The Catholic Historical Review

VOLUME LXXXV

1999

Published Quarterly by
The Catholic University of America Press
Washington, D.C. 20064
1999

Table of Contents

GENERAL INDEX

Volume LXXXV (1999)

The Catholic Historical Review

VOL. LXXXV OCTOBER, 1999 No. 4

"I HAVE NEITHER SILVER NOR GOLD": AN EXPLANATION OF A MEDIEVAL PAPAL RITUAL

BY

Robert T. Ingogiia*

Introduction

A medieval pope's post-coronation ceremonies usually included two forms of coin tosses.1 One type, performed for the pope by a member of his cavalcade, took place during the procession to the Lateran Palace. The pope, on the other hand, personally performed the second type of toss: at the Lateran during his ritual possession (possessio) of the palace.2 During his possessio a pope cast coins once at the marble seat

*Dr. Ingogiia is an assistant professor of history in Felician College, Lodi, New Jersey.

'See Reginald Maxwell Woolley, Coronation Rites (Cambridge, 1915), pp. 159-164, for the general aspects of papal coronations.

The new bishop of Rome's possessio (or introduction—a ritual act performed by his walking into and through the Lateran—proclaimed its new owner. Since only the pope could take possession of the palace, the possessio usually followed his consecration. See Eduard Eichmann, Weihe und Krönung des Papstes im Mittelalter ("Münchener theologische Studien," Vol. 3 [Munich, 1951]), pp. 4, 14; Nikolaus Gussone, Thron und Inthronisation des Papstes von den Anfängen bis zum 12.Jahrhundert: zur Beziehung zwischen Herrschaftszeichen und bildhaften Begriffen, Recht und Liturgie im christlichen Verständnis von Wort und Wirklichkeit ("Bonner historische Forschungen," Vol. 41 [Bonn, 1978]), pp. 144-145, and n.20 (for a good bibliography on the possessio); and Gaetano Moroni, "Possesso de'Papi," in Dizionario di erudizione storico-ecclesiastica,Vol. 54 (1852), pp. 294-297.

The twelfth-century prescriptions of Albinus, Cencius, and the Basel ordo—in, respectively, P Fabre, L. Duchesne, and G. Mollat (eds.), Le Liber censuum de l'église romaine, Vol. 2 (Paris, 1905), pp. 123 (col. 1)-124 (col. 1); ibid.,Vol. 1 (Paris, 1889), pp. 311 (col. 2)-312 (col. 1); and Bernhard Schimmelpfennig, "Ein bisher unbekannter Text zur Wahl, Konsekration und Krönung des Papstes im 12. Jiihrhunden" Archivum historiae pontifl-

(sedes stercorarid) located at the palace's entrance, and again at the two porphyry seats located at the door of the basilica Sancti Silvestri? All of the liturgical prescriptions (ordinesy for the conduct of the possessio (twelfth to fifteenth century) mention coin tosses at these two locations.5 Ceremonies extra Roman—for example, the consecration of Popes John XXII and Martin V (at Lyons and Constance, respectively)—did not duplicate the casts connected with the sedes of the Lateran palace.6

ciae, 6 (1968) 60-63—mention the possessio taking place after the election but prior to the consecration.

References to the Liber Censuum will hereafter be cited as LC.

3The sedes porphyreticae were actually made of rosso antico, a stone often confused with (and thus, substituted for) porphyry. Both seats (still extant):

> are absolutely identical and unmistakably antique works of unique quality. They were taken from the ruins of the city, . . . [and] had not been thrones originally, but—as analogies in the British Museum from Ostia and the Terme of Caracalla clearly show—Roman toilet seats or stools from the baths. It was their symbolic color and beautiful execution that induced the papal court to employ them for ceremonial purposes. . . .

See Josef Deér, The Dynastic Porphyry Tombs of the Norman Period in Sicily ("Dumbarton Oaks Studies," No. 5 [Cambridge, Massachusetts, 1959]), p- 144 (especially 142-146, "The 'Porphyry' Thrones of the Lateran Palace"). The connection of the porphyry thrones with the Pope Joan legend is explained in Johann J. I. Döllinger, Die Papst-Fabeln des Mittelalters: Ein Beitrag zur Kirchengeschichte (Munich, 1863), pp. 29-34, as well as in Cesare D'Onofrio, La Papessa Giovanna: Roma e Papato tra Storia e Leggenda (Rome, 1979), pp. 140-162.

'Succinctly defined,"An ordo is a compilation of the prayers, hymns, and anthems used in a religious ceremony; it is almost exclusively liturgical, its rubrics are as brief as possible, and it is usually prescriptive." See Richard A. Jackson, "A Little-Known Description of Charles LX's Coronation," Renaissance Quarterly, 25 (1972), 290 (note T).

'Albinus Ordo in LC, II, 123 (col. I)– 124 (col. 1);Cencius' Ordo, ibid.,1,311 (col. 2)—313 (col. 2); the Basel Ordo in Schimmelpfennig, op. cit., pp. 60-63; Gregory X's Ordo in Marc Dykmans (ed.),Ze cérémonial papal de la fin du moyen âge à la renaissance, Vol. 1: Le cérémonial papal du XIIt siècle (Rome, 1977), pp. 177-179; the Pontifical of the Roman Curia (thirteenth century) in Michel Andrieu (ed.), Le pontifical romain au moyen âge, Vol. 2: Le pontifical de la curie romaine au XIII' siècle (Vatican City, 1940), pp. 377-379; the early-fourteenth-century coronation ordo in Andrieu (ed.), ibid., Vol. 3, Le pontifical de Guillaume Durand Ç1940), pp. 667-668; Stefaneschi's Onto for the benediction of a new pope in Dykmans (ed.), ibid. ,Vol. 2.De Rome en Avignon ou le cérémonial deJacques Stefaneschi (1981), pp. 284-285; Stefaneschi's Ordo for the coronation of John XXII ibid, pp. 301 -302; Stefaneschi's prescriptions for a consecration at Rome, ibid., pp. 322-323; Barozzi's Pontifical in Bernhard Schimmelpfennig, Die Zeremonienbücher der römischen Kurie im Mittelalter ("Bibliothek des deutschen historischen Instituts in Rom," Vol. 40 [Tübingen, 1973]), P- 348; and Piccolomini's Ceremonial in Marc Dykmans, L'Oeuvre de Patrizi Piccolomini ou Le cérémonial papal de la première renaissance (Vatican City, 1980), pp. 82-83.

'Stefaneschi's prescriptions (Dykmans [éd.], Le cérémonial papal, II, 301) for John XXH's post-coronation cavalcade (at Lyons) state:

The sources are unanimous on the conduct of the ceremony at the sedes stercoraría. The procession having arrived at the Lateran, the pope is led to the sedes stercoraria and sits down.7 The cardinals then raise him up so that (according to the sources) these words could be fulfilled: "He raised the poor from the dust, and lifts the needy from the dunghill to give them a place with princes and to assign them a seat of honor" (1 Kings 2:8, cf. Psalm 112J-8).8 Standing, the pope removed from the folds of his chamberlain's garb ("de gremio camerarii") three handfuls of denarii and threw them to the assembled crowd while reciting, sometimes verbatim, Acts 3:6: "I have neither gold nor silver, but what I have I give to you" (Argentum et aurum non est mihi; quod autem babeo, hoc tibi do).9 It is not specified whether the pope proclaimed these words once or with each cast. The silence of the sources regarding the seeming incongruity of the biblical passage with the dispersal of wealth has generated the most fanciful modern reconciliations—the subject of the present analysis.

> Later when [the pope] comes into the entrance of the palace, a papal attendant will likewise make another toss.

However, given that an attendant (familiaris papaé)—not the pope—will cast the coins, and that the "palatum!" returned to is the Dominican priory—John XXII did not, at first, occupy the espiscopal palace—Stefaneschi's instructions do not refer to the coin tosses connected with a possessio.

7It is unknown when the sedes stercoraria first appeared. Eichmann, op. cit., states that "er ist jedenfalls älter als die Zeit, aus der wir diese erste Kunde besitzen" and suggests that Gregory the Great—the first pope to call himself the servus servorum Dei—may have introduced its use. This sedes has been linked to the pope Joan legend, but as Mabillon (ed~),Museum italicum, l, 57-58 has pointed out, references to the sedes stercoraria predate, by a century, the Pope Joan fable.

"The text of the Vulgate reads:

> Suscitât de pulvere egenum, et de stercore erigit pauperem, ut sedeat cum principibus, et solium glorie teneat.

The ninth-century vita de sancto Maximiano written by Agnellus (as found in his Liber pontificalis ecclesiae Ravennatis, MGH: Scriptores Rerum Langobardicarum (1878), pp. 332, 335, has references to fine-linen altar cloths displaying the words "de stercore exaltavit," and "de stercore exaltasti."

The Vulgate used in this and other biblical references is that edited by B. Fischer et al, Biblia sacra iuxta vulgatam versionem (Stuttgart, 1983).

9AU of the sources for a papal coronation at Rome refer to these words. Several sources, however, add the phrase "ad delectationem" direcdy after mihi. Its significance is reserved for a later discussion.

The two prescriptions for ceremonies extra Romam—the ordo for the coronation of John XXII (at Lyon, September 5,1316) and the ordo for the consecration of Martin V (at Constance, December 21, 1417)—do not, naturally, include the casts made at the Lateran.

The sources basically agree on the ceremony connected with the casts performed at the porphyry seats. The cardinals led the pope to the two porphyry seats placed at the entrance of the basilica Sancti Silvestri.10 The pope sat first in the chair on the right." At this point, the prior of the Saint Lawrence basilica handed the pontiff a rod (ferula, a symbol of the pope's authority) and a set of keys to the Laterans basilica and palace (a symbol, moreover, of the pope's power of binding and loosing). The pope then rose and proceeded to the second porphyry seat. Before sitting down, the pontiff restored both the rod and the keys to the aforementioned prior. This individual then girded the sitting pope with a red silk belt (cingulum, or zona) from which hung a purple purse filled with twelve seals (sigillae) of precious stone and perfumed powder (muscus).12 The pontiff then received the reverence of the palace officials "ad pedes et postea ad osculum." Still sitting, the pope took, three times, from the hand of his treasurer (earnerarius), a fistful of silver coins and tossed them to the crowd. With each cast the pope recited the words of 2 Cor. 9:9 (which refers to the words of Psalm 111:9): "He dispersed his wealth to the poor, his righteousness will live forever and ever" (Dispersit dedit pauperibus, justifia ejus manet in seculum secult). The harmony of biblical passage 'with ritual action required no medieval (or modern) commentary.

"The twelfth-century sources—namely Albinus in LC, II, 123 (col. 2); Cencius, ibid., I, 312 (col. 1); and the Basel ordo in Schimmelpfennig, "Ein bisher unbekannter Text," p. 61—uniquely refer to an ymago Salvatoris (placed on the arch at the basilica's entrance) which "a quodam Judeo percussa olim in fronte sanguinem emisit, sicut hodie cernitur. . . ."

"The description of the pope sitting in the sedes porphyreticae is convenient rather than accurate. The sources call for a posture closer to reclining than sitting. The description of the pope's posture (and its significance) as found in the thirteenth-century Pontifical of the Roman Curia (Andrieu [ed.], Le pontifical romain, H, 378-379) is typical:

> Et in istis duabus sedibus debet papa taliter se habere ut videatur potius iacere quam sedere, videlicet ut videatur incumbere inter duos lectos, scilicet inter principatum Petri et doctrinam Pauli. Et nulla istarum sedium, nee etiam stercoraria, erit cooperta, vel parata, sed nuda.

,2Albinus in LC, II, 123 (col. 2)—124 (col. 1); Cencius, ibid., I, 312 (col. 1); and the Basel ordo in Schimmelpfennig, "Ein bisher unbekannter Text," p. 62. Only these three twelfth-century prescriptions explain the significance of these items. The red belt symbolized chastity; the purple purse represented the pope's obligation to feed the pauperes Christi and to take care of widows; the twelve seals signified the potestas (alternately, precepto) apostolorum, and the muscus symbolized the apostolic claim "Christi bonus odor sumus Deo."

The Coin Casts at the Sedes Stercoraria

The meaning of the initial coin casts at the first palatial seat is clear. Eduard Eichmann views the coin tosses performed here as similar to those conducted by the Byzantine emperor upon his accession.13 The purpose of the casts was, therefore, the distribution of largess. This is a reasonable explanation in the light of the place of the toss within the ceremony as well as another previously ignored piece of evidence: Cardinal Stefaneschi's poem on the coronation of Pope Boniface VIII."1 Describing the moment immediately after the pope rose from the sedes stercoraria, Stefaneschi writes:

> … He [Boniface] casts coins three times
> into the people while saying: We do not have gold,
> And you do not have shining silver for enjoyment:
> What [wealth] there is, this with an eager
> hand he endeavors to distribute.15

The phrase "eager hand" (prompta manus) indicating Boniface's ardent generosity, only makes sense if the casts were a form of largess.

If it is clear that the new pontiff's first palatial coin toss demonstrated his munificence, the accompanying recitation of Acts 3:6 ("Argentum et aurum non est mihi ad delectationem; quod autem habeo, hoc tibi do,") seems out of place. In Acts 3:1-10, Peter and John, about to enter the temple for the evening sacrifice, are confronted by a crippled man. In response to the latter's request for alms, Peter recites the words quoted above ("argentum . . . do") and cures the man's lameness. Thus, the biblical context is not connected with the distribution of material wealth. It appears inappropriate for the pope to dispense coins while quoting a biblical passage describing Peter's bestowal of the gift of healing.

Given the biblical origin of the phrase, the contradictory juxtaposition of words and acts has engendered modern explanations. One his-

13Op. cit., pp. 48-49.

HFor biographical details on Cardinal Stefaneschi, see Dykmans (ed.), Le cérémonial papal,II,25-29.

15"De electione . . . Bonifacii Papae VHI" in L. A. Muratori (ed.), Rerum Italicarum Scriptores,\o\. 3, Part 1 (1723), p. 654 (lines 342-345):

> … ter missile jactat
> In populum, faturque docens; Non áurea nobis,
> Argentumque nitens vobis ad gaudia non sunt:
> Quod tamen est, hoc prompta manus dispergere tentât.

torian, Sergio Bertelli, asserts that the actions connected with the sedes stercoraria ritually mimicked a royal birth,16 and that:

> Il getto di monete che seguiva quella verifica, col grido 'non est mihi,' ribadiva questo mutatmento di status, questa 'nascita.'17

However, the phrase "non est mihi" does not indicate this putative change in the pope's status. In the Vulgate, these words clearly mean: "I, Peter, possess neither silver nor gold" (the mihi is a dative of possession). There is no compelling reason to believe that medieval popes used a standard grammatical construction to convey a particular notion of rulership.

In Alain Boureau's view, the new pope's recitation of Acts 3:6 was an acknowledgment of his possession ("habeo")—but not ownership ("non est mihi")—of the Church. The coin casts, the pope's gift to those who had "theologically but not actually" elected him, symbolized, by a "feudal transposition," an offering made by possessor (pope) to owner (people).18 This explanation is not convincing. No tenet of medieval ecclesiology stated that either the "people" or the pontiff owned the Church. Christ's words (Matt. 16:18) to Peter in founding the Church—tu es Petrus et super hancpetram aediflcabo ecclesiam meant—leave no doubt that Christ was the Church's "owner." Moreover, medieval clerics would not have conceptualized the relationship between pope and Church as that between possessor and thing owned, but as that be-

'6ll corpo del re: sacralità e potere nell'Europa médiévale e moderna (Florence, 1990), p. 149:

> Se la Chiesa di Roma era "mater et caput ecclesiarum" . . . , allora il pontefice ne era il figlio. Come tale, egli doveva, in un qualche modo, imitare la nascita del bambino regale, sottoponendosi da adulto ad una ostentatio intesa come testimonium fortitudinis. La cerimonia, insomnia, intendeva mimare il parto regio ed essa resta un ottimo documento di quanto üpontifex rex rincorresse a sua volta il rex sacerdos.

"Ibid.

"La papesse Jeanne (Paris, 1988), p. 104:

> On croit percevoir le sens originel du rituel décrit ici pour la première fois; il devait manifester la transformation religieuse de l'élu en dominant et prolonger ainsi le rite immédiatement antérieur, celui du changement de nom: l'action divine fait du pauvre l'occupant du trône de gloire. Dans sa transposition féodale, le rite dit aussi que l'élu prend possession de l'Eglise en donnant au peuple qui l'a théologiquement sinon pratiquement élu l'offrande symbolique du tenancier au propriétaire ou au suzerain:le pape prend l'argent des mains du camérier (chargé des finances pontificales) et proclame la possession ("habeo"), mais non la propriété ("non est mini"). Mais, dans nos ordines, ce sens se perd;. . . .

tween overseer (episcopus) and thing overseen. A newly-elected pontiff, surveying the admiring Roman crowds, could see in them neither his "theological" electors (whatever Boureau means by this) nor the Church's true owners.

In a later passage, Boureau provides an additional explanation of the significance of the casts:

> C'est sur la chaise stercoraire que le pape lance une triple poignée d'argent en disant:'Cet argent n'est pas à moi';la permutation des rôles (prendre ou piller/distribuer ou concéder) importe, car elle place le pontife élu en position christique et prétend annuler par anticipation le rite funéraire du pillage qui néantise la personne et le corps du pape.19

This explanation is baffling. Would an eyewitness (or the pope) perceive the tosses to the crowd as a counterpoint to the occasional despoliation of a deceased pontiff's worldly possessions? And, how does "distributing" rather than "pillaging" place the pope in a "position christique" (assuming that it was explained what this phrase means)?

The explanation of the seeming discrepancy between the pope's words and the coin cast is more prosaic: the popes (and/or the writers of the liturgical prescriptions) focused only on the literal wording of Acts 3:6 and ignored the context of the passage. Some medieval theologians did precisely that. The Glossa Ordinaria was the standard medieval commentary on the Bible. Each gloss has its own (sometimes complicated) history, but the one "on the Acts [of the Apostles] is almost entirely compiled from Rabanus Maurus and Bede."20 Rabanus Mauras' (780/1-856) commentary on Acts remains unedited.21 Bede's (c. 673-735) commentary on Acts 3:6 (c. 709) revolved around a literal understanding of the words "Argentum . . . do." He contrasted the material wealth of the Jews with the intentional poverty—prescribed in Matt. 10:9—of the Christians (and the triumph of the latter faith over the former).22 A Christian should distribute—not hoard—any wealth

"Ibid., p. 113- Bertelli, op. cit., p. 101, accepts Boureau's idea that the coin casts compensated the crowd for avoiding the pillaging usually accompanying a pope's funeral.

Boureau's statement that the pope tossed coins from the sedes stercoraria is incorrect. Every source indicates that the pope cast coins after rising from this chair.

"Oxford Dictionary of the Christian Church, ed. F. L. Cross, 3rd ed. by E. A. Livingstone (New York, 1997), p. 682.

21Raymund Kottje,"Raban Maur (Hrabanus Maurus)," Dictionnaire de spiritualité, \o\. 13 (1987), col. 5.

22The passage from Matt. 10:9 reads: "Nolite possidere aurum neque argentum neque pecuniam in zonis vestris."

which had come his way.23 The pertinent section of the Glossa Ordinaria preserved this emphasis on a Christian's obligation to distribute his wealth as alms:

> Vers. 6—Silver, etc. Peter was mindful of that teaching: Possess neither gold nor silver. The money placed at the Apostles' feet was not to be hoarded by themselves but used for the poor, for whoever relinquishes his patrimony protects his heavenly one.24

Thus, a literal understanding of the text of Acts 3:6 would—with one important reservation—make it suitable for recitation during a coin toss. Would it not be contradictory for the pope to assert that he did not have wealth while distributing it? A subtle, but important, difference in the wording of Albinus' prescriptions—our earliest source for these coin casts—suggests that Albinus was aware of the contradiction and attempted to correct it.

In prescribing the words the pope was to recite while casting coins, some sources reproduced, verbatim, Acts 3:6: "Argentum et aurum non est mihi; quod autem habeo, hoc tibi do." Several sources, however, add the phrase "ad delectationem" ("for the purpose of enjoyment") directly after "mihi." Table 1 separates the sources according to this distinction.25

2,Expositio actuum apostolorum et retractatio, edited by M. L. W Laistner in Corpus Christianorum,Vol. 121 (1983), 23-24:

> Argentum et aurum non est mihi, et cetera. Habuit quidem uetus tabernaculum iustificationes culturae et sanctum saeculare auro argentoque distinctum, sed metallis legis sanguis euangelii pretiosior emicat, quia populus ille, qui ante auratos postes mente debUis iacuerat, in nomine crucifixi saluatus templum regni caelestis ingreditur. Aloquin beatus Petrus dominici memor praecepti quod dicitur: Nolite possidere aurum et argentum, pecuniam quae ad pedes apostolorum ponebatur non sibi recondere, sed ad usum pauperum qui sua patrimonia reliquerant, reseruare solebat.

Lawrence T. Martin, The Venerable Bede: Commentary on the Acts of the Apostles ("Cistercian Studies Series," No. 117 [Kalamazoo, Michigan, 1989]), pp. 47-48, interprets Bede's understanding of Acts 3:6 as follows:

> The old law had the temple which glittered {emicat) with silver and gold, and that Peter does not have, but what he does have to give is the "blood of the gospel," which spurts forth {emicat) salvation for the enfeebled in mind, represented by the lame beggar.

^Patrología Latina,\o\. 114 (1852), col. 434:

> Vers. 6—Argentum, etc. Memor erat Petrus alius praecepti: Nolite possidere aurum et argentum.Pecvmiam etiam quae ad pedes apostolorum ponebatur, non sibi recondebant, sed ad usus pauperum, qui sua patrimonia reliquerant, servabant.

"Two prescriptions for a papal consecration/coronation are not included in Table 1: the ordines written for the coronation of John XXII (at Lyon, September 5, 1316), and for

TABLEl

THE RENDERING OF THE TEXT IN ACTS 3:6 ACCORDING TO THE SOURCES FOR A PAPAL CORONATION AT ROME26

Sources adding the phrase "ad delectationem" to the wording of Acts 3:6	Sources preserving the wording of Acts 3:6
Albinus (1183-1188)	Gregory Xs Ordo (c. 1274)
Cencius (1191-1198)	Pontifical of the Roman Curia (c. 1276)
Basel Ordo (12th c.)	Stefaneschi's Ordo for Benediction of a New Pope (1300-1340)
	Barozzi's Pontifical (1451/1455)
	Piccolomini's Ceremonial (1488)

Almost all of the sources which rendered verbatim Acts 3:6 did so within passages that relied—nearly verbatim—on the instructions found in Gregory Xs Ordo regarding the coin casts.27 Those sources whose passages added the phrase "ad delectationem" to Acts 3:6 closely followed the text of Albinus' prescriptions (written almost a century before those belonging to Gregory X's Ordo).

Albinus may have added the phrase "ad delectationem" to his liturgical instructions' quotation of Acts 3:6 to harmonize the words with the bestowal. The addition of the phrase "ad delectationem" does not endue

the consecration of Martin V (at Constance, December 21, 1417). Ceremonies extra Romam made no attempt to duplicate the coin casts performed at the Lateran.

26Albinus' Ordo in LC, II, 123 (col. 1);CenciusOrdo,2&irf.,I,311 (col.2);the Basel Ordo in Schimmelpfennig,"Ein bisher unbekannter Text," p. 60; Gregory X's Ordo in Dykmans (ed.), Le cérémonial papal, l, 177; the Pontifical of the Roman Curia (thirteenth century) in Andrieu (ed.), Le pontifical romain, II, 377-388; the coronation ordo dated to c. 1300, ibid.,Wo\.i, Le pontifical de Guillaume Durand (1940), p. 668 (Appendix I); Stefaneschi's Ordo for the benediction of a new pope in Dykmans (ed.), Le cérémonial papal, II, 284; Stefaneschi's prescriptions for a consecration at Rome ibid. ,II, 322; Barozzi's Pontifical in Schimmelpfennig, Die Zeremonienbücher, p. 348; and Piccolomini's Ceremonial in Dykmans (ed.), Patrizi Piccolomini, l, 82.

27The pertinent passage in Piccolomini's Ceremonial did not directly rely on the passage found in Gregory X's Ordo.

the passage—understood literally—with a new meaning. It does, however, harmonize the quotation with the bestowing of wealth. By crying out, "I possess neither gold nor silver for [my] enjoyment/pleasure, but what I have I give you!"—followed by the tossing of fistfuls of coins—the pope acknowledged his wealth, stated his intention to share it, and immediately made good on his word. Clearly, therefore, the pope's words at the Lateran sedes were, and are, to be understood literally. Doing so has theological precedents, ecclesiological consistency, and obviates the need for explanations as unjustified as they are complex.

THE ABDICATING CLERGY OF THE GIRONDE

BY

Kenneth R. Fenster*

On December 21, 1793, Jean Sabes, the curé of Beychac for over a decade, sent an irate letter to the district administration of Bordeaux complaining bitterly that its commissioner had threatened to arrest him if he refused to abdicate the priesthood. "There you have it, citizen administrators! The conduct of your commissioner and the manner in which he extorted from me my letters of priesthood. … It was in the name of the law that he stripped me of my property!"[1] In addition to signing his name to the municipal deliberation recording his abdication, Sabes indignantly wrote, "resigning, forced, protesting!"[2] A few days later the administration received a similar letter from curé Jean-Baptiste Anglade of Montussan. He too protested vehemendy about having been browbeaten by a district commissioner to relinquish his letters of ordination.[3] An outsider to the local community had forced these two clergymen to abdicate the priesthood. But was their experience typical in the department of the Gironde?

Almost ninety years ago, the French historian Albert Mathiez lamented the lack of studies of the abdicating clergy of the Year II.[4] For over fifty years, historians ignored his call for research on this subject. As late as the middle of the twentieth century, scholars interested in the clergy during the French Revolution generally wrote from a Catholic perspective and focused on the controversies arising from the Civil Constitution of the Clergy and the persecution of the refractory priests,

*Dr. Fenster is an assistant professor of history in DeKalb College, Central Campus, Clarkston, Georgia.

'Sabes to the district of Bordeaux, December 21, \191>, Archives départementales de la Gironde (hereafter A.D.G.), 4 L 282.

2Emphasis in the original. Municipality of Beychac to the district of Bordeaux, July 30, 1794, ibid.

'Deliberation of the district of Bordeaux, December 28, 1793, A.D.G., 3 L 26.

4"Coup d'oeil critique sur l'histoire religieuse de la Révolution," in Contributions à l'histoire religieuse de la Révolution française (Paris, 1907), p. 13.

neglecting the abdicating clergymen of the Terror.5 A turning point in the study of the abdicating clergy of the Year II occurred in 1964. Under the leadership of Marcel Reinhard, a team of historians responded to Mathiez's plea for systematic research into the experience of the clergy during the movement known as de-Christianization.6 Reinhard, Bernard Plongeron, Michel Vovelle, and others established statistics of abdicating priests for various departments and regions of France. They determined a chronology and geography of clerical abdications, and they sought to measure the extent of this aspect of de-Christianization. They followed the careers of the abdicating clergy through the later stages of the Revolution and into the nineteenth century, determining how many of them returned to ecclesiastical functions and how many remained among the laity. When this group of scholars presented their findings at the 89e Congrès national des sociétés savantes held at Lyon, they established the quantitative foundation of analysis of the abdicating priests of the Year II.

Simultaneously, they opened a historical debate about the abdicating clergymen and the motives behind their decisions. Bernard Plongeron concluded that the abdicating priests were the victims of desperate circumstances beyond their control; they abdicated under pressure and out of fear to avoid arrest and deportation. The attack on the clergy was imposed from above by the Revolutionary government and its representatives.7 Michel Vovelle, however, argued that some priests abjured in response to the wishes of the local community while others abdicated spontaneously, abandoning the priesthood to support de-Christianization or to rid themselves of an unwanted vocation. Rather than being initiated exclusively by strangers to the local community, the attack on the clergy depended on local efforts and revealed a long-standing and ongoing detachment from traditional Catholicism.8 Plongeron and Vovelle have continued to study the abdicating priests,

'Bernard Plongeron and Jean Godel, "1946-1970. Un quart de siècle d'histoire religieuse. A propos de la génération des secondes lumières, 1770-1820," Annales historiques de la Révolution française, 44 (1792), 187-188.

'Marcel Reinhard et al. ,"Les prêtres abdicataires pendant la Révolution," inicies du 8Sf Congrès national des sociétés savantes, Lyon, 1964 (Paris, 1965), pp. 27-228.

'"Les prêtres abdicataires parisiens," ibid., pp. 27-62.

""Prêtres abdicataires et déchristianisation en Provence," ibid., pp. 63-98. See two other articles that Vovelle published in 1964: "Déchristianisation spontanée et déchristianisation provoquée dans le Sud-Est sous la Révolution française," Bulletin de la société d'histoire moderne, 4 (1964), 5-1 l;"Essai de cartographie de la déchristianisation sous la Révolution française," Annales du Midi, 76 (1964), 529-542. Vovelle advances this same thesis in his major and best-known work, Piété baroque et déchristianisation en Provence au XVIII' siècle (Paris, 1973).

and their respective interpretations have changed little over the past thirty years.9 Vovelle, in fact, has recently taken the bold step of publishing a book on de-Christianization that is national in scope. It incorporated much of his earlier work on the abdicating clergy and concluded that little more needed to be said about the subject.10 Vovelle's general thesis and this book in particular have been strongly criticized. In an important conference paper delivered in 1995, Clarke Garrett argued that Vovelle's entire body of work has been influenced by his adherence to Marxist ideology; he interpreted de-Christianization "as part of a higher process, a longue durée that constitutes the ideological struggle of the Marxist dialectic." As such, Vovelle concluded that de-Christianization brought into focus a century-long mutation of religious mentality that brutally resulted in the triumph of a new set of values. Marxism led Vovelle into the "quagmire known as the history of mentalities," and few historians today accept his conclusions. Furthermore, Garrett dismissed Vovelle's attempt at a national approach to de-Christianization and the abdicating clergy as premature, calling instead for further local studies of the phenomena.11 The present research on the abdicating priests of the department of the Gironde seeks to contribute to the debate on this aspect of de-Christianization and to do so by responding directly to Garrett's plea for additional local studies of it.

In the Gironde, as elsewhere, abdications of the priesthood were only one manifestation of de-Christianization.12 Proponents of the movement closed churches and confiscated church bells, precious metals, and sacred vessels and ornaments. They celebrated sacrilegious festivals, inaugurating anti-Christian cults of reason or the Supreme Being. In a few places, they smashed confessionals, altars, and religious statuary. The de-

'Plongeron, "Regards sur l'historiographie religieuse de la Révolution française: la déchristianisation.Mnnafes historiques de la Révolution française, 40 (1968), 145-205; idem,"Autopsie d'une église constitutionnelle: Tours de 1794-1802," in Actes du 93' Congrès national des sociétés savantes, Tours, 1968 (Paris, 1971), pp. 147-201;Vovelle,Äengion et Révolution: la déchristianisation de l'an II (Paris, 1976); idem, The Revolution against the Church: Prom Reason to the Supreme Being, trans. Alan José (Columbus, 1991).

"The Revolution against the Church, pp. 62-82.

""The 'Dechristianization of the Year IF: Historians' Dilemma," in Consortium on Revolutionary Europe, 1750-1850, Selected Papers, 1995, ed. Bernard Cook et al. (Tallahassee, 1995), pp. 21 1,214.

12For the sources on which this paragraph is based and for a more complete discussion of these other manifestations of de-Christianization, see my dissertation, "De-Christianizers and de-Christianization in the Gironde during the Year II" (Marquette University, 1993), chap. 6.

Christianizers expunged the religious nomenclature from towns and villages. Unfortunately, official documentation concerning these events is unsystematic and deficient; it does not permit an accurate, quantitative analysis of their extent. The evidence that is available, however, suggests that they were secondary to the attack on the clergy. Except for the closing of churches, which occasionally coincided with the local cure's abdication of ecclesiastical functions, many of these other phenomena occurred long after the clerical abjurations. Months, in numerous cases many months, separated the abdications from the seizures of the precious metals and sacred ornaments from the churches. The administrators of one district of the department knew that something was incongruous when they remarked that many curés had abdicated but that few municipalities had bothered to remove the sacred vessels or precious metals from their churches.[13] The long interval between the abdications and the confiscations of the precious metals and sacred ornaments from the churches indicates that the latter was an afterthought and incidental to the antireligious campaign. Iconoclasm occurred so sporadically and in so few places that it too was incidental to the irreligious movement in the department. The same is also true of the renaming of towns and villages. Many of the new names were simple secularizations of the old ones, showing little genuine commitment to de-Christianization. Of all these other manifestations of de-Christianization, only the festival of reason in the city of Bordeaux was anticlerical and irreligious. With its blasphemous masquerade of men mocking ecclesiastics, including the pope who carried a banner reading, "Our Reign is Over," this highly planned affair served as a formal, even logical, conclusion to the clerical abdications that had recently occurred in the city.[14]

For the city of Bordeaux and five of the seven districts of the department—Bordeaux, Bourg, Cadillac, Lesparre, and Libourne—the documentation concerning the abdicating clergy is abundant. District deliberations and correspondence, lists of abdicating priests, and municipal deliberations of the city of Bordeaux provide the bulk of the data. In all likelihood, almost every clergyman who abdicated the priesthood in these regions has been located.[15] For the other two districts of the department, Bazas

"Deliberation of the district of Libourne, May 27, 1794, A.D.G., 10 L 8.

"Program of the festival of reason, December 10, 1793, A.D.G., 3 L 346.

"For Bordeaux, registers of deliberations, A.D.G., 3 L 26-27 and 4 L 14; correspondence with the municipalities of the district, A.D.G., 4 L 282-284; for Bourg, registers of deliberations, A.D.G., 6 L 4-5; list of abdicating clergymen, A.D.G., 6 L 52; for Cadillac, registers of deliberations, A.D.G., 7 L 6-7 and 7 L 12-15; lists of abdicating clergymen, A.D.G., 7 L 93; for Lesparre, list of abdicating clergymen, A.D.G., 9 L 46; for Libourne, register of delibera-

and La Réole, the documentation is incomplete and dispersed. The registers of deliberations of the district of Bazas and a special register containing the names of the abdicating clergymen have been lost.[16] The registers of deliberations of the district of La Réole are silent on the question.[17] An extensive search in the national, departmental, and archdiocesan archives has yielded few results; the number of abdications that has been found for these districts—via a wide variety of isolated documents—is well below the probable number of clerical demissions.[18] With these sources, and cognizant of their limitations, it has been possible to identify with certainty 412 abdicating clergymen in the Gironde (see Table I).[19]

tions.A.D.G., 10 L 8; list of abdicating clergymen, A.D.G., 10 L 93. For the city of Bordeaux, register of municipal deliberations, Archives municipales de Bordeaux (hereafter A.M.B.),D 104; list of abdicating clergymen, A.M.B., I 56.

16An inventory of the district's papers made in 1796 refers to this special register, A.D.G.,5L55.

"A.D.G., 8 L 3-4. In this district the abdications occurred at the municipal level, and the municipalities failed to inform the district administration of them. The administration sent a letter on March 16, 1794, to the municipalities, popular societies, and surveillance committees of the district asking if the local clergy had abdicated,A.D.G.,8 L 20.1 found no responses to this letter.

"Among the more important sources are the letters from the agent national of Bazas to the Convention's Committee of Public Instruction, January-May, 1794, Archives Nationales (hereafter A.N.) F" 873; retraction statements of the constitutional oath made in 1795, A.D.G., 2 V 8; notes by the administration of La Réole written on various clergymen's baptismal certificates, A.D.G., 8 L 69;"Etat des ci-devant curés du canton de Monségur," ADG., 13 L 59. Three biographical dictionaries of the clergy of the department and the copious notes drafted by Monseigneur de La Porte in 1802 have also been consulted. None of these items was useful for locating the abdicating clergy; the dictionaries duplicated what was found in the archival material; the notes made no references to the abdications of the Year II: MS card file on the clergy of the department of the Gironde during the Revolution, by Abbé Jean Pelette, Archives de l'évêché de Bordeaux (hereafter A.E.B.); chap. 15 of "L'ancien diocèse de Bazas, IV= siècle-1789," MS. by Dom Reginald Biron,A.E.B.;"Dictionnaire biographique des prêtres de la révolution, intrus, assermentés, rétractés, et émigrés," by Abbé Albert Gaillard, A.M.B., Fonds Gaillard, MS. 398; for de La Portes notes, see "Tableau général des paroisses du diocèse avec le nom des paroisses, des curés, leur distance de Bordeaux et le nom des collateurs tels qu'ils étaient en 1789," A.D.G., 2 V 8;"notes sur les intrus et jureurs du diocèse de Bordeaux en mai 1802,"A.D.G., 2 V 38; "notes sur le clergé du diocèse de Bordeaux en communion avec Monseigneur l'archevêque," ibid.

19An initial attempt was made to distinguish between those clergymen who renounced the priesthood by surrendering their letters of ordination and those who merely resigned their pastoral functions by evading the handing over of their letters. This effort was hopelessly frustrating because, in many cases, official records do not allow this distinction to be made. The lists of abdicating clergymen almost never refer to the letters of priesthood, making the problem particularly acute for the district of Lesparre, where a list is the only source. Some of the other sources used to locate the abdicating clergy also fail to mention the letters of ordination. Thus, of the 412 abdicating clergymen, 265 certainly relin-

TABLE1

GEOGRAPHIC DISTRIBUTION OF THE ABDICATING CLERGY

Region	Number of Abdicating Priests
City of Bordeaux	55
District of Bordeaux	80
District of Bazas	14
District of Bourg	46
District of Cadillac	60
District of La Réole	42
District of Lesparre	31
District of Libourne	84
Departmental Total	412

The representatives on mission, Jean Lambert Tallien and Claude-Alexandre Ysabeau, introduced de-Christianization in the department. The original impulse for their de-Christianizing activities came from Paris. About but certainly not after November 18, 1793, they or their secretary, Jacques Peyrend-d'Herval, received a letter from Paris, describing the clerical abdications and the festival of reason that had occurred recently in the capital.20 Armed with this letter, these men, along with Ysabeau's younger brother,21 arranged for a local constitutional cleric, Bernard Godineau, to abdicate the priesthood at the meeting of the Club National of Bordeaux on November 18, 1793.22 At that session of the club, Godineau mounted the podium, surrendered his letters of

quished their letters of priesthood, 51 certainly did not, and this distinction cannot be made for 96. Moreover, a comparison of the clergy who handed over their letters to those who did not revealed virtually no difference between them in terms of their career experiences, ages, places of birth, rates of return to ecclesiastical functions after the Terror, or motives for abdicating during the Terror.

20Only a reference to the letter has been found in the deliberation of the Club National of Bordeaux, November 18, 1793,A.D.G., 12 L 23.

21I have not been able to identify him with greater precision.

22Godineau was an excellent choice for this role. He had been ordained by the constitutional bishop of the Gironde, Pierre Pacareau. After taking the oath to the Civil Constitution of the Clergy, he became a superior at the constitutional seminary. He held this post from August, 1791, until September 14, 1793, when the seminary closed. Thus, he was not exercising any ecclesiastical function when he abdicated the priesthood. Godineau never resumed his ecclesiastical functions, and he never reconciled with the Church. Principal sources: card file on the clergy of the Gironde during the Revolution by J. Pelette.A.E.B.; Abbé L. Bertrand, Histoire des séminaires de Bordeaux et de Bazas (3 vols.; Bordeaux, 1894),I,190,196.

ordination, promised to marry, and declared that he had "always combatted fanaticism; that the true gospel was brotherhood, beneficence, love of country, and love of the Supreme Being, and that priests were no longer needed to spread this gospel." D'Herval followed Godineau at the podium where he read the letter from Paris. Ysabeau's brother then "read a proposal calling for the representatives on mission to round up the priests in order to catechize them and to exhort them to unfrock themselves."[23] Two days after these momentous events, Tallien and Ysabeau boasted that they "had attacked and were extinguishing fanaticism" in Bordeaux.[24]

Once the campaign against the clergy began, it took nine months to traverse the entire department, and it passed through three distinct phases (see Table 2).[25] First, a spectacular blast began in mid-November, 1793, and continued for a month. It affected most of the department but was primarily urban: over 40 percent (48 of 113) of the abdications that took place during this phase were in the city of Bordeaux. The second phase lasted intermittently for three months, from mid-December, 1793, to mid-March, 1794. It covered little territory and affected only a handful of clergymen. Finally, a four-month phase began in late March, peaked in June, and ended in July, 1794. This phase engulfed the entire department, and the total number of abdications surpassed the level that had been attained in November and December. The few abdications in August were a postscript to the movement.

During each phase, the campaign against the clergy originated in one or more of the towns and radiated outward to the rural areas of the department. The anticlerical attack began in Bordeaux in mid-November, 1793, and continued there for three weeks. The city's example influenced the rest of the department; from this primordial center, the movement spread to such geographically disparate sections of the Gironde as the canton of Monségur in the district of La Réole, the town of Blaye in the district of Bourg, and isolated villages in the districts of Bordeaux, Lesparre, and Cadillac. During the second phase, the campaign started in earnest in early February in the administrative town of Bazas. It spread from there to other villages of the district and to the neighboring district of Cadillac. In the final phase, the movement had several original centers that were independent of one another: the cities of Libourne and Bordeaux and the administrative towns of Cadillac, Bourg,

"Deliberation of the Club National, November 18, 1793, A.D.G., 12 L 23.

"Ysabeau and Tallien to Courtois, November 20, 1793, A.D.G., 2 L 7.

2The exact date of 79 percent (327 of 412) of all the abdications has been determined using the sources described above.

TABLE 2

THE PHASES OF THE ATTACK ON THE CLERGY

Phase	Number of Abdications	Percent of All Abdications
Nov. 18-Dec. 18, 1793	113	35
Dec.21,1793-Mar.20,1794	44	13
Mar.21-July 18, 1794	159	49
July 19, 1794 and After	11	3
Total	327	100

and Lesparre. In late March, abdications occurred for the first time in the district of Libourne, where they continued steadily through July. In April the campaign resumed in the district of Bourg for the first time in five months. And in late May and June, abdications occurred for the first time since December in the districts of Lesparre and Bordeaux. With the passage of time, the attack on the clergy covered the entire department.

The juxtaposition of the chronology and the geography of the drive against the clergy explains why most of the abdications occurred. In the city of Bordeaux, 54 of the 55 abdications can be dated exactly and, of these, 45 took place between November 18 and December 2, 1793. Moreover, 34 clergymen abdicated within the span of one week. The three most important dates were November 25, when Pierre Pacareau, the constitutional bishop, and four of his vicaires general abdicated; the following day, when ten clergymen abjured their vocation; and November 29, when curé Dominique Lacombe, a recognized leader of the local constitutional clergy,[26] led a contingent of five priests to municipal headquarters to surrender their letters of ordination. These abdications coincided with the anticlerical and anti-Catholic activities of Ysabeau and Tallien that culminated in a festival of reason on December 10, 1793.[27] These proconsuls rounded up the local clergy and forced them to abdicate the priesthood as a direct, administrative measure.

[26] On Lacombe, see the works of Jean Gérard, "Dominique Lacombe, curé constitutionnel et évêque métropolitain de Bordeaux (1788-1802)," Revue d'histoire de l'Eglise de France, 63 (1977), 87-102; La vie ardente et mouvementée de Dominique Lacombe, évêque concordataire d'Angoulême, Périgueux, à travers la Révolution, l'Empire, la Restauration (Paris, 1983).

[27] "Program of the festival of reason, December 10, 1793, A.D.G., 3 L 346.

In the rural areas of the department, no single explosion compared to the brevity of the one that occurred in the city of Bordeaux. Instead, in the districts of Bordeaux, Bourg, Cadillac, and Lesparre, there were two distinct and brief periods of abdication that were usually separated from each other by several months. In each district, these periods lasted for a month or less and, combined, they included more than 75 percent of the abdications for which exact dates are known (see Table 3). Moreover, each period coincided with the presence of anticlerical revolutionaries in the districts. Zealous district commissioners, members of the Club National of Bordeaux, and Ysabeau traveled throughout the department forcing clergymen to abdicate the priesthood. Two curés protested bitterly about the pressure exerted on them by the agents of the district of Bordeaux for the surrender of their letters of priesthood.28 Beginning in late May, 1794, the Club National sent its members on proselytizing missions to the countryside "to instruct our rural brothers … to combat error."29 In their reports, the clubbists on mission almost always recounted in detail—usually in triumphal and irreverent rhetoric—their successes in securing clerical abdications.30 Ysabeau's passage through the district of Cadillac in February, his presence in the district of Bourg in late April and May, and his control of the district of Lesparre in June account for the abdications in those regions at those times. It is not at all surprising that an inventory of Ysabeau's papers listed many letters of priesthood.31

The attack on the clergy in the district of Libourne differed from the movement in the other sections of the department. Here, it continued for four consecutive months, and no two months combined included more than 59 percent of the abdications for which exact dates are known. Nevertheless, the clergy of this district also abdicated under pressure; they abjured because of the wave of anticlerical and anti-Catholic manifestations emanating from the popular society of Libourne. On March 20, 1794, the

2"On December 3, 1793, the administration sent forty-eight commissioners to the countryside "to warn the good sans-culottes . . . about the perfidious insinuations of . . . fanatics, priests, and finally of any and all enemies of the Republic." Arrêté of the administration of Bordeaux, December 3, 1793, A.D.G., 4 L 31. Only one of these commissioners can be identified, and he interpreted this statement as a mandate to force the clergy of the communes he visited to abdicate the priesthood. Pierre-Paul Rivière to the representatives on mission, December 28, 1793, A.D.G., 13 L 29, dossier Rivière.

»Deliberation of the Club Nationaljune 6, 1794, A.D.G., 12 L 23.

"These reports are in A.D.G., 12 L 25.

3lThere is a reference to this inventory and its contents in the deliberation of the Club National of Bordeaux, June 13, 1794.A.D.G., 12 L 23.

TABLE 3

PERIODS OF ABDICATIONS IN FOUR DISTRICTS OF THE DEPARTMENT

District	Period	Number of Abdications	Percent Abdications for Which Exact Dates Known
Bordeaux	Nov. 27-Dec. 17, 1793	20	30
	May 29-June 28, 1794	33	49
	Total	53	79
Bourg	Nov. 23-Dec. 20, 1793	9	26
	Apr. 29-May 29, 1794	19	56
	Total	28	83
Cadillac	Feb. 4-27, 1794	15	39
	Apr. 10-20, 1794	14	37
	Total	29	76
Lesparre	Nov. 27-Dec. 5, 1793	11	37
	June 8-24, 1794	15	50
	Total	26	87

club ordered the closure of the local parish church and its conversion into a temple of reason, and it established April 9 as the date for a festival of reason. On March 23 the club issued a letter to the clergy of the district demanding their abdications and threatening to arrest all those who refused to comply[32] Immediately afterwards, the clergymen of the district began to abdicate in great numbers, and the flow of abdications continued unabated until mid-July[33]

The vast majority of abdicating priests were parish curés (see Table 4). The religious legislation of the early years of the Revolution explains the virtual absence of regulars, canons, chaplains, and other non-parish secular clergymen from the group of abdicating priests. In all likeli-

"Decree of the popular society of Libourne, March 20, 1794, cited in Marc Besson,^4ta; Armes Citoyens! Histoire de la Révolution à Libourne, 1789-1795 (Libourne, 1968), pp. 304-305,307.

"Of the 84 abdications that occurred in the district, 59 can be dated exactly and of these 57 were made after March 23, 1794.

TABLE 4

ECCLESIASTICAL FUNCTIONS OF THE ABDICATING CLERGY

Function	Number Abdicating	Percent of All Abdicating Clergy
Curés	323	79
Vicaires	34	8
Other Seculars	38	9
Regulars	17	4
Total	412	100

hood, these men returned to their native towns and villages or emigrated.[34] The numerical preponderance of curés and the small percentage of vicaires in the group of abdicating clergymen were legacies of the Old Regime and especially of the ecclesiastical oath of 1791. Clerical recruitment had declined steadily throughout the eighteenth century in the diocese of Bordeaux, resulting in an acute shortage of vicaires. In 1772 two-thirds of the cures of the diocese were without their services, and in 1790 vicaires were present in only every third or fourth parish of the department.[35] The requirement to swear an oath to the Civil Constitution of the Clergy in 1791 further diminished the corps of vicaires. In marked contrast to the parish priests, the vicaires of the department overwhelmingly rejected the oath: although 63 percent of the curés became jurors, only 44 percent of the vicaires accepted the revolutionary organization of the Church.[36] Most of the vicaires who swore the oath quickly became curés, resulting in yet a further decline in their ranks. New men, regulars, canons, and newly ordained ecclesiastics, entered the constitutional clergy primarily as curés. Thus, from 1791 to 1793, the number of curés increased by 27 percent, while the number of vicaires decreased sharply and continuously throughout the

[34] It is difficult to follow the careers of these men after 1790. Of the approximately 300 regulars in the city of Bordeaux in 1790, no information exists for 210; of the canons of the city of Bordeaux, half had emigrated or died by 1793.

[35] Timothy Tackett, "L'histoire sociale du clergé diocésain dans la France du XVIII' siècle," Revue d'histoire moderne et contemporaine, 27 (1979), 199, 206, and graph 205; Philippe Loupes, "Le clergé paroissial du diocèse de Bordeaux d'après la grande enquête de 1772," Annales du Midi, 83 (1971), 14, and chart 15; Timothy Tackett and Claude Langlois, "Ecclesiastical Structures and Clerical Geography on the Eve of the French Revolution," French Historical Studies, 11 (1980), 360.

[36] Timothy Tackett, Religion, Revolution, and Regional Culture in Eighteenth-Century France: The Ecclesiastical Oath of 1791 (Princeton, 1986), p. 329.

TABLE 5

ECCLESIASTICAL FUNCTIONS OF THE CLERGY
OF THE GIRONDE, 1789-1793

Function	Approx. Dept. Clergy of 1790 #	% Total	Approx. Const. Clergy of 1791 #	% Total	Approx. Const. Clergy of 1793 #	% Total
Curés	562	41	343	85	435	90
Vicaires	154	11	62	15	50	10
Other Seculars	222	16				
Regulars	445	32				
Total	1383	100	405	100	485	100

early years of the Revolution: from 1790 to 1791, the number of vicaires dropped 60 percent, and, between 1791 and 1793, it fell an additional 20 percent (see Table 5).

In terms of their ecclesiastical functions, the abdicating clergy of the Year II reflected the parish clergy of 1790 and the constitutional clergy of 1791. They were an even better reflection of the clergy exercising ecclesiastical functions in November, 1793—further evidence that they abdicated under pressure and compulsion. At that time, very few regulars, canons, chaplains, or vicaires were available anywhere in the department to abjure, leaving only curés exposed to de-Christianization. Length of service as a curé had minimal impact on the decision to abdicate: 93 percent of the regulars, canons, and newly ordained ecclesiastics who replaced refractory clergymen and became parish priests after 1791 abdicated; 82 percent of the vicaires who became curés after 1791 abjured; and 70 percent of those already installed as curés before the Revolution began abdicated.37 Because their numerical superiority was a legacy of both the old and the new regimes, parish priests were the central and collective victims of de-Christianization.

For the city of Bordeaux and the five districts of the department for which complete data exist, the extent of the attack on the clergy can be measured with a high degree of precision and accuracy. An attempt has been made to determine the number of parish clergymen exercising ecclesiastical functions in these regions as of November, 1793- These calculations are based on the number of curés and vicaires who took the

"The figure for curés refers to the five districts for which data are complete.

oath to the Civil Constitution of the Clergy in 1791[38] and on the transformation of this original corps of clergymen over the next two years. Using three biographical dictionaries of the clergy of the department, it has been possible to determine for each district an influx of new constitutionals: regulars, canons, newly ordained priests, and clergymen moving to the district from a different district or department; and an outflow of constitutionals caused by retraction, emigration, deportation, movement out of the district, arrest, retirement, or death.[39] The resulting number of constitutionals as of November, 1793, is only approximate, but is nevertheless close to reality.

Clearly, in these regions of the department the drive against the clergy made almost a clean sweep of the available priests (see Table 6). The administrators of the district of Cadillac accurately described the situation -when they claimed, "There are no longer any ecclesiastics exercising their functions in the district." The administrators of the districts of Bordeaux, Lesparre, and Libourne made similar conclusions; according to the administrators of Lesparre, "There remains for us no more than two of them in function. . . ."[40] At Bordeaux and in the countryside as well, the de-Christianizers destroyed the Constitutional Church; they designated its priests as targets for persecution, and few escaped unscathed. Indeed, the most common manifestation of de-Christianization in the Gironde was the spectacle of a clergyman abdicating the priesthood. By the end of the Year II, probably no priests were exercising ecclesiastical functions anywhere in the department. Almost every clergyman available to abjure did abjure. The reactions of curés Sabes and Anglade were typical: outsiders to the local community forced them and the other clergymen of the department to abdicate the priesthood as a deliberate political policy.

Both Sabes and Anglade resumed their ecclesiastical functions at some time before their deaths as did 49 percent (203 of 412) of all abdicating clergymen.[41] A large group of 164 priests rejoined the ministry

3*Roger Guitraud, "L'attitude du clergé girondin devant le serment constitutionnel," Revue historique de Bordeaux, n.s. 14 (1965), 127-129; Tackett, Religion, Revolution, pp. 328-329.

39These dictionaries are cited in note 18.

"Note by the administrators of the district of Cadillac on a list of abdicating clergy, June 23, 1794, A.D.G., 7 L 93; note by the administrators of the district of Lesparre on a letter received from the departmental administration of June 17, 1794, A.D.G., 9 L 62. For Bordeaux, see the district deliberation of July 12, 1794, A.D.G., 4 L 14; for Libourne, see the compte décadaire of the agent national of July 18, 1794, A.D.G., 10 L 29.

41For the sources on which this figure is based and for a complete discussion of the abdicating clergy after the Year II, see Kenneth R. Fenster, "The Post-Terror Careers of the Ah-

TABLEÓ

EXTENT OF THE ATTACK ON THE PARISH CLERGY
IN SLX REGIONS OF THE DEPARTMENT

Region	Parish Clergy 1790	Jurors 1791	Approx. Jurors '93	Abdications	% of 1793 That Abdicated
City of Bordeaux	46	4	36	28	78
Dist. of Bordeaux	116	53	80	74	92
Dist. of Bourg	84	54	55	39	71
Dist. of Cadillac	94	45	63	58	92
Dist. of Lesparre	57	41	36	30	83
Dist. of Libourne	166	98	105	79	75
Total	563	295	375	308	82

between the Year III and the end of 1802. A second group of 39 clergymen waited to return to service until after the definitive reorganization of the Diocese of Bordeaux under the Napoleonic Concordat in the summer of 1803. The key factor distinguishing the individuals in these groups was their attitude toward the Revolution. Almost two-thirds of the priests who delayed their return to ecclesiastical functions until after 1803 had already retracted their oaths to the Civil Constitution of the Clergy. Most of them retracted in 1795 or 1796, immediately following de-Christianization, and they expressed genuine bitterness toward and disillusionment with the Revolution. But only 19 percent of those who returned to service earlier had already retracted their oaths to the Civil Constitution. The others, however, remained loyal to the Revolution and had not been traumatized by their abjurations. For these priests, their abdications resulted in only a brief and temporary interruption of their ecclesiastical careers. For them, de-Christianization was a minor phenomenon, an event without permanent significance. In fact, the definitive end of their careers in the clergy occurred when an aristocratic prelate of the Old Regime, Charles-François d'Aviau, became archbishop of Bordeaux (1802-1826) and implemented the Concordat: of these 164 priests, only 59 served after 1803.[42]

dicating Clergy of the Gironde: From Thermidor to the Concordat and Beyond," in Cook (ed.), op. cit., pp. 233-240.

42ThUs, 98 former abdicating clergymen, or 24 percent of the total, served under the Concordat in or shortly after 1803.

But what of those clergymen who never resumed their ecclesiastical functions? Fifty-five of them married during the Revolution; the focus of their lives became their wives, children, and jobs. They became schoolteachers, local officials, professional men, businessmen, farmers, and artisans.43 Some former clergymen had no desire to return to service as they were content 'with the secular professions they had pursued since their abdications. They operated secondary schools, served in the local administration, and entered the liberal professions. These ex-priests were men of talent who easily accommodated themselves to civilian life. Other clergymen were simply too old or infirm to rejoin the ministry. For them and for the majority of abdicating clergymen, an abdication of the priesthood, although made under compulsion, definitively ended their ecclesiastical careers.

In addition to the direct pressure exerted by the de-Christianizers, other factors may have influenced the clergy to abdicate. Several researchers have found a link between religious and political events and attitudes during the Revolution and the presence of Protestants. In some places, the ancient hostility between Calvinists and Catholics resulted in de-Christianization.44 For the Gironde, however, no evidence supports this conclusion. Protestants had inhabited territories of the Gironde region since the middle of the sixteenth century, and in 1790 about 12,500 Calvinists, approximately 2.5 percent of the population, lived in the department. They constituted a significant minority of the population of the city of Bordeaux and the district of Libourne, especially in the vicinity of Sainte-Foy-la-Grande.45 De-Christianization and the attack on the clergy were no more intense in these regions than elsewhere in the department. In many communities where Protestants lived, de-Christianizing activities were limited to the administrative confiscation of the precious metals from the parish church. Only one Protestant, the pastor from Sainte-Foy-la Grande, Pierre Thomas, can be positively identified as a de-Christianizer, and he participated in the

"Principal sources: petitions from married clergymen to Cardinal Caprara,A.N.,AF IV 1895-1916; the dossier "constitutionnels mariés" in the A.M.B., Fonds Gaillard, MS. 372.

"James Hood, "Protestant-Catholic Relations and the Roots of the First Popular Counterrevolutionary Movement in France," Journal of Modern History, 43 (1971), 245-275; Tackett, Religion, Revolution, pp. 218-225; Laura Armand, "La bourgeoisie protestante, la Révolution et le movement de déchristianisation à La Rochelle," Revue d'histoire moderne et contemporaine, 31 (1984), 496-500.

"Samuel Mours, Les églises réformées en France: tableaux et cartes (Paris, 1958), pp. 42, 188, 197. The best study of the Protestants in the city of Bordeaux is Alfred Leroux, íes Religionnaires de Bordeaux de 1685 à 1802 (Bordeaux, 1920).

movement as a leading member of the Club National.[46] Moreover, at least in the city of Bordeaux, Protestants were victims, not proponents, of de-Christianization. On November 23, 1793, shortly after the attack on the clergy began, the pastor of the Bordeaux Protestant community appeared before the municipal council, surrendered the precious metals from his church, and renounced his ministry.[47]

Although the presence of Calvinists had no noticeable impact on the Catholic clergy during the Year II, the presence of other priests may have influenced some clergymen to abdicate the priesthood. In his study of the ecclesiastical oath of 1791, Timothy Tackett concluded that clergymen influenced one another's decisions regarding the oath. In their correspondence, in private consultations with each other, and over dinner, clergymen discussed what for many of them was an agonizing dilemma. Through contacts such as these, individual clergymen might sway their colleagues to accept or refuse the oath. Collective action by and a unified response to the oath among neighboring clergymen often resulted from this clerical interaction.[48] For at least a few priests in the Gironde, peer pressure may have been a factor motivating their decisions to abdicate the priesthood. Throughout the department, but especially in the district of Libourne, groups of clergymen from the same canton abdicated the priesthood on the same day. Thus, two curés from the canton of Guîtres abdicated on March 26, 1794. On May 8 two curés from the canton of Libourne appeared jointly before the district administration to surrender their letters of priesthood. A month later, three curés from the canton of Fronsac went as a group to the district administration to abjure. Perhaps, these men received the letter from the popular society of Libourne demanding their abdications, discussed it with each other, and decided together to abdicate the priesthood.

But did local men, a cure's parishioners, participate in the attack on the clergy? Although the evidence is not abundant, it is clear: local individuals occasionally pressured their curé to abdicate the priesthood. Frequently and on many issues during the Old Regime and again during the crisis over the oath to the Civil Constitution of the Clergy, lay men and women throughout France had imposed their views and values on local clergymen.[49] During the Year II, the laity and its opinions emerged yet again as a powerful force with which at least some local priests had

[46] On his role, see my dissertation, "De-Christianizers," chap. 3.

[47] "Deliberation of the municipality of Bordeaux, November 23, 1793, A.M.B., D 104.

[48] "Religion, Revolution, pp. 115-121.

[49] On this subject, see Gérard Bouchard, Le village immobile. Sennely-en-Sologne au XVIII' siècle (Paris, 1972), pp. 283-345; Paul Bois, Paysans de l'Ouest, abridged ed. (Paris,

to reckon; the laity succeeded in imposing its standards on the clergy by forcing the clergy to abdicate the priesthood. In seeking the abdication of its curé, locals were usually blunt and frank, leaving the clergyman little doubt as to their intentions and goals. Thus, the people of the village of Camiran forced their curé to abdicate by threatening to ransack the rectory and to throw his belongings out into the street.50 The municipal officers of Arsac, Croignon, and Ludon provoked the abdications of their curés by informing them of the National Convention's laws of November 22 and December 11, 1793, that granted pensions to clergymen who abdicated the priesthood.51 The inhabitants of the village of Leognan used a similar but more straightforward tactic to coerce their curé to abdicate. Here, in a scene reminiscent of the Old Regime conflict between parish priest and parish notable, the mayor interrupted the curé during the Sunday Mass.52 Choosing his text carefully, the mayor read aloud from the Bulletin de la Convention, telling the curé that "these charlatans have been unmasked. He could no longer tolerate the reading of these truths and stopped saying the Mass." The municipal officers added a succinct evaluation of their former curé:"He is an extremely useless being."53

But not all clergymen who abdicated under the pressure of their parishioners were held in such contempt by them. In fact, a few priests may have abdicated under pressure in order to retain the acceptance of their flocks. They abjured and then assumed a different and secular role of leadership in local affairs. Curé Jean-Baptiste Labarde of Sadirac, for example, surrendered his letters of ordination and subsequently used his influence to limit the excesses of the Terror in his community; he prevented arrests, arson, and property confiscations.54 At Saint-Médard-d'Eyrans, curé Jean Marie Campagne abdicated the priesthood, preserving sufficient local support among his former parishioners to secure the office of cantonal justice of the peace. After all, Campagne's "wisdom, his civisme, and the amenity of his character" made him the perfect candidate for the post.55 Indeed, many former priests continued to

1971), pp. 292-294; Timothy Tackett, Priest and Parish in Eighteenth-Century France (Princeton, 1977), pp. 17'0-221; idem, Religion, Revolution, pp. 165-172.

'"Deliberation of the district of La Réole, January 7, 1794, A.D.G., 8 L 4.

"Municipalities of Arsac, Croignon, and Ludon to the district of Bordeaux, March 23 and April 6 and 10, 1794,A.D.G.,4 L 282 and 283.

'Tackett, Priest and Parish, pp. 175, 177.

"Municipality of Leognan to the district of Bordeaux, undated ca.July 28, 1794.A.D.G. 4 L 283.

"Report on Labarde's conduct during the Revolution, ca. 1802-03, A.D.G., 2 V 38.

"Deliberation of the district of Bordeaux, April 5, 1794.A.D.G., 3 L 27.

command the respect of their former parishioners. The inhabitants of Langoiran praised their former curé, Antoine Toussant, as "a good and frank republican." Curé Jacques Trémolières of Pomerol was an "enemy of fanaticism." He served in the local administration as a municipal officer and an assistant to the local justice of the peace. Bernard Xavier Brun of Parempuire "is no longer our pastor but since 1788 . . . when he came to us, he has never ceased to be our friend because we know him to be a good and frank republican." Brun parlayed this local respect into political position: after abdicating, he became the chief executive officer of his commune.56 The curé of Le Teich, Bertrand François Castera, abdicated, and the municipal authorities regarded him as "a friend of the republic and a good republican, and today, he is for us of the greatest utility in our municipal operations."57 Jacques Siozard, curé of Saint-Romain-de-Blaye from 1771 until his abdication on November 29, 1793, displayed all the qualities of an exemplary citizen: "His morals have always been honest. Humane and charitable, he has always been ready to help the poor. Good patriot and true republican, he is known as much for his civisme as for his other virtues."58 After abdicating, Siozard served as an officer in the local national guard, and the municipality called on him to plan several revolutionary festivals. He and a few other priests may have abdicated under the pressure of their parishioners in order to conform to their standards and values. Only by abjuring the priesthood could they retain the respect and admiration of their flocks and assume a leadership role.

Some priests also seem to have spontaneously abdicated their functions to support de-Christianization. In his studies of de-Christianization in Provence, Vovelle estimated that approximately ten percent of the clerical abdications were spontaneous. To distinguish between coerced and spontaneous abdications, he used two principal criteria: first, the enthusiasm manifested by an individual priest the moment he relinquished his letters of priesthood; second, the date of the abdication. He argued that clergymen who specifically declared their intention to repudiate the priesthood probably abdicated spontaneously. He also concluded that the first abdications in a region and those that were isolated

^Municipal officers of Langoiran to the district of Cadillac, September 22, 1794, A.D.G., 7 L 92; attestation in favor of Jacques Trémolières by the inhabitants of Pomerol, July 18, 1794, A.D.G., 13 L 30, dossier Trémolières; municipal officers of Parempuire to the district of Bordeaux, June 28, 1794, A.D.G., 4 L 284; MS. card file on the clergy of the department of the Gironde during the Revolution by Abbé Jean Pelette, A.E.B.

"Municipality of Le Teich to the district of Bordeaux, August 9, 1794, A.D.G., 4 L 283.

"Evaluation by the municipality of Blaye cited in Abbé E. Bellemer, Histoire de la ville de Blaye (Bordeaux, 1886), p. 709. On Siozard, see ibid., pp. 369-443.

in time were generally not made under pressure. Vovelle asserted that it was difficult to follow the careers of the abdicating clergymen after the Year II, but he implied that some of those priests who never resumed their ecclesiastical functions after the Terror may have abdicated spontaneously.59

For the Gironde, the evidence suggests that 34 priests, about eight percent of the total affected, abdicated spontaneously. The handful of abdications in the district of Cadillac in late November and December, 1793, may have been spontaneous. They were not grouped within a few days of each other; rather, they were spread over the entire six-week period. One of the priests who abdicated in the district at this time was Jean-Marcellin Maigne, a former canon at the chapter of Cadillac who had not entered the parish clergy. He did not abdicate under pressure; instead, he merely followed the example already established by Jean Fonvieilhe,the curé of Cadillac.60 The curé of Lansac was the only priest to abdicate in the district of Bourg in the month of February. No abdications occurred in the district in the preceding month or in the following two months. In the district of Lesparre, only the curé of Begadan abdicated in March. In the district, no clergymen adjured in January, February, or April.

Some clergymen who abjured at Bordeaux before the abdication of the constitutional bishop on November 25 probably did so voluntarily and with conviction. They embraced de-Christianization with unrestrained enthusiasm. As we have seen, Bernard Godineau abdicated on November 18, denouncing Catholicism and the clergy at the Club National. Two days later, he continued his attack on the Church when he delineated "all the false principles that constitute the Catholic religion, and he praised the progress that Human Reason has made . . . especially since the present revolution."61 In front of a large crowd of people, another clergyman publicly burned his letters of priesthood at the foot of a liberty tree. To symbolize his transformation from a priest to a citizen, he ripped off his soutane and donned a patriotic uniform.62 Hughes-Bernard Combes, a vicaire at Saint-Seurin of Bordeaux, applauded the "progress of enlightenment that results in the good fortune of the

"Especially, "Essai de cartographie," p. 553;"Prêtres abdicataires," pp. 67, 90-91.

mAgent national of the district of Cadillac to the Committee of Public Instruction, containing Maigne's abdication statement of November 25, 1793, ca. December 13, 1793, A.N. F" 875.

"Deliberation of the Club National, November 20, 1793,A.D.G., 12 L 24.

"Representatives on mission to the Jacobin Club of Paris, November 19, 1793, Réimpression de l'Ancien Moniteur (32 vols.), XVIII, 555.

people by freeing them from the bonds of superstition." Combes boasted that his abdication on November 19, 1793,"had more than scandalized" the leaders of the Constitutional Church for whom he expressed utter contempt.63

After abdicating, some clergymen participated actively and willingly in de-Christianization. On November 20 Jean-Armand Peuch, a vicaire at Saint-Dominique of Bordeaux, abjured with enthusiasm. He surrendered his letters of priesthood, breviaries, and theology notebooks to the Club National, requesting that they be used as kindling for a bonfire.64 He and Jean Pradines, a vicaire at Saint-Pierre of Bordeaux who abdicated on November 19, 1793, then went to the district of Bourg as agents of the representatives on mission. They terrorized the district, making arbitrary arrests and house searches, and they smashed religious statues and removed the sacred vessels from several churches.65 Several clergymen abdicated in the district of Bourg in late November and December, 1793, precisely when Puech and Pradines were operating there. For their efforts, these apostates had the odious distinction of being branded for life as terrorists as both were listed in the infamous Livre Rouge.66

Several other abdicating clergymen later acquired reputations as terrorists for their political activities during the Year II. The former curé of Landiras "had been mixed up in all the excesses of the Revolution."67 In the Year III, former curés Raymond Lassusjean Fonvieilhe, and Charles-Hyacinthe Latapy were disarmed for having made arbitrary arrests and for abusing their authority while holding office during the Terror.68 It would be incorrect to conclude that these men abdicated spontaneously because they were terrorists. Nevertheless, their terrorism and

«Combes to Reveilhac, curé of Cazelles, December 20, 1793,ADG, 4 L 125.

"Deliberation of the Club National, November 20, 1793,A.D.G., 12 L 24.

"'Report on Puech by Antony, agent of the representatives on mission, December 23, 1793,A.D.G.,13L31.

""Liste par ordre alphabétique des hommes du sang et dénonciateurs qui ont le plus signalé leurs atrocités à Bordeaux pendant le règne affreux de l'an deuxième de la République (Paris, 1815), p. 21.

67Report by the subprefect of the arrondissement of Bazas, Year LX, A.N. F" 865.

"Deliberation of the district administration of Lesparre, August 6, 1795, A.D.G., 9 L 8; deliberation of the commune of Cadillac, May 23, 1795, A.D.G., 7 L 40; procès verbal of the disarming of Latapy, August 17, 1795, ibid. Specifically, Lassus served on the surveillance committee of Lesparre; Fonvieilhe -was procureur syndic and then agent national of the district of Cadillac throughout the Year II; and Latapy obtained numerous political commissions from the representatives on mission and the districts of Bazas and Cadillac during the Year II.

abjurations were inextricably linked. Lassus' abdication of November 27, 1793, was the first in the district of Lesparre. Less than two weeks later, he married an illiterate peasant girl sixteen years his junior in a public ceremony as the climax to a revolutionary festival held in honor of Jean Paul Marat and Louis Michel Lepeletier.[69] Fonvieihle married in March, 1793, long before the Terror or de-Christianization began;[70] his marriage occurred too early to have been the result of any outside pressure. Nine months later, when he surrendered his letters of priesthood, he admitted that he had always exercised his pastoral functions "with difficulty."[71] Latapy also married in March, 1793-[72] This apostate abdicated, damning Catholicism as "the monster which for so many centuries has dishonored the human race. Fanaticism has been annihilated here by the arms of reason alone, the only ones that the French will use toward all religions."[73] For these men, terrorism, marriage, and abdication were deliberate acts of defiance manifesting their determination to extirpate everything that remained of pre-republican France, including their status as clergymen.

A few clergymen who went beyond common formulas in their abdication statements emphasized their loyalty to the principles of the Revolution and supported the new order. They did not condemn their former vocation; they declared that in the Year II priests were no longer necessary. The curé of Villenave, Jean-Jacques Lanusse, abdicated the priesthood because "the republic no longer needs my ministry." He vowed to do whatever he could to advance the well-being and prosperity of the nation. After abjuring, Lanusse took a job in the local cantonal administration and eventually married.[74] As the constitutional curé of Saint-Sauver-de-Blaye, Jean Fauché strove to promote the welfare of his fellow citizens by "thwarting the perfidious schemes of the aristocrats and the refractory priests. But now that his ministry appears to be useless to the republic, he believes that he would be unworthy of the name republican if he did not renounce all his ecclesiastical functions." Fauché relinquished his letters of ordination, title to the parish, and two sacred vessels that belonged to him, declaring that

"Marriage certificate of Raymond Lassus, December 10, 1793, A.D.G., 2 V 8.

^Fonvieihle to the Pope, ca. March, 1819, A.D.G., 2 V 8.

"Fonvieihle to the Committee of Public Instruction, ca. December 13, 1793, A.N. F19 875.

^Latapy to the Pope, ca. July, 1808, A.D.G., 2 V 8.

73Speech by Latapy transcribed in the deliberation of the Club National of February 6, 1794, A.D.G., 12L23.

"•Statement of February 10, 1794, A.D.G., 4 L 284; municipal officers of Villenave to the district of Bordeaux, August 1, 1794, ibid.

henceforth he desired only the title, "republican sans-culotte"71* The curé of Sablons, Jean-Alexis Barbot, was even more explicit:

> A good citizen never balances his duties; he must always be the first to submit to the laws and to the will of the people who alone are sovereign. I am not unaware that Catholicism casts a shadow over the cult of Reason which alone is suitable to a man who wants to live happily in a free government. . . . Entirely convinced that to continue to exercise the profession of Catholic minister any longer would be on my part to oppose the cult of Reason and to attack the principles of the Revolution, and desiring as any good citizen to contribute to the success of my country, I abdicate my profession as a priest.76

For these men, and for most of the others who abdicated spontaneously, the decision to abjure the priesthood was motivated by the realization that their existence as ecclesiastics had become incompatible with their status as citizens dedicated to the First French Republic. They abdicated the priesthood because of their genuine, perhaps even idealistic, commitment to the Revolution and the political and religious transformation of the Year II.

The 34 priests who abdicated spontaneously differed noticeably from the other clergymen who abjured. They were younger men: in 1790 their average age was only 40 years compared to 47 years for all abdicating clergymen.77 Only 17 percent of these men were above 50 years of age in 1790 compared to 44 percent of the total abdicating clergy. Their pastoral experience also differed: only 59 percent of these priests were parish curés in the Year II compared to 79 percent of all clergymen affected by the movement. Of the other men in the group, there were six vicaires, one chaplain, one grand vicaire, and six who were not exercising any ecclesiastical function when they abdicated the priesthood. Almost 50 percent of these individuals entered the parish clergy after the Revolution began compared to less than 33 percent of all abdicating priests. Moreover, five of these men were ordained after 1790; they possibly did not have a strong commitment to the priesthood. Jacques Huquet, for example, was a doctor in 1789. He became a priest in 1792 and served as third vicaire at Saint-Pierre of Bordeaux until November 19, 1793, 'when he abdicated. Four days later, Huquet resumed his medical career.78 For him, the priesthood had been a short-lived ad-

7'Statement of November 27, 1793, cited in Bellemer, op. cit., p. 706.

"'Statement of March 26, 1794, A.M.B.,Fonds Gaillard, MS 372, dossier "prêtres constitutionnels."

"The age of 90 percent of all abdicating clergymen has been determined.

™Huquet to the district of Bordeaux, November 23, 1793.A.D.G., 12 L 24.

venture, a parenthesis in his life. Younger men without deep roots in the parish ministry could readily and easily abjure the priesthood and assume new identities. Indeed, 41 percent of them married compared to only 13 percent of all abdicating clergymen. They began new careers as schoolteachers, lawyers, merchants, farmers, newspaper editors, or bureaucrats, making the transition from religious to civilian life without difficulty. Only 17 percent of these men returned to the priesthood at some time before their deaths compared to 49 percent of all abdicating clergymen. Moreover, 24 of them obstinately refused, even as laymen, to be reconciled and to make peace with the Church they had once served. They remained in open revolt against the Church as they were content to live and to die without the sacraments.

Did these men and others abdicate the priesthood because they and their parishioners had already abandoned traditional Catholicism before 1789? Michel Vovelle argues that the clerical abdications were linked to a proto-de-Christianization that began long before the Revolution. He made this conclusion on the basis of his exhaustive quantitative study of collective religious mentality as expressed in wills passed in eighteenth-century Provence. In this source, he (and others, most notably Pierre Chaunu studying Paris), found a dramatic decline in religious references and an increasing detachment from traditional Catholic values and standards of behavior. The downward slide started about 1730 and accelerated rapidly after 1760. Vovelle argues that the clerical abjurations of the Year II revealed these profound changes.79 A preliminary analysis of slightly more than 2,100 wills written in the Old Regime diocese of Bordeaux examined at ten-year intervals beginning in 1710 and continuing until 1790 suggests the same broad transformation of religious mentality that Vovelle noted in Provence and Chaunu discovered in Paris.80 The number of individuals requesting requiem Masses in their wills declined from a high of 63 percent in 1730 to 51 percent in 1760 to a low of 30 percent in 1790. The actual number of Masses requested also decreased sharply. Moreover, the will itself and its purpose changed dramatically over the course of the century. In 1730, it was a religious document, with the testator invoking the Christ, the Virgin, and all the saints of

"Vovelle, Piété baroque; Pierre Chaunu, La mort à Paris, XVT, XVII', XVHT siècles (Paris, 1978).

80My research in series 3 E of the ADG. Of the 2109 wills studied, 564 emanate from the city of Bordeaux and the others come from 302 different localities. The wills were found in the minutes of 180 different notaries. The number of wills per decade varies from a low of 158 in 1720 to a high of 259 in 1780. The average number of wills for each decade is 234.

heaven, in order to save his soul. But by 1770, the will had become a far simpler and thoroughly secular document. The testator expunged the long religious invocation and replaced it with a terse comment that he was writing a will because he wanted to dispose of his property and other worldly goods.

Other evidence exists to suggest that the people of Bordeaux and the surrounding countryside underwent a profound change in religious attitudes and became increasingly detached from traditional forms of religious behavior during the Old Regime. In the city of Bordeaux churchgoing declined, and, in the last decades of the century, less than half the people performed their "Easter duties," the minimum sign of allegiance to the Catholic faith.81 An alert contemporary observed that, for midnight Mass on Christmas eve of 1788, "the churches are more and more deserted."82 Declines in church attendance and in the performance of the "Easter duty" also occurred in some of the small towns and villages beyond Bordeaux as more and more people spent Sundays at local markets or more frequently at local taverns.83 At the same time as the laity abandoned the Church for more secular pursuits, they sent fewer and fewer of their sons into the priesthood. The number of men entering the priesthood in 1780 was about half of what it had been in 1750 and half again of what it had been in 1730.84 In the last part of the century, there was an average of less than one new priest per year for every 1,000 inhabitants of the Diocese of Bordeaux, the lowest such ratio for the twenty-five dioceses studied by Timothy Tackett. Indeed, Tackett describes the Diocese of Bordeaux as a "veritable desert of recruitment."85

Clarke Garrett may well be correct in criticizing Vovelle's national approach to the abdicating clergy as premature. But this study of the abdicating priests of the Gironde supports Vovelle's general conclusions.

"Gabriel le Urns, Introduction à l'histoire de la pratique religieuse en France (2 vols.; Paris, 1942-1945), l, 97; idem, Etudes de sociologie religieuse (2 vols.;Paris, 1955-1956), I, 25-26; Fernand Boulard, An Introduction to Religious Sociology: Pioneer Work in France, trans. M.J.Jackson (London, I960), p. 30.

82Diary entry of Pierre Bernadau for December 24, 1788 cited in Michel Lhéritier, Les débuts de la Révolution à Bordeaux d'après les tablettes manuscrites de Pierre Bemadau (Paris, 1919), p. 42.

83Bernard Guilliemain, Le diocèse de Bordeaux (Paris, 1974), pp. 164-165; Raymond Darricau.'Etat religieux de Blayais et du Vitrezais (1675-1755)," Les cahiers du Vitrezais, numéro special (1975-1976), pp. 17-21; Bernard Peyrous,"La pratique religieuse dans le diocèse de Bordeaux au XLX' siècle (1838-1908),Mrercafes du Midi, 87 (1975), 445.

,4Tackett,"L' histoire sociale du clergé diocésain," p. 205.

""Ibid., p. 199, and table, p. 221.

To be sure, the vast majority of clergymen abjured out of fear and because of the direct pressure exerted on them by an outsider to their community. But local men also participated in the attack on the clergy, and, as Vovelle insists, their role in the movement should not be underestimated. They coerced their curé to abdicate the priesthood, pressuring him to conform to their standards and values. Some clergymen also abjured their vocation spontaneously. They abandoned the priesthood willingly, enthusiastically, and without regret. They abdicated because their status as priests became irreconcilable with their dedication to the principles of the Revolution and their new role as citizen republicans. Finally, the evidence suggests that the secularization of society and attitudes began early in and continued throughout the eighteenth century in Bordeaux and the surrounding countryside.lt supports Vovelle's argument that the clerical abdications of the Year II revealed these changes in religious mentality. The debate on the abdicating priests is just beginning, and future local studies of this subject should give greater attention to all the possible influences governing the clergy's decisions during the Year II; such research may yet provide additional support for Vovelle's conclusions.

MAINE, MASSACHUSETTS, AND THE MARISTS: AMERICAN CATHOLIC MISSIONARIES IN THE SOUTH PACIFIC

BY

Hugh Laracy*

There may be no "Grand Design" behind the unfolding and configuring of human affairs. Even so, the Pauline vision of "all things working together unto one" (Eph. 1:10; Rom. 8:28) remains relentlessly attractive, especially in retrospect. In order to understand the who? how? what? where? when? and why? of particular, local, and relatively obscure phenomena one may be driven to explore a heterogeneous set of circuitous linkages and to order them within a large and logically coherent context that seems to have been discovered rather than constructed. That is, one in which many disparate forces appear to have been harnessed in a singularly fortuitous way to produce and shape results that might accord with the intentions of planners and which a sympathetic providence might have engineered, but which could scarcely have been predicted. In this arrangement, hitherto undiscerned implications of diverse events may be discovered and occurrences widely separated by time and distance may be related as cause and effect. The indirectness of the connections need not dilute their potency. Their very unobtrusiveness may enhance the allure of enquiry by offering prospects of discovery

Such ruminations on the logistics of historical causality and on the seductions of hindsight arise in the present instance from a set of questions relating to Catholic missionary activity in the southwest Pacific: why is it that within the major denominations, with the notable excep-

*Dr. Laracy is an associate professor of history in the University of Auckland, New Zealand. Research for this paper was carried out while he was honored to hold a Fulbright Senior Fellowship in the United States of America in 1994. He is also grateful for the assistance of Fathers (S.M.) Ray Arsenault, Val Becker, Paul Chaisson, Gaston Lessard, and Mick O'Connor, and for that of Sisters (S.M. S.M.) Gloria Fournier and Aquin Maloney. A preliminary version of the paper was presented at the Australian and New Zealand American Studies Conference in Christchurch in February, 1996.

tion of the Lutheran mission to New Guinea, American missionaries have been numerous only among the Catholics?1 Why did many of these Americans have French surnames? Why did so many of them come from Maine or from Lawrence and other towns in northern Massachusetts? Why were they so numerous in the three decades following World War II? The answers to these and related questions require that the ramified causal mechanisms be placed within a setting that embraces the nineteenth and twentieth centuries and which extends well beyond America. Mercifully, it is one that also yields easily to the gravitational pull of narrative.

The most pertinent chronological starting point is 1836, with the official emergence in Lyon, France, of the Société de Marie. This was a company of priests and brothers usually known as the Pères Maristes or Marist Fathers. Helping to procure the Vatican's recognition of the Marists as a self-governing religious congregation was an undertaking by their founder that in addition to their other apostolic works they would also evangelize the islands of the western Pacific. By 1898, however, when they set up a separate province of Oceania, their responsibilities in that huge area had been confined to the Solomons, New Hebrides (since 1979 Vanuatu), New Caledonia, Wallis and Futuna, Fiji, Tonga, and Samoa, with another distinct province of New Zealand. Meanwhile, in 1861 the order had also spread from France, via England, to Ireland in order to recruit English-speaking priests for Irish migrants in New Zealand, and in 1863 to the United States, to minister to settlers of mainly French ancestry in Louisiana.2

The Marists' entry into the United States accorded with what was to be one of the defining features of American Catholicism for the next half-century. During that time the United States, far from having a Catholic missionary outreach, was itself a major absorber of missionary efforts. It was a place in which apostles from the Old World, mostly French, strove to build the structure of the Church around the immi-

1H. Wagner and H. Reiser, The Lutheran Church in Papua New Guinea: The First Hundred Years, 1886-1986 (Adelaide, 1987), lists 215 American missionaries. I am grateful to Father Theo Aerts, M.S.C., for this reference.

2Hugh Laracy, "Les Pères Maristes and New Zealand: The Irish Connection," in R. P. Davies (ed.), Irish Australian Studies, Papers delivered at the Eighth Irish-Australian Conference, July 1995; John L. White and Mark Edwards (eds.), Nicholas A. Weber, The Society of Mary; Its Foundation and First American Mission (Washington, D.C., 1946); Ralph M. Wiltgen, The Founding of the Roman Catholic Church in Oceania, 1825-1850 (Canberra, 1979), pp. 117-121.

grant hordes who were flooding into the New World during that period. This domestic preoccupation was not so true, at least in certain notable cases, of some other denominations. Thus, at a time when the Marists were finding a small foothold in Louisiana (and when others of their confreres were struggling against an already predominant British Protestantism in the South Pacific), Congregational Protestants despatched by the American Board of Commissioners for Foreign Missions had been successfully at work in Hawaii since 1820 and in the Caroline Islands of Micronesia since 1852, and the Mormons had been in the Pacific since 1844.[3]

Meanwhile, what was to become a peculiarly fertile constituency for Marist activity and recruitment was emerging in the American Northeast. Its growth may conveniently be dated from 1842, when the Webster-Ashburton Treaty, in settling a boundary dispute between the United States and Britain, made the St. John River part of the dividing line between the United States and Canada. The French Catholic farmers of what thus became northern Maine were thereby turned into Americans. French-Acadians had settled the main town of the area, the future Van Buren, in 17914A more significant addition, though, to the Catholic population of the region began about 1870, when, with the expansion of industry—particularly textile manufacturing—in New England, thousands of French Canadians began moving southwards, seeking employment in the labor-hungry mills, brickyards, and factories. The main concentration of them was in the mill towns of the Merrimack valley—Lawrence, Methuen, Lowell, and others—of Massachusetts. The peak of this migration occurred between 1880 and 1900, with the national census of 1910 counting nearly one million people of French-Canadian origin. With them they brought a powerful determination to survive as a people by retaining their language and by adhering to their religion. As in Quebec since the English conquest of 1760, survivance was sought by maintaining their foi, langue et moeurs—and to considerable effect. In the mid-1 950s, according to John Tracy Ellis, the "French Canadians" of New England were the most sharply defined national group of Latin Rite Catholics in the United States. Among these people, with their preference for the ministrations of French

'Robert D. Craig and Frank P. King, Historical Dictionary of Oceania (Westport, Connecticut, 1981).

4Lionel F. Beaudoin, Afanffe of Blue: A History of the Northeast Province of the Society of Mary (Boston, 1974), pp. 107-109; Francis Durning, 7ibe Whole World Marist (Wellington, 1983), pp. 81-85.

clergy, the Marists found a warm welcome and a rich catchment for recruits.'

At the invitation of the Archbishop of Boston, John Williams, they began this new phase of activity by taking charge of St. Anne's parish in Lawrence, Massachusetts, in 1882. By 1924, when the American Marist province, which had been created in 1889, was divided into two provinces, the "French" one of Boston (which included Quebec) and the "English" one of Washington (based on people of Irish and German stock), the former had six establishments in Massachusetts, four in Maine, two in Rhode Island, and one in New York. That of Washington, covering a vastly greater area, had eighteen. The seminary, Marist College in Washington, D.C., served both provinces until 1939, when Boston opened one of its own at Framingham, Massachusetts.6 In 1929 the Boston Province had also begun to draw more directly on French Canadians by founding a secondary school at Sillery in Quebec. Further expansion followed there, too, and a distinct Canadian province was created in 1965.7

Slowly from 1879, and steadily from about 1900, the Marists attracted American members: by 1916 thirty had joined the Society.8 With a growing pool of recruits to draw on and given their order's particular commitment to the South Pacific, the Marists were in a position to take a notable part in the overseas missionary movement which was at that time belatedly stirring in American Catholicism. In 1889, on the centenary of the establishment of the American hierarchy, Bishop Herbert Vaughan of Salford, England, had pointedly urged the American bishops to promote missions, yet by 1907 the number of American Catholics engaged in foreign mission work had reached only fourteen. By 1958, in contrast, they would number over six thousand.9

'Beaudoin, op. cit., pp. 86-90, 100, 129, 138, 152, 160-161, 168, 173; Jay P. Dolan, The American Catholic Experience: A History from Colonial Times to the Present (New York, 1985), pp. 133-134, 153-154, 178-180; John Tracy Ellis, American Catholicism (New York, 1965), p. 123.

'Beaudoin, op. cit., pp. 2-19, 87-90, 226-231; John L. White,^ History of the Marist Province of Washington (1924-1947) (Washington, D.C., 1949), pp. 2-16.

7Paul-Émile Vachon, Pour la Suite de Marie: les Pères Maristes au Québec, 1929-1979 (Sillery, 1979); Beaudoin, op. cit., pp. 3 16-324; Durning, op. cit. ,pp. 95-99. In the list of missionaries appended to this paper [C] indicates Canadian-born.

"Biographical and Statistical Data Concerning Marists in America (Washington, DC, 1947); Index S.M. (Lyon/Rome, semi-annually, 1878-1914); John Whynch, Marists of the Past: Northeast Province, USA, 1881-1986 (Boston, 1986).

'Ellis, op. cit., pp. 123-124; Dolan, op. cit., p. 393; Glenn D. Kittler, The Maryknoll Fathers (New York, 1963), pp. 32-37. As a matter of interest, it may be noted that the growth

Meanwhile, the interest in missions within the Protestant churches worldwide had become intense, especially through the efforts, since the 1880's, of the American Methodist J. R. Mott with his slogan "The Evangelization of the World in this Generation." The implications of this Protestant enthusiasm, which was especially directed at China and which culminated in the World Missionary Conference held in Edinburgh in 1910, were not lost on Catholics.[10] Protestant pacemaking helped reinvigorate Catholic missionary activity. The response was gradual but it steadily gathered momentum. At the top level it was most clearly expressed in the form of two papal encyclicals, Maximum Mud (Benedict XV) in 1919 and Rerum Ecclesiae (Pius XI) in 1926, calling for a stronger missionary effort, and by the action of Pope Pius XI in 1922 of bringing the principal mission fund-raising organization within the Church, the Work for the Propagation of the Faith, directly under Vatican control. The effect of these interventions was to mobilize and co-ordinate Catholic mission resources and energies world-wide, and to require every diocese to participate formally in promoting the cause of missions.[11]

The revival, actually, was already under way. In 1911, for instance, the American Society for Foreign Missions, popularly known as Maryknoll, was founded in New York. In 1918 its four pioneer priests were despatched to China.[12] In December of the previous year a Mission Sodality was started at the Marist seminary in Washington, thereby prompting the Marist superior for Oceania to write, rejoicing that the work begun by the French would be carried on by other laborers:

> I am glad to see the awakening of the Apostolic spirit in our young American Brothers. It has often been said that the missions in Oceania are the jewel of the Society of Mary, and one of its glories . . . the war has cruelly

of the American Catholic missionary movement closely parallels that of the modern Irish one. The Maynooth Mission to China was established in \916. Herder Correspondence, IV (July-August, 1967), 204-213. Concomitant developments, which rapidly spread internationally, were the founding in 1916 by an Italian priest named Paul Manna of The Missionary Union of the Clergy, and the founding in Ireland in 1918 of Saint Columban's Missionary Society for the evangelization of China.

[10] Stephen Neill, A History of Christian Missions (Harmondsworth, 1964), pp. 393-396. See also Angelyn Dries, O.S.F., The Missionary Movement in American Catholic History ("American Society of Missiology Series," No. 26 [Maryknoll, New York, 1998]), p. 107.

[11] The Popes and the Missions: Four Encyclical Letters (London, 1957); Pontifical Missionary Works: Vade Mecum (Rome, 1964).

[12] Kittler, op. cit., pp. 84, 89, 107-110.

> thinned the ranks of our French students, and for many years to come our Society will be unable to send new recruits to the missions. I wonder if you have been struck by the fact that France supplies at least two thirds of the total number of Catholic missionaries![13]

He did not have long to wait. Already two French Marists who had done part of their studies in America, Eugene Cherdel and Yves Helliot, and one who had worked there, Antonin Moussey, had gone to the Pacific. Then in 1919 the first American-born Marist was appointed to the missions. This was Elie Bergeron from Lawrence, Massachusetts. Already eight years ordained, he was sent to Tonga. Between then and 1943 another twenty-eight American Marists were despatched to Oceania, where they were particularly valued by their predominantly French confrères for their familiarity with English.[14] The greatest concentration of them, eleven, was in Bougainville, where Thomas Wade from Providence, Rhode Island, who had gone there in 1922, was made bishop in 1930. By the 1970s America had supplied four Marist bishops to the Pacific and three provincial superiors to Oceania, as well as two superiors general to the congregation itself. The bishops were Thomas Wade (North Solomons 1930-1960), Leo Lemay (North Solomons 1960-1974), George Pearce (Samoa 1956-1967 and Fiji 1967-1976), and Francis Lambert (Vanuatu 1977-1997); the provincials were Elie Bergeron (1939-1948), Leo Lemay (1954-1960), and Francis Lambert (1971-1977); and the generals were Alcime Cyr (1947-1961) and Joseph Buckley (1961-1967)." One notably influential source of interest in Marist missions was a book, Blazing the Trail, which was published with Wade's encouragement in Australia and America in 1935 and reprinted in America in 1950. Consisting of letters written by Emmet McHardy, a young New Zealand Marist who had died in 1933 after spending only three years on Bougainville, it was widely read and is reliably credited with having inspired numerous people (at least one

"Chevreuil to "Dear Brother," May 26, 1919, Correspondence with Missionaries, Marist Fathers Washington Province Archives. On the internationalization of the Catholic missionary effort after World War 1 see, Bernard de Vaulx, Histoire des Missions Catholiques Françaises (Paris, 1951), pp. 523-540.

"Biographical and Statistical Data, pp. 80-82; Lynch, op. cit., p. 103; Nicholas A. Weber, Brooks Mansion (Washington, D.C., I960), pp. 5-6; Weber, Dodon (Washington, D.C., 1959), p. 27; Weber, The Marist College of Brookland, D.C.: Its First Twenty-Five Years, 1900-1925 (Washington, D.C., 1962), pp. 16-17.

"In Memoriam: Societas Mariae Provincia Oceania (Suva, 1990); John W Lynch, His Name Was Alcime (Boston, 1976y, Marist Missions, vol. 19, no. 4, pp. 21-22; Nicholas A. Weber (ed.), A BriefBiographical Dictionary of the Marist Hierarchy (3 vols.; Washington, D.C., 1953, 1957, 1962).

hundred) to adopt religious vocations. It also generated considerable financial support for the missions.16

While the Society of Mary was growing steadily in America in the years before World War II, so too and at a more spectacular rate, was a related and specifically missionary organization of women. This was the Missionary Sisters of the Society of Mary (SMSM), which grew out of an auxiliary operation begun in France in 1845 to assist Marist missionaries in the Pacific. In 1932 it was canonically recognized as an independent religious congregation. It developed particularly strongly in New England. The first American recruit, Mary Decker, from Boston and of German-Irish parentage, entered the novitiate of the Third Order Regular of Mary (predecessor of the SMSM) at St. Foy near Lyon in 1919· In 1920 three other young women followed her. One of them, Marie Anna Leclerq, born in Canada in 1900 and raised in Brunswick, Maine, had her missionary interest kindled after being asked by a French-born Marist priest named Henri de la Chapelle to distribute copies of the journal Annales de la Propagation de la Foi to subscribers in the parish. Her interest was matched by that of her friend Florida La Chance. The third of the group, Emma Bennett from Cambridge, Massachusetts, had planned to join the Maryknoll Sisters in New York, but changed her mind when her Marist parish priest, Adolphe Rabel, also French and the person who would later initiate the Marist move into Canada, said to her, "Don't you know that the Marists have missionary sisters too?", and forthwith put her in touch with the two mill girls from Brunswick.17

To accommodate other American aspirants for the Oceania missions, the sisters in 1922 opened a house beside the Marists' church, commonly known as the "French church," of Our Lady of Victories in Boston. A sojourn there was followed by two years at the novitiate in France, that is, until 1929, when a novitiate was founded at Bedford, Massachusetts. By 1930 there were already thirty-two professed Americans in the order, twenty-eight of whom were working in Oceania. Four years later, when Mary Decker, professed in religion as Sister Mary Rose

,6Emmet McHardy (ed. Eileen Duggan), Blazing the Trail in the Solomons (Sydney, 1935) and Blazing the Trail (Providence, Rhode Island, 1935); Francis Durning, Here I Am, A Failure: Emmet C. McHardy S.M., Marist Missionary Priest in the Pacific (Auckland, 1985); Noel Delaney/'Emmet Charles McHardy SM; a 1990 Presentation," Martó Messenger, December, 1990, pp. 24-39; February, 1991, pp. 2-10; March, 1991, pp. 10-16.

"Marie Cécile de Mijolla, Origins in Oceania: Missionary Sisters of the Society of Mary, 1845-1931 (Rome, 1984), pp. 37-43, 248, 271; Clare O'Brien, To Celebrate My Son: A History of the Marist Missionary Sisters (Sydney, 1989), pp. 51, 53-54; Paulita [Schneller], A Jill of All Trades: The Life and Experiences of Sr Mary Leclerc, smsm (Waltham, Massachusetts, 1984), pp. 3-5.

of Lima, and recently chosen as the first Mother General of the SMSM, was making an extended visit to Oceania, a house of the order was also opened in Wellington, New Zealand. This was to serve both as a local recruiting point and as a base for the sisters working in the Islands missions. Similar objectives contributed also to the opening of a house in Australia, a hospital at Killara in Sydney, in 1945 under the direction of Mary Rose Decker herself. She had retired from her higher office in 1939.[8]

Besides the apostolic instincts of the community from which it derived, the subsequent growth of the SMSM in America owed much to the encouragement it received from Richard Cushing. Assistant Mission Promoter for the Archdiocese of Boston from 1922 and director from 1928, Cushing was a dynamic priest with a flair for organization and publicity and the backing of a generous and influential Irish Catholic community. Named auxiliary bishop in 1939, archbishop in 1944, and cardinal in 1958, he also had close ties to the Kennedy family. On coming to Boston in 1920 and being favored by Cushing, the SMSM were clearly in the right place at the right time for their order to prosper. They, in turn, assisted him by providing a sharp local focus for his work on behalf of missions, giving it a heightened sense of immediacy and relevance. Such was the regard in which he was widely held that Cushing was described by the Marist Mission News of August, 1945, as "the stellar patron of mission work throughout the world." More parochially, he had assisted the SMSM to acquire the convent at Bedford in 1929, had in 1936 founded a lay auxiliary (the "Alofa Malia Club"), a more specialized version of his broadly focussed Sen Fu mission club, to raise money for them, had edited their newsletter, titled Alofa Malia, and had written pamphlets extolling their work in the Islands, particularly that with the lepers at Makogai in Fiji. The Marist sisters had staffed the hospital there from its beginning in 1911[9] In 1947 there were sixteen

"Charles F. Decker (ed.), Saving the Solomons: From the Diary Account of Rev. Mother Mary Rose, smsm (Bedford, Massachusetts, 1948); O'Brien, op. cit., pp. 104, 106-110; Paulita Schneller, Half-Pint on Guadalcanal (Waltham, Massachusetts, 1993), pp. 13-14, 19-21.

^Marist Mission News, vol. 1, no. 1 (August-September, 1945); Francis Beauchesne Thornton, Our American Princes: The Story of the Seventeen American Cardinals (New York, 1963), pp. 234-249; Mary Stella, Makogai, Image of Hope: A Brief History of the Care of Leprosy Patients in Fiji (Christchurch, 1978). Cushing's writings include: In the Service of the Lepers: A Brief Outline of the Work of the Missionary Sisters of the Society of Mary among the Lepers of the Isle of Makogai, Fiji Islands (Boston, 1940); Partners in a Great Mission of Mercy (Boston, n.d.~);The Missions in War and Peace (Boston, n.d.); Where Is Father Hennessy? (Boston, 1943);^4wer2'ca, Hope of the Missions (Boston, n.d.).

nuns there, six of whom were American.20 Such was Cushing's regard for the SMSM that in 1947 he gave them a fine property and convent at Framingham to mark their twenty-five years in the Boston diocese. They, in turn, lauded him as their "Father."21 That affection, however, became somewhat diluted when in 1962, his interest in the Pacific having been overshadowed by a concern for Latin America, he prevailed upon them to return the Framingham establishment to the diocese, together with another property they occupied at Lowell, and to relocate on a new site in the town of Waltham.

The greatest boost to Marist missionary endeavors was to come from their being associated with World War II, where some of the heaviest American involvements occurred in the Solomon Islands, and from where the Marists had declined to be evacuated.22 That conflict brought hitherto obscure places into prominence and in so doing attracted much inspirational publicity and concern for those who lived and worked there. The elevating and "improving" task of missionaries and the privations they endured for the sake of their vocation were widely and admiringly reported on. So, too, was their wartime experience and conduct: their patriotism, courage behind Japanese lines, suffering—and sometimes death—at the hands of the Japanese. There were numerous dramatic occurrences, heroic and harrowing; for instance, early in 1943 American submarines rescued nuns from Bougainville; later that year, after the American landing at Torokina, John Conley from Philadelphia was beheaded at Kieta; and in 1944 Joseph Redman from Savannah, Georgia, was killed in a bombing raid on Ramale prison camp near Rabaul. Home town newspapers as well as the church press gave extensive coverage to such matters. A memorial tablet, blessed by Cushing, was installed in Methuen, Massachusetts, honoring Arthur Duhamel, a priest bayonneted by Japanese soldiers on Guadalcanal in 1942 on suspicion of having passed information to the American forces. Tableaux portraying the "martyrdom" of him and of other Marists on Guadalcanal were displayed at mission exhibitions. In 1946 Cushing founded the Father James Hennessy Men's Club, a sodality named after a diocesan priest from Boston who had volunteered to help the Marists on Bougainville and who was lost in the sinking of the Montevideo

^Marist Mission News, vol. 3, no. 5 (October-November, 1947).

2'Marist Mission News, vol. 3, no. 1 (1947); Marist Missions, vol. 15, no. 2 (March-April, 1959), pp. 32-36.

"Hugh Laracy, Marists and Melanesians: A History of Catholic Missions in the Solomon Islands (Canberra and Honolulu, 1976), pp. 110-117; Hugh Laracy, "Missionaries and the European Evacuation of the Solomons," ??: A Journal of Solomon Islands Studies, No. 4, pp. 27-36.

Maru after being captured by the Japanese in 1942. And in 1952, in a poignant allusion to the five Catholic Sullivan brothers, who were drowned when the U.S.S. Juneau was torpedoed in the Solomons in 1943, the Alofa Malia Club assembled five well-known citizens named Sullivan, including the television celebrity Ed Sullivan, on stage at a well-patronized fund-raising gathering.23 In 1948 a new edition of Mother Rose Decker's account of her 1934-1936 journey, originally issued in 1942 as A Mission Tour of the Southwest Pacific, was published containing material on the 'war, and with a more topical title, Saving the Solomons. Cushing wrote the foreword for each edition. In the second of them he spoke of the $100,000 fund that he had raised in the archdiocese to help rebuild the missions of the Solomons, those missions that "in many ways . . . seemed to belong to Boston," and also addressed a wider public by praising "the joyous generosity of the American giver" and by expressing the hope that the book would "find a ready audience among those who have fought in the Solomons and among their relatives and friends." The frontispiece was a U.S. Navy photograph of Bishop Wade and Admiral Nimitz, and the book was dedicated:

To the missionaries

and

To the Members of the Armed Forces

Who Gave Their Lives in Performance

of Their Respective Duties during the

Recent War in the South Pacific

That Catholicism was to be identified unequivocally with patriotism, should anyone be inclined to doubt it—and there was a strong tradition in American opinion that did—was also implicit in Wade's resounding, if unproven, claim in 1947 that

""Hennessy," "Lebel," and "Lamarre" files, Marist Provincial Archives, Boston and Washington; Beaudoin, op. cit., p. 225; Marist Mission News, vol. 2, no. 2 and 3 (1946); vol. 3, no. 1 and 3 (1947), vol. 4, no. 4 and 5 (1948); Ator¿sfM¿s«orcs, vol. 8, no. 2 (1952); Theo Aerts (ed.), The Martyrs of Papua New Guinea: 333 Missionary Lives Lost during World War II (Port Moresby, 1994), pp. 40-41, 47, 120-123. For a summary account of the background to many of these events, see Hugh Laracy, "World War II," in K. R. Howe et al. (eds.), Tides of History: The Pacific Islands in the Twentieth Century (Sydney and Honolulu, 1994), pp. 149-169.

> One in five of the living in . . . America is a Catholic; one in three of those who sleep in the war graves of the Pacific is of our Faith.24

The war thus provided both a source of religious inspiration to Catholics and an affirmation of their identity as Americans.

Clearly, the Marists and their supporters were adept at public relations. Moreover, it is likely that their success in this regard was fortuitously enhanced by a broad tendency among Hollywood filmmakers, presumably for good commercial reasons, to sentimentalize, if not to glorify, Catholic clergy and nuns (as they were also accustomed to do with things Irish!). A bitter comment about this bias, which he saw as perverse, was made by a former Baptist chaplain with the U.S. Navy.

> Without a single exception, every newsreel of religion on the firing line or back home (such as on invasion day) featured a Roman Catholic Chaplain or a Roman Catholic Church. I have seen practically every newsreel, and I saw not one exception. There were twice as many Protestant Chaplains in the Services as Roman Catholic, and every Protestant Chaplain I met was disgusted with this astounding disregard of fairness. But we could not blame our Roman Catholic fellow-chaplains, many of whom agreed that it was unfair. The blame lay in the production offices of Hollywood. The least they could do would be to feature a Protestant service or chapel as often as any other kind. But the propaganda continues in its utterly un-American way.25

That this might have been due to some quality of cinematographic appeal, perhaps deriving from a beguiling hint of quaintness and "foreignness," combined with the notion of America as an ethnic "melting-pot"—as an extensive corpus of Hollywood productions suggests—rather than to sectarianism, does not seem to have occurred to him.26

"Marist Mission News, vol. 3, no. 2 (1947). E. E. Y Hales, The Catholic Church in the Modern World: A Survey from the French Revolution to the Present (New York, I960), pp. 254-258.

"). Edwin Orr, / Saw No Tears (London, 1948), p. 67.

"Hollywood's residual interest in things Catholic and Irish, often in combination, is well attested://« Family Tree (1935), The Informer (1935), The Irish in Us (\955),Angels with Dirty Faces (1938), Gateway (1938), Boy's Town (1938), Full Confession (1939), Gone with the Wind (1939), Knute Rockne, All American (1940), Little Nellie Kelly (1940), Gentleman Jim (1942), The Song of Bernadette (1943), Keys of the Kingdom (1944), Going My Way (1944), The Sullivans (1944), The Bells ofSt.Mary's (1945),Fighting Father Dunne (1948), The Luck of the Irish (1948), Thunder on the Hill (1951), The Quiet Man (1952), / Confess (1953), On the Waterfront (1954), Heaven Knows Mr. Allison (1957), The Proud and Profane (1956), The Nun's Story (1959), The Singer not the Song (I960), The Hoodlum Priest (1961), The Nun and the Sergeant (1962), The Cardinal (1963), Lilies of the Field (1963), The Sound ofMusic (1965).

Even without the benefit of any kind of religious propaganda, nevertheless, the war did engender for many people—and, of course, not just Catholics—a reconsideration of the meaning of life and of the ordering of society which would have profound religious effects. The Vicechancellor of the Diocese of Brooklyn predicted something of this in April, 1943, to the superior of the Marist seminary in Washington, D.C.:

> Certainly Almighty-God has utilized the war to throw the search light of worldly fame on the decades of unselfish and sacrificing labors on the part of the Society of Mary in the enervating mission scene of the South Seas. Everyone talks in terms of the loudest praise of the magnificent work which your confreres have done—I venture to predict that after this war a wave of mission enthusiasm such as the world has never known will sweep the country, for the men returning from the far-flung corners of the globe will be mission-minded and will have witnessed with their own eyes the tremendous accomplishments of the missionaries for Christ. And I would go further and say that it is not at all unlikely that many of the younger men will receive mission vocations and return to their former battle fields armed with the crucifix![27]

Archbishop Cushing later developed that argument. In October, 1945, he put it in terms of the battle of the sexes. Commenting on "the large number of vocations for the priesthood coming out of the Armed Forces, and the comparative scarcity of vocations from the Women's auxiliary Forces!" he observed:

> Men, in the midst of the horrors of war, have had brought home to them the great work of the missionaries. Leaving now their country's service, they have heard the Call to a HIGHER SERVICE, and, generously, they are answering that Call. What about the women? Are WE right in believing that women are just as generous as men . . . perhaps more so? May we expect that, for the young women laying aside their Service uniforms, or for those countless others coming from behind the production lines, and for the thousands of Catholic sweet-girl graduates, this God-given V-Day could also mean VOCATION DAY . . . vocations for the MARIST MISSIONS in Southern Seas?[28]

Shortly afterwards, in rhetoric reminiscent of the Puritan colonist John Winthrops seminal vision of I63O of"a Citty upon a hill [with] the eies of all people . . . uppon us," he linked religion and patriotism to point to a missionary responsibility his audience had as Americans:

27J. H. Griffiths to D. C. O'Meara, April 1, 1943, M. McMahon file, Correspondence with Missionaries, Marist Provincial Archives, Washington, D.C. For similar opinions see Henry R Van Dusen, They Found the Church There: The Armed Forces Discover Christian Missions in the Pacific (London, 1945).

^Marist Mission News, vol. l,no. 1 (August-September, 1945).

> God has called America. We are the arsenal of the missions, the hope of the missions, the training ground of future missionaries. Please God we will not fail![29]

Similarly, in 1945, in a booklet distributed nationwide, Charles Decker, a Marist priest and brother of Mother Rose of the SMSM, wrote:

> To achieve victory in World War II, we of America built up and organized what Britain's Prime Minister called the greatest fighting force in the world. May we not confidently expect that in this hour, when the missions urgently need volunteers, the number of recruits will be such that the Catholic Church in America will have the greatest missionary army in the world?[30]

Such appeals were not wasted. Two years later, in 1947, in a guest editorial in Marist Mission News, the Propagation of the Faith director for the Archdiocese of Detroit was able to address the topic of "this mission interest that is becoming characteristic of our Catholic life."[31] At the same time, following their newly raised flag, American Jesuits, Capuchins, and Maryknoll Sisters were in the process of replacing Spaniards in the Catholic missions of American-occupied Micronesia, but that story has been told elsewhere.[32]

The contributions made by Americans to the growth of the Catholic Church in the islands of the Pacific served by the Marists have been immense and diverse. In numbers alone they have been outstandingly important. Although the missionary imperative was also felt by Marists in other countries—England, Ireland, Holland, Australia, New Zealand, Germany, Italy—as French numbers declined from the 1920's, America became the most prolific of the new recruiting grounds for the province of Oceania that opened up as the order expanded internationally. In the face of the pressures for localization that grew apace after World War II, they were a major factor in enabling the Catholic Church to develop its ministries and structures according to its own traditions and standards, and at a slow, controlled pace that required a large expatriate staff.

2,Marist Mission News, vol 1, no. 2 (October-November, 1945); J. A. Leo Lemay (ed.), An Early American Reader (Washington, DC, 1988), p. 23-

"|Charles E Decker, Modern Missions in Oceania (New York, [1945]), pp. 27-28; Marist Mission News, vol. 1,no. 2 (October-November, 1945).

"Marist Mission News, vol. 3, no. 3 (June-July, 1947).

"Francis X. Hezel, The Catholic Church in Micronesia: Historical Essays on the Catholic Church in the Caroline-Marshall Islands (Chicago, 1991), passim. Similarly, after World War II the vicariate of New Ireland in Papua New Guinea was transferred to the American province of the Missionaries of the Sacred Heart (M.S.C.). Personal communication from Father Theo Aerts, M.S.C.

(That is, until the 1970's, when, in the aftermath of the Vatican Council, and at a time when the supply of missionaries from all sources was drying up, the transition from foreign mission to local church was optimistically accelerated.) With its insistence on clerical celibacy and its requirement of a high level of education for admission to the priesthood the Catholic Church was less adaptable than the Protestant denominations which, with their less stringent requirements for ministry, could more readily "localize" their operations.33

In the three years 1946, 1947, and 1948, forty-two American SMSMs were sent to join the eighty-three American nuns who had been despatched to the Pacific before the war. The rate duly slowed down but still remained steady during the 1950s and into the mid-1960's. Another forty-five were sent out between 1949 and the last departure in 1974. By then there had been eighty-seven postwar appointments, and the total American SMSM commitment to Oceania had reached 170.34 Marist Fathers' figures are lower, but conform to a similar pattern: in the decade immediately after the war mission recruits were numerous; then there was a gradual drying up in the 1960's. By 1981 there had been fifty-seven postwar appointments, bringing the total contribution overall to eighty-six. The combined total for both orders since 1919 thus comes to 256. To that, in order to reach a final figure of 297 for the American missionaries who worked in the Marist Pacific, should be added Father Hennessy and another forty nuns. These latter were members of the Congregation of St. Joseph of Orange, California, which, through contacts with the Marists who ran the French parish in San Francisco, helped staff the North Solomons mission from 1940 to 1991."

In material ways, too, America became increasingly important to the Marist missions after World War II. Signs of innovative and generous contributions and of a broader vision of the missionary task, however, began to emerge from that quarter in the 1930's. For instance, in 1931 the recently consecrated Thomas Wade produced a film titled Saints and Savages to promote interest in his North Solomons mission.36 His

"Charles W Forman, The Island Churches of the South Pacific: Emergence in the Twentieth Century (Maryknoll, New York, 1982), pp. 175-177.

HMarist Mission News, vol, 2, no. 4 (June-July, 1946); vol. 3, no. 1 (1947); vol. 5, no. 1 (1949). Information received from Sister M. Acquin, S.M.S.M., Auckland.

KIndex SM (semi-annual); Michael J. Larkin, Marist Foundations in the Western USA, 1882-1981 (San Francisco, 1981), p. 6; personal communication from Sister Annette Bachand, C.S.J., Orange.

36Copy in Marist Fathers Provincial Archives, Wellington, New Zealand.

example was followed later in the decade by Arsène Laplante from Van Buren, Maine, who produced two films for distribution through Marist and Propagation of the Faith networks illustrating his work in Fiji: Bemana (1938) and Donato (1940).[37] The temporal well-being of their parishioners was also an American concern. Soon after arriving in the Solomons in 1931, Albert Lebel issued an appeal to his supporters in America for funds to buy food for his school pupils:

> RICE THE PRICE OF SOULS!
>
> Friends: Will an appeal in favor of my children in the Savage South Solomons receive only reading attention from you? Am I to be disappointed if I plead in God's name? I plead with all a missionary's love for these poor children . . . for their sake and for God's sake. I feel confident that you will consider kindly and lovingly this new demand on your generosity.
>
> Two schools with 125 children each; one of boys, one of girls.
> A boy needs three bags of rice to keep him one year at school.
> One bag of rice (lOOlbs) costs me about five dollars.
> Who will give five dollars for a bag of rice?
> Who will feed one boy or girl for a year and therefore send fifteen dollars?
> Have pity on your missionary's distress—help him if you can.
> All gifts can be sent to me directly by check in American money.
> Every gift shall be duly acknowledged by me personally.
>
> Rev. Albert Lebel, S.M.
> Vísale,
> Guadalcanal,
> British Solomon Islands.'"

The Americans also tended to bring a more informal and ostensibly "worldly" style to their ministry. Thus, Lebel introduced the Boy Scouts movement to the Solomons and called a small launch his friends had given him Scout, instead of naming it after a saint. In doing so, he offended the extravagantly pious sensibilities of one of his European confrères who had long been obsessed by what he saw as the threat of américanisme to the Society of Mary. This the complainant, R.J. Pavese, described as:

> that worldly spirit, that love of well-being, of the bourgeois life, of noise, of fame, that "bluff," that sensualisme, that concern for appearances which

[37] "In Memoriam; Lynch, Marists of the Past. Copies of these films are held in the Marist Fathers Boston Province archives at Marist College, Framingham, Massachusetts.

[38] "Copy of leaflet in writer's possession.

> reigns in some degree throughout the world, but especially in the United States.39

Joseph Delhi in Samoa was more fortunate. He earned nothing but credit for the Catholic Club that he founded in Apia in 1921 and which opened handsome, well-equipped club-rooms in 1926. Despite its name, it was open to everyone regardless of religion. In the words of Delhi's biographer, his old friend Edward Tremblay, who was the author, also, of several popular books on Tonga, "the community life of Apia came to center around the Catholic Club."

> Everything took place there: concerts, games, lectures, plays, bazaars, social functions, Communion breakfasts, meetings of the Boy Scouts and other parish and civic groups, and catechism classes. When tourist ships nosed into Apia's sun-drenched harbor, the Catholic Club was the center of the town's warm hospitality. . . . [By 1931] the club library contained more than three thousand books, classified and catalogued, and enjoyed a large and growing list of eager readers.40

Deihl died in 1948 but the Catholic Club endured until the mid-1960's, when it was superseded by other venues of social activity and entertainment. Meanwhile, through most of the province of Oceania, American Marists -were enthusiastic participants in the process whereby their pastoral role was being redefined and extended to include that concern for the economic and social conditions of their parishioners which was coming to be known as "development." Since the postwar appointees tended to have higher academic qualifications than their predecessors, as well as some secular professional training, they were well equipped to help improve the quality of traditional mission works such as education and medical care. They were assisted in this by being able, through friends and family and church organizations, to draw support from the burgeoning United States economy. In a couple of cases where the local authorities would allow it, namely, Tonga and the then British Solomon Islands Protectorate, they also obtained

"Quoted in Laracy, Afam£s and Melanesians, p. 101.

"Edward A. Tremblay, God's Redhead: A Life Sketch of Father Joseph Roch Deihl, SM (1895-1948) (Honolulu, 1964), p. 59. Other accounts of American Marists who worked in Samoa are: John W Lynch, Island Adventure ([Rome], 1977), about Louis Beauchemin; M. Consolata, Samoa with Love: Reminiscences of Forty-Five Years of Marist Missionary Service (Waltham, Massachusetts, 1991). Other books by Tremblay are: Under the Southern Cross in Tonga-Tabu (Melbourne, 1929); When You Go to Tonga (Derby, New York, 1954); Au pays de la reine de Tonga (Montreal, 1955); Rendez-vous à Tonga (Lyon, 1962).

large supplies of cereal and edible oil from America to help feed school children in those countries during the 1960's.41

Nowhere, however, were American (and other) Marist efforts to improve the material quality of people's lives comparable in kind or in scale to those in the North Solomons. That there was a need for such efforts was dramatically shown in two incidents in which people resentful and frustrated at their lack of prosperity turned against the most accessible form of colonial authority that they recognized, namely, the Catholic mission. In 1961 angry villagers on the northwest coast of Bougainville forced Roland Dionne to flee and destroyed his mission station at Kuraio. Then, in 1962, on the island of Buka, hitherto the most solidly Catholic district of the vicariate, most of the Catholics abandoned the mission and joined the Hahalis Welfare Society, in a bid to find economic, religious, and political autonomy. Prompted by this rebellion, Paul Demers of Lemanmanu parish on north Buka formed the Haku Development Society. This was a co-operative timbermilling venture, open to Methodists as well as Catholics, which aimed at providing European-style houses for its members. The other priests on Buka quickly followed Deniers' example and organized similar co-operatives.

On Bougainville, too, the missionaries became developers, on an even larger scale. Since indigenous coconut plantations were less extensive there than on Buka and problems of communication greater, the infrastructure for a cash economy had first to be constructed. Projects tended, therefore, to be more ambitious, more dependent on aid from international development agencies and to require a greater degree of missionary direction. They extended to road-building, land-clearing, making coconut plantations and planting coffee, and resettling mountain people in new villages nearer the coast. They employed bulldozers, sawmills, and Mercedes-Benz UNIMOG truck/tractors.42

Meanwhile, from the late 1940's the North Solomons mission had also been building extensive, well-equipped, and professionally staffed systems of schools and hospitals. Its commitment to procuring the temporal well-being of the islanders through all of these works was, therefore, already well attested when in the mid-1960's, with the encouragement of the government but to the displeasure of the local people, who saw it as damaging to their land and customs, large-scale

"What's New: Marist Missions, vol. 2, no. 2 (1968); Laracy. Afaráis and Melanesians, p. 134.

"Laracy, Marists and Melanesians, pp. 135-143; John Ryan, The Hot Land: Focus on New Guinea (Sydney, 1970), pp. 315-325.

copper-mining operations began in central Bougainville, directed by Conzinc Riotinto Australia (CRA). This was further demonstrated after a meeting at Tunuru Catholic mission, near Kieta, in August, 1966, when disgruntled landowners protested both against mining depredations and the legal regulation which denied owners an entitlement to receive royalties. By the principle of eminent domain mineral deposits were assumed to belong to the government. The Catholic missionaries strongly supported the protesters, describing the Mining Ordinance as "unsuitable and as contravening native land custom and traditions." On its side the Administration, which was determined that the project should proceed, accused the mission of "interfering" and contended that this was due to its being dominated by Americans who did not understand the legal issues involved.43

Such criticisms were severely inadequate. They disregard, for instance, the fact that one of the most outspoken critics of the Administration, Wally Fingleton, was an Australian Marist.44 More importantly, as Bishop Lemay told the Administrator, Sir Donald Cleland, in August, 1966—and as was proved by the war of secession that broke out in 1988—they took insufficient account of the villagers' sensibilities. Regretting his need to do so, Lemay expressed his views at length in a letter which surveyed various local issues and their implications, and at the same time illustrated the classic tension between the agents of formally constituted authority and those responsive to an alternative imperative. In what was at once a report as well as a sadly prescient declaration, he argued that the mission was obliged to support the people because they were being treated unjustly, and that a change of policy was needed in order to avoid conflict.45 Tragically, the warning proved to be justified two decades later. The Catholic Church and all else that pertained to a safe, prosperous, and settled way of life on Bougainville were devastated in a war of secession, which continues yet.

By the 1990s the number of American—like that of other expatriate—Marists in Bougainville, and elsewhere in the Pacific, was shrinking

"Catholic Mission, press release, September 23, 1966, copy in writer's possession; Douglas Oliver, Black Islanders: A Personal Perspective of Bougainville, 1937-1991 (Melbourne, 1991), p. 133.

"W Fingleton, "A Chronicle of Just Grievances," New Guinea and Australia, the Pacific and South-East Asia, vol. 5, no. 2, pp. 13-20.

"Lemay to Cleland, August 16, 1966, copy of letter in writer's possession. Original destroyed in Bougainville war. This letter warrants being quoted in extenso, and is reproduced in Appendix I. For an interview with Father Robert Wiley, see Link, no. 23 (November-December, 1991). Link is published by the Solomon Islands Development Trust, Honiara.

rapidly. Nevertheless, the commitment to the material well-being of the Church there and that of the Islands peoples which the missionaries had helped engender among their supporters "back home" was still strong. From I960 until his death in 1995 Boston-based Paul Chaisson, a former missionary in the Solomon Islands, was employed full-time as Mission Promoter, raising funds for Marist works in the Pacific and publicizing them in a quarterly newsletter titled Talofa. Marist influence has also spawned social improvement agencies that operate outside the aegis of the order. In the Solomon Islands New York-born John Roughan, a laicized ex-missionary priest, has set up the Solomon Islands Development Trust to enhance the quality of life in rural villages. On a much larger scale is the New York-based Foundation for the Peoples of the South Pacific. This was set up in 1966 through collaboration between the Marist Fathers and Australian-born Betty Silverstein, wife of the president of MGM International, to assist welfare and development projects—such as Roughan's SIDT—in the Pacific Islands. Its first project was to commission a report by a professionally qualified Marist sociologist titled Socio-Economic Guidance to Missionaries in the South Pacific. Drawing from private charities as well as from American government sources, it has since grown into one of the major funding agencies for such purposes operating in the region.46

The American contribution to the growth of the Catholic Church in the Pacific has been immense, second only to that of the French pioneers, especially in the islands served by the Marists. Historically, Americans might be better known there as whalers and warriors, but during the last eight decades of the twentieth century they have, through the Marist connection, likewise had a notable impact as evangelizers, pastors, teachers, medical workers, aid and development organizers, and financiers. Moreover, when the well-filled filing cabinets that occupy their archives in Massachusetts and in Washington, D.C., are examined, the American Marists will be seen also to have been bountiful recorders not only of their own activities and observations but of many of the events and processes, the mundane as well as the dramatic, that constitute modern Pacific history. Nor will their close links with the Pacific be severed when the last of them leaves the mission field, for during the 1990's there has been a steady flow of Pacific Islands Marists to the United States for higher study. The Marist Society may have changed greatly since Jean-Claude Colin, its founder, despatched his first missionaries to the South Seas in 1836, but the fertilizing spirit of adapt-

*Beaudoin, op. cit. ,pp. 335-338; G. Arbuckle, Socio-Economic Guidance to Missionaries in the South Pacific: Survey Dec. 1966-Jan. 1967 (New York, 1967).

ability and inclusiveness with which he imbued it has endured, not least among his American disciples.

Appendix I

Letter of Bishop Leo Lemay to Sir Donald Cleland, August 16, 1966

Your Honour,

Your télégramme arrived last week, your letter of the 12th this morning. I wish to thank you for showing your continued interest in our District of Bougainville, even though the contents of both télégramme and letter were rather of the unpleasant kind.

Like yourself, I am all for peace! However, as I pointed out many years ago at our Adrninistration-Mission Conference, and as I repeated to you several months ago, I am also very much for the people among whom we work. If ever there is a conflict with the Administration, it can only be because the Administration is not being fair to the people. This is a position that no Mission, Catholic or otherwise, can fail to protect at all costs; and you yourself would be the first to uphold us on this score. That is why, in discussing with you, I -went to the source of the Bougainville trouble, laid my finger on what is causing the local people to revolt against the Administration: its colonial system imposed by Canberra on a Trusteeship. The native people today just will not take it. I pinpointed the fact that Mr Barnes [Minister of Territories] didn't seem to have heard of Nauru and Ocean Islands! Having had personal contact with the Banabans in Fiji, I knew how desolate was their status for some 15 years; and only recently is that status being improved. Our local people do not want to be dispossessed of their few acres of ground; it is more precious to them than gold or silver.

Two months ago, I visited the mountain people; questioned them; discussed with them. They categorically denied that Catholic (Mission Fathers) had instigated them to fight CRA: it was their own member in the House of Assembly [Paul Lapun] who told them they had full right to hold on to their land, and so to tell CRA that they did not want that land worked. They admitted that a year ago I encouraged them to let CRA prospect, that the local Fathers at Deomori had said the same thing. Their one argument: 'we want to hold on to our land'.The cause of their dissatisfaction was clear: the Government had invited CRA to go on to their land without having had their permission! (Only one man actually

was asked). Even CRA and the local Administration Officers admit this was ? faux pas—based on the Australian law, of course, but NOT conforming to Native law or custom. After long discussions, after pointing out with the local missionaries that they would remain 'bush' if CRA were told to leave, since there would be no one to build roads for them, etc. we were told in no uncertain terms: 'We want our land; we do not want CRA; we want to remain bush: and if need be our children will remain bush'.

One cannot reason against this attitude. BUT the point I insist on Your Honour, is that this attitude is the result of Canberra colonialism. It is the refusal to have due regard for Native law and custom, whether it be a matter of confiscation of land by what we whites call right of eminent domain; or of timber rights (the present Ordinance is utterly devoid of Native approval, that is for sure); or of land leases—the three items I specified in my talk with you. Natives only know conquest, sale or outright gift, when it comes to exchange of land. Tonolei Harbour labels the present Administration as having stolen two hundred acres of land. It is putting things bluntly; but it is the truth in native eyes.

Unfortunately, even we white missionaries are implicated. That is why some of the missionaries are re-acting so strongly in favour of the People against the Administration's policies. And where there is conflict I personally stick with the People whom I have come to serve, unless they are wrong. This is a policy I enunciated clearly at the Administration-Mission Conference years ago—that I would not be anti-Administration but pro-People, if ever there were a conflict where I thought the people were right.

In the present conflict, I am all for royalties—partial, of course—for the General Administration, for the Kieta (Bougainville) Administration and also for the local people whose land is being exploited (in the proper sense of the word). But as I made clear to all those to whom I spoke—and as the Fathers of the Mission agree, too: granted that the law is against the royalty system, and that this has been approved temporarily by the House of Assembly, there is nothing to be done against it except for the House to reconsider the matter. On this particular point, our representative in Port Moresby is quite outspoken. To the local people involved in the CRA conflict, I have warned that any force would only get them to jail; that their one recourse was through local Councils and through the House of Assembly.

I know of no missionary under me who is saying anything contrary to the above.

The accusations against Catholic Missionaries often in the past turned out to be a way of trying to excuse rather stupid projects begun by young field officers who bungled miserably and then had to find a scapegoat. Mr [J.K.] McCarthy conceded that much years ago, when I pointed out a few examples. In the present area of Bougainville troubles our Missionaries have been most outspoken when the Natives asked them to speak on their behalf. They would have been shirking their duty had they not done so; and this, if you recall what I told you in Moresby was all the more necessary because so few of the Administrative Officers even made an attempt to listen to the people.

Now for the last incident which occasioned Mr [R.] Denehy's letter to Fr [R.] Wiley and to myself: I fear that Mr Denehy was badly informed. Fr Wiley never called that meeting and did not know that it was taking place. He warned the Natives that he would be blamed for its having been called at his station on a Sunday after Services. He was present to make sure that there would be no misrepresentation; never spoke; never approving. He is asking Mr Denehy to apologize—and rightly so.

Fr Wiley is not afraid to speak his mind; has done so at proper time and place. But he assured me that he was not mixed up in this quarrel between the Council members and non-members; and between the CRA adherents and dissidents. He was and still is on good terms with the CRA personnel.

To summarise: the situation is indeed deplorable; only the House of Assembly will succeed in rectifying the mistakes made by the past policies from Canberra. If the House of Assembly reiterates its stand against the royalty system, the locals promise to secede from the Territory Government! I warned them that it would mean war! A change of attitude on the part of the Administration in all matters mentioned above—timber leases, land leases, and mining leases—will alone pacify the Bougainville people. And be it known that CRA would be delighted to hand out royaltys because only then would they be assured of the goodwill of the locals.

This, Your Honour, is for yourself, of course. Still, even though you may not agree with its contents, you might pass a few of the thoughts on to your successor so that he will be in a position to judge the pros and cons of the case without having to begin all over again. I am far from happpy with the situation; I shall continue to do all I can to obtain peace and cooperation; but I do hope that, before you leave the high post you hold, you will manage to influence Canberra to the extent that

the Moresby Administration is given the freedom to act in the best interests of the people. May the few remaining months of your tenure of office be not too filled with disappointments like the present one on Bougainville. You certainly deserve better, much better!

Yours faithfully,

L. Lemay.

Appendix ?

AMERICAN MARIST (SM) MISSIONARIES IN THE PROVINCE OF OCEANIA

Arrival date	Name	Location
1919	Elie Bergeron	Tonga/Province/Fiji (1948)
1920	Joseph Deihl	Samoa
	Louis Desjardins	Fiji/N. Solomons (1936)
1921	Edward Tremblay	Tonga
1922	Thomas Wade	N. Solomons
1926	John Conley	N. Solomons
1927	Arsène Laplante	Fiji
1928	John Walter	Fiji
1929	Louis Beauchemin	Samoa
1930	James McConville	N. Solomons
	Timothy Brosnahan	N. Solomons
1931	Albert Lebel	S. Solomons/N. Solomons (1933)
1934	Daniel Martin (Br.)	Fiji
	Philippe Fluet	Fiji
1936	Honore ('Henry') Hebert	N. Solomons
	Joseph Lamarre	N. Solomons
1937	Roland Dionne	N. Solomons
1938	George Lepping	N. Solomons
	William Perras	Samoa
1939	Arthur Duhamel	S. Solomons
	Henry Fluet	N. Solomons
	Michael McMahon [C]	S. Solomons
1940	John Redman (Br. Joseph)	N. Solomons
	Frederick Riggs (Br. Paul)	N. Solomons

	John Slagle (Br.)	S. Solomons
	Camille Rossignol	New Caledonia
1941	Cyril Jepson	Samoa
1942	Jean-Marie Bedard (Br.) [C]	Samoa
1943	Patrick Dumais	Samoa
1946	Charles Barrett	N. Solomons
	Thomas Clemens	N. Solomons
	Thomas Hogan	N. Solomons
	Joseph Kane	N. Solomons
	Francis Kleman	N. Solomons
	Robert Logrip	N. Solomons
	Leonard Moran	N. Solomons
	Lawrence Ross	Samoa
	Lionel Roy [C]	Tonga
1947	Paul Chaisson	S. Solomons
1948	Arthur Devlin	S. Solomons
	Francis Lambert	Vanuatu/Province
	James Moore	N. Solomons
	Paul Sicard	Vanuatu/N. Solomons (1956)
1949	John Keady	N. Solomons
	George Pearce	Samoa
1950	Leo Lemay	N. Solomons/Province
	Andrew Rondeau [C]	N. Solomons
	Walter Smozylo	Fiji/S. Solomons (1956)
1951	Herman Therriault	Tonga
1952	Paul Demers [C]	N. Solomons
	George Fahey	Fiji/N. Solomons (1958)
	William Mentzer	N. Solomons
	Gerard Pelletier	N. Solomons
1953	Robert Fahey	N. Solomons
	Howard Gordon (Br. Joseph Chanel)	S. Solomons
1955	Carlton Grenier	N. Solomons
	Nicholas Kutulas	N. Solomons
	Roger Lebrecque	Samoa/Province
	Francis Springer	N. Solomons
1956	Bertrand Soucy	Vanuatu
1957	Camille DesRosiers [C]	Samoa

1958	Roland Bernier (Br.)	Vanuatu
	Gerard Lapointe	N. Solomons
	Louis Morosini	S. Solomons
	William Mullen	Fiji
	John Roughan	S. Solomons
1959	Michael Bellenoit	S. Solomons
1961	Leo Lapointe (Br.)	Vanuatu
1962	Roger Bourgea	N. Solomons
	Robert Wiley	N. Solomons
1963	John Lynch	Samoa
1964	Paul Brousseau [C]	New Caledonia
	Patrick Mallinson	N. Solomons
1965	Philip Morin	Samoa
	Neil Soucy	S. Solomons
1966	Alan Dubay	New Caledonia
	Jerome Frey	S. Solomons
	John ('David') Galvin	S. Solomons
	James McGrath (Br.)	Fiji
1968	Joseph Pusateri	Samoa
	Leroy Fox	N. Solomons
	John Sarro (Br, later Fr.)	N. Solomons
1972	Armand Robichaud	Fiji
	Howard Smith	N. Solomons
1981	John Bolduc	Fiji
	John Moore	Fiji

BOOK REVIEWS

General

World Christianity and Marxism. By Denis R. Janz. (New York: Oxford University Press. 1998. Pp. Lx, 188. $35.00.)

As the current century draws to a close and the passions of the Cold War recede, Denis Janz has found the time ripe for a comprehensive study of the impact of Marxism, in both its doctrinal and political expressions, upon world Christianity, broadly conceived. The question he raises is simultaneously massive and complex. His approach to that question can be divided into three parts.

In the first section of the book, Janz locates Marx in the context of nineteenth-century intellectual history, examines his generally dismissive approach to religion, and then surveys the essentially negative, but often qualified, responses of Christian churches and thinkers to Marxism in the period prior to the Cold War. The second, most original and extensive part of the book examines the concrete encounters of Marxism and Christianity in seven national case studies. The countries therein examined are the Soviet Union, United States, Poland, Nicaragua, Albania, Cuba, and China. On the basis of these case studies, the author, in the third part of the book, develops his general conclusion that the encounter with Marxism has been the defining event for twentieth-century Christianity, as a result of which, "on balance world Christianity has benefited" (p. 154).

That conclusion is certainly open to debate and rests largely on the case studies cited. These studies can be disputed on several levels. What is the basis of selection of the case studies? Would not France and Brazil provide equally, if not more fruitful studies than the United States and Cuba? Is an extensive series of case studies capable of producing a comprehensive explanation of the impact of Marxism on world Christianity? The problem of sources is also pertinent. The author uses mainly secondary sources in English. Here, to be sure, his purpose must be kept in mind. His goal is not to make a definitive answer to the crucial question which he raises, but rather to stimulate serious, scholarly exploration of that topic. However, such an undertaking requires the combined efforts of scholars from many disciplines, nations, and confessions. Janz deserves to be applauded for initiating this pursuit. He correctly emphasizes the impact of Marxism on Christianity's self-definition. But, that self-definition has to be probed in the light not only of Marxism but also of concurrent develop-

ments in theology and history. The greatest contribution of this book is thus not the debatable conclusion which it reaches, but rather the challenging question which it proposes.

Francis J. Murphy

Boston College

La Bibbia nel Concilio: La redazione delta costituzione "Dei Verbum" del Vaticano II. By Riccardo Burigana. [Istituto per le scienze religiose: Testi e ricerche di scienze religiose, nuova serie, 21.] (Bologna: Società éditrice il Mulino. 1998. Pp. 514. Lire 65,000 paperback.)

This work recounts in great detail the evolution of Vatican Council II's Dogmatic Constitution on Divine Revelation from the ante-preparatory phase of the Council to the final vote of November 18, 1965. Thanks to his thorough examination of many personal archives, the author is able to trace every stage of the discussion in the various committees and subcommittees that were responsible for this Council document. On the whole, the author's analysis confirms the usual interpretation, even while adding some surprising details.

The original schémas on "The Fonts of Revelation" and the "Deposit of Faith" were prepared, as is well known, by theologians of the Roman school under the supervision of Cardinal Alfredo Ottaviani and Father Sebastian Tromp, SJ. These schémas were challenged by a loosely knit group of non-Italian theologians, including Karl Rahner, Joseph Ratzinger, Edward Schillebeeckx, Yves Congar, Marie-Dominique Chenu, and Henri de Lubac. In the course of time these theologians were supported by exegetes and ecumenists who shared the concerns of Pope John XXIII that the Council be oriented toward a return to the sources, aggiornamento, and the promotion of Christian unity. After the creation of the Secretariat for Christian Unity, the reformist party could count on the patronage of Cardinal Augustine Bea, its president. Cardinal Franz König and many bishops rallied to the reformist cause.

Throughout the Council the sharpest debate about revelation focused on the question of the "two sources." Granted that revelation was transmitted through Scripture and Tradition under the vigilance of the magisterium, were there any truths contained in Tradition that were not also in Scripture? The Roman school considered the affirmative answer to be a matter of faith, constantly taught, at least since the Council of Trent. The opposition, influenced by Josef Rupert Geiselmann's research on the Council of Trent, maintained that Catholics were free to hold that all revelation was in Scripture, even though some revealed truths could not be fully and clearly known without the help of tradition. The Secretariat argued that since the Geiselmann position was compatible with the letter of Trent, and was more acceptable to Protestants, it could and should be tolerated.

The debate at the first session of the Council showed much dissatisfaction with the initial schémas prepared by the Roman school. John XXIII accordingly constituted a "mixed commission" under the joint presidency of Cardinals Ottaviani and Bea to draft a new document. But the mixed commission reached a stalemate on the question of "constitutive tradition."

Several other points were sharply debated. The Roman school held for the absolute inerrancy of the Bible, whereas the reformists were willing to admit errors in Scripture provided that they were not formally taught. Secondly, the revised schémas seemed to limit revelation to "salutary truths," an expression that the Roman school found vague and confusing. The Roman school were dissatisfied, thirdly, with the schémas that failed to affirm the historical reliability of the Gospels. On all these points, persistently championed by Cardinal Ernesto Ruffini, Cardinal Giuseppe Siri, Bishop Luigi Carli, and others, Paul VI finally intervened to insist on changes to accommodate the concerns of the minority, and Cardinal Bea himself went along with the pope. In the end, therefore, the Constitution on Divine Revelation, while more ecumenical in tone, was not markedly different in substance from the schémas prepared before the Council and withdrawn at the first session.

Thanks to his extensive research, Burigana is able to give an exact account of the positions taken by hundreds of theologians who engaged in the debates on revelation. Although the account is clear in itself, it is inevitably repetitious; it is also difficult to follow unless one makes constant reference to the relevant schémas. In his first appendix, Burigana lists all the schémas and indicates where they can be found. In his second appendix he reproduces the schema De fontibus revelationis of September, I960, the schema De revelatione divina issued by the Mixed Commission in January, 1963, and the revised text of April, 1964.

This work is a model of careful conciliar history and is probably as definitive as any such book can hope to be.

Avery Dulles, SJ.

Fordham University

Ancient and Medieval

Handmaids of the Lord: Contemporary Descriptions of Feminine Asceticism in the First Six Centuries. Translated and edited by Joan M. Petersen. [Cistercian Studies Series: 143·] (Kalamazoo, Michigan: Cistercian Publications, Inc. 1996. Pp. 441.)

This anthology, appearing after the editor's death, seems intended especially for church audiences. Dissociating early female asceticism from recent feminist interests, Petersen interprets it in ways that link it to twentieth-century church

practice. For the most part, Petersen assumes that the texts faithfully represent "real" women.

Translations of four sets of texts are preceded by an eighteen-page introduction on female monasticism in the first six Christian centuries. The texts selected by Petersen are Gregory of Nyssa's Life of Saint Macrina; several of the letters of Jerome to and about his ascetic female friends; texts on Melania the Elder and Melania the Younger, including Gerontius' Life of Melania the Younger; and materials pertaining to the life and death of Radegunde by Venantius Fortunatus, the nun Baudonivia, and Gregory of Tours. Peterson uses S. L. Greenslade's translations of Jerome's epp. 107 and 108, and his Introduction to Jerome, from his volume, Early Latin Theology (1956); otherwise, she has translated the materials herself. Each section/subsection is preceded by a short introduction that places the people and events of the text in historical and religious perspective. Ample notes at the conclusion of each section identify characters, literary quotations, and biblical references, and indicate points at which Petersen disagrees with a standard reading of the critical edition of a text.

Two virtues of this book deserve particular mention: the translations are for the most part clear and in twentieth-century English (unlike the translations in, for example, The Nicene and Post-Nicene Fathers series); and entire texts are translated, not just snippets, as is so often the case in anthologies. The volume is marred, however, not just by the usual typographical errors; in this case, whole lines have been omitted, sentences run together, and so forth. No doubt these errors are related to the fact that Petersen died before making the final editorial corrections to her manuscript, and no one, apparently, took responsibility to ensure that the page proofs were correct. Also puzzling is the fact that almost all of these texts have been translated before, most quite recently in various anthologies of writings about and by women in early Christianity. The texts on Radegunde, however, are ones often not included in anthologies pertaining to early Christian women; she is more often discussed in books pertaining to medieval women. The book concludes with "Suggestions for Further Reading."

Euzabeth A. Clark

Duke University

Christianity and Paganism in the Fourth to Eighth Centuries. By Ramsay MacMullen. (New Haven: Yale University Press. 1997. Pp. vi, 282. $32.00.)

In Christianizing the Roman Empire (1984), Ramsay MacMullen discussed the growth of Christianity and the suppression of paganism through the end of the fourth century, when, as he wrote, "monks and bishops, generals and emperors, had driven the enemy from our field of vision" (p. 119). That, to many readers, seemed a premature end of the story, and MacMullen has now taken the welcome step of extending his field of vision to the end of Late Antiquity.

In doing so, he has brought together a wide range of evidence from across the Mediterranean between the fifth and seventh centuries. But by going beyond the fourth century, now accepted as a legitimate area of study by ancient historians, and moving into the vaster territory of Late Antiquity, a field whose complexities have made it arguably "unstudyable" by any single discipline,1 MacMullen has also taken on an exceedingly difficult task, not all of whose pitfalls he has avoided.

Christianity and Paganism is a typical product of MacMullen's erudition and style, with 159 pages of text and 114 pages of endnotes and bibliography. The book's argument is usefully displayed in a narrative table of contents (pp. v-vi). Chapter !,"Persecution," describes the efforts of Christian leaders "to extirpate all religious alternatives," and to silence pagan writings and suppress "pagan acts and practices with increasing harshness and machinery of enforcement." Chapter 2, "The Cost to the Persecuted," describes "the successive layers of paganism which came under threat of destruction, what each had brought to religious life, and what was lost to the extent those layers were destroyed." Chapter 3, "Superstition," uses that term as a master-concept to describe "how best to understand the transition of the classical religious thought-world to the medieval and Byzantine." Chapter 4, "Assimilation," describes "the reception by the church of pagan acts and practices along with pagan converts, and how these helped to shape Christianity." Chapter 5, "Summary," reviews the argument and reaches the conclusion that religious changes of the fourth through eighth centuries can only be understood by defining religion "more in the style of pagans, or of anthropologists . . . rather than in the style of yesterday's historians," that is, what people did as well as what they believed (p. 158). Thus did the actions of ordinary people help to contribute to the formation of medieval Christianity.

Even as modified by MacMullen's reception of recent specialized work on Christianization, much of this argument will seem familiar to his veteran readers. At its core, as Peter Brown has observed, citing MacMullen among others,2 is David Hume's view of the "flux and reflux of polytheism and theism," by which the (mono)theism that develops from an original polytheism lapses back again into polytheism. For inevitably, argues Hume, "such refined ideas, being somewhat disproportioned to vulgar comprehension, remain not long in their original purity; but require to be supported by the notion of inferior mediators or subordinate agents, which interpose betwixt mankind and their supreme deity."3 Redefining Hume's contempt for the masses as a low assessment of everyone's rationality in Late Antiquity, MacMullen explains the rise of saints'

'Peter Heather, "Late Antiquity and the Early Medieval West," in Companion to Historiography, ed. Michael Bentley (London and New York, 1997), p. 69-

2Peter Brown, The Cult of the Saints (Chicago, 1981), p. 18, n. 62.

3David Hume, The Natural History of Religion, ed. A. W. Colver (Oxford, 1976), pp. 57-58.

cults and the persistence of idolatry among Christian converts in essentially the same terms: "Conversion and the repudiation of their old patrons and rescuers among the divine ranks had left an emptiness, a loneliness in times of trouble, not comfortably to be filled by the Power preached from urban pulpits" (p. 121). Hume's use of superstition as an analytical category may have made good sense in his own day—his essay "Of Superstition and Enthusiasm," on which Gibbon relied, is a brilliant piece of Enlightenment reasoning—but the very anthropologists of religion whose style MacMullen praises have long since pioneered other ways of examining religious practices and identities, to which we ought to pay at least equal attention.

One problem with MacMullen's use of the term superstition is that he is inclined to take completely for granted his sources' detection of it. Thus, in a description of the use of violence to suppress paganism (p. 68), MacMullen cites canon 11 of the Twelfth Council of Toledo (681), which mandated harsh penalties against slaves who practiced paganism and against their masters who did not deter them. Misinterpreting the canon's violent scriptural references and metaphors of spiritual death as references to an actual death penalty (which the bishops explicitly state that they are not advocating), MacMullen goes on in the next sentence to make the astonishing claim, "By then, most of the peninsula had long reverted to paganism." The note that corroborates this statement (n. 129 on p. 200) informs us that "The faithful are pauci and idolatriae sacrilegium overspreads the whole land, in the 580s, seen in McKenna (1938) 112." These references are based on two footnotes in Stephen McKenna's Catholic University dissertation, the oft-quoted Paganism and Pagan Survivals in Spain up to the Fall of the Visigothic Kingdom. In the first note (McKenna, p. 115, n. 34), Gregory of Tours asserts that owing to the Arian persecution of Catholics, few (pauci) true Christians remain in Spain (Histories 6.18): any reader of Gregory even tempted to take this statement literally would know from the context that the rest, of course, were not pagans, but Arians. The second reference (McKenna, p. 116, n. 37) cites canon 16 of the Third Council of Toledo (589), which states that the sacrilege of idolatry (idolatriae sacrilegium) has become implanted throughout almost all of Spain and Gaul. This is a typical specimen of episcopal rhetoric that also needs to be seen in context, and neither reference in fact justifies the belief that paganism had come to prevail again anywhere in the seventh century. Indeed, by the end of the book MacMullen comes to a different and more sensible conclusion, that the symbols and acts that bishops identified as pagan should instead be accepted as part of Christianity when practiced by a Christian population (p. 158). Unfortunately, the unwary reader who simply reads the text and does not follow the endnotes back to their sources will not quite see how this conclusion was reached.

As with other works by MacMullen, the notes are the key to this book's value: they are a gold mine of fascinating and informative reading. They can also help to correct the text itself. Thus it turns out that the two Psalms that MacMullen describes as favorite amulet texts (p. 141) are actually the same one, Psalm 91,

which his immediate sources refer to by its differing Hebrew (n. 135) and Septuagint (n. 136) numbering. One could perhaps excuse an ancient historian—even a very good one—for missing this kind of technical, patristic detail, for using Migne or Mansi when newer and better editions exist, or for confusing Pope Leo with a usurper of the previous century (n. 6 on p. 162, where the pope "absent from"—actually not given a separate entry in—the New Catholic Encyclopedia is not "saint and bishop Leo," but the antipope Felix H). But it is precisely because Late Antiquity must be studied with disciplines that have traditionally had little to do with one another that problems like the relationship of paganism and Christianity in the fourth through eighth centuries still far elude our understanding. MacMullen's book brings much to the surface: a careful reading will repay any reader interested in the subject.

William E. Klingshirn

The Catholic University ofAmerica

Saints' Lives and the Rhetoric of Gender. Male and Female in Merovingian Hagiography. By John Kitchen (New York: Oxford University Press. 1998. Pp. xv, 255. $49.95.)

Modern scholarship has usually classified Gregory of Tours as an influential historian of the early Franks and Fortunatus as a poet noted for the fluency of his versification. Yet both were also distinguished authors of saints' Lives. John Kitchen's study is an important contribution to the ongoing revival of their reputations as hagiographers. In particular, Kitchen examines current debates over the existence of a distinctive notion of female sanctity during the early medieval period. In his book he adopts two approaches. One is to compare an author's Lives of male saints with his Life of a female saint. In his book entitled Life of the Fathers Gregory included twenty Lives. One discussed Monegund, who had abandoned her husband to take up residence at the church of St. Martin in Tours. In this Life Gregory did not deviate from the formulas he employed in his other Lives except in the preface, in which he explicitly noted Monegund's "inferior sex" and associated it with male characteristics of holiness: "Monegund is consistently presented . . . neither as a man nor as a woman. She is . . . the same sexless figure we find throughout this collection" (p. 113). Fortunatus likewise composed one Life of a woman. This hero was the famous Radegund, who had been married to a Frankish king before founding a convent at Poitiers. Although in his other Lives Fortunatus had depicted the asceticism of male saints as controlled and restrained, in his Life of Radegund he highlighted her self-inflicted suffering and stressed the importance of self-mortification. In his discussions Kitchen is acutely sensitive to differences in attitudes, or perhaps rhetorical strategies, between Gregory and Fortunatus. He also consistently challenges some of the lazy generalizations of modern scholars about the appearance of a new, specifically female voice or outlook: "women who attained sanctity regarded themselves positively as male" (p. 131).

Kitchen's second approach is to compare a man's Life of Radegund with a woman's Life of Radegund. Baudonivia was a nun at Radegund's convent. Her supplement to Fortunatus' Life was also a subtle modification of Fortunatus' interpretation. In the introduction to her Life Baudonivia was completely indifferent to Radegund's gender. Because Gregory and Fortunatus had been likewise oblivious only when writing about men, Baudonivia's "standard indifference to gender constitutes a real distinctiveness" (p. 140). Baudonivia was furthermore noticeably more circumspect in mentioning Radegund's ascetic behavior, and the Radegund that she described was hence more deeply spiritual. Yet Baudonivia also included examples of Radegund's responsibility for typically male activities, such as her militant antagonism to paganism and the employment of punitive miracles within her community.

Kitchen's book is primarily a literary study of hagiographical texts. Its obvious strengths are its meticulous comparison of various Lives and its insistence upon including texts that are not explicitly about women in a study of female views of holiness. At the end of his analysis Kitchen is admirably direct in his conclusions about ideas of sanctity. "The present search for a distinctiveness that is determined purely on the basis of gender is undoubtedly a misguided approach to the study of Merovingian Vitae" (p. 159)· The next step is to combine text and context more explicitly by incorporating these literary conclusions into a comprehensive discussion of sexuality and gender in Merovingian society.

Raymond Van Dam

University ofMichigan

Britain and Early Christian Europe: Studies in Early Medieval History and Culture. By Patrick Sims-Williams. [Variorum Collected Studies Series.] (Brookfield, Vermont: Variorum, Ashgate Publishing Company. 1995. Pp. x, 337.)

This collection brings together fourteen essays, previously published separately, assembled under three headings, the Adventus Saxonum, Anglo-Saxon ecclesiastical culture, and early medieval devotion. The majority are on Anglo-Saxon subjects while the others range from Welsh origins stories and charters to Irish and Spanish symptoms in the early medieval liturgy. All are informed by acute questioning, good sense, and immense learning. Sims-Williams now occupies a chair of Welsh literature, and the benefits of his literary and philological training can be seen in every essay.

Professor Sims-Williams' method is usually that of sharp and close textual reading, proceeding with infinite care to strip away the accretions of scholarly misinterpretation and wishful thinking from the text, to uncover the author's original intentions and meanings. The fruits of this approach can be seen in his two essays on Gildas and the Anglo-Saxon settlements, where his investigation

of the De Excidio and the Anglo-Saxon Chronicle reveals the limitation of these sources as historical records of the Saxon incursions. Here Sims-Williams brings from his Celtic researches a stronger sense than many Anglo-Saxon historians have shown of the presence of oral traditions embedded in the written sources, arguing, for example, that Gildas relied almost entirely on oral sources and cannot be regarded as a reliable source for the fifth century.

Another group of six essays brings together studies resulting from the author's work on southwestern England in the seventh and eighth centuries. Here his attention to detail, often philological or palaeographical, enables him to uncover new evidence for the monasteries and bishops of Worcestershire and Gloucestershire. Three essays piece together evidence for the continental links of Bath Abbey for other houses in this area, fleshing out the Frankish connections of Anglo-Saxon monasticism suggested by Bede. In a remarkable piece of textual archaeology, Sims-Williams reconstructs a collection of Roman and papal inscriptions put together for the eighth-century bishop of Worcester, Milred. Liturgical and devotional texts form the subject of the final group of three essays which rehabilitate the Spanish origin of a prayer of the faithful, uncover knowledge of Ephraim the Syrian in Anglo-Saxon England, and identify the triad "thought, word, and deed" as characteristically Irish.

Because Professor Sims-Williams' learning is both so deep and so broad there is some problem about the coherence of this collection. The Anglo-Saxon material, as I have tried to show, fits fairly neatly into two groups, but the two essays on Welsh subjects integrate less well. One is glad to have them, but the fit is uneasy. Insofar as the volume possesses an underlying unity, it lies in his ability to reveal the international connections of the texts he discusses and the great range of the literary and intellectual culture of the Middle Ages. These are important essays, and it is a boon to have them made readily accessible.

Catherine Cubitt

University of York

Schools of Asceticism: Ideology and Organization in Medieval Religious Communities. By Luetz Kaelber. (University Park: Pennsylvania State University Press. 1998. Pp. viii, 278. $55.00 clothbound; $19.95 paperback.)

Luetz Kaelber has set himself an ambitious task: to complete and at the same time to offer a critique of the work of Max Weber on the impact of monasticism on western society. For Weber, in Kaelber's analysis, medieval monasticism's potential for an "ascetic empowerment of the self" (p. 12 and passim) was hamstrung by virtue of its being "other-worldly"; it had nonetheless to be reckoned "an important precursor to ascetic Protestantism" (p. 60). The ideological gulf between medieval monks and sixteenth-century Calvinists was, Weber sus-

pected, spanned by medieval heterodox sects, but he was never able to explore this idea. It is the aim of Kaelber in Schools ofAsceticism to develop it.

Kaelber's critique of Weber is based on his belief that Weber got medieval monasticism wrong: in the early and central Middle Ages,pace Weber, medieval monks for the most part did not put an especially high premium on manual work, nor were they purely other-worldly. They prayed hard for their noble patrons, leaving their fields to be ploughed by their serfs. Even Cistercians, despite a rhetorical commitment to manual labor, relied heavily on the work of lay-brothers to run their granges and keep their sheep. The true ascetics of the Middle Ages turn out, in Kaelber's thesis, not to be monks at all. They are laymen and women.

The prominence Kaelber gives to the laity forces him to consider another Weberian tenet, viz., the impediments to the "rationalisation of conduct" created by the "magic rituals" which priests alone could perform, and which thus encouraged the laity to rely on "the performance of ritualist actions rather than asceticism as the means to salvation" (pp. 101-102). This is not a view Kaelber rejects out of hand, but he does significantly qualify it, insisting that certain lay groups, under the influence of charismatic leaders, formed themselves into what, since Brian Stock, The Implications ofLiteracy (1983), have come to be known as "textual communities" and that these communities significantly rejected the miraculous in favor of "scriptural prescriptions" (p. 125). Of these communities, those that most interest Kaelber are Waldensians and Cathars.

Kaelber's chosen sects faced, often literally, many trials. This continual persecution meant that the ways of life of Waldensian and Cathar adherents varied from region to region, from one decade to another, and theology and organisation did not always match up. Thus the "flight from the world" that Cathar dualism logically advocated was tempered by the very active role that Cathar perfects played in teaching crafts, along with religion, to their followers. Many Waldensians meanwhile ended up mimicking rather than rejecting the soteriology of the established church. But—and it is a 'but' that lies at the heart of Kaelber's work—to the south of the Danube were Waldensians who managed differently. Here flourished an astonishingly egalitarian sect, with firm beliefs in the value for all of an ascetic life-style based on Gospel precepts: "the resulting rationalisation of conduct, in its methodical character and ascetic approach, preceded inner-worldly asceticism in ascetic Protestanism by more than three hundred years" (p. 167). What the Waldensians lacked was, of course, the economic infrastructure of the Reformation. How far it is indeed economics that brings ideological change to maturation is the challenging question with which Kaelber concludes this thought-provoking book.

Henrietta Leyser

St. Peter's College, Oxford

The Life of the Patriarch Tarasios by Ignatios the Deacon (BHG 1698). Introduction, text, translation and commentary. By Stephanos Efthymiadis. [Birmingham Byzantine and Ottoman Monographs, Volume 4.] (Brookfield, Vermont: Variorum, Ashgate Publishing Co. 1998. Pp. xvii, 309; 3 plates. $76.95.)

The opening words of this vita of the Patriarch of Constantinople who, even if a little prematurely, dug the grave for Byzantine iconoclasm reveal the genre to which this piece of hagiography belongs:

> About to swim across the infinite magnitude of the ocean of virtues of a glorious father who has led an unapproachable life, I fear lest by the adverse winds of my uncultivated tongue I raise a huge wave of obscurity and cause myself a tempest and a storm of psychic drowning. (§ 1)

At once one senses the verbal wealth, the assumed humility, and the delight in literary conjuring, which are hallmarks of the subgenre made by such vitae (studied in detail by Dr. Efthymiadis in an earlier Oxford thesis).

Tarasios, a pious lay court official, appointed Patriarch in 784 by the Empress Irene in order to restore the cult of icons, organized the Council (Nicaea II of 787) which condemned iconoclasm, and then set about an ambitious programme of writing and church decoration in favor of icons. Earlier he taught his biographer, then in the "acme of youth" the intricacies of Greek verse, "trimetre and tetrametre, trochees and anapaests, and dactylic verse" (§69), and Ignatios tells us that he was present at the Patriarch's deathbed (§60) in 806. Less than ten years later, iconoclasm was restored by Leo V, and would be finally interred only in 843.

The present vita, which is just over thirty pages long, probably dates from shortly after that date, when Ignatios was some seventy years old. A professional cleric, part-time monk, and perhaps bishop of Nicaea, he is thought to have died about half-a-dozen years later, after a life marked by doctrinal oscillations (he moved from rejecting icons to accepting them, then repeated the process as Emperors came and went) but with an unwavering devotion to literature, producing little masterpieces (three other vitae are attributed to him, and numerous other works in verse and prose) and probably a deep, but unheroic, piety.

This new edition has an excellent Greek text, established after a painstaking collation of the manuscripts, and an outstanding English translation. The 'high-style' Greek favored by Ignatios has a baroque quality, demanding of its readers and often opaque. The Greek-less reader may find the numerous Greek quotations in the introduction a little baffling (and it is here that one notices how the editor has had to struggle with English), but in general complex historical questions are treated with exemplary clarity. The historian will complain that hagiographie veneration has covered over too much historical truth (the sad fate of Constantine VI and the ambitious ruthlessness of his mother are never mentioned), but for a reader who wants glimpses of real life in Byzantium, this art-

fully told tale offers many tidbits. In addition, its inclusion in liturgical readings ensured its survival, when so much else from that disturbed period has been lost, and one must willy-nilly turn to it for some information, however biased, on the crucial struggle against iconoclasm.

Joseph A. Munitiz, SJ.

Manresa House
Birmingham, England

The Medieval Abbey of Farfa: Target of Papal and Imperial Ambitions. By Mary Stroll. [Brill's Studies in Intellectual History, Volume 74.] (Leiden: BrUl. 1997. Pp. xüi, 298.)

Mary Stroll has produced a welcome addition to the growing number of local studies on church reform in Italy. Her book presents a detailed analysis of the investiture controversy and the expansion of papal power from the point of view of a large central Italian monastery, the abbey of Farfa, examining the fight between regnum and sacerdotium through the eyes of a third party that was directly involved in the events. Stroll succeeds well in showing the complexities of the political dimension of church reform, and her book demonstrates just how important third parties such as Farfa were in the battle between pope and emperor. Throughout the book the author follows closely primary source materials found in Farfa, and although at times the book reads a bit like a summary of Gregory of Catino, the monk at the abbey responsible for the bulk of the documents, Stroll is also careful to note the possible biases and motives of Gregory and to place the documents within a larger historical context. Moreover, Stroll always keeps in mind that the reform movement was never monolithic but conceived in disparate ways by different players at different moments. She shows not only how the priorities of reform changed over time, but also traces well the development and transformation of ideas that individuals such as Gregory VII and Henry IV underwent during their lifetimes. The book contains good maps of the region which make finding obscure places easy, but unfortunately no genealogies, which would have been helpful, particularly in the case of the Ottaviani and the Crescenti, whose members are frequently mentioned.

Despite the cogent analysis of the abbey of Farfa's role in the investiture controversy, the book is not truly a local study since Farfa is never examined on its own terms, but exclusively as part of the papal-imperial conflict. Stroll never places the disputes between the abbey and the Ottaviani that she discusses at length within the context of the Sabina's local politics, but instead insists that they were a microcosm of the contest between pope and emperor. Moreover, the author focuses exclusively on the political dimension of reform, leaving out all discussion of religious life and clerical reform. Although the author states at the beginning of the book that her investigation started in response to the claims of other historians that Farfa represented a regressive form of Benedic-

tinism in the twelfth century in contrast to other monasteries which instituted reforms, the book fails to address the issue of internal organization except to claim that Farfa never imposed the moral aspects of ecclesiastical reform. And since the author examines neither the religious life and organization inside the abbey nor the monks' role in local politics, some of her conclusions are a bit puzzling. What does the author mean when she says that religious life at Farfa was debased? And in what sense did Farfa lose its independence when it went under papal power? But perhaps these issues can be taken up in another study, and one can only thank Stroll for piquing our curiosity about a monastery rich in archives and central to the history of the Western Church.

Valerie Ramseyer

Wellesley College

The Legend of Pope Joan: In Search of the Truth. By Peter Stanford. (New York: Henry Holt and Company. 1998. Pp. Lx, 207. $26.00.)

Joan refuses to go away. Allegedly, in 855, an English woman who had been educated at Fulda traveled to Athens, acquired a remarkable range of learning, went to Rome, rose high in everyone's estimation, and was elected pope. But he was a she and after two years, five months, and four days her deception was revealed when lapapessa unexpectedly gave birth while riding through a Roman street.

This is a legend, nothing more. Despite Stanford's attempt to impugn the ninth-century records, even asserting that Anastasius Bibliothecarius purged the sources, there is no room for anyone—papa or papessa—between the death of Leo IV on July 17, 855, and the elevation of Benedict HI later in that same month. Public records survive from Benedict's three-year pontificate, moreover.

Peter Stanford takes his reader on a breathless detective's quest for the "truth." Alas, he comes off more like Jacques Clouseau than Sherlock Holmes. Leaving aside misprints and misspellings—for which his editor may be in part responsible—Stanford is simply no historian. His gaffes in method and interpretation are such as would fail a first-year history student. Also, there are errors of fact on almost every page and two or three howlers per chapter. Apart from his suspicion that Joan is probably real because the hegemonic male hierarchy has always tried to suppress the good and important things that Catholic women have done, Stanford has contributed nothing new to a discussion that began in earnest in the thirteenth century.

In prodigious displays of pseudo-scholarship, Stanford tries to build a case that points conclusively to the reality of Pope Joan. He cites many documents, refers often to "manuscripts," and weighs the views of some good historians. All of this appears to lend an air of gravity to the book. Yet, Stanford has failed to get the best out of the books he seems to have consulted. Alain Boureau (La papesse Jeanne, 1988), for instance, says that the Joan story is a cultural artifact whose prominence between about 1200 and 1600 reveals a lot about that pe-

riod. Much the same line is taken by Cesare D'Onofrio (La papessa Giovanna, 1979). Stanford's scissors-and-paste methodology missed, or did not cite, Elisabeth Gössmann (Mulier Papa: Der Skandal eines weiblichen Papstes, 1994). But Stanford's pages bulge with oddly arranged and interpreted quotations from documents that can be found in these three books. I have a hunch that they represent his "archive."

In a few places, Stanford seems to glimpse the important questions: Why was the Joan story told? Who told it? Since the three best sets of answers to these questions are recent but not in English, there is (still) room for a good, up-to-date English discussion. Unfortunately, in an effort to capitalize on the perduring fascination of the tale and to score ideological points against the Church, Stanford missed the point and devoted himself to trying to show that Joan was real.

Thomas F. X. Noble

University of Virginia

Trinity and Incarnation in Anglo-Saxon Art and Thought. By Barbara C. Raw. [Cambridge Studies in Anglo-Saxon England, Volume 21.] (New York: Cambridge University Press. 1997. Pp. x, 221. $59.95.)

In this book, as in her previous volume in the same series, Anglo-Saxon Crucifixion Iconography and the Art of the Monastic Revival (1990), Barbara Raw explicates the meaning and function of a group of late Anglo-Saxon works of art by "relating" them to the literature of the period, something she claims "no one [so far] has attempted" (p. 2). Certainly no one has brought such a wide range and abundance of contemporary writings to bear on pre-Conquest English art as this able scholar of Anglo-Saxon literature. In the present volume everything from theological treatises, liturgical texts, and homilies to private devotional works, Old English poetry, and above all the writings of Aelfric are called upon to elucidate Anglo-Saxon beliefs concerning the Trinity and Incarnation and the pictorial means artists found to express them.

A short introduction briefly notes the remarkable character of the Anglo-Saxon images of the Trinity, all manuscript illustrations, which in number and ingenuity are unparalleled in early medieval art. It also includes a discussion of "the different, but complementary ways" in which "art and literature express religious truths" (p. 6). Analysis of the individual images is postponed, however, to the last four chapters of the book, the preceding four being devoted to theology and the theory of images.

The first two chapters review the early development of the doctrines of the Trinity and Incarnation, the evidence for increased devotion to the Trinity in Anglo-Saxon England, and the nature of that devotion. The next two consider early medieval arguments regarding the validity and function of religious images and the problems of representing a God who is not only invisible and immaterial, but also three persons in a single nature. All of the sources cited on

religious art are continental, except for Bede, since late Anglo-Saxon authors, including Aelfric, ignored the subject. Raw is thus left to speculate as to what the homilist's views might have been.

The analysis of some thirty images of the deity in the remaining chapters is organized by pictorial type, each of which Raw associates with a different mode of divine revelation: the "portrait-image" which "implies a presence," narrative illustration which "recalls God's intervention in history," and symbolic representation which "corresponds to the indirect forms of revelation" (p. 99). Each type, Raw believes, elicits a different viewer response (pp. 118-119). The analysis begins with illustrations of God's interventions in the Old Testament and scenes from the life of Christ (Chapter 5), then continues with iconic images of Christ as "the visible form of the Godhead" (Chapter 6) and symbolic representations of the Trinity incorporating the lamb, the dove, and, occasionally, Mary (Chapter 7). The final chapter describes the way these images aid the viewer in the contemplation of the Trinity which, the author argues, is "the focus of the religious life of prayer" (p. 169).

Raw's consideration of the images in the context of Anglo-Saxon spirituality is a significant contribution. So too is the textual evidence introduced in support of a number of new or expanded interpretations of individual images. Not all of the interpretations are equally compelling, however, and the study raises several questions. One wonders, for example, just how close to actual practice are Raw's theories concerning the use of the images. Troubling as well are her insensitivity to the formal complexities and multivalent character of medieval art, and, above all, her cavalier treatment of certain images. In order to convert the scenes of creation through the Son in the Junius manuscript into creation by the Trinity as taught by Aelfric, Raw had to misread the order and arrangement of the images and ignore half their contents. In the case of the drawings from the Arenberg Gospels, these interrelated components of a christological cycle are extracted from their pictorial context and treated as independent, self-contained compositions.

But the author's limitations as a reader of images are offset by her knowledge and mastery of texts, and so, in spite of the misinterpretation of some of the art, the book provides an impressive overview of late Anglo-Saxon thought and devotion to the Trinity.

Jane E. Rosenthal

Columbia University

Monastic Revival and Regional Identity in Early Normandy. By Cassandra Potts. [Studies in the History of Medieval Religion, Volume XI.] (Rochester, New York: The Boydell Press. 1997. Pp. xvi, 170. $72.00.)

From the days of C. H. Haskins during World War I through the time of D. C. Douglas after World War II and now recently in the works of R. McKitterick and

J. L. Nelson, the province of Normandy has attracted the attention of medievalists. The relative abundance of sources, the relative stability of the duchy under William the Conqueror, and the obvious importance of Normandy for English political, social, and constitutional history after 1066 help to account for this interest. Every generation of scholars asks new questions of the documents, or at least rephrases old ones.

The book under review seeks to answer two questions: why did the Normans, descendants of ninth- and tenth-century Vikings who had largely destroyed the ecclesiastical structure of the region, restore, rebuild, and rejuvenate the monasteries? How did the movement of monastic revival aid Normandy's regional and cultural identity and promote its political cohesion?

After a critical analysis of the sources, the author gives a general survey of monasticism in western Neustria, and then explores the pattern of ducal and aristocratic gifts to religious houses. Benefactors' motives, Potts argues, combined traditional piety and political pragmatism. Gifts of lands, mills, markets, fairs, exemptions from tolls on rivers and roads, the tithes of parish churches wove the religious houses into the economic fabric of the region. Some monasteries accumulated cash and acted as banking houses; others, such as Mont-Saint-Michel, served as stabilizing influences in contested frontier regions. Most of this information is generally known, but the author provides new examples supporting her generalizations. Through their loyalty and obedience to the duke, the Benedictine houses formed a major component in his process of "state building." There is almost no information on houses of women, nothing on the monastic horarium or internal spirituality—theoretically their raison d'être.

The contribution of this book rests on its synthesis of a large amount of recent literature, on its lively and engaging style, and on the significant detail it adds to the broad picture. That the book goes much beyond "The Ecclesiastical Revival," chapter 5 of Douglas's "William the Conqueror, is open to debate.

Bennett Hill, O.S.B

Georgetown University

St Cuthbert and the Normans: The Church of Durham, 1071-1153- By William M. Aird. [Studies in the History of Medieval Religion, volume XIV] (Rochester, New York: The Boydell Press. 1998. Pp. xvi, 31 1. $75.00.)

This book is the first major work on the far north of England in the eleventh and twelfth centuries to appear since W. E. Kapelle's The Norman Conquest of the North was published in 1979· Aird endorses its findings in several key areas. His own work examines the region from the perspective of the Church of Durham, whose inmates were custodians of the powerful cult of St. Cuthbert, the seventh-century missionary bishop of Lindisfarne.

Extensive estates were gradually accumulated by St. Cuthbert's community from 635, when King Oswald of Northumbria (634-642) founded a religious community on the tidal island of Lindisfarne. After Cuthbert's death in 687, his cult attracted rich donations of land, and the resulting wealth enhanced the power of the bishops of the Church of St. Cuthbert. Gradually there was created a great power block, the Land of St. Cuthbert, stretching south from the River Tyne to the Tees. Aird suggests that it was an intentional buffer zone between English Northumbria and Scandinavian York.

Aird argues that the wanderings of St. Cuthbert's community between 875 and 883 reinforced both the cult of St. Cuthbert, by perambulating his relics over a wide area, and also the claims of the community to its extensive lands. The community settled in Chester-le-Street, a convenient center from which to administer the growing estates toward the south, but in 995 relocated to its present site on the massive rock almost encircled by the River Wear.

The community negotiated in turn with the Scandinavians of York in the late ninth century and very early tenth; with the conquering kings of the house of Wessex; the comital House of Bamburgh, successor in the region to the kings of Bernicia, and with King Cnut (1016-1035). The effective government of the Norman invaders did not extend beyond the Tees in the 1070's, and perhaps not even by 1086. Successive campaigns led by William I and his sons against the Scottish kingdom opened the way for feudal settlement in Northumberland at the end of the eleventh century, while the introduction of Benedictine monasticism into the Church of Durham in 1083 lessened the ties between its community and the native aristocracy.

The twelfth-century writer Symeon of Durham claimed that individual Benedictine monks were active at Durham as early as the 1020's. Aird argues that an ongoing Benedictine presence, combined with the wish of the secular priests to avoid being uprooted, accounts for the absence of any recorded reaction to the new dispensation. There remained a possibility that St. Cuthbert would be regarded as a Scottish saint, and his church as a Scottish bishopric, until in 1157 Malcolm IV ceded Northumbria and Cumbria to Henry II. Even so, Scots continued to venerate the cult of St. Cuthbert, and his church retained its lands in Scotland.

Aird's book is a tenurial and political study, but he draws attention to recent monographs and volumes of conference transactions on other aspects of the community's life over the same centuries. His bibliography includes a wide range of manuscript, primary and secondary sources, while his arguments are elucidated by numerous maps and figures. This is a major work which repays careful reading.

Emma Mason

Birkbeck College
University of London

The Kingdom of León-Castilla under King Alfonso VII, 1126-1157. By Bernard F. Reilly. [The Middle Ages Series.] (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press. 1998. Pp. xv, 431. $65.00.)

This volume completes a trilogy that encompasses the history of the Iberian kingdom of Leon-Castile from 1065 to 1157.Earlierworks(1982,1988) dealt with the reigns of Alfonso VI and his daughter Urraca. The present study extends through the reign of the grandson, Alfonso VII, and affords Bernard Reilly an opportunity to revisit a number of issues and to reflect upon the character of monarchy and government during the foundational century of this realm. The first four chapters are chronological in organization. They successively (1) summarize the reigns of Alfonso VLTs predecessors, (2) treat the difficulties of the succession, (3) explore Alfonso VIFs relations with the other Christian realms of Iberia, and (4) examine the king's contribution to the Hispanic reconquista. Five chapters are topical and treat (5) the institution of kingship, (6) the royal curia and counts, CJ) local officers of the crown, castellans, and merinos, (S) royal military and fiscal resources, (9) bishops and royal policy toward the Church, and (10) the towns and the appearance of concejos. The final chapter (1 1) is an appraisal of the king, who is judged to be strong, energetic, but above all traditional.

The work is well edited and helpfully places notes where they belong, at the foot of each page. Given the importance of place names, the absence of maps is bothersome, and puzzling is a subsequent reference to Ramiro II of Aragon (p. 61) as Sancho II.

Reilly's work is foundational, if sometimes unwieldy. On the one hand, it is pioneering in its efforts to reconstruct the diplomatic record—for the reign of Alfonso VII amounting to a thousand royal diplomas and another thousand private documents, which are calendared in an appendix and rated according to their trustworthiness. With this material, supplemented by the two narrative chronicles of the reign, Reilly provides a patient reconstruction of the royal itinerary, establishes a chronology of events, excavates the names of prominent nobles, bishops, and court officials, dates the larger meetings of the royal curia, and estimates the size of the royal army, its capabilities, and underlying needs and resources. Reilly admirably fulfills his stated objective of providing "an adequate history" of the reign; this will serve as the essential point of departure for any who seek to follow in his footsteps.

Reilly is a cautious historian who refuses to push his sources beyond any reasonable level of inference; indeed, there are frequent cautions about the reliability of underlying documentation. Consequently, apart from a few interesting discussions of episcopal, capitular, and military institutions, there is a reluctance to generalize and an aversion to the construction of models. Reilly would surely argue that such prudence is dictated by the paucity and character of the sources (principally property donations) and the personal and peripatetic nature of this kingship, whose institutions were only just beginning to crystalize. Yet, because the result of this sort of approach is an encyclopedic laying out of fact, this work will be useful principally to scholars as a work of reference; stu-

dents seeking a broader overview would be better directed toward other works, such as Reilly's earlier Contest of Christian and Muslim Spain (1992). Nevertheless, the entire trilogy, and this final volume in particular, is a remarkable achievement that provides a solid foundation for our understanding of this era of medieval Spanish history.

James William Brodman

University of Central Arkansas

The Letters of Hildegard of Bingen, Volume II. Translated by Joseph L. Baird and Radd K. Ehrman. (New York: Oxford University Press. 1998. Pp. xv, 215. $45.00.)

The appearance of the second volume of translations of Hildegard's letters, almost four years after the first (see ante, LXXXII [July, 1996], 542-543), is an event to be welcomed. It makes accessible, in readable and accurate translations, another tranche of Hildegard's correspondence. This volume includes letters to and from members of religious orders whose location can be established, starting with correspondents from Ellwangen and finishing, at letter 217, with Trier. The arrangement follows the order of Van Acker's critical edition, though for some reason the letters translated here do not reflect the total number of letters in his Volume II, which continues through to letter 250 from Zwiefalten. However, it does include Hildegard's very important correspondence with her last secretary, Guibert of Gembloux, in which she answers his questions about her visionary gift and method of writing. Also included is her correspondence with Abbot Ludwig of St. Eucharius, another helper of her latter years with whom she seems to have had a close relationship, and exchanges with her visionary protégée, the nun Elisabeth of Schönau.

Most of the letters come from men and women who are otherwise unidentified, though sometimes named (and sometimes not even named, though their location is specified, this being the criterion for inclusion). Here the editors might have provided more help for the reader. There is no consistent attempt to identify the senders or even the orders to which they belonged. In this connection their titles—whether abbot or provost, or less usually, provisor—might have been used to distinguish between personnel from Benedictine or Cistercian houses and those of the newer orders of canons. This distinction was not absolute, however, since the Richard described as "Abbot of Springiersbach" (letter 207) was actually head of a house of Augustinian canons. He was also—a fact not mentioned here—the brother of Tengswich of Andernach, whose critical letter to Hildegard (no. 52) was featured in the first volume. It would have been useful for the reader to have had the opportunity to compare their letters in the light of this relationship. Given the lack of identification of Hildegard's correspondents, inevitable in some cases, but apparently due to an editorial decision in others, the provision of a map would have indicated at least

their geographical distribution and helped to identify some of the more obscure places from which they wrote.

Finally, a comparison of the first and second volumes reveals a sad deterioration in the production values of Oxford University Press (New York). Not only is the paper of the present volume noticeably coarser, but in several places the text threatens to disappear off the bottom of the page. Despite this, the book costs a good deal more than the first volume. It is to be hoped that this trend may be reversed for the two further projected volumes of this most important work.

Sabina Flanagan

University of Melbourne, Australia

Vioice of the Living Light: Hildegard of Bingen and her World. Edited by Barbara Newman. (Berkeley: University of California Press. 1998. Pp. Lx, 278. $48.00 clothbound; $1995 paperback.)

As Barbara Newman outlines in her introduction to Voice of the Living Light, the aim of this collection is to "set Hildegard in context" without diminishing her exceptionality. The contributors to this volume are respected scholars in their fields, who each examine a facet of Hildegard's life and activity—from abbess and reformer to medical writer and composer. They explore the breadth and scope of her diverse interests and personal creativity against the social, religious, intellectual, and political backdrop of twelfth-century culture and society. This approach locates Hildegard within the traditions she inherited, while at the same time demonstrating how she stretched these boundaries to accommodate her unique perspective. The result is a richly documented and perceptively written collection that not only offers insight into the life of this woman, but into the lives of medieval religious women generally.

The influence of Hildegard's monastic background in shaping her outlook as abbess, religious thinker, and reformer is apparent in the essays addressing these aspects of the visionary's life. Constant Mews explores the relationship between her experience as a recluse and her cosmology, tracing the development of her religious thought through her visionary trilogy. John Van Engen examines Hildegard's gradual transition from recluse to abbess of her foundation at Rupertsberg, outlining the various administrative and pastoral roles she performed as "mother and teacher" and leader of her community. Joan Ferrante extends this discussion through an analysis of the visionary's extensive correspondence, which iUurnines the pastoral role Hildegard adopted for a wider monastic community. Kathryn Kerby-Fulton analyzes Hildegard's reforming aims and strident polemic in the context of contemporary intellectual trends and political events. She highlights the visionary's often radical approach, emphasizing how Hildegard drew on the traditions of apocalyptic prophecy to create and sustain her stance as prophet and reformer.

The essays addressing Hildegard as artist, medical writer, composer, and poet provide sound scholarship into areas of her activity that have long been the mainstay of contemporary popularizing of Hildegard as a "new age" figure. Florence Eliza Glaze provides an important overview and analysis of Hildegard's medical writings, situating them within monastic practice and the intellectual trends of the twelfth century. Madeline Caviness discusses how the inherently visual quality of Hildegard's thought is represented through the relationship between text and image in the Scivias illuminations. Margot Fassler and Barbara Newman provide complementary studies on Hildegard as composer and poet. They emphasize the unity of words and music in her compositions, demonstrating how these compositions contributed to her wider educational and didactic program for the Rupertsberg community.

A particular strength of this collection is the way in which seemingly disparate areas of Hildegard's intellectual and spiritual creativity are explored within the overarching framework of her vision of God's divinity incarnate in the created world. Each essay offers a critical and original perspective on Hildegard's social, cultural, and religious context, and as a whole the interrelationships and resonances between the different facets of her extensive oeuvre emerge. Thus aspects of her activity previously viewed as marginal to her visionary writing, or marginalized by the scholarly overemphasis on the textual aspects of her work, are explored as different expressions of the cosmology articulated so effectively in her visionary trilogy. This collection is a valuable addition to the field of Hildegard studies that will also have broad appeal to readers interested in the twelfth century.

Juue Hotchin

Aranda, Australia

The Latin Church in Cyprus, 1195-1312. By Nicholas Coureas. (Brookfield, Vermont: Ashgate Publishing. 1997. Pp. xiv, 361. $76.95.)

Although several important articles on aspects of the history of the Latin Church in Cyprus have been published in recent years, the only extended treatment of the subject has hitherto been that of Hackett, whose History of the Orthodox Church of Cyprus appeared in 1901. A monograph on this important but neglected topic is thus very welcome.

Cyprus had been Byzantine until Richard I annexed it in 1191, and the Franks who subsequently settled there under the Lusignan kings were always in a minority. Pope Celestine ?? set up a Latin Church there in 1195, but it had few secular clergy—the Archbishop of Nicosia and his suffragans at Famagusta, Limassol, and Paphos, together with the chaplains of Frankish noblemen and a few parish priests. The Catholic monastic establishment, on the other hand, was far larger than the size of the Frankish population warranted because many of the communities in the Crusader States founded daughter-houses in Cyprus as places of

refuge should the need arise. Despite this, the newly founded mendicant Orders were welcomed by the Franks in Cyprus because their pastoral training enabled them to meet the needs of a predominantly urban Catholic population.

The Templars and the Hospitallers also founded houses in the island and inevitably became embroiled in dynastic power struggles. After 1291 both Orders moved their headquarters there, and given their international resources, might have grown more powerful than the crown. This did not happen, for the Templars were dissolved in 1312, while the Hospitallers moved their headquarters to Rhodes in 1310 (although they continued to draw considerable revenues from their Cypriot properties).

The Greek population of Cyprus were all members of the Orthodox Church of the island, which had been declared autocephalous by the Council of Ephesus in 431. Although Coureas rightly says that the Western Church had no concept of autocephaly the papacy did respect the Council's decision by making the Latin Church in Cyprus directly subject to the Holy See. In accordance with the custom of the Kingdom of Jerusalem the Popes treated the Orthodox of Cyprus as members of the Catholic Church, but vested all authority in the Latin hierarchy, merely retaining four Orthodox coadjutor bishops to assist their Latin colleagues. This caused great resentment, and anti-Latin feeling was exacerbated in 1231 when thirteen Orthodox monks were burned at the stake for refusing to accept the validity of the Latin eucharist. As Coureas points out: "This incident was the only recorded instance of Orthodox Christians in the Latin east suffering martyrdom at the hands of their Latin co-religionists . . ."

Innocent IV's proposal that the Orthodox of Cyprus should form a uniate church, directly subject to the Holy See, foundered because of opposition from the Latin bishops, but although Alexander IV's Constitutio Cypria of 1260 subordinated the Orthodox hierarchy to the Latins once more, it proved difficult to implement because the Lusignan kings were not prepared to antagonize the Greek population by enforcing it.

There are inevitably a few minor errors in the text which will need to be corrected in subsequent editions: for example, Vartan, who drew up the profession of faith for Innocent IV in 1246, was not King of Armenia, but a vartaped (theologian) of King Hethum I. Coureas also needs to offer more guidance about the composition of the Gestes des Chiprois and its relation to the Chronicle of Amadi. But overall this is a solid achievement and the author is particularly to be congratulated for the even-handed way in which he deals with the controversial issues of Catholic-Orthodox relations. I hope that this will be the first in a series of volumes by him, covering the history of the Latin Church in Cyprus until 1571.

Bernard Hamilton

University of Nottingham

The Flowering of Mysticism: Men and Women in the New Mysticism (1200-/350). Volume III of The Presence of God: A History of Western Christian Mysticism. By Bernard McGinn. (New York: Crossroad/Herder. 1998. Pp. xv, 526. $60.00.)

The present book is the third volume of a projected five-volume work treating the history of Western Christian mysticism. McGinn singles out the year 1200 as one of particular importance in the development of what he calls the new mysticism. In this context, he understands mysticism to be concerned with the "notion of consciousness of God's presence in a deeper and more immediate way" (p. xi). This understanding of the term has the advantage of allowing the author to treat a significant range of religious phenomena of an experiential nature under this more general definition.

The volume opens with an introduction that lays out the broader historical context for the material to be treated. One of the very significant factors in the movement from the earlier Christian tradition into the thirteenth century is the move from a spirituality characterized strongly by withdrawal to a monastic setting to a spirituality that is lived in the world outside the monastery. Significant in this regard is the rise of the mendicant Orders, and particularly the early struggle of St. Francis of Assisi. Should his way be one of withdrawal as a hermit, or should he go through the world preaching the Gospel? In a Franciscan text from the early thirteenth century known as the Sacred Exchange, the entire world is seen as a cloister for the friars. Later in the century, and going into the fourteenth, Meister Eckhart could insist that "God could be found, directly and decisively, anywhere and by anyone" (p. 14). McGinn sees this as a movement from a view of action and contemplation as successive steps in a life dedicated to God to a sense that the two could be fused in the context of public activity. Margaret of Cortona is a powerful example of one who was able to combine exceptional asectic and mystical practices even while being engaged in such public affairs as founding a hospital for the poor.

Another significant element that could lead one to speak of a new mysticism is the place played by women after the year 1200. This is not to say that women played no role in earlier Christian history. But it is to underscore the fact that written evidence for such a role is meager. And when the evidence becomes more plentiful, as it does in the thirteenth century, one is struck by the diversity among the women. This makes it difficult to argue for a single form of women's mysticism as distinct from a male form. In fact, McGinn chooses not to do so. Rather, he chooses the idea of a "conversation" between male and female mystics as a helpful model for understanding the relation between them. And even when we have written evidence from women mystics, it is often the case that this comes not directly from the women themselves, but from their male admirers. The origin of the well-known text of The Book of Angela is an excellent example of this sort of collaboration between a female ecstatic and a male cleric. Thus, what may be presented as the writing of a woman may, in fact, be

the view of a male writer about what he thought was significant in the life of the woman. To what extent this corresponds to the woman's self-understanding is problematic. But despite this sort of problem, it seems in the long run that such co-operation between male and female mystics led to the enrichment of both.

A third element in this historical period is the development of new literary forms and the expanded use of the vernacular. There were academic forms of theological development characteristic of the emerging universities. In that context, one moves from the common monastic lectio of the sacred text with a running commentary to new forms such as the quaestio drawn out in a highly dialectical fashion. The language of the university culture was Latin. During the same period, the developments in the area of mysticism led to new literary forms that were less dialectical in nature and to the more extensive use of the vernacular. These two factors contributed much to the variety to be found in the mystical literature.

Beyond these general observations, the treatment of individual persons with samples of texts is exceptionally rich and diverse. The treatment of the Franciscans, for example, ranges from Francis himself to the highly speculative theologian, Bonaventura; and then to David of Augsburg, and on to the poetic style of Jacopone da Todi and the theological, analytical concern of Ramon Hull. The discussion of women covers the early Franciscan women such as Clare of Assist, Douceline of Digne, Margaret of Cortona, and Angela of Foligno; and three great béguines, Hadewijch, Mechthild of Magdeburg, and Marguerite Porete. The final chapter discusses women mystics in a number of monastic Orders and among the Dominicans. The next volume in this series will move on to the speculative mysticism that appeared later in the century, for example, in the work of Meister Eckhart.

This study is richly researched and documented with primary and secondary literature as evidenced in 143 pages of footnotes and a forty-page bibliography. It is truly a monumental work, and without doubt will be a standard source for any serious study of the Western Christian mystical tradition for many years in the future.

Zachary Hayes, O.F.M.

Catholic Theological Union
Chicago, Illinois

The Letters and Charters of Cardinal Guala Bicchieri, Papal Legate in England, 1216-1218. Edited by Nicholas Vincent. [The Canterbury and York Society, Volume LXXXIII.] (Rochester, New York: The Boydell Press. 1996. Pp. xcvi, 193. $45.00.)

The thirty-month-long legatine mission to England of Guala Bicchieri certainly coincided with political events of considerable consequence: the deepening of baronial revolt against King John, foreign invasion by the rebels' ally

(Louis of France, the future Louis VIII), John's death and his son Henry's disputed succession, the creation of a viable minority government for the new child-king, royalist victory in the ensuing civil war, and the pacification of the country. Historians have long known that Guala's activities to assist the royalist cause—for such was the job assigned him by his superiors, Popes Innocent III and Honorius III—had been considerable. Now Nicholas Vincent of Christ Church College, Canterbury, has exhaustively quarried the letters and other written notices regarding this legation, thereby contributing considerably to our understanding of the politics and diplomacy of the time as well as the relationship between the papacy and English church.

The volume comprises two large parts: a sixty-four-page-long introductory essay, which reviews Guala's biography and the history of his English legation, and the acta (letters to and from Guala, contemporary written references about him by others) relating to his mission (including appendices one and two). In the former part Vincent ranges through a comprehensive variety of topics: the nature of papal legation during the early thirteenth century, Guala's peacemaking activities in England, the legate's relations and interactions with the local episcopate and religious houses, his legitimate—albeit controversial—levying of taxes (procurations) on individual English churches and prelates to finance his mission, his harsh punishment of those English clergy who rebelled against John and young Henry, Guala's contribution to the later practice of papal provision, the legate's judicial activities, his role as a propagator of ecclesiastical reform, his entourage and their activities, and the form and style of the epistolary documents that Guala and his clerks produced.

A Lombard from Vercelli, Guala made his first recorded appearance in 1187 as cathedral canon in that city. Although he was later styled in iure civili peritissimus by an English chronicler, we know practically nothing regarding his education. Vincent suggests that Guala's subsequently attested judicial expertise and his ownership of many theological books might indicate some formal training in both law and theology. Innocent III named him cardinal-deacon of S. Maria in Porticu in 1205, and Guala spent the next years in a variety of curial activities, including two legatine missions (to northern Italy in 1206 and to France in 1208-09). Sometime in 1210-11 he was promoted to cardinal-priest of S. Martino in Montibus. Guala was among the participants at Innocent's great Lateran Council, where most probably he received the pope's appointment to his English legation. In the aftermath of the extorted issue of Magna Carta and the deterioration of the political situationjohn had requested that Innocent send a legate. For his part the pope urgently desired peace in England and between the French and English kings in order to rally crusading support for embattled Latin Outremer; Innocent was also mindful of his role as John's feudal overlord. When the pope died in July, 1216, his successor, Honorius III, maintained his predecessor's policy and reappointed Guala.

The legate departed from Rome in late February, 1216; after a fruitless attempt to enlist the French King Philip II's support in restraining his son Louis

from military support for rebellious EngEsh barons, Guala finally arrived in England on May 20. As the civil war intensified and Louis invaded the kingdom with a French army, the legate acted forcefully as the leading clerical supporter of the royalist cause. He could operate in this fashion as an instrument of the pope's policy in the vacuum caused by Archbishop Langton's suspension and exile. Guala excommunicated Louis and his troops; he confirmed the excommunications of English rebels and interdicted their lands and the churches located therein. Similar penalties also befell their Scottish and Welsh allies. Excommunicated rebel clerics and religious especially felt the legate's wrath, for Guala deprived them of their churches and ecclesiastical offices and oversaw the conferral of these now vacant benefices on new incumbents, whether English royalist clerics or foreigners—often Italians of his own household, kindred, or acquaintance. Even John's death in October, 1216, signaled no let-up: Guala became on-site guardian to young Henry III and defacto, if not de iure, co-regent of the kingdom together with William Marshal.

In the course of the struggle the legate transformed the royalist cause into a quasi-crusade. Before the crucial military victory at Lincoln (May, 1217) he even granted the royalist host a plenary indulgence. As the tide turned in the royalists' favor, Guala scotched one attempt at rapprochement in order to secure terms even more unfavorable to rebel clergy. An active participant in concluding the Treaty of Lambeth (September, 1217) that ended hostilities, the legate administered penalties and absolution on Louis and his Frenchmen; he also established his despoliation of rebel clergy and his rebestowal of their benefices as irrevocable. Guala terminated his legation in September, 1218, departed England the next month, and took a leisurely months-long return journey to Rome. Apart from his English mission, his other enduring achievement occurred at this time, namely, the foundation in Vercelli of the abbey of S. Andrea, a house of regular canons. The cardinal spent the remaining eight years of his life mostly in routine curial activities, although Honorius sent him once again in the summer of 1225 on legation to southern Italy to negotiate with Frederick II Hohenstaufen regarding the latter's departure on crusade. His last important act was to participate in the election of Gregory LX (March, 1227): Guala died weeks later on May 31·

As noted above, Vincent offers many interesting observations. A papal legate like Guala could be kept under close papal control both by his authorizing mandate and by the potential for complaint by disgruntled parties within his legation area. Vincent notes that although Guala proved very effective in fulfilling direct papal injunctions as far as he was able, "the basic outline of his legation was determined in Rome" (p. xlix); nonetheless, as legate he was also relatively free to determine how and with what intensity these policy objectives were implemented on the local scene. His harsh punishments for rebel clergy and his participation in the reissue of a "sanitized" Magna Carta well illustrated a certain freedom of maneuver, as did also his role in the elections to vacated bishoprics and abbacies. In this latter capacity Guala worked very closely with royal

authorities to ensure that loyal men were placed in four vacated sees and that a royalist bishop could transfer from one see to another. In Langton's absence the legate worked relatively harmoniously with the remaining English bishops. As for religious houses, Vincent is certainly correct to draw attention to the legate's pronounced favoritism for Austin canons: half of the judges known to have received cases delegated from Guala were of that order, as were the allegedly dissolute cathedral canons of Carlisle whom the legate spared even though Honorius had ordered their dispersal.

English chroniclers such as Matthew Paris and Roger of Wendover made much of Guala's allegedly extortionate levy of "support fees" or procurations from the prelates and religious houses that he visited on legation. Vincent's survey of the incomplete surviving evidence indicates that, on the contrary, the legate was moderate and restrained in exacting the support that canon law permitted. That is not to say that Guala was ever short of funds; he was a rich man before embarking to England, and he had the opportunity as legate to collect many gifts and "sweeteners" from clergy, religious, and laity who desired his friendship and support. Guala certainly did not, Vincent observes, become poorer on account of his mission. Chroniclers also complained regarding his policy of ecclesiastical patronage, that is, both the despoliation of benefices and advowson rights from rebel clergy and patrons (both lay and religious) as well as the reconferral of vacant benefices and the exercise of lapsed patronage. Although the wholesale upheavals reported by his detractors were manifest exaggerations, Guala's interventions in such matters were both numerous and of long-term consequence, pre-empting any ultimate amnesty for rebel clergy and thus setting the harsh terms, as far as the English church was concerned, of the ultimate royalist victory.

The chroniclers also exaggerated somewhat the extent to which the legate himself collated or provided new incumbents to vacant benefices; the evidence nonetheless suggests that where the legate was active in this regard, fellow north Italians and his own kin (nephews and such) figured prominently among the beneficiaries, along with English members of his entourage and other English royalists. But Vincent places Guala's role in promoting the influx of Italian clergy into English churches and offices within context. English prelates and religious houses had for some time patronized cardinals and curial officials with grants of benefices and prebends. John's surrender of the kingdom to the Roman Church and the subsequent legation of Nicholas of Tusculum (12?–?4) accelerated the process whereby papal requests of English benefices for alien recipients became more frequent. For Vincent the contribution of Guala to this acceleration was a considerable intrusion of Italian clerks and thus a boost to the later practice of papal provision.

Concerned as he was with political, military, and disciplinary concerns, it is no surprise that Guala did not find opportunity, so soon after the Fourth Lateran Council, for much synodal legislation of his own in England. Regarding certain matters—for example, keeping episcopal vacancies short, protecting church

land from royal taxation, encouraging regular provincial chapters of monastic orders, and fostering the crusade while protecting crusaders' rights and properties—the legate encouraged Lateran norms. Other aspects of the council's legislation, such as the prohibition of clerical participation in the ordeal, played no role in his activities. Indeed, Guala's close co-operation with secular authorities regarding the filling of episcopal vacancies seemed to run directly counter to the council's prohibition of lay intrusion. On a related front, Guala was the second attested legate to England who subdelegated cases to local ecclesiastical judges; Vincent identifies at least eleven separate instances, all in minor disputes where at least one litigant had solicited his intervention. Guala's subdelegations closely resembled papal forms and practices; the decisions reached seemed to find enforcement without further appeal. One slight difference of form lay in the fact that the legate often named fewer judges (two instead of three) to a panel, a practice probably derived from Guala's superior knowledge of local circumstances and the suitability of potential judges.

Vincent caps off his introductory essay with some observations regarding the legate's household and chancerial practices. Especially noteworthy here were the mixture of papal and Anglo-French secretarial styles, the legate's sensitivity to local English epistolary conventions, and the editor's own detailed analyses of the ordinary features of Guala's letters. Space in this review precludes more than a sounding of the legatine acta assembled by Vincent in the second part of the volume. They include items of administration such as deprivations of benefice (#2, 61), collations (#54, 121) and institutions (#5, 46) to benefices, dispensations to hold benefices in plurality (#24, 135), provisions to a bishopric (#12, 22), confirmation of episcopal election (#139), confirmation of appropriations of churches by religious houses (#8, 47, 75), mandates to judge-delegates (#9, 63-64, 78, 120), and mandates to conduct inquests (#91, 103). Sometimes Guala wrote simply to inform the pope, for example, regarding John's death (#86) or the inadequacy of the cathedral site in Old Sarum (#170). The pope would order his legate to enforce mandates (#181), hear and transmit testimony (#160), or visit and correct exempt religious houses (#162). Although Innocent's initial written appointment of Guala is no longer extant, Honorius's letter of reappointment (#168) is of interest to this reviewer as an indication of the temporal limits of legation. Especially prominent among the acta were also matters of political import: excommunications (#56) and absolutions (#57) of Louis and his supporters and the penances imposed upon them (#59), disposition of exchange of royal hostages (#82-83) and of custody of a royal castle (#70-71), and grants of safe conduct (#123). Guala played a crucial role in Henry III's coronation (#36), in the reissues of Magna Carta and the Charter of the Forest (#37-39), and in the conclusion of the Treaties of Lambeth (#58) and of Worcester (#125). In this volume Vincent has provided a comprehensive document collection and an insightful study of an important medieval legation.

Robert C. Figueira

Lander University

Urban V. (1362-1370): Kirchenreform zwischen Kardinalkollegium, Kurie, und Klientel. By Ludwig Vones. [Päpste und Papsttum, Volume 28.] (Stuttgart: Anton Hiersemann. 1998. Pp. xii, 719. DM 340.)

Raised from an abbacy to the throne of St. Peter without having been either bishop or cardinal, and after a career in which his most notable role had been as a legate in Italy, Guillaume Grimoard succeeded Innocent VI as Pope Urban V in 1362. One of the succession of Avignon popes, in 1367 he led the papacy back to Italy. This proved to be only a temporary shift: in 1370 he would return to Avignon, to die. A few years later the first examination began in his process of canonization, but beatification was delayed until 1870.

In this massive tome, Ludwig Vones offers a detailed dissection of aspects of the pontificate, in a revised version of his Habilitationsschrift of 1994. Following a lengthy introduction, establishing a broad context (with a strong focus on reform movements and eschatology), the volume divides into three parts. The first, at just under a hundred pages, tackles the pope's family, tracing the genealogy and inheritance from the thirteenth to the sixteenth centuries. Here Urban himself plays only a minor part, although his early career merits some twenty pages. In the nature of genealogical studies, there is little debate or argument here, the stress being very firmly on establishing facts and tracing a succession. The second section (pp. 147-309) treats Urban Vs election as pope in 1362, and his dealings with the College of Cardinals, paying particular attention to his appointments to the College and his policy on the cardinals' benefices. The third part (pp. 31 1-457) considers the personnel surrounding the pope; his involvement in monastic reform (notably at St-Victor at Marseilles and Montecassino); his fostering of universities; and preparations for the return to Rome. A final consideration (pp. 459-487) summarizes Urban's reform policy in the context of the Church as a whole.

This is a major study, but by no means a full dissection of the pontificate. The focus is very much on concerns in the curia, only moving to a larger canvas when assessing particular aspects. Events in southern Italy accordingly gain prominence as they connect with factional divisions among the cardinals; England comes to the fore when considering the problem of benefices and clerical careers; Germany and eastern Europe are important in the discussion of universities. There is, however, no comprehensive analysis of the pope's impact on international politics, for instance, in the diplomacy of the Anglo-French conflicts. Vones spreads his net widely; in consequence Urban himself often sinks from sight: pages pass with nary a mention. Although Guillaume Grimoard's pre-papal career receives some attention in the section on family history, he does not dominate that part of the book. Although he would eventually emerge as a compromise candidate from outside the Sacred College, in the analysis of the conclave he is a minor player in relation to the aims and factioneering of the main protagonists. Elsewhere, he often gets lost in the contexts, or in the background to a situation—a somewhat elusive main character.

Vones certainly aims to be exhaustive, especially in his referencing. The volume is massively—indeed, dauntingly and overwhelmingly—documented: footnotes must account for at least half of the printed area of the main text. The scale of the referencing often appears excessive, if not self-indulgent—but it does mean that the notes are potentially also extremely useful in other areas. Potted biographies abound. These are clearly necessary and central to the genealogical analysis; they also appear regularly elsewhere, especially when discussing the people associated with the pope. This prosopographical approach is at its extreme at pages 350-354: a single sentence consisting of a list of names (which actually starts on p. 349), occupying twenty lines of text, with notes which are almost exclusively biographies. The bibliography is comprehensive, to put it mildly; the list of printed material, primary and secondary, extends to over 100 pages. The foreword says that the original thesis has been cut in places, but further pruning would not seriously have damaged the analysis. Three appendices in turn print a selection of documents concerning the pope's family; list the benefices in monastic houses held (or, rather, given up) by cardinals during the pontificate; and provide genealogies to illustrate the text. After such meticulous detail, the index comes as something of a disappointment: it is restricted to names and places.

The scholarship displayed in this volume is impressive, and it contains much to be quarried. This is a book which no one working on the Avignon papacy can afford to ignore; whether anyone can afford to buy it is another matter entirely.

R. N. Swanson

University of Birmingham

Joan of Arc. Her Story. By Régine Pernoud (tl998) and Marie-Véronique Clin. Translated and revised by Jeremy duQuesnay Adams. Edited by Bonnie Wheeler. (New York: St. Martin's Press. 1998. Pp. xxiii, 304. $27.95.)

In her short life, Joan of Arc was co-opted by opposing forces that sought to use her for their own ends. Since then, she has been hailed as a French nationalist, scorned as a monarchist, prayed to as saint and martyr, championed and pilloried as a feminist and cross-dresser, and honored as a prisoner-of-war. But scholarly and popular authors often consider Joan through their eyes, not hers. By contrast, Régine Pernoud, founding director of the Centre Jeanne d'Arc in Orléans, and Marie-Véronique Clin, director of the Musée d'Histoire de la Médecine in Paris, first published this book as Jeanne d'Arc (Paris: Librairie Arthème Fayard, 1986) to put Joan back in her time. Pernoud is the author or editor of more than three dozen books on Joan and her trials, and thus a scholar steeped in the historical record she often quotes liberally here. Her final work is an act of exegesis from the record that combats the frequent eisegesis coloring Joan.

This volume is divided into three parts. The first is largely a chronicle of Joan's story. From her first appearance at Vaucouleurs where Robert de Baudricourt told the male relative with whom she traveled to slap Joan and take her home, we follow Joan to the dauphin and through military successes, capture, trial, and execution. The trial in 1456 that nullified her earlier condemnation is also described. There is some satisfaction in this chapter, especially given the venom with which Bishop Pierre Cauchon, his colleagues, and their Parisian advisers treated Joan. They distorted her responses, denied her appeal to the pope, and conducted a procedure that was so irregular in so many ways that its verdict was easily reversed, especially given the testimony of a large number of witnesses from 1431 who were still alive to set the record straight a quarter century later. The book's second part is a series of sixty-nine character portraits of the three principal nobles in Joan's story (Charles VII, Henry VI, and Philip the Good, Duke of Burgundy), their subjects, and Joan's Rouen judges. The entries in this and the book's third part are arranged in double columns that function like an encyclopedia. The third part considers eighteen contentious images and issues, including Joan's name, family, impostors, trial records, and appearances in popular culture. Appendices provide texts of Joan's letters in French and English, a timeline, maps, and schematics of important cities and castles in her life. Adams has added his own preface, several of the character portraits (notably the entry on Philip the Good), and an excellent prelude that in five pages makes sense of the enormously complex and overlapping loyalties of the French civil war, the Hundred Years' War, and the Great Western Schism. Adams reworked and updated the bibliography, but he still directs readers to the original bibliography in the 1986 French edition because of its analysis of sources.

Joan of Arc: Her Story will serve the general public well and be put to very good use in the classroom. The lack of notes, while annoying, is partially amended by the informal hints and suggestions the authors include along the way. This volume functions as a primer on Joan for undergraduate and graduate students: its three parts tell the story clearly and reflect its natural drama without being cloying, give detailed accounts of the players, and judiciously deal with key controversies. It may be considered the place to begin for novices as well as a resource of measured conclusions and future directions for more advanced readers.

Christopher M. Beixitto

St. Joseph's Seminary, Dunwoodie

The Preacher's Demons. Bernardino of Siena and the Social Underworld of Early Renaissance Italy. By Franco Mormando. (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press. 1999- Pp. xvi, 364. $29.00.)

As is clearly shown in this well-written, thoroughly documented study, few historical figures of fifteenth-century Italy have come up smelling like roses at

the hands of historians quite like the Observant Franciscan, Bernardino of Siena. But in fact, Bernardino was a rhetorical assassin, encouraging his listeners to denounce and even to kill those who did not meet with his approval. To prove this point, Franco Mormando begins with a solid overview of the Bernardinian manuscript and printed tradition. He then proceeds to study in separate chapters the preacher's attitudes toward witches, sodomites, and Jews. There is little new here regarding Bernardino for those scholars who have studied any of these three topics in fifteenth-century Italy, though Mormando's discovery that the preacher largely steered clear of denouncing Jews, certainly on papal urging, is significant. Still, the cumulative impact of this overview of Bernardino's sermonizing in these areas will be profound for all readers. Mormando shows us a preacher who imagined the smoke of a witch's flesh to be incense offered the Christian God! Bernardino was indeed a mordant poet of the Christian grotesque!

In a couple of pages the author tries to explain the Bernardinian phenomenon as resulting from the sense of crisis that enveloped his age—schism and the like, but that argument is circular; the author's heart is in the telling and not the explaining. More seriously, he argues that in all three areas examined, Bernardino's sermons fomented the onset of a persecutorial age to come. For example, he can show that Bernardino's attacks against same-sex sexuality (he rightly avoids the term homosexuality) led certain cities to initiate new laws against sodomites, while the witch craze of the later fifteenth century was stimulated in part, the author argues, by the preacher's denunciations before that time.

I would like to note certain reservations I have about this generally solid work. First, there is the uncertainty about the subject matter of the book. Despite its subtitle, this is not a book about the "social underworld of early Renaissance Italy." Bernardino's sermons may have been directed, as the author at one time says they are, at the urban middle class (p. 22), or, as he states elsewhere, at a "largely plebeian humanity" (p. 44). But neither in terms of audience nor in terms of subject matter is the social underworld addressed.

This uncertainty about the subject matter of the book becomes particularly relevant when Mormando repeatedly insists that the witches, sodomites, and money lenders Bernardino denounced were "outsiders." As Michael Rocke has convincingly shown, in Florence at least, those who did engage or had engaged in same-sex behavior, represented a majority of the city's male population.1 In fact, as Bernardino himself repeatedly states, most of his male listeners were guilty of that "crime."

This leads me to the book's greatest weakness: the presumption that Bernardino's listeners played a largely passive role in the reception of his sermons. For the purposes of his argument, it is necessary for the author to insist on this top-down homiletic model, in which the preacher drums away and the audience slowly if imperfectly absorbs his message—thus the "influence" of the

'Forbidden Friendships: Homosexuality and Male Culture in Renaissance Florence (Oxford, 1996).

preacher. But as the author indirectly intuits, that is not how all sermons worked. Mormando notes that Bernardino's declamations had no apparent effect in either Siena or Florence, sites of the preacher's repeated exhortations. Why? Because, I believe, in the successful contemporary sermon "devotees raised their voices with questions for the preacher, slowly effecting a dialectic of emotion and intellect between them and bringing the church to life. Cries of Amen] and Misericordia), rhythmic and tearful wailing, and agitated but increasingly coordinated bodily movements closed the psychic distance between pulpit and audience. . . ."[2] In short, in this excellent book, the question that goes unanswered is: How might his audience "play with" the great preacher, and thus "discount" the effects of his sermons?

Richard C. Trexler

State University of New York, Binghamton

Concilio e papato nel Rinascimento (1449-1516): Un problema irrisolto. By Aldo Landi. [Studi Storici.] (Turin: Claudiana Editrice. 1997. Pp. 472, with 70 illustrations apart from the text, of which 15 are in full color, and 32 illustrations in the text. Lire 62.000 paperback.)

This is a history of the Council of Pisa-Milan-Asti-Lyons (1511-12) and of all that led up to it since the time of the previous council. Aldo Landi demonstrates that Nicholas Vs victory over conciliarism, as registered in the dissolution of the Council of Basel-Lausanne (1431-1449), was not complete; Europe did not suddenly convert to papalism. If the popes secured the abolition of Basel's legacy by abrogations of the Pragmatic Sanction of Bourges (1438) and of the Acceptance of Mainz (1439) and their replacement by concordats and political agreements negotiated with French and German rulers, many intellectuals still espoused conciliarist ideas, and rulers throughout Europe continued to appeal to councils when in disputes with the popes. Many canonists and theologians held that power in the Church should be exercised collegially, that the pope's power was limited by that of the cardinals (Andrea Barbazza) or bishops (Juan de Segovia). Civil rulers from across Europe so often ignored the prohibition of Pius II's Execrabilis (1460) against appeals to a council that it is difficult to claim that this decree was received and observed. Papal efforts to reform the Church were so few and ineffective that people looked to councils as the only solution. Scandalous behavior by Renaissance popes, culminating in the bellicose conduct of Julius II (1503-1513), led some reform-minded cardinals supported by the rulers of France and the Empire to convoke a reform council to meet in Pisa in 1511.

The first half of Landi's study is a rereading of the history of the Renaissance papacy that highlights conciliarist resistance to its growing power achieved

[2] R. Trexler, Public Life in Renaissance Florence (New York, 1980), p. 117.

through alliances with princes and leadership of the crusade effort. If Landi's style of presentation is reminiscent of the Annales of Cesare Baronio and Oderico Rainaldi with its year-by-year and European-wide narrative, the content of his account resembles the Magdeburg Centuries with its assiduous assembling of the criticisms of heretics and any references to councils. Landi goes beyond the summarizing of the views of conciliarist and papalist theologians and canonists as found in Olivier de la Brosse's Le pape et le concile (1965), Remigius Bäumer's Nachwirkungen des konziliaren Gedankens (1971), and Ulrich Horst's Zwischen Konziliarismus und Reformation (1985) to include writers ignored by them (e.g., Martino Garati da Lodi, Galgano Borghese, Bernard de Rousier, Pedro de Osma, Girolamo Massaino, and Vincent Gigault), to look at the views of ordinary lay persons, prophets, and politicians, and to examine carefully the course of events. His perspective is notably Florentine. By lumping together strictly conciliarist ideas with any call for a council, he is able to claim wide support for councils. Given this seemingly remarkable support for a general council, his explanation for the failure of Andrea Zamometic's effort to convene such a council in Basel in 1481 seems inadequate. Did politicians really support a conciliar model of church government, or were calls for a council mostly ploys to extract concessions from the pope?

The second half of Landi's book is devoted to the Council of Pisa. He goes well beyond the earlier treatments of it by Louis Sandret (1883) and Joseph Hergenröther (1887) by including modern studies on the motivations of the individuals involved in the council and by tracing the complicated political maneuverings of the pope and Christian rulers with extensive help from Augustin Renaudet's Le Concile Gallican de Pise-Milan (1922) that summarizes and transcribes documents in Florentine archives. Landi wants the council judged by the manifested intentions of its protagonists and not exclusively by narrow canonical norms designed to protect papal prerogatives. He notes that the council sought to come to an accord with the pope on celebrating the council in neutral territory, but Julius II refused to grant a safeconduct to its messengers. Rather than a politically motivated King Louis XII of France or a supposedly ambitious Cardinal Bernardino López de Carvajal being the driving forces behind the council, Landi's sources show Cardinal Guillaume Briçonnet as its strongest advocate. Why this former royal financier and family man should have become a leading proponent of church reform is unclear. Why did he make a vow to God and promise his colleagues to back the council? Were the conciliarist arguments of Zacearía Ferren that he heard in Milan prior to convoking the council that convincing? When citing the acta of the council, Landi uses the 1612 edition with no apparent awareness of its deficiencies, despite his references to studies where these are noted. Thus he claims that there is no information available on what happened at the tenth session in Lyons (p. 359), but the acta of the council for the general congregations of May 4 and June 4, 1512, in Milan, for the ninth session in Asti on June 12, for the tenth session in Lyons on July 6, and for the first anniversary celebration in Lyons on November 1,1512, have been published as Decreta sacrosanctae tertiae pisanae Synodi

praelibate de eius e Mediolano translatione (Sigs. A[i]'- [iii]v; Renaudet, Préréforme et humanisme à Paris [1494-1517], p. 552, n. 2, suggests Lyons as the place of publication sometime after November, 1512, and notes this edition in the Vatican collection). Landi also fails to note or cite my "Healing of the Pisan Schism" (1984, 1993), which contains important information and transcription of documents, e.g., detailing Leo X's efforts to have former conciliarists repent of their "heresy." Landi ends his account with Francis I's successful campaign, overcoming conciliarist resistance, to have the parlements of France register the Concordat of Bologna and thus terminate any significant political support for conciliarism. His claim that the collégial exercise of authority in the Church remains to this day an unresolved problem ignores the various collégial structures (e.g., synods of bishops, regional and national conferences of bishops, priest senates, parish councils, etc.) introduced into the Catholic Church after Vatican Council II.

Nelson H. Minnich

The Catholic University ofAmerica

Early Modern European

The Spanish Inquisition: An Historical Revision. By Henry Kamen. (London: Weidenfeld and Nicolson; New Haven: Yale University Press. 1998. Pp. xii, 369. $35.00.)

The dust jacket correctly notes that "thirty-five years ago Kamen wrote a study of the Inquisition that received high praise." But nowhere, not even in its bibliography (which includes four other books published by Kamen since 1980), does it mention Kamen's 1985 work, published by Indiana University Press, entitled Inquisition and Society in Spain in the 16th and 17th Centuries (a revised Spanish version appeared one year later). The author's unusual act of self-censorship seems oddly appropriate in a world-class expert on an institution which boasted old Europe's most effective censorship machinery. Because a great deal of scholarship, much of it good scholarship, has appeared in this past dozen years, the work reviewed here represents exactly what its subtitle suggests: it is an extensive revision of Kamen's previous book, which in turn was a major reworking of Kamen's original book on the Spanish Inquisition from the 1960's. A quick comparison should help scholars and libraries who own the 1985 Kamen (or its 1986 Spanish version) decide whether or not to purchase the 1998 edition.

Both books are almost exactly the same length and divided into fourteen chapters, most of which bear either the same or very similar titles in 1998, although often in different order; one of them (chapter 7 in 1985 and 11 in 1998), dealing with Spain's notorious "purity of blood" laws, actually has very little to do with the Inquisition, which neither originated these laws nor applied them consistently. Between 1985 and 1998, Kamen has rewritten a great deal of his

text in order to produce an updating of what was then and is now the standard English-language synthesis about Spain's notorious Holy Office. For example, Kamen's first chapter is entirely new, while his second, although approximately the same length as before, has expanded from 48 footnotes to 113, primarily because of the volume of work commemorating the 500th anniversary of the expulsion of Spanish Jewry. Other chapters about topics less intensively studied in recent years have been less thoroughly reworked, but even those on the Moriscos or on inquisitorial trials and punishments have kept only half of the earlier text and footnotes. Kamen's bibliography includes thirty titles published since 1985, and his notes suggest how often he has drawn information from some recent authors, including the father of Israel's former prime minister and also this reviewer. Diligent as he is, however, even Kamen can't read everything, and his bibliography omits a few important recent books, including Jaime Contreras' Sotos contra Riquelmes (Madrid, 1992) or Stephen Haliczer's Sexuality in the Confessional (New York, 1996).

A great deal of Kamen's earlier arguments remain from his previous book, usually in reinforced form; he simply jettisons outdated information. His most fundamental thesis (implicit in the title of his 1985 book) lies near the end:

> An enormous amount of data has been produced by researchers, but only limited progress has been made towards understanding the social or ideological conditions in which the Holy Office operated. ... In reality, ... the Inquisition was only a product of the society it served (p. 318).

William Monter

Northwestern University

Word, Church, and State: Tyndale Quincentenary Essays. Edited by John T Day, Eric Lund, and Anne M. O'Donnell, S.N.D. (Washington, D.C.: The Catholic University of America Press. 1998. Pp. xxiv, 343. $3995.)

This volume is a collection of essays originally presented as papers at the Washington International Conference that celebrated the 500th anniversary of Tyndale's birth Quly 14-17, 1994). It is to be noted that the past decade has seen a resurgence and harvest of Tyndale studies—one cannot speak of a renascence for an author who was so much neglected, save for C. S. Lewis's memorable discussion in English Literature in the Sixteenth Century Excluding Drama (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1954), and Norman Davis's Chambers Memorial Lecture at University College, London, in 1971, analyzing Tyndale's English of Controversy. There have been significant contributions since 1994, which lie outside the scope of this review. But these landmarks in Tyndale studies must be noted: David Darnell's modern-spelling texts of Tyndale's New Testament (1989) and Tyndale's Old Testament (1992), and Gerald Hammond's assessment of Tyndale's growth as a biblical translator, in The Making of the English Bible (New York: Philosophical Library, 1982). (See the survey of recent

contributions in the introduction by Anne M. O'Donnell, S.N.D., in the volume under review, pp. xii-xxii.)

Word, Church, and State is well organized, and the papers are appropriately divided into three sections. I, "Tyndale and the Word," with essays by David Daniell, Gerald Hammond, and Brian Cummings on Tyndale's translations, followed by three studies in Tyndalian hermeneutics: Mary Jane Barnett on allegory, Matthew DeCoursey on the semiotics of narrative in The Obedience of a Christian Man, and Douglas H. Parker on Tyndale's biblical hermeneutics. This section is concluded with three—how much symbolism rests upon the number three!—essays called pastoral applications: William S. Stafford on Tyndale's Voice to the Laity, Peter Auksi's essay on Tyndale's use of folk wisdom, and Rudolph P Almasy on Tyndale Menedemus, which subscribes to the thesis of Richard Y Duerden that "thinking allegorically or analogically is so natural for Tyndale that for him allegory is literal. Analogy structures the very grammar of his thought."

Section II, "Theological and Ecclesiastical Conflicts and Comparisons," has two sections. A, "The Old Church and the New Church," with contributions by Germain Marc'hadour comparing Tyndale and Fisher's 1521 Sermon against Luther; John T. Day, comparing Tyndale and Frith on Tracy's Will and Justification; Eric Lund writing on Tyndale and Frith on the Eucharist as sign and memorial; concluding with Jos. E. Vercruysse, S.J., analyzing Latomus and Tyndale's trial. Section B deals with Tyndale and More, and it presents studies by Robert Coogan, on More, Tyndale, and the Franciscans; by Clare M. Murphy, on the Turks in More and Tyndale; and by Elizabeth McCutcheon on the prison letters of More and Tyndale.

The third and final section deals with politics, prelates, and printing, with contributions by T. J. Wyly on Tyndale as Interpreter of Henrician politics, Arthur F. Kinney dealing with Skelton and Tyndale as men of the cloth and of the word, James Andrew Clark on corrupt prelates in Tyndale and Shakespeare, concluding with John A. R. Dick's study of posthumous revisions in the Tyndale text.

The book is well served by four indexes: subject index, index to scriptural quotations, index to quotations from Tyndale, and index to quotations from More. There is also an identification of the contributors.

The book is admirably edited and printed, and one can say, under the flag of brevity, that with this volume Tyndale scholarship has indeed come of age; the level of scholarship manifested in nearly all of the papers is very high indeed. We are moved greatly in understanding Tyndale's use of his sources, his relation to More, and his contributions to future developments in hermeneutics, English prose, and biblical scholarship and translation.

R.J. Schoeck

Lawrence, Kansas

El Catecismo Romano ante Felipe ILy la Inquisición española: Losproblemas de la introducción en España del Catecismo del Concilio de Trento. By Pedro Rodríguez. (Madrid: Ediciones Rialp. 1998. Pp. 246. Paperback.)

Pedro Rodriguez, who holds a chair of theology at the Universidad de Navarra, is the author of many earlier studies on the history of theology; he was the general editor of the critical edition of the Roman Catechism published in 1989. There he pointed out the close connection between this and the earlier catechism due to Bartolomé de Carranza, which—although its author had become archbishop of Toledo—was condemned by the Spanish Inquisition, and showed that the theologians who were responsible for the Roman Catechism of l 566 were among Carranza's defenders during his trial in Rome and that the Spanish critics of the Roman Catechism were, for their part, involved in the two processes against the archbishop.

Criticisms of the Latin text, while they may have delayed (until 1577) the publication of a Spanish edition, could not prevent the circulation in Spain of the Roman editions of 1566 and 1567. A Spanish translation was another matter. In 1567, in response to the desire of Philip II that the Catechism should be made available to all his subjects, St. Pius V authorized such a translation and asked the Inquisitor General, Cardinal Diego de Espinosa, to choose a translator; he selected Dr. Pedro de Fuentidueñas of Salamanca. Before Fuentidueñas could complete his work another (unofficial) translation by a leading scholar, Cristóbal de Carrera, had been presented to the Inquisition. The main object of this book is to show why neither translation was ever published.

Hostile reactions to the very idea of translating the Catechism were clearly stated in a memorandum on Fuentidueñas' work submitted in 1570 by the Dominican Diego de Chaves to the Consejo Supremo of the Inquisition. For Chaves, to translate even the most orthodox doctrinal statements into the vernacular could lead to the same problems that had arisen in Germany and England. Despite the fact that Espinosa was Inquisitor General and had acted at the personal request of Pius V and at the wish of Philip II, he was unable to contest Chaves' arguments, which had been immediately adopted by the Consejo; this veto was to remain in force for two centuries. While translations into Italian, French, German, and Polish were published as early as 1567-68, no complete Spanish version appeared until 1777.

While, as Rodríguez argues, Chaves' opposition to the translation of the Catechism appears to be linked with the second process against Carranza, the fundamental reason for this prohibition was, behind the condemnations of translations of the Bible and of spiritual and theological writings found in the Indices published by the Spanish Inquisition in the 1550's, the preservation of Spain from heresy, though this meant reserving spiritual teaching to those able to read Latin, something that St. Theresa, for one, found hard to take.

Rodriguez's work includes the crucial documents concerning this prohibition. By comparing Chaves' text with the writings of Melchor Cano against Car-

tanza, he brings out the reasons for it. The book thus sheds much light not only on the Spain of Philip II—who is shown as far from being an absolute monarch—but on the differences between the dominant Spanish theologians of the day and those outside Spain—including Pius V—who clearly wanted the new Catechism to be available to all those capable of understanding it.

J. N. Hillgarth

Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies, Emeritus

'Practical Divinity': The Works and Life of Revd Richard Greenham. By Kenneth L. Parker and Eric J. Carlson. [St. Andrews Studies in Reformation History.] (Aldershot, Hampshire, and Brookfield, Vermont: Ashgate. 1998. Pp. xiv, 395. $102.95.)

Richard Greenham belonged to the first generation of Elizabethan Puritan nonconformist divines, famous in his own day not for his nonconformity, which he minimized and excused to his bishop, Richard Cox, but rather as one of the early physicians of the soul. He left his fellowship at Cambridge University in 1570 for the nearby small village of Dry Drayton, where he ministered for twenty years, leaving only in the last years of his life to preach in London. Although he published almost nothing during his busy life as preacher and pastor, he was well known in his own day largely because his household became a kind of seminary for young Cambridge divines in need of training in the practicalities of ministering to a parochial living before they went on to benefices of their own; among them were such Puritan luminaries of the next generation as Arthur Hildersham, Richard Rogers, and Henry Smith. In this second generation Hildersham, William Whateley, John Dod, Thomas Gataker, Charles Offspring, and others all trained in their homes a third generation of godly preachers; Greenham's was an infectious as well as efficacious example.

After Greenham's death in London in 1594, his London colleagues and scattered disciples began to pull together collections of his sayings, "Grave Counsels, and Godlie Observations," and his posthumous works were then published in a series of editions by three prominent London Puritans, Thomas Crook, Henry Holland, and Stephen Egerton between 1599 and 1612, when the fifth and last edition was published. In addition to their lengthy introduction to Greenham's life and work, Kenneth Parker and Eric Carlson have included in this volume Rylands English Manuscript 124, a collection of Greenham's sayings which his protégés noted and which is closely paralleled by the printed works. What the Puritans preached we know, for sermons we have in plenty, but these sayings even at second hand give a unique insight into the problems and anxieties of parishioners and others who came to Greenham, as a physician of the soul, and the comment, counsel, and advice he dispensed in the course of his pastoral duties. Parker and Carlson have also included from Greenham's

printed works his important "A Short Forme of Catechizing," which, if incomplete, nevertheless runs in print to more than thirty pages of questions and answers, Greenham's treatises on marriage contracts, on the education of children, on the proper way to read and understand the Scriptures, and an abbreviated version of his treatise on the sabbath. Although Parker's and Carlson's reason for refusing to term Greenham a Puritan do not seem convincing—not least because they do repeatedly refer to his role in the 'godly' community and to his sayings as reflecting the preoccupations of the 'godly' in the early 1580's—we have no excuse now to ignore the pastoral thrust of Elizabethan Puritanism, hitherto overshadowed by the more public controversies generated by the presbyterian movement and by such famous preachers and scholars as Edward Dering and William Perkins.

Paul S. Seaver

Stanford University

The Reformation of Community: Social Welfare and Calvinist Charity in Holland, 1572-1620. By Charles H. Parker. [Cambridge Studies in Early Modern History.] (New York: Cambridge University Press. 1998. Pp. xv, 221. $59.95.)

The deacons of the ancient church, wrote Calvin in his Institutes, were stewards of the poor, and as such they did not undertake mere "secular management" but rather exercised a "spiritual function dedicated to God." A generation later, Calvin's spiritual heirs in the independent Low Countries likewise insisted that the care of the poor was one of the church's most sacred tasks, and they labored hard, with varying degrees of success, to ensure that the diaconate of the Dutch Reformed Church remained insulated against worldly interference. It is this process that Charles H. Parker describes in his fine comparative study of poor relief in the six largest cities of the province of Holland during the period 1572-1620.

Parker's central argument is that the evolution of municipal and ecclesiastical poor relief in these cities was dominated by a deeper conflict between older medieval and humanist traditions of municipal charity and the new diaconates set up by the Reformed Protestants who took over the province's public church after 1572. The older sacral and newer confessional definitions of community both saw charity as the principal Christian virtue, but while the former argued that all public forms of charity must serve the entire city, the latter insisted instead that it be directed more exclusively to the confessional community, the "household of faith." This exclusivity began during the Dutch Calvinists' experience of exile in the 1560's and early 1570's, when all ecclesiastical institutions were deliberately designed to be insular and protective in order to preserve the "true" church's autonomy, security, and identity. The Reformed carried this attitude with them when they became legitimate in 1572 and ran straight into long-entrenched traditions of city-wide parochial and mu-

nicipal charity that had operated within Holland's densely populated and fiercely independent towns since the later Middle Ages. The patricians who ran these towns saw themselves as both Christian magistrates and guarantors of public order, obliged to promote the welfare of all their indigent citizens, not just the Reformed ones. The confrontation between these two competing visions of the Christian community yielded a variety of outcomes in these six towns in the late sixteenth and early seventeenth centuries.

Parker's comparative approach nicely captures the variety and complexity of the Dutch urban world in the early modern era. He surveys the governmental, parochial, and charitable landscapes of Holland's six major cities in the later Middle Ages and then analyzes the different results of the introduction of the Reformed diaconate into each town. These results could range from a diaconate subsumed into municipal charity (as was the case in Leiden) to a diaconate largely free of magisterial meddling (Dordrecht). Conflicts concerning poor relief were part of a larger pattern of complicated church-state relations in Holland following the formal turn to Protestantism in 1572. This lucidly written and persuasively argued study will be essential reading for students of early modern social, religious, and political history.

Christine Kooi

Louisiana State University

Kurie und Politik. Stand und Perspektiven der Nuntiaturberichtsforschung. Edited by Alexander Koller. [Bibliothek des Deutschen Historischen Instituts in Rom, Band 87.] (Tübingen: Max Niemeyer Verlag. 1998. Pp. xii, 532. DM 152.00.)

This valuable volume grew out of a colloquium sponsored by the German Historical Institute in Rome from October 9 to 12, 1996, to evaluate and chart the course for the continuing publication of papal nunciature reports and to find ways for their wider use by scholars. It suggests new directions for use of the reports in light of changing historical interests and financial constraints, and it provides an overview of research into early modern papal foreign policy and diplomacy including efforts at church reform. As Wolfgang Reinhard emphasizes in his contribution, the history of papal diplomacy must be seen from a truly European perspective and its study to be a common European venture. The composition of the volume, with twenty-two contributions from scholars of seven nations, as well as the now established co-operation among historical institutes shows that this approach has taken hold.

A highlight of the volume is the bibliography compiled by Alexander Koller and Peter Schmidt of 1131 items published since 1890, 206 of them documentary collections nearly all of which are nunciature reports. The various institutes continue to publish the nunciature reports. The newly founded Polish Historical Institute in Rome has published ten volumes in the 1990's, with one

in preparation, and the revived Czech Historical Institute in Rome is preparing its first volume. The exceptions are Spain and Portugal, for which very few volumes have ever been published.

Besides Europeanization Reinhard enumerates a number of new approaches to the study of the nunciature reports that take it beyond the publication of documents. Among his many suggestions are their evaluation from the perspective of bureaucratic history, prosopographical studies of the nuncios and their staffs, anthropological and semantic analyses of the reports, and studies of the papal role in Catholic confessionalization. After noting an upswing of interest in diplomatic history that bodes well for the future of the nunciature reports, Schmidt analyzes the publications in the bibliography from a number of formal perspectives. He writes, for example, that 28.7% deal with the second half of the sixteenth century, 21% with the period from 1600 to 1650 including the Thirty Years' War, and only 9-1% with the first half of the sixteenth century or the Reformation.

An important moment in the Europeanization of the study of papal diplomacy was the publication of Instructiones pontificum Romanorum. Die Hauptinstruktionen Clemens' VIII. für die Nuntien und Legaten an den europäischen Fürstenhöfen 1592-1605, edited by Klaus Jaitner (2 vols.; Tübingen, 1984). Up until this time the publication of nunciature reports was usually undertaken with the purpose of gathering information about the country where the nuncio resided. The publication of the principal instructions of a pontificate shifted attention to the policy of the papacy itself while at the same time avoiding the expense of publishing the weekly nunciature reports. Jaitner has followed this up with a similar publication for the brief but critical pontificate of Gregory XV (1997). In his contribution to this volume he shows that in contrast to the bureaucratic conflicts of Clement VHFs pontificate, under Gregory XV the pope, the cardinal-nepot, Ludovico Ludovisi, and the secretary of state, Giovanni Battista Agucchi all worked together in harmony. Soon to be published is a third volume of this type for the pontificate of Paul V (1605-1621) edited by Silvano Giordano, who summarizes in his contribution the main lines of Paul's efforts to implement the decrees of Trent. To be sure, in the Hauptinstruktionen one misses the details of the application of policy to individual circumstances as well as many other details that one finds in the nunciature reports.

Some contributions exemplify new perspectives on the reports. Bernard Barbiche looks at the fifty regular nuncios who served in Paris from 1514 to 1700, whom he lists and for whom he provides minimal biographical information at the conclusion of his contribution. In the sixteenth century he finds that most nuncios were already bishops when they were appointed, whereas in the seventeenth they were usually consecrated bishops, for the most part in partibus infidelium,at the time they were named nuncios. Seventeenth-century nuncios were also usually promoted to the cardinalate after their service in Paris. Barbiche gathers information on the entourages of the nuncios as well as their residence and style of life. A report on the biography of Atilio Amalteo, nuncio in

Cologne from 1606 to 1610 and also a minor literary figure, constitutes the contribution of Stefan Samerski, who is currently editing the reports for 1607-1610. Peter Burschel, who has assisted in the preparation of nunciature reports from Cologne, lays out a program as to how one might "decode anthropologically" such reports from the point of view of the nuncios' experience of the "other," as foreigner and sometimes as heretic, a method that would be especially valuable if it were prolonged over a long period for a particular nunciature. Volker Reinhardt investigates the way nuncios thought in terms of national characteristics or stereotypes. He reports that the nuncios in Lucerne utterly failed to understand either the political organization or the social composition of the Swiss, identifying them with the peasants of the rural cantons who barely rose to the minimum of civilization. In contrast to this, Wojciech Tygielski finds that papal nuncios rapidly came to understand the way in which government and society in Poland functioned. Michael P. Feldkamp relates the activities of Giovanni Carlo Antonelli, who held the second position in the nunciature in Cologne, that of auditor, from 1722 to 1732, and who was given unusual responsibility by the nuncio.

Two important contributions come from Stefano Andretta for Italy, that is, for Florence, Venice, Turin, and Naples, and from Agostino Borromeo for the Iberian nations. Andretta notes that in recent decades scholarship in Italy has tended to focus on the publication of visitation reports rather than nunciature reports, partly because they reveal more about the religion of ordinary people. He welcomes the application of new approaches. Two volumes of nunciature reports for Venice (1596-1598, 1621-1623) are now in preparation. One reason for the failure to publish more nunciature reports for the Iberian nations, Borromeo writes, is that neither of them has historical institutes in Rome comparable to those of many other European countries. Borromeo then gives a thorough overview of the efforts of the papacy through the nuncios to implement the decrees of the Council of Trent during the reign of Philip II. He makes two points of major interest. The first is that in Spain the Vatican was considerably more concerned with the reform of religious orders, of both men and women, than it was with episcopal reform. The second is that to understand fully the papacy's efforts at reform, it is necessary to consult not only the correspondence of the nuncios with the secretary of state or cardinal nephews but also with Roman Congregations, especially in this instance with the new Congregations of the Council and for Bishops and Religious Orders.

The remaining ten contributions deal with the French nunciature and the Gallican crisis (Pierre Blet); papal policy toward Poland-Lithuania during the interregna of the 1570's and 1580's (Almut Bues); the nunciature of Giovanni DoLfin in Vienna in 1575/76 (Daniela Neri); the conflict over Emperor Rudolf IFs promise of obedience to the Holy See (Alexander Koller); the edition of the reports of nuncio Cesare Speciano from Prague (1592-1598) (Alena Pazderová); the nunciature in Vienna in the eighteenth century, especially during the tenure of Giuseppe Garampi (1776-1785) (Umberto Dell'Orto);an overview of

the nunciature in Graz (1580-1622) (Johann Rainer); reports on the reorganization of the archives of the Nunciature of Lucerne in the Vatican Archives (Roger Liggenstorfer) and on the state of research regarding the same nunciature (Urban Fink); and the conflict over the nunciature in Cologne in 1785-1794 (Burkhard Roberg).

The contributions are in German, Italian, and French, with brief summaries in German or Italian.

Robert Bireley, SJ.

Loyola University Chicago

Sermons at Court: Politics and Religion in Elizabethan and Jacobean Preaching. By Peter E. McCullough. [Cambridge Studies in Early Modern British History.] (New York: Cambridge University Press. 1998. Pp. xv, 237.)

Could 5,000 people attend sermons at Queen Elizabeth's Court? Would they? Peter McCullough convinces us that they could and did by measuring the space of the Whitehall outdoor preaching place, well known from its illustration in Foxe's Book of Martyrs. Matching the measurements with the written evidence, he stimulates new understandings of how preaching at the Court was shaped by its royal auditors, reflecting their personal theological tastes.

As its title implies, this book is about sermons, but not so much about their content as their context. Context throws important light on content, intent, and meaning, however, and leads to some interesting arguments about preaching in the Court. For instance, James I followed the Scots' practice of coming to the chapel only for sermons, meaning, given Court custom, that James, and therefore most of his courtiers, missed the prescribed Prayer Book liturgy leading up to the sermon. When the King entered, the service ended, an anthem was sung, the preacher mounted his pulpit, which allowed him to stand face-to-face with the King, and the sermon went forward. This irritated his clergy and led to an increasing demand for the King to attend the whole service as a sign of reverence. James ignored them, but Charles did not, and William Laud, a frustrated Jacobean chaplain, got Charles to institute a new regime of Court worship that emphasized the "beauty of holiness" on Lancelot Andrewes' model.

McCullough includes in his study sermons preached to Queen Anne. Given her suspected Catholicism, his exploration of her chapel and chaplains startles, in that he finds that she employed a number of Puritan chaplains, drawing heavily on people who, like her less than puritanical chaplain John Donne, came from the Essex connection. These clergymen, as far as he can tell, did not dare to address the Queen's crypto-Catholicism directly, though he finds evidence that Donne may have done so in one of his sermons. At the same time, McCullough's awareness of the physical arrangements and customs of the Court allows him to explain how Anne's avoidance of Anglican communion, and

possible private Masses, would have been almost invisible to the outside world. It was easier for the Queen than for most people to be a crypto-Catholic, since she was never expected to commune in her chapel. On the other hand, it is clear that, whatever her private sympathies, she believed that London was worth more than a Mass, no matter what the papacy thought.

By comparing the Elizabethan and Jacobean Courts, McCullough throws the religious preferences and styles of the monarchs into clear relief. Elizabeth faithfully attended the very public sermons held before large crowds during Lent. She sometimes corrected the preachers, but she was there, and she was seen. She also observed morning prayer daily with her household. Her devotion was liturgically oriented, and she used sermons as public occasions to show herself to her people. Ironically, James, who loved preaching, adding extra sermons to the Court calendar and hearing them even in his hunting lodges, did not attend them with the public. In the sermon-mad Jacobean period his people did not see him as participating, even though, as Lori Anne Ferrell establishes in her Government by Polemic. James I, the King's Preachers, and the Rhetoric of Conformity (Stanford, 1998), James deliberately used sermons as an instrument of policy.

McCullough is a literary scholar, but this is an historian's book. He takes pains to establish the importance of the preachers' literary production, but to do that, he had to get the history right, which no one has done. Included with this book is a floppy disk that calendars all the sermons at Court he has identified. What would have been a second volume has become a searchable companion disk, a very welcome tool. Presumably this calendar will give sermons at Court a prominence in scholarship that this excellent book proves they deserve.

Norman Jones

Utah State University

Religion et Société: Les Réguliers et la vie régionale dans les diocèses d'Auxerre, Langres et Dijon (fin XVI'-fln XVLLI' siècles). By Dominique Dinet. 2 vols. (Paris: Publications de la Sorbonne. 1999. Pp. 435; 437-950. 280F.)

A massive dissertation (doctorat d'état), this work has much to offer specialists of early modern religious history. The author examines in great detail the evolution of religious orders and congregations of three dioceses in Burgundy and Champagne, from the Edict of Nantes of 1598, to 1789 and the French Revolution. Responding to a historiographical tradition that has often slavishly repeated the harsh, Enlightenment polemics of a Voltaire or a Montesquieu, Dinet argues for a more nuanced view of seventeenth- and eighteenth-century religious houses.

This carefully documented study, based largely on archival sources, provides much evidence for the author's principal thesis: At least in the specific regions

studied, there was not, as has often been posited, a simple scenario of rapid growth of religious communities in the l600's, followed quickly by a well-earned and steep decline in the 1700's. Against this monochromatic rise-and-fall model, Dinet establishes a much more complex picture. While some groups, such as the Franciscan friars, did lose their popularity and numbers in the eighteenth century, others grew, especially the newer congregations of uncloistered women religious, such as the Daughters of Charity. Average Catholics, the people in the parishes, rarely perceived members of religious orders and congregations as lazy, useless, wealthy gluttons, even if the philosophes did portray them that way. Indeed, the educational and charitable work of many religious was highly valued, and missed greatly when it was suppressed by force at the century's end.

More sympathetic to Jesuits than to Jansenists, Dinet suggests that where a decline in religious vocations did occur it was in places of Jansenist dominance, such as the diocese of Auxerre for much of the first half of the eighteenth century. There, under the episcopate of Mgr de Caylus, religious unsympathetic to a Jansenist agenda of moral rigorism and infrequent reception of the Eucharist were expelled or otherwise punished. The Jesuits were barred from preaching or hearing confessions in his diocese. Dinet argues that devotions associated with the Jesuits, such as that to the Sacred Heart, gained many devotees among the rural population, while Jansenism remained more of an elite movement supported principally by the secular clergy.

The complexity of obstacles and difficulties faced by both older, established religious communities, and by newer ones, Dinet amply demonstrates. At least eight distinct instances of ecclesiastical and civil authority helped to determine a house's fate. There were the king, the pope, the parlements, the local bishop, the municipality, the religious order's own superiors, as well as the decrees of the Council of Trent and the rules or constitutions of the religious community itself. Both the foundation and the survival of a house could be promoted or prevented by one or more of these authorities. Many monasteries faced the additional complication of a commendatory abbot, normally absent and not a member of the order, and who may have drained away needed income.

Yet these and other obstacles, at times seemingly insurmountable, were often overcome, especially by women. Against much opposition, including the decrees of Treat on cloister for nuns, new communities of uncloistered women religious, devoted to an active apostolate of teaching and/or work among the sick and the poor, developed and prospered. The Sisters of St. Martha, founded in Dijon in 1628, preceded by a few years foundation of the Daughters of Charity, the best-known but certainly not the only such group, women's communities also had to face, on average, more financial strains than did men's houses. In 1768, the Dijon community of Dominican women went bankrupt. Despite these economic hurdles, and often unyielding resistance to female religious working outside the cloister, women's apostolic communities grew dramatically in the eighteenth century, right up to the early 1790's. In 1589 there were

more male religious than female; the proportions had been reversed by the time of the French Revolution.

This study is somewhat undermined by its excessive length. A great deal of tedious information is presented in an undigested manner; much of it could better be placed in footnotes. At the same time, some interesting topics are passed over too quickly. For instance, in a section on monastic architecture, the author states that, in the seventeenth century, the monastery's common dormitory was often replaced by individual cells, while in the eighteenth century, comfortable rooms tended to replace the small, austere cells. Dinet apparently thinks that this is but a minor architectural detail; he says nothing about possible religious, social, and economic significance of such changes. In this and a number of cases, further discussion of the meaning of developments charted would have been welcome.

These volumes do reward their readers with an up-close, sympathetic, and scholarly perspective on early modern French religious life. Libraries will surely want to obtain them.

Thomas Worcester, SJ.

College of the Holy Cross

Anti-Catholicism in Northern Ireland, 1600-1998: The Mote and the Beam. By John D. Brewer with Garth I. Higgins. (New York: St. Martin's Press, Inc. 1998. Pp. xi, 248. $69.95.)

John Brewer, professor of sociology in Queen's University, Belfast, distinguishes three important modes of anti-Catholicism. The covenantal mode, represented by Reverend Ian Paisley and his constituency, is characterized by both high political content and high theological content. Covenantal anti-Catholics understand their world in Old Testament terms; God has chosen the Protestants as He earlier chose the Israelites, and it is their duty to defend their land against the apostate minions of the Roman antichrist. The secular mode, which typically informs the actions of middle-class Unionists as well as some Protestant paramilitaries, is high in political content but low in theological content. Its adherents abhor the Catholics' principal political objective, a united Ireland, and therefore accept a variety of negative stereotypes of them and of the Irish Republic. The Pharisaic mode, reflected in the official positions of the Presbyterian and other mainstream Protestant churches, is high in theological content and low in political content. Its proponents do not stigmatize Catholics but, confident in their own possession of the gospel truth, seek to convert them while being careful to separate their own political beliefs from their religious convictions.

This tripartite conceptualization turns out to be a powerful and elegant device for understanding complexities of Ulster Protestant thinking. It enables

Brewer to explain, in the light of the Protestant community's dominance within their society, the unique persistence into the late twentieth century of anti-Catholicism as such a salient element in the political culture of Northern Ireland. This analysis of the contemporary situation is preceded by a lengthy review of the history of anti-Catholicism since the seventeenth-century plantations.

For a work of academic sociology this is a remarkably passionate book. In the preface the author and his research assistant declare themselves "Christians and sociologists," and one of their principal concerns is to convince the objects of the study that the theological foundations of the latter's anti-Catholicism are as unwarranted by scripture as their perceptions of Catholic belief are unfounded. To engage three distinct disciplines—sociology, history, and theology—is a risky endeavor. (J can't help wondering, for example, whether a New Testament scholar would think the Pharisees receive fair treatment.)

The historical section of the work reflects wide and sensible reading in the Irish historiography of the past generation and suffers from the flaws of that literature. In particular, Brewer echoes the tendency of recent historians, including sometimes this reviewer, to understate the significance of Presbyterian alienation from the Protestant establishment in the eighteenth century and to exaggerate the rapprochement of Dissenters and Anglicans in the middle decades of the nineteenth century. However, his typology of anti-Catholicism may be just what we Irish historians need to think our way out of the puzzle we have created in this revisionist reaction against dewy-eyed nationalist history. Something like Brewer's oddly-named "Pharisaic" mode of anti-Catholicism, with an irenic and compassionate regard for the agrarian underclass of the Famine era, is an important component of Irish Presbyterianism in its crucial transitional state which remains to be properly explicated.

David W. Miller

Carnegie Mellon University

Betrayal of the Innocents: Desire, Power, and the Catholic Church in Spain. By Timothy Mitchell. (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press. 1998. Pp. vu, 178. $39.95 clothbound; $16.50 paperback.)

Interpretations of the past sweeping over the centuries often make fascinating reading. But for historians moved by the traditional evidentiary canons of their craft, such grand sallies are the cause of some discomfort. This provocative study by a highly regarded social anthropologist combines the insights of his field with psychological theory and a dose of history to argue that Spanish Catholicism developed over the centuries a powerful set of values identified as authoritarian sexual repression. The imposition of these values on society, he maintains, was damaging to individuals and encouraged patterns of sexual abuse by the clergy ranging from the use of the confessional in the sixteenth

century to seduce penitents to cases of clerical sexual abuse brought to light in contemporary Spain.

That such cases occurred in the distant and recent past is beyond dispute. Nor is there any doubt that the Spanish Church's traditional dark and pessimistic view of human nature in its sexual dimension verged on the obsessional, perhaps more so in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries than in earlier times. To what extent this obsession was a uniquely Spanish phenomenon, as the author argues, is less certain. Similar concerns with upholding rigorous morality in sexual matters were scarcely absent from Protestant Europe until it was submerged by the powerful secularizing currents of the late nineteenth and twentieth centuries.

The thesis that the five centuries considered in some detail in this study are connected through an unchanging pattern of authoritarian sexual repression and the clerical abuse that accompanied it rests primarily on psychological arguments that may well have merit, although difficult to prove from an historical perspective. It is more difficult to see a direct historical connection between the abuse of the confessional brought to light by the Inquisition in the sixteenth century and recent cases of sexual abuse by priests. The author appears to assume that the clergy formed an undifferentiated mass over the centuries when, in fact, it underwent as dramatic a transformation as civil society during the nineteenth century. The chaotic recruitment of priests, the vastly uneven levels of clerical education, the extraordinarily diverse social backgrounds of the clergy, and the attraction of the priesthood for those inspired less by religious motives than the prospect of having a roof over one's head and food on the table in early modern Spain stand in sharp contrast to the more tightly controlled clerical caste formed during the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. It would have been useful for the legitimate indictment of abuses to have been placed in the context of the socio-economic backgrounds of priests and the particular social conditions of each period discussed.

The fact is that historians know little of the state of the lower clergy for both the early modern and modern periods. There are a handful of studies for the eighteenth century which present a mixed picture. Pilar Pueyo Colomina's solid work on Zaragoza, where the diocesan authorities carried out periodic inspections of the clergy, shows that there were few cases of improper behavior among priests. But Leandro Higueruela del Pino's study of the clergy of the Toledo archdiocese in the early nineteenth century establishes that in remote parishes, far from the vigilance of the archbishop, abuses of various kinds were common. Even less is known about the lower clergy in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. What is known indicates that problems continued in the areas of indiscriminate recruitment and the quality of clerical education, while, to judge from the complaints of church authorities, some entered the priesthood simply to get a decent job. The anticlerical literature of the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries used by the author often dwelt on the sexual misconduct of priests implying that it was massive in scale. But the few

studies of the lower clergy available for the modern period suggest that although there were undoubtedly cases of abuse, the vast majority of priests more or less lived up to their calling.

The author correctly identifies the anticlerical indictment of clerical sexual abuse with the broader conflict in twentieth-century Spain between powerful secularizing forces and a Church determined to impose its view of morality on an entire society. Whether the issue of sexual morality was as central to that conflict, as he maintains, is less clear. This is particularly true of the assertion that the assassination of more than 7,000 priests and religious during the Civil War of the 1930's can be attributed in large measure to a powerful popular reaction, especially among anarchists, against "authoritarian sexual repression" identified with the clergy. That such a reaction took place in some cases is beyond doubt. But the causes of the Civil War and the attack on the Church and its clergy were complex. Political, social, and economic motives combined in explosive combination in the summer of 1936 to produce a sustained assault on the Church. No single cause can explain its unprecedented scale and ferocity.

The connection between religion and sexuality that lies at the heart of this study is a legitimate object of enquiry. The author's sense of moral indignation at cases of sexual abuse and cover-ups by some ecclesiastical authorities, especially during the recent past, is justified. But from an historian's perspective, the brush is too broad. The thesis of "authoritarian sexual morality" as an overarching explanation applying to vastly different historical periods is too straightforward. Until historians turn their attention to study of the clergy in both early modern and modern Spain, a definitive answer to the questions raised in this study will remain elusive.

William J. Callahan

University of Toronto

Late Modern European

Village Bells: Sound and Meaning in the 19th-century French Countryside. By Alain Corbin. Translated by Martin Thorn. [European Perspectives.] (New York: Columbia University Press. 1998. Pp. xx,416. $35.00.)

The villages of nineteenth-century France were unfamiliar with the pervasive sounds of our contemporary world, the hum of the computer, the engines of the cars in the street and planes overhead, music and news amplified by the ubiquitous radios, tape decks, and compact-disk players. The silence of rural France was broken instead by the pealing bells of the parish church, which carried both an enormous amount of information, and an affective charge based on their ability to evoke feelings of belonging, danger, sadness, and joy. For Alain Corbin, the Village Bells which are the subject of his new book "bear witness to a different relation to the world and to the sacred as well as to a different way

of being inscribed in time and space, and of experiencing time and space" (p. xix).

Corbin opens with the revolutionary attempt to limit the ringing and, at the height of the Terror, to suppress the bells, understood as allies of religious fanaticism. But citizens were passionate in defending their bells against officials who sought to turn them into copper coinage and cannons. The religious peace established by Napoleon allowed the bells to ring, but called on clergy and public officials to co-operate in regulating this powerful instrument. As with so many other issues that required the co-operation of church and state under the Concordat, ringing the church bells became a source of constant tension, and sometimes open conflict, as priests and mayors fought to control the sounds that divided the time and structured the space of the French countryside.

In chapters that define "l'esprit du clocher" Corbin describes the rituals that surrounded the casting and raising of parish bells, as well as their central role in marking the hours at which people began and ended their day. Bells were also the principal means used "to make announcements, exhort people to assemble, sound the alarm, and express general rejoicing" (p. 159). For students of religious history Corbin paints a fascinating picture of how the secular and the sacred were intermingled, for bells called people both to prayer and to work. As Corbin notes, the disputes between curés and mayors over which occasions should be marked by bells, and the length and style of the ringing, cannot be reduced to a polarized clash with "faith on one side and unbelief on the other" (p. 141). What we see instead is a complicated struggle in which secular officials sought to sacralize official pronouncements and public holidays, and to defend the rights of individuals to have their deaths marked with the traditional knoll, even if they were not practicing Catholics.

Corbin's study is based on extensive research in both national and departmental archives, as well as a deep familiarity with the campanarian literature produced by local experts over the past two centuries. This is an evocative text that conveys the power and beauty of the bells, as well as the struggles to control them. General arguments, however, are not always elucidated with perfect clarity. Corbin makes a number of comments, for example, about the development of ringing over the course of the century. We learn that bells begin to lose their practical function after the 1860's, when newspapers and clocks become a more widespread means of spreading information and marking time. Readers would have profited from a more systematic treatment of periodization. Similarly, it would have been interesting to hear more from Corbin about how the conflicts over bells are linked to the larger religious changes that are alluded to in his work. These are minor reservations, however, for Village Bells in the end succeeds admirably in opening up a world of sound and meaning that enriches our understanding of nineteenth-century French culture.

Thomas Kselman

University of Notre Dame

Il clero a Perugia durante l'episcopato di Gioacchino Pecci (1846-1878). Tra Stato Pontificio e Stato Unitario. By Maria Lupi. [Italia Sacra: Studi e documenti di storia ecclesiastica, Vol. 57.] (Rome: Herder Editrice e Librería. 1998. Pp. xx, 582. Lire 160,000 paperback.)

This clearly written and richly detailed book concentrates on the condition of the clergy in a single diocese during the crucial years of Italian unification. Gioacchino Pecci was named bishop of Perugia in 1846, the first year of the pontificate of Pius LX, and held that position until Pius died in 1878. The leading reason why he was elected the next Pope, Leo XIII, was his success in concentrating the energy of his clergy on spiritual essentials, together with his leadership in the struggle with the newly proclaimed Kingdom of Italy to defend the Church and serve its people.

When Pecci assumed the reins in Perugia, there had been substantial movement away from the traditional model of the ancien régime toward one of greater pastoral care in the thirty years since the Restoration.

During the Restoration period, reduced numbers of clergy were hard-pressed to fill all of the positions and benefices available. The crippling of the religious communities hurt the many small oratories and confraternities which had served as centers of prayer and social ministry. Worship was concentrated in the parishes once again, with greater demands on the pastors for preaching, religious education, administration of sacraments, and direct contact between priests and people. Pecci's ideal "new" cleric was above all a man of prayer and blameless life, a good guide and example to all.

Beginning with the Revolution of 1848, Pecci worked to streamline and consolidate his authority for the coming struggle. He had only a short time before the Kingdom of Piedmont occupied and annexed his diocese and the rest of Umbría in I860, then seized Rome itself in 1870, and abolished the Papal States forever.

He made substantial progress toward recapturing moral hegemony among clergy and faithful. He encouraged the steady education of better-motivated clerics, and supported their increasing level of pastoral care and personal commitment. But he also used his greater centralized authority to reward and promote those who best followed his newer ideal. And he continued to hold the line against the special interests of institutions—henceforth, there was only one local church, not at war within itself. The twelve years between 1848 and I860 were indeed a short transition, but the new breed of clergy was already on the way.

After Papal forces lost Umbría to Piedmont in I860, the Special Royal Commissioner Pepoli quickly applied Piedmontese laws to remove church influence from the courts, schools, and charitable works. He also seized the property of religious orders, and levied taxes on church lands. The bishop protested each decree in detail as illegal and immoral, but he made it clear that he had to bow to superior force.

Under the strong leadership of their bishop, the priests of Perugia continued their attitude of moral protest, but actually increased their level of pastoral care despite hardships. As they worked out a modus vivendi with the new regime, they also drew closer to the bishop, since there were no other protections for them. The loss of enforced conformity in society boosted their own personal morality and spirituality as a norm of conduct for others. Clericalism and careerism died out quickly as clerics grew closer to the laity by sharing their sufferings.

As part of his reconcentration on spiritual values and tools, Pecci began his fifth pastoral visit (1868) with a homily at the cathedral listing twenty-four essential points of a genuine Christian life. His focus on moral living and service to the people effectively frustrated the most dedicated anticlericals.

Maria Lupi has produced a fine book which illustrates the pastoral development of the man called "the first modern Pope" by some. Her research is impressive, with citations and explanatory notes accounting for 40-50% of the entire work. She provides nearly 100 pages of statistical tables and helpful documents, as well as a useful index. Students of this crucial period of church history will need a bit of patience because of the sheer size of the work, but they will be well rewarded.

Leopold G. Glueckert, O.Carm.

Lewis University

Frederick Temple, Archbishop of Canterbury: A Life. By Peter Hinchliff. (New York: Clarendon Press, Oxford University Press. 1998. Pp. vii, 31 1. $75.00.)

During his long and active ecclesiastical career, Frederick Temple held some of the most important posts in the Church of England during critical periods for the Victorian Church. Temple was an undergraduate and fellow of Balliol College during the Oxford Movement, a close friend of Matthew Arnold, Benjamin Jowett, and A. C. Tait, a noted educational reformer and headmaster of Kneller Hall (an experimental workers college) and Rugby, contributor of the lead article to the controversial Essays and Reviews, Bishop of Exeter and London and Archbishop of Canterbury. Yet, as the late Peter Hinchliff observes at the opening of this work, "There has never been a full biography of Frederick Temple." This oversight owes partly to the attention paid Temple's more charismatic colleagues (even his friends admitted that Temple was often brusque and uncommunicative) but also to a general confusion regarding his theological and political views. The standard view, conveyed in the Dictionary of National Biography, depicts Temple as a young Tory turned Broad Church liberal. In his masterful survey The Victorian Church, Owen Chadwick describes Temple as one of the chief instigators, along with Jowett, of Essays and Reviews and considers Temple's Bampton Lectures of 1884 as reflective of his axiomatic acceptance of evolutionary theories. But a case can be made for Temple as High

Church champion—he became a leading advocate of the prerogatives of the episcopacy and the status of "voluntary" (Anglican) schools and refused to issue a blanket condemnation of ritualism in London and Canterbury.

Peter Hinchliff addressed this problem shortly before his death in this careful biography, which concentrates on the public (there is very little of the private) Temple. Hinchliff detects an underlying consistency throughout Temple's career. As Hmchliff sees it, Temple was essentially a constitutionalist with a deep, pre-Tractarian High Church sensibility, open to personal, individual freedom of inquiry but committed to the proprieties of the established Church, especially as his own responsibilities within that Church increased. Thus, Hinchliff carefully considers Temple's role as contributor to Essays and Reviews. Far from leading the effort, Hinchliff suggests that Temple answered an appeal from colleagues to contribute to a diverse collection designed not to advance a radical agenda but to demonstrate the possibilities for new avenues of inquiry in Anglican theology. Temple refused to disavow association with Essays and Reviews during his tenure as headmaster of Rugby and when he was being considered for the bishopric of Exeter in 1869. Only after his translation to Exeter did he remove his essay from future editions of the collection. What was appropriate for an academic was not appropriate for a responsible prelate. Likewise, Temple's Bampton Lectures were less a total surrender to evolutionary theory than a not altogether successful attempt to establish a "Christian Darwinism."

Essentially, Hinchliff argues for consideration of Temple as a pioneer of Liberal Catholicism (as opposed to Anglo-Catholicism) within the Church of England, a position shared by Hinchliff himself as noted by Archbishop Runcie in his foreword to this biography. In this light, Temple emerges as a more sympathetic (and prophetic) figure. Prelates today may relate to his attempt to balance personal faith and an inquisitive intellect with the external demands of an often beleaguered Church. Hinchliff provides interesting commentaries on the prevailing issues in the Victorian Church, if a less than compelling personal portrait of Temple the man.

Richard J. Janet

Rockhurst University

Acton and History. By Owen Chadwick. (New York: Cambridge University Press. 1998. Pp. xiv, 270. $49.95.)

Owen Chadwick is among the eminent historians of our time. For nearly a half century we have enjoyed the fruits of his wide-ranging curiosity in historical research, be it the Lutheran revolt or the conduct of the Vatican in the age of the dictators. Yet there is no mistaking the core of his opus: from Bossuet to Newman, from Clement XI to Pius XII, from Acton and Creighton to Theiner

and the secrets of the papal archives, Sir Owen's writings have illuminated many dark corners, none more brilliantly so than those within that ornate palace that was Victorian religion.

Now Cambridge University Press has published the lion's share of the collected writings of Chadwick on Acton, bringing together for easy access articles and lectures produced over more than three decades. All but the opening chapter, "The Making of a Historian," have appeared before, while chapter 5, "Acton and Newman," is presented for the first time in English, translated from the original French. Additions and deletions in text have occurred to avoid overlaps and close gaps though the pieces are presented essentially as originally given.

No doubt varied compelling influences drew Chadwick's intellect to that of the historian of freedom, one of which surely was the work of Sir Herbert Butterfield, whom the author has characterized elsewhere as "a lifelong worrier about Acton's view of history." Indeed, one regrets that this anthology does not include "Acton and Butterfield" from the Journal of Ecclesiastical History (July, 1987), a stirring defense of his older friend and colleague against the charge of Sir Geoffrey Elton, in 1986, that the late Butterfield must have had better things to do than try to unravel "a bogus enigma" deserving "honourable oblivion." Chadwick's response leaves one wishing that Sir Geoffrey had not gone so far out on his limb, that Acton was, after all, "the first big, technically equipped, European historian writing in the English language."

Chapter titles reveal the meat of this volume: "At the Vatican Archives," "At the First Vatican Council," "After the Council," "Acton and Newman," "With Gladstone," "Döllinger and Acton," "Professor Lord Acton," and "The Acton Library." There are many insights and much to ponder in these pages, notably the long, often harsh love-hate relationship Acton had with Newman—itself a vignette of the chronic intellectual pain in Acton's life—with its surprising, merciful ending. Equally telling is the Acton-Gladstone association of nearly forty years; they were enduring companions in matters of the mind. It was an uncommon and complex friendship in which the younger man became the sage of the older, each nourishing the insatiable intellectual curiosity of the other, producing, at times, the most unlikely of consequences.

All in all, Acton and History is a rare feast advancing understanding of one of the most engaging minds of modern history. It appears on the eve of a momentous event in Acton studies, the publication by Yale University Press of the first biography of Lord Acton to be derived from all the immense archival and published sources. The author, Roland Hill, at home in the cosmopolitan world of his subject, enjoys the added good fortune of having a foreword by Sir Owen, quite possibly his final word on the subject.

James C. Holland

Shepherd College

Robert Hugh Benson: Life and Works. By Janet Grayson. (Lanham, Maryland: University Press of America. 1998. Pp. xxvi, 231. $3950.)

At his death in 1914, at the early age of forty-three, Monsignor Robert Hugh Benson had achieved an enviable reputation in Britain, America, and Rome. His sermons and lectures, his historical novels and books of apologetics, had taken the public by storm. The adulation was such that one day the British Weekly clamored for the worship to cease in a headline NO MORE HUGH BENSON.

Today, it would seem, that headline writer has gotten his wish, for the very first sentence of this study poses the question: "Does anyone read Robert Hugh Benson any more?" The answer is given in sixteen short chapters that liken him to a brilliant comet that hurtled across the sky and quickly burned out. Some Benson admirers remain here and there, but little remains of the international audience he once commanded, one drawn from all classes, including the British royalty, that stretched across two continents. The appetite for Hugh Benson was unabating, and his devotees were not satisfied with a book now and again. Those not fond of his literary efforts claimed that his creative machinery was so smoothly oiled that he had contracted with his publishers to crank out three books a year.

This critical biography joins a half-dozen or so studies of his life and works. Though it contains little that is new, it is a highly readable presentation of a fascinating figure, a zealous member of the clergy and a highly capable writer. While it does not supersede C. C. Martindale's Life of Monsignor Robert Benson (1917) or Arthur Christopher Benson's Hugh: Memoir of a Brother (1915), it does bring various matters about his life, personality, and works into better perspective. Martindale, who to some extent envied Benson's great success, ironically, wrote his biography at the specific request of Cardinal Bourne, who tended to distrust Anglican convert-priests. Benson, additionally, was never on good terms with Cardinal Bourne. As for Arthur Christopher Benson's treatment of his younger brother's life, it reveals that he failed to appreciate Hugh's gifts and that he could never fully accept that someone ordained into the Anglican clergy, as Hugh had been in 1895, could then be ordained in the Roman Church on June 13, 1904—within nine months of his conversion.

Highly thought of in Rome, he was granted a private audience with Pius X. After a warm discussion of ecclesiastical matters, the Pope, smiling broadly, took off his white zucchetto, and in a humble, friendly gesture lifted the black one Hugh was wearing, and exchanged them. Hugh was ecstatic, and took the exchange of zucchettos as a sign of the Pope's expectations of great things from him.

Back in England Hugh worked indefatigably for the Church every way he could. Having a literary inclination, in eleven years, the span of his life as a Roman Catholic priest, he completed twenty novels, wrote plays, children's books, a great deal of poetry, and volumes of popular apologetics. Prominent among his presentations of the Faith are such books as Christ in the Church,

The Friendship of Christ, Confessions of a Convert, and Paradoxes of Christianity.

As a preacher he drew enormous crowds. Though he usually spoke with a slight stammer in ordinary conversation, in the pulpit he was always smooth, forceful, eloquent, convincing, moving. Many who were mesmerized by his sermons claimed he was the best preacher they had ever heard proclaim the Gospel. His reputation was such that wherever he spoke he packed the churches.

Despite his public acclaim and literary successes, like other notable individuals, he had his share of problems; but he tried to surmount them with his work as a spiritual adviser to an ever-increasing number of penitents, converts, and potential converts. To all who came within his orbit he offered comfort and encouragement. Always the priest that Pius X thought Hugh would be, he did his utmost to present Divine Truths in all he did. Wise enough to avoid ecclesiastical politics and personalities, he nevertheless occasionally stumbled into, as he put it, "blazing indiscretions." Despite strong opposition from Cardinal Bourne, and only through the persistent efforts of friends in Rome, was he made a Papal Chamberlain to Pius X.

Janet Grayson's account of Benson's life and works is straightforward and objective. Her biography is not "a puff-piece," a call for a Benson revival, or an attempt to send readers back to his books. One question, however, lingers: were his original readers mistaken about the quality of his books? Evelyn Waugh did not think so, and once commented that Benson was an almost faultless novelist. Most of his books are now out of print; indeed, Books in Print (1997-98) lists only four of his works that are currently available. Possibly some enterprising publisher will reissue his By What Authority'*, Come Rack! Come Rope!, The King's Achievement, The Queen's Tragedy, or one—or even a few—of his other exciting works of historical fiction.

Benson's spiritual influence is, of course, extremely difficult to measure. That at one time he moved young intellectuals, not only in Britain and America but in France as well, toward matters spiritual can be demonstrated. Three of his French devotees come quickly to mind—Jacques and Raissa Maritain and Teilhard de Chardin.

GA. Cevasco

St. John's University, New York

(Re)reading, Reception, and Rhetoric: Approaches to Roman Catholic Modernism. By C. J. T. Talar. [American University Studies, Series VII: Theology and Religion, Vol. 206.] (New York: Peter Lang. 1999. Pp. xü, 216. $44.95.)

Not that an international competition is afoot, but last summer in Rome, three German colleagues told me that, while interest in Roman Catholic Modernism

is growing in Germany, their scholarship lags fifteen years behind the States'. The relatively advanced state of Modernist research in the United States is due in no small measure to the work of C. J. T. Talar, who consistently pushes the historiographical envelope with relatively new applications of sociological and literary analyses. Doubly doctored in sociology and theology, Talar is uniquely qualified for his project. This latest work emerged developmentally from his dissertation on "A Sociological Reading of the Modernist Crisis" (1979); from his first book, Metaphor and Modernist: The Polarization of Alfred Loisy and His Neo-Thomist Critics (1987); and from a score of more recent articles and papers.

Five essays, flanked by a brief introduction and summary conclusion, are cleverly linked by the three R's of the book's title. Talar's overall interest lies in exploring the dynamics of interaction between texts and readers. Thus he uses reception and literary theory to explore not only what a text means but how it means, thereby wunrinating why readers react to texts as they do.

His first essay argues that Loisy's autobiographical/ecclesiastical context led him to employ a literary strategy in L'Évangile et l'église that ultimately undermined his purpose. Loisy's felt need to insinuate some of his views rather than state them openly resulted in a constantly shifting viewpoint, as, while overtly challenging Harnack's Das Wesen des Christentums, he covertly challenged the Catholic Church's stance on the immutability of dogma and proof-texting exegetical tradition. The result was an oblique communication that delighted a few sympathetic readers, roiled some who were not fooled, but simply confused most.

The second essay takes two analytical angles on Loisy as reader and re-reader. It appeals to the (re)reading theory of Matie Calinescu and Pierre Bourdieu's sociological analysis to show how changing institutional settings affected Loisy's multiple readings of the Fourth Gospel. The third essay shifts to Marie-Joseph Lagrange's La Méthode historique, as Talar employs Hans Robert Jauss's "aesthetics of reception" to show how factors both internal and external to texts—e.g., the Church-State struggle—shape their reception. The fourth essay draws on the rhetorical theories of Chaim Perelman and Lucie Olbrects-Tytaca to disclose Albert Houtin's prophetic agenda behind his ostensibly objective historical writings—namely, to proclaim that the secularization of the science of biblical criticism necessarily follows from the secularization of natural science. Finally, Talar trains Hayden White's tropological analysis on Loisy's autobiographical Choses passées to iUuminate how Loisy read his own personal history and sought to give it both continuity and integrity, despite its obvious discontinuity and dissonance.

Talar's work is dense and challenging. Some of the difficulty lies in a complex rhetorical style and unexplained jargon. Misspellings, typos, and grammatical lapses also mar the text. Those cavils aside, this study richly rewards effort, as it opens vistas of possibilities for further research and deeper understanding, not

only for Modernism but for virtually any other field that deals with historical texts. It belongs in every academic library.

David G. Schultenover, SJ.

Creighton University

War and Faith: The Religious Imagination in France, 1914-1930. By Annette Becker. Translated from the French by Helen McPhail. [The Legacy of the Great War.] (Berg. Distributed by New York University Press. 1998. Pp. xiii, 191. $55.00.)

In the "Introduction" to this noteworthy monograph, Annette Becker highlights the singularity of the French experience of World War I. At the outset of the war, unlike Great Britain, France was still feeling the sting of defeat in 1870 and the resulting loss of Alsace-Lorraine. At the end of the war, unlike the United States, France had suffered the full, long toll of the ordeal, not just its final offensive and victory. Moreover, France had lost a staggering 1,350,000 men, and the northeastern regions of the country lay largely in ruins. How could sense be made of such suffering and how could fitting memory be made of those who died for France? These are the two questions at the heart of this meticulously researched study.

The response to the first of these two questions comprises more than half the book and involves an exhaustive examination of the conduct not only of the troops in the trenches but also of their loved ones back home. In both cases, there was an extraordinary religious renewal, which coincided with the equally extraordinary political response of the Union Sacrée. France was thus united, militarily on the front, politically in its government, and spiritually in its turn toward God. Becker convincingly argues that Catholicism was especially well suited to the spiritual yearnings of war-ravaged France because of its theology of resurrection through suffering and death. However, she also demonstrates the ecumenical character of the wartime religious renewal, experienced as well among French Protestants and Jews.

In many respects, the second question concerning fitting memory of the war dead is more familiar terrain for historians. Here the author artfully examines the competing efforts of the Republic and of the Church to take control of the legacy of the fallen French soldiers. The burial of the Unknown Soldier of France beneath the Arch of Triumph and the dedication of the Basilica of Sacré-Coeur du Montmartre represent the fullest official memorials of the French war dead. However, it is the experience of ordinary French men and women, not the responses of the political or religious elites, which constitutes the focus of this study. Therein the author is strikingly original in her use of sources, which range from postcards from the front, to intercessory prayers and even superstitious practices. The result is a rare, fascinating analysis of religious conduct

from below. Apart from price, this book would be an excellent model for historical methods courses in graduate programs.

The translation by Helen McPhail is both accurate and graceful. The illustrations are judiciously selected. Unfortunately, the book does not contain a bibliography, but full citations are included in the abundant footnotes. That omission is a small flaw in an otherwise superb study.

Francis J. Murphy

Boston College

A Time of Silence: Civil War and the Culture of Repression in Franco's Spain, 1936-1945. By Michael Richards. [Studies in the Social and Cultural History of Modern Warfare.] (New York: Cambridge University Press. 1998. Pp. xii, 314. $59.95.)

This heavily annotated work (over one-third of the book is footnotes) by Michael Richards, a lecturer at the University of the West of England, "attempts to show how the Civil War was understood and absorbed . . . during and in the immediate aftermath of the conflict ... by exploring the interchanges between violence, ideas and economics during a period in which liberalism was seen as a foreign contagion that infected carriers of impurities, such as freemasons, regional nationalists, the working class, non-Catholics and women. . . ."

Richards accomplishes this task by using every source he can to bolster his thesis and ignoring those that do not. The result is an uneven work that diminishes the validity of his original intention. Every bloodthirsty statement of a Nationalist supporter, every incident of persecution of the working class and of non-Catholics is used to convince the reader that these were the norm. As one example, Richards rejects the carefully documented estimate of Ramón Salas Larrazábal of 2,314 executions by Franco's supporters in Granada during 1936, mentions Ian Gibson's undocumented "5,000 to 6,000", and then inflates that to 8,000, without any documentation.

Of course, the repression was terrible and unjust, but Richards fails to put it in the context of reprisals for executions carried out by leftists during the first few weeks of the war. This is particularly true of the documented thousands of clergy and the undocumented many more thousands of laity killed because they were Catholics. The embracing of the Franco regime by the church hierarchy and by most ordinary Catholics has to be viewed in this context, but Richards fails to provide it.

This major caveat aside, Richards' book is interesting in that it shows, among other insights, how the regime used Catholicism as part of its attempt to create a new Spain. Thus, "national-Catholicism" was integrated into the views of a revived Spain based on sixteenth-century values, rejecting modern progressive European models as foreign to the nature of Spaniards. Along with this was the

regime's imposition of autarchy as an economic doctrine, which Richards argues, was done not so much for economic reasons as for cultural ones, namely, to keep out foreign influences and, further, to make Spaniards suffer for having supported the Republic. Much of the regime's rhetoric, and Richards' as well, is biological: liberalism "infects" and the "cure" is hard work and austerity. Furthermore, the Church's view of suffering as necessary for salvation was placed in a political context. The destruction of the Spanish economy by the war and the resultant widespread starvation after 1939, led Franco, with the approval of some clergy, to claim that this suffering was a "spiritual punishment, the punishment which God imposes upon a distorted life, upon an unclean history." Richards has found every embarrassing clerical statement and sermon to back his view, again ignoring those clergy who opposed this rationale, including Cardinal Isidro Goma, the Primate of Spain.

As a corrective to Richards' unbalanced views, there is Stanley Payne's objective and measured The Franco Regime (1987). Reading Payne's chapters on the war and the immediate postwar period and comparing them with Richards' book makes one wonder if they are writing about the same period.

José M. Sánchez

Saint Louis University

The Vatican and the Red Flag: The Struggle for the Soul of Eastern Europe. By Jonathan Luxmoore and Jolanta Babiuch. (New York: Geoffrey Chapman. 1999. Pp. xiv, 351. $39.95.)

Historians have generally not studied religion, and, as a result, the dynamic impact of religion upon significant events has been underestimated. This book, written by a journalist Jonathan Luxmoore, and his wife, Jolanta Babiuch, who is a lecturer at Warsaw University's Institute of Sociology, helps to shed light on the pivotal role that the Catholic Church played in bringing down the Soviet empire. With verve and drama, the authors tell the story of Catholicism's confrontation with Marxist-Leninist ideology in the twentieth century. Using the life of John Paul II, from his birth in Wadowice, Poland, to his present reign as pope, as a thread to weave their story, Luxmoore and Babiuch explain how the Church at first failed to address the problems precipitated by the industrial revolution and thereby helped to open the door to radical ideologies that promised social and economic justice, then suffered horrific persecution at the hands of the ideologists, then endured marginalization as Franklin D. Roosevelt aligned himself with one of the chief ideologues, Joseph Stalin, even after Hitler was going down to defeat, and finally moved to a leadership position in the struggle against Communism under Pope John Paul II and soon brought the Iron Curtain down.

The story is interesting and based on church documents and mainly secondary sources, but it is somewhat one-dimensional. It covers church policy, to

be sure, and shows where the Church had shortcomings and where it had strengths, but it never really comes to grips with the dynamic role of the Catholic Church in world history. As a result, it fails to explain the fundamental role of religion in sustaining the West against Communism and, by the same token, in weakening Soviet society because the Communists attacked religion and thus cut the taproot of social order. Furthermore, while the study rightly places John Paul II at the head of the drive to bring down the Soviet empire, it does not appreciate that the pope, like earlier popes, still had no troops or weapons to move the Communist authorities, and so had to wait until a leader appeared in the most powerful of the Western states who would take a moral stand against Communism and use the threat of force to back up his words. As it turned out, two leaders emerged: Ronald Reagan and Margaret Thatcher. In combination with the pope, they abandoned the policy of debilitating compromises with the Communists, and Communist society quickly imploded.

The book does make the cogent point that the entire century was largely a struggle between religion and ideology, a fact that most historians fail to grasp as they focus solely upon economics, politics, or national security. However, the authors do not develop and explore their insight. Religious vigor, or the lack thereof, reveals much about order in many countries, from Russia to Poland to Bosnia to the United States, and it desperately needs more attention from the academic community.

The great lesson of history for nations and civilizations at the end of the twentieth century seems to be that religion, not ideology, is a requisite for order. Furthermore, Western Christianity, particularly the Catholic Church, is not only a source of order, but also a wellspring of change, more so than any other religion, including Orthodoxy, Islam, Judaism, Hinduism, Buddhism, and Taoism/Confucianism, and might very well be a prerequisite for modern Western-style democracy and economic development.

Dennis J. Dunn

Southwest Texas State University

American

John Eliot's Mission to the Indians before King Philip's War. By Richard W Cogley. (Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press. 1999. Pp. xiv, 331. $45.00.)

Richard Cogley's new book adds significantly to our understanding of Puritan missionary John Eliot's work among Indians in eastern Massachusetts from the 1640's to the eve of King Philip's War (1675-76). He is the first to integrate Eliot's thought, his interactions with other figures and institutions in both Eng-

land and New England, and the pastoral and administrative dimensions of his mission. Along the way Cogley corrects many details—as well as some lesser interpretive points—in the works of previous scholars. In particular, he shows that "praying Indians" asserted themselves far more forcefully than some previous scholars have suggested, and details more closely than they the lives of individual Indians.

Nevertheless, Cogley's discussion remains incomplete. On one hand, Cogley attempts to refute the arguments of several "revisionists," including this reviewer, who argued in the 1970's and '80's that Eliot's work was bound up with the larger English colonial project in which eastern Massachusetts Indians were disempowered. On the other hand, he declines to engage the primary subject matter that these "revisionists" introduced to the historiography: the larger cultural and historical contexts within which "praying Indians" came to identify themselves as such. What Indians brought to the missionary encounter in terms of beliefs, identities, and pre-colonization histories figures not at all in this book.

Another major omission arises from Cogley's chronology. By ending his study in 1675, Cogley avoids confronting the strongest evidence against his favorable verdict on Eliot's success: the shallowness of popular support for the missions, among both colonists and Indians. This shallowness cannot be attributed simply to the passions of wartime. When combined even with Cogley's own evidence, the mission's wartime collapse forces a more trenchant consideration. In connection with his ignoring the war, Cogley decides in his concluding evaluation of Eliot's mission not to include praying towns founded within five years of the war's outbreak. Yet these towns were as integral to the mission record as the older ones over which Eliot exercised more influence; the fact that they did not live up to his hopes does not detach them from his mission. Cogley denies the mission's links with English colonization by not considering some of the major evidence for such links in his favorable evaluation.

While full of useful information and of instructive reinterpretations of events and individuals, Cogley's book is finally a throwback to an older approach to mission studies, one that is concerned ultimately with extolling and exonerating missions. While finding fault with Eliot on occasion, Cogley generally strives to defend the missionary from his critics then and now. Such efforts are largely beside the point in the best current scholarship on missionaries' interactions with indigenous peoples, which views Euro-Indian encounters as moments of cultural crossing in which identities were modified and refashioned on all sides. Only by carefully examining the many contexts intersecting in missionary encounters, and by avoiding smgle-minded efforts to criticize and defend positions irrelevant to such examination, will scholars enrich our understanding of those encounters.

Neal Salisbury

Smith College

Boston Catholics: A History of the Church and Lts People. By Thomas H. O'Connor. (Boston: Northeastern University Press. 1998. Pp. xvi, 358. $28.95.)

Writing a history of the Catholic Church in Boston is a challenge for any historian; for Thomas H. O'Connor, professor emeritus of history in Boston College, it was obviously a pleasure. The skill of the author is evident in the way he integrates the story of the Church and its people with developments in secular society on the local, national, and international levels. Preceded by a helpful introduction and followed by an insightful conclusion, the core of the work is composed of eight chapters, each of which provides an essay on secondary sources for further investigation. Illustrations are strategically placed throughout the book to make the text come alive.

The first chapter covers nearly two centuries from the founding of Boston in 1630 to the end of the episcopacy of the "civil" and "friendly" Jean Lefebvre de Cheverus, Boston's first Roman Catholic bishop (1808-1823). With the focus of the chapter set by its title, "No Catholics Need Apply," the reader sees how Catholics moved from outcasts in Boston during colonial times to being tolerated by the first quarter of the nineteenth century.

Under Boston's second bishop (1825-1846), the "forthright" and "scholarly" Benedict Joseph Fenwick, Catholics were still "Strangers in the Land." Fenwick, who coped with bigotry and cared for a vast diocese which covered all of New England, was effective in having the city's school committee remove a textbook offensive to Catholics and in founding a diocesan newspaper to deal with attacks on their religion. If the burning of the Ursuline convent and boarding school in Charlestown in 1834 was Fenwick's greatest tragedy, the founding of the College of the Holy Cross in 1843 remains his greatest triumph.

What stamped the tenure of the "cultivated" and "intelligent" John Bernard Fitzpatrick, the third bishop of Boston (1846-1866), were "The Famine Years," when the city's Catholics, mostly Irish immigrants, came to adjust themselves to American society by facing the Know-Nothings and by coping with the American Civil War. Yet, by 1861, when Harvard bestowed on the Catholic bishop an honorary doctorate in divinity, they had become more acceptable and had switched their political allegiance from the Democratic to the Republican Party.

Under the "laconic" and "taciturn" John J. Williams, the city's fourth bishop (1866-1907), the "Growth and Assimilation" of the Irish, the backbone of the Church in Boston, was evident in the names of Andrew Carney, John Boyle O'Reilly, and others. However, with the arrival of other immigrants from Europe, Boston Catholics had "A Changing Church" which began to deal with the needs of French, German, Italian, Lithuanian, and Polish Catholics, among others. Such developments on the local and regional levels were reflective of challenges on the national level that split the nation's Catholic churchmen who responded as Americanists or as Romanists in a controversy which Williams had witnessed developing through the Second and Third Plenary Councils of Balti-

more. Though his own diocese had become an archdiocese with a larger population, it was geographically smaller with more diverse problems, and Williams handled them in a style not unlike the laissez-faire approach of that era's corporate executives.

With the "authoritarian" and "proud" William Henry O'Connell succeeding Archbishop Williams, Boston's Catholics had their fifth episcopal leader for an era (1907-1944) when they reflected "A Sense of Solidarity." Perhaps more than any of his predecessors, O'Connell's personality affected the character of Boston's Catholicism, especially after he became the city's first cardinal in 1911. Unlike Williams in managing the archdiocese, his Roman style and his deep sense of the richness of his Catholic heritage helped his flock to realize that it need not feel inferior to the Yankee establishment. If Williams emphasized the charitable institutions of the archdiocese, O'Connell expanded its churches, particularly the ethnic ones, and encouraged the development of its educational structure, including colleges. Yet, even on social issues, O'Connell tended to be more conservative than liberal.

With his successor, the "crusty" and "unpredictable" Richard J. Cushing, Boston Catholics, as never before, experienced "Winds of Change" (1945-1970). Compared to O'Connell, Cushing had the touch of the common man in an era stimulated by the Second Vatican Council when the church was coming out of its ghetto mentality and shaping a more ecumenical vision. Created a cardinal in 1959, Cushing was so generous in using funds that he ran the archdiocese into a debt which became a burden for his successor. Yet, Cushing gave Boston Catholics a broader vision of the Catholic Church by his founding of the Society of St. James the Apostle to help spread the faith in Latin America and by his defense of religious freedom at Vatican Council II.

For the concluding years of the twentieth century, Boston Catholics have been engaged in "Meeting the Future" under two quite different leaders. The "humble" and "pious" Humberto Medeiros (1970-1984) had to care for new immigrants from Latin America and Asia while coping with the see's burdensome debt. Elevated to cardinal in 1973, Medeiros brought the church's finances under control and bonded the life of the Church closer to the people in significant ways. Though Boston Catholics had to deal with a decline in their churches and schools, their leader was frustrated in dealing with his flock on the racial issue. In 1985, Medeiros was succeeded by the "elusive" and "shrewd" Bernard Law, who was that same year made a cardinal. Despite the challenging changes to which Cardinal Law has been responding creatively and efficiently in governing his archdiocese, Boston Catholics reflected more independence and were more critical of their Church which adhered strongly to traditional teachings.

O'Connor's work shows how much the Church and its people have changed over Boston's long history. In his "Conclusion," he states that "the feminization of the Church is not just inevitable—it has already happened" (p. 336). This remarkable statement should heighten the consciousness of American Catholics

about the direction which their Church, already weakened by a lack of priests and nuns, is taking as it enters a new millennium.

The strength and the weakness of the work center around O'Connor's expertise on the Irish in Boston. Confusion emerges in three places where he speaks of the city's mayors: Hugh O'Brien is "the first Irish-born Roman Catholic mayor of the city" (p. 139); Patrick Collins is "Boston's first Irish-born Roman Catholic mayor" (p. 155); and John E Fitzgerald is "the city's first Boston-born Irish-Catholic mayor" (p. 237). While the first two statements contradict one another, the third one contradicts the historical fact that a native of the West End of Boston, namely, Daniel A. Whelton (1872-1953), who immediately preceded Fitzgerald, was "the city's first Boston-born Irish-Catholic mayor." Nevertheless, O'Connor's book is an exceptionally fine one for anyone who wants to understand Boston Catholics.

Vincent A. Lapomarda

College of the Holy Cross

Massacre at the Yuma Crossing: Spanish Relations with the Quechans, 1779-1782. By Mark Santiago. (Tucson: The University of Arizona Press. 1998. Pp. xv, 220. $35.00.)

Since the journeys of St. Paul, Christian missionaries have gone forth to convert the world, trusting in the Holy Spirit. The degree of that trust, compromised by human nature, informs their actions. When it is low, they are inclined to take matters into their own hands, publicly knocking down the idols of opposing cultures. When it is high, they rely more on example and friendly persuasion. Fray Francisco Garces (1738-1781), a Spanish Franciscan, trusted to a high degree and gave his life. More than that of any other individual, this is his story.

From his chance meeting with Quechan (Yuma) headman Olleyquotequiebe (Salvador Palma) in August, 1771, just below the junction of the Gila and Colorado rivers until his violent death nearby a decade later, Garces bound himself, with God's help, to bring the native peoples of the region to Christianity and at the same time to assure overland passage from Sonora to California.

The story has been told before, but never with such focus. Mark Santiago of the Arizona Historical Society keeps his eye on the crossing. Utilizing all available primary and secondary sources, he crafts a straightforward, fast-moving chronicle that contains the requisite historical context but does not wander.

After a heroic decade of exploration and reform, Spain's entry into the war against Great Britain in 1779 caused a debilitating shift in men and matériel from New Spain's northern frontier to the Mississippi Valley and Gulf of Mexico. Familiar proposals like extending missions, presidios, and towns along the Gila and Colorado rivers had to be scaled back or abandoned altogether.

Abandonment might have saved Garces. Instead, Commandant General Teodoro de Croix endorsed a low-budget compromise: two isolated, makeshift communities, each with two Franciscan missionaries, ten soldiers, ten farmers, and five laborers, all with their dependents, set out in the winter of 1780-81 on the California side of the Colorado across from today's Yuma, Arizona.

Using quotations to good effect, Santiago conveys the growing tension as two or three thousand Quechans, fewer than two hundred colonists, and four Franciscans jostled to survive in a spare environment.

Although some Spaniards feared trouble, everyone relied on Father Garces to keep the peace. When the Quechan uprising erupted in July, 1781, it closely resembled a hundred others, down to the scheming, vindictive Hispanicized native interpreter who turned on his former masters. During the massacre, after scores of men, women, and children had been killed or taken captive, Salvador Palma allegedly ordered that Garces be spared. Francisco Xavier refused to listen.

Hence, the overland road to California was closed. Several punitive expeditions failed to humble the Quechans or capture their rebellious leaders. Spanish officials masked their shame in the boast that thirty armed men could force passage anytime they chose, but they never did.

John L. Kessell

University of New Mexico

Hispanic Catholicism in Transitional California: The Life of José Gonzalez Rubio, O.EM. (1804-1875). By Michael Charles Neri. [Academy of American Franciscan History: Monograph Series, Volume 14.] (Berkeley: Academy of American Franciscan History. 1997. Pp. xii, 175. $30.00.)

While historians and the reading public have long been familiar with Archbishop Jean B. Lamy's troubles with his native New Mexican clergy, similar episodes developed in the Pacific West after American conquest. Two Spanish-born bishops in Gold Rush California attempted to introduce greater regularity in clerical discipline and in the religious traditions practiced by Mexican Catholics. Joseph Sadoc Alemany archbishop of San Francisco, and Thaddeus Amat, bishop of Monterey-Los Angeles, faced monumental challenges in establishing their respective sees. Their unfortunate clashes with certain members of their flocks have attracted only passing scholarly attention, principally because of the more irenic resolution of the most drastic conflict in Santa Barbara. These pacific results were due in large measure to the efforts of the cleric who is the subject of this fine biography.

Born in Guadalajara, Mexico, José González Rubio entered the Franciscan Order, was ordained in 1827, and later affiliated with the friars' missionary college of Our Lady of Guadalupe of Zacatecas for assignment to the Alta Cali-

fornia missions. He held numerous administrative posts in California between 1833 and his death in 1875, and was secretary to the first bishop of the Californias in 1842. Upon that prelate's demise, González Rubio assumed administration of the diocese and negotiated a turbulent interregnum, 1846 to 1850, when the United States seized California in the war with Mexico, followed by massive immigration with the discovery of gold in 1848. With few priests, little money, and enormous needs for ministry, the Franciscan "administrator of the miter" capably managed as best he could to serve a vast multi-national flock.

The author makes a significant contribution to the scholarship of the history of the West and of the Roman Catholic Church in the United States in his careful explanation of the complexities that González Rubio resolutely faced. Neri explains the social and economic catastrophes that befell Spanish-speaking Catholics with the imposition of American legal, political, and economic systems. He notes how these jarring changes coincided with the more rigorous religious discipline introduced with the arrival of the hierarchy in San Francisco and Monterey-Los Angeles. Ironically, the man who had labored hardest to preserve the Church during the earlier years of turmoil found himself the object of the ire of his new bishop, Thaddeus Amat.

Neri offers a balanced and even-handed account of the origins of the serious disagreements Amat found with the Franciscan community in Santa Barbara, where González Rubio resided and served. Even when Amat suspended the Franciscan's priestly faculties, González Rubio never publicly criticized the ordinary of the diocese. This priest's action contrasted with his clerical counterpart in Taos, José Antonio Martinez, who clashed with Archbishop Lamy and eventually incurred excommunication. The Franciscans in California, however, like fellow religious in the state, the Jesuits and the Daughters of Charity of St. Vincent de Paul, resisted the hierarchy respectfully but tenaciously with extended and vigorous appeals to Rome.

The extensive archival materials that document Amat's conflicts with the Franciscans provided the author with rich sources for developing this biography. Neri's significant monograph profitably uses the life of this dedicated cleric as a window onto a troubled era of transitions for church leaders and the laity. One hopes that we will soon see further works from this insightful and thought provoking scholar.

Michael E. Engh, SJ.

Loyola Marymount University, Los Angeles

Lone Star Bishops: The Roman Catholic Hierarchy in Texas. By Franklin C. Williamsjr. (Waco:Texian Press. 1997. Pp. xi,621. $25.00.)

In the preface to his study, the author states that, while he was always interested in the history of Texas, his particular attraction to the Catholic narrative

of the state found its initial inspiration in his reading of Carlos Eduardo Castañeda's seven-volume study, Our Catholic Heritage in Texas. The final result of Williams' dedication to the story of the growth of the Catholic Church in Texas is his lengthy and detailed Lone Star Bishops: The Roman Catholic Hierarchy in Texas, a book that consumed more than twenty years in being researched and written. Dr. Williams is an independent scholar who has taught history at Stephen F. Austin State University, Austin Peay State University, East Texas State University, and the University of Wisconsin at Madison, where he earned his doctorate in history.

Williams' tome is organized into two parts, each of which could have been published as a smaller but valued contribution to the historiography of the Catholic Church in Texas. The first 184 pages of Lone Star Bishops, Part One, surveys in considerable depth varied aspects of the formation and operation of the episcopacy in Texas. This section of Williams' effort is divided into eleven areas. In his treatment here Williams offers an overview of the province of San Antonio, comments on the foundation of the office of bishop, describes the formative education of a bishop for Texas, analyzes the theological and juridical nature of the episcopate, defines how a bishop is designated, identifies types of bishops and their duties, reflects on episcopal style, reviews the development of the province of San Antonio within Texas, focuses on the topic of the bishop and his diocese, speaks to finances, and finishes Part One with what he refers to as "Roman Catholic Bishops in Texas: A Processional."

By far the most significant section of Lone Star Bishops, however, is Part Two: more than three hundred pages of biographical material treating every one of Texas' sixty-three bishops, from the state's first diocesan ordinary, Jean-Marie Odin, CM., named Vicar Apostolic in 1842 and first Bishop of Galveston in 1847, to all members of the present Texas episcopacy. Listed alphabetically, each prelate receives several pages of coverage. Generally quite well done, because of the breadth of the material the biographies do occasionally contain mistakes. For example, on page 403 Williams refers to Odin in 1837 as the Visitor (Superior) of the American Province of the Congregation the Mission. But Odin was never the American Vincentians' Visitor. And, in fact, in 1837 Father John Timon, CM., future first Bishop of Buffalo, New York, held that title. Moreover, because of the focus of Lone Star Bishops as a biographical tome, certain thematic concerns, such as nativism, slavery, Catholic immigrant struggles, Catholic-Protestant tensions, and so forth receive little or only cursory attention.

Nonetheless, the biographical section of the study will prove to be an excellent reference source for students of the Catholic Church in Texas for some time to come. In that respect, Lone Star Bishops is a volume that everyone interested in the Roman Catholic historical legacy of Texas should have in his or her library.

Patrick Foley

Editor, Catholic Southwest

Thy Honored Name: A History of the College of the Holy Cross, 1843-1994. By Anthony J. Kuzniewski, SJ. (Washington, D.C.: The Catholic University of America Press. 1999. Pp. xxv, 516. $34.95.)

Anthony Kuzniewski, SJ., professor of history in the College of the Holy Cross, can tell a good story. Others have written histories of Holy Cross, but none has matched his literary skill and historical acumen. This is genuine history, not a celebratory essay. The author's thoroughness and attention to detail persuade one that no relevant document illuminating the college's history has been overlooked. Moreover, using data-based analysis and quantification technique, all nineteenth-century Holy Cross students were profiled, plus every class in the twentieth century for years ending in zero and five. Over 11,000 profiles were collected. The search was both enlightening and disappointing; an abundance of information was collected, and despite considerable gaps in it, the results are both summarized in the text and used to construct graphs and charts.

The story unfolds in three parts: the first, from 1843 to 1901, or from the founding of "a New England college" and the influence of Boston's bishop Benedict Fenwick, to an indelible, permanent stamp of Jesuit character. Along with a recounting of "the struggle for success" reminiscent of the early life of most Catholic colleges of the time, there are many interesting sidelights, like the chartering tempest, the Georgetown degrees for Holy Cross students until I860, the devastating fire that all but destroyed Fenwick Hall, and an association with the famous convert Orestes A. Brownson and his four sons.

The second part, 1901 to I960, is filled with a variety of vexations. Money was in short supply and the school's needs were pressing; financial distress was a constant cloud on the horizon. But these years, too, were a time when Catholic colleges, and Holy Cross chief among them, began to reconstruct their curricula. It might be argued that Jesuit colleges shed their traditional classical curricula more slowly than others, but shed them they did. Charles W Eliot's direct influence on curricular change in American higher education might be somewhat inflated, and one should be slow to give him credit for priming the pump for electivism in Jesuit schools. Perceptive Jesuit educators could read the signs along the American academic trail as well as Eliot. In any case, it appears that his private correspondence and conversation with Holy Cross Jesuits were a good deal more cordial and civil than his public stance and utterance about Catholic college academic standards.

The third part, I960 to 1994, "this remarkable burst toward the future," features the skülful and stable leadership of presidents Raymond Swords and John Brooks (together their terms covered thirty-five years). Under their direction, foEowing the post-World War II college boom, Holy Cross came of age. Part of the right of passage involved coeducation, an early 1970's occurrence at Holy Cross that was met with a surprising equanimity. As a bastion of Jesuit tradition

and standard, Holy Cross might have become a battleground over an admission policy poised to admit women. Instead, to maintain its high academic standards and meet its enrollment goals, talented young women were made welcome.

A persistent complaint of past administrative practice in most Catholic colleges is the brevity of presidential terms. Most schools followed a rule for religious superiors that limited presidents (and in Jesuit houses, rectors) to two three-year terms. At Holy Cross, if Fathers Swords and Brooks are excluded, presidential terms averaged slightly fewer that four years, but Father Kuzniewski does not call this a fault. All presidents were young, usually under forty, some had administrative experience before taking office at Holy Cross, and only two served separate terms: Fathers Anthony Ciampi (three) and Joseph Dinand (two). The author is persuasive in arguing that an absence of local autonomy—with all grave decisions made at a provincial or higher level—was only a brake on, not an obstacle to, progress.

Whether the author or the publisher should be credited, notes are where they belong, at the bottom of the page, where either for documentation or explanation, they are excellent. The book might have benefited from a standard bibliography. Finally, it is a handsome, almost flawless volume, that scholars and others interested in American higher education are sure to welcome.

Edward J. Power

Boston College

The Emergence of a Black Catholic Community: St. Augustine's in Washington. By Morris J. MacGregor. (Washington, D.C.: The Catholic University of America Press. 1999. Pp. xiii, 543. $39.95 clothbound; $24.95 paperback.)

This is how parish history should be written: with an eye to the big picture! In this substantial volume, Morris J. MacGregor, drawing on rich archival sources, newspapers, and oral interviews, gracefully recounts the story of St. Augustine's Parish, the mother church of black Catholics in the nation's capital and historically one of the most prominent black congregations in the city. Expanding on recent scholarship on African American Catholics and the urban encounter between Catholicism and race, MacGregor sldllfully contextualizes this particular case study of a black Catholic community in microcosm, consistently tying developments at St. Augustine's to the larger racial currents swirling through the city, nation, and church. In the process, MacGregor paints a wonderful, variegated social portrait of black Catholic Washingtonians from 1864 through the 1980's. The author argues that for fourteen decades the determined pastors, priests, and people of St. Augustine's parish, despite adversity and formidable challenges (including almost constant debt), succeeded in creating and sustaining a vibrant African American Catholic community—one

known for its social activism, rich associational life, evangelization, hospitality, devotion to education, and outstanding liturgical music.

Limitations of space prevent more than a cursory sampling of this book and its themes. The founding families of St. Augustine's were free people of color prior to the Civil War and traced their Catholicism back to colonial times in rural Maryland. Indeed, middle-class respectability and the social divisions that sometimes existed between "aristocrats of color" and lower-class blacks would characterize St. Augustine's throughout much of its history. The desire of black Catholics in Washington to educate their children and to worship free from discrimination led to the construction of St. Martin's chapel and school (the forerunners of St. Augustine's). Organizers scored a financial coup when they persuaded President Lincoln to allow them to hold a fair on the grounds of the White House in 1864 as a fundraiser. The congregation quickly outgrew the small chapel, thanks in part to its extraordinary classical choir, which attracted blacks and whites from throughout the city and whose concerts would more than once rescue the parish financially.

In 1876 the congregation moved into an imposing new brick structure on Fifteenth Street, which was placed under the patronage of St. Augustine. The energy and vigor of St. Augustine's during the late nineteenth and early twentieth century what with its fairs, parochial school, choir, and numerous parish societies fairly leap off MacGregor's crisply written pages. St. Augustine's parishioners and their supportive white pastors hosted and played crucial roles in the Black Catholic Congress movement between 1889 and 1895 at the same time that their co-religionists in New Orleans were also challenging church and state over issues of racial discrimination. In the twentieth century, St. Augustine's parishioner Thomas Wyatt Turner and his Federated Colored Catholics became the conscience of the Church, challenging the Jim Crow that had hardened in Washington during the Wilson administration. Despite segregation's apparent triumph, however, St. Augustine's remained a haven of integration where whites and blacks continued to worship together. Anticipating a new day in race relations, parishioners joined the NAACP, taught in Washington's excellent black public schools, and supported the Catholic Interracial Council.

Ironically, as that new day began to dawn, St. Augustine's experienced a series of crises that included the financially pressed congregation's move to its auditorium on Fifteenth Street and the sale of the church building in 1940. Then, in 1961, in response to demographic changes and to the integration of the Archdiocese of Washington, archdiocesan officials, without consulting parishioners, merged St. Augustine's and St. Paul's, creating a hybrid known as SS. Paul and Augustine and inadvertently eroding the identity of Washington's oldest black Catholic parish. MacGregor describes the roles played by St. Augustine's parishioners in events of the civil rights era such as the desegregation of the CYO and the March on Washington. He paints vivid portraits of Cardinal Patrick A. O'Boyle, of activist pastors Geno Baroni and Raymond B. Kemp, of parish coun-

cilor Pauline Jones, and of music director Leon Roberts. MacGregor ably captures the spirit of the urban crisis and increasing racial polarization of the late 1960's that culminated in the riots that rocked Washington in April, 1968, and that threatened the very existence of the parish. (His occasional departure from chronology in favor of a topical approach in the latter part of the book, however, and his inclusion of the names of numerous parishioners and organizations detracts occasionally from the power of the narrative.) In the midst of these crises, the parish conducted a searching re-examination of its role and mission. What emerged was "a parish come alive," reflected in numerous social ministries, a collaborative decision-making process that included pastor and parish council, the introduction of a gospel choir that soon gained acclaim, and a renewed commitment to the parish school. The decision of the archdiocese in 1982 to accede to the requests of pastor and parishioners and to revert to the use of the original name of St. Augustine's testified to that rebirth and emphasized the parish's role in preserving and enriching the black Catholic heritage.

Stephen J. Ochs

Georgetown Preparatory School

The Poor Belong to Us: Catholic Charities and American Welfare. By Dorothy M. Brown and Elizabeth McKeown. (Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press. 1997. Pp. Lx, 284. $45.00.)

Dorothy M. Brown and Elizabeth McKeown, authors of The Poor Belong to Us: Catholic Charities and American Welfare, have made an extraordinary contribution to American Catholic and American welfare-state history crafting a lucid narrative from archival research, published papers, and secondary historical analysis. Their treatment of Catholic social provision from 1870 through the 1930's will inform historical analysis in these fields for decades.

Brown and McKeown provide compelling detail and conceptual frameworks for understanding the larger shifts in personnel, administration, and policy that influenced Catholic charitable provision over these decades. They begin with New York City from 1870 to 1910, and skillfully flesh out the networks that linked Catholic politicians, clergy, women religious, and middle-class volunteers in building the Catholic charities infrastructure. Based on the principle that "The Poor Belong to Us," religious proselytization or resistance to it was the most visible rationale for caring for the Catholic majority among the poor, "but the importance of material provision and service was never undervalued" (p. 3). Subsequent chapters shift to the national stage, and detail the post-World War I rationalization of disparate local charities under diocesan control, the imposition of male clerical authority over women religious and lay volunteers, and the increasing influence of the National Conference of Catholic Charities (NCCC). In part as a defense against Protestant charges of incompetency and

corruption, some leaders promoted Catholic "professional training" and case-work methodology, inviting especially female laity to attain social work education and credentials. Catholics who ascribed to principles undergirding convent or clerical life, lay voluntarism, or professional social work expertise were thereafter in conflict over administration and policy. Brown and McKeown highlight the tendency of both Catholic social workers and clerical administrators to wrest administrative control of institutions from nuns, who tended to be unschooled in social work principles, and resistant to policies infused with its logic and methodology. In their chapter on the New Deal, the authors document the considerable influence of John O'Grady and his cohorts in the all-male upper echelons of the NCCC, who in their zeal to maintain the influence of Catholic charities helped to narrow the scope of Aid to Dependent Children (ADC). Rose McHugh, a Catholic and prominent administrator in the New Deal, claimed that the resulting legislation buttressed the logic of the English poor laws rather than the "Catholic position" that "every human being has not only a claim in charity, but a strict right to as much of the wealth of the community as is necessary to maintain his life" (p. 179).

Yet McHugh's eloquent outcry jars the reader in the last pages of the book, in part because Brown and McKeown's overall structure tends toward a progressive narrative, so that the larger trend of Catholics to adopt what had been the principles and methodologies of Protestant charities is related predominantly as a march toward progress. Nuns' reluctance to investigate the children and women under their care, for instance, seems a stubborn refusal to be dragged into the twentieth century, rather than a principled resistance to subjecting the poor to the means-testing and public shaming they believed were inherent in scientific charity and social work methodologies. McHugh's contention that ADC policies reflected a substantively different notion of how poverty should be addressed than that found in "Catholic" tradition, and that Catholics should "make known the Catholic teaching on the right to subsistence and the right to a living wage," seems a hollow battle cry. Readers are treated to too few references to this part of Catholic tradition to understand how its loss was intimately tied to professionalization and "progress," how the middle-class ideology at the heart of such "progress" gave middle-class experts authority over working-class religious, or why some Catholics chose precisely this historical moment (1933) to found and nurture the Catholic Worker movement.

The Poor Belong to Us is nonetheless the most important book on the history of Catholic charities to be published in the last half-century. Together with Mary J. Oates (Catholic Philanthropy), Brown and McKeown have rendered inadequate histories of the American welfare state that ignore the enormous influence of Catholic charities. One can no longer claim that sophisticated research and analysis of Catholic social provision has yet to be done.

Maureen Fitzgerald

College of William and Mary

When fesuits Were Giants: Louis-Marie Ruellan, SJ. (1846-1885) and Contemporaries. By Cornelius Michael Buckley, SJ. (San Francisco: Ignatius Press. 1999. Pp. 399. $21.95.)

Cornelius Buckley has written here the biography of a fellow Jesuit, Louis Ruellan (1846-1885)—a biography of insight and understanding, appreciating the twists, turns, and "ironies of history." Within the very title of his book, "When Jesuits Were Giants," he presents this Jesuit missioner of but one short summer as a "Jesuit Giant" and asks the reader to judge for himself. Father Buckley's book is not only a revealing biography of a fellow Jesuit who might otherwise be forgotten, but also a reflective view of the author himself.

The first two chapters relate the beginnings and roots of Louis Ruellan in Pordic, Brittany, France, "that craggy peninsula that turns its brooding face toward the Celtic Peninsula and islands to the north: Cornwall, Wales, and Ireland." Ruellan was a Celt to the bone, with all the contradictory, conflicting traits of character of his Celtic heritage.

Buckley's next four chapters show and reveal him to be a good teacher of history as he was for twenty-five years at San Francisco University; in relating the education and growth of Louis Ruellan as a Jesuit, priest, and a missioner, he uses the times and places in France and England to outline movements and controversies of the French Jesuits of the 1870's.

Not until Part Two of his book does Father Buckley get to the heart of the biography. In the spring of 1884, Louis Ruellan arrived in Spokane Falls full of zeal to do missionary work among the Indians. He was met by his supervisor, Joseph Cataldo, SJ. (a Jesuit giant beyond challenge). Cataldo was in the midst of a building project for "Gonzaga College," a frame church and residence to take care of the needs of the whites in the wild gold-rush town of Spokane FaUs.

Cataldo, with the decisiveness of a field commander, put Louis in charge of the entire mission: building project, church and all, for he had to leave to attend the Third Plenary Council of Baltimore, and then head for Rome seeking new recruits for his Rocky Mountain Mission. So began the busy, short summer of 1884 for Louis Ruellan.

The author presents seven letters that Louis wrote during that summer and adds enlightening commentaries to each. Here is the heart of Buckley's biography. The letters show Ruellan's response to the heroic challenge given him by Father Cataldo. These letters become a revealing autobiography of Ruellan himself.

Louis, after the completion of the summer building project, was called on a mission to Colville, a hundred miles north of Spokane Falls, to settle some intercommunity differences between the Jesuit fathers and the sisters at the mission

school. There he took a sudden chill, had a fever, developed pneumonia, and died. So ended the life of Louis Ruellan, a true Jesuit giant of one summer.

In an overview Buckley writes of the internal transformation of the Society of Jesus between 1965 and 1975: "changes greater than the Society had experienced in all its four hundred years." The reviewer was a pastor in the diocese of Spokane during those years of great change following Vatican Council II and can sympathize with a shared experience that involves Louis Ruellan himself.

In that summer of 1884, Louis Ruellan viewed with cries of joy from the high plateau overlooking the Spokane valley, his mission and parish below. What a joy to stir the soul of this poetic Breton: On that same bluff was to rise up a magnificent brick and terra cotta building that was the Jesuit philosophate, the "jewel of the Northwest" from 1916 to 1970. On the brow of that plateau is also the Jesuit cemetery where Ruellan lies in peace with fellow Jesuits of his and Father Buckley's generations.

Within the first few years of the 1970's, the beautiful Mt. St. Michael Philosophate became a huge hollow hermitage inhabited by a few ancient Jesuits. In 1978, the building and grounds were sold, to a schismatic group called the Fatima Crusades!

At the cemetery where Louis Ruellan is buried in ground that (hopefully) "will be forever Jesuit," may we add by way of epitaph for his grave the words of the poet Virgil: "Hae sunt lacrimae rerum."—These are the tears of things?

William J. Brennan

Walla Walla, Washington

The Dying of the Light: The Disengagement of Colleges and Universities from Their Christian Churches. By James Tunstead Burtchaell, C.S.C. (Grand Rapids, Michigan: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Co. 1998. Pp. xx, 868. $45.00 clothbound; $30.00 paperback.)

In The Dying of the Light, James Burtchaell offers a copiously researched, eminently readable, and highly subjective account of the ways in which church-related colleges and universities in the United States—as Burtchaell tells the story—have broken faith with their founding religious traditions. This book is history, but it is also a jeremiad, a lamentation for what has been lost. Essentially, this book is the story of how many church-related institutions of higher education have made their way down the slippery slope that leads to secularization.

Burtchaell tells his story by focusing on seventeen institutions representing seven different Christian traditions: Congregationalists (Dartmouth and Beloit), Presbyterians (Lafayette and Davidson), Methodists (Millsaps and Ohio Wesleyan), Baptists (Wake Forest, Virginia Union, and Linfield), Lutherans (Gettys-

burg, St. Olaf, and Concordia at River Forest), Catholics (Boston College, College of New Rochelle, and Saint Mary's of California), and the Evangelicals (Azusa Pacific and Dordt).

According to Burtchaell, the slippery slope is greased by a variety of factors: a deep foreboding on the part of church-related colleges and universities that religious institutions are intrinsically inferior to non-religious ones; a fear that an institution's forthright Christian identity might somehow place it in the camp of right-wing extremists; a shift from liberal arts to professional studies or adult studies or remedial studies, often in response to financial exigencies; the failure of institutions to hire faculty, recruit students, and appoint administrators and board members whose commitment to the founding denomination is beyond question, prompting a numerical decline of denominational representation in the student body, the faculty, the administration, and the board; the loss of denominational control and, in the case of Catholic institutions, the decline of religious orders in terms of both numbers and influence; the role of faculty who exhibit little or no interest in maintaining a vital connection with the founding denomination or in nurturing any sort of religious sentiment in their teaching or in the curriculum; the failure of faculty, administrators, and board members to explore how Christian theology can, in fact, sustain the life of the mind; the role of well-meaning presidents who subtly redefine the religious mission of the institution in an attempt to either broaden its constituency or make the institution more academically respectable, or both; the tendency of presidents and other administrators to engage in "double-speak" as they seek to portray the institution in one way for this constituency and another way for that; the progressively vacuous language that institutions employ for purposes of self-description, e.g., from "Catholic" to "Christian" to "spiritual" to "value-centered" to "religious"; and the visible loss of nerve that is apparent in the evolution of institutional mission statements.

Of all these factors, the most critical in Burtchaell's view is the failure of church-related institutions to maintain their denominational particularities. Thus, the subtitle of his book: The Disengagement of Colleges and Universities from their Christian Churches. But one must ask, since Burtchaell never makes it plain, why he regards denominational particularity as so important. The answer to this question is not immediately self-evident, especially in light of Burtchaell's own contention that some faith traditions bring to the table an intellectual tradition that can sustain the life of the mind, while other faith traditions do not. In such a case, why should not Christian particularity give way to a broader Christian witness? But this is the kind of development that Burtchaell repeatedly deplores.

Moreover, some Christian traditions bring to the table a sectarian mentality that is positively inimical to the life of the mind. Yet, Burtchaell often scorns those colleges and universities that view a sectarian mentality as a threat to institutional integrity and the life of the mind. Davidson College is a case in point. "Sectarian," Burtchaell writes, "was a reproach that never lost its power to un-

nerve the Davidson authorities." It is unquestionably true that some church-related institutions routinely invoke the specter of the sectarian threat, especially when they wish to hire faculty from outside the sponsoring denomination or otherwise suppress their own denominational heritage. In cases like these, the fear of sectarianism—as Burtchaell rightly points out—is simply a red herring. But Burtchaell pays virtually no regard to the fact that at some church-related colleges and universities, sectarianism can be very real and can represent a genuine threat to the life of the mind.

The reader is tempted to respond to this book in one of two ways. On the one hand, so much that Burtchaell recounts rings so true that one is tempted to accept his thesis uncritically—lock, stock, and barrel. Indeed, those concerned with a meaningful intersection of faith and learning in the context of church-related higher education will find in this book much to learn and much to admire.

On the other hand, the reader might grow wary when she or he begins to realize that every story Burtchaell relates conforms to essentially the same plot. Burtchaell himself recognizes this common plot in his final chapter entitled, appropriately enough, "The Story within the Stories." The fact that the very same plot could define the stories of all these institutions is all the more remarkable, especially when one realizes that these institutions stand in seven very different Christian traditions with seven different core theological perspectives, often substantially different from one another.

The truth is, Burtchaell pays virtually no regard to different theological models for church-related higher education and writes as if "one size fits all." Thus, for example, Calvinists and Lutherans, operating out of very different theological perspectives, might evaluate in very different ways his claim that denominational particularity is critical for the maintenance of any meaningful form of church-related higher education. Many educators in the Reformed tradition might embrace that proposition with enthusiasm, but many Lutheran educators might not. Lutherans might be far more inclined to embrace Paul Tillich's proposal that "Christianity will be a bearer of the religious answer as long as it breaks through its own particularity," a proposition that might lead Lutherans to cultivate diversity for profoundly theological reasons.

Similarly, Burtchaell disparages time and again the way in which many Roman Catholic educators employ the sacramental principle to legitimate cultural diversity in the context of Catholic higher education. Thus, he criticizes President Monan of Boston College, who, in Burtchaell's words, "appears to believe that . . . since all of human culture is an artifact of God's unceasing activity, . . . the mature Catholic university will always be at its ease in the public culture." Or again, when Sister Alice Gallin, formerly executive director of the Association of Catholic Colleges and Universities, argues that what many regard as "secularization" is, from her Catholic perspective, a "movement . . . toward inculturation," Burtchaell dismisses her contention as doublespeak.

The bottom line is this: this book implicitly rejects the diversity of theological perspectives that can inform church-related higher education, even as it rejects cultural and religious diversity within church-related higher education.

Finally, how does Burtchaell treat the category of "secularization"? In the first place, he draws careful lines between the sacred and the secular, manifesting little recognition that in real life, sacred and secular impinge upon one another in remarkable ways. And second, for a book whose fundamental thesis focuses on the process of secularization, The Dying of the Light offers remarkably imprecise understandings of what secularization might involve. Sometimes he writes as if secularization can thrive in the very midst of denominational particularity. Thus, at Boston College "the board is still heavily Catholic, mostly lay, and apparently secularized." At other times, he writes as if secularization means the absence of a particularistic denominational or religious presence. Thus, the board at Marquette University "has been both laicized and secularized; that is, neither are they mostly Jesuits or Catholics." In the main, however, it is this latter understanding that dominates this book: secular means the loss of Christian particularity, not the loss of any sacred impulse whatsoever. One is reminded of those evangelical Christians in the early nineteenth century who routinely attacked the American Founders as "infidels," simply because the Founders embraced a vision of God that stood at variance with the particularistic understandings of nineteenth-century American evangelicalism.

Still and all, Burtchaell has written a powerful book that is compelling in a variety of ways. One can hardly quarrel with his major contention that many church-related institutions of higher learning have indeed witnessed a "dying of the light." Nor can one quarrel with much of the evidence that he presents. But one must read this book critically, keeping in mind (1) that in presenting his seven faith traditions, Burtchaell obscures critical theological distinctions; (2) that some of the most fundamental categories in this book (e.g., secularization) never receive precise definition; and (3) that at least some of his evidence reflects core presuppositions that Burtchaell apparently assumes are self-evident but that may not be all that self-evident to many readers.

Richard T. Hughes

Pepperdine University

Building a Protestant Left: Christianity and Crisis Magazine, 1941-1993.

By Mark Hulsether. (Knoxville: University of Tennessee Press. 1999. Pp. xxxix, 374. $38.00.)

Reinhold Niebuhr founded Christianity and Crisis magazine in 1941 in order to combat the pacifism of The Christian Century and the social gospel more generally. For the "Utopian" thinking of the social gospel, Niebuhr and his allies sought to substitute "Christian realism." They emphasized God's transcendent judgment on sinful humanity and attacked all types of "Progressivism." At

the same time, they were committed to liberal social action. For the next fifty-two years, until its demise in 1993, Christianity and Crisis was an important part of the Protestant left. Mark Hulsether's new book is a well-written and well-organized account of the history of this magazine.

Hulsether's primary interest is in the way that Christianity and Crisis shifted "paradigms" from Christian realism to liberation theologies. In its first decades, the major emphases of the magazine were "anticommunism, New Deal type economic reform, and pro-western international development," and the magazine consistently worked in conversation with the secular elite. Sometime in the late 1960's, however, the magazine began to focus more on contextual theologies and to stress "possibilities for radical change from the standpoint of oppressed communities" (p. xvii).

Hulsether describes this paradigm shift as a real transformation, and yet he also discerns continuities within the magazine across the decades. He notes that the magazine adopted a dialectical style in which articles typically affirmed "X, but at the same time Y." Even in the early years of the magazine, the kinds of emphases that the magazine developed later appeared on the "Y hand," as Hulsether calls it. Hulsether is thus able to describe both the gradual extension of early themes and the dramatic transformation of the magazine at the same time. This sensitivity to complex developments sheds helpful light on the "shattering of consensus" and the magazine's subsequent "picking up of the pieces."

Hulsether is effective at describing the history of the magazine, but his goal is more ambitious as well. His book aims to use "Christianity and Crisis as a case study to tell a larger story about trends in postwar Protestant social thought and political activism" (p. vii). He stresses three trends: "the simultaneous upsurge of fundamentalism and stagnation of liberalism in postwar Protestantism, the explosion of multiculturalist approaches to U.S. religion, and controversies about Niebuhr's legacy in light of critiques launched by liberation theologies" (p. xxviii). Hulsether does a nice job of describing the impact that these trends had on the magazine. He says less about what his particular case study can tell us about the larger story, or even how Christianity and Crisis played a role in shaping the larger story. As a result, his work is less effective at his more ambitious goal. Nonetheless, it remains an engaging and informative piece.

Harvey Hill

Berry College
Mount Berry, Georgia

Magnificat: The Life and Times of Timothy Cardinal Manning. By Francis J. Weber. (Mission Hills, California: Saint Francis Historical Society. 1999. Pp. iv, 729. $35.00.)

Timothy Manning was born in Ballingeary, County Cork, Ireland, where children and adults all spoke Gaelic. His father was a blacksmith, who suffered from

the Irish Curse and thereby incurred his son's permanent disapproval. His mother was a daily communicant, and the cardinal later said that his earliest memory was the way she taught him to make the Sign of the Cross. The family's food came from the garden and the domestic animals, and the boy's clothing was made of wool taken from their own sheep. It was a good place for training in Christian simplicity.

Young Timothy's education was received in a two-room school, where the master insisted that all the pupils learn their lessons by memory, including the entire text of several Shakespearean plays. Later, Manning studied with the Irish Christian Brothers and in the Jesuit college at Mungret. Influenced partly by a priest-cousin in California, young Manning applied to Bishop John J. Cantwell and was accepted as a student at Saint Patrick's Seminary in Menlo Park.

A story about the trip to America says a good deal about the personality of young Timothy Manning. During the ocean crossing he saw another boy from Ireland and noticed the fellow again on the train going west. Saying a brief hello, one of them admitted that he planned to enrol in a "private Institution," while the other said he was going to California for "research." Spotting each other again on the ferry from Oakland to San Francisco, and later on the train to Palo Alto, each kept his own counsel, until finally both arrived at the seminary in separate taxis. At this point the first introduced himself: "My name is Sheamus Nash." The other said: "My name is Timothy Manning."

He was a brilliant student. Within a year of his 1934 ordination, Manning was sent to Rome for study at the Pontifical Gregorian University, where he received the licentiate's degree and finally the doctorate in canon law. Returning to California in 1938, Manning found that he was to be secretary to Cantwell in the newly-organized Archdiocese of Los Angeles. Cantwell's health deteriorated even as his archdiocese continued to expand, and when he needed a second auxiliary bishop, Manning was his choice. Told that only native-born candidates could be considered, Irishman Cantwell reacted badly, finally getting Cardinal Spellman to intervene on Manning's behalf. Cantwell died soon thereafter, and the new archbishop, James Francis Mclntyre, decided that both his auxiliaries should also be pastors of busy parishes. Manning was named pastor of Saint Gregory's in the Wilshire district. Though initially troubled by the appointment, Manning finally concluded that parish work was "the perfect school" for a bishop. In 1955 Manning took on further responsibility as vicar general.

While Mclntyre obviously trusted Manning as a bishop and to some extent as an administrator, he never considered Manning to be a close friend. Perhaps their greatest disagreement was on the new liturgy, which Manning liked and Mclntyre did not. Finally, after a particularly annoying experience, Mclntyre wrote to ask Manning to "desist from your promotion of a schism in the archdiocese," or resign as vicar general. Humbled, even humiliated, Manning immediately submitted his resignation, which the cardinal refused to accept. A dozen years later Mclntyre chose Manning as his successor, stipulating that he undergo a trial period as bishop in Fresno. Eighteen months later, his unwitting

trial period successfully completed, Manning returned to Los Angeles as coadjutor. A few months later he was archbishop and then cardinal in his own right.

One of Manning's first accomplishments was the successful settlement of the controversy with the Immaculate Heart communities. He retained McIntyre's administrative staff and enlarged it, preferring always to let others handle routine administrative duties. He continued expansion of the parochial school system, established a liturgical commission, founded a priests' senate, and organized a clerical personnel board. He even approved the construction of a modern archival center for the archdiocese. Beyond this, his main contributions were as a pastor, a preacher, and a writer. He appreciated a well-turned phrase and borrowed freely from the classical literature he had memorized as a youth. In this biography Monsignor Weber includes extensive quotations from Manning's sermons and prose, letting Timothy Manning speak for himself much of the time.[1]

To say that Manning was a private man is to understate the case. He had few close friends and few confidants. While following an open-door policy in his office and appointing a host of new commissions and advisory groups, Manning seldom volunteered information or took any administrative action that was not absolutely necessary. He preferred to listen, to smile, to acknowledge problems, and to wait for them to go away. With all this, he was humble and self-effacing to an uncommon degree. When an interviewer asked Cardinal Manning about his private life, Manning answered in astonishment, "I have no private life." Retiring, almost shy, he took greatest delight in seeing honors conferred on his subordinates.

If a biography can be a sequel, this is such a book. Timothy Manning defined his role as a spiritual leader, relying on the material advances made by his predecessors. In this way Monsignor Weber's biography of Timothy Cardinal Manning is a sequel to his biography of James Francis Cardinal McIntyre.

Well written and well illustrated, the book is printed in a clear typeface on good-quality paper. The illustrations are sharp and clean. The beautiful dust jacket is almost too good, considering that most libraries discard these covers during the cataloging process.

Harry Kelsey

Altadena, California

[1]These were published previously by the same author in Days of Change, Years of Challenge: The Homilies, Addresses, and Talks of Cardinal Timothy Manning (Los Angeles: Borromeo Guild, 1987). Two other volumes from the same publisher followed in 1990, Times of Tension and Moments of Grace, and a volume of prayers, Hours of Consecration, Minutes of Prayer.

Hesburgh: A Biography. By Michael O'Brien. (Washington, D.C.: The Catholic University of America Press. 1998. Pp. xii, 354. $34.95.)

Michael O'Brien, a professor of history in the University of Wisconsin, has chosen for the subject of his biography one of the outstanding players on the field of American higher education in the twentieth century. Theodore M. Hesburgh, C.S.C., has been a leader not only in Catholic higher education but in the broader academic community, occupying at various times the chair of such diverse groups as the American Council on Education and the Board of Overseers of Harvard University. In addition to his contribution to education, Hesburgh played a significant role in several civic and social organizations, including his work as Ambassador and Head of the United States delegation to the U.N. Conference on Science and Technology held in Vienna in 1979.

Consequently, there exists an enormous body of material concerning Hesburgh's activities. The author has had access to written sources, both published and unpublished, as well as having benefited from interviews with many persons who knew and worked with his subject in a variety of environments. O'Brien successfully keeps his focus on Hesburgh's central mission—making Notre Dame into a "great Catholic University." His love for students, with its display of "tough love" on occasion, was a key to the decisions he made on many occasions, although as the university grew and became more complex and his national and international obligations multiplied, his firsthand encounters with students diminished. The history of the Hesburgh years, as recorded by O'Brien, suggests that his greatest leadership role, both within and outside the university, was exercised in the decades of the sixties and seventies.

His early and continual defense of American Catholic higher education is recounted in chapters 3, 4, and 5 and includes his convening of the Land O'Lakes meeting in 1967, a response to Roman attempts to limit academic freedom and institutional autonomy, areas which Hesburgh saw as foundational to American higher education. He was often protected by Pope Paul VI from Curia personnel who attempted to curtail these prerogatives. His own Father General and his Provincial Superiors strongly supported his work, especially the transfer of governing authority over the university to an independent board of trustees in 1967. This board was composed of both lay and religious members; it provided for significant lay leadership while also making a strong commitment to the Holy Cross presence and influence. Notre Dame's example was followed by many other Catholic colleges and universities although without identical structures.

A weakness of O'Brien's book, however, is his over-dependence on Hesburgh's own recollection of many of the events discussed. In chapter 1 alone there are thirty footnotes citing God, Country, and Notre Dame, Hesburgh's autobiography, and this reliance on a single source is obvious in many of the other chapters. It is also disconcerting to have several sources cited in a single note

without any clear indication of the specific location where the reader could find the direct quotation. An example of this is note 30 of chapter 4, where seven articles and three interviews are mentioned. In chapter 8, footnote 45 it would have been helpful to cite the actual text of Land O'Lakes and where it could be found. The quotation from Philip Gleason on page 275 includes a quotation from President Leo McLaughlin, SJ., of Fordham University, "pay any price, break any mold" but no identification of the speaker is given.

On the whole, O'Brien has given us an interesting book, one that will inform and please many of Father Ted's admirers. What it lacks in terms of objectivity and scholarly preciseness will probably be remedied in a later definitive biography where the views of his critics will also be considered. In the meantime, the Notre Dame story, of which Hesburgh is such a large part, will continue to arouse admiration among his peers in American higher education. His influence on the rest of Catholic higher education is another important story that needs to be told in more detail, and perhaps O'Brien's work will stimulate work in that direction.

Alice Gaixin, O.S.U..

New Rochelle, New York

Canadian

Myth, Symbol, and Colonial Encounter: British and Mi'kmaq in Acadia, 1700-1867. By Jennifer Reid. [Religions and Beliefs Series, No. 4.] (Ottawa, Ontario: University of Ottawa Press. 1995. Pp. 9, 133. Can. $16.00 paperback.)

The author has attempted a gigantic task, an analysis of the "problem of community that plagues Canadian society." She believes that this is the problem of "alienation," and she considers that it is anchored in the character of the relationship between "European Canadians and all others." "For non-Europeans," she writes, "the problem has to do with alienation from dominant structures of human significance in society. For Europeans," she continues, "it has to do with the capacity of recognizing the human composition of Canadian society and, consequently, of our own human significance." She has chosen to consider her ideas by looking at "British and Mi'qmaq in Acadia" between the years 1700 and 1867.

It was Bergson who suggested that the answers we find are contained in the questions we ask, and the monograph that Reid has published inevitably reflects her assumptions about Canadian society and its make-up, as well as about the nature of the relationship between the power of political institutions and organizations of social status. What results is a work that contains an interesting survey of an eclectic bibliography, with little or no reference to political and social theory and no attempt to consider the extent to which Irish, Scottish,

French, and English differ from one another. She poses an argument that requires much greater analysis than the monograph has allowed.

Much of the argument presented in the monograph depends upon a detailed analysis of questions which Professor Reid must have considered, but has had no space to broach in this short work. For example, the sharp division into Mi'kmaq and British of the many communities that lived during the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries in the territory that today forms the provinces of Nova Scotia, New Brunswick, and Prince Edward Island needs some elaboration. Since her work specifically is said to begin in 1700, the lack of attention paid to the presence of the Acadians there, as the most populous group of European descent before 1755, should be explicitly defended. Some comment should also have been made on the interpretation of Catholic belief systems, which were common among both Acadian and Mi'kmaq during these years. If Professor Reid considers that Protestant and Catholic beliefs are interchangeable, she should make this point explicitly. It would be interesting to have her consideration of how the varying groups of new migrants were linked to one another. Are the religious views of the Gaelic-speaking and Catholic Scots, who arrived in the seventeen-seventies in Nova Scotia and were without the franchise until 1829, not significantly different from those of the Protestant Yorkshire families who arrived at much the same time, or the United Empire Loyalists, who arrived after 1783? I commend to her attention, and that of other readers, the recent publications edited by Paul Robert Magocsi, Encyclopaedia of Canada's Peoples (University of Toronto Press, 1999).

Professor Reid has had the courage to tackle an important problem. I would hope that she continues to refine her arguments and to establish them more subtly.

Naomi E. S. Griffiths

Carleton University

Latin American

The Fire of Tongues: Antonio Vieira and the Missionary Church in Brazil and Portugal. By Thomas M. Cohen. (Stanford: Stanford University Press. 1998. Pp. xi, 262. $49.50.)

Charles R. Boxer once described Antonio Vieira as "the most remarkable man in the seventeenth-century Luso-Brazilian world." No less remarkable is the neglect of this great missionary in the historiography in English. This makes all the more significant Thomas Cohen's penetrating, illuminating, stimulating, and often revisionist study of the religious and social thought of Vieira. An opening chapter situates Vieira in the context of pastoral ideals, practices, and objectives enunciated by Manuel de Nóbrega, leader of the first Jesuit mission to Brazil. In terms of missionary theorizing, Vieira was Nóbrega's successor, and Cohen

shows parallelisms between the two in terms of attitudes and social thought. A second chapter traces the growth of Jesuit missionary activity in Brazil, establishment (1607) of a Jesuit missionary field in the Amazon, and events prior to Vieira's arrival in Maranhäo in 1653. This, and four subsequent chapters, focus on critical periods in Vieira's life: mission to the Amazon (1653-1661); years in the prison of the Inquisition in Coimbra (1663-1667) and, on his release, in Rome and Lisbon; and his residence in Brazil from 1681 until his death in 1697. This chronological framework permits the author to trace the evolution of Vieira's missionary strategy, his theology, his Christology and his social thought, as reflected in his writings. This is also an exercise in compensatory history: the focus is on the apostolic and pastoral dimension of Vieira, and not the political or biographical; Maranhäo, not Portugal, is central to Vieira's intellectual and apostolic formation and prophetic vision; the Brazilian dimension is paramount. In short, the periphery has become center stage.

Cohen has captured two aspects of Vieira: his eclecticism and his single-mindedness of purpose. The first is manifest in the breadth of his literary opus, his recourse to a gamut of sources including the Bible, St. Augustine of Hippo, and populist prophecies in Portugal, and the originality of his interpretations of Scripture and his exegetical mode. The second was evinced in his development of a pastoral strategy for Maranhäo. This demanded lobbying at court for legislation to advance an Indian ministry and protect the authority of the Jesuits, the use of language and concepts so outrageous that Vieira hoped they would shake Portuguese ecclesiastical and secular leaders out of their inertia, and occasional bouts of compromise and conciliation. The pastoral and apostolic mission in Maranhäo and the role of Brazil were key components in Vieira's advocacy of his great prophetic vision and millenarian project for the Jesuits, for Portugal, and for her empire: that Ignatius Loyola and his successors had been chosen by God to build the modern missionary church throughout the world; that Christ had entrusted an empire to the Portuguese specifically because they—led by a collaboration between the crown and the Jesuits—had been chosen for the universal mission of conversion and salvation of souls of non-Christians; and that Portugal would succeed the Jewish nation as the temporal locus of the Fifth Empire. Cohen identifies sources used (sometimes uncritically) by Vieira and, in particular, shows the importance of the Book of Daniel for his vision of the Fifth Empire.

Cohen focusses on the evolution of Vieira's thought, but there are other unexpected dividends for readers: insights into relations between the Society of Jesus and the religious orders and secular church, conflicts and polarization at court, Portuguese kingship, and the quality of Portuguese ecclesiastical and political leadership; information on colonial Brazil, and on governance, society, and economy, on factionalism, and on settler attitudes toward Jesuits and Indians in Maranhäo; his views on contemporaries (men of church and state, nobles, settlers) which were critical without attaining the causticity of Vieira's contemporary, the Bahian-born Gregorio de Matos (1636- 1695). Finally, the reader gains a keen appreciation of the strength of Vieira's personality, his fertile imagination

and fierce creativity, and the complexity of his persona to a degree which biographical details alone could not have provided.

Cohen is at his best when engaging in textual exegesis. His command of the many genres of Vieira's literary outpouring, and of scholarship on Vieira, gives his reassessments, revisions, and reinterpretations great authority. He demonstrates how the Esperanças de Portugal and the Représentâmes constitute a continuum, how the Historia do Futuro and the Représentâmes make a "sustained argument for human fallibility and for the right of every exegete to interpret the signs of the times" (p. 140), and how multilayered was Vieira's defense before the Inquisition. English translations of sources and quotations make Vieira accessible to those not versed in Portuguese. Footnotes are extensive and rich in information, some of which could profitably have been incorporated into the text. The bibliography of primary and secondary printed sources is comprehensive. In this eminently readable book, Cohen has made a major contribution to our understanding not only of Vieira's theology and pastoral and social thought, but to the history of ideas, of millenarianism, and missiology in the early modern period.

A. J. R. Russell-Wood

Thefohns Hopkins University

BRIEF NOTICES

Commendone, Giovanni Francesco. Discorso sopra la corte di Roma. Edited by Cesare Mozzarelli. ["Europa delle Corti," Centro studi sulle società di antico regime, Biblioteca del Cinquecento, 68.] (Rome: Bulzoni. 1996. Pp. 114. Lire 20.000 paperback.)

Cesare Mozzarelli, editor of this useful edition of the Venetian Cardinal Giovanni Francesco Commendone's (1524-1584) Discourse on the Roman Curia, argues that the author was just thirty years old and had been in Rome only four years when he completed his work. He places the work in 1554, during the pontificate of Julius III (1550-1555). This dating is significant and has merit. Commendone mentions he is in his fourth year at the court and has little experience to answer the questions of his interrogator; his language and references also fit the period prior to the conclusion of the Council of Trent. Commendone, in fact, makes no mention of the Council, which by this time would already have completed its second period at Trent (1551-52). He speaks somewhat prospectively of the Inquisition as a major undertaking, proposes ideas on church reforms, and makes many allusions to the problems Christian princes create for the Christian republic, though (prudently) giving no references to any prince or nation in particular. Commendone's work, then, is not that of the seasoned courtier he would later be when he exercised significant influence on post-Tridentine ecclesiastical policy, reform, and administration. This inexperience, however, is offset by Commendone's keen psychology and frankness in depicting the kinds of personalities at court, as well as giving sage advice for the courtier's advancement (and certainly his own) through the harsh realities, dangers, and opportunities of a highly complex society of patronage, honors, and riches.

Mozzarelli views the Discorso as especially relevant to understanding the cultural context for the revival of Catholicism in sixteenth-century Europe. He proposes reading the Discorso in a way that would resolve the contradictions we perceive in looking back at "an often profoundly felt religious impulse and what appears to us as an exteriorly secular form," recalling Alphonse Dupront's remark that in the sixteenth century "to be a good, reform-minded bishop meant making a profession of being a gentleman and defending one's noble honor" (p. 14). In this spirit he invites us to take up Commendone's Discorso. Frederick J. McGinness (Smith College, Northampton, Massachusetts)

Fedalto, Giorgio. Quando festeggiare il 2000? Problemi di cronología cristiana. (Rome: Edizioni San Paolo. 1998. Pp. 98. Lire 14.000 paperback.)

"When Do We Celebrate the Year 2000?" revisits "problems of Christian chronology" that have preoccupied scholars for centuries. The Patristic scholar and student of Christian antiquity Giorgio Fedalto challenges the widely held assumption that Dionysius Exiguus miscalculated the date of Jesus' birth by several years. Most scholars today date Jesus' birth sometime about 4-8 b.c., but Fedalto thinks it was closer to the date fixed by Dionysius that tradition has used to mark the beginning of the Christian era. A second problem, also age-old, is to fix a date for Easter that all Christian churches can agree on. No easy task.

Fedalto builds his case first by reviewing the information given in the Gospel according to Luke and the efforts of the early church Fathers to establish a continuous chronology. He makes much of a reference in the history of the Olympian Games by Phlegon of Tralles that mentions an eclipse and earthquake that occurred in the fourth year of the 202nd Olympiad. In a second essay Fedalto describes the efforts of the early Church to agree on a common method for fixing the annual celebration of Easter. Constantine thought that the Council of Nicaea settled the issue once and for all, but the Nicene solution did not take into account the discrepancy between the lunar and solar calendars and the different methods of correlating them in Alexandria and Rome. In the sixth century Dionysius, a Scythian monk resident in Rome, constructed an Easter table accepted by both East and West that was the basis used for the setting the date of the Paschal feast well into the Middle Ages. It did not, however, adequately compensate for the slippage between the lunar and solar calendars, and the celebration of Easter continued to fall further back toward the winter months. The third chapter expounds Fedalto's main thesis, namely, that Dionysius's calculations were basically sound. Thus, he says, we can properly celebrate the year 2000, allowing that, "born on December 25 in the year 0," Jesus was one year old on December 25 of the year 1.

In part four, Fedalto offers a desultory description of modern efforts to fix the date of Easter in a manner that is acceptable to both East and West. The latest and perhaps best proposal is the one put forth in 1997 at Aleppo in Syria—to have astronomers decide.

Fedalto acknowledges that his defense of Dionysius's methods and calculations questions assumptions commonly held in the scholarly community. None of the evidence he offers is new, but his interpretation of the sources is novel. Berard L. Marthaler, O.F.M. Conv. (The Catholic University of America)

Font, Marta. A német lovagrend alkonya [Twilight of the Order of the German Knights]. (Pecs: Egyetemi Nyomda [University Press]. 1997. Pp. 150.)

This book is a revised version of a work completed in 1989. The author has taken into consideration the results of recent research focused on her subject,

as evidenced by the bibliography at the end of the volume. In the introduction, the author defines her topic: the battle of July 15, 1410, fought between Grünwald and Tannenberg (Stebark) by the troops of the Polish-led coalition with the German Knights. Font explains that contemporaries had referred to this engagement as conflictus magnus, the outcome of which—the knights had suffered considerable casualties—must have appeared as sensational to them, even though the participants were hardly important personages, and the battle itself did not alter the course of European history.

The battle between the Polish coalition and the Knights must have focused on several diplomatic concepts that led to war, and it brought to a standstill the dynamic development of the state of the German Knights; it made it possible for the Poles to make inroads into the Order's territory, though it was only in 1464, in the Second Treaty of Thorn [Torun], that the Grandmaster of the Order had submitted to the Polish Crown.

In the former part of her book, Font briefly outlines Polish history to 1410; Lithuanian history; the formation of the Order of the Knights, and supports her theses by carefully prepared, well drawn maps, and selected illustrations. Her treatment of Europe at the turn of the fifteenth century is far too brief, and yet it provides a comprehensive assessment focused on the political background. In the latter half of her volume Font further analyzes the "Great Conflict," and its leading (military and political) participants; she spends time discussing events between the early months in 1409, and June, 1410, and depicts—in a text, supported by cleverly drawn maps—the battle of mid-July, 1415, and a few military skirmishes following it. In a concluding brief chapter she provides a clear analysis of the aftermath.

A brief bibliography of primary sources and secondary works, and a list of pictures and maps in the body of the text conclude this cleverly conceived and well researched volume. ZJ. Kosztolnyik (Texas A&M University)

KroegerJames H., MM. Remembering Our Bishop, Joseph W.Regan, M.M. (Quezon City, Philippines: Claretian Publications. [Distributed by Maryknoll Fathers and Brothers; P.O. Box 80938; 8000 Davao City, Philippines]. 1998. Pp. viii, 235. Paperback.)

This book is not meant to be a scholarly biography, but to provide "resources" for such. This it does in a way which informs, inspires, and entertains, and will be of value not only to those interested in Bishop Regan, but in the Philippine Church, in Maryknoll, and in mission in general.

Leaving for China after his ordination in 1929, Regan spent twenty-two years there, until his expulsion in 1951. After some months of recuperation, he led a group of Maryknollers to a new mission in the Philippines. After a few years working in Luzon, the Maryknollers left for Mindanao to take over two provinces from the PME Fathers of Quebec, Davao del Norte and Davao Oriental,

whose joint territory comprised a larger area than any diocese in the Philippines. Here the Holy See established the prelature nullius of Tagum, and Regan was ordained its bishop a few years later.

When Maryknoll took over this vast territory, there were no roads, no bridges, no hospital, not a single high school. In addition to the 120,000 non-Christian mountain peoples, many more thousands of settlers kept pouring in, seeking land and fleeing from the Communist-led insurrection in Luzon. There was no seminary and not a single Filipino priest. At his compulsory retirement in 1980, Regan turned over to the new Filipino bishop not only a network of Catholic high schools and a Catholic hospital, but a seminary which was to produce 100 Filipino diocesan priests by the time of his death in 1994.

Though other Maryknollers went elsewhere in Mindanao, he remained behind until his death as chaplain of the hospital he had founded, adding fifty-four years to the twenty-two in China, saying the monthly Masses in different towns for the high school students, whom he encouraged to bring a kilo of rice or an egg to support the seminarians. What else could a bishop do who was known to his people, even to the guerrillas of the New People's Army, as LoIo (Grandpa) and to his priests as Super-Lolo, as he went around in his old jeep, or on the back of a logging truck when the jeep could not ford the river?

The brief sketch of his life is followed by two substantial interviews, anecdotes from eulogies, and archival documents. The perceptive historian will learn much about the can-do spirit of Maryknoll, about Mindanao and the Philippine church, especially during the Marcos dictatorship. Of China there is relatively little, as the bishop was reticent about his years there. An enjoyable and useful book. John N. Schumacher, SJ. (Loyola School of Theology, Ateneo de Manila University)

Linage, Antonio. Rosendo Salvado or the Odyssey of a Galician in Australia. (PubUshed by Xunta de Galicia. 1999. Pp. 237.)

Bishop Salvado (1814-1900), founder and patriarch of New Norcia, is honored not only by the Catholic Church but by the state of Western Australia, which numbers him among its pioneers. As such his career has been thoroughly documented by his admirers. It is to the credit of our present author that his footnotes show familiarity with the writing on his subject.

He approaches the man, however, in a fashion somewhat different from that of the others. Naturally enough, we must say, he lays stronger emphasis on Salvado's origins in Spain, and at that in Galicia, and on his Benedictine life. These emphases add to the figure of a man who deserves to be remembered.

During his few visits to Europe Salvado shows his interest in the important developments among the Benedictines, making the acquaintance, for example, of such leading personages as Prosper Guéranger of Solesmes and Placid Wolter

of Maredsous. He shared the eager missionary spirit of the English Benedictines and more especially of the movement stemming from St. Ottilien.

His efforts in Europe were devoted especially to the interests of his Australian home, New Norcia. In that he met with most sympathy in Spain, where his name was held in great veneration. In Santiago de Compostela he was hailed as a quintessential Galician. Among expressions of support one especially to be cherished was the suggestion made by St. Anthony Mary Claret, confessor of Queen Isabel II, that he use the monastery of San Lorenzo del Escorial for training his recruits. Even though the tempting offer had to be refused, a good number of aspirants was gathered, sufficient to ensure the continuance of the monastery of New Norcia until the end of the century and beyond. With the Benedictine nuns the appeal of Australia was less successful. That could have been due to the declaration of one of the monks to the effect that Father Abbot preferred nuns with moustaches. That was not necessarily Salvado's view.

What the author offers is somewhat marred by too frequent misprints and by English expression of a quaintness that is at times distracting. SJ. Boland, C.SS.R. (Sydney, Australia)

Partykevich, Andre. Between Kyiv and Constantinople: Oleksander Lototsky and the Quest for Ukrainian Autocephaly [Church Studies Papers.] (Edmonton, Alberta: Canadian Institute for Ukrainian Studies. 1998. Pp. xvii, 101. $14.95 paper.)

During the early twentieth century, Oleksander Lototsky was one of the most important figures in the Ukrainian nationalist movement. Between 1896 and 1917, he helped his countrymen organize political associations and publish materials in the Ukrainian language. He also contributed to a Ukrainian translation of the New Testament. After the revolution of 1905, the Russian imperial government lifted most of its former censorship restrictions, so that Lototsky found himself with almost a free hand to distribute books and articles and promote the cause of Ukrainian independence in the newly founded Imperial State Duma.

As a friend of the historian Mykhailo Hrushevsky and associate of the patriot Symon Petliura, Lototsky was elected to the Ukrainian Rada in the spring of 1917 when an independent government was formed in Kyiv (Kiev). He served it first as General Chancellor and then as governor of Bukovyna (Bukovina). In 1919 when the country fell to the Bolsheviks, he was holding the post of Ambassador to Turkey. During this short chaotic period Lototsky emerged as one of the more conservative figures in the nationalist movement. He favored complete independence from Russia (Monarchist, Democratic, or Communist), but separated from his secularizing comrades by calling for a close co-operation between the new government and a Ukrainian Orthodox Church. He was also a

friend of the Uniat Metropolitan Andrei Sheptysky, but opposed Catholic proselytizing in Ukraine.

The final period of Lototsky's life was devoted to study and scholarship on the topics of canon law ecclesiastical history, and relations among Ukrainian, Russian, and Byzantine Orthodox Churches. His special interest in the field was autocephaly. He held a post at the University of Warsaw until 1939, when he died as a result of injuries suffered during the German assault on Poland.

Archimandrite Partykevich has performed an outstanding service by bringing a brief description of the life and work of this important figure to the attention of the English-speaking world. John D. Basil (University of South Carolina)

NOTES AND COMMENTS

Conferences, Symposia, and Lectures

On May 26-28, 1999, in Vicenza, the Istituto per le Ricerche di Storia Sociale e Religiosa held an international conference on "I percorsi del Papato dal mondo mediterráneo all'Europa médiévale nella diversità degli spazi e délie eredità culturali e religiose." The papers ranged from the fourth century to the beginning of the sixteenth. Copies may be obtained from the headquarters of the Istituto at Contra Mure S. Rocco, 28, 36100 Vicenza, Italy; telephone: 0444 544350; fax: 0444 326236.

The eighteenth annual meeting of the Holy Cross History Association was held at Loyola University, New Orleans, on June 18-20, 1999. The theme was the sesquicentennial of the Holy Cross congregations of men and women in Louisiana. In addition to papers on the Holy Cross foundations in that state, there were papers on the Holy Cross mission in Ghana, the Sisters of the Holy Cross at St. Joseph's Orphanage in Washington, D.C., and the Marianite Sisters of Holy Cross at the French Hospital in New York City. Sister M. Campion Kuhn, C.S.C, assumed the presidency of the Association, and James Connelly, C.S.C, of the University of Portland, was elected vice-president. The next meeting will take place at St. Mary's College, Notre Dame, Indiana, on June 9-11, 2000.

A German-Italian symposium on "Rezeptionsmodelle des IL Vatikanischen Konzils" was conducted by the Catholic Theological Faculty of the Westfälische Wilhelms Universität in Münster on June 19. On the previous day an honorary doctorate was conferred on Giuseppe Alberigo of the University of Bologna, who then delivered a lecture entitled "Fedeltà e creatività nella ricezione del Concilio Vaticano II: Criteri ermeneutici."

Sponsored by the Consiglio Nazionale delle Ricerche and the Accademia Nazionale dei Lincei, a round table was held at the Palazzo Corsini in Rome on June 24 and 25 on the theme "L'Inquisizione e gli storici: Un cantiere aperto." The archivist of the Congregation for the Doctrine of the Faith, Alejandro Cifres Giménez, presented the opening paper on "Lo stato attuale dell'archivio del S. Uffizio." Seventeen other scholars treated various aspects of the activity of the Holy Office from the sixteenth to the nineteenth century, and John Tedeschi moderated a concluding discussion of "Le domande degli storici."

The fiftieth anniversary of the founding of the Rivista di Storia delta Chiesa in Italia was commemorated in a conference held at the Pontificio Seminario Lombardo in Rome on September 8-10, 1999. The complete program and

copies of individual papers may be requested of the secretary, Dott.ssa Elena Girardi, at her fax number: 02.72.34.26.44.

John Jay Hughes of St. Louis has been invited to deliver the Archbishop Peter L. Gerety Lecture at Seton Hall University on October 14. His topic will be "A Mass Murderer Repents: The Case of Rudolf Höss, Commandant of Auschwitz."

Among the 143 sessions scheduled for this year's Sixteenth Century Studies Conference, which will take place in St. Louis on October 28-31, will be three on the Ratio Studiorum of 1599; in the first Michael W Mäher, S.J., of St. Louis University will read a paper entitled "A Year of Some Significance: Important Organizational Directives Published by Superior General Claudio Aquaviva in 1599"; in the second John Padberg, SJ., of the Institute of Jesuit Sources will speak on "History, Geography, and One Wide World"; Mark Lewis, S.J., of the Jesuit Historical Institute, Rome, on "Evaluating the Ratio Studiorum.The Letters from Naples"; and Dan Schlafly of St. Louis University on "The Ratio in Russia"; in the third Dennis L. Durst of St. Louis University will speak on "Prince Federico Cesi and the Accademia dei Lincei: An Early Modern Challenge to the Ratio Studiorum" "Radical Conservatives: Roman Catholic Resistance to the English Reformation" is the title of another session, in which papers will be presented by Ethan H. Shagan of the Harvard Society of Fellows, "Schismatics Be No Plain Heretics: Debating the Royal Supremacy over the Church of England; by Richard Rex of the University of Cambridge, "Why Were There No Catholic Martyrs under Henry VIII?"; and by Thomas S. Freeman of the University of Sheffield, "Nicholas Harpsfield, the Catholic Author of Foxe's Book ofMartyrs" "Catholicism in Comparative Perspective" will be studied by Marc Forster of Connecticut College, "Baroque Catholicism and Religious Identity: Southwestern Germany, 1550-1750"; by Sarah Nalle of William Patterson College, who will comment on Spain; and by James D. Tracy of the University of Minnesota, who will comment on the Netherlands. A session on "Forging Religious Identities in Hostile Environments" will consist of papers by Haruko Nawata Ward of Princeton Theological Seminary, "Women's Responses to the Jesuit Mission in Sixteenth-Century Japan"; by Angela Ellis of the University of Wisconsin at Madison, "Catholicism versus Protestantism in the Preservation of Welsh National Identity in the Late Sixteenth Century"; and by Heather M. Hales of the same university, "Demystifying Native Christianity: Missionaries and Indians in Seventeenth-Century New France."

An international, interdisciplinary conference entitled "Bonhoeffer's Dilemma: The Ethics of Violence" is being organized by the Institute for the Arts and Humanistic Studies of The Pennsylvania State University; it will be held on October 28-31, 1999. It will examine the ethical problem of Dietrich Bonhoeffer's resistance to Nazism and will consider current moral issues in the light of his experience. More information concerning the conference and related events may be obtained from the Institute at The Pennsylvania State University, University Park, Pennsylvania 16802; telephone: 814-865-0495; web site: http://www.psu.edu/dept/iahs.

Sister Mary Louise Sullivan M.S.C, vice-president of the American Catholic Historical Society of Philadelphia, will deliver the fall lecture to the Society on "American Saints" at Cabrini College, Radnor, Pennsylvania, on November 7, 1999.

An international conference on "Religion and the Cold War," sponsored by the Institute of Contemporary British History, will be held in London on April 12, 2000. "This conference aims to redress the neglect accorded the role of religion in the Cold War's crusades and requests papers in all related subject areas," such as religion and foreign policy-making during the Cold War, religion in the symbolic language of the Cold War, religion and anti-communism/McCarthyism, the Vatican's Cold War, communist persecution of religion, religion and the pro-Soviet Left, religion and political dissent/subversion in the Soviet bloc, and religious co-operation with communist regimes. Proposals for papers should fit on a single sheet and should be sent to the Institute at Room 357, Institute of Historical Research, Senate House, Malet Street, London WClE 7HU; telephone: 0171 862 8810; fax: 0171 862 8812; e-mail: icbh@icbh.ac.uk. The organizers intend that selected papers should be published in an edited volume.

Hartmut Lehmann, director of the Max-Planck-Institut für Geschichte in Göttingen, has proposed to the International Commission for Comparative Church History two sessions for the Nineteenth International Congress of Historical Sciences, which will be held in Oslo on August 6-13, 2000 (see ante [January, 1999], p. 148). One will be entitled "On the Road to a History of Twentieth-Century Christianity: Problems, Questions, Methods," and the other, "Writing the History of Religion under the Conditions of Stalinism and Marxism, 1945- 1989 "The names of the participants and the titles of their papers may be obtained from the editor of this journal.

The sixth Conference on European Culture will be held at the University of Navarre on October 25-28, 2000. Information about it may be obtained from the director of the Centro de Estudios Europeos, Enrique Banús, at the Universidad de Navarra, 31080 Pamplona, Spain; telephone: +34/948/425634; fax: +34/948/425622; e-mail: ebanus@unav.es.

The Herlihy Conference

"David Herlihy e la storia della Toscana del Tardo Medioevo e del Rinascimento. Ricordo di uno storico e prospettive di ricerca" was the topic of an international conference held on June 23-25 at the Centro Studi ? Cappuccini' in San Miniato and sponsored by the Fondazione Centro Studi sulla Civiltà del Tardo Medioevo, the Cassa di Risparmio di San Miniato, the Lila Walles-Reader's Digest Fund, and St. Michael's College, Winooski, Vermont. The conference organizers were George Dameron of St. Michael's College and Carol Lansing of the University of California, Santa Barbara. The late David Herlihy was a former President of the American Catholic Historical Association and the American Historical Association. His pioneering work in demography and his major con-

tributions to the history of medieval and Renaissance Tuscany brought together a distinguished group of scholars from the United States, Italy, France, and England.

There were a number of papers of interest to historians of the Church and of religion. George Dameron's "The Economy of the Florentine Church at the Time of Dante" and James Banker's (North Carolina State University) "Debts, Deposits and Loans in Borgo San Sepolcro in the Trecento" were part of a session devoted to economic history. Maria Luisa Ceccarelli Lemut's (Università di Pisa) paper on "Incastellamento e Signoria nella Toscana occidentale (secoli X-XIID" dealt in part with their impact on the churches in this region. Katherine Gill of Boston College spoke about "Religious Women and Women's Work in Late Medieval Italy." In a session devoted to ecclesiastical institutions in the cities and contado, John Henderson of the University of Cambridge took as his topic "Caring for the Poor, the role of commessi and commesse in the Hospitals of Medieval and Renaissance Florence." Daniel Bornstein of Texas A&M University spoke on "Civic Christianity in Late Medieval Cortona," and Maureen Miller of Hamilton College on "Authority and the Holy: The Organization of Space in Episcopal and Communal Palaces."

James M. Powell

Syracuse University

Canonizations and Beatifications

During his pastoral visit to Poland in June, 1999, Pope John Paul II beatified several Servants of God and canonized one woman. In Torun on June 7 he beatified Stefan Wincenty Frelichowski, a diocesan priest. He was born on January 22, 1913, in Chelmiza and was ordained on March 14, 1937, in Pelplin. He was known for his serenity, modesty, and devotion to the Sacred Heart. After serving as secretary to the bishop for a year, he was appointed a curate of St. Mary's Parish on Torun, where he immersed himself in parochial activities. On September 11, 1939, four days after the German army occupied the city, all the priests at the parish were arrested and imprisoned. The others were released the next day, but Father Frelichowski was sent to the concentration camp at Stuthoff and later to those at Sachsenhausen and Dachau. In each of them he engaged in clandestine pastoral work and gave spiritual guidance to all the prisoners. In 1945 he secretly resolved to aid those suffering from typhus in the camp, who were isolated and lacking any assistance. He brought them whatever food or medicine he could find and heard confessions in Polish, French, and German. He eventually contracted the disease himself and died on February 23, 1945. For the first time ever the camp authorities gave permission for his body to be shown to the public and crowds filed past his remains in silent reverence.

In Warsaw on June 13 the Holy Father beatified 108 martyrs of World War II and the Servants of God Sister Regina Protmann and Edmund Bojanowski. The

martyrs were put to death between 1939 and 1945 by the Nazis. They numbered three bishops, fifty-two diocesan priests, twenty-six religious priests, three seminarians, seven brothers, eight women religious, and nine lay people. One of the bishops was Antoni Julian Nowowiejski, Archbishop-Bishop of Plock (1858-1941), a zealous shepherd of souls and eminent teacher of liturgy and historian, who was tortured when he refused to trample on his pectoral cross and was put to death in the concentration camp at Dzialdowo. One of the diocesan priests, Henryk Kaczorowski (1888-1942), rector of the major seminary of Wloclawek, was arrested in 1939 and was taken to Dachau in 1942; he was killed in a gas chamber after encouraging a group of despairing prisoners with the words of Psalm 23. One of the religious priests, Anicet Koplinski (1875-1941), a Capuchin of German origin, the apostle of charity of Warsaw, refused to leave his friary in order to save his life and so died in the gas chamber at Auschwitz. A lay woman, Marianna Biernacka (1888-1943) gave her life in place of her pregnant daughter-in-law and was shot on July 13 in Naumowicze near Grodno. Five others were killed for having helped Jews.

Regina Protman (1552-1613) founded in Warmia a contemplative-active institute with perpetual vows, the Sisters of St. Catherine of Alexandria, who did not observe a strict enclosure that would prevent them from visiting the sick at home; they also taught children the catechism and the rudiments of reading and writing. She received guidance from Jesuits and founded communities in three other cities before she died. The Pope said of her in his homily: "She took an active part in the postconciliar reform of the Church [after the Council of Trent], carrying out a humble work of mercy with great generosity. . . . She gave particular attention to the pastoral care of women."

Edmund Bojanowski (1814-1871), born of a noble and patriotic family in the Prussian part of Poland and long devoted to literary studies, founded the religious institute of the Sisters Servants of Mary Immaculate, whose rule was approved by the Archbishop of Poznan in 1858. He remained a layman all his life. At his death the congregation had twenty-two houses and ninety-eight sisters in the Poznan region, which was in the Prussian part of Poland, as well as others in the Austrian part, which had to be separated for political reasons. Of him the Pope said: "Despite delicate health, this landowner from Wielkopolska . . . undertook and inspired a vast activity on behalf of the rural population, with perseverance, prudence, and generosity of heart. Guided by a discernment that was very sensitive to people's needs, he launched numerous educational, charitable, and religious works aimed at the material and moral support of the rural family. . . . He is remembered as a good man with a big heart, who for love of God and neighbor was able to bring different sectors together, effectively rallying them around a common good. In his many-faceted activity, he anticipated much of what the Second Vatican Council said about the apostolate of the laity."

Finally, on June 16 in Stary Sacz the Pontiff canonized Blessed Kinga. She was born in Esztergom in 1234, the third daughter of King Bela IV of Hungary and Maria, daughter of the Byzantine Emperor Theodore I Lascaris. When she was

five years old she was given in marriage to the Polish prince Boleslaus of Sandomierz, who was twelve. Invited by the nobles of Krakow to take over the Principality of Krakow, Boleslaus began his double governance in 1247. His lands had been devastated by the Tatars but were still Christian. Kinga governed with her husband, jointly signing and sealing all documents. She strove to help the poor, devoting all her personal possessions to that purpose. She persuaded her husband to live with her in virginity; hence he came to be called "the Chaste." When Boleslaus died in 1279, after forty years of marriage, Kinga renounced the throne and in the following year founded a Poor Clare monastery on land given her by Boleslaus at Stary Sacz. She lived as a guest in the house for eight years, not entering the community until 1288; later she became prioress. She died on July 24, 1292, at the age of fifty-eight, whereupon she was widely venerated as a saint. In 1690 Alexander VII confirmed her cult, the equivalent of beatification.

Prizes

Die Gesellschaft zur Herausgabe des Corpus Catholicorum e. V. has decided to establish the Hubert-Jedin-Preis. It will be conferred for the first time in the year 2000 to mark the centenary of Jedin's birth. It will be awarded every two years for the most outstanding work in the field of Reformation history and will consist of 3,000 DM. Further information may be obtained from the chairman of the society, Klaus Ganzer, in care of the Institut für Biblische und Historische Theologie, Universität Freiburg, Werthmannplatz 1, 79085 Freiburg, Germany.

Archives

The Department of Archives and Manuscripts in the Catholic University of America has received a grant of $55,000 from the National Archives to preserve, arrange, describe, and foster public use of the records of the Congress of Industrial Organizations, the papers of two of the organization's early leaders, Philip Murray and John Brophyand the papers of two Catholic social theorists and activists, John A. Ryan and Francis Haas.

Exhibition

From July to November, 1999, the Israel Museum in Jerusalem is holding an exhibition entitled "Knights of the Cross: In the Path of the Crusaders." Commemorating the ninth centenary of the liberation of the Holy City and the founding of the Kingdom of Jerusalem, this exhibition tries to provide a comprehensive history of the Crusader states and their impact on Palestine over the course of two centuries through sculptures and reliefs, illuminated manuscripts, reliquaries, coins, and many other art objects from this period, borrowed from museums and libraries in Israel and abroad, many of them on public display for the first time. Through interactive exhibits the visitors can re-

live the experiences of the Crusaders on their three-year, 3,000-mile march from Europe and their daily way of life in the Holy Land.

Publications

A colloquium entitled "La Turquie de Guillaume de Jerphanion, S.J.," was held in Rome on May 9-10, 1997, to honor the memory of the professor of Christian archaeology in the Pontifical Oriental Institute who died in 1948. The papers presented on that occasion have now been published in Mélanges de l'École Française de Rome, Moyen Age, Volume 110, number 2 (1998), pages 773-970.

Recent research on the catacombs of Italy is reported in the "Atti della Pontificia Commissione di Archeologia Sacra," published in the Rivista diArcheologia Cristiana, Volume LXXIV, Number 1 (1998), as follows: Fabrizio Bisconti, "La scoperta di una piccola basilica paleocristiana presso Ie catacombe di Villa S. Faustino a Massa Martana (Todi)" (pp. 27-55); Giulio Paolucci, "Appendice: Lo scavo della basilica presso Ie catacombe di Villa S. Faustino" (pp. 57-62); Vincenzo Fiocchi Nicolai, "La catacomba di S. Restituto a Monterotondo (Roma): un monumento recentemente ritrovato" (pp. 63-92); Valeria Cipollone, "Nuove ricerche sulla catacomba di Santa Mustióla a Chiusi"(pp. 93-147); and Paola Novara, "Sectilia parietali dalle catacombe di S. Gennaro a Capodimonte (Napoli)" (pp. 149-162).

"Vies de saints dans le nord de la France (VT-XT siècles)" is the theme of the articles published in the second number of the Mélanges de Science Religieuse for 1999 (Volume 56). Following an "Avant-propos" by Elisabeth Nortier are "Quelques aspects de la sainteté féminine d'après des Vitae mérovingiennes et carolingiennes," by Çlaire Thiellet (pp. 5-32); "Quelques remarques sur la Vita Eligii, Vie de saint Éloi," by Isabelle Westeel (pp. 33-47); "Passiones et Lnventiones S. Quintini, l'élaboration d'un corpus hagiographique du haut Moyen Âge," by Jean-Luc Villette (pp. 49-76); "Les étapes dans la vie posthume des reliques. À propos des problèmes posés par les reliques de saint Josse," by Hubert Le Bourdellès (pp. 77-79); and "Le diocèse de Thérouanne à l'époque de saint Orner," by Jean Heuclin (pp. 81-88).

The theme of the issue of Annales du Midi for April-June, 1999 (Volume 111, Number 226), is "Saint-Sernin de Toulouse à la fin du Moyen Age: Des reliques et des hommes."The five essays assembled by Michelle Fournie are: "La confrérie des Corps-Saints de Saint-Sernin de Toulouse au XVe siècle," by Frédérique Fantuzzo and Catherine Saint-Martin (pp. 155-167); "Une grande confrérie urbaine," by Frédérique Fantuzzo (pp. 169-183); "Le chapitre abbatial de Saint-Sernin de Toulouse au Moyen Age," by Catherine Saint-Martin (pp. 185-197); "Un couvent méconnu: les Dames chanoinesses de Saint-Sernin de Toulouse," by Priscille Fournier (pp. 199-216); and "Un hagiographe à l'oeuvre: Bernard Gui et les légendes de saint Saturnin de Toulouse," by Agnès Dubreil-Arcin (pp. 217-231).

Several lectures presented recently to the Erasmus of Rotterdam Society have been published in its Yearbook Eighteen (1998). Among them are "Erasmus, Melanchthon, and the Office of Christian Magistrate," by James M. Estes (pp. 21-39); "How to Get a Degree in Fifteen Days: Erasmus' Doctorate of Theology from the University of Turin," by Paul F. Grendler (pp. 40-69); and "Martin Luther's Erasmus, and How He Got That Way," by Richard Marius (pp. 70-88).

The major part of the second fascicle of Volume 110 (1998) of the Mélanges de l'École Française de Rome, Italie et Méditerranée, is devoted to a collection of papers on "Les secrétaires d'État du Saint Siège (1814-1979): Sources et méthodes," as follows: Jan De Voider, "Secrétairie d'État et secrétaires d'État (1814-1978). Acquis historiographiques sur l'institution et les hommes" (pp. 445-459); Luigi Londei, "L'ordinamento della Segreteria di Stato tra Antico Regime ed età della Restaurazione" (pp. 461-473); Claude Prudhomme, "Les hommes de la Secrétairie d'État. Carrières, réseaux, culture" (pp. 475-493); François-Charles Uginet, "Les secrétaires d'État de Léon XIII à Jean XXIII. Les problèmes d'une histoire institutionnelle" (pp. 495-500); Romeo Astorri, "La Segreteria di Stato nelle riforme di Paolo VI-Giovanni Paolo II" (pp. 501-518); Luigi Londei, "Fonti per la storia della Segreteria di Stato nell'Archivio di Stato di Roma" (pp. 519-524); Jean-Marc Ticchi, "Le cardinal Rampolla dans les archives françaises", (pp. 525-531); Giuseppe M. Croce, "Les papiers des cardinaux secrétaires d'État, de Pie VII à Benoît XV dans la série des Spoglie aux Archives secrètes Vaticanes" (pp. 533-543); Emma Fattorini, "La Secreteria di Stato e la Germania: il fondo degli Archivi per gli affari straordinari. Uno strabismo documentarlo: ricognizione di un campione significativo" (pp. 545-551); Giacomo Martina, "I segretari di Stato della S. Sede. Metodi e risultati di una ricerca" (pp. 553-568); Stefano Trínchese, "Fonti relative a Propaganda fide durante i pontificad di Leone XII, Pió VIII e Gregorio XVI (1823-1846)" (pp. 569-580); Giorgio Feliciani, "La riforma della Curia romana nelle carte deU'Archivio della codificazione canónica pio-benedettina" (pp. 581-589); Philippe Boutry, "Les écrits autobiographiques des cardinaux secrétaires d'Etat du premier XIXe siècle" (pp. 591-607); Philippe Levillain, "Les secrétaires d'Etat de Pie XI à nos jours. Sources diplomatiques, mémoires, souvenirs" (pp. 609-628); Jean-Dominique Durand, "Un diplomate sans secrétaire d'Etat: le journal de Wladimir d'Ormesson, ambassadeur de France près le Saint-Siège (1948-1956)" (pp. 629-641); Giancarlo Zizola, "Dal sospetto alla política dei media" (pp. 643-680); Jean-Dominique Durant, "Conclusions" (pp. 681-686).

The recent beatification of Frédéric Ozanam provided the occasion for a study day organized jointly by the Faculty of Theology and Religious Sciences of the Institut Catholique de Paris and the Société d'histoire religieuse de la France and held at the Institut Catholique on November 29, 1997. The proceedings of that day have now been published in the issue of the Revue d'Histoire de l'Église de France for January-June, 1999 (Volume 85, Number 214), as follows: Bernard Barbiche, "Un nouveau bienheureux: Frédéric Ozanam, intellectuel catholique" (pp. 5-9); Christine Franconnet, "Frédéric Ozanam: l'homme et son message à travers sa correspondance" (pp. 11-24); Marcel Vincent, "Frédéric

Ozanam et Lyon" (pp. 27-37); Jean-Claude Caron, "Frédéric Ozanam, étudiant catholique (1831-1836)" (pp. 39-52); Jacques-Olivier Boudon, "Les catholiques sociaux parisiens au milieu du XLXe siècle" (pp. 55-72); Claude Bressolette, "Frédéric Ozanam et l'Ere nouvelle" (pp. 75-87); Pierre Riche, "Frédéric Ozanam, historien du haut Moyen Age" (pp. 89-96); and Gérard Cholvy, "La sainteté du laïc au XIXe siècle: Frédéric Ozanam (1813-1853)" (pp. 99-106).

The issue of U.S. Catholic Historian for spring, 1999 (Volume 17, Number 2), is devoted to "French Connections." Part One comprises four articles, viz., Caryn Cossé Bell, "French Religious Culture in Afro-Creole New Orleans, 1718-1877" (pp. 1-16); C. J. T. Talar, S.S., "Crossing Boundaries: Interpreting Roman Catholic Modernism" (pp. 17-30); William L. Portier, "Père Just's Hero-Martyr Secularized: John R. Slattery's Passage from Self-Sacrifice to 'Honest Manhood'" (pp. 31-47); and Joseph Cunneen, "'What It Might Mean to be a Christian': Cross Currents—the First 48 Years" (pp. 48-61). Part Two is a symposium on "The Charisms and Contexts of Yves Congar, O.R" commemorating the fiftieth anniversary of the publication of the French theologian's book Vraie etfausse réforme dans l'Eglise: Etienne Fouilloux, "Friar Yves, Cardinal Congar, Dominican: Itinerary of a Theologian" (pp. 63-90); Thomas F. O'Meara, O.R, "Reflections on Yves Congar and Theology in the United States" (pp. 91-105); Mark Wedig, O.E, "The Fraternal Context of Congar's Achievement: The Platform for a Renewed Catholicism at Les Editions du Cerf (1927-1954)" (pp. 106-115); and Paul J. Philibert, O.E, "Yves Congar: Theologian, Ecumenist, and Visionary" (pp. 116-120).

The papers read at the sixty-fifth annual meeting of the English Section of the Canadian Catholic Historical Association, which was held at the University of Ottawa on May 28-29, 1998, have been published in the Association's Historical Studies for 1999 (Volume 65), as follows: Bernard Daly, "The Evolution of the Thinking of Eugene Cullinane, CSB, 1936-1948" (pp. 9-27); John Edward FitzGerald, "Archbishop E. P. Roche, J. R. Smallwood, and Denominational Rights in Newfoundland Education, 1948" (pp. 28-49); Frederick J. McEvoy, "'These Treasures of the Church of God': Catholic Child Immigration to Canada" (pp. 50-70); Vincent J. McNally, "Challenging the Status Quo: An Examination of the History of Catholic Education in British Columbia" (pp. 71-91); and Marion Norman, "Making a Path by Walking: Loretto Pioneers Facing the Challenges of Catholic Education on the North American Frontier" (pp. 92-106). Under the heading "Notes and Comments' is "Roman Catholic Ecclesiastics in English North America, 1610-58: A Comparative Assessment," by Luca Codignola (pp. 107-124). The second half of the volume is occupied by Etudes d'histoire religieuse, published by the Société canadienne d'histoire de l'Eglise catholique. There are three articles, viz., Paul-André Dubois, "Tradition missionnaire et innovations pastorales aux XVIIe et XVIIIe siècles: lecture et écriture dans les missions canadiennes" (pp. 7-27); Catherine Vallières, "Apprendre à bien mourir': les écoliers et la mort au Québec 1853-1963" (pp. 29-51); and Martine Cardin, "Le patrimoine archivistique religieux: enjeux et perspectives" (pp. 53-66). Thérèse Hamel has contributed a "Note de recherche," viz., "La production pé-

dagogique des Soeurs de la Congrégation de Notre-Dame: 1858-1991" (pp. 67-87).

A symposium on "The Reaction to Fascism" is published in the issue of The Chesterton Review for February and May, 1999 (Volume XXV, Numbers 1 and 2). It contains the following articles: Kevin Morris, "Fascism and British Catholic Writers"(pp. 21-52); Daniel Callam,C.S.B., "Catholics and Fascists"(pp. 53-57); Peter Hunt, "Who Dared Attack My Chesterton?" (pp. 58-64); Philip Jenkins, "The Last Floodgates of the World: Catholic Responses to Fascism" (pp. 65-68); and Joseph Pearce, "Fascism and Chesterton" (pp. 69-79). These are followed by an article by Jay P. Corrin, "Catholic Writers on the Right" (pp. 81-101).

Personal Notes

Patrick Foley has been re-elected editor of Catholic Southwest for another six-year term.

J. Philip Gleason, professor emeritus of history in the University of Notre Dame and president of the American Catholic Historical Association in 1978, was awarded the University's Laetare Medal at the commencement exercises held on May 16, 1999.

Zoltan J. Kosztolnyik of Texas ASiM University is a guest professor of medieval history at Janus Pannonius University in Pecs, Hungary, during the current fall semester. He is lecturing in English to students from half a dozen neighboring countries.

Robert Trisco of the Catholic University of America has been appointed by Cardinal Edward Idris Cassidy, President of the Pontifical Council for Promoting Christian Unity, to the International Mixed Commission for Theological Dialogue between the Catholic Church and the Orthodox Church. He has also been appointed by Cardinal Joseph Ratzinger, Prefect of the Congregation for the Doctrine of the Faith, to the Advisory Committee of the Association of Friends of the Archives of the Congregation for a three-year term.

Obituary

J. Manuel Espinosa, who retired in 1978 as chief historian of the Department of State, died on June 8, 1999, at the age of ninety in Frederick, Maryland, whither he had moved from Washington three months before. He was born in Chicago and received the B.A. degree and the MA. degree in history from Stanford University and the doctorate in history from the University of California at Berkeley. He taught history at Saint Louis University and at Loyola University of Chicago until 1944, when he began to work for the Department of State, fostering sentiment contrary to the Axis powers in Latin American countries. Later he was chief of escort interpreters and helped to organize the Fulbright scholars program. He was a translator for President Harry S. Truman. During the Eisen-

hower Administration he was executive secretary of the Board of Foreign Scholarships, and later he was deputy director of the Division of Educational and Cultural Affairs. He was appointed chief historian of the Department of State in 1971. He also taught history at the Catholic University of America and at George Washington University. He wrote The First Expedition of Vargas into New Mexico, 1692 (translated with introduction and notes, 1940), Crusaders of the Rio Grande: The Story of Don Diego de Vargas and the Reconquest and Refounding of New Mexico (1942), Inter-American Beginnings of U.S. Cultural Diplomacy, 1936-1948 (1977), and The Pueblo Indian Revolt of 1696 and the Franciscan Missions in New Mexico: Letters of the Missionaries and Related Documents (translated, edited, and with an introduction, 1988). He also edited three books on Indian folklore and contributed articles to historical journals. Dr. Espinosa was a member of the American Catholic Historical Association in the 1950's and again from 1990 until his death.

Letters to the Editor

September 5, 1999

Dear Editor:

Because Professor Samuel Jefferson Thomas Miller was such a private man, it was with great difficulty and only with the generous assistance of his good friend George G. Ferreira, his close colleague William M. Daly, and his devoted former student and university archivist Ronald Patkus that I was able to piece together his obituary (ante, LXXXV [April, 1999], 341-344). Among the remnants of his library I recently found a Missal, in tattered condition from much use, that provides more accurate information on his family background and personal spirituality. His father was Monfred Le Roy Miller, who died at 67 on April 13, 1948, of a heart attack while working at one of the coal fields of the Clearfield Bituminous Coal Corp. His mother was Grace Garfield (Amos) Miller; his brother John Amos Miller (who married Viola May McConnel); his sisters Anna Virginia (Mrs. Earl Thomas Smith) and Helen Elizabeth (Mrs. Curtis Campbell Smith). I strongly suspect that Sam's confirmation name of Thomas was taken to honor Saint Thomas More (not Aquinas), for inserted into the front of the Missal is an account typed on onion-skin paper of More's speech at his trial giving his reasons for remaining loyal to the Catholic Church, reasons that may account for Sam's own conversion. Inserted at the end of the Missal is a prayer he composed in imperfect Latin with an English translation that reads: "Lord Jesus Christ, grant unto me the grace to be patient, to give clear explanations, and to help and guide those who are entrusted to my care. Holy Virgin and blessed Saint Thomas, pray for us now and at the hour of our death." Given what I know of his life and death (I wrote my master's thesis under his direction in the late '60s and like many other former students have continued to be the beneficiary of his kindness, wisdom, and humor), his prayer was surely answered.

The Reverend William B. Faherty, S.J., of the Midwest Jesuit Archives in St. Louis, wrote to me in June to recount how Sam provided him photocopies of material he had collected over the years from archives in Rome (Propaganda Fide and the Irish College), Notre Dame, and other places on Archbishop Peter Richard Kenrick. "His generosity saved me many trips and many hours of drudgery. This was but one indication of the extreme kindness and willingness to cooperate evidenced by our good friend Dr. Miller."

I hope these details help to correct any errors or incomplete information provided in my earlier obituary and provide better insights into his personality.

Nelson H. Minnich

The Catholic University ofAmerica

Jesuit Archives
114, Mount Street
London W1Y 6AH

August 1,1999

Dear Editor:

I thought the legendary evil Jesuit still existed only in pamphlets of Protestant evangelical societies until I read Dr. Carrafiello's letter in your April issue (pages 344-345). Jesuits need no longer plot and conspire in taverns in the Strand; they can now weave their webs of deceit through e-mail and internet. It is, however, a sad comment on how far the Society has fallen that Jesuit intrigues no longer concern establishment of their empires, concealment of their fabled fortunes, and assassination of kings. Now, perhaps because of declining numbers, their—or, at least their historians'—machinations are more mundane: they safeguard Jesuit history. Presumably, I am the Jesuit "Exterminator" assigned by the "Black Pope" to discourage Dr. Carrafiello from poaching. Dr. Carrafiello skillfully avoids my specific criticisms as he portrays himself as a quasi-Candide, the latest victim of an anonymous cabal of Jesuit historians. Instead of countering my arguments and demonstrating my errors, he accuses me and Jesuit historians in general of attempting to "tarnish the reputation of lay historians not by challenging the theses of their works but by picking at those historians' choice of sources, attribution of documents. . . ." Examination of sources on which a thesis is based is a way of challenging it. In my review, I noted the author's failure to consult the most important archives for any research on Parsons, the Archivum Romanum Societatis Iesu; his neglect of most of Parsons's works; and lack of familiarity with recent secondary literature. More important was my assertion that he misdated the relevant passage from Parsons's memoirs and misinterpreted rhetorical flourishes for historical fact (see ante, LXXXIV [April, 1998], 302-304, and [October, 1998], 774-775).

The first three criticisms simply weaken Dr. Carrafiello's thesis. The fourth does more than challenge a thesis constructed on said document—it destroys it! And thus it renders further challenges unnecessary. In his letter, however, Dr. Carrafiello said nothing about these criticisms. Instead he accuses me of "conjuring up . . . the ghost of the most archaic 'controversy' of them all: whether or not Parsons was the real author of the Conference (1594)." The controversy may be archaic, but it has not been resolved to everyone's satisfaction. No one denies Parsons's involvement, but there is scholarly disagreement whether he acted alone or with others. A. F. Allison and D. M. Rogers (not card-carrying members of the Jesuit cabal) cite Parsons as one of many involved in the volume. Such disagreement should be acknowledged and not ignored in any study of Parsons.

Much has changed since we met in the Jesuit archives at Farm Street in the summer of 1985. I regret that he was subject to such red-tape, and I cannot explain why so many obstacles were placed in his path. As archivist of the British Province since 1994, I assure Dr. Carrafiello that on his next visit he will have access not only to niicrofilms and photocopies, but to the Anglia and Collectanea manuscripts themselves recently transferred from Stonyhurst. Who knows what we will find as we battle over the perennially fascinating Robert Parsons?

Thomas M. McCoog, SJ.

PERIODICAL LITERATURE

general and miscellaneous

Roots of a Democratic Church Polity in the History of Canon Law: The Case of Elections in the Church. Charles J. Reid, Jr. Proceedings of the Canon Law Society oj America,60 (1998), 150-178.

Une traversée du Millénarisme Occidental. Jean Delumeau. Rivista di Storia e Letteratura Religiosa, XXXIV (3, 1998), 455-469.

Marginalien zur Inquisition. Hannsjosef Hohn. Internationale Katholische Zeitschrift "Communio," 28 (Jan.-Feb., 1999), 59-79-

Männliche Tode—weibliche Tode. Zur Anthropologie des Martyriums in der frühen Neuzeit. Peter Burschel. Saeculum, 50 (1, 1999), 75-97.

A Man of the Universal Church: Peter James KenneySJ., 1779- 1841. Thomas J. Morrissey SJ. Recusant History, 24 (May, 1999), 320-334.

Clergé et esclavage aux Antilles et en Guyane françaises. De l'Ancien Régime à 1848. Philippe Deslisle. Mémoire Spiritaine, no. 9 (1, 1999), 161-172.

GLi archivi del silenzio e l'anthropologia storica nel Sannio. Angelomichele De Spirito. Ricerche di Storia Sociale e Religiosa, XXVIII (Jan.-June, 1999), 21-40.

Le Saint-Siège face à la guerre. Continuité et renouvellement de son action pour la paix à l'époque contemporaine. Joseph Joblin, S.I. Gregorianum, 80 (2, 1999), 299-352.

Christ and the Art of Agony Nigel Spivey. History Today, 49 (Aug., 1999), 16-23.

"Nihil Innovetur"—"opto omnes in ecclesiam regredi": Bischof Cyprian von Karthago im Spannungsfeld von Amtstheologie, Seelsorge und Gemeindeaufbau. Klaus Fitschen. Kerygma und Dogma, 45 (Jan.-Mar, 1999), 64-85.

The Dates of the Martyrdom of Simeon bar Sabba'e and the "Great Massacre." R. W BuTgess.Analecta Bollandiana, l 17 (1-2, 1999), 9-66.

Problèmes monastiques et conciles Africains (a. 345-427). Charles Munier.^4«-gustinianum,XXXSX (June, 1999), 149-168.

Problematic Sources: A Survey of Recent Scholarship Concerning Ambrose of Milan and the Defeat of Western Homoianism. George Demacopoulos. Greek Orthodox Theological Review, 42 (Fall-Winter, 1997), 359-373.

Female Participation and the Late Fourth-Century Preacher's Audience. Wendy Mayer. Augustinianum, XXXDt (June, 1999), 139-147.

The Rogation Ceremonies of Late Antique Gaul: Creation, Transmission and the Role of the Bishop. Geoffrey Nathan. Classica et Mediaevalia, IL (1998), 275-303.

Kaiser Justinian als Kirchenpolitiker und Theologe. K.-H. Uthemann.^Mgwsfi'm-anum, XXXIX (June, 1999), 5-83.

Impianti cultuali e cristianizzazione del territorio in Istria. Giuseppe Cuscito. Rivista di Archeologia Cristiana, LXXIV (1, 1998), 165-195.

Le cosiddette "scene di ingresso" nell'arte funeraria cristiana. Daniela Goffredo. Rivista di Archeologia Cristiana, LXXIV (1, 1998), 197-236.

L'area subdiale di S. Ermete: analisi delle fonti testuali e nuovi dati archeologici. Anna Misiani. Rivista di Archeologia Cristiana, LXXIV (1, 1998), 237-279.

El papel ideológico de las herejías medievales. Miguel Ángel Builes Uribe.Franciscanum, XXXLX (May-Dec, 1997), 63-81.

Matizaciones teológicas y políticas de Leandro de Sevilla a los discursos de Recaredo en el Concilio III de Toledo. Antonio Gómez Cobo. Carthaginen-««,XV (Jan.-June, 1999), 1-30.

Il "pozzo dei martiri" in S. Giustina di Padova. Maria Pia Billanovich. Italia Medioevale e Umanistica, XXXVIII (1995), 1-20.

Zur Überlieferungsgeschichte des "Liber de haeresibus" des Johannes von Damaskus. Ortwin Knorr. Byzantinische Zeitschrift, 91 (1, 1998), 59-69.

Holy Land Pilgrims from Frankish Gaul. Yitzhak Hen. Revue Beige de Philologie et d'Histoire, 76 (2, 1998), 291-306.

Milites Christi utriusque Sexus. Gender and the Politics of Conversion in the Circle of Boniface. Yitzhak Hen. Revue Bénédictine, 109 (1-2, 1999), 17-31.

Knowledge of Canon Law among Rural Priests: The Evidence of Two Carolingian Manuscripts from around 800. Yitzak Hen. fournal of Theological Studies, 50 (Apr., 1999), 117-134.

"Lurking with Spiritual Intent": A Note on the Origin and Functions of the Monastic Roundsman (Circator). Scott G. Bruce. Revue Bénédictine, 109 (1-2,1999X75-89.

Queens, Convents and Conversion in Early Anglo-Saxon England. Marc Anthony Meyet.Revue Bénédictine, 109 (1-2, 1999), 90-1 16.

Queens, Nunneries and Reforming Churchmen: Gender, Religious Status and Reform in Tenth- and Eleventh-Century England. Pauline Stafford. Past & Present, No. 163 (May, 1999), 3-35.

Encounters in Medieval Revivalism: Monks, Friars, and Popular Enthusiasts. Gary Dickson. Church History, 68 (June, 1999), 265-293-

The Wealth, Patronage, and Connections of Women's Houses in Late Anglo-Saxon England Julia Crick. Revue Bénédictine, 109 (1-2, 1999), 154-185.

The Commemoration of Patrons and Gifts in Chronicles from the Diocese of Liège, Eleventh-Twelfth Centuries. Arnoud-Jan Bijsterveld. Revue Bénédictine, 109 (1-2, 1999), 208-243.

The Miracula Inventionis Beate Mylburge Virginis Attributed to "the Lord Ato, Cardinal Bishop of Ostia." Paul Antony Hayward. English Historical Review, CXTV (June, 1999), 543-573.

Die rhetorische Ausgestaltung der kaiserlichen Auslandsschreiben der Komnenenzeit an die Päpste (Dölger-Wirth, Reg. 1320a, 1320b und 1348). Christian Gastgeber. Römische Historische Mitteilungen, 40 (1998), 197-235.

The Lives of St Wenefred (BHL 8847-51). Füona Winward. Analecta Bollandi-a?a,?? (1-2, 1999), 89- 132.

Cathedral of St. Saviour and the Polacak Principality of the Medieval Rus'. Halina R. Rusak. Byzantinoslavica, LLX (2, 1998), 325-350.

Quelques représentations médiévales inédites du Mont-Saint-Michel. Sophie Bourdon. Annales de Bretagne et des Pays de l'Ouest, 106 (2, 1999), 9-32.

Hildegard von Bingen in der Sicht ihrer Zeitgenossen. Das Zeugnis des Briefwechsels. Ernst Tremp. Freiburger Zeitschrift für Philosophie und Theologie, 46 (1-2, 1999), 52-66.

The Road to 1204: The Byzantine Background to the Fourth Crusade. Michael Angold./owr««/ ofMedieval History, 25 (Sept., 1999), 257-278.

Les moines anglais et la construction du politique (début du 13e siècle). Alain Boureau. Annales, 54 (May-June, 1999), 637-666.

Milenarismo joaquinista y su influencia en la naciente orden franciscana (hasta 1257). Fernando Garzón Raiaírez.Franciscanum,XXXIX (May-Dec, 1997), 37-61.

La dévotion à la Sainte Face chez les cisterciennes du XIIIe siècle. Marie-Noël Bouchard. Collectanea Cisterciensia,61 (2, 1999), 122-147.

Geografía de lo sagrado y creación de conventos. Las órdenes mendicantes en Galicia (siglos XIII-XV). María del Mar Grana Cid. Miscelánea Comillas, 57 (Jan.-June, 1999), 169-196.

Miracula et mirabilia chez Vincent de Beauvais. Étude de concepts. Michel Tumyre, Le Moyen Age, CV (2, 1999), 367-413-

Skinned to the Bone: Durham Evidence for Taxation of the Church in Scotland, 1254-1366. J. Donnelly. Innes Review,XlX (Spring, 1999), 1-24.

Le sermon inédit d'Adénulphe d'Anagni (1289) sur sainte Catherine. Gérard de Martel, O.S.B. Archives d'Histoire Doctrinale et Littéraire du Moyen Age, 65 (1998), 123-149.

Fable and Royal Power: The Origins of the Mercedarian Foundation Story. James William Brodman. Journal of Medieval History, 25 (Sept., 1999), 229-241.

The Relationship between Theology and Canon Law: Another Context of Political Thought in the Early Fourteenth Century. Takashi Shogimen./owr««/ of the History of Ideas, 60 (July, 1999),417-431.

King Robert of Naples (1309-1343) and the Spiritual Franciscans. Samantha Kelly. Cristianesimo nella storia, XX (Veto., 1999),41-80.

La biografía di Irene-Eulogia Cumnena Paleologhina (1291-1355): un riesame. Anna Stolfi. Cristianesimo nella storia,XX (Feb., 1999), 1-40.

Jan Hus's De Ecclesia, Precursor of Vatican II? Daniel Di Domizio. Theological Studies, 60 (June, 1999), 247-260.

The Appointment of Octavian de Palatio as Archbishop of Armagh, 1477-8. Mario A. Sughi.7ra/b Historical Studies, XXXI (Nov., 1998), 145-164.

L'invention des reliques de saint Jacques Le Majeur à l'église Saint-Jacques de Toulouse en 1491. Olivier Lamarque. Annales du Midi, 111 (Apr.-June, 1999X233-246.

SrXTEENTH CENTURY

Nature and Nature's God: Landscape and Cosmos of Albrecht Altdorfer. Larry Süver. Art Bulletin, LXXXI (June, 1999), 194-214.

L'iconographie du polyptyque d'Anchin de Jean Bellegambe. Monique Pelade-Olivier. Revue duNord, LXXXI (Jan.-Mar, 1999), 117-127.

Cajetan's Attack on Parallels between Church and State. Thomas M. Izbicki. Cristianesimo nella storia, XX (Veto., 1999), 81-89.

"Reformatio" in katholischer Perspektive: Drei Beispiele aus dem 16. Jahrhundert. Jos E. Vercruysse. Ephemerides Theologicae Lovanienses, LXXV (Apr., 1999), 142-156.

Friends and Relics at San Silvestre) in Capite, Rome. William E. Wallace. Sixteenth Century Journal, XXX (Summer, 1999), 419-439.

Popular Astrology and Lutheran Propaganda in Reformation Germany. C. Scott Dixon. History, 84 (July, 1999), 403-418.

The Origins of Rural Calvinism in Aunis: The Sphere of Influence of La Rochelle. Pascal Rambeaud. Sixteenth Century Journal, XXX (Summer, 1999), 367-395.

Il patriarcato di Aquileia neu"eta della Riforma e della Controriforma. Michèle Cassese. Ricerche di Storia Sociale e Religiosa, XXVIII (Jan.-June, 1999), 7-19.

Katharina von Bora, the Woman at Luther's Side. Martin Treu. Lutheran Quarterly,Xm (Summer, 1999), 157-178.

Gottes Wort und Teufels Beitrag: Luthers Billigung der Täuferverfolgung aus der Sorge um das evangelische Bekenntnis. Erik Margraf. Zeitschrift für Religions- und Geistesgeschichte, 51 (3, 1999), 193-216.

Living the Reformations: Generational Experience and Political Perception in Early Modern England. Norman Jones. Huntington Library Quarterly, 60 (3, 1999), 273-288.

The Involvement of the Religious Orders in the Northern Risings of 1536/7: Compulsion or Desire? Anthony N. Shaw. Downside Review, 117 (Apr, 1999X89-114.

Of Christianity, Enlightenment, and Colonialism: Russia in the North Caucasus, 1550-1800. Michael Khodarkovsky./owra«/ ofModern History, 71 (June, 1999)394-430.

"Padre et Pastor Vostro": Girolamo Seripando and the Restoration of the Episcopate in Salerno. Francesco C. Cesáreo. The Historian, 61 (Spring, 1999), 579-595.

L'Histoire de la Mappe-Monde Papistique de Jean-Baptiste Trento et ses sources italiennes. Alessandra Preda. Bulletin de la Société de l'Histoire du Protestantisme Français, 145 (Apr.-June, 1999), 245-260.

D'où le temple Paradis (1564-1567) tenait-il son modèle? Bernard Reymond. Bulletin de la Société de l'Histoire du Protestantisme Français, 145 (Apr-June, 1999), 263-282.

Catálogo de carmelitas antiguos que pasaron a la Descalez (1568-1593)- Pablo Garrido, O. Carm. Carmelus, 45 (1, 1998), 90-134.

Inquisizione, política e giustizia nella Sicilia di Filippo IL Vittorio Sciuti Russi. Rivista Storica Italiana, CXI (Jan., 1999), 37-64.

Utraquists, Lutherans, and the Bohemian Confession of 1575. Zdenëk V David. Church History, 68 (June, 1999), 294-336.

Saint Teresa's Problematic Patrons. Alison Weber. Journal of Medieval and Early Modern Studies, 29 (Spring, 1999), 357-379.

Surviving the English Reformation: Commonsense, Conscience, and Circumstance. Jonathan Wright./oMW«/ ofMedieval and Early Modern Studies, 29 (Spring, 1999), 381-402.

Prophesying Again. Peter Iver Kaufman. Church History, 68 (June, 1999), 337-358.

The Beatified Martyrs of Ireland, I: Patrick O'Healy, O.F.M., Conn O'Rourke, O.F.M. Benignus Millett. Irish Theological Quarterly, 64 (Spring, 1999), 55-78.

Die Studienordnung der Jesuiten. Geschichte und Pädagogik der "Ratio Studiorum."Stephan Ch. Kessler, SJ. Stimmen der Zeit, 211 (Apr., 1999), 243-254.

Filippo II fra storia e leggenda. Giovanni Sale. La Civiltà Cattolica, 150, II (Apr. 17, 1999), 134-147.

Anime in trappola. Confessione e censura ecclesiastica all'universita di Pisa fra '500 e '600.Adriano Prosperi. Belfagor, LIV (May 31, 1999), 257-287.

Conflictos religiosos en las islas griegas a la luz de documentos vaticanos (ss. XVI-XVII). José M. Floristán Imízcoz. Orientalia Christiana Periodica, 65 (1,1999), 53-105.

SEVENTEENTH AND EIGHTEENTH CENTURIES

L'application de Gedit de Nantes à Lyon, 1598-1685. Tristan Boffard. Bulletin de la Société de l'Histoire du Protestantisme Français, 145 (Apr-June, 1999), 285-320.

Guillaume Ranchin (1559-1605) érudit protestant et gallican. Sa bibliothèque et sa famille. Mathieu Lescuyer. Bulletin de la Société de l'Histoire du Protestantisme Français, 145 (Apr.-June, 1999), 323-358.

Robert Abercromby, SJ. (1536-1613) and the Baltic Counter-Reformation. Martin Murphy. /«««es Review, XYX (Spring, 1999), 58-75.

Bronze-Age Conciliarism: Edmond Richer's Encounters with Cajetan and Bellarmine. Francis Oakley. History of Political Thought, XX (Spring, 1999), 65-86.

Before The Raising of the Cross: The Origins of Rubens's Earliest Antwerp Altarpieces. Cynthia Lawrence.^/? Bulletin, LXXXI (June, 1999), 267-296.

Combining Martha and Mary: Gender and Work in Seventeenth-Century English Cloisters. Claire Walker. Sixteenth Century Journal, XXX (Summer, 1999), 397-418.

Development of Byzantine Iconographie Tradition in Ukrainian Antimensia of the XVIIth Century. Oksana Yurchyshyn-Smith. Byzantinoslavica, LLX (2, 1998), 320-324.

Vox Piscis: or The Book-Fish: Providence and the Uses of the Reformation Past in Caroline Cambridge. Alexandra Walsham. English Historical Review, CXTV (June, 1999), 574-606.

Pierre-François Chifflet, Heribert Rosweyde et Jean Bolland. Documents inédits à propos de l'hagiographie franc-comtoise. Bernard Joassart.^4««fecie Bollandiana, 117 (1-2, 1999), 163-180.

Wentworth and the Northern Recusancy Commission. Fiona Pogson. Recusant History, 24 (May, 1999), 271-287.

Materialien zur Kunsttätigkeit der gegenreformatorischen Orden in Österreich und in anderen Ländern der Habsburgermonarchie bis 1800. V. Die Archive des Camillianer- und des Piaristenordens. Jörg Garms. Römische Historische Mitteilungen, 40 (1998), 415-423.

"Neither Married nor Cloistered": Blessed Isabelle in Catholic Reformation France. Thomas Worcester. Sixteenth Century Journal, XXX (Summer, 1999), 457-472.

La mobilisation des saints dans la Fronde parisienne d'après les mazarinades. Moshe Sluhovsky.yl«««fes, 54 (Mar.-Apr., 1999), 353-374.

The Abbess and Mrs. Brown; Lady Mary Knatchbull and Royalist Politics in Flanders in the Late 1650s. Caroline M. K. Bowden. Recusant History, 24 (May, 1999X271-287.

Liturgical Services and Religious Practices during the Holy Week in Filipino Franciscan Pueblos. Luis Balquiedra. Philippiniana Sacra, XXXIV (Jan.-Apr, 1999), 5-50.

L'enseignement charitable en France: essor et crise d'adaption (milieu XVIP-fin XVIIP siècle). René Grevet. Revue Historique, CCCI (Apr-June, 1999), 277-306.

L'antijansénisme à la cour de Madrid au tournant des 17e-18e siècles. L. Ceyssens. Revue d'Histoire Ecclésiastique, XCIV (Jan.-Mar, 1999), 15-28.

El convento de Carmelitas de Valencia del siglo XVII al XLX. Balbino Velasco Bayon. Carmelas, 45 (1, 1998), 5-72.

The Rite of Confirmation in Anglican Thought during the Eighteenth Century. Robert Cornwall. Church History, 68 (June, 1999), 359-372.

La Orden Tercera franciscana en el contexto del asociacionismo religioso gallego en el Antiguo Régimen: La V.O.T. de la villa de Padrón. Ofelia Rey Caste-\??. Archivo Ibero-Americano, LLX (Jan.-Apr, 1999), 3-45.

Un indice de déchristianisation? L'évolution de la consommation de viande à Paris en carême sous l'Ancien Régime. Reynald Abad. Revue Historique, CCCI (Apr.-June, 1999), 237-275.

La façade de la basilique de Saint-Jean-de-Latran: Nouveaux documents. Anne-Lise Desmas. Mélanges de l'École Française de Rome, Italie et Méditerranée, 1 10 (2, 1998), 755-802.

Relazione di Suor Maria Maddalena Pandolfi su Mons. Tommaso Falcoia. Emilio Lage. Spicilegium Historicum C.SS.R, XLVII (1, 1999), 141-180.

Between Church and Sect: The Origins of Methodism in Manchester. Henry Rack. Bulletin of the John Rylands University Library of Manchester, 80 (Spring, 1998), 65-87.

George Bell and Early Methodist Enthusiasm: A New Manuscript Source from the Manchester Archives. Kenneth G. C. Newport and Gareth Lloyd. Bulletin oj the John Rylands University Library of Manchester, 80 (Spring, 1998X89-101.

A "Presbyterian Insurrection"? Reconsidering the Hearts of Oak Disturbances of July 1763. Eoin F. Magennis. Irish Historical Studies, XXXJ (Nov., 1998), 165-187.

Lettera di Sant'AIfonso a una Visitandina. Angelomichele De Spirito. Spicilegium Historicum CSSR. ,XLVII (1, 1999), 7-49.

The Hermes Case: The German Enlightenment vs. The Conservative Lutheran Church and The Debate on Religious Tolerance in Prussia, 1771-1777. Paolo Bernardini. Rivista di Storia e Letteratura Religiosa, XXXIV (3, 1998), 477-497.

Una visión autorizada del Carmelo español en el siglo XVIII. Francisco Vega Santoveña. Teresianum, XLLX (2, 1998), 651-717.

La iglesia de Santa María de Jesús de Valencia: Aspectos arquitectónicos y pictóricos. Vicent Pellicer i Rocher and Daniel Jiménez Puchol. Archivo Lbero-Americano, LLX (Jan.-Apr, 1999), 49-78.

D. Francisco Gomes do Avelar no Episcopado do seu tempo. Manuel Clemente. Didaskalia, XXVIII (2, 1998), 157-166.

NINETEENTH AND TWENTIETH CENTURIES

Riflessi liturgici dell'età napoleónica a Venezia: il culto di san Napoleone e sue connessioni. Ricerche di Storia Sociale e Religiosa, XXVIII (Jan.-June, 1999), 67-91.

Un priore generale "napoleonista"? Il caso di Timoteo M. Ascensi, dei carmelitani. Emanuele Boaga, O.Carm. Carmelas, 45 (1, 1998), 135-154.

Les débuts de l'implantation baptiste dans le Nord (1810- 1821). Sébastien Fath. Revue du Nord, LXXXI (Apr.-June, 1999), 267-281.

Der Heilige nicht nur aus dem Böhmerwald. Zu den Vorfahern des hl. Johann Nepomuk Neumann. Raimund Paleczek. Spicilegium Historicum C.SS.R, XLVII (1, 1999), 181-204.

Il bagno pénale di Civitavecchia e i fatti del 1820. Luciano Nasto. Rassegna Storica del Risorgimento, LXXXVI (Jan.-Mar, 1999), 57-80.

Catholic Members of Parliament Who Represented British Constituencies, 1829-1885: A Prosopographical Analysis. John A. Stack. Recusant History, 24 (May, 1999), 335-363.

Los capuchinos y la exclaustración del siglo XLX (1834-1877). José Angel Echeverría, O.EM.Cap. Scriptorium Victoriense, XLV (July-Dec, 1998), 353-470.

La papauté face à l'esclavage: quelle condamnation? Claude Prudhomme. Mémoire Spiritaine, no. 9 (1, 1999), 135-160.

Le costume des diaconesses, plus d'un siècle d'évolution spirituelle: Les tâtonnements (1840- 1960). Rosine Lambin. Bulletin de la Société de l'Histoire du Protestantisme Français, 145 (Apr.-June, 1999), 359-372.

The American Board and the Eastern Churches: The "Nestorian Mission" (1844-1846). H. L. Murre-van den Berg. Orientalia Christiana Periodica, 65(1,1999X117-138.

GIi eredi di Hofbauer nella Vienna del 1848,1'anno della rivoluzione. Otto Weiss. Spicilegium Historicum C.SS.R.,XLV\\ (I1 1999), 51-104.

"La Civiltà Cattolica" nei suoi primi anni di vita. Giovanni Sale. La Civiltà Cattolica, 150,1 (Mar. 20, 1999), 544-557.

"Wandering Nuns": The Return of the Institute of the Blessed Virgin Mary to the South of England, 1862-1945. M. Gregory Kirkus, I.B.VM. Recusant History, 24 (May, 1999), 384-396.

Ignaz von Döllinger (1799-1890): Opfer einer fixen Idee oder Zeuge der Wahrheit? Hubert Huppertz. Internationale Kirchliche Zeitschrift, 89 (Apr.-June, 1999), 69-95.

Döllinger und der Protestantismus (Schluss). H. Ewald Kessler. Internationale Kirchliche Zeitschrift, 89 (Apr.-June, 1999), 96-113.

Palazzo di Venezia und Palazzo Chigi als k. u. k. Botschaften beim Heiligen Stuhl und am königlich italienischen Hofe 1871-1915. Samt Anhang über die österreichischen Gesandtschaften und Botschaften in Rom 1921-1997. Rudolf Agstner. Römische Historische Mitteilungen, 40 (1998), 487-571.

Il problema della Destra Nazionale negli anni del non expedir Gabriele De Rosa. Ricerche di Storia Sociale e Religiosa, XXVTII (Jan.-June, 1999), 205-211.

El P. Francisco Butiñá (1834-1899) en el contexto histórico de la Compañía de Jesús. Manuel Revuelta González. Miscelánea Comillas, 57 (Jan.-June, 1999), 197-243-

Giacomo Lercaro: contributo alia conoscenza del periodo genovese (1891-1947). Niela Buonasorte. Cristianesimo nella storia, XX (Feb., 1999), 91-145.

El Colegio seráfico de San Antonio de Fuente del Maestre, 1894-1970. Teodoro-Agustín López y López. Archivo Lbero-Americano, LIX (Jan.-Apr, 1999), 79-88.

L'abbaye centenaire du Mont-César (Keizersberg) à Louvain (1899-1999). Guibert Michiels. Revue d'Histoire Ecclésiastique, XClV (Jan.-Mar., 1999), 30-53.

Il protettorato religioso sui cattolici in Oriente: la questione délie relazioni diplomatiche dirette ira Santa Sede e Impero ottomano, 1901-1918. Daniela Fabrizio. Nuova Rivista Storica, LXXXII (Sept.-Dec, 1998), 583-626.

Preußen und der bayerische Jesuitenerlaß vom 11. März 1912 im Spiegel der Berichte des preußischen Gesandten in München. Peter Hager. Archivum Historicum Societatis Iesu, LXVII (July-Dec, 1998), 233-292.

Spiritualism and Religion: Sir Arthur Conan Doyle's Critique of Christianity and a Roman Catholic Response. René Kollar, O.S.B. Recusant History, 24 (May, 1999), 397-413.

"Stand Therefore!"—Bishop Michael Bolton Furse,the Diocese of St. Albans, and the Church Schools Controversy, 1919-1939· David Parker. History ofEducation Quarterly, 39 (Summer, 1999), 161-192.

Some Aspects of Redemptorist Missions in the New Irish State (1920-1937). Brendan McConvery. Spicilegium Historicum C.SS.R., XLVII (1, 1999), 105-125.

Don Bosco's Beatification and Canonization. Arthur J. Lenti, SDB. Journal of Salesian Studies,X (Spring, 1999), 65-144.

The Disciples of the Lord: An Update. Samuel J. Boland. Spicilegium Historicum C.SS.R.,XL\n\ (X, 1999), 127-140.

"A Revolution in Christian Morals." Resolution nr 15 of Lambeth 1930. Theresa Notare. Revue d'Histoire Ecclésiastique, XCIV (Jan.-Mar, 1999), 54-75.

La Academia Ausias March de Valencia, o el intento de supervivencia de un colegio de jesuítas durante la II República. Enrique Llull Martí. Miscelánea Comillas, 57 (Jan.-June, 1999), 245-274.

The Martyrs and the Saints: Masculinity and the Construction of the Francoist Crusade. Mary Vincent. /fetory WorkshopJournal,Issue 47 (Spring, 1999), 68-98.

La "Carta Colectiva" del episcopado español (1937). Alfonso Alvarez Bolado. Cristianesimo nella storia,XX (Feb., 1999), 161-169.

Der Theologe Karl Barth und die Politik des Schweizer Bundesrats. Eine Darstellung anhand von unveröffentlichten Akten der Schweizer Behörden. Eberhard Busch. Evangelische Theologie, 59 (3, 1999), 172-186.

Pie XII: un procès biaisé? Jacques Nobécourt. Études, 391 (July-Aug., 1999), 77-88.

Liturgia e missione nel Cattolicesimo tráncese degli anni Quaranta. La proposta della Mission de France. Marcia Paiano. Rivista di Storia e Letteratura Religiosa,XXXTV (3, 1998), 499-537.

The Representation of Mary in the Architecture of Le Corbusier's Chapel at Ronchamp. Flora Samuel. Church History, 68 (June, 1999), 398-416.

Monk, Martyr, and Mystic: Christian de Chergé (1937-1996). Bernardo Olivera. Cistercian Studies Quarterly, 34 (3, 1999), 321-338.

AMERICAN AND CANADIAN

El viaje por el Mississipi de fray Luis Hennepin y la búsqueda del paso al mar del Sur. Antoni Muntaner Picazo. Archivo Lbero-Americano, LLX (Jan.-Apr., 1999X89-110.

Mission Report from Frederica, Georgia, to Gotthilf August Francke (July 30, 1744). George E Jones, trans, and ed. Concordia Historial Institute Quarterly, 12 (Spring, 1999), 27-45.

"A Most Mild and Equitable Establishment of Religion": John Adams and the Massachusetts Experiment. John Witte Jr. Journal of Church and State, 41 (Spring, 1999), 213-252.

The Pure American Woman and the Wicked Catholic Priest: An Analysis of Anti-Catholic Literature in Antebellum America. Marie Anne Pagliarini. Relgion and American Culture, 9 (Winter, 1999), 97-128.

Religion and Ethnicity in San Antonio: Germans and Téjanos in the Wake of United States Annexation. Timothy M. Matovina. Catholic Southwest, 10 (1999), 29-49.

The Iconography of the American City: or, A Gothic Tale of Modern Times. Peter W. Williams. Church History, 68 (June, 1999), 373-397.

Fenianism in North America in the 1860s: The Problems for Church and State. Oliver Rafferty. History, 84 (Apr., 1999), 257-277.

Piety, Politics, and Southern Culture: J. J. D. Renfroe's Lost Cause Ideology. B. Dwain Waldrep./lM>«m« Review, 52 (July, 1999), 192-224.

"It Is a Marvel to Many People" : Dwight L. Moody, Mass Media, and the New England Revival of 1877. Bruce J. Evensen. New England Quarterly, LXXII (June, 1999), 251-274.

Karl Georg Stöckhardt: His Life and Labor. Daniel Woodring. Concordia Historical Institute Quarterly, 72 (Spring, 1999), 46-65.

The German Priest, the Banana Boats and the Origins of Broadcasting in New Orleans. Nancy McKenzie Dupont. Louisiana History, XL (Spring, 1999), 211-221.

Building Churches on the Prairie: The Partnership of Bishop Vincent Wehrle and Anton Dohmen. James E. Coomber, Denis R. Fournier, and Sheldon W Green. North Dakota History, 65 (Winter, 1998), 17-26.

Collegiate Culture, Chicago Style: Student Life at DePaul University, 1920-1940. John L. Rury. Journal oJLllinois History, 2 (Summer, 1999), 101-122.

Ambassador on the Yangtse: Max Henry Zschiegner. Max C. E. Zschiegner. Concordia Historical Institute Quarterly, 72 (Spring, 1999), 4-26.

La jeunesse ouvrière catholique féminine: Un lieu de formation sociale et d'action communautaire, 1931-1966. Lucie Piché. Revue d'Histoire de l'Amérique française, 52 (Spring, 1999), 481-506.

A Failed Unity Movement within a Unity Movement: The Murch-Witty Unity Movement, 1937-1947. Rick Cobb. Restoration Quarterly, 41 (2, 1999), 87-107.

The North American Academy of Ecumenists: The Story of Its Establishment (1957-1967). Joseph A. Loya. Journal of Ecumenical Studies, XXXV (Summer-Fall, 1998), 319-340.

LATIN AMERICAN

Las "leyes nuevas de Indias" nunca fueron revocadas. Isacio Pérez Fernández, O.P. Communio,XXXl (1, 1998), 117-140.

Los jesuítas en el Nuevo Reino de Granada: Los fundadores de la provincia. Alberto Gutiérrez J., SJ. Theologica Xaveriana, 49 (Jan.-Mar., 1999), 5-40.

Virtue and Trangression: The Certification of Authentic Mysticism in the Mexican Inquisition. Nora Jaffary. Catholic Southwest, 10 (1999), 9-28.

El marco constitucional de las relaciones entre iglesia y estado en América del Sur (1811-1900). Agustín Sánchez Andrés. Hispania Sacra, 50 (July-Dec, 1998X578-610.

The Mexican Revolution and the Caballeros de Colón. Paul Rich and Guillermo de los Reyes. Catholic Southwest, 10 (1999), 61-74.

Monseñor Cayo Leónidas Peñuela. Julio Barón Ortega. Boletín de Historia y Antigüedades, LXXXVI (Jan.-Mar., 1999), 95-1 18.

Oral History of the Chilean Movement "Christians for Socialism," 1971-73- David Fernández. Journal of Contemporary History, 34 (Apr, 1999), 283-294.

What Is the Color of the Holy Spirit? Pentacostalism and Black Identity in Brazil. John Burdick. Latin American Research Review, 34 (2, 1999), 109-131.

OTHER BOOKS RECEIVED

[Books that were sent to scholars to be reviewed but of which no review has been received are indicated by an asterisk.]

Augustine, Saint. The Augustine Catechism. Volume I: The Enchiridion on Faith, Hope and Love. Trans. Bruce Harbert; Trans. John E. Rotelle, O.S.A. [The Augustine Series.] (Hyde Park, NY.: New City Press. 1999. Pp. 144. Paperback.)

"Barrell, A. D. M. The Papacy, Scotland and Northern England, 1342-1378. [Cambridge Studies in Medieval Life and Thought, Fourth Series, 30.] (New York: Cambridge University Press. 1995. Pp. xxvi, 291.)

Barresi, Sandra, and Angela Gandoln (Eds.). GU archivi del Centro ricerche Giuseppe Di Vittorio: Inventan. [Pubblicazioni degli Archivi di Stato, Strumenti CXXXV] (Rome: Ministero per i beni culturali e ambientali, Ufficio centrale per i beni archivistici. 1998. Pp. x, 454. Paperback.)

Bernanos, Georges. The Heroic Face of Innocence: Three Stories. [Ressourcement: Retrieval & Renewal in Catholic Thought.] (Grand Rapids, Mich.: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company; Edinburghs & T Clark. 1999. Pp. xii, 150. $1300 paperback.)

Blet, Pierre, SJ. Pius XII and the Second World War:According to the Archives of the Vatican. Trans. Lawrence J. Johnson. (Mahwah, N.J.: Paulist Press. 1999· Pp. xv, 304. $29-95.) Originally published in French and reviewed by John Jay Hughes ante (April, 1999), pp. 268-270.

"Bodo, Murray, O.F.M. (Trans, and Ed.). Tales of an Endishodi: Father Berard Hatte and the Navajos, 1900-1961. (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press. 1998. Pp. xvi, 263· Paperback.)

"Bolton, Brenda. Innocent III: Studies on Papal Authority and Pastoral Care. [Variorum Collected Studies Series.] (Brookfield, Vt.: Variorum, Ashgate Publishing Co. 1995. Pp. xvi, 318. $82.50.)

Boyd, Mark E, Hale G. Smith and John W Griffin. Here They Once Stood: The Tragic End of the Apalachee Missions. [Southeastern Classics in Archaeology, Anthropology, and History.] (Gainesville: University Press of Florida. 1999. Pp. xxi, 189, 12 plates. $29.95 paperback.) Originally published in 1951 and reviewed by Michael J. Curley ante, XXXVIII (April, 1952), 48-49.

Bresslau, Harry. Manuale di diplomática per la Germania e Vitalia. Trans. Anna Maria Voci-Roth. [Pubblicazioni degli Archivi di Stato, Sussidi 10.]

(Rome: Ministero per i beni culturali e ambientali, Ufficio centrale per i beni archivistici. 1998. Pp. lxxxvi, 1423)

Conley Carolyn A. Melancholy Accidents: The Meaning of Violence in Post-Famine Ireland. (Lanham, Md.: Lexington Books. 1999. Pp. xii, 249. $40.00.)

Crowe, Michael J. The Extraterrestrial Life Debate, 1750-1900. (Mineóla, N.Y: Dover Publications, Inc. 1999. Pp. xxiv, 680. $19.95 paperback.) Originally published by Cambridge University Press in 1986. This edition has new prefaces.

Dellacasa, Sabina (Ed.). / Libri Iurium della Repubblica di Genova,\61. 1/4. [Regione Liguria - Assessorato alla Cultura, Società Ligure di Storia Patria, Fonti per la storia della Liguria, XI; Pubblicazioni degli Archivi di Stato, Fonti XXVIII.] (Rome: Ministero per i beni e le attività culturali, Ufficio centrale per i beni archivistici. 1998. Pp. xxx, 613)

Dixon, C. Scott (Ed.). The German Reformation: The Essential Readings. [Blackwell Essential Readings in History.] (Maiden, Mass.: Blackwell Publishers. 1999· Pp. vii, 288. $26.95.) Five of the eight previously published essays have been translated from German.

Dolega, Józef Marceli, and Józef Wojciech Czartoszewski (Eds.). Ochrona srodowiska w ftlozofii i teologii. (Warsaw: Wydawnictwo Akademii Teologii Katolickiej. 1999. Pp. 295. Paperback.)

Eigo, Francis A., O.S.A. (Ed.). At the Threshold of the Third Millennium. [Proceedings of the Theology Institute of Villanova University, Volume XXX.] (Villanova, Pa.: The Villanova University Press. 1998. Pp. xi, 202. Paperback.)

Eigo, Francis A., O.S.A. (Ed.). Religious Values at the Threshold of the Third Millennium. [Proceedings of the Theology Institute of Villanova University, Volume XXXI.] (Villanova, Pa. .The Villanova University Press. 1999. Pp.xiii, 228. Paperback.)

Fausto, Boris. A Concise History of Brazil. Trans. Arthur Brakel. (New York: Cambridge University Press. 1999. Pp. xiii, 362. $4995 hardback; $16.95 paperback.)

Franzese, Paolo (Ed.). Archivio di Gabinetto della Sottoprefettura pot Prefettura di Pistoia (1861-1944). [Pubblicazioni degli Archivi di Stato, Strumenti CXXXTV; Archivio di Stato di Pistoia.] (Rome: Ministero per i beni culturali e ambientali, Ufficio centrale per i beni archivistici. 1998. Pp. x, 350. Lire 17.000 paperback.)

Furnish, Victor Paul. The Theology of the First Letter to the Corinthians. [New Testament Theology.] (New York: Cambridge University Press. 1999. Pp. xix, 167.)

Gelber, Michael Werth. The fust and the Lively: The Literary Criticism of John Dryden. (Manchester and New York: Manchester University Press. Distributed in the USA by St. Martin's Press. 1999. Pp. x, 342. $59.95.)

Goldberg, David J. Discontented America: The United States in the 1920s. [The American Moment.] (Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press. 1999. Pp. xii, 210. $42.50 hardcover; $15.95 paperback.)

Grafton, Carol Belanger (Ed.). Medieval Woodcut Illustrations: City Views and Decorations from "The Nuremberg Chronicle." (Mineóla, NY: Dover Publications, Inc. 1999. Pp. iv,75, 194 illus. $8.95 paperback.)

"Halecki, Oscar. Jadwiga of Anjou and the Rise of East Central Europe. Ed. Thaddeus V Gromada. [East European Monographs, No. CCCVIII, Atlantic Studies on Society in Change, No. 73] (New York: Distributed by Columbia University Press. 1991)

*Hann, John H. .4 History of the Timucua Indians and Missions. [The Ripley R Bullen Series, Florida Museum of Natural History] (Gainesville: University Press of Florida. 1996. Pp. xvi, 399. $49.95.)

Hope, W. H. St. John. Heraldry for Designers and Craftspeople. (Mineóla, N.Y: Dover Publications, Inc. 1999. Pp. 423. $14.95 paperback.) Originally published as Heraldry for Craftsmen and Designers by Sir Isaac Pitman & Sons, Ltd., London, in 1913- A new introduction by Helmut Nickel has been added.

Humphries, Michael L. Christian Origins and the Language of the Kingdom of God. (Carbondale, IU.: Southern Illinois University Press. 1999. Pp. ix, 98. $32.50.)

Ikegami, Keiko. Bariaam and fosaphat. A Transcription of MS Egerton 876 with Notes, Glossary, and Comparative Study of the Middle English and Japanese Versions. [AMS Studies in the Middle Ages, No. 21.] (New York: AMS Press. 1999. Pp. xvii, 243. $62.50.)

Janz, Denis R. (Ed.). A Reformation Reader: Primary Texts with Introductions. (Minneapolis: Fortress Press. 1999. Pp. xi, 386. $2900 paperback.)

Kalowski, Julian, M.I.C. Zycie braterskie we wspólnocie: Studium prawno-historyczne. (Warsaw: Wydawnictwo Akademii Teologii Katolickiej. 1999. Pp. 286. Paperback.)

Kendrick, Stephen. Holy Clues: Investigating Life's Mysteries with Sherlock Holmes. (New York: Pantheon Books. 1999. Pp. xi, 192. $21.00.)

Te Coz, Raymond. L'Église d'Orient: Chrétiens d'Lrak, d'Iran et de Turquie. (Paris: Les Éditions du Cerf. 1995. Pp. 441. 198 F paperback.)

Lewis, Katherine J., Noël James Menuge, and Kim M. Phillips (Eds.). Young Medieval Women. (New York: St. Martin's Press. 1999. Pp. xx, 202. $35.00.) Among the eight essays published here are "Model Girls? Virgin-Martyrs and the Training of Young Women in Late Medieval England," by Katherine J. Lewis (pp. 25-46), and "Joan of Arc: Gender and Authority in the Text of the Trial oj Condemnation', 'by Lilas G. Edwards (pp. 133-152).

'Lillich, Meredith Parsons. The Armor of Light: Stained Glass in Western France, 1250-1325. [California Studies in the History of Art, XXIIL]

(Berkeley: University of California Press. 1994. Pp. xxx, 420; 61 color plates. $150.00.)

Magyar Egyháztorténeti Vázlatok Regnum (Essays in Church History in Hungary), Volume 10: (1998), 1-2. (Toronto: Metern International Society for Encyclopedia of Church History in Hungary. 1998. Pp. 303· Paperback.)

Martin, Raymond. The Elusive Messiah: A Philosophical Overview of the Quest for the Historical fesus. (Boulder, Colo.: Westview Press. 1999. Pp. xvii, 236. $25.00.)

Matos Rodríguez, Félix V. Women and Urban Change in San fuan, Puerto Rico, 1820-1868. (Gainesville: University Press of Florida. 1999. Pp. xii, 180. $49.95.)

Melady Margaret B. The Rhetoric of Pope fohn Paul II: The Pastoral Visit as a New Vocabulary of the Sacred. (Westport, Conn.: Praeger. 1999. Pp. x, 256. $65.00.)

Monachino, Vincenzo, Emanuele Boaga, Luciano Osbat, and Salvatore Palese (Eds.). Guida degli Archivi diocesani d'Italia, III. [Pubblicazioni degli Archivi di Stato, Quaderni della Rassegna degli Archivi di Stato, 85;"Archiva Ecclesiae," Anni 40-41.] (Rome: Associazione Archivistica Ecclesiastica; Ministero per i beni culturali e ambientali, Ufficio centrale per i beni archivistici. 1997-1998. Pp. 416 paperback.) This last volume of the guide contains data on 160 diocesan (or archdiocesan) archives.

Netanyahu, B. The Marranos of Spain: From the Late 14th to the Early 16th Century, According to Contemporary Hebrew Sources. Third Edition, Updated and Expanded. (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press. 1999. Pp. xv, 302. $16.95 paperback.) Originally published in 1966 and reviewed by Richard H. Trame, SJ., ante, LV (April, 1969), 78.

*Noonan,James-Charles,Jr. The Church Visible.The Ceremonial Life and Protocol of the Roman Catholic Church. (New York: Viking. 1996. Pp. xxvi, 553- $39.95.)

Norris, Herbert. Medieval Costume and Fashion. (Mineóla, NY.: Dover Publications, Inc. 1999. Pp. xxvii, 485. $17.95 paperback.) Originally published by J. M. Dent and Sons, Ltd., London, in 1927, under the title Costume & Fashion,\o\. ïl.Senlac to Bosworth, 1066-1485-

Officiait (GIi) negli Statt italiani del Quattrocento. [Annali della Scuola Normale Superiore di Pisa, Serie IV, Quaderni, 1.] (Pisa: Classe di Lettere e Filosofía. 1997. Pp. xx, 334.)

Ozorowski, Edward (Ed.). Slownik malzenstwa i rodziny. (Warsaw: Wydawnictwo Akademii Teologii Katolickiej; Lomianki: Fundacja Pomoc Rodzinie. 1999. Pp. xx, 513· Paperback.)

Pennington, M. Basil (Ed.). William of Saint Thierry.The Way to Divine Union. Selected Spiritual Writings. (Hyde Park, N.Y.: New City Press. 1999. Pp. 144. Paperback.)

Pesiri, Giovanni, Micaela Procaccia, Irma Paola Tascini, and Laura Vallone (Eds.). Archivi di famiglie e di persone: Materiali per una guida. II: Lombardia—Sicilia. [Pubblicazioni degli Archivi di Stato, Strumenti CXXXIIL] (Rome: Ministero per i beni e le attività culturali, Ufficio centrale per i beni archivistici. 1998. Pp. xviii, 404.)

Prosperi, Cecilia. Il restauro dei documenti di archivio Dizionarietto dei termini. [Pubblicazioni degli Archivi di Stato, Quaderni della Rassegna degli Archivi di Stato, 89·] (Rome: Ministero per i beni e le attività culturali, Ufficio centrale per i beni archivistici. 1999. Pp. 188. Paperback.)

Ricci, Aldo Giovanni (Ed.). La "Revue mensuelle d'économie politique" nelle lettere di Théodore Fix a Jean-Charles-Léonard Simonde de Sismondi. [Pubblicazioni degli Archivi di Stato, Quaderni della Rassegna degli Archivi di Stato, 88.] (Rome: Ministero per i beni e le attività culturali, Ufficio centrale per i beni archivistici. 1999· Pp- 166. Paperback.)

Ross, Margaret Clunies. Prolonged Echoes: Old Norse Myths in Medieval Northern Society. Volume 2: The Reception ofNorse Myths in Medieval Iceland. [The Viking Collection: Studies in Northern Civilization, Volume 10.] (Portland, Oreg.: Odense University Press. Distributed by ISBS. 1998. Pp. 222. $32.00.)

Santoro, Raffaele. L'archivio del Genio civile di Roma. [Pubblicazioni degli Archivi di Stato, Strumenti CXXXVI; Archivio di Stato di Roma.] (Rome: Ministero per i beni culturali e ambientali, Ufficio centrale per i beni archivistici. 1998. Pp. 461. Paperback.)

"Sauer, Thomas. Anton Ruland (1809-1874): Ein Beitrag zur Geschichte der katholischen Restauration in Bayern. [Schriftenreihe zur bayerischen Landesgeschichte, Band 104.] (Munich: C. H. Beck'scheVerlagsbuchhhandlung. 1995. Pp. xxxv, 274. Paperback.)

*Schlögl, Rudolf. Glaube und Religion in der Säkularisierung: Die katholische Stadt—Köln, Aachen, Münster—1700-1840. [Ancien Régime Aufklärung und Revolution, Band 28.] (Munich: R. Oldenbourg Verlag. 1995. Pp. 447.)

Siek, Stanislaw. Autopsychoterapia. Wydanie drugie. (Warsaw: Wydawnictwo Akademii Teologii Katolickiej. 1999. Pp. 292. Paperback.)

Società (Le) di mutuo soccorso italiane e i loro archivi. Atti del seminario di studio Spoleto, 8-10 novembre 1995. [Pubblicazioni degli Archivi di Stato, Saggi 49.] (Rome: Ministero per i beni e le attività culturali, Ufficio centrale per i beni archivistici. 1999· Pp. 344. Paperback.) Among the papers published in this volume are "Le società operaie confessionali di mutuo soccorso: Itinerari storiografici negli archivi ecclesiastici veneziani," by Francesca Cavazzana Romanelli (pp. 197-208), and "Guida alle fonti per la storia délie società operaie cattoliche di mutuo soccorso negli archivi ecclesiastici veneziani," by Manuela Barausse (pp. 209-213.)

Swift, Roger, and Sheridan Gilley (Eds.). The Irish in Victorian Britain: The Local Dimension. (Portland, Oreg.: Four Courts Press, c/o ISBS. 1999. Pp.

320. $55.00.) Among the twelve essays in this volume are "Catholic Education in Victorian Hull," by Marie McClelland (pp. 101-121), and "From Victorian 'Little Ireland' to Heritage Trail: Catholicism, Community and Change in Liverpool's Docklands," by Frank Boyce (pp. 277-297).

Szymula, Marek (Ed.). Mistyka droga zjednoczenia ? Bogiem. Opracowanie merytoryczno-naukowe pod kierunkiem ks. Prof. Dr hab. Stanislawa Urbanskiego. (Warsaw: Wydawnictwo Akademii Teologii Katolickiej. 1999. Pp. 311. Paperback.)

Terpstra, Nicholas. Lay Confraternities and Civic Religion in Renaissance Bologna. [Cambridge Studies in Italian History and Culture.] (New York: Cambridge University Press. 1995. Pp. xx, 251.)

Twinam, Ann. Public Lives, Private Secrets: Gender, Honor, Sexuality, and Illegitimacy in Colonial Spanish America. (Stanford, Calif: Stanford University Press. 1999. Pp. xv, 447. $60.00.)

Urbanski, Stanislaw. Teología zycia mistycznego: Studium polskiej mistyki (1914-1939). Wydanie II. (Warsaw: Wydawnictwo Akademii Teologii Katolickiej. 1999. Pp. 439- Paperback.)

Viladesau, Richard. Theological Aesthetics: God in Imagination, Beauty, and Art. (New York: Oxford University Press. 1999. Pp. xv, 294. $4995.)

Winkelbauer, Thomas. Fürst und Fürstendiener: Gundaker von Liechtenstein, ein österreichischer Aristokrat des konfessionellen Zeitalters. [Mitteilungen des Instituts für Österreichische Geschichtsforschung, Ergänzungsband 34.] (Vienna: R. Oldenbourg Verlag. 1999- Pp. 656. öS 980,-.)

Wörmald, Patrick. The Making of English Law: King Alfred to the Twelfth Century. Volume I: Legislation and Its Limits. (Maiden, Mass.: Blackwell Publishers. 1999. Pp. xviü, 574. $99.95.)

Wright, Kevin J. Catholic Shrines of Central and Eastern Europe: A Pilgrim's Travel Guide. (Liguori, Mo.: Liguori. 1999. Pp. xii, 316. $16.95 paperback.)

Yount, David. Ten Thoughts to Take into Eternity: Living Wisely in Light of the Afterlife. (New York: Simon & Schuster. 1999. Pp. 191. $21.00.)