GENERAL INDEX
Volume XCII
(2006)

Compiled by
LAWRENCE H. FELDMAN, PH.D.

ABBREVIATIONS:

ACHA American Catholic Historical Association
b.n. brief notice
CoS Causes of Saints
p.n. personal notice
rev. review

The Catholic Historical Review

VOL. XCII OCTOBER, 2006 No. 4

THE EVOLUTION OF THE UTRAQUIST MASS, 1420-1620

BY

BARRY F. H. GRAHAM*

The description of the evolution of the Mass is based on liturgical documents of the period whose authenticity as witnesses of the Utraquist Mass is guaranteed by their former use in worshiping communities. The Utraquists retained the (Latin) Prague use of the Roman Catholic Church, but with Czech readings, until 1538. Thereafter, the use of Czech and the diversity of liturgical practice from church to church increased. There is no sign of Lutheran influence on the Utraquist Mass, unless one argues that Luther influenced the increased use of the vernacular after 1538. Language apart, later Utraquist books are direct descendants of the original fourteenth-century Prague Use. The promulgation of the new Roman Missal in 1570 had no discernible effect on later Utraquist books.

Utraquists and Their Relationship with the Catholic Church

Utraquism[1] was the culmination of a reform movement in Bohemia which had its beginning in the mid-fourteenth century. This movement, over the period from the mid-fourteenth century through the revolution of 1419, acquired an agenda of four items which became

*Dr. Graham is a sessional lecturer in medieval church history and liturgy at Trinity College, Toronto.

[1] "Utraquism" is from the Latin "sub utraque specie," meaning that communion was taken under both kinds (bread and wine). Synonyms include "Calixtine," from calix (a cup) and "Hussite," from Jan Hus (†6 July 1415) who was executed at Constance and became a symbol of the Bohemian reform.

codified in 1420 as the Four Articles of Prague.[2] The reformers, one of whom was the emperor Charles IV, had many of the customary concerns about eliminating abuses within the Church, including absenteeism, pluralism, non-residency, simony, immorality, and sometimes criminality among the clergy. Their concern to curb a level of luxurious living among prelates, parish priests, and monks which their flocks found offensive is reflected in Article 3. The specific remedy often advocated for this problem was that the clergy return to a life of apostolic poverty, an idea to which the intended targets were not attracted. These two basic ideas have been the stuff of periodic spells of church reform throughout the ages, which flourished for a time and then were forgotten. By the beginning of the fifteenth century, these themes were taken up by a number of aggressive preachers including Jan Hus. For a time, they were supported by the king and even by one of the archbishops of Prague. Being the time of the Great Schism, church discipline was perforce somewhat looser than usual, and the preachers were able to make bold attacks on ecclesiastical abuses. Of course they were eventually at least partly muzzled.[3] Article 2, which asserts that there should exist "free preaching of the word of God," reflects this problem. In the fall of 1414, Hus left for Constance to answer to the church council for allegedly heretical beliefs, a charge some modern scholars have concluded was mistaken.[4]

[2]There were a number of recensions of the articles. Howard Kaminsky's translation of the April 1420 form in *A History of the Hussite Revolution* (Berkeley, 1967), p.369, follows:

1. We stand for the ministering of the body and blood of the Lord to the laity in both kinds, for . . . this was Christ's institution and ... that of the first apostles and of the holy Primitive Church . . . , as the Council of Constance admitted to us.
2. We stand for the proper and free preaching of the word of God and of his every truth.
3. All priests, from the pope on down, should give up their pomp, avarice, and im-proper lordship in superfluity over temporal goods, and they should live as models for us.
4. We stand for the purgation and cessation from all public mortal sins, by each in his own person; and for the cleansing of the Bohemian realm and nation from false and evil slander; and in this connection for the common good of our land.

[3]Hus was exiled to southern Bohemia in 1413 after Prague had been placed under interdict for his efforts.

[4]Hus was undoubtedly a controversialist, but some modern scholars have pronounced his teaching free of heresy. The assessment of Paul De Vooght is found in De Vooght, *L'hérésie de Jean Huss* (Louvain, 1960), p. 476:

> Il était un homme et, comme tel, un composé mystérieux de défauts et de qualités. Avant tout, Hus n'avait le sens de l'opportunité. Il prêchait, enseignait, agissait non seulement opportune, importune, mais per fas et nefas, n'acceptant pas, n'acceptant jamais qu'il y ait un temps de parler et un temps de se taire

Article 1 had its foundation in an earlier movement for frequent, even daily, communion. The radical nature of this development has to be understood against the background of the current practice in fifteenth-century Bohemia of annual communion at Easter as provided in canon 21 of Lateran IV. An early proponent of frequent communion was Milíč of Kroměříž († 1374), who pursued a preaching ministry in Latin and Czech. He founded a community including reformed prostitutes in which apostolic poverty was observed and in which there were daily preaching and reception of the Eucharist. Daily preaching was offered at the Bethlehem Chapel in Prague, founded in 1391, to which was added daily communion in 1402. Jakoubek of Stříbro, after Hus's departure to Constance, extended this developing tradition. Together with some colleagues, he began giving the communion cup to the laity in four churches in Prague in the second half of 1414.[5] The chronicler Laurence of Březová, writing soon after, saw communion by both bread and wine as the defining act of the Bohemian reformation.[6] As an extension to this liturgical reform, Jakoubek's 1416 suggestion that infants should receive the cup directly after baptism[7] became universally adopted among Utraquists by 1418.[8] The muscular implementation of the last three Prague Articles began in late 1415 when the majority of the upper and lower nobility, Utraquist and Catholic,

[5]The custom of receiving communion under the two species was general in the Church until about the twelfth century. See F. L. Cross and E. A. Livingstone (eds.), *Oxford Dictionary of the Christian Church*, 3 ed. (Oxford, 1997), p. 386. There are even formulas in fifteenth-century Catholic Prague missals for administering the cup to the laity. See, for example, Prague, Knihovna Národního muzea (hereinafter: NM) XV A 5, fol. 178vb. It was made in 1487 for use in Plzeň by the scribe Peter of Prague (fol. 354v).

[6]Vavřinec z Březové, "Historia Hussitica," *Fontes Rerum Bohemicarum*, vol. 5 (Prague, 1893), p. 329:

> Anno incarnacionis dominice MCCCCXIV venerabilis ac divinissima communio eukaristie sub utraque specie panis scilicet et vini populo communi fideli ministranda per venerandum ac egregium virum Jacobellum de Misa, sacre theologie baccalarium formatum, et aliquos sibi tunc in hac materia assistentes sacerdotes est inchoata in urbe inclita et magnifica Pragensi, primum quidem in ecclesiis sancti Adalberti in Nova civitate, sancti Martini in muro et sancti Michaelis ac capella Bethleem in Civitate antiqua Pragensi.

[7]David R. Holeton, *Infant communion—Then and Now* (Bramcote, Notts, 1981), p. 11.

[8]Like administration of the cup to the laity, infant communion was hardly an innovation. We find it in such eighth-century sources as *Ordo Romanus* XI and a number of Gelasian-type sacramentaries (*Gellonensis, Augustodunensis,* etc.). See Michel Andrieu, *Les ordines romani du haut moyen âge*, vol. 2 (Louvain, 1960), p. 441, #75. It persisted until the thirteenth century. See Mark Dalby, *Infant Communion: The New Testament to the Reformation* (Cambridge, 2003), p. 22.

helped to relieve the Church of much of its temporal wealth and assumed the ultimate responsibility for the content of preaching in the country. Despite the execution of Hus, deemed an outrage and insult to the Czech people, most of his followers regarded themselves as faithful Catholics, even if the Roman Catholic Church did not share their opinion. Having this self-understanding, the more conservative among the Utraquists maintained the same liturgy and theology as that of the Roman Catholics, save for the cup and infant communion.

The Catholic Church continued to regard the Hussites as schismatics for the better part of two decades until the crushing effectiveness of the Hussite field armies induced it to reconsider its opinion. On July 5, 1436 at Jihlava, after lengthy negotiations, the delegates of the Council of Basel and the Bohemians signed a treaty (the *Compactata*) under which the Utraquists were received into the Roman Catholic Church. The treaty authorized in Bohemia and Moravia the administration of communion in two kinds and a somewhat revised version of the last three Prague articles. The *Compactata* applied only to Utraquists and had the effect of creating two classes of citizens in the Czech lands. Although Eugene IV did not authorize the *Compactata*, they were treated as being valid until Pius II abrogated them in 1462. After friction between Catholics and Utraquists, the two confessions agreed to a peace in 1485 within the secular and religious terms of the *Compactata* to last for thirty-two years (to 1516). The two groups agreed to refrain from polemics and from seizing churches occupied by the other. The peace implicitly acknowledged that the faith of the two confessions was the same, whereas that of the Bohemian Brethren, who were excluded, was different. The agreement, remarkable for its time, was extended indefinitely in 1511. While it was terminated by Maximilian II in 1567, it effectively remained in force until the end of the century.

While Bohemia was exposed to Lutheran influences, they never found fertile soil. Havel Cahera, a Lutheran, became the senior of the four administrators of the Utraquist Consistory in 1523. He convened an assembly of the three Utraquist estates in early 1524. The twenty propositions which the assembly accepted did not give great comfort to the Lutheran cause. Solafideism was either ignored or implicitly denied in Article 8 which stressed obedience to the Law of God. Article 13 confirmed the validity of infant communion, a practice rejected by Luther.[9] The three dated Utraquist manuscript graduals

[9]Zdeněk V. David, *Finding the Middle Way* (Washington, D. C., 2003), pp. 64-66.

produced in the decade after Cahera's appointment all contain offertories for all days in the calendar, thus affirming the sacrificial character of the Mass which Luther denied.[10] In 1528, Ferdinand I removed Cahera from office and in 1529 expelled him from the country.[11] While Lutheranism was popular among the nobility, it did not put down deep roots in the kingdom. Perhaps the most telling way of describing the influence of Lutheranism on Utraquism is to note that, in 1575, Lutherans amounted to less than 1 percent of the Bohemian population; Utraquists to 75-83 percent.[12]

In a decree of April 16, 1564, Pius IV allowed communion in both species throughout the Empire,[13] and Mass was celebrated *sub utraque* on several days in the Prague cathedral by Archbishop Antonín Brus of Mohelnice.[14] Brus and his two immediate successors[15] treated the Utraquists in some measure as a part of their own flocks, providing consecrated oils on Maundy Thursday and occasionally ordaining priests for Utraquist churches. During much of the last quarter of the sixteenth century, they acted as intermediaries between the Utraquist consistory and Rudolf II. Brus was one of the sponsors of a five-part Utraquist gradual containing a proper for Hus and the Bohemian martyrs that was assembled over the period 1573-1578 for

[10]Chrudim, Okresní muzeum přír. č. 12580; Louny, Státní okresní archiv I G 8a; New York, General Theological Seminary BX 2043 .A3 H8.

[11]David, *Finding*, pp. 72-73.

[12]Zdeněk V. David, "Utraquists, Lutherans, and the Bohemian Confession of 1575," *Church History* 68 (1999), pp. 297-298.

[13]See Gustave Constant, *Concession à l'Allemagne de la communion sous les deux espèces: Étude sur les débats de la réforme catholique en Allemagne (1548 – 1621),* vol. 1 (Paris, 1923), p. 461. Ferdinand I, in order to maintain tranquility in the Empire, was keen to have the cup restored to the laity and to reinstitute the married priesthood. Communion was administered in both kinds in 1562 in Bohemia, Austria, Hungary, Moravia, Silesia, Carinthia, Carniola, Styria, Sweden, Bavaria, and in most of the Germanic lands (p. 247). In February 1562, Ferdinand instructed Brus and the other archbishops whose sees were within the Empire to advocate these measures vigourously at Trent (pp. 212-214). Married priesthood was dropped, but Brus did make a forceful representation at a session of the Council of Trent in early August 1562 in favor of the chalice. On September 16, the Council referred the question to the Pope (p. 279), who allowed it in 1564. Permission to use the chalice was then gradually withdrawn, country by country. It was last suppressed in Bohemia in December 1621 by Archbishop Jan Lohel (pp. 757-758).

[14]Archbishop Brus served as Roman Catholic archbishop of Prague from 1561 to 1580. His predecessor was Konrád of Vechta, who was the archbishop from 1413 until his death in 1431. When he became a Utraquist in 1421, the bishop of Olomouc was named administrator of the diocese. There was no consecrated archbishop between 1431 and 1561.

[15]Martin Medek of Mohelnice (1581-1590) and Zbyněk Berka of Dubá (1592-1606).

use in a church in Prague's New Town.[16] An English visitor in 1592, a keen observer of liturgical customs, noted that in the Church of St. Mary Týn in the Old Town of Prague, "The Hussites [have] changed nothing in religion, save onely the communicating of the Lords Supper in both kinds. . . ."[17] He also observed:

> For whereas the Papists giue not the Cupp to the layety, but only the bread, which they say contaynes the blood in the body, the Hussites giue both kyndes, not only to lay men, but to very Infants, because Christ sayth, suffer little ones to come vnto mee. But still they beleeue with the Papists the Corporall eateing of the body and blood of our lord with the mouth by transubstantiation. . . . They sing the Masse in lattin, but they reade the Epistle, the Gospell, the forme of Baptisme, and buyriall in the Bohemian Tounge. . . . They agreed with the Papists for the number of Sacraments, and the doctryne of Predestination.[18]

The Utraquists continued to regard themselves as Catholics. Shortly after 1620, the year of the first major battle of the Thirty Years' War, Utraquism was effectively suppressed in Bohemia.

Ministers of the Utraquist Mass

A Utraquist Mass no less than a Catholic Mass required an ordained priest. Utraquists always insisted that the bishops ordaining their priests should be valid ones in the eyes of the Roman Catholic Church. This of course caused difficulties because there were no Utraquist bishops, so candidates would often have to travel outside the country to be ordained by a Latin or Greek bishop. On some occasions, the Utraquists were able to have candidates ordained within Bohemia. In 1417, a member of the upper nobility kidnaped an Augustinian friar named Herman, who was titular bishop of Nicopolis, and forced him to ordain a group of Hussite priests. Between 1421 and his death in 1431, Konrád of Vechta, Catholic archbishop of Prague, served as bishop to the Utraquists. Philibert of Coutances, legate to Bohemia of the Council of

[16]Prague, Národní knihovna (hereinafter: NK) XI B 1a, 1b, 1c, 1d and Prague, Knihovna Strahovského klaštera (hereinafter: STRA) DA II 3.

[17]Fynes Moryson Gent., *An Itinerary Containing His Ten Yeeres Travell through the Twelve Dominions of Germany, Bohmerland, Sweitzerland, Netherland, Denmarke, Poland, Italy, Turky, France, England, Scotland & Ireland*, vol. 4 (Glasgow, 1907-8), pp. 332-333. The author is indebted to Zdeněk V. David, who identified the chronicles of Moryson and of Pierre Bergeron, which are cited later.

[18]Fynes Moryson, *Shakespeare's Europe: unpublished chapters of Fynes Moryson's Itinerary, being a survey of the condition of Europe at the end of the 16th century* (London, 1903), p. 277.

Basel, ordained Utraquist priests between 1435 and his death in Prague in 1439.[19] Two bishops from Italy provided a supply of priests at the end of the fifteenth and the beginning of the sixteenth centuries. Agostino, bishop of Santorin in the Cyclades, served the Utraquists from 1482 until his death on September 27, 1493.[20] The next episcopal visitor was Filippo of Villanuova, vicar general to the bishop of Modena and titular bishop of Sidon, who served the Utraquists from the spring of 1504 until his death on October 20, 1507.[21] Two Greek Uniate bishops in Venice provided Utraquist priests between 1539 and 1555.[22] When the see of Prague was again filled in 1561, Archbishop Brus ordained twelve Utraquist priests in 1565 and a further thirty in 1566.[23] After that, Utraquist candidates for the priesthood were usually forced to seek ordination farther afield because of curial opposition to their ordination. Despite this difficulty, there was never a serious deficiency of Utraquist priests. Pierre Bergeron was part of a twelve-man diplomatic delegation under the leadership of Marshal Urbain de Laval de Boisdauphin sent in 1600 by Henri IV of France to Emperor Rudolf in Prague. His comments give interesting insights about the Hussites and their clergy:

> The Hussites are found in more than two-thirds of the towns and the rite of their Mass is almost the same as ours. On Corpus Christi, they hold a procession around the town, carrying the host through the streets. The Jesuits and everyone else of our faith think that they should not be prevented from venerating this host because in everyone's opinion, as it is known, it has been touched by the hands of a real priest who was not ordained by a follower of the Hussite religion. Hussite priests can, however, marry without impediment. They serve the sacrament in two kinds which the Catholic priests also do by the authority of a bull which the Pope issued to the Czechs to gain their obedience. The Hussites have not images of the saints in their churches, other than paintings. They control the principal church in the town [St. Mary Týn] and also all the rest of the churches, while the Catholics can administer the sacrament only in the monasteries.[24]

In short, the Hussite clergy were not only canonically ordained by Catholic standards, but were recognized to be so even by the Jesuits. Utraquist priests were expected to be celibate, at least to the end of

[19]David, *Finding*, p. 30.

[20]Ferdinand Hrejsa, *Dějiny křest'anství v Československu*, vol. 4 (Prague, 1948), pp. 45-47, 95-97.

[21]Hrejsa, *Dějiny křesťanství*, pp. 168-170, 172.

[22]David, *Finding*, p. 385.

[23]David, Finding, pp. 161, 164.

[24]Eliska Fucíková (ed.), *Tři francouzští kavalíři v rudolfínské Praze* (Prague, 1989), pp. 33, 44, 45. Author's translation.

the sixteenth century, and administered a liturgy which was based on the Prague use of the Roman Mass.

The Utraquists and the Office

The daily office was a part of Utraquist worship. In the late fifteenth century, at least four extant Latin antiphonaries in seven volumes were made for use in Utraquist towns. These include those made for the Church of the Holy Spirit in Hradec Králové,[25] the Church of St. Bartholomew in Kolín,[26] the Church of the Assumption in Ústí nad Labem,[27] and an unidentified church in Kutná Hora.[28] There are doubtless others. A Latin antiphonary made for the Church of Saints Peter and Paul in Čáslav was blessed by Bishop Filippo of Villanuova on September 13, 1504.[29] None of these books has any contents which distinguish it as Hussite. A sixth Latin antiphonary, perhaps from the 1510's with a feast day for Hus and now preserved in the metropolitan library of the archdiocese of Esztergom, Hungary, was made for a Utraquist choir.[30] In other respects, except for its smaller size, it is similar to the other six antiphonaries. How it found its way to Hungary is a mystery. From the relative paucity of extant sources for the office, we can judge that the chief and fundamental component of the Utraquist liturgy was the Mass, while the daily office receded in importance. Utraquist antiphonaries from the sixteenth century are rare.[31]

The Utraquist Low Mass[32]

By the end of the fourteenth century, there was an increased interest in having preaching in Czech. In 1391, the Bethlehem Chapel was

[25]Hradec Králové, Muzeum východních Čech (hereinafter: HK) Hr 3 and 4, ca. 1470.

[26]NM XII A 21 and 22, 1470's.

[27]Ústí nad Labem, Městské muzeum ST 1490 and 1491. Last quarter of fifteenth century.

[28]NK XXIII A 2, 1471.

[29]Vienna, Österreichische Nationalbibliothek Mus. Hs. (hereinafter: ÖNB) 15505. See Kliment Čermák, "O Čáslavských kancionálech," *Památky archaeologické a místopisné*, 23 (1909), col. 3.

[30]Esztergom, Főszékesegyhazí Könyvtár Ms. 1.313. The feast of Hus is on pp. 501-507.

[31]Jana Fojtíková, "České mešní ordinarium 2. poloviny 16. století," *Miscellanea Musicologica*, 31 (1984), p. 228. Even rarer are antiphonaries which include Czech chant, although there are at least two: NK XVII E 1 and NM IV A 17, both made in the 1550's.

[32]The comments which follow relate to the Mass of the mainline Hussites. There were a number of groups of Hussite radicals which sprang up in the late 1410's and whose theology and liturgical practices were beyond the pale. One such group was the Taborites, who were suppressed by King George of Poděbrady in 1452.

founded as a center for this purpose. Jan Hus, who became its preacher in 1402, coupled its homiletic program with the celebration of the Eucharist, thereby providing a daily ministry of word and sacrament. The new foundation was not only well endowed, but also well protected. Its privileges were secured in legal form and its relationship to the parish in which it was located fixed by permanent agreement. Its pulpit was used by many of the leaders of the Bohemian reformation. Lady Catherine of Vraba in 1402 provided a living for a preacher at St. Vitus's Cathedral who was to preach in Czech each holy day and three times weekly during Advent and Lent.[33] It would seem that Czech hymns were being used increasingly in the liturgy. At a synod held on June 15, 1406, it was ordered that only four such hymns, whose *incipits* were cited, could be sung in worship services. The use of any others would be punished under church law.[34] While it is possible that readings were in Czech at the beginning of the fifteenth century, the only bits of evidence in primary documents are lectionary *incipits* and *explicits* found in some Czech Bibles. In 1434, it would appear that the readings and the creed were being said in Latin only or else in both Latin and Czech, since canon 17 of the St. James's Synod of that year urged that they be said in Czech.[35] There is only one relevant manuscript to shed light on the question, a quasi-missal made ca. 1450.[36] It has Latin chants and variable prayers for each day in its calendar. The readings are in Czech. It does not, however, contain the elements of the ordinary or the canon. There is also no identification of the church for which the book was made, although the users were probably Utraquist. The difficulty in determining the exact contents of the Utraquist Mass arises because there seem to be only two extant Utraquist missals.[37] They are substantially similar to each another, were both written by the scribe Jan of Humpolec, are entirely in Latin, and in no significant way

[33]John M. Klassen, *The Nobility and the Making of the Hussite Revolution* (Boulder, Colorado, 1978), p. 87.

[34]4. Cantilenarum prohibicio

Item mandat dominus Archiepiscopus quod plebani et ecclesiarum rectores in predicationibus nuncient prohibitas esse novas cantilenas omnes preter:

buoh wssemohucy etc.; hospodine pomiluj ny; Jesu Chryste styedry kniezie; Swaty nass Waczlawe. Alias contra cantantes et cantare permittentes per remedia juris punientur.

See C. Höfler, *Concilia Pragensia 1353-1413* (Vienna, 1972), p. 52.

[35]Blanka Zilynská, *Husitské synody v Čechách 1418-1440* (Prague, 1985), pp. 117-118.

[36]NM IV B 6

[37]Kutná Hora, Okresní archiv č. 10 (1486) and Ledeč, Děkanství ZP 826/1 (1493). The latter is kept in a kitchen cupboard of the deanery of the Church of SS. Peter and Paul in Ledeč.

different from a Catholic Prague missal from Plzeň of the same period.[38] All three (the two by Humpolec and the one from Plzeň) have a formula to be used in administering the cup to the laity. Prague missals were first printed in Plzeň in 1479. Many other editions followed, all in Latin. The printed Prague missals had no Utraquist characteristics and no words to be used for administering the cup. The only extant books with prayers in Czech for the Mass are a 1588 manuscript which has three Eucharistic prayers, one in Latin and two in Czech, called the Altar Book of Adam Táborský[39] and a manuscript supplement to a printed Prague missal which has in Czech two of the three proper prayers for the days of the temporal and sanctoral cycles.[40] The former does not have the complete set of proper prayers, chants, and readings that would be found in a missal. So while Latin and Czech anaphoras were both used in at least one church at the end of the sixteenth century, there is no extant documentary evidence of which language was dominant in Utraquist worship in the Bohemian lands.

Czech may have been used in some churches for other parts of the Mass, but there is no evidence for this before 1539 in primary sources. We are told of a group of Prague Utraquists who, on March 3, 1502, drew up and presented to the priests and masters of the Charles University a list of five conditions which, in their view, were necessary as a basis for any reconciliation with Rome. The fourth was, "that the giving of the sacrament to infants and the singing in Czech of the gospel and epistle should remain and the abrogation of the *Compactata* should in no way affect them."[41] By the third decade of the sixteenth century, there had developed a movement toward using Czech in the music of the liturgy which was to become more widespread beginning in 1539, but which was never complete. A synod held in Prague on January 29, 1524 described the accepted form of the liturgy at that time which was identical to that found in the traditional Latin Mass. The synod added that the Mass should be celebrated,

[38]NM XV B 5 (1487).

[39]NM III F 17. See David R. Holeton, "The Evolution of Utraquist Eucharistic Liturgy: a textual study," in *The Bohemian Reformation and Religious Practice*, vol. 2 (Prague, 1998), pp. 99-100, 108-109. The book also has prefaces and eight noted gospel readings.

[40]The printed gradual STRA DR V 12 does have in a handwritten supplement collects and postcommunion prayers (but not secrets) for the temporal and the sanctoral translated into Czech. David R. Holeton, "Fynes Moryson's Itinerary . . . ," *The Bohemian Reformation and Religious Practice*, Vol. 5, Part 2 (Prague, 2005), p. 406.

[41]Hrejsa, *Dějiny křesťanství*, p. 113. "Aby podávání Svátosti dítkám a české zpívání evangellií a epis˘tol zu˚stalo a nebylo na závadu takovému dokonání kompactát."

> as it has been from antiquity, introit, separately for Sundays and annual saints' days either for Mary or apostles or others mentioned in scripture, *Kyrie eleison, Gloria*, epistle, gradual and alleluia, sequence which reflects the word of God, gospel, Nicene Creed, preface, *Sanctus, Agnus Dei*, communion, and other songs and collects, which are in accordance with God's law. And everything, as much as possible, should be in the vernacular. [42]

Nonetheless, in 1543 Jan Augusta (1500-1572), bishop of the Bohemian Brethren, remarked in reproof that the music in a Hussite Mass was more Latin than Czech.[43] Before this, Master Písecký wrote in his memoirs that it is true that the Czech office of the Mass takes place in many churches, especially in all churches where there are no literati, but that otherwise, the Hussite office is in Latin.[44] As our Englishman Fynes Moryson reported, the readings at the end of the sixteenth century in St. Mary Týn were in Czech and the rest of the Mass was in Latin. So, leaving aside for now the question of the music of the Mass, it seems to be a well supported conjecture that readings in Hussite Masses, to which one can probably add sermons, were more often in Czech than in Latin from the first half of the fifteenth century, the time of the Czech quasi-missal made ca. 1450 (NM IV B 6), until the seventeenth century. There were manuscript and printed Czech Bibles from which the lessons and gospels could have been taken.

But what of the language of the variable prayers, prefaces, and the Eucharistic prayer itself? Although we are told that, in the period 1415-1417, Jakoubek encouraged the priest Jan Čapek to translate the Mass into Czech, there is no extant record of his efforts.[45] There are no extant complete sets of Czech Mass prayers and, save for the two in the altar book cited by David Holeton, no Czech anaphoras. Judging by the

[42]Josef V. Šimák (ed.), "Kronika pražská Bartoše písaře," *Fontes Rerum Bohemicarum*, vol. 6 (Prague, 1907), pp. 23-24. The Mass is to be celebrated:

> . . . jakož bejval od starodávna, introitové, zvlášť pak nedělní a svátkův ročních buď také i Panny Marie neb apoštolští i jiní, kteří by z písem božských vzati byli; kyrie elejson, písnička anjelská, sláva na výsostech bohu a na zemi pokoj, epištola, graduálové, alleluja; časem svým i prosy některé, kteréž by se s zákonem božím srovnávaly, čtení svaté, víra obecná křesťanská podle sněmu nicenského, praefací, sanctus, agnus dei, communi i jiná při tom zpívání a kollecty kteréž by se s zákonem božím srovnávaly. A to všecko, což nejvíc byti můž, aby v jazyku rozumném bylo.

[43]Zikmund Winter, *Život církevní v Čechách*, vol. 2 (Prague, 1896), p. 854. The Jednota is known in English as the Unity of the Brethren or as the Bohemian Brethren.

[44]Winter, *Život církevní*, p. 854. Literati were members of literary guilds who, among other functions, acted as choristers.

[45]Kaminsky, *A History*, p. 198.

number of surviving graduals, there were scores[46] of Utraquist churches celebrating Mass in the sixteenth century. Each had to have the chants, readings, and fixed and variable prayers found in a missal. But there is not one extant Czech missal. Could it be that scores existed, but each one was subsequently destroyed? During the Counter-Reformation it is true that parts of Czech graduals were excised, but only a few leaves usually relating to Hus or containing polemic. Whole books seem not to have been destroyed and the censors showed no animosity toward the use of the Czech language per se. Total destruction seems virtually impossible and at least highly improbable. This leads us ineluctably to the conclusion that most Utraquist priests were commonly using the same printed Latin Prague missals used by the Roman Catholics for the anaphora, prefaces, and proper prayers.

Music of the Utraquist Mass to 1538

There is an extant Czech choral book made ca. 1420.[47] How it was used is not evident from the contents. Somewhat more than fifty Latin graduals made between 1420 and 1539 have survived. Slightly over a score were Utraquist, another over a score Catholic, and the remainder of unknown provenance. In most cases, it is impossible to distinguish between the confessions of the users of graduals using evidence internal to the books. Instead, one has to try to identify whether the church for which the book was made was Utraquist or Catholic. For example, it is impossible to identify any difference between the gradual made for use in the Catholic Church of St. Bartholomew in Plzeň in 1490[48] and the one made sixteen years later for use in the Utraquist Church of the Assumption in Havlíčkův Brod.[49]

Most of these books consist of a Kyriale (without creeds), the propers for the liturgical year with the temporal cycle preceding the sanctoral cycle, a sequentiary, and a single creed. The temporal cycle makes provision for each Sunday in the year, weekdays in Lent, and following Easter and Pentecost, and four sets of Ember days. The calendar is typically crowded, with sanctoral cycles often having more than 200 days. A sextet of saints traditionally dear to Bohemian hearts—Adalbert,

[46]Barry F. H. Graham, *Bohemian and Moravian Graduals 1420-1620* (Turnhout, 2006), p. 34 (Table 4).

[47]NM II C 7, usually called the Jistebnický Kancionál.

[48]NM XII A 20.

[49]Havlíčkův Brod, Okresní vlastivědné muzeum SK 2/1.

Sigismund, Vitus, Procop, Ludmilla, and Wenceslas—are usually present. While the days of the sanctoral included in the calendar may vary from book to book, the music and text of those present are almost always identical, save for spelling differences. Starting in 1491, there was some minor evolution in Utraquist books. Two Utraquist books made between 1490 and 1510 contain one sequence for the feast of Jan Hus.[50] All Utraquist books made between 1510 and 1537 also had proper chants for Hus, some of which were drawn from the common of martyrs.[51] The alleluia and verse were always specially written for Hus.[52] A second evolutionary trend began about 1500 and can be seen in some Utraquist and Roman Catholic graduals. The configuration of Kyriale, proper chants, and sequentiary remained, but the content of the proper had the temporal and sanctoral cycles intercalated. The number of days in the sanctoral cycle was reduced drastically (thirty would be a typical figure). The temporal cycle was pared to the seven major feasts from Christmas to Corpus Christi and a series of Masses in Advent for the Incarnation and/or for the Virgin in Advent.[53] Utraquist books of this general configuration usually have a section of hymns, a handful of which are in Czech.[54] Most of the books are in a *textualis formata* hand.

Music of the Utraquist Mass after 1538

With three exceptions,[55] Utraquist graduals made after 1538 were in Czech.[56] At least fifty-eight Czech Utraquist volumes were made between 1539 and 1620. This compares with eight Catholic graduals and eight Latin Utraquist volumes made in the same period. The configurations of the Czech Utraquist books are highly variable. The temporal cycle usually has the major feasts from Christmas to Corpus Christi, Sundays between Septuagesima and Palm Sunday, Good Friday,

[50]ÖNB 15492; Mladá Boleslav, Okresní muzeum (hereinafter: MB) II A 1.

[51]The first of these books, ÖNB 15501, was completed in 1510. The Hus leaves have been excised but rubric references to them remain on other leaves.

[52]Barry F. H. Graham, *The Litoměřice Gradual of 1517* (Prague, 1999), p. 186, #1382.

[53]Examples include NK XIV A 2 and Zittau, Christian-Weise-Bibliothek Ms. A. III. In NM, XII A 23, the sequentiary is intercalated with the Eucharistic propers. All three are Roman Catholic books.

[54]Examples include HK Hr 6 (214 hymns and motets of which 14 are in Czech); NM XIII A 2 (187, 7 in Czech); NK VI B 24 (79, 13 in Czech).

[55]NK XI B 1a, 1b, 1c, 1d and STRA DA II 3, a five-part Latin gradual; Prague, Archiv hlavního města Prahy rkp. 1870, the fifth part of an eight-part Latin gradual; Klatovy, Okresní muzeum MSS 102 and 103, two parts of an eight-part Latin gradual.

[56]The two 1539 codices are HK Hr 16 and NM V B 5.

votives for use between Septuagesima and Palm Sunday and at other times, and one to three Masses for Sundays.[57] In a number of books, the Sundays from Septuagesima through Quinquagesima are lacking[58] and only a series of votive Masses for the period is given.[59] For Advent, there may be a series of seven Masses for the Virgin (one for each day of the week)[60] and/or a number of Masses for the Incarnation.[61] Rarely, one finds the traditional four Sundays of the Latin books.[62] The number of Masses in honor of saints which occurred on more than 100 occasions in the earlier Latin graduals is much smaller. Only one or two scores of saints' days are intercalated with the temporal cycle. The Transfiguration, which appears in about one-half of the Latin books, is included in almost all the Czech ones. Proper chants and sequences for Hus are or were in almost all of the Czech graduals. The rubrics in four graduals from the last two decades of the sixteenth century refer to the feast of the Assumption as "on the burial day of the virgin Mary" or some close equivalent.[63] Most of the ordinary may be at the front, as in Latin books. The creeds (some of which may be multi-part) are most often at the end. Most books have sequences and about a half have hymns. Sequences and hymns may follow the proper. Alternatively, the ordinary, sequentiary, and hymnary may be intercalated with the proper chants for each day in the calendar. The script in most of the large Czech books, in the terminology of Derolez, is *cursiva formata*.[64]

The musical component of the chants in the Czech books differs somewhat from the pattern in Latin graduals of an introit, a gradual, an alleluia or tract (except for ferias), an offertory and a communion. The Czech graduals all have an introit and an alleluia or tract. Indeed, many provide more than one introit and alleluia, giving the users a choice. Gradual chants are usually provided for Sundays from Septuagesima through Easter and occasionally for other days of the calendar, especially during Advent. Offertories are found in some books, usually only on a handful of occasions. Communion chants appear from time to time but not very often. Since the period when the Eucharist is being

[57]For example, NK XVII A 3.

[58]For example, HK Hr 8, whose calendar jumps from Candlemas to Easter.

[59]For example, Česká Skalice, *Muzeum Božena Němcova 11058 o 13291*, pp. 209-244.

[60]For example, Rakovník, Muzeum T.D.M., N. 15, fols 12r-143r.

[61]For example, NK XVII A 3 ff. 109v-122v; NK XVII A 40, fols. 60v-73v.

[62]For example, London, British Library Additional ms 16175, fols. 134r-142v

[63]Graham, *Bohemian*, pp. 45-46.

[64]Albert Derolez, *The Palaeography of Gothic Manuscript Books from the Twelfth to the Early Sixteenth Century* (Cambridge, 2003), plate 111.

administered is a natural occasion for music, it would appear likely that, lacking chants, hymns were used instead. Hymns designated to be used in place of offertories or graduals are found in some of the codices of the scribe Jan Kantor Starý[65] and elsewhere.[66] In addition, one also finds Advent graduals or *rorátníks* (so named because the first word in the introit for the first Advent Ember day is "*Rorate*") which have a series of seven Masses for the Virgin (one for each day of the week), sequences, and hymns.[67]

If one looks at the lyrical content of the music in a Czech gradual, one usually finds that one of the alternative chants for a particular occasion has wording which is a translation of what is found in the Latin graduals. The other chants for that occasion are either conflations of the Latin wording, are based on a different scriptural source, or are not taken from scripture at all. For example, the first option in most Czech graduals for the introit for Ascension Day[68] is taken from Acts 1:11, as is its Latin[69] counterpart found in Utraquist and Catholic Latin graduals and missals.

> Men of Galilee, what are you wondering about, looking up into heaven? Alleluia. Just as you see him ascending into heaven, so he will come again. Alleluia, alleluia, alleluia.

The second option, found in many Czech graduals, is conflated:

> Men of Galilee, what are you wondering at from afar, do you not know or are you not acquainted with the scripture, that you so diligently look up to heaven? Alleluia. For just as you have seen your Lord ascending in a cloud to heaven, so he will come again from heaven, alleluia, alleluia, alleluia.[70]

Bohemian lyricists were fascinated not just by prolixity, but also by polemics. The Latin alleluia verse for the feast of Saints Peter and Paul was taken from Matthew 16:17:

[65]MB II A 2; NK XVII A 31; NK XVII A 53a

[66]For example, NM II B 4.

[67]An example of a rorátník is MB II A 4.

[68]ÖNB 15503, fols. 180v, 181r: "Mužíí Galileysstíí co se diwíte patrzíte spolu na nebe alleluyá neb yakož gste widěli geho wstupugícýho na nebe takť zas przigde Alleluyá alleluyá alleluya."

[69]ÖNB 15492, fols. 193v, 194r: "Viri galilei, quid admiramini aspicientes in celum? aevia: quemadmodum viditis eum asscendentem in celum, ita veniet, aevia, aevia, aevia."

[70]ÖNB 15503, fols. 181r, 181v: Mužíí Galileysstíí co se diwíte zdaliž newíte czi písem neznáte že tak pilňe patrzíte do nebe Alleluyá yá Nebo yakož ste ho pána swého widěli an wstupuge w oblace do nebe takť przigde zase z nebe Alleluyá alleluya alleluya.

> You are Peter and upon this rock I will build my church. Blessed are you Simon Peter, because flesh and blood did not reveal this to you, but my Father who is in the heavens.[71]

The Czech alleluia verse for the feast of Peter and Paul once found in twenty-two graduals strongly expresses the distaste the Utraquists felt for papal claims of plenitude of power:

> Glory to God: Father, Son, and Holy Spirit. I who alone am the powerful Lord, I tell you, "You are Peter, and on that rock [Christ] you alone confessed, not on yourself but on me, because I am the rock, and on that rock I alone, I the omnipotent and eternal Lord will build my dear and faithful holy church which I redeemed by my blood." I tell you faithfully, "Blessed are you, Simon Peter, for neither flesh nor blood, nor mortal human being nor any living creature has revealed to you this mystery of God, nor do you have that faith of yourself; but my Father by nature and your Father by grace [who] is the only omnipotent Lord (and who reigns and rules for ever) revealed it to you for others and also for you."[72]

One of the alternative graduals for the common of confessors in both the Latin and Czech books is based on Ps. 110:4 [Vg 109:4]. The Latin version uses the biblical text unaltered.

> The Lord has sworn and shall not change his mind; you are a priest forever according to the order of Melchisedek.[73]

Twelve Czech sources conflate the source to direct a polemical attack on Roman Catholic priests as opposed to Utraquist ones. It is hard to understand the logic, since both varieties of priests were ordained by the same bishops.

[71]ÖNB 15492, fols. 261r, 261v: Alleluia. Tu es petrus et super hanc petram edificabo ecclesiam meam. Beatus es symon petre quia caro et sanguis non revelavit tibi sed pater meus qui est in celis.

[72]ÖNB 15503, fols. 209r-210r: Alleluya budiž Bohu chwála wěčzná wotcy y synu y Duchu swatému. Ty gsy Petr prawímť yá genž gsem sám mocný pán a na té skále kterúž gsy ty wyznal sám ne na tobě ale na sobě nebť gsem yá skála na teyť skále sám yá wssemohúcý a wěčzný pán mocňe wzdělám swú mílú a wěrnú Cýrkew swatú kterúž sem krwí swau wykaupil. Blahoslawený sy Ssimone Petrze yáť wěrňe prawím tobie nebť gest tielo a krew žadný smrtedlný cžlowěk aní przíbuzný aní gíný který koliwěk ne zgewil tobě toho tagemstwí božího aníž od sebe mass té wíry prawé ale wotec můg przirozený a twůg mílostný on gest sám wssemohúcý pán zgewil tobě pro gíné také y pro tebe genž gest w nebesých kraluge y panuge na wěky.

[73]ÖNB 15492, fols. 309v, 310r: Iuravit dominus et non penitebit eum: tu es sacerdos in eternum secundum ordinem melchisedech.

> The Lord has sworn, is completely committed and shall not repent and we must understand that he is a priest forever, for which David gives thanks, according to the order of Melchizedek and not of the pope; the Lord always serves the faithful priests, he avoids false ones and suppresses them.[74]

There is some difficulty in accepting that the existence of new Czech graduals implies a single source for the music of the Utraquist Mass. The books have provision for at most three Sundays apart for those within Advent and preceding Easter and none for weekdays in Lent. The latter and all Sundays were usually present in the Latin graduals. Does this mean that the same three sets of introits and alleluias were used on over forty Sundays? Light is shed on the question by information about the choral societies and later guilds which provided the music for the Mass.

The choral societies went back at least to the beginning of the fifteenth century and were originally simply providers of church music. They were found in both Utraquist and Catholic churches. As time went on, they added literary interests to their agenda, including running choir schools to provide young choristers. The schools taught a balanced curriculum in addition to music and generally enjoyed a good reputation. By the end of the fifteenth century, they started to organize themselves as guilds with written articles of association which provided rules for the members. An early one was the guild of male and female singers which provided the music in the Catholic Church of the Assumption in Jindřichův Hradec. Their sponsors were Jindr˘ich IV of Hradec and his wife Magdaléna, both Franciscan tertiaries. The husband was active in national affairs, having been appointed Lord High Chamberlain in 1485 and High Burgrave of Bohemia in 1502. The statutes for the guild which he drafted in 1489[75] were approved by Innocent VIII. The guilds over time accumulated considerable endowments which were used for educational and charitable purposes. The members of the guilds, in addition to the singers, usually included others distinguished for their erudition or social status. The guilds

[74]ÖNB 15503, fols. 250v, 251r: Przísahu pán vcžíníl a tuze se záwázal a nebude želeti y my to máme wědieti že gest kníezem až na wieky z toho Dawid cžiní díky wedlé Melchysedechowa rzádu a ne papežowa wzdy wěrným posluhuge ktož se falessných waruge a ge potlacžuge.

[75]The original choral societies are analogous to the societies of craftsmen and merchants which also dated from the fourteenth century. The first charter granted to a Prague guild was given to the furriers of the Old Town in 1473, sixteen years earlier. See Jakub Hrdlička, *Pražské heraldika znaky pražských měst cechů a měšťanů* (Prague, 1993), p. 207.

seem to have had an important influence on the musical repertory of the churches in which they sang. Having considerable self-confidence in liturgical matters, they selected the contents of the books they used, which therefore differed from church to church.

A Latin choral guild existed in the town of Louny in 1515. It occupied a choir loft in the Church of St. Nicholas on the west end of the north wall beginning in 1540.[76] A traditional two-volume Latin gradual was made for its use in 1530 by the scribe Paul of Mělník.[77] A Czech choral guild was in existence in 1541[78] and acquired its own Czech gradual in 1563 made by the scribe Jan Táborský of Klokotská Hora.[79] Both guilds continued until 1626, when the Czech guild was folded into the Latin one.[80] The Latin guild was regarded as the senior of the two and tended to have among its members the more distinguished of the town's burghers. The Czech guild shared the loft of the Latin guild until 1561, when its own loft was constructed on the south wall above the door. Its loft was enlarged in 1619.[81] The ineluctable implication of the need for two lofts is that both guilds performed at the same services, although how the musical responsibilities were divided is unclear.

A large Latin gradual[82] was made ca. 1509 by Janíček Zmilelý of Písek for use in the Church of the Mother of God in Mladá Boleslav and a large Czech one[83] by Jan Kantor Starý in 1572. A single choral guild was chartered in the town in 1565. Perforce, it must initially have used the Latin gradual. One of the guild's articles specifies that there were to be two choirs, one which sang polyphony on Sundays and the other which sang plainsong on weekdays.[84] There may have been some overlap in the personnel of the two choirs. However, none of the four graduals extant from the church contains propers for weekdays in Lent and the Ember seasons except the Latin one. It would seem a reasonable speculation that the weekday plainsong choir sang in Latin. Even the Sunday

[76]Dagmar Vanišová, "Literáti latinského kůru v Lounech, před rokem 1620," *Sborník okresního v Lounech* 1 (1985), p. 43.

[77]Louny, Státní okresní archiv I G 8a and I G 8b.

[78]Bohumír Roedl and Dagmar Vanišová, "Kruchta a hudebniny bratrstva českých literátů v Lounech," *Hudební věda,* 24 (1987), p. 168.

[79]Louny, Státní okresní archiv I G 8c, also known as I G 9.

[80]Vanišová, "Literáti latinského kůru," p. 45.

[81]Roedl and Vanišová, "Kruchta," p. 168.

[82]MB II A 1.

[83]MB II A 2.

[84]Evá Mikanová, "Hudební život na Mladoboleslavku v 16. až 18. století," in Jiří Antoš et al. eds., *Boleslavica* '68 (Prague, 1969), p. 205.

choir may have used Latin on the Sundays after Epiphany and after Trinity for which the Czech gradual contains only two sets of propers.

A different arrangement is reported to have been in use at the Church of the Holy Spirit in Hradec Králové.[85] At the beginning of the sixteenth century, the more prominent Latin choir, which in time developed into a guild, sang a repertory on Sundays and saints' days which included polyphony. A Czech choir sang monophonic material, probably plainsong, on weekdays and especially during Lent. Later, the two choirs alternated on Sundays and feast days.

A two-volume Czech gradual was made in 1559-60, possibly for the Church of St. Mary Týn in the Old Town of Prague.[86] It may have been kept in the church in 1592.[87] Václav Trubec and Rovine donated an eight-part Latin gradual to the church in 1604 in memory of his father.[88] Thus, ca. 1600, the music in the church may conceivably have been in both Czech and Latin, notwithstanding Moryson's observation that it was only in Latin.

Summary of the Utraquist Mass

This concluding section summarizes what can be said about the evolution of the Utraquist Mass over the period 1420-1620 using the primary evidence of liturgical documents known to have been used in worship. It also notes directions that the Mass could have taken but apparently did not.

- The (Latin) anaphora and the proper prayers used by Utraquists in the fifteenth century were taken from the Prague use missal promulgated by Archbishop Arnošt of Pardubice in the fourteenth century. There is little evidence that it was ever abandoned by many Utraquist churches in the sixteenth century.

[85]Jaroslav Mikan, "Literary Groups in Hradec Králové," in Aleš Doubrava and Jaroslav Šůla (eds.), *Pearls of Old Parchments* (Hradec Králové, 1967), p. 13. Mikan cites no sources for his observation. The present writer doubts that the Czech choir was active as early as Mikan implies.

[86]NK fond křižovnický XVIII A 6 and 7.

[87]Notation on f. 119r, NK fond křižovnický XVIII A 7: Jan Kotwa Plzensky Corffysst spravcze tohoto kůru i u matky Boží před Týnem v Starým M. p. anno 1592. . . . Author's translation: JKPC, administrator of this choir at St. Mary Týn in the Old Town of Prague in the year 1592. . . .

[88]Prague, Archiv hlavního města Prahy rkp. 1870. Inscription fol. XLVII r. This is volume 5. The other seven volumes are missing.

- There is no evidence in liturgical documents for the language used in homilies, but it was probably chiefly Czech.
- The readings and the Creed in the fifteenth century were those of the Prague missal, usually in Latin, but sometimes in Czech. There is no evidence that the readings changed in the sixteenth century, but the language used was probably increasingly Czech.
- Specific changes to the calendar included the addition of sequences for Hus starting in 1491 and of proper chants for him in 1510. Almost all Utraquist liturgical books made after 1509 had proper chants and one or more sequences for Hus and the Bohemian martyrs. The Transfiguration, which figured in about one-half of graduals made before 1538, was found in almost all books made after that date.
- The number of days in the sanctoral cycles in deluxe graduals decreased from 150-200 in Latin books made before 1538 to 20-30 in (Czech) books made after 1538.
- The temporal cycles in Czech graduals after 1538 no longer had Sundays after Epiphany and Trinity Sunday, the Ember days and weekdays in Lent and in the weeks following Easter and Pentecost. Churches using such books would probably have relied on their old Latin ones for the missing days.
- The troping in the music of the ordinary, Latin until 1538, increased, particularly after 1500. It was concentrated among the Kyries and Sanctuses. Creeds were seldom troped. When many churches adopted the ordinary of the Mass in Czech after 1538, the incidence of troping did not change and indeed the tropes themselves were mostly translations of their Latin predecessors.
- Proper chants for the various days of the calendar up to 1538 were almost always the same, consisting of introit, gradual, alleluia/tract, offertory, and communion and used the same music and words as in any other Prague use gradual. These graduals and Latin graduals made in the last half of the sixteenth century were used after 1538 in churches which sang an exclusively Latin liturgy and in churches which used both languages. The chants in the Czech graduals made after 1538 had one or more introits and alleluias (or tract when appropriate) for every day in their calendar. Graduals and offertories were present in almost all books, but usually not for every day. Communion antiphons appeared more irregularly.
- Hymns were included in a handful of pre-1539 Latin graduals and a few had Czech words. Hymns were much more plentiful in the Czech graduals made after 1538. They were probably used in place of graduals, offertories and communions on some days. Indeed some

hymns are specifically designated to be used in place of a gradual or offertory chant.

- The number of sequences in Latin graduals, particularly those made in the sixteenth century, was high. The Litoměřice gradual, which dates from 1517, has 121 sequences.[89] The sequentiaries of Czech books were smaller, probably reflecting the smaller sanctoral cycles they had. A book made in 1561 for use in a church in Prague's old town has only seventy-four sequences.[90]

After saying what the Utraquist Mass was, it is also important to say what it was not. The increasing use of the vernacular in the Utraquist Mass can hardly be attributed to Lutheran influence. The Utraquists were using the vernacular at least seventy years before Luther burst on to the scene. Luther would allow no sequences. The Utraquists used many. Utraquists continued to venerate the host. Luther abominated the offertory and especially the sacrificial wording of the traditional anaphora. The Utraquists held to both—before and after Luther.

The Pius V Missal had no apparent effect on the Utraquist Mass. Czech was widely used and the new missal did not nudge the Utraquist liturgy in the direction of a greater use of Latin. A pruning of the calendar, much more vigorous than what occurred in 1570, was apparent in Utraquist graduals after 1538. There is little evidence that the anaphora was revised. The new Roman missal dealt severely with the troping in the ordinary which had grown up over the years. Utraquist graduals made after 1570 showed the same prolixity in the ordinary as was found in earlier ones. A two-volume gradual made in 1594 for use in the town of Rakovník[91] has seventy-two sequences, very close in number to the seventy-four sequences in the 1561 gradual cited earlier and much greater than the four permitted in the Pius V Missal.[92]

The evolution of the Utraquist Mass in the years 1420-1620 followed its own inherently Catholic path, little affected by other influences in the sixteenth century.

[89]Graham, *Litoměřice*, pp. 211- 272.

[90]NK XVII A 40.

[91]Rakovník, Muzeum T. G. M., N. 13 and 15.

[92]Joseph A. Jungmann, *The Mass of the Roman Rite: Its Origins and Development (Missarum Sollemnia)*, translated by Francis A. Brunner (New York, 1959), pp. 102, 103, 230, and 283.

THE SPANISH MINERVA: IMAGINING TERESA OF AVILA AS PATRON SAINT IN SEVENTEENTH-CENTURY SPAIN

BY

ERIN KATHLEEN ROWE*

In the early seventeenth-century, a movement began to elevate Teresa of Avila to co-patron saint of Spain (alongside the traditional patron, Santiago); this movement changed the ways in which the saint was imagined in both visual images and metaphors. Through a close reading of treatises and sermons, this article examines how Teresa's elevation to national patron saint required a distinctive symbolism that reflected national, rather than ecclesiastical, concerns. She was therefore transformed from author and founder into the "Spanish Minerva." By exploring this transformation, the article investigates the continual process of construction that saints' cults underwent and the roles played by conflict and gender in this process.

In 1617, the Castilian parliament (the Cortes) ratified a petition put forth by the Discalced Carmelites suggesting that the newly beatified Teresa of Avila be elevated to the status of co-patron saint of Spain. Teresa's patronage became official in 1627 when Pope Urban VIII confirmed the Cortes' decision. While historians have long known of Teresa's elevation to patron saint, we know little about the iconographic, theological, and popular images of the saint that were created in order accommodate her new status. This gap in our understanding of Teresa's cult is partially a result of the circumstances surrounding her elevation to co-patron. Resistance to her election spearheaded by the cathedral of Santiago de Compostela led, in 1629, to a papal revocation of her status and a subsequent decree that all representations of

*Dr. Rowe is an assistant professor of history in the University of Oregon at Eugene. A version of this essay was presented at the 2005 Annual Meeting of the Renaissance Society of America. She would like to thank Christopher Wilson and Alison Weber for their generous comments at the RSA meeting, as well as Richard L. Kagan, Andrew Ross and Tanya J. Tiffany. Her research was made possible by a Fulbright fellowship and a research grant from the Program for Cultural Cooperation between the United States and Spain. Unless otherwise noted, all translations are her own.

the saint as patron be destroyed. While the decree led to a virtual disappearance of visual images of Teresa-as-patron, it nevertheless highlights the power of visual imagery in cultic devotion. The struggle over whether or not Teresa should be patron, as we will see, was largely fought out in imagery, both through visual representations and metaphor. A brief examination of these images may startle those familiar with Teresa's conventional iconography (the saint holding a pen or falling back in the ecstatic state of transverberation).[1] In contrast, patronage images portrayed Teresa as a warrior, the Spanish Minerva who would defend Spain and battle her enemies. Such a dramatic alteration in Teresian symbology inevitably leads to questions regarding why such images were developed and what purposes they served.

At the same time, changes in how Teresa was represented provide an important lesson in iconographic fluidity and flexibility, as well as a warning against some approaches to saints' cults that emphasize coherence and stability. This is not to suggest that the topic of iconographic mutability has gone unstudied by historians. Historians of sanctity since Pierre Delooz have increasingly assessed such various issues as: iconographic changes implemented to produce a potentially more successful canonization bid[2]; the wide diversity in a saint's iconography over time for centuries-old cults[3]; and how iconography could change emphasis in different places.[4] Yet our understanding of each saint's iconography remains generally static and monolithic, in part because of the Church's interest in "fixing" each saint with a set of easily-recognizable symbols, such as Lucy holding her eyes, Catherine and her wheel, or Francis with his stigmata. Some historians have argued that iconographic diversity ground to an abrupt halt with the

[1]The most comprehensive examination of Teresian visual iconography in Spain is Laura Gutiérrez Rueda, "Ensayo de iconografía teresiana," *Revista de Espiritualidad*, 23 (1964), 3-168. Gutiérrez demonstrates that in Spanish iconography, by far, the most common visual representation of Teresa was as an author (with pen in hand).

[2]This has been a popular topic, especially for Counter-Reformation saints; for one example, see Sara T. Nalle, "A Saint for All Seasons: The Cult of San Julián," in *Culture and Control in Counter-Reformation Spain*, ed. Anne J. Cruz and Mary Elizabeth Perry (Minneapolis, 1992), pp. 25-50.

[3]Elena Ciletti, "Patriarchal Ideology in the Renaissance Iconography of Judith," in *Refiguring Women: Perspectives on Gender and the Italian Renaissance* (Ithaca, 1991), pp. 35-70; and Moshe Sluhovsky, *Patroness of Paris: Rituals of Devotion in Early Modern France* (Leiden, 1998).

[4]For a Teresian example, see Christopher Wilson, "Saint Teresa of Ávila's Martyrdom: Images of Her Transverberation in Mexican Colonial Painting," *Anales del Instituto de Investigaciones Estéticas*, 74-75 (1994), 211-233.

saint's official entry as canonized, particularly once the early modern Church succeeded in centralizing canonization processes. After canonization, the saint belonged to the Church, rather than to the people.[5]

But a saint cannot be fixed, not even by the Church. It would perhaps be appropriate to expand Delooz's astute observation that saints are in a continual *process of construction*, one that can never be seen as "complete," even after canonization; the dialogue between society and saint is never finished, but evolves over time.[6] In addition, it is important to point out that the saint does not have only one meaning for each society. Patrick Geary reminds those who study hagiography: "in [historians'] close readings of their texts, they find not a 'medieval mind,' but a variety of minds, a spectrum of people reacting to the living tradition of saints within their midst."[7] Geary emphasizes the "living tradition" precisely because cultic devotion is alive; it remains in a state of flux, growth, and movement. Despite the Church's increasing strictures on the proper way to represent saints in the early modern era, vibrancy and diversity in depicting saints never evaporated. Different interpretations or representations of saints revealed themselves most often during times of conflict; it is here we can see most vividly simultaneous, contrasting visions of a cult.[8] Perhaps historians have neglected such conflicts in part because they have been looking for them in the wrong places; officially sanctioned art and hagiography provide only pieces of a saint's image. Through the examination of oft-neglected sources, such as sermons and descriptions of religious festivals, and in particular the descriptions of decorations created for such festivals,[9] it is possible to unravel not only the rich diver-

[5]Although most historians of sanctity do not articulate the issue in such a simplified and unproblematic form, the relative paucity of works treating saintly representations after canonization leaves this impression, particularly in studies on the early modern era, when the Church is generally considered to have become more authoritarian and centralized than in the medieval period.

[6]Pierre Delooz, "Towards a Sociological Study of Canonized Sainthood," in *Saints and Their Cults: Studies in Religious Sociology, Folklore, and History*, ed. Stephen Wilson (Cambridge, 1983), pp. 189-216.

[7]Patrick Geary, "Saints, Scholars, and Society: The Elusive Goal," in *Saints: Studies in Hagiography*, ed. Sandro Sticca [Medieval and Renaissance Texts and Studies, vol. 141] (Binghamton, New York, 1995), p. 21.

[8]Sharon Farmer also emphasizes this point in her excellent study of conflict surrounding the cult of St. Martin: Farmer, *Communities of Saint Martin: Legend and Ritual in Medieval Tours* (Ithaca, 1991).

[9]I specify "descriptions" because the decorations themselves were, in the majority of cases, ephemeral.

sity in cultic representation, but also moments when such representations were open to dispute between competing parties.

In this article, I focus on the evolving and sometimes contentious development of Teresa's cult at the beginning of the seventeenth century. This period marked the time of her beatification (1614), canonization (1622), and elevation to co-patron saint of Spain (1627), all of which occurred with remarkable speed, considering that the controversial mystic had died a mere forty years earlier in 1582. A period of such intense movement and rapid cult formation affords a glimpse of the process of saintly construction in action. I begin by exploring how Teresa was imagined during the beatification period, primarily in sermons. These sermons reveal the ways in which the desire to achieve the saint's canonization informed the type of images her supporters crafted. Then I turn my focus to the co-patronage movement and analyze how Teresa's supporters appropriated language used in the beatification period, and adapted it to be compatible with the unique requirements of national patron sainthood. In particular, I explore the differences in how Teresa was imagined as Catholic Reformation saint and as national patron. Because the co-patronage period marked a time of bitter controversy, it also allows us to examine how the symbolic and theological meaning of a saint could provoke intense and angry disagreement. Not only did her supporters produce new iconography for the saint-as-patron, but such iconography triggered a firestorm of controversy from those wholly opposed to this way of imagining the saint.

Bitter disagreements arose over sermons and visual images of Teresa-as-patron precisely because a national patron had certain symbolic requirements that a "regular" saint lacked. Rather than reflecting general theological ideals, a national patron acted as a representative for the spirit of the nation. These were not restricted to spiritual values, however; here the spiritual mingled with the nation's more prosaic concerns, such as its defense against enemies. While these enemies were often described in confessional terms (such as heretics or Protestants), they could also be foreign powers whose political and economic interests ran counter to Spain's. Teresa, therefore, became imbued with the characteristics of a warrior, and received the epithet Minerva or Amazon queen. Teresa's supporters employed this militant language in order to place Teresa-as-patron squarely in line with the monarchy's most prominent foreign policy concerns. On the other side of the debate, the cathedral of Santiago and its partisans quickly mounted a counter-campaign that insisted, among other arguments, that a female saint was entirely unsuitable to act as the monarchy's

representative during a time of war and that it demeaned the apostle's dignity to have a woman as a partner in patronage. We therefore see the saint projected onto a wide variety of landscapes—theological, liturgical, political, and gendered—and viewed from multiple opposing perspectives.

Establishing Iconography, 1614-1615

Much of the rhetoric surrounding Teresa at the beginning of the seventeenth century originated from a desire to legitimate Teresa's cult. Teresa was a visionary, a writer, and a woman: three characteristics that made her career controversial during her lifetime. Her first biographer and the first editor of her work (Juan de Ribera and Luis de León, respectively) prepared elaborate justifications for Teresa's controversial writings and mystical experiences. For the most part, these authors can be seen as addressing a Spanish audience, with the motive of silencing critics of Teresa's orthodoxy who fought to suppress her writings.[10] Once Teresa achieved official recognition internationally through her beatification, supporters hoped to push forward her canonization at a time when few were being canonized.[11] Preachers giving beatification sermons, therefore, faced the challenge of addressing multiple audiences: local audiences (those physically present at the sermon); national audiences (through the printing of sermons); and international ones (through the distribution of such printings to Rome in particular).[12] Keeping in mind the need to turn beatification festivals into a platform for a canonization bid, preachers constructed their campaign around the following themes: Teresa's pivotal role in the struggle against the Lutheran heresy, her gender as a source of glory, and the universal popularity of her cult.

[10]Francisco de Ribera, *Vida de la Madre Teresa de Iesus en cinco libros* (Madrid, 1602), p. 35. The most comprehensive account of Teresa's troubles with the Inquisition (during her lifetime and posthumously) can be found Enrique Llamas Martínez, *Santa Teresa de Jesús y la inquisición española* (Madrid, 1972). For concerns over the publication of Teresa's Libro de su vida, see Ibid., pp. 261-274.

[11]For statistics regarding the paucity of canonizations from 1588 to 1658, see Peter Burke, "How to Become a Counter Reformation Saint (1984)," in *The Counter-Reformation: Essential Readings*, ed. David Luebke (Oxford, 1999), pp. 130-142.

[12]A Discalced Carmelite friar, José de Jesús María, collected sermons from nearly all the beatification festivities held in Teresa's honor and published them in a 449-folio volume for the purpose of sending them to Rome: José de Jesús María, ed., *Sermones predicados en la Beatificacion de la Beata Madre Teresa de Iesus Virgen, fundadora de la Reforma de los Descalços de Nuestra Señora del Carmen* (Madrid: Alonso Martín, 1615).

Those preaching sermons in honor of Teresa's beatification in 1614 nearly always introduced the topic of Teresa's integral role in the defense of the faith as a way of demonstrating the orthodoxy of her sanctity and the international importance of her cult. Teresa herself had claimed that her monasteries were founded to work for the defeat of Lutheranism, and her supporters quickly picked up this rhetoric, which emphasized how the power of prayer would vanquish the spiritual enemies of the embattled Church.[13] One preacher, the Dominican Juan González, for example, spent much of a 1614 sermon lamenting the destruction that the Protestants had wreaked across the Christian world by their demolition of churches, profanation of monasteries, violation of nuns, destruction of sacred images and relics, and rejection of the sacraments of penance and the Eucharist. He declared, however, that God had sent Teresa as both a contrast and a remedy to this list of Protestant atrocities.[14] The inversion of González's list demonstrates Teresa's glories: she built monasteries, dedicated herself a virgin, revered holy images and relics, confessed often, and continuously expressed the deepest devotion to the Eucharist. Similar ideas can be found in almost every beatification sermon. Emphasis on these specific issues reinforced both the perception of danger from Lutheranism and the efficacy of Catholic doctrine at a time when the Church was under attack. In this way, her supporters demonstrated how Teresa could be understood as an *embodiment* of the truth of Catholicism and of the precepts of the Council of Trent, as well as an effective weapon for the Church militant in the struggle against the devil (Luther).

Part of the discussion of Teresa's key role in the spiritual battle against Protestantism included comparisons between her and two Old Testament women: Deborah and Judith, the prophet and the warrior. Preachers grounded such comparisons in what they expressed as similarities between the contemporary age and that of the Hebrews; as they explained, in both ages, the Chosen People found themselves surrounded by hostile and armed enemies bent on their religious and political anni-

[13]Teresa de Jesús, "Libro de la Vida," in *Obras Completas*, ed. Enrique Llamas Martínez (Madrid, 1994), pp. 32: 9-10.

[14]Juan González, "En la misma Festividad por el padre Maestro fray Juan Gonzalez, del Orden de santo Domingo, Catedratico de prima de Teologia, en la Universidad de Alcalá de Henares, predicado en el Conuento de san Cirilo de descalzos Carmelitas," in *Sermones predicados en la Beatificacion de la Beata Madre Teresa de Iesus Virgen*, fols. 122-v-123r: "en medio destas grandes ruinas, y para remedio y reparo della leuantó Dios a la Bienaventurada virgen Teresa, esclareciendola con la antorcha, y lampara de su fe, y resplandor de su diuina ciencia."

hilation. One preacher created a parallel between Teresa and Luther, Judith and Holofernes, in which the "weakness and chastity" of Judith/Teresa vanquished the "blasphemy" of Holofernes/ Luther. He added that Teresa, like Judith, "made war on hell, decapitated vices, and reformed the century."[15] While maintaining the martial rhetoric of Judith's military victory, the preacher transformed the analogy into a purely spiritual struggle for reform and orthodoxy. In another sermon, the Jesuit Cipriano de Aguayo drew parallels between the victories brought about by Judith and Deborah and those won by Teresa, describing them as examples of how God shamed the Devil by vanquishing him not by valiant or learned men, but by "weak" women. He asserted that Teresa's victories carried more weight than Deborah's and Judith's because the darkness of the contemporary period was more all-encompassing than that of past ages; he described his own era as filled with sinfulness and vice, not just from "perfidious" heretics, but from the "bad living" of many Catholics.[16] Aguayo's comparison fulfilled the same rhetorical functions as the previous preacher. Both emphasized Teresa's ability to do battle against the Devil, while emphasizing spiritual victories over military. At the same time, comparisons to Old Testament women underscored historical precedent for a woman taking such action. And, finally, despite placing the three women in powerful and "manly" positions as warrior, they insisted that the inherent weakness and femininity were deliberate tools God used to demonstrate His power.

The ways in which these two preachers discussed Teresa's abilities and her gender echoed throughout beatification sermons; her sup-

[15]Domingo Daza, "Del Padre Maestro Fray Domingo Daza del Orden de Santo Domingo, predicando en las Descalças Carmelitas de Madrid, el dia de san Francisco, vispera de las solenes fiestas que se hizieron en la Beatificacion de la santa Madre Teresa de Iesus," in *Sermones predicados en la Beatificacion de la Beata Madre Teresa de Iesus Virgen*, fol. 56r: "Beatisima MS Teresa vos soys esta muger milagrosa . . . armó contra la Iglesia al blesfemo Holofernes, Martin Lutero . . . dexando a los varones santos y doctos os escogio a vos para hazer guerra al infierno, degollar los vicios, y reformar el siglo. . ."

[16]Cipriano Aguayo, "Sermon del padre Cipriano de Aguayo, de la Compañia de Jesus, que predicó en la misma festividad, en el Conuento de las Carmelitas descalças de la ciudad de Toledo," in *Sermones predicados en la Beatificacion de la Beata Madre Teresa de Iesus Virgen*, fol. 118v: "pues por mano de una flaca muger, para muestra de su potencia alcançó gloriosisimas vitorias, mayores harto que las que alcanço por mano de Debora, porque quando el demonio parece que en este miserable siglo nuestro triunfa en la muchedumbre de los infieles, y en la perfidia de tantos pueblos Hereges que hazen sus partes, en el mal viuir de tantos malos y pecadores Católicos; para hazer burla deste comun enemigo, quiso Dios oponerle, no un hombre valiente, no un gran Letrado y Doctor . . . sino una flaca muger que le desafie y leuante contra el vandera, y . . . huelle y acocee, y se diga lo que de Judith dixo."

porters often declared her to be a manly woman (*mujer varonil*). For example, the Dominican theologian Pedro de Herrera declared that it was nothing new "for a woman to transform herself into a man, leaving behind her feminine being and weakness to be considered a robust man and given masculine attributes."[17] As Herrera's remark indicated, the category of the spiritual "manly woman" had deep roots in ancient Christianity. In the oldest example, St. Perpetua's (d. 203) account of the events leading up to her martyrdom included a dream in which she was transformed into a man and cut off the head of an Egyptian.[18] In order truly to fight, Perpetua could only imagine herself as a man, the transformation into which gave her the strength to vanquish her opponent. Other early Christian theologians, such as St. Augustine and St. Ambrose, developed further the theme of women made manly through virtue; this theme continued throughout the Middle Ages, as hagiographical accounts of holy women often contained spiritual manly women, including descriptions of cross-dressing.[19]

The idea of manly women took on new life in the Renaissance; it increasingly appeared outside of a theological context as a common literary *topos* (for example, Shakespeare's cross-dressing heroines and Lope de Vega's Amazon queens) and as a description of women performing "male" tasks (sixteenth-century queens, female humanists, and the occasional woman-soldier).[20] Through discussions of manly women, Renaissance intellectuals and theologians grappled with the existence of exceptional women who overstepped traditional bound-

[17]Pedro de Herrera, "Sermon que predico el PMF Pedro de Herrera de la orden de Sancto Domingo, Catedratico de Prima de Teologia en la Universidad to Salamanca," in *Relacion de las fiestas de la cuidad de Salamanca en la beatificacion de la S. Madre Teresa de Iesus, Reformadora de la Orden de N. Señora del Carmen*, ed. Fernando Manrique de Luján (Salamanca: Diego Cusio, 1615), pp. 209-210: "no es cosa nueva que una muger se transforme en varon, quedandose en su ser y flaqueza mugeril, la cuenten por varon robuste, y le den atributos masculinos."

[18]"The Passions of Sts. Perpetua and Felicity," in *Readings in Medieval History*, ed. Patrick Geary (Peterborough, 1997), p. 61.

[19]For background on the martial and militant language of the early Church, see Valerie Hotchkiss, *Clothes Make the Man: Female Cross Dressing in Medieval Europe* (New York: Garland Publishing, Inc., 1996), pp. 17-21.

[20]There is an extensive historiography on this subject in early modern European history. For a few examples, see Ciletti, "Patriarchal Ideology in the Renaissance Iconography of Judith"; Natalie Zemon Davis, "Women on Top," in *Society and Culture in Early Modern France* (Stanford, 1975); Melveena McKendrick, *Women and Society in the Spanish Drama of the Golden Age—A Study of the Mujer Varonil* (Cambridge, 1974); and Sherry Velasco, *The Lieutenant Nun: Transgenderism, Lesbian Desire, and Catalina de Erauso* (Austin, 2001).

aries to attain positions of power or authority. They wondered if these women could be best classified as prodigies or monsters. In Spain, this uncertainty manifested itself in intensifying hostility directed at exceptional women in the spiritual realm, particularly by the Inquisition.[21] Throughout her life, Teresa found herself caught in contemporary polemics about feminine abilities, as she struggled for legitimacy as a mystic, theologian, and founder. As Alison Weber and Gillian Ahlgren have demonstrated, Teresa appropriated the language of femininity, which she used to represent herself as supremely feminine (obedient, humble, and submissive). Such language allowed her to shield herself from criticism and to make a space for her theological and mystical abilities, as well as to defuse suspicions that she deliberately overstepped gendered boundaries.[22] Teresa's early supporters followed her lead by employing the language of femininity that she developed and connecting it to the pre-existing theological *topos* of spiritual manly-women. Their primary goal was to make it clear that Teresa's activities as writer, visionary, and founder were neither transgressive nor unprecedented; they did so by constructing a version of manly-womanhood in which the transformation to masculinity was made possible through hyper-femininity. Rather than masculine virtues, such as courage or philosophical brilliance, preachers insisted that Teresa's spiritual gifts resulted from her passivity, obedience, and humility.[23]

Justification of Teresa's spiritual gifts and her femininity constituted a predominant theme in sermons preached in honor of her beatification in 1614. For example, the Dominican preacher Diego de la Cueva y Marín used the Old Testament story of Rebecca's infertility and medical theories about the bodily humors to legitimize Teresa's mystical experiences. He quoted Hippocratus, who explained how women with

[21]Much has been written on this topic as well. For one example, see Mary E. Giles, ed., *Women in the Inquisition: Spain and the New World* (Baltimore, 1999). This collection includes several essays on sixteenth-century holy women prosecuted by the Inquisition, including Gillian Ahlgren's excellent "Francisca de los Apóstoles: A Visionary Voice for Reform in Sixteenth-Century Toledo," pp. 119-133. See also Anne Jacobson Schutte, *Aspiring Saints: Pretense of Holiness, Inquisition, and Gender in the Republic of Venice, 1618-1750* (Baltimore, 2001).

[22]Gillian T. W. Ahlgren, *Teresa of Avila and the Politics of Sanctity* (Ithaca, 1996) and Alison Weber, *Teresa of Avila and the Rhetoric of Femininity* (Princeton, 1990).

[23]While preachers praised Teresa's theological brilliance effusively, often referring to her as a doctor of the Church, they tended to emphasize that the miraculous nature of her brilliance was made evident by her lack of education and femininity. Ahlgren also discusses the portrayal of Teresa as "exaggeratedly feminine" and the exceptional nature of feminine virtue, see her *Teresa of Avila*, pp. 159-165.

cold wombs were incapable of conception. Next, he described Teresa's transverberation, the state in which "a lukewarm soul was pierced by an angel with an iron arrow inflamed with fire. Contemplation is where . . . Seraphic souls become fertile in spiritual works, and their wombs become like Rebecca's."[24] By juxtaposing infertility, coldness, and spiritual emptiness with conception and the fire of contemplation, Diego explained how women, although given lesser spiritual gifts, could transform their spiritual barrenness into abundant works, just as, by the grace of God, Rebecca, when beyond all hope of conception, became pregnant in order to fulfill God's promise to Isaac. In addition, the conception metaphor alluded to the holy woman's fertility in another area: her spiritual birth to sons and daughters through her reformed order and monastic foundations, which he (and other preachers) referred to as Teresa's virgin motherhood. Diego defended Teresa's primary activities, contemplation and founding houses, by placing them squarely within the feminine province of motherhood. Rather than an aberration of nature, then, Diego understood Teresa's gifts as deriving from her *femaleness* in a divinely-sanctioned manner.

Despite the comparisons to Rebecca and Judith, preachers likened Teresa most often to Deborah, whose fame as wise judge made her the ideal Biblical figure with whom to conjoin a holy woman renowned first and foremost for her divine learning. Such comparisons were made explicit by applying symbolism associated with Deborah to Teresa; of these, one of the most frequently applied was the bee. According to preachers, the bee represented wisdom, combined with fertility of works and purity.[25] In addition, the Spanish word for bee—*abeja*—is gendered feminine, making it a uniquely appropriate symbol for a woman. During the beatification sermons, preachers often indulged in ecstatic descriptions of holiness in the most hyper-feminine of terms: the Dominican Luis Vallejo, for example, described the bee's wisdom as "honest, pacific, modest, and docile"—a more femi-

[24]Diego de la Cueva y Marín, "Sermon que predico en la misma solenidad y Iglesia el padre Maestro Fray Diego de la Cueva y Marin, del orden del glorioso santo Domingo," in *Sermones predicados en la Beatificacion de la Beata Madre Teresa de Iesus Virgen*, fol. 238v: "Ahí es donde se hazen los hombres fuego, y las almas Serafines, fecundas en obras espirituales, y sus partos fueron como el de Rebeca."

[25]Basilio Ponce de León, "Sermon predicado por . . . el dia de la Santa Madre Teresa de Iesus, en el Monasterio de las Descalças Carmelitas de Toledo, a 5 de Octubre de 1620," in *Sermones de la Purissima Concepcion de la Virgen, y de la S M Teresa de Iesus, y del Santo F. Thomas de Villanueva* (Salamanca: Antonia Ramírez, 1620), pp. 17-21. Cipriano de Aguayo provided a genealogy connecting the Latin for bee (*apis*) and the name Deborah in his "Sermon del padre Cipriano de Aguayo, de la Compañia de Jesus," fol. 101v.

nine description could hardly be possible.[26] Preachers often applied the diminutive form—*abejita*—in order to emphasis further the femininity of the woman in question. While true to some extent for all female saints, such a presentation was particularly important for Teresa, as her divine learning and mystical treatises provided both her greatest claims to sanctity and the most controversial aspects of her career.[27] So popular were comparisons between Teresa and Deborah that Pope Gregory XV himself proclaimed the Carmelite nun as "the new Deborah" in the canonization bull in 1622.[28]

In addition to her femininity and spiritual gifts, preachers also emphasized the importance of Teresa's cult to the universal Church. While they cited comparisons of Teresa to Deborah and Judith, who had fought their battles for their nations, they downplayed and generalized Teresa's nationality in these same sermons. Preachers did occasionally make references to Teresa's nationality, or to how she brought honor to Spain, but when they did so, they were likely to expand this idea to include the rest of the world. For example, the Jesuit Juan de Herrera proclaimed to the people of Avila in 1614: "[Teresa's] honor and glory, [is] not only yours, not only Spain's and all our nation's, but also of the whole Catholic Church."[29] While her importance as an *abulense* and a Spaniard were mentioned by Herrera, his stress on Teresa's

[26]Luis Vallejo, "Sermon que predico el padre maestro fray Luis Vallejo, del orden de Santo Domingo, Calificador del santo oficio en los Carmelitas descalcos de la ciudad de México, en la nueva España, en las solemnes fiestas que alli se hizieron a la Beatificacion de NSM," in *Sermones predicados en la Beatificacion de la BM Teresa de Iesus Virgen*, fol. 430r.

[27]The idea of a woman attaining spiritual authority was particularly troubling to sixteenth-century theologians; any attempt by women to subvert ecclesiastical authority through direct communication with God was seen as heretical. Teresa therefore had to insist on her obedience, particularly to her confessors, as when she burned her commentary on the Song of Songs; see Ahlgren, *Teresa of Avila and the Politics of Sanctity*; and Weber, *Teresa of Avila and the Rhetoric of Femininity*. Ahlgren, in particular, discusses Teresa's strategies in protecting herself from the Inquisition, as well as the Inquisition's heated debates over the posthumous publication of her writings.

[28]*Bulla Canonizationis Sanctae Teresiae Virginis Carmelitarum Discalceatorum Fundatricis a Sanctissimo Gregorio Papa XV factae, Liber secundus actorum pro canonizatione beatae virginis Teresiae de Iesu Ordinis discalceatorum Reformatae Religionis Beatae Mariae de Monte Carmelo Fundatricis*, BNM, MS 2261 (1622).

[29]Juan de Herrera, "Sermon que predico el padre Juan de Herrera, de la Compañia de Jesus, en la misma solemnidad, en la Iglesia de las descalças Carmelitas, de la ciudad de Auila," in *Sermones predicados en la Beatificacion de la Beata Madre Teresa de Iesus Virgen*, fol. 171v: "honra y gloria de no solo tuya, no solo de España y de toda nuestra nacion, sino tambien de toda la Catolica Iglesia."

international importance worked to give her a more general, broadly-based appeal. Teresa's religious reform, miracles, and cultic popularity were all demonstrated clearly as being just as popular and significant outside Spain as inside, her battles fought for the good of the Church in its most purely universal sense. It was this type of appeal that could provide the help necessary to springboard a holy person from having a cult of local devotion to enjoying one with more official recognition by the Church due to canonization.[30] In this context, Teresa's importance as a Spaniard was eclipsed by her central role in preserving the entire Catholic Church from a dangerous enemy.

Minerva Española

Just as supporters advocating for Teresa's canonization needed to develop an appropriate and persuasive iconography for their cause, so those defending her right to be co-patron saint of Spain needed to find a way of fashioning their saint as a national patron. The difference between the canonization of a beloved daughter and the elevation of a saint to national patron necessitated a corresponding increase in *national* polemics. Such polemics was shaped in part by the renewal of warfare on the Continent and in the New World and by a prevailing mood in Castile of "messianic nationalism," to use a phrase of John Elliott."[31] The impact of such factors on how Teresa was imagined as patron was immediate. As her importance to the Church as a whole became superseded by an emphasis on her Spanishness (*españolidad*); her spiritual arms against vices and demons were transformed into weapons against Spain's enemies. The contemplative writer was replaced by the Spanish Minerva.

The new imagery created for Teresa's patron sainthood was complicated by the bitter controversy that arose over her elevation to this position. The Discalced Carmelites spearheaded two movements to have the Castilian Cortes elect their founder co-patron saint of Spain, alongside the monarchy's traditional patron saint, Santiago (St. James the Greater). The first attempt (1617-1618) was quickly blocked,

[30]For a similar example of the need to broaden a canonization case to fit Counter-Reformation ideals, see L. J. Andrew Villalon, "San Diego de Alcalá and the Politics of Saint-Making in Counter-Reformation Europe," *Catholic Historical Review*, 83 (1997), 691-715.

[31]John H. Elliott uses this phrase in his seminal article "Self-Perception and Decline in Early Seventeenth-Century Spain," in *Spain and Its World, 1500-1700: Selected Esssays* (New Haven, 1989), pp. 241-261.

thanks in large part to the efforts of Pedro de Castro, the powerful archbishop of Seville, who asserted that a not-yet-canonized holy person could not be named patron saint.[32] During the second phase (1626-1630), the Carmelite cause won a great victory when Urban VIII declared Teresa the patron saint of Spain in a papal brief issued in July 1627. The brief did not end the rancorous polemic in Spain, however, as the archbishop of Santiago and nearly all the cathedral chapters in Castile promptly refused to celebrate the new feast day. The archbishop harnessed some of the greatest literary talent of the day to his cause, including Francisco de Quevedo, who argued that it would be a disgrace to Santiago's cult to deprive him of the singularity of his patron sainthood, which he had enjoyed for centuries. The debate quickly moved on to Rome, where late in 1629 a special commission determined that the 1627 brief did not reflect the will of the Spanish churches and revoked it, abruptly ending Teresa's patron sainthood.[33] Controversy surrounding Teresa's elevation, therefore, affected the way her supporters shaped her image as they sought to defend their saint from opponents who ferociously attacked the notion that a woman could act as a nation's spiritual representative.

One of the greatest shifts from the beatification sermons to sermons and treatises arising out of the co-patronage debate involved a de-emphasis of Teresa's importance to the universal Church. During the co-patronage period, Teresa's nationality became a key factor in the movement from Tridentine saint to national patron. Rather than discussing Teresa in the context of a general, European Catholic "nation," co-patronage supporters stressed the saint's *Spanishness* and her unique ties to the country and monarchy of Spain. They pointed out that Teresa's nationality necessitated her willingness to intercede on Spain's behalf, which created a unique bond between the saint and her nation. Discalced Carmelite Pedro de la Madre de Dios pushed the tie

[32]This argument centered on liturgical questions, such as whether or not it upset the heavenly hierarchy to have a beatified woman elevated to the same position as an apostle and martyr (Santiago). See BNM, MS 1749, fol. 421r-v, Castro to Philip III, September 4, 1618.

[33]The most comprehensive account of the debate can be found Erin Kathleen Rowe, *Disrupting the Republic: Santiago, Teresa de Jesús, and the Battle for the Soul of Spain* (Ph.D. dissertation, The Johns Hopkins University, 2005). Additional accounts can be found within the following monographs: Américo Castro, *España en su historia: Cristianos, moros, y judíos* (Buenos Aires, 1948); Pablo Jauralde Pou, *Francisco de Quevedo (1580-1645)* (Madrid, 1998); Thomas Kendrick, *St. James in Spain* (London, 1960); and Ofelia Rey Castelao, *La Historiografía del Voto de Santiago: Recopilación crítica de una polémica histórica* (Santiago de Compostela, 1985).

between the two, proclaiming: "She was born in Spain, raised in Spain, founded [convents] in Spain, wrote in Spain, God communicated with her in Spain, she lived always in Spain, never left Spain, died in Spain, and left her virginal body in Spain. Spain beatified her and canonization her."[34] Here one sees that Teresa's place of birth becomes the key reason why she will aid Spain and protect it from the threat of heretics. Pedro's list acts as an indirect response to critics of Teresa's elevation who posed the question "Why Teresa and not another saint?" The answer was simple: Because no other Spanish saint had as close a relationship with Spain as did Teresa. Other Spanish founders, such as Ignatius of Loyola or Domingo de Guzmán, lived the majority of their lives and died outside of Spain. Teresa, in contrast, was enveloped by Spain; they belonged to each other uniquely.

Teresiano authors then appropriated the rhetoric of their saint as the chief opponent of Lutheranism and applied it in a uniquely Spanish context that aligned it clearly with the monarchy's policies and ideologies. For example, one co-patronage author proclaimed:

> these Kingdoms are the principal opponents of the infidelity of the rebels and Lutherans, and since God conceded the protection and rule of this matter (heresy) to our Saint Teresa, he also gave her patronage of these same Kingdoms, which principally fight for the Faith and sustain its defense and strength.[35]

The author provided an excellent example of how Teresa's role as defender against heresy transformed from a concern of the universal

[34]Pedro de la Madre de Dios, *Memorial que Dio a su Magestad el padre F. Pedro de la Madre de Dios, Difinidor General de la Orden de los Descalços de nuestra Señora del Carmen, en defensa del Patronato de la Santa Madre Teresa de Iesus*, BNM, MS 9140 [1628?], fol. 128v: "Nacio en España, crió en España, . . . fundó en España, escriuió en España, comuncosele Dios en España, viuo siempre en España, nunca salio de España, murió en España, quedó su cuerpo virginal en España. España como pudo la beatificó, España como pudo la canonizació, España mas que pudo, contribuyó para las gastos desta causa. España la dio tantas Casas y Conuentos. . . ." As one can see from this example, co-patronage writers almost always used the terms *España / española* rather than *Castilla / castellana*.

[35]Francisco de la Cueva y Silva, *Informacion en derecho sobre el titulo de Patrona destos Reynos, dado a la gloriosa santa Teresa de Iesus, fundando la eleccion que los Procuradores de Cortes hizieron. Y respondiendo a todas las oposiciones contrarias*, BNM, MS 9140 [1618?], fol. 175r: "que siendo estos Reynos los principales opositores a la infidelidad de los rebeldes, y Luteranos, y auiendo concedido Dios la proteccion y gouierno desta empresa, y competencia a nuestra Santa Teresa de Iesus tambien le concedio el Patroncinio de los mismos Reynos que principalmente militan por la Fe, y sustentan su defensa y firmeza."

Church in Europe to a Spanish political problem. He created a syllogism: Teresa was the patron saint against heresy, Spain was the only country pure in faith and entrusted with the task of eradicating the said heresy, therefore, Teresa's patronage of Spain had been given by God to expedite this task. In addition, protection from heretics was privileged as the only specific example of help that was mentioned by the author, to which Spain's overall success and growth were inextricably bound. While Spain was rigorous in preventing heresy from taking hold within its own boarders, the majority of the rhetoric regarding heresy in these treatises was both outwardly-directed and bellicose, speaking to military concerns in places such as the Protestant Low Countries.[36] All the references to the Catholic faith were directed to Spain only, and to the singularity of its purity—a description that implicitly separated Spain from the rest of Europe, particularly from its rival neighbor France, which was Catholic yet beset by Protestantism. The rest of the Catholic world, so emphasized in the beatification sermons, ceased to be a concern in the discourses on Teresa as patron saint, as Spain became increasingly distinctive.

Spanish particularism in the realm of confessional purity combined with a more militaristic mood to create a rhetoric specific for the needs of patron sainthood. Rather than railing against Protestants in general, as preachers often did in beatification sermons, co-patronage preachers like the Augustinian friar, Basilio Ponce de León, directed specific venom at foreign leaders and their collusion with heretics. He contrasted Teresa's foundation of her first monastery in 1569 to the next year, in which the Church officially declared Queen Elizabeth a schismatic for proclaiming herself head of the Church of England. He then compared the situation to the Biblical story of Elias, the spiritual heir of Elijah, and Jezebel; here Teresa became transfigured into the new Elias sent by divine providence to remedy the harm done to the world by the "feroc-

[36]There are almost no references to the Turks or Muslims in this discourse; the emphasis remained on Luther, as in the beatification sermons. Teresa's effectiveness in countering heresy was underscored by a vision had by one of her followers, Antonia del Espíritu Santo from Granada. This vision revealed that Teresa had been made the patron for the conversion of the unfaithful. The story is recounted in a co-patronage sermon by Tomás de San Vicente: *Sermon predicado por el padre fray Thomas de San Vicente, Religioso Descalço de la Orden de Nuestra Señora del Carmen, en su Conuento de S. Hermenegildo el dia quinto de las Octauas, que el Rey Don Felipe IIII nuestro Señor celebró a una de los dos Conuentos de Carmelitas Descalços, y Descalças de Madrid, a la fiesta del Patronato de la gloriosa Virgen Santa Teresa Fundadora desta Reformacion, Patrona de los Reynos de España Corona de Castilla* (Madrid: Pedro de Madrigal, 1627), fol. 10v.

ity" of Jezebel/Elizabeth.[37] The gender dynamics of the example are telling; while Elizabeth had often been represented as a manly woman herself, here she took on the role of the corrupt, weak woman overcome by lust and sinfulness, whereas Teresa held the position of the virtuous male prophet. Because Elizabeth was a secular ruler and the head of a country politically as well as religiously at odds with Spanish interests, Ponce de León's story collapsed the political and religious. Far from being merely an *exemplum* of holy behavior, the Augustinian transformed Teresa into the protector of Spanish interests abroad.

Claims of Teresa's role in aiding Spain militarily moved from the rhetorical to the literal in 1624, when the victory at Bahía in Brazil over the Protestant Dutch forces began to be attributed to the Carmelite saint's intervention, largely because the Spanish fleet had flown the standards of the Immaculate Conception and Saint Teresa.[38] The Discalced Franciscan and royal preacher Diego del Escurial insisted on the pre-eminence of Teresa's military protection of Spain in a 1627 sermon in her honor. He called Teresa a "virginal Pallas" and declared: "We ought to paint [Teresa] with a sword in her hand, shield on her arm, helmet with a crest and plume on her head . . . because of the help she is always giving us, because she fights our battles, defends our side, and crowns our victories."[39] Here the attribution of the saint's aid in battle existed not as a pious depiction of spiritual intercession (Teresa praying for Spain), but it was transformed more literally into the saint

[37]Ponce de León, "Sermon predicando . . . el dia de la Santa Madre Teresa de Iesus," p. 23: "De suerte, que como al santo Viejo Elias le puso Dios en el mundo al tiempo de una Jezabel maldita . . . y se opusiese a su furia: en estos siglos a esta hija de Elias nos la embia la providencia divina, para que se oponga a la fiereza de Isabela, y restituya por otra parte el daño. . . de aquella."

[38]The information regarding the standards comes from Tomás Tamayo y Vargas, *Restauracion de la ciudad del Salvador, i Baía de Todos-Sanctos, en la Provincia del Brasil por las armas de Don Philippe IV el Grande, rei Catholico de las Españas i Indias, etc* (Madrid: La viuda de Alonso Martín, 1628), fols. 60r-v, 135r. One example of the attribution of victory to Teresa can be found in José de Santa Teresa, *Reforma de los Descalzos de Nuestra Señora del Carmen, de la Primitiva Observancia*, vols. 3 and 4 authored by José de Santa Teresa (Madrid: Julian de Paredes, 1683-1684), vol. 4, pp. 756-757.

[39]Diego del Escurial, *Sermon Predicado en el Convento de las Carmelitas Descalças de Madrid, en la Octaua que sus Magestades hizieron a la Santa Madre Teresa de Iesus, al nueuo titulo de Patrona de España* (Madrid: La viuda de Alonso Martín, 1627), fol. 16v: "En quanto Protectora y Patrona la debiamos pintar con espada en la mano, escudo en el brazo, morrión con cimera, y penacho en la cabeza . . . por el amparo que siempre nos está haziendo, porque pelea nuestras batallas, defiende nuestro partido, y corona nuestras vitorias." Unfortunately, no such images depicting Teresa this way seem to have survived the mass destruction of co-patronage engravings, paintings, and banners.

arming herself for battle; this represented a shift away from the more spiritual language employed in the beatification sermons. While Teresa's co-patronage supporters still drew from the same rhetoric of spiritual arms, they clearly felt that the saint's new status necessitated a more concrete, military, and classical iconography. Emphasizing this point, accounts for the co-patronage festivals for Teresa in Avila included the exhortation: "Teresa, i Cierra España!" ("Teresa and Close [off] Spain [from the invaders]!)[40] This phrase was the battle cry traditionally associated with Santiago and his corporeal presence in battle. In appropriating Santiago's battle cry, Teresa in turn appropriated his role as battle commander.

Yet *teresiano* rhetoric that stressed the saint's military activity did not always exclude Santiago; the two were sometimes represented as a team in martial endeavors. A broadsheet advertising a poetry contest in Granada for the 1618 co-patronage celebrations called Santiago and Teresa the embodiment of a classical pair, Mars and Thresa. The poster claimed that the "Thresa" was an alternate translation of Bellona (Roman goddess of war, sometimes another name for Minerva); it provided an elaborate explanation that Bellona was the sister to the god Mars, and that the two were often depicted together, Mars with sword unsheathed, and Thresa holding a flaming torch. In order to make the comparisons between the two couples more apparent, the poster included an engraving of Santiago and Teresa at the top depicted exactly as it claimed Mars and Thresa appeared; this engraving is one of the only surviving images of the two saints as co-patrons. The poster declared: "From this we understand how well-defended Spain will be between Mars and Thresa: with the sword of Santiago and the fire of Teresa; both are threatening the enemies of the Catholic faith and of the name of Spain with sword and fire."[41] The phrase "the name of Spain" (*nombre Español*) is awkwardly rendered in English, but its use underscores a particularly important part of the author's point: Part of the job for the patrons was a defense not just of Catholicism and

[40] *Una carta de una relación de las fiestas se celebró Ávila por el patronato de Teresa de Jesús*, BNM, MS 9140 (1627), fol. 274r.

[41] "Iusta Poetica en el Convento Real de los Santos Martires de la Ciudad de Granada—dia de la gloriosa Virgen Santa Teresa, fundadora del Carmelo," BNM, MS 4011 (1618), fol. 288r: "De aqui entenderemos, quan bien defendida quedara España entre Marte y Thresa: con la espada de SANTIAGO, y con el fuego de TERESA; pues ambos parece que estan amenzando a sangre y fuego a los enemigos de la Fee Catholica, y nombre Español." The illustration that accompanies this work is featured on the cover of this issue of the *Catholic Historical Review*.

Spain's borders, but of Spain's *name*, which we can read here as its honor. Stress on Spain's honor has the effect of moving the duties of patron sainthood out of a solely defensive task to one that includes an ideological (and military) program—that is, preserving Spain's international reputation.[42]

Such an ideological program was illustrated clearly on one of the altars decorated for the festival in honor of Teresa in Granada. This altar contained a depiction of Jesus as a child, dressed in secular clothing with a lance in one hand, which he was handing to a figure kneeling before him. The figure, Teresa, was holding a shield. Underneath the depiction was written: "So that you might defend Spain/ against the pagans/ I choose you as *Capitana*." Underneath this, the copyist of the piece added: "Those are appropriate weapons for a woman even if she is a saint = spear and shield."[43] In addition to being feminine, the choice of arms also evoked classical mythology, as these are the arms traditionally associated with the goddess Minerva. But most importantly, we see the Christ child himself, wearing "inappropriately" secular garments, handing the lance to her—investing her, as it were, in what can only be described as a *feudal* image. In the feudal ceremony of investiture, a vassal promised a lord military service in exchange for dominion over a set piece of the lord's land—to oversimplify, arms traded for land. Symbolically, therefore, Jesus was investing Teresa with Spain in return for her use of military arms against the enemies of the Church. The combination of the classical, feudal, and spiritual created a powerful argument justifying and glorifying Teresa's role as protectress of Spain.

The new secular and particularist emphasis in co-patronage works can also be illustrated by the Trinitarian Hortensio Félix Paravicino's discussion of the dual patronage of Santiago and Teresa within the context of Spanish history. Paravicino, arguably the most popular preacher of his day, contrasted Santiago and Teresa with another Spanish pair, Rodrigo and Florinda. Rodrigo had been the Visigothic king of Spain at the time of the Moorish invasion (A.D. 711). The twelfth-century *Primera Crónica General de España* (*The First General Chronicle of*

[42]On the significance of the concept of "*reputación*" in early modern Spanish foreign policy, see John H. Elliott, "Foreign Policy and Domestic Crisis: Spain, 1598-1659," in *Spain and its World*, pp. 114-136.

[43]"Iusta Poetica," fol. 287r: "En otro altar estaba un niño Jesus vestido a lo seglar indecentemente, con una lanza en la mano, que el legaba a una figura que estaba de Rodillas delante de el niño la qual era de la beata Me y madre tenía una rodela en la mano. Con una letra que la decía el niño Jesus: 'Para que a España defiendas/ Contra la gente pagana/ Yo eligo por capitana. [Son armas propias de mujer a un que sea santa = lanza y rodela.]'"

Spain) recounted how the king became smitten with the beautiful daughter of Count Julian, the lord who held Ceuta, which was the territory that acted as the southern gateway into the peninsula from North Africa. A seduction, or perhaps rape, occurred between the king and the daughter (unnamed in this version, but Florinda in others); when the king failed to marry her, her father turned against him and conspired with the Moors to allow them entry into Spain.[44] Paravicino declared that Spain's loss had resulted from the couple's sins. Therefore, the Trinitarian continued, it was fitting that Spain be restored by a man and a woman, which was clearly the role God intended for the dual patronage.[45] Paralleling the structure of the lapsarian narrative of Adam and Eve, Paravicino transformed the pair Rodrigo and Florinda into those responsible for the collapse of Spain into slavery and darkness for so many centuries.[46] In contrast, he invoked the celestial, chaste pair of Santiago and Teresa who would bring freedom and salvation back to the peninsula. What is most striking about Paravicino's use of the Rodrigo and Florinda story is his choice of a specifically Spanish legend over the more broadly applicable one of Adam and Eve. Unlike beatification sermons positing Teresa as a "New Eve" for the salvation of potentially every person's soul through her prayer and foundations, Paravicino underscored the uniquely Spanish context of the redemption story. Santiago and Teresa were not universal redeemers, but Spanish ones; rather than opening Spain to invasion, they would close its borders to enemies.[47]

Paravicino's story revealed another *teresiano* tactic: to discuss the two patron saints together in a way that it made it clear that their roles were interdependent and complementary. The controversy over dual patron-

[44]Alfonso X, *Primera Crónica General de España*, ed. Ramón Menéndez Pidal (Editorial Gredos, 1906; reprinted 1977), pp. 307-308.

[45]Hortensio Félix Paravicino, *Oracion Evangelica del Maestro Fray Hortensio Felix Paravicino, predicador de su Magestad, al Patronato de España, de la Santa Madre Teresa de Iesus* (Madrid: Juan González, 1628), fol. 35r. For Paravicino's popularity, see Hilary Smith, *Preaching in the Spanish Golden Age: A Study of Some Preachers of the Reign of Philip III* (Oxford, 1978), p. 35.

[46]O'Callahan remarks that the Count Julian-Rodrigo story remained absent from early Christian accounts of the Reconquest, but appeared in early Arab ones. Later Christians, he observes, picked up the theme in order to blame the loss of Spain on the sins of the Visigothic kings; see Joseph F. O'Callaghan, *A History of Medieval Spain* (Ithaca, 1975), pp. 52-53.

[47]The late 1620's marked a period of increasing crisis for the Spanish monarchy, both economically and politically, as it dealt with a series of military disasters on the Continent. Early seventeenth-century Castilians were beginning to see their monarchy as surrounded by enemies and in a state of decline. See Elliott, "Self-Perception and Decline."

age inspired some of Teresa's supporters to try to assuage *santiaguista* fears that their ultimate goal was to displace Santiago from his role as patron. Thus *teresianos* created metaphors that included pairings, as in Paravicino's Rodrigo-Florinda story and in the Granadino poster's Mars-Thresa. Invoking Teresa and Santiago as a divinely-sanctioned, harmonious couple led some writers to describe co-patronage as a spiritual marriage. The metaphor of coupling and marriage provided *teresianos* with the most obvious reason why Spain's co-patron should be a woman and not a man. Bishop Cristóbal de Lobera explained that the Book of Genesis laid out God's plan for supplying the male with a female helper: "God did not give Adam another man as a helper, but a woman, and He did not say that He gave her in order to multiply humankind, but in order to help him."[48] Lobera insisted that this critical event, in which God deliberately created a second human being, a female, proved that God wished men to be helped by women and, therefore, that Teresa was the most appropriate choice for co-patron to aid Santiago in his work on Spain's behalf. Arguments such as Lobera's served to reassure opponents of the continued necessity of Santiago's patronage while simultaneously providing a more conservatively gendered notion of Teresa-as-patron than was provided by the more militaristic images.

Opponents to Teresa's elevation were not mollified by conciliatory metaphors. In organizing their counter-campaign to preserve the singularity of Santiago's patronage, *santiaguista* authors and preachers quickly and aggressively launched attacks on their opponents' attempts to imagine Teresa and Santiago as spiritually united. They professed outrage at the idea that anyone could think Santiago required help from anyone to perform his function as patron, and they reserved a particularly venomous ridicule for those who, like Lobera, described the two as a married couple. Reginaldus Vicencius, for example, framed his attack on the marriage metaphor by invoking the prosaic and temporal aspects of marriage and ignoring the spiritual angle his opponents attempted to express. He proposed a satirical image of Santiago as the good husband, picking up his sword and going off to war to kill the Moors, while Teresa like a good wife stayed at home with distaff and needle. Mocking not only *teresiano* authors but also female enterprise, Vicencius ended his tirade by citing Thomas Aquinas's dismissal

[48]Cristóbal de Lobera, *Iusta Cosa a sido eligir por Patrona de España, y admitir por tal, a Santa Teresa de Iesus, en ello no se hizo perjuycio alguno al patronato de Señor Santiago Apostol y Patron de España*, BNM, MS 9140 (1628), fol. 4v: "No dio Dios a Adan parra su ayuda otro hombre, sino una muger, y no dixo que se la daua para multiplicar el genero humano, sino para ayudarle. . . ."

of women: "Women are helpers to men only in procreation; because it is better for men to be helped by men, than to be helped by women."[49] *Santiaguista* authors, therefore, ignored the metaphor of marriage as two parts coming together to create one whole in favor of a more negatively gendered and domestic one. Whereas in the *teresiano* marriage metaphor, Teresa's gender also contained a *value*, because it was her difference that enabled her to act as the balance and complement to Santiago, the opponents of co-patronage worked to portray femaleness as a negative, an obstacle to equality. To them, Teresa's gender could only be understood as both liability and roadblock to her role as helper. In fact, she was prevented from helping, hindered by the authority of Aquinas, who was employed here to silence both the saint and her followers.

Santiaguista authors preserved their greatest scorn for the image of Teresa as a warrior goddess. Quevedo made a scathing attack in the presumption that Teresa could take over Santiago's defense of Spain, in the process ignoring the tradition of invoking the Virgin Mary as a battle commander.[50] Addressing the Carmelites, Quevedo accused: "And you take the sword from Santiago's altar, snatching it from his hand, in order to give it to Saint Teresa, who has been depicted even by her own children with a distaff?"[51] There are two main thrusts to

[49]Reginaldus Vicencius, *Respuesta al papel de Don Francisco Morovelli, sobre el patronato de Santa Teresa* (Málaga: Juan René, 1628), fol. 19r-v. The Latin citation from Thomas Aquinas reads "Mulier facta est in adjutorium viri quoad generationem tantum: quia in alijs. . . melius adjuvatur vir per virum, quam per mulierem." For a more positive exposition of Aquinas' views on the relationship between men and women, see Prudence Allen, *The Concept of Woman*, 2 vols. so far, vol. II: *The Early Humanist Reformation, 1250-1500*, second revised edition (Grand Rapids, Michigan, 2002), pp. 127-152, especially p. 147 where she quotes Aquinas regarding the "greatest friendship" between a husband and wife that extends beyond procreation to partnership in a whole range of domestic activities.

[50]Francisco de Quevedo y Villegas, "Memorial por el patronato de Santiago y por todos los santos naturales de España," in *Obras de Don Francisco de Quevedo Villegas*, ed. Aureliano Fernández Guerra y Orbe, Biblioteca de autores españoles 23 (Madrid, 1852), p. 225. The Virgin had been invoked as a "conquistadora" in the Middle Ages and in the New World. See Amy G. Remensnyder, "The Colonization of Sacred Architecture: The Virgin Mary, Mosques, and Temples in Medieval Spain and Early Sixteenth-Century Mexico," in *Monks and Nuns, Saints and Outcasts: Religion in Medieval Society*, ed. Sharon Farmer and Barbara Rosenwein (Ithaca, 2000), pp. 189-219.

[51]Francisco de Quevedo y Villegas, "Su espada por Santiago," in *Obras de D. Francisco de Quevedo Villegas*, II, ed. Aureliano Fernández-Guerra y Orbe, Biblioteca de autores españoles 48 (Madrid, 1951), p. 443: "que de su altar tomeis la espada, y que le quiteis vos la que él tiene en su mano, para dársela a Santa Teresa, a quien sus mismos hijos han hecho estampar con una rueca?"

this rhetorical jab. First, Quevedo made a pointed attack on Teresa's ability to take over Santiago's duty based on her gender, implying through parallel imagery that her hands were already too full with the distaff to take the sword. Second, he suggested that the Carmelites themselves were aware of her unfitness, since they were the ones who had portrayed her with the distaff. It is evident from the contemptuous tone of his remark that for Quevedo, handing over Santiago's sword to a woman constituted a ridiculous enterprise.

The type of invective expressed by Quevedo raises an intriguing question: If the orthodoxy of calling Teresa a manly woman was not questioned during the beatification period (indeed, Gregory XV himself did so in the canonization bull), how did similar images become a hotspot during Teresa's elevation to co-patron? I believe a partial answer can be found in the shift from spiritual metaphors to the classical and military ones developed by Teresa's supporters. While these certainly drew from older, spiritual models, they also (and perhaps more obviously) invoked a series of cultural images of manly women popular during the early seventeenth century that were more secular than spiritual in nature. Such a shift can be identified by a move away from comparisons to Teresa as Deborah and towards ones as Minerva or an Amazon.[52] Despite the continued presence of Old Testament examples, classical figures took center stage during the co-patronage fight, as *teresianos* sought to provide a battery of historical justifications for Teresa's involvement in battle. The preacher Jerónimo de Pancorbo used the Amazons in order to bolster his claim that invoking Teresa in war was not anything new, but rather the continuation of a long tradition of women taking up arms in defense of their countries.[53] While discussions of Teresa's virility were an important part of "selling" her sanctity throughout the canonization effort, such virility remained spiritual; her transformation from female to male spirit was accomplished through hyper-femininity—i.e., humility, obedience, and pas-

[52]I do not wish to oversimplify this point. Beatification preachers did sometimes invoke the figure of the "Amazon" (as Cipriano de Aguayo did), while co-patronage authors sometimes produced more conventional and feminine imagery of Teresa. Nonetheless, the overall pattern in rhetoric justifies the discussion of a shift.

[53]Jerónimo Pancorvo, "Sermon predicado en la muy noble y muy leal Ciudad de Jerez de Frontera, en la fiesta que se hizo en el Convento de nuestra Señora del Carmen a la gloriosa Madre Teresa de Jesus, recibiendola por Patrona de España, 7 noviembre 1627," in *Sermones varios* (Cádiz: Juan de Borja, 1627), fol. 6v: "Digo, tambien, que auer mugeres valerosas, que con las armas defendieron sus tierras, y socorrieron las agenas, es tambien muy antiguo."

sivity. In the co-patronage period, we see her gender shift become more physical, evoking a warrior queen or a real-life manly woman like Catalina de Erauso.[54]

Yet we are still left with questions over precisely why Teresa's role as co-patron sparked such heated opposition. It must be stressed that descriptions of Teresa as a manly woman during the beatification and canonization went unremarked. The commonplace nature of such descriptions by a wide spectrum of preachers from different orders demonstrates that the Church had a long history of orthodoxy behind spiritual manly women. We are therefore left with the sense that it was having a woman as patron that caused outrage from Santiago's partisans. While it is true that any saint elevated to co-patron would have been rejected by the *santiaguista* faction, the choice of a female saint provoked greater outrage than a male one would have. There was clearly something *gendered* in their reaction to descriptions of the saint as Minerva—an involuntary recoil, a deep disgust. And it is precisely the patron saint's role as representative that led to this outrage. While spiritual and hagiographical accounts had a long tradition of describing how holy women could become virile, it seems some groups wished to set strict limitations on the types of masculine roles that even female saints were allowed to assume. Anxious about both self-image and international reputation, opponents to Teresa's elevation saw Spain's adoption of a female patron as a degradation; they equated her elevation with calling Santiago ineffective and in need of a woman's help, which they reacted to as a collective emasculation. But what is most fascinating here is the strength of position expressed by both sides. Teresa's supporters applied militaristic language and classical comparisons to bolster their case with as much righteousness as the outrage expressed by opponents to co-patronage, suggesting that gendered categories of sanctity were themselves supple. The saint's iconography, even after her canonization, was far from fixed and stable; it remained open to contestation, debate, and mutability.

[54]The story of Catalina de Erauso, the famous transvestite soldier-nun, can be found in Mary Elizabeth Perry, "The Manly Woman: A Historical Case Study," *American Behavioral Scientist* 31, no. 1 (1987), 86-100; and Velasco, *The Lieutenant Nun*.

REVIEW ARTICLE

THE CONTEMPORARY PAPACY FROM PAUL VI TO BENEDICT XVI: A BIBLIOGRAPHICAL ESSAY

BY

FRANK J. COPPA*

During the long pontificate of John Paul II (1978-2005) there has been a renewed interest in the papacy, head of the universal church and the world's oldest transnational institution. This is reflected in the spate of one-volume dictionaries and encyclopedias published during the past two decades including: J. N. D. Kelley, The *Oxford Dictionary of Popes* (1986); P. G. Maxwell-Stuart, *Chronicle of the Popes* (1997); Richard B. McBrien, *Lives of the Popes* (1997); Eamon Duffy, *Saints & Sinners: A History of the Popes* (1997); Allan Hall, *A History of the Papacy* (1998); William J. La Due, *The Chair of Saint Peter* (1998); Frank J. Coppa (ed.), *Encyclopedia of the Vatican and Papacy* (1999); and Bruno Steimer and Michael G. Parker (eds.), *Dictionary of Popes and the Papacy* (2001), among others. The bibliography on Pius XII is both contentious and voluminous, and only partly catalogued in the volumes by José M. Sánchez, *Pius XII and the Holocaust: Understanding the Controversy* (2002), and Joseph Bottum and David G. Dalin (eds.), *The Pius Wars: Responses to the Critics of Pius XII* (2004). The bibliography on John XXIII is equally voluminous if not as contentious, and has expanded beyond that presented in Peter Hebblethwaite's *John XXIII: Pope of the Council* (1984) and his *John XXIII: Shepherd of the Modern World* (1985). Hebblethwaite later published a biography *Paul VI: The First Modern Pope* (1993), whose pontificate ushered in the contemporary papacy from the time of Vatican Council II to the present—the focus of this essay.

Battista Mondin, *The Popes of the Modern Ages* (*sic*)*: From Pius IX to John Paul II* [The Pontifical Academy of Sciences.] (Vatican City: Urbaniana University Press, 2005. Pp. 223. €20,00 paperback) provides an overview of ten pontificates from that of Pius IX through that of John Paul II. This is somewhat of an apologetic volume, as is made clear in the preface, which refers to these ten popes as the "magnificent ten" and pinpoints their substantial contribution

*Dr. Coppa is professor of history in St. John's University, New York.

to the "civilization of love" (p. 7). Furthermore, English is clearly not the author's first language, accounting for the strange constructions and perhaps some of the misspellings and misprints. For example, I am listed in the bibliography on page 36 as "F. J. Crippa" and the subtitle of my biography of Pius IX converted from *Crusader in a Secular Age* to *Crusader in a Secular World*. Hebblethwaite is transformed to Hobblethwaite and the subtitle of his book listed as *Shepher* (*sic*) *of the Modern World* (p. 139) There are other misprints, but on a positive note there is considerable useful information provided on the popes surveyed and their pontificates—more than one would find in most dictionary or encyclopedia articles. For each of the ten articles there are clearly defined categories such as background material on each figure before he became a pope, his program, political activity, religious activity, theological activity, missionary efforts, and a summation or conclusion for each. This organization will prove useful for the interested reader seeking information on a particular aspect of these pontificates. However, there is a caveat for reliance on the material found within these pages. The author has borrowed widely from the secondary literature, but includes few notes and these are general without specific reference, so the reader cannot be certain of the source or accuracy of the material he has included. For example, on the issue of the vote on papal infallibility on July 18, 1870, Mondin claims that fifty-five bishops exempted themselves from the vote, while it is generally acknowledged that 140 did so. He also asserts that in that public session the vote was 451 in favor and 88 against (p. 30) while, in fact, the vote was 535 in favor and only two against! (See Giacomo Martina, *Pio IX, 1867-1878*, p. 215). On page 41 he has the German Emperor Wilhelm II visiting Pope Leo XIII in 1882, when Wilhelm I still sat on the throne!

Less sweeping in scope and more scholarly in substance are five recently edited works on the person and pontificate of Giovanni Battista Montini, who in 1963 became Pope Paul VI. The first of these focuses on the ecclesiastical life of this figure while serving as national director of the organization of university students in Italy: Giovanni Battista Montini, *Scritti Fucini (1925-1933),* edited by Massimo Marcocchi [Quaderni dell'Istituto Paolo VI, Brescia.] (Rome: Edizioni Studium, 2004. Pp. lxx, 729. €70,00 paperback). This large volume of over eight-hundred pages, collected and edited under the auspices of the Istituto Paolo VI of Brescia, gathers the writings of Giovanni Battista Montini from 1925 to 1933 during the years he served as national director of the Federation of Catholic University Students (Federazione Universitaria Cattolica Italiana or FUCI). The writings published here, originally sent to the university students and the leaders of the various FUCI clubs, have been drawn from journals and reviews such as "Studium," "Azione Fucina," "La Sapienza," and the "Bollettino per 'Azione fucina,'" as well as the archives of the Istituto Paolo VI di Brescia and that of the Istituto Paolo VI per la storia dell'Azione Cattolica e del Movimento Cattolico in Italia di Roma. While Richard Wolff in his volume *Between Pope and Duce: Catholic Students in Fascist Italy* (New York: Peter Lang, 1999) has focused on the political tension between the organization's leadership and the Fascist

regimes, the documents of this collection focus on the religious, philosophical, and educational thought and teachings of the future pope.

These documents reveal the emerging orientation of Montini during these years: his search for truth, his spiritual pedagogy, and his evaluation of education along with prayer as essential for the formation of conscience and the modification of behavior. Aware that a chasm had developed between the Church and the modern world, Montini, who as Paul VI would eventually bring Vatican II's *aggiornamento* to a successful conclusion, early on recognized the need to bridge this chasm, if not eliminate it. Stressing the importance of education in these early writings, Montini emerges above all as an educator rather than a political or social theorist. In these articles he reveals his faith that education could effect a reconciliation between doctrine and life, faith and reason, and the gospels and culture, convinced that the FUCI could help to reconcile modern man and the Christian message. Perhaps more optimistic than realistic, eventually, Montini could not escape from the political realities that confronted the organization and led to his dismissal as its national director in 1933 (pp. 688-704).

While the first volume on Montini explores his thought and action from 1925 to 1933, the second, the *Atti della commemorazione nel primo anniversario della morte di Nello Vian (Città del Vaticano, 19 gennaio 2001). Testimonianze e corrispondenza con Giovanni Battista Montini—Paolo VI (1932-1975)* [Istituto Paolo VI-Brescia, Quaderni, n.22.] (Rome: Edizioni Studium, 2004. Pp. 290. €26,00 paperback), concentrates on Montini's correspondence with Nello Vian from 1932 to 1975. Like the first volume, this one too was undertaken by the Istituto Paolo VI of Brescia, formed and long directed by Nello Vian, and published by Edizioni Studium of Rome. It includes five related though distinct elements. First an introductory article by Vittorio Peri on the militant but pacific Christianity of Nello Vian: "La Pacifica Milizia Cristiana di Nello Vian in un Secolo Cruciale per la Chiesa e per l'Italia" (pp. 1-42); second: the acts of the commemorative convocation on the first anniversary of the death of Vian on January 19, 2001 (pp. 45-84); third: the Montini-Vian Correspondence, 1932-1975 (pp. 85-230); fourth: an article by Nello's son Paolo Vian "For a Biography of Nello Vian," which first appeared in *Rivista di storia della Chiesa in Italia* (55 [2001], pp. 175-199); fifth and finally: Nello Vian's "Recollections of Giovanni Battista Montini—Paul VI" (pp. 261-270).

The two sections of greatest import for those interested in Montini are the correspondence and Vian's recollections of Montini. In the correspondence both Vian and Montini discreetly skirt political issues, even during the troubled times of World War II. While not revealing much about political issues in Italy and the Church, it does present the strong bond and friendship between these two figures over four decades, and the profound spirituality of Montini. Interestingly, Montini's tone toward Vian, and friendship for him, remains fairly constant through the years, even as he attained one important position after another, and finally the papacy. The most noticeable change in the correspondence published here, which does not include their entire correspondence, is

the frequency of the exchange of letters and the length of Montini's missives, as he was burdened with increased responsibilities. While the exchange reveals important elements of Montini's religious and spiritual outlook, other aspects of his personality and efforts emerge from the Vian recollections of Montini, including his work to gather and disseminate information about civilian and military prisoners of war and his contribution as Acting Secretary of State for Ordinary Affairs after 1952. Vian notes that that year Pope Pius XII reported he had offered the cardinalate to Montini and Tardini—and both had refused. He does not say or speculate why they refused the offer from Pius XII, but later accepted the honor when offered by Pope John XXIII. Especially interesting is Vian's report of an unannounced visit he made to Montini on February 12, 1961, when he found him in a pessimistic mood as he worried about the future of the universal Church in general and the position of the Church in Milan in particular, placing great hope in the Council that would open the following year (p. 267).

Vian surmised that Montini lamented the closed atmosphere of Rome, noting that while he was at Milan his visits to the Eternal City were few and brief (p. 267). Later when pope, this attitude was reflected in his frequent apostolic visits outside Italy—the subject of the third volume of edited works commissioned by the Istituto Paolo VI di Brescia: *I Viaggi Apostolici di Paolo VI. Colloquio Internazionale di Studio, Brescia, 21-22-23 settembre 2001,* edited by Rodolfo Rossi [Pubblicazioni dell'Istituto Paolo VI, 25] (Rome: Edizioni Studium, 2004. Pp. xii, 390. €40,00 paperback). The conference and its proceedings pinpoint the crucial role these apostolic visits played during Paul's pontificate, revealing him not only as the first contemporary pope to fly in an airplane and visit the United States, but also the first to transcend personally the Roman and Italian atmosphere to deliver the Christian message to the world beyond. The impact of these eight visits to all the inhabited continents, upon the Church and the Papacy, are explored in the three-day conference which examines the following: the pilgrimage to the Holy Land (January 4-6, 1964); the journey to Bombay, India (December 2-5, 1964); the visit to the United Nations in New York (October 4-5, 1965); the pilgrimage to Portugal on the fiftieth anniversary of the apparition at Fatima (May 13, 1967); the trip to Turkey (July 25-26, 1967); his venture to Bogotá, Colombia (August 22-25, 1968); the visit to Geneva (June 10, 1969); the trip to Uganda (July 31-August 2, 1969); and finally, the trip to the Far East, Polynesia, and Australia (November 26-December 4, 1970). Although all were religiously inspired and oriented, they had important social and political implications for both the Church and the modern world.

The significance of these visits is explored in the presentation of Andrea Riccardi of Rome, "Significato e Finalità dei Viaggi Apostolici di Paolo VI" (pp. 15-31), which puts them in historical perspective, noting the infrequent papal ventures outside Rome after the Great Western Schism (1378-1417) right down to the twentieth century. There was the visit of Pius VI to Vienna in 1782,

which failed to remove the restrictions imposed on the Church in Austria. Subsequently, he was captured by the French and snatched from Rome in 1799, as was his successor Pius VII in 1807. Later in 1848, Pius IX was forced by a revolutionary upheaval to flee Rome for Gaeta, in the Kingdom of Naples. After his return Pius IX never left Italy, and following the loss of Rome declared himself a "prisoner in the Vatican," refusing to step outside. Even after the resolution of the Roman Question during the pontificate of Pius XI in 1929, popes did not venture outside Italy—John XXIII made pilgrimages to Loreto and Assisi, maintaining the papacy's Italian perspective. Seen in this light, Paul VI's decision to travel abroad was revolutionary and transformative, contributing to his reputation as the first modern pope. In the words of Riccardi, Paul's decision to go abroad brought the papacy outside its habitual ambience, redesigned its rapport with the outside world, and established something of a new pontifical liturgy. Following in the footsteps of the Apostle Paul, the pope insisted that "Catholic" meant "universal" so that its vision, mission, heart, and responsibility should not be confined (pp. 16-18). Riccardi notes that this policy of travel outside Rome, going outside of the city to the world beyond, carried risks and the fear that it might dilute and therefore weaken the papal institution.That was certainly not the pope's intent, convinced that the Church had to be in contact with the entire world but had to be governed from Rome!

Riccardi goes on to examine the aim and impact of the various visits as does Bernard Sesboüé in his presentation "Les Voyages Apostoliques de Paul VI: Profil Historique" (pp. 63-77). Given the nature of the conference, there is understandably some overlap between presentations as there is between Riccardi and Sesboüé. Observing the novelty of Paul's apostolic visits, Sesboüé observes that in the past there were two types of papal journey: those of a political nature and those that were forced and brought the pope into exile. In dealing with the contemporary papacy, he differentiates visits in Italy, which he perceives as flowing from the pope's role as bishop of Rome and Primate of Italy, from the universal apostolic visits introduced by Pope Paul VI. In his historical overview of papal visits, Sesboüé describes the papal journeys before Paul VI, examining forced travels of exiles and political trips. He then goes on to explore the types of apostolic voyages undertaken by Pope Paul including: pilgrimages; other spiritual visits; symbolic and prophetic trips; missionary ventures; travels that open a dialogue with the entire world; various journeys stressing inter-religious relations; and those concerning dialogue within the Church, among others. Sesboüé then attempts to understand the motivation for the particular visits undertaken.

While Riccardi and Sesboüé provide overviews, the other presentations are more restricted with some dealing with specific trips and others focusing on particular aims of a number of trips. In the first category one finds: Pasquale Macchi (Paul VI's secretary), "Il Pellegrinaggio in Terra Santa" (pp. 33-45)—which is supplemented by a written intervention by Thomas F. Stransky, "Paul VI's Religious Pilgrimage in the Holy Land" (pp. 341-373); Guillermo Rodríguez

Melgarejo, "El Viaje de Pablo VI a América Latina. Problemática social" (pp. 111-124); João Batista Libânio, "Gli Influssi sull'Insegnamento Teologico in America Latina del Viaggio e dei Discorsi di Paolo VI in Colombia" (pp. 125-140) – which might have been placed in either the first or second category; Giuseppe Pittau, "I Viaggi di Paolo VI in Asia: L'Incontro della Chiesa con le Culture e Religioni Asiatiche" (pp. 151-166); and Laurent Monsengwo Pasinya, "Les Voyages Apostoliques de Paul VI. Reflets dans la Théologie Africaine" (pp.167-177) (the title of which in the program is translated into Italian, p. viii, as is that of Valdrini). In the second category one finds: William Henn, "Theological Aims and Content of the Apostolic Voyages of Paul VI: An Ecclesiology for the Areopagus" (pp. 79-110); Jean-Dominique Durand, "De L'ONU à L'OIT. L'Église et la Société Civile dans les Voyages Apostoliques de Paul VI" (pp. 201-225); Patrick Valdrini, "Les Voyages Apostoliques de Paul VI et l'Inculturation de la Foi" (pp. 201-239); Eleuterio F. Fortino, "I Viaggi di Paolo VI e l'Ecumenismo" (pp. 257-277); and Angelo Maffeis, "'Il Papa si fa Missionario': I Viaggi Apostolici di Paolo VI e l' Attività Missionaria della Chiesa" (pp. 279-319). The work of the various sessions and presentations are elaborated upon by the discussions at the end of each day and in the "Conclusioni" (pp. 335-340) of Cardinal Paul Poupard.

These volumes and a good deal of the literature and documentation on Pope Paul VI are published by the Istituto Paolo VI of Brescia, which serves as an international center for his study and documentation. Formed following Pope Paul's death in 1978, the Institute sponsors a number of diverse initiatives including the formation of an archive on his life and work; the gathering of Paul's edited and unedited writings; a library collection on his pontificate and life (which presently contains some 30,000 works and is growing), in addition to the nearly 10,000 volumes of his personal library housed here; and sponsorship of the triennial International Colloquia on Paul and his Pontificate and of the more frequent, in some cases yearly, "Giornate di Studio" or "Days of Study." The first of these "Days of Study" focused on Montini's role in liturgical reform, and was held in Louvain on October 17, 1984. The proceedings examined here center on the collaboration of Paul VI and Archbishop Maurice Roy of Quebec in the promotion of peace and justice; they are from a conference held in Quebec (April 1-3, 2004) and sponsored jointly by the Paul VI Institute and the Faculty of Theology and Religious Sciences of Laval University, Quebec.

Paul VI et Maurice Roy: Un Itinéraire pour la justice et la paix (Rome: Edizioni Studium. 2005. Pp. xii, 272. €35,00 paperback) prints the presentations and discussions of the three-day conference, most of whose participants hailed from Canada and Italy. Following greetings and salutations, there is an Introduction of sorts by Gilles Routhier, who co-ordinated the contents of the volume and places much of what follows in perspective. His "De Nouvelles Initiatives pour la Justice et la Paix" (pp. 11-37) describes the role of various lay and religious groups, the Pope, and the Cardinal on the development of the second stage of the Church's social agenda that opened with John XXIII's encyclical *Pacem in Terris* of April 1963 and culminated in the concerns of Paul

VI for the poor and the problem of poverty that led to the creation of the Pontifical Commission Justice and Peace (JUSTPAX) in 1967, and the selection of Cardinal Roy to preside over it as well as the new Council of the Laity. Routhier's presentation, like the others during the conference, was followed by a broad range discussion, delving into aspects of the presentation and the overall topic.

There is a commentary on part of the correspondence between the Pope and the Cardinal which casts light on the meeting of the minds of the two on the issues of peace and social action. Jacques Racine discusses "La *Lettre* de Paul VI au Cardinal Roy à l'occasion du 80 anniversaire de *Rerum Novarum* (1971)" (pp. 143-156), while Pierre Gaudette comments on "La *Lettre* du Cardinal Maurice Roy à Paul VI (1973)" (pp. 157-170). This last and long letter containing the reflections of Cardinal Roy is included in the Appendix (pp. 233-266). Other presentations examine the evolution of the themes of justice and peace in Papa Montini before the opening of the Second Vatican Council (Charles Morerod, pp. 45-74); the impact and role of Paul VI's social encyclical *Populorum Progressio* (Progress of Peoples) 1967, (Michel Beaudin, pp. 75-94); Paul VI's dialogue on peace in the modern world (Guy Jobin, pp. 175-194); the discussion of peace and justice during the Synod of 1971 (Pierre C. Noël, pp. 129-141); and a short presentation on the reception in Quebec of Pope Paul's appeals for peace (Gisele Turcot, (pp. 209- 215).

Two of the presentations during the conference were made in English, and printed as presented. The first by Pamela Martin Pelzel, "The Early Days of the Pontifical Commission JUSTPAX" (pp. 95-111) and the second by William F. Ryan, "The Influence of Paul VI and Cardinal Roy in the Mission for Justice and Peace in the North American Church" (pp. 201-208). In addition to providing an important chronology for developments, Pelzel recounts the problems encountered by Cardinal Roy, especially the competing interests that threatened to undermine the commission's goals. She also provides interesting insights on the ecumenical efforts of JUSTPAX and its co-operation and activity with the Society, Development, and Peace (SODEPAX), whose aims were seen to be linked to Liberation Theology (p. 107). Among other things, Father Ryan asks why the grand strategy of the Pontifical Commission on Justice and Peace gradually faded, if not failed. He concludes that "internal controversy over birth control sapped the energy of local bishops and clergy and lost the confidence of many lay leaders in the implementation process of Vatican II" (p. 208). Conclusions on the entire conference are provided by Angelo Maffeis (pp. 217-219) and Gilles Routhier (pp. 221-227).

Another of the Institute's days of study opened in Krakow on November 9, 2004, focusing upon, and comparing, the teaching offices and voices of popes Paul VI and John Paul II. The findings of this conference, held in collaboration with the Italian Cultural Institute of Krakow, are published in the short volume edited by the Istituto Paolo VI di Brescia, *Il Magistero di Paolo VI e di Giovanni Paolo II: Università Jagellonica—Cracovia, 9 Novembre 2004)* (Rome: Edizioni Studium. 2005. Pp. 119. €12,00 paperback). Following greet-

ings and salutations by various religious and political figures, there are three formal presentations by Professor Pietro Corsini, mayor of Brescia; Dr. Giuseppe Camadini, President of the Paul VI Institute of Brescia; and Professor Jan Daniel Szczurek of the Pontifical Theological Academy of Krakow. Their presentations are printed in Italian, and each is followed by a Polish version. The introductory remarks set the stage for the papers by hinting at the similarities between the agendas and activities of these two popes and the reasons for their linkage. These themes are developed in the formal papers that follow and that understandably have considerable overlap. Although these papers were prepared and presented before the death of John Paul II, and printed afterwards, they have not been revised.

Corsini's "Paolo VI e Giovanni Paolo II di Fronte alla Storia del Novecento" (pp. 25-39) points to the desire of the two popes to proceed with the *aggiornamento* or updating of the Church, commenced by the Second Vatican Council, especially as regards its social program. He notes that central to the thought of both figures was the recognition of, and emphasis on, the dignity of man, which led them to oppose the variant forms of totalitarianism—whether fascist or communist. At the same time both saw the need to make the presence and thought of the Church felt worldwide, assuring that the march of globalization serve all of mankind and that dialogue continue between peoples of different regions, nations, and faiths. Many of these themes are repeated in Szczurek's essay "Continuità nell'Insegnamento di Paolo VI e di Giovanni Paolo II" (pp. 87-102), which traces the continuity in the thought and teachings of Paul VI and John Paul II. In doing so, he places special emphasis on the encyclicals or circular apostolic letters these popes addressed worldwide, concerning questions of import to the whole of humanity. In the process he has reference to the seven encyclicals issued by Paul VI and the fourteen released by John Paul II. He especially cites the importance and influence of Paul's *Populorum Progressio* (1967) on the social thought and international outlook of John Paul II (p. 97). Although the author recognizes that every pope leaves his own mark on his pontificate, he sees a clear continuity in the doctrine and policies of Paul VI and John Paul II.

I found the presentation by Camadini, "Paolo VI e la Polonia" (pp. 57-70), the most problematic, given the difficult task undertaken by the author of showing a special relationship between Paul VI and Poland. To be sure, at the young age of not quite twenty-six, only three years after he was ordained, Giovanni Battista Montini was dispatched by Pius XI as attaché to the Apostolic Nunciature of Warsaw. However, he was not particularly happy there and this accounts for his rather short stay from June to October of 1923. "I still haven't seen much of Warsaw," the prelate wrote his parents, "but I don't suppose there is much to see." The impact and inspiration during his tenure there are difficult to gauge from his correspondence with friends and family. That he appreciated the loyalty of the Poles to Catholicism and the Papacy, and as Pope had hoped to visit the country during the celebration of its Sacred Millennium, is undeni-

able. It is also true that in naming the Archbishop of Krakow, Karol Wojtyła, a cardinal in 1967, Paul sought to honor not only the priest but the country (p. 69). What is not known, and is not shown, is the Polish factor in Paul's *Ostpolitik.* To be sure, Papa Montini embraced Poland, as well as the rest of Eastern Europe, in his global pastoral outreach.

As we have seen, a number of the Istituto Paolo VI's colloquia and conferences concentrate on Paul's important trips, including the colloquium "I Viaggi Apostolici di Paolo VI" (September 21-23, 2001) discussed earlier, and the conference on "Pellegrinaggio in Terra Santa nel 40 Anniversario del Viaggio di Paolo VI" (October 9-13, 2004). Paul VI, reflecting on the impact of his Apostolic Voyages observed, "You will see how many voyages my successor will make!" ("I Viaggi Apostolici di Paolo VI," p. 107). John Paul I's month-long pontificate (August 26 to September 28, 1978) was too short to actualize Paul's prophecy, but his successor John Paul II (1978-2005) more than fulfilled it. The published work of John Paul II and volumes on his long pontificate continue to proliferate. Recently John Paul II published *Rise, Let Us Be On Our Way,* translated by Walter Ziemba (New York: Warner Books. 2004. Pp. x, 230. $22.95), which stresseed the value of travel in order to spread the faith. Appearing on the forty-fifth anniversary of Karol Wojtyła's appointment as auxiliary bishop of Krakow, this volume focuses on his role as bishop just as his *Gift and Mystery: On the Fiftieth Anniversary of My Priestly Ordination* (1996) concentrated on the early years of his priesthood. Following a short Introduction (pp. vii-ix), the main text of *Rise, Let Us Be On Our Way* is divided into six sections: "Vocation," "The Ministry of a Bishop," "The Intellectual and Pastoral Responsibilities," "The Fatherhood of a Bishop," "Episcopal Collegiality," and finally "God and Courage." Early on in his episcopal office, he saw the bishop as shepherd of his flock and therefore the need to know and have a rapport with them; hence the importance of pastoral visits which put the shepherd in contact with his flock (p. 73).

Once pope, Wojtyła continued to appreciate the importance of pastoral visits, and his first apostolic pilgrimage in January 1979 was to the shrine at Guadalupe made in response to an invitation to attend the Conference of Latin American bishops at Puebla de los Ángeles. The newly elected pope was moved by the presence and devotion of the masses: first in Santo Domingo, where he stopped, and then in Mexico. John Paul II wrote that "this pilgrimage inspired and shaped all the succeeding years of my pontificate" (p. 55). He also believed that this visit served as a kind of "permit" that allowed him to go on a pilgrimage to Poland—a trip that would prove crucial for the Church, for the Polish regime, and for the future of communism in Poland, Eastern Europe, and eventually the Soviet Union. Dedicated to the mission to "go and make disciples of all nations," John Paul II was convinced that the pope had to understand the experiences of those around him and the language they used to communicate (p. 105). The pope also confided that the Second Vatican Council called by John XXIII and brought to a conclusion by Paul VI, intensified his impulse

for pastoral activity, citing the mystery of the mystical encounter with men "from every nation, race, people and language" (p. 158). Citing his visits to Asia, the Americas, Africa, and Oceania as well as different parts of Europe, he was convinced that such trips are important and have great value both on the ecclesial and interpersonal level—and in a sense follow the footsteps of Saint Paul. John Paul II concluded that the task of traveling has been assigned the pope by Christ himself (p. 162), since the responsibility of the successor of Peter extends to the entire world (p. 168).

This formative period provides interesting insights into Wojtyła's personal development, thus shedding light on his later pontificate. Among other things, he revealed that his intellectual journey took place in two stages: in the first he moved from literature to metaphysics and the second led from metaphysics to phenomenology. Indeed, he did his habilitation thesis on Max Scheler's book *Der Formalismus in der Ethik und materiale Wertethik*, which he translated into Polish. The tremendous impact of Scheler's work and thought on this pope is explored in Derek S. Jeffreys, *Defending Human Dignity: John Paul II and Political Realism* (2004). Another German influenced Wojtyła, namely, Joseph Ratzinger, the theological expert who accompanied Cardinal Joseph Frings during the course of the Second Vatican Council. John Paul later appointed his friend and advisor Prefect of the Congregation for the Doctrine of the Faith, which some believe led to his selection as John Paul II's successor as pope in 2005. The pontificate of John Paul II continues to excite interest and study resulting in the publication of scholarly and popular works.

Among the latter is Meg Greene, *John Paul II. A Biography* (Westport, Connecticut: Greenwood Press. 2003. Pp. xx, 172. $29.95), which is clearly aimed at middle and high school students. Like John Paul II's *Rise, Let Us Be On Our Way,* this popular volume focuses on the pre-papal life and experiences of Wojtyła, accounting for seven of its ten chapters. "The dual purpose of this biography," the author, a freelance writer, notes, "is first to describe for students the life of the man who became Pope John Paul II and, second, to explain the accomplishments and limitations of his papacy" (p. xv). Unfortunately, the relationship between the first half and the second is not always clear. While there are few startling revelations in the pages of the first section, there is some interesting material and a clear exposition of the most important developments in Wojtyła's early life and career. It is supplemented by a "Timeline" (pp. xvii-xix), which students will find useful. Within the pages of Chapter II, "A Young Man of Passion" (pp. 15-28), Greene relates the story of his rejection by a high school girl on whom he had "a crush" (p. 23)—an anecdote drawn from the secondary literature—but does not explore its implications or consequences. Indeed, the first seven chapters of this work provide more narrative than assessment, and the broader historical picture drawn is sometimes less than accurate. Thus, I found troubling her depiction of Poland as more aggrieved than aggressor in its 1920 confrontation with the Soviet Union (p. 5).

The final three chapters, which focus on John Paul II's pontificate, attempt a balanced assessment of his papacy. Here one finds the accomplishments of this first Polish and most traveled pope in history. Among other things Greene cites: his impact worldwide, his role in the collapse of communism in Poland and Eastern Europe, his efforts to achieve reconciliation with Judaism and Eastern Orthodoxy, his crusade against the materialism of the age and the culture of death, and the new Catechism of the Catholic Church, among others. She also provides a critique of this pope and his pontificate including: his unpopular stands on abortion, birth control, priestly celibacy, and women priests as well as the estrangement with the modern world and popular culture. Greene catalogues the many problems confronting the modern Church, which John Paul II was unable to resolve—and some believe he made worse—including the shortage of clergy and the disenchantment of many of its members, who refuse to follow its teachings. Interestingly, she pinpoints some of the contradictions in his stance, noting that while he supported the political action of Solidarity in Poland, in South America he has continuously opposed political action by the Church (p. 135).

The relationship between John Paul II's religious beliefs and political practices is the focus of Jo Renee Formicola, *Pope John Paul II, Prophetic Politician* (Washington, D.C.: Georgetown University Press. 2002. Pp. ix, 264. $19.95 paperback). Formicola sees this pope as a highly transformative religious leader such as Martin Luther King, Mahatma Gandhi, and Desmond Tutu and nothing short of a "catalyst for a new world order" and champion of "social justice and political change in the world." He became such, she claims, by his pursuit of "prophetic politics," which she sees as different from the political approach of his predecessors. The author, a professor of political science at Seton Hall University, describes the defining features of this prophetic politics as follows: first, "it is a political approach based on the spiritual as well as the temporal dimension of humankind"; second, it is a global approach; and finally, "it is based on reconciliation and religious engagement" (p. 8). As a historian of the modern papacy, I find this construct less than convincing. Perhaps the only original aspect outlined above is the global dimension of John Paul II's political arena, even though in the minds of some this diplomatic outreach commenced with Leo XIII, continued under John XXIII, and was extended by Paul VI. Certainly, the author is correct in the assessment that the global impact of John Paul II was greater than that of his predecessors, but this was due to changes in transportation and communications as much as aspirations and aims that differed dramatically from those of his contemporary predecessors. Furthermore, she writes that this pope "sought to bring about a return to doctrinal orthodoxy, and to set the church on a new course" (p. 37).

The author may be right in her assessment that "the traveling Holy Father" had assumed the status of a "personality for television, radio, press and even internet coverage," but we cannot assume that this broader publicity led to greater support for his policies (pp. 48-49). At any rate, transcending the theo-

retical formulation of "prophetic politics," the author does make some interesting and valid points. She rightly describes John Paul II's role in getting the prelates and hierarchy of Latin America to pursue evangelization rather than politics (p. 12), while examining the influence of Max Scheler on this pope's thought and intellectual development (p. 25). Formicola also explores the crucial role of Joseph Ratzinger, whom he appointed Prefect of the Congregation for the Doctrine of the Faith in 1981 (pp. 34-35). Her emphasis on Ratzinger's impact on this pope and the Church was later confirmed by his selection as John Paul II's successor in 2005.

Appropriately, the final volume here reviewed is on Ratzinger: John L. Allen, Jr., *Pope Benedict XVI: A Biography of Joseph Ratzinger* (New York and London: Continuum. 2005. Pp. xii, 340. $19.95 paperback). Actually, the title of this book is somewhat misleading, for it is essentially a reprint of Allen's earlier biography *Cardinal Ratzinger: The Vatican's Enforcer of the Faith,* which came out in 2000 and was published with this revised title after Ratzinger's election. Consequently, the biography focuses on Ratzinger's formation before becoming pope and in doing so the author, a writer for the *National Catholic Reporter*, has read most of what Ratzinger has written and much of what has been written about him. A journalist more than a historian, Allen has had recourse to a wide variety of sources, including a number of archives in Bavaria and the United States. Furthermore, though a self-proclaimed liberal and post-Vatican II Catholic, he has been balanced in his treatment of this conservative figure as he explores the man, his thought, and pre-papal career. The result, one of the few biographies of Ratzinger in English or any language, makes an important contribution.

In the first introductory chapter "Growing Up in Hitler's Shadow" (pp. 1-44), Allen traces Ratzinger's life from his birth to ordination, placing what follows in perspective, and providing some interesting insights on Ratzinger's analysis of the role of the Catholic Church in Nazi Germany (pp. 25-29). Here, and elsewhere, a number of the author's conclusions are less than convincing. In chapter 2, "An Erstwhile Liberal" (pp. 45-88), and chapter 3, "All Roads Lead to Rome" (pp. 89-130), Allen traces Ratzinger's transformation from the progressive during Vatican II to his subsequent stance as "chief inquisitor" (p. 46). This line is followed in the next four chapters, as can be readily gleaned from their titles: IV: "Authentic Liberation" (pp. 131-174); V: "Cultural Warrior" (pp. 175-215); VI: "Holy Wars" (pp. 216-256); and VII: "The Enforcer" (pp. 257-294). In the eighth and final chapter, "Ratzinger and the Next Conclave" (pp. 295-314), Allen speculates whether Ratzinger might be elected pope, providing four main reasons why his election was unlikely. He does acknowledge he could be wrong, and therefore explores what such a pontificate would mean for the Church and the world were Ratzinger elected. Having been wrong in his assessment of Ratzinger's election, one might well question his analysis of the nature of the pontificate.

REVIEW ARTICLE

NEW LIGHT ON VATICAN COUNCIL II

BY

JARED WICKS, S.J.*

Il concilio inedito. Fonti del Vaticano II. Edited by Massimo Faggioli and Giovanni Turbanti. [Istituto per le scienze religiose—Bologna, Testi e ricerche di scienze religiose, Serie Fonti e strumenti di ricerca, 1.] (Bologna: Il Mulino. 2001. Pp. 164. €12.91 paperback.)

Breve storia del Concilio Vaticano II. By Giuseppe Alberigo. [Universale Paperbacks Il Mulino, 488.] (Bologna: Il Mulino. 2005. Pp. 201. €10.50 paperback.). *A Brief History of Vatican II*. By Giuseppe Alberigo. Translated by Matthew Sherry. (Maryknoll, New York: Orbis Books. 2006. Pp. xiv, 141. $20.00 paperback).

La fatica della libertà. L'elaborazione della dichiarazione Dignitatis humanae *sulla libertà religiosa del Vaticano II*. By Silvia Scatena. [Istituto per le scienze religiose—Bologna, Testi e ricerche di scienze religiose, nuova serie, 31.] (Bologna: Il Mulino. 2003. Pp. 601. €38.00 paperback.)

Recent Vatican II Studies

Readers will be aware of the *History of Vatican II*, published by an international team of scholars co-ordinated by Giuseppe Alberigo of Bologna, of which the English version, supervised by Joseph Komonchak, reached completion with the publication of Volume 5 by Orbis Books in late April 2006. To prepare the five-volume *History*, scholarly conferences were held over the span of the last dozen years of the twentieth century, which allowed the contributors to exchange insights from their findings and discuss their interpretations, based on the *Acta* of the Council and many archives of its participants.[1]

*Father Wicks is a professor of religious studies at John Carroll University, University Heights, Ohio.

[1]Papers from these conferences have been published either at Leuven by Peeters, in *Instrumenta theologica*, the series of the theological faculty of the Catholic University of Leuven, or at Genoa by Marietti or at Bologna by Il Mulino, in the series *Testi e ricerche di scienze religiose, nuova serie* of the Istituto per le scienze religiose of Bologna. These publications are, in chronological order: *Sources locales de Vatican II*,

This new research is possible and necessary, first, because of the now completed publication of the *Acta* of Vatican II in two sections. First came the materials from the 1959-1962 preparation of the Council, the *Acta et Documenta* which gave, in Series I (*Antepraeparatoria*; 14 vols.), thousands of official proposals made by the future Fathers, by pontifical university faculties, and by the congregations of the Roman Curia in 1959-1960 for discussion and decision at Vatican II. Then, Series II (*Praeparatoria*; 13 vols., completed 1995) of the *Acta et Documenta* is the record of the work of the Central Preparatory Commission, which in 1961-1962 evaluated the draft documents produced by the particular preparatory commissions. Then followed the *Acta Synodalia*, a record first of what was said in the Aula during the four periods 1962-1965 and then in seven additional tomes (published 1989-1999) a record of meetings of the Council leadership (Board of Presidents, Moderators) and of the official correspondence during Vatican II of the General Secretary, Msgr. Pericle Felici.[2]

---

eds. Jan Grootaers and Claude Soetens (Leuven, 1990); *À la veille du Concile Vatican II. Vota et réactions en Europe et dans le catholicisme oriental*, eds. Mathijs Lamberigts and Claude Soetens (Leuven, 1992); *Verso il concilio Vaticano II (1960-1962). Passaggi e problemi della preparazione conciliare*, eds. Giuseppe Alberigo and Alberto Melloni (Genoa, 1993); *Vatican II commence . . . Approches Francophones*, ed. Etienne Fouilloux (Leuven, 1993); *Il Vaticano II fra attese e celebrazione*, ed. Giuseppe Alberigo (Bologna, 1995); *Der Beitrag der deutschsprachigen und osteuropäischen Länder zum Zweiten Vatikanischen Konzil*, eds. Klaus Wittstadt and W. Verschooten (Leuven, 1996); *Les Commissions Conciliaires à Vatican II*, eds. Mathijs Lamberigts *et al*. (Leuven, 1996); *Vatican II in Moscow (1959-1965)*, ed. Alberto Melloni (Leuven, 1997); *L'evento e le decisioni. Studi sulle dinamiche del concilio Vaticano II*, eds. Maria T. Fattori and Alberto Melloni (Bologna, 1997). The tenth work of this type is *Volti di fine concilio* (Bologna, 2000), to be treated in the next installment of this review-article on Vatican II.

Three other publications of conference papers on Vatican II deserve mention for their broad scope: *Le deuxième concile du Vatican II (1959-1965). Actes du colloque organisé per l'École française de Rome (28-30 mai 1986)* (Rome, 1989); *Réceptions de Vatican II. Le Concile au risque de l'histoire et des espaces humains*, ed. Gilles Routhier (Leuven, 2004); and *The Contribution of the Belgians to Vatican Council II*, the papers of the September 2005 conference at Malines, Louvain-la-Neuve, and Leuven, in preparation for publication by Peeters of Leuven.

[2]Francisco Gil Hellín, now Archbishop of Burgos, Spain, is bringing out a series of *Synopses*, of which six have appeared to date. These take from the *Acta Synodalia* numerous Latin texts, in order to facilitate genetic study of particular Vatican II documents and to show how oral and written interventions by the Council Fathers contributed to the successive revisions of the texts. The *Synopses* give in parallel columns the initial draft, intermediate drafts, and the final text, along with both the general and particular *Relationes*, in which the responsible conciliar commissions explain their approach and the particular wording of each text presented to the Council. In lengthy appendices, Gil Hellín gives the oral and written comments by the Fathers through which they influenced the formulation of the successive drafts. The first such volume was *Concilii Vaticani II Synopsis. . . . Constitutio dogmatica de divina revelatione Dei Verbum*, ed. Francisco Gil Hellín (pp. xxix, 744; Vatican City: Liberia Editrice Vaticana, 1993). After *Dei Verbum*, the same editor and publisher have brought out *Synopses* of

A second enabling condition of new Vatican II research is the organization and opening of many archives of the Council, a development of major importance for historical understanding both of the Council's drama and of its final documents. The primary archive is the special section, *Fondo Concilium Vaticanum II*, of the Archivio segreto Vaticano, made up of some two thousand boxes of Council papers, which may be consulted with the ordinary permission of the Prefect, under the ruling of Pope Paul VI in favor of early study of these sources.[3] This Vatican archive gives unique support to systematic study of the Vatican II commissions, both those that worked during the preparatory period 1959-1962 and the conciliar commissions of 1962-1965, since the published *Acta* give only the final versions of the texts and *relationes* produced by the commissions.

Around the world, many other archives are now accessible, which preserve, with different degrees of organization, the papers of the Council Fathers, the official observers, and the many assisting *periti* of Vatican II. The first book reviewed below is an initial survey of such archival troves of Vatican II documentation.

On this broad basis of sources, several Vatican II documents have recently been studied comprehensively in their genesis and development, spanning the years from initial proposals made by the future Council Fathers in 1959-60, through the stages of redaction, aula discussion, revision, further discussion, voting with submitted *modi*, and final emendation before the definitive approval and promulgation. One such study, on *Dignitatis humanae* by S. Scatena, figures directly in this review essay, while similar scholarly works on *Gaudium et spes* by G. Turbanti and on *Christus Dominus* by M. Faggioli will be treated in a further installment. But three other works of this genre deserve brief mention to complete the picture of this type of work.

Riccardo Burigana studied Vatican II's *Dogmatic Constitution on Divine Revelation* in the main lines of its dramatic development.[4] Central in this account is the draft-text *De fontibus revelationis*, produced by the Preparatory Theological Commission, but which was sharply criticized in the aula in November 1962 and then revised in 1962-63. The first revision was the work of a mixed ecumenical and doctrinal commission created by Pope John XXIII, but the draft then passed under the aegis of the Doctrinal Commission, for further revision in the light of successive and numerous comments by the Fathers. Burigana's

---

Lumen Gentium (1995), *Presbyterorum Ordinis* (1996), *Sacrosanctum Concilium* (2003), *Gaudium et Spes* (2003), and *Unitatis Redintegratio* (2005).

[3] For orientation to the general contents of the boxes of the *Fondo*, a summary inventory may be consulted, the *Elenco di cosistenza del fondo* (131 pages, for internal use only). Work has begun on a detailed inventory of the Archive's vast assemblage of Vatican II documentation, of which the first results may also be consulted in bound typescripts in the Indices Room of the Vatican Archive.

[4] *La Bibbia nel concilio. La redazione della costituzione «Dei verbum» del Vaticano II*. Testi e ricerche di scienze religiose, nuova serie, 21 (Bologna: Il Mulino, 1998).

work remains basic for *Dei Verbum*, a fundamental doctrinal statement of the Council, but Burigana leaves ample room for further work on the theologies that clashed amid the discussion and on the doctrinal positions that emerged and are present today "in, with, and under" the final text of the Constitution. Such theological analysis of *Dei Verbum* has been undertaken in works by Hanjo Sauer,[5] Gianluca Montaldi,[6] and the author of this review-article.[7]

Joachim Schmiedl has contributed a particularly solid study of Vatican II's *Decree on the Up-to-date Renewal of Religious Life*.[8] Schmiedl adds depth to his study by beginning with an ample survey of religious life in modern times and under the reforming impulses and checks stemming from Pope Pius XII. His treatment of the genesis and development of *Perfectae caritatis* draws on the archive of the relevant preparatory and conciliar commissions, still kept in the Vatican Congregation for Consecrated Life, and is then enhanced by a final chapter on post-conciliar developments in religious orders and congregations.

Alois Greiler treated the background, genesis, and significance of Vatican II's *Decree on the Training of Priests*.[9] This work gained notably from the author's personal interviews with surviving Council participants, especially with the Secretary of the responsible conciliar commission, Cardinal Augustin Mayer, and with an active member, Archbishop Dennis Hurley of Durban, South Africa. Grieler moves on from his account of the complex development and initial implementation of *Optatum totius* to a concise but valuable "genetic commentary" on the final text in his penultimate chapter.

[5]*Erfahrung und Glaube: die Begründung des pastoralen Prizips durch die Offenbarungskonstitution des II. Vatikanischen Konzils*. Würzburger Studien zur Fundamentaltheologie, 12 (Frankfurt/M: Peter Lang, 1993).

[6]*In fide ipsa essentia revelationis completur. Il tema della fede nell'evolversi del concilio Vaticano II: la genesi di DV 5-6 e i suoi riflessi su ulteriori ambiti conciliari*. Tesi Gregoriana, Serie Teologia, 126 (Rome: Gregorian University Press, 2005).

[7]Based on the Council papers of Pieter Smulders, held by the Katholiek Documentatie Centrum, Nijmegen, The Netherlands, I have told of his work related to the Constitution on Divine Revelation under the general title, "Pieter Smulders and *Dei Verbum*," in five articles, with appended documents, bearing these subtitles: (1) "A Consultation on the Eve of Vatican II," *Gregorianum* 82 (2001) 241-297; (2) "On *De fontibus revelationis* during Vatican II's First Period, 1962," ibid., pp. 559-593; (3) "Developing the Understanding of Revelation to Israel, 1962-63," ibid., 83 (2002) 225-267; (4) "Assessing the Mixed Commission's 1962 Work on Scripture/Tradition and Biblical Insporation," ibid., 85 (2004) 242-277; and (5) "A Critical Reception of the Schema *De revelatione* of the Mixed Commission (1963)," ibid., 86 (2005), 92-136. A sixth article still to come will review Smulders's work as a principal drafter of Chap. I, on revelation itself, of the successful *textus emendatus* completed in late spring 1964.

[8]*Das Konzil und die Orden: Krise und Erneuerung des gottgeweihten Lebens* (Vallendar-Schönstatt: Patris, 1999).

[9]*Das Konzil und die Seminare: Die Ausbilding der Priester in der Dynamik des Zweiten Vatikanums*. Annua Nuntia Lovaniensia, 48 (Leuven: Peeters, 2003). I reviewed this work in *Theological Studies* 67 (2006), 205-206.

For on-going information on the ocean of recent publications concerning Vatican Council II, the reader can receive valuable reports in the chronicles offered annually by Gilles Routhier in *Laval théologique et philosophique* and by Massimo Faggioli in *Cristianesimo nella storia*.[10]

This new research on Vatican Council II has also stirred controversy, symptomatic of which are critical reviews published by the energetic former Vatican diplomat and present-day curial Archbishop, Agostino Marchetto.[11] These reviews target especially "the Bologna school" headed by Giuseppe Alberigo, with the new five-volume *History* and its preparatory volumes. For Marchetto this school lacks a proper sensibility for the continuity present in the Council's *aggiornamento* and for the fidelity to tradition characterizing Vatican II's renewal of the Catholic Church. Instead of closely attending to the final results framed in the Council's texts of doctrine and reform, this group, according to Marchetto, presents Vatican II (1) as marked by sharp conflict, (2) as often untrue to the genial orientation given by John XXIII, and (3) in its overall significance being an "event" marking a sharp change and a new beginning. For this energetic and persistent critic, it is wrong to present Vatican II as a Catholic U-turn, because in fact it moved ahead in basically the same overall direction of the Catholic tradition, especially under the sure guidance of Pope Paul VI.

The controversy over the meaning of Vatican Council II received a surprisingly long treatment in Pope Benedict XVI's Christmas audience for staff-members of the Roman Curia on December 22, 2005, in which he was critical of "a hermeneutic of discontinuity and rupture," which the Pope sees as operative and troublesome across the span of the forty-year reception of Vatican II.[12] However, the Pope's alternative proposal does not simply affirm Vatican II's continuity with modern Catholicism. Instead of continuity, he recommends the application of "a hermeneutic of reform," which will be sensitive to Pope John's proposal of a demanding synthesis of fidelity and dynamic movement. As the work of the Council developed, Vatican II came to deal creatively with

[10]G. Routhier's reviews began appearing, as "Recherches et publications récentes autour de Vatican II," in *Laval théologique et philosophique* 53 (1997), 435-454, and have continued in further volumes of the same journal: 55 (1999), 115-149, 56 (2000), 543-585, 58 (2002), 177-203, 59 (2003), 583-606, 60 (2004), 561-577, 61 (2005), 613-653. M. Faggioli began his reports with "Concilio Vaticano II. Bolletino bibliographico (2000-2002)," in *Cristianesimo nella storia* 24 (2003), 335-360, and covered the period 2003-2005 in the same journal: 26 (2005), 743-768.

[11]Marchetto's book-reviews are collected in the fifty-two short chapters of *Il Concilio Ecumenico Vaticano II: Contrappunto per la sua storia* (Vatican City, Liberia Editrice Vaticana, 2005). For those who know only about the title of this work, I point out that it does not offer a source-based analysis of Vatican II, but instead concise summaries and sharply phrased assessments of recently published works. It is not an alternative history of the Council.

[12]Pope Benedict XVI, "Interpreting Vatican II," *Origins* 35, no. 32 (January 26, 2006), 534-39, esp. 536-39.

three clusters of issues posed by developments of modern thought and modern life, namely, faith and critical scholarship, the Church and the modern state, and Christian faith and world religions. Here Vatican II was a reform council undertaking corrections of aspects of Catholic teaching and life. The Council did embrace a type of discontinuity, while acting in agreement with undercurrents of permanent principles. This, according to Pope Benedict, was the Council's response at "the time . . . when broad new thinking was required."

The present review of three recent works on Vatican II is written in the conviction that solid work has been done recently, not only on the different and complex itineraries of the Council's documents, but also in proposals of more capacious interpretations. Both the former and latter deserve to be more widely known, because they can move a person beyond simplistic interpretations of the Council (e.g., "Pope John wanted to open the windows," "the Council's openness to the modern world"), which are no more than a soundbite or a facile phrase well-adapted to a bumper sticker.

Also, for well-grounded theological and ecclesial thinking on the topics addressed by Vatican II, the newly accessible historical record reveals how the intense work of the Council gave rise to important proposals, of which many found their way into the final documents, but some of which fell by the way. Both complexes of ideas deserve appreciative consideration even forty years after the end of Vatican II.[13]

A Guidebook to Dispersed Vatican II Sources

M. Faggioli and G. Turbanti are associated with the *Fondazione per le scienze religiose Giovanni XXII* directed by Professor Giuseppe Alberigo in Bologna. Their book, *Il concilio inedito* (2000), is a valuable research-instrument which offers information on papers circulating at Vatican II and left as archival contents by 772 individuals and twenty-three institutions such as embassies to the Holy See and episcopal conferences.[14] The body of the

[13]A recent major project of theological interpretation of Vatican II is *Herders theologischer Kommentar zum zweiten Vatikanischen Konzil*, eds. Peter Hünermann & Bernd Jochen Hilberath, 5 vols. (Freiburg: Herder, 2004-2006). In this work, vol. 1 is a bilingual Latin-German edition of the Vatican II documents, vols. 2-4 give commentaries on the Council documents by German-speaking theologians, and vol. 5 offers a theological overview and further perspectives on the whole Council. Herder has also announced for release later in 2006 a further work, *Das Zweite Vatikanische Konzil und die Zeichen der Zeit heute. Anstöße zur weiteren Rezeption*, ed. Peter Hünermann. The next installment of this review-article will offer a report on selected orientations of this German project.

[14]I reviewed the volume in *Gregorianum* 84 (2003), 209-211, but here I offer new information and further considerations. A. Marchetto's review is in *Il Concilio Vaticano II. Contrappunto*, pp. 336-339. Marchetto engages in a fencing match with the Faggioli-Turbanti Introduction (pp. 7-34), but offers no account or appreciation of the information given in the body of the book (pp. 41-155).

work gives under each person or institution the status of their Vatican II papers, covering 449 Council members, 185 *periti*, fifty-three Christian observers and guests of the Secretariat for Promoting Christian Unity, ten lay and religious auditors, and thirteen journalists who reported on Vatican II. The listing identifies the status of the papers, that is, whether extant or not, whether inventoried, whether accessible to scholars, and whether published in any part or form.

We learn from *Il concilio inedito* about forty-six diaries or memoirs of Council Fathers and about twenty-four diaries kept by *periti*. But the survey carried out to locate these materials also revealed that Council papers are not extant for ca. 175 of the 772 individuals about whom inquiry was made. Some of the existing collections were not at the time open to scholars, such as the papers of bishops of dioceses which place an embargo on personal papers for a set number of years. Also, the papers of important figures of Vatican II, such as Cardinal Alfredo Ottaviani and other commission presidents, fell under the practice applied when a cardinal of the Roman Curia dies, namely, that his extant papers go into the general Vatican Secret Archive and so the Vatican II portion of their documents is not open to scholars under the more liberal rule of accessibility laid down by Paul VI for the special Council Archive.

Along with the dispersed papers listed by Faggioli and Turbanti, Council scholarship must of course make use of the Vatican Archive's *Fondo Concilium Vaticanum II*. One recent discovery underscores the value of this collection, namely, the finding of thirteen notebooks containing the ample *Diarium Secretarii* kept by Father Sebastian Tromp, S.J., from June 6, 1959 to April 1, 1966, offering a detailed record of the meetings and movement of texts in both the Preparatory Theological and Conciliar Doctrinal Commissions.[15]

When Faggioli and Turbanti published *Il concilio inedito*, they knew their coverage was not complete, but they hoped to stimulate a wider circulation of information on troves of Council papers and even foster discovery of collec-

[15]Numerous researchers, including several contributors to *History of Vatican II,* have made use of Tromp's mimeographed *Relationes Secretarii*, regularly given to the commission members and *periti*, which summarize the work of the two commissions. While the *Relationes* are informative, they select from what the *Diarium* records in superabundant detail. The latter source was first used by its finder, Alexandra von Teuffenbach, in her Gregorian University dissertation, *Die Bedeutung des* subsistit in *(LG 8). Zum Selbstverständnis der katholischen Kirche* (Munich: Herbert Utz, 2002), in which she describes the thirteen volumes of the *Diarium* on pp. 68-70.—After this review-article began, A. von Teuffenbach brought out the first volume, in two parts totaling 965 pages, of what will be a five-volume edition, *Diarium/Konzilstagebuch Sebastian Tromp SJ, mit Erläuterungen und Akten aus der Arbeit der Theologischen Kommission II. Vaticanisches Konzil*, Band I/1-2 (1960-1962) (Rome: Editrice Pont. Università Gregoriana, 2006).

tions which escaped the net of their survey.[16] They hoped as well to motivate archivists around the world to organize Council papers under their care and to publish inventories. Several on-line inventories do exist, as for the Council papers at Notre Dame of Cardinal John Dearden and Bishops Roger E. Lucey and Marcos McGrath, and published inventories have come out for the papers of Belgian participants in the Council kept at Leuven and Louvain-la-Neuve.[17] A recent major addition, a model of its genre, is the published inventory of the Vatican II papers, no less than 5,387 items now in Munich, of Cardinal Julius Döpfner, one of the four Moderators installed by Paul VI in 1963.[18]

In conclusion, we recall that the published *Acta et Documenta* of Vatican II's preparation (1956-1962) and the *Acta Synodalia* of the working periods (1962-1965) give only the final form both of members' interventions and of

[16]One lacuna in *Il Concilio inedito* was filled by the discovery in the archive of the Séminaire Français in Rome of Vatican II papers of the then Archbishop of Toulouse, Gabriel Garrone, a member of the Council's Doctrinal Commission, who made a significant early contribution to *De revelatione* and late in Vatican II chaired the Central Commission overseeing the final revisions leading to the Pastoral Constitution *Gaudium et spes*. A first use of these papers, concerning Garrone's interaction with Jean Daniélou, was in the Gregorian University dissertation of Pietro Pizzuto, *La teologia della rivelazione di Jean Daniélou. Influsso su* Dei Verbum *e valore attuale*, Tesi Gregoriana, Serie Teologia, 96 (Rome: Gregorian University, 2003).—Also not mentioned by Faggioli-Turbanti are the Council materials, including a diary, left in the Gregorian University archive by Father Ramon Bidagor, S.J., Secretary of the Conciliar Commssion on the Sacraments.—For the 168 Christian observers and guests, a survey and analysis going beyond Faggioli-Turbanti has been given by Mauro Velati, "Gli osservatori non cattolici al Vaticano II: fonti e documentazione," *Cristianesimo nella storia*, 23 (2001), 459-485.

[17]The Center for Study of Vatican Council II in the Theology Faculty of the Catholic University of Leuven, has published with Peeters the following inventories: *Repertorium van de documenten in het Archief Monseigneur Willy Onclin*, edited by Constant van de Wiel (Leuven, 1998), *Emiel-Josef De Smedt, Papers of Vatican II, Inventory*, eds. Alois Greiler and L. De Saeger (Leuven, 1999), *Inventaire des papiers conciliaires de Monseigneur Gérard Philips, secrétaire adjoint de la commission doctrinale*, edited by Leo Declerck and W. Verschooten (Leuven, 2001), and *Inventaires des papiers conciliaires de Monsiegneur J. M. Heuschen, Éveque auxiliaire de Liège, membre de la Commission doctrinale, e du Professeur V. Heylen*, edited by Leo Declerck (Leuven, 2005). The Center Lumen Gentium of the Catholic University of Louvain, Louvain-la-Neuve, published *Concile Vatican II et église contemporaine (Archives de Louvain-le-Neuve)*, edited by Claude Soetens *et al.*, 4 vols. (Louvain-la-Neuve, 1989-1995), giving inventories of the papers of C. Moeller, G. Thils, F. Houtart, A. Prignon, H. Wagon, P. Delhaye, J. Dupont, and B. Olivier.

[18]*Erzbischöfliches Archiv München Julius Kardinal Döpfner. Archivarinventar der Dokumente zum Zweiten Vatikanischen Konzil*, eds. Guido Treffler & Peter Pfister, Schriften des Archivs des Erzbistums München und Freising, 6 (Regensburg: Schnell und Schneider, 2004). Amid much else, this work makes clear Cardinal Döpfner's constant gathering of expert comments on the Council's draft documents, for which he drew on the services of *periti* such as J. Hirschmann, H. Jedin, K. Mörsdorf, J. Ratzinger, K. Rahner, M. Schmaus, and K. Tilmann.

draft texts produced in the particular commissions, which worked intensely during the three inter-sessions of January to July 1963, 1964, and 1965. The papers and diaries catalogued by Faggioli and Turbanti enable one to see, first, how numerous oral and written interventions of the Council members were prepared and drafted, and, second, the stages of work in the preparatory and conciliar commissions which led to Council drafts and revised texts. To be sure, the texts given in the *Acta* do convey their essential meaning, but their genesis has to be considered if one is to understand historically the options incarnated in these texts.[19] Some proposals generated under the intense stimulus of the Council, which were not accepted then from members and *periti*, might well deserve consideration for what they can contribute to theological thinking and church practice today. Much remains to be learned about the major church-historical event that was Vatican Council II. An updated and expanded edition of *Il concilio inedito* will offer essential guidance to further historical work on Vatican II.

From Giuseppe Alberigo, a Compact Vatican II History

The Bologna-based director of the *History of Vatican II*, Giuseppe Alberigo, has now told the Council story in a volume notable in concision and striking in interpretations of the conciliar event and texts. Those who have read Alberigo's chapters in the *History* will meet familiar judgments in the new volume, and they will also learn more, as when Alberigo refers to a memorandum by Cardinal Augustin Bea on October 15, 1962, in which Bea's study of Pope John XXIII's opening discourse of just three days before led him to an impressive formulation of programmatic goals and criteria to guide the work of Vatican 0 The impulses given to Vatican II by Pope John XXIII constitute for Alberigo a set of interpretive norms which function throughout the new volume. Pope John meant to set in motion an epochal change in the church, ending the regime of Tridentine and anti-modern principles, by the "new Pentecost" of far-reaching evangelical renewal.[21] Beyond his discourse opening

[19]A recurrent refrain in A. Marchetto's reviews (note 11, above) is his assertion of the primacy of the published *Acta* in any interpretation of Vatican II and its documents. But the *Acta Synodalia* document next to nothing about (1) the work of commission *periti* in collecting relevant points made by the Fathers on drafts under discussion, (2) the preliminary draft revisions written by *periti* and subcommissions of members, and (3) the debates in full commission meetings over the revisions to include or to exclude from the emended text being prepared. For tracing these crucial genetic steps, one has to have recourse to the largely unpublished papers of the relevant commissions and of the individuals who took part in the processes.

[20]Alberigo, *Breve storia*, pp. 165-166; *Brief History*, p. 121 Bea's text is given in *Acta Synodalia Sacrosancti Concilii Oecumenici Vaticani II*, Vol. VI, *Acta Secretariae Generalis*, Part I, *Periodus Prima 1962* (Vatican City, 1996), pp. 200-204.

[21]John XXIII's intended event of *transizione epocale* meant to open a new historical phase of Gospel witness and proclamation by the Church, given new vigor by recovering

Vatican II, John framed his legacy in late 1962 and early 1963 (1) by repeatedly underscoring the primacy of pastoral and ecumenical renewal, which ruled out condemnations and new dogmas, (2) by instituting a directorate of seven cardinals, the Commission on Coordinating the Labors of the Council, to impress these aims on the commissions then preparing revised and more concise draft texts, and (3) by an eloquent letter, *Mirabilis ille*, which John sent to all council members under date of January 6, 1963, and which he wrote in full knowledge of the malignant tumor which would soon end his life.

In his new volume Alberigo makes clear the formative influence on his view of John XXIII and his interpretation of the Council exercised by Don Giuseppe Dossetti, the one-time member of the Italian Parliament who after ordination became, beyond being Alberigo's mentor in historical work, the trusted conciliar advisor of Cardinal Giacomo Lercaro of Bologna. The new *Breve storia* relates that on February 23, 1965, Cardinal Lercaro gave in Rome a lecture prepared by Dossetti on Pope John, which in Dossetti's conclusion (not read by Lercaro) proposed that Vatican II complete its work by canonizing Pope John, in order to place beyond any reversal or mitigation the exceptional impulses given by the Holy Spirit through John XXIII, namely, the great theses of evangelical optimism, a church more spiritual and dedicated to being one with the poor, the ecumenical commitment, and the service of peace in the world.[22]

Amid factors making for mitigation of the Johannine impulses, Alberigo relates the organized activity of 1964 and 1965 of the *Coetus internationalis Patrum*, led by Bishops Luigi Carli and Marcel Lefebvre, and several retarding influences of the Curia through the Secretary of State, Amleto G. Cicognani, and the Council's General Secretary, Pericle Felici. With Pope Paul VI, these voices at times gained a hearing, especially as they played on his firm intention to have Vatican II both safeguard Petrine primatial authority and issue documents backed by a morally unanimous *placet* of its members. John XXIII's early interventions had aimed to facilitate manifestations of the deepest convictions of the Council members, as when he acted on November 21, 1962, to remove from the immediate Council agenda the *Schema de fontibus revelationis*. While Alberigo can express admiration for the patient mediation and constancy with which Paul VI brought Vatican II "into port," he also relates inter-

---

elements both permanent and powerful from the early Christian tradition. *Breve storia*, p. 26; *Brief History*, p. 10. "New Pentecost" was Pope John's designation of Vatican II with a typical Christian term but also one expressing the exceptional character of the moment and placing first the action of the Holy Spirit, for whom Pope, Council, and Church are subordinate instruments. *Breve storia,* p. 163; *Brief History*, p. 119. We first read this in *History of Vatican II*, vol. 1, *Announcing and Preparing Vatican Council II*, p. 42.

[22] *Breve storia*, pp. 131-133; *Brief History*, pp. 93-95. Lercaro's lecture is in *Discorsi conciliari del card. Giacomo Lercaro. Per la forza dello Spirito* (Bologna, 1984), pp. 287-310. A diary entry of Angelina Nicora Alberigo expressed wonder why Bea was the only cardinal present at Lercaro's lecture. *Breve storia*, p. 131; *Brief History*, p. 93.

ventions, such as the *Nota praevia* to Chapter III of *Lumen gentium*, which for him mitigated and even frustrated the expression of the convictions of the majority of Paul VI's brother bishops.[23]

What John XXIII wanted Vatican II to be, as Dossetti and Alberigo read this, was by no means realized consistently in the Council's documents. Because of fears spread by a small anti-collegiality minority, *Lumen gentium* in the end obfuscates its central intent and lacks clarity and incisiveness. Thus, the promulgations of the third period (1964) issued texts of diminished vigor. *Gaudium et spes* is weakened by mixing theology and sociology, evangelical optimism and the naive Western confidence in progress through technology, while being superficial on war and peace.[24] Some decrees on church practice hardly correspond with the main intentions of Vatican II, but are heavy with preconciliar, retrospective directives. Where evangelical content breaks through, it is not consistently applied. The documents leave huge omissions, such as "the church of the poor," reform of the Curia, the condemnation of racism, and any appreciation of the feminine condition. Even the great documents, *Sacrosanctum Concilium* and *Dei Verbum*, lack the pneumatological dimension needed to protect them from superficial readings.[25]

Precisely because Alberigo's new history is short, these negative judgments leave a strong impression, but they do co-exist with a parallel impact of Alberigo's numerous positive judgments about Vatican II. The Council did break free of the 1959-1962 preparation oriented toward consolidation of the doctrine and practice of 1890 to 1958, for example, the earlier deductive

[23]Concisely on this contrast: *Breve storia*, pp. 170-171; *Brief History*, p. 125. But reservations about Paul VI are a continual refrain. On the *Nota praevia* to Vatican II's chapter on episcopal collegiality, an addition which clarifies how the Pope can exercise his authority personally, Alberigo conveys a sharply negative interpretation by quoting at some length Don Dossetti's letter of November 15, 1964, to Paul VI's theologian, Bishop Carlo Colombo, to express the "unspeakable bitterness" with which Dossetti's group was reacting to the *Nota*. Colombo and others have given Paul VI bad advice on this intervention, which will leave many depressed and wounded and which Dossetti wants communicated respectfully to the Pope himself. *Breve storia,* pp. 109-110; *Brief History*, pp. 74-76.

[24]The Pastoral Constitution, for Alberigo, suffers from Vatican II having insufficient time to frame the new attitude to the modern world in adequate conceptual formulations drawn from the Christian sources. Moreover, major work on *Gaudium et spes* was done in late 1964 and throughout 1965, when theological fissures had begun to weaken the cohesion of the Council majority. *Breve storia*, pp. 114, 141, 154-156; *Brief History*, pp. 78, 100-101, 113-115.

[25]*Breve storia*, pp. 99-100 and 119; *Brief History*, pp. 66-67 (*Lumen gentium* weakened and unclear). *Breve storia*, p. 125; *Brief History*, p. 87 (on the texts of 1964). *Breve storia*, pp. 156-157; *Brief History*, p. 115 (problematic tensions in *Gaudium et spes*). *Breve storia*, pp 157 and 169; *Brief History*, pp. 115 and 124 (texts of 1965 disharmonious with the central intent; absences in key places of the Holy Spirit). *Breve* storia, p. 167; *Brief History*, pp. 122-123 (the omissions).

method in social teaching. The Liturgy Constitution did anticipate significant points of the ecclesiology then imperfectly presented in *Lumen gentium*. The Council did resolutely portray Catholic life as being *in*, and not apart from, history. Vatican II's advance from its preparation to its end was "a masterwork of the Spirit," who fused the many very different individual participants into an overriding unity of purpose, as they espoused with huge majorities the sacramental character and collegiality of the episcopate, ecumenism, Scripture as central in Catholic life, religious liberty, and the great statement of *Nostra aetate* on relations with the Jewish people.[26]

Thus Alberigo has offered an account of Vatican II that is impressively informative in spite of its brevity, while being both passionate and complex in its assessments. In dialogue with Alberigo, I offer first a small correction, namely, that it was not Pope John XXIII who placed *De sacra liturgia* at the head of the Council agenda in 1962, but instead the Council of Presidents by a close vote.[27] Second, in the account of the Council's preparation, the 1961-62 work of the Central Preparatory Commission, a veritable mini-council, deserves more than the perfunctory notice given in the *Brief History*. During its meetings, the future leaders of the majority, Bea, Frings, Suenens, Alfrink, Liénart, Döpfner, Léger, and König, found themselves together and allied in their dissatisfaction over much of the preparatory work on draft texts. The meetings of the Central Commission included some remarkable confrontations, such as between Bea and Ottaviani over the *Schema de fontibus* (November 10, 1961) and Montini's warning about the "great damage" that the chapter on church-state relations of the *Schema de ecclesia* would inflict on the Catholic Church if it were ever passed by the Council (June 19, 1962).[28] Third, on Paul VI's different interventions to amend documents, which Alberigo

[26]*Breve storia*, pp. 46 and 52-54; *Brief History*, pp. 24 and 29-30 (moving away from the preparation during Period I of 1962, e.g., by the initial pause to prepare elections to the commissions, by torching the prepared *De ecclesia* in early December). *Breve storia*, pp. 167-168; *Brief History*, p. 123 (away from deductive social teaching). *Breve storia*, pp. 52, 64-65, 86, and 90; *Brief History*, pp. 29, 38-39, 55-56, and 59 (ecclesiological gems in *Sacrosanctum Concilium*). *Breve storia*, pp. 168-169; *Brief History*, pp. 123-125 (the Church in history). *Breve* storia, pp. 174-175; *A Brief History*, pp. 128-129 (a work of the Spirit leading Council members toward the major decisions).

[27]*Breve storia*, p. 48; *Brief History*, p. 25. See A. G. Martimort, "Les débats liturgiques lors de la première Période du Concile Vatican II (1962)," in *Vatican II commence . . . Approches Francophones*, edited by É. Fouilloux (Leuven: Peeters, 1993), pp. 291-314, at p. 297, with reference to a 5-4 vote of the Presidents on October 15, 1962, recorded in *Acta Synodalia*, V/1 (1989), pp. 17-18.

[28]*Acta et Documenta Concilio Oecumenico Vaticano II Apparando, Series II (Preparatoria)*, Vol. II, Part I (Vatican City, 1965), pp. 546-548 (Bea), and Part IV (Vatican City, 1968), p. 729 (Montini). Five weeks after his criticism of *De fontibus* in the meeting of the full Central Preparatory Commission, Bea sent extensive further criticisms to that Commission's sub commission on amendments, as now given in *Acta et Documenta*, Vol. IV, Part III/1, pp. 33-45 (letter of December 15, 1961, with a detailed *Annexum*).

judges critically, it has to be kept in mind that Vatican II's Rules were defective in making no provision for the Pope to make known his views, his own *modi*, at specific moments in the genesis of the documents.[29]

A fourth point concerns Pope John XXIII's opening discourse of the Council, on which Alberigo has done fundamental interpretive work.[30] But even more light on that great text can come from a further perspective, namely, by setting it beside what stands first in Vatican Council I (1869-1870). Pope John's innovative intention emerges sharply when his encouraging, optimistic words of October 11, 1962, are contrasted with the *Prooemium* added just before the promulgation of Vatican I's Constitution *Dei Filius*. There Vatican I looked back, first in gratitude to divine providence for the benefits that its predecessor the Council of Trent had brought to the ecclesial body of Christ, but then at length in "profound grief" over the evils afflicting the modern world that had rejected Trent. These evils pass in review: first, the confused sects of Protestantism, then the deistic undermining of faith in Christ, and, in recent times, the atheism that threatens to destroy the foundations of society.[31] This is a further perspective which reveals that Pope John did mean for Vatican II to bring about an "epochal transition" in Catholic perceptions of and engagement with the modern world.

A Difficult Itinerary: *Dignitatis humanae* on Religious Freedom

A recent dense study of Vatican II's epoch-making document on religious liberty has been presented by Silvia Scatena, also a collaborator with Giuseppe Alberigo. Her work rests on extensive archival study, for example, at Georgetown University (J. C. Murray papers), at Leuven (Bishop E.-J. De Smedt papers), at Louvain-la-Neuve (papers of J. Dupont and A. Prignon), and in the assembled papers at the Insitute in Bologna (copies of World Council of Churches papers, along with papers of Cardinal Lercaro and of the Dominican *peritus*, R. Gagnebet).

Scatena's work is especially informative on interventions by the Council's *periti*, both in formulating the successive draft-texts of *De libertate religiosa*

[29]This omission was pointed out by Joseph Ratzinger, *Theological Highlights of Vatican II* (New York: Paulist, 1966), p. 106.

[30]See *Dalla laguna al Tevere. Angelo Giuseppe Roncali da San Marco al San Pietro* (Bologna: Il Mulino, 2000), pp. 157-190 (Ch. VIII, "L'allocuzione *Gaudet mater ecclesia*").

[31]Vatican I's *Prooemium* is given in *Decrees of the Ecumenical Councils*, edited by Norman Tanner (London: Sheed and Ward, and Washington, D.C.: Georgetown University Press, 1990), pp. 804-805. Its account of the genealogy of modern errors was popular in nineteenth century Catholic apologetics, e.g., in writings of Jaime Balmes and in pastoral letters of 1850 by Italian bishops guided by Pope Pius IX. On the latter, see the Introduction by Giovanni Miccoli to *Lutero in Italia. Studi storici nel V centenario della nascita*, edited by L. Perrone (Casale Monferrato: Marietti, 1983), pp. IX-XXXIII.

and in evaluations which they circulated, with a view to educating the Council members concerning these drafts. The topic of religious freedom was not one to which many Council members brought a good understanding of the problematic. The *periti* became especially important, but they were not of one mind on religious liberty. As she gives voice to the *pertiti*, Scatena makes clear how this declaration was constantly troubled by the differences between the approaches of those who commented on its drafts and thereby influenced the positions taken by members of the Council. A large majority at Vatican II came to accept that the Council should issue a declaration on religious freedom, but this majority did not agree on how to frame the central notion, how to ground it in Christian sources, how to relate it to previous Catholic teaching, and how to show the universal scope of the declaration.[32]

Scatena mentions briefly that at the end of the pontificate of Pius XII the Holy Office of Cardinal Ottaviani was preparing to censure a syllabus of untraditional and unacceptable views advanced recently by authors such as Jacques Maritain and J. C. Murray on the lay character of the state and the natural right to freedom of religious inquiry and practice.[33] Religious freedom was a controverted issue in the 1950's. But once Pope John XXIII announced his inten-

[32]At the international conference, *The Contribution of the Belgians to Vatican Council II*, held at Leuven, Malines, and Louvain-la-Neuve, September 12-16, 2005, Silvia Scatena's paper, "Emiel De Smedt, John Courtney Murray and Religious Freedom," brought out sharply the differences over presenting religious freedom that troubled the relationship between Murray the *peritus* and Bishop De Smedt the *Relator,* who repeatedly spoke before the Council to introduce revised versions of the draft-text *De libertate religiosa*. De Smedt, on more than one occasion, took over advice given to him on this issue by Dom Jacques Dupont, O.S.B.

[33]The Holy Office consultor, Rosario Gagnebet, O.P., assembled in 1957 a list of forty-two deviant propositions on the church-state relation. See É. Fouilloux, "Du rôle des théologiens au début de Vatican II: un point de vue romain," in *Christianesimo nella storia. Saggi in onore di Giuseppe Alberigo*, edited by A. Melloni *et al*. (Bologna: Il Mulino, 1996), pp. 279-311, at pp. 288-292. J. A. Komonchak, "The Silencing of John Courtney Murray," *ibid.*, pp. 657-702, recalls the work of Antonio Messineo, S.J., who published in the early 1950's no fewer than nineteen articles in *La Civiltà cattolica* against Maritain's views, for example, as stated in *Man and the State* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1951), Chap. VI, but also attacking Murray's proposal that Catholic doctrine did not imply the necessity, where possible, that a state should espouse confessionally the Catholic faith (p. 666). The same contribution then relates (pp. 698-701) the drafting in early 1958 of a Holy Office declaration on the "classical and immutable" position regarding a state's duties to the true Church, leading to what would be the censure of twenty-one propositions, assembled by Gagnebet, which had been found in writings of Catholics like Maritain and Murray. The death of Pope Pius XII in October 1958 and the ecumenical orientations of Pope John XXIII ended this *démarche* and less than eight years later, the Council passed *Dignitatis humanae*, which was confirmed and promulgated by Paul VI, who readily acknowledged the formative influence on himself of the thought of Jacques Maritain. On the latter point, see Philippe Chenaux, *Paul VI et Maritain* (Rome: Studium, 1994).

tion to convoke the Council, spokesmen for the World Council of Churches began urging that Vatican II review and treat in a fresh way the Catholic position on religious freedom. At its first plenary meeting in November 1960, the Secretariat for Promoting Christian Unity formed a sub-commission to prepare a proposal on "tolerance" in civil society. Bishop De Smedt emerged as the leader, with Jérôme Hamer, O.P., ably assisting from the beginning and Gustave Weigel, S.J., making known the views of his Woodstock colleague, J. C. Murray.

In the sub commission, a text prepared for De Smedt in late 1960 by Louis Janssens of Louvain, on tolerance, co-operation with non-Catholics, and the relation of Church and state became the starting point of SPCU work.[34] But early in the Secretariat's work, Charles Boyer, S.J., of the Gregorian, registered his disagreement with a text which remained silent on the state's obligation to worship God. The SPCU developed its proposal in 1961 and in June 1962 presented to the Central Preparatory Commission a text in which (1) "tolerance" had given way to *libertas religiosa*, (2) co-operation with non-Catholics had moved to a draft *De oecumenismo*, and (3) "immunity from external coercion" served to define "the right to follow one's conscience in religious matters."[35] On June 18-19, 1962, the Central Commission also considered Chap. IX, on Church-State relations, of the draft *De ecclesia* of the Preparatory Theological Commission of Cardinal Ottaviani. The differences between the two texts led to a sharp clash, as noted above regarding Cardinal Montini's repudiation of the doctrine stated in *De ecclesia*. But the Secretariat was not sufficiently established to make its draft-text prevail, and as Vatican II opened, the fate of religious freedom as a Council topic remained uncertain.[36]

Early in Vatican II, Pope John XXIII determined that the Unity Secretariat would be equal to the Council's commissions in being able to present draft-texts and see them through revisions in accord with comments made by the Council Fathers. This cleared the way for the Secretariat to treat religious liberty, especially after leading Council members voiced decisive criticisms of the Preparatory Theological Commission's *De ecclesia*, including its chapter on Church-State, in the debate at the end of Vatican II's First Period, December 1-6, 1962. The new *De ecclesia* of early 1963 had no chapter on Church-State and in July 1963 the Coordinating Commission approved Cardinal Suenens's motion to authorize the Unity Secretariat to bring before the Council a draft

[34]Scatena, *La fatica della libertà*, pp. 24-27. On the December 1960 text, see J. Hamer, "Histoire du texte de la Déclaration," in *La liberté religieuse. Déclaration "Dignitatis humanae personae"*, eds. J. Hamer & Y. Congar (Paris: Cerf, 1967), pp. 53-105, at pp. 53-57.

[35]Scatena, *La fatica della libertà*, pp. 27-36, and Hamer, "Histoire," pp. 57-60.

[36]Scatena, *La fatica della libertà*, pp. 36-43. Joseph Komonchak, "The Struggle for the Council during the Preparation of Vatican II (1960-1962)," in *History of Vatican II*, Vol. I, *Announcing and Preparing Vatican Council II*, edited by G. Alberigo and J. Komonchak (Maryknoll: Orbis, and Leuven: Peeters, 1995), pp. 167-356, at pp. 296-300.—Montini's June 19 intervention is given at *Acta et Documenta*, *Series II*, Vol. II/IV, p. 729. Strangely, it is not mentioned by Scatena in *La fatica*.

on religious liberty in a chapter added to its text *De oecumenismo*. The Secretariat could by this time relate its text to John XXIII's *Pacem in terris* (April 11, 1963), as a development and application of the encyclical's no. 14 on the human right to worship God "according to the dictates of an upright conscience" and of nos. 60-61 on the obligation of governments to ensure that the human rights of its citizens "are acknowledged, respected, coordinated with other rights, defended, and promoted."

Scatena narrates the early developments of 1962-63 in detail and then follows the complicated *iter* of the Secretariat's text through its five revisions in the light both of numerous written comments by the Council Fathers and of the discussions in the Council aula: first briefly in November 1963, more at length in a substantial debate September 23-28, 1964.[37] After public discussion of a once-more revised text, September 15-20, 1965, the Council finally voted on September 21, 1965, at the insistence of Paul VI, and this revealed that 90% of the members favored of the overall orientation of the text (*Placet*, 1,997; *Non Placet*, 224). In late October, 1965, votes part-by-part on a further revision brought in numerous *modi* for classification and evaluation, leading to thirty-nine last-minute changes incorporated into the definitive text, which then on November 19, 1965, gained the *Placet* of 1984 members against 249 who remained unconvinced. But the naysayers fell to just seventy at the promulgation on December 7, 1965.

After each discussion in the aula, the *periti* of the Secretariat had to review the interventions and the further written comments from the Fathers in order to identify amendments satisfactory to the Secretariat's members and conformed to the desires of the Council Fathers who would in time vote on the text. The *periti* also composed and/or amended the accompanying explanatory and documentary notes on the drafts and worked with Bishop De Smedt on the *Relatio* that he would give to introduce each stage of debate.

On the activities of the *periti* on the text on religious liberty, Scatena naturally writes often of J. C. Murray, but as well of Pietro Pavan, of the Lateran University, who had served John XXIII in drafting *Pacem in terris*, and who agreed with Murray's option for a narrowly framed formulation of religious liberty as the immunity based on human dignity from external coercion in religious matters. Pavan contributed the clarifying subtitle of the draft of mid-1964, *De iure personae et communitatum ad libertatem in re religiosa*, lifted from comments by Bishop Pablo Gúrpide Beope (Bilbao, Spain). This

[37]Scatena, *La fatica della libertà*, pp. 169-199, relates the interventions of these days, beginning with the Cardinal of Palermo, Ernesto Ruffini, who insisted on Catholic truth and the importance of concordats, and ending with Cardinal Zoa, who spoke for ca. 300 African bishops on the urgency of a doctrinally grounded declaration of the right to religious freedom based on Jesus, meek and humble of heart, who did not impose, but proposed, his word lovingly. See especially *ibid.,* pp. 198-199, on the irreducible heterogeneity of the Council Fathers in their approaches to the project of the declaration.

specification allowed the text to affirm a universal right to religious freedom in society while also affirming that human persons are absolutely and permanently obliged to seek the truth of God's plan of salvation and order their lives in conformity with this.[38]

The second conciliar version of 1964 was a Declaration detached from *De oecumenismo*, and it stimulated evaluations, both critical and constructive, for example, by J. Dupont, O.S.B., for Bishop De Smedt, by Y. Congar, O.P., by the Declaration's dogged opponent Gustave de Broglie, S.J., initially in texts for francophone North African bishops which also circulated in print, and by J. C. Murray, in a text initially written for the American bishops but then widely circulated.[39]

The next schema, revised so as now to base freedom on human dignity and notably expanded after the debate of September 1964, was distributed to the Fathers on November 17, 1964, and became the object of extensive evaluation by *periti* and Fathers in early 1965. This stage of discussion brought out once more the contrast between a general agreement favoring a conciliar declaration affirming religious liberty and sharp differences on whether to ground it in human nature or in revealed doctrine. Jean Daniélou argued against French exponents of basing the Declaration on revelation and Scripture, since the issue was the human right to which early Christians had appealed as already existing. Even Jacques Maritain functioned from a distance as an expert on religious liberty as a natural right, in responding to a personal request from Pope Paul VI.[41] With the next draft, completed in May 1965, the *periti* faded into the

[38]Scatena, *La fatica della libertà*, pp. 132-139. On March 30, 1964, Pavan sent to Paul VI a memo on the new draft, clarifying the central point as a constitutional right to personal immunity in religious matters, which modern states must recognize and guarantee. The Pope thanked Pavan for his useful clarification. *Ibid*, p. 145, n. 142. The promulgated Declaration bears the subtitle given by Pavan and immediately refers to the "constitutional limits [that] should be set to powers of government" (no. 1). But then follows a profession of faith in the revelation of God and the mission of the Catholic Church, coupled with the human obligation to seek the truth of God and his way of salvation. This obligation came to the fore especially after the discourse of September 25, 1964, of the Auxiliary Bishop of Milan, Carlo Colombo, who was widely known to be Paul VI's main theological advisor. On Colombo's intervention: Scatena, *La fatica*, pp. 194-197, regarding the text given in *Acta Synodalia*, III/2, 554-557.

[39]Scatena, *La fatica della libertà*, p. 146 (Dupont), 147-148 (Congar), 150-153 (de Broglie), 159-162 (Murray, in "The Problem of Religious Liberty," *Theological Studies* 25 [1964], pp. 503-575, translated into French, German, Italian, and Dutch). Murray's study, in a form expanded over the version in *Theological Studies*, is also given with three other works by him in *Religious Liberty. Catholic Struggles with Pluralism*, ed. J. Leon Hooper, S.J. (Louisville: Westminster/John Knox, 1993), pp. 127-197.

[40]Scatena, *La fatica della libertà*, pp. 353-354 (Danielou). Maritain commented orally to J. Guitton and Paul VI's personal secretary, Don Macchi, who visited him on December 27, 1964, and in writing in March 1965. Maritain's text on religious freedom sent to the Pope is given by P. Chenaux, *Paul VI et Maritain* (note 33, above), pp. 111-114.

background as the Council members readied themselves for the decisions on religious liberty that followed in 1965.[41]

One of the better known moments of Vatican II was the omission on November 19-20, 1964, of a vote on the *textus emendatus* on religious liberty which the Fathers had received on November 17. Paul VI had indicated that a vote should be taken, but when some 280 Fathers protested that the revised text included such extensive changes and additions that more time was needed for study and discussion, then the Pope let stand the judgment of the Council's Presidents and Administrative Tribunal that the protest was legitimate. Scatena informs her readers amply on these tense days at the end of the Third Period, with a generous offering of reactions registered in diaries, letters, and publications close to the events. She points out that the Council minority showed deftness in its appeal to the Council's Rules, while Paul VI's non-intervention made clear his distance from the Council's majority.[42]

Given my interest in the work of the Council *periti*, I would point out that the anguish of late November 1964, which the American bishops felt so deeply, resulted in fact from the freedom with which the *periti* J. C. Murray and Pietro Pavan had drafted the revision of *De libertate religiosa* after the debate of September 1964. On October 14, Yves Congar, who was well versed in both the theory and practice of expert service of council commissions, noted that the two lead-redactors had gone well beyond amending the previous text in the light of comments by the Fathers. The Secretariat did not rein in its two brilliant *periti,* and the result was a text demonstrably innovative and half again as long as its textual predecessor.[43]

[41]Scatena, *La fatica della libertà*, pp. 364-423, relates the complex *iter* leading to the *textus denuo emendatus* of mid-1965, in the midst of which Yves Congar, co-opted by the SPCU, composed a biblical *Proemium*, on salvation-history as a divine pedagogy of humans to act and grow in freedom, which tried to satisfy backers of a declaration based on revelation. But both Carlo Colombo and Paul VI expressed reservations over Congar's text, because they thought it more likely to stimulate further discussion than to foster convergent conviction, and it was removed, albeit with Congar's consent (pp. 370-372, 396, 405, 407, 413-415).

[42]Scatena, *La fatica della libertà*, pp. 286-324, esp. 292 on the minority and on Paul VI, and pp. 318-324 on early reactions.

[43]Y. Congar, *Mon Journal du Concile*, ed. Éric Mahieu, (Paris: Cerf, 2002), vol. 2, p. 202, an entry of October 14, 1964: "On m'a donné à lire le texte actuel du schema *De libertate*. Il ne reste à peu près rien de l'ancien texte. Dans ces conditions, il faudra une discussion nouvelle. Je trouve qu'il y a, dans cette démarche, une certaine légèreté. Les rédacteurs (surtout Pavan et Murray) ne se doubtent pas des difficultés que leur texte soulèvera." In the booklet distributed November 17, the synoptic presentation of the two texts of 1964 made evident that the *textus emendatus* did contain numerous passages beside which the prior text showed only blank space. The numbered paragraphs were increased from seven to fourteen. See *Acta Synodalia*, vol. III/8, pp. 426-442. When John Courtney Murray explained the argument of the revised draft in early 1965, he rightly absolved the Roman Curia from any blame for the postponement of the previous

Finally, what about the role of Paul VI in the genesis, revision, and completion of *Dignitatis humanae*? Jan Grootaers of Leuven, a scholar of Vatican II who used the papers of Bishop De Smedt, gave a striking account of this at the 1989 congress of the Istituto Paolo VI, concluding that the success of the Vatican II project on religious liberty was essentially due to the "vigilant attention" given by Paul VI and to certain "dynamic initiatives" that he took on behalf of the Declaration. At the same congress, Pietro Pavan added his own weighty testimony that regarding *Dignitatis humanae* Paul VI's personal contribution was decisive.[44]

The massively informative work of Scatena does document Paul VI's close attention to all stages of the draft, and she leaves no doubt about the importance of Pope Paul's directive that the orientation vote of September 21, 1965, be taken. Her thoughtful general conclusion on the redaction of *Dignitatis humanae* does not, however, feature Paul VI, while it does note, first, that while he was favorable to the Declaration, so that the Church could dialogue with its contemporaries, he was at the same time affected by those who were disturbed by this magisterial innovation. Second, the diversity of approaches among those favorable to the Declaration opened a space in which Paul VI could intervene to guide the redaction, for example, in highlighting the human obligation to search for religious truth.[45] This is correct and pertinent regarding key moments in text's development, but this reviewer would add more about the personal conviction, originating from Maritain, which on the eve of Vatican II, in the Central Preparatory Commission in June 1962, motivated Cardinal Montini's sharp repudiation of the recent textbook tradition on the confessional state. This same conviction then inspired the tenacity of Paul VI in withstanding strong winds of opposition as he led Vatican II to complete the project of *Dignitatis humanae*.[46]

November, but his account omitted any word about his revision containing significant innovations which called for an open exchange of judgments by the Council Fathers. See "This Matter of Religious Freedom," *America* 112 (Jan. 9, 1965), 40-43.

[44]J. Grootaers, "Paul VI et la Déclaration conciliare sur la liberté religieuse *Dignitatis humanae*," in *Paolo VI e il rapporto Chiesa-mondo al Concilio*. Pubblicazioni dell'Istituto Paolo VI, 11 (Rome: Studium, 1991), pp. 85-125, especially the summary list of Paul VI's actions, pp. 121-123. P. Pavan, "Testimonianza," *ibid*., pp. 186-189, concentrating on the vote of September 21, 1965, taken at an explicit order of Paul VI by which he reversed a majority decision of the Presidents and Moderators.

[45]*La fatica della libertà*, pp. 569 and 578-579.

[46]On Montini's June 1962 intervention, see pge 462, above. In May 1965, Paul VI made a personal analytical study of the problematic, which signaled his conviction to a small circle. The Pope's text is given by Vincenzo Carbone, in "Il ruolo di Paolo VI nell'evoluzione e nella redazione della dichiarazione *Dignitatis humanae*," in *Paolo VI e il rapporto Chiesa-mondo al Concilio*, pp. 154-156. Then on June 28, at the audience in St. Peter's square on the second anniversary of his coronation, he spoke with conviction of the text in which the Council would soon declare, concerning the freedom of faith in

This extensive review of Scatena's detailed account of the long and at times torturous itinerary leading to *Dignitatis humanae* has aimed to illustrate and solidify the conviction voiced above, namely, that the new wave of Vatican II research, based on the recently completed *Acta* and many recently organized archives, is in fact providing illuminating accounts and interpretations which carry us well beyond early Vatican II studies of 1965-1980. These recent publications set in light the astounding riches of thought and ecclesial orientations produced during the epoch-making event that was Vatican Council II.

---

modern society, the two principles of this major doctrine, *Nemo cogatur* and *Nemo impediatur*! Scatena, *La fatica della libertà*, pp. 423-424.

BOOK REVIEWS

General and Miscellaneous

The Encyclopedia of Christianity, Volume 1: A-D; Volume 2: E-I; Volume 3: J-O; Volume 4: P-SH. Edited by Erwin Fahlbusch, Jan Milič Lochman, John Mbiti, Jaroslav Pelikan, and Lukas Vischer; English-language editor Geoffrey W. Bromiley; statistical editor David B. Barrett. (Grand Rapids, Michigan: William B. Eerdmanns Publishing Company 1999, 2001. English translation 2003-5. Pp. xl, 893; 819; xxxii, 884; xxxii, 952. $100.00 each volume.)

When the editors embarked upon this scholarly enterprise they judged that the time was ripe to bring up to date the Christian knowledge of our day. They took as their basis what many regard as the best Christian encyclopedia which is not so bulky and many-volumed that ordinary persons in search of truth can pay for it and find room on their shelves, the *Evangelische Kirchenlexikon*, its third and revised edition last published in Göttingen by Vandenhoeck and Ruprecht in 1997. The English translation of volume 1 appeared two years later and in 2005 four volumes were out in English and the fifth volume (Sl to Z) still lies in the future. Jaroslav Pelikan has been one of the most eminent experts on the Christianity of the centuries, and his loss is sad; yet he helped to give us this as his last contribution.

The articles are short though not superficial, and clear-headed. The English language used is direct and almost entirely free from jargon (on this we ought to pay a compliment to Geoffrey W. Bromiley). When it is said that this is a translation from the German, that is not accurate, first because the articles contain a mass of bibliographical information which appeared at a date later than the German, and certain articles, especially those on very modern and contemporary themes, have been added or altered or supplemented to meet new knowledge and new circumstances. And much more: they have added articles, country by country, on all the States of the world except the very smallest, and enlisted the aid of David B. Barrett, well-known as expert on Christian statistics through the continents and peoples; not easy since the world map can change fast, as with the ex-Communist States after 1989. How will they treat the matter when they come to Ukraine, a fascinating theme for church history? Yet the new state of Macedonia receives informative treatment. They have thought it right to add more than seventy biographies.

So we are given three kinds of article: those where study is available already and when knowledge is moving forward it walks very deliberately; those where a new discovery means that conclusions even of the remote past must still be

a matter of argument (for example, with the finding of the Dead Sea Scrolls, here under *Qumran*); and the modern or contemporary articles which must break the rule that one can hardly understand anything in a right perspective until at least thirty or forty years have elapsed. Within that last variety there can be much good factual information, such as the date when a female rabbi was first appointed, or the astonishing number of books by Karl Rahner which have been sold in paperback. It treats many wide themes in the history of doctrine or morals, theories or movements such as *God is dead*, or *religionless Christianity* (a truly thoughtful article), and histories of an idea or ethical question like *Pacifism* and the extent to which it has Christian origins and later Christian influence. Sometimes this tackles problems which are as yet impossible to get into balance. There is a contrast between two articles close to one another. *Proverbs* is full of matter without ever becoming boring, and the reader rises from it feeling that there is a surprise that so much more is to be learnt. And just before comes the article on *Program to Combat Racism*, where the material cannot help but be bitty and provisional and hardly yet in a full historical perspective, and one can rise vaguely dissatisfied with the treatment while admiring the courage both of the editors who included it and the author for his survey. Searching readers are not likely to look for an article on racism under the letter P; they will be more likely to consult the article *Racism* which partly overlaps. Another important article on a contemporary theme is an excellent treatment of *Reproductive Technology*. A chain of such articles here holds the attention almost continuously: *Resistance*, which entered the moral debate more pressingly as a result of the event of June 20, 1944, and resulted in revived study of the theories in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries, but is wider here, for example, liberation theology, or civil disobedience. The article on "Religious Liberty" is long and thoughtful, and impresses hard because 'everyone' seems to think it right and much of the world rejects it in practice.

There is a short but surprising and valuable article under *Roma* of Sinti/gypsies. This is followed by the *Roman Catholic Church*, in which there is a learned but still slightly confusing study of the relation between the personal primacy of the Pope defined in the First Vatican Council and the collegiality of the bishops as declared in the Second Vatican Council. All the right emphases are here, on the Mass, and prayer, and private devotion, and the developing sense of the need for ecumenical relations. *Romanticism* is learned and readable and yet gives the reader a sense of something woolly, no doubt because the subject is inseparable from wool. Meyendorff is author of *Orthodox Christianity*, and two of the best of all articles are by Pospielovsky on *Russia* and the *Russian Orthodox Church*, with at one point a charmingly sad exclamation, "Alas, Yeltsin proved to be more of a demagogue than a statesman." But it is not so sad as what follows when we reach *Rwanda*.

The study of Compostella and its pilgrimages will be found under *Santiago Cult*. The biography of Schleiermacher is rather short but the following study of his theology is profound. *Seal of the Confessional* is perhaps not explicit

enough about the troubles with law-courts when someone is accused and the priest/pastor is believed to know about the guilt. We are given contemporary problems with *Service Society* and *Sex Education* and *Sexism* (meaning male treatment of women as inferior, not feminism, which has a separate article under the heading); the conclusions of *Sexism* depress the reader.

There is a sensitive ethical strength in the editorial board. To take a little example, there is an article on *military chaplains*. It contains not only a list and description of the way States and their armies have behaved but a discussion of the personal tension inevitable to such an office in time of war.

The second volume (E to I) contains a surprising number of States, with their statistics of people and of Christian denominations, from larger ones like France, Germany, Hungary, India, and Italy, to smaller ones like Guinea-Bissau or Guyana or Haiti or the Ivory Coast, and these surveys of peoples are always valuable. Sometimes it is not easy, as with Iraq. On Fiji it is weighty for the relation between the nationalist coup and Methodism. A long discussion of *Family* warms the heart. There is a humane study of the origin and history of the word *Ghetto*, and a similar humanity is found in the treatment of *Genocide* (very depressing on the weakness of the United Nations) and holocaust. *Fascism* is surprisingly short, almost laconic, but very intelligent. An essay on *German Christians* defines them as the foremost example of a compromised Church. Long theological treatments of *God* and of *Grace* are helped by appendices on *God, arguments for the existence of*, and *God is Dead Theology*. *Friendship* has a charming sentence of exhortation as its start—"In wrestling with the concept, theology and the Church must do some rethinking." *Evolution* is sensible and informed, but oddly the first two books in the recommended bibliography are Darwin's *Origin of Species* and Richard Dawkins' *The Blind Watchmaker* (1986). *Faith and Order* lists the main meetings (somehow Evanston gets omitted), but like Faith and Order itself we flounder on where it goes next. *Europe* is gloomy on the Christian task, and *European Theology (Modern)* carries a lot of names but in a summary form. *Euthanasia* is sensitive and *Homosexuality* sane, the ethical articles are unusually good throughout. In *Evangelical Catholicity* comes a powerful sentence from Cardinal Ratzinger: "The Augsburg Confession might be interpreted as a Catholic statement . . . drafted with inner conviction as a searching for evangelical catholicity."

A review can only select out of riches. But this will be enough to persuade the student and the general reader of the scholarly excellence, the breadth of themes, and the readability of this *Encyclopedia.*

Cambridge University OWEN CHADWICK

The Church Unfinished: Ecclesiology through the Centuries. By Bernard P. Prusak. (Mahwah, New Jersey: Paulist Press. 2004. Pp. x, 404. $22.95 paperback.)

Understanding the complex nature of the Christian Church has been a continual challenge for theologians throughout the ages. Bernard P. Prusak of Villanova University has joined their ranks with his history of ecclesiology which emphasizes an eschatological openness to the future. His is a formidable task, dealing with two millennia of history, a vast amount of primary and secondary literature, and a plethora of interpretations. He devotes nearly one hundred pages to the biblical sources and then, in a *tour d'horizon*, addresses some of the principal ecclesiological topics.

Prusak often refers to the patristic idea that the Church can become young again. That image was mentioned in *Lumen Gentium* 4: "the Spirit by the power of the Gospel rejuvenates the Church." The Council's view reflects the second-century apocalyptic work, *The Shepherd of Hermas*, which portrayed the Church as a haggard old woman who gradually becomes younger and more beautiful. St. Bede had a similar idea about the continuous growth of the Church when he wrote that "every day the Church gives birth to the Church" (PL 93: 166). Leonardo Boff in our own day speaks often of "ecclesiogenesis."

We do not find, however, an exhaustive survey of ecclesiological history in Prusak's work. Of necessity, he is selective in his choice of topics. Yet one regrets that he did not give more attention to such important questions as ecumenism, Mary and the Church, social justice, the laity, religious life, and the priesthood. He mentions the Council of Trent only briefly, almost as an aside. Although Trent did not discuss *ex professo* some of the pressing ecclesiological issues of the sixteenth century, such as the papacy, it did discuss the sacraments, the sources of revelation, and institutional reform, all of which clearly have significant ecclesial ramifications. Finally, Prusak's "Epilogue: A Future for Women in the Church?" raises a legitimate ecclesiological issue, but unfortunately he does not present it with the rigorous theological evaluation it deserves.

This volume is most readable. Prusak writes clearly with a positive and irenic tone. He shows familiarity with a wide range of biblical, theological, and historical sources. The footnotes provide us with an abundance of valuable information. Moreover, he deals masterfully with several critical ecclesiological issues. For example, his description of the founding of the Church by Jesus is well nuanced in his explanation of "the extended establishment of the Church" as it came into existence in stages. His treatment of the ecclesiology of communion is excellent and functions as a leitmotiv. It is appropriately applied to the Eucharist, the local and universal Church, collegiality, and the Church as a communion of churches. Of special value are his comments on the eschatological nature of the Church found in *Lumen Gentium* and *Gaudium et Spes*. The Church, though "unfinished," is ever called to newness in its ongoing pilgrimage.

The Catholic University of America PATRICK GRANFIELD

Dos Mil Años de Evangelización: Los Grandes Ciclos Evangelizadores. Edited by Enrique de la Lama, Marcelo Merino, Miguel Lluch-Baixauli, and José Enérez. [XXI Simposio Internacional de Teología de la Universidad de Navarra.] (Pamplona: Servicio Publicaciones de la Universidad de Navarra, Facultad de Teología de la Universidad de Navarra. 2001. Pp. xxiv, 705.)

The unceasing effort to spread the word of God is an inspiring story of heroes. The Faculty of Theology of the University of Navarre has put us in its debt for offering to the reading public the results of its twenty-first international symposium on theology. Its purpose was to bring together scholars and experts, not just from Spain but also from other European countries, to discuss the progress of the Church's labor to carry out the divine injunction to "go and preach the Gospel" to all nations.

The contents of the book are classed as either "*Ponencias*" ("position papers") or "*Comunicaciones*" ("conferences"). Logically, the first paper discusses the spread of the Church, despite the well-known persecution of its converts, around the Mediterranean world until the Constantinian peace, while the closing conference introduces the Christianization of the South American continent. The evangelization of Canada and the United States is included, although the emphasis is on the non-Catholic agencies concerned.

The value of the book is perhaps best expressed by one of the speakers, Bruno Neveu of the Sorbonne, who pointed out that to appreciate history or the movement of ideas—and events, of course—one must look back to earlier authors. Otherwise, one cannot claim more than a "presumptuous superficiality" (p. 341).

In all the analyses of the different mission enterprises over the years, there is an implicit hint at the necessary mission methods followed. But with such a global scope as is covered by the symposium, one would have expected at least one explicit essay on the changing methodology of the Christian missions. The problem was not totally overlooked, and several of the speakers offered suggestive ideas on the new approaches, especially in a society now rapidly forgetting God.

Two essays impress this reviewer as especially relevant: Antonio García-Moreno, "Evangelizar según San Juan. Del dicho al hecho," and José Luís Illanes, "La inculturación de la fe como problema teológico. Consideraciones a la luz de la encíclica, *Fides et Ratio*." García-Moreno insists on the power of the Word, which crystalizes and enriches thought, and is the greatest symbol of self. In many ways considered as the "divine seal" that transforms one's personality, the best dreams are useless unless expressed in words. The full instrument of all human communication, the spoken word was respected by the Jews, and because it was used by Yahweh, the Jews attributed a deep mystical value to it. And pronouncing a word meant control and possession of the word and its meaning. And because Yahweh had spoken and used the word, to them it had a mystical value. That is why, they never uttered the name of Yahweh. Several conclusions can be drawn, and they should help in future mission programs.

Following the guide lines Pope John Paul II had suggested in his encyclical *Fides et ratio*, Llanes hints at a possible new mission methodology. The debate over the irreconcilability or incompatibility of reason and faith has now run its course, and we now realize that culture always tends to the transcendent. All Christians, not just the missionaries, then, are called to look into the values each national culture enshrines. These we have to enlist to explicitate the divine message, otherwise, we would be crying in the wilderness. Faith, after all is one's answer to God's call, always a concrete process.

Ateneo de Manila University JOSÉ S. ARCILLA, S. J.
Quezon City, Philippines

Eccentric Culture: A Theory of Western Civilization. By Rémi Brague. Translated by Samuel Lester. (South Bend, Indiana: St. Augustine's Press. 2002. Pp. vi, 205. $28.00.)

Western civilization has at times been conceived of as the confluence of Athens and Jerusalem, but in *Eccentric Culture* Rémi Brague points to the essential role of Rome, which performed the indispensable role of drawing together and assimilating these cultural traditions. In fact, what makes the West unique, according to Brague, is its "Romanity," which he defines as "the situation of secondarity in relation to a previous culture" (p. 43).

Just as the West borrowed so much from ancient Greece (which, while within the geographical boundaries of what we now recognize as Europe, from the time of the division of the Roman Empire belonged to and developed within a civilization distinct from that of the West), Brague likewise argues that Christianity, the dominant religion of the West, is itself "Roman" (in his sense) in relation to the Old Testament. The Christian world stands in relation to the Old Testament where Rome stood in relation to Greece: it derives from and is indebted to something prior to and outside of itself. "Our Greeks are the Jews," Brague says (p. 54).

Brague's thesis thus leads him to the provocative claim that the rejection of Marcionism as a heresy—which would have separated the Christian faith from its Old Testament origins and from its ongoing relationship with that tradition—was perhaps "the founding event of the history of Europe as a civilization, in that it furnished the matrix of the European relationship to the past and anchored it at the highest level" (p. 111).

It is this sense of "secondarity"—Brague's neologism—in relation to other cultures, he contends, that has made possible the Western world's series of renaissances, each of which represented a return to and a re-examination of earlier texts. "Europe did not pretend, as to profane culture, to have absorbed in itself everything that Hellenism contained or, in religion, everything that the Old Testament contained—in such a way that one could throw away the empty shell" (p. 111). Hellenism, and reigning interpretations of Hellenic thought, could be continually revisited and reinterpreted by returning to the original texts.

Brague here draws a legitimate if politically sensitive contrast with Islam, whose posture he describes as one of "absorption," either of secular culture—Islam speaks of an "age of ignorance" prior to the introduction of Islam to a previously non-Islamic culture—or of preceding religious traditions. In the case of Islam, "the truth of Judaism, as well as that of Christianity, is found within itself, and it alone" (p. 112). This posture vis-à-vis both religious and secular knowledge, not to mention the lack of the original sources (since original secular texts were sometimes discarded after being translated into Arabic), inhibited the rise of movements in Islamic culture corresponding to the Western renaissance.

The idea of renaissance was also foreign to Byzantium, perhaps because it did not conceive of itself as being estranged or separated from its cultural origins by race, culture, and time. Thus Theodorus Metochites could write, "We are the compatriots of the ancient Hellenes by race and by language." A twentieth-century historian concluded, "Antiquity was for the Byzantines something so near that it could not establish that feeling of estrangement which would drive creation and so nothing could truly be 'reborn'" (pp. 124-125).

Brague's thesis, as the author himself realizes, directly challenges those who would disparage European civilization from a multicultural point of view. Such criticism, according to Brague, completely misconceives the nature of European civilization: "No culture was ever so little centered on itself and so interested in [others] as Europe" (p. 134).

Eccentric Culture's main difficulty lies in its English translation, which is at times clumsy and inelegant. Brague's thesis nevertheless promises to bear much intellectual fruit, even if we may be skeptical of his speculation that Western imperialism may have had "among its most secret mainsprings, the desire to compensate, through the domination of people it pretends are inferior, for its own feeling of inferiority in relation to classical antiquity" (p. 42).

Ludwig von Mises Institute THOMAS E. WOODS, JR.

The Christian Communities of Jerusalem and the Holy Land: Studies in History, Religion and Politics. Edited by Anthony O'Mahony. (Cardiff: University of Wales Press, 2003. Pp. viii, 210.)

This well-conceived collection of eight essays on various aspects of Christian history and communal life in Jerusalem and Israel/Palestine is a valuable contribution to a wider understanding of a very complex and problematic political context. For most of its history since the rise of Islam in the seventh century, the Holy Land was ruled by a succession of Muslim governments. During this period the Christian majority population was gradually reduced to a small minority of 15% by the time of the establishment of a Jewish state in Palestine in 1948. The mass expulsion of both Muslim and Christian

Palestinians at that time and the subsequent influx of several million Jews from the Middle East and Europe have reduced the number of Christians to a mere 2% of the total population, or roughly 200,000, mostly Arab Palestinians divided primarily among the two most ancient churches, Greek Orthodox and Catholic (both Roman and Eastern-rite), with much smaller numbers of Armenians, Copts, and Protestants. Another 200,000 Christians live in neighboring Jordan, two-thirds of them Greek Orthodox and equally divided among those of West Bank Palestinian origin and native East Bank Jordanian Arab stock. Those in Jerusalem and the West Bank, occupied by Israel since 1967, have been under considerable pressure by the Zionists to leave and many have, in desperation, emigrated. Still they remain a very important and visible presence in the societies of Israel and Palestine.

In Jerusalem, where Christians number only about 10,000 out of a population of nearly half a million, they maintain a substantial number of historical churches and monasteries, and own large tracts of very valuable real estate. Three patriarchs are based in Jerusalem—Greek Orthodox, Roman (Latin) Catholic, and Armenian Apostolic (Orthodox). The oldest and richest patriarchate is the Greek Orthodox, since the Ottoman conquest in 1517 headed by an ethnic Greek, even though the Orthodox population in the Holy Land is Palestinian Arab, a long-standing bone of contention. The Latin Catholic patriarch is an ethnic Palestinian from Nazareth, the first since the patriarchate was re-established in1847. His predecessors were Italian Franciscans.

The first essay by the editor gives the reader an historical and political overview of the various Christian communities, while the succeeding seven focus on individual groups. All are by authors with a thorough knowledge of their subjects, though some essays are inevitably better than others. The most interesting and informative are those on the Armenian Church and Community of Jerusalem by Ara Sanjian of Haigazian College in Beirut, and the Coptic communities of Egypt and Ethiopia by John Watson and Kirsten Pedersen. Although these churches are among the smallest in the Holy Land, they have a long, rich, and it must be added, contentious history that makes for fascinating reading. For me it would be worth the price of the book for these three essays alone. The most disappointing article was the one on the largest and most complex church and community, the Greek Orthodox. It is very brief—only seventeen pages—and is written by a Greek scholar from a Hellenic perspective. He apparently does not know Arabic, or is somehow unaware that the third caliph, 'Umar ibn al-Khattab, was an Arab, since he inexplicably refers to him by the Turkish form of his name "Omar Khattap" (p. 38).

Other minor errors and oversights include the failure to mention, when listing the dates, on which the various uniate Catholic groups in the region were accorded *millet* status by the Ottoman government, that the oldest of these is the Greek Catholic Church, founded in 1724 (p. 7). Also in the essay on the Anglican presence in Jerusalem the author refers to the Archbishop of Canterbury, Edward White Benson, only as "Archbishop Benson," never citing his

full name (p. 157), and the popular Archbishop in Jerusalem in the 1950's and '60's, The Rt. Rev. Campbell MacInnes, is wrongly referred to by the Christian name of "Angus" (p. 165). Was the author, who teaches at the Virginia Theological Seminary, by any chance confusing him with the Episcopal Bishop of Washington, D.C., at the time, Angus Dunn?

Despite these minor complaints I would have no hesitation in recommending the book to anyone interested in Eastern Christianity and the Holy Land. It contains a wealth of information that is not, to my knowledge, to be found in any other study currently available.

University of Balamand ROBERT B. BETTS
Al-Kura, Lebanon

The Church and Mary. Edited by R. N. Swanson. [Studies in Church History, Volume 39.] (Rochester, New York: Boydell Press. 2004. Pp. xvi, 376. $75.00, £45.00.)

Volume 39 of the "Studies in Church History" series published by the Ecclesiastical History Society is dedicated to the theme of "The Church and Mary." The twenty-seven articles include the seven major papers and twenty shorter communications selected from the presentations at the July 2001 and January 2002 meetings of the Society. These articles, virtually all interdisciplinary in approach, are arranged roughly chronologically, their topics ranging from the development of Marian doctrines in early Christianity through studies of medieval Marian Latin poetry, Marian iconography and various popular devotions, Protestant Reformers' reactions to Mary, Marian revivalism around Our Lady of Walsingham, to contemporary Marian devotion in Ethiopia. The majority of authors hold positions at universities in the United Kingdom.

The strength of this volume is the wealth of historical detail provided in each article. D. F. Wright (University of Edinburgh), for example, carefully examines the linguistic shift from the title "God-bearer" to "Mother of God" in Greek and Latin Christian authors from the fourth to the eighth centuries, while Patrick Preston (University College, Chichester) provides a fascinating account of an early sixteenth-century moment in the debate over the Immaculate Conception. While articles like these may be of interest chiefly to Marian specialists, others will appeal to a broader readership. Iona McCleery (University of Edinburgh), for example, examines the changing role of Mary in the Theophilus legend as it was told and recorded in medieval and early-modern Spain and Portugal. This story of Mary's rescue of the sinner who had made a pact with the devil is one of the oldest and most widely circulated of the Marian miracle tales, and giving careful attention to the changes in detail that took place in the early-modern period as it became associated with historical figures, McCleery argues that Mary's role in the legend declined as more emphasis came to be placed on individual persons and their guardian angels

who could effect and represent a more personal relationship with God. Here is a reminder that the variants of a simple folktale can reveal much about changing cultural trends and theological assumptions.

Perhaps the most tantalizing article, and the one that especially calls for further research, is Marta Camilla Wright's description of contemporary Marian devotion in Ethiopia based on her field research there in 1998-2000. Although few readers are likely to be well informed about the traditions of Ethiopian Christianity, the themes here will be familiar to anyone with a passing knowledge of Marian doctrine, devotion, and controversy: Mary as the second Eve, her soteriological status in popular culture as a healer, her entanglement in the tension between purity and sexuality, her image as an empathetic and sensitive mother in contrast to a harsh, judgmental, and condemning image of her son. As a communication, this study is too short to provide any but the most cursory historical background, and so one is left wondering about precedents. For example, did a devotion to Isis lay the groundwork for, and later color, the acceptance of Mary into Ethiopian worship? This article, fittingly the last in the volume, leaves one wanting more studies on Marian devotion in non-Western settings.

University of Kansas SANDRA L. ZIMDARS-SWARTZ

The Rise of Evangelicalism: The Age of Edwards, Whitefield and the Wesleys. By Mark A. Noll. [A History of Evangelicalism: People, Movements and Ideas in the English-Speaking World, Volume 1.] (Downers Grove, Illinois: InterVarsity Press. 2003. Pp. 320. $23.00.)

The first in a five-volume series on the 300-year global history of evangelicalism, Mark A. Noll's informative *The Rise of Evangelicalism* presents the world and work of early evangelicals in Britain and North America from 1734 to 1795. His book provides both a synthesis of scholarship in the religious history of Protestantism in the English-speaking world and an introduction to the most significant primary sources written or read by evangelicals during the era of revivals and awakenings on both sides of the Atlantic in the 1700's.

Evangelicalism arose during an era when men and women sought to revitalize religion, to encourage godliness in a world expanding under the pressure of industrial and economic growth. Early evangelicals were reformers who set out primarily to better themselves spiritually. The consequence of conversion, however, was often the betterment of the wider society. And sometimes, as in the case of African Americans and slavery, evangelicals played an important role in altering the ways people thought about this world, not just the next.

Noll introduces both the series and his own work by defining evangelicalism, associating the term first with the Protestant Reformation. Theological emphases introduced in the sixteenth century, such as justification by faith rather than works and salvation through Christ's sacrifice on the cross rather

than ecclesiastical mediation or the sacrifice of the Mass, were also associated with the early evangelical movement in Britain and America. However, Noll stresses that there was no one unified evangelical code of beliefs or practices. Yet, while conflicts sometimes flared between different evangelical groups (most notably Calvinists and Arminians), what was more amazing was the ecumenism that generally existed among the various evangelicals at this time. The goal was not to encourage competition among evangelicals, but to inspire spiritual conversion among all believers.

The book begins with the physical and mental geography of evangelicalism, linking Britain and her North American colonies through their common history and religious traditions. These links are central; Noll never loses sight of the intimate connection between evangelicalism on the British Isles and in the American colonies. Noll also uncovers the international influence on the development of evangelicalism through Puritanism, continental pietism (especially the Moravians) and High-Church Anglicanism.

Four central chapters cover the years 1734 to 1795. They include an examination of the transatlantic nature of British revivals and the American Great Awakening; the expanding role of the laity; the central figures of the revivals including Jonathan Edwards, George Whitefield, and Charles and John Wesley; the growing "theological differentiation" among evangelicals; the development of evangelization and voluntary societies; hymnody; the role of women; and the movement of evangelicalism beyond both established churches and the borders of the British Isles and North America.

Along with tracing the development of evangelicalism, Noll also considers why the movement began in the first place. Early evangelical preachers "created evangelicalism" (p. 142) by recognizing first their own spiritual needs and then addressing the needs of others within and outside their own communities in England, Scotland, Ireland, and the colonies. Emphasizing once again the diversity of the evangelical experience, Noll outlines the political, social, economic, and religious circumstances that "awakened" men and women on both sides of the Atlantic to revitalize religion in their own lives. Evangelical leaders were men willing to look outside the box, whether as preachers, theologians, publicists, or publishers. These innovators, such as Jonathan Edwards and George Whitefield, recognized a society in flux as the Enlightenment, the growth of empire, and early industrialization changed their world and the lives of ordinary men and women who longed for something more.

Noll divides evangelicals "in the world" by class, arguing that "evangelicalism transformed people within their inherited social setting, but worked only partial and selective transformation on the social settings themselves" (p. 254). Patricians, usually members of the established church, sought to improve society within the constructs of the traditional social order, mainly through paternalism. For example, these elite evangelicals worked within the legal structure to attack slavery, but not to alleviate the suffering of the working poor in England. The "bourgeois" or

emerging middle class, formed voluntary societies and missionary societies which would lead evangelicals into the next phase of their history. Finally, by allowing men and women moved by the Spirit to speak in public, preaching to African Americans, and erasing class distinctions reinforced by architecture by preaching outdoors, itinerant ministers of the Great Awakening itself inspired the plebeians to challenge the social order in new ways.

While Noll points out that the contributions of evangelicals were limited by the personal nature of the movement itself, his work continually reminds us that religious history is crucial to understanding history as a whole. Too often, scholars underestimate the place that religion held in the hearts and minds of their historical subjects. Noll places the religion of the heart at the forefront.

Sacred Heart University JENNIFER PETRAFESA MCLAUGHLIN

Ancient

From Dogma to History: How Our Understanding of the Early Church Developed. By William H. C. Frend. (London: SCM Press. 2003. Pp. viii, 212. £12.99 paperback.)

This, William Frend's last book, is a fitting summary of his personal concerns and contributions to the history and archaeology of the early Church. It is as much about the six giants, two German, two French, one Scot, and one Englishman, who particularly influenced his views, as about the development of the modern disciplines of church history and Christian archaeology, whose history he so memorably traced in his 1996 book. His own liberal tendencies and sympathies are evident in the treatment of figures often in dispute with authority, conservatism, and traditionalism, and his own personal reminiscences of two of them add color to his account. His choice, if personal, as he admits, is certainly well justified: it comprises Adolf von Harnack, Hans Lietzmann, Stéphane Gsell, Sir William Ramsay, Louis Duchesne, and Norman Baynes, covering the first six centuries of church history and ranging from armchair historians (von Harnack, Baynes) to full-blown field archaeologists (Gsell, Ramsay) and revealing the fascinating other roles they played. After a characteristic Introduction giving details of his own autobiography, Frend allots a chapter to each scholar, supplying very valuable biographical information, putting each in context, and assessing their careers and contributions. A brief Epilogue, while gloomy about prospects for early church history in British divinity faculties and about the threats facing archaeological sites, notes the rise of interest in Late Antiquity in classics and other departments in Britain, the Commonwealth, and America, and ends on a characteristically optimistic note.

Frend's English background did give him a valuable *entrée* into both German and French scholarly circles before and during World War II and the ability to be fair to both sides in what emerges as often a nakedly political contest to exclude the rival country (and sometimes Britain as well) from a par-

ticular region, such as North Africa. His own training as an archaeologist also enables him to chart the developing interplay between it and church history, one of the most significant factors in the last century: we can no longer study the latter in blissful isolation, but must let texts and sites, theologians, historians, and archaeologists, interact. His judgments are generally fair, if he can be critical. Harnack he sees as making a fundamental contribution to the study of church history, taking it far beyond the confines of dusty doctrine, if no archaeologist. Lietzmann he presents, again like Harnack, as a staunch Lutheran and a man of the Church, who not only successfully combined a study of history, archaeology, and liturgy, but also was responsible for some key series of scholarly aids covering both the New Testament and the early Church. The lesser-known Gsell is rightly lauded for his painstaking and uniquely valuable contribution to the history, geography, and archaeology of early Christian North Africa, and useful detail of later scholarly developments in the field is supplied. Ramsay's pioneering work in Asia Minor and Phrygia and its continuing relevance, despite his dated political judgments, are duly recognized. Duchesne's judicious balance between history and the development of doctrine, despite his bitter struggles with Roman Catholic authority, and his recent rehabilitation, are sympathetically sketched. Finally Baynes' contributions to patristic as well as Byzantine scholarship are sympathetically presented.

Frend's book, with its blend of biography and autobiography, does indeed trace the move from dogma to history of the last century, while it also highlights the problems of the discipline and the struggles of major scholars to combine faithfulness to their subject matter with loyalty to their Christian tradition. The future may lie with a different approach, but Frend has written a fitting account and defense of his.

University of Exeter ALASTAIR H. B. LOGAN

Die Vorstellung vom Norden und der Eurozentrismus. Eine Auswertung der patristischen und mittelalterlichen Literatur. By Piotr Kochanek. [Veröffentlichungen des Instituts für europäische Geschichte Mainz: Abteilung für abendländische Religionsgeschichte, Band 205.] (Mainz: Verlag Philipp von Zabern. 2004. Pp. xi, 631.)

This book offers a contribution to the current re-evaluation of the European self-perception by analyzing the representation of the northern regions of Europe from the biblical ages to the thirteenth century. The author focuses on the progressive integration of those regions into what Europe and Christianity were considered to be. He explores the ambivalence of this process, in which the North was either idealized or viewed as a threat to civilization, stating repeatedly that the construction of such representations held a reciprocal relationship with the rise of Eurocentrism.

It would hardly be possible to give an abstract of the three chapters in which the author offers an in-depth and innovative study of the images devel-

oped during Biblical and Greco-Roman Antiquity, the Patristic period, and the Middle Ages. The author succeeds in establishing significant distinctions such as the East-West axis that structures the *oikoumene* symmetrically in the Bible and, sticking to a significantly different agenda, in the works of ancient pagan authors. As a matter of fact, the Patristic period may be held responsible for the fusion of biblical images and the ethno-geographic knowledge of classical Antiquity as well as for the creation of a Christian *schema* of the World (through the acrostic of Adam's name in Greek being a sign of the Christian *oikoumene*; the Cross being a structuring element of the *imago mundi*; or Europeans being descendants of Japhet according to the reformulations of the table of peoples in *Genesis*). Hence the political geography of Antiquity seems to fade away, leaving space for a theology of geography in which the New Alliance is extended to all the people of the *oikoumene* in connection with the typology of Jesus Christ as the new Adam—two ideas that were at the basis of missionary activity. After the disaster of Adrianopolis (378), this conception faced the crude facts of the barbarian invasions (mostly those of the Goths and the Huns), which appeared to many as the concretization of the prophetic threat of plagues coming from the North. As for the Middle Ages, one can eventually identify, as the author does, a progressive integration of those regions into a Christian Europe that was growing northwards and hence restoring the lost unity of the *pars Europae* of the Japhetites. The construction of the argument, though persuasive and harmonious at once, may partly be based on premises that would call for a more profound evaluation. It seems doubtful, for instance, whether the acrostic of Adam really played such an important role in the Middle Ages. Certain general presumptions on the Christocentric symbolism of the *mappae mundi*, in which the "T" separates three parts (rather than continents) of the *oikoumene* as a Cross, are yet to be proven. It may be noted that the association of the sons of Noah with each of these parts is a relatively late phenomenon, which, being datable to a period that does not seem to begin earlier than the seventh century, can hardly have served as a foundation for the Patristic image of the World. Moreover, the exact relation of such historical aspects with the genealogy of Eurocentrism—an element that is explicitly mentioned by the author as an essential part of his thesis—is not sufficiently in evidence.

Nevertheless, such fragilities should in no way hide away the essential qualities of the work. Within the actual historiographical context, this study is markedly distinct from so many others, which merely paraphrase documents to misuse them in the context of impertinent theoretical constructions. The author has treated an enormous quantity of information (the list of sources fills twenty-nine pages, the bibliography twice as much), and he has been able to trace concrete and often very complex relations between the texts and their historical context (political and military events, philosophical and theological controversies), thereby going far beyond the usual miseries of purely intellectual history. By this he manages to explore the complexity of the "theological" character of medieval geography and cartography, which is much too often a meagre commonplace presumption of historians. This book is neither on the history of geog-

raphy nor on the history of theology, but rather a very successful and notable attempt at creating new and illuminating relations between commonly separate disciplines. The monographic analyses are admirable despite the fact that the repetition of facts inevitably leads to a certain dismemberment of the overall argument. The chapters dedicated to Jordanes and Adam of Bremen are exemplary. For all these reasons as much as for the countless references and clues that one can find in this book, it shall swiftly become a reference work.

École pratique des hautes études, Paris PATRICK GAUTIER DALCHÉ

Medieval

The Cartulary of Montier-en-Der, 666-1129. Edited by Constance Brittain Bouchard. [Medieval Academy Books, 108.] (Toronto: University of Toronto Press. 2004. Pp. ix, 404. $75.00.)

The absence of an edition of Montier-en-Der's charters has long been a source of frustration, given the monastery's underappreciated importance. It was founded in the mid-seventh century as part of the movement influenced by Luxeuil (indeed, all editions of Luxeuil's ground-breaking exemption go back to the copy in Montier-en-Der's cartulary), and the family of its founder, Bercharius, appears to have been one of the greatest in the Merovingian kingdoms. Guarding an invasion route between East and West Francia, its ninth-century rectors and patrons were consistently among Charles the Bald's most trusted palatines (Wulfad, Adalgarius, Boso). In the 930's it was one of the first houses brought into the monastic reforms emanating from Toul. A subsequent abbot, Adso, was one of the period's most interesting writers. Another was so close to Leo IX that the pope gave him his own name (Bruno). Der remained a favored recipient of privileges of the early reform popes. It also developed extremely close ties with the counts of Champagne and the first lords of Joinville. Bouchard's splendid edition is therefore a treasure.

Compiled in the 1120's, the cartulary contains 167 acts ranging from the seventh through the early twelfth centuries, ending with the privilege for Luxueil and the monastery's important polyptich. Bouchard adds another nine acts from other sources (including several that show the monks' continuing ties with Boso's family, when they sought refuge from the Northmen in Vienne with his son). The collection sounds many themes familiar to historians who work with monastic charters: the replacement of a mixed rule under Louis the Pious; the abbacy's subsequent secularization; the reform program which gave secularized altars to monasteries; recurring troubles with banal lords. But there is much else besides. In keeping with current understandings, Bouchard maintains the cartulary's integrity as a designed compilation created by an author (several, in fact), and she has been scrupulous in disentangling the forgeries that are unusually rife in the cartulary (particularly among the papal bulls). This allows a reader to see how much those forgeries seemed designed to insert the

monastery into an ongoing ecclesiastical, Frankish history almost epic in scope (e.g., no. 87). Though not as circumstantial as those from western France, the disputed charters are unusually detailed and foresightful in their settlements. I know of few charters that insist so explicitly on the ties of *societas* and *fraternitas* given to lay donors. Fascinatingly, one charter has a donor captured and wounded in battle demanding that the monks ransom him *per fraternitatem* (no. 118). Crusades figure prominently in several acts (as does a campaign in Spain, no. 83), in which the monastery funded expenses for donors. In others one sees new ideas of Christian piety being inculcated among lay aristocrats (e.g., no. 37). However, one of the most unusual aspects of these acts are the small glimpses they give into the bonds of family. Clearly having bettered himself, a priest redeems his mother, sister, and his sister's sons from servitude (no. 115). A knight gives property he had from his mother and her father, for his soul and theirs, and for his sister who had just been buried in the monastery, and asks that when he dies he be buried next to her (no. 97; cf. no. 48). In an intriguing charter (no. 54), the monks recount how a young man wanted to give over his entire inheritance from his mother and become a monk, but the monks resisted because he could not promise his father's agreement. They compromised by allowing him to live with them for five months, testing his commitment, until the father finally came and agreed. An edition this valuable more than repays Bouchard's hard work.

University of California, Berkeley GEOFFREY KOZIOL

The Reform of the Frankish Church: Chrodegang of Metz and the Regula canonicorum in the Eighth Century. By M.A. Claussen. [Cambridge Studies in Medieval Life and Thought—Fourth Series, Vol. 61.] (New York: Cambridge University Press. 2005. Pp. xiv, 342. $80.00.)

This is an extremely welcome book. It fills what has been a significant gap in our knowledge of the eighth-century Church, and it puts Chrodegang firmly on the map as bishop, reformer, founder of Gorze, and patron of Lorsch. It draws attention to the importance of the councils of Ver, Verberie, and Attigny dominated by Chrodegang, and it analyzes the Rule for canons in scrupulous detail. The analysis of the Rule takes up a good third of the book. Claussen examines the relationship between Chrodegang's instructions for canons and Benedict's for monks, showing exactly how they differ—though here (and indeed elsewhere) it is perhaps a pity that no translation is provided for lengthy passages in Latin: the effect will be to put off students, who could learn a great deal from the discussion. Claussen goes on to look at Chrodegang's dependence on Gregory the Great, Caesarius of Arles, and also Pomerius, author of *De vita contemplativa*. The discussion of Pomerius is particularly useful; it provides a full description and evaluation of an important but understudied work. All this analysis Claussen achieves with a keen sense of the value of intertextuality, which allows him not only to note where Chrodegang departs from or disagrees with his sources, but also where he appears to be

pushing his own clergy further than the basic text of his Rule implies. In the final third of the book Claussen opens up his discussion to look at Chrodegang's ideas for the community of Metz as a whole—to be thought of as a new hagiopolis, comparable in certain respects with Rome. For this he draws attention to the evidence for the bishop's involvement in liturgical reform in his own city, which involves both archaeological and art-historical material (notably the chancel of St. Pierre-aux-Nonnains) and also those liturgical manuscripts which have been associated in one way or another with Chrodegang or Metz. Claussen's reading of the Rule and of Chrodegang more generally is totally convincing, and provides us with a fixed point, to put alongside Boniface, for understanding the Frankish Church in the generation before Charlemagne. Perhaps inevitably, in doing so Claussen leaves us with questions which need more consideration—though some may well prove to be insoluble. The title of the book, *The Reform of the Frankish Church*, may lead readers to expect more consideration of the state of that Church before Chrodegang. Claussen repeats the established picture of a Church in need of reform: but is there any way of getting further under the rhetoric of the reformers? Can anything more be said, in particular, about cathedral clergy in such cities as Lyon and Autun, places associated with the *Vetus Gallica*, which we have learnt in recent years to regard as a compilation of considerable sophistication? Scholars working on the seventh-century Church in Francia have concentrated largely, though not exclusively, on monasticism. The non-monastic clergy deserve more consideration: indeed they need to be re-evaluated before we can fully assess the significance of Chrodegang's Rule. Claussen also notes the impact of Anglo-Saxons (notably Boniface) on the eighth-century Church, though he prefers to emphasize the importance of Rome, and in so doing adds much to our understanding of papal influence. It would, however, be interesting to put possible Anglo-Saxon influence more firmly under the spotlight. Many of the matters which Claussen sees as central to Chrodegang's contribution have been traced in late-seventh- and early-eighth-century England: the significance of liturgical singing in the Roman manner, an interest in a stational liturgy, the Jerusalem community of the Acts of the Apostles as an ideal. The last is central to Bede's thought, yet Bede is a notable absentee from Claussen's analysis. Of course, these parallels do not prove that Anglo-Saxon influence on Chrodegang was greater than Claussen implies (and some historians may in any case have overestimated these aspects of the English Church anyway). On the other hand, as a result of Claussen's work, we do need a yet sharper analysis of what the Anglo-Saxons did and did not contribute: of what developed independently and yet in parallel in England and on the continent. In other words, Claussen's study of Chrodegang transforms our knowledge of the *Regula canonicorum* and of Metz itself. It also opens up avenues for further work on the eighth-century Church in Francia, Rome, and England.

University of Leeds IAN N. WOOD

The Chrodegang Rules: The Rules for the Common Life of the Secular Clergy from the Eighth and Ninth Centuries. Critical Texts with Translations and Commentary. By Jerome Bertram. [Church, Faith, and Culture in the Medieval West.] (Burlington, Vermont: Ashgate Publishing Company. 2005. Pp. x, 293. $99.95.)

The eighth-century bishop Chrodegang of Metz (d. 766) had a deep influence on the early medieval Church. Building on the reforming spirit of St. Boniface, Chrodegang's efforts to regulate the lives of secular clergy formed one of the cornerstones of Christian order under the Carolingians and influenced the tenth-century Benedictine reforms in England. In this volume, Jerome Bertram attempts to make some of the sources for Chrodegang—often only found in rare Latin editions—more accessible for a wider public. His interest is not historical per se but rather pastoral, providing part of a call to isolated Catholic clergy to re-establish a form of communal living. There are things to be gained, he argues, by studying the history of the *vita communis* so that those who do not take the monastic vow to renounce property can still effectively engage with their pastoral responsibilities.

Bertram offers us editions of three texts with accompanying translations: the *Regula sancti Chrodegangi* of c. 755, the Aachen *Institutio Canonicorum* of c. 816, and the later-ninth-century *Regula Longior Canonicorum*. Although only the first of these texts is actually by Chrodegang himself, Benedict of Aniane's decrees at Aachen were deeply indebted to the spirit of Chrodegang's work, while the *Regula Longior* represents a heavily interpolated reworking of the earlier *Regula* to the extent that it is sometimes mistakenly thought to be by the bishop of Metz himself. The Latin editions are largely taken from those by, respectively, Jean-Baptiste Pelt (1937), Albert Werminghof (1906), and Arthur Napier (1916) with only minor amendments; but their inclusion is anyway to make the texts more available, not to supersede them. It is regrettable that chapters 1-113 of the *Institutio*—mainly a collection of quotations from Isidore and church councils—were excluded. Here would have been a valuable resource from which to gain a sense of the historical perspectives of those at the Aachen councils. Further disappointment lies in the decision to place the translations after each edition, rather than across the page, which can make the volume a little cumbersome depending on how one imagines one might use it. The translations themselves are on the whole faithful and readable, and will be of great use for helping students, especially those without Latin, to engage with the sources and the issues they raise.

The historical context as given is useful, setting in broad terms the background to issues such as clerical continence. The benefit of this section for non-academic readers is that it sets out some key definitions and distinctions. For those wishing to pursue things in more detail, however, the scholarship on which it is based is rather on the thin side, most notably in German where the works of Rudolf Schieffer, Josef Semmler, and others are poorly represented. Such problems are exacerbated, through no fault of the author, by the publica-

tion of two recent books on similar themes: Martin Claussen's study of Chrodegang's *Regula* and Brigitte Langefeld's study of the Old English version of the *Regula Longior*. It is a shame that the three writers were unable to collaborate in their work. Langefeld's lists and examination of the manuscript traditions of the *Regular Longior*, for example, are more extensive than Bertram's and could have aided his discussion considerably. Future scholars of Chrodegang and his influence will, nevertheless, have a much richer field in which to work, and Bertram will have contributed to that felicitous development.

Despite its academic shortcomings, *The Chrodegang Rules* does what it was intended to do: it provides a useful and accessible place in which to study some important but often neglected early medieval documents.

University of Nottingham JAMES T. PALMER

Send Me God: The Lives of Ida the Compassionate of Nivelles, Nun of La Ramée, Arnulf, Lay Brother of Villers, and Abundus, Monk of Villers by Goswin of Bossut. Translated by and with an introduction by Martinus Cawley O.C.S.O. [Brepols Medieval Women Series.] (University Park: The Pennsylvania State University Press. 2003. Pp. xlix, 258. $25.00 paperback.)

This is a splendid volume. It comes with its own kit of tools to enrich the reader's scholarly experience. It begins, for example, with a useful bibliographical mapping of the scholarly terrein. It also provides a detailed map of the physical locale in which the saintly subjects of these *vitae* lived, prayed, and worked. It provides an important preface by Barbara Newman identifying and illustrating the religious culture of the Low Countries and the Rhineland these *vitae* express, a culture in which spiritual friendships flourished at distance and across the boundaries segregating spiritually serious persons by sex. There is also a second introduction more narrowly focused upon the *vitae* of Goswin themselves, describing the physical world he would have known, the literary corpus to which his hagiographical efforts belonged, Goswin's position within the life of his community, his relationship to and possible intent for the *vitae* he wrote, his use of language, and the challenge it presents to the would-be translator. As said, all these tools serve to enrich the reader's subsequent encounter with the translations themselves.

The translations are lucid, even when stretching language and grammar to present something of the feel of the Goswinian originals. Moreover, the translator provides the reader full access to his "study." That is, he takes the time to present example after example of the conundra he faced in dealing with Goswin's Latin, for Goswin was that kind of monastic author who took the patterns of meditative reading (*ruminatio*) and used them as structural principles of effective writing. That is, he extended word-play beyond all modern sense of decorum; it operates on multiple levels, constituting, at one and the same time, principles of invention, conceptual arrangement, and *ductus* or rhetori-

cal flow. In addition, the translator uses footnoted italicization in the text to give the reader a sense of the intertextual echoes that constantly sound and resound in Goswin's prose. Most strikingly, he uses his apparatus to let the reader in on the presence of secrets that he has uncovered by virtue of his deep familiarity with the texts and their author. I point especially to his identification of places where Goswin has deliberately suppressed the names of his protagonists' interlocutors. Reading these translations, one enters deeply into the literary and linguistic world of the Latin originals. They constitute an extraordinarily effective rendering.

The *vitae* themselves deserve mention. They breathe their author's insistence that in the figure of these saints, and in the 'universe' that radiates out from them, heaven and earth are joined and the King and Queen of Heaven walk among us. Moreover, we see that in their world, for all its discursive antitheses, flesh is not body. For, when heaven and earth are joined and flesh is banished into outer darkness, the body remains central to life lived before the face of God. In one *vita*, it takes on the form of consecrated bread. In another, the pulsing rouge of the flagellated back. In a third, the labile softness of the Virgin's lips. Indeed, body remains the very site of religious encounter. Such corporeal emphasis is, of course, an emphasis we have learned to associate with high medieval women above all. But here we see that body functions similarly in the extraordinary religious radicality of a Cistercian lay brother and monk. Together, these three *vitae* suggest that we could be more nuanced in our understanding of the intersection of gender and high medieval religion.

Institute for Christian Studies ROBERT SWEETMAN
Toronto

A Translation of the "Chronicle" of the Abbey of Morigny, France, c. 1100-1150. Edited and translated by Richard Cusimano. [Mediaeval Studies, Vol. 22.] (Lewiston, New York: Edwin Mellen Press. 2003. Pp. ix, 233.)

Several monastic chronicles from northern France in the first half of the twelfth century give us much of our information both on political events and on monastic life during the period: the chronicles of Suger, of Orderic Vitalis, of Guibert of Nogent, of Herman of Tournai, and of Galbert of Bruges. The Chronicle of Morigny deserves to be considered with this group but is much less well known. The critical edition of the twelfth-century manuscript, done by Léon Mirot, is a century old; there has been no modern study of the monastery and its historiography; and the chronicle has never before been translated. It consists of three books by at least three different authors; the first book is rather fragmentary. Only the first book names its author, the prior Thiou. Here Richard Cusimano, one of the co-translators of Suger's *Deeds of Louis the Fat* (1992), provides an English translation, with Mirot's Latin helpfully reproduced on facing pages. Handsome color photographs of the churches mentioned, family trees, endnotes, and maps (the latter very useful

but unfortunately reproduced a bit too small and without a scale of kilometers) complete the volume. The notes, as well as identifying people, places, and biblical citations, provide important discussions of issues raised by the text.

Morigny was a house of Benedictine monks, not affiliated with any of the great twelfth-century monastic orders, but nonetheless dedicated to establishing a regular life and maintaining its property. The monastery flourished especially under the thirty-year rule of Abbot Thomas, best known now for his role in condemning the writings of Peter Abelard. Overall, the Morigny chronicle focuses on the history of the monastery from its foundation at the end of the eleventh century to about 1150, especially the monks' long quarrel with the secular canons of nearby Etampes. In addition, the second book of the chronicle provides a good deal of information on King Louis VI, including his decision at the 1130 Council of Etampes to support Pope Innocent II against the antipope Anaclet, and the accidental death of the king's heir in 1131. The chronicle also includes summaries of some early donations of property to the monastery.

Cusimano's translation is serviceable and faithful to the Latin, although the English is sometimes rather awkward. Latin is in fact very hard to put into good English without lapsing into paraphrase, but when the chronicle begins with the ringing, "Noveritis, o posteri nostri." one wishes for a more poetic translation than, "Understand, O our future generations [at the abbey]" (pp. 16-17). Similarly, in a scene where the abbot complains to the king about his treatment at the hands of the canons of Etampes, "He revealed the affront" is indeed an accurate translation of "Pandit injuriam" (pp. 38-39), but it is not graceful English.

This said, the volume should be warmly welcomed. It makes an important and fascinating chronicle much more accessible. It is however unfortunate that it was brought out by the Edwin Mellen Press, which means that it is priced out of the range of most individuals and will not be bought by most libraries, given the rather unsavory reputation of some other Mellen books. Perhaps an academic press will take up the paperback rights; it would be an excellent book to use in an upper-level class on medieval monasticism.

University of Akron CONSTANCE B. BOUCHARD

The Secular Jurisdiction of Monasteries in Anglo-Norman and Angevin England. By Kevin L. Shirley. [Studies in the History of Medieval Religion, Vol. XXI.] (Rochester, New York: Boydell and Brewer, Inc. 2004. Pp. xii, 184.)

Beginning from the assumption that, for the century and a half after 1066, the honour courts of the greater English abbeys have been little studied, Kevin Shirley uses various of the better-known English chroniclers and the published editions of royal writs to advance a simple and generally convincing thesis. In essence, the idea that at some time in the pre-Plantagenet past the English abbots presided over honorial courts from which royal authority was entirely excluded is, as Shirley demonstrates, a myth. On the contrary, from a very early date, royal writs and

access to the king's courts were solicited by the English abbots to support their authority over and against their tenants. Rather than representing the first real intrusion of royal authority into the relationship between the abbots and their secular tenantry, the new possessory assizes of Henry II's reign enjoyed a long pre-history. Their effect, gradual rather than revolutionary, and fiscal rather than authoritarian in intent, was to supply tenants with new leverage against landlords who previously had looked to the crown for support rather than rebuke. However, after a period from the 1160's to the 1220's in which the abbots faced the erosion of their liberties, the relatively unintrusive government of Henry III allowed a breathing space in which the ecclesiastical franchises were rebuilt and their independence and profitability buttressed against future attack. So far, so good. Shirley defends his argument, albeit somewhat repetitively, through the recital of case after case in which royal authority either was or was not invoked. In the process, he proves both his own competence in the reading of medieval legal records and his eligibility for the doctoral degree with which, one assumes, his labors were crowned. As a book rather than a thesis, however, his work has to be judged according to more stringent criteria, and here two serious faults emerge. To begin with, Shirley merely rehearses a line of argument that has been advanced with far more subtlety by previous writers, most notably, in recent years, by John Hudson. Not only does Shirley continue to cite one of his principal sources—the Abingdon Chronicle—without reference to Hudson's new edition, but he makes no use whatsoever of other recent literature. Thus Alain Boureau's interesting if controversial ideas on the monastic contribution to the development of English law go entirely unnoticed. David Bates's edition of the charters of William I is cited, but frequently confused in the footnotes with the older edition of Rufus's charters in the Anglo-Norman *Regesta*. The work of Emily Amt and Graeme White on the accession of Henry II, although fundamental, is apparently unknown to Shirley, as indeed are many of the more important contributions to his debates, not least the various articles by J. C. Holt and others which have called into question the reliability of the Battle Chronicle. More seriously, Shirley assumes that the majority of the business of the honour court concerned property and land law: an assumption which, although unconsciously shared by various of the modern authorities, is surely false. Long after the possessory assizes had eroded the independence of the abbatial court in some though by no means all cases involving land, the criminal jurisdiction of the liberties remained both effective and, one assumes, highly lucrative. Shirley has virtually nothing to say on criminal jurisdiction. It is nonetheless worth bearing in mind that the liberty of the bishops of Ely maintained an officer named the chief justice until 1837, and that the liberty of Peterborough, direct successor to the pre-Reformation abbatial liberty, had its own jail as late as 1877. Here as throughout, Shirley fails to define precisely which private courts he regards as honorial. Thus he makes no attempt to distinguish between the courts of hundred and liberty (which represented the private exercise of franchises exercised elsewhere by royal sheriffs, coroners, and bailiffs) from the honour court as imagined by Stenton: a much more "feudal" affair, served chiefly by the liberty-holder's knights, and convened, so far as we can judge, not merely in imitation at the private franchisal level of procedures, which under royal jurisdiction

took place in the county or hundred courts, but on an *ad hoc* basis, more akin to the operations of the court *coram rege* or that protean body known as the King's council or Parliament. Since he is almost entirely dependent upon evidence drawn from royal writs and from the handful of monastic chronicles in which such writs were recorded, Shirley not surprisingly writes a history concerned chiefly with property cases drawn from the monastic courts into royal jurisdiction. Not only does this risk placing too great a reliance upon the monastic chroniclers, who had a vested interest in recording, and if necessary in rewriting, those cases in which the monks could be seen to have triumphed, but it overlooks various crucial bodies of evidence. Just as our chief knowledge of the twelfth-century county courts comes to us in the form of writs and instructions issued by the King, so the search for the monastic honour court should carry us to the *acta* and charters of the greater English abbots. Yet here, Shirley uses only a very limited number of published collections, entirely overlooking, for example, R. H. C. Davis' edition of the *Kalendar of Abbot Samson*. For the financial implications of the private franchises, the royal pipe rolls preserve vacancy accounts from a number of bishoprics and abbeys which, on occasion, detail the profits of justice. Through his neglect of such sources and through his failure to distinguish between the various levels of justice available in private franchise courts—from the manor through the hundred to the seneschal's tourn, the liberty and the direct hearing in the monastic chapter—Shirley's must be accounted an interesting but far from definitive study of the abbatial franchise.

University of East Anglia NICHOLAS VINCENT

Gesammelte Abhandlungen und Aufsätze: Volume 1: *Von Dante zum Risorgimento. Studien zur Geistesgeschichte und Sozialgeschichte Italiens*; Volume 2/1: *Studien zur Papst- und Reichsgeschichte, zur Geschichte des Mittelmeerraumes und zum kanonischen Recht im Mittelalter*. Erster Halbband; Volume 2/2: *Studien zur Papst- und Reichsgeschichte, zur Geschichte des Mittelmeerraumes und zum kanonischen Recht im Mittelalter*. Zweiter Halbband. By Peter Herde. (Stuttgart: Anton Hiersemann Verlag. 1997, 2002, 2005. Pp. ix, 419; viii, 468; 469-928. €58.00; 188.00; 248.00.)

The Collected Studies of Peter Herde reflect his scholarship over some forty years with extensive archival research, especially in Italy. He exhibits a pronounced global perspective in much of his work, a quite unique trait for a medieval Latin paleographer and historian by training. These volumes contain editions of numerous Latin documents, color photographs, and topographical maps of medieval battlefields. Of the thirty-four articles, six are in Italian and two in English.

Volume 1 considers humanism in Italy and the transition of Florence from a republic to an oligarchy. The author observes that an agonal mind arose among the many city-states of Tuscany, Umbria, Lombardy, the Veneto, and Piedmont

which led to a spirit of inquiry and creativity which were so essential for the development of the Renaissance. Herde illuminates Dante's intellectual development and increasing political responsibility, especially the way in which his views evolved from a personal to a broader Florentine perspective. Visits to Naples, San Gimignano, and Rome most likely occurred in his capacity as an official or pilgrim during the 1290's to 1300. Dante remained skeptical of his city's commercial ties to France and the Angevins, while his personal feelings toward Boniface VIII did not cloud his ability to separate the office and the person of the pope. His idea of a philosopher-emperor did not rely on historical precedent, i.e., on the imperial German dynasties, while the subordination of the emperor to the pope could only be understood in terms of fatherly grace.

The wealthy and traditional magnate families were excluded from power with the rise of politically well-versed families which saw themselves as Guelfs. By the 1260's the Church and Guelf circles dominated politics as Florence became the center of the Guelf movement, anti-imperial and pro-papal, espousing freedom of the communes. About 1300 the names Guelf and Ghibelline spread into Lombardy and south central Italy, but by the 1330's the Guelf bloc had disintegrated. The interests of the communes were no longer identical with those of the pope, now in Avignon. For a brief period during the *Otto santi* rebellion of 1375-1378, the lower classes asserted themselves, but the oligarchic reaction soon silenced them.

As chancellor since 1375, Coluccio Salutati shaped Florentine policy ideologically. His official correspondence reveals a Guelf and pro-French attitude after his initial interest in Rienzo's concept of sovereignty and Petrarch's idea of a universal emperor had faded. By 1400, during the so-called crisis of the early Italian Renaissance, the Giangaleazzo crisis in Florence, signs of the decline of liberty were already being felt. Humanists began to conform and to serve new rulers, and politically Florentine humanism became a neutral entity. In this context Herde concurs with scholars like Michael Seidlmayer that the thesis of Hans Baron about liberty vis-à-vis tyranny is too sharply drawn. In addition, scholars have overrated the Giangaleazzo crisis because they took the rhetoric of humanists like Salutati literally.

Herde's analysis of the Guelf idea and its Neo-Guelf variant deserves a close reading. Conradin's demise gave Guelfs much food for thought. Thomas of Pavia, writing at Santa Croce, saw him as a victim of his advisors while the Guelf party viewed his death due to French barons, not to Charles of Anjou. Brunetto Latini, an arch Guelf, remained distant and cool to Conradin's fate. Fourteenth-century historians like Giovanni Villani deepened the Guelf-Ghibelline dichotomy while Salutati's state letters express the ultimate rhetorical-political and historical-ideological form in arguing for the Guelf idea. During the nineteenth century, the Risorgimento adopted the medieval Guelf idea as part of the liberal Catholic program, wherein the Turin cleric Vincenzo Gioberti was central and the historians Cesare Balbo and Luigi Tosti played significant roles. They, in turn, elicited a reaction among Neo-Ghibelline historians.

Volume 2/1 considers the Greek church in southern Italy, the survival of the Greek rite and language within the *ecclesia Romana*. Canonists, especially after Pope Innocent III, strove for the Latinization of this region. A unique contribution is Herde's analysis of epidemics. Using medieval sources, neglected or misread by early twentieth-century medical scholars, and our current understanding of symptoms, Herde is able to reclassify some diseases once thought to have been malaria, but are now seen as bacillary dysentery, *Shigella dysenteriae*. The epidemic which decimated Frederick Barbarossa's army in 1167 is an excellent case study in this regard. Oftentimes, a combination of causes contributed to a weakened condition and subsequent death.

Herde uses N. Daniel, *Islam and the West* (Edinburgh, 1960) as a basis for discussing how canon law treated Jews and Muslims. The former lived at peace in Christian lands while the latter were in a state of war against Christendom. Battlefields in Italy and the Holy Land are discussed using medieval sources and topographical observations. For the battle at the Horns of Hattin on July 3-4, 1187, Herde finds Ernoul valuable, Arabic sources quite reliable, and concludes that the weak king of Jerusalem took advice from the short-sighted master of the Templars leading to disaster. The unholy rivalry which divided the feudal lords of the kingdom was its downfall.

Oriental armies often used the feigned retreat followed by a surprise attack from an ambush. They were lightly armed, fought at a distance, harassed and wore down the enemy. The feigned retreat and ambush are trademarks of the Mongol victory near Liegnitz in 1241, of the Mamelukes at Ain Jalūt in 1260, and of the French over the youthful German king Conradin at Tagliacozzo in 1268, where two French combatants had Oriental experience and where even a decoy was used, something adverse to the knightly code of honor.

The Mongols are also considered in apocalyptic speculation. The struggle between Emperor Frederick II and Pope Innocent IV provided images of the end of times while their respective chanceries poured forth material like the curial pamphlet *Eger cui lenia* (1245/46). Anti-Christ and the pro-Byzantine, anti-Islamic propaganda of Pseudo-Methodius were useful to authors of this era, e.g., Albert Behaim, a canon at Passau, utilized Pseudo-Methodius on behalf of the papacy. Later, an about-face occurred as the papacy sought the Mongols as allies against the Muslims in the Holy Land.

The fate of southern Italy was decided at Tagliacozzo. Conradin was brought to Naples and executed at its marketplace with his remains later interred in the town's newly constructed Carmelite church. The author finds contemporary sources of the battle good: the chronicle of Morea and Primat, and of modern historians Busson and Hampe unhindered by national bias, unlike Gregorovius, while Roloff and Delbrück are poor. Herde largely confirms the negative view that historians have of Charles I of Anjou, but does not see him responsible for the economic decline of the Regno in subsequent centuries.

In considering papal elections in the thirteenth century, Herde observes at least five elections by compromise by committee and one by inspiration with subsequent confirmation by the cardinals. The author focuses on the tribulations between 1276 and 1294 and sees the pontificate of Celestine V bringing a certain conclusion to the development of papal election in terms of legislation. The suspensions of *Ubi periculum* by the popes Hadrian V and John XXI were rescinded by Celestine V on December 10, 1294, as the resistance of the cardinals to the new regulations faded. However, Celestine V's measures were not incorporated by Boniface VIII into *Liber Sextus* and thus not anchored in canon law. It was Gregory X's *Ubi periculum* that was incorporated and settled procedures for conclaves of the fourteenth century as election by *scrutinium* became the rule.

In Volume 2/2 the author expands upon his research on Pope Celestine V. He considers a possible affinity of Peter of Morrone's hermit congregation of Benedictine monks to Franciscan spirituality: hermitages named for the Holy Spirit, the loose connection to Joachim of Fiore, the strict rules of the congregation which may reflect the Franciscan rule to some degree, and the pope's meeting with two prominent Franciscan Spirituals leading to the creation of the Poor Hermits of Pope Celestine. Finally, two seventeenth-century artists are remembered for commemorating the life of the pope. In the late 1650's Mattia Preti painted a ceiling fresco in the church San Pietro a Maiella in Naples, one of the oldest and most important monuments of the Angevin Celestine cult. Carl Ruthart, most likely of Danzig, became a Celestine monk at Rome, and spent his last years at Santa Maria di Collemaggio in L'Aquila, which he decorated with paintings and where he died about 1703.

The early life of Benedict Caetani/Pope Boniface VIII and his education including how well-versed he was in canon law are considered. His advice about the question of the inheritance of deceased heretics and a plan to elevate him to Cardinal-Bishop follow. His election as pope on December 24, 1294, was a highly charged political event. Matteo Rosso Orsini was his most likely rival, but his chances of election were nil. With one exception contemporary sources indicate he was elected on the first ballot, although not unanimously. Only a simple, and in many respects, unreliable priest of Thuringia claimed it took three ballots. The political climate made it expedient that the ceremonies for his investiture be performed with much dispatch on the same day as his election.

This volume also considers three cardinals, Gerard of Parma at the synod of Melfi in 1284, Matthew of Acquasparta, and Giangaetano Orsini's discussion of heretics and their property. The latter piece is contrasted with the advice of Benedict Caetani on this subject. The author concludes with the beginnings of European expansion in the Middle Ages. He draws from the work of S. E. Morison, P. Chaunu (1969), and F. Braudel, and raises the question about the transfer of the impetus for exploration from Italy to the Iberian peninsula. He sees it as a slow process of some hundred years with the reconquest, the

plague, Avignon, and dislocation in Italy all playing their part. It also took almost a hundred years from the sighting of the Azores in 1341 until they were settled. This topic concludes with Magellan, for, as the author says, this era ceases about 1520 as colonization begins in earnest.

Given the author's perspective on Italian humanism and the papacy, Martin Luther is mentioned only twice. The Reformer is most likely understood as a given historical quantity who belongs in a theological context in a post-medieval debate while Christopher Columbus does belong here, given the global and intellectual context which sparked his adventures.

Newport News, Virginia JOHN R. EASTMAN

The Hanged Man: A Story of Miracle, Memory, and Colonialism in the Middle Ages. By Robert Bartlett. (Princeton: Princeton University Press. 2004. Pp. xiv, 168. $14.95 paperback.)

Robert Bartlett has previously devoted scholarly attention to medieval legal procedure (trial by ordeal) and to English (and European) expansionism and attitudes to peoples regarded as subject or inferior. These interests meet in this compact study of one of the many stories included in the canonization dossier of Thomas Cantilupe, bishop of Hereford. In November 1290 William Cragh, a Welshman variously described as brigand and rebel, was sentenced to be hanged by William de Briouze, lord of Swansea Castle; for some reason he attracted the compassionate interest of the lord's wife, Mary, and, although to all appearances satisfactorily dead, was "measured" to St. Thomas and resuscitated. The story was first reported by the canons of Hereford Cathedral in their compilation of Cantilupe's miracles, and in 1307 it was painstakingly investigated by the papal commissioners appointed to conduct the official enquiry into his sanctity. Their inquisitorial procedure is in itself an important part of Bartlett's story. The testimonies they elicited from witnesses conflicted both with one another and with the story previously told by the Hereford canons, but Bartlett does not attempt to resolve all these contradictions in order to achieve an impossibly authoritative version of events. He is more interested in letting the dead speak. How did the witnesses (including the Hanged Man himself) remember and date past events, and what did they reveal under questioning about their own beliefs and behavior? A wealth of context (for example, about the late thirteenth-century Welsh background) and discussion (for example of concepts of time and space) is contained in the book's succinct chapters. We are told what can be known from other sources about William and Mary de Briouze and the other actors in the story; we learn about death by hanging and about current devotional practices.

If there is anything missing, it might be a fuller discussion of Cantilupe's Welsh miracles, for the revival of the Hanged Man was by no means the only one. The saint responded to the supplications of both English persons in Wales

and native Welshmen, including individuals of both nationalities who had been imperiled during the wars. William Cragh's case was conspicuous inasmuch as he was clearly regarded by several witnesses as a very dubious character; he was also solely Welsh-speaking. The papal commissioners investigated another miracle which interestingly resembles one performed by Thomas Becket over a century before. A boy from Ludlow, mute because he had no tongue, went at least twice to the shrine, on each occasion obtaining a little more tongue, which enabled him to speak mingled Welsh and English. Becket's Welsh client had gone to Canterbury, which was a long way away, but when relics of Becket were installed at Whitchurch in Shropshire, specifically as a shield against the marauding Welsh, they seem to have become a focus for Welsh and English pilgrims alike. The efficacy of English saints in such a context might be thought to underline English political authority; did recourse to the saint imply acceptance of the establishment which possessed and presented his relics? Another Welshman who had been dumb for four and a half years came to the shrine "against the will of his kin and friends," but it is not clear what their objections were. For the canons of Hereford Cathedral it was of course entirely desirable that their saint should be all things to all men, and many native Welsh fell within the geographical range that the shrine might reasonably hope to cover (Swansea was three days' journey away). Perhaps William Cragh was playing shrewdly to his audience when he claimed to have been a pilgrim to Cantilupe's shrine before his arrest and execution.

King's College DIANA WEBB
University of London

The Crusade against Heretics in Bohemia, 1418-1437. Sources and Documents for the Hussite Crusades. By Thomas A. Fudge. [Crusade Texts in Translation, Volume 9.] (Burlington, Vermont: Ashgate Publishing Company. 2002. Pp. xix, 419, 6 maps. $74.95.)

The core of the book consists of translated documents relating to the period from the first Bohemian crusade (1420) to the fifth (1431). It begins with a general introduction relating to the whole period. Each of the 208 documents is preceded by an explanation of its contents, context, and date. There are between sixty and seventy documents whose originals are in each of Czech, German, and Latin. While most scholars interested in the Middle Ages can handle German and Latin readily, the availability of translations of the Czech material will be widely welcomed.

The author has selected his material so that the dates are as equally as possible spread over the years under study. He draws on a wide variety of sources including songs, contemporary historians, commentaries on military practice, and registers of the papal chancellery, synods, *reichstags,* and diets. Dr. Fudge's efforts to select material adequately covering the period, while using diverse sources, have been successful.

The documents give a vivid picture of the military leadership on the two sides and why the crusaders failed so abjectly. The crusades were organized by a series of papal legates who attempted to cajole leaders of the states surrounding Bohemia to contribute troops and cash to the effort. It was a hard sell. Those princes who did participate all wanted a role in the leadership despite having little military talent. The end results were separate, ill-co-ordinated armies led by incompetents. Sigismund, the pretender king of Bohemia, managed to miss every crusade. The Bohemians, on the other hand, were very well led. Until 1424, their commander was the military genius Jan Žižka, an extraordinary leader and creative tactician. His successors, Procop Holý and Procůpek, while lacking Žižka's brilliance, were good, solid commanders.

There is an interesting story of Cardinal Henry Beaufort's petition to the Privy Council to be permitted to raise funds from English citizens to provision a crusade. He was eventually allowed to do so, but had first to present to the council a tally of all funds raised. The money could then be spent to purchase material for the crusaders, but the funds could be spent only in England. Some things never change!

The author seems to relish referring to the Bohemians as "Hussite heretics." It grates. The only doctrinal difference between the two sides was whether to give the chalice to the laity. The legates of the Council of Basel in 1434 accepted that this was permissible. So if the Bohemians were orthodox on this issue in 1434, they were equally orthodox in 1418 when Martin V, presumably through ignorance, branded them as heretical. Furthermore, Utraquism was instituted by Jakoubek of Stříbro, not by Hus, who counseled from Constance against it. It is much more accurate to talk about Czech Utraquists than about Hussite heretics.

The quality of the translation is uneven, in one case caused by reliance on a Czech translation of a document rather than on its Latin original. Feast days are sometimes confused, that of Saint James the Greater is said to fall on May 1 and that of Matthias in September. In commenting on the bull proclaiming the first crusade, the author notes, "The usual plenary indulgence guaranteed that whoever took up arms against the heretics would receive absolution of all their sins." The bull which follows puts it somewhat differently: "Those who respond, through absolution and true penance, shall have one hundred days of penance remitted. . . ."

University of Toronto BARRY F. H. GRAHAM

Pilgrimage to Images in the Fifteenth Century: The Origins of the Cult of Our Lady of Częstochowa. By Robert Maniura. (Woodbridge, Suffolk, and Rochester, New York: The Boydell Press. 2004. Pp. x, 238. £50.)

Among the many pilgrimage destinations in the Catholic world, the monastery of the order of St. Paul the First Hermit on the summit of the Jasna Góra (Bright Mount) in Częstochowa in Poland contains one of the most famous images, viz., a painted panel of the Virgin Mary with an apparently scarred face

holding the Christ child. Since the Middle Ages, pilgrims have come here; miracles have been associated with the image; and the site has become richly embedded in Poland's national memory, having withstood attacks by heretic Hussites in the fifteenth century and assaults by Swedish armies in the seventeenth, and—more recently—having survived the Nazis' efforts to destroy it in 1944.

In this well-documented study (based on an art history dissertation at the Courtauld Institute of Art in London), Robert Maniura carefully examines the legends associated with the picture and its site. He first provides a detailed analysis of the image as it is seen today, considering especially its history of preservation, reconstruction, and conservation, showing it to be not an icon in the Orthodox Christian tradition (and certainly not, as tradition has it, painted by St. Luke in the Holy Land) but rather a thirteenth-century western product, perhaps Italian, possibly based on an eastern model. Next he analyzes the texts of the legend of the picture's translation to its current site, ostensibly as the result of a donation in the late fourteenth century by Duke Władysław (Ladislaus) of Opole, the founder of the monastery at Jasna Góra. A subsequent chapter examines the problem of how the distinctive scarring on the right side of the Virgin's face came about. Maniura rejects both the testimony of the historian John Długosz that they were the result of Poles attempting to discredit heretic and iconoclastic Hussites and the tradition that they were indeed the work of a Hussite attack, suggesting instead they reflect a conscious "motif deriving ultimately from Mt Athos" (p. 182; see also his discussion pp. 78-79).

Maniura's next five chapters bring him to the heart of his argument. They deal with pilgrimage—why individuals undertake them and what they expect from them; with miracles (in addition to his text, he edits and/or reproduces in four of his nine appendices collections of miracles connected with the image and the site); with the origins of the site as a pilgrimage goal and how this developed; with the shrine itself—how it was structured so that its spaces and the placement of the image facilitated a visual engagement with the holy; and then with the way the cult image at Jasna Góra was integrated into an extended continuum of images elsewhere. In these pages he shows how the miracle stories embody the pilgrim experience and what role the actual image plays in the experience of the believer. He thereby makes an important contribution not only to Polish cultural and religious history but also to the study of pilgrimage and of late medieval visual culture in general, in particular how historians and art historians ought to "read" the relationship between the verbal and the visual.

On some specific points, Maniura's conclusions are sure to be challenged by specialists: for example, the question of the origin of the image, the issue of its physical characteristics, or the details of when and how Częstochowa emerged as a pilgrimage site. But on the larger issues of understanding pilgrimage, the nature of the miracles associated with pilgrimage, and the way to understand visual culture, this book makes an important and stimulating contribution.

University of Southern California PAUL W. KNOLL

Early Modern European

Ritual in Early Modern Europe. By Edward Muir. Second edition. [New Approaches to European History, 33.] (New York: Cambridge University Press. 2006. Pp. x, 320. $70.00 clothbound; $24.99 paperback.)

In 1997 Edward Muir published the first edition of *Ritual in Early Modern Europe*, an influential and much-lauded volume in Cambridge's distinguished series of textbooks, *New Approaches in European History*, designed for upper-level undergraduate and graduate students. The author has updated the current text in the light of recent work, especially research relating to women, and deflects postmodern criticism that doubts whether much can be learned by modern historians unable to witness past rituals directly and forced to rely on the fallible memories and mediated texts left by contemporaries. Moreover, the new edition examines how Europeans' understanding of their own rituals was affected by their growing awareness of the ritualized behavior of other peoples. Muir blends the work of dozens of scholars laboring in the fields of Renaissance and Reformation studies with his own research into civic rituals, vendetta, and factions in Italy to argue that Europe between 1400 and 1700 experienced a revolution in ritual theory and practice. He offers at the end of each chapter suggestions for further reading, distinguishing between works suitable for novices and those better suited to specialists. For the former, the suggestions are an ideal initiation into ritual studies; for the latter, they are a valuable compendium of scholarship in the field.

Although his work is informed by recent anthropological theory and ritual studies, Muir nonetheless avoids the charge of "presentism" by dedicating himself to recapturing the past. He asserts that his goal is not only to understand the past but also "to respect the dead, to honor how different they were from us rather than celebrate their ability to anticipate us or our ability to surpass them" (p. 11). Therefore, he succeeds in transporting us back to a world in which rituals were *experienced* by participants who believed that rites actually accomplished and not just represented something. Therein lies the strength of his work, for Muir (who informs the reader that he was raised a Mormon) convincingly explains why Catholicism relied so heavily on rituals. He argues that medieval Christianity should not be seen primarily as a set of beliefs but as a set of ritualized practices that pertained to supernatural forces and beings. In other words, religion was an essential part of a wider cultural response to an intimidating and mysterious world that it hoped to explain, order, and manipulate. Through the use of repetitive rituals that served either as a mirror or model for society, Catholicism not only made sense of a nonsensical world but also provided emotional solace for the otherwise forlorn faithful.

Muir begins by succinctly introducing the anthropological debates concerning ritual theory. He argues that his main concern is not to arrive at the "true definition" of ritual but instead to determine how the concept can be used as a heuristic device. Muir presents his materials in three major sections:

The first two examine the pre-Reformation, Catholic world in which ritual theory was dominated by the doctrine of *presence*, i.e., the assumption that rites made something "present." The first of these two sections explores how this doctrine influenced concepts of time, resulting in "ritual moments" or rites of passage (e.g., those of baptism, transition to a new social status, marriage, and death) and the rites associated with calendrical or liturgical time in annual, monthly, daily, and hourly cycles. The second section deals with rituals pertaining to the putatively rational upper half and passionate lower half of the human body. The third section examines the genesis of the Reformation debate about what rituals actually do. According to the theory of *representation* advanced by Renaissance humanists and Protestant Reformers, rituals did not create presences or enact states of being but were only an aspect of language that conveyed meaning. In other words, argues Muir, the educated elite came to regard them as "mere rituals." Although Protestants were more thorough in attacking religious rituals, Catholics also engaged in the systematic reform of ritual practices after the Council of Trent (1545-1563). In this atmosphere of heightened intolerance and skepticism about ritual, both Protestants and Catholics condoned the rooting out of practices they identified as witchcraft and persecuted Jews engaged in supposedly dangerous, anti-Christian practices. Ritual, however, did not vanish completely during the early modern period. In the final chapter, Muir examines how city-states, principalities, and monarchies adapted religious rituals to create a secular repertoire of rituals devoted to creating "theater states" that enacted and represented power through ceremonial performances in which the "body politic" constituted the central image. Even today, he concludes, ritual has not entirely disappeared due to the fact that modern mass culture still relies on collective rituals to evoke a sense of community.

Muir very effectively conveys to the reader the rationale and sensual appeal of pre-Reformation rituals as well as the gist of the Protestant Reformers' objections. The only minor criticism that could be offered is that his historicist approach may have led him to overlook the most perplexing question all, that is, *why* the ritual revolution occurred where and where it did. Whereas the first edition was already considered the definitive introduction to the history of rituals in early modern Europe, this second edition is even more valuable to readers who wish to keep abreast of fascinating new approaches in the discipline.

University of Texas at Arlington STEVEN G. REINHARDT

Werewolves, Witches, and Wandering Spirits: Traditional Belief and Folklore in Early Modern Europe. Edited by Kathryn A. Edwards. [Sixteenth Century Essays and Studies, 62.] (Kirksville, Missouri: Truman State University Press. 2002. Pp. xxii, 226. Paperback.)

This collection of articles is a good read and a useful tool. The essays are well written, well edited, and very informative. They cover many different aspects of the phenomena mentioned in the title. Moreover, they present much useful bibliographical information, which means that they effectively

serve the expert who looks for new information while assisting the neophyte who seeks introduction and a guide to further reading(s). Finally, the geographic coverage (Western Europe) helps to make clear, once again, that the interaction with and reaction to werewolves, witches, and ghosts differed greatly depending on region and culture. The attitude of poor and wealthy alike toward "Living with the Dead" in early modern Bavaria (Lederer) contrasts sharply with the juridically reasonable reaction to occult phenomena in Italy, Spain, and Portugal (Schutte). Lederer's essay also effectively points to the upsurge in the belief in ghosts, treasure hunting, and conjuring as a result of the famine and death brought on by the wars of the seventeenth century.

Moreover, the essays try to do away with two still widely accepted popular misconceptions: the association of the witch phenomenon with the Middle Ages (it was an early modern problem), and the assumption that the Inquisition was instrumental in witch persecutions (witches were generally tried and convicted by lay courts). Very interesting to the modern reader is Nalle's essay on the Las Germanias uprising in sixteenth-century Valencia and the emergence of the Hidden One, a messianic figure that appeared out of nowhere promising relief and redemption to the poor. According to Nalle, Valencia still had a large number of Muslims whose agricultural skills served the wealthy to the chagrin of their Christian peasant neighbors. Furthermore, conversos, Christians of Jewish descent, had led Valencia to establish an office of the inquisition.

When it came to alleged witch activities and changes of humans into werewolves, people had long memories. Once tainted, a family often bore the burden of possible accusations for generations to come (Briggs). Still, witches and werewolves that haunted the minds of French demonologists such as de Lancre and Bouguet causing fear among rich and poor alike, lost some of their potency. During the mid-seventeenth century French courts refused to impose death sentences and instituted procedures based on rigorous demands for proof (Ferber, Krampl). The collection concludes with Midelfort's enlightening essay on Freud's reading of early modern demonologists, specifically Johann Weyer, the sixteenth-century physician, defender of witches, and believer in Satan. The review of late nineteenth- and early twentieth-century thinking about the kinship between psychoanalysis and demonology reconnects the collection to the first essay on the psychological implications of shape shifting and fantasy (Briggs), which moderns might explain as psychological and physiological disorders (sleep paralysis).

The collection is knowledgeably introduced by Edwards, whose excellent editing skills make this a very readable and informative book. Two *caveats* might be raised: it is by now accepted as scholarly orthodoxy that the *Malleus Maleficarum* was written by Kramer (Institoris) alone without the help of Sprenger (Behringer, et al, 2000). Also, the volume's usefulness would have been increased had a bibliography been added. Neither of these suggestions does, however, detract from the collection's overall quality.

Washington University in St. Louis GERHILD SCHOLZ WILLIAMS

Husbands, Wives, and Concubines: Marriage, Family, and Social Order in Sixteenth-Century Verona. By Emlyn Eisenach. [Sixteenth Century Essays and Studies, 69.] (Kirksville, Missouri: Truman State University Press. 2004. Pp. xxiv, 240. $36.95 paperback.)

Husbands, Wives, and Concubines places Emlyn Eisenach among the best of a large contingent of international scholars studying non-normative heterosexual relationships in early modern Europe. These scholars, many Italian or researching Italian materials, have already contributed to three volumes edited by Diego Quaglioni and Silvana Seidel Menchi, covering topics like separation and divorce, clandestine and contested marriages, and concubinage, adultery, and bigamy. Eisenach's monograph ranges across many of these topics.

Eisenach exploits ecclesiastical court records, but she does not pose her findings in terms of the changes worked by Tridentine reforms, if only because the period from which she draws her cases, 1538-1593, did not really see their effect. Instead she frames her analysis in terms of patriarchalism—a normative model centering on the *padre di famiglia*. She sets out to problematize this model against actual cases with their variations of social class. She also distinguishes the concerns of churchmen, notably Verona's famed bishop, Gian Matteo Giberti, who saw limitations and responsibilities in paternal power.

A short review cannot convey how rich this book is. The heart of Eisenach's approach is her second chapter. There she argues that, alongside the conventional model of patriarchal arranged marriage, there was a second form prevailing among "ordinary" folk. Lack of economic leverage gave poorer parents less control of children's marriages, and where they were in control that did not mean marriage was forced or without spousal affection. Eisenach argues, convincingly, that the style of wedding ritual in which the bride's father was prominent was not designed so much to publicize the legitimate union but to stress his influence in it and his continuing interest in his daughter (and her dowry). Wedding rituals in which there was no father tried to fill the void with evidence of the groom's affection and commitment.

Clandestine marriages had their uses. Secrecy avoided contrary kin and bought time to win them over. Pregnancies threw such plans awry and tended to land parties in court. The secrecy itself was not unusual, "they made private promises to each other, which they and their community considered highly binding" (p. 96). The risks represented by secrecy and possible legal denial of marriage were balanced for women by the possibilities of improving social position.

Concubinage figures largely as elite exploitation of lower status women. The court cases that disclose these relationships arose when the man's wife sought separation because he kept another woman or, more rarely, when the lower-class woman's husband sought separation or demanded that she return to a matrimonial relationship with him. Concubinage by the elite threatened

legitimate families on all social levels. "Nonelite" concubinage (between roughly social equals) was rarer and more likely to be equated with forms of prostitution for the women.

Women left husbands because they were mistreated; they sued for formal separation *a mensa et thoro*. Women's departure harmed their husbands' economic position and reputation; husbands thus might countersue for *adherere* to make them return. Wives' very act of departure was a challenge to the social order, breaking up a household in an act that was anything but subservient. So women had to make the case that, in face of a husband's flagrant abuse, they were upholding social order by their departure. Courts were fairly sympathetic to their claims when presented with the evidence.

Eisenach is a careful reader of her sources. She makes clear that there were strategies, interests, and procedural logics at work in shaping them. The considerable strength of her book lies in this close interpretation, and in the clear prose by which she places it before her readers. The main critical concern resides in the statistical thinness of her source base. There are 193 cases from fifty-five years. She draws conclusions about clandestine marriage from fifty-one cases, about marriage dissolution from "several dozen" (twenty-four), about nonelite concubinage from only six. Her findings will have to remain tentative, if plausible; but the rapidly expanding comparative context being developed by others, as well as Eisenach's future work, will anchor them more firmly.

Clemson University THOMAS KUEHN

A Convent Tale: A Century of Sisterhood in Spanish Milan. By P. Renée Baernstein. (New York: Routledge. 2002. Pp. xxii, 270. $27.50.)

Renée Baernstein's book about the Angelic nuns of the convent of San Paolo Converso in sixteenth- and seventeenth-century Milan can satisfy a broad audience including scholars of Renaissance nuns, college teachers and students of history, and non-academics with an interest in social and political history, women's history, and the history of religion. The book is enjoyable to read because Baernstein's writing is clear, precise, and accessible, while approaching a level of literary artistry that is uncommon among historians. The author deftly draws the reader into the fascinating relationships the nuns sustained with one another inside the convent and with their families and a network of contacts on the outside. She describes a microcosm of vital, competing characters with both shared and conflicting motivations during a period in which political, religious, and social leaders rose and fell from influence with dizzying frequency. Her account is thoroughly grounded in research that is documented straightforwardly and accessibly, including even a chronology of events that impacted the life of the convent from 1494 to 1635. Further useful supplementary materials include a generous quantity of illustrations (thirteen) that provide a sense of the physical

aspects of the nuns' lives, like the architecture and frescoed decorations that enclosed them. A well-labeled architectural plan helps readers visualize the paths traveled by nuns in the convent as they fulfilled the daily tasks and prayers that Baernstein describes. The black and white illustrations of the church's exterior and of painted decorations from its interior are not of high quality but are certainly legible, while the maps reproduced in the book are too small to be legible.

The introduction provides an ambitious overview of contextual topics like Catholic Reform, Counter-Reformation, Spanish domination of Milan, and the nuns' various allegiances, along with thoughts about the author's methodological approach. In each of five chapters that treat important events in the convent's history from 1535 to 1635, Baernstein lends vitality to her account by focusing on an essential character in the narrative. In the first, she offers an analysis of the convent's establishment in the climate of pre-Tridentine Milan via the life of its foundress, Ludovica Torelli. In the second, we follow the fate of Paola Antonia Negri, a mystic and "undoubtedly the most famous Angelic who ever lived" (p. 58) as the Angelics of San Paolo first allied with and then distanced themselves from her to maintain the convent's strong position. The third chapter shows us the convent from the outside, through the reign of Archbishop Carlo Borromeo, who favored the convent while also ensuring its strict enclosure. The fourth chapter recounts the convent's status and fame under the leadership of women from the Sfondrati family who were great strategists, using their connections outside the convent to increase its size and finances, its fame (particularly for musical performances), and its facilities (with structural renovations and frescoed decorations). The final chapter describes the decline and fall of the convent, ironically beginning with the apparently auspicious election of Niccolo Sfondrati as pope, and the reign of Agata Sfondrati, perhaps the convent's most charismatic abbess and greatest artistic patron.

Baernstein's very successful choice to pursue this history through the lives and deeds of its most exciting characters is illuminated by her autobiographical preface and the last paragraph of the epilogue. She is aware and even transparent with her readers about the motivations and aims of her methods. A mark of the book's success is that it raises a reader's interest in the activities of other contemporary nuns. How did the Angelics' actions and achievements compare with those of other nuns in Milan, and in convents containing the daughters and sisters of the social elite in other Italian cities? Baernstein even identifies two comparable local convents, San Maurizio in Milan and San Vittore in Meda, which had church buildings similar to that of San Paolo. Other wealthy north-Italian convents like San Zaccaria in Venice or San Paolo in Parma might have offered fruitful comparisons as well. How, for example, were the Angelics' strategies for political, social, and financial advancement similar to those used by their contemporaries at prestigious and not-so-prestigious convents elsewhere in Italy? Such comparisons are left for others to make, and Baernstein's book is an important resource for comparative studies. With a keen focus and expertly integrated historical details from unpublished documents, this book portrays

the ways in which Angelic nuns' adaptations enabled the convent of San Paolo to thrive in the ever-changing environment of Renaissance and Baroque Milan.

University of Chicago MARY-ANN WINKELMES

The Saint as Censor. Robert Bellarmine between Inquisition and Index. By Peter Godman. [Studies in Medieval and Reformation Thought, Volume LXXX.] (Leiden: Brill. 2000. Pp. xxi, 503. $215.00.)

Since the Second Vatican Council, Robert Bellarmine has been largely neglected as a subject of scholarly study. Godman's erudite study is an important work in the attempt to redress this neglect of one of the most eminent figures of early modern Catholicism.

Godman has divided his work into three parts. In Part One (pp.1-233), he examines Robert Bellarmine's "activity as a censor of the Inquisition and Index" (p. xii). Godman explores the early ineptitude of the Congregation of the Index as a background to which Bellarmine added much needed theological precision and order. Bellarmine's activities as a censor are presented largely through several high-profile cases: the attempt by Sixtus V to censor Bellarmine's own works, Bellarmine's conflict with James VI of Scotland, and of course the Galileo affair, for which Godman succeeds in offering a new and insightful interpretation.

In 1998 the archives of the Holy Office and the Congregation of the Index of Prohibited Books were opened to scholars. Godman has exploited this in Parts Two and Three of his work, providing 246 pages of documents. Part Two (pp. 237-309) contains Bellarmine's *censurae* from 1587 to a few weeks before his death in 1621. A fascinating example of Bellarmine's work is his censure of several propositions by the Benedictine Alessio of Piacenza. After citing one proposition as heretical "or at the least erroneous" since it was repugnant "to the scriptures, the creeds, general councils and the common consent of the Fathers," Bellarmine refers the reader of the censure to his own work, *Disputationes de Controversiis Christianae Fidei,* for a fuller explanation (p. 291). Part Three (pp. 311-483) consists of ninety documents from various sources, including the Holy Office. These cover the period from May of 1549 (when Bellarmine was six years old) to July of 1609 and provide important documentation concerning the early activities of this Congregation.

A number of criticisms must be leveled against Godman's text. First, while the narrative portion of the book is ostensibly about Bellarmine's role as a censor, the work is filled with lengthy digressions. As interesting as Godman's digressions may be, much of this material could and should have been dealt with in footnotes. Second, while Godman's stated method is to understand Bellarmine and the other censors "historically" and "on their own terms" (p. xiii), he shows little attempt to do so. Godman never offers a convincing reason why Bellarmine the "saint" would have involved himself with the "monster" that he calls the Inquisition (p. 7), though such an explanation would seem to be

material. Godman suggests that it was Bellarmine's firm belief in the necessity of expertise and his desire to be obedient to the papacy that compelled him to participate in such activities. Surely these reasons, while perhaps true, fail to understand Bellarmine on his own terms; rather they virtually reduce him to a *factotum*. Bellarmine's motivation since the days of his youth, as revealed in his last will and testament, was to serve God. While censoring and burning books may now be considered irreligious and intolerant, certainly Bellarmine, who took the scriptures seriously, looked back to the example of the apostles who assisted in the burning of the works of "magicians" (Acts 19:19-20). Moreover, in Bellarmine's most famous work, *Disputationes*, he devoted four and a half folio-size columns to the religious reasons for the prohibition of the works of heretics (Bellarmine, *Disputationes Roberti Bellarmini Politiani Societatis Jesu, de Controversiis Christianae Fidei, adversus hujus temporis Haereticos*, vol. 2 [Paris: Triadelphorum, 1613], 544a-548a). Godman reduces this explanation to a single paragraph (pp. 224-225). A third difficulty with Godman's analysis is that he frequently pours scorn on figures of the Cinquecento and Seicento, stating, for example, that Sixtus V was "imprudent," "ruthless," and "had no taste for finer distinctions" (p. 102), or that Bonardo was a "muddled thinker," or that Cardona was incapable of "mustering two" ideas (p. 106). Perhaps some of this invective was well earned, but it is so frequent as to become tiresome, especially because Godman rarely offers supporting evidence to justify his abuse. The same criticism applies to Godman's treatment of his own contemporaries. Certainly, Godman redresses a neglected element of recent scholarship on Bellarmine, but is it really just to call the recent studies on Bellarmine's role as archbishop "a strain of apologetic scholarship" (p. xii)? Finally, in the postscriptum, Godman complains that "I am the victim" (p. 487). The reader is left wondering what could possibly be meant by this statement for he was given access to the Vatican Library, the Vatican Secret Archives, and the archives of the Holy Office and Index.

In spite of these limitations, Godman has made an important contribution to the study of Bellarmine's influence on the Inquisition and late sixteenth-century intellectual life. The 246 pages of unpublished documents alone are worth the price of the book (pp. 235-483).

St. Charles Seminary, Philadelphia CHRISTIAN D. WASHBURN

A Catholic Response in Sixteenth-Century France to Reformation Theology: The Works of Pierre Doré. By John Langlois. [Roman Catholic Studies, Volume 18.] (Lewiston, New York: The Edwin Mellen Press. 2003. Pp. xi, 307. $119.95.)

Despite his standing as the most edited Catholic writer in France in the first half of the sixteenth century, the Dominican and Paris theologian Pierre Doré (ca. 1497-1569) remains largely in the wings of Reformation historiography. This scholarly neglect is unfortunate, John Langlois argues compellingly, con-

sidering the sheer size of Doré's publishing record and its convergence with the first decades of the French Reformation. Returning Doré to the prominence he enjoyed in his own day, Langlois provides a general introduction to his literary corpus and its significance as a "grass-roots" Catholic response to Protestant theology and the challenges it posed to French Catholic unity.

Langlois begins by situating Doré's works in the context of the institutional reaction to the Reformation in France, and more specifically, that of his fellow Dominicans (introduction, Chapter 1). Set against this backdrop, Doré clearly stands out in his early and unwavering commitment to fighting heresy based on a singular strategy. Rather than engaging the Reformers directly, he addressed the French laity instead, seeking to keep them within the Catholic fold through religious instruction, guidance, and inspiration. Chapter 2 reveals that this strategy found expression in more than thirty texts written by Doré in French between 1537 and 1557, ranging from a catechism to polemical treatises and devotional writings.

Especially striking here is the large number of devotional works Doré wrote at the request of and for aristocratic women, most of which went on to become his top sellers (pp. 89-97; see also the book's four appendices, where Langlois neatly summarizes Doré's bibliographical output). While acknowledging this female influence on Doré's literary career, Langlois does not consider the broader implications regarding the role of women in shaping early modern French Catholicism. Given the fact that his book is the first comprehensive study of Doré, this comment is not a criticism per se; Langlois has a lot of basic ground to cover, which he does effectively. But it does point to the rich veins of analysis remaining to be tapped.

As Langlois demonstrates, a determined desire to undermine the validity of Protestant theology while calling his readers to a more personal (and orthodox) relationship with Christ shaped Doré's work regardless of genre. For this reason, Langlois devotes the second part of his study to an analysis of three major themes found repeatedly in Doré's books: justification, grace, merit and free will (chapter 3); the Eucharist (chapter 4); and the virtuous life (chapter 5).

Reflecting Doré's own preoccupations, the chapter on the Eucharist is the longest in the book. Because Doré believed Protestants' rejection of transubstantiation was satanic, thereby posing the greatest risk to the Church and the individual believer, he addressed the Eucharist in some fashion in almost every one of his books (pp. 167-169). To elucidate this angle of Doré's anti-Protestant strategy, Langlois examines the basic features of Doré's theological exposition and how he packaged them for his readers. Despite the strength of Langlois' textual analysis, it offers little insight into Doré's place in the growing debate in France concerning the nature of Christ's presence in the Eucharist. Noticeably absent from Langlois' bibliography is Christopher Elwood's book exploring precisely this topic (Oxford, 1999). Doré was ahead of the game, not just in recognizing the potency of the printed vernacular as a bulwark against

Protestantism (as Langlois contends), but also in situating the Eucharist at its core. As Elwood discusses, the 1560's saw an explosion of eucharistic treatises and related public discourse in France, which ultimately helped to reshape its political and religious landscape. Doré's early contributions to this debate expose another, more complex layer of his historical footprint. Of course, understanding the central themes of his works is essential to teasing out Doré's significance within the larger picture. Langlois' study succeeds on this front, thus providing an essential point of departure for future research.

University of Southern Maine KATHARINE LUALDI

The Church in the Republic: Gallicanism and Political Ideology in Renaissance France. By Jotham Parsons. (Washington, D.C.: The Catholic University of America Press. 2004. Pp. xiv, 322. $59.95.)

Gallicanism was self-invented, as early modern scholars began to construct its documented history as well as to formulate its basic principles. According to one story, it began as a movement of "reform," especially in the wake of the Great Schism, although it had a prehistory going back centuries to the primitive church and the conflict between church and state. It was given its modern form in 1510, when Louis XII, drawing on earlier precedents, called a council, but of the clergy, which "declar[ed] that there was no reason the king could not fight a just was against the pope" (Julius II). The council was a failure, but authors of many sorts began to pour forth a steady stream of rhetoric, beginning with Jean Lemaire des Belges and continuing especially with the learned jurists of the day, their erudite humanism creating what Parsons calls "a new historicist Gallicanism" that carried political theory down a road different from the secularism of Machiavelli and Hobbes. After the "Gallican crisis of 1551" began the stream of long accumulated "Gallican liberties," collected first by Jean du Tillet, Pierre Pithou, Charles Dumoulin, and their successors into the seventeenth century and the time of Bishop Bossuet. "By the time that Henry IV had consolidated his power, then," according to the author, "a Gallicanism had appeared on the scene that was based on historical research and narrative. . . ." It had also divided the three estates.

The controversial story of Gallicanism has been told in many ways, but the later phase has usually been avoided. Mr. Parsons has remedied this with a work of careful scholarship and at the same time has linked it with modern questions of political ideology. Yet he tries to avoid anachronism and so prefers the term "republic" to monarchy in his book. Like other recent authors he emphasizes the religious dimension, as the nature of seventeenth-century polemic demands, and he has discovered the neglected significance of the assemblies of the clergy, which began in the wars of religion, and the *parquet*, or *gens du roi*, which supported juristic Gallicanism down to the eighteenth century. This was the source of much of the pamphlet literature generated by the *érudits* and jurists and the clergy concerning the king's sovereignty, the

high points between Gallicanism and its opponents found in the Estates General of 1615 and the Assembly of the Clergy of 1617. From this and surrounding litigation Parsons moves from "absolutism" into "the pure area of theory." In general, erudite Gallicanism, drawing its strength from humanism, reached its peak in the early seventeenth century.

Mr. Parson's account fits well within the standard story of secular state-building, and indeed, ignoring the culturalist turn of this generation, he remains convinced that Ranke's survey is correct in its general outlines. Gallicanism began as a support of centralizing monarchy from the seventeenth century to the Revolution and after that turned against the supposed legacy of Jean Bodin. In this way Gallicanism, out of its religious origins, became a force for Revolution.

Rutgers University DONALD KELLEY

Le Nain de Tillemont et l'historiographie de l'Antiquité romaine: Actes de Colloque international organisé par le Centre Le Nain de Tillemont et tenu à la Fondation Singer-Polignac présidée par Monsieur Édouard Bonnefous les 19 et 20 novembre 1998 et à l'Institut de France le 21 novembre 1998. Edited by Stan-Michel Pellistrandi. [Colloques, congrès et conferences sur le Classicisme, 3.] (Paris: Honoré Champion. 2002. Pp. 540 €75.00.)

The contributions of thirty scholars, almost all from Paris (though one, Jean Laporte, is identified as coming from Université catholique d'Indiana rather than Notre Dame), are gathered in this book which commemorates the 300th anniversary of the death of the French scholar Sébastien Le Nain de Tillemont (1637-1698). The papers discuss aspects of the life of Le Nain (or Lenain—the contributors do not agree on the spelling), critique his publications concerning the ecclesiastical and political history of the first through the sixth centuries, or describe his contributions to historiography. The variety of topics is so great that it would be impossible to discuss them adequately in the space allotted for this review. It is possible, however, to describe succinctly the purpose of the conference from which the papers originated, placing Le Nain in the context of his time and place in order to understand his achievements better.

Bruno Neveu, well known for his work on both le Nain and early modern religious history, especially Franco-Papal relations, contributed the introduction, a biographical sketch, and an account of Le Nain's treatment of the papacy. Together, Neveu's contributions show clearly that Le Nain was a serious scholar, but was strongly influenced by his beliefs and his milieu. He was a Jansenist and a Gallican who favored St. Augustine among theologians and did not accept papal infallibility.

The authors of the papers show that Le Nain's time, place, training, and beliefs influenced him. But, as Neveu notes, that is true of all of us, despite our

modern pretensions. Perhaps the most striking instances of Le Nain's blind spots or myopia are seen in the fact that his Jansenism kept him from serious investigation of pagan religiosity and from appreciating the reasons behind the development of religious ideas that were eventually declared heretical by the Church.

Le Nain maintained contact with many scholars throughout Europe. One of the most interesting contributions, provided by Jean-Louis Quantin, describes Le Nain's contacts with Anglican scholarship.

Le Nain's interests spanned many fields including epigraphy, numismatics, classics, patristics, prosopography, hagiography, theology, and apologetics. His real expertise was as a historian—one of the best of his time whose works are still useful to scholars in a variety of disciplines today.

Le Nain's usefulness for the present is addressed in several essays. Several of the contributors express surprise at how "modern" some of Le Nain's insights were and how well some of his conclusions have stood the test of time. One aspect of his work that stands out is his realization of the importance of understanding and explaining degrees of probability.

The theme of modern relevance is taken up most strikingly in the Conclusion of the book provided by Jacques Fontaine, a Latin scholar. He praises Le Nain for his realization that the histories of Christianity and Rome are inseparable, for his attention to present reality, and for establishing the critical bases for a new history of the Church. He also praises Le Nain's use of collaborative scholarship—the approach that Francophone historians in Europe and North America, in common with most other French scholars, have favored for many years.

University of Saskatchewan J. MICHAEL HAYDEN

Crown, Church and Episcopate under Louis XIV. By Joseph Bergin. (New Haven and London: Yale University Press. 2004. Pp. xii, 526. $60.00.)

Following his very important and very convincing study of *The Making of the French Episcopate, 1589-1661* (*ante,* LXXXIV [1998], 112-113), Professor Bergin directs his attention to the 250 bishops who took office in the fifty-four years of Louis XIV's personal rule (1661-1715). Following the pattern established in the previous work, the book is a study of royal patronage that focuses on the personalities of the prelates, their origins (geographical, social, professional), their education, and their ecclesiastical careers. This meticulous and sweeping "collective portrait of bishops" (p. 14) contributes therefore to the assessment not just of the Gallican church, at its peak during this reign, but also of the Crown's vision of the role of that church in the kingdom.

The prosopographic study corrects or at least nuances the usual assertions on the social origins of the French episcopate: yes, the great majority came from the

nobility (87.75%), but about 10% belonged to recently ennobled families (p. 60). One in five French bishops under Louis XIV was a commoner (p. 63). Unsurprisingly, the main characteristic shared by the vast majority of Louis XIV's bishops was to have been "born into families that were engaged in activities that had something to do with the service of the monarchy" (p. 79). This was a feature shared with the military, another occupation suffused by royal patronage (p. 343).

In other words, Bergin's research confirms what had already been assumed: here as in other instances the choice was the king's. According to what criteria and possible influences? That is the main question. Regarding influences, the king's confessors, the archbishops of Paris, and later the royal consort have been regularly mentioned. Bergin sees their hand in some key appointments, but in most cases, Louis played their "mutual rivalry" (p. 263) in order to make the right appointment. In the later years, Madame de Maintenon was more instrumental, but not as much as her enemies asserted.

As to the criteria, the book clearly demonstrates how Louis XIV endeavored to select the best men to run his national church. According to the 1516 Concordat and the Tridentine spirit, they had to be qualified, not only by their social origin but by their virtue, education, and experience. This meant that most French bishops of the period were formed as theologians, most of them with a licentiate's degree or doctorate from the Sorbonne, the Faculty of Theology of Paris. (By the time of Louis XIV's death, all but six of France's 121 bishops were theologians by training, p. 96.) Before their first episcopal preferment, at the average age of 41.9, they had an administrative experience, mostly as *Grand Vicaire*, that is vicar general of a portion of a diocese, often governed by a relative, who was therefore bolstering their promotion. An interesting part of Louis' policy was his notion that promotion to a metropolitan see should come only after a successful tenure of a minor bishopric. This episcopal mobility, the author writes of "musical chairs" (p. 318), was frowned upon by some, who considered that a bishop was wedded to his church. It certainly denotes a *cursus honorum*, from poorly endowed dioceses to richer ones, especially when associated with a political dignity of peer or president of the Provincial Estates; nevertheless, it also provided for the better qualification of the entire body. It is interesting, for instance, to note that during the 1680's, when the Crown was trying to "re-unite" the Huguenot minority to the national church, twenty southern dioceses fell vacant, and each one was given to a nominee with experience of preaching or mission to the Protestants (p. 247). This concern for qualification is also supported by the records from the Consistorial Congregation in Rome. Bergin's inquiry in these archives shows how during the major part of the reign, the process went smoothly, he speaks of the "fluency of the entire system" (p. 187). There were, of course, periods of tensions, especially during the reign of Innocent XI (1682-1685), when the Pope rejected all nominations. The fine analysis of this difficult situation (pp. 235-260) shows how the elected but unconsecrated bishops administered their diocese, as capitular vicars without incurring any canonical penalty.

As stressed by the author (p. 309), this attempt to "follow collectively the French bishops" cannot provide a full view of the pastoral influence exerted in the different dioceses. Many elements, however, contribute to a better perception of this collective action, supported by references and comparisons to studies of the episcopate in other countries. The major one, emphasized by the cover jacket, is the assertion of the magisterium of the French episcopate. The choice of Archbishop Vintimille du Luc, whose portrait by Hyacinthe Rigault is kept in University of Rochester's Memorial Gallery, is particularly apt. In this recently restored picture, the archbishop of Paris, dressed in brilliant episcopal blue, holds with pride the black bonnet of a Sorbonne Doctor. As the precious "Biographical Dictionary" appended to the study indicates, Vintimille held only a license in theology from that institution. Upon his accession to the Parisian see he was awarded an honorary doctorate. At that time, as this study establishes well, a bishop had to be a doctor, since both in his local church and collectively he exerted a doctrinal magisterium (p. 361). This explains the growing importance of the provincial councils, and above all of the assemblies of the French Clergy often considered as the equivalent of a national council.

In sum, another well-researched, clear, and convincing work that will long serve as a model and a reference, one can also hope that it will reinvigorate the neglected genre of episcopal biography. If there is one lesson taught by this excellent book it is indeed that in positions of power individuals made a difference.

The Catholic University of America JACQUES GRES-GAYER

Érudition hagiographique au XVIII^e siècle, Jean Lebeuf et les Bollandistes: Correspondance. Edited by Bernard Joassart. [Tabularium hagiographicum, 3.] (Brussels: Société des Bollandistes. 2003. Pp. 209. Paperback.)

The controversy over Jansenism represented one of the greatest challenges to the Catholic Church in *Ancien Régime* France, but perhaps the influence of the movement on the Church and its members has been overestimated. This is essentially the issue which Bernard Joassart addresses in his work *Érudition hagiographique au XVIII^e siècle, Jean Lebeuf et les Bollandistes: Correspondance*. Joassart, who previously published the correspondence between the Bollandists and their contemporaries, presents the letters exchanged by the Jesuit hagiographers and Jean Lebeuf, a cathedral canon from Auxerre and a Jansenist sympathizer. Lebeuf had earned the acclaim of his eighteenth-century contemporaries and future generations for his contributions to the history of France, particularly his native Auxerre. His research on the hagiography of local saints' cults brought him into contact with the Bollandists in Antwerp. In exchange for assistance and verification of his own work, Lebeuf offered his services and research to the Bollandists, despite the antagonism that existed between Jesuits and Jansenists.

Although the collaboration between Lebeuf and the Bollandists bore scholarly fruit, the relationship appeared to sour around the 1730's as the letters

sent by the Bollandists became less frequent. Joassart's introduction to the previously unpublished correspondence concentrates in particular on the motivation which led to the end of this epistolary friendship. Henri Leclercq, who wrote the biography of Lebeuf for the *Dictionnaire d'archéologie chrétienne et de liturgie*, claimed that the Bollandists, motivated by their desire to terminate contacts with anyone of Jansenist tendencies, cut off the contact with Lebeuf. Joassart, however, argues that the sources in his present publication suggest that perhaps Lebeuf's Jansenism may not have been the only factor that broke the lines of communication. When Lebeuf declared that he had found the long-lost relics of Saint Germain d'Auxerre and asked the Bollandists to verify their authenticity, the hagiographers of Antwerp refused their approbation. The indirect connection between the relics and the Jansenists (Saint Germain had been a supporter of St. Augustine, upon whose writings the Jansenists developed their doctrine) may have swayed their decision, but Joassart does not seem to believe that this incident caused a permanent rift in the relationship. Rather, the letters in this volume reveal that Lebeuf still expressed his admiration for the work of the Bollandists, even after the relic incident. Furthermore, Joassart points out that the Bollandists did not seek to discontinue their correspondence with more prominent Jansenists such as Pasquier Quesnel. For their part, the Bollandists may have answered Lebeuf's missives with less frequency, but as Joassart notes, these elderly and infirm clerics simply may have lacked sufficient energy to keep up the literary pace of the younger catherdral canon.

By publishing for the first time the letters between the Bollandists and their Jansenist contemporary, Joassart contributes to the historiography of the eighteenth century by calling into question the influence of Jansenism on the correspondence between Lebeuf and the Bollandists. This work also injects a new interpretation into the broader context of Jansenism in general. If Jansenism may not have been the main factor which brought this collaboration to a halt, then perhaps the pervasiveness and influence of Jansenism deserves reconsideration. Overall, Joassart's book not only contributes to the source base, but it also raises new questions for the study of Catholicism during the *Ancien Régime*.

Lourdes College MARY KATHRYN COONEY
Sylvania, Ohio

Convents and Nuns in Eighteenth-Century French Politics and Culture. By Mita Choudhury. (Ithaca, New York: Cornell University Press. 2004. Pp.xi, 234. $42.50.)

On July 17, 1794, sixteen Carmelite nuns went to the guillotine, accused of royalism and counterrevolutionary behavior. These nuns became symbols to both opponents and supporters of the French Revolution. To the former, they were heroic martyrs; to the latter, dangerous fanatics. What made these nuns such potent political symbols? Mita Choudhury's study of the discourse

around convents and nuns in eighteenth-century France provides us with some intriguing answers to this question.

Choudhury's study spans the period from the1730's, when Jansenist nuns resisted the papal bull *Unigenitus*, through the French Revolution, which, as it became increasingly radical, closed France's convents and monasteries and labeled those who resisted counterrevolutionaries. She argues that during this period, discussions of convents and nuns were central to critiques—and to the eventual dismantling—of the political and social institutions of the Old Regime. Like the Bastille, convents came to symbolize the arbitrary and despotic nature of power in pre-revolutionary France.

During the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries, debates about nuns and convents centered on matters of enclosure and authority. In the 1560's, the Council of Trent declared that all religious communities of women must be cloistered and submit to the authority of the bishop, though these prescriptions were challenged by new active women's congregations, such as the Ursulines, and by nuns who brought court cases against ecclesiastical superiors who challenged their traditional rights. The Enlightenment shifted the terms of the debate. As Sophie, Rousseau's "natural woman," became the basis for a new ideal of womanhood, convents and convent education were branded "unnatural." The religious "fanaticism" denounced by *philosophes* like Voltaire and Diderot tended to be gendered female, and in the latter writer's scurrilous novel, *La Religieuse*, the convent stood for all that was wrong with Old Regime politics and society.

Choudhury does a masterful job of unpacking the complex and contradictory images of nuns—as victims and despots, submissive and disobedient, holy and sexual—that appeared in the Jansenist controversy of the 1730's through the 1750's, in judicial memoirs of cases regarding the abuse of power by mother superiors, in narratives of forced vocations, and in debates over convent education. While for the most part these sources represent the perspectives of elite men, we do get some fascinating glimpses of how nuns themselves deployed this rhetoric toward their own ends, especially during the early years of the Revolution when nuns wrote pamphlets and addressed the National Assembly to defend their communities. However, Choudhury sometimes elides the distinction between women as actors and as images deployed by men, and at times it appears as if discussions about women's religious life were merely pretexts for addressing larger political issues. What tends to get lost is the real religious commitment—or, in the case of forced vocations, the lack of such commitment—on the part of these women. Admittedly, this is not the focus of the book, but as Choudhury herself argues, what made the convent such a potent symbol, even more so than other images of despotism like the seraglio or the Bastille, was its existence as an evolving social institution that played an important role in the real lives of people in eighteenth-century France.

By 1794, the convents of France had been shut down by the revolutionary government, and their former inhabitants dispersed, imprisoned, or killed.

Although they would be revived during the nineteenth century, convents would never play the central role in society or have the same political significance that they had had in the Old Regime. This dismantling was facilitated by an increasingly hostile discourse that "desacralized" the convent and, like contemporaneous attacks on aristocratic women such as Madame de Pompadour and Marie Antoinette, cast despotism in feminine terms. This book contributes to the growing scholarship on the political culture of eighteenth-century France by showing us that our picture is incomplete without an understanding of the central role played by religion and especially by religious women.

Hawai'i Pacific University LINDA LIERHEIMER

Felipe V y su tiempo: Congreso internacional celebrado en Zaragoza, 15 al 19 de Enero de 2001. Edited by Eliseo Serrano. 2 vols. (Zaragoza: Institución "Fernando el Católico," C.S.I.C. 2004. Pp. 1062, 898. Paperback.)

For decades, eighteenth-century Spain and the Spanish kingdoms during the first half of the century in particular have received little scholarly attention. The eighteenth century had neither the allure of early modern imperial power, nor the appeal of impending modernity. Indeed, to many historians, the War of the Spanish Succession and Philip of Anjou´s succession was a vague interim after the Habsburg decline but before the full expression of the Enlightenment under Charles III. However, as a recent spate of new monographs and these volumes reveal, historians have breathed new life into eighteenth-century studies. In January 2001, many of Spain's best scholars gathered to celebrate the 300th anniversary of the Bourbon dynasty's ascent to the Spanish throne. The result is a remarkable two-volume set of seventy-five essays that provide detailed, useful discussions of nearly all aspects of Spanish history and culture during the reign of Philip V (r.1700-1746).

Some essays provide broad overviews of the political, economic, and social contexts. For example, Elisa Torres Santana examines marginalized people, including gypsies, prostitutes, and slaves; José Manuel Pérez García lays out the changing demography of the period; and Manuel Lobo Cabrera provides a broad look at the Spanish economy. Other essays provide a glimpse into regional differences. As the conference was held in Zaragoza, the kingdom of Aragón is particularly well represented, but other regions including Galicia receive some attention as well. The most striking aspect of this collection is its topical and methodological range. In addition to political, economic, and social history, diplomatic history, literature, musicology, architecture, and ritual all receive interesting and up-to-date treatment.

In terms of the readership of this journal, seven of the seventy-five essays deal directly with religion or the Catholic Church. Historians of eighteenth-century Spain, like their counterparts in other parts of Europe, have demonstrated greater interest in Enlightenment ideas and increased secularization

during the eighteenth century than what is often viewed as a stagnant or even declining Church. Nevertheless, this handful of articles offers much to the religious historian, and they provide the same variety of breadth and detail as the rest of the collection. Maximiliano Barrio Gozalo provides an excellent "state of the clergy." He includes statistical data and provides some basic analysis on an array of issues including the moral and intellectual state of the clergy and the effect of the ascent of the French dynasty on the Spanish church. Teófanes Egido takes up the impact of Gallicanism on the peninsula and whether the Spanish clergy formed a new relationship with the monarchy in the wake of Philip´s 1709 break with Rome. Ricardo García Cárcel argues that the Inquisition did not suffer any assumed decline during the eighteenth century. Rather, the tribunals pursued more than 3000 cases with heretical propositions, solicitation, superstition, and judaizing topping the list. Articles on religious discourse and the press in Barcelona and the Aragonese clergy's support of the Austrian candidate in the War of the Spanish Succession connect local issues to broader national concerns. Finally, an examination of Bishop Belluga of Cartagena's visitations *ad limina* and a piece on music in the Cathedral of Barbastro offer interesting views of the Church in its local context.

These volumes will prove to be very useful for all scholars of the period. As we work to better understand this transitional century, these clearly written, up-to-date discussions will be critical references for a wide array of studies.

University of Mary Washington ALLYSON M. POSKA

Thinking of the Laity in Late Tudor England. By Peter Iver Kaufman. (Notre Dame, Indiana: University of Notre Dame Press. 2004. Pp. xiv, 175. $40.00 clothbound; $20.00 paperback.)

Thinking of the Laity is not quite a counter-factual history, but it does concern itself with a "might-have-been" of the English Church in the sixteenth century. It examines the hopes and schemes of advocates of greater local and lay control over the Elizabethan Church, and attempts to account for their ultimate failure. This is a line of thought that Kaufman traces from Lollardy and the early Reformation, through the activities of "stranger" churches in the Edwardian period, and into and beyond the Marian persecution (a time when exiled congregations experimented with lay participation in governance). Thereafter, the key figures included William Fulke, John Field, Thomas Lever, and Dudley Fenner, proponents of what Kaufman dubs a populist Puritanism in the first half of Elizabeth's reign. The anachronism "populist," he contends, is allowable if "we suspend the requirement that populists reflect the opinions of those whose participation they promote" (p. 25). The aim was usually, if not full-blown presbyterianism, then at least some degree of lay oversight of the local ministry, involving the right to consent to patrons' nominees, or to veto unsatisfactory candidates after probation. All the plans came to nothing, partly as a result of a royal and episcopal backlash in the 1570's exemplified in the

putting down of the preaching exercises known as "prophesyings" (occasions which Kaufman regards as more genuinely subversive than does Patrick Collinson); partly as a consequence of reformers' own growing distrust of the common people. From the 1580's, Kaufman contends, Puritans turned to inward piety and abandoned schemes for congregational participation.

There is much to think about here, but also some occasion to pause and question. The decision to wrap the story up in the mid-1580's prevents any discussion of the Marprelate Controversy, surely a seminal moment for both perceptions and practices of populist puritanism. There is also the issue of what precisely we should understand by Kaufman's regularly recurring phrase, "broadly participatory parish regimes." On one reading, English parish regimes had always been broadly participatory, before and after the Reformation. Kaufman is arguably too dismissive of continuities, and too prone to find new shoots in the everyday working out of parish life. Thus, he suggests that in the early Elizabethan decades churchwardens were coming to resemble presbyters, and that their initiative and leadership in the policing of morality and disorder anticipated that puritan desideratum, "a lawful and godly seigniory in every congregation" (p. 89). It was surprising, he thinks, that Puritans did not make more of them in their schemes. But churchwardens were simply doing what they had ever done, in the context of a well-understood demarcation of responsibilities between clergy and laity. A good case can be, and has been, made that lay oversight of the sort Kaufman valorizes was actually more evident before rather than after the Reformation, not least through the regular employment and supervision of chantry and fraternity priests. It will not quite do to say (p.77) that pre-Reformation parishes must have been less popular and participatory than revisionists like to think, just because early evangelical activists castigated the clergy. *Thinking of the Laity* is an engaged, and engaging essay, but one rather too locked into its own terms of reference.

University of Warwick PETER MARSHALL

Wotton and His Worlds: Spying, Science and Venetian Intrigues. By Gerald Curzon. (Philadelphia: Xlibris Corporation. 2003. Pp. 341. $32.99 hardcover; $22.99 paperback.)

Sir Henry Wotton was one of the multi-talented political figures whose careers spanned the late sixteenth and early seventeenth centuries. Gerald Curzon rightly calls him one of the "new men" of his time. He was of gentry rather than aristocratic origins, received a university education at Oxford, acquired practical experience by traveling abroad, and worked for the monarchy in hopes of advancement to high office and material success. These hopes were only partially fulfilled. He served as James VI and I's ambassador to Venice three times between 1604 and 1623, headed diplomatic missions to Savoy and Vienna, and was a key figure in the carrying out of the king's foreign policy. On the other hand, he never became secretary of state, did not always receive the

salary owed him, and was once, late in life, arrested for debt. Among his other achievements is that he wrote poems that are still anthologized and the first book in English on the aesthetics of architecture. He ended his career as Provost of Eton, one of the most prominent English schools. Izaak Walton, who admired him greatly, was his first biographer (1670). Logan Pearsall Smith published his substantial *Life and Letters of Sir Henry Wotton* in two volumes in 1907. But Wotton has been strangely neglected since Smith's time. Curzon, using a variety of printed sources, attempts successfully to bring him to life for the general reader and to show the significance of his career.

Curzon is not a professional historian, as the back cover of his book acknowledges, but a neuroscientist who served as the archivist and historian of the International Society for Neurochemistry. He learned of Wotton through investigating how the poet John Donne could have learned so quickly of Galileo's astronomical discoveries and their significance. Two works of Donne's, *Ignatius His Conclave* and *An Anatomy of the World*, both published in 1611, refer to Galileo's epoch-making observations and theories, which had first been announced in *Siderius Nuncius* (*The Messenger of the Stars*), published in Venice in 1610. Donne's "And new philosophy calls all in doubt" is often used as a description of the effect of the scientific approach of Galileo. Curzon shows that Wotton sent a copy of Galileo's book to England on the very day the book appeared in Venice. In a covering letter to Sir Robert Cecil, the king's leading minister, he said: "I send herewith unto his Majesty the strangest piece of news (as I may justly call it) that he hath ever yet received from any part of the world." Wotton said of Galileo: "So as upon the whole subject he hath first overthrown all former astronomy" (p. 146). Curzon argues that his copy reached the hands of Donne, a supporter of the king in the Oath of Allegiance controversy, soon after it arrived in London. Curzon is perceptive in explaining the connections among the "new" in Venetian culture in Wotton's time there. These innovations included Monteverdi's *Vespers of the Blessed Virgin* (1610), Paolo Sarpi's political and theological defense of Venice against the papacy in the time of the Interdict (1606-07), and the art and architecture of the city. Galileo, of course, taught at the University of Padua, in the Venetian territories on the mainland. Curzon also writes skillfully about the rivalry for influence in northern Italy by France and the Spanish and Austrian Habsburgs, a rivalry that lay behind the crisis involving Venice and the papacy. He describes vividly the flight to England of Marco Antonio de Dominis, the Roman Catholic Archbishop of Spalato (Split), a move that Wotton encouraged and helped to plan. De Dominis, who ultimately returned to the Roman Catholic obedience, only to die in a prison of the Inquisition in Rome, is not ridiculed in Curzon's account but treated as an ecumenist, although an egotistical one.

Curzon's judgments are sometimes wide of the mark. Wotton did not want to bring Venice into the "Anglican Church," a term almost unknown in his time. He did promote the independence of Venice from the papacy, and he and his chaplain William Bedell thought that Protestant services at the embassy and

the introduction of an Italian translation of the Bible might promote such an objective. Curzon treats James VI and I as largely ineffective, and his theological and political writing in the *Apologie for the Oath of Allegiance* (1607) and the *Premonition to All Christian Monarches* (1609) as anti-Catholic propaganda. But these books are now seen as cogent if shrill discussions of the state's need to exercise sovereignty and to be independent of ecclesiastical interference. James's political theory has, indeed, some of the qualities of those new ways of thinking that Curzon found so pervasive in Venice, especially in the writings of Sarpi, the theological adviser of the Venetian Republic. James's foreign policy, aimed at resolving conflicts through negotiation and compromise, helped to maintain peace in Europe for a decade and a half before the onset of the disastrous Thirty Years' War. These caveats do not diminish Curzon's achievement. His account of Wotton's life and career opens many windows on an era of immense complexity and importance.

University of the South W. B. PATTERSON
Sewanee, Tennessee

Religion and the Early Modern State. Views from China, Russia, and the West. Edited by James D. Tracy and Marguerite Ragnow. [Studies in Comparative Early Modern History, Center for Early Modern History, University of Minnesota, Vol. 5.] (New York: Cambridge University Press. 2004. Pp. xvii, 415. $85.00.)

In fifteenth century Ming China, a soldier turned religious teacher, Luo Qing, came to a critical insight of "Vacuous Emptiness" and "actionless action" (pp. 22-24). Luo Qing then laid out a text that was to become the germ of a heterodox, widespread, and persistent group of sects centered on the Eternal Mother, which inspired fear and provoked violent repression among imperial state officials. Though the Eternal Mother sects shared a belief that the predestined faithful would be saved from impending world catastrophe (p. 30), they branched into many forms. A branch of the sect in the 1570's was led by an adolescent girl and group of nuns (p. 32); the Red Sun sect preached that the youngest son of the Eternal Mother would descend to earth to save the elect (p. 33); the Unity Sect and Dragon Flower Vegetarian Assembly centered on a kind of Mater lacrimosa, "with tears running continuously from her eyes and drenching her clothes," mourning her fallen children (p. 35); and the apocalyptic Incense-Smelling sect had somewhere near two million followers and led a full-scale rebellion in 1622 (pp. 33-34). Although followers were sentenced to death by decapitation or slow-slicing, imperial officials recognized that the martyrs (to use the western category) "show no regret . . . as they are eager to return to heaven" (p. 38).

The account of the rise and eventual suppression of the Eternal Mother cult in China might seem a perplexing opening chapter to a book that declares in the first line of its introduction that it "owes its origins to a desire to bring

together two divergent approaches to the English Reformation." But this excellent and fascinating chapter by Richard Shek clearly and persuasively answers the initial skepticism natural to readers—Why should one read so far from one's geographical area of specialty? The account of the Eternal Mother cult lucidly lays out key conceptual categories that give structure to a collection of essays that could have fallen short of its challenging task in many ways, yet instead yields astonishing insights both through close focus and conceptual flexibility. Balancing between broad thinking through analogy and specific historical circumstances, the volume also addresses questions surrounding the importance of ritual, the definition of the sacred, the desire and ability of the official church or political authority to control religious behavior, and the wondrous ability of dissenting factions not only to survive but also to revolt and even, in the case of Cossacks in Ukraine and Puritans in England, seize control. Although each of the three sections includes an essay from the more familiar English religious history as an anchor, the essays about far-flung China (by Richard Shek and Romeyn Taylor) and Russia (Robert Crummey, Frank Sysyn, and Eve Levin) create a most productive mental ferment.

The two divergent approaches to the English Reformation referred to above are a top-down model—rapid, imposed, and led by the monarch—properly studied as political history, and a popular model—a slowly growing synthesis of Lutheran, Calvinistic, and Zwinglian doctrines and practices at the local level—properly studied as social and cultural history. Indeed, these two models do find resonance in the Russian, Iberian, Dutch, Chinese, and other cases brought forward, but there is also much more. The essays also present rich questions of the relationship between worship practices, beliefs, local communities, and the broader social order. For those readers (this author included) converted to the rewards of a global comparative view, more can be found elsewhere in this series (Catholicism and Aztec religion in the Spanish Empire, and the Jesuits in China in *Implicit Understandings* [1994]; religious pluralism in the Ottoman and Mughal empires in a forthcoming volume). The collected essays here show that although states share an interest in promoting orthodoxy, people seem to share a common response in thwarting it—an insight that certainly deserves and should provoke further studies.

New Haven, Connecticut CHERIE WOODWORTH

Late Modern European

Por la vida y el honor: el Presbítero Félix Varela en las Cortes de España, 1822-1823. By Manuel Pablo Maza Miquel, S.J. (Santo Domingo, Domincan Republic: Instituto Pedro Francisco Bonó. 2000. Pp. 358.)

In *Por la Vida y el Honor*, Maza Miquel traces the parliamentary career of the Cuban priest and liberal deputy of the 1822-1823 Spanish Cortes, Félix

Varela. This premise highlights Varela's contradictory vocation. He was an ecclesiastic who nevertheless condemned the priest-led, anti-liberal insurrections which ravaged Spain throughout his tenure. He supported the Cortes in its removal of rebellious bishops, yet defended the right of the Papacy to nominate successors. A committed defender of the Constitution of 1812, he nonetheless represented Cuba, a Spanish colony ruled by varying degrees of autocratic special measures throughout the nineteenth century. The author thus recounts the life of a discerning, moderate liberal, for whom there were principles above the dominant ideologies of the age. In so doing he has made a nuanced contribution to a historiography which is still largely dominated by the partisan historians of the field, Alberto Gil Novales (a wholehearted sympathizer with the radical-liberals of the 1820-1823 Triennium), and José Luis Comellas (a conservative critic of radicalism).

Maza Miquel begins by outlining the context of the 1814-1820 period of absolutism. In this analysis he gravitates towards two key points. The first refers to the view that the 1814-1820 Spanish Church was bloated and shedding its moral authority due to its virulent support for absolutism. This conforms to the traditional view (José Manuel Cuenca, 1971) that the Church would never become entirely reconciled with liberalism, with the result that by the mid-nineteenth century the institution was living in a ghetto of its own making. The second point refers to the revisionist view (Leandro Alvarez Rey, 1998) that the radicals who conspired in the Masonic and secret societies had a lesser impact than has traditionally been thought, the revolution of 1820 being enacted by liberal army elites with marginal popular support. From the liberals' point of view, this circle could be squared by instructing priests to tutor their flocks in classes of constitutional catechism, in order to instil them with *amor a la Constitución*. The dead-hand union of "throne and altar" absolutism would thus be swept aside by the liberal alliance of "Constitution and altar."

Insofar as this debate is concerned, Varela was clearly in the second camp. However, the policy was a demonstrable failure; the clerical-royalist insurrection of 1821-1823 enjoyed an organic popular support which the opposing liberal armies and militia could not muster. Maza Miquel provides clues as to the popular disillusionment with liberalism but fails to develop them. In 1821, the Cortes decreed the halving of tithe payments throughout Spain, a policy mooted to be extended to Cuba the following year. Varela resisted this policy because he deemed such stringency could not adequately fund even the colonial Church. More significant for the Spanish masses, however, was the fact that the half-tithe had to be paid in cash instead of kind, a massive burden for a peasantry unaccustomed to a cash economy at a time of low agricultural prices. In 1823 Varela urged the establishment of representative town-halls in Cuba, despite so few of the island's settlements consisted of the "twenty-five houses forming roads" which the Constitution demanded as a precondition. Varela's concern might have been informed by an analogous geographical quandary in Spain, as the populous and compact settlements of southern Spain lent themselves to close con-

trol by liberal town-halls, whereas the isolated and strung-out villages of the Basque lands and of parts of Navarre and Aragón were the hotbed of reaction.

Nevertheless, these qualifications merely suggest scope for a "bottom-up" study of Triennium politics; they do not detract from the author's otherwise refreshing study of a liberal priest opposed to all forms of fanaticism and militarism. In short, Maza Miquel depicts Félix Varela as an even-handed moderate. He thus stands head-and-shoulders above the praetorian and opportunistic politicians and caciques who so retarded the political development of both Spain and Cuba throughout the nineteenth century.

University of Liverpool MARK LAWRENCE

Holy Tears, Holy Blood: Women, Catholicism, and the Culture of Suffering in France, 1840-1909. By Richard D. E. Burton. (Ithaca, NewYork: Cornell University Press. 2004. Pp. xxviii, 291. $45.00.)

Richard Burton's haunting study of the religious sensibilities of eleven French women makes an original contribution to the history of modern France. Many of these women—Thérèse de Lisieux, Raïssa Maritain, Claire Ferchaud, Simone Weil, and Camille Claudel—are well known figures in the world of the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. The others—Mélanie Calvat and Colette Peignot, for example—are less so. In a period during which the state and civil society became increasingly secularized and the Catholic Church increasingly "feminized," Burton seeks to understand the emergence of a distinctive kind of female religiosity, characterized by a conscious embrace of both suffering and sacrifice, which reflected the Catholic doctrine of "vicarious suffering." It should be emphasized, as Burton himself does, that these women are not representative of French Catholic women as a whole. Indeed, the majority of women lived ordinary lives and those who entered religious life joined active religious orders and were *congréganistes*, not nuns in cloistered orders, like Mélanie Calvat or Thérèse Martin. In this sense it is difficult to claim, as Burton does, that they illuminate what was "the most publicized, if not the most generalized, expression of female Catholic spirituality in France" (p. xv).

What all these women share is a life of suffering, which could take the form of mental anguish, as in the case of the sculptress Camille Claudel, the one-time mistress of Auguste Rodin and sister of the poet Paul Claudel, or physical pain associated with tuberculosis, stigmata, and eating disorders. Burton charts the way in which each of these women transformed often excruciating suffering into forms of holiness or martyrdom, which was celebrated or appropriated for their own purposes by the men around them. These include some of the most significant intellectual figures of the day—Paul Claudel, Jacques Maritain, Georges Bataille, Léon Bloy, Joris-Karl Huysman, and Georges Bernanos, among others.

The book is divided into seven chapters, six of which are devoted to the women's biographies and an analysis of their writings and visions. Burton tells

their stories with great subtlety and sensitivity. In a highly suggestive final chapter, he draws together the similiarities in the lives of women as different as the political activist Simone Weil and Georges Bataille's renegade mistress Colette Peignot, while pointing to the common experience of absent mothers and "feminized" fathers, their curious relationship to food, their classification as hysterics (or "mysterics") by the medical profession, and their preoccupations with tears, blood, and hair.

The importance of this carefully crafted book is that Burton not only sheds light on the interior lives of his female protagonists, but he also illuminates the political implications of the doctrine of vicarious suffering, by showing how it was intimately associated with an ultrareactionary political right wing. To this extent this form of Catholicism continued to propagate the close association between the Church and the right wing in France. Burton demonstrates that the suffering of women was viewed as a means to redeem an afflicted Church and nation for much of the period between the early nineteenth century to the World War II, and he asks an inevitable question regarding who reaped the benefits of this suffering. He concludes that it was "the men in their lives or, more generally, the male-dominated order of things, particularly in the Church . . . who did not go nearly as far along the Via Dolorosa as they did" (p. 249). Burton suggests that the principle of patriarchal authority remained unchallenged. There is, however, considerable evidence that "women religious" frequently clashed with the church hierarchy, as he himself admits in his discussion of Mélanie Calvat.

Burton, who is a literary scholar, has written a fascinating interdisciplinary work on a significant and neglected current in Catholic doctrine and practice. The work is particularly valuable for the light that it sheds on a specific form of female devotional life and its broader impact on politics and civil society.

University of California, Los Angeles CAROLINE FORD

La République contre les Congrégations: Histoire d'une passion française (1899-1914). By Christian Sorrel. (Paris: Les Éditions du Cerf. 2003. Pp. 265. €23.00.)

Timed to coincide with the centenary of the association laws in France (1901 and 1904), Christian Sorrel's book provides a synthesis of the most recent scholarship on the religious orders and associations which were victimized by these laws. The dates in the book's subtitle are somewhat misleading because Sorrel reaches back to the (radical) "republican program" of the French Revolution in offering a fairly substantial overview of the nineteenth century (sixty-one pages), and forward to later twentieth-century developments which dismantled the anti-*congréganiste* legislation. There are no scholarly notes in this book, but the bibliography of secondary works is extensive, and Professor Sorrel diligently mentions primary sources throughout his text.

Sorrel divided his book into three parts with two chapters each, and decided to follow the tradition of the French state and French society in using the term *congrégations* to mean both the religious orders with their solemn vows *and* the religious associations with their "simple" vows. Part One of the book focuses on the *congrégations* before the passage of the first association law, with the first chapter surveying the revival of the *congrégations* from 1800 to 1880, when they were generally accepted and prosperous, and the second chapter covering 1880-1900, when the republicans captured control of the state and started attacking the congregations with the laic laws. These chapters assess the congregations' resources and apostolic commitments, and explore the oftentimes creative strategies for dealing with the new assaults. Anticlericalism provided the sole possible political cement for the fissiparous French Left, and the congregations were an easy target. Part Two traces the making of the association laws and their gradual implementation. Here Sorrel privileges the many arguments of the day. Part Three explores the response of the *congréganistes* to the brutal new laws. Ultimately deprived of their property and sources of sustenance, the majority desperately sought means to remain in France and continue their apostolate (*les eouvres*)—almost always at the cost of submitting to laicization; others (the minority) became part of the "diasporas"—a fascinating episode, told well, with excellent attention to the issue of geographical considerations and varying local conditions. Either strategy, however, left most of these men and women with very precarious, difficult, and disappointing lives. But the ten-year transition period for the elimination of all congregations was just ending when World War I erupted, and with that, France announced that it had "need of all her sons and daughters." Thereafter, there were other "keys to the return," and the *congréganistes* gradually resumed their activities in France. With official recognition of the Jesuits in France in 2001, the process came full circle.

It would be impossible to write this book without the bridge of Part Two, but I would have advised a compression of the substantial detail and quotation in this part. The quotes do help support Sorrel's compounded conclusion—that the Third Republic treaded on dangerous ground when it attacked the *liberté* of some of its citizens in the name of greater *liberté* for the rest, and that this provides a cautionary tale for "a democratic state faced with the growth of new religious movements. . ." (p. 223). But less time on legislative details (available elsewhere) and fairly well-known arguments of the opposing factions would have highlighted the main project better and allowed for a sharpening of the context for the attacks—something Sorrel is eminently equipped to offer. Church-State relations in the Second Empire needed more complexity, and some attention might have been given to issues like the triumph of ultramontanism, the cultural nature of the struggle with the Church (including Catholic anti-republicanism), and the charge that it was the strident anti-Semitism of Catholics during the Dreyfus Affair that was mainly to blame for the association laws. But these points aside, Professor Sorrel has given us a very valuable and interesting volume.

Georgetown University SANDRA HORVATH-PETERSON

Pour une histoire du monde catholique au 20e siècle, Wallonie-Bruxelles: Guide du chercheur. Edited by Jean Pirotte and Guy Zelis. [Collection Sillages.] (Louvain-la-Neuve: Archives du monde Catholique Eglise-Wallonie. 2003. Pp. 784.)

In some respects the contributors to this book are like a who's who of Catholic history at the time and since the split of the ancient university into two universities in the 1960's, the Dutch-language Katholieke Universiteit Leuven and the French-language Université Catholique de Louvain. That indeed is the uniqueness of this book and also part of its problem.

What emeritus Louvain professor Edouard Boné has called a "monumental book" has six major parts that deal with: (1) Religious Life, (2) Catholics and Political Life, (3) Societal Problems, (4) Cultural Life, (5) Wars and Peace, and (6) World Missionary Activity. The twenty-six contributors to this book have amassed a phenomenal amount of information and facts, and their documentation is precise and impeccable. The book's subtitle, "*guide du chercheur*," is apt. Anyone researching twentieth-century Belgian history and the recent history of the Catholic Church in Belgium cannot ignore this book.

Throughout the twentieth century the Roman Catholic Church was by far the dominant religious group in Belgium; and to understand its impact on political, social, and cultural life the concept of "pillarization" is a useful tool. A network of affiliated organizations was created and based around the Church. This process began in the last quarter of the nineteenth century and it acquired a new impetus after World War I, as a consequence of the democratization of politics and society. A separate "Catholic world" was created with schools, youth movements, a trade union, employers' organization, cultural organizations, etc., etc. Each group (farmers, workers, self-employed) had its specific set of organizations and political representation within the Catholic Party. The cement that held all of these organizations together was the Catholic religion. The Church was the central focus of this Catholic pillar. The network of organizations was considered to be an essential part of the Church and its infrastructure. And historians must study and research this major element of Belgian history.

The current book constructed under the direction of Jean Pirotte (historian and professor at UCL- Université Catholique de Louvain) and Guy Zelis (director of ARCA: Archives du Monde Catholique) falls far short of what it could have been—an excellently researched and documented study of Catholicism in Belgium—because its goals are impossible to achieve. By focusing only on Wallonia (French-speaking Belgium) and Brussels they have fallen into an ideological hole that blinds them to a number of Belgian realities. By focusing only on Wallonia they have disengaged Catholic history from its Belgian context. Although there is today a State of Wallonia with its own president and its own parliament, just as there is a State of Flanders with its own president and its own parliament, the fact remains that it is impossible to make an objective and accurate historical assessment of the Catholic Church in the French-speaking

part of Belgium without simultaneously considering Catholicism in the Flemish- speaking part of the country. The states of Wallonia and Flanders are recent political constructions created at the end of the twentieth century. A further difficulty I have with this unfortunate book is that the authors have tried to link Brussels with Wallonia. Although French is still heard more often than Dutch in Brussels, the city of Brussels is officially bi-lingual. To focus only on the French-speaking element of Brussels is terribly short-sighted. And finally Brussels is geographically located in the heart of the State of Flanders and the Flemish Parliament is located in Brussels.

With all due respect to the eminent historians who have contributed to this book, it is unfortunate they still seem to wear the old ideological blinders that far too many Dutch-speaking and French-speaking Belgians so militantly put over their heads during the language wars of the 1960's when the venerable University of Louvain became two universities. As someone who lived through those traumatic years, and who still makes his home in Belgium, I thought we had moved well beyond that course of narrow thinking.

Université Catholique de Louvain–Louvain-la-Neuve, Belgium JOHN A. DICK
Katholieke Universiteit Leuven–Leuven, Belgium

Vom Seelenhirten zum Wegführer. Sondierungen zum bischöflichen Selbstverständnis im 19. und 20. Jahrhundert. Die Antrittshirtenbriefe der Germanikerbischöfe (1837-1962). By Martin Leitgöb. [Römische Quartalscrhift für christliche Altertumskunde und Kirchengeschichte, 56. Supplementband.] (Freiburg: Herder. 2004. Pp. 319. €78.00.)

Asked some years ago what was his heaviest burden, a Mexican archbishop answered sadly: "The poor." Many bishops in today's Third World would say the same. It was not always thus. Asked the same question, the earlier bishops in this study might have spoken about the challenge of saving souls and preserving the faith in a world hostile to faith. A century later their successors might have mentioned the difficulty of persuading the faithful that they were not merely passive recipients of the Church's pastoral care and faith, but responsible themselves for passing on that faith to others and extending God's kingdom in the world around them.

In this book the Austrian Redemptorist Martin Leitgöb analyzes the inaugural pastoral letters written by forty-three bishops trained in the German College at Rome. They presided over dioceses not only in Germany and Austria, but also in Luxembourg, Switzerland, Brixen (in South Tyrol), Trent, and Prague. The bishops themselves range from such well-known figures as Senestréy of Regensburg (an ally of the English Cardinal Manning at Vatican Council I) to Cardinals Döpfner, Höffner, and König a century later. Excluded, because they did not receive their formation in Rome, are others of equal importance: Ketteler and Hefele in the nineteenth century, and Faulhaber, von Galen, and Frings in the twentieth.

All of these bishops issued pastoral letters upon assuming office. Many of them also wrote separate letters to their clergy. In the earlier period these were often in Latin—testimony to the educational level of clergy in that day. Leitgöb places these episcopal statements under his scholarly microscope, scrutinizing, dissecting, parsing, and analyzing them with a thoroughness and attention to detail that might astonish their authors. The resulting study, a notable example of German *Gründlichkeit*, makes severe demands on the reader.

As one would expect of men who received their entire priestly formation in Rome, all the bishops emphasize the pope's central role in the Church. In 1847 Reisach told his flock in Munich that the pope was "the center, from whom all episcopal power derives." Over a century later the Austrian bishop Zauner of Linz called the pope "the chief pastor in every diocese." None of these bishops indulged, however, in the exaggerated personality cult that flourished during the pontificate of Pius IX (the pope as "incarnation of the Holy Spirit" and similar absurdities).

The earlier bishops saw themselves primarily as high priests, charged with responsibility for the eternal salvation of their flock. They emphasized the duty of obedience in a fortress church battling the hostile winds still blowing from the French Revolution. The post-World War II bishops begin to emphasize themes taken up by Vatican II, telling the laity that they too are Church, charged, like their pastors, with responsibility for others. "Believers have a responsibility for seekers," Joseph Höffner told his people in Münster in 1962. "We Christians must never become emigrants in this world." Absent from all episcopal statements, however, is any reference to the bishop's responsibility for the whole Church, or to the universal Church as a communion of local churches.

The overall impression is of men more aware of the burdens of their office than of its honor, well educated and clear sighted, and willing to spend themselves freely in the service of their flocks. Worthy of special mention are some words of a man destined to become one of the great men of the Church in his day. Speaking in 1956 at his installation as archbishop of Vienna, Franz König, told the throng in his packed cathedral: "The festive pomp of my first entrance into this church has not prevented me from thinking of my final departure in death, when I shall have to give an account of my stewardship. That is a useful and salutary thought."

Archdiocese of St. Louis JOHN JAY HUGHES

Johann Sebastian Drey. Praelectiones Dogmaticae (1815-1834). Gehalten zu Ellwangen und Tübingen. Edited and Introduction by Max Seckler. 2 volumes. (Tübingen: Francke Verlag. 2003. Pp. xviii, 775. €129.)

Ever since the Reformation, German Catholics have had to struggle to maintain their theological authenticity as a minority group in the German cultural stream that ultimately matured in the Second Reich. Catholic theologians

could maintain a defensive position through a rigorous adherence to Scholastic and subsequently Neo-Scholastic patterns of thought. They could also create a way for their faith to engage their culture in a more positive fashion. The Tübingen School of Theology adopted this latter impetus and looked for the positive contribution that a historicist, romantic, and idealistic culture could provide. Drey was the father of this school, which included Johann Adam Möhler, Franz Anton Staudenmaier, and Johann Kuhn. Subsequently, this nineteenth-century school of thought nurtured such theologians as Hermann Schell, Karl Adam, Johann Metz, and Joseph Ratzinger (Benedict XVI). This theological tradition has tended to see God in the "signs of the times" and so could support the "event-driven" theology of such scholars as Metz.

Seckler's very scholarly contribution to analyzing this tradition appears in his carefully edited text of the formerly unpublished *Praelectiones*. This work contains the notes of Drey's outlines of his systematic theology lectures. This collection of notes is critical as background for understanding Drey's *Einleitung* and *Apologetik*. Drey's reviews of the works of others have also allowed recent scholars to envision what Drey's systematic theology would have looked like as a formal treatise. Seckler, a scholar's scholar, has used virtually every published and unpublished source to help unpack the *Praelectiones* as a text containing Drey's seminal thoughts on the structure of theology as a discipline and on the interaction between theology and history. He and his colleague, Winfried Werner, have even found the class notes of some of Drey's students, which help establish the fact that Drey's scholarly reflections were what he actually taught.

Seckler has also carefully provided his readers with Drey's own publication plans concerning a work on systematic theology, which he viewed as a very crucial future project. The text of the *Praelectiones* itself has been very carefully edited in light of Drey's own usage of abbreviations and punctuation. Seckler's attention to such details can help inform the reader of the meaning of Drey's sometimes cryptic notations. Within the introductory portion of this work, Seckler has explicated a history of how the unpublished text has been used by such twentieth-century scholars as Josef Rupert Geiselmann and Josef Rief as they have analyzed the contributions of the Tübingen School. In light of the meaning of the *Praelectiones*, Seckler has uncovered some of the nuances in earlier works, which gave an inaccurate picture of what Drey was trying to do when he connected theology with historical developments.

In the final analysis, only Neo-Thomism, which assisted Karl Rahner and Bernard Lonergan, and Drey's Tübingen tradition have remained dynamic forces nourishing Catholic theology for the past few decades. Both systems have exhibited healthy tensions that have proved vital as Catholic theologians wrestle with issues of methodology. Seckler helps his readers understand these tensions. He has very effectively embedded his edition of Drey's work into an array of lucid and incisive essays. He has also offered a model for younger scholars who want to reappropriate theological texts, by showing that mere translations are not enough. Finally, Seckler has reminded

scholars involved in church history and in historical theology of the importance of the Catholic Tübingen School in the ongoing development of the intellectual life of the Church.

Boston College DONALD J. DIETRICH

Old Thunder: A Life of Hilaire Belloc. By Joseph Pearce. (San Francisco: Ignatius Press. 2002. Pp. x, 318. $24.95.)

Robert Speaight's *The Life of Hilaire Belloc* was published in 1957, a mere four years after the death of his subject. As is customary with authorized biographies, this thick volume is awash in detail and extravagant praise. Nearly three decades later A. N. Wilson produced a more critical, less sympathetic rendering, but his 1986 treatment of Belloc's career suffers from defects of emphasis and judgment. Thus, it is past time for the appearance of a new, thoughtful, carefully-researched, definitive reappraisal of Belloc for the twenty-first century. Unfortunately for students of modern British culture, politics, and letters, Joseph Pearce has not provided such a book.

Pearce relies far too much upon Speaight. Nearly a quarter of his nine-hundred-plus endnotes cite either Speaight's official biography or Speaight's edited letters of Belloc. By contrast, Pearce exhibits a clear distaste for Wilson's interpretation, referencing the latter volume a mere handful of times.

Pearce's narrative resembles nothing so much as a garden maze, with plenty of promising pathways that, in the end, lead nowhere. A representative example is Chapter 26 entitled "Reformed Characters." Pearce begins this section by discussing Belloc's mounting fascination in the mid-1920's with the historiography of the English Reformation, an interest sparked by the Anglo-French controversialist's Catholic-inspired determination to combat what he decried as Whiggish bias. But Pearce gives the reader only three short paragraphs on this complicated subject. There is no examination of the interpretative framework of Belloc's depictions of the central figures of the Reformation in England or, more importantly, of the origins of the Bellocian version of the sixteenth century in his contemporary political and religious prejudices. Instead, Pearce proceeds to race through a cascade of unrelated topics. The reader is treated to a couple of sentences on the breadth of Belloc's 1925 literary output; half a page on Belloc's delight at G. K. Chesterton's clever illustrations; ten lines on Belloc's support for Chesterton's rectorial candidacy at Glasgow University; an aside on Bellocian public revulsion at the unveiling of an art deco memorial in Kensington Gardens; a paragraph on the death of Belloc's mother; mention of the consolation Belloc received from his grandchildren; seventeen lines on Belloc's admiration for the fiction of Maurice Baring; a brief description of the dinners of the Squire's cricket team; two pages on Belloc's reaction to the 1926 General Strike; and finally a short section recounting an October 1927 public debate between Chesterton and G. B. Shaw.

Only after this four-and-a-half-page detour (in an eight-and-one-half-page chapter) does Pearce return, almost as an afterthought, to the original subject of Belloc-as-historian in the 1920's and '30's. Yet even then, Pearce makes no attempt to summarize the general contour, much less the messy details, of Belloc's historical argument. The most that Pearce can muster is a couple of perfunctory quotes that convey Belloc's anger and despair at "that false official history which warps all English life" (p. 229). The author neglects to define the tenets of the "false official" Whig historians whom Belloc treats with such contempt. The bare extent of what an uninitiated reader learns here is that Belloc championed the "Catholic version of history" in its battle against the pro-Protestant consensus of Macaulay, Freeman, and Trevelyan. Then, having adequately analyzed nothing, Pearce asserts that "[p]erhaps . . . Belloc deserves recognition as being more than merely a much-needed counterbalance to the bias of previous 'official' historians. Perhaps he deserves to be seen as a true historian, that is, a historian who sought objectivity to his judgments to such a degree that he tried sincerely to overcome his own prejudices in the service of historical accuracy and truth" (p. 231). To establish credentials for mounting such a counterattack on Belloc's behalf, at the very least a biographer owes his audience a full explanation of what the battle is all about.

A reader interested in depth is frustrated at every turn. There is no searching examination of the roots of Belloc's grievances against Oxford; of his alleged anti-Semitism; of the causes of his early and bitter alienation from parliamentary politics that sparked the publication of *The Party System*; of the finer points of "Distributism," Chesterbelloc's "Third Way" between socialism and capitalism laid out in *The Servile State*; or of the deeper connections between all of Belloc's various efforts at Catholic apologetics. Most disappointing of all is Pearce's failure to explain how all of these elements of the politically-engaged, ideologically-charged Belloc intertwined over sixty years to construct a coherent, generally consistent public persona.

Clearly this is in no sense an intellectual biography of a very public intellectual. Rather, Pearce has written a "social biography," that is to say, he lavishes most of his attentions on Belloc's personal relationships with friends and family. The author is much more concerned with depicting Belloc as "hail-fellow-well-met" in lieu of a public image of Belloc as indefatigable controversialist and somewhat self-pitying iconoclast. As a result, Pearce's principal new contribution to our knowledge of Hilaire Belloc is the inclusion within the text of dozens of extended quotations from previously unpublished letters to and from Belloc, most of them providing a window on his character rather than his ideas. Belloc as son, husband, father, and friend we get to know very well within these pages. The public Belloc eludes us.

Louisiana School for Math, Science, and the Arts VICTOR FESKE
Natchitoches

Der Staat und die katholische Kirche in Litauen seit dem Ende des Zweiten Weltkrieges. By Martin Jungraithmayr. [Zeitgeschichtliche Forschungen, Band 16.] (Berlin: Duncker und Humblot. 2002. Pp. 423. €76 paperback.)

This law dissertation at the University of Marburg deals with the relations between the Catholic Church and the State since the Soviet occupation of 1940. After a detailed introduction on church and state at the time of Lithuania's independence, the destruction of the church as an institution and the physical liquidation of the clergy through Stalin's religious policy are set forth in detail. The juridical aspects and the hostile Soviet church law take up much space.

From the Soviet point of view, it was a question of the fastest possible and unlimited extension of the atheistic policy of destruction to the states and territories occupied since 1939. For this reason the ideological basis, the principles of the Soviet religious policy in general, the laws and decrees, and their translation into reality are treated in detail. Unfortunately, the work of bringing out adequately the specific situation in Lithuania in comparison with other regions of the Soviet Union is missing. The reader gains the impression that the persecution and annihilation of the Church were exceptionally extensive in Lithuania; actually in few regions of the Soviet Union could the Church preserve as much strength and spirit of resistance as in Lithuania. The reasons for that await a detailed investigation.

From the time of "perestroika" the episcopate and clergy stood without reservation behind the independence movement, which had been prepared by a widespread movement of dissidents within the Church. The last part deals with the legal restoration of church-state relations, property rights, and educational policy since 1991, which tore open painful wounds in society. The Lithuanian religious law of 1995 could not manage to come to treat all religious denominations as equal before the law and was to make the further penetration of foreign religious communities more difficult.

This book is a compilation of the research and journalism in the German language without sufficiently evaluating it critically; Russian, English, and Lithuanian sources and accounts are not taken into consideration. The possibilities for a comparative examination are hardly exploited.

University of Cologne GERHARD SIMON

American

The Supreme Court and Religion in American Life. Vol. I: *The Odyssey of the Religion Clauses*; Vol. II: *From "Higher Law" to "Sectarian Scruples."* By James Hitchcock. (Princeton: Princeton University Press. 2004. Pp. x, 218; viii, 261. $32.95; $35.00.)

In this two-volume work, Professor James Hitchcock first provides a comprehensive survey of the Supreme Court's decisions concerning religion. He

then evaluates and critiques the Court's decisionmaking, especially in the contemporary period.

In Volume I, Professor Hitchcock offers a historical survey of the Supreme Court's religion cases, from the Court's earliest decisions to those of the Rehnquist Court. He attempts to describe every case, whether prominent or obscure, offering what he calls "the most comprehensive survey of the religion cases that has yet been published" (p. 1). Hitchcock discusses cases arising not only under the Religion Clauses of the First Amendment, i.e., the Free Exercise and Establishment Clauses, but also under the Free Speech Clause, other constitutional provisions, common-law doctrines, and statutes. All in all, he describes nearly 300 cases, drawn from a wide variety of contexts. In so doing, he highlights many decisions that are frequently overlooked, including decisions not relying on the Religion Clauses. For example, the Dartmouth College case of 1819 rested on the Contract Clause, but Hitchcock maintains that it served to protect the liberty of organized religious groups and, in particular, to promote the proliferation of religiously affiliated colleges.

This volume is a valuable historical resource, albeit one that is not without shortcomings. To the legally trained eye, the book's case discussions are generally accurate, but not precisely so in every particular. (For example, some cases decided under the Free Speech Clause are described at times as cases grounded on the Free Exercise Clause.) More generally, the principal strength of this volume—its comprehensive coverage—may also be its principal weakness. Hitchcock provides a helpful synthesis and historical analysis in his conclusion, but the volume lacks an introductory summary, and its chapters are rather loosely organized, in part by topic and in part by historical period, creating something of a potpourri at times. More to the point, the volume may pursue comprehensiveness to a fault. Many of the cases discussed are interesting and significant, but many of the others are obscure for good reason. As a result, some of the discussion is tedious.

Volume II, standing alone, is an extremely impressive work. With clear thematic organization and rich documentation, Hitchcock discusses and analyzes the Supreme Court's understanding of the Religion Clauses and of religion itself. He explains that throughout most of American history, the Court, like society generally, accepted a broad public role for religion, but that the Court's approach shifted dramatically in the 1940's, with the Court expanding certain aspects of private religious liberty but substantially contracting the permissible role of public religion. Hitchcock documents the personal religious histories of the justices, from John Marshall to the Rehnquist Court, and he suggests that the separationist justices of the 1940's may have been influenced by their personal estrangement from religion, leading them to support a jurisprudence resting in part on the view that religion is radically subjective, irrational, divisive, and potentially dangerous. He systematically criticizes these assumptions about religion, as well as the Court's asserted reliance on the original intent of the framers, including what he regards as an undue emphasis on the views of

Madison and Jefferson. In his conclusion, Hitchcock extends his focus beyond the Supreme Court, offering a provocative and far-reaching critique of various strands of contemporary liberal theory, including especially those strands that promote a liberalism that is "comprehensive" as opposed to merely "political." This is an important work that deserves close attention.

Indiana University School of Law–Bloomington DANIEL O. CONKLE

Sacred Song in America: Religion, Music, and Public Culture. By Stephen A. Marini. [Public Expressions of Religion in America.] (Urbana and Chicago: University of Illinois Press. 2003. Pp. xiv, 400. $34.95.)

Stephen Marini's latest book examines sacred song's function in the religiously pluralistic society of 1990's America. Two Catholic groups are included: Chicanos of the Hispanic Southwest and the Catholic charismatic movement. The book provides a delightful travelogue through a variety of musico-religious cultures, and with its indices serves as something of a field guide for identifying and understanding varieties of sacred song.

Marini, a professor of Christian Studies at Wellesley College, acknowledges both the immensity of the subject and his newcomer status in many of the interdisciplinary fields covered. His stated purpose is to formulate a definition of sacred song (he provides a literature survey) and test it with field research. The bulk of the book is this field research, and it is in these "thick descriptions" (p. 11) of detail that he shines. He casts his net wide to catch public expressions of sacred song: we follow him as he attends concerts and musicals, goes to church, sits in on rehearsals, and watches broadcasts on television. Histories, interviews, and analyses follow.

The religions included as case studies reflect the "particular attention to diversity" (p. ix) requested by the IUPUI Center for the Study of Religion and American Culture that commissioned the book. They range from "old religions," such as Native American, Chicano Catholic, Sacred Harp, Black Church, and Jewish, to newer faiths, including Mormon, Southern Baptist, and New Age.

Marini hunts down song "function" in the public sphere by exploring sacred song available not only to the "worshipping public" but to the non-preselected "general public" (p. 9). For this reason, and perhaps diversity, the primary worship music of a tradition is often bypassed for a body of song less linked to ritual. Particularly interesting was his explanation of why Sacred Harp sings and klezmer music concerts, far removed from their original context, appeal to non-religious intellectuals. He posits that this "dislocated sacrality" (p. 90) allows post-moderns to experience "intense personal engagement in a mythic past" (p. 323) without commitment. Sacred song is both the link and the buffer.

His use of different religion theories to analyze each song type is explained as a critique of existing inadequate theories, but this methodology comes across

as arbitrary. While his analyses are often interesting, his critique suffers from his refusal to formulate an overarching theory. In contrast, his questions about the effect on sacred song of commercialization, audiences that include non-believers, and "market competition" of religious groups are organic and insightful.

There are also some factual errors in the book. For instance, while John Michael Talbot is rightly situated in the Catholic charismatic movement, his music does not typify it, as Marini implies. He describes Talbot's songs as "ideal for congregational singing and thereby for consistent popularity and sales" (p. 325), but they were seldom sung by congregations, whether in "eucharistic meetings" (p. 253) or charismatic praise gatherings. His presentation of Vatican II's teaching on liturgical music ignores the great debates raging on the subject, and the Palm Sunday order of worship he says he observed in Chimayó, New Mexico, is improbable (p. 48).

This book might be useful for discussions in classes studying religion theory, or as background for a survey course in American religion. The musical examples are helpful, but a CD would have made a wonderful addition.

Primarily it serves as a very interesting and mostly non-technical tour of modern religious music-making in America.

The Catholic University of America AMY LEWKOWICZ

Dominicans at Home in a Young Nation, 1786-1865. Volume 1 of *The Order of Preachers in the United States: A Family History*. Edited by Mary Nona McGreal, O. P. (Strasbourg, France: Editions du Signe. 2001. Pp. 304.)

Before the publication of this elegantly produced and attractively illustrated volume it was necessary to look in many places for information about the early history of the Dominicans in the United States. Here information about the ministries and missions of Dominican sisters, brothers, and priests (there were no chapters of Dominican Laity during the time-frame considered) are described in a single narrative written by seventeen Dominican contributors. The book contains endnotes (that provide a useful guide to the sources), a glossary of ecclesial terms, a bibliography, an index, and four profiles that provide close-up views of how Dominican life was lived by these pioneers.

The sacrifices and struggles of these early Dominicans and their efforts to sustain their Dominican identity in the United States are lovingly described, but problems of personnel, leadership, and the ownership of slaves are also noted.

The volume has an impressive consistency of style and content, which is a tribute to the collaborators and the general editor. The inevitable instances of repetitiveness that result from multiple authorship are likely to be helpful for readers who may consult a particular section of the book for information. One consistent feature of the book is the admirable effort to connect Dominican

history with major developments in United States history. Making connections between the particular history of the American Dominicans and the history of the United States is a challenging undertaking because it requires a high level of skill in selecting and accurately summarizing complex situations that often are interpreted in conflicting ways, and in some instances this admirable effort founders. For example, after describing the first Dominicans in New York City, the book notes (p. 35), "In that year of 1787 the Constitutional Convention met in New York, with George Washington presiding." The New Federal Government met in New York City in 1789, but the Constitutional Convention of 1787 met in Philadelphia.

Another consistent characteristic of the volume is an emphasis on description. The information presented is infrequently analyzed or interpreted. For example (p. 213), the departure of slaves who had been Roman Catholics from St. Rose, a Dominican parish in Kentucky, after the end of slavery is mentioned, but the departure of the slaves is not analyzed even though the article by C. Walker Gollar (published in this journal January, 1998), which is cited in the text, includes an interpretation of the departure of the freedmen and freedwomen from Roman Catholicism. A page later the volume notes that ". . . the expansion of ideas aroused by the Enlightenment was confronted by the narrowing of theological perspective in the 'Syllabus of Errors'. . . ," but how reactions to the French Revolution had already impinged on the conflict of the Dominicans and the secular clergy in Kentucky about penitential practices (p. 86), the thoughtfully described conflicts with parish trustees (pp. 52-62), and the difficulties the Dominicans had in communicating their pastoral situation to the Master of the Order, A. V. Jandel (pp. 215-216, 229) are not considered.

It is also curious that a volume devoted to the history of the Dominicans in the United States 1786-1865 begins with a chapter devoted to Bartolomé de Las Casas (1464-1566), who was never in the territory of the United States. If the intention of this "Prelude" is to provide a background sketch of Dominican ministry and concern for social justice in the Americas, why not include St. Rose of Lima (1586-1617), the first canonized saint from the Americas (1671), or St. Martin de Porres (1579-1639), or something about the Dominicans in Baja California?

These issues, however, are minor compared with the achievement of producing a comprehensive chronicle of Dominican life and ministry in the United States to 1865. It is a volume that should be in any library collection on Catholicism in the United States.

Providence College JON ALEXANDER, O.P.

Creating Community: Mary Frances Clarke and Her Companions. By Ann M. Harrington. (Dubuque, Iowa: Sisters of Charity, BVM. 2004. Pp. xv, 198. $10.00.)

Like scholars in other historical fields, at least some of those concerned with the history of women religious have begun to challenge the "great

[wo]man" approach to the past, in which extraordinary credit is given to the significance or contributions of a specific person in shaping the experiential legacy of a group. For those writing about sisters, however, this concern raises particular trials, because congregations and orders traditionally have been understood to owe their distinctive character and spirit to the inspiration or "charism" of an individual "founder." Without rejecting the notion of charism entirely, a number of recent works have skillfully modified and nuanced its understanding. Important scholars contributing to this approach include Josephine Marie Peplinski (*A Fitting Response: The History of the Sisters of St. Joseph of the Third Order of St. Francis*), M. Raphael Consedine (*Listening Journey: A Study of the Spirit and Ideals of Nano Nagle and the Presentation Sisters*), Carol K. Coburn and Martha Smith (*Spirited Lives: How Nuns Shaped Catholic Culture and American Life, 1836-1920*), the collective authors of *Building Sisterhood: A Feminist History of the Sisters, Servants of the Immaculate Heart of Mary,* and, perhaps most creatively, Mary C. Sullivan (*Catherine McAuley and the Tradition of Mercy*). Now, with *Creating Community: Mary Frances Clarke and Her Companions*, Ann M. Harrington has earned her place within this circle.

Creating Community is a concise and very readable account primarily of the founding and foundational traditions of the Sisters of Charity of the Blessed Virgin Mary, an Irish-American congregation originally established in Philadelphia (1833), but soon moved to Dubuque, Iowa. Harrington has built upon the work of numerous previous historians of the community (most, like her, both BVM sisters and trained scholars), but she has also taken upon herself the more difficult—and sometimes controversial—task of exploring aspects of the heritage that she calls its "mythistory," citing William McNeill who describes this as "what groups of people have known and believed about their past and found necessary to preserve as essential for their entire existence" (p. 3). In so doing, Harrington draws extensively upon archival materials that others have used, but also upon extensive original scholarship in both the United States and Ireland, as well as upon impressive familiarity with relevant contextual materials and historiography. The result is an analytic narrative that is both respectful and persuasive: answering questions that have remained unanswered (or misunderstood) in the BVM tradition, and gently correcting some deeply rooted misunderstandings.

Throughout this work, the "foundress," Mary Frances Clarke, remains central but not inappropriately so. Harrington presents her as "first among equals"—not only among her four original companions, but also among the increasingly larger circle of sisters who quickly joined the BVMs and, because they were enabled by an approach to religious life that celebrated individual gifts as well as common purpose, soon made important contributions of their own to the congregation's evolving legacy. Harrington also does not shy away from detailing the sometimes tense relationship between Clarke and various members of the clergy, giving the clerics credit when it is warranted, but equally clearly recounting the obstacles

they sometimes put into the path of the women whose services they nonetheless valued and so eagerly sought. The result is not so much a collective biography as it is an important account of community, accessible both to insiders such as the BVM sisters themselves and to scholars not only of religious life, but also of nineteenth-century women and social change.

Syracuse University MARGARET SUSAN THOMPSON

Charles Hodge Revisited: A Critical Appraisal of His Life and Work. Edited by John W. Stewart and James H. Moorhead. (Grand Rapids: William. B. Eerdmans Publishing Co. 2002. Pp. x, 375. $25.00 paperback.)

In his summary chapter, coeditor James Moorehead states that Charles Hodge (1797-1878) was neither the bogey man nor the icon that later generations considered him. Professor at Princeton Seminary for five decades, instructor to 3,000 students, author of more than a dozen books and several score articles, Hodge's influence, particularly among certain strains of mid-nineteenth-century American Protestantism, is indisputable. This volume revisits that legacy with a well-qualified cadre of scholars providing an updated assessment of Hodge's significance as theologian, scriptural exegete, and public intellectual. Philosophically, Hodge stood squarely in the tradition of Scottish Common Sense Realism, an impulse that was powerfully regnant among many Protestants, even if challenged by the currents of Kantianism and nineteenth-century Romanticism. With its confidence in the mind to know the world and overcome any residues of Humean skepticism, this philosophical tradition promoted a static rather than a dynamic view of theology. It understood the world, the heavens, and everything in between in terms of equilibrium with little recognition of historical development. Hodge's view of scripture was equally ahistorical. The centrality of the Bible for issues of faith was paramount. This volume clarifies Hodge's engagement with European and specifically German intellectual resources that go beyond the Scottish tradition. However, these alternative resources were drawn from conservative and pietist circles, and not from the historically sensitive influences of Hegel and Schleiermacher. Finally, regarding society and politics, Hodge was firmly anchored in the Federalist-Whig-Republican trajectory, skeptical of Jacksonian appeals to the common man, fearful of the social instability posed by Transcendentalism and Abolitionism, and opposed to the market revolution taking place under his own feet.

For readers of this journal, Hodge might seem to be a prototypical nineteenth century American Protestant with little attraction. His affirmation of biblical authority would brook no appeal to tradition, and his animus against historicism could not embrace even Newman's doctrine of development. Even if his occasionally unsympathetic remarks about Catholicism might be written off as reflections of his class and cultural position, his insistence upon the sufficiency of the Bible and the error of a mediating priesthood represented a deeper chasm. Nevertheless, Hodge was more than a demagogue purveying a

simplistic anti-Catholicism. His *Systematic Theology*, published in 1871-1872, was every bit as concerned with the issue of religious authority as were the roughly contemporaneous reflections taking place at the Vatican under Pius IX. Moreover, Pius had invited several American Protestant denominations to send representatives to the First Vatican Council. When the Northern Presbyterians decided to decline this invitation, Hodge was chosen to write the response. While Catholic and Protestant relations were often combative in this era, Hodge wrote a conciliatory response stating that any who professed Jesus as Lord and Savior were true Christians. Consequently, while students of American Reformed Protestantism can encounter in this volume a more nuanced estimate of one who has played an important role in that tradition's nineteenth- and early-twentieth-century history, so too can students of American Catholicism find in Hodge not simply a one-dimensional caricature of their tradition, but rather an informed disputant. Finally, for the general student of American Christianity, as this volume makes so clear, Hodge represented an important, though ultimately limited, authority in the intellectual domain of the nineteenth century and its legacy for future generations.

University of North Carolina at Wilmington WALTER H. CONSER, JR.

The Kingdom Is *Always But Coming: A Life of Walter Rauschenbusch*. By Christopher H. Evans. [Library of Religious Biography.] (Grand Rapids, Michigan: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company. 2004. Pp. xxx, 348. $25.00 paperback.)

Evans's biography of the most influential and sophisticated Protestant theological social ethicist and reformer early in the twentieth century serves two audiences.

It offers those who have studied Rauschenbusch in depth a rich account of his life and thought in relation to other Christian writers during this period and in relation to Christian scriptures and tradition. Evans exhaustive, and sometimes repetitive, reporting on his subject's personal life surpasses in comprehensive detail the only other balanced biography of Rauschenbusch, the one by Paul Minus. Evans has combed the many boxes of the Rauschenbusch archives at the Colgate Rochester Crozer Divinity School for correspondence revealing personal matters such as Rauschenbusch's relations to the institution of the family and his own family members and his embrace of an upper-middle class financial and social status. Evans ably uses these discoveries to show connections between his subject's life and his theology and ethics that have escaped other interpreters of Rauschenbusch. I, for one, would have written a richer understanding of Rauschenbusch on justice had Evans's book been available.

Second, Evans offers those interested in American Christian social ethics a readable and enjoyable introduction to its principal Protestant progenitor. Evans competently explicates Rauschenbusch's most prominent theological and ethical innovations as well as the evangelical and Anabaptist roots of these

contributions to social ethics. Although this biography does not render Paul Minus's book otiose, it provides at least as adequate an entree into the fertile thought of Rauschenbusch.

Relying solely on Evans to introduce Rauschenbusch, however, can mislead and diminish the penetrating creativity of his theology and his legacy for social ethics. Evans proposes to interpret Rauschenbusch as a window for a better understanding of Protestant thought in the United States at the turn of the twentieth century in a strictly chronological approach to his subject, mingling interpretations of Rauschenbusch's professional and personal activity during distinct periods in his life. The result portrays Rauschenbusch as embodying the most prominent typical expression of Protestant liberal theology and the Social Gospel within the cultural constraints of his era. Yet Evans unrestrainedly describes Rauschenbusch's traits and values from a twentieth-first century perspective. Evans labels his subject an idealist and moralist (in juxtaposition to Marxist materialism); a Victorian paternalist with regard to family, gender relations, and work; and as keeping upper middle-class distance from the laboring class whom he purported to champion. These partially accurate descriptions fit John A. Ryan, Rauschenbusch's most influential Catholic counterpart, as well as they do Rauschenbusch. They also veil characteristics of Rauschenbusch's thought that make it a distinctively valuable source for contemporary theology and ethics.

Most important, Evans fails to account fully for how Rauschenbusch connected the realization of religious and moral ideas in the Kingdom of God with their embodiment in movements and institutions within the church, politics, education, family, and the economy. These connections are most fully explained in *Christianizing the Social Order*, a book Evans interprets more as a sequel to Rauschenbusch's first book, *Christianity and the Social Crisis*, than as a distinctive contribution to the corpus of his thought. Rauschenbusch's recognition that religious and moral ideas must be instantiated in social institutions with a momentum of their own modified his idealism and his use of theological concepts such as sin, grace, and redemption. Full appreciation for this dimension of Rauschenbusch's thought enables more discerning descriptions and evaluations of his views regarding family, work, middle-class values, class relations, and even paternalism. Rauschenbusch was, of course, constrained by the cultural and moral values of his place and time, but Evans, despite meticulous research and appreciation for his subject, misses some of what makes Rauschenbusch worthy of continued examination by theological ethicists.

Evans has written a good biography. It could have been improved by an organization focused on key theological, social, and ethical themes in Rauschenbusch's thought and personal life rather than merely on chronicling distinct periods of his life. *The Kingdom Is Always But Coming* is an accessible and able introduction to Walter Rauschenbusch. Just don't stop with it.

Washington and Lee University HARLAN BECKLEY

Catholic Higher Education in Protestant America: The Jesuits and Harvard in the Age of the University. By Kathleen A. Mahoney. (Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press. 2003. Pp. xi, 348. $42.95.)

Kathleen Mahoney has undertaken the challenging historiographic task of answering the call issued by Martin Marty several decades ago to "fuse *l'histoire de mentalité* with narrative line" in American religious history, and she has admirably succeeded in her well written and engaging monograph. The narrative focus of Mahoney's study is the 1893 decision of Harvard's president Charles W. Eliot to bar graduates of Jesuit colleges from regular admission to Harvard Law School. The tension generated by this decision erupted into a full-blown, nationally publicized controversy, marking (among other things) the Gilded Age transition from the era of the denominational college to the "age of the university," as well as highlighting the surprising (and, in the view of the Jesuits, disturbing) fact that already, by the 1890's, the vast majority of American Catholic college students were enrolled in non-Catholic institutions, leaving Catholic colleges under-subscribed.

The *l'histoire de mentalité* opened up by this important but surprisingly under-studied historical event is the conjunction of two very different understandings of "higher education" that clashed in Gilded Age America: the Jesuit pedagogical ideal embodied in the famed *Ratio studiorum*, a plan of studies formalized by the Jesuits in 1599 privileging the Renaissance ideals of classical-language training, rhetoric, and moral formation, and the new ideal of the modern "liberal" university privileging scientific reasoning and the "elective" system of undergraduate education, allowing each student to create an individualized course of study. As Mahoney so elegantly shapes her story, the Jesuit devotion to the *Ratio* in fact becomes the embodiment of a much broader Christian ideal of college education that had led the Congregationalists to establish Williams College, the Baptists to sponsor Colgate, and the Methodists to support Wesleyan University. Over against this quite revered "denominational" ideal of a moral formation dedicated to shaping a "Christian manhood" trained for service in church and state, President Eliot of Harvard—in conjunction with other educational giants like Daniel Coit Gilman of The Johns Hopkins University and William Rainey Harper of the University of Chicago—came to see "traditional" liberal arts education like that embodied in the Jesuit system of higher education as being "rooted in the past and thus irrelevant to the wants of the day in modern, Protestant America" (p. 59).

But Mahoney's richly textured study quite cannily avoids a simple "us versus them," Catholic against liberal Protestant set of debates; indeed, at least as interesting as the publicized debates between Eliot and the Jesuit presidents of Holy Cross, Boston College, and Georgetown which she narrates is her subtle exploration of an even more complex "intramural" debate among Jesuit educators over *internal* competing impulses in the ideals of Jesuit education: the desire to remain faithful to the "wisdom of the fathers" as embodied in the *Ratio* over against the call of the *Constitutions* of the Society of Jesus to adapt their edu-

cational programs, when necessary, "to the times, persons, and places they encountered." As the American Jesuits came to understand that their colleges, with their traditional course of studies and strict discipline, were rejected by increasing numbers of middle-class Catholics (in the process making Harvard the largest Catholic university in the United States), a heated debate emerged *within* the Society of Jesus over how much of the *Ratio* could (or should) be retained in the service of an apostolic vision which—since its enunciation by Ignatius Loyola—had held up "cultural adaptation" as an apostolic ideal.

As Mahoney so elegantly interprets this important historical encounter, the Jesuits' adaptation to the newly emergent ideal of the "research university" did not entail a complete concession to "modernity," but rather a mix of adaptation and resistance. And this mix helped Catholic higher education to reach the twenty-first century "with one thing Protestants did not: universities with substantial religious identities." This is a well-researched and important monograph that scholars of American Catholicism and of higher education in twentieth century America will read with interest.

Fordham University MARK MASSA, S.J.

Rock Beneath the Sand: Country Churches in Texas. Text by Lois E. Myers and Rebecca Sharpless. Photographs by Clark G. Baker. [Sam Rayburn Series on Rural Life, no. 5.] (College Station: Texas A&M University Press. 2003. Pp. xx, 197.)

When reviewing history, it is easier to be struck by tumultuous events than to grasp the bedrock that stands firm even while tyrants and tempests rage. "Rock Beneath the Sand," a fitting title for this book detailing the proud stories of some tenacious rural churches in Central Texas, is also a metaphor for the foundations that undergird rural churches, things that seem strange or hidden in a world of cities and suburbs.

One remarkable foundation unearthed by this book is the religious diversity found within remote rural areas in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. The authors aptly describe the growth of "open country churches" in McLennan County, Texas, where successive waves of immigrants brought their faith communities with them. Certainly we know there were Anglo settlers in rural Texas, but who would have guessed there were also German, Norwegian, Czech, Polish, Wendish, and African-American churches (both Protestant and Catholic), not to mention Mexican-American parishes in and near this single county. More than ethnic islands, these small churches provided a place to socialize, to speak, sing, and worship in native languages and cultures. Clearly, these rural churches also provided an entry way to American life and gradual integration. While many rural churches have disappeared in the last seventy-five years, those that remain have done so by remembering and celebrating their ethnic roots and strong family ties.

The role of agriculture is also acknowledged for its prominent position in the life of rural churches. Throughout American history, faith communities settled where they could draw sustenance from land that was accessible to newcomers. Their church life was closely tied to the seasons of the farm life. Most importantly, living with the land gave rural churches in McLennan County (and elsewhere) a sense of place—an anchor that continues to bolster small churches that have survived. It is noteworthy that this book spends significant time on a major cause of rural church decline: the shift from subsistence farming to cash crops, then to mechanized agriculture, which drastically diminished the number of families in small churches.

Two additional foundations of country churches revealed by the authors are the churches' ability to adapt to changes and an ethic of service. Rural churches that survive today defy the quaint, conservative, caricatures of their ilk. In reality, these communities were not static, but highly dynamic in responding to the struggles of antebellum America and the World Wars, and to the rapid changes brought on by contemporary society. Furthermore, a key to survival of rural churches has been their ability to endow their members with a sense of service, and to continually carve out a strong and creative mission outreach, even as society changed and populations shifted.

One final note about this book is that it is a handsome edition: high quality paper, strong binding, and exquisite black-and-white photographs—features that bespeak the sacredness of its contents. In a North American world where country churches are disappearing, this book is an inspiring illustration of foundations that endure through time, and of practices that matter most of all . . . regardless of where we live.

Ogallalla Commons DARRYL BIRKENFELD
Nazareth, Texas

Habits of Devotion. Catholic Religious Practice in Twentieth-Century America. Edited by James M. O'Toole. [Cushwa Center Studies of Catholicism in Twentieth-Century America.] (Ithaca, New York: Cornell University Press. 2004. Pp. viii, 289. $39.95.)

Habits of Devotion is one of the first fruits of the "Catholicism in the Twentieth Century" study hosted by the Cushwa Center for the Study of American Catholicism at the University of Notre Dame. James O'Toole has ably edited this important volume on Catholic practice and Catholic identity. Four scholars, well-known in American Catholic studies, examine the "week-to-week" experience of "ordinary" Catholics in America by taking a "long historical view" of the material for the half-century (1925-1975) which encompassed the Second Vatican Council. The historiography complements the work of anthropologists, oral historians, and ethnographers, who have treated similar material. The sources used include religious pamphlets, church bulletins, diaries, letters,

and national conference proceedings. A central theme explores how Catholic belief and practice both changed and remained the same in differing social and political times, as well as the insight that modifications in public and private prayer life had begun earlier than the Second Vatican Council.

Joseph P. Chinnici, O.F.M., provides a substantial chapter on prayer. Analyzing an array of national prayer movements, including lay retreats, various liturgical groups, the Christopher Movement, and the Confraternity of Christian Doctrine, Chinnici traces the continuities and discontinuities in American Catholic prayer life and concludes that because of a "pedagogy of participation" (p. 39), American Catholics generally accepted the liturgical changes which preceded and followed from the Second Vatican Council. Secondly, part of the reason for a "piety void" which coincided with the collapse of the Cold War can be related to a transformed social world and to a gap between experience and theory. Finally, Catholics sought a new relationship between contemplation and their social world, a dimension of American Catholic prayer life often overlooked by scholars.

Paula Kane analyzes the malleability of Marian devotion from its ethnic expressions to anti-communism, the impact of the Second Vatican Council, and the apocalyptic aspects of the devotion in the 1980's. Marian devotion provided both divine assistance and resistance to social evils, especially communism and sexual immorality. She notes the international origins of the turning points in American Marian piety and suggests reasons why contemporary expressions reflect something quite different from devotion in the post-World War II years.

James O'Toole investigates the practice of private sacramental confession and the factors which led to a dramatic decrease in its observance in a short period of time. Social factors of gender, ethnicity, geographic location, as well as penitents' perception of the theological elements of confession affected the reception of the sacrament. But between 1965 and 1975, dissatisfaction with the practice of confession, changing understandings of morality, especially with respect to birth control, "psychologizing" confession, and other liturgical changes, all contributed to a meteoric change in practice.

Margaret McGuinness explores Eucharistic devotional practice from the 1926 International Eucharistic Congress, which displayed the public force of Catholicism with clear theological and social boundaries between Catholics and Protestants, to that of the 1976 International Eucharistic Congress, which placed a catechetical stress on the social implications of the Eucharist. In three periods—Tradition, 1926-1945; Transition, 1945-1960; Transformation, 1960-76—McGuiness examines Eucharistic "etiquette" (p. 198) and Eucharistic devotional theology to illustrate the change of Catholic attitudes toward the Eucharist brought about partially through the increased participation in the sacrament.

Ample footnotes in the chapters provide fine resources for further research. While many readers of the *Catholic Historical Review* will have personal remembrance of the practices noted by the authors, my graduate stu-

dents have replied that, in addition to the perceptive analyses in the chapters, the depiction of the practices was also helpful in understanding their parents' religious world.

Saint Louis University ANGELYN DRIES, O.S.F.

Canadian

Dictionnaire biographique des évêques catholiques du Canada: Les diocèses catholiques canadiens des Églises latine et orientales et leurs évêques; repères chronologiques et biographiques, 1658-2002. By Jean LeBlanc. [Instruments de Recherche.] (Montreal: Wilson & Lafleur. 2002. Pp. 882. Can. $94.50, US $75.00.)

There have been three major efforts in the past to compile a listing of the bishops of Canada, one by Gérard Brassard in 1940, one by André Chapeau and colleagues at the Research Centre in Religious History of Canada at St. Paul's University, Ottawa, in 1980, and finally, the work of J. Lemarche in 1999. These were supplemented by various histories that have detailed the lives of bishops. All were significant works for their time and provided helpful information for historians and other researchers. Despite meticulous research, the writers were sometimes hampered by a lack of archival material or inexact information that was reproduced in various directories and dictionaries, and so the works were not without mistakes. As well, each of the directories very soon became "dated" as new bishops were added.

Based on these earlier works, and with many more sources now available, the present volume offers the researcher more information than before, and includes newer bishops (now numbering almost 530 since the time of François de Laval in 1658) named since the earlier works were published. In the first part, along with the list of (arch)dioceses and all their (arch)bishops, coadjutors, or auxiliaries where applicable, the *Dictionnaire* also includes information about Canadians who have served as bishops outside of Canada, the titular sees of coadjutor and auxiliary bishops, those who have been representatives of the Holy See in Canada, an index of bishops who were members of religious orders, and an index of all names cross-referencing the rest of the *Dictionnaire*. The bulk of the work comprises the second part, a biography of each bishop named in the first part. Here is where one finds more than basic data, but also details such as the bishop's involvement on the local and national scene. These biographies give a glimpse into the lives of the hierarchy, making them more than simply names in a list.

LeBlanc has benefited from the work done in earlier decades, but he has also tried to correct mistakes made earlier and even, in detailed footnotes, shows where the spelling of a name or a date varies from source to source, trying to ascertain which one is correct. Hardbound, well-organized, and easy-to-read, this volume is an invaluable resource for historians and other researchers. I would

venture so far as to say that there is even an American audience for this work, especially along the border, since historically, many bishops traveled back and forth to assist neighboring bishops in time of need, or to share in the great celebrations of their neighbors. The fact that the work is entirely in French will be a problem for a small part of the reading audience, since most researchers are called upon to use at least a few languages in their work. For the unilingual, even a minimal knowledge of French makes the basic data available, and so it can still appeal to a wide audience throughout Canada and the USA.

There is one obvious limitation to this work; it is already dated. Some thirty new bishops have been named to fill vacancies in the intervening period since the work was published in 2002, and the Nuncio is busy preparing for more retirements in the near future. Yet, this bodes well for a revised and up-dated version at least every decade!

St. Peter's Seminary JOHN P. COMISKEY
London, Ontario

Latin American

Juan Soldado: Rapist, Murderer, Martyr, Saint. By Paul J. Vanderwood. (Durham: Duke University Press. 2004. Pp. xvi, 333. $22.95 paperback.)

Where does guilt end and faith begin? This seems to be the prevailing leitmotiv of this splendid exposition of the life and afterlife of Juan Soldado (Soldier), celebrated saint of Tijuana, Mexico. The book begins with a detailed accounting of the horrific rape and murder of an eight-year-old child, Olga Camacho, on February 13, 1938. The next day a young soldier, Juan Castillo Morales, was arrested, and he subsequently confessed to the crimes. Three days later, invoking the old Ley Fuga (the prisoner was told to pretend to escape as he stood before a firing squad), the soldier was executed. Almost immediately, blood began to ooze up from his grave and his *ánima* (soul) was reported to have begun to wail his innocence. A cult of lay votive devotion followed and continues to this day, with franchises of veneration expanding north into the United States and farther south into Mexico, joining a frontier pantheon of other renegade saints, such as Jesús Malverde, the alleged patron saint of drug dealers. Perhaps best described as a generalist in regard to what believers ask of him, not surprisingly Juan Soldado is also considered to be the protector of [illegal] immigrants.

Like that of most saints, the soldier's path to sainthood was fraught with violence and grief, and it is here that Vanderwood's grand gift for historical storytelling again becomes apparent. The 1930's were hard times just about everywhere in North America. The Depression had taken its toll on everyone. In Mexico, President Lázaro Cárdenas was nearing the end of a presidency that had brought hope to many but not to everyone. Worst of all, the Cristero Revolt and its aftermath meant that there was to be only one priest for every fifty thousand

people. In 1938, Tijuana had a population of fifteen thousand. In the 1920's Prohibition had brought boom times to the city. Casinos, bars, brothels, resorts, and a state-of-the-art race track flourished. The number of tourists was three times that of locals. Many Tijuanenses fared well, and union activists were there to guarantee it. But Prohibition ended in 1933, and the Mexican government abolished gambling. Mexicans in the United States had been forced to leave during the Depression, and they congregated in Tijuana, waiting for better times.

Word spread quickly about the murder of Olga Camacho, and restive locals turned to mob rule, screaming for justice, torching the jail, and destroying whatever was in their path. The border was closed. In these circumstances, a terrified secret military tribunal sentenced the soldier to die. But once he was executed, the crowd became reflective, and some questioned his guilt. Contrition and despair; surely he was a martyr, which soon became the community sentiment. A shrine, feast day (San Juan Day, June 24) with mariachis singing "Las Mañanitas" (Happy Birthday), pilgrimages, statuary, and graveyard picnics were dedicated to his memory.

Today, Tijuana has a population of close to two million people, and it has many more priests in addition to a cohort of evangelicals. The Catholic Church's often conflicted position on such manifestations of popular religiosity was succinctly revealed in Tijuana's former Bishop Jesús Posadas y O'Campo's "God knows" (pp. 262-263). Most devotees are local Tijuanenses and most consider themselves Catholics. Many are middle-aged women, and all ask Juan Soldado to intervene on their behalf so that a favor will be granted. Judging by the monetary donations as well as the plaques, gifts, and thank-you notes, their wishes have been granted and they are eternally grateful.

Tijuana is so close to the United States that many wonder if it is even a part of Mexico. Moreover, for years it was a city without religion but ostensibly not one without belief. The Juan Soldado devotion was the product of a community in the throes of great hardship trying to save itself. That the saint would come to embody spiritual, civic, and national boosterism as well should come as no surprise to anyone who knows Mexico.

Tulane University SUSAN SCHROEDER

NOTES AND COMMENTS

The 2008 Annual Meeting of the American Catholic Historical Association

The First Vice-President of the American Catholic Historical Association, the Reverend Joseph J. Chinnici, O.F.M., will be chair of the Committee on Program for the eighty-eighth annual meeting, which will be held in Washington, D.C., on January 3-6, 2008. Proposals for papers or (preferably) complete sessions should be submitted to Father Chinnici by January 15, 2007, at the following address: Franciscan School of Theology, 1712 Euclid Avenue, Berkeley, California 94709; email address jchinnici@fst.edu. Only members of the Association are eligible to present papers, and no one who will have presented a paper at the eighty-seventh meeting will be permitted to present one at the eighty-eighth.

Conferences and Colloquia

On September 15-16, 2006 at the National University of Ireland in Maynooth the annual Conference on Consecrated Women was held with the theme: "Towards the History of Women Religious of Britain and Ireland." The papers presented ranged from the seventh century to the modern period, from Ireland and England to India and Africa and America, and across denominational divisions to include Lutherans and Quakers.

On September 26, 2006 at the University of Regensburg the Gesellschaft zur Herausgabe des Corpus Catholicorum (whose membership is over 150 subscribers) held its annual meeting that commemorated the one-hundredth anniversary of its series Reformationsgeschichtliche Studien und Texte with a reception sponsored by Verlag Aschendorff, which has published the series since its beginning. The volume that appeared this year as Supplementband 5 was a collection of his studies honoring the sixty-fifth birthday of a former president of the Gesellschaft: *Heribert Smolinsky: Im Zeichen von Kirchenreform und Reformation. Gesammelte Studien zur Kirchengeschichte in Spätmittelalter und früher Neuzeit*, edited by Karl-Heinz Braun, Barbara Henze, and Bernhard Schneider. The volume that appeared this year in its series Katholisches Leben und Kirchenreform im Zeitalter der Glaubensspaltung as Heft 66 is the second volume of *Orden und Klöster im Zeitalter von Reformation und katholischer Reform 1500-1700,* edited by Friedhelm Jürgensmeier and Regina Elisabeth Schwerdtfeger. For more information on the society, contact its current president, Professor Dr. Peter Walter, at Corpus.Catholicorum@theol.uni-freiburg.de.

On September 30, 2006 the Texas Catholic Historical Society held a workshop entitled "Teaching Texas Catholic History" at the Catholic Archives of Texas in Austin. Among the presentations given were "Spanish Missions in Texas" by Jesús de la Teja, "Ethnicities and Catholicism in Texas" by Patrick Foley, and "American Catholic Biography and Autobiography" by Thomas W. Jodziewicz. For further information, please contact Professor Jodziewicz of the University of Dallas at tjodz@udallas.edu.

On August 12 to 19, 2007 will be held the Triennial International Thomas More Conference at the Massachusetts Center for Renaissance Studies, University of Massachusetts at Amherst. The theme of the conference is "Thomas More, Man of Letters." Proposals for papers should be sent to Dr. Clare M. Murphy at Villa Clara, 17 rue Lainé Laroche, 49000 Angers, France, email cmurphy_5@hotmail.com.

On September 6 to 10, 2007, the International Commission of Comparative Church History will hold a conference at Lublin, Poland (September 6-8) and Lviv, Ukraine (September 9-10) on the theme: "The Religious Space of East Central Europe, Open to the West and East." The deadline for submission of topics was September 15, 2006. Of particular interest to the organizers are papers dealing with socio-religious history treating the various Christian denominations and the Jewish and Muslim communities from spatial, historical, and comparative perspectives from the ninth century to the present. Proposals were to have been sent to Professor Jerzy Kłoczowski of the Institute of East-Central Europe, Niecała 5, 20-080 Lublin, Poland, fax (48 81) 534 72 32, email instesw@platon.man.lublin.pl.

Archives

Pope Benedict XVI has authorized the opening of the Vatican archives, principally the Vatican Secret Archives and the Archives of the Second Section of the Secretariat of State, for the pontificate of Pius XI (1922-1939). Material contained in these archives should shed new light on such topics as the Church's relations to Fascism, Nazism, Communism, the Civil War in Spain, and the persecution of the Church in Mexico.

In 1997 the Archives of the Society of Jesus of New England was relocated to the College of the Holy Cross in Worcester, Massachusetts. Located with the Holy Cross College Archives and Special Collections, the Province Archives remains under the auspices of the Province and is administered separately. In 1997 a project archivist was employed to process the institutional records of the Province (founded in 1926), as well as the personal papers of individual members of the New England Province. At this time, ninety percent of the records have been processed, and the collection is available for use by qualified researchers. The collection measures approximately 1300 linear feet and includes the administrative records of the Province and the aposolates in

which New England Jesuits have been engaged—including missions in Baghdad and Jamaica. The Archives also contains publications, including a collection of books authored by Province members, and audiovisual material. More information about the Archives of the Society of Jesus of New England can be found at the web site: http://www.holycross.edu/departments/library/website/archives/jesuit.html.

Exhibitions and Historic Relics

From December 7, 2006 to April 9, 2007 an exhibition will be held in the Lateran Apostolic Palace in Rome on the sacred rites for electing a pope. It will trace the ritual gestures and actions in support of the transition to a new pope. From the first institution of the conclave by Nicholas II in 1059, ceremonials have been used that were first completely codified by Pierre Amiel in his ceremonial (1385-1390). In 1996 the final updating of these ceremonies was promulgated by John Paul II. The exhibition will underscore the difference between a civil election and what occurs in a conclave with its constant immersion in sacred rites and prayer.

On July 8, 2006 Benedict XVI venerated in the cathedral of Valencia, Spain a chalice traditionally considered to be that used by Christ at the Last Supper. His predecessor John Paul II celebrated Mass with it on November 8, 1985. According to ancient tradition the chalice went from Jerusalem to Rome at the time of St. Peter and was used by the early popes. It arrived in Spain in 258, supposedly sent by St. Lawrence to preserve it from pillaging during the persecutions under Valerian. It was hidden away during the Muslim invasions, reappearing in the eleventh century and was sent to the Monastery of Saint John of the Rock in 1071, where it stayed for three centuries and then went to Valencia. The relic is in three parts: an outer decoration of rich gold added in the thirteenth or early fourteenth century; an Egyptian or caliphal stone cup of the tenth to twelfth centuries that functions as the setting for another cup; and the inner cup or chalice that dates, according to its Hellenistic stylistic indications, from the second century before Christ to the first century of the Christian era and can be placed in the region of Egypt or Palestine. Similar cups were used for solemnities and usually belonged to wealthy families. It is suggested that the Last Supper was held in the house of St. Mark and that he kept the cup. He took it with him when he accompanied St. Peter to Rome, where he continued to function as the apostle's secretary. The history of the "Holy Grail" is the subject of a book published by EDICEP in 1999 by Professor Salvador Antuñano Alea of the University of Francisco de Vitoria in Madrid, entitled *The Mystery of the Holy Grail: Tradition and Legend of the Holy Grail.*

On September 1, 2006 Benedict XVI visited the Shrine of the Holy Face of Manoppello in Abruzzo, Italy, believed to contain the veil of Veronica, now measuring 6.8 by 9.6 inches. Scientific studies conducted by Professor Donato Vittori of the University of Bari demonstrate that the veil is not painted nor

does it contain colored fibers woven into it. The iconographer Blandine Pascalis Shloemer has shown that the Manoppello image corresponds perfectly to that found on the Holy Shroud of Turin. Father Heinrich W. Pfeiffer, S.J., the noted historian of religious art of the Gregorian University, has concluded after thirteen years of study that the Manoppello image is that of Veronica's veil. The veil was stolen from a glass reliquary in St. Peter's Basilica in 1608 during construction work there. The Manoppello veil still contains a fragment of the glass from that reliquary.

Canonizations

On June 5, 2006 the Congregation for Sainthood Causes authorized the opening of the process for the beatification of two Polish priests of the Order of Friars Minor Conventual: Michael Tomaszek (1959-1991) and Zbigniew Strzalkowski (1961-1991), both of Krakow. The diocesan inquiry into their lives while in Krakow is nearing completion. They were both martyred after a staged trial for being "lackeys of imperialism" on August 9, 1991 in the mountains outside Pariacoto, Peru, by members of the Maoist Sendero Luminoso. They had come to Peru to preach the Gospel and work among the poor.

On June 12, 2006 at the request of all the members of the Japanese episcopal conference, the Congregation for Sainthood Causes approved the cause of beatification of Peter Kassui Kibe and 187 other seventeenth-century martyrs of Japan. The ceremony of beatification is scheduled for some time after May 2007.

On June 15, 2006 in the Mineirao Stadium of Belo Horizonte, Brazil, the prefect of the Congregation for Sainthood Causes, Cardinal José Saraiva Martins, C.M.F., read a proclamation of Benedict XVI declaring as blessed Father Eustaquio Van Lieshout (1890-1943). A Dutch member of the Congregation of the Sacred Hearts of Jesus and Mary, he worked as a missionary priest for eighteen years in various parishes of Brazil, where he was noted for his concerns for the poor, the afflicted, and children.

On August 18, 2006 Monsignor Giorgio Lise, the vice-procurator of the cause for the beatification of John Paul I (1978) (Albino Luciani, born in Canale d'Agordo in 1912), announced that the diocesan phase of the process was nearing an end and will probably conclude on November 11. During this inquiry, begun in Belluno in 2003, 170 witnesses have given testimony during 190 sessions.

On September 17, 2006 in the cathedral of Brescia the former diocesan seminary professor Father Mosé Tovini (1877-1930) was beatified. He was noted for his passionate dedication to the catechism.

On September 17, 2006 in the cathedral of Budapest, the primate of Hungary, Cardinal Peter Erdö, conducted the beatification ceremonies of Sister

Sara Salkahazi, a member of the Sisters of Social Service. She was executed by henchmen of the ruling fascist Arrow Cross Party together with the Jews she was sheltering on December 27, 1944.

On October 15, 2006 Benedict XVI will canonize the following four blesseds: Rafael Guízar Valencia (1878-1938), thrice exiled bishop of Vera Cruz, Mexico; Filippo Smaldons (1848-1923), diocesan priest and founder of the Institute of the Salesian Sisters of the Sacred Heart; Rosa Venerini (1656-1728), virgin and foundress of the Congregation of the "Maestre Pie Venerini;" and Theodore Guérin, christened Anne-Thérèse (1798-1856), virgin and foundress of the Congregation of the Sisters of Providence of Saint-Mary-of-the-Woods, Indiana.

Publications

Blackwell Publishers of Boston and Oxford has announced plans for a three-volume *Encyclopedia of Christian Civilization* to be edited by George Thomas Kurian. It will contain 908 entries, and trace the evolution of Christianity over two millennia and in all regions of the world in the areas of theology, calendar, law, society, language and literacy, literature, art, science, music, architecture, human rights, worship, spirituality, rights of women, charity, education, politics, medicine, celebrations and festivals, and philosophy. There will be biographies, history, interpretative essays, and articles on confessional and denominational Christianity. Anyone interested in contributing to this encyclopedia and/or in receiving a Prospectus and Schematic of the encyclopedia should contact its editor at gtkurian@aol.com.

The Sixteenth Century Studies Conference has announced a new series of monographs entitled "Religious Cultures in the Early Modern World, 1400-1800" to be edited by Dr. Fernando Cervantes of the University of Bristol (f.cervantes@bristol.ac.uk), Dr. Peter Marshall of the University of Warwick (p.marshall@warwick.ac.uk), and Professor Philip Soergel of the University of Maryland, College Park (psoergel@umd.edu). The series will highlight the social, cultural, and political history of religion in both European and non-European societies. Detailed proposals of eight to ten pages (including chapter outlines) and the text of a sample chapter should be sent in hard copy and by electronic attachment to the editors.

Volume 64 (2006) of *Franciscan Studies* is devoted to the theme *Vita Evangelica.* Edited by Michael F. Cusato, O.F.M., and Jean François Godet-Calogeras, it contains the following essays in honor of Margaret Carney, O.S.F.: David Flood, O.F.M., "Poverty and the Gospel" (pp. 1-15); Michael Higgins, T.O.R., "*Dominus conduxit me inter illos et feci misericordiam cum illis:* Francis of Assisi and Mercy" (pp. 17-32); Giovanni Miccoli, "Francesco e la Pace" (pp. 33-52); Laurent Gallant, O.F.M., "Francis of Assisi: Forerunner of Interreligious Dialogue: Chapter 16 of the Earlier Rule Revisited" (pp. 53-82); Pierre Brunett, O.F.M., and Paul Lachance, O.F.M., "Giles of Assisi: Mystic and Rebel" (pp. 83-101); Jean François Godet-Calogeras, "Evangelical Radicalism in

the Writings of Francis and Clare of Assisi" (pp. 103-121); Michael F. Cusato, O.F.M., "From the *Perfectio sancti Evangelii* to the *Sanctissima Vita et Paupertas*: An Hypothesis on the Origin of the *Privilegium Paupertatis* to Clare and Her Sisters at San Damiano" (pp. 123-144); Maria Pia Alberzoni, "*Servus vestrum et ancillarum Christi omnium*: Gregorio IX e la vita religiosa femminile" (pp. 145-178); Jacques Dalarun, "Gospel in Action: The Life of Clare of Rimini" (pp. 179-215); Mary Meany, "The *Meditaciones Vite Christi* as a Book of Prayer" (pp. 217-234); Lezlie Knox, "*One and the Same Spirit*: Clare of Assisi's Form of Life in the Later Middle Ages" (pp. 235-279); Frank P. Lane, "Not for Time but for Eternity: Family, Friendship and Fidelity in the Poor Clare Monastery of Reformation Nürnberg" (pp. 255-279).

Historical Studies, the journal published by the Canadian Catholic Historical Association, for 2006 (Volume 72) contains six of the papers presented at the seventy-second annual meeting of the English Section of the Association, which was held at the University of Western Ontario in May, 2005. They are as follows: Richard Leclerc, "Representations of Japan in the *Bulletin de l'Union missionnaire du Clergé:* A Chapter in the History of Québec Catholic Missionaries in Asia, 1925-1973" (pp. 7-28); Peter Ludlow, "Fostering Social Awakening 'along safe and sane lines': Archbishop James Morrison and the Antigonish Movement" (pp. 29-53); Frederick J. McEvoy, "'Naturally I am passionate, ill-tempered, and arrogant . . .' Father Matthew J. Whelan and French-English Conflict in Ontario, 1881-1922" (pp. 54-70); Ryan O'Connor, "'You can beat us in the House of Assembly but you can't beat us in the street': The Symbolic Value of Charlettown's Orange Lodge Riot" (pp. 71-94); Yves Yvon J. Pelletier, "Fighting for the Chaplains: Bishop Charles Leo Nelligan and the Creation of the Canadian Chaplain Service (Roman Catholic), 1939-1945" (pp. 95-123); and Elizabeth Smyth, "Gertrude Lawler and St Joseph's Academy: Alumnae, Advocate and Author" (pp. 124-141). The articles are followed by "A Current Bibliography of Canadian Religious History" (pp. B1-B35). The second half of the volume consists of *Études d'histoire religieuse,* the journal published by the Société canadienne d'histoire de l'Eglise catholique (also Volume 72). The articles are by Michael Gauvreau, "Le couple religion/urbanité: les trajectoires anglocanadienne et québécoise à la lumière de l'historiographie internationale" (pp. 7-29); Suzanne Clavette, "Réponse des catholiques progressistes à l'industrialisation, la réforme de l'entreprise (1944-1954)" (pp. 31-54); Paul-André Dubois, "Marc-Antoine Charpentier chez les Abénaquis ou la petite histoire d'une Chanson des Bergers au Nouveau-Monde" (pp. 55-73); and Jean-René Thuot, "La pratique de l'inhumation dans l'église dans Lanaudière entre 1810 et 1860: entre privilège, reconnaissance et concours de circonstances" (pp. 73-96).

Christopher Kauffman, editor of the *U.S. Catholic Historian,* has been honored with a special issue of his journal (Volume 24, Number 2 [Spring, 2006]) entitled "Historian, Mentor, and Editor" and edited by Justus George Lawler. It contains the following "studies": Justus George Lawler, "With Chris Kauffman

over the Years: Notes for a Talk Not Given" (pp. 1-17); James T. Fisher, "Christopher Kauffman, the *U.S. Catholic Historian,* and the Future of American Catholic History" (pp. 19-26); Thomas J. Shelley, "American Catholic Identities: A Documentary History" (pp. 27-40); William M. Montgomery, "The Oblate Sisters of Providence: The Origins of Their Mission to Latin America" (pp. 41-55); Richard Gribble, C.S.C., "A 'Consecrated Thunderbolt' of Catholic Education: The Contribution of Peter C. Yorke" (pp. 57-70); Patrick J. McNamara, "Russia, Rome, and Recognition: American Catholics and Anticommunism in the 1920s" (pp. 71-88); David J. Endres, "An International Dimension to American Anticommunism: Mission Awareness and Global Consciousness in the Catholic Students' Mission Crusade, 1935-1955" (pp. 89-108); Leon Hutton, "The Future Pope Comes to America: Cardinal Eugenio Pacelli's Visit to the United States" (pp. 109-130); and Helen M. Ciernick, "Catholic College Students in the San Francisco Bay Area and the Civil Rights Movement" (pp. 131-141).

Personal Notices

Father Joseph C. Linck has been appointed by the Bishop of Bridgeport, William E. Lori, as rector of Saint John Fisher Seminary Residence in Stamford, Connecticut, a house of discernment for men considering the priesthood. Father Linck will continue to serve as diocesan director of divine worship.

Dr. Joseph M. McCarthy of Suffolk University in Boston, Massachusetts, has been awarded the title of professor emeritus. He will continue to lead the honors seminar in historiography and historical method.

Father Cyprian Davis, O.S.B., of St. Meinrad's Archabbey, continues to lecture on history in the three-year summer institute for junior monks (between novitiate and solemn profession) of Benedictine monasteries in the United States and Mexico that is hosted at different monasteries each year. In May he was the recipient of an honorary degree from the Catholic University of America.

Dr. Charles Joseph Fleener of the History Department of Saint Louis University died on November 27, 2005 at the age of 67.

Professor Jaroslav Pelikan, winner of the John Gilmary Shea Prize in 1971, died on May 13, 2006 at the age of 82.

Father Francis J. Murphy of the History Department of Boston College died on August 28, 2006 at the age of 71.

Professor emeritus Charles H. O'Brien of Western Illinois University has published a fifth historical mystery novel, this one entitled *Fatal Carnival*. The story is set in Nice on the Mediterranean coast in 1788.

PERIODICAL LITERATURE

General and Miscellaneous

A Mirror for Every Age:The Reputation of Roger Bacon. Amanda Power. *English Historical Review*, CXXI (June, 2006), 657-692.

Die Bedeutung des Minoriten-Ordens für die musikalische Stilentwicklung in Europa. Friedrich W. Riedel. *Wissenschaft und Weisheit*, 69 (1, 2006), 131-151.

Jean XXIII et Paul VI: deux papes pour un concile. Jean-François Galinier-Pallerola. *Bulletin de Littérature Ecclésiastique,* CVII (Jan.-Mar., 2006), 11-22.

O Concílio Vaticano II no contexto da Igreja e Mundo: uma perspectiva histórica. Riolando Azzi. *Revista Eclesiástica Brasileira*, 66 (Apr., 2006), 337-369.

O Concílio Vaticano II e sua recepção na América Latina. José María Vigil. *Revista Eclesiástica Brasileira*, 66 (Apr., 2006), 370-395.

O Concílio Vaticano II e sua recepção na Europa. François Houtart. *Revista Eclesiástica Brasileira*, 66 (Apr., 2006), 396-408.

Las cuatro constituciones del Concilio Vaticano II y su recepción. Salvador Pié-Ninot. *Estudios Eclesiásticos*, 81 (June, 2006), 267-296.

Du Livre d'Heures médiéval au Paroissien du XX^{e} siècle. Arnaud Join-Lambert. *Revue d'histoire ecclésiastique*, 101 (Apr.-June, 2006), 618-654.

«Bibliotheca Lamiarum» (2): La bataille intellectuelle avec les démons: théories sur la magie, la démonologie, la possession diabolique et les exorcismes (13^{e}-20^{e} s.) *Revue d'histoire ecclésiastique*, 101 (Apr.-June, 2006), 682-695.

Studio del francescanesimo in 75 anni di Collectanea Franciscana, 1931-2005. Ottaviano Schmucki, ofmcap. *Collectanea Franciscana*, 76 (1-2, 2006), 5-91.

La bibliografia francescana: sviluppo e scopo. Costanzo Cargnoni, ofmcap. *Collectanea Franciscana*, 76 (1-2, 2006), 93-118.

El convento agustino de S. Mateo in Merulana de Roma. Carlos Alonso, O.S.A. *Spicilegium Historicum C.SS.R.*, LIV (1-2, 2006), 151-184.

Ancient

The Enigma of Ignatius of Antioch. Allen Brent. *Journal of Ecclesiastical History*, 57 (July, 2006), 429-456.

Widows and Women in the Pastoral Ministry of Cyprian of Carthage. Geoffrey D. Dunn. *Augustinianum*, XLV (Dec., 2005), 295-307.

Manum ab episcopo et clero in paenitentiam impositam. El proceso penitencial en los escritos de Cipriano de Cartago. Juan Antonio Gil Tamayo. *Revista Agustiniana*, XLVII (Jan.-Apr., 2006), 57-80.

Giuliano l'Apostata nel pensiero di Giovanni Crisostomo: imperatore, filosofo, persecutore. Emanuele Di Santo. *Augustinianum*, XLV (Dec., 2005), 349-387.

Virgins and Eunuchs: Pulcheria, Politics and the Death of Emperor Theodosius II. Kathryn Chew. *Historia*, 55 (2, 2006), 207-227.

A lost year: Pelagianism in Carthage, 411 A.D. Walter Dunphy. *Augustinianum*, XLV (Dec., 2005), 389-466.

Agostino e i suoi libri: dalla composizione alla diffusione. Matilde Caltabiano. *Augustinianum*, XLV (Dec., 2005), 519-537.

El Concilio Ecuménico de Éfeso. Fernando Soto-Hay. *AnáMnesis*, 31 (Jan.-June, 2006), 1-55.

A Church Historian in Search of an Identity: Aspects of Early Byzantine Palestine in Sozomen's *Historia Ecclesiastica*. Eran I. Argov. *Zeitschrift für Antikes Christentum*, 9 (2, 2005), 367-396.

St. Aninas/Mar Hanina and His Monastery. Sebastian Brock. *Analecta Bollandiana*, 124 (June, 2006), 5-10.

The Historical Context of John Philiponus' *De Opificio Mundi* in the Culture of Byzantine-Coptic Egypt. Leslie S. B. MacCoull. *Zeitschrift für Antikes Christentum*, 9 (2, 2005), 397-423.

'ενωσις καθ' υπόστασιν. Die ersten zehn Anathematismen des fünften ökumenishen Konzils zu Konstantinopel (553) als Dokument neuchalkedonischer Theologie (Teil 2). Florian Bruckmann. *Annuarium Historiae Conciliorum*, 36 (2, 2004), 259-388.

Qualifications of the Monastery Cellarer—(RB 31): Part II. Aquinata Böckmann, O.S.B. *American Benedictine Review*, 57 (June, 2006), 186-211.

Medieval

Origine de l'office grégorien. Jacques-Marie Guilmard. *Ecclesia Orans*, XXIII (Jan.-Apr., 2006), 37-80.

Storia monastica ligure. San Pietro in Ciel D'Oro e la corte *de Alpeplana* tra l'alto e il basso medioevo. Carlo Mogtgia. *Studia Monastica*, 47 (1, 2005), 69-80.

De l' «antependium» au retable: la contribution des orfèvres et émailleurs d'Occident. Jean-Pierre Caillet. *Cahiers de civilisation médiévale*, 49 (Jan.-Mar., 2006), 3-20.

«Reformatio Ecclesiae»: a proposito di unità e identità nella costruzione dell'Europa medievale. Ovidio Capitani. *Studi Medievali*, XLVII (June, 2006), 1-27.

Smaragdus of Saint-Mihiel: Ninth-Century Sources for Twelfth-Century Reformers. Daniel Marcel La Corte. *Cistercian Studies Quarterly*, 41 (3, 2006), 272-290.

La *villa Floriacus* et la présence de l'abbaye des Fossés en Rémois durant le Haut Moyen Âge. Jean-Pierre Devroey. *Revue Belge de Philologie et d'Histoire*, 82 (4, 2004), 809-838.

Constantinopla entre dos milenios. Testimonio de Symeón el Nuevo Teólogo en sus propios escritos y la "*Vita Symeónis*" de Nicetas. Consideraciones políticas, sociales y religiosas. Pablo Argárate. *AnáMnesis*, 31 (Jan.-June, 2006), 57-67.

The origins of the monastic communities of St Benedict at Holme and Bury St. Edmunds. Tom Licence. *Revue Bénédictine*, 116 (June, 2006), 42-61.

Les pélerinages du XI^e^ siècle en Terre sainte dans l'historiographie occidentale de l'époque. Aryeh Graboïs. *Revue d'histoire ecclésiastique*, 101 (Apr.-June, 2006), 531-545.

La réorientation du paysage canonial en Flandre et le pouvoir des évêques, comtes et nobles (XI^e^ siècle-première moitié du XII^e^ siècle). Brigitte Meijns. *Le Moyen Age*, CXII (1, 2006), 111-134.

Monastic literate practices in eleventh- and twelfth-century northern France. Steven Vanderputten. *Journal of Medieval History*, 32 (June, 2006), 101-126.

Entre sacré et profane. Essai sur la symbolique et les fonctions du portail d'église en France entre le XI^e^ et le XIII^e^ siècle. Caroline Roux. *Revue Belge de Philologie et d'Histoire*, 82 (4, 2004), 839-854.

Praying with Anselm at Admont: A Meditation on Practice. Rachel Fulton. *Speculum*, 81 (July, 2006), 700-733.

The *Life* and *Miracles* of Godric of Throckenholt. Tom Licence. *Analecta Bollandiana*, 124 (June, 2006), 15-43.

Introduction to the Letters of Saint Bernard (II). Jean Leclercq. *Cistercian Studies Quarterly*, 41 (3, 2006), 291-310.

Le chapitre général des prémontrés au Moyen Âge. Florent Cygler. *Analecta Praemonstratensia*, LXXXI (1-4, 2005), 5-34.

Saint Lambert et la Dévolution moderne: la diffusion de la *Vita Landiberti Leodiensis* du chanoine Nicolas (†ca 1146) au XV^e^ siècle. Renaud Adam. *Revue Bénédictine*, 116 (June, 2006), 119-132.

The Date of the Merger of Savigny and Cîteaux Reconsidered. Francis R. Swietek and Terrence M. Deneen. *Revue d'histoire ecclésiastique*, 101 (Apr.-June, 2006), 547-573.

Tempête pour un crâne. Conflit pour une relique à l'abbaye Saint-Vaast d'Arras. Péripéties et enjeux (1166-1194). Jean-Pierre Gerzaguet. *Revue du Nord*, 87 (Oct.-Dec., 2005), 727-751.

The profits of the Cross: merchant involvement in the Baltic Crusade (*c.* 1180-1230). Mark R. Munzinger. *Journal of Medieval History*, 32 (June, 2006), 163-185.

Päpstliche Kurie und menschlicher Körper. Zur historischen Kontextualisierung der Schrift *De miseria humane conditionis* des Lothar von Segni (1194). Annette Kehnel. *Archiv für Kulturgeschichte*, 87 (1, 2005), 27-52.

Érémitisme et solitude dans la première *Vie des Pères*. Adrian P. Tudor. *Le Moyen Âge*, CXII (1, 2006), 43-61.

Entstehung und Entwicklung der Westfälischen Zirkarie im Mittelalter. Ingrid Ehlers-Kisseler. *Analecta Praemonstratensia*, LXXXI (1-4, 2005), 35-63.

Kloster- und Ordenspolitik der Staufer als Gegenstand einer vergleichenden Ordensforschung. Das Beispiel der Prämonstratenser, die Vogteiregelungen Friedrich Barbarossas und viele offene Fragen. Sabine Penth. *Analecta Praemonstratensia*, LXXXI (1-4, 2005), 64-93.

Stellung und Tätigkeit des Abtes von Steinfeld in der Zirkarie Westfalen. Ingrid Joester. *Analecta Praemonstratensia*, LXXXI (1-4, 2005), 94-127.

Beziehungen zwischen den Zirkarien Friesland und Westfalen im Mittelalter. Johannes A. Mol. *Analecta Praemonstratensia*, LXXXI (1-4, 2005), 128-153.

Kriegserfahrung und geistlicher Kampf in den Viten von Mariëngaarde und der Chronik von Wittewierum (13. Jh.). Ulrich G. Leinsle. *Analecta Praemonstratensia*, LXXXI (1-4, 2005), 154-194.

Il *Pater noster* nei rituali catari. Roberta Bertuzzi. *Studi Medievali*, XLVII (June, July, 2006), 29-70.

Die Einheit des *imperium Romanum* in den Papst-Kaiser-Chroniken des Spätmittelalters. Heike Johanna Mierau. *Historische Zeitschrift*, 282 (Apr., 2006), 281-312.

La grande croce dipinta da Giunta Pisano per la Basilica di San Francesco d'Assisi. Silvestro Nessi. *Il Santo*, XLV (Sept.-Dec., 2006), 691-721.

Neue Chronologie zu Clara von Assisi. Niklaus Kuster O.F.M.Cap., and Martina Kreidler-Kos. *Wissenschaft und Weisheit*, 69 (1, 2006), 3-46.

Tre legende minori latine di s. Chiara d'Assisi con *incipit*: "*O quam pulchra est casta generatio*." Giovanni Boccali, OFM. *Archivum Franciscanum Historicum*, 99 (Jan.-June, 2006), 3-31.

Aspects of Fatherhood in Thirteenth-Century Encyclopedias. Philip Grace. *Journal of Family History*, 31 (July, 2006), 211-236.

Un inventario del Tesoro del duomo di Arezzo nel secolo XIII. Pierluigi Licciardello. *Archivio Storico Italiano*, CLXIV (2, 2006), 303-318.

Les obituaires, sources de l'histoire des universités médiévales. Les fondations de messes-anniversaires par les universitaires parisiens au XIII^{e} siècle. Nathalie Gorochov. *Revue d'Histoire de l'Église de France*, 92 (Jan.-June, 2006), 5-23.

Franziskus von Assisi als Triumphator. Zur Rezeption von Heinrich von Avranches' «Francisceis» in der Kunst. Klaus Braunger. *Collectanea Franciscana*, 76 (1-2, 2006), 161-187.

Edieren oder nicht edieren. . . ? Überlegungen zu einer Neuedition des hebräischen Berichtes über die Disputation von Barcelona 1263. Ursula Ragacs. *Judaica*, 62 (June, 2006), 157-170.

Zu Genese und Kompositionsvorgang der Σύνοψις Χρονική. Raimondo Tocci. *Byzantinische Zeitschrift*, 98 (2, 2005), 551-568.

"Your Name Will No Longer Be Aseneth": Apocrypha, Anti-martyrdom, and Jewish Conversion in Thirteenth-Century England. Ruth Nisse. *Speculum*, 81 (July, 2006), 734-753.

Damianite e Clarisse a Sansepolcro nei secoli XIII-XIV. Andrea Czortek. *Archivum Franciscanum Historicum*, 99 (Jan.-June, 2006), 133-188.

Another Look at the Career of Pierre Bersuire, O.S.B. Kimberly Rivers. *Revue Bénédictine*, 116 (June, 2006), 92-100.

Procès précoces de sorcellerie dans la prévôté-le-comte de Valenciennes (1350-1378). Catherine Pavot. *Revue du Nord*, 87 (Oct.-Dec., 2005), 753-761.

On the Provenance of the Holy Shroud of Lirey/Turin: A Minor Suggestion. Alan Friedlander. *Journal of Ecclesiastical History*, 57 (July, 2006), 457-477.

Soul Food and Eating Habits: What's at Steak in a Medieval Monk's Diet? David Moses. *Downside Review*, 124 (July, 2006), 213-222.

La ciudad de Tudela y el convento de San Francisco: Influencias de una nueva espiritualidad en la baja Edad Media. Ángeles García de la Borbolla. *Archivo Ibero-Americano*, LXVI (Jan.-Aug., 2006), 291-313.

Quelle place a tenu le sacre royal de Reims (1429) dans la mission de Jeanne d'Arc? Georges Peyronnet. *Revue d'histoire ecclésiastique*, 101 (Apr.-June, 2006), 575-589.

Kardinal Juan de Torquemada OP und die Lehrautorität des Papstes. Ulrich Horst. *Annuarium Historiae Conciliorum*, 36 (2, 2004), 389-422.

A Renaissance Audience Considered: The Nuns at S. Apollonia and Castagno's *Last Supper*. Andrée Hayum. *Art Bulletin*, LXXXVII (June, 2006), 243-266.

Les marguilliers, «chevilles ouvrières» de la vie paroissiale d'après les visites archidiaconales de Josas, 1458-1470. Geneviève Hoëttick-Gadbois. *Revue d'Histoire de l'Église de France*, 92 (Jan.-June, 2006), 25-46.

Mathieu Grenet (1452-1503), bénédictin et écrivain à Saint-Martin de Tournai: sa vie et son œuvre. Pieter-Jan De Grieck. *Revue Bénédictine*, 116 (June, 2006), 101-118.

Sixteenth Century

El clero de la diócesis de Santiago y la historia en la Edad Moderna. Ofelia Rey. *Compostellanum*, L (1-4, 2005), 627-654.

Les Chroniques de Saint-Pierre-le-Vif au miroir de la primatie sénonaise: enquête sur les manuscrits d'Odorannus, du pseudo-Clarius et de Geoffroy de Courlon. Fabrice Délivré. *Bibliothèque de l'École des Chartes*, 163 (July-Dec., 2005), 481-503.

Actas de los Capítulos Generales de la Congregación de San Benito de Valladolid. I. 1503-1538. Ernest Zaragoza Pascual. *Studia Monastica*, 47 (1, 2005), 81-156.

Don Francisco Álvarez de Toledo, maestrescuela de la cathedral y benefactor del convento San Miguel de los Ángeles en Toledo. Laura Canabal Rodríguez. *Archivo Ibero-Americano*, LXVI (Jan.-Aug., 2006), 269-290.

The Problem of the Ecumenical Council in German Reformation Pamphlet Literature, 1520-1563. Thomas Brockmann. *Annuarium Historiae Conciliorum*, 36 (2, 2004), 423-447.

La généalogie imaginaire de la Réforme protestante. Yves Krumenacker. *Revue Historique*, 130 (Apr., 2006), 259-289.

Petrus Sutor et son plaidoyer contre les traductions de la Bible en langue populaire (1525). Sim François. *Ephemerides Theologicae Lovanienses*, 82 (Apr., 2006), 139-163.

An English Friendship and Italian Reform: Richard Morison and Michael Throckmorton, 1532-1538. M. A. Overell. *Journal of Ecclesiastical History*, 57 (July, 2006), 478-493.

John Forest and Derfel Gadarn: A Double Execution. Anne Dillon. *Recusant History*, 28 (May, 2006), 1-21.

The Early Modern Teacher, Marie Dentière: An Outspoken Reformer Enters the French Literary Canon. Mary B. McKinley. *Sixteenth Century Journal*, XXXVII (Summer, 2006), 401-412.

La place de la «religion» chez Claude d'Éspence (1511-1571). Alain Dubois. *Revue d'Histoire de l'Église de France*, 92 (Jan.-June, 2006), 47-71.

Ein katechetischer Fingerzeig zum zweiten Abendmahlsstreit. Jakob Andreaes Erstlingswerk „Bericht von des Herren Nachtmahl" (1557). Björn Slenczka. *Zeitschrift für Kirchengeschichte*, 116 (3, 2005), 327-353.

«La nouvelle Réformation de Lausanne»: the proposal by the Ministers of Lausanne on Ecclesiastical discipline (June 1558). Michael W. Bruening. *Bibliothèque d'Humanisme et Renaissance*, LXVIII (1, 2006), 21-50.

The Spanish Hieronymites and the Reformed Texts of the Council of Trent. Timothy J. Schmitz. *Sixteenth Century Journal*, XXXVII (Summer, 2006), 375-399.

Pastoral Care East of Eden: The Consistory of Geneva, 1568-82. Scott M. Manetsch. *Church History*, 75 (June, 2006), 274-313.

El arzobispo Valtodano (1570-1572). Un recuento de Testamentaría. José García Oro and María José Portela Silva. *Compostellanum*, L (1-4, 2005), 701-749.

Southern English Catholics and the Indian Mission in the Sixteenth Century. Ibrahim Mumayiz. *Downside Review*, 124 (Apr., 2004), 89-110.

Encuentro de culturas en la Fe Cristiana en el Japón de los siglos XVI-XVII. Juan T. Okamoto, O.P. *Studium*, XLVI (1, 2006), 75-87.

William Carter (c. 1549-84): Recusant Printer, Publisher, Binder, Stationer, Scribe—and Martyr. T. A. Birrell. *Recusant History*, 28 (May, 2006), 22-42.

Seventeenth and Eighteenth Centuries

The Development of the Lord Bishop's Role in the Manx Tynwald. Peter W. Edge and C. C. Augur Pearce. *Journal of Ecclesiastical History*, 57 (July, 2006), 494-514.

L'archivio di Filippo Ferrari e il cardinale Federico Borromeo agiografo (ms. Milano, Biblioteca Ambrosiana, L 22 suss.). Giliola Barbero and Paolo Chiesa. *Analecta Bollandiana*, 124 (June, 2006), 45-92.

De la ville inquisitoriale à la ville de tolérance: identités féminines judaïsantes en Europe occidentale (XVII^{e} siècle). Natalia Muchnik. *Annales de Bretagne et des Pays de l'Ouest*, 113 (2, 2006), 29-42.

La communauté protestante d'Authon-du-Perche au XVII^{e} siècle: de l'apogée à la résistance. Amélie Duchemin. *Annales de Bretagne et des Pays de l'Ouest*, 113 (2, 2006), 61-79.

The Secret Sharers: "Anthony Rivers" and the Appellant Controversy, 1601-2. Patrick Martin and John Finnis. *Huntington Library Quarterly*, 69 (2, 2006), 195-237.

'G.C.', Recusant Prison Translator of the *Japonian Epistells*. Paul Arblaster. *Recusant History*, 28 (May, 2006), 43-54.

'Casting Anchor in the Harbour of Religion': The Peregrination of Humfrey Leech (1571-1629). Barbara Coulton. *Recusant History*, 28 (May, 2006), 55-74.

Giurare al Sant'Uffizio. Sarpi, l'Inquisizione e un conflitto nella Repubblica di Venezia. Vincenzo Lavenia. *Rivista Storica Italiana*, CXVIII (Apr., 2006), 7-50.

English Calvinism and the Crowd: *Coriolanus* and the History of Religious Reform. Peter Iver Kaufman. *Church History*, 75 (June, 2006), 314-342.

De la amistad y desencuentro de Galileo con los Jesuitas. Ignacio Núñez de Castro, S.I. *Archivo Teológico Granadino*, 68 (2005), 79-109.

Church Discipline: The Operation of the Winchester Consistory Court in the Seventeenth Century. Andrew Thomson. *History*, 91 (July, 2006), 337-359.

Disputas del Beato Francisco Morales con los no cristianos japoneses (S. XVII). José Delgado García, O.P. *Studium*, XLVI (1, 2006), 137-150.

Les limites du patronage français sur les lieux saints. Autour de l'installation d'un consul à Jérusalem dans les années 1620. Géraud Poumarède. *Revue d'Histoire de l'Église de France*, 92 (Jan.-June, 2006), 73-116.

Anselm Casimir Wambolt von Umstadt. Kurfürst-Erzbischof von Mainz 1629-1647. Aspekte eines Lebensbildes. Fred G. Rausch. *Jahrbuch für westdeutsche Landesgeschichte*, 31 (2005), 163-201.

Le droit chemin. L'ange gardien, instrument de disciplinarisation après la Contre-Réforme. Anne Manevy. *Revue de l'histoire des religions*, 223 (Apr.-June, 2006), 195-227.

John Taylor (1597-1655), English Catholic Gentleman and Caroline Diplomat. Thea Lindquist. *Recusant History*, 28 (May, 2006), 75-94.

Du catholicisme des judéoconvers: Rouen, 1633. Natalia Muchnik. *XVII^e Siècle*, 58 (Apr.-June, 2006), 277-299.

Les protestants de la province synodale d'Anjou-Touraine-Maine et le Refuge au XVII^e et XVIII^e siècle. Didier Boisson. *Annales de Bretagne et des Pays de l'Ouest*, 113 (2, 2006), 43-60.

Henschen et Papebroch en France en 1662. Savoie—Dauphiné—Normandie—Flandres. Bernard Joassart. *Analecta Bollandiana*, 124 (June, 2006), 93-150.

La congregazione del Concilio e lo scioglimento dei voti religiosi. Rapporti tra fratelli e sorelle. Anne Jacobson Schutte. *Rivista Storica Italiana*, CXVIII (Apr., 2006), 51-79.

Vitesse d'écriture et vérité aristocratique dans les *Mémoires* du cardinal de Retz et dans les *Mémoires* du duc de Saint-Simon. Marc Hersant. *XVII^e Siècle*, 58 (Apr.-June, 2006), 199-216.

Of Sceptres and Censors: Biblical Interpretation and Censorship in Seventeenth-Century France. April G. Shelford. *French History*, 20 (June, 2006), 161-181.

Innocenzo XI nel pensiero di Pio XII. A cinquant'anni dalla beatificazione. Andrea Drigani. *Vivens Homo*, XVII (Jan.-June, 2006), 219-227.

El estudio del árabe entre los franciscanos españoles. Colegio trilingüe de Sevilla-Colegio árabe de Damasco. Ramón Lourido Díaz. *Archivo Ibero-Americano*, LXVI (Jan.-Aug., 2006), 9-240.

L'importance des chanoines dans la vie religieuse d'un diocèse de frontière en Croatie habsbourgeoise (17e-18e siècles). Luc Oreŝković. *Revue d'histoire ecclésiastique*, 101 (Apr.-June, 2006), 591-617.

La fortuna di Pufendorf in Inghilterra: il contributo del clero anglicano nella prima metà del Settecento. Guglielmo Sanna. *Rivista Storica Italiana*, CXVII (Apr., 2006), 80-124.

La vita quotidiana delle Clarisse urbaniste d'Italia nel XVIII secolo ricavata da testi e documenti dell'epoca. Mauro Papalini. *Collectanea Franciscana*, 76 (1-2, 2006), 189-252.

Labrüe au paradis, Chapeau aux enfers. Les notables de Saint-Germain-l'Auxerrois face à leurs curés au XVIIIe siècle. Nicolas Lyon-Caen. *Revue d'Histoire de l'Église de France*, 92 (Jan.-June, 2006), 117-146.

Walpole's Tax on Catholics. Eveline Cruickshanks. *Recusant History*, 28 (May, 2006), 95-102.

La politique de répression et de conversion de l'intendant d'Alençon Lallemant de Lévignen envers les protestants (1726-1766): une politique réussie? Nicolas Clolus. *Annales de Bretagne et des Pays de l'Ouest*, 113 (2, 2006), 81-97.

S. Alfonso candidato agli arcivescovati di Otranto e di Salerno, ma non a quello di Palermo. A proposito di un falso di A. M. Tannoia. Giuseppe Orlandi, C.SS.R. *Spicilegium Historicum C.SS.R.*, LIV (1-2, 2006), 185-237.

Vérité et tolérance: Le problème posé par la déclaration de 1789. Laurent Sentis. *Nouvelle Revue Théologique*, 128 (July-Sept., 2006), 428-443.

Espansione della Congregazione del SS. Redentore in Calabria nel 1790 ed abolizione del Regolamento. Giovanni Vicidomini, C.SS.R. *Spicilegium Historicum C.SS.R.*, LIV (1-2, 2006), 259-298.

El clero diocesano de Santiago a finales del s. XVIII. Actitudes morales en perspectiva comparada. José Antonio Vázquez Vilanova. *Compostellanum*, L (1-4, 2005), 579-607.

Nineteenth and Twentieth Centuries

The experience and understanding of religious revival in Ulster Presbyterianism, *c.* 1800-1930. Andrew Holmes. *Irish Historical Studies*, XXXIV (Nov., 2005), 361-385.

Le Rédemptoriste Clément-Marie Hofbauer et le cercle des romantiques à Vienne dans les années 1810: Progrès ou régression pour l'avenir de l'Europe? Christine de Gemeaux. *Spicilegium Historicum C.SS.R.*, LIV (1-2, 2006), 239-258.

The Problems of Church and State: Dissenting Politics and the London Missionary Society in 1830s Britain. Michael A. Rutz. *Journal of Church and State*, 48 (Spring, 2006), 379-398.

Orthodox or Catholic? The choice of William Palmer. Robin Wheeler. *Downside Review*, 124 (Jan., 2006), 33-60.

An Evolving Concept of Mission: New Norcia 1846-2006. Bernard Rooney. *Australasian Catholic Record*, 83 (July, 2006), 309-319.

St. Suitbert in Rheinbrohl und die Frage der romanischen Chorturmkirchen im Rheinland. Udo Liessem. *Jahrbuch für westdeutsche Landesgeschichte*, 31 (2005), 107-146.

Se préparer au métier de missionnaire: la formation dispensée aux Missions Étrangères au XIX^{e} siècle. Véronique Ragot-Delcourt. *Revue d'Histoire de l'Église de France*, 92 (Jan.-June, 2006), 147-163.

Rev. Alessandro Gavazzi (1808-1889) and Scottish Identity: A Chapter in Nineteenth-Century Anti-Catholicism. Bernard Aspinwall. *Recusant History*, 28 (May, 2006), 129-152.

Biblical Authority and the Impact of Higher Criticism in Irish Presbyterianism, ca. 1850-1930. Andrew R. Holmes. *Church History*, 75 (June, 2006), 343-373.

Les cent cinquante ans de la maison "Sant'Alfonso" à Rome. Jean Beco, C.SS.R. *Spicilegium Historicum C.SS.R.*, LIV (1-2, 2006), 3-36.

Rudolf Ritter von Smetana, der dritte Generalvikar der transalpinen Redemptoristen (1802-1871). Otto Weiss. *Spicilegium Historicum C.SS.R.*, LIV (1-2, 2006), 37-150.

Robert Rodolph Suffield's Dominican Decade (1860-1870). Tony Cross. *Recusant History*, 28 (May, 2006), 103-128.

Un rêve de Merle d'Aubigné: la Salle de la Réformation à Genève. Luc Weibel. *Bulletin de la Société de l'Histoire du Protestantisme Français*, 152 (Apr., May, June, 2006), 245-262.

Un révélateur des rapports entre Rome et les missions au XIX^{e} siècle: le contrôle des livres publiés en Extrême-Orient. Véronique Ragot-Delcourt. *Bibliothèque de l'École des Chartes*, 163 (July-Dec., 2006), 505-524.

La opción política del clero. El traslado del Obispo de Vitoria, Miguel y Gómez. Andrés Martínez Esteban. *Scriptorium Victoriense*, LII (Jan.-Dec., 2005), 147-184.

Administering Medicine Without a License: Missionary Women in Rhodesia's Nursing History, 1890-1901. Ruramisai Charumbira. *Historian*, 68 (Summer, 2006), 241-266.

My Matrimonial Bureau: Masculine Concerns and Presbyterian Mission Evangelization in the Gabon Estuary, c. 1900-1915. Jeremy Rich. *Journal of Religion in Africa*, 36 (2, 2006), 200-223.

Demythologising the Evan Roberts Revival, 1904-1905. Robert Pope. *Journal of Ecclesiastical History*, 57 (July, 2006), 515-534.

Une vie au service de Notre-Dame de Lourdes: le comte Étienne de Beauchamp (1859-1957). Agnès Périat. *Revue d'Histoire de l'Église de France*, 92 (Jan.-June, 2006), 165-192.

Ein Kampf der Kulturen? Intrakonfessionelle Auseinandersetzungen und interkonfessionelle Konflikte im deutschen Kaiserreich. Armin Owzar. *Zeitschrift für Kirchengeschichte*, 116 (3, 2005), 354-376.

"Because We Are Catholic, We Are Modern." The Adaptation of Dutch Catholicism to Modern Dutch Society, 1920-1960. Erik Sengers. *Bijdragen*, 67 (1, 2006), 23-41.

Paul Tillich and Erich Przywara at Davos. Thomas F. O'Meara. *Gregorianum*, 87 (2, 2006), 227-238.

Embodied Ideals and Realities: Irish Nuns and Irish Womanhood, 1930s-1960s. Yvonne McKenna. *Éire-Ireland*, 41 (Spring-Summer, 2006), 40-63.

The Gospel of Psychology: Therapeutic Concepts and the Scientification of Pastoral Care in the West German Catholic Church, 1950-1980. Benjamin Ziemann. *Central European History*, 39 (Mar., 2006), 79-106.

Die katholischen Bischöfe und der 17. Juni 1953. Christoph Kösters. *Vierteljahrshefte für Zeitgeschichte*, 54 (Apr., 2006), 269-298.

Boquen-Clairvaux et retour. Un projet avorté de refondation monastique (1959-1962). Yvon Tranvouez. *Revue d'Histoire de l'Église de France*, 92 (Jan.-June, 2006), 193-220.

Die Entwicklung der Beziehungen zwischen Kirche und Staat in Deutschland und Österreich im Licht des Zweiten Vatikanischen Konzils. Wilhelm Rees. *Antonianum*, LXXI (Apr.-June, 2006), 339-379.

Feminist Christians in Flanders, 1979-1990: A New Feminisation? Bart Latré. *Revue d'histoire ecclésiastique*, 101 (Apr.-June, 2006), 656-680.

Dreaming from the Heart of Australia Twenty Years on—Reflecting on Pope John Paul II's 1986 Visit to Alice Springs. Frank Brennan. *Australasian Catholic Record*, 83 (July, 2006), 274-285.

Donner sa vie pour la gloire de T'aimer. Tibhirine ou un chemin communautaire vers le martyre. Thomas Georgeon. *Collectanea Cisterciensia*, 68 (2, 2006), 76-104.

Voici ta mère. L'expérience d'un martyr contemporain: Christophe Lebreton. Bernardo Olivera. *Collectanea Cisterciensia*, 68 (2, 2006), 117-132.

Le monastère Notre-Dame de l'Atlas au Maroc. Jean-Pierre Flachaire. *Collectanea Cisterciensia*, 68 (2, 2006), 147-166.

American and Canadian

Godly Republicanism and the Origins of the Massachusetts Polity. Michael P. Winship. *William and Mary Quarterly*, LXIII (July, 2006), 427-462.

Evolución de la Iglesia católica en el Canadá colonial durante el período de mandato británico (1763-1867). Juan José Varela Tembra. *Compostellanum*, L (1-4, 2005), 474-481.

American Missionaries and the Opium Trade in Nineteenth-Century China. Michael C. Lazich. *Journal of World History*, 17 (June, 2006), 197-223.

Reconsidering the Boundaries of Maternal Authority in the Evangelical Household: The Davis Family of Antebellum Murfreesboro. Scott M. Stephan. *North Carolina Historical Review*, LXXXIII (April, 2006), 165-192.

A "Study of Church in America": Catholicism as Exotic Other in *The Damnation of Theron Ware*. Aaron Urbanczyk. *Religion and the Arts*, 10 (1, 2006), 39-58.

The Methodology of the Modernists: Process in American Protestantism. Kathryn Lofton. *Church History*, 75 (June, 2006), 374-402.

Tolerance and Bigotry in Southwest Louisiana: The Ku Klux Klan, 1921-23. Yvonne Brown. *Louisiana History*, XLVII (Spring, 2006), 153-168.

"Still Potentially Dangerous in Some Quarters": Sylvester Andriano, Catholic Action, and Un-American Activities in California. William Issel. *Pacific Historical Review*, 75 (May, 2006), 231-270.

Cardinal Humberto Medeiros and the Desegregation of Boston's Public Schools, 1974-1976. Richard Gribble. *Journal of Church and State*, 48 (Spring, 2006), 327-353.

What Happened to Christian Canada? Mark A. Knoll. *Church History*, 75 (June, 2006), 245-273.

Camelot Only Comes but Once? John F. Kerry and the Catholic Vote. Mark M. Gray, Paul M. Perl, and Mary E. Bendyna. *Presidential Studies Quarterly*, 36 (June, 2006), 203-222.

Religious Influences in the 2004 Presidential Election. James L. Guth, Lyman A. Kellstedt, Corwin E. Smidt, and John C. Green. *Presidential Studies Quarterly*, 36 (June, 2006), 223-242.

Latin American

La primera visión de Fray Juan de Zumárraga de los indígenas mexicanos (1528-1533). Luis Martínez Ferrer. *Archivo Ibero-Americano*, LXVI (Jan.-Aug., 2006), 241-268.

La monarquía y los conquistadores—La hora de las cuentas: I Parte: Hernán Cortés y Francisco de Arteaga. José García Oro and Mª José Portela Silva. *Archivo Ibero-Americano*, LXVI (Jan.-Aug., 2006), 335-382.

La monarquía y los conquistadores—La hora de las cuentas: II Parte: Hernando Colón y García de Toledo. José García Oro. *Archivo Ibero-Americano*, LXVI (Jan.-Aug., 2006), 383-399.

El último asalto: el Arzobispo Toribio de Mogrovejo y los jesuitas de Santiago del Cercado en Lima colonial, 1595-1606. Alexandre Coello de La Rosa. *Colonial Latin American Historical Review*, 13 (Winter, 2004), 1-30.

Franciscanos vasco-cántabros en las expediciones misioneras a América de los siglos XVII y XVIII. Pedro Borges Morán. *Archivo Ibero-Americano*, LXVI (Jan.-Aug., 2006), 315-334.

El cardinal Miecislao Ledóchowski (1822-1902) y los primeros redentoristas en América Latina. Álvaro Córdoba Chaves, C.SS.R. *Spicilegium Historicum C.SS.R.*, LIV (1-2, 2006), 373-457.

Apuntes de Historia para una mejor comprensión del México Contemporáneo (Tercera Parte). Elizabeth Serna Monroy. *Efemérides Mexicana*, 24 (Jan.-Apr., 2006), 131-142.

La Guerra con el Perú: 1932. Participación de género y de la Iglesia en Nariño. Lidia Inés Muñoz Cordero. *Boletín de Historia y Antigüedades*, XCIII (Apr., May, June, 2006), 421-430.

El primer año del Post Concilio. Paul Dabezies. *Soleriana*, XXVI (Jan.-June, 2001), 69-103.

La Iglesia chilena desde 1973 a 1993: De Buenos samaritanos, antiguos contrahentes y nuevos aliados. Un análisis politológico. Veit Strassner. *Teología y Vida*, XLVII (1, 2006), 76-93.

OTHER BOOKS RECEIVED

Aston, Nigel. *Christianity and revolutionary Europe, 1750-1830.* [New Approaches to European History.] (New York: Cambridge University Press. 2002. Pp. xiv, 379. $24.00 paperback.)

Aubert, R. *Dictionnaire d'Histoire et de Géographie Ecclésiastiques.* [Fascicule 169b-170, Know-Knothingism-Krafft.]. (Paris: Letouzey et Ané. 2006. Cols. 386-767. €78.90 paperback.) Among the longer articles are those on Cardinal Georg von Kopp by G. H. Aschoff (cols. 637-646) and Cyrille Korolevskij by G. M. Croce (cols. 670-678).

Audisio, Gabriel (Ed.). *Religion et exclusion: XII^e-XVIII^e siècle.* [Collection Le temps de l'histoire.] (Aix-en-Provence: Publications de l'Université de Provence. 2001. Pp. 216. €22,87 paperback.) Contents: *Présentation:* Gabriel Audisio, "De la parole au livre" (pp. 5-10); *Liminaire:* Émile Témine, "La minorité en Histoire: fiction ou réalité?" (pp. 11-20); *Les cathares:* Bernard Doumerc, "La croisade en Orient, ferment de la lutte anti cathares au XII^e siècle" (pp. 23-33); Paul Amargier, "Contestation et pauvres catholiques: l'Église dans le Midi au XII^e siècle" (pp. 35-40); Michel Roquebert, "Mouvement et doctrine cathares. L'exemplarité de Montségur (1204-1244)" (pp. 41-48); *Les vaudois:* Michel Rubellin, "Lyon et Valdès: un réexamen" (pp. 51-60); Gabriel Audisio, "L'organisation de la clandestinité vaudoise" (pp. 61-70); Gabriel Audisio, "La fin d'une secte: les vaudois deviennent protestants" (pp. 71-80); *L'Inquisition:* Bartolomé Bennassar, "Les inquisitions modernes et la répression des minorités aux XVI^e et XVII^e siècles" (pp. 83-92); Jean-Pierre Dedieu, "Autant d'amour que de haine. Répression et résistance à la répression dans l'inquisition espagnole, XV^e-XVIII^e siècle" (pp. 93-105); Bartolomé Bennassar, "Des chrétiens passent à l'islam: les renégats (XVI^e-XVII^e siècle)" (pp. 107-113); *Les protestants:* Gabriel Audisio, "Valdo-protestants des Pouilles au XVI^e siècle: le culte de la différence" (pp. 117-125); Michelle Magdelaine, "Le voyage interdit: l'exil des huguenots" (pp. 127-133); Gabriel Audisio, "La résistance passive des huguenots au XVIII^e siècle: le Désert" (pp. 135-140); *Les juifs:* Noël Coulet, "Les juifs de Provence au Moyen Âge: entre intégration et exclusion (XIII^e-XV^e siècle)" (pp. 143-160); René Moulinas, "Juifs et chrétiens en Provence et Comtat du Moyen Âge à la Révolution" (pp. 161-170); *Aux marges:* Robert Muchembled, "Une minorité produite par la justice: les sorcières des temps modernes" (pp. 173-181); Dominique Julia, "Le pèlerinage aux temps modernes (XVI^e-XVIII^e siècle)" (pp. 183-195); Gabriel Audisio, "À la recherche de l'espace et du temps perdus" (pp. 197-205).

Batson, David. *The Treasure Chest of the Early Christians: Faith, Care and Community from the Apostolic Age to Constantine the Great.* (Grand Rapids, Mich.: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company. 2002. Pp. xvi, 128. $18.00 paperback.)

Becker, Winfried (Ed.). *Der Passauer Vertrag von 1552: Politische Entstehung, reichsrechtliche Bedeutung und konfessionsgeschichtliche Bewertung.* [Einzelarbeiten aus der Kirchengeschichte Bayerns, 80. Band.] (Neustadt a.d. Aisch: Verlag Degener & Co. 2003. Pp. 208.) Contents: Eike Wolgast, "Die Religionsfrage auf den Reichstagen 1521 bis 1550/51" (pp. 9-28); Volker Henning Drecoll, "Verhandlungen in Passau am 6. Juni 1552: Eine Einigung in der Frage der Religion?" (pp. 29-44); Maximilian Lanzinner, "Passau als Verhandlungsort" (pp. 45-55); Albrecht P. Luttenberger, "Politische Kommunikation, Neutralität und Vermittlung während des Fürstenaufstandes 1552" (pp. 56-84); Günter Wartenberg, "Moritz von Sachsen und die protestantischen Fürsten" (pp. 85-95); Alfred Kohler, "Kaiser Karl V. und der Passauer Vertrag" (pp. 96-104); Anton Schindling, "Der Passauer Vertrag und die Kirchengüterfrage" (pp. 105-123); Alexander Koller, "Der Passauer Vertrag und die Kurie" (pp. 124-138); Helmut Neuhaus, "Der Passauer Vertrag und die Entwicklung des Reichsreligionsrechts: Vom Nürnberger Anstand zum Augsburger Religionsfrieden" (pp. 139-150); Jörg Haustein, "Das Verhältnis der Konfessionen um die Mitte des 16. Jahrhunderts. Ein europäischer Vergleich" (pp. 151-165); Winfried Becker, "Der Passauer Vertrag in der Historiographie" (pp. 166-194).

Beschin, Giuseppe, Fabrizio Cambi, Luca Cristellon (Eds.). *Lutero e i linguaggi dell'Occidente: Atti del convegno tenuto a Trento dal 29 al 31 maggio 2000.* [Filosofia, Nuova serie 6.] (Brescia: Editrice Morcelliana. 2002. Pp. 470. €28,50 paperback.) Contents: Luigi Sartori, "Presentazione" (pp. 11-16); Paul Ricoeur, "Dal Concilio di Trento al Convegno di Trento" (pp. 17-23); Heiko A. Oberman, "Lutero e la via moderna. La svolta della Riforma e il suo sfondo filosofico" (pp. 25-56); Alessandro Ghisalberti, "Dalla *via moderna* alla *via antiqua*" (pp. 57-71); Giancarlo Pani, "L'autografo di Lutero sulla *Lettera ai Romani*: un progetto di Riforma?" (pp. 73-97); Sergio Rostagno, "Ontologia e linguaggio nel discorso luterano" (pp. 99-128); Karl-Heinz zur Mühlen, "L'antropologia di Martin Lutero alla luce dell'escatologia" (pp. 129-148); Mario Galzignato, "La giustificazione-evangelo negli scritti giovanili di Martin Lutero (1509-1516)" (pp. 149-174); Emanuele Banfi, "Vicende e politiche linguistiche nell'Europa del periodo della Riforma" (pp. 177-192); Federico Albano Leoni, "Lutero e la storia della lingua tedesca" (pp. 193-211); Sebastian Seyfert, "L'influsso delle fonti latine sulla formazione dei testi nelle redazioni della Bibia di Martin Lutero (1522-1545)" (pp. 213-238); Heinrich Magirius, "La Riforma di Martin Lutero e i suoi effetti sull'arte dell'epoca" (pp. 239-256); Johannes Erichsen, "Lutero e le immagini" (pp. 257-276); Jos E. Vercruysse, "Lutero nella teologia e nella storiografia cattolica del Novecento" (pp. 277-298); Giampiero Bof, "Barth e Lutero" (pp. 299-329); Andrea Poma, "Leibniz e l'unità delle chiese" (pp. 331-

341); Marco Ivaldo, "Fichte e la Riforma" (pp. 343-368); Fortunato M. Cacciatore, "Hegel e il protestantesimo. Eticità, religione, filosofia" (pp. 369-385); Alberto Gallas, "È Lutero un dialettico? L'evoluzione del giudizio di Kierkegaard sul Riformatore di Wittenberg" (pp. 387-409); Horst Georg Pöhlmann, "La presenza della lingua di Lutero in Friedrich Nietzche" (pp. 411-421); Giuseppe Cantillo, "Luteranesimo e mondo moderno in Ernst Troeltsch" (pp. 423-438); Marco Gozzi, "*Cantus planus* e *Kirchengesenge Deudtsch*, quali dipendenze?" (pp. 439-468).

Biller, Peter. *The Waldenses, 1170-1530. Between a Religious Order and a Church.* [Variorum Collected Studies Series.] (Burlington, Vt.: Ashgate Publishing Company. 2001. Pp. xxii, 320. $99.95.) Four of the sixteen chapters were originally published in French, and one in Italian; they are here published in English translations for the first time. Three chapters have never been published before, viz., X. "The *Topos* and reality of the heretic as *illiteratus*" (pp. 169-190); XII. "The *Liber Electorum"* (pp. 207-224); and XV. "The anti-Waldensian treatise *Cum dormirent homines* of 1395 and its author" (pp. 237-269).

Bird, Otto, and Katherine Bird. *From Witchery to Sanctity: The Religious Vicissitudes of the Hawthornes.* (South Bend, Ind.: St. Augustine's Press. 2005. Pp. x, 164. $24.00.)

Bonazza, Marcello. *Il fisco in una statualità divisa: Impero, principi e ceti in area trentino-tirolese nella prima età moderna.* [Istituto trentino di cultura. Annali dell'Istituto storico italo-germanico in Trento, Monografie, 35.] (Bologna: Società editrice il Mulino. 2001. Pp. 530. €29,95 paperback.)

Boutry, Philippe, Pierre-Antoine Fabre, and Dominique Julia (Eds.). *Rendre ses Voeux: Les identités pèlerines dans l'Europe moderne (XVI^e^-XVIII^e^ siècle).* [Civilisations et Sociétés, 100.] (Paris: Éditions de l'École des Hautes Études en Sciences Sociales. 2000. Pp. 586. 350F paperback.) Contents: I. Les Foules Pèlerines (pp. 11-14): Laura Artioli, "Le long de la via Emilia. Les hôpitaux de pèlerins entre XVI^e^ et XVIII^e^ siècle" (pp. 15-38); Christophe Duhamell, "Les pèlerins de passage à l'hospice zum Heiligen Kreuz de Nuremberg au XVIII^e^ siècle" (pp. 39-56); Antje Stannek, "Migration confessionnelle ou pèlerinage? Rapport sur le fonds d'un hospice pour les nouveaux convertis dans les Archives secrètes du Vatican" (pp. 57-74); Marc Wingens, "Franchir la frontière. Le pèlerinage des catholiques néerlandais aux XVII^e^ et XVIII^e^ siècles" (pp. 75-85); Marie-Elizabeth Ducreux, "L'ordre symbolique d'un pèlerinage tchèque dans l'espace habsbourgeois au XVII^e^ siècle: Stará Boleslav" (pp. 87-122); Pedro Penteado, "Pèlerinages collectifs au sanctuaire de Nossa Sennhora de Nazaré (Portugal) aux XVII^e^ et XVIII^e^ siècles" (pp. 123-138); Silvana Seidel Menchi, "Les pèlerinages des enfants mort-nés: ritual de redressement d'un dogme impopulaire" (pp. 139-153); II. Expériences: de la règle religieuse aux récits (pp. 155-337): Pierre-Antoine Fabre, "«Ils iront en pèlerinage…» L'«expérience» du pèlerinage selon l' «Examen général» des *Constitutions* de

la Compagnie de Jésus et selon les pratiques contemporaines" (pp. 159-188); Daniel-Odon Hurel, "Vie monastique et pèlerinage au XVI^e^ siècle: Dom Nicolas Loupvent, moine de Saint Mihiel et son *Voyaige Itineraire et transmarine de la saincte cité de Jherusalem* (1531)" (pp. 189-215); Pierre Gonneau, "Les pérégrinations de Vasilij Grigorovič Barskij, 1723-1747" (pp. 217-237); Dominique Julia, "Curiosité, dévotion et *politica peregrinesca*: Le pèlerinage de Nicola Albani, melfitain, à Saint-Jacques-de-Compostelle, 1743-1745" (pp. 239-314); Marina Caffiero, "Le modèle de l'ermite pèlerin: le cas Benoît Labre" (pp. 315-335); III. Identités Pèlerines (pp. 337-473): Maria de Lurdes Rosa, "Promesses, dons et mécénat: Le pèlerinage noble au Portugal entre salut et représentation, XV^e^-XVIII^e^ siècle" (pp. 341-362); Isabelle Brian, "Le roi pèlerin. Pèlerinages royaux dans la France moderne" (pp. 363-378); Georges Provost, "Identité paysanne et «pèlerinage au long cours» dans la France des XVII^e^-XIX^e^ siècles" (pp. 379-399); Philippe Boutry, Françoise Le Hénand, "Pèlerins parisiens à l'âge de la monarchie administrative" (pp. 401-437); Dominique Julia, "Aveux de pèlerins" (pp. 439-456); Sandro Landi, "Législations sur les pèlerinages et identités pélerines dans la péninsule italienne, XVI^e^-XVIII^e^ siècle" (pp. 457-471); IV. Liturgies et mises en scène (pp. 473-475): Catherine Velay-Vallantin, "Les usages de la controverse provençale. Le pèlerinage de la Sainte-Baume et la procession de la Madeleine à Marseille, XVII^e^-XVIII^e^ siècle" (pp. 477-499); Albrecht Burkardt, "Voyage de dévotion et quête du miracle à travers les procès de canonisation de saints français de la première moitié du XVII^e^ siècle" (pp. 501-529); Philippe Martin, "Une pastorale pèlerine dans la Lorraine du XVIII^e^ siècle" (pp. 531-547); Bibliographie, Index, Tables: "Pèlerins et pèlerinage dans l'Europe moderne, XVI^e^-XIX^e^ siècle. Éléments de bibliographie" (pp. 551-566).

Boxall, Ian. *The Revelation of Saint John.* [Black's New Testament Commentaries.] (Peabody, Mass.: Hendrickson Publishers. 2006. Pp. xvi, 347. $29.95.)

Bremmer, Rolf H., Jr., Kees Dekker, David F. Johnson (Eds.). *Rome and the North: The Early Reception of Gregory the Great in Germanic Europe.* [Mediaevalia Groningana New Series, Volume 4.] (Leuven: Peeters. 2001. Pp. xvi, 308. Paperback.) Contents: Introduction by the editors, "Gregory the Great and the Germanic World" (pp. ix-xvi); Kate Rambridge, "*Doctor Noster Sanctus:* The Northumbrians and Pope Gregory" (pp. 1-26); Kees Dekker, "King Alfred's Translation of Gregory's *Dialogi:* Tales for the Unlearned?" (pp. 27-50); David F. Johnson, "The Gregorian Grendel: *Beowulf* 705b-09 and the Limits of the Demonic" (pp. 51-65); Nicole Guenther Discenza, "The Influence of Gregory the Great on the Alfredian Social Imaginary" (pp. 67-81); Sharon Rowley, "Shifting Contexts: Reading Gregory the Great's *Libellus Responsionum* in Book III of the Old English Bede" (pp. 83-92); Malcolm R. Godden, "Were It not That I Have Bad Dreams: Gregory the Great and the Anglo-Saxons on the Dangers of Dreaming" (pp. 93-113); Thomas N. Hall, "The Early English Manuscripts of Gregory the

Great's *Homiliae in Evangelia* and *Homiliae in Hiezechihelem:* A Preliminary Survey" (pp. 115-136); Patrizia Lendinara, "Gregory and Damasus: Two Popes and Anglo-Saxon England" (pp. 137-156); Andrew Cole, " Jewish Apocrypha and Christian Epistemologies of the Fall: The *Dialogi* of Gregory the Great and the Old Saxon *Genesis*" (pp. 157-188); Brian Murdoch, "Using the *Moralia:* Gregory the Great in Early Medieval German" (pp. 189-205); Geert H. M. Claassens, "Gregory's *Dialogi* in Middle Dutch Literature" (pp. 207-237); Rolf H. Bremmer, Jr., "Gregory the Great in Medieval Frisia: What Is and What Might Have Been" (pp. 239-253); Kirsten Wolf, "Gregory's Influence on Old Norse-Icelandic Religious Literature" (pp. 255-272); Eugene Crook, "Gregory's *Dialogi* and the Old Norse Sagas" (pp. 275-285).

Caspary, Anita M., I.H.M. *Witness to Integrity: The Crisis of the Immaculate Heart Community of California.* (Collegeville, Minn.: Liturgical Press. 2003. Pp. xx, 287. $21.95 paperback.)

Corni, Gustavo, and Christof Dipper (Eds.). *Italiani in Germania tra Ottocento e Novecento: Spostamenti, rapporti, immagini, influenze.* [Istituto trentino di cultura. Annali dell'Istituto storico italo-germanico in Trento, Quaderni, 67.] (Bologna: Società editrice il Mulino. 2006. Pp. 731. €43,00 paperback.)

Desmette, Philippe. *Les Brefs d'Indulgences pour les Confréries des Diocèses de Cambrai et de Tournai aux XVII^e^ et XVIII^e^ Siècles (A.S.V., Sec. Brev., Indulg. Perpetuae, 2-9).* [Analecta Vaticano-Belgica, 1, XXXIII.] (Brussels and Rome: Institut historique belge de Rome. 2002. Pp. 319. Paperback.)

Duffy, Eamon. *Saints and Sinners: A History of the Popes.* (New Haven and London: Yale University Press. 2006. Pp. xiv, 474. $18.00 paperback.) Originally published in 1997 and reviewed by Simon Ditchfield *ante,* LXXXV (April, 1999), 256–260. In this third edition the bibliography has been updated and the last chapter has been revised and extended to take account of recent work on Pius XII, of the death of John Paul II, and of the election of Benedict XVI.

Faggioli, Massimo, and Alberto Melloni (Eds.). *Religious Studies in the 20th Century: A Survey on Disciplines, Cultures and Questions: International Colloquium Assisi 2003.* [Christianity and History. Series of the John XXIII Foundation for Religious Studies in Bologna, Vol. 2.] (New Brunswick, New Jersey: Transaction Publishers. 2006. Pp. ii, 340. Paperback.) Contents: *Introduction:* Massimo Faggioli, "Introduction: Towards a Possible Overview of Religious Studies in the 20th Century" (pp. 15-19); Alberto Melloni, "La parabola delle scienze religiose nel '900: questioni, tappe ed esiti" (pp. 21-33); Giovanni Filoramo, "Research on the Religions in the 20th Century and its Methodological Phases" (pp. 35-49); *The Debate between the 19th and 20th Centuries:* Thomas Albert Howard, "Theology or the Science of Religion? The Legacy of Adolf von Harnack" (pp. 53-73); Rosanna

Ciappa, "Storia, esegesi e teologia nel carteggio tra Alfred Loisy e Maurice Blondel" (pp. 75-90); *The Disciplines*: Giuseppe Ghiberti, "L'esegesi biblica nel Novecento" (pp. 93-119); Carlo Fantappié, "Problems of Methodology in Canon Law in the 20th Century" (pp. 121-134); Richard Puza, "Theology, History and Jurisprudence in German Faculties of Theology" (pp. 135-148); Giuseppe Ruggieri, "Lo statuto della teologia nel '900" (pp. 149-163); Paul Tombeur, "Tradition et modernité. Outils informatiques pour l'étude de la tradition en sciences religieuses" (pp. 165-184); *National Landscapes*: Claude Langlois, "Histoire religieuse en France" (pp. 187-195); Étienne Fouilloux, "Histoire et sociologie religieuse en France depuis un siècle" (pp. 197-218); Francis P. Kilcoyne, "Christian Theology in the United States in the 20th Century. A Protestant and Catholic Overview" (pp. 219-235); Feliciano Montero, "Historiografía española de la Iglesia y del catolicismo en el siglo XX" (pp. 237-249); Claus Arnold, "Konfessionalismus und katholische kirchenhistorische Forschung in Deutschland (1900-1965)" (pp. 251-271); Maria Lupi, "Italian Historical Periodicals on the Church and Christianity since the End of the Second World War" (pp. 273-305); Norman Tanner, "Religious Studies in Britain since 1850" (pp. 307-322).

Frost, Michael. *Exiles: Living Missionally in a Post-Christian Culture*. (Peabody, Mass.: Hendrickson Publishers. 2006. Pp. x, 333. $19.95 paperback.)

Giles, Mary E. (Ed.). *Women in the Inquisition: Spain and the New World.* ((Baltimore, Md.: The Johns Hopkins University Press. 1999. Pp. xi, 402. $49.00 clothbound; $19.95 paperback.)

Gill, Robin. *Health Care and Christian Ethics.* [New Studies in Christian Ethics, Vol. 26.] (New York: Cambridge University Press. 2006. Pp. xiv, 229. $75.00.)

Grant, Edward. *God and Reason in the Middle Ages.* (New York: Cambridge University Press. 2001. Pp. x, 397. $65.00.)

Grant, Lindy, and Richard Mortimer (Eds.). *Westminster Abbey: The Cosmati Pavements.* [Courtauld Research Papers No. 3.] (Burlington, Vt.: Ashgate Publishing Company. 2002. Pp. x, 141. $89.95.) This volume contains the papers presented at a multidisciplinary conference held in November 1998 and sponsored jointly by the Courtauld Institute and Westminister Abbey. Contents: Lindy Grant, "Introduction" (pp. 1-6); 1. Christopher Norton, "The luxury pavement in England before Westminister" (pp. 7-36); 2. David Carpenter, "Westminister Abbey and the Cosmati pavements in politics, 1258-1269" (pp. 37-48); 3. Richard Foster, "The context and fabric of the Westminster Abbey Sanctuary pavement" (pp. 49-91); 4. Nicholas Durnan, "The condition and conservation of the Cosmati pavements at Westminster Abbey" (pp. 92-99); 5. David Howlett, "The inscriptions in the Sanctuary pavement at Westminster" (pp. 100-115); 6. Paul Binski, "The Cosmati and *romanitas* in England: an overview" (pp. 116-131).

Hannan, Monica. *The Dream Maker.* (Tucson, Ariz.: E.T. Nedder Publishing. 2006. Pp. 264. $20.00 paperback.)

Hillgarth, J. N. *The Mirror of Spain, 1500-1700: The Formation of a Myth.* (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press. 2000. Pp. xxii, 584. $72.50.)

Hostetter, Larry. *The Ecclesial Dimension of Personal and Social Reform in the Writings of Isaac Thomas Hecker.* [Roman Catholic Studies, Vol. 15.] (Lewiston, N.Y.: The Edwin Mellen Press. 2001. Pp. xvii, 574. $119.95.)

Irvine, Christopher. *The Art of God: The Making of Christians and the Meaning of Worship.* (Chicago: Liturgy Training Publications. 2006. Pp. xii, 148. $14.95 paperback.)

Isasi-Díaz, Ada-María, and Yolanda Tarango. *Hispanic Women—Prophetic Voice in the Church. Mujer Hispana—Voz profética en la Iglesia.* (Scranton: University of Scranton Press. 2006. Pp. xxxii, 113. $15.00 paperback.) Originally published by Harper and Row, San Francisco, in 1988.

Kavanaugh, Kieran (Trans. and Intro.). *The Collected Letters of St. Teresa of Avila,* Vol. 1: *1546-1577.* (Washington, D.C.: ICS Publications. 2001. Pp. 702. $14.95 paperback.)

Kelly, Joseph F. *An Introduction to the New Testament for Catholics.* (Collegeville, Minn.: Liturgical Press. 2006. Pp. xiv 278. $29.95 paperback.)

Kirk, James (Ed.). *The Scottish Churches and the Union Parliament, 1707-1999.* (Edinburgh: Scottish Church History Society. 2001. Pp. 167. Clothbound.)

Kowaleski, Maryanne (Ed.). *Medieval Towns: A Reader.* (Peterborough, Ontario: Broadview Press. 2006. Pp. xviii, 405. $32.95 paperback.) Chapter VIII (pp. 235-268) is devoted to "Religion, Piety, and Charity" with fifteen texts and two figures.

Lemaitre, Nicole (Ed.). *Religion et politique dans les sociétés du Midi.* [Comité des Travaux Historiques et Scientifiques.] (Paris: Éditions du CTHS. 2002. Pp. 324. €30 paperback.) Contents: "Présentation" (pp. 9-14); I. "Pratiques religieuses anciennes: La mort et la glorie": Jacques Lapart, "Les sculptures en calcaire trouvées dans les piles gallo-romaines de Betbèze à Mirande (Gers) d'après le carnet de fouilles inédit de George Fouet" (pp. 17-35); Marcelino Beroiz Larcano, "La mort dans les terres du Sud: rites funéraires en Navarre au Moyen Âge (XIII^{e}-XV^{e} siècle)" (pp. 37-48); Valérie Stauner, "Fondations cisterciennes dans la France du Sud: désir religieux ou volonté politique?" (pp. 49-61); II. "Dissidences et Inquisitions": Jacqueline Carabia, "Christianisation superficielle dans la région de Lannemezan" (pp. 65-77); Matthieu Desachy, "L'Église du Viaur: les derniers partisans de l'obédience avignonnaise dans le Midi (1420-1430)" (pp. 79-93); Jesús Cortés Mateo et Manuel Pérez Belanche, "Conséquences de la dis-

sidence morisque: la répression inquisitoriale en Aragon" (pp. 95-103); Jack Thomas, "Rendre ceux de la RPR invisibles et muets: le parlement de Toulouse, les grands jours de Nîmes et les protestants (1656-1682)" (pp. 105-122); III. "Mémoires collectives": Michel Casta, "Les Giovannali, lieu de mémoire de la dissidence en Corse" (pp. 125-138); Sylvie Mouysset, "De père en fils: livre de raison et transmission de la mémoire familiale (France du Sud, XV^{e}-XVIII^{e} siècle)" (pp. 139-151); Serge Brunet, "Anatomie des réseaux ligueurs dans le sud-ouest de la France (vers 1562-vers 1610)" (pp. 153-191); Sandrine Messines, "Contre-Réforme et Réforme catholique en Agenais, à travers les visites pastorales de Nicolas de Villars (1592-1607)" (pp. 193-201); Véronique Castagnet, "Les ecclésiastiques forains face à la «reconstruction» de l'Église catholique en Béarn (1599-1789)" (pp. 203-213); Arnaud Girodon, "Fraternité de prêtres et crédit: la «communauté des messieurs prêtres de Saint-Chély d'Aubrac» (XVI^{e}-XVII^{e} siècles)" (pp. 215-227); IV. "Mémoires affrontées": François-Lionel Florentin, "Cohabitation religieuse dans la municipalité de Lectoure pendant les premières guerres de religion (1558-1578)" (pp. 231-243); Valérie Sottocasa, "Mémoires affrontées: catholiques et protestants des montagnes du Languedoc face à la Révolution française" (pp. 245-264); Roger Dupuy, "Politisation populaire et religion: étude comparée de l'antirévolution dans le midi et l'ouest de la France (1790-1799)" (pp. 265-278); Germain Sicard, "La répression contre les prêtres «réfractaires» en Haute-Garonne et dans le midi toulousain durant la Révolution française" (pp. 279-288); Anne-Marie Uffler, "Restaurations et reconstructions des églises en Tarn-et-Garonne au XIX^{e} siècle" (pp. 289-306); Carlos Barrul Perna, "Religiosité populaire et anticléricalisme dans la société prépyrénéenne: quelques exemples à propos de la Ribagorza (1930-1940)" (pp. 307-319).

Levin, Miriam R. *Defining Women's Scientific Enterprise: Mount Holyoke Faculty and the Rise of American Science.* (Lebanon, N.H.: University Press of New England. 2006. Pp. xiv, 209. $19.95 paperback.)

Maguire, Nancy Klein. *An Infinity of Little Hours: Five Young Men and Their Trial of Faith in the Western World's Most Austere Monastic Order.* (New York: PublicAffairs Books. 2006. Pp. xii, 258. $26.00 clothbound.)

McAndrews, Lawrence J. *The Era of Education: The Presidents and the Schools, 1965-2001.* (Urbana and Chicago: University of Illinois Press. 2006. Pp. x, 306. $45.00.)

McCarthy, John P. *Kevin O'Higgins: Builder of the Irish State.* (Dublin and Portland, Ore.: Irish Academic Press. Distributed in the U.S.A. by ISBS. 2006. Pp. xvi, 312. $35.00 paperback.)

McLeod, Hugh and Werner Ustorf (Eds.). *The Decline of Christendom in Western Europe, 1750-2000.* (New York: Cambridge University Press. 2003. Pp. ix, 234. $60.00.) Contents: 1. Hugh McLeod, "Introduction" (pp. 1-26); Part I: 2. Callum G. Brown, "The secularization decade: what the 1960s have done

to the study of religious history" (pp. 29-46); 3. Eva M. Hamberg, "Christendom in decline: the Swedish case" (pp. 47-62); 4. Yves Lambert, "New Christianity, indifference and diffused spirituality" (pp. 63-78); Part II: 5. David Hempton, "Established churches and the growth of religious pluralism: a case study of christianisation and secularization in England since 1700" (pp. 81-98); 6. Sheridan Gilley, "Catholicism in Ireland" (pp. 99-112); 7. Peter Van Rooden, "Long-term religious developments in the Netherlands, c. 1750-2000" (pp. 113-129); Martin Greschat, "The potency of 'Christendom': the example of the *Darmstädter Wort* (1947)" (pp. 130-142); Part III: 9. Thomas Kselman, "The dechristianisation of death in modern France" (pp. 145-162); 10. Michel Lagrée, "The impact of technology on Catholicism in France (1850-1950)" (pp. 163-183); 11. Lucian Hölscher, "Semantic structures of religious change in modern Germany" (pp. 184-197); Part IV: 12. Jeffrey Cox, "Master narratives of long-term religious change" (pp. 201-217); 13. Werner Ustorf, "A missiological postscript" (pp. 218-225).

Mews, Constant J. (Ed.). *Listen, Daughter: The Speculum Virginum and the Formation of Religious Women in the Middle Ages.* (New York: Palgrave. 2001. Pp. xiii, 306. $49.95.)

Milem, Bruce. *The Unspoken Word: Negative Theology in Meister Eckhart's German Sermons.* (Washington, D.C.: The Catholic University of America Press. 2002. Pp.xii, 192. $44.95.)

O'Brien, Michael. *John F. Kennedy: A Biography.* (New York: Thomas Dunne Books. A Division of St. Martin's Press. 2005. Pp. xx, 971. $40.00.)

Papenheim, Martin. *Karrieren in der Kirche: Bischöfe in Nord- und Süditalien 1676-1903.* [Bibliothek des Deutschen Historischen Instituts in Rom, Band 93.] (Tübingen: Max Niemeyer Verlag. 2001. Pp. xiv, 435.)

Pekkanen, Tuomo (Ed.). *Carmina Viatoris.* [Supplementa Humanistica Lovaniensia, Vol. 19.] (Louvain, Belgium: Leuven University Press. 2005. Pp. 266. Paperback.)

Ranft, Patricia. *A Women's Way: The Forgotten History of Women Spiritual Directors.* (New York: Palgrave. 2000. Pp. x, 254. $39.95.)

Reichenbach, Hans. *Experience and Prediction: An Analysis of the Foundations and the Structure of Knowledge.* (Notre Dame, Ind.: University of Notre Dame Press. 2006. Pp.xliv, 410. $48.00 paperback.)

Rosenwein, Barbara H. (Ed.). *Reading the Middle Ages: Sources from Europe, Byzantium, and the Islamic World.* (Peterborough, Ontario: Broadview Press. 2006. Pp. xx, 594. $42.95 paperback.)

Schabel, Christopher (Selected and Trans.). *The Synodicum Nicosiense and Other Documents of the Latin Church of Cyprus, 1196-1373.* [Cyprus Research Centre, Texts and Studies in the History of Cyprus, XXXIX.]. (Nicosia: Cyprus Research Centre. 2001. Pp. 393.)

Schutte, Anne Jacobson. *Aspiring Saints: Pretense of Holiness, Inquisition, and Gender in the Republic of Venice, 1618-1750.* (Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press. 2001. Pp. xvi, 337. $45.00.)

Selinger, Reinhard. *The Mid-Third Century Persecutions of Decius and Valerian.* (Berlin and New York: Peter Lang. 2002. Pp. 179. €33,95 paperback.)

Skalnik, James Veazie. *Ramus and Reform: University and Church at the End of the Renaissance.* [Sixteenth Century Essays & Studies Series, Vol. LX.] (Kirksville, Mo.: Truman State University Press. 2002. Pp. xii, 172.)

Solway, Jacqueline (Ed.). *The Politics of Egalitarianism: Theory and Practice.* [Methodology and History in Anthropology, Vol. 12.] (New York: Berghahn Books. 2006. Pp. viii, 260. $25.00 paperback; $80.00 clothbound.)

Stevens-Arroyo, Antonio M. *Cave of the Jagua: The Mythological World of the Taínos.* (Scranton: University of Scranton Press. 2006. Pp. xlvi, 294. $24.00 paperback.) Originally published by the University of New Mexico Press in 1988.

Todd, Margo. *The Culture of Protestantism in Early Modern Scotland.* (New Haven and London: Yale University Press. 2002. Pp. xiv, 450.)

Trexler, Richard C. *Reliving Golgotha: The Passion Play of Iztapalapa.* (Cambridge, Mass., and London: Harvard University Press. 2003. Pp. xi, 351. $35.00.)

Turchetti, Mario. *Tyrannie et tyrannicide de l'Antiquité à nos jours.* [Fondements de la politique] (Paris: Presses Universitaires de France. 2001. Pp. 1044. Paperback.)

Twyman, Susan. *Papal Ceremonial at Rome in the Twelfth Century.* [Henry Bradshaw Society Subsidia, IV.] (Rochester, N.Y.: The Boydell Press. 2002. Pp. xii, 251. $70.00.)

Vermigli, Peter Martyr. *Commentary of Aristotle's Nicomachean Ethics.* Edited by Emidio Campi and Joseph C. McLelland. [The Peter Martyr Library, Volume Nine. Sixteenth Century Essays & Studies, Volume LXXIII.] (Kirksville, Mo.: Truman State University. 2006. Pp. xxxii, 439.)

Vésteinsson, Orri. *The Christenization of Iceland: Priests, Power, and Social Change 1000-1300.* (New York: Oxford University Press. 2000. Pp. xvi, 318. $80.00.)

Weber, Francis J. *A Legacy of Healing: The Story of Catholic Health Care in the Archdiocese of Los Angeles.* (Mission Hills, Calif.: Saint Francis Historical Society. 2003. Pp. viii, 84. $10.00 paperback.)

Wiesner-Hanks, Merry E. *Early Modern Europe, 1450-1789.* [Cambridge History of Europe.] (New York: Cambridge University Press. 2006. Pp. xiv, 495. $85.00 clothbound; $34.99 paperback.)