

The Irish Ecclesiastical Record

Monthly Sournal unùtr (Episcopal Sanction)

VOLUME LXVII

JANUARY to JUNE 1946

FIFTH SERIES

DUBLIN

BROWNE AND NOLAN LIMITED. NASSAU STREET

104-

ALL RIGHTS RESERVED

1M frütflüü

“ „< * — ^ . << * << .

jgiÆ . . K' << — — » , » , * *

C: 'l' V PBia P ^ z ~ £ll H'd " . " ' -rac, in the Mass. Bv Hi« Grace tha Are) 'l' i

O.F.M.Cap. to .he t ris' -rnr -> / Lite. By Ht:iec de;: . *L

The A^ittr^A^ Liturgy. Exc-tor: Catholic K^ötu Pri. Catholic Cnivority of 4. . * P,

The Downside Review. I>JWüSRÍ(Abbey" Bath

The Fatter Mathew Retort. 2 Card sI^t. Dublin.

The Irish Monthly. 3 Great Denmark Street, Dublin.

The African Rosary. Kiilesandra, Co. Cavan.

Africa. Kiitegan, O. WmWow.

The Universo. Field House. Br.:ans E C t

Tte Catholic Times. 173-5 fl,ve stro.-t, L<Jlldon

The Standard. Pearse Street, Dublin

The Clergy Review. Bun» Qab-s and Washboume. Blackfridars. Blackwell, Oxford whuourie

Wa^Sert". Catholic Biblical Awociation, St Edm mù »1 &.

The Catholic World 401 Muet 10th Street, New York, 1».

'alunitna. New Haven, Conn

The HeeoiLtic and Intend Wagn-r, Now York.

AoufUte Bei-us Thù.iicji.-tu.. Louvain.

Theological Studies. Woodstock Ma the Faith. 1 Caver..li.-h Ruw, D.

(rat^i^ ^IJ- <^Wic Pass. Ebate Metta.

Tte Catnohc Worter. 1U Mort Strn^, New York.

^tenna, 7 EJy Place, Dubiin.

Ttet.3 Me^ ^ - Dublin.

The εη^ 3t: i^,°W*: Dublin.

'ite -^"Λ ■"r.... :■: Pa>1 2' M^r.

« -bus'rauan Catei:r Rccori j» IMrwk- Code^, Manby

j^w~j . Roma.

Jur L<bi* /th"» Sacnd Sacred Heart Cc-Uei.. <^ ^.

The fi-,£ British Catholic bi-^z. 34B North End Road. Ur-dcn- X u

2,7* iritA Diffysl. Marlbuuush Street. Dublin.

Afrioan Mûmenar^'. Biackrock Road, Cork.

f7o>rrr M.-irihly. i'iac-, Duhhn,

f,?^**; MiTChaats 4>xay. Dv,bLn.

,-?^ £^^. St- Coliinsbaf't». Nwvan.

ite Cruca. 5Lilult Dublin.

concerning 'thomist metaphysics and
THE SACRAMENT-SACRIFICE

Br Rev. J. BRODIE BROSNAN. MA.. O.B.E., P.1.

f 'Xi,!Vf Λ teta "XÎ'confliderâtion and



the Mas,-Svrlùv. Only an honest examination of
the pap-î Hiivl be summarized under the heads :

'a., rr.iixr'l sacrament'; sacrificial immolation . our puesm
u-r and the dilieulty of duly relating its function with Christ s
in Holy Mass.

/fe.. i

SACRAMENT

kînw that there arc seven sacraments. Yet the paper
m> by slating :

ci-If Ute areat sacrament. the arram nt>1 I'li-i-t « ill' uiniiy.

TJfhierat.hic-n.ty^m.
Our present study is concerned m>>1 JTM
jx it is reprted in the saerament of the activiv}
priesthood, liti-iic, mined



h- arued IVniiniiwi gives no char indi-id>>« ? » \[tr
i> -.;his; which he attaches to the word 'sacrament- we
iPT<< ft tw puzzle it out. and the puzzle increases as we



-1 'r r/I.-jmin m mr-d-na times to discover the folk sacramental eivctacXcr

thnjkfiaas, ia ~ trtw*L-
of secnfxi; or again in thei? mystiral-inynoktipn
entirely the tm. y--y- ; *

«s a .Srtirnwwto-n <><< M>><< W>> Λ
vr.r.r..'. <'> TM* M ,he

ifad l^;,er toh. Stated *
,, ^, >e ,, ,, ,, ,, H tab* <<<<<<

HiU

wLn.hicUO::' I «K-t
tiH-t. As they stan<<-"-7 rie. -aibiguity is a «nwkt· screen
/ni^nterpromptjo®huh truth urfds-.h<-od.

► H'

μηκο!·i·î* < jK-ru-i-t **<>* eocnad ih*: «unl ' sa<!FU>vfltaj,
-ma> uu'.J A.lyxander ; ",foment ' «tould not l>? ua*! m ω t
'«a. t.'i-Λ 'lu > » f.y a-j nt* 'V
t ckc sense. It w ***ø* -

>>Φ.

MI

ceremony of a religious nature. When discussions arose among the Scholastics (say of baptism) as regards what properly constituted the sacrament, a distinction was made between the *sacrum tantum*, *sacramentum et res*, and *res tantum*. The first was the outward rite, the second the character, and the third sacramental grace. As regards the sacraments this distinction has not survived. But as regards Holy Mass, it would be interesting to learn where it may be found. No doubt St. Augustine and St. Thomas states that the words of consecration have in Christ an instrumental power and 'operate sacramentally. Augustines 'sacred sign,' from the context, can only mean the outer sacrifice. Clearly the Mass is not the outer sacrifice of the Cross; for the Council of Trent declares the Mass to be distinct from the Cross-mode. Why, therefore, call the Mass the *Sacrament of the Cross*? Catholics speak of the *sacrifice* of the Mass and deem it strange if asked: 'Have you been to the Mass?' Their terms 'sacrifice of the Mass' and 'Eucharist' seem truly traditional. Is it surprising that tridentine theologians do not call the Mass a *sacrament* or a *sacrifice*? Post-tridentine theologians have always regarded the priest's communion as intimately connected with the Mass; indeed, later on, some, as Dr. J. Bellord, Renz and others, regard the Mass just a sacrificial banquet and in the graphic words of Father McNabb, O.P. transferred it to the culinary domain. It is hardly credible therefore that post-tridentine theologians should have the traditional sacramental outlook of the Mass.

It may be that St. Thomas wished his words to imply that the Mass is a sacrament and a sacrifice? Though aware of their teaching, the great Dominican theologian gives no sufficient hint that such was the saint's intention. On the feast day, St. Thomas says, was not an *aptum* for the consecrating of this sacrament. 'Ideo in die quo instituitur, non celebratur sacramentum, quia Christus non est consummatus, sed est consummatus in seipso.' Yet the Body of Christ is consecrated on the day of the Passion bestowal on us by this sacrament, having admitted that the *omnino* is derived from the *actus* of the Eucharist as a sacrament?

That the Eucharist as a sacrament? ... that was ... the other ... of the Eucharist ...

terrans is not consecratus est. St. Thomas makes t esse
-subtle distinction: 'Dicitur ennn m abbu^tae^,,

quod jam est ; lien autem secundum q nsecration are
H.n. another difliculty is that the words of

-ijniativ. Hence, working on this^prajjnic . L:1W - (the Mass)

-η Measure calls ' the ritual sacrifice of the- Phosen materials

Λ 'i-rits visible signs anti actions, auniv contain the

! : 'b red formulas, which by reason of Chn ,3 No doubt

; Tifi.-t whose image they portray before our e- act of the

' ! ? contain the sacrifice,' but only inasmuc - «-«crament, but

- ; i:iate priest makes them by priority ''° , ointed out. the

? jut. r sacrifice in fieri or the Mass. ^spa^ nsecration when the

! .. uht-sacrament exists only after the c . P nresent. This

! ! û-ristic-active-saerifice, qua tale, has cease church secures

λ <■...! tally offen d for all contains Christ and

especially for th. faithful: V. [he salvation

' ' ' : paving stinn-nie reverence and o < . not they

' " nr-n to whom Of itself it proffers grace- => h c ; no r

: ? it. A sacrament gives gracc only θ saCranient

: ■' u;y sacrament contain the whole Cross - Christ's active

■■■ Eucharist does not. qua sacrament.^con <, (t. cited, it

: 'π,.. Em- these and other reasons whict g impliecl in the

“.' nod there is an incongruity or impo- . deprecated.

^r.^nt-^enfire and that it> use >> to b< I |

immolation. _ knottv problem

,i: > grateful that Father Barden faces 1^ * nK:taphysieal

■"l 'lation. His purpose is to solve s.sacrainental theory»

■d>hty; the great difliculty of th - immolation in the

"!.. ' Hie numerical identity of ie . grasp clearly w

' o.d the Mass/ Here it is Thus Father Barden

l the active immolation of Xe^atively it is no

- Icrm negatively and positive - Thdr M.tv,n says

' d.-ath on the part of the exeiu R is n(sL as la-iu r

' I l m t', «as a mau fidum, a? e ' ,mtarv acceptance of <lr..th

..... ..h...

l ■■■.* 3. (hrist s drath merely- *' I *.,, inio Hr (>>η<-'..''Γ

jiving or yirldmil "P

*' ■ b h an ; a' t ot y?; th*r fHoph; ..iō>.... :

l .uo fut pne- s ...l ;jn art ' tak...* «..

= l. - << God. ' -Brr'i'd Qle.' Λ".* " ' tak...* «..

: 'tv>.ris»! which i' taint. t.,nve off< nmi- h. t.s's man'.

X . -! .rj.i It !' !h< in!,s.V';V(r Bardin-uy- 1 δ mm-r < nc<

■ ' .i:i .-te-n. Thu> i :^;. r.-b>tmgH ' B<<.h .l u;.-<î

B.' > mm r

Air-

.t. -flilT:>*»n U'^^'

, « ntk. in'''l

expression is stated to be twofold : the absolute or 'neces'arv ; natural expression at the blood-shedding and death on laivr. and the relative and sacramental or the 'double transubstan* ;.. where *vi verborum* the Body alone is present under the mu- bieu and the Blood alone under the species of wim-. Bt imrnolative priestly act is other than the transubstantia'i. t.inst in His human nature elicited the transubstantiafn. the instrument of the divinity, but He elicited His pri'*. precisely as a secondary cause.'

This explanation seems a modification of the oblatii>n-f̄.◀" tae trench School; agreements and disagreements nvoi : ' mentioned., Now can it truly be that the ' inner essence «; L... was Christ s act of ' relating His Bodv and Blood out of Hb ◀;◀. into the dominion of God f ? Can it be really said that tub ' the Cross outer-sacrifice really expressed? Considering tu .: static union, how possibly can Christ alienate His Body ::! out of His own dominion into the dominion oi God I.v: dead, Christ retained complete dominion over His Body anil B Sinner and saint, and every creature are so perfectly u'..: dominion of God that a more perfect dominion sum imp. " I though it is true that sinner and saint hold each a ditiert nt r... to Him. As man. Christ's relation to the Father was : I reverent and subordinate that any change therein do - n-!# conceivable. In tart it semis that Christ's perfect donui.r'-rlis Body and Blood enabled Him to u-e them with lia freedom in accomplishing the Father's Will and Burp-s., Ar J i urpose (which was also Christ's) was not to relate ('raid s I; ami Blood out of His dominion into the dominion ◊t t.,,: her redeem fallen man anti enable him to enter int< d.' ' that (. hn.st ever had with the Fatlier : * That they all may b as t.um batheryin me, and I in thee : that they also ma } lit ' us. ...John xvii. 21.) It was this same Purpose, may >!< " " .ηil^ ^rist expressed ami accomplished on the (r- " I mat I host expresses and accomplishes in the Mnss-Si◊ r)hv.. it is interesting to find the *itrborum* argument still n . ' ,[U »] the leurif d Dondni, ;,] j, I- at e . I L;animal Billot (and others, on the threefold ground: that "

of hrJn/r' +◊,t 'utlc Blood from the Bodv under the

✕ personally! ?km swi Γ<4i'Tlī nb'd<.riam quae consecratur.' Γ- I »o 'heī-atheMn H.◊.|v|'" ;il><<,"i,- iY" "d,"ir ','l,a' (hn'' * ;

hapfwnir.ci but **H U**—a ny th<' betiding u> Ji'-ri th» (r>ss M-.u,d S.-.U **TM** * * ^presented but. misrepn'

CONCERNING THOMIST METAPHYSICS

misrepresentation which seems also inherent in the sacrament-

representing the different theories of the Father Himself? His all

might be defined as His freely giving which will
Either unto immediately accomplishing His sacrificial
father's Will and redeem the world: an offering of that act
ion defined as His most reverent carrying out by the
details according to the mode and manner of the oblation
A moment's consideration will reveal the Cross. In
oration obtain in the Mass as well as in the world
five-ve have the same Christ, redeeming these

immutable supreme revealed. Father. The
by the mode and manner decreed but the active
and manner of the Cross and Mass are Christ lost
and the same. Lest we neglect Him immolated on
> His Human Nature with His Human Nature
well to remember that no suffering (Tree for the
< His Human Nature only to Father's
in the manner He allowed it to freely endure
He permitted no bone to be broken in
'union' wherein He granted its grace for three
body. Then taking the matter ever. Father
with it with all suffering through with his meaning
rip-f-rout a. therefore. The
di... nor consequently with His death. Hence, seems

It is not expressly treated in the indistinctly
but it is

m ? = ...

i-t p - - A X - - '

S. M

I

Tr. h. W; "IXI

St. Th. n. » « i in » , n

function is instrumental ; though permanent itself, its action : transient.

Before proceeding, perhaps, it may be well to note that a priestly character is a free instrument, in the sense that it will function by the sufficient intention and purpose of its possessor who uses the proper matter and form. Using these any priest brings his character into act; nor does he require preventing or invalid sacrificial activity, as is evidenced by the case of one who celebrates sacrilegiously.

Father Barden declares that our ' priestly character is analogous to the character of Christ : that it is ' only an analogous participation in the character of Christ ' ; but he questions the statement that the act of our priesthood is ' completely understood as if it is recognized as an analogous participation in the priestly act of Christ.'

It is to be regretted that Father Barden does not specify what he means by ' analogous.' Usually the word implies an agreement of likeness or proportion in things that of different natures or otherwise diverse. He does mention disagreements when he says that our priestly character is ' distinct from Christ's and that its act 'cannot be numerical; it is the same as the instrumental action of Christ.' Their agreement is invoked in his treatment of physical participation as applied when really functioning in Christ's active sacrifice. What is physical participation ?

Father Barden's explanation is philosophical and abstract, occasioning some ambiguity. So, in the sincere hope that it may be correctly understood, may one be allowed to put the matter in this way. Existence is the *actus primus* : the action of what (creatures, of course) is called *actus secundus*. Physical participation concerns *actus secundus*. Take an organ pipe which gives out a note.

When the organ is silent, this pipe-note is in potentiality. The action of the air current awakes this pipe, the note given is actual.

The air current is the cause which reduced the potentiality of the pipe to the actuality of the pipe-note. While the pipe-note is now in act, it is the *actus secundus* of the pipe. This is the *actus secundus* of the pipe-note. This is the *actus secundus* of the pipe-note. This is the *actus secundus* of the pipe-note.

the air current forte, piano. X

the formal control the formal

his instrumental sacrifice.

its formal act

transient.

its formal act

Father Barden, if one understands the word 'analogous' in the intellectual sense...

for promotion ;

- ?is immolative or sacrificial act itsclt. II tyie actUJ!
- .lit. between the power and the inimo a i nr;costly power
causalis or physical promotion, by * uc over it as
: J.,,S ertually raus« H» priestly art and dommat«O«

It is not quite dear here whether tta d°TM

immediately to the promotion or to the pn resemblance
b th. aho« example, the players M-^rUStStysicaUy
I,II he would produce. lite act of .l the note,
-n nf from the promotion or air current "wu *uv«rally m
purpose is the same and it domina es p action
lotion in order to secure the formal act or n< anti
>,rb fn.-se might be described as analogica ó len seems to teach
Iπ> might be called analogous, l ath character and that
what similar analogy between our pries ,mv character is
irixt, IL* suggests that the formal act o ou J
- i.tti .n not nv rtlv of the actus secundus farmali ** hut ab° nf the aciuS
pripiity
Iof Ihrriifs priestly power, i.e. tie t æ. wcn doubtless.
* nr' :ipiitr-^ in the causal net of < hrist s pries P< dominating over
i ;ii wt. Tims we actually participate i

ie in act is possessing
: : ti.<- human priest at the moment his charae e is numerically
a ; t- v.-ry pri'-tly action of Jesus J^Her of J^us. but «hæh
i. t.-r. vhv-ical promotion of the Pr' tion thereof, he is ^c\-/ .su<
Thou-h real and physical P"t'clif,s3fne immolative .^O^ anj
..I. :t?Ii-π>:iHii" in dominion user which is
...r... »:««*» *f act' of the Character < the < athc U
tt-ii. appt)prmt<i. in rn

niinH solve λ

.l-AH.-ss, η . clever
difficulty and one, " I;l* p Hoes not runt*||
" :; "χ it a tiHH'h of originali >- fi<>wn here".

I II ---^I.II

"III '!ar;.. t< r priestly

- i. .TM.t.r I hmt.ah' !^,>Tin|! in the m <
' 'y llis t h... the infur a*! ^' ".VhXeter it. < hrist »<

phy-' P"

l. ni.im- Father Ban < fIAf^v.r... MUv «*««*«*-

But then Father Barden may mean by Christ's priestly character any ^on His human intellect, but that the fulness of presence therein: or as St. Thomas puts it. 'Christo r*er* i*ntellectus* i*n* d*e* re characterem: sed potestas sacerdotii ejus c*on*p*er*at „C*on*„ra^o n*on* sicut id quod est plenum et perfectum.' The speaking of Christ's active immolation Father Barden writes: 'The act still persists in the mind and will of Christ (John 1:14) as a witness in which His human nature ever remains; the perpetual term of that priestly action.'

There can be no doubt that Christ exercises the fullness of priestly office through His intellect and will, but the more is made out Christ's perpetual act of immolation and sacrifice of Himself. Father Barden's view must be judged on his immolation and afford deep and enlightening thought. The author has already been discussed nor does its existence as regards heaven seem to need further discussion here. The point is that, on Father Barden's permanent and immutable priestly power: and the question is, can such a promotion be physical promotion in Christ's mind which ever enjoyed the beatific vision? The answer is given by the answers. Still it does seem that the perfection infused into the soul by the beatific vision is a permanent promotion; and if it does, the beatification of Father Barden seems to lapse.

'/ SC('ms- t'' what actually happens. St. Th. m- t yf. d * the priest does nothing more- than pronounce. <<; S ix-In hoc sacramento perficiendo mai habet n*on* n*on* X-Citlonen\ verborum/s No doubt it is in the proper intention and over the du- n- Giia-i- II, en briefly explains: Forma h*ab*im<-; n-rm. er- m nkJ.r ;persuria Christi loquenti-. ut dicitur in'0-: : Christi ' 3ll Perlee-inm. >itl r;ilri,r*j ; j. Christ one X*on* i.o- maF*ab* n?ted that th< Latin adm*is* of more it were th*at* n: sH*er*amm*t* the form l- prone eV or hXWOr^ i,f Christ Himself .speikiu- sentim*en*t*is* ^'nOUnt C,i W*ir*t' «I the per-on. i.e. by not i>“ dk, /XX| r, | ”T, i' i.U. r- r. | .! ” I what part tho . ik l'O*rd* is t*er*mat. as it i. not exp.? th-... wnnU 4IJ>-* .V. * * i' n l- t>:u hij.g i,,, "l' "pr<<. ; a; - .-; ;t... U*ir*â- . iir.r dm-n> ...n, "i± H<<v <<-<< i> n<<.m f.r .

>> Tl ; > of I hast, who is the Pr*o*vstly charachr rhe . . . that it must be a"'"* B will, how- ver, h- U and iW B were freHv handed t- Ct

... human priest before Christ will use it. This t|ie forrtl
 ... λπ priest shall have a proper intention an I .
 ... •l'ijænts pre-ordained by Christ. ,, .u,, poñ-
 v -he Slipper. Christ, merely moment the
 words over bread and wine. At tne re*%llv and
 " of His Priesthood made Himself really Plt'!* .pai-tieulur
 if-rinir His sacrifice to God under the species o : Christ ;
 At Muss the human priest o<tKardly suV
 ... unctiety character he is the deputed an< a uJnce. when
 l-*> minister whom Christ has willed to cnip oy. words of
 'U'i-ti.>ninu as subordinate and pronouncing. utilizes
 "Vi"iî. infallibly and instantaneously Chns the fulness
 r c.f the subordinate priest in ord<?r (f bread
 :I> ..wii Priesthood on to these particular christ makes
 ■ ar.il so. under their particular ,SP^ ' whole sacrifice
 I r;dly present, really and truly . 'l for all men;
 : r 'he Church, for the living and ' i.e-re-according
 ' ruiticular way Christ is offering Hissai particular
 'P-r-irtl intention of the subordinate PT** ' e*c> Hence,
 ' < purpost s. for a private favour, pc * ordination,
 ■ thf human priest's authority iec< J *|| js priest
 η. !. ;γ<- utilizes the priestly ehara
 ' i'! pr-per intention in his performem pre-ordained
 : tin- words (or prescribed forma,) nriesfs character,
 ■'. K-r then. utilizing this ^^L^rfXts and completes
 ' HniK. It instantaneously and infalh efficient and
 ' ; w-rdiip by these elements, «'^^tituted this worship
 - Hv tl,c Will of His Father. Ci ξi thus be performed by
 ■ ;Lai ...ituurdS. H ^.î.ψηι. η»'i' I,ia> i,
 ■■ I iin.itt. prir st. Omitting further d I (K,ηη>χ'Η<< with
 ' : b th.- hr.maa !<“λνιρμ hi. i<>
 'I -s-u dfiee. how by pronouncing ti th<. pro.ound
 ■ i .■ ■■a'»!.. ■*■ >■;*... irs;i^ (J!il.n'i<l<!atl..

- ■..md^r.-m^dousaudone priest. It **
 «... .i;y of Christ. >-■ ">■!
 ■ .;v?-i.nl rnmur.cn uni I ,,v f.r ttu.

