DAVID J. O'BRIEN
President of the
American Catholic Historical Association
1998

The Catholic Historical Review

VOL. LXXXV APRIL, 1999 No. 2

WHEN IT ALL CAME TOGETHER: BISHOP JOHN J. WRIGHT AND THE DIOCESE OF WORCESTER, 1950-1959

David J. O'Brien*

I want to express my sincere gratitude to the members of the Association for allowing me to serve as president. I have drawn inspiration over a lifetime from the work of so many of you. When I was still a graduate student, more than thirty years ago, Father Harry Browne tracked me down at one of these AHA meetings to challenge my first published article, which contained some criticism of my elders in the field of U.S. Catholic history. Brown, who became a lifelong friend, then introduced me to Monsignor John Tracy Ellis, and through the two of them and another benefactor, Francis L. Broderick, president in 1968, I was ushered into this field, mentored we would say today. Their witness persuaded me that one could do no better work for our church and our country than to join the small but talented brigade of scholars, historians, theologians, and social scientists who were opening up the whole field of American Catholic Studies. To have the privilege of presiding over this Association, one of the centers of Catholic intellectual life, is a high honor for which I am sincerely grateful.

Please regard these highly provisional remarks about Bishop John J. Wright and the infant Diocese of Worcester in the 1950's as an invita-

*Dr. O'Brien is Loyola Professor of Roman Catholic Studies in the College of the Holy Cross, Worcester, Massachusetts. He prepared this paper as his presidential address but because of illness could not attend the seventy-ninth annual meeting of the American Catholic Historical Association. He therefore asked the second vice-president, Sister Alice Gallin,O.S.U.,to read a shorter version of it in his place at a luncheon held in the Marriott Wardman Park Hotel in Washington, D.C, on January 9, 1999.

tion to further reflection on the experience of the American Catholic community between the end of World War II and the opening of the Second Vatican Council. When I began to work in this field everyone argued that we needed more studies of the American Church in the twentieth century if we were to understand our experience of change in the 1960's. We now have had an exceptional development of American Catholic historical scholarship, including remarkable work on Catholic life from 1900 through the 1930's. But, aside from the pioneering work of John McGreevy,[1] the years of war and cold war remain more or less untouched. One result is that we historians have made a less significant contribution than we should have to the self-understanding, and thus to the common life, of the American Church.

Several years ago, after finishing my history of the Diocese of Syracuse, I delivered the annual Loyola Lecture at Lemoyne College. I organized the talk around three questions about the church of Syracuse: what did it mean when they put it together? what did it mean when they had it together? what did it mean when it all (well, almost all) fell apart? I still think they are pretty good questions. Today I want to ask the second question of another particular time and place, Worcester under John Wright.[2]

Did it really all come together in Worcester in the 1950's? If one will accept a caveat about the ambiguity of all success stories, I think the answer is yes. The coming together began on February 1, 1950, when the Associated Press wire-informed the local newspaper that Worcester county was now separated from the Diocese of Springfield and was a new diocese with its cathedral at St. Paul's Church, under John J. Wright, at that moment auxiliary bishop of Boston. The news was not unexpected; rumors had spread after the death several months earlier of the Bishop of Springfield, Thomas Mary O'Leary, that Worcester's time had finally come. St. Paul's was a surprise. Built two generations earlier as a potential cathedral by an impressive Americanist, John Power, St. Paul's leadership role had been lost to another church and its powerful pastor. As for the new bishop, he had some important clerical contacts locally but was unknown to the general public. John Deedy, then a young reporter for the Worcester Telegram, was sent out to find Wright because he had met him briefly in Dublin a year earlier. Deedy, later

[1] John McGreevy, Parish Boundaries: The Catholic Encounter with Race in the Twentieth-Century Urban North (Chicago, 1996).

[2] I am grateful for assistance on this paper by the diocesan historian Owen Murphy, retired editor of the Catholic Free Press, Jennifer Regan of Worcester, and Holy Cross students Jill Fontaine, Mary Gonzalez, Danielle Rinella, and Stephanie Pacheko.

picked by Wright to begin his diocesan newspaper, remembers that he reported that Wright, like any good Bostonian, was a Red Sox fan. Later he learned that the bishop hadn't the faintest interest in sports.3

Worcester county was forty by fifty miles, with numerous small towns, some beginning to grow into suburbs. Its 250,000 Catholics constituted about half the population. The city was, and remains, the second largest in New England. With a diverse industrial base, the Worcester area prospered in the war years, and employment remained strong through the 1950's, although the departure of textiles and wire manufacturing put strains on the local economy. Worcester itself had a rich mix of European ethnic communities among its 200,000 people. A large Irish population still fought for political dominance with a Republican alliance of Protestant Yankees and Swedes, but the city also included large numbers of French, Italian, Lithuanian, and Polish Catholics. For a variety of historical reasons Worcester's African-American population was tiny, and its Spanish-speaking community remained small throughout the Wright years. Finally, and in many ways most important, Worcester was a classic second city, its confidence smothered by Boston, forty miles away. (Aside: many years later, in 1975, when Worcester opened its new Civic Center with Frank Sinatra singing among other things "New York, New York," the next day's banner headline read: "NO MORE LITTLE TOWN BLUES.") For Catholics there was another problem: they felt that the Bishop of Springfield consistently neglected their local church.4

It was this intangible of chronic hurt feelings that best explains the outpouring of civic and ecclesiastical enthusiasm that greeted John Wright. All Catholics obviously welcomed elevation to diocesan status. Some priests may have been apprehensive, but most seemed genuinely excited by the prospect of local leadership and reorganization. Wright wisely moved immediately to enlist key local priests: John Gannon, who had studied with Wright in Rome, advised on the ceremonies, then became a very able chancellor, later vicar general. David Sullivan, from a well connected local family, advised Wright on invitations and "who was who" in Worcester; he too quickly became a Wright intimate and head of Catholic Charities. When Wright named his first diocesan appointments, twenty-two of them, all priests, seven were Worcester natives and eighteen Holy Cross graduates.

'"The Green Years," Catholic Free Press, March 4, 1955; interview by Owen Murphy with John Deedy, January 19, 1996; transcribed memoir of the first days of the diocese by Monsignor John E Gannon, made available by Owen Murphy.

4"The Worcester Diocese after Twenty Five Years," Worcester Telegram, April 13, 1975.

Clerical backing and lay enthusiasm could be expected. What was truly remarkable, and is vividly remembered as such, was the welcome offered by the non-Catholic establishment. Wright reached out early to Protestant, Jewish, and civic leaders, and they responded. Men and institutions long thought hostile to Catholics appeared genuinely appreciative of the ecclesiastical honor bestowed on the city. As for John Wright, for them it was love at first sight. His years of friendship with Worcester's elite began when the newspaper publisher George Booth and the industrialist Harry Stoddard presented him with a photograph album of his installation day.5 Wright said he wanted to make the church "a more indestructibly intimate part of every local community in which it finds itself" and he got off to a good start.6

Wright was born in 1909 in Dorchester of mixed Irish and English parentage, the oldest of six children in a working-class family. He was a brilliant student at Boston Latin School, Boston College, St. John's Seminary, for a year, then in Rome. He loved the city and the Roman church and was ever afterwards thought of as "Roman." Wright stayed on after his 1935 ordination to win a doctorate in 1937 with a timely and widely cited thesis on National Patriotism in Papal Teaching.7 Summers he served in parishes in Scotland, England, and France, his second love after the Eternal City. There he began his lifelong fascination with St. Joan of Arc. Returning to Boston, he was installed as a professor at the seminary, then became William Cardinal O'Connell's secretary, a position he continued to occupy with the Cardinal's successor, Richard Cushing, until he was made an auxiliary bishop in 1947. During the Worcester years Cushing continued to rely upon the able and eloquent Wright, who regularly advised him on local and national church affairs and wrote many of his major speeches. But it was his patron, O'Connell, the highly educated Roman, whom Wright admired, and in some sense tried to emulate. Catholicism with its rich history and tested wisdom, deserved a place of prominence in public life, everywhere, and certainly in Worcester.

Wright's personal eloquence and charisma, combined with the second city's lust for recognition, all but guaranteed such a place for the new church of Worcester. At forty, he was the nation's youngest bishop. Already he was an established national figure as episcopal leader of the

'Bishop John Wright, Homily at Silver Jubilee of Diocese of Worcester, April 19, 1975, copy in Wright Papers, Archives, Diocese of Worcester (hereafter ADW).

'Worcester Telegram, September 29, 1950, Scrapbooks, ADW

'National Patriotism in Catholic Teaching (Westminster, Maryland, 1939).

lay retreat movement, sponsor of the Catholic Association for International Peace, and writer and lecturer on Catholic history and culture. In an adoring profile his friend, the writer Dorothy Wayman, called him "the Benjamin among American bishops." She thought he resembled "a sixteenth-century portrait of an Italian cardinal . . . olive skin, glossy black hair, piercing black eyes and a blue-black chin that requires shaving twice a day."[8] Thick set, he had weight problems during the Worcester years, although he once bragged to his friend Paul Dudley White that he had lost thirty-five pounds.[9]

Always a public man, he was a member of Boston's Athenaeum and the Somerset Club. Although he had no parish experience in the United States, he did serve as chaplain for Boston's League of Catholic Women and had made a host of well placed, and well-to-do, Catholic friends. The latter were always generous, as is evident in his correspondence, and Wright seemed never to lack for funds for favorite causes, from deserving students to émigré intellectuals. His energy was legendary. The editor John Deedy often spent his day off searching bookstores and antique barns with Wright, but he rarely saw him on business during the day. Instead, Wright regularly called by telephone after midnight, sometimes for a chat, sometimes to deliver a not very optional invitation to drop by the bishop's house.[10]

Wright participated in a variety of national organizations, lectured across the country, and carried on an enormous correspondence. He joined Cushing on long pilgrimages almost every year, and he could be counted on for friends' weddings, baptisms, and funerals. He served as episcopal moderator for the Laywomen's Retreat Movement and for the Mariological Society of America. He was an active member of a variety of internationalist organizations and a fellow of the American Academy of Arts and Sciences. He offered informal advice to almost every movement for renewal in the Church, lunching with Commonweal editors on trips to New York, advising liturgical reformers on how to deal with the bishops, and responding to almost daily requests to speak across the country. And yet memories locally are of his availability and his informal drop-ins, for dinner monthly at a fraternity at Worcester Polytechnic Institute, for boxing matches at Mt. Carmel's always busy parish center, at a diocesan staffer's home during a family crisis. Youth, intelligence, loy-

[8] Article enclosed with Wayman to Wright, March 17, 1950, Wright Papers, ADW

[9] Paul Dudley White warned Wright on his weight. White to Wright, January 5, 1954, and April 23, 1957, and Wright to White, March 4, 1959, in Wright Papers, ADW.

[10] Deedy interview.

alty, national reputation, enormous energy, and absolute confidence in himself and his Church: it was a formula written in heaven for a new diocese at a promising moment in national life.

Without question Wright's first priority was the firm establishment of the diocesan church. He selected an able group of consultors and an equally able administrative body to assist with finances, using a few lay advisors and making sure to accord due recognition to the diverse ethnic interests in the diocese. And he did consult them regularly; every major decision seems to have had a full airing with one group or the other. He attempted to draw the established clerical leaders into his orbit, and with one or two exceptions he succeeded. At the same time he constructed his own team with the trusted Gannon, the savvy Sullivan, and talented younger priests such as John Martin, who took charge of youth programs, and Edmund Haddad, who moved the diocese into self-insurance and development funds.

Wright knew well the feudal power of pastors that had long hampered Boston's bishops, and he took on an area always at a distance from Springfield's diocesan administration. He knew he could not get full control overnight, and he did not try to. But with the consent of the consultors he set the rules: a limit of $1000 for expenditures without diocesan approval; central office approval of all construction contracts; annual reviews of parish financial records, now with uniform bookkeeping, to be carried out at chancery rather than in the parish. Parishes were now forbidden to publish personal contribution reports "for fear of libel suits." No parish checking account could maintain a balance of more than $60,000 and no transfer from savings to checking accounts could be made without the bishop's permission. The consultors approved regulations that encouraged expanding parishes to deposit their surplus with and seek their loans from the diocese. Wright told the consultors that another bishop had established a diocesan credit union and simply refused to cosign loan applications for pastors who stayed out. He would not go that far, but he would try to persuade people to participate. It would free the Church from the banks (a widespread post-depression goal), create a sizable investment pool, earn interest for the diocese, and lead to "prestige" in "financial circles," which might prove helpful when loans were needed in the future. Apparently these efforts were successful, as Wright seemed to command a solid budget for diocesan activities. When Wright suggested a million-dollar drive for diocesan funds, his consultors persuaded him simply to con-

tinue the sizable parish assessments that had funded the self-insurance program."

Wright's caution and skill were evident in one early episode when the elderly and ailing pastor of a Polish parish in Clinton left town. Wright used the situation to deal with the parish's lay trustees, a structure that had been allowed to persist because of the threat posed years before by the Polish National Church. Consultors warned of public scandal, but Wright lectured them on the history of trusteeism and the reasons for diocesan control. Eventually Wright was able to assist the retired pastor in exchange for the transfer of the deed from the trustees to the diocese.12

The most important goal of Wright's administration, as he saw it, was to reduce the size of parishes. In all he oversaw establishment of twenty-nine new parishes, most in the first five years. Some were rural missions ready to graduate to suburban churches; others represented population growth in Worcester and other urban areas. Wright thought "small, compact parishes" desirable on pastoral and administrative grounds, but he argued that they also allowed men ordained fifteen years, at the peak of their energy and enthusiasm, to take charge of their own parishes. At the start he had told the priests that parish needs, not seniority, would determine all clerical appointments. These policies undoubtedly help account for Wright's great popularity with his priests.13

Wright worked hard to make his priests accountable. The diocese set salaries for parish staffs and parochial school sisters. School construction was halted until a full survey was made of parish schools and the vast number of necessary repairs completed. Annual conferences for senior and junior priests always had a substantive agenda. Hoping for learned priests, he resisted appeals to reduce seminary time in order to get men on the job more quickly.

He regularly challenged his priests on controversial pastoral matters. One issue was mixed marriages. Many lay people knew that neighboring dioceses were allowing such marriages to take place in the church, rather than in the rectory. At first Wright and the consultors simply let pastors know that the church option was available on request. How-

"Consultors minutes, November 6, 1952, February 21, 1956, and March 29, 1957, Consultors File, ADW

"Consultors minutes, November 6, 1952, ADW

"Clergy Conference Notes for September 13, 1950, and May 15, 1951; interview, Worcester Gazette, February 25, 1955, Scrapbooks, ADW

ever, after one particularly insensitive episode, in which the bride fainted while her mother and the priest argued, they reversed the order and made clear that the choice should be made on the basis of the preference of the people.14

On several other issues Wright spoke sharply to priests. One was harsh treatment by pastors of young women with unplanned pregnancies. Wright took a special interest in this issue, helping his Catholic Charities staff begin a home and saying Mass there on a regular basis. He made a similarly sharp statement of policy regarding the pastoral treatment of people with mental health problems. He was angered by reports of negative comments regarding psychiatry and mental health professionals, and he let the priests know it. He was also disturbed all through the Worcester years by the danger of priests leaving behind "scandalous wills." When one was reported in the press, he urged his priests to make wills and file copies with the diocese.15 He complained later that the last twenty priests who had died had left more than two million dollars and less that ten percent of that was given to religious causes.

Still, Wright was clerical to the core, and this was a priest's church. Priests were to teach religion in their schools because the sisters were "not prepared or equipped to do so."16 When one priest was assigned to start a new parish in Worcester, he called a meeting of his new parishioners to seek their ideas about the new church they would build. When Wright heard about this, he exploded: "I appointed one man pastor of that parish, not two hundred lay people." There were no further meetings and the new church was designed by the pastor, the architect, and diocesan officials.17

Always Wright was conscious of the ethnic factor. The Irish, about a third of the Catholic population, still provided half the priests, but Wright made sure that other groups were represented in the chancery and that new diocesan policies did not infringe on the interests of eth-

14Consultors minutes, March 24, 1953, October 11, 1955,ADW. One pastor, faced with a woman interested in the faith, nevertheless insisted on a rectory wedding. During the ceremony, they argued and the bride fainted. After that Wright made it clear that the wedding should normally be performed in church.

"On pastoral care of unwed mothers see consultors minutes for March 11, 1952, and Notes for a Clergy Conference, September 22, 1953, and April 30, 1957. On mental illness see Clergy Conference notes for May 24, 1954. Discussion of "scandalous wills" began in 1950 and continued throughout the Wright years. See in particular consultors minutes for March 11, 1952, and Clergy Conference notes for September 12, 1950, and May 13-14, 1952.

"Clergy Conference, September 16, 1952, notes in ADW.

"Deedy interview.

nie parishes. When conflicts with territorial parishes arose over "affiliation," Wright seemed to lean toward the national parishes.18 He supported construction of a new mission chapel for Poles in Dudley and encouraged Slovaks in Webster to build a school, the only one in the state. His new diocesan newspaper, the Catholic Free Press, carried occasional columns in French, Italian, Lithuanian, and Polish. Gannon reported that the local Italian community had suffered losses in the past because of the lack of priests, but clerical and lay support for advancing religion was now intense. Indeed Worcester's Mount Carmel parish was among the most active in the diocese. This center of Worcester's Italian life, with a pastor and four assistants, opened a large new community center in 1953, backed construction of a new mission church for the growing Italian population in the Grafton Hill neighborhood, and provided some of the largest and most enthusiastic components of the diocese's massive youth program. Father Michael Bafaro, then a curate at Mt. Carmel, illustrates the parish's newfound enthusiasm by recalling a December afternoon when a foot of snow fell in a few hours, endangering that night's roast beef supper. But when the doors opened, nine hundred people showed up, filling the auditorium.19

Wright's biggest concern was the French. Shortly after arriving in Worcester he began negotiations to move Anna Maria, a small women's college run by the Sisters of St. Anne, from Marlboro in the Boston diocese to suburban Paxton. Speaking of this move to Cushing, Wright stated confidentially: "The unacknowledged fact is that this particular diocese is probably 40% French. The French speaking people—not the priests—have been given a raw deal. I think these particular sisters would be well received here in the City provided that they took in French girls and maintained the present low tuition."20 "The Church has no nationality, Wright said. "Its language is prayer. Like the church, so America lets us pray in the language of our choice. You may remain French [or Italian or Polish] as you choose, provided that you are tolerant of others and share your heritage with them."21 Wright could affirm ethnic differences because on other fronts he was building unity. In women's and youth mobilizations and dozens of less formal but spon-

"Consultors minutes, December 14, 1953,ADW

"Interview with Father Michael Bararo by Mary Gonzalez, October 27, 1998. See also John J. Capuano, "A Brief History of the Italian Americans of Worcester, Massachusetts" (pamphlet in parish file,ADW).

20Wright to Cushing, June 5, 1950, Wright Papers, ADW; Consultors minutes, May 15, 1951,ADW.

"Quoted in Robert L. Reynolds, "Worcester: A New Diocese," fubilee, LU (February, 1956), 11.

sored networks, people mingled across ethnic lines and developed a sense of Catholic pride and solidarity. Equally important, the ties between the tremendously popular bishop and his ethnic constituents provided a bridge for them into the American mainstream. The dance of diversity was evident in April, 1955, when Wright was given a community service award by the Unico Club of Italian-American business and professional men. To the formal dinner came the entire leadership of the city, economic, civic, and religious, by their participation acknowledging both the bishop and the flourishing Italian community.22

Wright was very interested in education. From the start he made it clear that all children were entitled to Catholic education. Pastors were required to organize the Confraternity of Christian Doctrine in their parishes, and he told them they had no right to criticize public-school children or their parents.23 In higher education he immediately moved to organize Newman chaplaincies at the area's many private and state colleges. He dreamed of a Newman house in Worcester, for five priests, separate from the campuses but serving all their students.24

Wright took great interest in high schools, encouraging a new school in the northern part of the diocese and regionalization of parish schools in the city. While he had no intention of disturbing schools in national parishes, he wanted to combine small parish schools into diocesan schools with the bishop's representative and neighboring pastors on the board. He anticipated four high schools for Worcester, two for girls and two for boys, along with several private schools. He gave one parish high school, St. John's, to the Xaverian Brothers, who constructed a new campus in Shrewsbury. Wright purchased one of the city's finest estates and then persuaded the Sisters of Notre Dame to open Notre Dame Academy for young women.25

Wright championed parochial schools in regional and national debates, but he had reservations. Only three new elementary schools opened during the Wright years. When a new school was proposed in Leominster, he worked with his staff to curb an overly ambitious pastor. When a similar proposal came from Clinton, the consultors joined Wright in resisting because "the town is Catholic anyway," thus presumably rendering the public schools adequate. As a graduate of Boston's public schools, Wright rarely dismissed the public school. He knew that

22Worcester Telegram, April 1, 1955, Scrapbooks, ADW.

"Consultors minutes, September 13, 1950,ADW.

"Wright to Grace Gummo, September 25, 1950, Wright Papers, ADW

"Consultors minutes, December 14, 1953,ADW

many of the principals and teachers were Catholics. He went out of his way to acknowledge their work and organized special spiritual programs for them. He told the consultors that it was bishops in the Midwest who pushed the Catholic education agenda, attributing to them the policy of building the school first, then the church. He thought this approach was "not right and produced a peculiar type of Catholic. Prayers, altars and Mass, if necessary can take second place." In Detroit and Chicago the financial pressures on pastors drove many to "beano" and "the effect on religion, naturally, is poor." The minutes for that meeting conclude: "Hence for the time being the Bishop will not authorize extensive school building."[26]

As a member of a bishops' committee charged with challenging the alleged secularization of American education, Wright campaigned for a "positive approach" that would set forth Catholic ideals of education in a way that would invite general consideration. He worried that there was great confusion about public education. He hoped to produce a study that would "state precisely 'what the Catholic church stands for in the field of American education: what are the terms on which we will cooperate with other schools; what are our real criticisms of public education; what are we doing in our own schools and what philosophy informs not only our own schools but our theory concerning what all schools should be and accomplish." It would be a standard manual by which people could chart their course amid the "increasing confusion in our own ranks and the mounting misgivings in the ranks of our neighbors."[27] Few bishops shared Wright's balanced concern with both Catholic and public education.

Wright often reached out across religious boundaries and he enjoyed a reputation as an advanced advocate of inter-religious understanding. Early in his Worcester years he addressed the local ministerial association and spoke frankly of the existence of "many and supremely important 'fences'" dividing religious groups. He worried that mingling across religious boundaries could lead to religious indifference, and he worked hard to erect such fences in the form of multiple associations for Catholics. But more than most bishops he urged co-operation with non-Catholics in public affairs, suggesting to the local ministers such areas as "labor, . . . divorce, abuse of public office, gambling legislation, reckless

"Consultors minutes, May 8, 1954, ADW See also minutes for September 5 and December 11, 1951.

"Materials on this project are collected under the folder for Cardinal McIntyre of Los Angeles in the Wright papers, ADW. See also Wright to Bishop Matthew F. Brady of Manchester, November 12, 1953, Wright Papers, ADW

granting of licenses, care of the sick, displaced persons." Wright regularly commented strongly on anti-Catholic statements such as those by Paul Blanshard, but he met privately with many Boston area leaders thought hostile to Catholics and corresponded with more. To cite one example, he carried on a long, learned, and friendly—to the point of intimacy—exchange with Agnes E. Meyer, nationally prominent advocate of federal aid to public schools, birth control, and the very secular liberalism Wright could occasionally blame for many of the nation's problems.[28]

Wright had a deep love for classical liberal-arts education. Where others complained about secularism and materialism, Wright complained about the failure to teach Latin. In private and public he contended that Catholic education at every level rested on the ideas that "did so much to help produce this once superb, now badly battered reality we call 'western civilization.'"[29] He told a friend at the Boston College School of Education, after a talk that was not well received by some local businessmen: "I shall never miss an opportunity to point out that people should be educated as humane human beings no matter what work they plan to do, not as robots or pure technicians in the abominable scientific civilization which these good men have done so much to make possible."[30] He took a personal interest in promoting this kind of education at Boston College, Assumption, and Anna Maria, but he worried about Holy Cross, where he was always welcomed but less warmly than elsewhere. He thought the Jesuit College was no longer producing vocations to the priesthood as it had in the past, in part, Wright thought, because of its "country club atmosphere." In an uncharacteristic moment of pessimism, Wright reflected that men of college age "have no great ardent love for the Church and the exception is rare. As a matter of fact our Catholic colleges today do not contribute very much to the religious thinking of our young men."[31] Ordinarily he kept such thoughts to himself, but in this case he shared his irritation with the consultors, and word of his attitude undoubtedly filtered back to the Jesuits. He was a distinguished and devoted graduate of Boston College, but never seemed to hit it off with the Holy Cross community.

[28] On the Worcester discussion see Worcester Telegram, January 16, 1952, and Gazette, January 15, 1952, in Scrapbooks; the remarkable Meyer correspondence is gathered under her name in the Wright Papers, ADW Wright's concern about indifference resulting from inter-religious contacts is evident is his extended correspondence with Grace Gummo, organizer of Newman work in the Fitchburg area. See especially Gummo to Wright, October 23, 1950, and Wright to Gummo, October 25, 1950, in Wright Papers, ADW

[29] Quoted in Worcester Gazette, March 7, 1951, Scrapbooks, ADW

[30] Wright to Marie Gearan, April 6, 1954, Wright Papers, ADW.

[31] Consultors minutes June 4, 1957, ADW

Wright was the darling of Catholic intellectuals, and no wonder. Ho-W many bishops could take a short vacation and then write their best clerical friend: "had a wonderful trip to Toronto, attended a couple of lectures on Herodotus and some of Gilson on medieval history. The best of the lectures was on John of Salisbury and the influence on him of Cicero. I greatly enjoyed it."[32] He regularly provided Catholic intellectuals with reassurance about their place in the life and work of the Church. One theme of many talks was the danger of the Church losing the intellectuals, as it had lost the workers in the nineteenth century. The modern loss would be particularly tragic because the Church's great struggle of the age was "ideological."[33] More broadly he argued that the dominant spirit of the age was fear, and the greatest gift Christian humanism could offer was hope. "Devout intellectuals," he believed, knew well the dangers of Utopian optimism, but their faith protected them as well from the "universal discouragement" arising from contemporary denials not just of God and the Church, but of the very possibility of reason itself. Responding to Monsignor ElUs's famous essay on Catholic intellectual life, Wright wrote: "What a tragic irony it would be if, after centuries of battling for the natural law and the rights and function of reason, as well as for the primacy of the intellect over passion, emotion, instinct or even will, the church should find herself represented in the world of the college, the press or the forum by persons contemptuous of that wild, living intellect of man' of which Newman spoke and cynical about the slow, sometimes faltering, but patient, persevering procedures by which intellectuals seek to wrest some measure of order from chaos."[34] This firm adherence to classical culture and to the "perennial philosophy" in which he had been trained may explain Wright's self-confessed elitism, his great self-confidence, and perhaps his later difficulties with post-conciliar theology and catechetics.[35]

John Wright's finest moment came in the wake of Worcester's greatest twentieth-century disaster, the tornado of June 9, 1953, which swept across the city and county leaving ninety-four dead, hundreds injured, more than 12,000 people homeless, and millions of dollars in property

32Wright to "Dan" Honan, February 25, 1957, Wright Papers, ADW

"See as one example John J. Wright, "The Vocation of the Catholic Intellectual," The Catholic Mind, UN (March, 1956), 121-128.

"Excerpts from Wright lectures infubilee, February, 1956, p. 14.

"See "Education for an Age of Fear," Convocation Address, School of Education, Boston College, October 20, 1953, pamphlet in Wright Papers, ADW For another characteristic reflection see reports of speeches in Worcester Telegram for February 9 and April 4, 1956, Scrapbooks. On the loss of the intellectuals see Wright to Robert Crean, January 21, 1954, Wright Papers, ADW

damage. Assumption College and preparatory school were totally destroyed. Almost immediately Wright emerged as the pastoral leader of the community. He visited devastated homes and made sure that Catholic parishes and agencies helped shelter and feed the homeless. Then he was at the city morgue to anoint the dead and comfort survivors. The next day he began to marshal the Church's resources to assist the homeless. He was named treasurer of the city's Central Massachusetts Disaster Relief Committee, together with the city manager Everett M. Merrill and George Booth, editor of the local newspaper, who was widely regarded as the most powerful man in the city. They were not token leaders, but men who got the public and private money together and made sure it was distributed quickly and fairly. During the crisis Wright was on the front page almost daily, spokesman for the rebuilding effort, a voice for the people hurt by the storm. He told Archbishop Cushing: "I do find very great inspiration of a priestly kind in the sort of things I have been able to do this summer. Things that never crossed my path before."[36] His work cemented his location at the heart of local civic leadership, a place ritually affirmed when he was named recipient of the Isaiah Thomas Award, the city's highest honor.

Behind the scenes during the aftermath of the tornado Wright made a major move, personally persuading the Assumptionist Fathers to rebuild and to change their emphasis from the heretofore quite successful prep school to the college. Toward that end he raised almost three quarters of a rnillion dollars from his own diocese, Boston, and Springfield. Cushing and Springfield's Bishop Christopher Weldon channeled their contributions through Wright, who used the leverage to encourage the Assumptionists to strengthen their work in higher education. Another benefactor was Joseph Kennedy, "Joe" in Wright's letters, whose "princely gift," he was told, would be welcomed by all for whom the school was "a symbol to the French throughout New England of everything that their tradition means to them." It will ease past tensions and "lay [to rest] many ghosts of the past."[37] This was far more than an act of charity or a sign of Wright's love affair with French culture. He saw it as an historic step which would end the long, bitter antagonism between the region's French Catholics and the Irish-dominated hierar-

"Wright to Cushingjuly 15, 1953. Wright's enthusiasm about Assumption College predated the tornado. Trying to persuade his friend Jacques Maritain to join the Board of Trustees, Wright wrote in January, 1953, that he was convinced "that the apostolic and cultural possibilities of the college are providential and beyond estimation." Wright to Maritain, January 20, 1953, Wright papers.ADW

"Wright to Joseph Kennedy, July 3, 1953, Wright Papers, ADW.

chy. As he told Bishop Weldon,"this single action will do more to shape the direction of a certain problem here in New England than all previous events of ecclesiastical history hereabout."38

There were two other areas that revealed the spirit of fifties Catholicism in Worcester. One, of course, was the laity. Wright appointed a full-time priest as Secretary for the Lay Apostolate; he promoted lay retreats, calling them his "pet project," and he required pastors to train lay people for work with the Confraternity of Christian Doctrine. The newer lay groups, such as the Christian Family Movement, did not find a toe hold in Worcester. Although Wright was a warm admirer of Dorothy Day, no Catholic Worker house took shape in the city. But the bishop did organize Masses and communion breakfasts for lawyers, doctors, dentists, nurses, public school teachers, bus drivers, policemen, firemen, even taxi drivers. Wright accurately described his message to the laity: "I am perpetually teaching the necessity for Catholics to understand that they are all part of the church and responsible for its progress, that the bishop is and should be their teacher and their leader but that he is not the diocese and certainly not the church." Everyone, including the bishop, is dispensable and "the work of the church is in point of fact done by many, many believing and generous souls."39

For Wright the practical leader, laity meant women. Wright was national chaplain for the Laywomen's Retreat League; his correspondence contains massive exchanges with lay friends, the vast majority women, and he had serious reservations about lay organization for men beyond the parish level, as these groups were too easily taken over by politics.40 Moreover, he spoke out strongly on behalf of higher education for women. As early as 1946 he was warning his largely Irish audience in Boston that their daughters fully deserved an education equal to that of their sons.41 While he, of course, idealized woman as wife and mother, he regularly affirmed the option of the career woman as altogether proper for an apostolic Catholic.

In Worcester Wright arranged for the Sisters of the Cénacle to open a retreat center for women in the diocese. Then he organized a League of Catholic Women modeled on the similar League in Boston. Its purpose

«Wright to Bishop Christopher Weldonjuly 14, 1953, Wright Papers, ADW

"Wright to Grace Gummo, June 9, 1953, Wright Papers, ADW

"See Clergy Conference notes, May 24, 1953. For his preference for women's organizations see Wright to Joseph Holleran, October 19, 1954, Wright Papers, ADW

41"The Holy Father's Historic Appeal to Women" in Resonare Christum, Volume I: 1939-1959 (San Francisco, 1985), pp. 71-86.

was "to bring together Catholic women and to further their cultural and religious interests." It affiliated some 125 parish, charitable, and ethnic women's groups with the Catholic Women's Club of Worcester, which the bishop controlled. Wright carefully monitored the organization to ensure that ethnic groups received due recognition. His special interest was the program of theological classes conducted in Worcester and Fitchburg. Wright was very involved with the details of these classes and taught many of them himself. He preached popular sermons all the time, he said, and in no way neglected the general listener. But some people wanted "an intensive course in theology," and he thought they had a right to it. "I would be happy to give it for a group of very, very few people if I thought that in doing so I was helping to shape a nucleus of informed Catholic minds," he told the woman organizing the program in Fitchburg.42

The best-known League project was one of those mass events which marked Catholicism in the 1950's, the annual convention of the League, held at the Worcester Memorial Auditorium with thousands of women, including nuns, listening to national speakers, praying and worshiping together, and leaving with an agenda for action during the coming year.

The second area was youth, where "Catholic big" also had its place. In 1954 Wright installed the NCWC Catholic Youth Council structure with a diocesan council and five regional councils, each directed by a priest but with youth leadership reflective of the ethnic and regional interests in the diocese. By then a cadre of energetic curates had bunt strong parish youth programs throughout the diocese. The new system higlilighted these, drew in heretofore weak parishes, drew public and Catholic school students together through an endless array of athletic leagues and diocesan tournaments, weekend dances, summer outings to Hampton Beach, and a massive diocesan convention featuring a parade down Main Street.43 Wright described the enormous 1957 parade with obvious relish. He described floats of all sorts, twenty marching bands, the Governor bowing to 40,000 people lining the streets. Best of all the mayor (whose name was O'Brien) "caused some of the tombstones in Hope Cemetery to whirl about like Sputnik by opening City Hall. . . so that all the Sisters who attended the parade could watch from the windows." Sisters appeared at every window and on the balconies; the mayor served them coffee, and, Wright boasted, "City Hall

"Wright to Grace Gummo, August 4, 1953, Wright papers, ADW

'These events received unusual coverage in the local press. See, for example, Worcester Telegram for June 24 and October 12, 1956, Scrapbooks, ADW.

became a kind of Motherhouse." In Worcester at last Catholics had truly arrived.44

Although Wright was a leader of the Church's national movements for social justice and world peace, there was little evidence of this in Worcester. He did support a growing Catholic Charities organization, of course. A huge outdoor concert to raise funds for charities was another of those events that promoted diocesan identity and built support for the bishop. Upon his arrival, Wright backed a drive for a new Catholic hospital for the Sisters of Providence, and he arranged the movement of the Little Sisters of the Assumption into the city. A new home for unwed mothers arose from his personal fund-raising work. He welcomed a Summer School of Catholic Action at Holy Cross and brought in speakers who worked at the frontiers of Catholic social ministry, including the interracial apostolate, but few local activities resulted.

In this period social action was closely connected with the liturgical movement, which Wright supported. In 1955 the annual gathering of the Liturgical Conference took place in Worcester, as did a meeting of its more radical subgroup, the Vernacular Society, whose members looked to Wright for advice even though he remained an unabashed advocate of Latin. Wright encouraged the dialogue Mass and defended its use against local critics, but he made no organized effort at liturgical reform in the diocese.45

The gap between Wright's national image as a reformer and his more conventional local profile was evident following the 1955 liturgical convention when Wright hosted a closed-door meeting of reform-minded priests at the Trappist St. Joseph's Abbey in Spencer. This gathering of "kindred spirits" was organized by the Louisiana activist Joseph Gremillion after a conversation with Wright following the latter's talk to a Friendship House group in Shreveport. The forty priests attending read like an honor roll of Vatican Council II reformers. Gremillion and his friends, such as John Egan of Chicago, hoped to connect the many pockets of reform and social action for mutual support and collaboration. But they knew "that the Church might well view such gatherings

"Wright to "Giovanni," November 12, 1957, Wright papers, ADW

45He summarized his work on liturgy in Wright to William R Brown, February 21, 1958, Wright Papers, ADW Wright corresponded with many of the leaders of the liturgical movement and offered advice to advocates of the vernacular as to how they should deal with the bishops. In a review of a book by the liturgical reformer H. A. Reinhold he admitted his preference for Latin but praised those who opened the question for debate and who had "great courage, great competence and great love for the church." America, February 1, 1958, p. 516.

with serious reservations," and they looked to Wright for a connection to the hierarchy.[46] With good reason, for Wright also hoped to see the progressive groups in the American Church work together. As early as 1952 Wright told Joe Cunneen, founder of Cross Currents, of his concern that "so many of those who love God and His Church appear to be working in complete isolation from one another and therefore with tragically diminished effectiveness. A thousand independent efforts are underway, most of them good. The offensive against the supernatural is almost completely unified. However, in God's own providence, it may well be that each of the programs for the supernatural is really united by their deep roots and are preparing themselves through their several experiences for the eventual great counteroffensive on the level of the spirit."[47]

On international matters Wright played an important role in articulating the Catholic response to the Cold War. He could play the anti-communist card, but most of the time he was positive. He befriended Catholic opponents of Senator Joseph R. McCarthy, and his national addresses were peppered with warnings against isolationism, emotionalism, fear, and witch hunts, all framed by insistence on reasonable patriotism and militant but heavily spiritual opposition to communism. As an active member of the Catholic Association for International Peace, he spoke of the "titanic educational task" of winning support for the United Nations among American Catholics, whose "world mindedness" he described as "pathetically inadequate."[48] When a historian at Princeton University, Eric Goldman, sought Wright's advice on a text dealing with Catholics and public affairs, he argued that the "collective witness of the American hierarchy expressed a point of view considerably more broad than that of their people in many parts of the country." He urged Goldman to examine in particular the "forward looking positions" taken by Archbishop Cushing in the last years of the war and the period of peacemaking that followed; Wright had written those speeches.[49] Aware of the gap between church teaching and Catholic popular opinion on these matters, Wright attempted to raise the sights of Worcester's Catholics through his own talks, his diocesan newspa-

'Correspondence on this session is gathered under the name Gremillion in the files of Wright's correspondence, ADW

47Wright to Joseph Cunneen, December 19, 1952, Wright Papers, ADW.

'"Worcester Telegram, November 14, 1953, Scrapbooks, ADW

"Wright to Goldman, May 1, 1956, and Goldman to Wright, April 13 and May 10, 1956, Wright Papers, ADW

per, and the gatherings of the League of Catholic Women. But he never succeeded in establishing a local chapter of the Catholic Association for International Peace, and social ministry in general took second place to the pastoral and organizational development of his new diocese.

So what can be said of Worcester's experience with John Wright in the 1950s?

First, in Worcester, for a moment at least, American Catholicism had it all together. A strong bishop built a well designed diocesan structure and placed it in the hands of capable priests who knew how to promote diocesan interests without damaging the Church's parish base. Diocesan leadership blended parish-based youth and women's groups together in ways which drew forth lay leadership, brought people together across ethnic, class, and territorial lines, and provided a basis for funding of diocesan projects. At one level this was a response to the persistent problem of providing a basis of organizational discipline and popular support for the diocese, as distinct from the individual parish. Three elements needed for this were present in Worcester: a popular bishop, able to unite his priests and lift the sights of a substantial number of his people, a well designed diocesan structure -with talented leaders, and a variety of transparochial movements able to express new forms of Catholic commitment.

Second, this was an American Catholic community still, in James Hennesey's well-known phrase, "certain and set apart."50 The Worcester/Wright record suggests that when it all came together Catholicism and Americanism enjoyed a level of faith, authentic taken-for-grantedness, that was unusual, and necessarily short-lived. You don't have to be a theologian to understand that Christianity never gets too comfortable anywhere without a critical reaction. The comfort level in Worcester, in retrospect, was very high. But we need to remember how recently these people had arrived, all it had taken to get them there, and how it must have felt. The bright side is that for so many descendants of European immigrants this was the climax of an authentic experience of liberation. The darker side is that however skilled these latter-day leaders of the immigrant church were in easing the transition to a post-immigrant, American, church, they thought too little about the next step. Having kept Catholics Catholic, and having secured the Catholic place in American pluralism, they had to face some new questions, which would explode around them in the next decade.

"James Hennesey, S.J., American Catholics (New York, 1979).

Third, there is John Wright himself. He had only nine years to get his new diocese organized. In 1977, two years before his death, Wright recalled Worcester fondly. "It was great fun to establish a diocese," he told a Boston Globe reporter. "Whenever a pastor would say 'Bishop, we don't do it that way in this diocese' I would tell him there was no way we could have. Now I think I'll try it."[51] If one can judge from both his public and private self-presentation, Wright was very happy in Worcester, a city he thought had "all the spiritual, social and civic advantages and human consolations of a New England town."

And in Worcester as elsewhere these were indeed years of success as measured by growth and organization. The Catholic population of the diocese had passed 300,000; there were now 479 priests, 287 diocesan (up from 375 and 241), along with 111 brothers (up from nineteen), and 1,193 religious sisters (a number not much changed from 1950). Catholic high school students had risen from 3,500 to over 5,000, elementary enrollments from 15,300 to 22,500. And everywhere there were new buildings, plans for more, and money in the bank.

In 1959 Bishop Wright moved on to Pittsburgh, an older diocese with established routines: it appears that he did well there, even as his national image faded a bit during the Council.[52] In 1969 he returned to his beloved Rome as a Curial leader. Old friends thought this would be the fulfillment of a dream often talked about before his fireplace in Worcester. But life and work in Rome seem to have made him terribly unhappy. This man who in a very real sense embodied so much of the rich experience of American Catholicism became deeply alienated from many of his oldest friends. His biography needs to be written. It may turn out a sad story, but it is surely a story with many clues to our recent experience. But for the fifties, in Worcester, it was a wonderful story of a man and a local church delighting in an experience of arrival.

[51] Quoted in Catholic Free Press, August 17, 1979.

[52] On the Pittsburgh years see Timothy J. Kelly, "The Transformation of American Catholicism: The Pittsburgh Laity and the Second Vatican Council," unpublished Ph.D. dissertation, Carnegie Mellon University, 1950.

JUAN DE TORQUEMADA'S DEFENSE OF THE CONVERSOS

BY

Thomas M. Izbicki'

In January of 1449 the city of Toledo rose up against an attempt by Alvaro de Luna, the favorite of the reigning king of Castile, Juan II, to impose a heavy tax on the city. This levy was intended to help Don Alvaro to defend his position against the hostility of certain noble families, including the king's cousins. The insurrection led to the burning of the house of the appointed tax collector, Alonso Cota, a "New Christian," one of those descendants from converts to Judaism who had made a career for himself as a royal official. There followed a wider attack on the conversos, a sign that baptism, even voluntarily received, would not win for Jewish converts or their Christianized descendants full acceptance in some "Old Christian" circles.1 Men who themselves had abandoned Judaism or whose families had received baptism, often during upheavals at the end of the fourteenth century and the beginning of the fifteenth, were deprived of official posts in the city. An ecclesiastical trial of converts accused of "judaizing" also was held, leading to some

"Dr. Izbicki is the Collection Development Coordinator at Eisenhower Library, Johns Hopkins University.

The original version of this article was read as a paper at the twenty-ninth International Congress on Medieval Studies held at Western Michigan University, Kalamazoo, in 1994. The author wishes to thank Professor Norman Roth for his insightful critique of the manuscript and Professor Richard Kagan for his reading of an earlier draft of it.

'Disputes over the sincerity and depth of these conversions have been fierce, especially since the publication of Benzion Netanyahu, The Marranos of Spain from the Late XIVth to the Early XVIth Century according to Contemporary Hebrew Sources (New York, 1966), which argued that the converts were sincere Christians. More recently, see idem, The Origins of the Spanish Inquisition (New York, 1995); Norman Roth, Conversos, Inquisition, and the Expulsion of the Jews from Spain (Madison, Wisconsin, 1995). For a review of these debates which favors Netanyahu's views, see Allan H. Cutler and Helen E. Cutler, The Jew as Ally of the Muslim: Medieval Roots of Anti-Semitism (Notre Dame, Indiana, 1986), pp. 205-248. See, however, José Faur, "Four Classes of Conversos: A Typological Study," Revue des Études Juives, 149 (1990), 113-124; Kristine T. Utterback, "Conversi Revert: Voluntary and Forced Return to Judaism in the Early Fourteenth Century," Church History, 64 (March, 1995), 16-28; David M. Gitlitz, Secrecy and Deceit: The Religion of the Crypto-Jews (Philadelphia, 1996).

executions, and much property was confiscated. Led by a disgruntled royal official, Pedro Sarmiento, the Old Christians of Toledo issued the Sentencia-estatuto, which forbade New Christians to hold offices and benefices in the city and its surrounding territories. The same document declared conversos infamous and unable to testify in legal proceedings.2 Polemics, the most important written by the lawyer Marcos Garcia de Mora, called Marquillos, denied that Jews could become true Christians and accused them of a propensity for evil. Old Christians, treated as the only true adherents to the faith, were described as threatened by Jewish machinations.3 (Part of his case against the converts was grounded on local laws, including a statute of Alfonso VII issued during the twelfth century, which forbade converts from Judaism to hold office in the city.4)

At first Alvaro de Luna made feeble efforts to help the conversos of Toledo, and then he abandoned them. King Juan made efforts to coerce the rebels, but he abandoned them when his son and heir, Don Enrique, took Toledo under his wing. Thereafter, he was more interested in conciliating than punishing his rebellious subjects.5 The New Christians in the city were not without friends. Fernán Díaz de Toledo, the king's relator and a prominent convert, worked to enlist Lope de Barrientos, the Dominican bishop of Cuenca and a leading member of the royal entourage, among the opponents of the rebels. Alonso de Cartagena, bishop of Burgos, also a New Christian, wrote a detailed critique of this "sentence." He also described the Jews as a nation ennobled by God, not lost in infamy.6

Participation in this debate quickly spread outside Castile, as both sides attempted to gain a favorable hearing from Pope Nicholas V

2ElOy Benito Ruano, Los orígenes del problema converso (Barcelona, 1976), pp. 4 1-83; idem, Toledo en el siglo XV (Madrid, 1961), pp. 33-50. Many of the key documents are printed as an appendix ibid., pp. 185-227. For a partial translation of the Sentencia, see The Jews in Western Europe 1400-1600, ed. John Edwards (Manchester, 1994), pp. 100-101.

'Netanyahu, Origins, pp. 350-384, 486-511. For the text of a memorial by García de Mora in defense of the Sentencia, see E. Benito Ruano,"El memorial contra los conversos del Bachiller Marcos García de Mora," Sefarad, 17 (1957), 314-351.

4For an authentication of this document, see Roth, op. cit., p. 91. For a denial that this was a law of Alfonso VII, see B. Netanyahu, "Did the Toledans Rely on a Real Royal Privilege," Proceedings of the American Academy for Jewish Research, 44 (1977), 93-125.

'Netanyahu, Origins, pp. 328-350.

6Ibid., pp. 385-420, 517-577; Alonso de Cartagena, Defensorium unitatis christianae, ed. Manuel Alonso (Madrid, 1943). See also Guillermo Verdín-Díaz, Alonso de Cartagena y el Defensorium unitatis Christianae (Introducción histórica, traducción y notas) (Oviedo, 1992).

(1447-1455). Sarmiento and his allies sent representatives to Rome to plead their case, but they were turned away on the urging of the leading Dominican theologian present in the Curia, Cardinal Juan de Torquemada.7 In September of 1449, probably following the cardinal's advice, Pope Nicholas issued a bull condemning any effort to segregate or penalize converts from Judaism. The pope also excommunicated Sarmiento and his followers, and he deposed the ecclesiastical judge Pedro López de Gálvez for his role in the heresy proceedings against the conversos. Nicholas, after his fashion, wavered later in his opposition to the sentence under pressure from lay powers, suspending and then canceling the censures imposed on the inhabitants of Toledo. (The pope later renewed certain measures favoring Juan II, but he ignored the victims of the Toledan uprising.8)

Torquemada, however, was not deterred by the pontiff's wavering. In 1450 he published a tract denouncing the proceedings held against the conversos. (This may have been an amplification of one or more memoranda written for the pope when news of the rising in Toledo first came to Rome.) Torquemada, in this work, labeled Sarmiento and his allies, clerical and lay, Midianites and the Ishmaelites, biblical enemies of the Israelite people.9 In this tract the cardinal's object seems less to attack the Sentencia than to denounce the heresy trial held by Gálvez, but the legislative measures of the rebels also came in for criticism. The cardinal was well aware of the accusations made against the converts, and he knew that the Old Christians' case was argued by using quotations from the Bible, canon law, and local laws. These authorities under-

Tlenito Ruano, Los orígenes, pp. 51-52. On Torquemada's life and works, see Thomas M. Izbicki, Protector of the Faith: Cardinal Johannes de Turrecremata and the Defense of the Institutional Church (Washington, DC, 1981), pp. 1-30. García de Mora's memorial shows an awareness of Torquemada's role in the pope's denying the envoys of Toledo an audience and refers to the cardinal as of Jewish ancestry; see Benito Ruano, "El memorial," p. 325.

"Nicholas' most important bulls concerning Toledo are printed in Shlomo Simonsohn, The Apostolic See and the Jews: Documents, 1394-1464 (Toronto, 1988), pp. 935-937, 940-941, 979. The other documents can be found in the appendix cited above in n. 4. For the pope's habitual yielding to the strongest pressures upon him, see Donald Sullivan, "Nicholas of Cusa as Reformer: The Papal Legation to the Germantes, 1451-1452," Medieval Studies, 36 (1974), 382-428. One of the strongest influences in Rome was that of the king of Aragon, whose brothers were among the principal opponents of Alvaro de Luna; see Alan E C. Ryder, .<4//braso the Magnanimous, King of Aragon, Naples and Sicily, 1396-1458 (Oxford, 1990), pp. 259-261.

'Juan de Torquemada, Tractatus contra Madianitas et Ismaelitas QDefensa de los fudios conversos), ed. Nicolás López Martínez and Vicente Proaño Gil (Burgos, 1957) [hereafter CMI]. All translations are the author's own.

went close scrutiny in the development of the cardinal's pro-converso polemic. Torquemada would dismiss these arguments from authority as misinterpreted or non-applicable. Moreover, he would denounce the ideas of the likes of García de Mora as dangerous departures from sound doctrine.

Torquemada's tract against the Midianites and Ishmaelites is ignored by those who see him as a blind zealot for orthodoxy,10 but it is of great interest to students of the beginnings of the Spanish Inquisition. The tract is a sharp and relentless attack delivered in a style almost devoid of ornament, but it shows a sensitivity to the meanings of biblical texts, as interpreted by the Scholastics, and to the possibility of error in the beliefs and practices of both Old Christians and New. It also addresses the pastoral problem of unjust treatment of converts, which might cause them to become indifferent or to fall away from the faith. One cannot be sure whether the cardinal had a specific audience in mind for this tract beyond an unspecified Christian population, but the most likely individual targeted was Pope Nicholas himself, to discourage any further compromise on the issues raised by the Toledan rising.

Torquemada's motivation for this endeavor, beyond defense of orthodoxy, must be given its due attention. Sarmiento's partisans accused the cardinal of acting in defense of Jewish kinsmen. This argument that the cardinal was of Jewish ancestry has gained currency in the Spanish sources, pro- and anti-converso alike, and it is repeated in the works of modern historians. Most recently, Benzion Netanyahu has advanced the intriguing but undocumented argument that the cardinal was the son of a convert mother. In his opinion, this moved her son not just to defend the conversos of Toledo but to exalt the Jews at the expense of the gentiles, turning medieval anti-Jewish polemics on their heads.11 The cardinal may have felt some impetus from ancestry, however remote,12

,0See most recently, Solomon Gaon, The Influence of the Catholic Theologian Alfonso Tostado on the Pentateuch Commentary of Isaac Abravanel (New York, 1993), pp. 6-8.

"Netanyahu, Origins, pp. 421-485, 1110-1121.

'The possibility of a more remote descent of the cardinal from conversos is mentioned plausibly, on the basis of an anonymous gloss to Pablo de Santa Maria's Scrutinium scripturarum, in Roth, op. cit., pp. 225, 371 n. 16. Unfortunately, Torquemada's surviving letters to Castile cast no light on this subject; see Vicente Beltrán de Heredia,"Colección de documentos inéditos para ¡Ilustrar la vida del Cardenal Juan de Torquemada O.P." Archivum Fratrum Praedicatorum, 7 (1937), 210-245; ¿dem, "Noticias y documentos para la biografía del Cardenal Juan de Torquemada," ibid., 30 (I960), 53-148.

but the theological motive should be emphasized. From his youth, Torquemada had been a Dominican friar, one of an order dedicated to the defense of the faith. On his order's behalf, he argued the papal cause at the Council of Basel.13 Torquemada's whole literary output leaned to the refutation of the errors of his day. This included refuting the opinions of those Christians whom he regarded as being in error, like the conciliarists and the Greeks, as well as those of condemned heretics like the Bogomils. Also, the cardinal refuted the doctrines of the Muslims at length.14 These efforts would lead a fellow Dominican, Ambrosius Catharinus Politus, to call Torquemada the Protector of the Faith.15 To such a man, even without personal motivations, the acts and opinions of the Toledan rebels would have seemed an insult to Christ, His mother, and the patriarchs, prophets, and apostles. Moreover, they would inevitably have seemed to be casting aspersions on the faith and the sacraments, especially baptism.

When composing the preface to this tract, Torquemada opened with the third line of Psalm 82 in the Vulgate enumeration, For lo, thy enemies have made a noise: and they that hate thee have lifted up the head. Those who have cried out are identified as persecutors of "the faithful Israelite people," that is, the descendants of Ishmael and Esau. These peoples "have hated the children of Israel descended from Isaac, just as Ishmael persecuted Isaac, Abraham's son." The specific outcry of these foes of Israel is identified as the recent events in Toledo, especially the supposed heresy proceedings. Torquemada goes on to denounce the heresy trial as "pernicious and, consequently, null." The accusers were rebels against their natural lord, "heads of factions and of the iniquitous judges at Toledo," who attempted to hide their iniquity behind a search for supposed heretics.16 (Here the cardinal sounds a note of monarchist propaganda which echoes the papalist polemics recently authored by himself and certain of his contemporaries. They had written tracts and orations intended to move the princes to support an-

"Thomas M. Izbicki,"The Council of Ferrara-Florence and Dominican Papalism," Christian Unity.The Council ofFerrara-Florence 1438/39-1989, ed. Giuseppe Alberigo (Louvain, 1991), pp. 429-443.

,4Thomas Kaeppeli, Scriptures Ordinis Praedicatorum medii aevi (4 vols.; Rome, 1970-1993), III, 24-42; LV, 173-176.

"De certa gloria, invocatione ac veneratione sanctorum disputationes atque assertiones catholice adversus impíos, in Opuscula (Lyons, 1542; East Ridgewood, New Jersey, 1964), p. 25.

"CMI, pp. 41-43, 45.

other embattled monarch, Nicholas Vs predecessor, Eugenius IV, whose deposition had been attempted by the Council of Basel.17)

The cardinal pilloried the proceedings for every form of procedural fault and perversion of justice, the lack of adequate judges with jurisdiction over the supposed offenses and of a duly appointed prosecutor, iniquitous witnesses and false accusations against not just persons of mediocre status but even those of greater stature, men, "famous for many virtues, religion, and nobility," because of their Jewish origins. Torquemada described the proceedings as motivated by the hatred of men whom he compared to Haman,18 who was brought down by Mordechai and Queen Esther:

> Behold their diabolical proposal; behold their malign intention, similar to the impiety conceived by Haman, an open enemy of the Israelite people, concerning whom Mordechai, praying to the Lord in the person of the children of Israel, said, Lord. . . have mercy on thy people, because our enemies resolve to destroy us, and extinguish thy inheritance [Esther 13:15].

Having dismissed the trial held in Toledo, Torquemada moved on to criticize at greater length the two foundations of this proceeding. Both of these were supposed to prove that:

> all those descended from the Israelite people are bad Christians and must be held suspect, as if thinking badly about the Catholic faith.

The first foundation was a general one, a contention that those who have done evil and their descendants remain condemned to the fourth generation. This condemnation, of course, was specifically supposed to have been incurred by the Jews. It involved, according to Torquemada, an erroneous belief that one who abandoned his ancestors' error still was condemned with them.19 (One notes here that Torquemada, still more a theologian than a canonist, despite his work on the Decretum, newly under way, rejected traditional legal teachings on infamy.20) He also denounced the second, more specific foundation, a distinction

"Anthony Black, Monarchy and Community: Political Ideas in the Later Conciliar Controversy, 1430-1450 (Cambridge, 1970), pp. 85-129.

18CMI, pp. 45-52.

19CMI, pp. 53-59.

"Vincent A. Tatatczuk, Infamy of Law (Washington, D.C., 1954). For Torquemada's difficulties in composing his commentary on the Decretum, see Thomas M. Izbicki, "Johannes de Turrecremata, Two Questions on Law," Tijdschrifl voor Rechtsgeschiednis, 43 (1975), 91-94.

made by the New Christians between converts from Judaism, regarded as entirely condemned, and from other, previously pagan peoples.21 The cardinal said specifically that:

> it is erroneous to assert that the nation of the Jews ever was condemned absolutely. . . .

In reply to the first foundation Torquemada argued that old stains did not remain, being "abolished by most manifest works." Here he pointed to the recent conversions of the Polish king Ladislas II Jagiello and of the Bosnian royal family to show that recent pagans could excel as Christians.22 This implied that recent converts from Judaism also could excel in life and purity of belief. To argue otherwise, he maintained would posit "a stain on holy mother Church." The attack on this foundation stressed the individual responsibilities of men, not those of their ancestors or other kin, and their individual salvation or damnation. They would be judged for their own belief and conduct. This line of argument extended beyond questions of human responsibility for sin to an argument that any condemnation of an entire group would attempt to restrict the efficacy of Christ's passion, which was sufficient for the reconciliation of the whole world:

> since the power of Christ's passion extends not just to one family, not to one people alone, but to the whole world. . . .

Moreover, the guilt incurred at the Crucifixion by a certain number of the Jews was wrongly regarded as imputed to all of their descendants.23 It also would deny the effect of the sacrament of baptism, "which is the gateway to the Church and the foundation of the other sacraments," and of reconciliation through the sacrament of penance.24

The attack on the second foundation involved a vindication of the Jewish people as a whole. They were not all of them condemned, nor were those who did not embrace the faith in the earliest centuries rejected forever, especially if any one of them converted. Arguments from both reason and authority were advanced to demonstrate this truth. Perhaps the most eloquent proof advanced by Torquemada is that any attack on the Israelite people meant rejecting not just the patriarchs,

21CMI, pp.61-65.
22CMI, p. 54.
25CMI, pp. 56-57.
24CMI, pp. 57-58.

prophets, and apostles but even Jesus Himself, born a Jew in the flesh, and His mother.25 The cardinal argued that:

> it is most clearly obvious that the aforesaid impious men speak with stupid and rash daring when they say that it is absolutely certain and notorious that the nation of the Jews is condemned.

(This argument for continuity between the converts and the heroic past of Israel bypassed traditional attacks on the Jews of medieval times, which treated them as detached from their illustrious ancestors.)

The divine promises made to the Jews were reviewed at length, and a thoroughgoing exegesis of Romans 11 was offered in the best Scholastic style of Torquemada's day to prove that the chosen people were not cast off forever. Paul's authority was used to prove that:

> all authorities speaking of the unbelief or condemnation of the Jewish nation [must] be accepted individually concerning certain persons, and not universally. . . otherwise one would blaspheme and condemn not just the holy ancient fathers, the patriarchs, the prophets and many living virtuous men most famous for wisdom and holy life, but even our Savior, His most noble and holy mother, the virgin Mary, the glorious apostles and the evangelists, who derived origin from the nation of the Jews.

The cardinal echoed the apostle's idea that the world would be enriched were all the Jews to embrace the faith. The Augustinian version of this argument too, emphasizing conversion of the Jews in the last days, remained accessible in Torquemada's day, but he made more—and more thoroughly positive—use of it than had become the custom.26

Torquemada argued that most of the converts were sincere Christians and that their Christian commitment was very real. He did not deny that there might be some "judaizers" among them, but he denied any supposition that the conversos, because they were born Jews or of Jewish parents, had to be suspected of only public observance of Christian rites and merely superficial profession of orthodox doctrine. This does not mean, however—pace Netanyahu27—that the cardinal knew the religious situation of the Toledan converts well after being absent from Castile for nearly two decades. His arguments were based on sup-

25CMI, pp. 67-69.

26Jeremy Cohen, The Friars and the Jews: The Evolution of Medieval Anti-Judaism (Ithaca, New York, 1982), pp. 19-22; Netanyahu, Origins, pp. 459-464. In contrast, no use of Romans 9-11 was made in a key nau-converso tract; see Steven J. McMichael, Was Jesus of Nazareth the King of the Jews: Alfonso de Espina's Argument against the Jews in "Fortalitium Fidei" (c. 1464) (Atlanta, 1994), pp. 291-292.

^Origins, pp. 1117-1121.

position and reports from afar, not on certain knowledge. Thus, unable to be sure that all converts were orthodox, Torquemada was quick to point out that Christians descended from gentiles also could be secret heretics:

> How many diverse parts of Christendom descended from other nations have we heard of being punished and burned for heresy and grave errors!

Besides mentioning the religious woes of Bohemia, he pointed to the recent arrest and trial in Fabriano of a group of Fraticelli, probably the group arrested during Nicholas Vs sojourn in that city:

> We even saw in Fabriano, in March of last year, twenty-two persons suspected of heresy; of those who could be seized, nine were burned, and others of them consigned to prison, according to the gravity of their iniquity and impiety.

(Some of the heretics condemned to death were burned in Fabriano and others in Rome.28) All Christians, in Torquemada's opinion, were descended from converts, and none could be held suspect for the sins of their fathers. They should be "regarded rightly according to their works, which are testimonies of faith."

Taking a more positive and pastoral tack, the cardinal argued that converts were to be loved and honored rather than despised. They were part of the Christian brotherhood, which was supposed to be bound together by bonds of "spiritual brotherhood." In that unity would lie the peace to be enjoyed by all Christians. Moreover, all are reborn "through the bath of regeneration," baptism. Not loving converts was unchristian:

> wherefore one is not numbered among God's sons and in the Church who does not love his Christian brothers, wherever they originated.

Converts from Judaism were to be loved all the more because of the roots of the Church, which extended back to Abel, the first man to live by faith. The apostles and prophets, on whom the Church was founded, according to the epistle to the Ephesians, had been born Jews, and Torquemada again pointed out that Jesus Himself was a Jew according to the flesh. In a particularly pastoral vein, Torquemada warned that vil-

28CMI, pp. 95-98. On Nicholas and Fabriano, see Charles Burroughs, From Signs to Design: Environmental Process and Reform in Early Renaissance Rome (Cambridge, Massachusetts, 1990), pp. 135-137, 216. On the issue of "apostolic poverty" in this period, see John Monfasani, "The Fraticelli and Clerical Wealth in Quattrocento Rome," Renaissance Society and Culture: Essays in Honor of Eugene F. Rice, fr., ed. John Monfasani and Ronald G. Musto (New York, 1991), pp. 177-195.

ification "turns men away from love of the Christian faith, is impious and cruel both to Mother Church Militant and Triumphant." The Church Militant is offended, since it had conferred baptism on the converts, and the Church Triumphant, because it is defrauded of its future joy over souls saved.29

The specific denial of offices and honors to converts is denounced as against Scripture and as inserting into the body a distinction not made by the Spirit. It also denies the efficacy of Christ's passion. It might cause potential converts "to draw back from accepting the Christian religion," and the newly converted might be "sorry or cool in love for the faith received." To this end Torquemada even was able to turn their weapons back on the Old Christians of Toledo, citing not just texts of canon law—even one from the Council of Basel—but the Siete partidas and the Fuero reaP" on behalf of converts. He also cited laws of the reigning king and his father to the same end. Any restrictions cited from canon law or royal decrees is dismissed as applicable only to apostates. Torquemada's last cited authority is the 1449 bull of Nicholas V, adding papal to royal prestige in the condemnation of the Toledan proceedings.31

Torquemada's defense of the conversos seems to have had more impact in Rome than in Castile.32 In Rome the cardinal prevailed to the extent of seeing the pope confirm in 1451 the principles of equality for all Christians he had decreed in 1449. In Castile, the cardinal's polemic may have had an unintended impact, his name being used on either side of the argument by those who show no signs of having read his words. Thus, although Garcia de Mora tried to dismiss Torquemada as a Jew defending Jews, later Old Christians tried to claim him as one of their own. At the same time, he was claimed by the New Christians in the time of the Catholic Kings as from their own background.33

29CMI1Pp. 109-115.

""See also Alonso Díaz de Montalvo's pro-converso gloss on the Fuero real, discussed in Roth, op. cit., pp. 98-100; and Nicholas Round, The Greatest Man Uncrowned: A Study of the Fall of Don Alvaro de Luna (London, 1986), p. 182.

"CMI, pp. 117-136.

'2No manuscripts from outside Italy are listed in Kaeppeli, Scriptores, Vol. Ill (Roma, 1980), pp. 36-37.

"Fernando del Pulgar, Claros varones de Castilla, ed. R. B. Tate (Oxford, 1971), pp. 57-59; Nicolás López Martínez, Los judaizantes castellanos y la inquisición en tiempo de Isabella Católica (Burgos, 1954), p. 390. The documentary evidence for Torquemada's Jewish descent is denied as readily as it is affirmed; see John H. Edwards,"The Conversos: A Theological Approach" Bulletin of Hispanic Studies, 62 (1985), 39-49 at p. 40.

The line of argument the cardinal adopted, an emphasis on professed faith, the efficacy of Christ's passion and of the sacraments, the equal calling of gentiles and Jews, and the responsibility of individuals for their own sins, not for those of their fathers, was relentlessly orthodox. This polemic even helps to explain the cardinal's argument in his Summa de ecclesia, which was being composed during that period, that the Church originated with Abel.34 Torquemada, however, was piping to those unwilling to hear for two reasons. First, although ideas about purity of blood had no theological or canonistic roots, they represent a different set of values, not grounded in Christianity, which lay alongside of and often overshadowed orthodoxy in the Uves of Castile's Old Christians. (These ideas were criticized in vain by popes, prelates, and canonists.35) Second, a more theological approach to these problems, but one still inimical to acceptance of New Christians by Old, was the long-standing idea of a uniform Christendom with no room for difference or dissent, a concept which—in a royalist form—lay behind the actions of the Catholic Kings, just as it would lie behind Louis XIV's revocation of the Edict of Nantes.36

What followed in Castile after the Toledan uprising was a gradual progress toward persecution. Sarmiento himself fled Toledo when the revolt died down. New Christians, however, found Toledo increasingly a hostile climate in which to seek lay or ecclesiastical preferment. Alvaro de Luna abandoned them, and Juan II, eager to pacify the key city, accepted the prohibitions imposed in Toledo on New Christians holding office there.37 The reign of Enrique TV, Juan IFs son and heir, saw other risings of the Old Christians against the New, and conversos were removed once more, although temporarily, from any offices which they had obtained in Toledo. An inquisition under royal auspices was autho-

"This connection is drawn by William E. Maguire,/oi!ra of Torquemada, O.R: The Antiquity of the Church, Annotated Text and Commentary (Washington, D.C., 1957). On the origins of this concept, see Yves Congar, "Ecclesia ab Abel," in Abhandlungen über Theologie und Kirche: Festschrift für Karl Adam (Düsseldorf, 1952), pp. 79-108. On the dating of the Summa and Torquemada's contemporaneous canonistic writings, see Karl Binder, "Kardinal Juan de Torquemada Verfasser der Nova ordinatio decreti Gratiani," Archivum Fratrum Praedicatorum, 22 (1952), 269-293.

"John Edwards, "Mission and Inquisition among Conversos and Moriscos in Spain," Studies in Church History, 21 (1984), 139-151 at pp. 149-150.

"John Edwards,"Religious Belief and Social Conformity: The Converso Problem in Late Medieval Cordoba," Transactions of the Royal Historical Society, ser. 5,31 (1985), 39-49.

"Benito Ruano, Toledo, pp. 55-81. The supposed role of the conversos in the fall of Alvaro de Luna has been minimized by Round, op. cit., pp. 169-2 10.

rized, and, even in the most peaceful years of Enrique's reign, the idea that purity of blood, mentioned above, was necessary for office holding was taking root. The convert community of Toledo, like those elsewhere in Castile, would suffer at the hands of the inquisitors during the reign of the Catholic Kings.38

The upheavals of 1449 now can be seen as one step on the road from tolerance extended to Jews to forced expulsion, and from the advancement of some converts as officials and men of affairs to the careful scrutiny of many of their kin by the Inquisition.39 The larger issues addressed by Torquemada and his contemporaries can be seen as an aspect of the development of European racism, especially the replacement of anti-Judaism with race-based anti-Semitism.40 This is a legitimate line of inquiry, but another can be pursued. Certain of the attitudes Torquemada pilloried, especially the belief that Christians could be divided perpetually into a superior and an inferior group, would be transferred to the New World. Even when the pope had ruled that the indigenous peoples of the Americas were fully human, a distinction between Spanish and native Christians would be maintained. Baptism was administered, often with little preparation, but the emergence of a native clergy, truly equal in holy orders, was resisted.41 Even the most millenarian expectations of the missionaries included a supposition that Spanish friars would continue to be custodians of lesser, native-born lay Christians.42 This distinction between Christians on grounds alien to theology ran counter to Juan de Torquemada's earnest arguments offered during the century before Mexico and Peru were conquered, but, as with the persecution of the conversos, other factors

'"Enrique upheld laws against office-holding by conversos in 1468, but they were revoked in 1471. See Roth, op. cit., p. 103; Benito Ruano, Toledo, pp. 83-119; William D. Phillips, Jr., Enrique IV and the Crisis of Fifteenth-Century Castile, 1425-1480 (Cambridge, Massachusetts, 1978), pp. 81-87. For Toledan conversos arrested for judaizing, see Francisco Cantera Burgos and Pilar León Tello, Judaizantes del arzobisbado de Toledo habilitados por la inquisición en 1495 y 1497 (Madrid, 1969). Despite inquisitorial activity, however, identifiable converso families still can be traced in sixteenth-century Toledo, according to Linda ????," Converso Families in Fifteenth- and Sixteenth-Century Toledo: The Significance of Lineage," Sefarad, 48 (1988), 117-196.

"Cecil Roth,^4 History of the Marranos, 4th ed. (New York, 1974), pp. 30-34.

"E.g., Netanyahu, Origins, pp. 1141-1146.

"Charles Ralph Boxer, The Church Militant and Iberian Expansion 1449-1770 (Baltimore, 1978), pp. 2-30.

42John Leddy Phelan, The Millennial Kingdom of the Franciscans in the New World, 2nd ed. (Berkeley, 1970), pp. 59-68.

carried more weight in Castillan society—and in European society as a whole—than did basic Christian doctrine. The same pattern can be found in the evangelization of Africa and later in missionary efforts in Asia. The fundamental equality among Christians of different origins inherent in Torquemada's arguments in favor of the conversos would find little acceptance until the Age of Empires had come to a close.43

"This tendency toward stratification and even infantilization runs alongside the drive toward deculturation of indigenous populations noted in David Sweet, "The Ibero-American Frontier Mission in Native American History," The New Latin-American Mission History, ed. Erick Langer and Robert H.Jackson (Lincoln, Nebraska, 1995), pp. 1-48 at pp. 23-29.

THE FRANCISCAN PREACHING TRADITION AND ITS SIXTEENTH-CENTURY LEGACY: THE CASE OF CORNELIO MUSSO

BY

Corrie Norman*

Recent scholarship on the changes that took place in early modern preaching has cited a number of Franciscans who were instrumental in the return to classical rhetorical models including Lorenzo Traversagni in the fifteenth century, Luca Baglione in the sixteenth, and Francesco Panigarola at the turn of the seventeenth. But it is their Humanism that has been emphasized while their affiliation with the Franciscan Order, one of the great preaching orders, has been treated as background detail. Although McGinness and O'Malley have noted that the Franciscan Rule is quoted in several important preaching documents of the period and even served as a shorthand formula in the primarily classically-inspired post-Tridentine sacred rhetorics, the contributions of the Franciscan Order to early modern preaching remain largely unexamined.1 The case of the Conventual Franciscan Cornelio Musso highlights continuity with the values of the medieval Franciscan preaching tradition and the need for a closer look at its significance for sixteenth-century preaching.

Musso (1511-1574) was a man of many talents and roles. He was a prodigious scholar, a churchman of distinguished service in the courts of Paul III and Pius FV, and a bishop who both helped to define Tridentine ideals and strove to put them into practice.2 But Musso was known

*Dr. Norman is an assistant professor of religion in the University of the South, Sewanee, Tennessee.

'Frederick McGinness,"Preaching Ideals and Practices in Counter-Reformation Rome," Sixteenth Century Journal, 11 (1980), 109-127, and Right Thinking and Sacred Oratory in Counter-Reformation Rome (Princeton, 1995), esp. pp. 30-35. John O'Malley, "Form, Content, and Influence of Works about Preaching Before Trent: The Franciscan Contribution," in Ifrati minori tra '400-'50O (Assisi, 1985), pp. 27-50.

The amount of attention Musso has received by scholars is meager relative to his significance for sixteenth-century Catholicism. Between 1586, when a short biography of Musso was published, and 1933, almost no new information about him appeared. In 1933, attention was brought to Musso again by Hubert Jedin, who published a long article on

mostly in his own day as a preacher, as his five volumes of Italian sermons attest.3 He was chosen to preach the inaugural sermon at the Council of Trent and was a preacher of choice for the annual Lenten cycles of several Italian cities. Musso's Italian sermons were reported to have "effected miracles" in the hearts of the crowds that thronged to hear him. Many of the same sermons, translated into Latin, were enjoyed at papal court.4

To connoisseurs of sacred rhetoric, Cornelio Musso was a "humanist" preacher: a "modern Demosthenes," the "Chrysostom of Italy"5 In 1554, at the midpoint of Musso s career, the Paduan humanist Bernardino Tomitano wrote a short treatise praising Musso's preaching. For Tomitano, Musso was "a Michelangelo of words" whose vivid adaptation of

Musso based on information he found in Vatican collections. Hubert Jedin, "Der Franziskaner Cornelio Musso, Bischof von Bitonto. Sein Lebensgang und seine kirchliche Wirksamkeit," Römische Quartalschrifl, 41 (1933), 207-275. Musso has received only cursory attention since, mostly from Franciscan scholars interested in his theology, episcopacy, or role at Trent. For example, Angélico Poppi, "La spiegazione del Magnificat' di Cornelio Musso (1540)," in Benjamino Costa e Samuele Doimi (eds.), Problemi e figure della scuola scotista del Santo (Padua, 1966), pp. 415-489; and "Il Commente della lettera di S. Paolo ai Romani di Cornelio Musso," in Il Santo, 6 (1966), 225-260. Also, Giovanni Odoardi,"Fra Cornelio Musso, OFMConv.(151 l - l 574). Padre, oratore e teólogo al Concilio di Trento," Miscellanea Francescana, 48 (1948), 223-242, 450-478; 49 (1949), 36-71 ; and R. J. Bartman, "Cornelio Musso, Tridentine Theologian and Orator," Franciscan Studies, 5 (1945), 247-276. Despite Musso's fame as a preacher in his own day, only one scholar in this century, Gustavo Cantini, has focused at any length on Musso the preacher. Gustavo Cantini, "Cornelio Musso dei Frati Minori Conventual·!, Predicatore, Scrittore e Teólogo al Concilio di Trento," Miscellanea Francescana, 41 (1941), 146-174, 424-463; 44 (1944), 218-219. While Cantini fell short of analyzing Musso's preaching in its broader contexts, he provided basic biographical and bibliographical information that makes such analysis possible. The most recent work on Musso is Gabriele De Rosa, "Il francescano Cornelio Musso dal Concilio di Trento alla Diócesi di Bitonto," Rivista di storia della chiesa in Italia, 40 (1986), 55-91 .

'Musso's sermon collections comprise seven volumes that appeared in multiple editions in the sixteenth century. The first editions are Prediche. . . fatte in diversi tempi e in diversi luoghi, nelle quali si contengono molti santi evangelici precetti. . . (5 vols.; Venice, 1556 [vol. 1], 1568 [vols. 2-3], 1580 [vol. 4], and 1586 [vol. 5], hereafter cited as Prediche), Delle Prediche quaresimali. . . sopra l'epistole e sopra i vangeli corrente per i giorni di quaresima (Venice, 1586, hereafter cited as Quaresimale); Quaresimale sopra U símbolo (Venice, l 590, hereafter cited as Símbolo). Citations in this article appear as follows: Short title (as above). Volume number (for Prediche only). Sermon number. Page number.

4Giuseppe Musso, Vita del Rev. Cornelio Musso, Vescovo di Bitonto descritta dal reverendo Don Giuseppe Musso, sua creatura (Venice, l 586), p. 4.

5See Cantini, op. cit. , pp. 442 ff.

classical style for contemporary audiences accounted for his appeal.[6] A generation after Musso's death, Federigo Borromeo described him as the first to return to a "noble" style of preaching.[7] What Tomitano, Borromeo, and like minds saw in Musso mirrored their own interests in the revival of sacred rhetoric based on classical and patristic models. In replying to Tomitano's praise, Musso admitted to having "striven. . . to raise myself from the common style of our time following. . . in the footsteps of the most eloquent Latin and Greek fathers."[8]

When he initiated the discussion about preaching, however, it was not to classical sources that Musso appealed, nor even the Church Fathers. Rather, he looked to more immediate family, to the heritage of his Franciscan brotherhood. Further, the issues on which he concentrated were the same concerns that had been expressed by Franciscan preachers since the inception of the Order. He shared the humanist tastes of his times; yet traditional Franciscan values provided the foundation for his preaching ministry.

There is much that is "Franciscan" about Musso the preacher and his preaching. Franciscan doctrinal themes and spirituality permeate Musso's sermons. His biographer cast his life story in the mold of Franciscan hagiography, even describing Musso's death much as Bonaventure had described Francis'.[9] Musso's itinerary reveals his primary self-identity as a Franciscan Lenten preacher, even after he became a bishop. His biographer claimed that Musso preached Lent in the cities "continually" for twenty-four years.[10]

But when I say that Cornelio Musso's ideas about preaching reflect his Franciscan heritage, I refer specifically to a cluster of elements found in the Rule of Francis. They include (1) a high estimate of the "authority" of preaching, (2) the powerfully affective "utility" of preaching, (3) the necessity for preachers to preach in both "works and words," and (4) an understanding of the Christian message as essentially moral-

6Bernardino Tomitano, Discorso sopra Veloquentia et ¡'artificio delle prediche, e del predicare di Monsignor Cornelio Musso (Venice, 1554).

'Federigo Borromeo, De sacris nostorum temporum oratoribus (Milan, 1632), cited by Cantini, op. cit., p. 446.

"Cornelio Musso, "All'eccellente dottore M. Bernardino Tomitano," in Prediche 2.

'Giuseppe Musso, op. cit., p. 11, and Bonaventure, The Life of Francis. Among other similarities, Giuseppe Musso claimed that Cornelio died on the same date that Francis died.

'"Giuseppe Musso, op. cit., p. 14. Jedin and De Rosa have traced Musso's itinerary during his years as Bishop of Bitonto (1544-1572). The dates and locations given for his occasional sermons also reflect the extent of his travels.

penitential. That is, in the words of the Rule, preachers were to preach "vices and virtues, punishments and glory" in order to move their hearers to penitence and better living.11

These elements appear together in Franciscan stories, commentaries, spiritual texts, and the artes praedicandi. They were reinforced by the most influential Franciscan preachers of the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries who discussed preaching in their sermons using the same words and phrases. Franciscans from Francis to Anthony of Padua to Bernardino of Siena understood them in basically the same way. Here, I will trace these elements through this lineage and then describe how Cornelio Musso followed it in the frequent discussions of preaching that appear in his sermons.

Basic Elements of the Franciscan Preaching Tradition

To trace the elements inherent in the Franciscan preaching tradition, it is necessary to begin with the Rule of Saint Francis both its earliest extant form (the "First Rule" of 1221) and the Regula bullata approved by Honorius III in 1223In Chapter 17 of the First Rule, Francis opened his discussion of preaching by warning his followers not to contradict the "form and institution" of the Roman Church. Here, Francis emphasized that authentic Franciscan preaching occurred only when it was undertaken with ecclesiastical permission. The authority to preach derived exclusively from Christ's legitimately constituted representatives in the ecclesiastical hierarchy and from the superiors in the Franciscan Order. Thus it was both "apostolic" and "authorized." With this principle established, Francis turned to focus on the life and character of the preacher. The First Rule stressed that humility was the most important virtue of a preacher and warned against vainglory, for preachers are to "preach by example" as well as words.12

"Regula Bullata, Chap. 9, Seraphicae Legislationis Textus Originales (Quaracchi, 1847), p. 44:"Fratres non praedicent in episcopatu alicuius episcopi, cum ab eo Ulis fuerit contradictum; et nullus Fratrum populo penitus audeat praedicare, nisi a Ministro generali huius fraternitatis fuerit examinants et approbatus, et ab eo officium sibi praedicatlonis concessum. Moneo quoque et exhorter eosdem fratres ut in praedicatione quam faciunt sint examinata et casta eorum eloquia, ad utilitatem et aedincationem populi, annuntiando eis vitia et virtutes, poenam et gloriam cum brevitate sermonis, quia verbum abbreviatum fecit Dominus super terram."

"Regula non bullata, Chap. 17, in Marion A. Habig (ed.), St. Francis ofAssist: Writings and Early Biographies. An English Omnibus (Chicago, 1983), p. 44.

The Ninth Chapter of the Regula bullata also began with authority, specifying that the brothers must have the permission of the bishops of the dioceses in which they would preach and approval by the Minister General of the Order. Their preaching should be "examined and chaste" for the "utility and edification" of the people. As for content, they were to "announce vices and virtues, punishment and glory. . . ."[13] Directly from these two documents came the four basic elements of Franciscan preaching: authority, utility, vices and virtues, word and example.

Following the Rule, Franciscan discussions of preaching commonly began with the "authority and utility" of preaching, a shorthand phrase that appeared among other places in an exposition on the Rule attributed to Bonaventure.[14] Franciscans generally appealed to two types of authority. The Legend of the Three Companions (1244) described Francis as "a genuine preacher" confirmed by "apostolic authority."[15] That is, the mission of Francis and his followers was confirmed by its likeness to the apostolic life of poverty and preaching. Ultimately, however, ecclesiastical sanction legitimized the Franciscans. Recognition by the successors of the apostles, the papacy and bishops, as well as a lifestyle patterned on apostolic ideals, made Franciscans "true apostles" in contrast to the "false evangelists" who preached outside the Church's authority.[16] Thus, as the Apostles were sent out by Christ, so Franciscan preachers had to be sent by the Church and the Order. This language commonly described the basis of the preachers' authority: they "were sent."

In the first formal commentary on the Rule, the Provincial Minister of Provence, Hugh of Digne (d. 1254), listed three necessary impositions for preachers. The first two pertained to ecclesiastically sanctioned authority. Preachers must "serve the peace of the Church" and preach "having been sent." Hugh's final imposition dealt with the second element, utility. The utility of preaching was the raison d'être of the Franciscans and tied together the other elements of Franciscan preaching. Through preaching, Franciscans served the Church. Hugh connected preaching's usefulness directly to the affective power of the content

[13] Regula Bullata in Seraphicae, p. 44. See note 10 for full text.

[14] "Expósito super regulam in Scripta S. Bonaventurae (Rome, 1942), p. 117. Ignatius Brady, "The Writings of St. Bonaventure regarding the Franciscan Order," in Alfonso Pompei (ed.), San Bonaventura, maestro di vita francescana e di sapienza cristiana, vol. 1 (Rome, 1976), p. 109, argued that this text was most likely produced by the school of John Capistrano in the fifteenth century. For Cornelio Musso and his contemporaries, however, it carried the imprimatur of Bonaventure.

[15] Legend of the Three Companions, Chap. 13, Habig, op. cit., p. 938.

[16] Paolo M. Sevesi, L'ordine dei frati minori (Milan, 1942), p. 136.

that Francis had outlined (the third element). Preaching was to be "of vices and virtues because in these ways are men best instructed. . . and ofpunishment and glory which. . . move men's hearts."17

Francis' original approval by Innocent III hinged on the preaching of penitence and avoidance of doctrinal preaching.18 All sermons, Francis told the leaders of the Order, were to remind people of the need to do penance.19 Franciscan preaching became ever more associated with the practice of hearing confession.20 The utility of Franciscan preaching, as well as its legitimacy, rested in its ability to move souls toward that end. Franciscan preaching had to be affective and moralistic, aimed at the heart and the amending of life rather than the head and the teaching of knowledge. Preachers intended to stir up sorrow and compunction in the crowds, after which they provided relief in confession.

Thus, Franciscan preaching was essentially about moving (movere). For too long, scholars assumed that late medieval Franciscans used the scholastic thematic form for preaching to the masses and thus directed their energies toward proving points rather than stirring hearts. There is some truth to this observation; the scores of thematic reportationes, sermons, and artes provide abundant evidence for it. Recent scholarship, however, has reassessed the purpose of these preachers. Daniel Lesnick has argued that in popular preaching Franciscans rejected the abstract scholastic preaching the Dominicans employed for a vivid, moving narrative style.21 More recently, John O'Malley has suggested that while vernacular sermons retained some scholastic influence, they were a far cry from the written Latin versions that have come down to us.22 Whether one accepts Lesnick's argument or O'Malley's more moderate view, it is clear that whatever influence scholasticism had on Fran-

"Hugh ofDigne's Rule Commentary, ed. David Flood (Rome, 1979), pp. 175-177.

"Sevesi, op. cit.,p. 135. John Moorman,vl History ofthe Franciscan Orderfrom Lts Origins to the Year 1517 (Oxford, 1968), p. 72.

"Francis of Assisi, Letter to All Superiors, Habig, op. cit., p. 113.

20See for example, Roberto Rusconi, "La predicazione francescana sulla penitenza alia fine del quattrocento nel Rosarium Sermonum di Bernardino Busti," Studia Patavina, 22 (1975), 68-95; "Predicatori e predicazione secoli ix-syii" Annali della Storia d'Italia, 4 (Turin, 1981), 95 1-1035; and "Dal pulpito alla confessione. Modelli di comportamento religioso in Italia tra 1470 circa e 1520 circa," in Paolo Prodi and R Johanek (eds.), Strutture ecclesiastiche in Italia e in Germania prima della Riforma (Bologna, 1984), pp. 259-316.

21Daniel Lesnick, Preaching in Medieval Florence: The Social World of Franciscan and Dominican Spirituality (Athens, Georgia, 1989).

"John W. O'Malley in the introduction to Beverly Kienzle et al., De Ore Domini: The Preacher and the Word in the Middle Ages (Kalamazoo, Michigan, 1989), pp. 9-10.

ciscan preaching, it did not replace the emphasis on moving, penitential preaching.

Closely related to the affective quality that characterized Franciscan utility was the preacher's "example and word" (the fourth element). Franciscan preachers literally had to practice what they preached. The First Rule urged preachers to "preach by example." Thomas of Celano, Francis' early biographer (d. 1260), said that Francis went about "announcing to everyone the reign of God, edifying the hearers with works and words" making "a tongue" of his whole body.[23] Franciscan legislation had little to say about doctrine or style, but included frequent exhortation about the preachers' lives as examples.[24] (Indeed, one could argue that lifestyle superseded style for medieval Franciscans.) The importance of humility and the admonition against vainglory that appeared in the First Rule were underscored by Saint Bonaventure.[25] The fifteenth-century Franciscan writer known as Pseudo-Bonaventure introduced a phrase taken from Jesus' words in John 7 that other Franciscans, including Musso, would repeat: Preachers were not "to seek their own glory."[26] Besides the warnings against moral improprieties, Franciscan writers emphasized spiritual preparation, especially meditation and spiritual purgation. Hugh of Digne said that for the "utility and edification of the people" preachers must meditate beforehand and "study without corrupt intention."[27]

These four elements were so important to the self-consciousness of Franciscans that they frequently called explicit attention to them in their own sermons as well as in Rule commentaries and narratives. Sometimes, a preacher might make preaching or the roles of the preacher and his audience the main topics of his sermon; more often, however, these topics were discussed in passing. Saint Anthony of Padua (1195-1231), the first major Franciscan preacher and the patron of Musso's monastery of Il Santo in Padua, typifies the preacher who included these preaching elements in his sermons. In his preaching on preaching, Anthony addressed all four of the elements that I have outlined. He appealed to apostolic authority and example and admonished

"Sevesi, op. cit., p. 135.

24Bartholomaeus Belluco, De sacra praedicatione in ordine fratrum minorum (Studia Antoniana, \o\. 8 [Rome, 1956]), p. 83, traces this history.

2,Eric Doyle in the introduction to The Disciple and Master: St. Bonaventure's Sermons on St. Francis of Assist (Chicago, 1983), pp. 21 and 45.

26(Pseudo) Bonaventure, p. 117, quoting Gregory the Great, Morana 22.

27Hugh of Digne, p. 177.

preachers to "holiness of doctrine" in obeisance to the Church.28 Anthony emphasized the "moral-penitential" function of preaching and modeled it in his own preaching on "vices and virtues."29

Anthony primarily stressed the second element, utility, or as he phrased it, the "necessity and utility" of preaching. The "ultimate goal" of preaching for Anthony was to change lives: to lead hearers to a "sincere, perfect, and durable conversion."30 Preaching's effectiveness lay in its ability to move people, "to illumine the mind and heart, ignite the flame of love of God, and unite in charity those who believe in Christ."31 This ability was intrinsically tied to the affectivity of the eternal Word of God (logos) to which preachers gave voice. I will return to the importance of the Word for Anthony later when I discuss its centrality to Musso's ideas on preaching.

For Anthony, as for Francis and the early commentators, the utility of preaching depended on the fourth element, the life and character of the preacher. He complained, "Today all the preachers rest on the bank of words and don't want to pass over to the bank of works; thus the devil doesn't fear them, and their words have little effect." Anthony specifically warned against glorying in one's eloquence and insisted on the spiritual preparation of preachers over learning and eloquence. If the speaker was vain his words would be in vain.32

The four basic elements of the Franciscan preaching tradition are also evident in the sermons of several great Franciscan preachers of the fifteenth century, including the immensely popular Bernardino of Siena (1380-1444). Like Cornelio Musso, Bernardino was regarded by contemporary observers as an innovator in homiletic style.33 Also like Musso, when Bernardino discussed preaching, he said little about style. He, too, concentrated on the fundamentals of his Order.

In his sermon "On the Preacher and the Hearer," Bernardino reiterated all four elements of the Franciscan preaching tradition. The preacher's authority, he insisted, derived from his mission as one "sent" and as one

2*Samuele Doimi,ia Dottrina della predicazione in S.Antonio diPadova (Studio Teológico per Laici al Santo, Serie A, no. 3 [Padua, 1952], pp. 57-58; 91.

29TWd., p. 67.

xLbid., pp. 70-71.

"TWrf., p. 135.

52ToJd., pp. 95; 128-129.

5iSee Zelina Zafarana, "Bernardino nella Storia della predicazione popolare," in Bernardino predicatore nella società del suo tempo (Convegni del Centro di Studi sulla spiritualità médiévale, Vol. 12 [Todi, 1976]), pp. 41-70.

whose words did not contradict the teachings of "Holy Church and holy doctors." As for preachers' lives, he admonished them to imitate Christ's example and preach in both "words and works."[34] When Bernardino outlined the content of preaching, he quoted the Rule. In a sermon in Florence in 1435, Bernardino stated:"I have learned from our father Saint Francis who said in our Rule to preachers: Announce to the people virtue and vices, glory and punishment."[35] He repeated the phrase in at least two other sermons.[36] Above all, Bernardino emphasized the utility of preaching. Sermons could be so effective in Bernardino's estimate that he even recommended preaching over the Mass.[37] In the same vein as Anthony and later Musso, Bernardino tied preaching's utility to the affectivity of the Word.

Franciscan Preaching Models

For Musso and his Franciscan forebears, these elements originated in the Bible; that is, they were exemplified by the apostles, prophets, and Christ himself. They were sent to preach repentance; their lives clearly matched their words. Franciscans were convinced that these elements were central to the biblical and Christian tradition as well as to the Franciscan Order. For this reason Franciscans seldom discussed these elements as being specifically "Franciscan." In fact, Musso did not directly name Francis or any other Franciscan as a preaching model or source in his sermons. This is consistent with his Franciscan heritage; biblical figures and metaphors had always been the principal sources or models cited in Franciscan discussions of preaching.

Most often in his sermons, Musso expressed Franciscan ideas through the mouths and Uves of biblical models. As if dressed in the Franciscan habit, his biblical characters spoke about preaching in the words of the Rule and other Franciscan documents. As "a Michelangelo of words," Musso was particularly adept at bringing the basic elements of Francis-

[34] Bernardino da Siena, Prediche volgari, ed. Carlo Delcorno (Milan, 1989), pp. 142; 145-146.

[35] Sevesi, op. cit., p. 144, quoted from a sermon preached by Bernardino on March 23, 1435.

[36] In Florence in 1424 and again on April 4, 1535. Both Sevesi (p. 144) and Zafarana (p. 57) note Bernardino's quotation of the Rule.

[37] Bernardino da Siena, p. 149.

can preaching to life through vivid narratives and imaginary dialogues of biblical exemplars. Thus, examining the models that Musso employed is a good way to begin to appreciate Musso as an advocate and perpetuator of the Franciscan preaching tradition in the early modern period.

The entire Franciscan enterprise began with Francis' attempt to imitate the apostolic model. Not surprisingly, Musso also embraced these original models. Echoing the early Franciscan preaching texts, he appealed to apostolic authority.38 Like Anthony, he depicted the apostles as wandering preachers of penitence.39 Scattered references to other New Testament figures as models appeared throughout Musso's preaching: Barnabas, Timothy, and John the Baptist.40 The Apostle Paul, however, was the most important of these. Paul was the "master preacher" for Musso; his method and eloquence were unparalleled.41 References to Paul's statements on preaching and examples of his "preaching" (for Musso, Paul "preached" in his letters) abound in Musso's sermons. Paul, like Musso's other models, was a preacher of penitence who preached in example and word.42 Pauline texts undergirded his other models and spurred preachers on to the task. For Musso, as well as Anthony and Bernardino before him, Paul gave the rallying cry for all preachers of penitence in 2 Timothy 4:2: "preach the word, be urgent in season and out of season, convince, rebuke, and exhort. . . ."43

It was the Hebrew prophets, however, who most often embodied Cornelio Musso's preaching ideals. Their stories provided the basis for most of Musso's preaching on preaching. Again, the prophets were common models among Franciscans. Bonaventure said that Francis preached "according to the words of the prophets and in the spirit of

58For example, Quaresimale 2 and 4.56; Prediche 3.2.37-38 and 3.8.328.

^Prediche 3.2.37-38. On Anthony's depiction of the apostles as penitence preachers, see Doimi, op. cit., pp. 57-58; 84.

""Quaresimale 2, 5, and ^,Prediche 3.10.

"Prediche 4.9.440.

"From 1 Corinthians 1:17 inQuaresimale2.2i;2:4inPrediche3.S328;3:4inSimbolo 3-43; 6:3 in Quaresimale 8.120. A series of analogies on preaching based on 1 Corinthians 9 in Quaresimale 41.68. 2 Corinthians 12:21 in Quaresimale 59-379- 1 Timothy 4 in Quaresimale 2.22. 2 Timothy 4:2 in Quaresimale 2.22 and 5.72-73. 1 Thessalonians 2:3-6 in Quaresimale 2.22;Titus 2 in Quaresimale 2.23. Paul's preaching as exhortation from Acts 13:15 in Prediche 4.5.206. Paul's preaching as an example of method and vice preaching in Philippians in Quaresimale 67.533 and preaching by example and word in Romans in Prediche 4.9.440. The text as preaching in Símbolo 3.43; Prediche 4.9.440.

"Translation from RSV Bernardino, p. 167. Doimi on Anthony, op. cit., p. 121. Musso, Quaresimale 5.73.

the prophets."44 Anthony and Bernardino looked frequently to the prophets as models.45

The Franciscans certainly were not the only ones to hold up these biblical models; and Musso certainly was not the only preacher in the sixteenth century to do so. For one thing, the look backward to biblical exemplars conformed to the humanist call ad fontes. Frederick McGinness has noted the repeated appeal to models and an established "succession" of exemplars, including the prophets and apostles, to •whom preachers could look for guidance in the humanistically inspired preaching treatises of the later half of the sixteenth century.46 But Musso was not just following the crowd of humanist colleagues. His use of these models was consonant with his Franciscan heritage.

First of all, some models and images carried special significance for the Franciscan tradition. One such image is the trumpet. Musso often associated the function of preachers with the trumpet.47 Again, the preacher as trumpet was a common analogy, usually based on the priestly function of sounding the trumpet to call together the people (Numbers 10). It appeared in authors from Caesarius of Aries to Luther.48 Girolamo Seripando, an Augustinian, used it in reference to Musso.49

It was common practice among Franciscans to refer to their great preachers as trumpets and to link them with biblical models through the metaphor. Bernardino da Feltre called Michael Carcano the "trumpet of the Holy Spirit and Paul reborn." Salimbene said that Hugh of Digne had a voice like a trumpet and was "another Elijah and Paul." Anthony was called "a trumpet of the Gospel, a new Paul."50 The famous preacher Giacomo della Marca applied it to Bernardino da Siena.51 In

"Bonaventure, Life of Francis, in Bonaventure, trans. Ewert Cousins (New York, 1978), p. 200.

45Doimi, op. cit., p. 94. Loman McAodha, "The Nature and Efficacy of Preaching According to St. Bernardino of Siena," Franciscan Studies, 27 (1967), 238.

^Frederick McGinness, "Rhetoric and Counter-Reformation Rome: Sacred Oratory and the Construction of the Catholic World View, 1563-1621" (Ph.D. Dissertation, University of California, Berkeley, 1982), p. 199.

<7In Quaresimale 1.15, 5.68-73, 8.112, 2i.316-311, Prediche 3.2.66, 4.3.107, 3.3.121, 1.5.231, 5.1.125, 4.9.477, and 1.6.283.

"Caesarius of Aries, Sermons ("Fathers of the Church," Vol. 47 [Washington, D.C, 1964]), p. 169. Luther in Rodney L. Petersen, Preaching in the Last Days: The Theme of "Two Witnesses" in the Sixteenth and Seventeenth Centuries (Oxford, 1993), pp. 98 ff.

"Jedin, op. cit., p. 236.

50Sevesi, op. cit., pp. 140; 137.

"Bernardino da Siena, p. 167, n. 147.

such great company, it is no wonder that Musso humbly thought of himself as "the small trumpet."[52]

The trumpet was more than honorific for Franciscans; it sounded out the elements of Franciscan preaching. For Anthony, the trumpet called the people to hear about "vice, punishment, and glory."[53] Larissa Taylor pointed out that for the French Franciscan Michel Menot (d. 1518), the ardent preacher excoriating vice, exemplified primarily by Paul, was "like a trumpet that blares forth and pierces the hearts of the listeners."[54] Bernardino da Siena also compared the call to zealous preaching against vices to the trumpet of Isaiah 58: "Cry without ceasing. . . as a trumpet. . . and announce to my people their wickedness and sin."[55] Musso did the same.

Musso used the trumpet analogy repeatedly, sometimes taking it directly from the text on which he was preaching.[56] The way he applied it was consistent with the interpretation of his Franciscan forebears. The trumpet linked prophets, apostles, and preachers through time in the common purpose of preaching incessantly against vice:

> This was always the office of the priests, hearers, to sound the trumpets in war in the Old Testament. And likewise of the prophets to raise their voices against the sins of the people. O how useful were these trumpets of the preachers to the world, these threats, these reproaches, these bold and intrepid voices of the prophets and Apostles of Christ.[57]

Musso himself descended from this line. He and his colleagues "were sent" to Rome as "trumpets" to call the city to penitence.[58]

The prophetic model provides another example of how Musso followed his Franciscan tradition in interpreting a common image. Old Testament prophets were popular models for those who wrote about preaching in the early modern period.[59] The use of this model did not

[52] See for example Prediche 1.6.283, 4.3.107, 3.3.121; Quaresimale 5.72.

[53] Doimi, op. cit., p. 81.

[54] Larissa Taylor, Soldiers of Christ: Preaching in Late Medieval and Reformation France (New York, 1992), p. 59.

[55] Bernardino da Siena, pp. 161-162.

[56] For example, Prediche 1.3-151, 1.5.231, 1.6.283, 3.3.30, 5..1.125; Quaresimale 8.112 and 21.316-317; Símbolo 12.186. In Quaresimale 5, he followed Isaiah 58:1; in Quaresimale Ijoel 2:15.

[57] Quaresimale 5.71.

[58] Prediche 1.3.151: "Tutti habbiano bisogno di penitentia; per cio il Signore ti ha mandato tanti predicatori a Roma che sonó come tante trombe. . . ."

[59] On Catholic authors, see McGinness, "Rhetoric," p. 199. On the use of this model by Protestants, see Petersen, op. cit.

come without its problems, however. For sixteenth-century Catholic leaders, contemporary prophets were at least annoyances and at worst serious threats to the Church; they were misguided, apocalyptic visionaries who stirred up the people, charlatans out for money, or deceptive heretics. Although the Fifth Lateran Council prohibited the preaching of self-proclaimed, itinerant prophets in 1517, preaching on the demise of Rome, a "new age," and an "angelic pope" could still be heard in the streets of Rome in Musso's time and beyond.60 Relatively few understood the prophets as Erasmus reinterpreted them. For him, they were teachers of "ethics-related wisdom," very much in keeping -with his general prescription for the preaching of his day.61

Earlier Franciscans had been no less troubled by the prophetic model.62 This is not the place to recite the Order's problems with apocalypticism and how divisive propheticism became for the Order. In the fifteenth century, however, even orthodox preachers like Bernardino dei Busti reported prophecies about the birth of the Antichrist. This apocalyptic-prophetic model was opposed by other Franciscans, among them Roberto Caracciolo and Bernardino da Siena.63 For these Franciscans, prophets were examplars of the value Franciscans placed on penitential preaching. Although Bernardino believed that he was living at the "end of the sixth age," his prophets were more concerned with banishing sin than ushering in a new era.64 Cornelio Musso, who also thought he was living near the end of history and looked forward

60In 1516, Lateran V in "circa modum praedicandi" attempted to prohibit preaching on apocalyptic themes, false miracles, heretical opinions, and preaching in general by itinerant "prophets." On prophecy and Lateran V, see Nelson Minnich, "Prophecy and the Fifth Lateran Council," in Marjorie Reeves (cá), Prophetic Rome in the High Renaissance Period (Oxford, 1992), pp. 63-87. Two other essays in Reeves yield information on the continuation of prophetic preaching after Lateran V Ottavia Niccoli,"High and Low Prophetic Culture in Rome at the Beginning of the Sixteenth Century," pp. 203-222, describes a wandering hermit who gave apocalyptic sermons in Rome in 1584, and Thomas Cohen, "A Note on Fra Pelagio, A Hermit-Prophet in Rome," pp. 233-237, discusses prophecy in Rome at mid-century.

610'Malley,"Erasmus," p. 24.

"There is a large body of literature on the Franciscan Spirituals and apocalyptic propheticism. The classic work on this topic is Decima Douie, The Nature and Effect of the Heresy of the Fraticelli (Manchester, 1932). Gordon Leff gives an informative account in Heresy in the Later Middle Ages (New York, 1967), vol. I, part 1. For English translations of some of the major works of the Spiritual Franciscans, see Bernard McGinn (trans.), Apocalyptic Spirituality (New York, 1979).

63Rusconi, "Busti," pp. 93-94. San Bernardino told his hearers not to pay attention to prophecies about the Antichrist in "On the Preacher," Bernardino da Siena, p. 152.

"McAodha, op. cit., pp. 220-224.

to an "eighth age," followed Bernardino's interpretation and made his prophets moralistic preachers of vice and virtue.65

There were more immediate associations for Musso between his Franciscan heritage and the prophetic model. As Larissa Taylor observed, Michel Menot could not help but see the similarity of his mission in sin-filled cities to the missions of the urban prophets.66 Bordin noted that the brothers of Il Santo were taught specifically to think of their cloister as "the desert or sanctuary where God came to prepare new prophets and apostles" as he had done with Elijah, Isaiah, Jeremiah, and the Baptist.67 Thus Musso and his brothers came to think of themselves as "prophets" as they prepared for their Lenten preaching missions.

These factors help to explain why Musso identified so closely with the stories of prophetic callings. He began a significant part of his career in Rome by preaching on the call of Jeremiah, using it to outline his very Franciscan ideas about preaching and his relationship to his congregation in San Lorenzo in Dámaso.68 In the first sermon of his second Lent there, Musso began another sermon cycle by exhorting the preachers of Rome to join him in imitating the mission of the prophet Joel: "O preachers, O my co-apostles, O senior colleagues! Raise, raise the sound of your divine trumpets, of your voices in Rome, this is Zion, this is Jerusalem, this is the metropolis of God!"69

Finally, Musso used a model that was common among Franciscans but rarely used by anyone else: Christ. Historically, Christ has been treated more as the subject of preaching than as a preacher himself. Augustine, to take a very important example, does not discuss Christ's preaching in De Doctrina Christiana. In the Ecclesiastes, Erasmus does not discuss Christ's preaching per se. Peter Bayley found Giovanni Botero's treatment of Christ's style ("sermo piscatorius") in De Praedicatore verbi Dei unusual enough to note in his study70

"Musso discussed the "eighth age" of perpetual stability in Prediche 5.3-75.

""Taylor, op. cit., p. 15.

67Bordin, op. cit., p. 82.

68MuSSo served as house theologian to Cardinal Alessandro Farnese and preacher in San Lorenzo in Dámaso, the titular church of Farnese, from 1539 to 1542.

"'Quaresimale 1.15: The text of Joel 2:15 reads, "Blow the trumpet in Zion; sanctify a fast; call a solemn assembly, gather the people . . ." (RSV).

70Peter Bayley, French Pulpit Oratory, 1598-1650 (Cambridge, 1980), p. 51. Botero was the secretary of Carlo Borromeo. His De praedicatore verbi Dei was among those treatises on preaching published in the generation following Musso. Bayley referred to a 1585 edition.

The Franciscan appeal to Christ as a model and the imitatio Christi is well known. More specifically, Christ was also a model preacher for Franciscans.[71] The last phrase of the Ninth Chapter of the Regula Bullata told preachers to preach "in a discourse that is brief because it was in a few words that the Lord preached while on earth."[72] Here, the appeal was to Christ's unornamented style, to how he preached. The interest in Christ as a stylistic model continued in the Franciscan tradition. Bernardino da Siena, for one, saw Christ as a model of eloquence.[73] The author of the late medieval Meditations on the Life of Christ, Giovanni de Caulibus de Sancto Gemeniano, was intrigued by the mixture of methods that Christ used to reach people:

> Our Lord and Redeemer, desiring the salvation of the souls for which He had come to give His Life, tried to draw them to Him in all ways and extricate them from the prisons of the enemies. Thus He sometimes used persuasive and humble sermons, sometimes reproving and harsh ones, sometimes threats and frights. In this way He varied the means and remedies of salvation as He saw them and was necessary according to the place and time and different people that were listening.[74]

Musso followed this interest in Christ's style of preaching. Musso presented Christ as a model preacher several times.[75] Although not one of his own personal strengths, Musso noted that Christ preached with few words, using the words of the Rule." verbum abbreviatum. "[76] Like Bernardino, Musso found ultimate eloquence in Christ.[77] And like earlier Franciscans, he usually described Christ's eloquence not in terms of ornamentation but in terms of its ability to move without rhetorical device. With Giovanni de Caulibus, he found that Christ the preacher reached his audience by both soothing and fearsome means. Musso ex-

[71] Lesnick, op. cit., p. 143.

[72] Regula Bullata in Seraphicae, p. 44.

[75] Bernardino quoted in Salvatore Nicolosi, "Tensione escatologica ed equilibrio razionale nella predicazione di San Bernardino," in Francesco Episcopo (ed.), San Bernardino predicatore epellegrino (Atti del convegno nazionale di studi Bernardiniani, 1980 [Lecce, 1985]), p. 81:"Gesù, fontana d'eloquenza, usava sempre in parabole e cose palpabili per dare ad intendere il regno del cielo; viene a dire per queste cose umane, si vengono ad intendere chiaramente Ie cose divine."

[7<] From Giovanni de Caulibus de Sancto Gemeniano, Meditations on the Life of Christ, quoted in Lesnick, op. cit., p. 143.

[] Quaresimale 2,50,58,60,6l; Prediche 1.5, 1.10,3.1,3.2,4.5 and 4.6.

[^] Prediche 4.2.61 :"Io non posso esser lungo nel dire in questo giorno; poiche il Signore hà abbreviate tanto il verbo suo, 'Verbum abbreviatum fecit Dominus super terram.'" Pseudo-Bonaventure, p. 117, noted that "verbum abbreviatum" comes from Romans 9:28.

[^] Prediche 1.5.269: "Redondava nella lingua, e nelle labbra, del dolce Giesu un'eloquentia inestimabile; una copia infinita di figure, d'auttorità, d'oracoli, di paraboli. . . ."

plained this mixed style in Christ's first sermon in the synagogue at Nazareth by connecting it to the third element of the Franciscan preaching tradition. Christ as the "true" model of the penitence preacher moved his hearers through a balanced mix of "punishment and glory":

> Behold the penitence with which the preachers heal the contrite of heart. . . . Behold the terror of infernal punishment. . . Behold the consolation of eternal glory. . . Oh what a true preacher Christ was![78]

For Musso, Christ was the exemplar par excellence of basic elements inherent in the Franciscan preaching tradition. I turn now to discuss each of these elements as they appear in Musso's preaching.

Franciscan Elements in the Preaching of Cornelio Musso

Musso usually began his discussions on preaching with the appeal to authority just as the Rule and subsequent commentaries had done. In his first sermon in Rome, Musso introduced the topic by equating the preacher's authority with that conferred on Jeremiah. Musso loosely paraphrased God's call to the prophet in Jeremiah 1:10, "I put my words in your mouth, Jeremiah, go, preach, announce, edify, plant, uproot, disperse, destroy as you wish; already I have made you the captain of these peoples." He followed with the exclamation, "O sacred office of the Preachers of the Gospel!"[79]

For Musso, the authority of preachers rested on their connection to the apostolic tradition to which earlier Franciscans had looked. "For what were the apostles sent if not to preach. . . ? St. Paul, what purpose did he have if not to preach?" he asked the Romans. Yet the apostolic tradition did not stand on its own; as with the prophets, apostolic authority derived ultimately from the call of God. Musso used the same language that Bonaventure and Hugh had used to describe the call. "This apostolic office," Musso concluded, "is such a great charge. . . that in neither of the laws was ever a holy man the Preacher without having been sent."[80] In keeping with the emphasis on ecclesiastical legitimacy and with contemporary problems in mind, Musso was careful to link the apostolic call and sending to ecclesiastical legitimation. Just as "being sent" by the Church distinguished the early Franciscans from

[78] Quaresimale 5.72.
[79] Quaresimale 2.21.
[80] Quaresimale 2.21-22.

other itinerant evangelizers, for Musso it separated Catholic preachers from the heretics of his time.[81]

Whenever Musso defined the content of preaching, he repeated the guidelines that he had learned in the Franciscan Rule. He paraphrased the Regula Bullata's instruction to preach "vices and virtues, punishment and glory" at least seven times in his sermons and quoted it directly in his instructions to the clergy of his diocese.[82] In one instance, Musso exhorted preachers to imitate Joel, summarizing the steps by which the prophet induced penitence in his hearers:

> Begin little by little to preach of virtue, penitence and the glory of Paradise; raise your voice like a trumpet in your pulpit, reproaching vice, highlighting the gravity of the sins of the people. . . Finally, send out that terrible sound of the tremendous voice of the day of judgment. . . .[83]

Every step is taken -with St. Francis here: virtue and glory, vice and judgment (punishment).

As for the Franciscan emphasis on the preacher's example (words and works), it is second in importance only to the ability to affect hearers' hearts in Musso's preaching on preaching. Musso longed for preachers cut in the mold of the prophets, but did not find them:

> O Elijah, where are you?. . . There are no more Elijahs today. Elijah would have a double spirit both to prophesy and to do miracles, both in living words and in holy works. . . They have only one spirit, they speak well but they don't do well, they have good words but bad works.[84]

Musso's Franciscan sensibilities told him that the complimentarity of the preachers' words and works was of central importance because they could enhance or inhibit the effectiveness of preaching. The primary problem of sixteenth-century preaching for Musso was not bad style, wrong content, or even wily heretical preachers, but rather Catholics who preached daily on judgment yet exhibited no compunction about their own lives.[85] Speaking directly to the Roman clergy in 1539, Musso admonished, "The syllogisms of the words are works; if

[81] For instance Prediche 3.10.

[82] Quaresimale, 1, 2, 5, 36, 58; Símbolo 9; Prediche 2.7. Synodus Bituntina (Venice, 1579), p. 392. In the Synodus, Musso's instructions to the preachers of Bitonto recapitulate the Franciscan values, wording, and models that appear in his sermons.

[83] Quaresimale 1.15.

[84] Quaresimale 23.396.

[85] Quaresimale 11.160.

one doesn't see a good life, one won't believe the true doctrine."[86] A preacher's actions pertained not only to the effectiveness of his own preaching but also to the entire preaching office. With Anthony, Cornelio believed that when preachers behaved badly, it gave the devil an edge. He warned his colleagues not to bring scandal, allowing the devil to turn "a fly into an elephant" and thereby making the words of all preachers fruitless.[87]

Musso the great stylist, in concert with his Franciscan heritage, held that spiritual preparation and lifestyle were more important than rhetorical eloquence. Like his Franciscan forebears, Musso thought that preachers must be receptive to spiritual cleansing before they could preach effectively. Referring to the description of Paul's preaching in 1 Thessalonians 2:3-6, Musso noted that it 'was free of seven evils:"error, adulation, scurrility, conflict, scandal, vainglory, and malice." That is, according to Musso, Paul's "marvelous preaching" was "purged seven times," a phrase from Psalm 11:7 that had also appeared in the Regula Bullata, Hugh, and Bernardino.[88]

Musso recommended one virtue above all others to preachers, the fundamental virtue emphasized by the Rule and the subsequent preaching tradition: humility. He used the same words from John 7:18 that Franciscan forebears had quoted to point to Christ's humility as a standard: "When he was preaching, he always said, ? do not seek my own glory.'"[89] But the humble Christ wears a particularly sixteenth-century face in Musso's discussions of preaching. When he spoke of Christ the humble preacher, Musso applied another saying from John 7,

^Quaresimale 2.23.

"Quaresimale 8.120.

^Quaresimale 2.22-23 "Cosi tocco Paolo, che di se stesso dicea. 'Praedicatio nostra, non de errore, ñeque de immunditia, neque de dolo, non quasi hominibus placentes, neque fuimus aliquando in sermone adulationis, neque quaerentes ab hominibus gloriam, neque in occasione avaritiae, Deus, mihi testis est.' O santissimo predicatore, délie cui marvigliose predicationi, ben si puo dire, che col settiforme fuoco dello spirito santo, erano sette volte púrgate, daU'errore, dall'adulatione, dalla scurrilita, dal contraste, dallo scandalo, dalla vanagloria, dalla malitia.'Eloquia domini, eloquia casta, argentum igné examinatum, probatum terrae, purgatum septuplum.' Felici tutti quelli, le cui parole. . . saranno con sette doni, sette volte púrgate." The Vulgate version of Ps. 11:7 reads:"Eloquia Domini eloquia casta; argentum igné examinatum, probatum terrae, purgatum septuplum." The Ninth Chapter of the Regulata Bullata contains similar wording: "Moneo quoque et exhorter eosdem Fratres, ut in praedicatione, quam faciunt, sint examinais et casta eorum eloquia. . . ." Hugh used Ps. 11:7 as a prooftext for this section of the Rule. Bernardino quoted it in his sermon on preaching, p. 153.

"Quaresimale 60.417.

"My doctrine is not mine but that of the one who sent me" (John 7: 16).90 Combining these, he has Christ himself speak to the contemporary situation:

> You see that I have not sought my own glory; if I were preaching a worldly doctrine, I would seek to be praised by men as have the princes of the sects. I seek nothing but the praise of God who has sent me; thus my doctrine is not mine; it is his."

For Musso, and the Franciscan tradition, humility was closely tied to the preacher's fulfillment of his duty to the One who sent him. Preachers who were faithful to Christ's (and the Church's) doctrine confirmed their humility and legitimacy.

Like Bernardino and Anthony, Musso located the importance of preaching primarily in its utility, or in the same words that Anthony had used, "how useful and necessary the preachers are."92 This theme appeared repeatedly in Musso's preaching. In fact, most of his attention to preaching focused on its utility.93 Further, Musso discussed the utility of preaching or its service to the Church in terms of its ability to affect hearers. He understood and explained this affective quality by connecting it to the eternal Word (logos).

Musso's emphasis on the Word is significant in the context of early modern preaching theory. John O'Malley has noted a lack of "any developed theology of the Word or minister of the Word," among various Catholic authorities from Erasmus' Ecclesiastes to Carlo Borromeo and the early Jesuits.94 In the context of his Franciscan heritage, however, Musso's focus on the Word is consistent with the development of Fran-

vQuaresimale 50.43, 60.417, 2.28, and Prediche 10.561.

""Quaresimale 50.43.

"'Prediche 3.2.65.

"For example in Quaresimale 2, 59, 5, 41; Simbolo 20; Prediche 2.2 and 3. 10.

94The quotation is taken from John W. Malley's discussion of this subject with specific reference to Borromeo in John W. O'Malley/"Saint Charles Borromeo and the Praecipuum Episcoporum Munus: His Place in the History of Preaching," in John M. Headley and John B. Tomaro (eds.), San Carlo Borromeo: Catholic Reform and Ecclesiastical Politics in the Second Half of the Sixteenth Century (Washington, D.C, 1988), p. 142. As for the Jesuits, O'Malley observed that they discussed the Word and "shared a practical conviction" about the connection of nature and grace in preaching, but not in a systematic way. See John W O'Malley, The First Jesuits (Cambridge, Massachusetts, 1993), pp. 102-103. Tife»2, "Erasmus and the History of Sacred Rhetoric: The Ecclesiastes of 1535" Erasmus of Rotterdam Society Yearbook, 5 (1985), 19, credited Erasmus with acknowledging that "the preacher has a special relationship to the sermo Dei or verbum Dei. . . ," but pointed to the lack of "a fuller development of Erasmus' ideas on the special dynamism and transforming power of the word of God" that appeared elsewhere in Erasmus' works.

ciscan ideas about preaching. Anthony of Padua left rudimentary observations about the relationship of preaching to the Word.95 Bernardino da Siena devoted most of his sermon on preaching (twenty-seven out of thirty-two pages) to the Word. Musso, in turn, took up this emphasis.96

When these Franciscans discussed the Word they meant the eternal Word that manifests itself in various forms such as the Bible, Christ incarnate, and in preaching. A few decades ago Loman McAodha reconstructed Bernardino's "theology of preaching" as largely a theology of the Word in which the preached word is essentially equal to the eternal Word {logos).97 Musso equated the authority and power of preaching with that of the Word in all other forms. In establishing the authority of the preacher in his first sermon in San Lorenzo, Musso connected the preacher-prophet's call to the Word. Repeating the biblical text/'Behold I put my Word in your mouth," Musso underlined, "not words, but Word." He continued, "There is one Word only, incarnate, inspired, written, and preached. . . ."98 These Franciscans spoke of the Word not just as the subject of preaching. For them, authentic preaching was the Word.

Anthony, Bernardino, and Cornelio were interested in the relationship between preaching and other forms of the Word. They were concerned that the Bible be treated in its entirety by preachers.99 Doimi pointed out that Anthony admonished preachers to "serve both Testaments" repeatedly, probably in response to the Albigensian heresy.100 Similarly, Musso exhorted preachers to address both Testaments, connecting the "old grapes" with the "new wine." With the contemporary

"Doimi, op. cit., pp. 94-95. On Christ's preaching and the logos in Anthony see also, Joseph Morgan Miller,"Il fondamento Cristologico della predicazione secondo S.Antonio di Padova,"T/ Santo, 1 (1967), 242-257.

^Bernardino's remarks on preaching may have held particular significance for Cornelio because, like Anthony, Bernardino was more than a distant hero for the Conventuals of Il Santo. They wholeheartedly embraced the great Observant preacher. A chapel dedicated to him and Francis was commissioned at Il Santo in 1456, six years after Bernardino's canonization. See Bernardino Bordin, "Profilo storico-spirituale della comunità del santo," in Antonino Poppi, Storia e cultura al Santo (Fonti e studi per la storia del Santo a Padova, Studi, Vol. 1 [Vicenza, 1976]), p. 23. On Bernardino's significance at Il Santo, see also Antonio Blasucci, "Maestro di vita spirituale al Santo," in Poppi, Liturgia, pietà e minister! al Santo (Vicenza, 1978), pp. 73-85.

"McAodha, op. cit. ,p. 247, asserted that Bernardino's theology is based on the "verbum efficaxT

""Quaresimale 2.24.

"Bernardino, p. 148. Doimi on Anthony, op. cit. , p. 109 .Musso, Quaresimale 2.24.

lMDoimi, op. cit. , p. 109.

theological debates about law and gospel in mind, he added, "This, this is that doctrine the preachers ought to preach!"101

Scripture as the Word was not their focus, however. When Musso talked about preachers and the Word, he was primarily concerned with linking preaching to the Word as Christ. This is an emphasis he shared with Bernardino. McAodha stated that Bernardino specifically equated "the verbum Dei of the preacher" with the "voxfilii Dei"w2 Musso told the Romans, "Christ is the one who cries through the mouths of the preachers."103 Even more emphatically, he made this connection when exhorting the Romans to come to preaching: "Come on, come on, Romans, to the sermons, to the sermons of Christ, of no less than God!"104 Despite what could be read into this comment, Musso was careful to distinguish between the preacher and the preaching. The power rested in God's sending of the Word not in the preacher himself, a mere "earthworm."105

The connection between preaching as the Word and the Word as Christ or Christ's Word was crucial to these Franciscans not just because of the authority it lent to preachers but primarily because it meant that preaching could be affective; it could move hearts as Christ's Word had done when he was on earth. Both Bernardino and Cornelio spoke of this affective quality of preaching and its utility as Franciscans, that is, in the context of the Franciscan understanding of salvation history and spirituality and based on Christ's example.

Bernardino's ideas about preaching and the Word were grounded in the familiar Franciscan focus on love. McAodha summarized, "Christ was sent by the Father's love in order to cast the fire of divine love on the earth. . . that all men might be inflamed by it; it continues to come each day in preaching."106 What happens in this perpetual advent in preaching is, in Bernardino's own words: "the word of God (as preaching). . . which speaks of Christ is like a flame of fire which penetrates the mind and heart; it burns and consumes all sins and leaves in the heart a fiery love for God and for one's neighbor."107

"Quaresimale 2.24.
°2McAodha, op. cit., p. 230.
"Quaresimale 5.74.
"Quaresimale 2.29.
"Símbolo 3.43.
^McAodha, op. cit., p. 224.
"Bernardino, p. 167. Translation is McAodha's, op. cit., p. 232.

While Bernardino set this out in one sermon, Cornelio took four sermons, "On the Two Loves," to explore all the connections.[108] Cornelio focused mainly on human response, reciprocal love, rather than divine initiative. Humans have gone in the wrong direction and do not feel the fire of God's love because of their sin; they have become tepid. They can reverse their course, rising gradually as they attempt to unite 'with their beloved Christ. As they draw closer, the flame of divine love will burn more ardently in their hearts. This flame is fueled by hearing the Word. "The Word of God is all fire," Musso summarized, immediately adding, "It is impossible to come to preaching assiduously and repeatedly hear the Word of God and not be stirred to love him."[109] Just as Bernardino had, Musso used the "road to Emmaus" story (Luke 24) to illustrate his point:"Don't you see that when those disciples heard Christ the holy pilgrim speak, they got inflamed in love?" He encouraged his hearers to follow the same path by hearing the Word in preaching: "Set yourselves to hear the sermons. Pay attention to and meditate on them and you will feel the fire descend into your marrow."[110]

Fire and light are the predominant images that these Franciscans associated with the spiritual effects of the Word made manifest in the moving preaching of true prophets and preachers, and Christ himself. For Anthony, preaching could "illumine the mind and heart, ignite the flame of love of God, and unite in charity those who believe in Christ."[111] Bernardino and Cornelio similarly detailed the various ways in which the Word as preaching affected those who received it. Through scholastic analysis, Bernardino described three qualities of the Word: "splendor, heat, and vigor." Each of these pertains to certain ways in which the Word affects its hearers: splendor "illumines"; heat "vivifies, feeds, consoles, and inflames"; vigor "defends, fructifies, and glorifies."[112] Musso described the Word's efficacy with similar language but in flowing strings of metaphor. It is the "light that chases away darkness

""Símbolo 20-23.

™Simbolo 20.306-307:"Pero mai si perfetto 1'huomo in questa vita, che non vada sempre anco crescendo, che come più s'approssima à unirsi con la cosa amata, co'l dolce amoroso suo Christo Giesu, più va crescendo la fiamma ardente della carita santa. … Le flamme del fuoco vanno sempre crescendo, l'amor divino augmenta ogn'hora. Questo, questo è U fuoco sacro che commando il Signore che ardesse sempre nelTaltare . . . Qual è Faltare di Dio, se non il nostro cuore? . . . Oime che habbiamo lasciato spegner questo fuoco. … Il verbo di Dio è tutto fuoco … E impossibile andar alie prediche assiduamente, e sentir parlar sempre di Dio, e non scaldarsi ad'amarlo."

""Símbolo 20.308. Bernardino on the Emmaus story, p. 166.

"'Doimi, o/J. cit., p. 135.

"'Bernardino, pp. 146-147; 159.

(illumines); the shield that defends against demons (defends); food that satiates the soul (feeds); and fire that brings devotion (inflames)."113 In another sermon, he reiterated, it "satiates the soul, illumines the intellect, inflames the affections, fructifies good works, and makes you end blessed in heaven (glorifies)."114

For Cornelio as for Bernardino, preaching was the most effective manifestation of the Word for his time. Anthony had talked about God's continued revelation of the Word "in the soul" and through preaching, but he did not distinguish one as more efficacious than the other.115 Bernardino counted three ways: inspiration, preaching, and the Mass. In comparing the Word as revealed in preaching to the Word in the Mass, however, Bernardino said that the oral character of preaching worked better to reach the heart than the visual experience of the Mass. The preached Word "immediately passes from the ear to the heart" while the sacramental Word still required the preacher's explanation.116

In Musso's thinking, preaching was a middle way, the most practical means of affecting people. In his first sermon on the Apostles' Creed, he Usted three means by which Christ teaches:"inspiration," preaching, and "tribulation." Musso admitted that tribulations such as plague epidemics got one's attention when interior inspiration or preaching might not. But tribulation is an extreme means. Relative to it, Musso could describe reproachful prophetic preaching as "consolation."117 As for inspiration, Musso doubted that most people were capable of the simplest meditation on the benefits of God without the preacher's prodding.118 Unlike Bernardino, Musso did not compare the efficacy of the Word preached to the Mass but rather to writing. Questioning the Mass would have been particularly dangerous in his time, and Musso was concerned that his educated, print-oriented audience put too much store in the books they read.119 Nevertheless, the reason that Musso gave for this emphasis on preaching was that it paralleled most closely the method that Christ

•"Símbolo 20.308.

""Quaresimale 2.24.

115Doimi, op. cit., p. 94.

116McAodha, op. cit., p. 224. Bernardino, pp. 148-150.

n7Simbolo 1.8.On the consolation of prophetic preaching, see Quaresimale 2.21 and 41.68.

""Símbolo 29308-309.

"'San Lorenzo in Dámaso was among the oldest and most important parishes in Rome. Its position in Parione, the cultural and business (particularly publishing) center of Rome, assured San Lorenzo a well-heeled and well-educated resident congregation as well as important visitors. As the titular church of the papal family, it would have had a special attraction for churchmen. On San Lorenzo, see Fiorenza Gemini, "Aspetti sociali e religiosi

endorsed as most effective. "The real way to teach is with the voice . . . not writing," he declared, "because one hears the voice. . . . Our Master wanted to put the full force of the virtue and grace of the Holy Spirit in our minds. Thus, he spoke and didn't write."120

If preaching's utility to Christ (and the Church) was its powerful ability to affect hearers, then it makes sense that Musso understood the primary purpose of preaching to be to move (movere). He voiced this purpose through his models. Jonah's preaching to the Ninevites "wounded them in the heart like a sword and caused them to repent."121 Musso did recognize secondary goals that helped the preacher to reach his primary purpose, the foremost of which was to teach (docere). In keeping with Augustine's reminder that teaching can be a corollary to persuasion, Jeremiah "teaches to correct and change!"122 The "first thing" that Jonah "teaches" is that "the preaching of the word of God is what moves the hearts of men to penitence."123

Christ provided not only the supreme example but also the fundamental impetus for the Franciscan insistence on moving preaching. As Musso emphasized, Christ "moved all the people to marvel."124 When Christ as the Word spoke on the road to Emmaus, the disciples were profoundly affected, "inflamed with love." Franciscans and all preachers are called to follow Christ in this manner; that is their utility. When filled with the Word, preachers could set hearts afire for God.

While preaching on Pentecost, Musso poetically described the affectivity of the Word as speech, sermon, and teaching in images appropriate to the occasion and redolent of Franciscan piety:

> You want knowledge, behold the tongue;
> You want charity, behold the fire;
> Fire on tongues, tongues on fire;
> Wise love, amorous wisdom of the holy apostles;
> Spirit, fire, love are one thing only;
> Thus are tongue, sermon, doctrine the same thing.125

della parrocchia di San Lorenzo in Dámaso nel settecento," Ricerche per la storia religiosa di Roma, 5 (1981), 149-174.

""Símbolo 1.6-7.

"•Prediche 3.2.65.

^Quaresimale 41.84. See Augustine.öe doctrina Christiana Book 4, Chapter 12.

"'Prediche 3.2.65.

""Prediche 4.6.287.

"^Prediche 3-8.296: "Voleté la sapienza, ecco la lingua; voleté la carita ecco'l fuoco, fuoco in lingue, lingue in fuoco, savio amore, amorosa sapienza de gli Apostoli santi, spi-

The kind of passionate affectivity that Musso expressed in this passage is also a hallmark of much of the "new" early modern preaching that has been attributed in recent scholarship to the reappropriation of ideas associated with the classical grand style. Deborah Shuger has documented a new way of understanding preaching "based on the new primacy of emotional experience as the means by which the soul orients itself toward a transcendent Beyond," in sermons and preaching treatises of the period. Preaching, Shuger observed, was viewed less as teaching the mind than as "transforming the love of the soul" in these works, of which the most influential is Erasmus' Ecclesiastes.'26 Musso was tapping into a notion that found expression in the Ecclesiastes and the preaching treatises of the next generation: that the purpose of preaching, broadly construed, was to move people's hearts so profoundly that they would change their lives, co-operate with grace, become virtuous.127 But the idea that preaching was primarily about moving people to change had always been at the core of the Franciscan preaching tradition. Musso understood and articulated this purpose in accord with his Franciscan heritage.

Many of Musso's preaching ideals were shared by other sixteenth-century Catholics and have been interpreted as reflections of the influence of classical rhetoric. For instance, recent scholarship has discussed the emphasis on the preacher-rhetor's lifestyle and preparation, virtue, and affective persuasion in Catholic preaching treatises as primarily classically inspired.128 Musso saw them as fundamentally Christian and articulated them in traditional Franciscan ways. For Musso, the reform of preaching required a double return ad fontes: a return to classical-patristic style and a return to the basic elements of the Franciscan preaching tradition. He was a great humanist stylist and a faithful son of Francis. His case should encourage scholars to revisit the preaching traditions of the religious orders as well as the humanistic sources of inspiration for early modern Catholic preaching.

rito, fuoco, e amore, sono una cosa sola; cosi sono una medesima cosa, lingua, sermone, dottrina. . . ."

126Deborah K. Shuger, The Christian Grand Style (Princeton, 1988), pp. 257 and 132; and McGinness, Right Tbinking,esp. pp. 106-107.

127McGinness, Right Thinking, pp. 29-61 , explores this in detail.

12eSee ibid., pp. 9-61. While noting an affinity between some of these themes and the admonition to preach vices and virtues in the Rule, McGinness focused on their adaptation as classical-patristic themes by post-Tridentine authors of preaching treatises and preachers attempting to articulate a new image of Rome and Catholicism.

THE SEVENTY-NINTH ANNUAL MEETING OF THE AMERICAN CATHOLIC HISTORICAL ASSOCIATION

Report of the Co-Chairmen of the Committee on Program

The Association met along with the American Historical Association at the Marriott Wardman Park and Omni Shoreham Hotels in Washington, D.C., between January 8 and 10, 1999. Despite the inclement wintry weather in the Midwest and a brief period of snow and ice in the nation's capital on Saturday, registration for the meeting was not adversely affected. Only two participants in the program were prevented from attending the meeting because of the season's snow. The generous sunlight during the weekend was emblematic of the generally enlightened presentations at each of the Association's nine sessions.

The first session on Friday, January 8, was entitled: "Inculturation Three Historical Perspectives." Edmundo Flores of the Hispanic Division of the Library of Congress spoke on "Religious Conversion and Syncretism in Mesoamerica During the Sixteenth Century." Using works of sixteenth-century Spanish missionaries (e.g., Diego Duran, Diego de Landa, Bernabé Cobo), Flores compared the missionaries' Spanish Catholicism with Aztec, Inca, and Mayan religions in seven categories: afterlife, devils and demons, sin and forgiveness, communion, feast days, commandments and sermons, and priests. The striking similarities facilitated conversion and the "Building of a new religion." The question arose as to whether the missionaries read their own categories into the behaviors they observed.

Marie Thérèse Archambault, O.S.E, a Lakota woman religious who teaches at Standing Rock College, presented a paper on "Eugene Beuchel, S.J., among the Lakota: An Historical Reflection on a Process of Inculturation." Archambault presented Beuchel (1874-1954) as a generous missionary who worked to preserve "secular" aspects of Lakota culture, especially the language. His opposition to traditional religion, however, resulted ironically in his contributing to the destruction and identity confusion of the people he served for almost fifty years. Questions arose about the extent of Beuchel's opposition to traditional religion and the state of contemporary Indian Catholicism which Archambault portrayed as confused.

Takako Frances Takagi, S.N.D., of Notre Dame Seishin University in Okayama, Japan, spoke on "From Europe to Japan: Inculturation During a Challenging Cen-

tury of the Church."Takagi emphasized the role of Archbishop Paolo Marella as a "prophet of inculturation." Marella came to Japan as apostolic delegate in 1933. He urged European and American missionaries to a deep adaptation to Japanese culture on the intellectual, affective, and spiritual levels. By the time of World War II Japanese Catholicism was largely in the hands of Japanese leaders illustrating the transition of Catholicism from its Western forms to a full-blown world religion. Discussion raised a number of questions about Marella's approach. Was it part of the Vatican's general policy toward the Axis countries? Did Marella have any role in the approval of the Chinese rites in 1939? It was pointed out that he had previously been posted in Washington.

William L. Portier of Mt. St. Mary's College, Emmitsburg, Maryland, chairman and commentator, commented on inculturation as involving both a moment of translation on the part of missionaries and a moment of creating new forms on the part of new indigenous Christians. Inculturation might be complemented by I^min Sanneh's notion of the "translatability of the Gospel." He raised the question of the extent to which inculturation, with its Christ-centered theological presuppositions, could be used fruitfully in the historical enterprise.

The afternoon session focused on "Myth, Folklore, Film, and the American Catholic Experienced Pop Culture Review." Unfortunately, Susan Kalcik of the Heritage Resource Center in Johnstown, Pennsylvania, was unable to attend; those in attendance at that session were disappointed not to witness her presentation, "Whoopie Goldberg and the Boxing Nun: Women Religious in Myth and Folklore." However, there was a positive response to Mary Ann Janosik's exploration of "The Crisis of Faith: Spiritual Dilemmas, Moral Conflict, and the Catholic Church in the Hollywood Film."

Professor Janosik of Lake Erie College, Painesville, Ohio, discussed the role of Catholicism in several well-known Hollywood films ranging over several decades, from Michael Curtiz'Angels with Dirty Faces to John Gregory Dunne's True Confessions and Quentin Tarantino's Pulp Fiction. Using video clips from the latter two films as illustrations, Professor Janosik argued that they reveal the presence of an analogical or sacramental imagination rooted in the Catholic experience of their creators. Professor Janosik offered a way of viewing films that recovers the spiritual dimension by locating the sources of a distinctively Catholic aesthetic that clearly differs—in its sacramental qualities—from the "dialectic" worldview associated with Protestant aesthetics.

In his comment, James T. Fisher of Saint Louis University noted that Professor Janosik's approach can be highly fruitful in uncovering the often hidden spiritual dimension of many significant films. He raised the issue of intentionality in asking how much we know about the Catholic background and convictions of the artists under discussion. Are films made by artists with Catholic upbringings inevitably possessed of a sacramental quality, or must filmmakers show a more conscious and explicit desire to put these concerns on the screen?

The second session on Friday afternoon was in sharp contrast to its simultaneous session on pop culture. "The Papacy Confronts Anti-Semitism during the

Fascist Era" was chaired by John Pollard of East Anglia University. The first presentation, by Frank J. Coppa of St. John's University, New York, was a richly contextualized presentation and analysis of the "hidden encyclical," commissioned by Pope Pius XI, Humant Generis Unitas. Coppa's paper entitled, "Pius XI's Condemnation of Racism and Anti-Semitism," raised many questions as he highlighted the significance of the encyclical within the literature on the Vatican's putative complicity with the rise of Hitler's Germany and its failure to criticize the Holocaust.

The substance of the paper by José Sánchez, of Saint Louis University, "The Alleged Silence of Pius XII," was a bibliographical analysis of the controversy over Pius and the Holocaust, pointing out the differing interpretations. He then analyzed some of the chief problems causing the controversy, including the concept of the Holocaust as Pius understood it at the time, the ignorance of both critics and defenders of the time frame in which the events took place, the context of Pius' statements, the aims and means of the Papacy, and a final argument against those who contend what would have happened if Pius had made the clear, forceful statement that they wanted. He closed by asking for critics to look at Pius in the context of the times. Peter Kent, of New Brunswick University, praised both papers while the most interesting point that came out was a statement by Coppa at the end, that if Pius XI had lived through the war years, he would have come out with the clear statement that Pius XII did not make condemning the Nazis.

In accord with the traditional arrangements the association held its business meeting at 4:45 p.m. chaired not by the President, David O'Brien of the College of the Holy Cross, who was recovering from surgery, but by the incoming President, James D. Tracy of the University of Minnesota. After reports on the activities of the previous year, members met in an adjacent room for a collégial social hour at 5:30 p.m.

The next morning's session, "Evangelizing and Empowering Free Women of Color in New Orleans, 1727-1862," was well attended. The chairman and commentator was Diane Morrow of the University of Georgia.

In her paper, Emily Clark of Tulane University focused on the early Ursuline efforts to catechize and evangelize among slave and free women of color through the confraternity "Children of Mary," whose female members—which may have included three women of color among its members of eighty-five women and girls—dedicated themselves to the religious instruction of their children and slaves. Located at DeKalb College, Virginia Meacham Gould examined the Sisters of the Holy Family—a sisterhood of women of color which developed from a religious confraternity—and emphasized the tradition of French spirituality informing the various French sisterhoods that established missions or foundations in nineteenth-century New Orleans and interacted with women of color. Charles Nolan's paper on the diocesan response painted an overview of the dioceses of Louisiana from 1793 to 1862 and examined the roles of clergy and bishops as well as those of sisterhoods in addressing the needs of

free women of color in New Orleans during the period under review. Dr. Nolan is the archivist of the Archdiocese of New Orleans.

Stephen Ochs's thoughtful and perceptive commentary acknowledged the significance of the research presented in the three papers and posed the problem that ministry to people of color remained at best a by-product of the clergy's and sisterhood's ministerial focus, in spite of the fact that people of color constituted the majority of the adherents to the faith in New Orleans. Ochs, a scholar of the African-American experience located at Georgetown Prep, further suggested the panelists might explore more substantively the role of syncretism and African cultural influences.

The chairman concurred with Ochs's point about African influences and asked whether the eager participation of people of color in godparenting at baptism might not reflect the cultural significance of the responsibilities members of extended families fulfilled toward each other throughout traditional societies in West Africa. She further questioned the extent of black agency that European clergy and women religious were prepared to tolerate beyond catechetical instruction to people of color.

The audience numbered from twenty to thirty people and engaged the panelists in lively dialogue. Questions from the floor problematized considerations of race and racism within the ranks of the clergy and sisterhood by addressing issues of slave ownership, attitudes about slavery, and the essentially anti-abolitionist position of the Roman Catholic Church in the antebellum United States.

Due to inclement weather, Francis C. Oakley of Williams College did not occupy the chair at the session, "Gerhard Ladner's Idea of Reform, Forty Years After." At this joint session with the American Society of Church History the commentator, Phyllis B. Roberts of the Graduate School and University Center of the City University of New York, also chaired the session. William H. Stump, of Lynchburg College, noted that Ladner created a subfield of intellectual history that simultaneously engaged theologians, historians, and ecumenists. Louis B. Pascoe, S.J., of Fordham University, stressed that Ladner's identification of personal reform as normative for the first millennium of Christianity has gone unchallenged. He posited that more attention should be paid to the theological interaction of nature and grace in reform. Christopher Bellitto of St. Joseph's Seminary, Dunwoodie, New York, discussed how reform has been applied to history, theology, sociology, anthropology, art, architecture, spirituality, and humanism. Comments from Roberts and the audience demonstrated how Ladner's book continues to be an entry point for the field and bridges the medieval and the modern, especially given continuing debates on Vatican Council IFs aggiornamento.

The presidential luncheon was held at 12:15 p.m., with James D. Tracy presiding. The invocation before the meal was presented by Sister Mary Alice Gallin, O.S.U., Research Fellow at The Catholic University of America, who also read

David O'Brien's presidential address, "What Was It Like When It All Came Together? Bishop John J. Wright and the Diocese of Worcester." The address highlighted Wright's dynamic leadership in integrating the diocese and in developing positive relationships with the Worcester civic and religious cultures. Prior to this address Professor Frederic J. Baumgartner of the Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University, Blacksburg, chairman of the Committee of the John Gilmary Shea Prize, presented the award to John M. Howe of Texas Tech University. Also John E. Monfasani, chairman of the Committee on the Howard R. Marraro Prize, reported that this year's recipient was John Headley of the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill. Father Robert I. Burns, SJ., emeritus of the University of California at Los Angeles, presented the John Tracy Ellis Dissertation Award to Jeffrey Zalar of Georgetown University to support his doctoral research in Germany. The recipients of both prizes as well as Mr. Zalar were present and made brief responses.

Chaired by Elisabeth G. Gleason of the University of San Francisco, the session "Beyond the Millennium: the American Catholic Historical Association in the Twenty-First Century" was very well attended. Gerald R Fogarty, SJ., of the University of Virginia, the first panelist, made some general introductory remarks. The second speaker, James A. Brundage of the University of Kansas, recalled the great changes in the direction of medieval studies during the last generation, and discussed new approaches to a period that in the past occupied such a central place in the work of Catholic church historians. Josef L. Altholz of the University of Minnesota was the third speaker, and presented a most challenging reflection on the character, mission, and future of the Association. He urged that the Association continue and strengthen its emphasis on serious study of church history and hoped that its meetings will carry on the tradition of good discussions and exchanges among scholars interested in that subject, regardless of their religious affiliation. Basically, he hoped that it would retain a focus on the study of the Church as an institution, and made a clear distinction between such a goal and the more amorphous study of "religion" as exemplified by the annual programs of the American Academy of Religion, for example.

A lively discussion followed the presentations. Many points of view were expressed, and some pertinent recollections of past debates within the Association were offered. Elisabeth Gleason noted that there appears to be a notable loyalty to the Association among its members, a belief that it does have a future even though the Catholic Church is changing (and at times even seemingly turning away from its own past), and that the contributions of the Association through the Review and the annual meetings have set a high standard of responsible scholarship. Repeatedly, the hope was expressed that this standard will continue to be upheld in the future.

The session entitled "Confraternity, Indians, and the Rules and Regulations for All of It in New Spain" also met on Saturday afternoon, with about fifty-five people in attendance.

Susan Schroeder, of Loyola University Chicago, presided over the panel. The Catholic Church in colonial Spanish America is often seen as a monolith, but actually there were many divisions. The papers addressed interesting problems and presented new research.

Frederick Schwaller, of the University of Montana, delivered the first paper, which was entitled "Popular Piety and Early Colonial Spain: The Cofradías of Mexico City in the 1570's."He deftly analyzed the important role played by the religious sodalities for the lay populace, usually based around the veneration of specific saints. The cofradías were popular among all different classes and racial groups.

The next paper, by Kristen Mann of Northern Arizona University, was entitled "Such Glorious Voices: Mission Music on New Spain's Northern Frontier." She summed up the musical record of an area and period which has not been studied until now.

Michael Brescia, of the University of Arizona, spoke about "Crafting the Tridentine Version of the Indian: Bishop Juan de Palafox y Mendoza and the Baroque Values in Seventeenth-Century Puebla de los Angeles, Mexico." He analyzed the changing view of the Indian in the Mexican Catholic Church.

Stafford Poole, of the Vincentian Studies Institute, addressed authoritatively "The Libro de Gobernación Espiritual: Regulating Religion in the Indies." He broke new ground in analyzing the documents which prescribed improving spirituality and Christian life.

A very engaging discussion ensued by the more than fifty who remained to the end of the session.

The first panel on Sunday morning, on "Catholicism, Politics, and Secular Ideologies," addressed the Church's struggle to achieve an influential position on the political, social, and moral landscape against the totalitarian claims of radical secular ideologies of both the right and the left. Both the paper of Martin R. Menke of Rivier College on "Foundation for a 'Better' Nationalism: The German Center Party, 1918-1933," and that of Ines A. Murzaku of St. John Fisher College on "Religion and Communism: The Case of Albania" illustrated the obstacles hampering Catholic claims to the contested terrain of national identity. How were Catholic leaders to carry out their transcendent, transnational spiritual principles while advocating specific national interests? In both cases, the Church's failure to do so led to tragic defeat at the hands of German National Socialism and rnilitantly atheist, nationalist Albanian Communism under Hoxha. In his commentary Professor Raymond Sun of Washington State University, who was also chairman of the session, suggested further research into the social and cultural factors that affected the Church's attempts to bridge confessional and national identity. Possible topics include the confessional milieu, as the basis for Catholic political and cultural hegemony, popular perceptions of the rela-

tionship between religion and nationality, Catholic images and languages of identity, and the connections between popular piety and political and social identity.

The second session on Sunday morning featured "Public Catholicism in New York, Virginia, and California." The presenters examined three very distinct aspects of "Public Catholicism," ranging from the political nativity of the Catholic community in Federal New York to the beginnings of an organized Catholic presence in frontier Virginia to the distinctive civic involvement of a Catholic prelate in the twentieth-century Bay area. The paper of Jason Duncan of the University of Iowa, "Toward an Epoch of Responsibility? Federalists, Republicans, and the Catholics' Struggle for Political Equality in New York, 1787-1806," traced the emergence of Catholics to full political power through the rise and abolition of the anti-Catholic oath in New York State. Tricia T. Pyne of Wheeling Jesuit University ("Catholicism on Virginia's Frontier, 1800-1850") gave an extended glimpse of the beginnings of church organization in the northern and eastern panhandles of western Virginia, focusing in particular on the economics of apostolic selection and early efforts to provide Catholic education in the area. Richard Gribble, C.S.C, of Moreau Seminary, Notre Dame, Indiana, looked at "The American Hierarchy in Public Service: The Case of Archbishop Edward J. Hannah" of San Francisco, whose career in public mediation between labor and management at the city, state, and national levels from 1916 to 1934 represents an unprecedented public activism for an American bishop. R. Emmett Curran of Georgetown University chaired the session and gave comment with an emphasis upon unifying the diverse topics into forms of public Catholicism.

Georgette Dorn
Library of Congress
Christopher Kauffman
The Catholic University of America

Report of the Committee on Nominations

In this election 364 ballots were cast. The results are as follows:

For First Vice-President (and President in the following year):

Joseph H. Lynch, Ohio State University 191

James M. Powell, Syracuse University 173

For Second Vice-President:

Ellen Lovell Evans, Georgia State University 144

John M. Padberg, S.J., Institute of Jesuit Sources, St. Louis 201

For the Executive Council (three-year term, 1999, 2000, 2001):

Section I:

James K. Farge, CS.B.,Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies, Toronto ... 222

Paul S. Seaver, Stanford University 128

Section II:

Patrick Allot, Emory University 176

Margaret Susan Thompson, Syracuse University 172

For the Committee on Nominations (three-year term, 1999, 2000, 2001):

Lisa M. Bitel, University of Kansas 171

Jo Ann Hoeppner Moran Cruz, Georgetown University 180

COMMITTEE ON NOMINATIONS:
Robert Emmett Curran
Georgetown University
Raymond A. Mentzer
Montana State University
Maureen C. Miller, Chairman
Hamilton College

The Report of the Chairman of the Committee on the John Gilmary Shea Prize

The Committee on the John Gilmary Shea Prize, consisting of John C. Moore of Hofstra University Mary J. Oates, C.S.J., of Regis College, and Frederic J. Baumgartner of the Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University, Blacksburg, as chairman, is honored to award the Prize in this year's competition to John M. Howe, professor of history in Texas Tech University in Lubbock, for his book Church Reform and Social Change in Eleventh-Century Italy: Dominic of Sora and His Patrons, which was published by the University of Pennsylvania Press in November, 1997. As always, the entries in the competition constitute an impressive list of books on church history from the fourth century to the present. Given the strength of that list, it was a difficult task to select one for the Prize, but we feel that it demonstrates all the more the quality of this book.

The book is an original and insightful analysis of the social, political, and ecclesiastical development of tenth- and eleventh-century Italy. John Howe employs a case study of the life and work of St. Dominic of Sora, an influential Italian abbot and founder of monasteries, to illuminate the little-known world of religious revival among ordinary people in central Italy in the eleventh century.

Through Dominic, Howe is able to trace the establishment of towns and monasteries and to analyze crucial property and ecclesiastical reforms. Drawing on an oral tradition and hagiographie materials, he reveals not only the importance of charismatic leaders like Dominic in initiating these reforms, but also the essential role of the community—familial, religious, political, and social—in their implementation.

Although the rhythms of higher-level reform, especially Gregorian and monastic, are well known, this book examines the popular perceptions and expectations that made Dominic of Sora (d. 1032) a revered figure among lay people. The author extracts from difficult and taciturn sources a wide range of information depicting the religious, social, and political environment in which Dominic lived and acted. For example, Howe shows how the patronage of warrior aristocrats, so important for Dominic's ambitious building program, came from a desire both for spiritual comfort (often in the form of miraculous cures) and the political consolidation that came from monasteries established in their lands and associated with their names.

In this erudite and perceptive study, John Howe has provided his readers with evidence that sanctity is to a considerable degree a social construct. He shows too how the cult of a saint, in this case one promising protection against snakebites and rabies, can arise out of a life that is at best only marginally associated with such phenomena. The memory of Dominic has survived in a local cult high in the Italian mountains that were his domain, but through this book he will take his place among the forgers of medieval culture. Because Howe amply demonstrates that a good historian can ferret out the life and impact of an obscure man who lived a millennium ago, Church Reform and Social Change in Eleventh-Century Italy eminently merits the 1998 John Gilmary Shea Prize.

Frederic J. Baumgartner, Chairman
Virginia Polytechnic Institute
and State University, Blacksburg

Report of the Chairman of the Committee on the Howard R. Marraro Prize

The committee has decided to confer the twenty-fourth annual Howard R. Marraro Prize on Dr. John M. Headley Distinguished University Professor of History in the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill, for his book Tommaso Campanella and the Transformation of the World, which was published by Princeton University Press in August, 1997.

Tommaso Campanella (1 568-1639) was an extraordinary man. A prisoner for nearly thirty-five years in Venice, Rome, and Naples and subject at times to the

most horrific torture, he kept his sanity (even if it meant having on occasion to feign insanity), wrote nearly incessantly, and became a European celebrity. His Neapolitan dungeon rose to the level of a site on the grand tour, while he himself maintained epistolary contact with a European-wide constellation of intellectuals. Metaphysician, political philosopher, seditious revolutionary, theologian, prophet, Dominican chauvinist, daring free-thinker, defender of Galileo, astrological adviser to Pope Urban VIII, and client of Cardinal Richelieu, Campanella filled a dizzying number of roles and covered a breath-taking range of subjects. To treat his life adequately and to analyze his writings cogently requires a scholar with a stamina, intellectual range, and scholarly erudition to match Campanella's. John Headley has proven to be such a scholar. His new book is the best single study of Campanella available in any language. It is actually two books bound in one. In Part One, Headley gives a detailed, sympathetic account of Campanella's life. Surprisingly, but with great common sense and a feel for the historical setting, he finds that Campanella's Spanish prosecutors and religious inquisitors often knew their man better than some modern apologists. In Part Two, Headley brings coherence to the main lines of Campanella's political thought, theology, and conception of history. Rather than portraying Campanella as a sort of preternatural harbinger of modernity, Headley sees him as in many ways the terminal point of the Renaissance and even of the Middle Ages. Campanella's espousal of a universal theocracy, of a Spanish and then a French world monarchy, of a view of nature suffused with Neoplatonic and animistic elements, and of a naturalistic religion that looked not only out on the amazing new geographic discoveries, but also back to many traditional sources all suggest the suniming up of an intellectual epoch rather than the start of the new outlook of Descartes, Mersenne, and the other thinkers of the Scientific Revolution. In short, Headley educates us not only on Campanella, but quite consciously also on the main intellectual contours of the Renaissance. In the process, Headley disproves Thucydides: a prize-winning book can be "a possession for all time."

Alexander Grab
University of Maine, Orono

John E. Monfasani, Chairman
State University of New York at Albany

Roland Sarti
University of Massachusetts, Amherst

Report of the Committee on the John Tracy Ellis Dissertation Award

In the second annual competition for the John Tracy Ellis dissertation award of the American Catholic Historical Association, the panel of judges sifted and

pondered nine projects from as many universities: the University of California at Berkeley, University of Connecticut, University of Florida, Florida State (Tallahassee), Georgetown, Northwestern, Stanford, Texas (Austin), and Toronto.

So close in quality were the competing entries, all impressive, that the judges experienced serious difficulty in ranking them. The geographical/chronological range of entries covered twelfth- and sixteenth-century England, eighteenth- and nineteenth-century Germany, thirteenth- and fifteenth-century Italy, twentieth-century Algeria, twentieth-century Vietnam, and twentieth-century United States. All were admirably archival, and each engaged novel methodologies or perspectives.

The judges finally agreed unanimously that Jeffrey T. Zalar of Georgetown University had emerged as the winner, with Lisa R. McClain of the University of Texas at Austin and John S. Ott of Stanford University as ex aequo runners up. Of the paired sharers of Honorable Mention, Lisa McClain is dealing with "The Reconstruction of Catholic Communities in Protestant England, 1559-1642," specifically the accommodations imposed on the lived experience of varied communities by differing evolutions and pressures. John Ott is tracing the reform tensions between "Episcopal Authority and Community in Northern France, ca. 1070-1 150," as new forms of lay apostolic piety as well as shifts of power in the urban communes diminished the previous identity of bishops in their cathedral towns and evolved an ongoing "dialectical relationship" between bishops and community.

The main award with its $1,200 check, however, clearly goes to Jeffrey Zalar and his dissertation titled "A Cultural History of the Association of St. Charles Borromeo in Wilhelmine Imperial Germany, 1890-1914." Mr. Zalar is exploring that lay association of a quarter-million members in over 4,000 library-centers, focusing on its role in restructuring Wilhelmine Catholicism by cultural accommodation. This shift involved an unlikely dynamic, as a significant section of the Catholic middle class turned away from its adversarial Kulturkampfin order to synthesize "traditional Catholic thought and spirituality" with the dominant bourgeois system of "nationalism, literary sophistication, and social progress," creating a novel mentalité. Mr. Zalar is currently completing a Fulbright year in major German archives, and will use the John Tracy Ellis award to expand his research base to other collections he has identified there, including the diocesan/parochial levels.

As Mr. Zalar's dissertation director, Professor Roger Chickering, notes, this is a project both imaginative and practical: "It comports with the revitalization of research interest in Germany's confessional history in the modern era; it promises to extend this research into the everyday life of the Catholic milieu; and it will certainly throw new light on both inter- and intra-confessional tensions in Imperial Germany; I am confident that an important piece of scholarship will emerge from Jeff Zalar's work, for I believe he is the most talented young scholar with whom I have worked."

The committee has sent its thanks and appreciation to each of the many fine entrants and looks forward to seeing their projects eventually in publication.

Robert I. Burns, SJ. ,Chairman
University of California at Los Angeles

Carlos Eire
Yale University

Thomas J. Shelley
Fordham University

Report of the Secretary and Treasurer

For the first time in six years and the last time In the twentieth century we are holding an annual meeting in the national capital, where we hope that the historic political events taking place in these days will not distract us from the purpose of our coming together. We regret that our president, Professor David J. O'Brien, cannot be with us because of the serious surgery he underwent on December 29, and we pray that he may promptly and completely recover his health. We are grateful that in spite of his illness he wrote a presidential address, which the second vice-president, Sister Mary Alice Gallin, O.S.U., will read in his place at the luncheon tomorrow and which we will publish in the Catholic Historical Review as is the custom.

During the autumn Professor O'Brien also conducted a campaign for new members. He obtained the mailing list of the Cushwa Center at the University of Notre Dame in the form of adhesive labels and composed a form letter. A graduate student who assists us in the executive office of the Association, Mr. Joseph Sladky then eliminated from the list the names and addresses of persons who were already members and affixed the rest to envelopes; he also typed an individual salutation on each copy of the letter and sent the letters in the unsealed envelopes to Professor O'Brien, who signed each one and added a postscript by hand to many of them. A copy of the program of this meeting was enclosed in each envelope along with an application form, and the postage was paid by the president's institution, the College of the Holy Cross. Since there were more than 600 letters, we can easily imagine the amount of time and energy that he expended on this task in his weakened condition, and we thank him for the sacrifice that he willingly made. His successors will be inspired by his example, as he was by the example of some of his predecessors. It is too soon to reckon the results of this campaign, for we are receiving more and more positive responses every day, but I think that more than forty applications can be attributed to this initiative. In the office we also continued our practice of sending an invitation along with tear sheets of his or her book review to every reviewer who is not already a member.

That such efforts were necessary is shown by the loss of members that, unfortunately, occurred in 1998. Fifty-nine neglected to pay their annual dues in spite of three notices; six resigned for various reasons; and twelve (one of the new ordinary members included) died. The average length of the membership of these deceased was twenty-one years. We mourn the following:

The Reverend Edward B. Carley, of Santurce, Puerto Rico, and the Diocese of Wilmington, a member since 1954

Professor Robert H. Connery, of Fairfax, Virginia, a member since 1963

The Reverend Anthony H. Deye, of Erlanger, Kentucky, and the Diocese of Covington, a member since 1943

The Reverend Charles F. Donovan, SJ., of Boston College, a member since 1986

The Most Reverend Frederick W Freking, Former Bishop of La Crosse, a member since 1984

The Reverend Edward J. Malatesta, SJ., of the Ricci Institute for Christian-Western Cultural History at the University of San Francisco, a member since 1984

Ms. Maureen S. McArdle, of Forest Hills, New York, a member since 1977

Professor Norman Neuerburg, emeritus of California State University at Domínguez Hills, a member since 1991

The Reverend Earl Francis Niehaus, S.M., of Xavier University, New Orleans, a member from 1962 to 1966 and again for six months in 1998

Dr. Albert Shumate, M.D., of San Francisco, California, a member since 1970

The Reverend Jack H. Stipe, of Beaverton, Oregon, and the Archdiocese of Portland, a member since 1985

Professor Delno C. West, of Northern Arizona University, Flagstaff, a member since 1984

May their souls and the souls of all the departed members of the American Catholic Historical Association through the mercy of God rest in peace.

In all, the losses amounted to seventy-seven, or five fewer than in 1997, when the numbers of deceased and lapsed members were exactly the same but the number of resignations was higher by five. On the other hand, seventy-one persons have applied for membership, of whom forty-nine are ordinary members, four life members, and eighteen student members. In the preceding year, by comparison, there were seventy new and five renewed members, while two ordinary members became life members. This year there are five new life members, one of whom was previously an ordinary member. Four of them prudently took advantage of the delay in the increase of the fee for life membership, which, though announced last January, did not become effective until July 1; the delay was, of course, intended for that purpose. Let me record their names:

Mr. Terrence Deneen, of Arlington, Virginia

Professor Lance Lazar of the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill

Reverend Dr. John R. McCarthy of Cleveland, Ohio, previously an ordinary member since 1973

Reverend Dr. Cosmas Nwosuh, of Gwagwalada, Abuja, Nigeria
Dr. Xiaoyu Peng, of Beijing University

We appreciate their financial support as well as the confidence in the Association and its journal that it betokens, and wish them long lives.

In addition, ten former members who had not paid the annual dues for one year or more have renewed their membership, and we welcome them back. These renewals are due to the persuasive appeal of the membership director, Professor Erving E. Beauregard, emeritus of the University of Dayton.

The gain of these eighty-one members is almost equaled, regrettably, by the loss of the seventy-seven, but we still have a net gain of four members in 1998, which is better than the net loss of seven reported in 1997. The combined new and renewed members were six more than the seventy-five added or restored to the rolls in both 1997 and 1996. Consequently, our total membership has risen from 1,105 to 1,109. Of these, seventy-six are life members (sixty-two individuals and fourteen institutions), thirty-eight retired members (five more than in 1997), and sixty-seven student members (ten fewer than in 1997).

In the executive office of the Association (and the editorial office of the Catholic Historical Review) we have purchased a new computer and printer to replace the old, original ones, which had served since 1986; the former, besides being old, was always very slow, and the latter was difficult to repair because of the unavailability of parts. The new computer is a Gateway 2000 (E3 110-333 DVD ID, and the new printer is a Hewlett Packard LaserJet 6R One-half of the cost was defrayed by the Association and the other half by the Review. Since the new computer can support a Web page, we are seeking an expert who can design one for us; we also solicit suitable graphics.

During the past year the Association was represented by the Reverend Richard M. Nardone of Seton Hall University at the installation of Sister Francis Raftery as the sixth president of the College of Saint Elizabeth on April 21 in Morristown, New Jersey, and by the Reverend John W. Witek, SJ., of Georgetown University at the installation of the Very Reverend David M. O'Connell, CM., as the fourteenth president of the Catholic University of America on November 19 in Washington, D.C.

The spring meeting, held at Marian College in Indianapolis on March 27-28, was a most satisfactory and memorable intellectual and social experience for those who attended it. Since the chairman of the organizing committee, Professor James J. Divita, published a brief report on it in the October issue of the Catholic Historical Review, I wish here only to repeat the thanks of the Association for his and his committee's outstanding work.

We also express our gratitude to the Committee on Program for the current meeting, especially to the co-chairmen, Professor Christopher J. Kauffman of the Catholic University of America and Dr. Georgette Dorn of the Library of Congress. We are indebted to the latter, no doubt, for the greater attention to

the religious history of Latin America than we have been accustomed to, and we are glad to note a joint session with the American Society of Church History after being deprived of one for the last two years.

As treasurer I must point out the net operational loss of more than $21,000 for 1998, and if the $3,150 paid for life memberships had been invested instead of being counted as an item of disposable revenue, the loss would be even larger. Once again we had to make up this loss with income from our investments. We did not yet realize the full benefit of the increase of annual dues, which went into effect only after the majority of the members had been sent statements at the lower rates, but we had to pay the higher rate (thirty-two dollars per year) for each member's subscription to the Review beginning last January; moreover, fewer members paid dues. The only extraordinary expenditure we incurred was one-half of the purchase price of the new computer and printer. One-half of the salary of the office secretary, Ms. Maryann Urbanski, also is paid by the Review.

There has been a considerable turnover in the Association's portfolio. Some stocks were automatically sold when their prices declined through stop-loss orders placed with the brokerage firm. The Committee on Investments decided to invest more money in index equity funds and, only last month, in three companies in the high technology sector. I wish to thank the two other members of this committee, my colleagues at the Catholic University of America in the Department of Economics and Business, Dr. Reza Saidi and Dr. Jamshed Y. Uppal, for the precious time and sage advice that they have again given without recompense during the past year.

In spite of the downturn of the market in the third quarter, the value of our investments has risen over the year as a whole. The net equity of our portfolio held in street name by BT Alex. Brown Incorporated on November 30, 1997, was $704,858.12; on November 30, 1998,it was $829,931.82; this represents an increase of $125,000. In addition to the stocks and equity and money funds comprising that portfolio, we continue to hold several investments directly, the current value of which is as follows:

T. Rowe Price GNMA Fund: 3,779922 shares at $9.56 per share (November 30)	36,136.05
Vanguard GNMA Portfolio: 3,784.884 shares at $10.54 per share (September 30)	39,892.68
Vanguard GNMA Portfolio: 466.511 shares at $10.45 per share (December 31)	4,875.04
Vanguard High Yield Corporate Portfolio: 847.767 shares at $7.83 per share (December 31)	6,638.02
Vanguard Preferred Stock Fund: 1,313.777 shares at $10.45 per share (September 25)	13.728.97
Total	101,270.76
To these should be added the net equity of the portfolio held by BT Alex. Brown (November 30)	829.931.82
Hence, the Association's total invested assets were valued at	931,202.58

The comparable figure reported a year ago was $801,943.43. We continue to reinvest the income from the Washington Mutual Investors Fund, the two GNMA funds listed above, and the Vanguard Preferred Stock Fund.

Of our five special funds the only one to which new contributions were made in 1998 was the fund for the expansion of the Catholic Historical Review. Gifts amounting to a total of $7,629 were added to the $2,759 remaining from the previous year. We used $9,542 to add 210 pages to the 608 plus the four to six pages of front matter in each issue and the twenty-page index provided for in the annual budget. I warmly thank everyone who contributed any amount, large or small, for this cause,* as well as the scholars who contributed

"Prof. Albert A. Acena, Mr. Maurice Adelman, Jr., Ms. Charlotte A. Ames, Mr. Anthony D. Andreassi, Rev. Dr. William A. Au, Rev. Dr. Robert C. Ayers, Prof. William S. Babcock, Rev. Dr. Paul E Bailey, Ms. Carla Bang, Dr. Mary F. Bednarowski, Mr. Gregory S. Beirich, Dr. Martin J. Berginjr, Mr. Clifford J. Berschneider, Prof. Joseph A. Biesinger, Dr. Melinda K. Blade, Prof. Maxwell Bloomfield, Ms. Susane E. Bohr-Hirte, Prof. Henry W Bowden, Prof. Thomas A. Brady, Jr., Rev. Leo P Broderick, Dr. Joseph P. Byrne, Prof. Joseph E Byrnes, Prof. William J. Callahan, Rev. Msgr. Patrick J. Carney, Rev. Daniel E. Carter, Mr. Joseph C. Castora, Rev. Christian Ceplecha, O.S.B., Rev. Dr. Peter Clarke, Rev. Dr. Rory T. Conley, Prof. Frank Coppa, Prof. Jay Corrin, Rev. Robert Croken, SJ., Dr. Timothy P. Cross, Prof. Robert Emmett Curran, Rev. Dr. Richard L. DeMolen, Prof. John A. Dick, Dr. John J. Dillon, Rev. John P. Donnelly, SJ., Rev. Msgr. Thomas M. Duffy, Rev. Msgr. Walter J. Edyvean, Most Rev. Edward M. Egan.Rev. Edward J. Enright,O.S.A.,Rev. Dr. John Whitney Evans, Rev. George P Evans, Rev. Dr. James K. Farge, C.S.B., Sr. Janice Farnham, R.J.M., Dr. Abigail Firey, Dr. Michelle M. Fontaine, Rev. Msgr. John T. Foudy, Dr. Allen J. Frantzen, Prof. John B. Freed, Rev. Prof. Astrik L. Gabriel, Dr. Charles R. Gallagher, Dr. Richard C. Garvey, Prof. Frank X. Gerrity, Rev. Paul E.Gins, O.S.M., Prof. Joseph W Goering, Dr. Virginia Gould, Prof. KennethV Gouwens,Dr. Philip A. Grant, Jr., Prof. Walter D. Gray, Rev. Peter N. Graziano, Prof. Paul F. Grendler, Prof. Martin J. Havran,Rev. Lawrence R. Hennessey, S.T., Rev. Dr. Bennett D.Hill,O.S.B.,Rev. Carl Hoegerl, C.SS.R., Rev. Msgr. John V. Horgan, Rev. Dr. Joseph G. Hubbert, CM., Rev. Prof. John J. Hughes, Rev. Msgr. Richard A. Hughes, Prof. Jane C. Hutchison, Rev. Leon M. Hutton, Prof. James J. John, Prof. Christopher J. Kauffman, Rev. John P. Kavanaugh, William Cardinal Keeler, Dr. Leonard J. Kempski, Mr. Michael J. Kennedy, Dr. John E Kenney, Prof. Eric D. Köhler, Rev. Dr. Joseph A. Komonchak, Prof. Zoltan J. Kosztolnyik, Rev. Henry C. Kricek, Rev. Dr. Raymond J. Kupke, Mr. Thomas L. Lalley, Dr. Henry J. Lang, Prof. Emmet Larkin, Dr. Charles F. Lasher, Mrs. Joan M. Lenardon, Most Rev. Oscar H. Lipscomb, Mr. Richard A. Loiselle, Rev. Thomas A. Lynch, Rev. Michael P Lyons, Rev. Floyd McCoy, Dr. John T. McGreevy, Dr. Frederick J. McGinness, Rev. Thomas C. McGonigle, O.P, Dr. Mary M. McLaughlin, Rev. Msgr. Robert McMain, Rev. Robert E McNamara, Rev. Ambrose Macaulay, Dr. Ellen A. Macek, Mr. Walter H. Maloney, Jr., Prof. Dennis D. Martin, Rev. Mark S. Massa, S.J., Rev. Clarence Menard, O.M.I., Sr. Bridget Merriman, Dr. David C. Miller, Prof. Samuel J. T. Miller, Ms. Cecilia A. Moore, Dr. Victoria M. Morse, Prof. James M. Muldoon, Rev. Dr. Francis J. MurphyDr. Louis J. Nigro, Prof. Thomas E X. Noble, Dr. William L. North, Prof. Doyce B. Nunis, Jr., Prof. Francis Oakley, Prof. David J. O'Brien, Rev. Dr. Fergus O'Donoghue, S.J., Most Rev. Gerald O'Keefe, Prof. Glenn W. Olsen, Dr. John R. Page, Dr. Matthew L. Panczyk, Rev. Dr. Louis B. Pascoe, S.J., Dr. and Mrs. Robert E. Paul, Prof. Neal Pease, Dr. John T. Phelan, Rev. Dr. John F. Piper, Jr., Rev. Dr. Charles W. Polzer, S.J., Rev. Thaddeus J. Posey, O.EM.Cap., Prof. James M. Powell, Dr. Craig R. Prentiss, Dr. Cyriac Pullapilly, Dr. Robert E. Quigley, Mr. John F.Quinn, Ms. Peggy A. Rabkin, Rev. Msgr. John A. Radano, Rev. Francis Reed, Mr. Charles J.

articles, book reviews, brief notices, and items for "Notes and Comments," especially obituaries. By way of comparison let me mention that in 1997 we received $9,212 and expanded Volume LXXXIII by 241 pages.

In the volume for 1998 we have published fourteen articles (Professor Uta-Renate Blumenthal's presidential address of last January included), a bibliographical essay, one piece of miscellany, the annual reports of the Association, reviews of 216 books, and brief notices of seven. Thus on the average fifty-six books were reviewed, mostly at normal length, in each issue. We have only a small accumulation of book reviews awaiting publication but a large number of articles. A balance of only $846 remains to be carried over to the next volume, but we hope that that sum will be rapidly and substantially augmented in order to be able to render more extensive service to our readers.

In 1998 thirty-seven articles were submitted—eight fewer than in the preceding year. Once again we did not receive a single article in the field of Latin American history. The distribution of the submitted articles by field and the disposition made of them are shown in the following table:

	Accepted	Conditionally accepted	Rejected	Pending	Withdrawn	Total
General		1				1
Ancient and Medieval		1				4
Early modern European	2		5			8
Late modern European	3	4	3		1	11
American	4		6	1	1	12
Asian		1				1
Total	5	10	18	1	3	37

Reid, Jr., Ms. Margherita Repetto-Alaia, Prof. John F. Roche, Prof. John D. Root, Prof. Anne C. Rose, Prof. Jane Rosenthal, Dr. Jonathan Rotondo-McCord, Dr. James D. Ryan, Rev. Msgr. Robert J. Sarno, Dr. Daniel L. Schlafly, Prof. John A. Schutz, Rev. Rodney A. Schwartz, Rev. Robert Scully, Rev. Msgr. Francis R. Seymour, Dr. William D. Sharpe, Rev. Dr. Thomas J. Shelley, Rev. Dr. John Silke, Rev. Joachim Smet, O.Carm., Mr. George T. Spera, Jr., Rt. Rev. Matthew Stark, O.S.B., Mr. George C. Stewart, Jr., Dr. Neil Storch, Dr. Stephen J. Sweeney, Rev. Dr. Charles J. T. Talar, Mr. Daniel F. Tanzone, Prof. Leslie W. Tender, Prof. Samuel J. Thomas, Rev. Dr. Thomas W. Tifft, Ms. Anne R. Tirone, Prof. James D. Tracy, Rev. Dr. Edward R. Udovic, CM., Prof. Nicholas Varga, Rev. Andrew J. Walsh, Dr. James Walsh, Prof. Morimichi Watanabe, Rev. Msgr. Edward Wetterer, Rev. Arthur Wheeler, C.S.C, Dr. Joseph M. White, Prof. Joseph L. Wieczynski, Mr. Jeffrey Wills, Mrs. Leah R. Wolf, Dr. Richard J. Wolff, Rev. William L. Wolkovich, Rev. Dr. Martin A. Zielinski

The forthcoming January issue will carry in a box the statement of ownership required by the United States Postal Service for periodicals enjoying the privilege of second-class mail. In it the business manager of the Review, Mr. Gordon A. Conner, states that the total paid circulation to subscribers and members of the Association (including exchange copies) was an average of 1,994 for the preceding twelve months and for the issue nearest to the filing date, and the total number of copies distributed was 2,013. A year ago the total distribution was 2,029; we continue to have exchanges with 164 other periodicals.

I cordially thank the advisory editors, among whom we welcomed in September my new colleague in the Department of Church History, Dr. Jane Merdinger, for their advice and assistance and all the other referees of articles, who must be left as anonymous as they are unremunerated. Once again Dr. Lawrence H. Feldman has compiled the annual index rapidly (lest the October issue, in which it appears, be delayed) and accurately; we all appreciate his learning and skill.

In the office I continue to rely on Ms. Urbanski, who is quickly mastering the new computer. She and I have benefited from the help given by two undergraduate students in the work-study program, namely, Miss Wendy Nufer in the second semester of the last academic year and Miss Michelle Diaz in the first semester of this year.

In a few weeks the organizers of our spring meeting, which will actually be held on the last days of winter, Professors Thomas R. Greene of Villanova University and Margaret McGuinness of Cabrini College, will send each member of the Association a copy of the program and information about lodging and other practical matters. Villanova University sponsored spring meetings in 1973 and 1984. The only other institution that has been the host three times is the University of Notre Dame. Once more we look forward to enjoying Villanova's distinctive hospitality along with that of its sister institution. May its example be followed by other universities and colleges that have not yet or only once rendered that service to our profession.

As was announced long ago, we will meet in Chicago a year from now. Our incoming president, Professor James D. Tracy, is exercising the prerogative of his office of being the chairman of the Committee on Program and has chosen members in Minnesota and western Wisconsin to serve on it, since they have not previously been called upon, no meeting having ever been held in that area.

That meeting will take place shortly after the beginning of the Great Jubilee of the Year 2000. In the bull of indiction of the jubilee, Incamationis Mysterium, issued on November 29, 1998, Pope John Paul II exhibits again his acute historical consciousness. "How many historic memories the Jubilee evokes! "(par. 5) he exclaims. He calls anew for "the purification of memory," which requires that everyone "make an act of courage and humility in recognizing the wrongs done by those who have borne or bear the name of Christian" (par. 11). Although he asserts, "The history of the Church is a history of holiness" (ibid.), he acknowledges "that history also records events which constitute a counter-testimony to

Christianity." Therefore, he asks that the Church "kneel before God and implore forgiveness for the past and present sins of her sons and daughters." On the other hand, he adds,"there will be no lack of fair-minded people able to recognize that past and present history also records incidents of exclusion, injustice, and persecution directed against the sons and daughters of the Church" (ibid). At the end he recalls "the memory of the martyrs" (par. 13). He reminds us,"The two thousand years since the birth of Christ are marked by the ever-present witness of the martyrs. This century now drawing to a close has known very many martyrs, especially because of Nazism, Communism, and racial or tribal conflicts. People from every sector of society have suffered for their faith, paying with their blood for the fidelity to Christ and the Church, or courageously facing ^terminable years of imprisonment and privations of every kind because they refused to yield to an ideology which had become a pitiless dictatorial regime" (ibid). He concludes that "the Church in every corner of the earth must remain anchored in the testimony of the martyrs and jealously guard their memory." Surely, he has promoted this veneration over the years of his pontificate by beatifying and canonizing so many victims of religious persecution. He also presents a challenge to us historians to study their lives in the context of their times and thus to clarify the nature of the witness they gave.

Robert Trisco

New Members

Dr. H. Dale Abadie, Croft Institute for International Studies, University of Mississippi, University, MS 38677

Rev. Jon Alexander, O.P., Department of History, Providence College, Providence^ 02918

Mr. Colin R Barr, 16745 Mt. Rose Highway, Reno, NV 895 l l

Rev. John J. Bonzagnl, 29 Crystal Street, RO. Box 363, Lenox Dale, MA 01242-0363

Dr. Constance B. Bouchard, Department of History, University of Akron, Akron, OH 44325-1902

Mr. John A. Calamettijr, 287 Siena Vista Street, Mobile,AL 36607

Bro. J. T. Carroll, CEC, 715 North Avenue, New Rochelle, NY 10801

Mr. Douglas H. M. Carver, Department of Medieval History, Trinity College, Dublin 2, Ireland

Mr. John F. Chuciak, IV 58681 Eileen Street, Rayland, OH 43943

Mr. Michael L. Courtney, 21 Roblin Road, Bedford, NH 031 10

Mr. Daniel F. Curtin, 6014 Munson Hill Road, Falls Church, VA 22041-2426

Mr. Timothy J. Davis, 6249 Clark State Road, Gahanna, OH 43230

Mr. Alan Delozier, 77 Bakun Way, Ewing, NJ 08638-1 507

Mr.Terrence Deneen,2310 14th Street, North, #408, Arlington, VA 22201

Mr. Frederick Dotólo, 217 Winston Road, Buffalo, NY 14216

Mr. Brian Doyle, Portland Magazine, University of Portland, 5000 North Willamette Boulevard, Portland, OR 97203-5798

Mr. Nick Falco, 1258 Pelham Parkway South, Bronx, NY 10461-1006
Sr. Carolyn Farrell, B.VM., Director, Gannon Center for Women and Leadership, Sullivan 200, Loyola University, 6525 North Sheridan Road, Chicago, IL 60626
Ms. Mary Beth Fraser, 1246 Monroe Street, N.E., Washington, DC 20017
Dr. Brian T. Froehle, Executive Director, Center for Applied Research in the Apostolate, Georgetown University, Washington, DC 20057-1203
Francis Cardinal George, Archbishop of Chicago, 155 East Superior Street, Chicago, IL 60611
Mr. Michael I. Glazier, 700 Island Way, Apt. #102, Clearwater, FL 33767
Prof. Robert M. Grant, 5807 Dorchester Avenue, 1 IE, Chicago, IL 60637
Prof. Bernard Hamilton, 7 Lenton Avenue, The Park, Nottingham NG7 IDX, England
Mr. William Christopher Hoag, 4129 Mary Kay Circle, North Olmsted, OH 44070
Mr. Stephen M. Hoder, III, RO. Box 3053, Newtown, CT 06470
Dr. David R. C Hudson, 1816 Avenue O, Huntsville.TX 77340
Dr. Susan J. Kalcik, 749 Sunset Avenue, Johnstown, PA 15905-1635
Dr. Thomas G. Kelliher, Jr., 829 South Euclid Avenue, Oak Park, IL 60304
Rev. Omer U. Kline, O.S.B., Saint Vincent Archabbey, Office of the Archivist, 300 Fraser Purchase Road, Latrobe, PA 15650-2686
Prof. Lance Lazar, Department of Religious Studies, 101 Saunders Hall, CB#3225, University of North Carolina, Chapel HUl, NC 27599-3225
Rev. Albert H. Ledoux, Mt. St. Mary's Seminary, Emmitsburg, MD 21727
Rev. William J. Leonard. S.J.Jesuit Community, St. Mary's Hall, Boston College, Chestnut Hill, MA 02467
Rev. Ronald J. Lewinski, 22333 West Erhart Road, Mundelein, IL 60060
Dean David T. Link, 203 Law School, University of Notre Dame, Notre Dame, IN 46556
Dr. Charles H. Lippy, Philosophy and Religion 2753, University of Tennessee, 615 McCaLUe Avenue, Chattanooga, TN 37403
Ms. Ann Marie Lo Prieno, 2363 South York Street, #301, Denver, CO 80210
Dr. Kristin Mann, 3905 Coyote Lane, Flagstaff, AZ 86004-7719
Ms. Anne M. Martinez, P.O. Box 14123, Minneapolis, MN 55414-0123
Rev. Clifford Mavunkal, Jyotir Bhavan, Kalamassery—683 104, Kerala, India
Ms. Eileen M. McConnell, 3602 Isbell Street, Silver Spring, MD 20906-4336
Dr. Elizabeth McKeown, Department of Theology, Georgetown University, Washington, DC 20057
Rev. John T. Monaghan. Cardinal Spellman High School, 1991 Needham Avenue, Bronx, NY 10466
Dr. Diane Batts Morrow, 130 Pine Tops Drive, Athens, GA 30606
Mr. Greel Myers, 7132 West Tamarack Court, Mequon, WI 53092
Dr. Francis W Nichols, Saint Louis University, P.O. Box 56907, St. Louis, MO 63156-0907
Rev. Earl F. Niehaus, Department of History, Xavier University, 7325 Palmetto Street, Box 101B, New Orleans, LA 70125
Mr. Michael Novak, American Enterprise Institute, 1 150 17th Street, N.W, Washington, DC 20036

Rev. Cosmas K.O. Nwosuh, M.S.R, RO. Box 23, Gwagwalada, Abuja, Nigeria
Dr. Christopher H. Owen, Department of History, Northeastern State University, Tahlequah, OK 74464
Dr. Xiaoyu Peng, Department of History, Beijing University, Beijing 100871, China
Prof. Amanda Porterfield, Religious Studies Program, 201 Hoyt Hall, University of Wyoming, Laramie, WY 82070
Dr. William F. Powers, Suffolk Community College, Seiden, NY 11784
Dr. John V Redington, M.D., 4305 Torrance Boulevard, #305, Torrance, CA 90503
Bro. David Richardson, O.S.C, Saint Mary's Catholic Church, 727 5th Street, NW, Washington, DC 20001
Ms. Milda B. Richardson, 11 WalHs Road, Chestnut Hill, MA 02467
Dr. Walter Rinderle, R.R. 6, Box E-2, Vincennes, IN 47591
Dr. Kimberly Rivers, Department of History, University of Wisconsin, 800 Algoma Boulevard, Oshkosh, WI 54901
Dr. Jonathan Rotondo-McCord, 608 Woodridge Boulevard, Mandevüle, LA 70471
Sr. Ann Thomasine Sampson, CSJ., Bethany Convent, 1870 Randolph Avenue, St. Paul, MN 55105
Dr. James T. Schleifer, 220 Alston Avenue, New Haven, CT 06515
Mr. Kevin E. Schmiesing, 5711 TuUp Street, Philadelphia, PA 19135
Mr. Junhyoung Shin, Department of Art History, University of Wisconsin, Madison, WI 53706
Ms. Deborah Skok, 5415 South Ellis Avenue, #2, Chicago, IL 60615
Mr. Joseph F. X. Sladky, 6529 Old Carriage Drive, Alexandria, VA 22315-5039
Mr. Kenneth J. Sleyman, 5625 Willoughby Newton Road, #15, Centreville, VA 22020
Dr. David S. Spear, Department of History, Furman University, Greenville, SC 29613-0444
Dr. PhiUp H. Stump, Department of History, Lynchburg College, 1501 Lakeside Drive, Lynchburg, VA 24501
Ms. Mariko Takahashi, 5451 Laurelton Avenue, Garden Grove, CA 92845
Mr. Harold D. Willis, 4527 West Alabama Street, Houston, TX 77027-4803
Sr. SaUy Witt, C.S.J., 1425 Washington Street, Watertown, NY 13601

Financial Statement

Fund Statement (as of December 15, 1998)

Cash:		
Balance as of December 15, 1997	12,612.73	
Increase (Decrease): see Exhibit A	(21,146.83)	
Transfer from investment income	25.584.00	
Balance as of December 15, 1998		17,049.90
Investments: see Exhibit B		296.333.47
Total Fund Resources		313,38337

Statement of Revenue and Expenses (Exhibit A)
(for the period December 15, 1997, through December 15, 1998)

Revenue:			
Membership fees (annual)		29,373.57	
Life membership fees		3,150.00	
Annual meeting, 1997/98		2,035.00	
Rental of mailing list		7500	
Endowment Fund		325. 10	
Dividends (cash)		566.65	35,525.32
Expenses:			
Office Expenses:			
Secretary	12,952.28		
Telephone	57.13		
Supplies, printing	1,464.00		
Postage	2,223.63		
Computer (one-half)	1.676.00	18,37304	
Catholic Historical Review			
Subscriptions		33,936.00	
Annual meeting, 1997/98		3,192.25	
John Gilmary Shea Prize		500.00	
Peter Guilday Prize		100.00	
Bank service charges		134.79	
Discount on checks		14.92	
Miscellaneous		421.15	56.672.15
Operational surplus—Net gain (loss)			(21,146.83)
Investments (Exhibit B)			
General Fund			
Balance as of December 15, 1997			236,11361
Income from investments (dividends and interest):			
Abbott Laboratories		936.00	
Alex. Brown Cash Reserve Fund		739.48	
BT Investment Equity 500 Index Fund		5,461.30	
Edison International		1,001.00	
General Electric Company		960.00	
ITT Corp. New		74.99	
Johnson & Johnson		776.00	
Starwood Hotels and Resorts		285.48	
T. Rowe Price GNMA Fund,Inc		2,264.71	
T. Rowe Price Index Equity Fund		1,471.93	
Vanguard GNMA Portfolio		2,565.15	
Vanguard High Yield Corp. Portfolio		566.65	
Vanguard Preferred Stock Fund		772.82	
Van Kampen American Capital Bond Fund		1,125.00	
Washington Mutual Investors Fund		3.182.56	22,183.07
Capital gains:			
BT Investment Equity 500 Index Fund		4,934.86	
T. Rowe Price Index Equity Fund		208.33	
Vanguard GNMA Portfolio		7.28	
Washington Mutual Investors Fund		8.119.41	13.269.88
Total			35,452.95

Less dividends received as revenue (Exhibit A)		(566.65)
Total income from investments		34,886.30
Less transfer to cash		(25,584.00)
Balance as of December 15, 1998		245,41591

Special Fund L—Howard R. Marraro Prize		
Balance as of December 15, 1997:	15,663.68	
Investment income:		
Washington Mutual Investors Fund		
dividend	316.67	
capital gain	807.90	1,124.57
Prize and luncheon		(543.00)
Balance as of December 15, 1998		16,245.25

Special Fund II—Anne M. Wolf Fund		
Balance as of December 15, 1997:	8,272.13	
Investment income		
Alex. Brown Cash Reserve Fund	405.33	
Withdrawal	(2.500.00)	
Balance as of December 15, 1998	6,177.46	

Special Fund III—Expansion of the CHR		
Balance as of December 15, 1997	2,759. 17	
Contributions	7,629.00	
Expense	(9.542.19)	
Balance as of December 15, 1998	845.98	

Special Fund LV—Endowment		
Balance as of December 15, 1997		
Vanguard GNMA Portfolio	4,542.50	
Investment income	325.10	
Transferred to Exhibit A	(325.10)	
Balance as of December 15, 1998	4,542.50	

Special Fund V—f. T. Ellis Memorial Fund		
Balance as of December 15, 1997	22,857.74	
Investment income		
Washington Mutual Investors Fund		
dividend	459.17	
capital gain	1.171.46	1,630.63
Award		(1,200.00)
Luncheons		(86.00)
Three subscriptions to CHR		(96.00)
Balance as of December 15, 1998		23,106.37
Total investments		296,333.47

FROM PETER TO JOHN PAUL II

Review Article

by

Simon Ditchfield

Saints & Sinners: A History of the Popes. By Eamon Duffy. (New Haven: Yale University Press. 1997. Pp. ix, 326. $37.50 clothbound; $18.95 paperback.)

The Papacy. By Paul Johnson. Edited by Michael Walsh. (London: Weidenfeld & Nicolson. 1997. Pp. 224.)

Duffy takes advantage of single-authorship to lend his narrative a boldness of conception and argument which volumes such as that edited by Michael Walsh simply cannot aspire to (notwithstanding the distinguished contributions by R. A. Markus and Sheridan Gilley). With only a single volume at his disposition and one where the two hundred-plus (imaginatively chosen) illustrations reduce the space available to him even more, Duffy has pulled off nothing less than a miracle of concision. This has been achieved without sacrificing anything of the author's well-known talent for narrative, which is matched by a rare capacity (shared with Peter Brown) to put the intangible into words, together with an unerring eye for telling detail. Moreover, Duffy is acutely aware of the hubris implicit in his solo enterprise and insists right from the start that there cannot be a single story line since "the papacy has been at the centre of too many human stories and enterprises" (p. Lx).

Nevertheless, in reality, his approach would appear to be substantially indebted to a single idea: Hans Rung's belief that the unity of the Church must be understood not institutionally but theologically and that, indeed, the unity of the Church presupposes a multiplicity of churches. From this derives the overarching argument of his book: that by historicizing the Papacy and its origins "one surely rules out any absolutist understanding of the nature of papal authority." These words are actually taken not from the book under review but from Duffy's 1998 Tablet Open Day Lecture, "The papacy and the burden of history" (printed in an abridged form in the Tablet of July 4, 1998, pp. 871-873; quotation at p. 872), the reading of which is essential for those who wish to understand the rhyme of Duffy's reason. This brings him to conclude that "the papacy is the way things have worked out" (p. 873); a conclusion which goes beyond the historian's duty to rehabilitate the contingent by questioning the

Divine institution of the Papcy itself and to posit in its place a "foundation myth" (p. 871). For in his book he views the emergence of a single bishop of Rome as not predating the mid-second century and as being, above all, a response to the pressure of heresy and the "seething diversity" of the multicultural city of Rome. In particular, Christian organization reflected, in its decentralized authority, the Jewish community out of which it had grown (p. 6). It would appear from the correspondence in the Tablet provoked by his lecture, however, that Duffy has now modified his argument in crucial respects. (See in particular his letter in the Tablet of October 24, 1998, p. 1397, where he concedes, "So it seems likely that one of the Roman presbyters had special responsibility for relations with other Churches of the [Roman] Empire") The question at issue here is not Duffy's masterly evocation of the ritual and doctrinal confusion which characterized Early Christian Rome, but rather whether there is anything in historical fact which negates the faith enshrined in the six-foot high rendition of Matthew 16:18-19 that encircles the dome of St Peter's and with which Duffy opens his first chapter: Tu es Petrus, et super banc petram aediflcabo ecclesiam meam et tibi dabo claves regni caelorum.

Duffy thus predictably devotes considerable attention to how the papacy met the challenge of constructing continuity with its apostolic origins. A particularly striking and concrete early example of this is the "crypt of the popes" (begun ca. 230 a.d.) in the Catacombs of S. Callisto, situated off the Appian Way just outside the city walls: a three-dimensional counterpart to the episcopal succession list drawn up in the late-second century by Irenaeus of Lyon. This theme of retrospective tidying up of the papal past is a recurrent one throughout the book and is well served by the excellently reproduced and frequently unusual illustrations, which are fully integrated into the text's argument. (The picture researcher, Sheila Lee, surely deserves an Oscar for her efforts.) For example, Cesare Nebbia, in his late-sixteenth-century depiction of the First Council of Nicea in SLxtus Vs redecoration and extension of the Vatican Library (Illus. 24) depicts the Pope Sylvester presiding over the council, flanked by cardinals, when, in reality, the council had been called by the emperor, Sylvester was absent, and cardinals had not yet been invented. The pope's absence from Nicaea I was mirrored, naturally enough, by the emperor's own absence from Rome, and Duffy gives due weight to the significance of Constantine's departure from the city as having constituted a precondition for the emergence of Papal Rome, thereby ensuring, in the long run, that sacred and secular authority would be differentiated in the West and frequently in tension with one another (most famously between the Holy Roman Emperor and the Pope during the High Middle Ages over the question of episcopal investiture, but also significantly within the Pope's own dual identity down to 1870 as both territorial prince and universal pastor).

The Christianization of Rome was, of course, accompanied by the Romanization of Christianity, whose principal architect was Pope Damasus I (366-384). The latter's secretary, Jerome, latinized Christianity just as his master drew on imperial procedures to recast himself as supreme spiritual lawgiver. Damasus

also romanized the Early Christian martyrs by collecting and reburying their remains so that the papacy further enhanced its prestige as guardian of a sacred arsenal without peer in the West. As might be expected from Duffy's ecumenical sympathies, he is very good on the local relationship between successive bishops of Rome and their city. The first Pope to engage fully Duffy's sympathies is therefore, appropriately enough, a Roman who saved his city from famine and disaster: Gregory the Great. The latter matched unselfconscious devotion (reflected in the simple piety of his Dialogues) with hard-headed pragmatism (demonstrated most graphically in his reorganization of the patrimony of the church which permitted him to take responsibility for feeding the Roman populace during the crisis years of his papacy). Moreover, concern with the "avalanche of practicalities" did not prevent Gregory from taking an unprecedented initiative which was to have "momentous consequences for the papacy": the evangelization of England.

For Duffy, the next pope to display this combination of local concern about gritty practicalities with universal spiritual aspirations was a Tuscan by birth but certainly Roman by adoption. He was Gregory VII; although he achieved very little in concrete terms, "after him the papacy never receded from its claims to freedom from secular and political control in secular matters" (p. 99). During the High Middle Ages successive popes were hard-pressed to hold together hierarchy and charism, and after the high-water mark of Innocent Ill's pontificate and his inspired recognition of Francis of Assisi and mendicant spirituality, the papacy lost its balance on the tightrope and lurched first momentarily toward impractical asceticism in the form of the hermit Pope Celestine V, then toward the ambitious clerical careerist Boniface VIII Caetani (inspired inventor of the Jubilee in 1300), whose subordination of his office to family interests was so complete that he offered the spiritual privileges of crusade to anyone who joined his vendetta against the rival Colonna family. After this, the papacy settled temporarily in Avignon, where in contrast "to the popes of the Early Middle Ages who had drawn their power from the relics of the Apostles, the popes of the Avignon period [drew theirs] from their centrality in the legal systems of Europe" (p. 125).

The extremes of worldly pragmatism and ascetic puritanism embodied by Boniface and Celestine are echoed for Duffy (though in a less extreme fashion) by the dual pontificates of Paul III and Paul IV, which reflected, for him, the dialectic of reform in the early modern papacy: "for the rest of the Tridentine Era, Catholic Reformation would move between these two poles, and it would be the task of the popes to manage the resulting tensions. Indeed, the popes themselves were part of the dialectic, for there was no such thing as a 'typical' Counter-Reformation Pope" (pp. 169-170, italics added). It is to Duffy's considerable credit that his narrative never resorts to the trickery of simplistic teleologies or retrospective projection: not for him the view of the modern papacy as the necessary outcome of evolution over two millennia, or the perhaps more insidious tendency (particularly favored by Italian scholars of a certain persuasion) to project backwards the remarkably monolithic clerical culture under the

pontificate of Pius X onto our image of the Renaissance or Counter-Reformation papacy. Nonetheless, this is perhaps the weakest section of Duffy's narrative: he is ultimately too soft on the Renaissance papacy and too harsh on the Counter-Reformation incumbents of the throne of St. Peter. In the light of the vast recent literature which has problematized our understanding of the exercise of authority at every level in the early modern period and thus downsized absolutism from a fact to a tendency, it is simply not good enough to write: "In an age of absolutism, the Pope was one absolutist ruler amongst others" (?. 176). Moreover, his over-sanguine characterization of Sixtus V is simply out of date (failing as it does to take any account of the important work of Irene Polverini-Fosi) and that of Urban VIII simplistic and unfair (the latter's prowess as a lawyer-pope has been overshadowed by his success as an art-patron on the one hand and by his political misjudgment on the other).

From the eighteenth century onwards, however, Duffy regains his sure touch (as might be expected, given his beginnings as a historian of eighteenth-century English Catholicism), which does not desert him for the rest of his narrative. The French Revolution is rightly accorded its overwhelming significance as the "historical catastrophe" which "causes" the modern papacy. As Duffy summarizes the argument of his book at this juncture with admirable concision in his Tablet lecture: "The revolution swept away the Catholic Kings who had appointed bishops and ruled Churches. The hostile secular states which emerged to replace them in nineteenth-century Europe attempted to control the influence of the Church in public life, but were glad to leave its internal arrangement to the pope" (ibid., p. 872, emphasis added). Central to the latter was the right to appoint the bishops of the Catholic world. This was enshrined in canon law as late as 1917 (Canon 329) and as such lies at the heart of papal domination of the modern Church.

Predictably for a man of Duffy's ecumenical sympathies, the Ultramontanes are given short shrift, "extravagantly vamping up papal authority" (p. 228), and ultramontanism is seen as "a form of absolutism" (p. 235). However, the pontificate of Leo XIII, "Ultamontanism with a liberal face," is dealt with by Duffy in a judicious and balanced fashion. Readers should also be grateful to him for allowing us to see so clearly how in St. Pius X's centralization of the Church in the service of enhancing its pastoral effectiveness one is seeing the fulfillment of the Tridentine agenda two and a half centuries after the council's close. As author of Mortalium ánimos (1928), Pius XI is a soft target for pro-ecumenical writers, yet whilst unsparing with his criticisms of this encyclical, Duffy is fully equal to the task of communicating unanachronistically that Pope's uneven legacy, where distrust of democratic politics was matched by "the blistering denunciation of Fascism and its collaboration with Nazi lies" which would have been Humani Generis Unitas had the pope's own death not intervened. Similarly, Duffy succeeds in capturing the successive phases in the papacy of Pius XII, and does not allow it to be colored uniformly by an undifferentiated condemnation of the Vatican's wartime policy toward the Jewish question. Pius was also author between 1943 and 1947, as Duffy is quick to acknowledge, of

three theological encyclicals, Mystici corporis, Divino afflante Spiritu, and Mediator Dei, which opened up "new and hopeful avenues for Catholic theology" (p. 265), even if his last years were dominated by violent anti-communism and saw the publication of his fiercely conservative Humani Generis in 1950, the year which also witnessed the canonization of that other arch-conservative of the twentieth-century papacy: Pius X.

Proximity to the last three pontificates inevitably makes any judgment of them particularly problematic, but Duffy on the whole is fair and even-handed. John XXIII is helpfully situated as a man who could identify strongly with a pastoral model of the 1560's (St. Charles Borromeo), yet display almost a naive optimism that saw Providence as guiding humanity toward "a new order of human relationships," which was very much of the 1960's. This, the shortest pontificate in over two centuries, "yet. . . transformed the Catholic Church, and with it the world's perception of the papacy" (p. 272). Duffy may not add substantially to our understanding of the complex Paul VI, but he writes compassionately of a man manifestly shattered and irredeemably depressed by the storm of protest which greeted his encyclical on birth-control, Humanae Vitae, of 1968. With John Paul II the concern with orthodoxy—whether it be in the field of sexual ethics or theology—has been matched by a powerful skepticism in the face of Western capitalism as well as Marxist collectivism, as seen in his Sollicitudo Rei Socialis of 1988. Moreover, his openness to other religions is unprecedented and extends to the non-Abrahamic traditions. Yet it is not hard to see that the present pope's emphasis on obedience and conformity to the magisterium makes Duffy uncomfortable and that Karol Wojtyla "has seemed at times more like the successor of Pius LX, Pius X or Pius XII than of John XXIII or Paul VI" (p. 286).

Turning very briefly to the second book under review, it must be said straightaway that the book is by Paul Johnson only in name. Although apparently the Vatican's personal and original choice as author, Johnson's other writing commitments meant that the work was in actual fact carried out by a team of writers under the editorship of Michael Walsh. If the pious clichés and anachronistic waffle which characterize Johnson's introduction and afterword are anything to go by, the Vatican committed a profound error of judgment and owes Walsh a not inconsiderable debt for having rescued it from embarrassment. However, it must be said that despite Walsh's wide knowledge and the undoubted expertise of his individual contributors, the volume fails to cohere, and we are left with an uneven text not assisted by poorly co-ordinated, if lavish, illustrations. It goes without saying that Duffy's history of the popes is preferable in every respect and, with the important caveat concerning his presentation of evidence relating to the question of the divine institution of the papacy (discussed above), may be recommended to both scholars and the general reader alike as the best one-volume treatment of its subject currently available.

The University of York

BOOK REVIEWS

General

Church and Revolution: Catholics in the Struggle for Democracy and Social Justice. By Thomas Bokenkotter. [Image Books.] (New York: Doubleday. 1998. Pp. xii, 580. $15.95 paperback.)

How did the Catholic Church become a staunch defender of human rights in the late twentieth-century world, after having spent the nineteenth century in emphatic denunciations of the French Revolution and its "rights of man"? A seasoned historian proposes to cast light on this question chiefly by presenting a series of biographical portraits that illustrate his subtitle. "Lives and times" are what the reader finds here, presented with great care for factual accuracy and balanced judgment. Though highly selective, it is not a gallery only of heroes and champions of human dignity: alongside of Daniel O'Connell, Frédéric Ozanam, Luigi Sturzo, and Dorothy Day one finds Monsignor Umberto Benigni (1862-1934), whose campaigns for the social ideals of Leo XIII, as he understood them, and against political democracy, led him eventually to adopt a clerico-fascist stance.

The temporal and geographical range of the figures treated is broad. The sixteen chapters go from Lamennais and companions in the first generation of Liberal Catholics to Oscar Romero's martyrdom in 1980 and Lech Walesa's contemporary "revolution." France (Albert de Mun, Jacques Maritain, Emmanuel Mounier) and Ireland (O'Connell, Michael Collins, and Eamon de Valera) are prominent. Italy has its pair as noted, while England is represented by Cardinal Manning; Germany (only) by (Karl Marx and) Konrad Adenauer. The need to sketch the appropriate context for each life excluded any attempt at blanket coverage of all the interesting and significant Catholics prominent in the human rights struggles. Performing feats of condensation, the author vividly and not uncritically portrays the predicaments of his protagonists. In the chapter on Adenauer, for instance, he makes excellent use of Noel D. Cary's Path to Christian Democracy (1996) and provides enough of the history of Germany and the Center Party to put Adenauer's accomplishments in context.

The popes of the era do not appear on center stage, either; Leo XIII and Pius X are accurately if briefly described in the chapter on Benigni; as is Pius XI in

connection with Don Sturzo. The contributions of Rerum Novarum, Quadragesimo Anno, the Second Vatican Council, and John Paul II are recognized, but the plan of the work is not to deal with "the Catholic Church" (often equated with the hierarchy, as on p. 569), but with some striking figures of social and political "Catholicism." Such limits make sense; a good deal of material, relatively speaking, is available on the modern papacy.

The book is a particularly welcome addition to Catholic studies for instructional purposes. Though lacking a bibliography or "suggestions for further reading," it has a good, if less than exhaustive index; its footnotes are well placed (at the bottom of the page) and adequate, while kept to a useful miriirnum. Its limpid style and modest price should help assure it broad use.

Paul Misner

Marquette University

Dizionario degli Istituti di Perfezione. Edited by Guerrino Pelliccia and Giancarlo Rocca. Vol. LX: "Spiritualità-Vézelay." (Rome: Edizioni Paoline. 1997. Pp. xxvi, 1,960; 17 colored plates.)

These truly monumental volumes, undertaken in the wake of Vatican Council II in 1968, ambition covering all monasticism, religious Orders, and analogous movements, not excluding non-Catholic and Asian analogues, from the Early Church to the present day, from a largely historical perspective, including themes, mentalities, theologies, and movements, in comprehensive scope. Its riches are so varied and sometimes unexpected under their Italian indicators that we Anglophones must hope for ample multilingual indexes at the end.

Major themes can amount to small books, as with Historiography of religious life (77 columns), the role of Study including libraries (85 columns), Third Orders both regular and secular (81 columns), or Virginity (56 columns). Generous space is also accorded Theater, monastic Taxes, Trent on religious life, Theology, and concepts such as Spouse of Christ, State of Perfection, Tonsure, and the process and history of Leaving (Uscita). Some entries are particularly contemporary: the problem of an aging population in Orders (Terza Eta), the pros and cons of the Third Way as sexual expression (Terza Via), and the use of modern communications (Strumenti). Other entries are unexpected: Vegetarianism, Utopia, Humanism (monastic, then Renaissance), siting of religious houses (Ubicazione, some 30 columns), and their relation to cities (Urbanística). A sprinking of exotic items catches the eye: Sufism, Stoicism, Taoism, Tantrism, Vestals, and Waldensians.

An unending parade of monks and Orders down the centuries forms the backbone of this enterprise; the alphabetical sequence here brings us the Templars, Trinitarians (over 40 columns), Virgins (over sixteen Orders under that title), the ancient Stylites and the Lutheran Humiliati begun in 1921, as well as

the older movement of the Humiliati. A Typology of Orders sorts them all out (13 columns). Notable monasteries with separate entries include Subiaco, the ecumenical Taizé. Tintern Abbey, Tokwon in Korea, Vallombroso, and Vézelay. Individuals whose alphabetical turn has come include Lorenzo Valla and Thomas Aquinas on religious life, Teresa of Avila and Thérèse of Lisieux, Francisco Suárez, Stephen Harding, Humbert of Romans, Cardinal Herbert Vaughan, and any number of founders whose names begin with Van.

The regions whose monasteries and religious life receive extended special treatment in this volume include Hungary, the Holy Land (Terra Santa), Switzerland, and Tibet, with 30 columns for the United States and an unusual 150 for Latin America. An oddity is that some regional units are lumped under the rubric States (Statt Baltici, Statt di Nord Europa). A similar alphabetical displacement locates some topics under History (Storia): of Charity (hospitals, poor), of the Consecrated Life, or of the Missions.

The tight focus of each entry on its relation to the monastic or religious context, the dense material available within each entry, the encompassing scale of the whole enterprise, the up-to-date bibliographies, and the historical professionalism throughout, make this volume like its predecessors indispensable to historians of Christendom or religion, especially for anything touching on monasticism under its many guises. Every library should have this tool.

Robert I. Burns, SJ.

University of California at Los Angeles

San Benito y los Benedictinos. Tome I: La Edad Media, 1; Tome II: La Edad Media, 2; Tome III: La Edad Moderna, 1; Tome IV: La Edad Moderna, 2; Tome V: La Edad Contemporánea, 1; Tome VI: La Edad Contemporánea, 2; Tomo VII: Cartografía; Tomo VIII: índices. By Antonio Linage Conde. (Braga: Ediçâo da Irmandade de S. Bento da Porta Aberta. 1992-93. Pp. xxxiv, 35-392, 37 illus.; 395-1129, 33-78 illus.; 1131-1695, 79-137 ülus.; 1695-2245, 138-164 illus.; 2457-3058, 165-253 illus.; 3059-3722, 253-321 illus.; índices: 3727-4472; Cart.: No. 1-59H. Paperback.)

Professor Linage Conde offers the reader nothing less than a fifteen-hundred-year survey of Benedictine monasticism. It is a narrative at once highly discursive and personal, overflowing with familiar ecclesial figures in the Western Church alongside a welter of relatively unknown minor figures from the monastic ranks.

One should laud Linage Conde at the outset for attempting to provide what is sorely needed for scholar and student alike—a synthetic survey of the history of Benedictine monasticism. In this respect it is an invaluable update of the multi-volume history of the Benedictine Order written a half-century ago by Dom Philibert Schmitz.

Contained in the seven volumes of this work are resources that one is not likely to find elsewhere. There is a separate volume containing indices and maps that serve as useful referents to the text. One would have hoped, however, to see the collection of maps of monastic sites be given a chronological guide and more clearly uniform arrangement. A rich collection of color plates at the end of each of the five volumes enhances the text with reproductions of significant monastic persons, places, and art. The reader cannot help but be impressed at the breadth of bibliographic resources the author brings to bear upon his subject. A broad and current mix of sources in English, French, Italian, and German, as well as Spanish, buttresses the author's narrative. Of particular note is the inclusion of an astounding array of secondary historical sources that are brought to bear upon the particular monastic topic or era being treated.

This is very much a narrative account, at once highly personal and rich in historical detail, but uneven in quality. One would be hard pressed to imagine any other history that could incorporate monastic architecture and agriculture, hymnody and healing, liquors and libraries, an entire Benedictine world of arts and sciences. The author's intellectual compass seems as expansive as his chronological framework, but it often takes flight in a fashion that leaves the reader wishing for more coherence and less encyclopedic fact.

Linage Conde displays a special bent for the life of the mind. In this respect he is writing an intellectual history, and he betrays the subjectivity inevitable in such an enterprise. Why there is such a lengthy exposition given to the fortunes of the Abbey of Monte Cassino in all of its different epochs and no acknowledgment of the role of the Eastern monastic tradition down to the twentieth century is only one question that arises in light of the arbitrary selection of content. One would expect the author, an expert on the monasticism of the Iberian peninsula and South America, to excel in describing these areas and he does. He also delivers a superb presentation on the monasticism of the Baroque and the nineteenth-century monastic revival. But it becomes difficult to justify extended treatment of various literary enterprises of the twentieth century in the monastic world, while barely mentioning the most dramatic and significant development of monasticism in this century—the rapid growth of communities of men and women on the subcontinents of Africa and Asia. One also regrets that the treatment of monastic women is very uneven. The great monastic mystics of the Middle Ages, such as Gertrude die Great and Hildegard of Bingen, receive scant treatment. Nor does the changing demographic distribution and spiritual composition of monasteries of women in the last two centuries.

Linage Conde's prose style can also be a test to the reader. It is prolix and given to lengthy allusive descriptions that can be interesting but also distracting for someone intent on maintaining a focus on major figures and events of the history of monasticism.

In short, this is at once a monumental labor of scholarship and an indispensable tool for anyone doing monastic history today. At times it can be tortuous going, getting through some of the peripheral historical excursions of the au-

thor, but it is rewarding in giving one a comprehensive and continual narrative of the story of Western monasticism from the time of Benedict until the present. One can only hope that it will stimulate some contemporary monastic historians to produce a comparable study in English.

Joel Rippinger, O.S.B.

Marmion Abbey
Aurora, Illinois

Mille anni di storia dell'Arciabbazia di Pannonhalma. Edited by József Pal and Adám Somorjai. (Rome and Pannonhalma: Accademia d'Ungheria in Roma and METEM. 1997. Pp. 233.)

Since 1989 a growing number of Hungarian scholars have turned their attention to church history. The International Society for the Encyclopedia of Hungarian Church History (METEM) and the Archabbey of Pannonhalma have played an important role in the publication of a number of recent monographs on church history. The volume at hand was published to commemorate the Archabbey of Pannonhalma's millennium.

Following the introduction, written by the Pope and the Archabbot, the essays are grouped in five sections. The first section deals with the history of the origins of the Archabbey, with special attention given to the missionary activities of St. Adalbert (Vojtech) (956?-997). These essays are based entirely on secondary sources by authors who are admittedly not specialists on the topic.

The second section of the book consists of a series of essays on early extant documents found in the archives of the Archabbey. Three essays deserve mention: Gábor Thoroczkay's is a detailed historiographical essay about the diploma of King (saint) Stephen (1000-1038). It describes the controversies played out in the analysis of this fundamental document to the Archabbey's early history. László Veszprémy's essay is a study of the earliest extant (eleventh-century) inventory of the Archabbey's library, written between 1093 and 1095. Veszprémy shows that Pannonhalma, in contrast to contemporaneous European monasteries, had a rather modest library. Edit Madas's is an essay about references to Saint Benedict in the sermons and legends of medieval Hungary. The author analyzes a number of hitherto unpublished sermons from the archives of the Archabbey.

The third section consists of articles about the relationship between Italian and Hungarian Benedictines. The essay by Géza Mihályi is a memoir in which he sketches the foundation of the Liceum Dante Alighieri, which operated in the Archabbey between 1939 and 1948. The essay is based entirely on personal recollections (no sources cited), and leaves many topics unexplored.

The fourth section consists of essays in praise of one of the monks, Geliert Békes, who contributes to this volume. Father Békes was the publisher of Vigi-

lia, a periodical publication that played an important role in the community of Hungarian expatriates in the postwar years. These essays seem out of place in this volume.

The fifth section contains an essay on the architecture of the monastery. Unfortunately, this essay suffers from its superficiality. The appendix contains good-quality photographs of some of the charters addressed in this volume and details of some parts of the monastic complex.

The exact purpose of this volume remains nebulous to the reviewer. It is not a collection of scholarly works, though it contains some. It is not a collection of personal reminiscences. It is not a coffee-table book, despite the nice photographs and the glossy paper. The uneven caliber of the essays does little justice to the thousand-year history of the Archabbey of Pannonhalma.

PONGRÁCZ SeNNYEY

Bradley University

Spazi e figure lungo la storia dei Servi di santa Maria (secoli XIII-XX). By Franco Andrea Dal Pino. [Italia Sacra: Studi e documenti di storia ecclesiastica, Vol. 55.] (Rome: Herder Editrice e Librería. 1997. Pp. xxx, 760. Lire 188.000.)

Franco Andrea Dal Pino's historical research and publications on the Servite Order have extended over fifty years, making him the dominant Servite historian of the last half of this century. This volume, published in the Herder's "Italia Sacra" series, collects twenty-one of his more important writings on the history of the Servite Order. He first lists the twenty-one articles, indicating where they were first published, and he notes if any changes have been made in the text. One contribution is entirely new and another has been extensively rewritten; thirteen have some minor revisions in them, while six are presented as they were originally published. It should be added, however, that there is a bibliographical updating at the end of each article, some quite lengthy. There follows a list of his 135 published works, beginning in 1949 and concluding with several which are in the press at the present time.

The work is divided into three major sections. "Moments of History" includes a variety of subjects from the early centuries of the Servite Order, Monte Senario, where the Order was founded, editions of the Constitutions, and reform movements. The second section, "Figures noteworthy for holiness, spirituality, and culture," features articles on the Seven Founders of the Servite Order, Blessed Joachim of Siena, Fra Ivo of Siena, Bernardino Ricciolini, who founded the Hermits of Monte Senario, Fulgenzio Micanzio, who is best known as the first biographer of Paolo Sarpi, and Angelo Maria Montorsoli, a post-Tridentine reformer. There is also his controversial article on St. Juliana Falconieri and his article on the correspondence between Servîtes and the Bollandists in the late

seventeenth century. The third section presents the lives and works of three Annalists of the Order: Arcangelo Giani in the seventeenth century, and two of Dal Pino's predecessors as Annalists in the present century: Alessio Rossi and Raffaello Taucci. The work concludes with a detailed name, place, and subject index (pp. 707-760).

The major importance of this work is the convenience of finding in one place articles published in different periodicals, some of which are difficult to locate. This reviewer found three contributions which by themselves warrant the rather high price of the book. The first is the first article in the book (pp. 3-67), which is entirely new. It presents for the first time a rapid summary of the history of the Servite Order from its foundation in the thirteenth century to 1431. Dal Pino had already studied quite exhaustively the first century of Servite history, from the foundation to its final papal approval in 1304. But in recent years his position as professor of medieval history at die University of Padua permitted him to direct talented students to investigate the 1300's, which up to the present had remained largely unexplored territory. Their research helped him to present, for the first time, a unified and continuous history of the Servîtes throughout the 1300's, the period of me Western Schism, and then up to the death of Martin V This new article is in Dal Pino's usual dense style, with numerous footnotes.

The second important article is on the Seven Holy Founders (pp. 449-526). This article appeared first as "Sette santi Fondatori" in the Dizionario degli Istituti di Perfezione,Yol.Ym (1988), cols. 1442-1453. But it has been entirely rewritten with copious footnotes which explain and document the information as found in the original article. It also makes much greater use of the central section of the Legenda de origine Ordinis. The final redaction of the Legenda de origine Ordinis is generally dated as about 1317, but recently historians have called attention to the central section, which is clearly by a different author. Dal Pino dates this central section "with all probability" to the period before the Second Council of Lyons (1274), that is, contemporary to the lives of the Founders themselves. In his doctoral dissertation at the University of Louvain (reviewed ante, LXIV [April, 1978], 302-305) and later publications he took up two of the challenges made by the Bollandists in 1940: the number and the names of the Founders. No Servite historian had had the courage to look objectively at those very delicate questions. Dal Pino concludes that although the number Seven is first found in the Legenda de origine Ordinis (the section dated 1317 ca.), it need not be interpreted merely as a symbolic number, but nevertheless must be used with caution. Only two of the names of the Founders (Bonfilius and Alexis) can be documented, and of the various later lists he prefers the earliest one, not the one used at their canonization in 1888. Furthermore, he rejects the family names of the Founders, suggested by later traditions, as being without historical foundation. One progression in his thought can be traced through the titles of his works: The traditional date of foundation is 1233, based on the Legenda de origine Ordinis. In his doctoral

dissertation (1972), however, this becomes at least questionable (1233 ca.) but now in later writings he clearly dates the beginning of the Order from the earliest extant documents, 1245/47. It might be hoped that Dal Pino's conclusions, shared by virtually all Servite historians and now easily available to all historians through publications such as the present one, will find their way into the general historical works which mention the Servîtes. Finally, the third great value of his new compilation is the lengthy and detailed index, which guides the reader so effectively through the various writings. This is a most important work for those interested in the history of medieval religious orders and their spirituality.

Conrad M. Borntrager, O.S.M.

Chicago, Illinois

Pie XII et la Seconde Guerre mondiale d'après les archives du Vatican. By Pierre Blet SJ. (Paris: Perrin. 1997. Pp. 342.)

The death of Pius XII on October 9, 1958, brought unanimous praise of his work for peace and relief of suffering during World War II. Jewish leaders repeated their thanks, which had started during the war itself and climaxed at its conclusion, for his unremitting efforts to save their people from extennination.

Publication of Rolf Hochhuth's play Der Stellvertreter in 1963 reversed this positive image. Overnight the Pope became the hero of a black legend who during the war stood mute and inactive, motivated either by political calculation or cowardice, in the face of bureaucratically planned mass murder which he could have ended with a single flaming protest.

Confronted with what he knew from his own close collaboration with Pius XII throughout the war to be a grave falsification of history, Paul VI in 1964 ordered the publication of everything in the Vatican Archives which could shed light on the actions of his wartime predecessor. An international team of four Jesuits, including the author of this book, produced twelve volumes between the years 1964 and 1981. As Blet writes in his foreword, however: "Fifteen years after the publication of the final volume many of those who speak or write about the Holy See during the war remain unaware of the contents of these volumes, or even of their existence." Blet's book is an attempt to make the record more widely known.

Drawing on the twelve volumes of Vatican documents, but also on published collections of documents from government archives on both sides, as well as on memoirs, articles, and monographs, Blet has produced a narrative history of the Holy See's wartime role. The account is largely devoid of commentary. Blet limits his interpretation to the minimum necessary for intelligibility. A footnote at the beginning of each chapter lists the sources for the material which follows.

The Pope's wartime policy was not neutrality (which could imply indifference) but impartiality, which enabled him to judge events and nations according to truth and justice. At times, however, he stretched impartiality to the limit: informing the British government in January, 1940, that a group of German generals was prepared to replace Hitler if they could be assured of an honorable peace, and warning Britain, France, and the Low Countries of Hitler's impending attack in May, 1940. Those communications were secret. Not so the Pope's telegrams of sympathy to the Belgian and Dutch sovereigns following Hitler's attack. When Mussolini threatened the Pope with "the gravest consequences" for this supposed breach of neutrality, Pius said that he was not afraid to go to a concentration camp and had had revolvers pointed at him before (as Nuncio in Munich in the 1920's). In the same interview the Pope said that he had wanted to speak words of "flaming protest" against the well-known Nazi atrocities in Poland. He had refrained only to spare the victims further suffering.

Following Hitler's attack on his erstwhile ally, Stalin, in June, 1941, the Pope refused repeated demands that he endorse a crusade against Bolshevism. And he assured American Catholics that while the previous papal condemnations of communist ideology remained in force, these need not limit support for the Soviet Union now invaded by a power whose leader, like Stalin, was the declared enemy of Christianity.

The desire to save as many victims as possible explains the Pope's public reserve. But he was not silent. His clearest protest came in his 1942 Christmas broadcast pleading for "those hundreds of thousands who, through no fault of their own but simply by reason of their nationality or race are marked for death or progressive destruction." Well understood at the time (the speech earned the enthusiastic praise of the New York Times and angry condemnation by the Nazis as "one long attack on everything we stand for"), these words are either unknown today, or simply ignored. Pius repeated this protest in his speech to the cardinals on June 2, 1943, protesting against those "destined for extermination simply because of their race or nationality." For those who wanted him to speak louder or more often, he added in the same speech that every one of his public words had "to be considered and weighed for its possible effect on those who are suffering."

Much of this book recounts the feverish and unremitting efforts of the Holy See, through its nuncios in the various countries, to save as many victims as possible. The archives report the attempts, seldom their results. Flaming public protests would have been counter-productive—as the Dutch bishops learned, to their sorrow, when their public protest against Nazi persecution of Jews in 1942 brought immediate acceleration of the deportations to Auschwitz. In a rare comment, Blet quotes the judgment of the Israeli historian Pinchas Lapide (in his 1967 book The Last Three Popes and the Jews) that Vatican diplomacy, pursued necessarily in secrecy and directed by Pius XII, saved 860,000 Jews from death. At the 1975 Holocaust conference in Hamburg Lapide told this reviewer that this figure was based on six months' research in the Yad Vashem

Holocaust archive in Jerusalem and added: "If the leaders of other churches had done only what Pius XII did, several hundred thousand more Jews might have survived the war."

Despite the dispassionate tone, the book has many dramatic high points. An English translation would be welcome. It is unlikely, however, to change many minds. Confident that they occupy the moral high ground, the critics of Pius XII have long since concluded that he is guilty as charged. They insist that his defenders prove a negative. How much of the unremitting clamor to "open the Vatican Archives" is motivated by the desire to pursue scientific history? How much comes from people unwilling to be moved by evidence or facts who wish to rummage at will until they find some document which, taken out of context or read without knowledge of the conditions under which it was written, supports the verdict rendered in advance: that Pius XII is co-responsible for the death of six million Jews? Until these questions are resolved the Holy See's caution seems fully justified.

John Jay Hughes

Archdiocese of St. Louis

Ancient

Lehrbuch der Geschichte der Alten Kirche. By Karl Suso Frank, with the collaboration of Elisabeth Grünbeck. (Paderborn: Ferdinand Schöningh. 1996. Pp.xxvü,476.DM98,-.)

This volume is Schöningh's most recent successor to the famous Kirchengeschichte by Karl Bihlmeyer that was revised by Hermann Tüchle after his death in 1942. Its more than 500 pages span the first six hundred years of Christianity in seventy-eight sections drawing from approximately 250 books, journals, and other publications in German, French, Italian, English, Spanish, Greek, and Latin. In short, it is an international bibliographical goldmine on the Early Church.

The introduction, which runs twenty-nine pages, sets out the whole study in relief. It briefly discusses methodology, defines terms of the study, and reviews the multiple sources that will be used: chronicles (East and West), the earliest church historians, conciliar and papal documents, the massive body of secondary literature, and an equally vast collection of lexicological, canonical, liturgical, and hagiological references in many languages.

The text itself is divided simply into two parts: from the origins to Constantine and the Church in the Roman Empire from late Antiquity to the early Middle Ages. A ten-page name and issue index and a list of the popes and the Roman and Byzantine emperors into the seventh century complete the text.

The final division of the volume (XI) will probably be most helpful for the beginning scholar of the Early Church. It reviews by author the theological literature of both the Greek and Latin Church, and concludes with two final sections that concentrate on the writings of the sixth and seventh centuries, especially in North Africa, Italy, Gaul, and Spain.

This volume is impressively documented, and is about as complete as any one-volume church history covering six centuries could ever be expected to be. And it is genuinely interesting! There are biographical sketches of key personalities, descriptions of major councils and synods, overviews of movements (heretical and otherwise), explanations of major conflicts, and discussions of social and liturgical life and of women in the early Christian communities. Especially helpful are the various lists of key events and dates (Datenübersichten) that the author gives regularly throughout the text to highlight and summarize his treatment of particularly complicated epochs in the Church's history.

This is truly a Lehrbuch for grasping especially the history of the Great Church down to the early Middle Ages. Anyone who is at home with a German text will find this volume an enormous help in understanding the dynamics of those early centuries of Christianity. Professor Frank and Dr. Grünbeck have truly achieved a superb volume, and the publishing house Schöningh has again confirmed its reputation for producing premier volumes in church history.

Ray R. Noll

University of San Francisco

From Death to Rebirth: Ritual and Conversion in Antiquity. By Thomas M. Finn. (New York: Paulist Press. 1997. Pp. v, 286. $19.95 paperback.)

One of the weaknesses with much writing about the history of early Christian practices is that parallels in Judaism—and still more those in paganism—are often overlooked, or given scant treatment, frequendy consisting of a few broad generalizations that fail to do justice to the rich complexity of those traditions. Why anyone should imagine that Christian practices demand carefully nuanced treatment for their proper understanding while those of other religions can easily be comprehended in several simple sentences is a puzzle. However, this is not a charge that can be made about Thomas Finn's latest book. On the contrary, its greatest strength is that it devotes approximately half the volume to an exploration of the phenomenon of conversion in Greco-Roman paganism and in ancient Judaism, being highly sensitive to the varieties of forms that this could take in any tradition. Obviously, since it is a work aimed at a broad readership, there are inevitably some points where specialized scholarship might have liked to see an even more detailed consideration of some aspect of the subject, but the vast majority of readers will find what is here greatly

muminating and be very satisfied with both content and style. For that reason, the book will serve well as a college or seminary textbook.

The second half of the book naturally turns to an examination of conversion within the early Christian tradition, from the first century to the fourth. And here I detect a significant change of mode. The material becomes more descriptive and less analytical. The author prefers to tell the stories of particular converts (in some cases, imaginary; in others, historical figures) rather than examine in any detail the phenomenon of conversion and its varied forms and manifestations in early Christianity. One looks in vain, even in the conclusion, for the sort of analysis of the subject so clearly laid out in the introduction and opening chapter of the book. There are only brief observations here and there. In particular, it was disappointing not to find a discussion of the changing role played by the initiatory rituals of Christianity in the Constantinian era, as they evolved from being primarily an outward expression of a profound change that was already taking place within the candidate to become instead highly theatrical means of inducing some such experience in candidates who were often not so highly motivated as their predecessors had been. One might also observe an apparent lack of acquaintance with the important work of Michel Dujarier on the early catechumenate, and note the presence of the occasional factual error, most notably the claim that at Jerusalem preparation for baptism began on Epiphany rather than at the beginning of Lent (p. 196).

I am sure that very many readers (and teachers) will appreciate and enjoy the more biographical approach taken to the subject in this second half, but I believe that the shortcomings I have outlined detract from what could have been a much more profound and valuable study which Professor Finn is certainly capable of writing.

Paul Bradshaw

University of Notre Dame

The Burden of the Flesh: Fasting and Sexuality in Early Christianity. By Teresa M. Shaw. (Minneapolis: Fortress Press. 1998. Pp. xii, 298. $27.00 paperback.)

Teresa Shaw explores a topic not always approached with either sympathy or style, and she offers both in abundance. The book is beautifully written, clear in its detail, and soundly structured. It is marked at every turn by shrewdness and respect.

Neither her interest nor her approach is entirely novel. She has followed consciously and explicitly in the steps of Aline Rousselle, for example, and Peter Brown. What she adds to the debate, however, is more than polish. Her own words signal her breadth of reference: "Arguments concerning the effects of diet on the condition of the body and the soul interweave with eschatological

images . . . , with instructions for the daily practice of female chastity and with the theological interpretation of creation, embodiment and gender" (p. 2). The insistent awareness, in particular, of human origins and final destiny colored every facet of early Christian experience. As the author puts it, in perhaps the best part of her book, "Ascetic discipline looks back to the garden and forward to the kingdom" (p. 163). It is such a gathering of threads from practical (particularly medical) endeavor, from the formulae of faith, and from scriptural exegesis that gives the book its distinctive authority. While the focus is on fasting, one is reminded constantly of implications elsewhere.

The range of Dr. Shaw's allusions (which reach back to Hesiod) is harnessed always to a clear-sighted understanding of enduring human anxieties. Herein lies her sympathy. Her patient and illuminating analysis of texts depends always on taking seriously the motives of those who wrote them. She has no wish to impose a modern sense of outrage or 'correctness' on ancient practice. While explanations remain strange to us, the urgent response to experience is instantly recognizable. Above all, Dr. Shaw rejects the glib assumption that we witness in this period the dethroning of classical rationalism.

To appeal, however, to Hesiod, Plutarch, Galen, or Porphyry is not to deny that Christians gave a specific twist to long-standing traditions. Their apparent preoccupation with sex has absorbed scholars for some time; but here we have a firmer step forward in explaining that focus. The question can be posed, whether Christian virginity represented a refinement of tradition, making explicit a latent concern, or whether, nervous about sexuality on other grounds, Christians visited upon an inherited tradition an extraneous fascination. Dr. Shaw would argue that neither question quite hits the mark. The biblical myth of the Fall echoes, without merely aping, a sense of loss already abroad in the ancient world. Christianity did not originate people's willingness to blame on that primal disappointment whatever they found unnerving or distasteful in their current experience. What is remarkable about the Christian version, as Dr. Shaw shows, is the optimism inspired by the body: a gendered enveloping of the flesh entirely capable of untainted union in the lost paradise, and destined to regain that poise and harmony in the final days.

'Gender' is all, for men were as involved as women in those losses and redemptions. Unfortunately, as we now know well, it is hard to discover what women thought about such matters. Neither their pain nor their wisdom is easily accessible. The accounts provided by men, however, stylized and insensitive though they may be, did subvert a traditional way of looking at women's lives. They may also tell us something about men. 'Sexuality' in this book does mean women's sexuality; and one might ask whether this privileging of the female arena has not skewed the picture, has not obscured what women shared with men in ascetic culture. The imperfection of the female body, the intricacies of its warm, wet structure, certainly fed the urge to fast; but men fasted also, and was that not, for all their contrasting 'normality,' something to do with their passion, their bodies, their sex? Clearly, by Dr. Shaw's detailed admission, yes. Men

and women were also thrown together by their very strictness of régime. They formed together an élite. Their principles could be applied, in theory, as obligations upon all believers: even the command to fast. By the very sophistication of their arguments, however, both sexes found themselves distanced from other lay people—an eventual outcome, perhaps, rather than an immediate purpose. How could they now reach back across the divide? The question arose even in the narrower field of virginity and marriage, and arose for men as well as women. These are issues that Dr. Shaw addresses less directly.

Where she triumphs is in the link already referred to, the link between body and soul. She is soundly reluctant "to ignore the role of bodily behaviors in religious expression and self-definition" (p. 19): "It is to presume upon the ancients to suggest that ascetic practice was distinct from the nurturing of the soul" (p. 23). The resulting need to 'interweave' rescues the book from becoming a mere catalogue of praxis. Dr. Shaw's starting point is the medical amalgam of technique and philosophy. The heroine here, as it were, is Galen's body—"delicately balanced and vulnerable to any change of regimen" (p. 63)—which carries us directly, in Christian terms, to the asceticism of precariousness so vividly developed by Evagrius and Cassian. There were implications both within and beyond the individual. "The power of medicine"—and here the author quotes Helen King—"lies in its ability to make the social appear natural" (p. 65). Hence, diagnosis and healing, whether by doctor or by ascetic master, affected every attempt to link society and nature (Bryan Turner is well used here). Ascetics adopted a social style, among themselves and vis-à-vis others, designed to reflect and underpin a fresh sense of what was 'natural.' To behave was to define. Meanwhile, within the individual, a symbiosis of the visible and the reflective ran counter to any distinction between the 'active' and the 'contemplative' life. At one stroke, many of the dichotomies cherished by students of asceticism are rendered obsolete: not merely 'flesh' and 'spirit' but self-discipline and pastoral concern, desert and city, learning and simplicity, the celibate and the familial.

Given her focus on the body and on theories of fulfillment, Dr. Shaw might have given fuller attention to the resurrection. It is true that all the Christian writers she brings before us placed the body within a continuum that ran from creation to final glory. Yet a particular understanding of the resurrection could serve to distinguish, say, Evagrius from Jerome, who demanded a radical transformation of the body, a transformation that Origenists might elide. He feared (perhaps unfairly) the acceptance of a gradual spiritualization, and demanded instead the literal but contingent intrusion of God's triumph over death and corruption. This is but one example of Dr. Shaw's occasional readiness to transcend such variety, preferring to suggest a shared solution to the problems of embodiment. That may have made it easier for her to leave out Ambrose and Augustine, so vigorous in their analyses of creation and judgment. Ascetics and their champions were prepared to label some approaches right and others wrong—offering opinions as bewildering as modern advice on diet and exercise. Indeed, disagreement affected the classical tradition more broadly. It is important that the Platonic tripartite theory of the soul triumphed over Stoic

conceptions, affecting the understanding of passion and control. Dr. Shaw describes excellently the Platonist belief that passions could be used to the soul's good; a belief crucial to the Christian moral canon, and to the collaborative model of body and soul. Yet less integrated theories persisted, even in Christian circles, and played their part in maintaining tensions and exaggerations within ascetic society. The theorization of gluttony was also partial. For Cassian, it is true, "gluttony and sexual lust are further distinguished [from other 'evil thoughts'] because they exist naturally in human beings, they both require an external object of desire, and they are both consummated in a bodily act" (p. 146). Thus they fit tidily together in Dr. Shaw's analysis. But not everyone saw gluttony as "the mother of all vice" (p. 129). Pride, to some, could seem equally important, equally characteristic of the Fall: the root of embodiment and all its pain; the price of disobedience.

None of that can detract, however, from the freshness and verve of the book. Dr. Shaw is lucid, erudite, and provoking of thought; and The Burden of the Flesh will qualify inescapably much that we have too lazily taken for granted.

Philip Rousseau

The Catholic University of America

Early Christian Women and Pagan Opinion. The Power of the Hysterical Woman. By Margaret Y. MacDonald. (New York: Cambridge University Press. 1996. Pp. xiv, 276. $54.95 hardback; $1995 paperback.)

Feminist books have been appearing recendy in great numbers, and they vary in quality. Those that deal with Christian history are mostly respectable scholarly books, and many of them rank among enduring academic achievements. This one can be called a "feminist" book only because its topic is early Christian women; otherwise it is a serious historical-exegetical study. The author, who is teaching in the religious studies department of the University of Ottawa (Canada), has previously published an essay on the Pauline and Deutero-Pauline churches and several articles in scholarly journals on early Christian women. She must have received the inspiration for the present book from these earlier studies, which she successfully incorporated in her new book. Nothing is wrong with this procedure; on the contrary, it gives the reader the assurance that the book is based on long, careful research.

The book consists of three major components. First, there is a lengthy review of cultural-anthropologists' and sociologists' works pertaining to the author's topic. This part is a very interesting and informative review of what cross-cultural studies can do to make us better understand women's place in ancient societies. The concepts of "honor" (associated with males) and "shame" (= reputation, associated with females) are discussed in detail. Then we are told that to clearly understand women's situation we must be aware of the concepts of

"public" (male) and "private" (female) "power" and "authority"—all of which is explained thoroughly. But when we come to the statement that to understand women's lives more attention should be given to "chronological, geographical, and even architectural variation" (p. 37), one begins to wonder just how far this scholarly hairsplitting should go. Do we have to define first what the meaning of "is" is before we can talk about early Christian women?

The second major topic of the book is the pagans' reaction to early Christian women. This topic (pagan reaction to Christianity) has been adequately researched by many scholars, and Mrs. MacDonald knows them aU and duly quotes them. But ancient society was not as aware of the blessings of diversity ("divided we stand, united we faU") as some in modern America are, and references specificaUy to women are rare; most ancient authors deal with Christianity as a strange phenomenon and not with male and female Christians. There are some references to women within the everyday situations of Ufe, and the author makes the most of sharpening these images. In the correspondence of Pliny with Trajan there is only one brief reference to female slaves, but this is a good enough Anknüpfungspunkt from which we can go into the discussion of other issues, such as the communal meal, the nomen ipsum, etc. Similar is the situation with respect to the other pagan authors (Fronto, Apuleius, Lucían, Galen, Celsus). The lack of sufficient references to women in these texts leaves the field wide open to speculation. For example, in connection with the imprisonment of Peregrinus, Lucían says that near the prison "aged widows and orphan children could be seen waiting" (p. 74). What did these widows do there? Mrs. MacDonald concludes that they were probably praying and standing guard (p. 76), a totally logical hypothesis; but what if they were just waiting to visit the prisoners? It is in the book of Celsus that the expression "hysterical women," which our author uses as the subtitle of this book, first occurs (to characterize the women who discovered the resurrection). Celsus also serves as the source for discussions of the birth of Jesus, female foUowers of Jesus, witchcraft, and related topics.

The third major component of this book is the author's original research on Pauline and post-Pauline churches. Here we find detaUed analyses of 1 Cor. 7:1, Timothy 5:3-16, 1 Peter 3:1-6, and some later writings. The author views some of these passages as Christian responses to pagan opinion and offers valuable insights into problems such as marriage, ceUbacy, mixed marriages (pagan-Christian), and other issues related to women's Uves within the early Church.

Those interested in women's studies wiU, of course, welcome this book, but any student of the early Church wiU learn from it. Apart from the author's tendency to repeat herself and to use first person singular too UberaUy, this is a good book for scholars and lay people alike.

Stephen Benko

Sonoma, California

Sacred Fictions: Holy Women and Hagiography in Late Antiquity. By Lynda L. Coon. [The Middle Ages Series.] (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press. 1997. Pp. xxiii, 228. $39.95.)

The study of the saints has undergone a renaissance in the past twenty years, and a considerable amount of this effort has focused on the vitae of female saints. For example, this ambitious study, Sacred Fictions: Holy Women and Hagiography in Late Antiquity, might be profitably read alongside John Kitchen's, Saint's Lives and the Rhetoric of Gender (Oxford, 1998), both of which examine identical subjects. Dr. Coon's chief focus is on selected biographies of Christian women composed both in the east and in the west from 400 to 700. She reads these sacred biographies as theological texts that "exploited biblical rhetoric to empower and bridle sacred portraits of women." While her readings are often iUuminating, exegetical might better reflect her actual method since there is little actual theological study in these pages. Her book has six chapters: the first three chapters treat broad thematic issues (e.g., a review of the genre of sacred biography; gender and the Bible; rhetoric and the use of cloüüng in hagiographies) and three chapters discuss eight female vitae, viz., Saints Pelagia of Antioch, Mary of Egypt, Helena Augusta; Jerome's Life of Paula; the anonymous life of Melania the Younger; and finally Saints Monegund, Radegund, and Balthild. The subjects are well known, and the scope of the study is broad. The bibliography is extensive, the notes judicious and a useful resource.

Her study is a close reading of these texts illustrating their dependence on biblical models, and how those models were transformed by their historical situations, e.g., Baudonivia's depiction of St. Radegund's duty to her household is read as a motif designed to limit the saint's authority and thus satisfy the expectations of her seventh-century audience. Coon identifies three paradigms prominent in female sacred biographies: the repentant hermit, the philanthropist, and the cloistered nun. She suggests that the vitae contain the universalist message that if these holy women (all daughters of Eve, who brought death into the world) can so transform themselves, then there is hope for all. Coon makes much of the Old Eve/New Eve Virgin Mary as a typological foundation in female saints' lives. Her traditional reading of these vitae would have been more nuanced if she had not applied this binary model so rigorously.

Coon argues that these texts represent women as alienated from God because of gender, and holiness consists of combating this alienating female self. She derives this negative paradigm of the alienated female from the Bible. While generalizations are powerful epistemological tools, they may obscure the complexity of historical circumstance. It is worth underlining (Coon does recognize other depictions) that there are a number of autonomous, virtuous, heroic female rulers depicted in the Old Testament (e.g., the political leader Deborah, the Macabbean mother, the charismatic and loyal Ruth, the heroic and daring Judith, Susanna, and there is even a hint of messianism surrounding the figure of

Queen Esther) who were well known and celebrated by medieval hagiographers (see for example, The Martyrdom, of Pionius, Polycarp, Marian and fames, and The Life of St. Eustachius etc.).

It would have helped this reader, if, in Dr. Coon's discussions of hagiographie reconstructions of biblical texts—for example, in the correspondences with King Solomon and the Queen of Sheba in the Life of Pelagia the Harlot—she explained in more detail precisely what she means by "reconstruction." Is a reconstructed passage obvious by virtue of a verbal parallel, direct quotation, echo, allusion, a non-verbal typology, etc.? Further, while these reconstructions might have been apparent to a learned contemporary, would they have been recognized by less learned contemporary listeners, and if so how did the texts' authors manage that?

I would recommend this volume to those interested in the study of female sacred biography. It is a solid study of broad and heterogeneous textual traditions; it proposes interesting readings of female vitae, and illustrates the richness of these documents.

Thomas J. Heffernan

University of Tennessee, Knoxville

Medieval

Varieties of Religious Conversion in the Middle Ages. Edited by James Muldoon. (Gainesville: University Press of Florida. 1997. Pp. vü, 208. $49.95.)

The subject of this important anthology is conversion to Latin Christianity from alien cults, mainly between the fifth and the fifteenth centuries. The one exception to the rule is an essay by Father Leonard R Hindsley, O.P, about conversio monástica, the spiritual progress of the Dominican nun, Margaret Ebner, through obedience to the discipline of her order. The nine collaborators have provided independent variations on the theme of conversion, each with its own foci of place and time. Two Qohn Howe, on the creation of a sacred topography of shrines, churches, and other sacredly taboo spaces as Europe assimilated Christianity; and Jonathan Elukin, on the suspicion of hidden or impending apostasy which haunted Jewish converts) span the entire period and gather materials from all over the map. The rest are studies on discreet events or texts, predominantly from the thirteenth and fourteenth centuries.

The extraordinary wealth of learning mustered into the volume unfolds to display articles on papal evangelistic missions to the Far East, the criss-crossing of religious borders in the Crusader states of the Levant, dilatory flirtations with which pagan Lithuania long tantalized the Teutonic Knights, literary recreations by Scandinavian writers of conversions which occurred centuries earlier, and the agonized, spiritual eroticism of a bed-ridden nun in an obscure corner of Germany.

The three articles—all by women—grouped together under the heading, "Women in Conversion History," concern different subjects (from Merovingian Gaul to England and France in the waning Middle Ages). They have in common the proposition, imported from literary criticism, that, until recent times, articulating historical narrative was a privilege of dominant male elites. This valuable accent on historical narrative as an assertion of power allows a reflection on the admittedly limited homogeneity of Fragestellungen in the contributions to this volume.

The facts that three out of the four female collaborators took up the theme that narrative expressed the class values of die narrator (including gendered ones), and that none of the seven male contributors adopted this perspective, open the way to other observations: that (with one exception) all the contributors received tiieir professional training in the United States, that (with one exception) all of tiiose professionally trained in the United States were educated in die northeastern corridor (where most still live), and uiat (with two exceptions) all have appointments in university posts. Unfortunately, I am unable to establish a generational profile of the collaborators. However, the limited homogeneity of Fragestellungen in the splendidly varied articles displays one common preoccupation of academic historians in North America during recent years, of which the importation from literary criticism, particularly from feminist criticism, is one sign.

At least before the Reformation, Christian tiieologians agreed that conversion was a miracle wrapped up in the mystery of baptism. The seven historians and two linguists who collaborated to make this anthology run to political experience, rather than to miracle or mystery. Politics is the universal common denominator: in the rearrangement of habitat, with shrines, churches, and other sacred sites; in marriage (particularly dynastic alliances) as a device for winning kings and their peoples to Christianity; in the machinations of regional and trans-continental diplomacy. The same common denominator governs studies of historical writing, portrayed as exercises in dominance over the recorded memories of events as well as over events themselves, dominance by which ruling male elites edited out "historyless classes" of women and inferior social orders.

Only one contributor (Russell, in an essay on Augustine of Hippo which is plainly the result of long, mature reflection) alludes to the supernatural character of conversion. Even he moves from the exalted theology in Augustine's reflections on his own journey away from and back to God to the brutal politics in Augustine's call for imperial persecution of the Donatists.

To be sure, the theological perspective also gave conversion a political cast. For, whether as spiritual or as social re-assimilation, conversion was transgressive. It required a transgression, a breaking of boundaries easily recognizable as opposition, covert subversion, or overt rebellion. Augustine's controversy with the Donatists demonstrated that conversion could be a political transgression in crossing boundaries, not only between Christianity and alien cults, but also between professed Christianities.

If a major objective of this collaborative volume was to "unpack"—i.e., recover—medieval concepts of conversion (p. 3), I cannot see that that objective has been achieved. For none of the authors actually attempts to recover medieval ways of thinking about conversion.

In the literature of which I am aware, conversion was a turning of the heart ablaze with insatiable passion, from evil to good. To "unpack" medieval concepts of conversion, modern investigators would need, at least, to admit into their narratives inner conflicts of raw emotion, morality illuminated by consuming, inextinguishable fires, and consciences wounded, made wary, and toughened in warfare against seducer spirits. To reconstruct medieval ideas of conversion, investigators would need to take account of such counter-rational matters as these, almost entirely absent from Varieties of Conversion, as well as two disciplines equally absent: ecclesiology and theology. The supernatural—including mystery and miracle—would have to be allowed at least cameo appearances. And somewhere, not necessarily on the fringe of the action, an epistemology postulating absolute Truth, would have to have a speaking role.

Each article has its own considerable merits. The excellence of the collection as a whole does not lie in exposing the dynamics of faith as they were conceived long ago. Instead, it consists in establishing conversion at the nucleus of an enduring mentality in western European culture, the rationale underlying both its never fulfilled quest for redemption and its remorseless consecration of suffering, inflicted and endured, in the prodigal son's homeward journey.

Karl F. Morrison

Rutgers University—New Brunswick

Liborius: Brückenbauer Europas: Die mittelalterlichen Viten und Translattonsberichte. By Volker de Vry. (Paderborn: Ferdinand Schöningh. 1997. Pp. xviii,382.88DM.)

To commemorate the alleged 1600th anniversary of the death of Bishop (St.) Liborius of Le Mans, whose body was translated to Paderborn in 836, the bishop, chapter, and city of Paderborn underwrote the lavish publication of Völker de Vry's 1996 dissertation from Albert-Ludwigs-Universität at Freiburg im Breisgau (directed by Hubert Mordek). The production values are extraordinary. The photographs, usually of excellent quality, include eighty-nine reproductions, many in full color, of pages of the major manuscripts and incunabula. This book is a bargain for students of paleography! There are also fifteen images of Liborius and his reliquaries and even eleven pictures of scholars who have examined the dossier.

This is the first comprehensive study of Liborius materials to systematicaUy survey the manuscript evidence. After presenting what Uttle is known about the historical Liborius and his cult prior to the 836 translation to Paderborn, De Vry analyzes, in individual chapters, the parallel translation accounts. Then he edits the vita and translatio (Bibliotheca Hagiographica Latina 4912-4913) written by the "Paderborn Anonymous" who was commissioned by Bishop Biso at some point between 888 and 909. De Vry inventories many minor late medieval Latin and vernacular Liborius texts. He offers a seventy-two-page descriptive catalog of "Manuscripta Liboriana" as weU as other useful indexes. He even itemizes his unsuccessful initiatives, specifying aU the libraries where he made mquiries, aU the places where he examined manuscripts, and all the research strategies he employed.

How does this magnum opus advance our knowledge of the dossier of Liborius? Everyone will welcome the critical edition of the "Paderborn Anonymous," the most widely distributed version of the legend and the major source for the early history of the Diocese of Paderborn. The last complete edition was pubUshed by the BoUandists in 1727. De Vry's industry has added to the dossier a great many manuscript witnesses, albeit largely late medieval ones.

Yet this book wiU not end all debates. Historians have been most interested in the materials related to the translation of the relics of Liborius to Paderhorn. Are the surviving translationes relatively independent parallel accounts? Or do they depend on a common literary ancestor? How do they relate to the Le Mans forgeries, a group of hagiographical and legal concoctions less famous than the roughly contemporary Pseudo-Isidorian decretals? The best survey of these problems in EngUsh is Walter Goffart's "The Literary Adventures of St. Liborius: A Postscript to the Le Mans Forgeries," in Analecta Bollandiana, 87 (1969). Goffart's elaborate stemma for the dossier explains the unity of the tradition, but at the cost of postulating at least two lost versions. De Vry offers a simpler reconstruction based upon the work of some German predecessors, which, in part by rejecting one of the alleged ninth-century witnesses as a fifteenth-century compendium, features relatively independent (suspiciously?) paraUel texts. This review is not the place to analyze the stylistic shifts and textual borrowings upon which such reconstructions depend, but there appears to be room for further discussion.

Quibbles are possible. The organization involves redundancies. Not everyone will reUsh the way De Vry traces each debate from the Renaissance to the present before offering his own conclusions. He might have used BHL numbers more consistently. The general index has omissions: for example, the page references for Goffart miss pp. 71-73 and 106-107.

John Howe

Texas Tech University

Byzantine Magic. Edited by Henry Maguire. (Washington, D.C: Dumbarton Oaks Research Library and Collection. Distributed by Harvard University Press, Cambridge, Massachusetts. 1995. Pp. vii, 187. $30.00.)

The essays collected here were originally delivered at a colloquium held at Dumbarton Oaks in 1993, when magic was in the air. Valerie Flint's The Rise of Magic in Early Medieval Europe (Oxford, 1991) had come out two years previously to considerable acclaim, while S. J. Tambiah provided an anthropological perspective in the shape of his Magic, Science, Religion and the Scope of Rationality (Cambridge, 1990). Byzantine Magic was the response on the part of Dumbarton Oaks. The result is a bit of a ragbag, with no clear unifying themes, but with interesting individual papers. Henry Maguire's "Magic and the Christian Image" (pp. 51-71) has the distinction of bringing out the magical properties of Christian images, an aspect of the iconoclast controversy which tends to be downplayed. The interest of this piece is increased because it fits neatly into the pattern noted by Flint in her work on western Christendom. Her theme was the way Christianity was enriched by its willingness to absorb local practices and beliefs, which in the process were given Christian meaning. This, however, produced difficulties over authenticity: who and what was holy or unholy? A. Kazhdan tackles this problem in "Holy and Unholy miracle workers" (pp. 73-82). He challenges the orthodox view that "unholy magic causes death, confusion, sexual misbehaviour; holy miracles are creative, healing, and reviving." It was never as clear as this. The Byzantines found it difficult to draw a clear line between the holy and the unholy, between the natural and the supernatural. These were problems that still remained unresolved in the twelfth century when they troubled the historian Nicetas Chômâtes—as intelligent and objective an observer as Byzantium produced. This fits with a "Kazhdian" theme: Byzantine ambivalence. Other contributors seem to take their cue from Kazhdan. John Duffy (pp. 83-95) points to the embarrassment produced by the academic study of the occult. This had been made possible by Michael Psellos's rediscovery of the Chaldaean Oracles and allied texts which he brought back "almost from the dead." Psellos's stance on the occult was informed by his general attitude toward the Neoplatonic tradition. He made the right noises about pagan mumbo-jumbo, but he justified his interest by pointing to similarities with the Christian mystical tradition. This Duffy then contrasts with Michael Italikos's far more cautious and dismissive attitude toward the same material in the next century. But what was he doing studying it in the first place? In much the same way that Michael Italikos was embarrassed by the occult, so the canon lawyer Balsamon found it difficult to come to terms with popular beliefs and customs, as M. T. Fögen demonstrates (pp. 99-1 15). She rounds off her study of Balsamon with a comparison between the treatment of magical practices in the fourth and the fourteenth century. The best that can be said is that a comparison over a thousand years is not that helpful, especially when some of the most important material on magic and popular customs has been neglected. It is a shame that nobody thought to comment on the investigations into popular customs and beliefs attributed to Michael Psellos. These have been used since

the seventeenth century by those interested in Greek folklore, but there is still no proper study of these texts, which remains a desideratum. Their style suggests that they did come from Psellos's pen, but his authorship must remain in doubt now that the treatises on demonology originally attributed to him are no longer so.

The one substantial contribution to the volume is R. P. H. Greenfield's survey of Palaeologan Magic (pp. 117-153)· Whereas for earlier periods there is surprisingly little material on magic, for the last centuries of Byzantium there is a wealth of material available, including court cases involving magic, which come from the Patriarchal Register. Greenfield's aim is to provide "an overview of the great range and variety that clearly existed in the Byzantine magical spectrum." In his conclusion he returns to the theme of Byzantine ambivalence, which in this field he sees as the result of the complicated relationship which existed "between the central Christian orthodoxy and the peripheral semi-Christian (or actually non-Christian) elements of belief and practice." Most Byzantines were uninterested or even incapable of recognizing "distinctions between religion and magic." This is a potentially very rich seam, which Byzantinists have scarcely started to tap.

A final piece on Magic in Slavia Orthodoxa (pp. 155-177) is interesting in itself but it probably ought to have appeared in a different collection of essays. It only underlines the bittiness of this volume. One has to accept the hit-and-miss character of conference proceedings. Sometimes it is better if they are not published. This volume at least draws attention not only to the need for a proper study of Byzantine magic, but also to the difficulties that this will present.

Michael Angold

University of Edinburgh

Relics, Prayer, and Politics in Medieval Venetia: Romanesque Painting in the Crypt of Aquileia Cathedral. By Thomas E. A. Dale. (Princeton: Princeton University Press. 1997. Pp. xiv, 179; VIII color plates, and 160 black-and-white figures. $79.50.)

The cathedral of Aquileia is one of the oldest in Christendom with foundations and a floor mosaic that go back to the Constantinian era. Today, the church is perhaps best known for a glorious array of frescoes in its medieval crypt, some of which are often cited as prime examples of Byzantine influence in the Italian mainland. Past scholarship has tended to focus on sources for the style and iconography of these paintings. This excellent book by Thomas Dale is much indebted to previous research but it goes far beyond earlier studies to elucidate the complex and intriguing context of this decorative program. Dale is primarily concerned with what he terms "typological, spiritual and political messages." In a sober, reasoned, and highly organized manner he carefully

analyzes multiple aspects of the pictorial ensemble in order to show how the crypt and its decoration were designed "to amplify both the religious and poUtical functions of the relics" of Aquileia's founding bishop and martyr Hermagoras.

The book is divided into eight chapters, a conclusion, and two appendixes, foUowed by ample notes and a detailed bibUography The first three chapters investigate the historical background, the architectural setting, and issues of style, dating, and general meaning. The next three chapters consider different parts of the figurai program, including iconic images and a narrative cycle. The last two chapters concern the significance of a fictive curtain in the dado zone and a wide range of framing ornament. The first appendix provides an extensive catalogue of the iconography in each scene whUe the second appendix quotes and comments on the earUest description of the crypt paintings from the eighteenth century. The text is accompanied by numerous illustrations, a few in color, that are, for the most part, weU reproduced.

For Dale, the crypt and its frescoes must be considered in connection with Aquileia's claim of primacy in the region as an apostolic foundation through an alleged mission of Saint Mark the Evangelist and the consecration as bishop of Mark's disciple, Hermagoras, by Saint Peter. Dale is certainly correct to date the vaulted hall crypt to the early eleventh century and not to two centuries before, as some have suggested. The crypt's architectural typology makes this clear as does the fact that under Patriarch Poppo (1019-1042) the relics of the founding bishop were retrieved from neighboring Grado where they had resided since the time of the Lombard invasions. The preserved frescoes, however, represent a second layer of painting added, according to this study, by Patriarch Ulrich II (1 161 - l 182). Again, this marked a period, however brief, when Aqufleia's claim to episcopal primacy in the region was recognized by both Venice and Grado. Dale shows how these political tensions help to explain both the subject and arrangement of much of the painted program. Yet equally important is the Uturgical function of these images as "visual prayers." Here decorative schemes of Byzantine churches and their icons were freely adapted to enhance the majesty of intercessory themes and the pathos of scenes of Christ's Passion. Thus, in keeping with the pioneering theories of Meyer Schapiro and Ernst Kitzinger, differences in style are not attributed to different artists but to the same group of local artists using different styUstic modes depending upon the type of image being rendered. Particularly intriguing is his contention that the Uvely, and thoroughly Western, outline drawings of misceUaneous figures in the dado curtains are intended to comment on the more didactic and devotional images above.

Although some of the author's arguments must remain speculative, this study is a fine example of a relatively new and growing trend in the study of medieval art that attempts to consider works in the context of their function in the soci-

ety that produced them. The many facets of this book and its broad impUcations should be of interest to anyone interested in the rich cultural, historical, and religious matrix of medieval Italy.

Charles B. McClendon

Brandeis University

Wayward Monks and the Religious Revolution of the Eleventh Century. By PhyLUs G. Jestice. [Brill's Studies in InteUectual History, Volume 76.] (Leiden: Brill. 1997. Pp. x, 309. $115.00.)

Dr. Jestice has written a provocative and wide-ranging examination of monastic reform, the role of some monastics in the Church reform of the eleventh century, and the emergence within Benedictine monasticism of some new ideas about monastic spirituaUty and an expanded role of monks and ascetics in the world. Yet, readers should be warned that the rigor and clarity of Ms. Jestice's argumentation waxes and wanes, she often does not cite the most current scholarship, and the book contains some topographical as well as factual errors.

The book contains an introduction, a conclusion, and seven chapters, which form the body of the text. Jestice begins her introduction with a statement of her main argument that "the driving force behind monastic reform was the issue of monks' active involvement in the world." She addresses the "state of the question" and explains how she intends to provide "an alternative theory on how and why monastic life diversified in the eleventh and twelfth centuries." For this "alternative theory" she offers an altered orientation, choosing to focus on the German empire including Italy during the tenth and eleventh centuries.

The first three chapters provide a topical overview of the worldly and spiritual dimensions of monasticism in the tenth century (chap. 1), investigate the changing notion of monastic mission and new interpretations of the concept of stabilitas (chap. 2), and examine recluses as the links between monks, stabUity, and monastic work in the world (chap. 3). While these chapters present the essential background of emerging ideas, one has to question how widespread some of them were within the broad range of monasticism in the empire. Moreover, the author underestimates the use of monasteries in imperial missionary activity in the tenth century (e.g., St. Maurice, Corvey, and probably Memleben) and perhaps overestimates the number and impact of recluses on monks.

Chapters 4 and 5 address monks and monastic reform in the early eleventh century. This reviewer found these chapters to be the most uneven and least rigorous in the book. The first sections of chapter 4 suffer from over-generaUzations and lack of focus, whereas the last three sections present interesting ideas

and relatively solid scholarship. One senses that Ms. Jestice ptishes her hagiographical sources too hard and thus portrays a Benedictinism that was on the verge of collapse from the number of monks about to stream out the doors. Much of this literature indeed does demonstrate a growing diversity of thought and opinions, but the author seems to overstate her case. Concerning the Vita Haimeradi Ms. Jestice should have read the more recent articles by Hagen Keller (1972) and Karl Leyser (1994). Chapter 5 focuses on the role of abbots William of St. Bénigne, Richard of St. Vanne, and Poppo of Stavelot/Lorsch in monastic reform. It places an inordinate emphasis on these men and gives only passing credence to more conventional monastic reformers, such as Godehard of Niederaltaich. Ms. Jestice strongly criticizes previous scholarship without really offering a better alternative concerning the reform interventions of these men, and she overlooks the important article of Hubertus Seibert (1991). More problematic, however, Ms. Jestice makes two serious errors of content and interpretation in this chapter. Berge (pp. 182-183) was not "reformed" by Alfkerus of Pöhlde, but rather, with Archbishop Tagino's license, it was transformed from a monastery into a canonry! Moreover, regarding St. Emmeram (p. 184), Bishop Gebhard certainly did not try to "reform" St. Emmeram, but rather tried to make more worldly use of its resources as an episcopal proprietary monastery (see Christine Rädlinger-Prömper [1987], C. Stephen Jaeger [1985], and a careful reading of Arnold of St. Emmeram).

Ms. Jestice's last two chapters emerge generally as the best argued and focused in the book. They address the role of monks in the Roman reform of the eleventh century and the polemics that emerged as a result of that activity. In these chapters the author makes more effective and judicious use of hagiography coupled with additional primary and secondary support than in earlier parts of the book. These chapters demonstrate the author at her best when she is describing and analyzing, in an engaging narrative, movements like Vallombrosa and Hirsau, for which she has sources pro and con to compare and argue. On the other hand, she is at her worst when she blindly conjectures about broader movements about which she has little evidence. While Ms. Jestice's "alternative theory" does not fully displace older theories about new trends in monasticism and spirituality, she provides a new and worthwhile perspective to these changes.

Finally, I am obliged to point out several unfortunate errors: (p. 30) Northusen, instead of Nordhausen; (p. 108) Driibeck is in the Harz, that is, Saxony, not Westphalia; (p. 140) notes 19 and 20 seem to be reversed; and finally, (p. 255) here Ms. Jestice, although she does recognize that an alternative exists, accepts and presents an outdated theory of authorship of the Liber de unitate ecclesiae conservanda, which one can easily find rejected in the newest edition and the standard reference books.

John W Bernhardt

San José State University

Theophylact of Ochrid. Reading the Letters of a Byzantine Archbishop. By Margaret Mullett. [Birmingham Byzantine and Ottoman Monographs, Volume 2.] (Brookfield, Vermont: Variorum, Ashgate Publishing Co. 1997. Pp. xviii, 441. $84.95.)

Margaret Mullett feels that there is a need to rescue Byzantine literature from the low esteem in which it is generally held. Why Byzantine literature, unlike Byzantine art, has had such a bad press is rather strange, given that they both display the same basic traits, which can be summed up as "artificiality" in the best sense of the word. Still stranger is the way that the most damaging criticism of Byzantine literature has come from distinguished Byzantinists. Mullett notes that "even the most experienced editors of Byzantine letters are unsure of their value once they are edited" (p. 24), including Paul Gautier, who edited and translated Theophylact's Letters. The position has been reached in Byzantine studies when there is an impressive corpus of new editions of Byzantine letters, but very little in the way of commentary and evaluation. For this reason Mullett's study of Theophylact's Letters is most welcome.

Theophylact was born ca. 1050 on the island of Euboea,but was educated at Constantinople, possibly under Michael Psellos. In 1088/89 he was appointed to the archbishopric of Bulgaria, where he remained until his death in 1126 or soon afterwards. While the Byzantines remembered him as a great exegete, his modern reputation depends far more on his letters and other rhetorical pieces. Most of his letters were edited by J. Meursius from a single manuscript (Laur. Gr. 59, 12) in the early seventeenth century with others being added in the course of the eighteenth century from other manuscripts. Mullett tells us that Gautier died before he had solved the relationship between the different manuscripts, but cannot herself get any further. For the time being she accepts Gautier's "hypothesis of a single collection, which became separated before the late thirteenth to fourteenth century" (p. 82). The operative word is collection. All we have is a selection of Theophylact's letters—numbering some 135—which cover a period from ca. 1088/89 to ca. 1110. There is nothing from the last fifteen years or so of his time as archbishop. It is not known on what basis the letters were chosen, though the assumption is that it was on literary and stylistic grounds.

Mullett warns us that "Byzantine literature should be regarded as anything but unproblematic" (p. 1). One large problem is the way Byzantinists have latched on to the implications of Cyril Mango's formulation of Byzantine literature as a distorting mirror. It raises serious doubts about the relationship of text and context, thus undermining the historical value of the literary text, while rationalizing a distrust of Byzantine literature. Mullett is well aware that literary criticism long ago dispensed with the need for context, but insists that her book "is not primarily a work of criticism or theory but of cultural history" (p. 2). Therefore, a major concern is to establish a context for Theophylact's Letters. This Mullett does on the basis of "Network theory." The assumption is that

an analysis of Theophylact's network of correspondents revealed in his letters will pinpoint his place and influence both in provincial and metropolitan society. It rests on another assumption: that the sample of letters that we have is representative of his epistolary activity. The results obtained are nevertheless impressive. They give a more assured and nuanced account of Theophylact's relationships and conduct of office than has emerged from earlier sketches. However, they need testing against similar work—still to be done—on other letter collections.

Disregarding the misgivings that current literary criticism has about the "author," Mullett provides a sophisticated and satisfying pen portrait of Theophylact as "Author and Man." Despite some elegantly translated verses and snatches of letters—which catch Theophylact's real literary ability—this book confirms the chasm that separates the modern reader from the imaginative world of the Byzantine elite. Its real value lies elsewhere. Mullett has shown that with patience and skill context can be restored to Byzantine literary texts and with it their historical value. It is in this way that she achieves a partial rehabilitation of Byzantine literature. This is an achievement, for which many Byzantinists will be grateful.

Michael Angold

University of Edinburgh

Virgin Martyrs: Legends of Sainthood in Late Medieval England. By Karen A. Winstead. (Ithaca, New York: Cornell University Press. 1997. Pp. xiii, 201. $35.00.)

If saints are supposed to be models, why were the most popular saints' lives in late medieval England the stories of women who were tortured and brutally murdered? This question is the focus of Winstead's insightful study of the retelling of early female virgin martyrdoms in a time of Christian dominance. Analyzing various revisions of the saints' lives, Winstead discerns the medieval authors' intentions and their audiences' response. To show how the retold saints' lives and their visual representations both reflected and shaped cultural norms, Winstead carefully places them in their medieval context. Sensitive to feminist issues as well, Winstead's scholarly work should become standard reading for anyone studying late medieval English spirituality, religion, literature, or women's history.

Winstead's introduction is a helpful guide for what is to follow. Posing a host of provocative questions that draw the reader into her inquiry, Winstead presents recent scholarly research related to her topic. The chapters that follow have both a thematic and a chronological focus: Winstead's greatest contribu-

tion is her correlation of variations in the retelling of the virgins' lives with religious and spiritual change.

In Winstead's assessment, between 1100 and 1250 the virgin martyr saints' lives were produced primarily by and for people in religious life. The best-known examples are the legends of the Katherine Group. In these, the saints' devotions and prayers are emphasized over the narrative events of their martyrdoms, a stress that made them suitable models for medieval religious. In the next period, from 1250 to 1400, clerical authors reshaped these paradigms of sanctity for a lay audience. In this phase, the saints were presented not as heroines to imitate but as powerful miracle-workers; to emphasize their exceptionality, the tortures they endured were described with particular relish. Because the distinction between the saints and other mortals was emphasized, Winstead believes these versions bolstered clerical authority and the power of the institutional church.

In the final period Winstead considers, 1400 to 1450, the radical elements in these heroic tales were toned down to make them more suitable as purveyors of the values of "middle-class readers." The virgin martyrs were portrayed as "refined gentlewomen"—introspective, gracious, discreet, modest, and even enamored with the joys of living. Looking especially at the legends by Osbern Bokenhamjohn Lydgate, and John Capgrave, Winstead identifies an attempt to discourage excesses of piety that could lead to heresy. Particularly intriguing is Winstead's attention to the "politics of reading," the ambiguous attitudes male authors had about the increased literacy of lay women.

Winstead's identification of shifting emphases in the various versions of the lives of the virgin martyrs is convincing. Her hypothesis that the changes in the saint's lives reflect different audiences and cultural settings is persuasive, although at times one can wonder whether the authors were as tightly attuned to cultural shifts and whether the historical changes were as pronounced as Winstead argues. But her basic thesis is persuasive, and she successfully shows how the lives of the early female virgin martyrs related to the concerns of late-medieval women and men.

Sharon Elkins

Wellesley College and Popefohn XXIII National Seminary

The Idea of Natural Rights: Studies on Natural Rights, Natural Law and Church Law, 1150-1625. By Brian Tierney [Emory University Studies in Law and Religion, No. 5.] (Atlanta, Georgia: Scholars Press. 1997. Pp. xi, 380. $24.95 paperback.)

It is given to few scholars to produce truly path-breaking books and to still fewer to produce more than one of them. Tierney's Foundations of the Concil-

iar Theory and his Origins of Papal Infallibility both qualify for that coveted designation, and the book under review surely comes close to so doing. Unlike the other two books it does not claim to offer a fully integrated account of its subject. Its subtitle suggests, indeed, diat it may be no more than a collection of studies. But it is, in fact, a good deal more than that. If some of its chapters were originally published as separate articles and others at first conceived of in the same way, all have been so revised as to minimize repetition and embedded in new material that sets them in an overarching context; it explores related topics and provides the sort of connective tissue needed to make clear that these several studies are united and propelled forward by a powerful and sustained argument.

The topics covered range far and wide and treat of a truly impressive range of issues, from the canonist origins of natural right discourse in the twelfth and thirteenth centuries via Henry of Ghent and the claims made for the "revolution" Ockham has been alleged to have made in the development of individual rights theory, on into an extended probing of the legal and political theorizing stimulated in Ockham and others by the great fourteenth-century dispute over Franciscan poverty and thence to chapters devoted in turn to Gerson, Almain, Mair, and Summenhart, to Vitoria and Las Casas on the question of the rights of the American Indians, to Vitoria and Suarez on questions of rights, community, and sovereignty, and finally to Hugo Grotius, the great Dutch scholar whose genius it was to have been able to link together in his thinking the seemingly alien worlds of medieval and modern natural rights thinking.

Disparate though these topics may seem to be, they are connected, with all the clarity and force one has come to expect of Tierney, by a series of firm rejections and equally firm affirmations. Rejected is the assumption that the theory of natural, individual, human rights was an invention of the early-modern era, that it was "as modern as the internal combustion engine" (thus Kenneth Minogue). Rejected also is the notion that the critical point of departure is to be found in the writings of the early-fifteenth century theologian, Jean Gerson (thus Richard Tuck). Rejected, again, the reiterated claim that the true "father of subjective rights" was, rather, none other than Ockham himself (thus Michel Villey). And the affirmations? That "an ideology of rights," however universal its significance has ultimately proved to be, first developed, nonetheless, in the Western world, that it did so "in a religious culture that supplemented rational argumentation about human nature with a faith in which human beings were seen as children of a caring God" (p. 343), and that the critical moment in that development occurred in the "obscure glosses" of the twelfth- and thirteenth-century canonists.

This is a very rich and stimulating book, and the space available to me permits no more than an illustration either of the unexpected insights that punctuate its pages or of the claims that stimulate a measure of skepticism. Of the former, I was most taken by Tierney's observation that the "truly significant" context "that makes Gerson's theory of rights intelligible" is that of late-medieval conciliarism (p. 221). Of the latter, I must confess to being un-

convinced by the very sweeping nature of his rejection of attempts to affirm the presence in the thinking of Ockham of an intellectual affiliation between his voluntarism as a philosopher/theologian and the legal and political ideas he developed as a controversialist. Bastit's exaggeration (or misrepresentation) of the voluntarist strand in Ockham's thinking does not mean that it does not exist or that it is irrelevant to an understanding of what he means when he invokes "right reason." Only "by the very fact that the divine will wishes it," he says in the Ordinatio, does "right reason dictate what is to be willed." And if right reason is thus subordinated to the divine will, then there is nothing fixed about it, and the simple designation of Ockham as belonging "in the rationalist camp" (p. 199) is less than helpful. But, then all praise to a book that gives rise in its admiring reader to so recondite a doubt!

Francis Oakley

Williams College

Painting on Glass: Studies in Romanesque and Gothic Monumental Art. By Madeline Harrison Caviness. [Collected Studies Series.] (Brookfield, Vermont: Ashgate Publishing Company. 1997. Pp. xviii, 284. $159.95.)

These fifteen essays profiling Caviness's contributions over a thirty-year period, show a great breadth, constantly linking "painting on glass" to wall painting, manuscripts, the architectural setting, and the complexity of medieval systems of patronage and thought. They are important corollaries to her three magisterial volumes: The Early Stained Glass of Canterbury Cathedral: circa 1175-1220 (Princeton, 1977);The Windows of Christ Church Cathedral, Canterbury (Corpus Vitrearum Medii Aevi Great Britain, 2 [London, 1981]); and Sumptuous Arts at the Royal Abbeys in Reims and Braine: Ornatus Elegantiae, Varietate Stupendes (Princeton, 1990).

Caviness's own introduction to the volume reveals a remarkably open and generous mind. The "morellian" details in her writing, however, confirm her lived, not simply voiced, scholarship. Awareness of systems of appropriation, for example, is seen in the subtleties of label illustration. A "series drawn for Monfaucon," rather than "after Monfaucon" articulates that Monfaucon's accomplishments rest on the skill and labor of many. Often contemporary students place theory as an alternative to contextual studies. Caviness's grounding in context, including painstakingly acquired connoisseurship, is the base, not the limit. An early assignment by Jean Lafond, an extraordinary mentor, profiling the life of King Edward the Confessor in glass and manuscript around 1300, announces the meticulous attention to detail characteristic of all her work. The priorities of art history of the time, to define the authenticity of the object (still the sine qua non of any subsequent reading), to fix chronologies, and to establish sequential influence, inform the writing yet do not overwhelm a penchant for presenting alternatives or for demonstrating interconnectedness. A much

later article on Saint Remi focuses not on hagiographie content but on the aniconic object, exploring the value of sumptuous decoration as an element of both architectural and contemplative ambiance.

Her exploration of Saint-Denis, a monument that has gained status as exemplifying key aspects of medieval thought, becomes an exploration of the methodology of scholarship in a manner that avoids hierarchical categories of meaning. Such clarity in analysis makes this essential reading for aU scholars of the Middle Ages, whatever their discipline. In a truly sweeping overview she articulates (citing the manner of Richard of Saint-Victor) a fourfold division of the sources that may contribute to a work of art. Spiritual or iconographie sources include textual inspiration and also pictorial, iconographie guides. Material or styUstic sources are distinct from these and encompass the artist's reception of moduli, certain poses, drapery schémas, or facial types, and secondly the manner of combining all of these elements. Thus she defines a possible separation of iconographie from stylistic sources, a perception revealed through her analysis of Canterbury Cathedral's windows, and an issue not nearly confronted enough by other scholars in the field.

Perhaps most keenly, Caviness's work chaUenges "textual primacy," seeing the work of art as a paraUel to a written or oral presentation of the same subject, not as its "Ulustration" in the modern sense. Although present in much of her work, these issues are reviewed in "Biblical Stories in Windows: Were They Bible for the Poor?" She analyzes entire programs as well as individual windows at Saint-Denis, Bourges, Auxerre, Rouen, Canterbury, Poitiers, and Assisi, challenging reductive systems of meaning. Multivalent readings lurking beneath even her earliest work are here aggressively addressed. Given the present interest in intertextuality, especiaUy from literary or biblical scholars, this is required reading. These essays help frame Caviness's recent work on patronage and text and image that included the French queen, Jeanne d'Evreux, "Patron or Matron? A Capetian Bride and a Vade Mecum for her Marriage Bed," Speculum, 86 (1993), 333-362, and HUdegard of Bingen, Herrad of Landsberg, Christina of Markyate, among many women, in "Anchoress, Abbess, and Queen: Donors and Patrons or Intercessors and Matrons?" in June HaU McCash (ed.), The Cultural Patronage of Medieval Women (Athens: University of Georgia Press, 1996), pp. 105-154. Always one sees a refusal to find an easy reading, accompanied by passion for analysis of structure and articulate framing of the argument.

Virginia Chieffo Raguin

College of the Holy Cross

Miracula sancti Dominici mandato magistri Berengarii collecta: Petri Calo legendae sancti Dominici. Edited by Simon TugweU, O.R [Monumenta Ordinis Fratrum Praedicatorum Histórica, Volumen 26.] (Rome: Institutum Historicum Ordinis Fratrum Praedicatorum. 1997. Pp. 338. Paperback.)

This is the first volume of a project which is intended to provide reliable texts for the major thirteenth- to sixteenth-century writings concerning St. Dominic de Guzman (1 170- 1221), the founder of the Order of Preachers or Dominicans. At this point, Father Tugwell's principal interest is in the early primary sources for the saint. The earliest lives and sources were published in 1933-1935 by M. -H. Laurent, O.P, in his Monumenta Histórica S. P. N. Dominici (Monumenta Ordinis Fratrum Praedicatorum Histórica, Volumen 16). This edition is not only long out of print, but the progress of manuscript studies, to which Father Tugwell has contributed enormously, has made the need for a new edition urgent. In comparison to the exhaustive work done on the sources for St. Francis of Assisi and the early Franciscans, early Dominican sources remain almost uncharted and inadequately edited, if at all.

As the early lives and miracle collections for St. Dominic have a muddy and mostly uncharted textual history, no edition in this new series will be definitive, if such a word can be used for an edition of a medieval text, until the whole project is complete. Father Tugwell foresees at that point another revision of the texts. He is already involved in such a revision of his edition of the earliest life of Dominic, the Libellas of Jordan of Saxony. This volume contains editions of two previously unedited sources. The first is the short Miracula Sancti Dominici collected after the 1314 appeal of the Master of the Order, Bérenger of Landorra. This text exists in a single manuscript, Trier: Stadtsbibliothek MS 1 168/470. Next, Father Tugwell presents Petrus Calö's two Legendae, compiled before 1340 from extant and lost sources. The first of these legends is known from two unreliable manuscripts and the second from four. Other witnesses to the latter are found in fifteenth-century printed breviaries and early modern hagiographers.

The Bérenger and Calo legends may not be the most important sources for the life of St. Dominic, but they are extremely important for tracing the development of his cult. Father Tugwell has introduced his editions by extended essays on their compilers and textual transmission and, in the process, identified the landmarks in the early history of devotion to St. Dominic. Although it was not a popular text among Dominicans (the one surviving manuscript is Carthusian), Bérenger's collection is important as signaling new hagiographie projects dedicated to Dominic after a lull since the 1260's. It was used not only by Calo but also by Bernard GuL Tugwell's introduction to this text nicely places it within the context of inter-order rivalry and the Dominican cultivation, or lack thereof, of Dominic's cult. In the case of Calö's legends, Tugwell exhaustively tracks the relation of extant manuscripts and other witnesses to borrowing from the texts. His introduction to the Calo material gives the reader a good idea of the complexity of miracle story transmission and the methods of miracle collectors.

These editions are typical of the painstaking care we have come to associate with Father Tugwell's manuscript studies, and they are presented with his typi-

cal verve and wit. Every student of the early Preachers will look forward to the appearance of the future volumes of this project.

Augustine Thompson, O.P.

University of Oregon

Ad cognitionem scientiae festinare: Gli studi nell'Università e net conventi di Padova net secoli XLLL e XLV. By Paolo Marangon. Edited by Tiziana Pesenti. [Contributi alia storia dell'Università di Padova, 31.] (Trieste: Edizione Lint. 1997. Pp. xxxiii, 531. Lire 82,500 paperback.)

In commemoration of the early death of the young Paduan historian, Paolo Marangon (1947-1984), the Centro per Ia storia dell'Università di Padova has published a collection of his essays representative of the scholar's wide-ranging interests in the religious and intellectual life of Padua in the tiiirteenth and early fourteenth centuries. Marangon knew thoroughly the contents of Padua's archives and libraries, and these essays offer a wealth of material for scholars interested in Italian Aristotelianism, early Italian humanism, and the history of religion and education in late medieval Italy. Marangon's interests in the role of the religious orders in Padua and especially that of Sant'Antonio, its patron saint, are reflected in a series of essays concerned with various aspects of Sant'Antonio's career, with his influence on the devotional, ecclesiastical, and intellectual life of the city, and the contribution of the religious orders to higher education in the city.

In what is his most cited article, "La Quadriga e i Proverbi di maestro Arsegino. Cultura e scuole a Padova prima del 1222" (pp. 2-46), Marangon provides a census of the numerous teachers and scholars at work in the city before the creation of the Studium in 1222 and characterizes the institutional structure of both lay and clerical education in the period. He interprets available evidence as pointing to the role of the bishop, Giordano, in the establishment of both the communal Studium and the studia of the Dominicans and Francis-

A group of essays deals with early Paduan Aristotelianism. On the basis of a careful examination of Paduan sources, Marangon convincingly demonstrates in his "Marsilio tra preumanesimo e cultura delle arti: Ricerca sulle fonti padovane del I discorso del Defensor pads" (pp. 380-410), that Marsiglio of Padua's supposed Parisian "Averroism" was rather a reflection of views common to the medical and "prehumanistic" milieux of his native city around the turn of the fourteenth century. In "Principi di teoría política nella marca trevigiana: Clero e comune a Padova al tempo di Marsilio" (pp. 41 1-430), Marangon, continuing his study of Paduan intellectual life in the early fourteenth century, analyzes the first political treaties written in the Paduan region in the early four-

teenth century, including those of the Franciscan Paolino da Venezia, the Domenicans Enrico da Rimini, Guido Vernani, Borromeo of Bologna, and Bartolomeo CapodiUsta of Padua, and Agostino da Ancona, who also had close links with Padua.

Although Marangon's essays often lack conceptual framework, the rich panorama of medieval Padua's intellectual life they offer helps to explain why the relatively smaU city produced the leaders of the first two generations of Italian humanism and the foremost European political thinker of the fourteenth century.

Ronald G. Witt

Duke University

Jews in the Notarial Culture: Latinate Wills in Mediterranean Spain, 1250-1350. By Robert I. Burns, SJ. (Berkeley: University of California Press. 1996. Pp. x, 267. $45.00.)

In this fascinating volume, the reader enters the multilingual, multicultural world of Jews in the medieval Crown of Aragon through a unique set of documents: the wills of Jews—both men and women—written in Latin, when the vast majority of medieval Jewish wills are presumed to have been written in Hebrew only. The Latin wills, however, were not simple translations of a Hebrew text, because the norms of Jewish and the Romanizing law of the Crown of Aragon had quite different prescriptions for testamentary dispositions.

According to Burns, there were two basic reasons why a Jew would go to the trouble of drawing up a Latin will paraUeling another in Hebrew. First, a Latin wiU was enforceable under the normal legal procedures avaUable to all citizens of the realm, thus ensuring the testator that if the Jewish community (or the testator's own family) did not carry out the terms of the will faithfuUy, royal justice would so do. Second, through a Latin wUl a Jewish testator could reaUze, or enforce, personal objectives that were incompatible with Jewish law. Jewish law, for example, did not recognize a "universal heir"; thus a man could make his wife his sole heir under Roman law norms, but not in Jewish law.

These considerations allow Burns to reflect on the experiential meaning of the interaction between parallel societies—Jewish and Christian—created by the autonomous structures permitted the Jewish community. Jews interacted normally and easUy with the ambient Christian world, particularly in the legal realm: recording contracts with Christian notaries, for example, was the normal way in which business was conducted. So in this context, the Latin wiU was an outgrowth of both the commercial world of medieval Europe in which Jews were active participants and of the revival of Roman law in thirteenth-century Spain.

The phenomenon represented by Latinate Jewish wills could well be termed "legal code switching," by analogy with "linguistic code switching." In the latter, bilingual persons or those living in multilingual cultures will switch languages in order to enter a symbolic realm consonant with a specific situation or set of conditions. Thus did Catalan-speaking Jews switch to Hebrew or Latin as events required: most men had double personal names: a Catalan name for daily life, which might be a translation of a Hebrew sacred name (e.g., Vidal/Hayyim). Similarly, by switching from a Jewish to a Christian legal code, the Jew thereby entered a different normative world, in consonance with a set of specific objectives.

A documental appendix contains forty-five previously unpublished texts (dated 1260 to 1343), either wills or documents related to their execution, in Latin, with English summaries.

Thomas F. Guck

Boston University

Canon Law and Cloistered Women: Periculoso and Its Commentators, 1298-1545- By Elizabeth Makowski. [Studies in Medieval and Early Modern Canon Law, Volume 5.] (Washington, D.C: The Catholic University of America Press. 1997. Pp. x, 149. $46.95.)

When Chaucer's Prioress went off to Canterbury, she violated canon law because in 1298 Pope Boniface VIII had decreed the "strict enclosure of nuns of every order throughout the Latin Church" (p. 1). Canonists commented on the decree throughout the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries and the Council of Trent re-enacted it. In spite of this continued interest, however, the decree was often ignored in practice. The career of Periculoso thus illustrates the tension between the ideals of the religious life articulated by the reforming papacy and the practical realities of monastic existence. Furthermore, it also sheds light on the way in which female spirituality was understood in the late medieval Church. Boniface was attempting to bring communities of women under tight control, ending the development of "quasi-religious communities of laywomen throughout Christendom" that posed a "potential threat to church discipline" (p. 27). Such groups continued to flourish, however.

Periculoso was a major step in differentiating between male and female religious life. Previously, according to Makowski, the regulations for religious life had been similar for monks and nuns. Subsequently, women's religious life was increasingly under the control of men and centered on enclosure. Men's communities, however, were not held to the same standard of enclosure. One unforeseen consequence of this was that this decree, if fully enforced, would have made it almost impossible for abbesses to oversee the operation of the properties upon which the economic well-being of their communities rested, because they could not leave the confines of the cloister.

This study provides insight into the way in which the leaders of the late medieval Church dealt with what they saw as the threat that women's spirituality posed to the Church and how to control it. To that extent alone, it is a valuable contribution to scholarship. It also raises some related issues. For example, because the application of Periculoso affected the ability of an abbess to visit the properties owned by the community, it raises questions about the economics of religious life. Just how much did it cost to support a monk or nun? Were there significant differences in the economic bases of male and female communities?

As Makowski's discussion of the canonistic commentaries on Periculoso also demonstrates, the later canonists had important things to say. While it may be true that these lawyers were not as creative as those in the classical period of canon law, 1140-1375 (not 1250 as she states, p. 5 n. 10), nevertheless they were quite capable of developing the implications of the work of the classical period to meet the needs of their own day. Study of the canon law flourished in these later centuries as the number of lengthy commentaries and treatises indicates. With the exception of the literature generated by the conciliar movement, however, this later canonistic material has generally been neglected. In her discussion of Periculoso, Makowski follows a path pioneered by Brian Tierney and Kenneth Pennington that is adding to our understanding of the debt that the legal world of the early modern era owes to the medieval canonists.

James Muldoon

John Carter Brown Library

Early Russian Hagiography: The Lives of Prince Fedor the Black. By Gail Lenhoff. [Slavistische Veröffentlichungen, Fachbereich Neuere Fremdsprachliche Philologien der Freien Universität Berlin, Band 82.] (Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz Verlag. 1997. Pp. xi, 496. Paperback.)

Prince Fedor Rostislavich of Smolensk and Jaroslavl', who after his deathbed tonsure was known as "the Black," was one of the most venerated of the "sovereign" saints of imperial Russia. His death, on September 19, 1299, and the inventio of his uncorrupted relics and those of his sons, Konstantin and David, on March 5, 1463, were commemorated widely, and the large corpus of writings associated with his cult extends over several centuries. The significance of Fedor's cult makes it an effective subject for Gail Lenhoff's comprehensive and thorough study, which addresses the question of how a saint's life in its sociocultural development inspired a variety of texts over an extended period of time.

Part I of the study describes the sociocultural context of Fedor's cult and establishes the methodology employed by Lenhoff in her investigation. In contrast to other diachronic approaches that assume that texts originally created for religious purposes evolve over time into literary narratives, Lenhoff applies the notion of Sitz im Leben developed by Formgeschichte critics and investi-

gates Fedor's cult in the context of sociocultural factors such as local customs, behavior, and experiences. She shows that Jaroslavl, located in what she caUs a "multicultural zone," was able to develop a distinctive regional culture that provided a foundation for the cults of Fedor and other local princes and affected their development long after the demise of the appanage system and the consoUdation of central authority in Moscow.

The analysis of the texts associated with Fedor Rostislavich begins with chronicle accounts. Little of saintly promise is present in these rather bleak records of a mercenary soldier, but they do provide a foundation for the later biographies. The investigation of the texts associated with the cult of Fyodor Rostislavich follows and comprises Parts II and III of the study dealing with regional and national veneration respectively. Regional veneration is examined using a synaxarion lection, reports of miracles, vitae, and liturgical commemoration. National veneration is traced through the versions in the Velikie Minei Cetii of Metropolitan Makarij and Stepennaja kniga, and in manifestations of private veneration such as references to the cult in the correspondence between Tsar Ivan IV and Prince Andrej Kurbskij. In the seventeenth century a significant proliferation of writing about the prince occurred among diverse strata of the population. Most intriguing in this regard is Lenhoff's well-supported claim that designated redactions appeared in this period that reflect the religious and cultural interests of varied social groups, ranging from a petition to glorify members of Fedor's famUy composed in chanceUery language to the elitist panegyrical redaction inspired by the Stepennaja kniga.

The appendices contain selected texts from the cult accompanied by EngUsh translations and a description and classification of the manuscripts by Boris M. Kloss of the Russian Academy of Sciences. The volume concludes with summaries in German and Russian, a comprehensive bibUography an index of manuscripts, and a general index.

Gail Lenhoff is to be congratulated for producing this ground-breaking study. It is an exceUent companion piece to her earUer book, The Martyred Princes Boris and Gleb.A Socio-Cultural Study of the 7kx;fe, which first introduced the notion of approaching a saint's life socioculturaUy as a complex of texts associated with a cult. Intriguing concepts such as her ideas that regional saints' lives were more Ukely, at least in their early stages, to reflect sociocultural rather than Uterary considerations, and, that due to their editorial protocol the sixteenth-century collections, though not belletristic, prepared the way for later Uterary texts, should be given careful consideration by investigators. It is hoped that this volume will serve as a model for future studies of medieval texts from other regions of Russia.

David Prestel

Michigan State University

The Trial of the Templars in Cyprus: A Complete English Edition. By Anne Gilmour-Bryson. [The Medieval Mediterranean, Volume 17.] (Leiden: Brill. 1998. Pp. xvii, 502. NIg 270/US$ 159.00.)

The surviving records of the Templar trial in Cyprus in the early fourteenth century contain the testimonies of seventy-six brethren and fifty-six non-Templar witnesses. The Templars all denied the main charges leveled against them and gave similar, though not completely identical, responses to the 122 or 123 articles on which they were questioned. The answers provided by these Templars do not differ greatly from those given in other places where brethren were not tortured, such as Lérida and Zaragoza in Spain, although in the Iberian peninsula a shorter list of accusations was used. The evidence given by non-Templars in Cyprus was notably supportive of the order. It contrasts markedly with that provided in the British Isles, which is the other district where numerous non-Templar witnesses were questioned. But the frequently hostile testimony in the British Isles probably reflects general attitudes toward the order; it certainly cannot be accepted as proof of wrongdoing.

The proceedings in Cyprus have long been known from the work of Schottmüller, who edited most of the Latin text in 1887. Anne Gilmour-Bryson does not, however, merely produce a translation of the published version: she has gone back to the manuscripts, which are in the Vatican Archives. Although many parts of these are in a poor state, she is able to rectify numerous minor errors in SchottmüUer's text, and she also inserts sections which he omitted from his edition. The present version, therefore, can be used to monitor Schottmüller's work. As most of the sections which were not included in the published Latin edition were, however, omitted because they largely duplicated earlier statements, the new material does not add substantially to what is already known. She also seeks to provide information about individuals—both Templars and others—mentioned in the proceedings, and brings together a considerable amount of material. Discussion of named Templars is, however, hampered by the frequent difficulty of relating references to individuals with the same or similar names; and about some of the Templars there is more information available, even in published works, than is utilized. The book will, however, no doubt be used mainly as a translation. As such, it is not completely free from error, although the mistakes which have been detected are of relatively minor significance; and the language is at times somewhat stilted: this is partly because a fairly literal translation is attempted, and the original Latin is not very elegant. But the book provides a serviceable translation of the proceedings. Until now, very few documents relating to the Templar trial have been translated into English and, as it can no longer be assumed that even postgraduates will have a working knowledge of Latin, translations of primary sources are to be welcomed. But it may be questioned whether, for those who are dependent on translations and therefore have access to only a limited range of primary sources, there is much justification in publishing in full very repetitive Templar testimonies from one set of interrogations. It might be argued that it would be

more useful to provide a selection of more varied sources. The editor states that it was suggested to her that she should publish merely extracts of the more interesting depositions, but argues that "only a full and complete version can be truly useful." Yet the case for a full version in English has not been sufficiently made out.

A.J. Forey

Kirtlington, Oxford

The Convent and the Community in Late Medieval England: Female Monasteries in the Diocese of Norwich, 1350-1540. By Marilyn Oliva. [Studies in the History of Medieval Religion, Vol. 12.] (Rochester, New York: The Boydell Press. 1998. Pp. xiv, 271. $90.00.)

This is a work of historical revision which challenges the model of late medieval female monasticism established for England by Eileen Power three-quarters of a century ago. Dr. Oliva convincingly argues for a new interpretation informed by modern feminist perspectives, and more sensitive to the multifaceted service of the nunneries to their local society. These houses did not have the wealth to dominate the countryside like some of their male counterparts, but there is plenty of evidence arrayed to substantiate the relatively modest claim that they were "important features of the local landscape."

Whereas Power's pioneering Medieval English Nunneries is a broad-ranging survey, Dr. Oliva confines her attention to the single diocese of Norwich and provides a detailed study of eleven religious houses for women from the mid-fourteenth century to the Dissolution. The difference in scale is extremely important, because generalizations supported by evidence from houses in widely different locations over more than two and a half centuries of their existence do not stand up to scrutiny, when the focus is changed to the continuous history of a coherent group of nunneries in one region.

It is not simply a question of denigratory comments about the moral standards of nuns or their capacities as financial managers. Recruitment to these communities and their place in local society are demonstrably different from traditional stereotypes of aristocratic institutions. At least in Norwich diocese the nuns are drawn predominantly from the middling ranks of society and lesser gentry; office-holders are mostly drawn from the same class; and it is with such modest landowners that they seem, from wills at least, to have their closest connections.

A justification in the past for neglect of the nuns by monastic historians has been an assumed lack of evidence. This study suggests strategies for addressing a problem that is not illusory but which has almost certainly been exaggerated. Dr. Oliva has explored a wide range of sources effectively and demonstrated the significant results that the patient researcher can extract from them. At the

heart of her evidence is an examination of 3,000 wills. Paradoxically one of the significant results of her researches is to demonstrate the very small proportion of testators who left a bequest to the nuns at all. Most wills contained no legacies to religious houses, and of those that did, just 18% went to the female religious.

Dr. Oliva has made an important contribution to the growing literature on medieval nunneries, which brings a breath of fresh air to tired debates and indicates directions that further research might take. It demonstrates the diversity that existed among the small religious houses, and the need for similar sympathetic studies of the many male institutions within this group. Perhaps in regional studies of this kind we might hope also to see explored the extent to which the small houses were able to adapt to the radical changes (demographic, social, and religious) of the late medieval period.

John Tillotson

Australian National University

"Songes of Rechelesnesse": Langland and the Franciscans. By Lawrence M. Clopper. (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press. 1997. Pp. xviii, 368. $52.50.)

Lawrence Clopper's "Songes of Rechelesnesse" a provocative, challenging, and fascinating book, is one of the most important studies of William Langland's Piers Plowman published in the past twenty years. It confronts directly the commonplace view that this fourteenth-century poem—along with Chaucer's "Summoner's Tale"—is the artistic culmination of the antifraternal tradition in England, a view strongly argued in Penn Szittya's highly influential book, The Antifraternal Tradition in Medieval Literature (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1986). Clopper maintains instead that Langland "systematically exhibits a Franciscan mentality, ideology, and spirituality" (p. 3) and that the poem's insistent castigation of the mendicants is the criticism of an insider determined to reform the fraternal orders rather than the attack of an outsider dedicated to their eradication. Although not denying the central place of antifraternal polemic in the poem, he shows how "Langland has characters respond to specific arguments of external critics" (p. 11) and argues that the poet's "engagement with the external critics of mendicancy indicates that Piers is not so much a defense as a meditation on the impediments and difficulties of that life" (p. 14).

The eight chapters are divided into two major groupings: the first three link Langland to Franciscan ideology, whereas the second five, building on this historical framework, investigate Franciscan issues central to the poem's thematics. Readers of this journal will likely find the first three chapters, which draw on a wealth of historical detail, the most immediately useful. Chapter 1, "Mendi-

cant Debate and Antifraternal Critiques," summarizes the rich tradition of late medieval antifraternalism; Chapter 2, "Langland's Friars," examines the many ways in which Langland represents friars in his poem; and Chapter 3, "Langland's Exemplarism," argues strongly for the influence of Bonaventure on the ways in which Langland organizes his poem and even on his poetic style, the alUterative long Une. The remaining five chapters, which display sharp critical acumen, address more Uterary issues, but the discussion of Langland's poUtics in Chapter 4—especially his unique notion of the traditional "three estates"—and the many insights of Chapter 7, "Renewal and the Friars' Role in History," will be especiaUy welcomed by historians.

In an afterword Clopper poses the question, "Was Langland a Franciscan?" He thinks "it probable that Langland at some point was a member of the Franciscan order," but he appropriately delayed this question to the conclusion because he didn't want debates regarding biographical questions to divert attention "from the more important matter, the presence of Franciscan materials in the poem" (p. 325). This commonsensical strategy typifies "Songes of Rechelesnessse" which, argued strongly and forthrighdy, is nevertheless considerate of a variety of critical stances. Clopper, furthermore, treats scholars with whom he disagrees with respect, as when he challenges those critics who have rather simpUsticaUy equated the poet's historical scheme to that of Joachim of Fiore. Clopper also repeatedly acknowledges the difficulties his thesis faces, as when he asks, "How does Langland signal that his accusations differ from external ones?" (p. 91), a crucial question that is sure to arise for most readers famiUar with the poem. By raising and confronting such questions directly, Clopper has written a model of nuanced argument and an exemplary work of scholarship that should influence scholars studying the complexities of late medieval religious history and perhaps even revolutionize the interpretation of Piers Plowman, the most challenging of medieval poems.

Richard K. Emmerson

Western Washington University

The Parish in English Life, 1400-1600. Edited by Katherine L. French, Gary G. Gibbs, and Beat Kümin. (Manchester and New York: Manchester University Press. Distributed by St. Martin's Press, Scholarly and Reference Division. 1997. Pp. xU, 276. $69.95.)

The editors set themselves the goal of producing a work which would place the EngUsh parish in an historical and geographical framework, which would compare the EngUsh experience with the continental, which would examine the nature of parish records and their limits, which would examine the range and form of community actions and expectation, and finally which would look at particular groups within the parish, e.g., gender, status, and ethnicity. They have succeeded in the task they set themselves and have produced a volume

which should be read by anyone interested in late medieval and Tudor and early Stuart England. Unfortunately, it is impossible to deal with all of the articles in this anthology in a review of this length.

The editors remind us in the Introduction that "religious and secular reform was not simply imposed, but negotiated and modified in accordance with local concerns. Resistance could take the form of outright rebellion, but more often it involved subtler strategies of adaptation, evasion, or concealment" (p. 13). Most of the articles deal with some aspect of that adaptation. Part I of the book consists of the introduction and Beat Kümin's "The English Parish in a European Perspective." Part II, "Parochial Sources," is extremely good because it discusses not only the sources which exist for parish history, e.g., churchwardens' accounts and parish registers, but what one can learn from such sources and the dangers one encounters in using them. This review, however, will consider four of the articles from Part III, "Community Action and Expectation," and Part IV, "Groups Within the Parish."

Caroline Litzenberger examines the conformity (and its cost) of St. Michael's in Gloucester in the years 1540-1580. She presents a parish which adapted its worship space to each change of religion and notes that conformity was "… a strategy employed by a close-knit, coherent parish elite to retain their church's prominent position in the city and to preserve it from further disruption and harmful inner division" (pp. 248-249).

Claire S. Sehen analyzes the changing roles of women in London parishes from 1500 to 1620. Women lost devotional and employment opportunities in the Anglican parish, which in fulfilling its religious and civic role "reinforced shifting gender roles that limited women's opportunities and involvement in the parish" (p. 251). These changes affected the way women were treated in church, their bequests, the supervision of poor women by the parish, and the "workfare" developed by the parish to get a return on the monies given to deserving poor women. That same mentality could break up families of poor women as well because parishes refused to allow their adult children to live with them. The parish became more an instrument of control than an outlet for devotion, which, according to the author, may account for the rate at which women joined the sects later in the century.

Gary Gibbs writes of the changing responsibilities of parishes in Tudor and Jacobean London. He notes that while salaries for parish staff did not keep up with inflation, there were parishes that realized that and augmented the salaries of parish clerks. By the reign of James I twenty percent of the parish funds went to the care of the poor, because the crown and city had decided that the parish was the best unit to control poor relief. "Prayers for the dead had been replaced by alms for the living, private masses had given way to public sermons, and devotion to the saints had been replaced by service to king and country."

Eamon Duffy's article on rood screens deals with the function of the screen, its decoration, the piety underlying that decoration, its removal, restoration, and removal again. Duffy reminds us that while benefactors might pay to have the screen painted, while they might choose the saints to be painted and their placement on the screen, they first had to obtain the permission and concurrence of the parish for their benefaction, thus demonstrating the corporate nature of the medieval English parish.

John J. LaRocca, SJ.
Xavier University

Church Art and Architecture in the Low Countries before 1566. By Jeremy Dupertuis Bangs. [Sixteenth Century Essays and Studies, Vol. XXXVII.] (Kirksville, Missouri: Sixteenth Century Journal Publishers. 1997. Pp. xii, 244. $65.00.)

Bangs's book aims to recreate what the churches in the Low Countries looked like before they were stripped of their art during the Reformation. His book is designed to counter what Bangs takes to be common misconceptions that Dutch churches were always "Calvinistically empty" and that virtually no art survived the iconoclastic riots of 1566. To this end, after a brief historical account of the 1566 riots, Bangs devotes the bulk of his book to studying the art objects and furniture found in Netherlandish churches during the pre-Reformation period. The broad variety of objects includes baptismal fonts, pulpits, choir screens, choir stalls, organ cases, altarpieces, tabernacles, paintings, stained glass, statues, tombs, textiles, and Mass implements; a closing section addresses Gothic and Renaissance architecture of the Lowlands. By and large, each chapter focuses on a single type of church furniture. After briefly assessing how the art form under consideration functioned within Catholic practice, and the attitude of the Reformers toward such works, Bangs provides a chronologically organized, descriptive survey of the style and iconography of the main surviving works. Among the better-known of these works are Reinier of Huy's baptismal font in Liège, Jacques Dubroeucq's choir screen at Mons, Cornells Florisz. de Vriendt's tabernacle in Zoutleeuw, Cornells Engebrechtsz' Crucifixion triptych, and Jan Borreman's St. George altarpiece.

The book's utility lies in its offering the only complete survey of Catholic church furnishings in Dutch churches. Moreover, the analysis brings out a number of interesting stylistic issues, documenting not only the shift from Gothic to Renaissance styles, but also the combination of the two styles within single works of art (as seen, for example, in the Leiden pulpit). In addition, the book raises important points about how church furnishings conveyed Catholic theological beliefs and even at times contained specifically anti-Reformation iconographie programs (an issue considered, for example, in the study of the pulpit at 's Hertogenbosch).

However, it is difficult to ascertain who the audience for this book might be. For the book is too specialized and at points presupposes too much art historical background to be fully accessible to the general reader. On the other hand, the book's value to the scholar of Netherlandish art is limited by the absence of sufficiently detailed analyses of individual works (many of the works are treated in just a single paragraph), and by the lack of sustained attention to key issues raised by the material (for instance, the interrelation between the various art forms, the impact of standardization on design, the nature of the different production centers, the documentary evidence about lost works, and the role of patronage). One would, of course, not expect a treatment of all of these issues within a book of this size and scope; nevertheless, because the book does not treat any of these at any length, it provides one seriously interested in this area with only a basic acquaintance with the art objects, not an interpretive structure for further study.

The book's production, while generally good, has some minor flaws: there are some problems with the quality of photographs (e.g., Figs. 82, 109), a couple of inaccuracies in photo captions and numbering (in Chapter 9), and a vexing lack of consistency in the arrangement of columns, which, when interrupted by photographs, sometimes read across (as on p. 119), and sometimes down (as on p. 28).

Lynn F. Jacobs
University of Arkansas

Early Modern European

The Pope's Elephant. By Silvio A. Bedini. (Manchester: Carcanet in association with the Calouste Gulbenkian Foundation and the Discoveries Commission, Lisbon. 1997. Pp. x, 302. £30.)

Silvio Bedini's The Pope's Elephant charmingly tells the tale of a remarkable diplomatic gift: Hanno, an Indian elephant, who was presented in 1514 to Pope Leo X by King Manuel I of Portugal. By coincidence, Bedini's historical study followed closely on the paperback issue of a novel, Lawrence Norfolk's The Pope's Rhinoceros (New York: Henry Holt, 1997), whose protagonist was King Manuel's follow-up gift to Pope Leo in 1515. Unfortunately, Ganda the rhinoceros was shipwrecked just off the Italian coast and made it to the Vatican only as a stuffed carcass. Hanno, on the other hand, was still very much alive in 1515, lodged in a special stall in front of St. Peter's Square right next to the pontifical lions.

In an article of 1981, Bedini referred to Hanno and Ganda as "the papal pachyderms," already balancing the playful element in their story with the recognition that they, together with a host of other exotic presents to the Pope, expressed serious intentions on King Manuel's part. These intentions were

both financial and poUtical. A series of campaigns against the Moors in North Africa and worldwide voyages of exploration promised Portugal new and lucrative sources of income, but in the short term Manuel needed money to raise troops and outfit ships. European states were often accustomed under such circumstances to request that the Pope waive tithes and other church taxes on a one-time basis as a way of providing a loan without incurring the charge of usury. Manual, with his gifts of pachyderms, wildcats, spices, metalwork, ivories, and brocades, hoped to charm Pope Leo into extending such a courtesy, but at the same time he also aimed to reinforce the Portuguese claim on the Spice Islands, aware that Spain had been preparing a counterclaim since 1512. Bedini deftly interweaves a fascinating description of Portugal's far-flung poUtical and economic interests in the early sixteenth century with accounts of the guttering cultural atmosphere of Leonine Rome, where the docile Hanno performed tricks amid ancient ruins and Renaissance pageantry, had his portrait done by none other than Raphael, and finally died of constipation in 1516. Meanwhile, the elephant's image, like that of the iU-fated Ganda, reverberated through contemporary European art—although the rhinoceros did not live to merit a portrait by Raphael, the creature was engraved by Albrecht Dürer—and Bedini does a careful job of tracing this curious visual legacy, as weU as the papal pachyderms' no less curious appearance in contemporary occasional verse.

Despite King Manuel's ingenuity, Leo X continued to prefer spending his money on parties, pageants, and performances in Rome rather than subsidizing Portuguese armies, and soon there was littie money left to spend on anything. By 1517, moreover, Martin Luther had begun to present the Pope with a more urgent chaUenge than the distant Moors. Hence, when Pope and Portuguese king died within a few months of one another in 1521, their deaths also effectively closed their respective versions of a "Golden Age," Manuel's of exploration and Leo's of culture, a heady setting in which apostolic zeal and modern technology combined with scientific curiosity and cosmopolitan culture to produce a strange and rarefied mix. An expert storyteller, Bedini makes the crazy yarn of Hanno, the wandering elephant who came to live with lions in the Vatican, create its own pecuUar and infinitely deUghtful logic.

Ingrid D. Rowland

University of Chicago

Martin Luther. Learning for Life. By MarUyn J. Harran [Concordia Scholarship Today] (St. Louis: Concordia PubUshing House. 1997. Pp. 288. $16.99 paperback.)

This is a very useful book, weU researched and succinctly written. The author is a professor of religion at Chapman University, Orange, California, with well established credentials as a Luther scholar (focus on his "conversion"). This book presents a detailed study of Luther's academic and spiritual formation, conclud-

ing with Luther's view of education as the principal means of Christian witness in a complex world.

The first four chapters present Luther's own detailed experiences of learning from elementary education to the doctorate in biblical studies; the last three chapters present an assessment of Luther's "success" in changing medieval and sixteenth-century education. The "introduction" addresses the question of "Luther and Education in the Age of Internet"; and the "conclusion" offers a summary of what Luther viewed as "learning for life."

What makes the book very useful is its clear compilation and critical assessment of the complex evidence on the young Luther in primary and secondary sources. Neuralgic issues are soberly presented and analyzed, be they the problematic study of Erik Erikson, the controversies about the date of Luther's spiritual "breakthrough," or the research of Gerald Strauss on Luther's failure as an educator.

Reading this book will enforce the author's conclusion that Luther was quite independent in his view of learning. He was neither a Humanist, nor an elitist, but an advocate of a broad, inclusive program of education based on his insight that all Christians are priests through baptism and have a clear vocation in this world. Luther fought not only illiteracy, be it rational or spiritual, but an ideology that refused to grant education to everyone. In this sense, Luther's view of learning is quite consistent with his vision of Christian freedom: liberation from the spiritual bondage of righteousness by moralistic works leads to freedom from the ideological chains on the minds of naive Christians.

The book is minimally illustrated, with an index and a bibliography. It belongs on any shelf of books on Luther.

Eric W Gritsch

Gettysburg Lutheran Seminary (Emeritus)

Remembering the Renaissance: Humanist Narratives of the Sack of Rome. By Kenneth Gouwens. [Brill's Studies in Intellectual History. Vol. 85.] (Leiden: Brill. 1998. Pp. xix, 232. $85.50.)

The year of the Lord 1527 is a pivotal date for students of Early Modern Europe. I vividly remember hearing a revered professor, more than three decades ago, announce that the Sack of Rome was the end of the Renaissance! The number of publications dealing with the Italian Renaissance that conclude with the infamous Sack reinforced this conclusion. Over the years, I have found this agreed-upon notion most puzzling, because my own research into the institutions and practices of the Roman Curia before and after the catastrophe seemed to indicate more continuity than change. I now begin to understand. Kenneth Gouwens' analysis of the work of four Roman humanists written dur-

ing and shortly after these events sheds light on perceptions that have endured for four centuries and more.

Professor Gouwens studied the literary reactions of four of the humanists who had been part of the court of Clement VII; although these works vary in form and substance, they are all set in prescribed classical forms: orations, Virgilian narrative poetry, Ciceronian "familiar" letters, and a dialogue. The first two authors, Pietro Alcionio and Pietro Corsi, were unfortunate enough to have endured the sack in person—indeed, Alcionio's death within the year probably resulted from a wound he sustained fleeing for the protection of the Castel Sant'Angelo. The third, Jacopo Sadoleto, had prudently left Rome for his diocese of Carpentras in Provence shortly before the attack; the fourth, Pierio Valeriano, was in Florence as tutor to the Medici nephews during that fateful May.

Professor Gouwens discusses the reactions of each at length. Alcionio's orations range from outrage over the Christian burial of the slain Charles of Bourbon, leader of the Imperial forces, to a plea to the Emperor Charles V to a violent denunciation of the same emperor, to a panegyric of the author's new patron, the imperialist Cardinal Pompeo Colonna. Corsi vividly describes the devastation of the city and its contado in his poem, Romae Urbis Excidium, a long lament. Sadoleto's epistles to his friends show that he was hesitant in approaching his old patron, the pope, and only wrote to him directly in September of 1527. During the 1530's, Valeriano wrote a dialogue in which he catalogues the unhappy fate of humanists, many from the Roman sodalities, but also from elsewhere in Italy. Professor Gouwens asks what these writings suggest about changing perspectives of Roman humanists, to what extent the Sack represented a "watershed in Roman Renaissance history," and finally, what did this experience tell us about the significance of traumatic events "as historical or historiographical markers?" (p. 6).

Gouwens' findings are convincing. Despite the variety of subject matter, all four humanists recognize that the events of May, 1527, have ended something significant, that the "golden age" of Rome, as they remember it, is forever lost. Using recent studies in cognitive psychology to support his thesis, Professor Gouwens argues that events tend to shape memory and tiiat the idyllic days mourned by our protagonists were more fantasy than reality. He shows that the actual pre-Sack humanist sodalities of Rome were far less attractive affairs, ridden with pettiness, jealousies, superficiality, and back-biting. While Pietro Corsi continued to propound pre-Sack humanist ideology, his work was increasingly shallow and, ultimately, irrelevant. Alcionio died almost at once, but he had already broken the curialist code by withdrawing from the patronage of the besieged pope in favor of the politically more potent Cardinal Colonna. Sadoleto's letters show him increasingly distancing himself from Rome psychologically, and finally determining that his true calling was that of the good shepherd to his diocese and the solitary scholar in his study. He would, to be sure, reappear in Rome in 1536 to become one of the members of Paul Ill's reform commission, but he returned as an outsider, an observer, a reformer, no longer a courtier.

Valeriano remained faithful to Clement VII, but after the pope's death he withdrew to his benefices in Belluno, where he spent the rest of his days, writing and teaching.

This elegant book, beautifully written and eminently persuasive, argues that the gilded and fond memories of these humanists have in fact helped to shape the conventional historiography of the Italian Renaissance since the sixteenth century. In this sense, the Sack did represent a watershed, and the traumatic nature of those experiences became "historical or historiographical markers" for us all. I am grateful to Kenneth Gouwens for his prose, for his meticulous scholarship, and for his acute insights.

Barbara McClung Hallman

California Polytechnic State University
San Luis Obispo, California

Accommodating High Churchmen: The Clergy of Sussex, 1700-1745. By Jeffrey S. Chamberlain. (Urbana and Chicago: The University of Illinois Press. 1997. Pp. xix, 192. $32.50.)

Of the two best-known English churchmen of the eighteenth century, one spent his days dizzy from port while the other (who needed a clearer head) was mostly dizzy from politics. The first was Parson Woodforde, the second the Vicar of Bray. Both, in their different ways, were forever in search of a party. In that pursuit they seem somehow representative of a church whose character (indeed charism) has been a splendid adaptability to the claims of pleasure and profit. Anglicanism's ability to acquire protective clothing has been, over the years, little short of miraculous. Making peace with the powers that be has been the key to its survival. To be sure, one man's pragmatism is another man's perfidy. Even so, Christ himself recognized the need to render unto Caesar: a convenient injunction for those who would seek a good living as well as good living. Nor is this of merely historical curiosity. The present reviewer found himself recently at Sunday worship in St. John's Cathedral, Hong Kong. "O Lord, save the Queen" had been erased from the order of service and in its place was written, quite without embarrassment, "O Lord, save our rulers." Somewhere in that humid outpost a new Vicar of Bray was memorizing Mao.

Such thoughts are prompted by Jeffrey Chamberlain's fine study of Sussex Anglicanism after the Hanoverian Succession. If ever there was an accommodation of old and new orders it was that between High Churchmen and triumphant Whiggery in the reigns of the first two Georges. The traditional alliance between the High Church and the Tory Party was shattered, and in its place came a more relaxed attitude to the politics and churchmanship of the Whigs. Much of this reflected common sense. Toryism based on Jacobite nostalgia was manifestly a lost cause once the Hanoverians had come into their

kingdom. Indeed, the very nostalgia was recognition that the cause was lost. Occasionally when in their cups, High Churchmen longed for the king across the water, but in their hearts they knew he was not going to come. Besides, another reason for Toryism—the need to fight Dissenters—diminished as dissent itself diminished. In fact a greater threat was heterodoxy, and in that struggle High and Low Churchmen could make common cause. Moreover, the Whigs turned out not to be so bad after aU. The Pelham family (of whom the scion was the Duke of Newcastle, the greatest political broker of his day) proved to be perfectly pious in their own way. Patronage from such a source was no shame. This is not to say, of course, that High Church Toryism disappeared. Nor is it to argue that Whigs unUaterally co-opted the High Church to suit their own purposes. Some such co-option indeed took place, but as Dr. Chamberlain argues, "it would be just as true to say that High Churchmen succeeded in modifying Whiggery" (p. 93). There was a great deal more to the relationship between High Churchmanship and Whiggery than piety in search of patronage. In Bray the vicar may have been brazen; in Sussex he was subtle.

Dr. Chamberlain's book, pleasingly written and persuasively argued, may be commended with entire confidence. It is sober and serious: more sober, at any rate, than anything Parson Woodforde might have produced.

Dermot Quinn

Seton Hall University

Late Modern European

Le Silence des moines: Les Trappistes au XIXe siècle, France-Algérie-Syrie. By Bernard Delpal. (Paris: Beauchesne. 1998. Pp. viii,612. 381FF.)

Bernard Delpal has assembled a vast amount of archival material about individual Trappist foundations, principally in France but with attention to North Africa and the Near East. The study began as a thesis of 1,035 pages directed by Claude Langlois and J.-M. Mayeur. It is now a source book of steps and statistics for the foundation and development of the monasteries, and an explanation of the spiritual and material accomplishments of the monks. Steps and statistics predominate—largely: Delpal had the doctoral candidate's obUgation to amass aU the data he could find. "It is, then, legitimate, in Ught of statistics and the great quantity of data furnished by them, to work up a type of 'monastic demography'" (p. 144); hence, a study of stages in monastic life (postulancy profession, death), structural elements (social condition, age, type of monk), and broad historical background.

The monastery of AiguebeUe was arguably the center of Trappist survival and revival in the nineteenth century. Delpal leads up to the AiguebeUe phenomenon with pages on the compUcations of the Cistercian reform known specifically as Trappist, the name taken from the monastery of La Trappe as

transformed by Jean-Armand Le Bouthillier de Raneé (1626-1700). The historical problem of survival and revival never admits of an easy solution; so the relation of La Trappe to the medieval monasteries of Cîteaux and Clairvaux and to the new nineteenth-century foundations is not always clear. Furthermore, the de Raneé reform was itself redone at the beginning of the nineteenth century by Dom Augustin Lestrange, who added a powerful note of expiation—in view of the atrocities of the Revolution—to the already heavy asceticism of de Raneé.

From the beginning of the revival of Aiguebelle—and the Trappistine monastery of Maubec—Trappists were to be a nucleus of dynamic Christianity, inaccessible to compromise, in the face of institutionalization and routine. Leaders dreamed of reconstituting the coenobitic communities of Egypt, Syria, Palestine, and the western Mediterranean. The French monasteries themselves could be compared to the experiments of Egypt. The Algerian foundation of Staouëli receives most attention as Africa's "window on the West." There is full documentation of an established foundation with charts of ages at profession and at death of choir monks and lay brothers, admissions, professions, five-year changes in monastic population. The motto of the French governor General Bougeaud, ense et aratro (by axe and plow), was extended in the monastic motto ense, cruce et aratro (by axe, cross, and plow). Celebrities, functionaries, politicians, researchers, journalists sought out the monastery: in the midst of the debates about Algeria at the beginning of the Second Empire Staouëli became a major symbol of French colonial goals. Maintenance of good health was a primary challenge in Africa, but elsewhere (e.g., Notre-Dame des Neiges, Notre-Dame du Désert) Trappists prioritized elimination of miasmas by clearing of land, especially swampland; malaria was a major enemy.

Dealing with monastic formation, industries, and educational apostolates, Delpal gives data on personalities and moral and spiritual achievements, and education of aspirants, i.e., tables on rejection/departure of aspirants and the reasons for these rejections/departures. Chocolate factories were at once an industrial success and a spiritual dilemma. "Concern for the temporal" is juxtaposed to the spiritual reforms of the abbot who embraced this concern, Jean-Baptiste Chautard, one of the best-known Trappist authors of the century. Industry caused a "major rupture with observance and tradition, and overturned attitudes on economy, work, riches, gain, and money" (p. 342). Difficulties in running an orphanage do not get great attention (undoubtedly because of less in sources). We get data on rehabilitation and formation, rules and etiquette for orphans, but little analysis of this extremely complex spiritual/missionary effort.

The chapter "Asceticism, Compromise, and Spirituality" makes a vital comparison between the public image of the Trappists and their own image of themselves: two generic imaginaires. The monks had to set themselves to the task of promoting their real work. Juxtaposed here is the discussion of a matson de correction, in effect a reform school. This, too, must have been a com-

plexly challenging ministry for the men. "Trappists and the State" looks at the expiatory function assigned to Trappists as opposed to the decadent state. "Trappists and the Holy See" is a look at the technicalities of vows, and Trappist submission to the Roman system of orders and congregations. Studies were assigned an ambiguous place in formation of and for the interior life—some abbots being wary of speculative theology.

In the last pages of the book, Delpal gives spirituality the emphasis it may well have deserved from the beginning. Passive contemplation and holy abandonment, a certain rediscovery of St. Bernard, and the guiding spiritual influence of Dom Vital Lehodey, Abbot of Bricquebec at the beginning of the twentieth century, are finally dealt with: "Dom Lehodey takes his place then as the source of a true spiritual movement tíiat is closely associated with the search and experimentation rooted in Trappist life, and which has an important place in the modern teaching on [holy] abandonment" (p. 506). Trappist asceticism is reduced to three characteristics: continual penance, total abandonment of self-will, conversion driven by interpretation of the Divine Model; in sum, predominance of the community over the individual. Delpal believes that this loss of self in the "otherness" of the community entails satisfaction in the quest for perfection that may have weakened the order's role as a permanent critic of society and as a lived utopia. But could not this loss of self have (1) made the search for individual perfection less egotistical and (2) clarified the striving for utopia as one of the conditions for its future attainment?

Joseph F. Byrnes

Oklahoma State University

Religion, Politics and Preferment in France since 1890: La Belle Epoque and Its Legacy. By Maurice Larkin. (New York: Cambridge University Press. 1995. Pp. xiv,249. $49.50.)

Maurice Larkin, in the volume under review, adds significantly to our knowledge of the role of successive French Republican governments to free the French civil service from what it termed clericalism in the period before World War I. In fact, the first eight chapters are devoted to the belle époque period before 1914 and only the last three consider France after 1914. The form of anticlericalism practiced by the French Republicans during the belle époque gradually waned in the period after World War I and appears to have declined rapidly when Charles De Gaulle assumed power in 1958.

Larkin's study examines the dossiers of the higher French civil service officers and looks at their religious and educational backgrounds. The evidence is somewhat spotty, but he does examine the lists of alumni as well as alumni newsletters from the Marianist Collège Stanislaus and the Jesuit École Sainte Geneviève in Paris and the Jesuit Caousou in Toulouse, which were the Catholic schools most noted for supplying candidates for the higher civil service.

In order to comprehend the Republican anticlericalism in France, Larkin made an exhaustive study of the Vatican, Jesuit, Assumptionist, and French National Archives as well as the archives of the Grand Orient. The result is a detailed account of Vatican policy under Popes Leo XIII and Pius X. Leo XIII foUowed a poUcy of ralliement with republican France in the hope that France would aid him in regaining the papal territories lost in 1870. Pius X and his Secretary of State Raphael Merry del Val followed a policy of seeking an accommodation with Italy rather than France. This poUcy created great difficulties for the French Church at the very moment of the crisis in the French Church over separation of church and state.

Larkin's basic conclusion is that the French governmental policy aimed at keeping the prefectoral corps free of committed CathoUcs and this extended also to the ministries of Interior and Justice. Promotions of committed CathoUcs into ministries which required expertise such as pubUc works, finance, commerce, and ponts et chaussées were not so restricted. The army was a special case as at the beginning of the wave of anticlericaUsm there were large numbers of CathoUc officers. It took major efforts of staunch repubUcan officers to somewhat redress the balance. Throughout aU of this period there were numerous notations in the personnel files describing the private lives of the officers in question as weU as their wives and children. Of special interest was whether they educated their children in private or pubUc schools. One conclusion is certain: Protestants and Jews were overrepresented in the higher civil service and Catholics grievously underrepresented.

The author writes in a clear and forceful, often witty, style which is a joy to read. This valuable, weU-researched, and remarkable work clarifies the church-state problem such as the attitudes of the Vatican, the role of the Grand Orient in supporting repubUcan poUcies, especiaUy in the Affaire des fiches of 1904. The attitudes of Waldeck-Rousseau and EmUe Combes in purging the civU service of practicing CathoUcs is well treated as is the complex role of Vichy.

Walter D. Gray

Loyola University Chicago (Emeritus)

Romano Guardini: A Precursor of Vatican II. By Robert A. Krieg, CS.C. (Notre Dame, Indiana: University of Notre Dame Press. 1997. Pp. vn, 270. $18.00 paperback.)

The Italian-German theologian Romano Guardini (1885-1968) was an influential figure in the formative stages of the Uturgical movement and a prominent contributor to the modern renewal of ecclesiology. As professor of CathoUc Weltanschauung at the Universities of Berlin (1923-1939), Tübingen (1945-1948), and Munich (1948-1962), he held a series of speciaUy designed appointments which both required and allowed him to teach outside the parameters of

standard theological programs. Guardini developed a pattern of lecturing regularly on three distinct sets of topics: major themes of ethics and Christian anthropology; the New Testament, not in a technical exegetical sense, but through reflections of a meditative nature; and interpretations of philosophical or literary texts of religious significance. This wide-ranging activity led to prolific publication, much of which was translated into the major Western languages, with the result that Guardini became one of the most widely read Catholic religious authors of the first half of the twentieth century.

Interest in Guardini has subsided in North America, though the centenary of his birth and the publication of several dissertations have spurred renewed attention to his work in the German-speaking world. Yet the historical impact of his thinking on the Church remains significant. For these reasons, Robert Krieg, professor of theology in the University of Notre Dame and author of Karl Adam: Catholicism in German Culture (University of Notre Dame Press, 1992), seeks to introduce this prominent theologian to a late twentieth-century North American audience.

After an introduction providing basic biographical information and locating Guardini theologically between Vatican Councils I and II, successive thematic chapters present his thought on seven topics of interest: revelation, the Church, the liturgy, faith and literature, Nazism, Jesus Christ, and the modern world. The usual pattern is to depict the historical and theological context of an aspect of Guardini's life and work, present (sometimes quite selectively, as in the chapter on faith and literature) his theological contribution, and then assess his thought by the standard of the relevant conciliar teaching. The final chapter discusses Guardini's activity in retirement, summarizes the reception of his thought in Germany and North America, and describes his legacy to the Church as a commitment to the twofold task of mining the wealth of the Judeo-Christian tradition and learning from the contemporary world. Special attention is devoted to lectures on Guardini by Karl Rahner, Joseph Ratzinger, and Hans Urs von Balthasar, with Krieg expressing most sympathy for Rahner's observations. The book concludes with two appendices, select bibliographies of primary and secondary literature, and an index of names.

Krieg's work successfully accomplishes its goal of introducing Guardini to contemporary American readers—an achievement that is especially welcome in view of the dearth of recent English-language studies of Guardini. His interpretation of Guardini as a precursor of Vatican Council II is surely justified, though many references to conciliar documents appear forced and risk evaluating Guardini by criteria foreign to his own time. Speculation on what Guardini could have done in certain situations—from more active opposition to the Nazis to adoption of the historical-critical method after the issuance of Divino afflante Spiritu—often fails to consider the more limited range of possibilities realistically open to a man of Guardini's disposition. The account of the Nazis' suppression of Guardini's chair in Berlin differs in some particulars from the version in Guardini's Berichte über mein Leben ([Düsseldorf: Patmos, 1985],

pp. 51-53). The Nazi policy of Gleichschaltung was not a matter of "synchronization" (p. 120), but of forcing into line. On page 154, read Gegensatz for Gegenstand. Nonetheless, despite some weaknesses, this book is an informative addition to recent literature on twentieth-century theology.

John P. Galvin

The Catholic University of America

Der Religionsphilosoph fohannes Hessen (1889-1971): Ein Gelertenleben zwischen Modernismus und Linkskatholizismus. By Chrisoph Weber. [Beiträge zur Kirchen- und Kulturgeschichte, Band 1.] (Frankfurt am Main: Peter Lang. 1994. Pp. 693. $97.95.)

The subject of this four-part study is the tumultuous life of Johannes Hessen, a priest and philosopher of religion at the University of Cologne, who in the course of his life managed to run afoul of church hierarchy, university faculty, the National Socialist regime, and the politics of the Bundesrepublik in the 1950's. A major part of the book is devoted to Hessen's "marginalization within the Church," the reason, the author charges, why he is largely forgotten today (p. 23). Leaving the judgment of the merits of Hessen's thought to philosophers, the author undertakes to document historically "the struggles of an independent mind in the age of ideology" (p. 23). The task is difficult, not least because of the relative scarcity and incompleteness of available sources, a situation not improved by Hessen's own highly selective retrospective in 1959, entitled Geistige Kämpfe der Zeit im Spiegel eines Lebens. The author accordingly provides readers with a valuable array of relevant documents, including unedited archive materials, in the last three parts of the study (over two-thirds of the book).

The yzrsi part of the book is an introduction to Hessen's philosophy of religion as well as the many conflicts spawned by it (more on this later). The second part is a collection of short but illuminating excerpts from Hessen's writings. The third part, entitled "six dossiers on his life and struggles," assembles materials on his difficulties with ecclesiastical authorities (including a critical piece by Karl Rahner), University of Cologne documents from 1924 to 1950 (including a recommendation by Max Scheler, his Habilitationsvater), correspondence regarding his suspension by the Archbishop of Cologne in 1928, State Police reports about Hessen from 1942-43, letters concerning the restoration of his academic status after the war (including a favorable review by Karl Jaspers), and documentation of his political activity against rearmament in the 1950's. The fourth part of the study is an extensive register of Hessen's writings as well as those of collaborators and critics, interlocutors and reviewers.

The author identifies Hessen as an eclectic "modernist," bent on appropriating Neokantian, critical realist, and phenomenological insights into the Augus-

tintan tradition of Catholic philosophy, on the way to establishing an epistemological and axiological foundation of religion. A valuable portrait of influences on the young Hessen (especiaUy Hermann Lotze, Ernst Troeltsch, Rudolf Eucken, and Georg Herding) is given along with a regrettably all too condensed review of his major works, including Die Religionsphilosophie des Neukantianismus (1919), Wertphilosophie (1937), Piatonismus und Prophetismus (1939), lehrbuch der Philosophie (3 vols., 1947-1950), and Religionsphilosophie (2 vols., 1948). With his rejection of rational proofs of God's existence and their impUcations for the relation between philosophy and theology, Hessen is portrayed as a philosopher of religion ahead of his time, more prescient than Przywara and Guardini regarding the need to move beyond Neo-Scholasticism to historical-critical thinking. The bulk of the study is devoted to recounting the major controversies that erupted over Hessen's work: the 1928 censure of his Die Weltanschauung des Thomas von Aquin and Erkenntnistheorie foUowed by his (temporary) suspension from priestly functions the same year, the Church censor's problems with his 1932 pacifist essay Der Sinn des Lebens (in which he identifies Christianity and sociaUsm) and other works from the 1930's, his suppression by the National SociaUst regime (which, in addition to forcing tiim out of the university, interdicted the printing of four of his books and forbade him from making pubUc addresses, apparently for his rejection of racism), his lengthy and ultimately successful struggle after the war to have his ftdl academic status reinstated, the postwar censure of his writings, especiaUy the 1947 ecumenical essay Luther in katholischer Sicht, and finally his involvement with the poUtical opposition to rearmament (and Adenauer's politics) in the 1950's. The author also devotes an entire section to the "Breakdown of Neo-Scholasticism," as a means of explaining, in Hessen's own words, his "rehabilitation in the Church" (p. 187). In addition to summarizing Hessen's personal and scholarly shortcomings, the author's "Concluding Reflections" suggest that the effectiveness of Hessen's model of a "Catholic modernization" accounts for his considerable influence in and outside Germany. According to the author, Hessen's philosophy of reUgion provided an alternative to Neo-Scholasticism (the established ideology of the CathoUc right and the "Center Party," p. 204) and naturaUsm (variants of which include positivism, communism, and national sociaUsm) and thus identified "a legitimate place for a freer form of reUgiosity in a modern democracy" (p. 216).

The writing is clear and spirited, bent on righting an historical wrong and vindicating Hessen's efforts to buUd a philosophical and religious bridge to a CathoUc modernity. StUl, there are reasons to be wary of the book's argument. The extensive documentation, for aU its usefulness, remains selective. For example, in view of discrepancies in police reports of Hessen's public addresses in 1942, notably regarding an accommodation of the National SociaUst "worldview" (pp. 409, 417), it would have been useful to include relevant excerpts from writings of this period, such as Die Ewigkeitswerte der deutschen Philosophie. Moreover, even though the work is conceived as an historical and not a phUosophical study, the presentation of the lines of debate between more

orthodox, Neo-Scholastic theologians and Hessen struck this reader as oriented too much to poUtics and too little to theoretical issues. Indeed, there seems to be a basic inconsistency between the author's claim that his study does not pretend to offer a philosophical investigation of Hessen's work and his conclusion that "ultimately all decisions for and against Hessen are to be explained on the basis of partisanship" (p. 205). There are also a number of typographical errors.

Daniel O. Dahlstrom

Boston University

Religion and Politics in Spain: The Spanish Church in Transition, 1962-96. By Audrey Brassloff. (New York: St. Martin's Press, Inc. 1998. Pp. xvU, 183. $65.00.)

This brief but intense book examines one of the most crucial periods in the history of the Spanish Church in its relations with the Spanish state: the transition from nearly total union to near-independence. The interplay among the different factions in both church and state provides the dramatic tension that makes this a fascinating story. The author commands a wide use of sources which include the press, diocesan bulletins, speeches, and memoirs to form an analytical narrative that flows smoothly and holds the reader's interest. There is no other work in Spanish or English that covers this period so well, with the possible exception of WiUiam CaUahan's forthcoming magisterial study of the Spanish Church in the last century.

Brassloff's narrative begins in 1962 with the opening of the Second Vatican CouncU and its appeal for religious freedom and toleration so at variance with the Spanish Church's dominant position in the Franco regime. WhUe the older clergy retained their memories of the persecutions of the CivU War of the 1930's and promoted the triumphaUst vision of the Church, the younger clergy wanted to break away from the restraints of the 1953 concordat and were already showing their sympathy with the working-class movements. This became and remained one point of tension throughout the entire period, particularly the younger clergy's desire to reconcfle the Church to a coUectivist economic approach at variance with the capitalism of the older clergy and the Opus Dei technocrats.

The new pope, Paul VI, supported the progressive faction and had a number of run-ins with the Franco regime, which by this time was arresting obstreperous clergy and imprisoning them in a special prison. Most important was the Pope's support of Cardinal Enrique y Tarancón, who became the proponent of "the extreme center" in bringing the factions of the Church together. The concordat was reviewed: the bishops wanted to maintain their privileges in education and clerical salaries whUe at the same time attempting to sever relations

with a dying regime. But the tensions of the growing secularization of society that the universal church was facing showed up in Spain as well, along with disputes over the Church's approach to economic problems.

By the early 1970's the clergy began to prepare for the change of regime as Franco weakened, and in fact the Church became one of the most important protagonists in bringing about democracy when the dictator died. But with the new democratic regime, the Church faced more difficult problems: it had taken a positive stand on human rights and freedom, but was now met with the pluralism of the new Spanish society. Furthermore, the new pope, John Paul II, became unhappy with the liberal stance of the Spanish clergy, and conservative churchmen in Spain came into leadership positions. The concordat of 1953 was replaced in 1979 with the "Partial Agreements," which retained some concessions for the Church, but the clergy had to face the secularistic reforms of the socialist government which dominated the 1980's and early 1990's.

By the mid-1990's, Brassloff points out perceptively, the Church found itself caught in the problem of the Church everywhere, that of "the enemy without—postmodern secularisation—and the enemy within—an increasingly disaffected and pluralised membership." And with only thirty percent of the people practicing Catholics, she hopes that the solution will be "less institution and more community of believers."

José M. Sanchez

Saint Louis University

American and Canadian

Seeds of Struggle/Harvest of Faith: The Papers of the Archdiocese of Santa Fe Catholic Cuarto Centennial Conference on the History of the Catholic Church in New Mexico. Edited by Thomas J. Steele, SJ., Paul Rhetts, and Barbe Await. (Albuquerque: LPD Press. 1998. Pp. xx, 436. $4995 clothbound; $27.95 paperback.)

A decade before the Pilgrims landed on Plymouth Rock, eight Franciscan missionaries and other Spanish subjects in Juan de Oñate's expedition established the permanent foundation of New Mexican Catholicism. This book's twenty-three essays span the four centuries of Catholic life that began with Oñate's 1598 entrada into New Mexico. The professional and local historians who collaborated on the volume presented their papers at the Cuarto Centennial Conference on the History of the Catholic Church in New Mexico held in September, 1997, at Santa Fe. Roughly one-third of the papers treat subject matter from the colonial period; another third examine developments in the hundred years following the mid-nineteenth-century takeover of New Mexico by the United States. Of the remaining essays, three explore the evolution of Catholicism in a locale from colonial times to the present, while two others deal

specifically with the period of the Mexican Republic (1821-1848). The range of topics encompasses aspects of the missionary enterprise, the New Mexican apostolic work of the Franciscans and subsequently the Jesuits, the establishment and development of the diocesan church, the pioneering role of Catholic women in the region, the Penitentes, and the evolution of devotions like those to St. Michael, Nuestra Señora de Guadalupe, and "La Conquistadora." Thomas Steele, S.J., merits acclaim as the primary editor who helped turn the various papers into a polished collection of essays.

Several essays offer new evidence and particularly insightful analysis on various elements of New Mexican Catholic history. For examplejoseph P Sánchez examines El Farol Indiano, Augustinian Father Manuel Perez's fascinating 1713 manual in which "Catholic doctrine and Indian culture come together in an attempt by missionaries to reconcile the two" (p. 53). Robert Wright's thorough study of priests in New Mexico from 1780 to 1851 demonstrates that extant primary documentation is not consistent with the standard thesis of a largely clergyless Catholicism plagued by "decline, neglect, and scandal" (p. 220) during this period. Juan Romero offers a nuanced analysis of the renowned priest Antonio José Martínez, especially Martinez's response to the 1847 Taos Rebellion. Romero illuminates some of the complexities in the life of Martinez, an historical figure too often narrowly depicted solely as a Catholic apostate or as a hapless victim of U.S. imperialism and die ecclesial rule of French prelate Jean Baptiste Lamy

Given the rich and extensive history of Caüiolicism in New Mexico, it is not surprising that the volume does not include material on all elements of that history. For example, there is little treatment of events during the last half of the twentieth century, such as the emergence and development of the Las Cruces diocese. Nonetheless, this is a valuable book for historians and other readers interested in New Mexico and U.S. Catholicism. Seeds of Struggle/Harvest of Faith enhances the growing body of literature that makes it clear the American Catholic story is not a univocal narrative of westward growth and expansion, but a multivocal account that encompasses the historical legacy of enduring faith communities in what is now the Southwest.

Timothy M. Matovina

Loyola Marymount University

On the Padres' Trail. By Christopher Vecsey. [American Indian Catholics, Volume L] (Notre Dame, Indiana: University of Notre Dame Press. 1996. Pp. xvi, 440. $50.00.)

Vecsey's ambitious undertaking in this first volume of a three-volume series on American Indian religion constitutes an interpretation of culture change. To achieve this, the author classifies Native Americans in the "Southwest" as sug-

gested in part by the late Edward Spicer. Hence, the book presents sections on early contact in North America; on northwest New Spain (Mexico); on the Puebloan highlands; and on California. Such a scheme thus emphasizes Spanish presence as the primary vehicle of evangelization and transformation.

The author depends heavily on secondary sources for historical detail and on recent interviews with contemporary evangelists and social workers. His concern is less to demonstrate the historical nature of contact between Native Americans and Western culture than to assess the effect of missionary indoctrination on twentieth-century tribal survivors. In this regard Vecsey laments the paucity of information from the Indians' perspective, thus coining quickly, and almost totally, to rely on contemporary statements by modern tribal leaders and Catholic clergy about that history Such a methodology fits snugly into the current tide of revisionist, anti-Western literature dealing with mission history.

All sectors of the Southwest and northern Mexico suffered long periods of Church neglect due to expulsions, secularizations, and a dearth of clerical vocations. Vecsey carefully accounts for these impacts on Indian beliefs and practices. As evidence mounts to confirm certain reversions to pre-Christian rituals and practices, it is also clear that many tribal groups maintained a close adherence to those ritual traits of Catholicism that blended best with traditional aspects of Indian culture. The result is an amalgam of cultural traits that challenge the tenets of orthodoxy.

While this work undeniably deals with the effective nature of the processes of conversion to Roman Catholicism, it ultimately begs the question about the nature and characteristics of conversion. There are two levels of expectation here—what does it mean to be a Christian, and what does it mean to be a Catholic? St. John answered the first question in that "you will know Christians by their love." The second question is usually answered by discovering a complex intertwining of elaborate philosophical premises and sophisticated doctrines. The latter question is what Vecsey and many missionaries are asking; but there were many missionaries, as well as modern-day ministers, who were content with the basic law of love as their criterion of conversion. Love accepts variation; orthodoxy expects unyielding adherence. Perhaps this book had been better titled On the Trail ofIndian Orthodoxy regardless of the historical circumstances of the Spanish missionaries.

Unfortunately, the author does not delve sufficiently into Spanish imperial policy that frequently set the tone for operation of the missions. To say the Franciscans handled the missions not much differently from the Jesuits after their expulsion is a major misreading of Charles Ill's gross interference in mission policy, subjugating it as he did to military purposes. The intense struggle for justice against the absolutist doctrines and policies is simply glossed over by Vecsey, making it seem the Church was responsible for the ugly treatment of Indian peoples—a position as absurd as would be the canonization of capitalism.

Nevertheless, Vecsey's volume is a most worthwhile, provocative, and challenging effort that attempts to tie present to past in the context of religious ritual and belief. His summations of Sonoran Catholicism, problems of authority among the Pueblos, secularization in California, and the recent controversy over Father Junípero Serra underscore the importance of knowing an unbiased version of both human and ecclesiastical history. Far more a treatise on missiology than an historical overview of America's missions, On the Padres' Trail proves the continuing need for a document-based, contextualized history of contact and conversion of America's native peoples.

Charles W. Polzer, SJ.
Arizona State Museum

Visual Piety: A History and Theory of Popular Religious Images. By David Morgan. (Berkeley: University of California Press. 1997. Pp. xviii, 265. $35.00.)

David Morgan, an art historian at Valparaiso University, is concerned with how the most predictable of mass-produced religious imagery may be invested with "vital meanings" in the lives of those who find the art useful (p. xv). In pursuit of this, he has composed a short but densely written book on popular Christian art in the United States. Visual Piety considers both Protestant and Catholic imagery. Its subjects range from the aesthetic piety of Jonathan Edwards to the contemporary placement of religious prints in the home. It attempts to provide a history of popular Christian images, a survey of domestic religious practices, and a discussion of visual theory. In order to get a better sense of why people use pious art, Morgan placed advertisements in Protestant and Catholic magazines asking readers to send him their views on Warner Sallman's "The Head of Christ." Their responses are analyzed throughout the text to show how people make and maintain their worlds through interaction with religious images. Using Sallman's art as a starting point, Morgan discusses other topics such as the masculine portrayal of Christ in Sunday School art, the "hidden" meaning in art, the role of art to stimulate memory.

While Morgan deals with the realm of the popular, his book would be a difficult read for those who are not already schooled in art theory and cultural history. The book ranges widely through philosophical and sociological texts, and Morgan does not spare us the names of the many people he read before writing the book. Visual Piety is a history of ideas painted quickly and in broad strokes. It rarely considers the influence of technology, politics, or even denominational theology upon the production and use of religious images. Other than quoting from the letters sent to him about the "Head of Christ," Morgan does not include the voices of other Christians. He prefers to give us theoretical discussions about the images in holy cards, for example, rather than do the difficult historical and sociological work of finding examples of how Catholics at differ-

ent times and places have understood the images. It is also unfortunate that the University of California Press only reproduced small black-and-white photographs, thus ignoring the rich potential that the images have to convey information. Visual Piety joins a number of new books on "lived reügions" whose authors persuasively argue that historians of reUgion can no longer afford to ignore the spirituaUty of the majority of religious people.

Colleen McDannell

University of Utah

For Faith and Fortune: The Education of Catholic Immigrants in Detroit, 1805-1925- By JoEUen McNergney Vinyard. (Urbana: University of Illinois Press. 1998. Pp. xviii, 310. $49.95 clothbound; $18.95 paperback.)

Make it local and the story is weU told. Mrs. Vinyard transforms the national story of CathoUc education, told so ably by Timothy Walch (Parish School: A History of American Catholic Parochial Education from Colonial Times to the Present, 1995) and Harold Buetow (Of Singular Benefit: The Story of Catholic Education in the United States, 1970), into an engaging encounter with the past by focusing on the City of Detroit and its CathoUc schools.

While CathoUcs and Protestants in Detroit attempted to open schools in the first period of this story, only the rapid increase in population during the 1830's brought success. The newly developing public school movement competed with these parochial efforts. Taxes were first assessed in the 1840's. This gave rise to Bishop Peter Paul Lefevere's request for pubUc funds for his schools in 1853. This fight differed from those in New York and Philadelphia since Detroit was nearly 40% Catholic and the anti-CathoUcism was not as vitriolic. Rather, there were more opponents to the bishop's plans within the CathoUc fold.

Vinyard's book concludes with the account of the state initiatives in the 1920's to force aU children to attend public schools. CathoUcs and Lutherans successfuUy countered the bigotry, particularly of the Ku Klux Klan, which threatened them.

The heart of the book (chapters 3-7) is most fascinating. The author weaves a fabric of ethnic and convent threads through the parochial estabUshment and management of the city's CathoUc schools. Vinyard indicates the differing educational phUosophies of the several reUgious communities which dominated the Detroit educational scene; she notes the strengths and weaknesses of the diverse forms of the sisters' training. Education in Detroit remained tied to parishes, often due to ethnic forces. Parishes and their daughter estabUshments developed great loyalty to particular religious communities. The author's richest portrayal is of the Sisters of the Immaculate Heart of Mary of Monroe, Michigan, who held a near monopoly of education in Detroit in the 1800's.

Vinyard regularly relates the Detroit scene to parallel events in the nation, seeing both similarity and contrast. One major difference was how strongly the ethnic plurality of Detroit resisted national forces for the centralization of Catholic education in local dioceses. In Detroit the parish remained the locus of the school. One ethnic group which is well represented in this work is the large Polish community, which, due to its own inner divisions, relied on two religious communities, the Felicians and the German School Sisters of St. Francis. Vinyard's central account ends with the beginning of Catholic high schools.

Mrs. Vinyard paints a detailed and attractive picture of a community's struggle to educate its youth, depicts the disparate forces at work in that community which allowed for a colorful diversity in the overall unity of the piece, provides national scenery for background, and induces pride for all who had a hand in producing the current educational landscape.

Note only that the text should read "John Lancaster Spalding" on page 93-

EarlBoyea

Sacred Heart Major Seminary
Detroit, Michigan

Sharing the Bread in Service: Sisters of the Blessed Sacrament, 1891-1991 | By Patricia Lynch, S.B.S. (Bensalem, Pennsylvania [19020-8502] : Sisters of the Blessed Sacrament. 1998. Pp. viii,742.)

Quite fortuitously, I happened to be doing some research at the Vatican Archives in the November week that Katharine Drexel (1858-1955) was beatified in 1988, and I found myself seated eight rows from the altar at St. Peter's Basilica for the ceremony. Even more amazingly, the pensione where I stayed happened to have a copy of the requisite Positio super virtutibus in specie for Drexel's beatification. The celebration brought into the present the fruit of her lifelong ministry with African Americans and Native Americans.

Drexel's ministry concerns were carried forward in the foundation of the Sisters of the Blessed Sacrament. Sharing the Bread in Service looks back at the hundred years of the Congregation, which has a strong eucharistie spirituality. Part One surveys Drexel's family background, noting especially the influences which shaped her consciousness about "the Colored and Indians," as they were referred to in her youth. At a time when the American Catholic Church had all it could do to keep up with the pastoral needs of European immigrants, Drexel bore a considerable amount of financial and physical outlay in the evangelization of African Americans and Native Americans. The section ends with the early development of congregational missions devoted to diese groups in the southwest and in some urban areas in Pennsylvania. In time, the Congregation took over several of the Native American schools originally funded by Drexel. Part Two ("Expanding Mission Fields, 1914-1937") notes the growth of the Congregation's work in the Southeast. Part Three ("Deepening Roots, 1937-

1964") examines the transition under new Community leadership other than Drexel's. In Part Four ("Strong Against the Winds, 1964-1991"), the author identifies the fruition of the Sisters' previous efforts and the time of vital changes in the Congregation as a result of the Second Vatican Council, the Civil Rights Movement, and school desegregation. Appendices contain the names and dates of all the members of the Congregation and a list of the 122 missions and convents founded since the Community's inception. The publishers are working on a way to correct the errors in the index.

Lynch draws extensively on primary sources in the archives of the Sisters of the Blessed Sacrament for her narrative. By and large, the centennial study chronicles the development of the missions which the Sisters staffed from 1891, the year that Katharine Drexel made her first profession. With the exception of the section on the 1960's and the Civil Rights Movement, there is little interpretation provided placing the Sisters' work and lives in a larger context of American history. However, by sheer force of the number of pages, as well as the identification of mission locations, the reader is impressed with the considerable role which the Sisters played in the formation and education of the two groups to whom they went in mission. The addition of a map indicating the sites of schools and catechetical centers would have enhanced this perception. At various points in their history, the Congregation took significant stands in relation to race questions, especially in the southern part of the United States. In addition to the Sisters' role in the formation of local churches, education on reservations, in cities and rural areas, the Congregation founded Xavier University (1925) in New Orleans, an institution which remains a notable locus for higher education for African American Catholics to this day.

Angelyn Dries, O.S.F.

Cardinal Stritch University
Milwaukee, Wisconsin

People of God: A Centennial History of Sacred Heart of Jesus Parish, New Britain, Connecticut. By Daniel S. Buczek. (New Britain, Connecticut: Sacred Heart of Jesus Church, 158 Broad Street, 06053-4104. 1998. Pp. vi, 136. $15.00.)

Although entitled People of God, this history reviews the accomplishment of the three Polish pastors who have held sway in Sacred Heart parish for more than one hundred years. The role of the first pastor, Right Reverend Lucyan J. Bojnowski, who created and sustained Polonia there from 1895 almost until his death in 1960, is emphasized. This is logical. No other pastor of the Hartford Diocese has, in fact, ever had the permission or power to build the bulwark of ethnic Catholic institutions that he did. As the author makes clear, even those who did not share Bojnowski's ethnic background or his faith saw him as a key player in local religious and secular affairs. Yet, we are quick to learn that almost

half of his parishioners left him to become part of a second Polish parish in New Britain some thirty years after he assumed control.

But what of the PoUsh people who were his parishioners? One is struck by the degree to which the factionalism that constantly beset the congregation takes precedence in this history of Sacred Heart over their story of faithful adherence to pastors and parish. According to the author, discord was core to the parochial life of Sacred Heart, resurfacing with weU-documented vigor as late as the 1980's. Despite this, the majority of the congregation endured because of "fierce loyalty" and dedication to the Catholic Church. Moreover, a magnificent church, a school, a reUgious congregation of women, an orphanage, a cemetery, and a home for the aged aU emerged as monuments to PoUsh faith. How could such prodigious growth occur in the face of such turmoil? It appeared that Monsignor Bojnowski must have been more than the briUant buUder.

What was the secret of Bojnowski's persistence? One could assume, from the emphasis given to it, that the loyalty of the "people of God" was highly motivated by fear. Thus, the concern that "Americanization" could destroy the Polish kind of faith or the requirement that the people needed annual certification of the reception of Holy Communion (kartkt) might have been the factors that kept many parishioners in line during the Bojnowski administration. But what of the Uturgical, devotional, and sacramental life during his, and each succeeding pastorate? Was it rich enough to overcome fear, episodes of rancor, and other negative influences? What, moreover, of the role of other workers in the parish, especiaUy the Daughters of the Immaculate Conception? Was it not possible that this congregation of women, a major conduit of the spiritual and corporal works of mercy, did much to enhance the faith of parishioners? Unfortunately, the author is silent on these aspects of the life of the parish.

The people of Sacred Heart certainly valued the powerful citadel of institutions that had been created by their first pastor. They must also have reUed upon the pastoral gifts that their pastors and other leaders of the parish provided. The role of these still-anonymous parishioners and co-workers in forging New Britain's Polonia should also be told.

Dolores Liptak, R.S.M.

Catholic Historical and Archival Services
West Hartford, Connecticut

Bishop Francis Hodur: Biographical Essays. By Joseph Wieczerzak. Edited by Theodore L. Zawistowski. (Boulder: East European Monographs, No. DXXIII. Distributed by Columbia University Press, New York. Also avaüable from The Polish National CathoUc History and Archives Commission, 515 East Locust Street, Scranton, PA 18505. 1998. Pp. 312.)

Bishop Francis Hodur was the founder of the Polish National CathoUc Church. His home for fifty-eight of his eighty-six years was located in Scranton,

Pennsylvania. From that small city, he created what his Roman Catholic contemporaries viewed as a very dangerous schism and an eroding threat to the traditional loyalty of Polish Catholics to the Pope and the institutional church. Though the number of his followers and the extent of his authority were greatly exaggerated, his domain was still impressive. It included every metropolitan center from the Midwest to the Northeast with scattered outposts elsewhere in the United States plus a few in Canada and Poland. Organized into four dioceses subject to his jurisdiction as the Prime Bishop, his independent church was never to be ignored nor taken for granted.

Ironically, the Second Vatican Council and the ecumenical movement intervened. On February 15, 1992, less than forty years after the once-formidable antagonist had died, his church was formally recognized by His Holiness, Pope John Paul II.

Francis Hodur was born in Zarki, Poland, on April 1, 1866. As a theological student, he left for the United States on December 31, 1892, and arrived in New York on January 23, 1893. Accepted as a candidate for the Diocese of Scranton, he finished his studies at Saint Vincent's Seminary, Beatty Pennsylvania. On August 19, 1893, he was ordained by Bishop William O'Hara.

Four years later, his obedience to his superior came to an end. A splinter group from Scranton's principal Polish parish, Sacred Hearts of Jesus and Mary, followed a pattern which had become familiar elsewhere. Its members formed Saint Stanislaus Parish and invited Father Hodur to be their pastor. His defiance immediately earned him a suspension from his clerical duties. One year later, September 29, 1898, he was formally excommunicated.

While that particular ferment was also occurring elsewhere in the Diocese of Scranton, serious Polish independent movements were flourishing in Cleveland and Detroit as well as in smaller locales in Massachusetts. More significantly, Chicago and Buffalo had their own independent Polish bishops claiming Apostolic Succession through ceremonies performed in 1897 and 1898. Not to be outdone, Father Hodur had himself elected bishop in 1904 at the First Synod of his own small, though growing, Polish National Catholic Church. But consecration remained a hurdle until September 29, 1907, when three Old Catholic prelates elevated him to their privileged rank at Saint Gertrude's Cathedral in Utrecht, Holland.

For the remaining forty-five years of his episcopate prior to his death on February 16, 1953, Bishop Hodur consolidated the various Polish dissenting enclaves until his church stood alone in its ethnic opposition to the Roman Catholic Church. His talents were enormous, his oratory fiery, his strategic planning carefully tailored to situations, and his use of the print media exceptional. In the process, he gave to his followers a sense of mission and a pride in their independence. To them, he was an icon to be forever revered for what he had done.

Professor Wieczerzak has devoted twenty years to researching the life of Bishop Francis Hodur. Unfortunately, even before he was commissioned, almost

all primary source materials were either lost or destroyed. As a result, he had to depend largely upon a vast array of American Polish newspapers, journals, articles, pamphlets, and books. His treatment of even the most sensitive of topics has been unbiased. His portrayal of Bishop Hodur's life has been objective throughout. Neither friend nor foe has been given preferential status. As a result, he has made a significant contribution to the understanding of a very controversial prelate.

If there are any reservations, it would be that the author's eleven essays are simply individually published articles. In turn, they offer only glimpses into the life of a prominent religious figure. While many gaps have been filled in and a new foundation has been laid, it is to be hoped that Wieczerzak will continue his task until a final portrait has been produced.

John R Gallagher

Scranton, Pennsylvania

The Missionary Movement in American Catholic History. By Angelyn Dries, O.S.F. [American Society of Missiology Series, No. 26.] (Maryknoll, New York: Orbis Books. 1998. Pp. xviii, 398. $20.00 paperback.)

Missionaries are foreign no more! Angelyn Dries moves them from ancillary status in American Catholic history to their rightful position as gospel evangelizers possessing their own story and purpose. Drawing upon archival sources, secondary literature, and interviews, Dries establishes a narrative which successfully "outlines the main contours of the mission movement" (p. 1).

Dries correctly argues that following the colonial period (1492-1775), immigrant, frontier, and overseas evangelical zeal predated American Catholicism's own 1908 independence as a mission land. Thus the nineteenth century "is not a bleak picture in terms of overseas missions as is popularly believed" (p. 58).

From the Spanish-American War (1898) through World War I (1918) American missionaries moved onto the international stage. Missionaries' relationship to the Modernist controversy in the United States, German anthropology and grace, and the romance of the martyr-hero myth receives Dries's attention, as does the significance of Mission Congresses and the Society for the Propagation of the Faith of the late nineteenth century, and the founding of Maryknoll (1911) and the American Board of Catholic Missions (1919). The Catholic Student Mission Crusade, the Bishops' Committee on Latin America, and the influence of women in medical missions help shape the 1920's.

A skillful narrative which uses well dates, facts, statistics, biographical sketches of missionaries, analysis of missionary meetings and organizations, and examination of varied cultures invites a larger polemic. Who are the animators

of twentieth-century American Catholic missionary impulse—individuals (men and women), reUgious orders or lay missioners, bishops, or sponsoring organizations? Likewise, what inspires missionary impulse—gospel, political realities, evangelical competition, finances, education, or theology? Though specificaUy unstated or unresolved by Dries, these issues serve as her invitation to historians and scholars to integrate missionaries within American Catholic history, missiology, and world history.

Twentieth-century China missions reveal questions of missionaries' cultural accommodation, relief work, service of men and women in mission, death, internment and expulsion of missionaries throughout the NationaUst, Japanese, and Communist periods. Missionaries of the post-World War II era (1946-1959) faced a world of freedom vs. communism. Opinions of Bishop Fulton J. Sheen and Father John J. Considine, M.M., shaped the period. The genesis of the mission impulse to Latin and South America and the conflictual dynamics surrounding liberation theology and the re-emergence of the martyr myth in 1980 is weU done. The conclusion is a synthetic summary of the "themes and threads" in the book.

Helpful would have been Dries's addressing the attraction of the missionary vocation itself. Why were some interested in the missions never sent whUe those having no interest were? Enriching as well would have been comparing the American Catholic missionary movement in relationship to other regional impulses such as that described in Edmund H. Hogan's The Irish Missionary Movement (1990).

Noteworthy are valuable appendices, excellent footnotes, listing of mission periodicals and archival and Ubrary deposits, a rich bibliography, and a thorough index. This book wiU serve as a standard work on the American Catholic missionary experience.

Robert E. Carbonneau, CR
Passionist Community, Catholic Theological Union
Chicago

The Unread Vision. The Liturgical Movement in the United States ofAmerica: 1926-1955. By Keith F. Pecklers, SJ. (CollegeviUe, Minnesota: The Liturgical Press. 1998. Pp. xvü, 333- $24.95 paperback.)

Professor Keith Pecklers of the Pontifical Liturgical Institute of Sant'Anselmo in Rome has written an exceUent survey of the liturgical movement in the United States from 1926 to 1955. This book examines the major ideas and the leadership of the movement.

At times, I found the footnotes to be as interesting as the main text. Professor Pecklers often presents key passages from the writings of our liturgical pioneers, from official documents, and from personal interviews with actual pioneers and their associates. There are a very comprehensive twenty-six-page bibliography and two useful indexes: a subject index and an index of names.

Like many comprehensive surveys, this book can exhaust its readers with details. In the interest of documenting the nationwide contributions of liturgical leaders, there are occasionally a greater number of examples of a particular notion or practice than the reader may care to know.

Despite the valiant efforts to make the rationale behind the liturgical movement clear to both clergy and laity alike, there was and still is a great gap between popular understanding of the liturgy and the actual intent of the renewal itself. This book will definitely help fill this gap. It is a superb introduction to the goals of the movement, especially for those unfamiliar with it.

I found the division of chapters to make eminent good sense. Chapter 1 begins with the European roots of the movement from 1833 to 1925. It highlights the pioneering efforts of European leaders, especially in Germany, France, and Belgium.

Chapter 2 surveys the beginnings of the movement, emphasizing the goal of full and active participation in the liturgy. It summarizes the efforts of and the challenges faced by our liturgical pioneers.

Chapter 3 deals with the connection between liturgy and social justice. It is here that our American movement made its most distinctive contribution, uniting both the social justice and liturgical movements. Unfortunately, this connection was lost during the 1950's.

Chapter 4 is on the liturgical movement and education. It surveys numerous publications, summer programs, liturgical days and weeks, catechetical efforts, study clubs, academic programs, and seminary programs. It documents the difficulties our pioneers faced in finding support for liturgical education.

Chapter 5 deals with the liturgical movement and art, architecture, and music. Ideas such as art serving the needs of the liturgy, liturgies being the highest form of art, or viewing artists as lay apostles were quite foreign to popular thinking. Often the very design of the church contradicted good liturgical theology. Returning the assembly to its proper role in singing hymns and the propers of the Mass rather than delegating them to choirs and soloists was no easy task.

In conclusion, The Unread Vision is an excellent contribution to the history of the liturgical movement in the United States. It is inspiring to revisit the goals

and ideals of the pioneers who have gone before us. While we have done well in liturgical renewal, there is still a great deal to be accomplished.

Robert L.Tuzik

Mount Prospect, Illinois

Guardian of America: The Life of James Martin Gillis, C.S.P. By Richard Gribble, C.S.C. (New York; Mahwah, New Jersey: Paulist Press. 1998. Pp. iv, 368. $22.95 paperback.)

To underscore his belief that the "art of biography" had fallen on hard times, the renowned biographer Lytton Strachey once observed that "we do not reflect that it is perhaps as difficult to write a good life as to live one." Father Richard Gribble's life of James Martin Gillis, C.S.P., ably demonstrates that, all difficulties notwithstanding, the art of biography is not dead, and still serves as a fine vehicle for iUuminating both the particular and the universal lessons of the past.

In the chronicles of American Catholicism, the contribution of Gillis, surely one of the leading clergymen of his time and the outstanding representative of his Paulist community, has been insufficiently appreciated by historians. (Fittingly, the book was published by the Paulist Press.) Building upon and superseding the earlier biography written by J. F. Finley C.S.R, forty years ago, Gribble set out to correct that oversight; he has succeeded admirably by writing a prodigiously researched and balanced account of Gillis' life, properly rooted in the rich soil of the American religious landscape during the critical middle years of the twentieth century.

Thoroughly analyzing the conflicted life of his subject in all of its facets—missionary, journalist and editor of the Catholic World, syndicated newspaper columnist, and charismatic preacher (in both the traditional pulpit and as a featured speaker on the "Catholic Hour" radio broadcasts)—Father Gribble succinctly summarizes the essential James Martin Gillis as a Paulist priest who "voiced his tightly held convictions in his perceived role as GUARDIAN OF AMERICA." Always controversial and conservative, Gillis projected his personal tensions and demons onto an American society in desperate need of religion.

The key to understanding Gillis—and much of American Catholic history during the tumultuous times of the Great Depression, World War II, and the Cold War—is to be found in his dualistic world view. This dualistic lens was one shared by many of his famous, or infamous, Catholic contemporaries and fellow priests—the parallels between Gillis and the more famous Fulton Sheen come immediately to mind (as noted on the back cover publicity capsule of the book). Unlike Sheen, however, Gillis proved unable to adjust to changing times, calling to mind the less flattering image of the other "radio priest" of the thirties.

In both Gillis' writings, and the recollections voiced after his death in 1957, images of warfare and fighting for the Lord abound; the ultimate contest was fought on a battleground which pitted the forces of light and goodness against the forces of darkness and evil. Throughout a long and productive life, James Martin Gillis fought valiantly against myriad manifestations of these forces—Satan, secularism, and Communism—guided by his steadfast faith in Christ and the cross, the "fear of God" as his shield. According to Gribble, these stark images shed light on the private as well as the public life of the Paulist priest.

Employing Gillis' own references to the "heart and soul of man as a battleground of Titans" and applying the self-assessed "Jekyll and Hyde" metaphor from Gillis' conflicted mind and soul (between the public and private sides of his personality and spirituality) throughout his book—sometimes to an excessive degree—Father Gribble has written a fine interpretation of this zealous "guardian" of the traditional values of his Church and his nation. Among its greatest strengths is the even-handed yet critical tone which Gribble adopts; acknowledging that Gillis' struggles often bordered on obsession in no way takes away from his appreciation of the significance of James Martin Gillis' contribution as a man of profound courage and discipline. In the final analysis, the life of James Martin Gillis gave witness to an exemplary struggle for spiritual renewal—for himself, his Church, and his nation. And students of American Catholicism owe a debt of gratitude to Richard Gribble, C.S.C, for his exemplary efforts to preserve his subject's memory, and for demonstrating anew that the "art of biography" lives on as a prism of history.

Kathleen L. Riley

Ohio Dominican College

Harold S. Bender, 1897-1962. By Albert N. Keim. (Scottdale, Pennsylvania: Herald Press. 1998. Pp. 590. $23-99 paperback.)

As the dominant intellectual and ecclesiastical leader of Mennonites in the United States in this century, Harold S. Bender has long been in need of a proper biography. In the early 1990's, the Mennonite Historical Society—one of the many church agencies which Bender had founded—tapped Albert Keim of Eastern Mennonite University to write one. The result is a book that stands not only as the definitive biography of Bender, but also as a landmark study in recent Mennonite historical scholarship.

Keim adeptly moves through the major passages of Bender's life, repeatedly setting him and events in their larger historical context. For example, he shows how Bender's father performed a leading role in the Mennonite "quickening" of the turn of the century, in which progressive members of this rural ethnoreligious sect urged the adoption of outside innovations such as mission agencies and Sunday Schools. By the 1920's, however, conservative leaders

endeavored to draw the Une against further change by maintaining strong channels of church hierarchy, which they themselves headed. This is the context into which Bender came into adulthood, and it marked him accordingly. As a young progressive, his choices were either exUe, or a pragmatic acceptance of the possibilities that could be achieved within the limits imposed by conservative control. Bender was temperamentaUy suited for the latter course; Keim summarizes his "regard for decorum and authority, his instinctive search for a middle-ground, his aversion to risk-taking … his comfort with conventional orthodoxy, his persistence, and his intellectual prowess" (p. 118).

By the 1950's, such character traits had helped to establish Bender at the apex of upwards of fourteen major Mennonite church institutions or church bureaucracies. This rise was made possible both through his adept mastering of church politics and through the compelling vision he mapped out for the church. Keim carefuUy explores the development and inteUectual power of Bender's fundamental "Anabaptist Vision"—a conception that, says Keim, emerged as Bender's ultimate contribution to his church.

Keim's Bender is not without flaws, however. Goshen College faculty colleagues found him "pushy and impetuous" (p. 226); as faculty dean and chair of Mennonite Central Committee, he moved people around like chess pieces. He guarded his own authority jealously, unwilling or unable to delegate it, Keim shows. Not surprisingly, he repeatedly ran into personality conflicts with other titanic egos of his church who did not defer to him. Also a result of such tendencies, Bender's life was terribly overloaded, and he paid the price in other ways: in his teaching effectiveness (pp. 342-343), and perhaps, Keim hints (p. 409), his own inattention to his famUy Ufe.

Keim might have taken these critiques fürther. As the fundamentaUst-modernist dispute divided his church, Bender remained safely on the sidelines, but performed a cheerleading role for the purposeful and directed smears of his father-in-law, the leading anti-modernist crusader John Horsch. Bender's relentless drive for power had a darker side. Nonetheless, Keim has done a masterful job in summarizing the complexities and contributions of this Mennonite leader in a manner that sheds much light on the story of his people in the historical context of twentieth-century America.

Perry Bush

Bluffton College

The Catholic Crusade against the Movies, 1940-1975. By Gregory D. Black. (New York: Cambridge University Press. 1998. Pp. xi, 302. $59.95 cloth; $17.95 paperback.)

In The Catholic Crusade against the Movies, 1940-1975, Gregory Black (professor of communication studies at the University of Missouri-Kansas City)

continues the story he began in his 1994 work, Hollywood Censored: Morality Codes, Catholics, and the Movies. In the earlier work, he chronicled the events that led to the 1934 adoption of the Motion Picture Production Code and the formation of the Production Code Administration (PCA). In The Catholic Crusade against the Movies, he documents the work of the PCA over the next four decades, focusing in particular on its relationship with what Black describes as "its alter ego," the Legion of Decency.

Black begins by summarizing the pressures and compromises that brought the PCA into being (Chapter 1), then goes on to document postwar challenges to the Production Code (Chapter 2), challenges from foreign films (Chapter 3), and various attempts by the Legion to continue functioning after the 1952 Supreme Court decision extending First Amendment protection to motion pictures definitively altered the status of movie censorship nationwide (Chapter 4). The book's final three chapters describe battles over challenges to the Production Code in the 1950's and 1960's, changes in the personnel and approach of the Legion, and the eventual abandonment of the Production Code in favor of an age-based ratings system.

Like Black's earlier book, this one is primarily a series of case studies, chronicling the negotiations among Hollywood producers, the staff of the PCA, and the Legion of Decency concerning the relatively few films over which the groups disagreed—Duel in the Sun, Forever Amber, A Streetcar Named Desire, Iolita, Baby Doll, Tea and Sympathy, and Suddenly Last Summer, among others. It presents ample archival information, drawing on the archives of the PCA and the Legion, and of relevant dioceses, studios, and individuals. What is missing from his account is an informed interpretive context for these debates. It is relatively easy to trace a rancorous debate through the archives and present the participants' best shots in print; it is more difficult to explain why the vast majority of studio producers "meekly removed any scene that offended the church" (p. 1). Black's assertion that such submission was "indefensible" (p. 242) and a "sad commentary" (p. 244) does little to explain how and why it was sustained for so long. Asserting that Hollywood producers and studio heads were motivated primarily by profit does little to explain why they thought the most effective path to that profit was collaboration with the Catholic Church.

If the Legion was indeed, able to "force," "coerce," "threaten," and "demand" "that offending films be altered to Catholic tastes," why did anyone listen? If "For more than three decades the industry's PCA and the Catholic church's Legion had demanded that the movies adhere to a moral code that had little to do with morality" (p. 239), how did they achieve the significant level of adherence that characterized the functioning of the PCA for most of the mid-twentieth century? Far from having "little to do with morality," Catholic efforts were informed by self-conscious and explicit moral codes—ones uncongenial in contemporary terms, perhaps, but worth investigating, since they constitute the

intellectual history of the conflicts Black documents. Filling in the outlines of that history might have illuminated the Legion positions that he found "curious" or "ironic" or "surprising."

For a much fuller understanding of this background, readers are referred to Frank Walsh's Sin and Censorship (Yale University Press, 1996), which contains all the information available in Black's two volumes, along with a nuanced appreciation for the complexity of the struggle for cultural control that characterized American society as a whole as it attempted to come to grips with twentieth-century transformations in mass culture.

Una M. Cadegan

University of Dayton

NOTES AND COMMENTS

Association News

Next year the American Catholic Historical Association wiU hold its spring meeting jointly with the American Society of Church History at Santa Fe on April 28 and 29 (the Friday and Saturday of Easter Week). In this way the Association wiU participate in the celebration of the sesquicentennial of the erection of the episcopal see of Santa Fe. The archdiocesan archivist, Marina Ochoa, wiU be in charge of local arrangements. The chairman of the Committee on Program wiU be Sandra Yocum Mize. Proposals for sessions or individual papers should be sent to Dr. Mize by October 1, 1999, in care of the Department of Religious Studies, University of Dayton, 300 CoUege Park, Dayton, Ohio 45469-1480; e-mail: mize@checkov.hm.udayton.edu.

Meetings, Conferences, Congresses, Lectures

On November 23-27, 1998, in the Arabesque Alcazar or royal palace of SeviUe.a major international congress commemorated the 750th anniversary of the conquest of the city by St. Fernando III, King of Castile, from the Muslims. FormaUy opened by the King and Queen of Spain with an array of dignitaries of Church and State, and with ample media attention throughout, the congress comprised thirty extensive addresses (/5o«e«««'«s) and an equal number of briefer papers (comunicaciones) under the central coordinator, Professor Manuel González Jiménez. Among the American scholars who were brought to SeviUe and generously endowed there for their participation were Robert Burns, SJ., Cynthia Chamberlin, and Teófilo Ruiz, aU of the University of CaUfornia at Los Angeles, OUvia Remie Constable of the University of Notre Dame, Joseph O'CaUaghan of Fordham University, and James Powers of the CoUege of the Holy Cross. The varied offerings, praised by one critic as "el corpus más importante sobre la época," wül be pubUshed shortly.

In the Albert Cardinal Meyer Lecture Series held at Mundelein Seminary of the University of St. Mary of the Lake Robert A. Orsi of Indiana University conducted a day-long seminar on January 9, 1999, speaking on "Catholics in American Memory" in the first session and on "Remembering Children" in the second.

An international conference entitled "Vatican II Nears Its End? Hopes, Fears, Disappointments, Prospects" was held at the Château de Klingenthal and Stras-

bourg on March 11-14, 1999, to examine the specific characteristics of the final period of the Council. The discussion focused on the "moment represented by the realization that the end of the CouncU (in terms both of its potential and of certain risks) was nearing, and by the beginning of the reception of its decisions." It was organized by the Fondazione per Ie scienze religiose Giovanni XXIII. Those who desire copies of the papers should write to the secretariat of the Fondazione at Via S. Vitale 114,40125 Bologna, Italy; fax: 0039-05 1-230658; e-maU: isrfond@tin.it.

At the twenty-sixth annual Sewanee Mediaeval Colloquium, which was held on March 26-27, 1999 (see ante, LXXXTV [October, 1998], 787) and devoted to the theme "Last Things: Apocalypse, Judgment, Millennium and MUlenniaUsm," one session was entitled "Franciscan Interpretations of the Apocalypse"; papers were presented by John V Fleming of Princeton University, "Two Voices of Franciscan Apocalypticism"; by David Burr of Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University, Blacksburg, "Angelo Clareno's Apocalyptic Timetable"; and by Larry Hunt of the University of Georgia, "Heat from the Seraph's Coal: Saint Francis as the Prophet Isaiah and Herald of Bonaventure's Sixth Age."

The Canadian CathoUc Historical Association (EngUsh Section) will hold its annual meeting at the University of Sherbrooke and Bishop's University during the Congress of the Social Sciences and Humanities (June 2-12, 1999). Copies of the program may be obtained from Elizabeth Smyth (e-mail: esmyth@oise.on.ca).

The Pontifical Committee on Historical Sciences in collaboration with the École Française de Rome wiU sponsor a congresso internazionale entitled "I GiubUei neUa storia deUa Chiesa" in Rome on June 23-26, 1999. Requests for copies of the program and for other information should be addressed to the secretary of the Pontifical Committee, P. Vittorino Grossi, O.S.A., at its headquarters, Piazza Pio XII, 3, 00120 Vatican City State, Europe; telephone: 379 06 69 88 46 18; fax: 379 06 69 87 30 14; e-maü: vati065@scienstor.va; or at his residence, Istituto Patristico Augustinianum (where aU the sessions except the opening wiU be held), Via Paolo VI, 25, 00193 Roma, Italy; telephone: 39 06 68 00 69; fax: 68 00 62 98. Lodging may be arranged through Courtial International, Via Paolo VI, 25, 00193 Roma; telephone: 39 06 68 65 704 or 06 68 32 293; fax: 06 68 30 85 68; e-maU: courtial.intl@pronet.it.

The third annual Senator Rush Holt History Conference wiU be sponsored by West Virginia University on September 17-18, 1999. The theme wUl be "Power in Society: Culture, ReUgion, and Politics." Proposals for papers should be submitted by April 19 to the chairman of the conference, WUliam Klaus, in care of the Department of History, West Virginia University, Post Office Box 6303, Morgantown, West Virginia 26506.

Manuscripta wiU sponsor the twenty-sixth Saint Louis Conference on Manuscript Studies on October 8-9, 1999. Scholars are invited to present papers in such areas of manuscript and textual research as codicology, palaeography, pa-

pyrology, epigraphy, Uluminations, textual criticism, cataloguing formats, and computer appUcations. Abstracts of proposed papers should be submitted by August 1 to the Conference Committee, Manuscripta, Pius XII Memorial Library, Saint Louis University, 3650 LindeU Boulevard, Saint Louis, Missouri 63108-3302; e-maU: Ermatcj@slu.edu.

Also in Saint Louis the 1999 meeting of the Sixteenth Century Studies Conference wiU be held on October 28-31. Those who wish to respond to the caU for papers should write to Eckhard Bernstein in care of the Department of Modern Languages, CoUege of the Holy Cross, Worcester, Massachusetts 01610-2322: e-maU: bernstein@hcacad.holycross.edu.

Grants and Fellowships

The LouisviUe Institute on December 10, 1998, conferred a grant on SueUen Hoy of the University of Dayton for a study of "Catholic Sisters and African Americans in Chicago (before Selma)."

Timothy Wadkins of Canisius College is a short-term feUow for 1998-1999 at the Folger Institute. His research topic is "A Jesuit at the Jacobean Court: ReUgious Culture and Theological Conflict in the Controversies with 'Fisher' the Jesuit, 1622-1640."

Video

The Sisters of Providence of Saint Mary-of-the-Woods, Indiana, have sponsored a video on the Ufe of their foundress, who was beatified by Pope John Paul II on October 25, 1998 (see ante [January], p. 151). Entitled "Blessed Mother Theodore Guerin: Her Journey of Faith and Courage," it incorporates excerpts from her travel journals and letters as well as historical images, photographs, and re-creations. It was produced by Nineteenth Star, LLC, of Indianapolis, and Ann Ryan Communications, Inc. Copies of the cassette are avaUable for $19.95 plus $4.05 for shipping and handling from the Gift Shop at Providence Center; telephone: 812-535-3131, ext. 143; e-maU: giftshop@spsmw.org. Providence Center is also offering spring and summer tours and pUgrimages focused on the Ufe of Blessed Theodore Guerin; information may be obtained by calling 812-535-3131, ext. 147, or by e-mafl: mrmadden@spsmw.org.

Publications

One section of the issue of Annales: Histoire, Sciences Sociales for November-December, 1998 (Volume 53, Number 6), is devoted to the theme "Transmettre la foi au Moyen Age." It consists of the foUowing four articles: Éric Palazzo, "Foi

et croyance au Moyen Age. Les médiations liturgiques" (pp. 1131-1154); Daniele Alexandre-Bidon, "Une foi en deux ou trois dimensions? Images et objets du faire croire à l'usage des laïcs" (pp. 1155-1190); Marie Anne Polo de BeauUeu, "Le lundi des Trépassés'. Création, diffusion et réception d'un rituel" (pp. 1191-1217); and Jean-Marie Sansterre, "Attitudes occidentales à l'égard des miracles d'images dans le Haut Moyen Age" (pp. 1219-1241).

The quincentenary of the birth of PhUip Melanchthon (1497-1560) is commemorated in the issue of Lutheran Quarterly for winter, 1998 (Volume XII, Number 4), with the following articles: Günter Wartenberg, "PhiUp Melanchthon, the Wittenberg Reformer Alongside Luther" (pp. 373-382); Stefan Rhein, "The Influence of Melanchthon on Sixteenth-Century Europe" (pp. 383-394); Michael B. Aune, "'? Heart Moved': PhUip Melanchthon's Forgotten Truth about Worship" (pp. 395-418); Ralph Keen, "Melanchthon and His Roman CathoUc Opponents" (pp. 419-429); Jonathan W Zophy, "Philip Melanchthon as a Family Man and Friend" (pp. 430-444); Eric W Gritsch, "Reflections on Melanchthon as Theologian of the Augsburg Confession" (pp. 445-452); Robert B. Lynn, "Notes on Melanchthon's Contribution to Church Music" (pp. 453-456); Stefan Rhein, "Melanchthon at the Dinner Table" (pp. 457-460); Charles P Arand, "The Texts of the Apology of the Augsburg Confession" (pp. 461-484); and Timothy Wengert, "Philip Melanchthon's Gift to Caspar von Niedbruck" (pp. 485-489).

A study day on Pierre Viret (1511-1571) was held at Geneva on May 23, 1997. The six papers presented on that occasion have now been published in the Bulletin de la Société de l'Histoire du Protestantisme Français for October-December, 1998 (volume 144, Number 4), as foUows: Dominique-?. TroUo, "L'oeuvre de Pierre Viret: le problème des sources" (pp. 759-790); Ruxanda Vulcan, "'Et que dis-tu à ce propos?' La persuasion au XVIe siècle d'après les dialogues du réformateur Pierre Viret" (pp. 791-801); Bernard Roussel, "Pierre Viret en France (septembre 1561-août 1565)" (pp. 803-839); PhiUppe Chareyre, "'Les derniers miracles de Viret vivant et mourant': Pierre Viret et la réformation du Béarn (1567-1571)" (pp. 841-861); Claude Postel, "Autour de !Intérim fait par dialogues de Pierre Viret" (pp. 863-879); Francis Higman, "Viret en anglais" (pp. 881-892).

Volume 12 (1998) of Studia Borromaica consists of "Miscellanea di studi carolini e federiciani." Some of the articles are as foUows: Claudia di FUippo Bareggi, "Fra libri e lettere, appunti e progetti manoscritti: la biblioteca ecclesiastica 'selecta' per U governo della Milano di Carlo Borromeo" (pp. 17-29); Wietse de Boer, "Il curato di Malgrate o il problema della cultura del clero nella Milano della Controriforma" (pp. 137-154); Claudio Rossi, "Tanquam scholae atque exercitationes. Congregazione dei casi e formazione sacerdotale a Legnano tra Sei e Settecento" (pp. 155-214); Lucia Pelagatti, "Pratiche 'superstiziose' nella pieve di San Donato nel secondo Cinquecento" (pp. 215-238); Danilo Zardin, "Le confraternité e la morte nell'Italia della prima età moderna. Note sul caso lombardo" (pp. 239-252); Mario Maspero and Giordano Monzio Compagnon!, "Le omelie di Girolamo Alié in onore di san Cario Borromeo" (pp.

261-316); and Adele Buratti Mazzotta, "Federico Borromeo, l'Ambrosiana e U suo Sacro Monte di Arona. Disegni e nuove fonti d'archivio" (pp. 317-338).

Catholic anti-Semitism in Switzerland from 1900 to 1945 is the theme of a dossier in the volume (92) of the Zeitschrift für Schweizerische Kirchengeschichte for 1998. It consists of these six articles: Urs Altermatt, "Vom doppelten Antisemitismus der Katholiken in der Zwischenkriegszeit" (pp. 9-18); Pierre-Alain Eltschinger, "La presse suisse face à l'Affaire Dreyfus: Une comparaison entre gazettes catholiques romandes et alémaniques, 1894-1906" (pp. 19-41); Urs Altermatt and Franziska Metzger, "Der radikale Antisemitismus der rechtskatholisch-integraUstischen Zeitung Schildwache, 1912-1945" (pp. 43-72); Christina Späti, "Ein radikaler Exponent des kathoUschen Antisemitismus in den 1920er Jahren: Josef Böni (1895-1974)" (pp. 73-90); Urs Altermatt and Martin Poster, "Gonzague de Reynold: Gegen den Rassenantisemitismus und gegen die Juden" (pp. 91-106); and Lukas Rölli-Alkemper, "Katholischer Antisemitismus und die 'Freiburger Schule.' Eine RichtigsteUung" (pp. 107-123).

The theme "Sources of Social Reform" is continued in the issue of U.S. Catholic Historian for faU, 1998 (Volume 16, Number 4) with the foUowing articles: Richard Gribble, C.S.C, "Church, State, and the American Immigrant: The Multiple Contributions of Archbishop Edward J. Hanna"(pp. 1-18); Deborah S. Skok, "Organized Almsgiving: Scientific Charity and the Society of St. Vincent de Paul in Chicago, 1871-1918" (pp. 19-35); Sandra Yocum Mize, "Unsentimental Hagiography: Studies on Dorothy Day and the Soul of American Catholicism" (pp. 36-57); Margaret M. KeUeher, "Liturgy and Social Transformation: Exploring the Relationship" (pp. 58-70); James T. Fisher, "John M. Corridan, SJ., and the Battle for the Soul of the Waterfront, 1948-1954" (pp. 71-87); Jeffrey Marlett, "Harvesting an Overlooked Freedom: The Anti-Urban Vision of American CathoUc Agrarianism, 1920-1950" (pp. 88-108); and Patricia DeFerrari, "CoUaborating in Christ's Redeeming Work: The U.S. Grail and Social Reform in the 1950s" (pp. 109-126).

The American Baptist Quarterly has devoted its issue for December, 1998 (Volume XVII, Number 4), to the educational 'work of its denomination. Some of the brief articles published here are "A Look Back at the Teaching Ministry of American Baptists," by Grant W Hanson (pp. 233-238) and "Kenneth L. Cober: Christian Education Was His Life," by Kenneth D. Blazier (pp. 247-253).

Edith Stein (1891-1942) is the subject of the articles in the issue of the Internationale katholische Zeitschrift Communia for November-December, 1998 (Volume 27, Number 6), as foUows: Elisabeth Prégardier, "Wer sind sie? Woher sind sie gekommen?" (pp. 484-493); Ulrich Dobhan, O.C.D., "Teresa von Avila und Edith Stein" (pp. 494-514); Reinhard Körner, O.C.D., "'Einfühlung' im Sinne Edith Steins. Ein personaler Grundakt im christUchen GlaubensvoUzug" (pp. 515-531); Beate Beckmann, "Phänomenologie des reUgiösen Erlebnisses im Anschluss an Adolf Reinach und Edith Stein" (pp. 532-547); and H.-B. Gerl-Falkovitz, "EndUches und ewiges Sein. Der Mensch als Abbild der Dreifaltigkeit nach Edith Stein" (pp. 548-562).

Personal Notices

Erving E. Beauregard, professor emeritus of the University of Dayton, received the 1998 Ohioana Library Association Award in Education for his contributions in that area.

Joseph M. McCarthy of Suffolk University has been elected president of the North East Regional Popular Culture Association/American Culture Association.

Thomas M. McCoog, SJ., will be the first occupant of the Donald I. MacLean, SJ., Chair at Saint Joseph's University in PhUadelphia in the autumn semester. Father McCoog wiU teach one section of the course in Western CivUization.

Obituaries

Francis F. Guest, O.F.M., died at Old Mission Santa Barbara on January 13, 1999. Born in Alameda, California, on August 29, 1914, he grew up in a large famUy, which settled in Los Angeles in 1924 and later relocated to Highland Park. In 1928 he entered St. Anthony's Preparatory Seminary in Santa Barbara; after finishing high school there, he made his novitiate in the Order of Friars Minor and his undergraduate studies at Mission San Luis Rey In 1938 he returned to Mission Santa Barbara for his theological studies and was ordained priest in the mission church on June 4, 1941. After teaching history in St. Anthony's for ten years, Father Florian (his religious name) went to Saint Louis University and earned an M.A. degree in medieval history in 1952. For the next five years he taught church history in the Franciscan Theological Seminary at the Old Mission. In 1957 he became a student of Latin American history and anthropology in the Catholic University of America and received a second M.A. degree in the foUowing year. Then as a resident at Saint Joseph's Church in Los Angeles, he enrolled in the doctoral program at the University of Southern California, which awarded him the Ph.D. degree in 1961. Later he spent a year in Rome as research assistant to the Sacred Congregation of Rites. In 1964 he was appointed professor of church history at the Old Mission seminary, and in 1968 he was a visiting professor of history in the University of Southern California, the first priest to serve as a faculty member in that department. In the foUowing year he became director of the Academy of American Franciscan History, located in Bethesda, Maryland, but returned to teaching when the Franciscan School of Theology was opened in Berkeley. In 1976 he went back to the Old Mission as assistant archivist under the distinguished historian Maynard F. Geiger, O.F.M., and the next year upon the latter's death succeeded him as archivist. Father Guest held that position untfl 1994, when he retired.

Professor Doyce B. Nunis, Jr., has written of him: "As a scholar, Father Guest was exceptional. He was a gifted linguist, versed in French, German, Italian, Spanish, and Latin. His breadth of knowledge spanned the centuries from me-

dieval Europe to modern times, from the colonial period to 1900 in Latin America, and embraced the American Southwest and California from the initial Spanish contact, conquest, and colonization to the Mexican War. His research skills equaled his linguistic abiUties—he worked in every major archive and library in the United States, Spain, and Mexico. He was indefatigable in his prodigious research labors.

"These dual talents, language ability and broad research, led to his authorship of some of the most important studies relating to Hispanic California that have been pubUshed. From his brUUant biography of Fermín Francisco de Lasuén (1 736-1803) (1973) to his seminal essays on California Mission history that appeared in the Southern California Quarterly, his reputation as an historian and scholar was weU established."

The Santa Barbara Mission Archive Library in 1996 sponsored the pubUcation of Hispanic California Revisited: Essays by Francis E Guest, O.F.M., edited and with an introduction by Professor Nunis; this book contains aU his articles published between 1966 and 1994.

Father Guest was a member of the American CathoUc Historical from 1965 to 1969.

Samuel Jefferson Thomas MUler, a noted scholar of early modern European reUgious and inteUectual history and professor emeritus of the History Department of Boston CoUege, died of heart failure at his home in Roslindale, Massachusetts, on January 30, 1999.

Born on August 7, 1919, in Jewett, Ohio, a small rural town about fifteen miles west of SteubenviUe, and raised in the even smaller nearby hamlet of Germano, he was the youngest of four children of Munfred Leroy MUler, the local blacksmith of German ancestry, and his wife, Grace Amos MUler, descendant of an old Maryland slave-owning famUy Three of the MUler children later made careers in education: John as a high school teacher and superintendent, Virginia (Smith) as a primary school teacher (and aviatrix!), and Sam. His sister Helen (Smith) became a manager in a New Jersey hotel. The MUlers were colorful and strong-minded people. His early education was in Germano; high school was fifteen miles away in CarroUton. He left this section of southeastern Ohio to study at Ohio State University in Columbus, obtaining in 1941 a B.S. degree in education—a degree he often disparaged for its lack of inteUectual rigor. Following graduation he taught Latin, French, and history in various local high schools. Because of health problems he served in the medical corps of an engineering battaUon of the Army during World War II, being stationed in Puerto Rico. After the war he returned to Ohio State to earn in 1947 a Master's degree in history, studying under the Reformation scholar Harold J. Grimm, converting from Lutheranism to Roman Catholicism, and adopting the Confirmation name Thomas in honor of the great CathoUc inteUectual from Aquino. He subsequently studied at Brown University, where he became part of a multi-denominational group of graduate students who regularly discussed reUgious questions, much

to the dismay of most of their professors. At Brown he was awarded a university feUowship and wrote his dissertation, "A Study in ReUgious Reunion in the Seventeenth Century: Bossuet, Spinoza, and Leibnitz" under the direction of WilUam F. Church, obtaining his Ph.D. degree in 1952. During his doctoral studies he was a Fulbright FeUow at the University of Strasbourg in 1950-51. In Commonweal (56 [fuly 25, 1952], 386-388) he pubUshed a pioneering article, "Trends toward Irenics," that alerted American Catholics to the work of German, French, and English scholars who were helping to aUay the Catholic siege mentaUty, and caUed for open and learned discussions on reunion here in America. To further such ecumenical efforts he began work on the seventeenth-century Catholic bishop, Cristobal de Rojas y Spinola, who labored for the reunion of the churches; he obtained from the American PhUosophical Society in 1955 a grant in support of his research. He was a fellow in the late 1950's at the Institut für Europäische Geschichte in Mainz, where he continued his work on Rojas and came under the influence of its director, Father Joseph Lortz (1887-1975). He spoke with warm affection of his time in Mainz, dedicating to Lortz his first book, coauthored with John P Spielman and entitled Cristobal Rojas y Spinola, Cameralist and Irenicist, 1626-1695 ("Transactions of the American PhUosophical Society," New Series, Vol. 52, Part 5 [1962], 108 pp.), and returning to the Institut in 1963- He also contributed an article to the Festschrift honoring Lortz. To make his work better known to an English-reading audience, MiUer spent considerable time translating his Die Reformation in Deutschland, only to learn that Lortz insisted that he update the bibUography. Negotiations dragged on and MUler was surprised and perplexed to see the work published in 1968 by Herder and Herder of New York and Darton, Longman, and Todd of London with another person listed as the translator and thanked by Lortz.

MUler made his academic career at Boston CoUege, beginning in 1952 and being promoted to associate professor in 1959. He taught courses in the Renaissance, Reformation, Enlightenment, and Ancien Regime. He was also a frequent adjunct lecturer in church history, teaching theology students at the Jesuit Weston-in-the-Woods and at the diocesan St. John's Seminary in Brighton. To St. John's he willed his extensive personal Ubrary. During the 1960's he was caught up in the effort to make Boston CoUege a first-rate CathoUc university and played an important role in setting up the Honors Program in which he taught Honors History. On occasion he regretted having spent so much time in university politics to the "neglect" of his scholarship. He worked quietly away on various projects, publishing articles in Church History, Speculum, The Anglican Theological Review, The Proceedings of the American Philosophical Society, Amen, Le Monde, The Boston Pilot, The New Catholic Encyclopedia, and Colliers Encyclopedia. He recounted with bemusement how his bewUdered coUeagues came to him to ask if it was possible that he was the Samuel J. T. MUler who published Peter Richard Kenrick, Bishop and Archbishop of St. Louis, 1806-1896 (Records of the American Catholic Historical Society of Philadelphia, 84 [1973], 163 pp.)—indeed he was! An article in the Catholic

Historical Review in 1977 foreshadowed his next major work, Portugal and Rome c. 1748-1830: An Aspect of the Catholic Enlightenment ("MisceUanea Historiae Pontificiae," Vol. 44 (1978), 412 pp.). For this work he was given the Alpha Sigma Nu National Book Award from the Association of Jesuit Colleges and Universities in 1980. His coUeagues in the History Department insisted that he apply for promotion, something he resisted doing on the grounds that he should not have to ask for a promotion. Assisted by their paper work, he was named in 1981 full professor. In 1986 he retired from the university, eager to get to work on a project he had introduced in his 1983 article in the Catholic Historical Review, a study of the career and theology of the Utrecht EnUghtenment figure, Gabriel Dupac de Bellegarde (1717-1789), copies of whose correspondence and other writings he had coUected. Unfortunately, his eyesight gave out while poring over the documents, and his final years were plagued by various ailments.

Miller made a lasting impression on those who knew him. In appearance he was in many ways the typical academic of his generation— slight in build, spectacled, with closely cropped hair, sporting a tweed jacket, forever pottering with his high-maintenance pipe, and driving a sputtering Volkswagen Beetle. He spoke in a soft, deliberative voice, but his laughter was hearty and contagious. His lectures were carefully planned, often delivered without notes, and peppered with witty asides. He was a widely read inteUectual, fluent in five languages, a man of high academic standards, who did not tolerate fools gladly. Among the characteristic stories told of him is that of an episode in his seminar: "Sam customarUy had students read their papers to the other students toward the end of the semester. One fellow, who had done Uttle or no reading or research, decided to wing it with a verbose substitute for the real thing. Sam sat expressionless through it aU. When the student had finished his performance, Sam asked his by this time uneasy peers if they had any comments to make. None did. He waited several seconds, then said,'Well,Mr. X, I do: . . . BuU ____!'" To students who made the effort and sought his assistance he was a generous and caring mentor and friend who modeled the life of learning. He invited students and coUeagues to dinner at his home in the Mission Church section of Roxbury where he lived with his cat ClarabeUe and an occasional stray untU the area had so deteriorated and his neighbors became so noisy that he reluctantly moved to Roslindale. These dinner parties with their MoseUe wines and gourmet dishes were held in his formal dining room and study whose waUs were lined with scholarly books, engravings, and maps, except for the one on which hung a life-size portrait of a nineteenth-century New England society matron who stared impassively as the host and his guests engaged in learned but witty conversation weU into the night. He kept in contact with some of his students by deUghtful letters typed on the backs of scrap paper—he was into recycling before it became fashionable! He contributed very generously to various religious causes. WhUe he welcomed the reforms of Vatican CouncU II, he had harsh comments to make about those who sought to refashion the Church according to their own desires. Although an intellectual, he had a deep

appreciation for the simple faith of his fellow parishioners. Sam wiU be missed by many.

MUler was a devoted member of the American CathoUc Historical Association. Joining in 1959, he was a regular reviewer of books and pubUshed articles on the Enlightenment in its journal. He served as a member of the John Gilmary Shea Prize Committee and was elected Second Vice-President in 1980. He was an admiring fan of the late Anne Wolf and of Msgr. Robert Trisco, and was a regular contributor of money to expand the number of pages in the Catholic Historical Review.

His ashes were interred in Forest Hills Cemetery in Jamaica Plain, and a memorial service was held in St. Mary's Chapel at Boston CoUege on March 8.

Nelson H. Minnich

Letter to the Editor

February 19, 1999

Dear Editor:

Father Thomas McCoog's roiling review of my Robert Parsons and English Catholicism, 1580-1610 (ante LXXXFV [October, 1998], 774-775), brought both a smUe to my face and this anecdote to mind. Some years ago when I first visited the Jesuit Archives in London, I enquired whether or not it would be possible for me to go to Lancashire so that I might read the original documents of the Jesuit Stonyhurst Archives. The Jesuit archivist at that time explained to me that this was simply not possible, the frayed manuscripts were in such a state of deterioration, I was told, that I could not view them. Instead, I would have to be content with copies of the Stonyhurst documents housed there at Mount Street. The archivist also informed me that I needed to write to Lancashire so that I could secure permission to use the copies in London. I did, and within the short space of a month's time permission was granted. Nevertheless, the Jesuit archivist was at pains to teU me that the Stonyhurst coUection wouldn't be of much help to me anyway since it did not convey a true picture of Jesuit activities, although other historians, most notably Christopher Haigh, had been foolish enough to think that they could make use of it.

Shortly thereafter I began my work at Mount Street. Some time later, a young Jesuit priest arrived at the office to read, presumably, from the same coUection of copied manuscripts that I myself was consulting. I remember weU what the Jesuit archivist said when he introduced him to me: "Here is a young scholar who is going to make a name for himself." The name of that young priest and scholar? Thomas McCoog, of course. Is it somehow possible that Father McCoog has forgotten our chance encounter in the bowels of the boxes of xeroxes?

The point is that the Jesuit recapitulation of Jesuit history, whether personal or professional, tends to be spotty and self-serving. Father McCoog is the latest in a long line of Jesuit historians who have labored mightily to defend the clerical purity of their clerical predecessors and who in so doing have perpetrated their own "sins," as Father McCoog calls them, of omission and commission. In the category of omission, Father McCoog's own work has shown a curious disregard for the actual political theory and real poUtical activities of politicized Jesuits like Parsons. Insofar as commission is concerned, Father McCoog and the Jesuit historians have for a century attempted to tarnish the reputation of lay historians not by chaUenging the theses of their works but by picking at those historians' choice of sources, attribution of documents, and in some cases arrangement of footnotes. The prime example of this tactic in Father McCoog's review is his conjuring up of the ghost of the most archaic "controversy" of them aU: whether or not Parsons was the real author of the Conference (1594). Time and historiography march on, but not for the Jesuit historians; they are forever mired in the eternal present of seeking to discredit those outsiders who presume to write the history of their order.

Well, in any case, the Jesuit archivist's prediction was correct: Father McCoog has made a name for himself. I also repeat what I have said before: I am glad that he wrote his book on the Society in England, Scotland, and Wales. And while we continue to disagree on being able to disagree, I feel certain that our mutual interest in, though not necessarUy equal passion for, Jesuit history wiU once again lead to our meeting among the boxes at Mount Street.

Michael L. Carrafiello

Miami University, Ohio

Correction

The Maltese artist who painted the image of Saint Paul being bitten by a viper that was used as the cover Ulustration of the January issue was incorrectly identified on page ii. His name was Francesco Zahra. The reproduction was supplied by Monsignor John Azzopardi, director of the Wignacourt CoUege Museum, Rabat, Malta.

PERIODICAL LITERATURE

GENERAL AND MISCELLANEOUS

Augustine and the Amerindian in Seventeenth-Century New France. Peter A. Goddard. Church History, 61 (Dec, 1998), 662-681.

Das Wunder bei Helmold von Bosau und Nestor. Materialien zu einem Kulturvergleich. Christoph Schmidt. Saeculum, 49 (2, 1998), 235-258.

Le scriptorium de Zwettl et ses manuscrits hagiographiques. Joseph van der Straeten. Analecta Bollandiana, 116 (3-4, 1998), 384-403.

Asking the Historical Questions: Angola and the Church 1491-1990. David Birmingham. Neue Zeitschrift für Missionswissenschaft, 54 (4, 1998), 259-274.

Bartolomé de Las Casas y la Escuela de Salamanca en la historia de los derechos humanos. Vidal Abril Castelló. Studium, XXXVIII (3, 1998), 373-401.

Dos relaciones inéditas sobre la fundación del monasterio Jerónimo de Guijosa (1559-1771). José Vicente Frías Balsa. La Ciudad de Dios, CCXI (May-Aug., 1998), 621-643.

Pope Pius XI's "Encyclical" Humani Generis Unitas against Racism and Anti-Semitism and the "Silence" of Pope Pius XII. Frank J. Coppa. Journal of Church and State, 40 (Autumn, 1998), 775-795.

Der Lyoner Märtyrer Vettius Epagathus. Zum Status und zur Herkunft der ersten gallischen Christen. Lothar Wierschowski. Historia, XLVII (4, 1998), 426-453.

Lactantius, Porphyry and the Debate over Religious Toleration. Elizabeth DePalma Oigeser. Journal of Roman Studies, IXXXNlll (1998), 129-146.

A New Look at the Patronage of Santa Costanza, Rome. Gillian Mackie. Byzantion, LXVII (2, 1997), 383-406.

Priscillian and Nicolaitism. Alberto Ferreiro. Vigiliae Christianae, LII (Nov., 1998), 382-392.

Augustinus' verstaan en indeling van de geschiedenis. Martijn Schrama. Tijdschrift voor Theologie, 38 (Oct.-Dec, 1998), 351-365.

Das Werk des Abtes Eugippius. Zum literarischen Vermächtnis eines spätantiken Augustiner-Kenners an die frühmittelalterliche Kirche des Abendlandes. Johannes Hofmann. Zeitschrift für Kirchengeschichte, 109 (3, 1998), 293-305.

Leontius of Jerusalem's Against the Monophysites as a Possible Source for Justinian's Letter to the Alexandrian Monks.}. MacDonald. Byzantion, LXVH (2, 1997), 275-382.

La penisola di Alicarnasso in eta bizantina. II/2 parte: Le chiese di Tavsan Adasi e Monastir Dag: eredita monofisita? Vincenzo Ruggieri, SJ,. and Franco Giordano. Orientalia Christiana Periodica, 64 (2, 1998), 265-303.

Weltflucht und Verwandlung der Welt. Monastische Bewegungen in der Westschweiz im Früh- und Hochmittelalter. Ernst Tremp. Zeitschrift für Schweizerische Kirchengeschichte, 92 (1998), 125-163.

Kranke als Zeugen einer Epoche. Die Entstehung eines religiösen Individualismus im Frühen Mittelalter. August Nitschke. Saeculum, 49 (2, 1998), 216-234.

L'hospitalité, la charité et le soin aux malades à Stavelot-Malmédy au moyen âge (VIP-XIF siècles). Philippe George. Revue Bénédictine, 108 (3-4, 1998), 315-330.

The Bonifacian Mission and Female Religious in Wessex. Barbara Yorke. Early Medieval Europe,7 (2, 1998), 145-172.

Cathwulf, Kingship, and the Royal Abbey of Saint-Denis. Joanna Story. Speculum, 74 (Jan., 1999), 1-21.

Place-names and the Early Church in Scotland. Simon Taylor. Records of the Scottish Church History Society, XXVIII (1998), 1-22.

St-Germain des Prés, St-Vincent and the Martyrs of Cordoba. Ann Christys. Early Medieval Europe, 7 (2, 1998), 199-216.

The Alliance between Church and State in Early Medieval Alba. Kenneth Veitch. Albion, 30 (Summer, 1998), 193-220.

Großmähren, Passau und die Ungarn um das Jahr 900. Zu den neuen Zweifeln an der Authentizität des Briefes der bayerischen Bischöfe an Papst Johann

LX. aus dem Jahr 900. Dusan Trestík. Byzantinoslavica, LLX (1, 1998), 137-160.

Christianity in Great Moravia and Its Centre in Uherské Hradistë-Sady. Ludëk Galuska. Byzantinoslavica,UX (1, 1998), 161-180.

Charters and Episcopal Scriptoria in the Anglo-Saxon South-West. Charles Insley.Early Medieval Europe, 7 (2, 1998), 173-197.

Zum Verhältnis von "Topos" und "Wirklichkeit" in der Vita Petri Damiani des Johannes von Lodi. Stephan Freund. Archiv für Kulturgeschichte, 80 (2, 1998), 297-324.

La Chronologie des abbés de Saint-Florent de Saumur au XT siècle. William Ziezulewicz.T?wwe Bénédictine, 108 (3-4, 1998), 282-297.

Rank and Authority in the Military Orders during the Twelfth and Thirteenth Centuries. A. J. Forey. Studia Monástica, 40 (2, 1998), 291-327.

St Magnus and St Rognvald—the Two Orkney Saints. Barbara E. Crawford. Records of the Scottish Church History Society, XXVIII (1998), 23-38.

St Ninians by Stirling: A Fragment of an Early Scottish Minster Kirk. Alan Macquarrie. Records of the Scottish Church History Society, XXVIII (1998), 39-54.

Henry of Blois and the Lordship of Glastonbury. N. E. Stacy. English Historical Review, CXTV (Feb., 1999), 1-33.

Il "Rythmus" di Maginfredo di Astino e l'espansione vallombrosana in Italia settentrionale durante la prima età comunale. Giordano Monzio Compagnoni. Rivista di Storia della Chiesa in Ltalia, LI (July-Dec, 1997), 341-420.

Die rhetorische Ausgestaltung der kaiserlichen Auslandsschreiben der Komnenenzeit an die Päpste (Dölger-Wirth, Reg. 1320a, 132Ob und 1348). Mit drei Falttafeln. Christian Gastgeber. Römische Historische Mitteilungen, 40 (1998), 197-235.

Minute nel fondo del monastero di S. Salvatore al Monte Amiata. Annotazioni critiche sulla tradizione del privilegio di Celestino II del 23 febbraio 1144 (CDA 344). Wilhelm Kurze. Rivista di Storia della Chiesa in Italia, LI (July-Dec, 1997), 451-462.

Der Dank der Toten. Zur Vorstellung von wechselseitigen Hilfeleistungen zwischen Lebenden und Verstorbenen im Spätmittelalter. Mireille Othenin-Girard. Zeitschrift für Schweizerische Kirchengeschichte, 92 (1998), 165-190.

Diplomatische und historische Beobachtungen zu den in den Kanzleiregistern Papst Innocenz' III. überlieferten Auslandsschreiben byzantinischer Kaiser. Otto Kresten. Römische Historische Mitteilungen, 37 (1995), 41-79.

Sprachliche und übersetzungstechnische Beobachtungen zu dem in den Kanzleiregistern Papst Innocenz' III. überlieferten Schreiben des Patriarchen Ioannes X. Kamateros von Konstantinopel: I. Einführung, Besonderheiten der Übersetzung, Bibelzitate, Edition. IL Wortuntersuchung mit sieben Appendices. Christian Gastgeber. Römische Historische Mitteilungen, 38 (1996), 85-127; 39 (1997), 83-161.

A Letter of Pope Innocent III to the Monastery of Sant Esteve de Banyoles (1216). Flocel Sabaté and Paul Freedman. Römische Historische Mitteilungen,^ (1996), 129-141.

Die Nicopea in San Marco. Martin Schulz. Byzantinische Zeitschrift, 91 (2, 1998), 475-501.

Des sources primitives de la Légende des Trois Compagnons. Maurice Causse. Collectanea Franciscana, 68 (3-4, 1998), 469-491.

Patriarch Gerold and Frederick II: The Matthew Paris Letter. James M. Powell. Journal of Medieval History, 25 (Mar., 1999), 19-26.

Death and Resurrection in the Middle Ages: Some Modern Implications. Caroline Walker Bynum. Proceedings of the American Philosophical Society, 142 (Dec, 1998), 589-596.

Der Oberburger Bistumsplan vom Jahre 1237. Günther Bernhard. Römische Historische Mitteilungen, 39 (1997), 163-179.

The Representation of the Crusades in the Songs Attributed to Thibaud, Count Palatine of Champagne. William C. Jordan./owrwei of Medieval History, 25 (Mar., 1999), 27-34.

En torno a los orígenes de la "Ordo sancti (beati) Augustini" en España. Teófilo Viñas Romás.X« Ciudad de Dios, CCXI (May-Aug., 1998), 477-508.

Le concile oecuménique Lyon I (1245). Quelques aspects canoniques et pastoraux des décrets 1-22. Jean Longère. Revue d'histoire de l'Église de France, 84 (July-Dec, 1998), 337-347.

"... der Welt gestorben": ein Vertrag zwischen dem äthiopischen Heiligen Iyyäsus-Mo'a und König Yakunno-Amlak über Memoriae im Kloster Hayq. Manfred Kropp. Analecta Bollandiana, 116 (3-4, 1998), 303-330.

La Politique beneficíale d'Urbain IV (1261-64) en France du Nord: intérêt d'une approche prosopographique. Pascal Montaabm. Medieval Prosopography, 19 (1998), 81-98.

L'ordre du Temple au coeur d'une crise politique majeure: la Querela Cypri des années 1279-1285. Pierre Vincent Clzverie. Le Moyen Age, CTV 0-4, 1998), 495-511.

Handschriften aus der päpstlichen Bibliothek von Avignon-Peñiscola. Beobachtungen zur Überlieferungsgeschichte der theologischen Schriften Papst Innocenz' III. Christoph Egger. Römische Historische Mitteilungen, 37 (1995), 81-96.

Northern Italian Confraternities and the Immaculate Conception in the Fourteenth Century. Barbara Seün. fournal of Ecclesiastical History, 49 (Oct., 1998), 599-619.

Cola di Rienzo, the Lateran Basilica, and the lex de imperio of Vespasian. Amanda Collins. Medieval Studies, 60 (1998), 159-183-

Medieval Longevity: The Experience of Members of Religious Orders in Late Medieval England. Virginia Davis. Medieval Prosopography, 19 (1998), 111-124.

Crusading at the Court of Charles VI, 1388-1396. James Magee. French History, 12 (Dec, 1998), 367-383.

From Erfurt and Lyons to the Parish Church of Björkvik: The Friars of Vadstena Abbey as Cultural Transmitters. Roger Andersson. Medieval Studies, 60 (1998), 185-218.

Le légat catéchiste. Vincent Ferrier en Bretagne (1418-1419). Jean-Christophe Cassard. Revue Historique, CCXCVIII (2, 1998), 323-343-

Isidoros von Kiev, Begrüßungsansprache an Kaiser Sigismund (Ulm, 24. Juni 1434). Herbert Hunger and Herbert Wurm. Römische Historische Mitteilungen, 38 (1996), 143-180.

Patronage and Appropriation in Ely Diocese: The Share of the Benedictines. Roy Martin Haines. Revue Bénédictine, 108 (3-4, 1998), 298-314.

SrXTEENTH CENTURY

El Monasterio de Santa Isabel la Real de Granada: Su fundación y su Archivo. María Luisa García Valverde. Archivo Ibero-Americano, LVIII (Sept.-Dec, 1998), 491-527.

The Social and Regional Origins of the Henrician Episcopacy. Andrew A. Chibi. Sixteenth Century Journal, XXLX (Winter, 1998), 955-973.

Die Vertreibung der Bernhardiner aus Breslau und der Beginn der Neuzeit in Schlesien. Gabriela Was. Wissenschaft und Weisheit, 61 (2, 1998), 195-209.

Eine Predigt Hildrich Zwingiis im Buchdeckel eines Obwaldner Gültenprotokolls 1526. Kristina Streun. Zeitschrift für Schweizerische Kirchengeschichte, 92 (1998), 191-208.

Le protestantisme en Calaisis aux XVT-XVIP siècles. Alain Joblin. Revue du Nord, LXXX (July-Dec, 1998), 599-618.

Il cardinale Gasparo Contarini vescovo di Belluno (1536-1542). Vanda De Boni. Rivista di Storia della Chiesa in Italia, LI (July-Dec, 1997), 463-491.

Preaching the Last Crusade: Thomas Cranmer and the "Devotion" Money of 1543. Paul Ayris. Journal of Ecclesiastical History, 49 (Oct., 1998), 683-701.

Calvin: A Prophet without a Prophecy. Max Engammare. Church History, 67 (Dec, 1998), 643-661.

The Lord's Supper in Early Modern England. Arnold Hunt. Past & Present, No. 161 (Nov., 1998), 39-83.

"Darke speech": Matthew Parker and the Reforming of History. Benedict Scott Robinson. Sixteenth Century Journal, XXIX (Winter, 1998), 1061-1083.

Girolamo Gallarati, Vescovo di Sutri, e i suoi intervenu al Concilio di Trento. Daniele De Marchis. Toí'wta di Storia della Chiesa in Italia, LI (Jan.-June, 1997), 97-142.

Italian Tridentine Diocesan Seminaries: A Historiographical Study. Kathleen M. Comeríovd. Sixteenth Century fournal, XXIX (Winter, 1998), 999-1022.

Minorité et martyre: les huguenots en France au temps des guerres de religion. Frank Lestringant. T?íwífe.s Théologiques & Religieuses, 74 (1, 1999), 21-34.

Die reformierte Konfessionalisierung als "negative Gegenreformation." Zum kirchlichen Profil des Reformiertentums im Deutschland des 16. Jahrhunderts. [Zweiter Teil]. Harm Klueting. Zeitschrift für Kirchengeschichte, 109 (3, 1998), 306-327.

The Importance of Being Josiah: An Image of Calvinist Identity. Graeme Murdock. Sixteenth Century Journal, XXLX (Winter, 1998), 1043-1059.

Protestantische Heäigen-memoria im 16. Jahrhundert. Thomas Fuchs. Historische Zeitschrift, 267 (Dec, 1998), 587-614.

Literatorum Galliae decus dulcissimum . . . Un échange de lettres entre dorn de Billy et Gerardus Vosius (1580-1581). Steven Gysens. Revue Bénédictine, 108 (3-4, 1998), 331-358.

SEVENTEENTH AND EIGHTEENTH CENTURIES

Father John Chrysostom Campbell "Scotch Capuchin" in Search of an Identity. Stephen Innes, O.EM.Cap. Collectanea Franciscana, 68 (3-4, 1998), 521-553.

Migrations religieuses dans les Provinces-Unies avant le second Refuge. Willem Frijhoff.Tieîw du Nord, LXXX (July-Dec, 1998), 573-598.

Materialien zur Kunsttätigkeit der gegenreformatorischen Orden in Österreich und in anderen Ländern der Habsburgermonarchie bis 1800: II. Das Archiv des Servitenordens. III. Die Archive des Theatiner- und des Barnabitenordens. IV. Das Archiv des Barnabitenordens (Fortsetzung). V Die Archive des Camillianer- und des Piaristenordens. Jörg Garms. Römische Historische .M*WetfM«gew,37 (1995), 145-l6l;38(1996),269-306;39 (1997X277-320; 40 (1998), 413-423.

"The Souls of the Righteous in a Bright Place": Landscape and Orthodoxy in Seventeenth-Century Russian Maps. Valerie A. Kivelson. Russian Review, 58 (Jan., 1999), 1-25.

Una pagina dalla storia delle relazioni diplomatiche tra la Santa sede ed il regno di Georgia. Barbara Lomagistro and Gaga Shurgaia. Orientalia Christiana Periodica, 64 (2, 1998), 359-381.

The Parochial Roots of Laudianism Revisited: Catholics, Anti-Calvinists and "Parish Anglicans" in Early Stuart England. Alexandra Walsham./owrwei of Ecclesiastical History, 49 (Oct., 1998), 620-651.

Firing in Unison? The Scottish Canons of 1636 and the English Canons of 1640. Joong Lak Kim. Records of the Scottish Church History Society, XXVIII (1998), 55-77.

Re-examining Federico Cornaro's Retirement to Rome. William L. Barcham. Studi Veneziani, XXXV (1998), 137-152.

G. L. Bernini a San Francesco a Ripa. Una rilettura per una nuova proposta tematica. Marcello Beltramme. Studi Romani, XLVI (Jan.-June, 1998), 29-59.

R Jurieu et les voies contournées de l'histoire. L'origine, l'écart et la variation. Nicolas Piqué. Revue d'Histoire et de Philosophie Religieuses, 78 (Oct.-Dec, 1998), 435-449.

Emmanuel Schelstrate et les Bollandistes: Lettres inédites à Daniel Papebroch. Bernard Joassart. Analecta Bollandiana, 116 (3-4, 1998), 361-383.

O Padre Antonio Vieira e as Companhias de Comercio. Rui de Figueiredo Marcos, ßofefi'/w de Faculdade de Direito, LXXIII (1997), 149-171.

Von der "Unteren Kurpfalz Kirchengüter- und Gefallverwaltung" zur "Pfalzer Katholischen Kirchenschaffnei Heidelberg." Ein Beitrag zum Doppeljubiläum einer kirchlichen Großstiftung im Erzbistum Freiburg, zugleich zur Geschichte des Pfalzer Kirchengutes seit der Reformation. Eginhard Scharf. Freiburger Diözesan-Archiv, 118 (1998), 161-284.

The Nine Lives of the Episcopal Cat: Changing Self-images of the Scottish Episcopal Church. Gavin D. White. Records of the Scottish Church History Society, XXVIII (1998), 78-92.

Schule und Bruchsaler Priesterseminar im 18. Jahrhundert. Heribert Smolinsky Freiburger Diözesan-Archiv, 118 (1998), 313-328.

Une congrégation aux ambitions modestes: les Montfortains aux XVIIP et XIXe siècles. Louis Perouas. Annales de Bretagne, 105 (4, 1998), 59-68.

El padre Antonio Soler (1729-1783) en el Monasterio de El Escorial. Paulino Capdepón. La Ciudad de Dios, CCXI (May-Aug., 1998), 599-619.

Entre deux États en révolution: Pierre-Joseph Pigneaux de Béhaine, la France et le Dai-Viêt.J.-R Duteil.T?ei>we d'histoire de l'Eglise de France, 84 (July-Dec, 1998), 283-296.

L'élection de l'évêque et des curés constitutionnels dans l'Oise sous la Révolution (1791-1793).Jacques Bernet.Revue du Nord, LXXX (July-Dec, 1998), 637-655.

NINETEENTH AND TWENTIETH CENTURIES

O Sainte Mère: Liberalism and the Socialization of Catholic Men in Nineteenth-Century France. Paul Seeley.fournal ofModern History, 70 (Dec, 1998), 862-891.

The Life, Death and Resurrection of the Cathedral of Christ the Saviour, Moscow. Andrew Gentes. History Workshop Journal, No. 46 (Autumn, 1998), 63-95.

Notas biográficas y tres sermones político-religiosos del P. Fermín de Alcaraz. José Angel Echeverría, O.F.M.Cap. Collectanea Franciscana, 68 (3-4, 1998), 555-621.

The French Catholic Press and the July Revolution. M. Patricia Dougherty. French History, 12 (Dec, 1998), 403-428.

The Making of the Veto Act, 1833-34. Donald J. Withrington. Records of the Scottish Church History Society, XXVIII (1998), 101-128.

Le Saint-Esprit et le Saint-Coeur de Marie; une union de congrégations au XLX" siècle (suite): L'aboutissement. Michel Legrain. Mémoire Spiritaine, No. 8 (2, 1998), 7-29.

Il tentativo di pacificazione religiosa della Svizzera del 1848: la missione di Mons. Luquet nei giudizi di Stefano Franscini e di Antonio Rosmini. Fabrizio Panzera. Zeitschrift für schweizerische Kirchengeschichte, 92 (1998), 209-231.

Katholiken und ihre Kirche in der Badischen Revolution von 1848/49. Wolfgang Hug. Freiburger Diözesan-Archiv, l 18 (1998), 283-31 l.

Débats autour de la christianisation des Noirs aux Antilles et en Guyane française après l'abolition de l'esclavage (de 1848 aux années 1880). Philippe Delisle. Mémoire Spiritaine,No.8(2, 1998), 87-1 10.

Miracle-Working Icons, Laity, and Authority in the Russian Orthodox Church, 1861-1917. Vera Shevzov. Russian Review, 58 (Jan., 1999), 26-48.

Le osservazioni del Cardinale Antonio Maria Cagiano de Azevedo sul progetto del Sillabo degli errori. Stefano Gizzi. Pío IX, XXVII (May-Dec, 1998), 95-101.

La "Asociación Católica" ante la configuración del Régimen Demoliberal de 1869. José García-Cuevas Ventura. Carthaginensia, XPV (July-Dec, 1998), 345-367.

Palazzo di Venezia und Palazzo Chigi als k. u. k. Botschaften beim Heiligen Stuhl und am königlich italienischen Hofe 1871-1915. Samt Anhang über die österreichischen Gesandtschaften und Botschaften in Rom 1921-1997. Rudolf Agstner. Römische Historische Mitteilungen, 40 (1998), 489-571.

Le cardinal Lavigerie et les missions spiritaines au coeur de l'Afrique. Henry J. Koren and Henri Littner. Mémoire Spiritaine, No. 8 (2, 1998), 30-49.

Henry Drummond, Evangelicalism and Science. D. W. Bebbington. Records of the Scottish Church History Society, XXVIII (1998), 129-148.

The Tears of the Poor: John Glasse, Christian Socialist (1848-1918). Michael A. McCabe. Records of the Scottish Church History Society, XXVIII (1998), 149-172.

An Early Attempt at an Anglican Congregation of Religious Orders: The Anglican Benedictines and the Society of the Sacred Mission. Rene Kollar. Studia Monástica, 40 (2, 1998), 329-341.

Francia, Ciña e Santa Sede: la "querelle" intorno alla nunziatura di Pechino nel 1886. Luciano Trincia. Rivista di Storia della Chiesa in Italia, LI (Jan.-June, 1997), 1-34.

Affaire de moeurs, conflits de pouvoir et anticléricalisme: la fin de la congrégation des frères de Saint-Joseph en 1888. Éric Baratay. Revue d'histoire de l'Église de France, 84 (July-Dec, 1998), 299-321.

Los franciscanos y la Revolución filipina (1896-1898). Cayetano Sánchez Fuertes. Archivo Ibero-Americano, LVIII (Sept.-Dec, 1998), 439-490.

Von Leo XIII. zu Pius X. Die wirtschaftliche Lage des Vatikans zu Beginn des 20. Jahrhunderts. Hartmut Benz. Römische Historische Mitteilungen, 37 (1995), 193-224.

Nuovi documenti sugli esordi della Società Internazionale di Studi Francescani fondata da Paul Sabatier. Sandro G. ^ranchita. Rivista di Storia della Chiesa in Italia, LI (Jan.-June, 1997), 35-96.

Banister ?. Thompson and Afterwards: The Church of England and the Deceased Wife's Sister's Marriage Act. Bruce S. Bennett Journal of Ecclesiastical History, 49 (Oct., 1998), 668-682.

Wilhelminische Baupolitik im Ausland: Die deutsche evangelische Kirche in Rom. Jürgen Krüger. Römische Historische Mitteilungen, 39 (1997), 375-394.

Monseigneur Charost, évêque de Lille durant la Grande Guerre. Carine Cnudde-Lecointre. T?eîw du Nord, LXXX (Apr.-June, 1998), 355-366.

Le clergé paroissial en Belgique: la perception de l'occupation allemande. Frédéric Dauphin. Revue du Nord, LXXX (Apr.-June, 1998), 367-382.

From Ethnie Borderland to Catholic Fatherland: The Church, Christian Orthodox, and State Administration in the Chehn Region, 1918-1939. Konrad Sadkowski. Slavic Review, 57 (Winter, 1998), 813-839.

Ludwig Ihmels (1858-1933) und die Soziale Frage. Aspekte lutherischer Sozialethik in der Weimarer Republik. Uwe Rieske-Braun. Zeitschrift für Kirchengeschichte, 109 (3, 1998), 328-362.

Making Christian Colonists: An Evaluation of the Emigration Policies and Practices of the Scottish Churches and Chrisitan Organisations between the Wars. Marjory Harper. Records of the Scottish Church History Society, XXVIII (1998), 173-216.

El Archivo de fray Agustín Arce, ofm, en la Biblioteca Nacional de Madrid. Pilar Hernández Aparicio. Archivo Ibero-Americano, LVIII (Sept.-Dec, 1998), 531-570.

Evolution and the Eucharist: Bishop E. W Barnes on Science and Religion in the 1920s and 1930s. Peter J. Bowler. British Journal for the History of Science, 31 (Dec, 1998), 453-467.

Un discepolo nella storia. Per gli studi su Giuseppe Dossetti. Alberto Melloni. Rivista di Storia della Chiesa in Italia, LI (July-Dec, 1997), 421-450.

Le R Etienne Nkodo (1911-1983), premier spiritain camerounais. Jean Criaud. Mémoire Spiritaine, No. 8 (2, 1998), 50-73.

Die Kirchenpolitik Frankreichs in seiner Besatzungszone. [Zweiter Teil]. Martin Greschat. Zeitschrift für Kirchengeschichte, 109 (3, 1998), 363-387.

La création du Centre catholique des intellectuels français: une nouvelle approche du monde profane par les intellectuels catholiques? Claire Guyot. Revue d'histoire de l'Eglise de France, 84 (July-Dec, 1998), 323-336.

Von der "Neuen Heimat" zur "Familienheim"—Geschichte des "Siedlungswerkes Baden e. V und seiner Mitgliedsunternehmen in der Erzdiözese Freiburg. Frank Schillinger. Freiburger Diözesan-Archiv, 118 (1998), 5-160.

Les spiritaines à Madagascar: Vingt-sept ans d'apostolat dans l'île Rouge (2/2). Soeurs Anita Disier et Paul Girolet. Mémoire Spiritaine, No. 8 (2, 1998), 74-86.

The Church of Uganda and the Exile of Kabaka Muteesa II, 1953-55. Kevin Waid. Journal of Religion in AJrica, XXVIII (4, 1998), 41 1-449.

The Genesis of Maring Christianity: The First Quarter Century, 1955-1980. Edward UPuma. Ethnohistory, 45 (Fall, 1998), 621-655.

Feu le "complexe minoritaire"? Les catholiques suisses et l'objection de conscience (I960- 1990). Frédéric Yerly. Zeitschrift für Schweizerische Kirchengeschichte, 92 (1998), 233-250.

Littérature et histoire: le cardinal Roques et Jean Sulivan. Frédéric Le Moigne. Annales de Bretagne, 105 (3, 1998), 75-98.

Moine, martyr et mystique. Christian de Chergé (1937-1996). Bernardo Olivera, O.C.S.O. Collectanea Cisterciensia, 60 (4, 1998), 279-294.

AMERICAN AND CANADIAN

Les hospitalières françaises en Amérique aux XVIP et XVIIP siècles. Marie-Claude Dinet-Lecomte. Revue d'histoire de l'Église de France, 84 (July-Dec, 1998), 261-282.

Daily Religious Exercises of the American Catholic Laity in the Late Eighteenth Century. Thomas E. Wangler. Records of the American Catholic Historical Society of Philadelphia, 108 (Fall-Winter, 1997-98), 1-21.

Sifting the Evidence: Perceptions of Life at the Ohlone (Costanoan) Missions of Alta California. Russell K. Skowronek. Ethnohistory, 45 (Fall, 1998), 675-708.

Revivals and Revolution: Historiographie Turns since Alan Heimert's Religion and the American Mind. Philip Goff. Church History, Cl (Dec, 1998), 695-721.

Thomas Jefferson, Religious Freedom, and the Supreme Court. Edwin S. Gaustad. Church History, Cl (Dec, 1998), 682-694.

Cultural Politics on the Indiana Frontier: The American Home Missionary Society and Temperance Reform. Suzanne Xnxnnxan. Indiana Magazine of History, XCTV (Dec, 1998), 285-302.

The Struggle for the Soul of Frontier Baptists: The Anti-Mission Controversy in the Lower Wabash Valley. Randy Mills. Indiana Magazine of History, XCIV (Dec, 1998), 303-322.

From Biracial to Segregated Churches: Black and White Protestants in Houston, Texas, 1840-1870. Charles A. Israel. Southwestern Historical Quarterly, 101 (Apr., 1998), 429-458.

"Wholly Occupied with My Special Work": Reverend William Graham's Stay at Fort Coffee and New Hope, 1845-1847. Donald L. Parman. Chronicles of Oklahoma, LXXVI (Fall, 1998), 262-281.

Missioner Extraordinary: Henry Melchior Muhlenberg, Part 2. Helmut T. Lehmann. Concordia Historical Institute Quarterly, 71 (Fall, 1998), 107-127.

Someone's in the Garden with Eve: Race, Religion, and the American Fall. Mason Stokes. American Quarterly, 50 (Sept., 1998), 718-744.

The Young Phillips Brooks: A Reassessment. Gillis J. Harp. Journal of Ecclesiastical History, 49 (Oct., 1998), 652-667.

Praeceptores in orbe novo. En torno a los colegios benedictinos en los Estados Unidos. Antonio Linage Conde. Studia Monástica, 40 (2, 1998), 343-393.

Middle Man for Peace: Senator Stephen B. Elkins and the Spanish-American War. M.A. Michael. West Virginia History, 57 (1998), 46-61.

Equality of Right: Polish American Bishops in the American Hierarchy? Daniel S. Buczek. Polish American Studies, LV (Spring, 1998), 5-22.

Countering Federalization of Education in the United States, 1920-1930. Richard Gribble, C.S.C. Records of the American Catholic Historical Society of Philadelphia, 108 (Fall-Winter, 1997-98), 23-52.

Conversion at Bethlehem: Religion and Union Building in Steel, 1930-42. Elizabeth Fones-Wolf and Ken Fones-Wolf. Labor History, 39 (Nov., 1998), 381-395.

Sacred or Profane? The Cross at Mount Davidson Park, San Francisco. Marie Bolton. Pacific Historical Review, Cl (Nov., 1998), 543-571.

Harry Stagg and the Rise of New Mexico Baptists, 1938-1960. Daniel R. Carnett. Baptist History and Heritage',33 (Spring, 1998), 7- 18.

Spiritual Motherhood: Granville's Theology of Gender and Rural Life in the 40s and 50s. Craig R. Prentiss. Records of the American Catholic Historical Society of Philadelphia, 108 (Fall-Winter, 1997-98), 73-86.

Catherine Schaeffer and the Strategy for a Catholic Presence at the United Nations, 1946-1947. Joseph S. Rossi, SJ. Records of the American Catholic Historical Society of Philadelphia, 108 (Fall-Winter, 1997-98), 53-72.

In memoria di William Congdon (1912-98). Michael R. Pastizzo.Z« Civiltà Cattolica, 149, III (Aug. 1-15, 1998), 254-261.

The Crisis of Authority in American Catholicism: Urban Schools and Cultural Conflict, the Quest for Common Ground. Peter R. D'Agostino. Records of the American Catholic Historical Society of Philadelphia, 108 (Fall-Winter, 1997-98), 87- 122.

LATEN AMERICAN

Bounded Identities: Women and Religion in Colonial Brazil, 1550-1750. Carole A. Myscoiski. Religion, 28 (Oct., 1998), 329-337.

Fray Gabriel de Saona, artífice de la Provincia Agustiniana de Quito. Félix Carmona Moreno. La Ciudad de Dios, CCXI (May-Aug., 1998), 509-551.

Conjuring the Body Politic from the Corpus Mysticum: The Post-Independent Pursuit of Public Opinion in Mexico, 1821-1854. Brian F. Connaughton. The Americas, 55 (Jan., 1999), 459-479.

Female Apostolates and Modernization in Mid-Nineteenth Century Chile. Gertrude M. Yeager. The Americas, 55 (Jan., 1999), 425-458.

Ein heilsamer Stachel der Erinnerung. Zur Vor- und Wirkungsgeschichte der Bischofsversammlung von Medellin. Franz Weber, M.C CJ. Zeitschrift für Katholische Theologie, 120 (4, 1998), 385-401.

OTHER BOOKS RECEIVED

Agius, Emmanuel, and Lionel Chircop (Eds.). Caring for Future Generations: fewish, Christian and Islamic Perspectives. [Praeger Studies on the 21st Century.] (Westport, Conn.: Praeger. 1998. Pp. xv, 257. $65.00 hardcover; $23.95 paperback.)

BeU, Rudolph M. How to Do It: Guides to Good Living for Renaissance Italians. (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press. 1999- Pp. xiii, 375. $25.00.)

Borchardt, Karl, and Enno Bünz (Eds.). Forschungen zur Reichs-, Papst- und Landesgeschichte: Peter Herde zum 65. Geburtstag von Freunden, Schülern und Kollegen dargebracht. 2 vols. (Stuttgart: Anton Hiersemann. 1998. Pp. xxi, 574; vi, 575-1044.) Among the sixty-one articles the following are especially noteworthy for ecclesiastical history: Peter Munz, "Von Julius Cäsar zu Gregor von Tours—Neue Thesen zu einer alten Geschichte" (pp. 1-13); Theo Kölzer,"Kloster Weißenburg und Baden-Baden" (pp. 15-24); Geoffrey Wallis Barrow, "Religion in Scotland on the eve of Christianity" (pp. 25-32); Peter Schreiner, "Der Liber Pontificalis und Byzanz: Mentalitätsgeschichte im Spiegel einer Quelle, mit einem Exkurs: Byzanz und der Liber Pontificalis (Vat. gr. 1455)" (pp. 33-48); John N. McCulloh, "The 'Pseudo-Bede of Cologne': A Martyrology of the 'Gorzean' Reform" (pp. 81-99); Uta-Renate Blumenthal, "Zu den Datierungen Hildebrands" (pp. 145-154); Hannes Möhring, "Benzo von Alba und die Entstehung des Kreuzzugsgedankens" (pp. 177-186); Benjamin Z. Kedar, "The Forcible Baptisms of 1096: History and Historiography" (pp. 187-200); Rudolf Weigand,"Rom und Konstantinopel: Zur Rangordnung der Patriarchate bei Gratian und den Dekretisten" (pp. 201-210); Giulio Battelli, "L'esame di idoneità dei notai pubblici apostólica auctoritate nel Duecento"(pp. 255-263); Anne J. Duggan, "Diplomacy, Status, and Conscience: Henry IFs Penance for Becket's Murder" (pp. 265-290); John T. Noonan,"Cwn« Romana and the Story of Magna Carta" (pp. 291-302); Alfred Wendehorst and Othmar Hageneder,"Eine Dekretale Papst Innocenz' III. die Pfarrei Altkrautheim betreffend (Prag, Universitätsbibliothek MS XXIII. E. 59 fol. 40v42r)" (pp. 303-311); Thomas Frenz, "Die Bewertungen des Passauer Domdekans Albert Behaim—wissenschaftliches Urteil oder Schwarze Legende?"(pp. 331-345); Charles Burnett: Imperium, Ecclesia Romana and the Last Days in William Scot's Astrological Prophecy of ca. 1266-73" (pp. 347-360);Jane Sayers,"The Court of'Audientia Litterarum Contradictarum'

revisited" (pp. 411-427); Andreas Kiesewetter, "Die Regentschaft des Kardinallegaten Gerhard von Parma und Roberts II. von Artois im Königreich Neapel 1285 bis 1289" (pp. 477-522); James A. Brundage, "Taxation of Costs in Medieval Canonical Courts" (pp. 565-574); Anthony Luttrell,"The Hospitallers and the Papacy, 1305-1314" (pp. 595-622); TUmann Schmidt, "Das factum Bonifatianum auf dem Konzil von Vienne (1311/12)" (pp. 623-633); Ivan Hlavácek, "Zu Regalienverleihungen Wenzels IV an reichsunmittelbare kirchliche Würdenträger (Skizze aufgrund des "Falles" des Abtes von Werden)" (pp. 651-663); Patrick N. R. Zutshi,"The Office of Notary in the Papal Chancery in the Mid-Fourteenth Century" (pp. 665-683); Anne-Marie Hayez,"Un aperçu de la politique beneficíale de Grégoire XI: première moitié du pontificat (1371-1375)" (pp. 685-698); Thomas Hofmann, "Päpstliche und gegenpäpstliche Klosterpolitik während des Großen Abendländischen Schismas am Beispel griechischer Klöster in Süditalien" (pp. 699-722); Dieter Girgensohn, "Reste von Rubrizellen aus einem verlorenen Register Gregors XIL: ein Beitrag zur Kenntnis der römischen Obödienz im Jahre 1412" (pp. 723-743); María Milagros Cárcel Ortí, "Documentos pontificios en los registros episcopales del obispo de Valencia Hug de Llupià (1408-1425)" (pp. 745-760); María Josefa Sanz Fuentes, "Documentos pontificios medievales referentes al jubileo ovetense de la Santa Cruz" (pp. 783-793); Jürgen Petersohn, "Giovanni Geraldini, Bischof von Catanzaro (tl488), und die Gründung des Archidiakonats von Amer-Ha" (pp. 795-821); Anton Schindling, "Verspätete Konfessionalisierungen im Reich der Frühen Neuzeit—Retardierende Kräfte und religiöse Minderheiten in den deutschen Territorien 1555-1648" (pp. 845-861); Stefan Kummer, "Vom Grabmal Innozenz' VIII. des Antonio Pollaiuolo zum Grabmal Urbans VIII. von Gianlorenzo Bernini" (pp. 885-898); Heinrich Euler, " 'Den Papst nach Jerusalem schicken': Ein Streit zwischen Papst und Kaiser im 19. Jahrhundert" (pp. 941-963); Klaus Wittstadt, "Weichenstellungen für ein 'pastorales' Konzil—Papst Johannes XXIII. unmittelbar vor Konzilsbeginn" (pp. 983-1000); "Schriftenverzeichnis von Peter Herde" (pp. 1001-1019).

Brown, Mary Elizabeth. Shapers of the Great Debate on Immigration: A Biographical Dictionary. [Shapers of the Great American Debates, Number 1.] (Westport, Conn.: Greenwood Press. 1999. Pp. xxv, 322. $59.95.) Among the twenty persons who are the subjects of these essays are Lyman Beecher ("The No-Popery Crusade," pp. 15-29) and John Joseph Hughes ("Definitions of'Assimilation,'" pp. 31-44).

Calamari, Barbara, and Sandra DiPasqua. Novena: The Power of Prayer. (New York: Penguin Studio. 1999. Pp. xi, 156. $24.95.)

Commende (Le) dell'ordine di S. Stefano. Atti del convegno di studi, Pisa, ??-?1 maggio 1991. [Pubblicazioni degli Archivi di Stato, saggi 44.] (Rome: Ministero per i beni culturali e ambientali, Ufficio centrale per i beni archivistici. 1997. Pp. 203· Paperback.)

De Courten, Ludovica (Ed.). Bibliografía di Alberto Aquarone. [Pubblicazioni degli Archivi di Stato, Quaderni della Rassegna degli Archivi di Stato, 86.] (Rome: Ministero per i beni culturali e ambientali, Ufficio centrale per i beni archivistici. 1998. Pp. 84. Paperback.)

Di Simone, Mariapina, Nella Eramo, Antonio Fiori, and Jerzy Stoch (Eds.). Documentiper la storia delle relazioni italo-polacche (1918-1940), Yolumes I and II. [Pubblicazioni degli Archivi di Stato, fonti XXVI.] (Rome: Ministero per i beni culturali e ambientali, Ufficio centrale per i beni archivistici. 1998. Pp. xxvii, 798; iv, 799-1615.

Doherty Richard. The Williamite War in Ireland, 1688-1691. (Portland, Oreg.: Four Courts Press, c/o International Specialized Book Services. 1998. Pp. 256. $24.95 paperback.)

Eichberg, Barbara Bruderer. Les neuf çhoeurs angéliques: Origine et évolution du thème, dans l'art du Moyen Âge. [Civilisation Médiévale, VI.] (Poitiers: Centre d'Études Supérieures de Civilisation Médiévale. 1998. Pp. 303, 94 pi. Paperback.)

Finnis, John. Aquinas: Moral, Political, and Legal Theory. [Founders of Modem Political and Social Thought.] (New York: Oxford University Press. 1998. Pp. xxi, 385. $52.00 cloth; $18.95 paperback.)

Francejohn. Western Warfare in the Age of the Crusades, 1000-1300. (Ithaca, N.Y.: Cornell University Press. 1999. Pp. xv, 327. $49.95 cloth; $19.95 paperback.)

Frentzen, Allen J. Before the Closet: Same-sex Love from Beowulf to Angels in America. (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press. 1998. Pp. x, 369. $35.00.)

Frey, Nancy Louise. Pilgrim Stories: On and Off the Road to Santiago. (Berkeley: University of California Press. 1998. Pp. xv, 313. $45.00 cloth; $17.95 paperback).

Fuentes, Carlos. The Buried Mirror: Reflections on Spain and the New World. (New York: A Mariner Book. Houghton Mifflin Company. 1999. Pp. 399. $25.00 paperback.) Originally published in 1992.

Green, Richard Firth. A Crisis of Truth: Literature and Law in Ricardian England. [The Middle Ages Series.] (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press. 1999- Pp. xvi, 496. $62.50.)

Halttunen, Karen, and Lewis Perry (Eds.). Moral Problems in American Life: New Perspectives on Cultural History. (Ithaca, N.Y: Cornell University Press. 1998. Pp. xii, 350. $59-95 cloth; $19-95 paperback.) Among the fourteen essays published here are "Interfaith Families in Victorian America," by Anne C. Rose (pp. 223-243), and "Prophetic Ministry and the Military Chaplaincy during the Vietnam Era," by Anne C. Loveland (pp. 244-258).

Huizinga, Johan. The Waning of the Middle Ages. [Dover Books on History, Political and Social Science.] (Mineóla, N.Y: Dover Publications, Inc. 1999. Pp.

viii, 328. $9.95 paperback.) This edition is an unabridged republication of the English-language edition originally published in 1924 by Edward Arnold & Co. It includes, as footnotes, English translations of French and Latin poetry and prose quotations published in the original edition.

Huppert, George. The Style of Paris: Renaissance Origins of the French Enlightenment. (Bloomington: Indiana University Press. 1999- Pp. ix, 146. $35.00 cloth; $14.95 paperback.)

Interpretation of the Bible. [The Slovenian Academy of Sciences and Arts, Section Two: Philological and Literary Sciences; University of Ljubljana, Faculty of Arts, Faculty of Theology; University of Maribor.] (Sheffield, England: Sheffield Academic Press. 1998. Pp. 1909.)

Jones, Frederick M. Alphonsus de Liguori: Saint of Bourbon Naples, 1696-1787, Founder of the Redemptorists. (Liguori, Mo.: Liguori. 1999- Pp- xii, 532. $24.95 paperback.) Originally published by Christian Classics, Inc., of Westminster, Md., in 1992 and reviewed by Tommaso Astarita ante, LXXX Guly, 1994), 613-615.

Kelsey Morton. The Drama of the Resurrection: Transforming Christianity. (Hyde Park, N.Y: New City Press. 1999. Pp. 140. $9.95 paperback.)

Klaassen, Walter. Armageddon and the Peaceable Kingdom. (Scottdale, Pa.: Herald Press. 1999. Pp. 288. $15.99 paperback.)

Kolinsky, Eva, and Wilfried van der Will (Eds.) The Cambridge Companion to Modern German Culture. [Cambridge Companions to Culture.] (New York: Cambridge University Press. 1998. Pp. xix, 365, 3 maps. $59.95 hardback; $1995 paperback.)

Lagrée, Michel (Ed.). Chocs et ruptures en histoire religieuse (fin XVIIT-XIX' siècles). [Collection "Histoire."] (Rennes: Presses Universitaires de Rennes. 1998. Pp. 217. 95F.) This volume contains the papers presented at an international conference held at Rennes on July 1-2, 1997, and organized by the Centre de recherches historiques sur les sociétés et cultures de l'Ouest. Contents: La rétroaction religieuse dans l'aire de la Rule Britannia: Emmet Larkin, "The rise and fall of stations in Ireland, 1750-1850" (pp. 19-32); René Hardy, "Les fondements du renouveau religieux dans le Québec du XIXs siècle: éléments d'une réinterprétation" (pp. 33-50); Louis Rosseau, "Crises, choc et revitalisation culturelle dans le Québec du XLXe siècle" (pp. 51-69); À l'est de l'Elbe: Hanna Dylagowa,"Le grand choc à la frontière de l'Europe catholique et orthodoxe: la liquidation de l'Église uníate (gréco-catholique), 1794-1875" (pp. 73-83); Maciej Serwanski, "Catholicisme et identité nationale des Polonais au XDi' siècle" (pp. 85-94); De l'Helvétie à la Vénétie: subculture catholique et intégration à l'État moderne: Urs Altermatt,"Le cas de la Suisse catholique aux XIX" et XXe siècles" (pp. 97-111); Victor Conzemius, "Les défis d'un livre. À propos des thèses de M. Altermatt" (pp. 113-127); Marcello Malpensa, "Vénétie, 1866: choc ou continu-

ité? Les effets de l'unification dans le catholicisme en Vénétie d'après les lettres pastorales des évêques" (pp. 129-148); Unité et diversité du cas français: les pôles armoricain et lyonnais du catholicisme: Philippe Boutry, "Une dynamique sacrificielle. Le catholicisme lyonnais du premier XIXe siècle"(pp. 15 1-166); Michel Lagrée,"Religion et chocs révolutionnaires en Bretagne" (pp. 167-181); Roger Dupuy,"Clergé et insurrections de l'Ouest (1791-1815): chocs et continuité" (pp. 183-190);Jean-Clément Martin and Catherine Pomeyrols,"Les clercs et l'Eglise du Québec et de la Vendée face à l'Histoire, fin XLXC début XXe siècles" (pp. 191-208).

Lagrée, Michel, and Nadine-Josette Chaline (Eds.). Religions par-delà les frontières. [Bibliothèque Beauchesne, Religions, Société, Politique, 32.] (Paris: Beauchesne. 1997. Pp. 103. 96 FF paperback) Contents: Jean-Dominique Durand,"La Furia fráncese vue de Rome: peurs, suspicions et rejets des années 1950" (pp. 15-35); Francis Python, "Le coreligionnaire étranger: catholicisme français et catholicisme suisse"(pp. 37-51); Christian Chanel, "Les images du coreligionnaire français dans le luthéranisme suédois (1850-1960)" (pp. 53-72); José Manuel Cuenca Toribio, "Le catholicisme français de la première moitié du XXe siècle vu par le catholicisme espagnol" (pp. 73-86); Catherine Maurer, "La France, 'pays classique de l'amour'? Les Catholiques allemands et le modèle français de la charité (1820-1930)" (pp. 87-99).

Laing, Lloyd and Jennifer. Medieval Britain: The Age of Chivalry. (New York: St. Martin's Press. 1998. Pp. 224. $16.95 paperback.) First published in 1996.

Machamer, Peter (Ed.). The Cambridge Companion to Galileo. [Cambridge Companions to Philosophy] (New York: Cambridge University Press. 1998. Pp. xii, 462.) Among the dozen essays comprising this volume are "3. The Use and Abuse of Mathematical Entities: Galileo and the Jesuits Revisited," by Rivka Feldhay (pp. 80-145);"5. From Galileo to Augustine,"by Pietro Redondi (pp. 175-210); "8. Galileo on Science and Scripture," by Ernan McMullin (pp. 271-347);"9- Could There Be Another Galileo Case,"by Richard Blackwell (pp. 348-366); "10. The God of Theologians and the God of Astronomers: An Apology of Bellarmine," by Marcello Pera (pp. 367-387);" 11. The Never-ending Galileo Story," by Michael Segre (pp. 388-416); and "12. The Sepulchers of Galileo: The 'Living' Remains of a Hero of Science," by Paolo Galluzzi (pp. 417-448).

McDannell, Colleen. Material Christianity: Religion and Popular Culture in America. (New Haven: Yale University Press. 1998. Pp. xii, 312. $40.00 cloth; $24.95 paperback.) Originally published in 1996 and reviewed by Timothy J. Meagher ante, LXXXTV (January 1998), 149-150.

McGurn, Barrett. The Pilgrim's Guide to Rome: For the Millennial Jubilee Year 2000. (New York: Viking. A Giniger Book published by Penguin Putnam, Inc. 1998. Pp. xv, 205. $19.95 paperback.)

Minois, Georges. History of Suicide: Voluntary Death in Western Culture. Trans. Lydia G. Cochrane. [Medicine & Culture.] (Baltimore Johns Hopkins University Press. 1999- Pp. ix, 387. $35.95.)

Orsi, Robert A. Thank You, St.fude: Women's Devotion to the Patron Saint of Hopeless Causes. (New Haven: Yale University Press. 1998. Pp. xiii, 303· $35.00 cloth; $18.00 paperback.) Originally published in 1996 and reviewed by Leslie Woodcock Tender ante, LXXXIII (July 1997), 526-528.

Per la storiografia italiana del XXI secólo. Seminario sul progetto di censimento sistemático degli archivi di deposito dei ministeri realizzato dall'Archivio centrale dello Stato, Roma, 20 aprile 1995. [Pubblicazioni degli Archivi di Stato, saggi 46.] (Rome: Ministero per i beni culturali e ambientali, Ufficio centrale per i beni archivistici. 1998. Pp. 231· Paperback.)

Podles, Leon J. The Church Impotent: The Feminization of Christianity. (Dallas: Spence Publishing Company. 1999. Pp. xviii, 288. $27.95.)

Recezione (La) delpensiero alfonsiano nella Chiesa. Atti del congresso in occasione del terzo centenario della nascita di S. Alfonso Maria de Liguori, Roma 5-7 marzo 1997. [Bibllotheca Histórica, Congregationis Ssmi Redemptoris. Vol. XVIII.] (Rome: Collegium S. Alfonsi de Urbe. 1998. Pp. 666. Paperback.) Among the papers published in this volume are Louis Chatellier,"La mission populaire: Annonce prophétique du salut" (pp. 91-111); Francesco Chiovaro,"S. Alfonso Maria de Liguori. Ritratto di un moralista" (pp. 121-153);Terence Kennedy"Did St. Alphonsus Practice Practical Theology? 'Per venire dunque alia pratica': Practice or Pragmatism?" (pp. 155-167); Gabriele De Rosa, "La figura e l'opéra di sant'Alfonso nell'evoluzione storica" (pp. 207-224); Fabriciano Ferrero,"La recepción del magisterio alfonsiano en las iglesias de España" (pp. 225-267); Otto Weiss, "Tra misericordia e rigorismo. La recezione della dottrina di s. Alfonso nei paesi germanici nell'Ottocento" (pp. 269-290); John Sharp, "The Alphonsian Mission in Britain and Ireland in the Nineteenth Century" (pp. 291-307); Claude Langlois, "Régulation romaine et morale alphonsienne en France dans la première moitié du 19e siècle. Les propositions de Mgr Bouvier sur la morale conjugale" (pp. 309-329); Raphael Gallagher, "The Moral of St. Alphonsus in the Light of the Vindiciae Controversy" (pp. 331-349); Giuseppe Orlandi, "La recezione della dottrina morale di S. Alfonso Maria de Liguori in Italia durante la Restaurazione" (pp. 353-452); Giuseppe Orlandi,"fl'Caso Panzuti'" (pp. 453-5l6);Hamish F. G. Swanston,"The Voice of the Poor in the Writings of S. Alfonso" (pp. 517-618).

Rey-Mermet, Théodule, C.Ss.R. Moral Choices: The Moral Theology of Saint Alphonsus Liguori. Trans. Paul Laverdure. (Liguori, Mo.: Liguori. 1998. Pp. xxvii, 180. $14.95 paperback.)

Ronda, Bruce A. Elizabeth Palmer Peabody.A Reformer on Her Own Terms. (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press. 1999. Pp. xv, 391. $45.00.)

Roth, Robert J., SJ. Radical Pragmatism: An Alternative. (Bronx, N.Y: Fordham University Press. 1998. Pp. xix, 168. $35.00 cloth; $18.00 paperback.)

Sarmiento de Gamboa, Pedro. History of the Incas. [Dover Books on the American Indian.] (Mineóla, N.Y.: Dover Publications, Inc. 1999· Pp- xxvi, 395. $14.95 paperback.) Originally published by the Hakluyt Society and printed by the University Press, Cambridge, England, in 1907.

Schweitzer, Albert. The Mysticism of Paul the Apostle. Trans. William Montgomery. [The Albert Schweitzer Library] (Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press in association with The Albert Schweitzer Institute for the Humanities. 1998. Pp. xxvi, 41 1. $18.95 paperback.) The first edition was published in 1931 by Adam and Charles Black.

Selinger, Suzanne. Charlotte von Kirschbaum and Karl Barth: A Study in Biography and the History of Theology. [The Penn State Series in Lived Religious Experience.] (University Park: The Pennsylvania State University Press. 1998. Pp. Lx, 206. $45.00 cloth; $1995 paperback.)

Telemme, Umr. Religion et Identité: Actes du colloque d'Aix-en-Provence, octobre 1996. (Aix-en-Provence: Publications de l'Université de Provence. 1998. Pp. 294. 200,00 F. paperback.) Contents: Individu et famille: William Monter,"Des identités protestantes faussées par (et pour) l'Inquisition espagnole" (pp. 11-15); Bruno Léal, "Conversion et changement d'identité des renégats chrétiens en terre d'islam (fin XVT début XVIP siècle)" (pp. 17-27); Frauke Volkland, "Bi-confessionnalité et identité confessionnelle: le cas du bailliage commun du Thurgau en Suisse aux XVT et XVIP siècles" (pp. 29-35); Eckart Birnstiel,"Suivre Dieu ou le roi? Le conflit de conscience d'un protestant cévenol au temps des dragonnades (1683-1686)" (pp. 37-46); La cité au XVIe siècle: Oliver Christin, "Identités urbaines et pluralité confessionnelle: les pactes d'amitié entre catholiques et protestants à l'automne 1567" (pp. 69-76); Wolfgang Kaiser," 'Les étranges fantaisies des Welsch': les débuts difficiles de la communauté réformée de langue française à Bale (XVP-XVIP siècles)" (pp. 77-87); Anne Kempa, "Etre protestant, officier et/ou juriste à Aix-en-Provence pendant les guerres de religion" (pp. 89-96); Claire Dolan, "Relations sociales, regard des autres et identité chez les néophytes aixois du XVIe siècle" (pp. 97-107); Nations: Pierre Gouhier, "Identité gaélique et divergence religieuse. L'Irlande et l'Ecosse au milieu du XVIe siècle" (pp. 115-121); Michèle Janin-Thivos, "Le rôle de l'Inquisition dans la construction d'une identité nationale portugaise: exclusion ou intégration des Nouveaux-Chrétiens" (pp. 123-132); Émile Kolodny "Primauté de l'identité religieuse sur la citoyenneté: le cas des échanges obligatoires de populations entre la Grèce et la Turquie (1923)" (pp. 133-142); Christian Cannuyer, "Entre identités égyptienne, arabe et chrétienne: les coptes d'Egypte" (pp. 143-151); Le cas français: Martine Lapied, "Les Comtadines et la Révolution française: une défense prioritaire de l'identité religieuse?" (pp. 169-175); Patrick Ca-

banel,"Les deux vocations: catholique ou laïque? La France, le Levant et l'Islam" (pp. 199-209); Philippe Enclos, "Conflits d'identités religieuse et professionnelle" (pp. 211-219); Cultures: Stéphane Boissellier, "Conquête chrétienne et acculturation dans le sud du Portugal aux XIP-XIVe siècles" (pp. 227-239); Ronnie Po-Chia Hsia, "Être chinois et chrétien: religion et identité en Chine aux XVIP et XVIIP siècles" (pp. 241-248); Michel Lagrée, "Identité religieuse contre identité politique: le catholicisme 'bleu' en Bretagne" (pp. 249-258); Sévériano Rojo Hernandez, "Le catholicisme et la déstructuration de l'identité culturelle locale: le cas basque (1937-1939)" (pp. 259-268).

The Message of St Francis: With Frescoes from the Basilica of St Francis at Assist. (New York: Penguin Studio. 1998. Pp. 61. $16.95.)

Tweed, Thomas A., and Stephen Prothero (Eds.). Asian Religions in America: A Documentary History. (New York: Oxford University Press. 1999. Pp. xvi, 416. Paperback.)