meyer, CM. Stafford Poole, CM. Vincentian Heritage, XNlU (1, 1997), 93-100.

The Shaker Church and the Indian Way in Native Northwestern California. Thomas Buckley. American Indian Quarterly, 21 (Winter, 1997), 1-14.

Textbook Wars: Governor-General James Francis Smith and the Protestant-Catholic Conflict in Public Education in the Philippines, 1904- 1907. Judith Rañery. History ofEducation Quarterly, 38 (Summer, 1998), 143-164.

History of Concordia, Portland: 1905-1995. Erhardt P. Weber. Concordia Historical Institute Quarterly,7\ (Spring, 1998), 4-21.

A New England Missionary and African-American Education in Macon: Raymond G. von Tobel at the Ballard Normal School, 1908-1935. Titus Brown. Georgia Historical Quarterly, LXXXII (Summer, 1998), 283-304.

American Baptists and the Japanese-American Internment: Serious Injustices. Paul M. Nagano. American Baptist Quarterly, XVII (June, 1998), 82-144.

Persistence in Religious Faith and Practice: Traditional Holy Week Observances in Socorro, Texas. Lois Stanford. Catholic Southwest, 9 (1998), 75-98.

LATIN AMERICAN

Juan Nuix i Perpinyá, SJ. frente a Bartolomé de las Casas (continuación). Isacio Pérez Fernández, O.P. Studium, XXXVII (3, 1997), 453-487.

La pastoral de la confesión en México (s. XVI) y los ritos penitenciales mesoamericanos. Luis Martínez Ferrer. Neue Zeitschrift für Missionswissenschaft, 54 (3, 1998), 161-192.

Gender and the Politics of Mestizaje: The Convent of Santa Clara in Cuzco, Peru. Kathryn Burns. Hispanic American Historical Review, 78 (Feb., 1998), 5-44.

Le Huguenot au Brésil à travers les documents portugais (1560-1584). Jean-Claude Laborie. Bulletin de la Société de l'Histoire du Protestantisme Français, 144 (July-Sept., 1998), 563-589.

Las décadas iniciales del Monasterio de Santa Clara de Quito, Reflejo de su medio (1596-1640). Jesús Paniagua Pérez. Archivo Ibero-Americano, 58 (Jan.-Apr., 1998), 127-144.

Epistolario de Fray Gaspar de Villarroel, Obispo de Santiago de Chile (1637-1651). Alba María Acevedo. Revista de Historia Americana y Argentina, XLX (No. 37, 1997), 31-84.

De mar a mar: El arzobispado de México a mediados del siglo XVIII. La Relación de Visita ad lirnina de D. Manuel Rubio (1761). José Ignacio Tellechea Idígoras. Scriptorium Victoriense,XLTV (July-Dec, 1997), 209-241.

A Collective Biography of the Rio de la Plata Clergy, 1806-1827. Fidel Iglesias. Latin American Research Review, 33 (2, 1998), 166-183.

La préparation et la convocation du concile plénier de l'Amérique Latine célébré à Rome en 1899. Misael Camus Ibacache. Revue d'histoire ecclésiastique, XClIl (Jan.-June, 1998), 66-82.

OTHER BOOKS RECEIVED

Ames, Charlotte, and William Kevin Cawley (Comps.). Catholic Newspapers in Microform: A Directory of Works at Notre Dame. Second Edition: Summary and Detailed Holdings Versions. (Notre Dame, Ind.: The University Libraries of Notre Dame and the Charles and Margaret Hall Cushwa Center for the Study of American Catholicism. 1997. Pp. xii, 111; xii, 155. Paperback.) This second edition contains a list of 373 newspapers with annotations.

Baker-Smith, Dominic (Ed.). Collected Works of Erasmus, Volume 63: Exposition of the Psalms. Trans, and Annot. Michael J. Heath. (Toronto: University of Toronto Press. 1997. Pp. lxxii, 305. $100.00.)

Berdan, Frances E, and Patricia Rieff Anawalt. The Essential Codex Mendoza. (Berkeley: University of California Press. 1997. Pp. xviii, 268; 16 color folios. Vol. 4:"Pictorial Parallel Image Replicas oí Codex Mendoza." (Pp. 148.) $18.00 paperback.) This book is an adaptation of the four-volume edition of The Codex Mendoza published in 1992. It presents a vivid pictorial and textual account of early-sixteenth-century Aztec life, combining a history of imperial conquests, a tally of provincial tribute, and an ethnographic chronicle of daily customs. It is the most comprehensive of the known Mesoamerican codices.

Bethell, Leslie (Ed.). Latin America: Economy and Society since 1930. [The Cambridge History of Latin America.] (New York: Cambridge University Press. 1998. Pp. ix, 522. $59.95 cloth; $19.95 paperback.)

Bethell, Leslie (Ed.). Latin America: Politics and Society since 1930. [The Cambridge History of Latin America.] (New York: Cambridge University Press. 1998. Pp. ix, 489. $5995 cloth; $21.95 paperback.)

Biggs,B.J. H. (Ed.). The Imitation of Christ. The First English Translation of the "lmitatio Christi" (New York: Oxford University Press. Published for the Early English Text Society. 1997. Pp. fxxx, 249. $50.00.) This translation of Books UII only (Book IV is omitted) was made in the mid-fifteenth century.

Bouchard, Constance Brittain. "Strong of Body, Brave and Noble": Chivalry and Society in Medieval France. (Ithaca, NY.: Cornell University Press. 1998. Pp. xv, 198. $37.50 cloth; $14.95 paperback.) The last chapter deals with "Nobility and the Church."

Brichto, Herbert Chañan. The Names of God: Poetic Readings in Biblical Beginnings. (New York: Oxford University Press. 1998.Pp.xvii,462. $65.00.)

Brown, Catherine. Contrary Things: Exegesis, Dialectic, and the Poetics of Didacticism. [Figurae: Reading Medieval Culture.] (Stanford.: Stanford University Press. 1998. Pp. xvi, 209. $45.00.)

Bulliet, Richard W (Ed.). The Columbia History of the 20" Century. (New York: Columbia University Press. 1998. Pp. xv, 651. $49.95.) "Religion" is dealt with by Zachary Karabell in Chapter 4 (pp. 81-101).

Burrell, David, C.S.C, and Elena Malits, C.S.C. Original Peace: Restoring God's Creation. (Mahwah, N.J.: Paulist Press. 1997. Pp. iv, 103. $8.95 paperback.)

Bury, John B. The Life of St. Patrick and His Place in History. (Mineóla, N.Y: Dover Publications, Inc. 1998. Pp. xxi, 404. $12.95 paperback.) Originally published by Macmillan and Co., Ltd., of London and New York, in 1905. The introduction, by Liam de Paor, is new.

Carrolljackson W (Ed.), et al. Being There: Culture and Formation in Two Theological Schools. [Religion in America Series.] (New York: Oxford University Press. 1997. Pp. x, 299- $35.00.)

Caussadejean Pierre, S.J.^4 Treatise on Prayer from the Heart. A Christian Mystical Tradition Recovered for All. Trans, and Ed. Robert M. McKeon. [Jesuit Primary Sources in English Translation, No. 17.] (Saint Louis: The Institute of Jesuit Sources. 1998. Pp. vi, 249. $17.95 paperback.)

Caviness, Madeline H. Stained Glass Windows. [Typologie des sources du Moyen Âge Occidental, Fase. 76.] (Turnhout: Brepols; Louvain-la-Neuve: Institut d'Études Médiévales. 1996. Pp. 94. Paperback.)

Chadwick, Owen. A History of Christianity. (New York: St. Martin's Press. 1998. Pp. 304. $19-95 paperback.) Originally published by George Weidenfeld and Nicolson, London, in 1995, and reviewed by Hans A. Pohlsander ante, LXXXIII (April, 1997), 281-282.

Clark, Charles. "The Delegitimation of Land Tenure in Tropical Peten, Guatemala." [Research Paper Series, No. 31, May, 1998.] (Albuquerque: Latin American Institute. The University of New Mexico. 1998. Pp. 19, 9 maps. Paperback.)

Cullen, Dolores L. Chaucer's Host: Up-so-Doun. (Santa Barbara: Fithian Press. 1998. Pp. 207. $14.95 paperback.)

Cunningham, Mary Rose, C.S.C. Calendar of Documents and Related Historical Materials in the Archival Center of Los Angeles. (Mission Hills, Calif.: Saint Francis Historical Society. 1997. Pp. viii, 118.) Contents: Part One: The Apostolic Delegation, 1894-1970 (pp. 1-89); Part Two: Roman Agent, Msgr. Salvatore Luzio, 1920-1957 (pp. 90-100); Part Three: Roman Congregations, 1896-1969 (pp. 101-1 18). Each part is followed by its own index.

Dante Alighieri. Dante's Divine Comedy: Purgatory. Journey to Joy, Part Two. Retold, with Notes, by Kathryn Lindskoog. (Macon, Ga.: Mercer University Press. 1997. Pp. xiv, 202.)

De Lubac, Henri. Medieval Exegesis. Volume 1: The Four Senses of Scripture. Trans. Mark Sebanc. [Ressourcement: Retrieval and Renewal in Catholic Thought.] (Grand Rapids,Mich.: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company; Edinburgh: T&T Clark. 1998. Pp. xxiv, 466. $45.00 paperback.) Originally published as Exégèse médiévale, 1: Les quatre sens de l'écriture in 1959.

De Maistre, Joseph. An Examination of the Philosophy of Bacon: Wherein Different Questions of Rational Philosophy Are Treated. Trans, and Ed. Richard A. Lebrun. (Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press. 1998. Pp. lxiv, 331. $75.00.)

Delehaye, Hippolyte. The Legends of the Saints. Trans. Donald Attwater. (Portland, Oreg.: Four Courts Press, c/o International Specialized Book Services. 1998. Pp. xxxiv, 252. $30.00 paperback.) Originally published in French in 1905. This is a translation of the third French edition.

Dominguezjorge I. (Ed.). International Security and Democracy: Latin America and the Caribbean in the Post-Cold War Era. (Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh Press. 1998. Pp. xiv, 346. $50.00 cloth; $22.95 paperback.)

Drogus, Carol Ann. Women, Religion, and Social Change in Brazil's Popular Church. [The Helen Kellogg Institute for International Studies.] (Notre Dame, Ind.: University of Notre Dame Press. 1997. Pp. xiv, 226. $26.00.)

Dutton, Paul Edward (Ed. and Trans.). Charlemagne's Courtier: The Complete Einhard. [Readings in Medieval Civilizations and Cultures: IL] (Peterborough, Ont: Broadview Press. 1998. Pp. liii,199. $12.95 paperback.) The works of Einhard given here in translation are "The Life of Charlemagne," "The Charters,""Art and Architecture,""The Translation and Miracles of the Blessed Martyrs, Marcellinus and Peter," "The Collected Letters," and "The Correspondence with Lupus of Ferrières, Including 'On the Adoration of the Cross.'"

Esortazione (L') apostólica di Paolo VI "Evangelii nuntiandi": Storia, contenuti, ricezione. [Pubblicazioni dell'Istituto Paolo VI, 19.] (Brescia: Istituto Paolo VI; Rome: Edizioni Studium. 1998. Pp. x, 328. Lire 60.000 paperback.)

Fichtenau, Heinrich. Heretics and Scholars in the High Middle Ages, 1000-1200. Trans. Denise A. Kaiser. (University Park: The Pennsylvania State University Press. 1998. Pp. viii, 403. $45.00.) Originally published by the C. H. Beck Verlag of Munich in 1992 under the title Ketzer und Professoren: Häresie und Vernunflglaube im Hochmittelalter and reviewed by John Hiñe Mundy ante, LXXLX (July 1993), 518-519.

Finley, Mitch. The Seeker's Guide to the Christian Story. [Seekers Series.] (Chicago: Loyola Press. 1998. Pp. xxii, 286. $10.95 paperback.)

Flood, David, O.F.M., and Gedeon Gal, O.F.M. (Eds.). Peter offohn Olivi on the Bible: Principia quinqué in sacrant Scripturam; Postilla in Isaiam et in L ad Corinthios. Appendix: Quaestio de oboedientia et sermones duo de S. Francisco. [Franciscan Institute Publications, Text Series, No. 18.] (St.

Bonaventure, N.Y.: Franciscan Institute Publications. 1997. Pp. vi, 431. Paperback.)

Fonti per la storia del movimento sindacale in Italia. Atti del convegno, Roma, 16-17 marzo 1995. [Pubblicazioni degli Archivi di Stato, Quaderni della Rassegna degli Archivi di Stato, 79] (Rome: Ministero per i beni culturali e ambientali, Ufficio centrale per i beni archivistici. 1997. Pp. 183· Paperback.)

Fry, Timothy, O.S.B. (Ed.). The Rule of St. Benedict in English. [Vintage Spiritual Classics.] (New York: Vintage Books. A Division of Random House, Inc. 1998. Pp. xxxvi, 75. $9.95 paperback.)

futuro (II) della memoria. Atti del convegno internazionale di studi sugli archivi di famiglie e di persone, Capri, 9-13 setiembre 1991.2vols. [Pubblicazioni degli Archivi di Stato, saggi 45] (Rome: Ministero per i beni culturall e ambientali, Ufficio centrale per i beni archivistici. 1997. Pp. 446; 449-849. Paperback.)

Garcia, Mario T. The Making of a Mexican American Mayor: Raymond L. Telles of El Paso. [Southwestern Studies, No. 105.] (El Paso: Texas Western Press, the University of Texas at El Paso. 1998. Pp. xii, 187. Paperback.)

Gelbart, Nina Rattner. The King's Midwife: A History and Mystery of Madame du Coudray. (Berkeley: University of California Press. 1998. Pp. xii, 347. $35.00.)

Giussani, Luigi. At the Origin of the Christian Claim. Trans. Viviane Hewitt. (Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press. 1998. Pp. xii, 125. $44.95 cloth; $14.95 paper.)

Gjergji, Lush. Mother Teresa: To Live, To Love, To Witness. Her Spiritual Way. Trans. Jordan Aumann, O.P (Hyde Park, N.Y: New City Press. 1998. Pp. 139. $24.95.)

Goodwin, Richard N. The Hinge of the World in Which Professor Galileo Galilei, Chief Mathematician and Philosopher to His Serene Highness the Grand Duke of Tuscany, and His Holiness Urban VIII, Bishop of Rome, Battle for the Soul of the World: A Drama. (New York: Farrar, Straus and Giroux. 1998. Pp. vü, 209- $25.00.)

Green, Garrett. Imagining God: Theology and the Religious Imagination. (Grand Rapids, Mich.: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company. 1998. Pp. xii, 179. Paperback.)

Green, Peter. Classical Bearings: Interpreting Ancient History and Culture. (Berkeley: University of California Press. 1998. Pp. 328. $18.00 paperback.) Originally published in 1989.

Groóme, Thomas H. Educating for Life: A Spiritual Vision for Every Teacher and Parent. (Allen, Tex.: Thomas More. An RCL Company. 1998. Pp. 472. $19.95.)

Hammer, Jane Ross. Protector: A Life History of Richard Cromwell, Protector of the United Kingdom, 1658-1659/60. The English Sovereign Who

Served According to the Constitution Written by the People of England, Scotland, and Ireland. (New York: Vantage Press. 1997. Pp. xxviii, 263. $17.95.)

Hege, Nathan B. Beyond Our Prayers: Anabaptist Church Growth in Ethiopia, 1948-1998. (Scottdale, Pa.: Herald Press. 1998. Pp. 277. $14.99 paperback.)

Hugo, William R., O.F.M.Cap. Studying the Life of Francis of Assisi. A Beginner's Workbook. (Quincy Ill.: Franciscan Press. 1996. Pp. xv, 223. $17.95 paperback.) The purpose of this large-format book is to guide students at all levels of background to a knowledge of St. Francis through twelfth- and thirteenth-century sources.

Jensen, Lionel M. Manufacturing Confucianism: Chinese Traditions and Universal Civilization. (Durham, N.C.: Duke University Press. 1997. Pp. xxi, 444. $5995 cloth; $19-95 paperback.) The scholar asked to review this book replied: "Jensen's book is a typical product of contemporary (and, I am sure, short-lived) hype of postmodern, deconstructivist window-smashing history writing, and his main thesis—Confucianism being an artificial 'construct' produced by the Jesuits—is so patently absurd that it does not deserve to be disclaimed."

Kay, Richard (Trans.). Dante's Monarchia. [Studies and Texts, 131] (Toronto: Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies. 1998. Pp. xliii, 449. $85.00.)

Kempis, Thomas à. The Imitation of Christ in Four Books. Revised Edition. Trans. Joseph N. Tylenda, SJ. [Vintage Spiritual Classics.] (New York: Vintage Books. A Division of Random House, Inc. 1998. Pp. xliv, 242. $995 paperback.)

Kohl, Benjamin G. Padua under the Carrara, 1318-1405. (Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press. 1998. Pp. xxvi,466. $45.00.)

Kydd, Ronald A.N. Healing through the Centuries: Models for Understanding. (Peabody Mass.: Hendrickson Publishers. 1998. Pp. xxxi, 235. Paperback.)

Landes, Richard. Relics, Apocalypse, and the Deceits of History. Ademar of Chabannes, 989-1034. (Cambridge, Mass. .Harvard University Press. 1995. Pp. xii, 404. $55.00.)

Levinas, Emmanuel. Of God Who Comes to Mind. Trans. Bettina Bergo. [Meridian: Crossing Aesthetics] (Stanford.: Stanford University Press. 1998. Pp. xvi,211. $45.00 cloth; $17.95 paperback.)

Loomis, Albertine. Grapes of Canaan: Hawaii 1820. (Woodbridge, Conn.: Ox Bow Press. 1998. Pp. xvi, 334. $19.95 paperback.) This documentary novel on the representatives of the First Company of New England in the Hawaiian Islands was originally published in 1951. The author was a great-granddaughter of two of them.

Lydon, James. The Making of Ireland: From Ancient Times to the Present. (New York: Routledge. 1998. Pp. x, 425. $22.99 paperback.)

MacCulloch, Diarmaid. Thomas Cranmer-.A Life. (New Haven: Yale University Press. 1996. Pp. xii, 692. $35.00.)

Main, Jackson Turner. Inherited or Achieved? The Social Origins of the World's Leaders 2000 B.C. to A.D. 1850. (St. James, N.Y: Brandywine Press. 1998. Pp. xix, 375.)

Manent, Pierre. Modern Liberty and Its Discontents. Ed. and Trans. Daniel J. Mahoney and Paul Seaton. (Lanham. Md.: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, Inc. 1998. Pp. vi, 237. $58.00 cloth; $22.95 paperback.)

McCaffrey, Lawrence J. The Irish Catholic Diaspora in America. (Washington, D.C.:The Catholic University of America Press. 1997. Pp. ix, 253. $24.95 paperback.) Originally published as The Irish Diaspora in America by Indiana University Press in 1976 and reprinted by the Catholic University of America Press in 1984; this edition is revised. Reviewed by James P. Walsh ante, LXIII (October, 1977), 649-650.

Mikalson, Jon D. Religion in Hellenistic Athens. [Hellenistic Culture and Society, XXLX.] (Berkeley: University of California Press. 1998. Pp. xii, 364. $48.00.)

Morando, Umberto (Ed.). Regesto dei documenti ufficiali promulgati da Paolo VI. [Pubblicazioni dell'Istituto Paolo VI, 20.] (Brescia: Istituto Paolo VI; Rome: Edizioni Studium. 1997. Pp. ?, 215. Lire 60.000 paperback.)

Murphy, Cullen. The Word According to Eve: Women and the Bible in Ancient Times and Our Own. (New York: Houghton Mifflin Company. A Peter Davison Book. 1998. Pp. xiii, 277. $23.00 paperback.)

Murphy, Daniel. Christianity and Modern European Literature. (Portland, Oreg.: Four Courts Press, c/o International Specialized Book Services. 1997. Pp. 544. $65.00.) There are chapters on Dostoevsky Tolstoy, Unamuno, Mauriac, T. S. Eliot, Pasternak, Osip Mandelstam, Anna Akhmatova, W H. Auden, Patrick White, Czeslaw Milosz, and Joseph Brodsky.

Nelson, Stephanie A. God and the Land: The Metaphysics of Farming in Hesiod and Vergil. With a translation of Hesiod's Works and Days by David Grene. (New York: Oxford University Press. 1998. Pp. xviii, 252. $55.00.)

Neusner, Jacob, and Bruce Chilton. fewish-Christian Debates: God, Kingdom, Messiah. (Minneapolis: Fortress Press. 1998. Pp. xiv, 240. $24.00 paperback.)

Newman, John Henry. Fifteen Sermons Preached before the University of Oxford between A.D. 1826 and 1843- In the Definitive Third Edition of 1872. [Notre Dame Series in the Great Books.] (Notre Dame, Ind.: University of Notre Dame Press. 1997. Pp. *lii,xxiv, 351. $14.95 paperback.)

Olson, Lynette (Ed.). Religious Change, Conversion and Culture. (Sydney: Sydney Studies. 1996. Pp. viii, 273· $20.00 paperback.) This volume contains thirteen essays on conversion in medieval Europe, modern India, aboriginal Australia, the Middle East, and New Guinea.

Ombre e luci della Restaurazione: Trasformazioni e continuità istituzionali nei territori del Regno di Sardegna. Atti del convegno, Torino 21-24 ottobre 1991. [Pubblicazioni degli Archivi di Stato, saggi 43] (Rome: Ministero

per i beni culturali e ambientali, Ufficio centrale per i beni archivistici. 1997. Pp. 782. Paperback.)

Pabel, Hilmar M. Erasmus' Vision of the Church. [Sixteenth Century Essays & Studies, Vol. XXXIIL] (Kirksville.Mo.: Sixteenth Century Journal Publishers, Inc. 1995. Pp. xxii, 170. $35.00.) This volume contains five essays: James D. Tracy, "Erasmus among the Postmodernists: Dissimulatio, Bonae Literae, and Docta Pietas Revisited" (pp. 1-40); Erika Rummel, "Monachatus non estpietas: Interpretations and Misinterpretations of a Dictum" (pp. 41-55); Hilmar M. Pabel, "The Peaceful People of Christ: The Irenic Ecclesiology of Erasmus of Rotterdam" (pp. 57-93); Irena Backus, "Erasmus and the Spirituality of the Early Church" (pp. 95-1 14); Germain Marc'hadour, "Erasmus as Priest: Holy Orders in His Vision and Practice" (pp. 115-149).

Pagnotta, Walter (Ed.). Riconoscimenti dipredicati italiani e di titoli nobiliari pontifici nella Repubblica italiana. [Pubblicazioni degli Archivi di Stato, sussidi 9J (Rome: Ministero per i beni culturali e ambientali, Ufficio centrale per i beni archivistici. 1997. Pp. 345.)

Paolo VI. Discorsi at vescovi italiani. Ed. Carlo Ghidelli. [Quaderni dell'Istituto, 15.] (Brescia: Istituto Paolo VI; Rome: Edizioni Studium. 1997. Pp. xviii, 348. Lire 50.000 paperback.) A collection of Paul VTs addresses to the Italian Episcopal Conference, to regional conferences gathered in Rome for their ad limina visits, and to other groups on various occasions.

Paravicini Bagliani, Agostino (Ed.), et al. Les pays romands au Moyen Age. [Collection "Territoires."] (Lausanne: Editions Payot. 1997. Pp. 640. FS 79.00.) In Part II Chapter 4 deals with "Les principautés episcopales" in four brief essays on the bishops of Sion, Basel, Lausanne, and Geneva, and in Part III the first section is entitled "Institutions religieuses"; it consists of essays on "Les évêchés et leurs métropoles," "L'organisation paroissiale," "Les dédicaces des églises: Lausanne et Sion." "Le pouvoir de l'inquisition," and "Exorcismes, malédictions et procès d'animaux;" finally in PartV there is an essay on "L'architecture religieuse."

Pelikan, Jaroslav. What Has Athens to Do with Jerusalem? Timaeus and Genesis in Counterpoint. [Jerome Lectures, 21.] (Ann Arbor: The University of Michigan Press. 1997. Pp. xvi, 139. $27.95.)

Peters, Edward (Ed.). The First Crusade: The Chronicle of Fulcher of Chartres and Other Source Materials. Second Edition. [The Middle Ages Series.] (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press. 1998. Pp. xiv, 317. $1995 paperback.) Originally published in 1971.

Phan, Peter C. Responses to 101 Questions on Death and Eternal Life. (Mahwah, N.J.: Paulist Press. 1997. Pp. x, 133. $9.95 paperback.)

Pirulo, Nestore (Ed.). // vincolo del giuramento e il tribunate della coscienza. [Istituto trentino di cultura, Annali dell'Istituto storico italo-germanico, Quaderno, 47.] (Bologna: Società éditrice il Mulino. 1997. Pp. 490. Lire 62.000 paperback.) Among the fourteen articles published here are "Il giuramento: storia e teología," by Giampiero Bof (pp. 57-75); "Silenzio e co-

scienza: il giuramento di [Thomas] More," by Michèle Nicoletti (pp. 79-128); and "L'evoluzione degli 'Esecutori contro la bestemmia' a Venezia in età moderna," by Vittorio Frajese (pp. 171-211).

Pizzo, Marco (Ed.). L'Archivio storico della Camera di commercio di Rieti. Inventario. [Pubblicazioni degli Archivi di Stato, Quaderni della Rassegna degli Archivi di Stato, 83] (Rome: Ministero per i beni culturali e ambientali, Ufficio centrale per i beni archivistici. 1997. Pp. 196. Paperback.)

Pulsiano, Phillip, and Elaine M. Treharne (Eds.). Anglo-Saxon Manuscripts and Their Heritage. (Brookfield,Vt.: Ashgate. 1998. Pp. xiv, 304. $76.95.)

Randeraad, Nico. Autorità in cerca di autonomía. Lprefetti nell'Ltalia liberale. [Pubblicazioni degli Archivi di Stato, saggi 43] (Rome: Ministero per i beni culturali e ambientali, Ufficio centrale per i beni archivistici. 1997. Pp. 315. Paperback.)

Ruether, Rosemary Radford. Women and Redemption: A Theological History. (Minneapolis: Fortress Press. 1998. Pp. xi, 366. $45.00.)

Samway, Patrick H., SJ. Walker Percy: A Life. (New York: Farrar, Straus and Giroux. 1997. Pp. xix, 506. $35.00.)

Sarasohn, Lisa T. Gassendi's Ethics: Freedom in a Mechanistic Universe. (New York: Cornell University Press. 1996. Pp. xiii, 236. $45.00.)

Schmolke-Hasselmann, Beate. The Evolution of Arthurian Rromance: The Verse Tradition from Chrétien to Froissart. Translated by Margaret and Roger Middleton. [Cambridge Studies in Medieval Literature, 35.] (New York: Cambridge University Press. 1998. Pp. xlix, 321. $59.95.)

Schroeder, Susan (Ed.). Native Resistance and the Pax Colonial in New Spain. (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press. 1998. Pp. xxvi, 200. $45.00 cloth; $19.95 paperback.)

Schweitzer, Albert. The Quest of the Historical Jesus: A Critical Study of Its Progress from Reimarus to Wrede. (Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press in association with The Albert Schweitzer Institute. 1998. Pp. xviii, 413. $18.95 paperback.) Originally translated into English in 1910; this edition was originally published by Macmillan of New York in 1968.

Sowell, Thomas. Conquests and Cultures: An International History. (New York: Basic Books, a member of The Perseus Books Group. 1998. Pp. xvi, 493. $35.00.)

Stackhouse, Reginald. The End of the World? A New Look at an Old Belief. (Mahwah, N.J.: Paulist Press. 1997. Pp. viii, 136. $11.95 paperback.)

Stinger, Charles L. The Renaissance in Rome. (Tiloomington: Indiana University Press. 1998. Pp. xxxii, 444. $49.95 cloth; $19.95 paperback.) Originally published in 1985 and reviewed by Randolph Starn ante, LXXIII (October, 1987), 585-586.

Stopp, Elisabeth. A Man to Heal Differences: Essays and Talks on St. Francis de Sales. (Philadelphia: Saint Joseph's University Press. 1997. Pp. xvi, 202. $21.95 paperback.)

Swartley, Willard M., and Donald B. Kraybill (Eds.). Building Communities of Compassion: Mennonite Mutual Aid in Theory and Practice. (Scottdale, Pa.: Herald Press. A Pandora Press U.S. Book. 1998. Pp. 319. $14.99 paperback.)

Taft, Robert E, SJ. (Ed.). The Armenian Christian Tradition. Scholarly Symposium in Honor of the Visit to the Pontifical Oriental Institute, Rome, of His Holiness Karekin I, Supreme Patriarch and Catholicos of All Armenians, December 12, 1996. [Orientalia Christiana Analecta, 254.] (Rome: Pontificio Istituto Orientale. 1997. Pp. 197. Paperback.)

Tobin, Frank (Trans.). Mechthild of Magdeburg: The Flowing Light of the Godhead. [The Classics of Western Spirituality.] (Mahwah, N.J.: Paulist Press. 1998. Pp. xl, 373. $24.95 paperback.)

Townsend, David, and Andrew Taylor (Eds.). The Tongue of the Fathers: Gender and Ideology in Twelfth-Century Latin. [The Middle Ages Series.] (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press. 1998. Pp. vi, 211. $37.50.) Among the seven essays published here are "Caput afemina, membra a viris: Gender Polemics in Abelard's Letter 'On the Authority and Dignity of the Nun's Profession,'" by Alcuin Blamires (pp. 55-79), and "The Color of Salvation: Desire, Death, and the Second Crusade in Bernard of Clairvaux's Sermons on the Song of Songs" by Bruce Holanger (pp. 156-186).

Tylendajoseph N.,S.].fesuit Saints & Martyrs: Short Biographies of the Saints, Blessed, Venerables, and Servants of God of the Society of Jesus. Second Edition. (Chicago: Jesuit Way, an imprint of Loyola Press. 1998. Pp. xviii, 478. $14.95 paperback.) The first edition was published in 1984. Since then six Jesuits have been canonized; twelve have been beatified, and four have been declared venerable. In all there are nineteen new entries dealing with twenty-four additional Jesuits.

Ugolino di Monte Santa Maria. The Little Flowers of St. Francis of Assist. Ed. and Trans. W. Heywood. [Vintage Spiritual Classics.] (New York: Vintage Books. A Division of Random House, Inc. 1998. Pp. xxxviii, 120. $995 paperback.)

Weber, Francis J. The Literary High Spots of Mission Hills, California: Reflections on the Library Attached to the Archival Center, Archdiocese of Los Angeles. (Mission Hills, Calif.: Saint Francis Historical Society. 1998. Pp. viii, 116. Paperback.) A sampling of the more than 10,000 volumes collected by the author.

Wills, Lawrence M. The Quest of the Historical Gospel: Mark, John, and the Origins of the Gospel Genre. (New York: Roudedge. 1997. Pp. viii, 285. $75.00.)